CORE Metadata, citation and similar papers at core.ac.uk
Provided by Histoire sociale / Social History (E-Journal, York University)

name was Richard Sievers (p. 164), and Bartholomew Roberts did not kill the governor of Martinique, as asserted on page 195. Nevertheless, in comparison with other popular books on this subject matter, the author has done a good job sorting fact from fiction.

In sum, this book provides a useful introduction to a topic that has drawn considerable public and scholarly attention in recent years. Travers's work places maritime depredations into the larger context of international rivalries and conflicts. One hopes that this book will find an eager and interested readership.

Arne Bialuschewski
Trent University

TULCHINSKY, Gerald — *Canada's Jews: A People's Journey*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008. Pp. 597.

This one-volume condensation of Gerald Tulchinsky's magisterial *Taking Root: The Origins of the Canadian Jewish Community* (1992) and *Branching Out: The Transformation of the Canadian Jewish Community* (1998) adds some further references to scholarship and events since 1998, but fundamentally covers the same ground as the two original volumes did. Since their contents are presumably well known, I focus here on issues of emphasis, construction, and coverage in this immense 600-page compendium.

As the subtitle suggests, this book is intended for a generalist audience with little or no knowledge of Jewish history in Canada. Although Tulchinsky is always advancing arguments that bear on the causes of this or that phenomenon or its origins, arguments that belong to the order of historiographical discourse, he never engages directly with the scholarship to which he is responding, which feels a bit like shadow-boxing. Historians of Canada or Jewish historians will know the debates about the origins of antisemitism in twentieth-century Canada, but general readers will have to take Tulchinsky's word that there was no real antisemitism or anti-Jewish feeling in eighteenth- or nineteenth-century "Canada" (or its predecessor polities) — rather, it appeared sometime before the end of massive Eastern European Jewish immigration to Canada in 1925 and caused the change in that policy to boot (p. 236). Furthermore, while the antisemites responsible for the end of mass immigration — just as things were getting really bad for Eastern European Jewry and not long before the Shoah — were federal civil servants and government officials (especially Frederick Blair and William Egan), Tulchinsky feels that the main nexus of Canadian antisemitism was to be found in "clerico-fascist" Catholic circles in Quebec. This is only one example of the contradictory and sometimes downright asymmetrical arguments Tulchinsky advances (while refusing to engage the specialist literature or debates explicitly). Some of these problems result from duplication, probably due to merging two previous books that somewhat overlapped into a single volume. There are two distinct and very detailed sections on the Jewish role (of employers and of workers) in the Montreal and Toronto garment (*shmattes*) trade, overlapping around the 1910s and 1920s. Tulchinsky's work on the "rag trade" is excellent, it should be noted, and forms the core of his historical insights into the conditions of recent Jewish immigrants, their class consciousness, and their experience of life in Canada. These sections, despite the overlaps, will be of particular interest to readers of this journal for classroom use.

The other notable example of this doubling is the dual coverage of the Montreal school crisis, an event that emerged with an almost rigorous logic from the provisions of the *British North America Act* for separate schooling for children of Protestant denominations and for Catholics. In 1867, the few German and Sephardic Jews in Montreal were no more reliant on public schools for their children than were other well-to-do urban merchants, and so there was no provision for the public education of Jewish children. In the wake of bloody pogroms in Eastern Europe, the exploding population of mainly Yiddish-speaking Jews without private resources quickly outnumbered the established, largely well-to-do German and Sephardic Jews of North America in the later nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. This led to a crisis in the funding and provision of public education for Jewish children in Montreal. Although the Protestant school board took Jewish children and exempted them from Christian religious instruction, Jews had no right to representation on the Protestant school board, and no Jewish teachers were hired in its schools. While a separate Jewish school board very nearly materialized before the Second World War, the Protestant school board and representatives of the Jewish community eventually yielded to government pressure to compromise. Tulchinsky's careful and detailed examination of this crisis is one of the great merits of his work.

The school crisis deeply affected many Montreal families. In 1919, my great-grandfather Albert Freedman and his wife Mabel left Montreal with their children to live in Brussels. The rising tide of antisemitism in Quebec and the Montreal school crisis were factors in their decision to emigrate from Canada to Europe. In 1940, my grandmother got out of Brussels with my mother and uncle, with nothing but the clothes on their backs, a few hours before the Germans arrived — a high price to pay for the excellent Jesuit education she received in Brussels. One wonders how many other Montreal Jews left the city before the Second World War for similar reasons.

The University of Toronto Press has now had at least two opportunities to correct errors, typos, misspellings, and the like in each of the texts of the three volumes, yet far too many remain, given the claims that are constantly made (in the Canadian academy and granting agencies, at least) regarding its exceptional prestige and quality. There are a number of odd usages and turns of phrase. On page 109, the psalmic Hebrew phrase "Rosh Pina" (used as the name of a synagogue) is rendered literally and woodenly as "Head of the Corner"; "cornerstone" would be more conventional. On page 22, Aaron Hart is said to have brought his cousin Dorothea from England as a bride in 1778 — and in the same year to have written to his son Moses to remind him to observe Jewish law! In fact, Aaron brought Dorothea to Three Rivers in 1768, and their first son, Moses, was born later that year.

