

Elizabethtown College JayScholar

Education: Student Scholarship & Creative Works

Education

Spring 2018

To What Extent Does Haidt's Moral Foundations Theory Reveal Liberal or Conservative Biases When Applied to Selected State's Citizenship and Government Curriculum?

Jennifer R. Lloyd

Elizabethtown College, lloydj@etown.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <https://jayscholar.etown.edu/edstu>

 Part of the [Education Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Lloyd, Jennifer R., "To What Extent Does Haidt's Moral Foundations Theory Reveal Liberal or Conservative Biases When Applied to Selected State's Citizenship and Government Curriculum?" (2018). *Education: Student Scholarship & Creative Works*. 3.
<https://jayscholar.etown.edu/edstu/3>

This Student Research Paper is brought to you for free and open access by the Education at JayScholar. It has been accepted for inclusion in Education: Student Scholarship & Creative Works by an authorized administrator of JayScholar. For more information, please contact kralls@etown.edu.

To What Extent Does Haidt's Moral Foundations Theory Reveal Liberal or Conservative Biases
When Applied to Selected State's Citizenship and Government Curriculum?

By

Jennifer R. Lloyd

Elizabethtown College

This thesis is submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for Honors in the Discipline in
Education and the Elizabethtown College Honors Program

May 7, 2018

Thesis Director _____

Dr. Kyle C. Kopko, Ph.D.

Second Reader _____

Dr. Rachel Finley-Bowman, Ph.D.

Abstract

This paper begins with an overview of the evolution of social studies education overtime, from moral education to civic education. It then analyzes the compatibility of the current form of social studies education with the national standards for education. The literature introduced in this paper looks at the social studies curriculum from three selected states, California, Texas and Pennsylvania. Furthermore, Dr. Jonathan Haidt's Moral Foundations Theory, which contends that all humans use five foundations when engaging in moral decision-making, will be used as a framework to analyze the selected states' curricula. The purpose of this research study then, is to determine whether or not these three states emphasize specific moral foundations in their social studies curricula and standards utilizing Haidt's framework.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction 5

Section 1: Intolerance of Youth Today 5

Section 2: History/Purpose of Social Studies Education 5

Section 3: National/State Standards on Citizenship Education 7

Section 4: Jonathan Haidt’s Moral Foundations Theory 9

Chapter 2: Literature Review 13

Section 1: Intolerance 13

Section 2: Public Opinion on Moral Education 14

Section 3: Relationship Between Standards and Social Studies Education 15

Section 4: Citizenship Education 17

Section 5: Curriculum Analysis from California, Texas and Pennsylvania 18

California 19

Texas 21

Pennsylvania 23

Section 6: Previous Bias Studies Using Haidt’s Framework 24

Section 7: The Unknowns 25

Section 8: Purpose of this Research Project 26

Chapter 3: Methodology 27

Chapter 4: Results 29

Section 1: Research Findings 29

Section 2: Discussion of Findings 31

Chapter 5: Conclusion 34

Section 1: Final Conclusions 34

Section 2: Recommendations for Future Research 35

References 36

Appendices 39

Chapter 1: Introduction

Section 1: Intolerance of Youth Today

Recently in America, there has been an alarming reduction in the amount of political tolerance that citizens are willing to extend to people outside their political circles, and this poses a grave threat to the existence of democracy in our country. Political scientists define political tolerance as, “the willingness to extend civil liberties and basic democratic rights to groups one dislikes;” hence, tolerance is not referencing people with whom you agree, but rather people who hold beliefs in which you disagree (Kelly-Woessner, 2017). With this definition in mind, Kelly-Woessner (2015) set out to either confirm or refute the commonly held belief that the younger generation, people in their 20s and 30s, is “more tolerant” than the older generation, people in their 40s. She found that per the 2012 GSS (General Social Survey), the young had higher levels of intolerance than the old. When asked if they would prohibit a Muslim clergyman from preaching an anti-American message in their community, 60% of people in their 20s agreed, 52% of people in their 30s agreed, but only 43% of people in their 40s agreed. Through her research, Kelly-Woessner (2015) also discovered that, “young people are also less tolerant than the middle-aged groups toward militarists, communists, and racists. This is not true for tolerance towards homosexuals or atheists, because younger people simply like these groups more.” This promotion of limiting “the rights of political opponents, so long as they frame their intolerance in terms of protecting others from hate,” is destroying the marketplace of ideas in schools and higher education and is creating a disastrously polarized America.

Section 2: History/Purpose of Social Studies Education

To understand the factors causing this rise in intolerance in American youth, we must investigate the main avenue in which they are exposed to political ideologies, social studies

education. Across the United States, students of all ages are required to complete social studies classes and learn about government, politics, ideologies, etc. In the past however, there was another major component to social studies education, and that was moral/character education. Although very similar in meaning, character education by definition is, “the long-term process of helping young people develop good character, i.e., knowing, caring about, and acting upon core ethical values such as fairness, honesty, compassion, responsibility, and respect for self and others” (Sanchez, 2004, 106). Moral education, on the other hand, deals specifically with ethical issues and preparing “the next generation of democratic citizens” (Banks, 1997; Dewey, 1966, 1975 as cited in Howard, 2005, p. 44).

Pre-1800s, American school systems heavily relied on the church to dictate moral principles that all students should know and try to embody. At the turn of the century, Enlightenment ideals emerged, which called for separation of church and state, thus posing a threat to the church and its influence over the religious ideals being taught in schools (Brimi, 2009). With the church no longer dictating religious morals, teachers began to interpret character education as a means of encouraging certain behaviors in students: “Punctuality, regularity, obedience, and silence,” were at the heart of this secularized character education (Urban and Wagoner, 2004, p. 174 as cited in Brimi, 2009). This form of curriculum persisted up until the 1960s, when there was a “values clarification” movement. In the wake of the Civil Rights Movement, no longer could teachers openly discuss morals and character in schools, in fear of indoctrinating their students with false definitions of what constitutes “right” and “wrong,” and what defines a “good” citizen, because these definitions were changing. This take on character/moral education in public schools prevailed until the 1990s, when there began a movement, spear-headed by Thomas Lickona (1993), titled, “The Return of Character Education.”

Likona (1993) saw disintegration of the family and depraved teenage behavior and deemed recognition of a shared basic morality as the solution.

Today, a modified form of character education, referred to as citizenship education, has returned to social studies classrooms. This approach is more consistent with behaviorist beliefs: “American policymakers primarily want students to act appropriately, whether they have internalized a real sense of moral virtue or not” (Brimi, 2009, p. 126). Teachers have adopted the form of teaching students how to think, not what to think, when discussing morals and values. As shown, character education is a significant topic of discussion because of the important role that schools play in potentially cultivating morality in young Americans. Because of this, it has been constantly reevaluated throughout the past two hundred years as the morals of society have evolved.

Section 3: National/State Standards on Citizenship Education

Although social studies teachers have a significant amount of control over the curriculum they introduce in their classrooms, national and state standards play an even greater role in deciding what citizenship education is provided to the students. There are five civic standards at the national level:

- 1) What is Government and What Should It Do?
- 2) What are the Basic Values and Principles of American Democracy?
- 3) How does the Government, Established by the Constitution, Embody the Purposes, Values, and Principles of American Democracy?
- 4) What is the Relationship of the United States to Other Nations and to World Affairs?

- 5) What are the Roles of the Citizen in American Democracy? (Pritchard, 2001, p. 97)

These national standards drive state level curriculum designs. Although these standards are useful to the states, Pritchard (2001) clearly points out that they do not comment on moral dispositions; therefore, the states wield the majority of the power to interpret the characteristics of future citizens. This raises the question then of how much power state legislatures have over the curriculum and political ideologies being taught in schools? Additionally, how much emphasis are the states placing on civic education in schools? Since the enactment of No Child Left Behind in 2001, there has been an implementation of high stakes testing for English and math and a much greater emphasis from the national government on these subjects, not social studies. This has forced states to divert many educational resources away from social studies classrooms and supply them to English and math classes in order to hopefully boost test scores and receive national funding. This act essentially led to the marginalization of social studies in school districts and left teachers struggling to “strike a balance between achieving quantifiable academic standards and assisting with students’ character development” (Brimi, 2009, p. 125).

In response to No Child Left Behind and the newfound dismissal of civic education, the National Council for the Social Studies disseminated its own standards for social studies educators. These consisted of “the 3 C’s – Career, College and Citizenship” (Blevins, 2014). The establishment of these standards in the field of social studies solidified the shift from moral education to citizenship education in social studies classrooms. This shift was due in large part to America’s culturally pluralistic society, and the fear of educators indoctrinating the youth. Hence, as part of the NCSS’s framework, there is a citizenship and government category, but it focuses completely on citizenship in a democracy and morality/value-based learning is not

present. Citizenship education is defined by Lin (2015) as, “instructional strategies that promote democratic ways of thinking that foster informed and active citizenship” (Hoge, 2002, p. 36).

This differs from character/moral education, because teachers are no longer defining what “good” character or ethics are, but rather they are teaching the more secular notion of how to embody democratic citizenship ideals.

Section 4: Jonathan Haidt’s Moral Foundations Theory

Another component of this thesis research is Dr. Jonathan Haidt’s Moral Foundations Theory. Dr. Haidt, a former psychology professor at the University of Virginia, published his book, *The Righteous Mind*, in 2012, and contained within this book is the Moral Foundations Theory, the culmination of his research on moral decision-making. This theory explains moral decision-making and value setting along ideological lines: why conservatives and liberals have different definitions for what constitutes morality. His book gained much popularity from academics within its field and the general public; therefore, it was placed on the New York Times Best Sellers list in April, 2012.

Contained within this theory, Haidt (2012) names five foundations, which he argues every person evaluates when making a moral decision. His first foundation, care/harm, explains the ability to feel and dislike the pain of others. Within this foundation are the virtues of kindness, gentleness, and nurturance. His second foundation, fairness/cheating, deals specifically with reciprocal altruism. He explains that conservatives and liberals define fairness very differently. Conservatives equate fairness with proportionality (fairness of opportunity in the beginning, so the end result can be unequal) and liberals equate fairness with outcome (the end result must be completely equal). The third foundation is loyalty/betrayal, which underlies virtues of patriotism and self-sacrifice for the group. The next foundation is authority/subversion.

Hierarchal social interactions, leadership, followership and respect for traditions all fall under this foundation. The fifth foundation, sanctity/degradation, relates directly to disgust and contamination. For conservatives, this foundation underlies religious notions and for liberals, environment and clean food can fall under this foundation (YourMorals.org, 2016).

Through the course of Haidt's (2012) research, he found that contained within these foundations are every consideration that people utilize when making moral decisions. In knowing this, he determined that liberals focus heavily on the first two foundations, care/harm and fairness/cheating, when deciding whether or not a situation is moral. Conservatives, on the other hand, have a much broader platform, drawing upon all five of the foundations when determining morality, with the loyalty/betrayal and authority/subversion foundations having the most weight in their decisions. For example, in a situation where there is unfairness to a certain group, by Haidt's theory, liberals would immediately deem it immoral; however, if in that situation, the unfairness to the group occurred because of loyalty to the nation, conservatives would deem that situation moral (Haidt, 2012). This example reveals how in all situations there are always opposing perspectives that can be taken. Conservatives and liberals are normally in disagreement over the determination of morality, and it is because of their different evaluation of the foundations. So, with this in mind, are there implicit messages in curriculum to value one or more foundations over the others? Are the standards and curriculum decisions coming from state legislatures implicitly promoting certain foundations in the determination of morality over others? The intention of this study therefore is to determine the extent to which Haidt's Moral Foundations Theory reveals liberal or conservative biases when applied to selected state's citizenship and government curriculum.

Haidt's moral foundations framework is intended to be objective in its evaluations on moral decision making, and for his purposes, is used to explain the national divide in political ideologies. For the purposes of this study however, I will be using this framework to analyze social studies curriculum from selected states. In designating this framework as a component of my study, I accumulated critiques from pundits in his field. The major flaw that critics took issue with in his research is the fact that Haidt does not acknowledge reasoning as a prerequisite to moral decision-making. However, for the purposes of this study, I am not evaluating how individuals make moral decisions and whether or not reason plays a role, but rather, I am using these foundations to give a statistical evaluation on whether the content in the curriculum relies more on specific foundations. In the research that I completed on the pundits, none that I found argued against the objectivity of his foundations; therefore, Haidt's Moral Foundations Theory will be accepted as an objective framework in which to analyze curriculum for the purposes of this study.

Within this study, there are limitations that must be noted. Due to finite time and resources, this study will not include curriculums from all states, but rather be reduced to curriculum from California, as representative of states with historically liberal legislatures and executives, Texas, as representative of states with historically conservative legislatures and executives, and Pennsylvania, as representative of states with a historically ideologically different legislatures and executives. Additionally, I will only be testing this curriculum under the auspices of Haidt's Moral Foundations Theory, and no other evaluative moral framework. Lastly, along that same line, this study will only linguistically analyze curriculum and not actually test the outcomes of the curriculum on students and their moral preferences. This research design could undoubtedly be expanded in the future; however, at this point in time, it

will potentially give insight into legislatures' influences over the cultivation of political ideologies in the younger generation through the lens of Haidt's (2012) Moral Foundations Theory.

Chapter 2: Literature Review

Section 1: Intolerance

As research ensues, there emerges a consensus that the civic knowledge of our youth is at an all-time low and that there is a correlation between this declining knowledge and increasing political intolerance. The American Council of Trustees and Alumni (ACTA) has been a leading force in conducting research to draw attention to the lack of civic knowledge by American youth today, and how detrimental it will be to American democracy. A recent survey by ACTA (2016) found, “of over 1,100 liberal arts colleges and universities. . . only a handful – 18%-- require students to take even one survey course in American history or government before they graduate” (p. 1). ACTA expresses its concern over the realization that, “college graduates do not understand the fundamental processes of our government and the historical forces that shaped it,” by writing, “the problem is much greater than a simple lack of factual knowledge. It is a dangerous sign of civic disempowerment” (p. 6). As the title of their research article states, there is a “Crisis in Civic Education,” and lawmakers’ attempt to implement civics tests and standards are producing little to no improvements. In the 2010 Civics Report Card, the National Center for Education Statistics (2011) revealed that of all 12th graders studying civics in America, only 24% scored “proficient” or above, and 36% did not reach “basic” achievement.

The declining civic knowledge of American youth in recent years inversely correlates with the rise in political intolerance in the U.S. As Kelly-Woessner (2016) found in recent research, “participation in a free marketplace of ideas requires a certain level of confidence in one’s own political acumen.” Instead of viewing a discussion with someone who holds differing political opinions as a way to strengthen one’s own argument, individuals with limited civic knowledge view dissenters as threats to their beliefs and reputations. Kelly-Woessner (2016) also

shared that based on data from the 2012 General Social Survey (GSS), which included ranking one's inclination to silence a group and how confident one felt about his/her civic knowledge, people with the least amount of confidence in their political knowledge were the most likely to be intolerant toward groups with differing political beliefs. Sniderman (1975) concurs with Kelly-Woessner's findings that political intolerance correlates with psychological insecurity when discussing politics. In sum, the growing rate in which people, especially American youth, are lacking in civic knowledge is fueling the rising levels of political intolerance in our nation.

Section 2: Public Opinion on Moral Education

This need for improvements in the social studies curriculum is recognized not only by researchers, but also by the public. Studies conducted in the field on public sentiment toward moral education in schools reveal that opinions are very favorable. Since the Watergate scandal with Nixon in the 1970s and the Columbine shooting in the late 1990s, there has been a renewed interest in implementing some form of moral education back into classrooms (Howard, 2005). In accordance with these findings, ACTA (2016) cites, "documented deep public support for civic education in public schools, [and] widespread impatience with existing school programs" (p. 3).

In knowing this, what then are the best, empirically-based, means to approach moral education in schools? Howard's (2005) research summarizes the three most effective approaches under three titles: character, cognitive development, and care. The first, character, has its roots based in the philosophical reasoning of Aristotle and focuses on making "virtuous behaviors habitual" (DeRoche & Williams, 1998; Ryan & Bohlin, 1999). The second, cognitive development, is from the teachings of Socrates and its prime "focus is on the process of ethical decision-making over the content-driven character education" (p. 45). The major concern under this category is morality and moral development; therefore, Haidt's Moral Foundations Theory

would fall under this category. Lastly, the third, care, deals specifically with relationships and how to treat other people (Gilligan, 1977, 1982; Noddings, 1984, 1992, 2002). These three approaches have been empirically supported as being effective in the classroom, and as noted previously, surveys demonstrate favorable public sentiments toward increasing moral education; so, the question then becomes, why is this form of education no longer taught in schools?

In an ideal world, more educational time on morality and political discourse would be occurring; however, in classrooms today, discussion of controversial topics in social studies classrooms is on the decline, because teachers fear being accused of indoctrination. Students' developing brains are extremely susceptible to the influences of biases and prejudices, and for parents, having schools teach their children a different viewpoint than their own is very unsettling. Additionally, moral education is declining because of the implementation of No Child Left Behind and the fact that there are no state or federally-mandated assessments for social studies. Social studies educators are not being forced to teach controversial material for a test, so they are avoiding it completely, and this is a contributing factor to Kelly-Woessner's (2016) and Sniderman's (1975) conclusions of declining political tolerance.

Section 3: Relationship Between Standards and Social Studies Education

Although No Child Left Behind requires no form of assessment for students in social studies, there are standards for this discipline at the state level that educators must implement into their classrooms. Researchers in the field are in conflict with one another, with regard to whether or not the relationship between standards and social studies is mutually beneficial or incongruous. In 2012, Godsay, Henderson, Levine, Littenberg-Tobias, & The Center for Information and Research on Civic Learning, summarized state requirements for civic education. They discovered that all states have social studies standards focused on the themes of "power,

authority, and government,” and due to pressure from NCLB, the researchers found that, “states have shifted educational resources away from social studies toward subjects that are included on state-wide assessments” (p. 2). Additionally, 4 percent of states have no social studies requirements for graduation, 18 percent of states have both course completion and assessment and 78 percent require only course completion (Godsay et al., 2012). It can therefore be concluded that as a result of NCLB and the absence of a required assessment in standards, social studies education is being marginalized in schools.

To that same end, as Byrd (2012) delved into the curriculum standards for social studies education in the United States, he concluded that there is a high priority for “memorization of historical narratives” (p. 1073). He further argues that high stakes testing has pushed memorization of facts, which does not promote discussions of the elements of a just society and how to live with people in a pluralist society. He brings attention to the “substantial need for innovative approaches that move beyond traditional frameworks and encourage the development of moral dispositions and personal conscience” (p. 1074). At the conclusion of his article, Byrd (2012) advocates for the inclusion of “ideas of fairness, equality of opportunity, liberty, participatory democracy, and the meta-construct of social justice,” as just a few means to improve social studies curriculum despite the obstacle that NCLB poses.

Contrary to the first two researchers who proposed a negative relationship between standards and social studies education, Howard (2005) contends that moral education is compatible with standards-based education; however, it is the schools and educators who are acting as barriers to the inclusion of both. In his study, Howard (2005) found that discussions on ethical issues are practically non-existent in classrooms, especially in the higher grade levels, because administrators are not emphasizing the need for this discourse. Jones, Ryan, and Bohlin

(1998) confirmed 90 percent of administrators want moral education in their school's classrooms; however, only 24 percent of them emphasized it in their programs (as cited in Howard, 2005). It is the responsibility of the leadership in the schools to ensure that ethical discussions and academic service-learning are implemented into social studies curriculum. As shown, researchers who are looking into the compatibility of standards and social studies curriculum are not able to come to a complete consensus as to whether or not the standards or the leadership in the schools are to blame for the declining discussion of key elements in social studies education.

Section 4: Citizenship Education

With regard to citizenship education, it has been determined and agreed upon that its presence in social studies curriculum is very beneficial to students, yet not enough is being done in schools to ensure its presence. There are also conflicting opinions on what are the most effective ways to teach this curriculum. A research study by Journell (2010) looked at citizenship discourse in the classroom and then analyzed Virginia's Standards of Learning for civics and government, "to discern the underlying civic messages being sent to students enrolled in these courses" (p. 352). The Standards of Learning (SOL) are Virginia's form of standards for civics, economics, and U.S. and VA government. The results were that the SOLs encouraged a conservative approach to citizenship and that discussions were an effective way to teach citizenship education in social studies. The final conclusion that Journell (2010) reached was that it is the responsibility of the teacher to ensure that students receive a balanced view of citizenship: "By exposing students to different perspectives of citizenship, educators can better achieve the goal of developing well-rounded citizens who will positively contribute to our democratic society" (p. 357).

The major controversy surrounding teaching citizenship education is the question of “how schools define who is considered to be a citizen and what entails proper citizenships within a society” (Ahonen 2001; Al-Haj 2005; Banks 1990; Gordon 2005; Hoffman 2007; LaSpina 2003; Pike 2007 as cited in Journell, 2010, p. 352). To address this, Lin (2015) looked to understand activities in K-12 citizenship programs and evaluate whether these activities actually develop civic engagement. Through his studies, he found the most effective citizenship education takes place through service-learning and character education programs. Service-learning projects are classified under the category of participatory citizenship, and political simulations, such as debates and mock elections, fall under the category of personally responsible citizenship. Lin (2015) defines these two aspects as the most essential concepts related to citizenship education, and he strongly advocates for keeping them in the curriculum because there is evidence that citizenship education does have an impact on developing civic engagement. Although his methods for teaching these characteristics differs from Journell’s (2010) proposed methods, both researchers agree that this form of education needs to be continued in social studies classrooms across America.

Section 5: Curriculum Analysis from California, Texas and Pennsylvania

For the purpose of this study, I have selected three states that have legislatures and executives that span the political ideological spectrum and I will be reviewing their citizenship and government curriculum for potential moral decisions-making biases. Prior to doing this, I researched these selected states’ curriculums and standards to have a better understanding of major changes that have occurred and what the state’s proposed focus is for the curriculum.

California

The first state I chose to represent a historically liberal legislature and executive is California. In the 1990s, this state underwent major educational reforms that shifted its focus from rules and processes to student achievement and accountability. In 1992 and 1994, unsatisfactory test scores by Californian students led to even more reforms, including smaller class sizes, changes in state standards and new instructional material. For social studies in particular, there are designated standards: “The K-12 content standards identify what students need to know and do at each grade level in each of the four subjects [Social Studies, English, Math and Science] and are the basis for the standards-aligned tests that are currently being developed for California’s student assessment system” (Hart & Brownell, 2001, p. 183). The state also provides instructions for teachers on how to implement these changes and standards. In 1998, Governor Davis was elected and had a platform for education, which included a way to test students. This time in California’s history became known as the “era of higher expectations.” Since that time, standardized tests and high school exit exams were put in place, teachers are held accountable through Peer Assistance and Review programs, and schools’ performances are ranked, so that aid can be provided to failing schools. In an effort to summarize the educational system in California, Hart & Brownell (2001) write that the reforms, “deliver on the promise to move public schools toward a culture where high standards are the norm, accountability is expected, and collaboration among teachers, administrators, and families is encouraged.” (p. 185)

California’s curriculum is “influenced most prominently by subject matter professional experts.” (Stetson, 1996, p. 1). They follow what is known as a “top-down process,” where the curriculum is developed by professionals in the field and then trickled down to the lay public.

California is considered an example of the professional elite approach, because it does not involve the lay people in much of the curriculum development (Massell, 1994, pp. 88-89 as cited in Stetson, 1996). The professional committee is typically comprised of, “university faculty, teachers, [and] other educators with strong expertise in subject matter” (Stetson, 1996, p. 11). Curriculum is developed by the Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission (advisory board to the State Board of Education) and is considered for revision every eight years. Lastly, this committee is not heavily focused on selecting textbooks for schools to use, which is not the case in every state.

When reviewing research in the field about social studies curriculum in California, I discovered that because of the process California utilizes when designing curriculum, the state does have an impact on what is being taught in the classroom. In a survey distributed to currently practicing educators in August 2010 by the California Council for Social Studies, 89 percent of respondents reported using the history-social studies standards when designing curriculum. Only 5.8 percent reported using service learning in the classroom when teaching social studies; therefore this would mean that participatory democracy is not being emphasized as much in the California schools surveyed (Campbell, Heath, Ingrao & Middleton, 2012). Lastly, another study completed by Stuteville & Johnson (2016) found that out of their seven defined characteristics of good citizenship, liberalism, communitarianism, civic republicanism, cultural pluralism, assimilation, critical thinking and legalism, California’s schools placed heavy emphasis on liberalism. This study defines liberalism as encompassing the ideas of individual rights, freedom, critical thinking, tolerance and respect. All of which, under Haidt’s theory, would be categorized as falling under the liberal concept of morality.

Texas

The second state selected for this study is Texas. Citizenship education in this state is a high priority and permeates social studies curriculum. At the center of Texas's state-mandated curricula is the purpose of creating democratic citizens. In the spring of 2009, there were significant curricular changes made to social studies standards in Texas. According to J. Kelton Williams (2010), Texas's curricula moved from conservative to more inclusive from the 1960s to the 1990s, but in 2009, standards were re-created by a conservative bloc within the Texas State Board of Education (as cited in Strunc & King, 2013). Curricula now focuses on, "traditional gender roles, capitalism, select parts of the Constitution, the military and religion" (Strunc & King, 2013, p. 147). Strunc & King (2013) also note that by discussing this more conservative curricula and how, "far-right state board members continue to push for more conservative ideology within the curriculum, attempting to eliminate many important cultural and historical figures" (p. 147). Basset (2010) summarizes the major concern that most people have with the development of curricula by writing that, "politicians determine the curriculum" (as cited in Strunc & King, 2013, p. 148). This is especially true in Texas, because state legislators choose the content of the textbooks being used in public schools. Additionally, "the proportion of social studies textbooks sold containing the basic Texas-approved narrative range from half to 80 percent" (Collins, 2012, p. 111 as cited in Strunc & King, 2013, p. 148).

The Texas Education Agency is the governing body in charge of development of curriculum in Texas (Strunc & King, 2013). When designing citizenship education for Texas schools, the Agency is heavily influenced by the philosophies of Dewey, Vygotsky and Bandura. Dewey advocated for socialization within democratic education and viewed the teacher as the "facilitator of inquiry" (Strunc & King, 2013, p. 143). Vygotsky taught that culture is the

essential component for the development of children. His most significant contribution to the development of citizenship education was that citizens develop by working in groups. Lastly, Bandura believed that people learn through watching others. He was a major proponent of service learning and the use of simulations to increase “high school students’ civic awareness” (Kahne & Sporte, 2006, p. 742 as cited in Strunc & King, 2013).

All three of these philosophers’ findings played a significant role in the creation of Texas’s citizenship standards. A research study on Texas’s state social studies standards by Smith (2012), defines the four standards and their aims. The first standard expects students to, “understand the concept of American exceptionalism” (p. 313). The second standard ensures that, “the student understands efforts to expand the democratic process” (p. 315). The third standard for citizenship demands that, “the student understands the importance of effective leadership in a constitutional republic” (p. 316). And the fourth standard requires that, “the student understands the importance of the expression of different points of view in a constitutional republic” (p. 316). After analyzing these standards, Smith (2012) determined that the Texas curricula does not represent a balanced political view for citizenship, because, in his opinion, Texas’s standards have shifted toward a neoconservative ideal about the nation’s past. These findings are not in complete agreement with Stuteville & Johnson (2016), who found that of the seven characteristics of a good citizen, liberalism, communitarianism, civic republicanism, cultural pluralism, assimilation, critical thinking and legalism, Texas’s curriculum more heavily promotes cultural pluralism, the notion that, “the knowledge of one’s own culture and the culture of others produces tolerance among diverse cultural groups” (p. 103). These concepts of tolerance and teaching students the cultural backgrounds of diverse groups of people would not necessarily fall under the “conservative” approach to teaching American history. Hence,

researchers have not reached a complete consensus as to whether or not Texas's curriculum has drastically shifted to a more conservative definition of citizenship.

Pennsylvania

The last state I will be analyzing is Pennsylvania, and it will represent a state with more ideologically disparate legislatures and executives on the political ideological spectrum. The social studies academic standards in this state consist of benchmarks for students to ensure that they are on track for their year. The state determines what students should know and be able to do at certain points in their academic careers and they disseminate this information to the schools (Wolf, 2016). In Pennsylvania, the PA State Board of Education is in charge of designing standards to be used and they publish these standards in a code book for teachers to reference. The State Board works with the Department to “develop and adopt regulations that govern significant components of both basic and higher education in the Commonwealth” (Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, 2017). The Secretary of Education serves as the head of the Department of Education and as the chief executive office of the State Board of Education, and he/she oversees the entirety of this process (Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, 2017). Ultimately, the goal for the Board of Education is to create “academic standards [that] serve as a framework from which districts develop their specific curriculum” (Wolf, 2016).

Because Pennsylvania's legislature takes a very hands-off approach when it comes to developing specific curriculum for schools, teachers have much more control over what specifically is taught in their classrooms. The PA Department of Education is a member of the Standards Aligned System, which provides schools and teachers with digital curriculum and instructional resources. Teachers are to reference this system for specific standards and curriculum ideas within their respective disciplines. The Standards Aligned System contains six

key elements that provide a common framework for “continuous student, teacher, and school and district growth” (Wolf, 2016). These six elements are as follows: “Standards, Assessment, Curriculum Framework, Instruction, Materials and Resources, and Safe and Supportive Schools” (Wolf, 2017). Within the Standards Aligned System, the designated standard for civics and government (C&G) is as follows: “C&G is the teaching and presentation of the principles and ideals of the American republican representative form of government as portrayed and experienced by the acts and policies of the framers of the Declaration of Independence, Constitution of the United States and Bill of Rights” (Wolf, 2016). School districts and educators are tasked with creating curriculum that aligns with this standard and produces students that can reach the benchmarks designated by the state. Because of this more hands-off approach, not much research has been conducted on curriculum in Pennsylvania looking for potential biases from the legislature.

Section 6: Previous Bias Studies Using Haidt’s Framework

As previously mentioned, the framework that will be used to analyze the states’ curriculum will be Dr. Haidt’s (2012) Moral Foundations Theory. Although this framework has never been applied to curriculum before to test potential ideological biases, it has been applied in the past to sermons to test the same concept. In one of their research projects, Dr. Haidt and his research assistant, Jesse, obtained the text of dozens of sermons from Unitarian (liberal) churches and obtained the text of dozens of sermons from Southern Baptist (conservative) churches. Jesse then identified hundreds of words that “were conceptually related to each foundation (for example, *peace*, *care*, and *compassion* on the positive side of Care and *suffer*, *cruel*, and *brutal* on the negative side; *obey*, *duty*, and *honor* on the positive side of Authority, and *defy*, *disrespect*, and *rebel* on the negative side)” (Haidt, 2012, p. 188). These researchers then used

the program, Linguistic Inquiry Word Count, LIWC, to keep a running count of how many times each of these words were used in each of the texts. Their findings were as expected, the liberal church made use of words falling under the Care and Fairness foundations, and the conservative church made use of words under the Authority, Loyalty and Sanctity foundations. The premise of this study very much mirrors the premise of my research study; however, I am simply substituting curriculum with sermons and seeing whether the ideological stance of the legislature aligns with the moral foundations being presented in public schools' citizenship curriculum.