After Aaron's death in 1800, Dorothea ran their businesses for decades out of what is now the Auberge Le St-Gabriel in the old town of Montreal. Although Tulchinsky mentions two other cases of a widow carrying on her husband's business (Phoebe David, 1776, p. 23; and John Levy's widow, 1859, p. 42), he states that "it is unlikely that many other Jewish women entered business affairs in those early days. Home and childbearing were their destiny" (p. 23). He seems to have confused these well-to-do urbanites with pioneers on the woodsy frontier. Urban Jewish women traditionally ran businesses and traded in their own right, as the early modern example of the famous Glückl of Hameln demonstrates. Tulchinsky recognizes that almost all early Jewish Canadians were "middle class" (urban and not dependent on wages), yet he seems to fail to appreciate what that meant for family structure, the employment of domestics, and the role of women in such households. The European Jewish urban context would have been a more appropriate pattern to apply in extrapolating about the role of Canadian Jewish women in the early period. Vague expressions of sympathy with (Jewish) women that actually relegate them to a subordinate role are not helpful, politically or historically.

There are some omissions and inadequacies that are stunning for so lengthy a book: York University, a centre of Jewish education with its large historical and current population of Jewish students, with its pioneering Jewish studies programme, is mentioned only once, in the context of anti-Israel activities on campus, and does not even appear in the index. A few photographs, grouped in two sections, seem chosen largely to reflect the book's major theme (the last 120 years of Eastern-European Jewry in Canada). There are few direct references to them in the text. The 11.5 per cent of Canada's Jewish population who are of Israeli origin or immigrated via Israel (*yordim*) since 1948 receive around one page — though this reader is grateful even for the reference and the startling statistic. The French-, Arabic- and Ladino-speaking communities of more recently arrived Sephardic Jews (mainly of North African origin) in Montreal and Toronto rate fewer than 10 pages out of nearly 600, and there is nothing about Iraqi, Persian, Yemenite, or Indian Jews (*mizrachim*, meaning "orientals"), many of whom have settled in Canada (many are also *yordim*), nor about the many thousands of converts to Judaism in recent decades. In fact, "Canada's Jews," in Tulchinsky's account, are not merely Ashkenazim; they are of Eastern European extraction. Tulchinsky's focus makes up, in this regard, for the establishmentarian focus of many earlier studies, such as A. D. Hart's *The Jew in Canada* (Montreal, 1925), which devoted a great deal of space to Hart's illustrious German and Sephardic ancestors (full disclosure: mine too), their connections, wealth, achievements, and honours, and very little space to the recently arrived Yiddish-speaking masses. However, Tulchinsky's "nationalist" paradigm, so close to that of other ethno-linguistic nationalisms, is also an ethnocentric distortion that obscures the complexity of Jewish ethno-linguistic and religious identities. While Yiddish-speakers certainly formed a majority in Canada by around 1890, the German and "Spanish-and-Portuguese" (Sephardic) Jews who were the first to settle here, from the 1760s on, appear only as distant background, with a mere

36 pages dedicated to almost 100 years of history in chapter 2, "Foundations in the Colonial Era." To be fair, these proportions reflect the smaller volume of both sources and scholarship relating to the earliest period, as well as the size of that community.

Yet these coverage proportions should also be seen in the context of the large number of pages devoted to Jewish agricultural settlements on the Prairies (an ambitious but ill-considered enterprise that Canada shared with Argentina) — though, given the absolute priority the Canadian government gave to agricultural settlement at the time, Tulchinsky's careful examination is not unjustified. There is an odd comment on p. 125 that Jewish farming had been "a fragment of the European experience that did not translate well to the new environment." Yet there had never been any full-time Jewish farmers in isolated homestead settlements anywhere in Europe. The relatively few Jewish farmers in Eastern Europe had been villagers engaged in a variety of market-oriented occupations, working and living within a tightly-knit Jewish infrastructure. This context, more than references to a Jewish preference for educating children over making agricultural improvements or to Jews' inexperience (real as it was for most of them), might have helped to make better sense of the failure of the agricultural settlements after the first generation — especially since they might have been more successful had they been set up as nucleated villages based on Jewish organizational patterns and community needs. There are also dozens of pages (in two separate sections) on the intricacies of the various Zionist organizations, their infinitesimally nuanced gradations (both political and religious), and the unique strength in fund-raising and Zionist fervour of Canadian Jewry as compared to that of Americans. This is indeed an important part of the Canadian Jewish context, but one has to look hard to discover that there were (and are) anti-Zionist or non-Zionist Jews in Canada at any time. Perhaps because I am a specialist in pre-modern history, I find it hard to accept that these issues deserve more coverage than the eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century communities.

The emphasis on Eastern Europeans' experience also stands out at the very end of the volume. In reference to the titles of the two books on which this one is based, we read: "Canadian Jewry was *taking root* until about 1920" and has spent the last 80-plus years "*branching out* into the mainstream community" (emphasis mine). The first Canadian Jewish communities had, arguably, taken root much earlier — by the 1840s, by which time Montreal's second synagogue and first Ashkenazic-rite *shul*, Shaar Hashomayim, had been established. Many Jews had entered the mainstream well before that time; even more would do so after the 1840s. The small size of these communities (amidst a small Gentile population, it should be noted) is no reason to give them such short shrift or to suggest (implicitly) that they were merely provisional or a prelude to the "real thing," especially given the stature, influence, and achievements of Canadian Jews before the "Yiddishers" arrived. Tulchinsky's emphasis as a social historian is on "the people," especially the working-class Jews who were in a clear majority in the later nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and that alone justifies his focus on Eastern Europeans for that period. Having zeroed in on that group, however, he continues to foreground them despite (or because of?) their immediate descendants' rise into the educated middle classes after the Second World War. Perhaps it is the nature of all chronological surveys to abridge and thus to foreground both history's "winners" (in this case, the rising Jewish middle class of Eastern European descent) and the more recent past as the immediate prelude to the present — as Herbert Butterfield argued in 1931. However, both early Canadian Jews and minority groups among the Jews in Canada, as well as the scholarship on them, deserve more attention and consideration in a book that presents itself as a generalist historical survey.

Andrew Gow
University of Alberta