Section 7: The Unknowns

Throughout all the research conducted for this project and presented in this literature review, there are still some unknowns in this field. The first of these being: how precisely do educators follow the curriculum and standards they are given from the state? In some states, especially Pennsylvania, educators are given the power to design and implement their own curriculum with little to no interference from the state. The only time that interference comes is when students' test scores do not reach specified benchmarks; however, with social studies not being a tested subject, social studies educators are not held accountable in this same way. Secondly, an unknown in this field is how much "credit" can state legislatures take for the political ideologies of emerging students? There are many factors other than just standards and curricula that influence students' political stances, and because of the plethora of factors that this could encompass, it is very difficult to test the breakdown of how everyone's political ideologies came to be. With this in mind, it is recognized that this research project is an initial step, taken from a macro perspective, in solving the enigma of how important social studies curriculum is in cultivating political ideologies in the younger generation, and how much influence state legislatures can exert over that.

Section 8: Purpose of this Research Project

Ultimately, the goal of this research project is to apply an unbiased framework that can test ideological preferences in moral decision-making to curriculum selected from polarized states. California, Texas and Pennsylvania have legislatures and executives that span the political ideological spectrum and all have a role, some more significant than others, in helping to design standards and/or curricula for their respective educational systems. Hence, this project will hopefully be able to determine whether or not these three states emphasize specific moral foundations in their social studies standards and curricula utilizing Haidt's framework.

Chapter 3: Methodology

When conducting research projects in the social sciences, there are two forms of data that can be collected: quantitative and qualitative. With the quantitative research approach, researchers collect numerically measurable data; whereas, with the qualitative research approach, researchers focus on compiling descriptive data that is not numerically measurable (Leedy & Ormrod, 2013). For the purposes of my research project, I will be collecting quantitative data with the assistance of the Linguistic Inquiry and Word Count (LIWC) program.

LIWC is a computerized text analysis program for researchers to utilize that, “counts the percentage of words that reflect different emotions, thinking styles, social concerns, and even parts of speech” (Pennebaker et al., 2015). When operating this program, the researcher can either use the built-in dictionary included in the LIWC program, or he/she can input a customized dictionary that instructs the program on what words and stems to highlight and how to code them. The program then reads through the uploaded text files and produces a statistical report which includes the percentage of words or ideas from the files that fall under each of the foundations provided in the researcher’s chosen dictionary. For the purposes of my project, I will input a customized moral foundations dictionary (see Appendix 6), and have the program analyze each state’s standards and curricula (see Appendices 1 – 5) and produce a report with the percentage of words that are categorized under each of Haidt’s moral foundations.

My project will begin with obtaining the certified moral foundations dictionary as defined by Dr. Haidt and his colleagues. I will then input this dictionary into LIWC, so that it can recognize the words and stems that correspond with each of the foundations. The next step will involve visiting the department of education websites for California, Texas, and Pennsylvania respectively and securing Citizenship and Government curricula approved from each. I will only

acquire standards and curricula from each state that are used for grades nine through twelve and relate to the subjects of civics and government, U.S. history and economics. All of these standards and curricula will then be transferred to readable text files and uploaded to the LIWC program. The program will then provide me with a statistical analysis of how often the chosen standards and curricula from each state referenced words, stems, or concepts from each of the five moral foundations. Using this data, I will then compare it to the political ideologies of the states' legislatures and executives, and determine if the foundations Haidt contends liberals and conservatives value more so than each other align with the foundations emphasized in the standards and curricula.

Chapter 4: Results

Section 1: Research Findings

The following chart indicates the results from the curriculum and standards that were processed through the Linguistic Inquiry and Word Count program. The decimal numbers shown represent the percentage of words found in the document that fall within the respective foundation as defined in the moral foundations dictionary. I also calculated the mean for each foundation and took one standard deviation in each direction. The black bolded number ranges below each foundation indicate one standard deviation from the mean in both directions. The percentages in green indicate values that exceed one standard deviation above the mean and percentages in blue indicate values that are below one standard deviation from the mean. Lastly, included in the moral foundations dictionary was a morality general category, and included in this foundation was a selection of especially “moral” words and stems that could be used. The extent of words and stems contained within this foundation can be viewed in Appendix 6.

Filename	Segment	WC	WPS	Dic	01	HarmVirtue	02	HarmVice	03	FairnessVirtue	04	FairnessVice
PA Citizenship: Government Standards	1	1413	17.44	7.15		0.57		0.00		0.21		0.07
PA Standards	1	3666	16.37	4.61		0.05		0.00		0.30		0.00
Texas SS Standards - Chapter 113	1	8211	31.22	2.28		0.10		0.05		0.07		0.05
Texas Character Education Curriculum	1	282	35.25	9.93		1.06		0.00		0.71		0.35
California History-Social Science Standards	1	4844	22.64	2.89		0.19		0.10		0.14		0.02
California Social Studies Framework	1	6974	23.02	3.14		0.37		0.11		0.17		0.06
						{.010, .770}		{-.009, .095}		{.040, .500}		{-.039, .219}
					05	IngroupVirtue	06	IngroupVice	07	AuthorityVirtue	08	AuthorityVice
PA Citizenship: Government Standards						2.48		0.71		1.42		0.07
PA Standards						1.72		1.20		0.49		0.11
Texas SS Standards - Chapter 113						0.77		0.49		0.46		0.00
Texas Character Education Curriculum						1.42		0.00		2.13		0.00
California History-Social Science Standards						0.85		0.47		0.56		0.02
California Social Studies Framework						0.65		0.63		0.79		0.09
						{.615, 2.025}		{.190, .970}		{.311, 1.649}		{.000, .096}
					09	PurityVirtue	10	PurityVice	11	MoralityGeneral		
PA Citizenship: Government Standards						0.07		0.00		1.56		
PA Standards						0.00		0.00		0.74		
Texas SS Standards - Chapter 113						0.02		0.00		0.27		
Texas Character Education Curriculum						0.00		0.00		4.26		
California History-Social Science Standards						0.04		0.00		0.50		
California Social Studies Framework						0.01		0.00		0.26		
						{-.004, .050}		{.000, .000}		{-.274, 2.814}		

Additionally, below is a chart that indicates a numerical count for the number of times the document analyzed scored the highest or the lowest in a specific foundation. It is broken down by state and by curriculum versus standards.

Curricula	Highest	Lowest	Total
TX Character	5	4	9
PA Standards	2	5	7
CA Framework	1	3	4
TX Standards	0	4	4
PA Citizenship	2	1	3
CA Standards	0	1	1

*All curricula were counted as “lowest” for PurityVirtue except PA Citizenship
 **PurityVice was not included in this table since all were 0.00

Section 2: Discussion of Findings

At the onset of this research project, I had made some predictions as to what I believed the results would reveal. I began the project with the assumption that California's curriculum and standards would score the highest in both the care/harm and fairness/cheating foundations, because those are the two foundations that Dr. Haidt contends liberals rely on heavily when making moral decisions. Furthermore, I hypothesized that Texas's curriculum and standards would score the highest in the loyalty/betrayal, authority/subversion and sanctity/degradation foundations, as those are the three foundations Dr. Haidt contends conservatives rely on heavily. Lastly, for Pennsylvania, I believed its curriculum and standards would be dispersed among all of the foundations and not rank highest or lowest in any of the categories. In actuality, the results I gathered had some alignment with my initial predictions, but the majority of the results gathered yielded deviations from my initial predictions.

For the authority foundation and the morality general foundation, Texas scored the highest. This was expected at the onset of this research, because Texas has historically had a very conservative legislature and respect for authority is a tenet of the conservative ideology. Additionally, California was the lowest in the loyalty foundation, and this again was expected because of California's historically liberal legislature. Through his moral foundations theory, Dr. Haidt argues that liberals tend to view loyalty as less significant than other foundations when making moral decisions. Both of these state's results align with the conclusions that I expected to reach at the culmination of this research project.

Comparatively, there were many conclusions drawn that were unexpected. The first was that Texas scored the highest in the care and fairness/cheating foundations. These are both foundations that Dr. Haidt argues liberals place great emphasis on, but conservatives do not.

Second, California was the highest in none of the foundations with the exception of harm. Third, there was 0.00 for all curricula and standards for the degradation category. A possible explanation for these results is that since the Enlightenment movement, there has been a definitive separation of church and state, especially for schools, so there is not much discussion of religion or purity in classrooms. Fourth, Pennsylvania's citizenship and government standards scored the highest percentage of words in more than one foundation, including loyalty/betrayal, subversion and sanctity, which are all conservative moral decision-making foundations. Lastly, California scored the lowest in the morality general foundation. These were all unexpected results in each of the foundations.

After taking the mean and one standard deviation for each foundation, a different set of results were shown other than just the highest and the lowest in each category. Because there were only six numerical values for each foundation, any data that is one standard deviation away from the mean would be considered unusual and worth highlighting. Again, Texas's character curriculum emerged as unusual in many foundations, including harm, fairness/cheating, authority, and morality general. This means that in all of these areas, Texas's curriculum referenced concepts within these foundations significantly more times than the other standards and curricula analyzed. Pennsylvania's standards also appeared many times as unusual by exceeding one standard deviation above the mean. This occurred in the loyalty/betrayal, subversion and purity foundations. As for California, the only really notable data came within the harm foundation. Both the California History-Social Science Standards and the California Social Studies Framework yielded percentages above one standard deviation from the mean.

As per each state, there were specific conclusions drawn as a result of the LIWC analysis. For Pennsylvania, the standards scored higher within the conservative morality foundations and

lower within the liberal morality foundations as based on Dr. Haidt's moral foundations theory. For Texas, there were significant discrepancies between the Texas character education curriculum and the Texas standards, with regard to infusion of morality per the moral foundations theory. Texas's character education consistently ranked highly in many of the foundations that were used for testing and scored the highest by almost three percent in the morality general foundation when compared to the other two states. The same was not true for Texas's social studies standards. Finally, for California, there was not much infusion of morality in the standards and framework analyzed. Both pieces scored very low on the morality general category, with only .50 and .26 percent, and both pieces did not reveal unusual data in many foundations. Lastly, California's standards and framework placed highest in the harm foundation and lowest in the loyalty foundation, which was anticipated before the thesis was tested.

Chapter 5: Conclusion

Section 1: Final Conclusions

This research project was intended to look at social studies curriculum and standards at a macro level and determine whether or not there are biases from the state legislatures that appear in the social studies standards and curriculum they create. This project focused specifically on biases with regard to moral decision-making and measured the biases with Dr. Jonathan Haidt's moral foundations framework. If this analysis revealed biases within the curriculum, the conclusion could be drawn that the state in which a student attends public school could determine the type of citizen they become with regard to moral decision-making.

After the gathering of results for this thesis research, it was concluded that in Pennsylvania, the conservative legislature has had a significant impact on the foundations emphasized within the social studies standards. The same is true for Texas's character education curriculum. The results also revealed that within the social studies framework and standards from California, there is not much emphasis placed on certain foundations, even the more liberal foundations. A potential explanation for this could be that because California relies heavily on professionals within each of the fields to create the curriculum and standards, the legislature does not actually play a significant role in the creation of the standards and curricula for the state; hence, many of the ideological biases that were expected to be seen were not actually present. Ultimately, Pennsylvania was the only state that revealed consistent conservative biases within its standards; therefore, it was not able to be determined for all three states that there are definitive ideological leanings evident in the curricula and standards that correlate with the state legislature's ideologies as initially predicted. In reaching this conclusion however, there is now

further support for the notion that teachers and their interpretation of the curriculum is very influential in the creation of future citizens.

Section 2: Recommendations for Future Research

For future research, the first avenue that could be taken would be to actually visit social studies classrooms in Pennsylvania school districts and have the students take the moral foundations quiz before and after the completion of a civics and government course. The researcher could then compare the student's quiz results and determine whether or not his/her ideological preference for any of the foundations shifted as a result of taking the course with the mandated curriculum and standards. It would be expected that students in Pennsylvania social studies classrooms should be more inclined to value the conservative foundations, loyalty, authority and sanctity, more so than when they enter the course. This conclusion would align with the foundational preferences determined at the macro level.

Another area of study for future research would involve the significant discrepancies between the Texas character education curriculum and the Texas social studies standards. Per Haidt's moral foundations dictionary, Texas's character education curriculum revealed much higher levels of moral infusion than Texas's social studies standards and this research project was not able to determine its cause. A future research project could delve into who is actually creating the curricula and standards and if they both have the same creators, then determine why there are discrepancies in the reference of foundational elements of moral decision-making.

No matter which course of future research one decides to pursue from this thesis research, it is clear that it will involve physically visiting school districts from the various states and testing whether or not the results determined at the macro level are actually being seen at the micro level once the teacher's discretion of curriculum interpretation is taken into account.

References

- American Council of Trustees and Alumni. (2016). *A crisis in civic education*. Retrieved from https://www.goacta.org/images/download/A_Crisis_in_Civic_Education.pdf
- Brimi, H. (2009). Academic instructors or moral guides? Moral education in America and the teacher's dilemma. *Clearing House*, 82(3), 125-130. doi:10.3200/TCHS.82.3.125-130
- Byrd, D. (2012). Social studies education as a moral activity: Teaching towards a just society. *Educational Philosophy And Theory*, 44(10), 1073-1079.
- Campbell, S. E., Heath, B. E., Ingrao, M., & Middleton, T. L. (2012). California teachers and social studies: A survey report on approaches to curriculum and instruction. *Social Studies Review*, 51(1), 120-123.
- Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. (2017). *State board of education*. Retrieved from <http://www.stateboard.education.pa.gov/Pages/default.aspx>.
- Godsay, S., Henderson, W., Levine, P., Littenberg-Tobias, J., & CIRCLE (The Center for Information and Research on Civic Learning). (2012). State Civic Education Requirements. CIRCLE Fact Sheet.
- Gould, J. (ed). (2003). *Guardian of democracy: The civic mission of schools*. Retrieved from <http://civicmission.s3.amazonaws.com/118/f0/5/171/1/Guardian-of-Democracy-report.pdf>
- Haidt, J. (2012). *The righteous mind: Why good people are divided by politics and religion*. New York: Vintage Books.
- Hart, G. K., & Brownell, N. S. (2001). An era of educational accountability in California. *Clearing House*, 74(4), 183-186. doi:10.1080/00098650109599187

Howard, R. W. (2005). Preparing moral educators in an era of standards-based reform.

Teacher Education Quarterly, 32(4), 43-58.

Journell, W. (2010). Standardizing citizenship: The potential influence of state curriculum standards on the civic development of adolescents. *PS: Political Science And Politics*, 43(2), 351-358.

Kelly-Woessner, A. (2015). *How Marcuse made today's students less tolerant than their parents.*

Retrieved from <http://heterodoxacademy.org/2015/09/23/how-marcuse-made-todays-students-less-tolerant-than-their-parents/>

Kelly-Woessner, A. (2016). *Trade protectionism in the marketplace of ideas.* Retrieved from

<http://heterodoxacademy.org/2016/05/18/trade-protectionism-in-the-marketplace-of-ideas/>

Kelly-Woessner, A. (2017). The silencing of generation [PowerPoint slides].

Leedy, P. D. & Ormrod, J. E. (2013). *Practical research: Planning and design, 10th edition.* New York: Pearson Education, Inc.

Lin, A. (2015). Citizenship education in American schools and its role in developing civic engagement: A review of the research. *Educational Review*, 67(1), 35-63.

doi:10.1080/00131911.2013.813440

National Center for Education Statistics. (2011). *The nation's report card: Civics 2010.*

Retrieved from <https://nces.ed.gov/nationsreportcard/pdf/main2010/2011466.pdf>

Newseum Institute. (2015). *The 2015 state of the first amendment.* Retrieved from

http://www.newseuminstitute.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/FAC_SOFA15_report.pdf

Pennebaker, J.W., Booth, R.J., Boyd, R.L., & Francis, M.E. (2015). Linguistic inquiry and word count: LIWC2015. Austin, TX: Pennebaker Conglomerates (www.LIWC.net).

- Pritchard, I. (2001). The American standards for citizenship: Do they include morality? *International Journal of Social Education*, 16(1), 94-108.
- Sanchez, T. R. (2004). Facing the challenge of character education. *International Journal Of Social Education*, 19(2), 106-113.
- Smith, N. (2012). Directing curriculum through standards: A content analysis of the 2010 Texas state social studies standards. *ProQuest LLC*
- Sniderman, P. (1975). *Personality and democratic politics*. Berkley, CA: University of California Press
- Stetson, E. G. (1996). *Current Trends in State Curriculum Reform: A Comparison of Two Opposing National Models*.
- Strunc, A., & King, K. (2013). Citizenship education in Texas. *American Educational History Journal*, 40(1/2), 141-151.
- Stuteville, R., & Johnson, H. I. (2016). Citizenship education in the United States: Perspective reflected in state education standards. *Administrative Issues Journal: Education, Practice, And Research*, 6(1), 99-117.
- Van den berg, R. G. (2015). *SPSS tutorials*. Retrieved from <https://www.spss-tutorials.com/spss-what-is-it/>
- Wolf, T. (2016). *Pennsylvania department of education: Social studies*. Retrieved from <http://www.education.pa.gov/Teachers%20-%20Administrators/Curriculum/Pages/Social-Studies.aspx#tab-1>.
- YourMorals.org collaboration. (2016). *Moral foundations theory*. Retrieved from moralfoundations.org

Appendices

Appendix 1: Pennsylvania Citizenship and Government Standards/ PA Standards

TopLevel	Description
	Civics and Government
	Principles and Documents of Government
	GRADE 9
	Apply examples of the rule of law as related to individual rights and the common good.
	Analyze the major arguments advanced for different systems of government.
	Analyze the principles and ideals that shape United States government. Liberty / Freedom Democracy Justice Equality
	Compare and contrast the basic principles and ideals found in significant documents: Declaration of Independence United States Constitution Bill of Rights Pennsylvania Constitution
	Demonstrate an understanding of how the PA Constitution and the US Constitution co-exist.
	Analyze the role political symbols play in civil disobedience and patriotic activities.
	GRADE 12
	Analyze the sources, purposes, functions of law, and how the rule of law protects individual rights and promotes the common good.
	Employ historical examples and political philosophy to evaluate the major arguments advanced for the necessity of government.
	Evaluate the application of the principles and ideals in contemporary civic life. Liberty / Freedom Democracy Justice Equality
	Evaluate state and federal powers based on significant documents and other critical sources. Declaration of Independence United States Constitution Bill of Rights Pennsylvania Constitution
	Analyze and assess the rights of people as written in the PA Constitution and the US Constitution.
	Evaluate the role of nationalism in uniting and dividing citizens.
	CIVICS & GOVERNMENT
	Analyze the sources, purposes, functions of law, and how the rule of law protects individual rights and promotes the common good.
	Employ historical examples and political philosophy to evaluate the major arguments advanced for the necessity of government.
	Evaluate the application of the principles and ideals in contemporary civic life. Liberty / Freedom Democracy Justice Equality
	Evaluate state and federal powers based on significant documents and other critical sources. Declaration of Independence United States Constitution Bill of Rights Pennsylvania Constitution
	Analyze and assess the rights of people as written in the PA Constitution and the US Constitution.
	Analyze the role political symbols play in civil disobedience and patriotic activities.
	US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT
	Apply examples of the rule of law as related to individual rights and the common good.
	Analyze the principles and ideals that shape United States government. Liberty / Freedom Democracy Justice Equality
	Compare and contrast the basic principles and ideals found in significant documents: Declaration of Independence United States Constitution Bill of Rights Pennsylvania Constitution
	Analyze the role political symbols play in civil disobedience and patriotic activities.
	Rights and Responsibilities of Citizenship
	GRADE 9
	Contrast the rights and responsibilities of a citizen in a democracy with a citizen in an authoritarian system.
	Analyze strategies used to resolve conflicts in society and government.
	Examine political leadership and public service in a republican form of government.
	Analyze citizens' roles in the political process toward the attainment of goals for individual and public good.
	GRADE 12
	Evaluate an individual's civil rights, responsibilities and obligations in various contemporary governments.
	Examine the causes of conflicts in society and evaluate techniques to address those conflicts.
	Evaluate political leadership and public service in a republican form of government.
	Evaluate and demonstrate what makes competent and responsible citizens.
	CIVICS & GOVERNMENT
	Contrast the rights and responsibilities of a citizen in a democracy with a citizen in an authoritarian system.
	Analyze strategies used to resolve conflicts in society and government.
	Evaluate political leadership and public service in a republican form of government.
	Evaluate and demonstrate what makes competent and responsible citizens.
	US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT
	Contrast the rights and responsibilities of a citizen in a democracy with a citizen in an authoritarian system.
	Analyze strategies used to resolve conflicts in society and government.
	Examine political leadership and public service in a republican form of government.
	Evaluate and demonstrate what makes competent and responsible citizens.
	How Government Works
	GRADE 9
	Examine the process of checks and balances among the three branches of government, including the creation of law.
	Analyze the roles of local, state, and national governments in policy-making.
	Explain how government agencies create, amend and enforce policies in local, state, and national governments.
	Explain how citizens participate in choosing their leaders through political parties, campaigns, and elections.
	Compare and contrast the different election processes for local, state, and national offices.
	Explain the Supreme Court's role in interpreting the U.S. Constitution. Individual rights States' rights Civil rights
	Analyze the influence of interest groups in the political process.
	Evaluate the importance of freedom of the press and the political influence of mass media.
	Explain various types of taxes and their purposes.
	Compare and contrast various systems of government.
	GRADE 12
	Analyze the changes in power and authority among the three branches of government over time.
	Compare and contrast policy-making in various contemporary world governments.
	Evaluate how government agencies create, amend, and enforce regulations.
	Evaluate the roles of political parties, interest groups, and mass media in politics and public policy.
	Evaluate the fairness and effectiveness of the United States electoral processes, including the electoral college.
	Analyze landmark United States Supreme Court interpretations of the Constitution and its Amendments.
	Evaluate the impact of interest groups in developing public policy.
	Evaluate the role of mass media in setting public agenda and influencing political life.
	Evaluate tax policies of various states and countries.
	Evaluate critical issues in various contemporary governments.

CIVICS & GOVERNMENT

Examine the process of checks and balances among the three branches of government, including the creation of law.

Analyze the roles of local, state, and national governments in policy-making.

Explain how government agencies create, amend, and enforce policies in local, state, and national governments.

Evaluate the roles of political parties, interest groups, and mass media in politics and public policy.

Compare and contrast the different election processes for local, state, and national offices.

Explain the Supreme Court's role in interpreting the U.S. Constitution. Individual rights States' rights Civil rights

Analyze the influence of interest groups in the political process.

Evaluate the role of mass media in setting public agenda and influencing political life.

Explain various types of taxes and their purposes.

US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT

Evaluate the roles of political parties, interest groups, and mass media in politics and public policy.

Analyze landmark United States Supreme Court interpretations of the Constitution and its Amendments.

How International Relationships Function

GRADE 9

Explain how United States foreign policy is developed.

Explain why and how different foreign policy tools are used to advance a nation's self interest (e.g., diplomacy, economic aid, military aid, sanctions, treaties).

Identify the role of international organizations.

Analyze the various mass media outlets and their influence on global issues.

Identify the politics of interest groups (e.g. business and labor organizations, ethnic and religious organizations) on foreign policy.

GRADE 12

Examine foreign policy perspectives, including realism, idealism, and liberalism.

Evaluate the effectiveness of foreign policy tools in various current issues confronting the United States (e.g., diplomacy, economic aid, military aid, sanctions, treaties).

Evaluate the effectiveness of international organizations, both governmental and non-governmental.

Evaluate the role of mass media in world politics.

Compare and contrast the politics of various interest groups and evaluate their impact on foreign policy.

CIVICS & GOVERNMENT

Explain how United States foreign policy is developed.

Explain why and how different foreign policy tools are used to advance a nation's self interest (e.g., diplomacy, economic aid, military aid, sanctions, treaties).

US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT

Explain how United States foreign policy is developed.

Economics

Scarcity and Choice

GRADE 9

Analyze how choices are made because of scarcity.

Identify the origin of resources and analyze the impact on the production of goods and services. Analyze how unlimited wants and limited resources affect decision making.

Explain the opportunity cost associated with government policies.

Explain how incentives cause people to change their behavior in predictable ways.

GRADE 12

Predict the long-term consequences of decisions made because of scarcity.

Evaluate the economic reasoning behind a choice. Evaluate effective allocation of resources for the production of goods and services.

Analyze the opportunity cost of decisions made by individuals, businesses, communities, and nations.

Predict how changes in incentives may affect the choices made by individuals, businesses, communities, and nations.

CIVICS & GOVERNMENT

Predict the long-term consequences of decisions made because of scarcity.

Evaluate the economic reasoning behind a choice.

Explain the opportunity cost associated with government policies.

US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT

Analyze how choices are made because of scarcity.

Analyze how conflict and cooperation among groups and organizations have impacted the control of limited resources in the United States.

Analyze the opportunity cost of decisions made by individuals, businesses, communities, and nations.

Markets and Economic Systems

GRADE 9

Analyze the flow of goods and services in the national economy.

Explain how competition between buyers and sellers affects price.

Analyze how media affects economic decisions.

Explain the laws of supply and demand and how these affect the prices of goods and services.

Analyze the characteristics of economic expansion, recession, and depression.

Analyze the functions of private economic functions the national economy.

Compare and contrast various economic systems.

GRADE 12

Evaluate the flow of goods and services in an international economy.

Analyze the effect of changes in the level of competition in different markets.

Predict and evaluate how media affects markets.

Predict how changes in supply and demand affect equilibrium price and quantity sold.

Evaluate the health of an economy (local, regional, national, global) using economic indicators.

Evaluate the impact of private economic institutions on the individual, the national and the international economy.

Evaluate various economic systems.

CIVICS & GOVERNMENT

Analyze the flow of goods and services in the national economy.
 Analyze how media affects economic decisions.
 Analyze the characteristics of economic expansion, recession, and depression.
 Compare and contrast various economic systems.

US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT

Analyze the flow of goods and services in the national economy.
 Evaluate the impact of advertising and media on individual and group behavior throughout United States history.
 Explain how the laws of supply and demand impacted individuals and groups behavior over time.
 Analyze the impact of the business cycle on individual and group behavior over time. Analyze the characteristics of economic expansion, recession, and depression.
 Analyze the impact of private economic institutions on individuals and groups over time.
 Compare and contrast various economic systems.

Functions of Government

GRADE 9

Analyze the process through which government provides public goods and services.
 Examine how and why the government acts to regulate and stabilize the state and national economy.
 Compare and contrast the taxation policies of the local, state, and national governments.
 Explain why governments limit or promote international trade.

GRADE 12

Evaluate the costs and benefits of government decisions to provide public goods and services.
 Assess the government's role in regulating and stabilizing the state and national economy.
 Evaluate the social, political, and economic costs/benefits of potential changes to taxation policies.
 Evaluate the role that governments play in international trade.

CIVICS & GOVERNMENT

Evaluate the costs and benefits of government decisions to provide public goods and services.
 Assess the government's role in regulating and stabilizing the state and national economy.
 Evaluate the social, political, and economic costs/benefits of potential changes to taxation policies.
 Explain why governments limit or promote international trade.

US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT

Analyze how conflict and cooperation among groups and organizations have impacted the growth and development of the U.S. Ethnicity and Race Working conditions Immigration Military conflict Economic Stability
 Compare and contrast the taxation policies of the local, state, and national governments.
 Analyze how conflict and cooperation among groups and organizations have impacted the growth and development of the U.S. Ethnicity and Race Working conditions Immigration Military conflict Economic Stability (Reference History Standards 8.3.9.)
 Economic Interdependence

GRADE 9

Explain how specialization contributes to economic interdependence on a national and international level.
 Explain how trade contributes to economic interdependence.
 Explain the scope and influence of multinational corporations and other non-government organizations.
 Explain how the level of development of transportation, communication networks, and technology affect economic interdependence.

GRADE 12

Evaluate the comparative advantage of nations in the production of goods and services.
 Assess the growth and impact of international trade around the world.
 Evaluate the impact of multinational corporations and other non-government organizations.
 Analyze how changes in transportation, communication networks, and technology affect economic interdependence around the world in the 21st century.

CIVICS & GOVERNMENT

Explain how specialization contributes to economic interdependence on a national and international level.
 Evaluate the impact of multinational corporations and other non-government organizations.

US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT

Explain how specialization contributes to economic interdependence on a national and international level.
 Compare the role groups and individuals played in the social, political, cultural, and economic development of the U.S. (Reference History Standards 8.3.9.A.)
 Explain how the level of development of transportation, communication networks, and technology affect economic interdependence.

Income, Profit, and Wealth

GRADE 9

Define wages and explain how wages are determined in terms of supply and demand.
 Describe how productivity is measured and identify ways in which a person can improve his or her productivity.
 Identify and explain the characteristics of sole proprietorship, partnership, and corporation.

Analyze how risks influence business decision-making.

Define wealth and describe its distribution within and among the political divisions of the United States.
 Examine leading entrepreneurs in Pennsylvania and the United States in terms of the risks they took and the rewards they received.
 Compare and contrast the various financial tools available to savers.

Explain the impact of higher or lower interest rates for savers, borrowers, consumers, and producers.

GRADE 12

Analyze the factors influencing wages.
 Evaluate how changes in education, incentives, technology, and capital investment alter productivity.
 Analyze the costs and benefits of organizing a business as a sole proprietorship, partnership, or corporation.
 Analyze the role of profits and losses in the allocation of resources in a market economy.

Compare distribution of wealth across nations.

Assess the impact of entrepreneurs on the economy.
 Analyze the risks and returns of various investments.
 Evaluate benefits and costs of changes in interest rates for individuals and society.

CIVICS & GOVERNMENT

US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT

Compare the role groups and individuals played in the social, political, cultural, and economic development of the U.S. (Reference History Standards 8.3.9.A.)
 Define wealth and describe its distribution within and among the political divisions of the United States.

Examine leading entrepreneurs in the United States in terms of the risks they took and the rewards they received.

History

Historical Analysis and Skills Development

GRADE 9

Compare patterns of continuity and change over time, applying context of events.
 Compare the interpretation of historical events and sources, considering the use of fact versus opinion, multiple perspectives, and cause and effect relationships.
 Construct research on a historical topic using a thesis statement and demonstrate use of appropriate primary and secondary sources. (Reference RWSL Standard 1.8.8 Research)

GRADE 12

Evaluate patterns of continuity and rates of change over time, applying context of events.
 Evaluate the interpretation of historical events and sources, considering the use of fact versus opinion, multiple perspectives, and cause and effect relationships.
 Analyze, synthesize, and integrate historical data, creating a product that supports and appropriately illustrates inferences and conclusions drawn from research. (Reference RWSL Standard 1.8.11 Research)

CIVICS & GOVERNMENT

Analyze the major arguments advanced for different systems of government. (Reference Civics and Government Standard 5.1.9.B.)

US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT

Evaluate patterns of continuity and change over time, applying context of events.
 Evaluate the interpretation of historical events and sources, considering the use of fact versus opinion, multiple perspectives, and cause and effect relationships.
 Analyze, synthesize and integrate historical data, creating a product that supports and appropriately illustrates inferences and conclusions drawn from research. (Reference RWSL Standard 1.8.11 Research)

Pennsylvania History

GRADE 9

Contrast the role groups and individuals from Pennsylvania played in the social, political, cultural, and economic development of the U.S.
 Compare the impact of historical documents, artifacts, and places in Pennsylvania which are critical to U.S. history.
 Compare and contrast how continuity and change in Pennsylvania are interrelated throughout U.S. history. Belief systems and religions Commerce and industry Technology Politics and government Physical and human geography Social organizations
 Interpret how conflict and cooperation among groups and organizations in Pennsylvania have influenced the growth and development of the U.S. Ethnicity and race Working conditions Immigration Military conflict Economic stability

GRADE 12

Evaluate the role groups and individuals from Pennsylvania played in the social, political, cultural, and economic development of the US and the world.
 Evaluate the impact of historical documents, artifacts, and places in Pennsylvania which are critical to U.S. history and the world.
 Evaluate continuity and change in Pennsylvania are interrelated to the US and the world. Belief systems and religions Commerce and industry Technology Politics and government Physical and human geography Social organizations
 Evaluate how conflict and cooperation among groups and organizations in Pennsylvania have influenced the growth and development of the US and the world. Ethnicity and race Working conditions Immigration Military conflict Economic stability

CIVICS & GOVERNMENT

Demonstrate an understanding of how the PA Constitution and the US Constitution co-exist. (Reference Civics and Government Standard 5.1.9.E.)
 Compare and contrast the basic principles and ideals found in significant documents: Pennsylvania Constitution (Reference Civics and Government Standard 5.1.9.D.)

US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT

Evaluate the role groups and individuals from Pennsylvania played in the social, political, cultural, and economic development of the U.S.

Evaluate the importance of various historical documents, artifacts, and places in Pennsylvania which are critical to U.S.
 Evaluate continuity and change in Pennsylvania are interrelated to the U.S. Belief systems and religions Commerce and industry Technology Politics and government Physical and human geography Social organizations
 Evaluate how conflict and cooperation among groups and organizations in Pennsylvania have influenced the growth and development of the U.S. Ethnicity and race Working conditions Immigration Military conflict Economic stability
 United States History
 GRADE 9
 Compare the role groups and individuals played in the social, political, cultural, and economic development of the U.S.
 Compare the impact of historical documents, artifacts, and places which are critical to the U.S.
 Analyze how continuity and change have impacted the United States. Belief systems and religions Commerce and industry Technology Politics and government Physical and human geography Social organizations
 Interpret how conflict and cooperation among groups and organizations have impacted the growth and development of the U.S. Ethnicity and race Working conditions Immigration Military conflict Economic stability
 GRADE 12
 Evaluate the role groups and individuals from the U.S. played in the social, political, cultural, and economic development of the world.
 Evaluate the impact of historical documents, artifacts, and places in U.S. history which are critical to world history.
 Evaluate how continuity and change in U.S. history are interrelated with the world. Belief systems and religions Commerce and industry Technology Politics and government Physical and human geography Social organizations
 Evaluate how conflict and cooperation among groups and organizations in the U.S. have influenced the growth and development of the world. Ethnicity and race Working conditions Immigration Military conflict Economic stability
 CIVICS & GOVERNMENT
 Compare and contrast the politics of various interest groups and evaluate their impact on foreign policy. (Reference Civics and Government Standard 5.4.12.E.)
 Compare and contrast the basic principles and ideals found in significant documents: Declaration of Independence United States Constitution Bill of Rights (Reference Civics and Government Standard 5.1.9.D.)
 Analyze the principles and ideals that shape United States government. Liberty / Freedom Democracy & Justice Equality (Reference Civics and Government Standard 5.1.9.C.)
 Analyze the role political symbols play in civil disobedience and patriotic activities. (Reference Civics and Government standard 5.1.9.F.)
 US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT
 Compare the role groups and individuals played in the social, political, cultural, and economic development of the U.S.
 Compare the impact of historical documents, artifacts, and places which are critical to the U.S.
 Evaluate how continuity and change have impacted the United States. Belief systems and religions Commerce and industry Technology Politics and government Physical and human geography Social organizations
 Evaluate how conflict and cooperation among groups and organizations have influenced the growth and development of the U.S. Ethnicity and race Working conditions Immigration Military conflict Economic stability
 World History
 GRADE 9
 Compare the role groups and individuals played in the social, political, cultural, and economic development throughout world history.
 Contrast the importance of historical documents, artifacts, and sites which are critical to world history.
 Analyze how continuity and change have impacted world history. Belief systems and religions Commerce and industry Technology & Politics and government Physical and human geography Social organization
 Analyze how conflict and cooperation among groups and organizations have influenced the history and development of the world.
 GRADE 12
 Evaluate the role groups and individuals played in the social, political, cultural, and economic development throughout world history.
 Evaluate the importance of historical documents, artifacts, and sites which are critical to world history.
 Evaluate how continuity and change have impacted the world today. Belief systems and religions Commerce and industry Technology Politics and government Physical and human geography Social organization
 Evaluate how conflict and cooperation among groups and organizations have impacted the development of the world today, including its effects on Pennsylvania.
 CIVICS & GOVERNMENT
 Evaluate critical issues in various contemporary governments. (Reference Civics and Government Standard 5.3.12.J.) Evaluate the effectiveness of various international organizations, both governmental and non-governmental. (Reference Civics and Government Standard 5.4.12.C.)
 Compare and contrast the basic principles and ideals found in significant documents: Declaration of Independence United States Constitution (Reference Civics and Government Standard 5.1.9.D.)
 Evaluate critical issues in various contemporary governments. (Reference Civics and Government standard 5.3.12.J.) Employ historical examples and political philosophy to evaluate major arguments advanced for the necessity of government. (Reference Civics and Government Standard 5.1.12.B)
 Analyze strategies used to resolve conflicts in society and government. (Reference Civics and Government Standards 5.2.9.B.) Evaluate the role of nationalism in uniting and dividing citizens. (Reference Civics and Government Standards: 5.1.12.F.)
 US HISTORY 1850-PRESENT

Appendix 2: Texas Social Studies Standards – Chapter 113**§113.41. United States History Studies Since 1877 (One Credit), Beginning with School Year 2011-2012.**

(a) General requirements. Students shall be awarded one unit of credit for successful completion of this course.

(b) Introduction.

(1) In United States History Studies Since 1877, which is the second part of a two-year study that begins in Grade 8, students study the history of the United States from 1877 to the present. The course content is based on the founding documents of the U.S. government, which provide a framework for its heritage. Historical content focuses on the political, economic, and social events and issues related to industrialization and urbanization, major wars, domestic and foreign policies, and reform movements, including civil rights. Students examine the impact of geographic factors on major events and eras and analyze their causes and effects. Students examine the impact of constitutional issues on American society, evaluate the dynamic relationship of the three branches of the federal government, and analyze efforts to expand the democratic process. Students describe the relationship between the arts and popular culture and the times during which they were created. Students analyze the impact of technological innovations on American life. Students use critical-thinking skills and a variety of primary and secondary source material to explain and apply different methods that historians use to understand and interpret the past, including multiple points of view and historical context.

(2) To support the teaching of the essential knowledge and skills, the use of a variety of rich primary and secondary source material such as biographies, autobiographies, landmark cases of the U.S. Supreme Court, novels, speeches, letters, diaries, poetry, songs, and artworks is encouraged. Motivating resources are available from museums, historical sites, presidential libraries, and local and state preservation societies.

(3) The eight strands of the essential knowledge and skills for social studies are intended to be integrated for instructional purposes. Skills listed in the social studies skills strand in subsection (c) of this section should be incorporated into the teaching of all essential knowledge and skills for social studies. A greater depth of understanding of complex content material can be attained when integrated social studies content from the various disciplines and critical-thinking skills are taught together. Statements that contain the word "including" reference content that must be mastered, while those containing the phrase "such as" are intended as possible illustrative examples.

(4) Students identify the role of the U.S. free enterprise system within the parameters of this course and understand that this system may also be referenced as capitalism or the free market system.

(5) Throughout social studies in Kindergarten-Grade 12, students build a foundation in history; geography; economics; government; citizenship; culture; science, technology, and society; and social studies skills. The content, as appropriate for the grade level or course, enables students to understand the importance of patriotism, function in a free enterprise society, and appreciate the basic democratic values of our state and nation as referenced in the Texas Education Code (TEC), §28.002(h).

(6) Students understand that a constitutional republic is a representative form of government whose representatives derive their authority from the consent of the governed, serve for an established tenure, and are sworn to uphold the constitution.

(7) State and federal laws mandate a variety of celebrations and observances, including Celebrate Freedom Week.

(A) Each social studies class shall include, during Celebrate Freedom Week as provided under the TEC, §29.907, or during another full school week as determined by the board of trustees of a school district, appropriate instruction concerning the intent, meaning, and importance of the Declaration of Independence and the U.S. Constitution, including the Bill of Rights, in their historical contexts. The study of the Declaration of Independence must include the study of the relationship of the ideas expressed in that document to subsequent American history, including the relationship of its ideas to the rich diversity of our people as a nation of immigrants, the American Revolution, the formulation of the U.S. Constitution, and the abolitionist movement, which led to the Emancipation Proclamation and the women's suffrage movement.

(B) Each school district shall require that, during Celebrate Freedom Week or other week of instruction prescribed under subparagraph (A) of this paragraph, students in Grades 3-12 study and recite the following text: "We hold these Truths to be self-evident, that all Men are created equal, that they are endowed by their Creator with certain unalienable Rights, that among these are Life, Liberty and the Pursuit of Happiness--That to secure these Rights, Governments are instituted among Men, deriving their just Powers from the Consent of the Governed."

(8) Students identify and discuss how the actions of U.S. citizens and the local, state, and federal governments have either met or failed to meet the ideals espoused in the founding documents.

(c) Knowledge and skills.

(1) History. The student understands the principles included in the Celebrate Freedom Week program. The student is expected to:

(A) analyze and evaluate the text, intent, meaning, and importance of the Declaration of Independence and the U.S. Constitution, including the Bill of Rights, and identify the full text of the first three paragraphs of the Declaration of Independence;

(B) analyze and evaluate the application of these founding principles to historical events in U.S. history; and

(C) explain the contributions of the Founding Fathers such as Benjamin Rush, John Hancock, John Jay, John Witherspoon, John Peter Muhlenberg, Charles Carroll, and Jonathan Trumbull Sr.

(2) History. The student understands traditional historical points of reference in U.S. history from 1877 to the present. The student is expected to:

(A) identify the major characteristics that define an historical era;

(B) identify the major eras in U.S. history from 1877 to the present and describe their defining characteristics;

(C) apply absolute and relative chronology through the sequencing of significant individuals, events, and time periods; and

(D) explain the significance of the following years as turning points: 1898 (Spanish-American War), 1914-1918 (World War I), 1929 (the Great Depression begins), 1939-1945 (World War II), 1957 (Sputnik launch ignites U.S.-Soviet space race), 1968-1969 (Martin Luther King Jr. assassination and U.S. lands on the moon), 1991 (Cold War ends), 2001 (terrorist attacks on World Trade Center and the Pentagon), and 2008 (election of first black president, Barack Obama).

(3) History. The student understands the political, economic, and social changes in the United States from 1877 to 1898. The student is expected to:

(A) analyze political issues such as Indian policies, the growth of political machines, civil service reform, and the beginnings of Populism;

(B) analyze economic issues such as industrialization, the growth of railroads, the growth of labor unions, farm issues, the cattle industry boom, the rise of entrepreneurship, free enterprise, and the pros and cons of big business;

(C) analyze social issues affecting women, minorities, children, immigrants, urbanization, the Social Gospel, and philanthropy of industrialists; and

(D) describe the optimism of the many immigrants who sought a better life in America.

(4) History. The student understands the emergence of the United States as a world power between 1898 and 1920. The student is expected to:

(A) explain why significant events, policies, and individuals such as the Spanish-American War, U.S. expansionism, Henry Cabot Lodge, Alfred Thayer Mahan, Theodore Roosevelt, Sanford B. Dole, and missionaries moved the United States into the position of a world power;

(B) evaluate American expansionism, including acquisitions such as Guam, Hawaii, the Philippines, and Puerto Rico;

(C) identify the causes of World War I and reasons for U.S. entry;

(D) understand the contributions of the American Expeditionary Forces (AEF) led by General John J. Pershing;

(E) analyze the impact of significant technological innovations in World War I such as machine guns, airplanes, tanks, poison gas, and trench warfare that resulted in the stalemate on the Western Front;

(F) analyze major issues such as isolationism and neutrality raised by U.S. involvement in World War I, Woodrow Wilson's Fourteen Points, and the Treaty of Versailles; and

(G) analyze significant events such as the Battle of Argonne Forest.

(5) History. The student understands the effects of reform and third-party movements in the early 20th century. The student is expected to:

(A) evaluate the impact of Progressive Era reforms, including initiative, referendum, recall, and the passage of the 16th, 17th, 18th, and 19th amendments;

(B) evaluate the impact of muckrakers and reform leaders such as Upton Sinclair, Susan B. Anthony, Ida B. Wells, and W. E. B. DuBois on American society; and

(C) evaluate the impact of third parties, including the Populist and Progressive parties.

(6) History. The student understands significant events, social issues, and individuals of the 1920s. The student is expected to:

(A) analyze causes and effects of events and social issues such as immigration, Social Darwinism, eugenics, race relations, nativism, the Red Scare, Prohibition, and the changing role of women; and

(B) analyze the impact of significant individuals such as Clarence Darrow, William Jennings Bryan, Henry Ford, Glenn Curtiss, Marcus Garvey, and Charles A. Lindbergh.

(7) History. The student understands the domestic and international impact of U.S. participation in World War II. The student is expected to:

(A) identify reasons for U.S. involvement in World War II, including Italian, German, and Japanese dictatorships and their aggression, especially the attack on Pearl Harbor;

(B) evaluate the domestic and international leadership of Franklin D. Roosevelt and Harry Truman during World War II, including the U.S. relationship with its allies and domestic industry's rapid mobilization for the war effort;

(C) analyze the function of the U.S. Office of War Information;

(D) analyze major issues of World War II, including the Holocaust; the internment of German, Italian, and Japanese Americans and Executive Order 9066; and the development of conventional and atomic weapons;

(E) analyze major military events of World War II, including the Battle of Midway, the U.S. military advancement through the Pacific Islands, the Bataan Death March, the invasion of Normandy, fighting the war on multiple fronts, and the liberation of concentration camps;

(F) evaluate the military contributions of leaders during World War II, including Omar Bradley, Dwight Eisenhower, Douglas MacArthur, Chester A. Nimitz, George Marshall, and George Patton; and

(G) explain the home front and how American patriotism inspired exceptional actions by citizens and military personnel, including high levels of military enlistment; volunteerism; the purchase of war bonds; Victory Gardens; the bravery and contributions of the Tuskegee Airmen, the Flying Tigers, and the Navajo Code Talkers; and opportunities and obstacles for women and ethnic minorities.

(8) History. The student understands the impact of significant national and international decisions and conflicts in the Cold War on the United States. The student is expected to:

(A) describe U.S. responses to Soviet aggression after World War II, including the Truman Doctrine, the Marshall Plan, the North Atlantic Treaty Organization, the Berlin airlift, and John F. Kennedy's role in the Cuban Missile Crisis;

(B) describe how Cold War tensions were intensified by the arms race, the space race, McCarthyism, and the House Un-American Activities Committee (HUAC), the findings of which were confirmed by the Venona Papers;

(C) explain reasons and outcomes for U.S. involvement in the Korean War and its relationship to the containment policy;

(D) explain reasons and outcomes for U.S. involvement in foreign countries and their relationship to the Domino Theory, including the Vietnam War;

(E) analyze the major issues and events of the Vietnam War such as the Tet Offensive, the escalation of forces, Vietnamization, and the fall of Saigon; and

(F) describe the responses to the Vietnam War such as the draft, the 26th Amendment, the role of the media, the credibility gap, the silent majority, and the anti-war movement.

(9) History. The student understands the impact of the American civil rights movement. The student is expected to:

(A) trace the historical development of the civil rights movement in the 19th, 20th, and 21st centuries, including the 13th, 14th, 15th, and 19th amendments;

(B) describe the roles of political organizations that promoted civil rights, including ones from African American, Chicano, American Indian, women's, and other civil rights movements;

(C) identify the roles of significant leaders who supported various rights movements, including Martin Luther King Jr., Cesar Chavez, Rosa Parks, Hector P. Garcia, and Betty Friedan;

(D) compare and contrast the approach taken by some civil rights groups such as the Black Panthers with the nonviolent approach of Martin Luther King Jr.;

(E) discuss the impact of the writings of Martin Luther King Jr. such as his "I Have a Dream" speech and "Letter from Birmingham Jail" on the civil rights movement;

(F) describe presidential actions and congressional votes to address minority rights in the United States, including desegregation of the armed forces, the Civil Rights acts of 1957 and 1964, and the Voting Rights Act of 1965;

(G) describe the role of individuals such as governors George Wallace, Orval Faubus, and Lester Maddox and groups, including the Congressional bloc of southern Democrats, that sought to maintain the status quo;

(H) evaluate changes and events in the United States that have resulted from the civil rights movement, including increased participation of minorities in the political process; and

(I) describe how litigation such as the landmark cases of *Brown v. Board of Education*, *Mendez v. Westminster*, *Hernandez v. Texas*, *Delgado v. Bastrop I.S.D.*, *Edgewood I.S.D. v. Kirby*, and *Sweatt v. Painter* played a role in protecting the rights of the minority during the civil rights movement.

(10) History. The student understands the impact of political, economic, and social factors in the U.S. role in the world from the 1970s through 1990. The student is expected to:

(A) describe Richard M. Nixon's leadership in the normalization of relations with China and the policy of *détente*;

(B) describe Ronald Reagan's leadership in domestic and international policies, including Reaganomics and Peace Through Strength;

(C) compare the impact of energy on the American way of life over time;

(D) describe U.S. involvement in the Middle East such as support for Israel, the Camp David Accords, the Iran-Contra Affair, Marines in Lebanon, and the Iran Hostage Crisis;

(E) describe the causes and key organizations and individuals of the conservative resurgence of the 1980s and 1990s, including Phyllis Schlafly, the Contract with America, the Heritage Foundation, the Moral Majority, and the National Rifle Association; and

(F) describe significant societal issues of this time period.

(11) History. The student understands the emerging political, economic, and social issues of the United States from the 1990s into the 21st century. The student is expected to:

- (A) describe U.S. involvement in world affairs, including the end of the Cold War, the Persian Gulf War, the Balkans Crisis, 9/11, and the global War on Terror;
- (B) identify significant social and political advocacy organizations, leaders, and issues across the political spectrum;
- (C) evaluate efforts by global organizations to undermine U.S. sovereignty through the use of treaties;
- (D) analyze the impact of third parties on presidential elections;
- (E) discuss the historical significance of the 2008 presidential election; and
- (F) discuss the solvency of long-term entitlement programs such as Social Security and Medicare.

(15) Economics. The student understands domestic and foreign issues related to U.S. economic growth from the 1870s to 1920. The student is expected to:

- (A) describe how the economic impact of the Transcontinental Railroad and the Homestead Act contributed to the close of the frontier in the late 19th century;
- (B) describe the changing relationship between the federal government and private business, including the costs and benefits of laissez-faire, anti-trust acts, the Interstate Commerce Act, and the Pure Food and Drug Act;
- (C) explain how foreign policies affected economic issues such as the Chinese Exclusion Act of 1882, the Open Door Policy, Dollar Diplomacy, and immigration quotas;
- (D) describe the economic effects of international military conflicts, including the Spanish-American War and World War I, on the United States; and
- (E) describe the emergence of monetary policy in the United States, including the Federal Reserve Act of 1913 and the shifting trend from a gold standard to fiat money.

(16) Economics. The student understands significant economic developments between World War I and World War II. The student is expected to:

- (A) analyze causes of economic growth and prosperity in the 1920s, including Warren Harding's Return to Normalcy, reduced taxes, and increased production efficiencies;

(B) identify the causes of the Great Depression, including the impact of tariffs on world trade, stock market speculation, bank failures, and the monetary policy of the Federal Reserve System;

(C) analyze the effects of the Great Depression on the U.S. economy and society such as widespread unemployment and deportation and repatriation of people of European and Mexican heritage and others;

(D) compare the New Deal policies and its opponents' approaches to resolving the economic effects of the Great Depression; and

(E) describe how various New Deal agencies and programs, including the Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation, the Securities and Exchange Commission, and the Social Security Administration, continue to affect the lives of U.S. citizens.

(17) Economics. The student understands the economic effects of World War II and the Cold War. The student is expected to:

(A) describe the economic effects of World War II on the home front such as the end of the Great Depression, rationing, and increased opportunity for women and minority employment;

(B) identify the causes of prosperity in the 1950s, including the Baby Boom and the impact of the GI Bill (Servicemen's Readjustment Act of 1944), and the effects of prosperity in the 1950s such as increased consumption and the growth of agriculture and business;

(C) describe the economic impact of defense spending on the business cycle and education priorities from 1945 to the 1990s;

(D) identify actions of government and the private sector such as the Great Society, affirmative action, and Title IX to create economic opportunities for citizens and analyze the unintended consequences of each; and

(E) describe the dynamic relationship between U.S. international trade policies and the U.S. free enterprise system such as the Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries (OPEC) oil embargo, the General Agreement of Tariffs and Trade (GATT), and the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA).

(18) Economics. The student understands the economic effects of increased worldwide interdependence as the United States enters the 21st century. The student is expected to:

(A) discuss the role of American entrepreneurs such as Bill Gates, Sam Walton, Estée Lauder, Robert Johnson, Lionel Sosa, and millions of small business entrepreneurs who achieved the American dream; and

(B) identify the impact of international events, multinational corporations, government policies, and individuals on the 21st century economy.

(19) Government. The student understands changes over time in the role of government. The student is expected to:

(A) evaluate the impact of New Deal legislation on the historical roles of state and federal government;

(B) explain constitutional issues raised by federal government policy changes during times of significant events, including World War I, the Great Depression, World War II, the 1960s, and 9/11;

(C) describe the effects of political scandals, including Teapot Dome, Watergate, and Bill Clinton's impeachment, on the views of U.S. citizens concerning trust in the federal government and its leaders;

(D) discuss the role of contemporary government legislation in the private and public sectors such as the Community Reinvestment Act of 1977, USA PATRIOT Act of 2001, and the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act of 2009; and

(E) evaluate the pros and cons of U.S. participation in international organizations and treaties.

(20) Government. The student understands the changing relationships among the three branches of the federal government. The student is expected to:

(A) describe the impact of events such as the Gulf of Tonkin Resolution and the War Powers Act on the relationship between the legislative and executive branches of government; and

(B) evaluate the impact of relationships among the legislative, executive, and judicial branches of government, including Franklin D. Roosevelt's attempt to increase the number of U.S. Supreme Court justices and the presidential election of 2000.

(21) Government. The student understands the impact of constitutional issues on American society. The student is expected to:

(A) analyze the effects of landmark U.S. Supreme Court decisions, including *Brown v. Board of Education*, and other U.S. Supreme Court decisions such as *Plessy v. Ferguson*, *Hernandez v. Texas*, *Tinker v. Des Moines*, *Wisconsin v. Yoder*, and *White v. Regester*;

(B) discuss historical reasons why the constitution has been amended; and

(C) evaluate constitutional change in terms of strict construction versus judicial interpretation.

(22) Citizenship. The student understands the concept of American exceptionalism. The student is expected to:

(A) discuss Alexis de Tocqueville's five values crucial to America's success as a constitutional republic: liberty, egalitarianism, individualism, populism, and laissez-faire;

(B) describe how the American values identified by Alexis de Tocqueville are different and unique from those of other nations; and

(C) describe U.S. citizens as people from numerous places throughout the world who hold a common bond in standing for certain self-evident truths.

(23) Citizenship. The student understands efforts to expand the democratic process. The student is expected to:

(A) identify and analyze methods of expanding the right to participate in the democratic process, including lobbying, non-violent protesting, litigation, and amendments to the U.S. Constitution;

(B) evaluate various means of achieving equality of political rights, including the 19th, 24th, and 26th amendments and congressional acts such as the American Indian Citizenship Act of 1924; and

(C) explain how participation in the democratic process reflects our national ethos, patriotism, and civic responsibility as well as our progress to build a "more perfect union."

(24) Citizenship. The student understands the importance of effective leadership in a constitutional republic. The student is expected to:

(A) describe qualities of effective leadership; and

(B) evaluate the contributions of significant political and social leaders in the United States such as Andrew Carnegie, Thurgood Marshall, Billy Graham, Barry Goldwater, Sandra Day O'Connor, and Hillary Clinton.

(25) Culture. The student understands the relationship between the arts and the times during which they were created. The student is expected to:

(A) describe how the characteristics and issues in U.S. history have been reflected in various genres of art, music, film, and literature;

(B) describe both the positive and negative impacts of significant examples of cultural movements in art, music, and literature such as Tin Pan Alley, the Harlem Renaissance, the Beat Generation, rock and roll, the Chicano Mural Movement, and country and western music on American society;

(C) identify the impact of popular American culture on the rest of the world over time; and

(D) analyze the global diffusion of American culture through the entertainment industry via various media.

(26) Culture. The student understands how people from various groups contribute to our national identity. The student is expected to:

(A) explain actions taken by people to expand economic opportunities and political rights, including those for racial, ethnic, and religious minorities as well as women, in American society;

(B) discuss the Americanization movement to assimilate immigrants and American Indians into American culture;

(C) explain how the contributions of people of various racial, ethnic, gender, and religious groups shape American culture;

(D) identify the political, social, and economic contributions of women such as Frances Willard, Jane Addams, Eleanor Roosevelt, Dolores Huerta, Sonia Sotomayor, and Oprah Winfrey to American society;

(E) discuss the meaning and historical significance of the mottos "E Pluribus Unum" and "In God We Trust"; and

(F) discuss the importance of congressional Medal of Honor recipients, including individuals of all races and genders such as Vernon J. Baker, Alvin York, and Roy Benavidez.

(29) Social studies skills. The student applies critical-thinking skills to organize and use information acquired from a variety of valid sources, including electronic technology. The student is expected to:

- (A) use a variety of both primary and secondary valid sources to acquire information and to analyze and answer historical questions;
- (B) analyze information by sequencing, categorizing, identifying cause-and-effect relationships, comparing and contrasting, finding the main idea, summarizing, making generalizations, making predictions, drawing inferences, and drawing conclusions;
- (C) understand how historians interpret the past (historiography) and how their interpretations of history may change over time;
- (D) use the process of historical inquiry to research, interpret, and use multiple types of sources of evidence;
- (E) evaluate the validity of a source based on language, corroboration with other sources, and information about the author, including points of view, frames of reference, and historical context;
- (F) identify bias in written, oral, and visual material;
- (G) identify and support with historical evidence a point of view on a social studies issue or event; and
- (H) use appropriate skills to analyze and interpret social studies information such as maps, graphs, presentations, speeches, lectures, and political cartoons.

(30) Social studies skills. The student communicates in written, oral, and visual forms. The student is expected to:

- (A) create written, oral, and visual presentations of social studies information;
- (B) use correct social studies terminology to explain historical concepts; and
- (C) use different forms of media to convey information, including written to visual and statistical to written or visual, using available computer software as appropriate.

(31) Social studies skills. The student uses geographic tools to collect, analyze, and interpret data. The student is expected to:

(A) create thematic maps, graphs, and charts representing various aspects of the United States; and

(B) pose and answer questions about geographic distributions and patterns shown on maps, graphs, charts, and available databases.

(32) Social studies skills. The student uses problem-solving and decision-making skills, working independently and with others, in a variety of settings. The student is expected to:

(A) use a problem-solving process to identify a problem, gather information, list and consider options, consider advantages and disadvantages, choose and implement a solution, and evaluate the effectiveness of the solution; and

(B) use a decision-making process to identify a situation that requires a decision, gather information, identify options, predict consequences, and take action to implement a decision.

§113.44. United States Government (One-Half Credit), Beginning with School Year 2011-2012.

(a) General requirements. Students shall be awarded one-half unit of credit for successful completion of this course.

(b) Introduction.

(1) In United States Government, the focus is on the principles and beliefs upon which the United States was founded and on the structure, functions, and powers of government at the national, state, and local levels. This course is the culmination of the civic and governmental content and concepts studied from Kindergarten through required secondary courses. Students learn major political ideas and forms of government in history. A significant focus of the course is on the U.S. Constitution, its underlying principles and ideas, and the form of government it created. Students analyze major concepts of republicanism, federalism, checks and balances, separation of powers, popular sovereignty, and individual rights and compare the U.S. system of government with other political systems. Students identify the role of government in the U.S. free enterprise system and examine the strategic importance of places to the United States. Students analyze the impact of individuals, political parties, interest groups, and the media on the American political system, evaluate the importance of voluntary individual participation in a constitutional republic, and analyze the rights guaranteed by the U.S.

Constitution. Students examine the relationship between governmental policies and the culture of the United States. Students identify examples of government policies that encourage scientific research and use critical-thinking skills to create a product on a contemporary government issue.

(2) To support the teaching of the essential knowledge and skills, the use of a variety of rich primary and secondary source material such as the complete text of the U.S. Constitution, selected Federalist Papers, landmark cases of the U.S. Supreme Court (such as those studied in Grade 8 and U.S. History Since 1877), biographies, autobiographies, memoirs, speeches, letters, and periodicals that feature analyses of political issues and events is encouraged.

(3) The eight strands of the essential knowledge and skills for social studies are intended to be integrated for instructional purposes. Skills listed in the social studies skills strand in subsection (c) of this section should be incorporated into the teaching of all essential knowledge and skills for social studies. A greater depth of understanding of complex content material can be attained when integrated social studies content from the various disciplines and critical-thinking skills are taught together. Statements that contain the word "including" reference content that must be mastered, while those containing the phrase "such as" are intended as possible illustrative examples.

(4) Students identify the role of the U.S. free enterprise system within the parameters of this course and understand that this system may also be referenced as capitalism or the free market system.

(5) Throughout social studies in Kindergarten-Grade 12, students build a foundation in history; geography; economics; government; citizenship; culture; science, technology, and society; and social studies skills. The content, as appropriate for the grade level or course, enables students to understand the importance of patriotism, function in a free enterprise society, and appreciate the basic democratic values of our state and nation as referenced in the Texas Education Code (TEC), §28.002(h).

(6) Students understand that a constitutional republic is a representative form of government whose representatives derive their authority from the consent of the governed, serve for an established tenure, and are sworn to uphold the constitution.

(7) State and federal laws mandate a variety of celebrations and observances, including Celebrate Freedom Week.

(A) Each social studies class shall include, during Celebrate Freedom Week as provided under the TEC, §29.907, or during another full school week as determined by the board of trustees of a school district, appropriate instruction concerning the intent, meaning, and importance of the Declaration of Independence and the U.S. Constitution, including the Bill of Rights, in their

historical contexts. The study of the Declaration of Independence must include the study of the relationship of the ideas expressed in that document to subsequent American history, including the relationship of its ideas to the rich diversity of our people as a nation of immigrants, the American Revolution, the formulation of the U.S. Constitution, and the abolitionist movement, which led to the Emancipation Proclamation and the women's suffrage movement.

(B) Each school district shall require that, during Celebrate Freedom Week or other week of instruction prescribed under subparagraph (A) of this paragraph, students in Grades 3-12 study and recite the following text: "We hold these Truths to be self-evident, that all Men are created equal, that they are endowed by their Creator with certain unalienable Rights, that among these are Life, Liberty and the Pursuit of Happiness--That to secure these Rights, Governments are instituted among Men, deriving their just Powers from the Consent of the Governed."

(8) Students identify and discuss how the actions of U.S. citizens and the local, state, and federal governments have either met or failed to meet the ideals espoused in the founding documents.

(c) Knowledge and skills.

(1) History. The student understands how constitutional government, as developed in America and expressed in the Declaration of Independence, the Articles of Confederation, and the U.S. Constitution, has been influenced by ideas, people, and historical documents. The student is expected to:

(A) explain major political ideas in history, including the laws of nature and nature's God, unalienable rights, divine right of kings, social contract theory, and the rights of resistance to illegitimate government;

(B) identify major intellectual, philosophical, political, and religious traditions that informed the American founding, including Judeo-Christian (especially biblical law), English common law and constitutionalism, Enlightenment, and republicanism, as they address issues of liberty, rights, and responsibilities of individuals;

(C) identify the individuals whose principles of laws and government institutions informed the American founding documents, including those of Moses, William Blackstone, John Locke, and Charles de Montesquieu;

(D) identify the contributions of the political philosophies of the Founding Fathers, including John Adams, Alexander Hamilton, Thomas Jefferson, James Madison, John Jay, George Mason, Roger Sherman, and James Wilson, on the development of the U.S. government;

(E) examine debates and compromises that impacted the creation of the founding documents; and

(F) identify significant individuals in the field of government and politics, including George Washington, Thomas Jefferson, John Marshall, Andrew Jackson, Abraham Lincoln, Theodore Roosevelt, Franklin D. Roosevelt, and Ronald Reagan.

(2) History. The student understands the roles played by individuals, political parties, interest groups, and the media in the U.S. political system, past and present. The student is expected to:

(A) give examples of the processes used by individuals, political parties, interest groups, or the media to affect public policy; and

(B) analyze the impact of political changes brought about by individuals, political parties, interest groups, or the media, past and present.

(5) Economics. The student understands the roles played by local, state, and national governments in both the public and private sectors of the U.S. free enterprise system. The student is expected to:

(A) explain how government fiscal, monetary, and regulatory policies influence the economy at the local, state, and national levels;

(B) identify the sources of revenue and expenditures of the U. S. government and analyze their impact on the U.S. economy;

(C) compare the role of government in the U.S. free enterprise system and other economic systems; and

(D) understand how government taxation and regulation can serve as restrictions to private enterprise.

(6) Economics. The student understands the relationship between U.S. government policies and the economy. The student is expected to:

(A) examine how the U.S. government uses economic resources in foreign policy; and

(B) understand the roles of the executive and legislative branches in setting international trade and fiscal policies.

(7) Government. The student understands the American beliefs and principles reflected in the U.S. Constitution and why these are significant. The student is expected to:

- (A) explain the importance of a written constitution;
- (B) evaluate how the federal government serves the purposes set forth in the Preamble to the U.S. Constitution;
- (C) analyze how the Federalist Papers such as Number 10, Number 39, and Number 51 explain the principles of the American constitutional system of government;
- (D) evaluate constitutional provisions for limiting the role of government, including republicanism, checks and balances, federalism, separation of powers, popular sovereignty, and individual rights;
- (E) describe the constitutionally prescribed procedures by which the U.S. Constitution can be changed and analyze the role of the amendment process in a constitutional government;
- (F) identify how the American beliefs and principles reflected in the Declaration of Independence and the U.S. Constitution contribute to both a national identity and federal identity and are embodied in the United States today; and
- (G) examine the reasons the Founding Fathers protected religious freedom in America and guaranteed its free exercise by saying that "Congress shall make no law respecting an establishment of religion, or prohibiting the free exercise thereof," and compare and contrast this to the phrase, "separation of church and state."

(8) Government. The student understands the structure and functions of the government created by the U.S. Constitution. The student is expected to:

- (A) analyze the structure and functions of the legislative branch of government, including the bicameral structure of Congress, the role of committees, and the procedure for enacting laws;
- (B) analyze the structure and functions of the executive branch of government, including the constitutional powers of the president, the growth of presidential power, and the role of the Cabinet and executive departments;
- (C) analyze the structure and functions of the judicial branch of government, including the federal court system, types of jurisdiction, and judicial review;

(D) identify the purpose of selected independent executive agencies, including the National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA), and regulatory commissions, including the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA), Food and Drug Administration (FDA), and Federal Communications Commission (FCC);

(E) explain how certain provisions of the U.S. Constitution provide for checks and balances among the three branches of government;

(F) analyze selected issues raised by judicial activism and judicial restraint;

(G) explain the major responsibilities of the federal government for domestic and foreign policy such as national defense; and

(H) compare the structures, functions, and processes of national, state, and local governments in the U.S. federal system.

(9) Government. The student understands the concept of federalism. The student is expected to:

(A) explain why the Founding Fathers created a distinctly new form of federalism and adopted a federal system of government instead of a unitary system;

(B) categorize government powers as national, state, or shared;

(C) analyze historical and contemporary conflicts over the respective roles of national and state governments; and

(D) understand the limits on the national and state governments in the U.S. federal system of government.

(10) Government. The student understands the processes for filling public offices in the U.S. system of government. The student is expected to:

(A) compare different methods of filling public offices, including elected and appointed offices at the local, state, and national levels;

(B) explain the process of electing the president of the United States and analyze the Electoral College; and

(C) analyze the impact of the passage of the 17th Amendment.

(11) Government. The student understands the role of political parties in the U.S. system of government. The student is expected to:

- (A) analyze the functions of political parties and their role in the electoral process at local, state, and national levels;
- (B) explain the two-party system and evaluate the role of third parties in the United States; and
- (C) identify opportunities for citizens to participate in political party activities at local, state, and national levels.

(12) Government. The student understands the similarities and differences that exist among the U.S. system of government and other political systems. The student is expected to:

- (A) compare the U.S. constitutional republic to historical and contemporary forms of government such as monarchy, a classical republic, authoritarian, socialist, direct democracy, theocracy, tribal, and other republics;
- (B) analyze advantages and disadvantages of federal, confederate, and unitary systems of government; and
- (C) analyze advantages and disadvantages of presidential and parliamentary systems of government.

(13) Citizenship. The student understands rights guaranteed by the U.S. Constitution. The student is expected to:

- (A) understand the roles of limited government and the rule of law in the protection of individual rights;
- (B) identify and define the unalienable rights;
- (C) identify the freedoms and rights guaranteed by each amendment in the Bill of Rights;
- (D) analyze U.S. Supreme Court interpretations of rights guaranteed by the U.S. Constitution in selected cases, including *Engel v. Vitale*, *Schenck v. United States*, *Texas v. Johnson*, *Miranda v. Arizona*, *Gideon v. Wainwright*, *Mapp v. Ohio*, and *Roe v. Wade*;
- (E) explain the importance of due process rights to the protection of individual rights and in limiting the powers of government; and

(F) recall the conditions that produced the 14th Amendment and describe subsequent efforts to selectively extend some of the Bill of Rights to the states, including the Blaine Amendment and U.S. Supreme Court rulings, and analyze the impact on the scope of fundamental rights and federalism.

(14) Citizenship. The student understands the difference between personal and civic responsibilities. The student is expected to:

- (A) explain the difference between personal and civic responsibilities;
- (B) evaluate whether and/or when the obligation of citizenship requires that personal desires and interests be subordinated to the public good;
- (C) understand the responsibilities, duties, and obligations of citizenship such as being well informed about civic affairs, serving in the military, voting, serving on a jury, observing the laws, paying taxes, and serving the public good; and
- (D) understand the voter registration process and the criteria for voting in elections.

(15) Citizenship. The student understands the importance of voluntary individual participation in the U.S. constitutional republic. The student is expected to:

- (A) analyze the effectiveness of various methods of participation in the political process at local, state, and national levels;
- (B) analyze historical and contemporary examples of citizen movements to bring about political change or to maintain continuity; and
- (C) understand the factors that influence an individual's political attitudes and actions.

(16) Citizenship. The student understands the importance of the expression of different points of view in a constitutional republic. The student is expected to:

- (A) examine different points of view of political parties and interest groups such as the League of United Latin American Citizens (LULAC), the National Rifle Association (NRA), and the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP) on important contemporary issues; and
- (B) analyze the importance of the First Amendment rights of petition, assembly, speech, and press and the Second Amendment right to keep and bear arms.

(17) Culture. The student understands the relationship between government policies and the culture of the United States. The student is expected to:

(A) evaluate a U.S. government policy or court decision that has affected a particular racial, ethnic, or religious group such as the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and the U.S. Supreme Court cases of *Hernandez v. Texas* and *Grutter v. Bollinger*; and

(B) explain changes in American culture brought about by government policies such as voting rights, the Servicemen's Readjustment Act of 1944 (GI Bill of Rights), the Immigration and Nationality Act of 1965, the Immigration Reform and Control Act of 1986, affirmative action, and racial integration.

(18) Science, technology, and society. The student understands the role the government plays in developing policies and establishing conditions that influence scientific discoveries and technological innovations. The student is expected to:

(A) understand how U.S. constitutional protections such as patents have fostered competition and entrepreneurship; and

(B) identify examples of government-assisted research that, when shared with the private sector, have resulted in improved consumer products such as computer and communication technologies.

(20) Social studies skills. The student applies critical-thinking skills to organize and use information acquired from a variety of valid sources, including electronic technology. The student is expected to:

(A) analyze information by sequencing, categorizing, identifying cause-and-effect relationships, comparing, contrasting, finding the main idea, summarizing, making generalizations and predictions, and drawing inferences and conclusions;

(B) create a product on a contemporary government issue or topic using critical methods of inquiry;

(C) analyze and defend a point of view on a current political issue;

(D) analyze and evaluate the validity of information, arguments, and counterarguments from primary and secondary sources for bias, propaganda, point of view, and frame of reference;

(E) evaluate government data using charts, tables, graphs, and maps; and

(F) use appropriate mathematical skills to interpret social studies information such as maps and graphs.

(21) Social studies skills. The student communicates in written, oral, and visual forms. The student is expected to:

- (A) use social studies terminology correctly;
- (B) use standard grammar, spelling, sentence structure, and punctuation;
- (C) transfer information from one medium to another, including written to visual and statistical to written or visual, using computer software as appropriate; and
- (D) create written, oral, and visual presentations of social studies information.

(22) Social studies skills. The student uses problem-solving and decision-making skills, working independently and with others, in a variety of settings. The student is expected to:

- (A) use a problem-solving process to identify a problem, gather information, list and consider options, consider advantages and disadvantages, choose and implement a solution, and evaluate the effectiveness of the solution; and
- (B) use a decision-making process to identify a situation that requires a decision, gather information, identify options, predict consequences, and take action to implement a decision.

§113.47. Special Topics in Social Studies (One-Half Credit), Beginning with School Year 2011-2012.

(a) General requirements. Students shall be awarded one-half unit of credit for successful completion of this course. Students may take this course with different course content for a maximum of two credits.

(b) Introduction.

(1) In Special Topics in Social Studies, an elective course, students are provided the opportunity to develop a greater understanding of the historic, political, economic, geographic, multicultural, and social forces that have shaped their lives and the world in which they live. Students will use social science knowledge and skills to engage in

rational and logical analysis of complex problems using a variety of approaches, while recognizing and appreciating diverse human perspectives.

(2) Statements that contain the word "including" reference content that must be mastered, while those containing the phrase "such as" are intended as possible illustrative examples.

(3) Students understand that a constitutional republic is a representative form of government whose representatives derive their authority from the consent of the governed, serve for an established tenure, and are sworn to uphold the constitution.

(4) State and federal laws mandate a variety of celebrations and observances, including Celebrate Freedom Week.

(A) Each social studies class shall include, during Celebrate Freedom Week as provided under the Texas Education Code, §29.907, or during another full school week as determined by the board of trustees of a school district, appropriate instruction concerning the intent, meaning, and importance of the Declaration of Independence and the U.S. Constitution, including the Bill of Rights, in their historical contexts. The study of the Declaration of Independence must include the study of the relationship of the ideas expressed in that document to subsequent American history, including the relationship of its ideas to the rich diversity of our people as a nation of immigrants, the American Revolution, the formulation of the U.S. Constitution, and the abolitionist movement, which led to the Emancipation Proclamation and the women's suffrage movement.

(B) Each school district shall require that, during Celebrate Freedom Week or other week of instruction prescribed under subparagraph (A) of this paragraph, students in Grades 3-12 study and recite the following text: "We hold these Truths to be self-evident, that all Men are created equal, that they are endowed by their Creator with certain unalienable Rights, that among these are Life, Liberty and the Pursuit of Happiness--That to secure these Rights, Governments are instituted among Men, deriving their just Powers from the Consent of the Governed."

(5) Students identify and discuss how the actions of U.S. citizens and the local, state, and federal governments have either met or failed to meet the ideals espoused in the founding documents.

(c) Knowledge and skills.

(1) Social studies skills. The student uses problem-solving and decision-making skills, working independently and with others, in a variety of settings. The student is expected to:

- (A) apply social studies methodologies encompassing a variety of research and analytical tools to explore questions or issues thoroughly and fairly to include multiple perspectives;
- (B) evaluate effects of major political, economic, and social conditions on a selected social studies topic;
- (C) appraise a geographic perspective that considers physical and cultural processes as they affect the selected topic;
- (D) examine the role of diverse communities in the context of the selected topic;
- (E) analyze ethical issues raised by the selected topic in historic, cultural, and social contexts;
- (F) depending on the topic, use a problem-solving process to identify a problem, gather information, list and consider options, consider advantages and disadvantages, choose and implement a solution, and evaluate the effectiveness of the solution; and
- (G) depending on the topic, use a decision-making process to identify a situation that requires a decision, gather information, identify options, predict consequences, and take action to implement a decision.

(2) Social studies skills. The student applies critical-thinking skills to organize and use information acquired from a variety of valid sources, including electronic technology. The student is expected to:

- (A) locate, analyze, organize, synthesize, evaluate, and apply information about the selected topic, identifying, describing, and evaluating multiple points of view;
- (B) differentiate between valid primary and secondary sources and use them appropriately to conduct research and construct arguments;
- (C) read narrative texts critically and identify points of view from the historical context surrounding an event and the frame of reference that influenced the participants;
- (D) analyze information by sequencing, categorizing, identifying cause-and-effect relationships, comparing, contrasting, finding the main idea, summarizing, making generalizations and predictions, and drawing inferences and conclusions;

(E) collect visual images (photographs, paintings, political cartoons, and other media) to enhance understanding and appreciation of multiple perspectives in a social studies topic;

(F) identify bias in written, oral, and visual material;

(G) evaluate the validity of a source based on language, corroboration with other sources, and information about the author; and

(H) use appropriate mathematical skills to interpret social studies information such as maps and graphs.

(3) Social studies skills. The student creates written, oral, and visual presentations of social studies information. The student is expected to:

(A) apply the conventions of usage and mechanics of written English;

(B) use social studies terminology correctly;

(C) use appropriate oral communication techniques;

(D) construct a thesis that is supported by evidence;

(E) recognize and evaluate counter arguments;

(F) use visual images (photographs, paintings, and other media) to facilitate understanding and appreciation of multiple perspectives in a social studies topic;

(G) develop a bibliography with ideas and information attributed to source materials and authors using accepted social science formats such as *Modern Language Association Style Manual* (MLA) and *Chicago Manual of Style* (CMS) to document sources and format written materials; and

(H) use computer software to create written, graphic, or visual products from collected data.

Appendix 3: Texas Character Education Curriculum

Sec. 29.906. CHARACTER EDUCATION PROGRAM. (a) A school district may provide a character education program.

(b) A character education program under this section must:

(1) stress positive character traits, such as:

(A) courage;

(B) trustworthiness, including honesty, reliability, punctuality, and loyalty;

(C) integrity;

(D) respect and courtesy;

(E) responsibility, including accountability, diligence, perseverance, and self-control;

(F) fairness, including justice and freedom from prejudice;

(G) caring, including kindness, empathy, compassion, consideration, patience, generosity, and charity;

(H) good citizenship, including patriotism, concern for the common good and the community, and respect for authority and the law; and

(I) school pride;

(2) use integrated teaching strategies; and

(3) be age appropriate.

(c) In developing or selecting a character education program under this section, a school district shall consult with a committee selected by the district that consists of:

(1) parents of district students;

(2) educators; and

(3) other members of the community, including community leaders.

(d) This section does not require or authorize proselytizing or indoctrinating concerning any specific religious or political belief.

(e) The agency shall:

(1) maintain a list of character education programs that school districts have implemented that meet the criteria under Subsection (b);

(2) based on data reported by districts, annually designate as a Character Plus School each school that provides a character education program that:

(A) meets the criteria prescribed by Subsection (b);
and

(B) is approved by the committee selected under Subsection (c); and

(3) include in the report required under Section 39.332:

(A) based on data reported by districts, the impact of character education programs on student discipline and academic achievement; and

(B) other reported data relating to character education programs the agency considers appropriate for inclusion.

Appendix 4: California History-Social Science Standards**United States History and Geography: Continuity and Change in the Twentieth Century**

Students in grade eleven study the major turning points in American history in the twentieth century. Following a review of the nation's beginnings and the impact of the Enlightenment on U.S. democratic ideals, students build upon the tenth grade study of global industrialization to understand the emergence and impact of new technology and a corporate economy, including the social and cultural effects. They trace the change in the ethnic composition of American society; the movement toward equal rights for racial minorities and women; and the role of the United States as a major world power. An emphasis is placed on the expanding role of the federal government and federal courts as well as the continuing tension between the individual and the state. Students consider the major social problems of our time and trace their causes in historical events. They learn that the United States has served as a model for other nations and that the rights and freedoms we enjoy are not accidents, but the results of a defined set of political principles that are not always basic to citizens of other countries. Students understand that our rights under the U.S. Constitution are a precious inheritance that depends on an educated citizenry for their preservation and protection.

11.1 Students analyze the significant events in the founding of the nation and its attempts to realize the philosophy of government described in the Declaration of Independence.

1. Describe the Enlightenment and the rise of democratic ideas as the context in which the nation was founded.
2. Analyze the ideological origins of the American Revolution, the Founding Fathers' philosophy of divinely bestowed unalienable natural rights, the debates on the drafting and ratification of the Constitution, and the addition of the Bill of Rights.
3. Understand the history of the Constitution after 1787 with emphasis on federal versus state authority and growing democratization.
4. Examine the effects of the Civil War and Reconstruction and of the industrial revolution, including demographic shifts and the emergence in the late nineteenth century of the United States as a world power.

Students analyze the relationship among the rise of industrialization, large-scale rural-to-urban migration, and massive immigration from Southern and Eastern Europe.

1. Know the effects of industrialization on living and working conditions, including the portrayal of working conditions and food safety in Upton Sinclair's *The Jungle*.
2. Describe the changing landscape, including the growth of cities linked by industry and trade, and the development of cities divided according to race, ethnicity, and class.

3. Trace the effect of the Americanization movement.
4. Analyze the effect of urban political machines and responses to them by immigrants and middle-class reformers.
5. Discuss corporate mergers that produced trusts and cartels and the economic and political policies of industrial leaders.
6. Trace the economic development of the United States and its emergence as a major industrial power, including its gains from trade and the advantages of its physical geography.
7. Analyze the similarities and differences between the ideologies of Social Darwinism and Social Gospel (e.g., using biographies of William Graham Sumner, Billy Sunday, Dwight L. Moody).
8. Examine the effect of political programs and activities of Populists.
9. Understand the effect of political programs and activities of the Progressives (e.g., federal regulation of railroad transport, Children’s Bureau, the Sixteenth Amendment, Theodore Roosevelt, Hiram Johnson).

Students analyze the role religion played in the founding of America, its lasting moral, social, and political impacts, and issues regarding religious liberty.

1. Describe the contributions of various religious groups to American civic principles and social reform movements (e.g., civil and human rights, individual responsibility and the work ethic, antimonarchy and self-rule, worker protection, family-centered communities).
2. Analyze the great religious revivals and the leaders involved in them, including the First Great Awakening, the Second Great Awakening, the Civil War revivals, the Social Gospel Movement, the rise of Christian liberal theology in the nineteenth century, the impact of the Second Vatican Council, and the rise of Christian fundamentalism in current times.
3. Cite incidences of religious intolerance in the United States (e.g., persecution of Mormons, anti-Catholic sentiment, anti-Semitism).

4. Discuss the expanding religious pluralism in the United States and California that resulted from large-scale immigration in the twentieth century.
5. Describe the principles of religious liberty found in the Establishment and Free Exercise clauses of the First Amendment, including the debate on the issue of separation of church and state.

4. **11.4 Students trace the rise of the United States to its role as a world power in the twentieth century.**
 1. List the purpose and the effects of the Open Door policy.
 2. Describe the Spanish-American War and U.S. expansion in the South Pacific.
 3. Discuss America’s role in the Panama Revolution and the building of the Panama Canal.

4. Explain Theodore Roosevelt’s Big Stick diplomacy, William Taft’s Dollar Diplomacy, and Woodrow Wilson’s Moral Diplomacy, drawing on relevant speeches.
 5. Analyze the political, economic, and social ramifications of World War I on the home front.
 6. Trace the declining role of Great Britain and the expanding role of the United States in world affairs after World War II.
5. **11.5 Students analyze the major political, social, economic, technological, and cultural developments of the 1920s.**
1. Discuss the policies of Presidents Warren Harding, Calvin Coolidge, and Herbert Hoover.
 2. Analyze the international and domestic events, interests, and philosophies that prompted attacks on civil liberties, including the Palmer Raids, Marcus Garvey’s “back-to-Africa” movement, the Ku Klux Klan, and immigration quotas and the responses of organizations such as the American Civil Liberties Union, the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People, and the Anti-Defamation League to those attacks.
 3. Examine the passage of the Eighteenth Amendment to the Constitution and the Volstead Act (Prohibition).
 4. Analyze the passage of the Nineteenth Amendment and the changing role of women in society.
 5. Describe the Harlem Renaissance and new trends in literature, music, and art, with special attention to the work of writers (e.g., Zora Neale Hurston, Langston Hughes).
 6. Trace the growth and effects of radio and movies and their role in the worldwide diffusion of popular culture.

7. Discuss the rise of mass production techniques, the growth of cities, the impact of new technologies (e.g., the automobile, electricity), and the resulting prosperity and effect on the American landscape.

Students analyze the different explanations for the Great Depression and how the New Deal fundamentally changed the role of the federal government.

1. Describe the monetary issues of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries that gave rise to the establishment of the Federal Reserve and the weaknesses in key sectors of the economy in the late 1920s.
2. Understand the explanations of the principal causes of the Great Depression and the steps taken by the Federal Reserve, Congress, and Presidents Herbert Hoover and Franklin Delano Roosevelt to combat the economic crisis.
3. Discuss the human toll of the Depression, natural disasters, and unwise agricultural practices and their effects on the depopulation of rural regions and on political

movements of the left and right, with particular attention to the Dust Bowl refugees and their social and economic impacts in California.

4. Analyze the effects of and the controversies arising from New Deal economic policies and the expanded role of the federal government in society and the economy since the 1930s (e.g., Works Progress Administration, Social Security, National Labor Relations Board, farm programs, regional development policies, and energy development projects such as the Tennessee Valley Authority, California Central Valley Project, and Bonneville Dam).
5. Trace the advances and retreats of organized labor, from the creation of the American Federation of Labor and the Congress of Industrial Organizations to current issues of a postindustrial, multinational economy, including the United Farm Workers in California.

Students analyze America’s participation in World War II.

1. Examine the origins of American involvement in the war, with an emphasis on the events that precipitated the attack on Pearl Harbor.
 2. Explain U.S. and Allied wartime strategy, including the major battles of Midway, Normandy, Iwo Jima, Okinawa, and the Battle of the Bulge.
 3. Identify the roles and sacrifices of individual American soldiers, as well as the unique contributions of the special fighting forces (e.g., the Tuskegee Airmen, the 442nd Regimental Combat team, the Navajo Code Talkers).
 4. Analyze Roosevelt’s foreign policy during World War II (e.g., Four Freedoms speech).
 5. Discuss the constitutional issues and impact of events on the U.S. home front, including the internment of Japanese Americans (e.g., *Fred Korematsu v. United States of America*) and the restrictions on German and Italian resident aliens; the response of the administration to Hitler’s atrocities against Jews and other groups; the roles of women in military production; and the roles and growing political demands of African Americans.
 6. Describe major developments in aviation, weaponry, communication, and medicine and the war’s impact on the location of American industry and use of resources.
 7. Discuss the decision to drop atomic bombs and the consequences of the decision (Hiroshima and Nagasaki).
 8. Analyze the effect of massive aid given to Western Europe under the Marshall Plan to rebuild itself after the war and the importance of a rebuilt Europe to the U.S. economy.
- 8. 11.8 Students analyze the economic boom and social transformation of post–World War II America.**
1. Trace the growth of service sector, white collar, and professional sector jobs in business and government.
 2. Describe the significance of Mexican immigration and its relationship to the agricultural economy, especially in California.
 3. Examine Truman’s labor policy and congressional reaction to it.

4. Analyze new federal government spending on defense, welfare, interest on the national debt, and federal and state spending on education, including the California Master Plan.
 5. Describe the increased powers of the presidency in response to the Great Depression, World War II, and the Cold War.
 6. Discuss the diverse environmental regions of North America, their relationship to local economies, and the origins and prospects of environmental problems in those regions.
 7. Describe the effects on society and the economy of technological developments since 1945, including the computer revolution, changes in communication, advances in medicine, and improvements in agricultural technology.
 8. Discuss forms of popular culture, with emphasis on their origins and geographic diffusion (e.g., jazz and other forms of popular music, professional sports, architectural and artistic styles).
9. **11.9 Students analyze U.S. foreign policy since World War II.**

1. Discuss the establishment of the United Nations and International Declaration of Human Rights, International Monetary Fund, World Bank, and General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) and their importance in shaping modern Europe and maintaining peace and international order.

2. Understand the role of military alliances, including NATO and SEATO, in deterring communist aggression and maintaining security during the Cold War.
3. Trace the origins and geopolitical consequences (foreign and domestic) of the Cold War and containment policy, including the following:
 - The era of McCarthyism, instances of domestic Communism (e.g., Alger Hiss) and blacklisting
 - The Truman Doctrine
 - The Berlin Blockade
 - The Korean War
 - The Bay of Pigs invasion and the Cuban Missile Crisis
 - Atomic testing in the American West, the “mutual assured destruction” doctrine, and disarmament policies
 - The Vietnam War
 - Latin American policy
4. List the effects of foreign policy on domestic policies and vice versa (e.g., protests during the war in Vietnam, the “nuclear freeze” movement).
5. Analyze the role of the Reagan administration and other factors in the victory of the West in the Cold War.
6. Describe U.S. Middle East policy and its strategic, political, and economic interests, including those related to the Gulf War.

7. Examine relations between the United States and Mexico in the twentieth century, including key economic, political, immigration, and environmental issues.

Students analyze the development of federal civil rights and voting rights.

1. Explain how demands of African Americans helped produce a stimulus for civil rights, including President Roosevelt’s ban on racial discrimination in defense industries in 1941, and how African Americans’ service in World War II produced a stimulus for President Truman’s decision to end segregation in the armed forces in 1948.
2. Examine and analyze the key events, policies, and court cases in the evolution of civil rights, including *Dred Scott v. Sandford*, *Plessy v. Ferguson*, *Brown v. Board of Education*, *Regents of the University of California v. Bakke*, and California Proposition 209.
3. Describe the collaboration on legal strategy between African American and white civil rights lawyers to end racial segregation in higher education.
4. Examine the roles of civil rights advocates (e.g., A. Philip Randolph, Martin Luther King, Jr., Malcom X, Thurgood Marshall, James Farmer, Rosa Parks), including the significance of Martin Luther King, Jr.’s “Letter from Birmingham Jail” and “I Have a Dream” speech.
5. Discuss the diffusion of the civil rights movement of African Americans from the churches of the rural South and the urban North, including the resistance to racial desegregation in Little Rock and Birmingham, and how the advances influenced the agendas, strategies, and effectiveness of the quests of American Indians, Asian Americans, and Hispanic Americans for civil rights and equal opportunities.
6. Analyze the passage and effects of civil rights and voting rights legislation (e.g., 1964 Civil Rights Act, Voting Rights Act of 1965) and the Twenty-Fourth Amendment, with an emphasis on equality of access to education and to the political process.
7. Analyze the women’s rights movement from the era of Elizabeth Stanton and Susan Anthony and the passage of the Nineteenth Amendment to the movement launched in the 1960s, including differing perspectives on the roles of women.

11.11 Students analyze the major social problems and domestic policy issues in contemporary American society.

1. Discuss the reasons for the nation’s changing immigration policy, with emphasis on how the Immigration Act of 1965 and successor acts have transformed American society.
2. Discuss the significant domestic policy speeches of Truman, Eisenhower, Kennedy, Johnson, Nixon, Carter, Reagan, Bush, and Clinton (e.g., with regard to education, civil rights, economic policy, environmental policy).
3. Describe the changing roles of women in society as reflected in the entry of more women into the labor force and the changing family structure.

4. Explain the constitutional crisis originating from the Watergate scandal.
5. Trace the impact of, need for, and controversies associated with environmental conservation, expansion of the national park system, and the development of environmental protection laws, with particular attention to the interaction between environmental protection advocates and property rights advocates.
6. Analyze the persistence of poverty and how different analyses of this issue influence welfare reform, health insurance reform, and other social policies.
7. Explain how the federal, state, and local governments have responded to demographic and social changes such as population shifts to the suburbs, racial concentrations in the cities, Frostbelt-to-Sunbelt migration, international migration, decline of family farms, increases in out-of-wedlock births, and drug abuse.

Principles of American Democracy and Economics

Students in grade twelve pursue a deeper understanding of the institutions of American government. They compare systems of government in the world today and analyze the history and changing interpretations of the Constitution, the Bill of Rights, and the current state of the legislative, executive, and judiciary branches of government. An emphasis is placed on analyzing the relationship among federal, state, and local governments, with particular attention paid to important historical documents such as the *Federalist Papers*. These standards represent the culmination of civic literacy as students prepare to vote, participate in community activities, and assume the responsibilities of citizenship.

In addition to studying government in grade twelve, students will also master fundamental economic concepts, applying the tools (graphs, statistics, equations) from other subject areas to the understanding of operations and institutions of economic systems. Studied in a historic context are the basic economic principles of micro- and macroeconomics, international economics, comparative economic systems, measurement, and methods.

Principles of American Democracy

12.1 Students explain the fundamental principles and moral values of American democracy as expressed in the U.S. Constitution and other essential documents of American democracy.

1. Analyze the influence of ancient Greek, Roman, English, and leading European political thinkers such as John Locke, Charles-Louis Montesquieu, Niccolò Machiavelli, and William Blackstone on the development of American government.
2. Discuss the character of American democracy and its promise and perils as articulated by Alexis de Tocqueville.
3. Explain how the U.S. Constitution reflects a balance between the classical republican concern with promotion of the public good and the classical liberal concern with protecting individual rights; and discuss how the basic premises of liberal

constitutionalism and democracy are joined in the Declaration of Independence as “self evident truths.”

4. Explain how the Founding Fathers’ realistic view of human nature led directly to the establishment of a constitutional system that limited the power of the governors and the governed as articulated in the *Federalist Papers*.
 5. Describe the systems of separated and shared powers, the role of organized interests (*Federalist Paper Number 10*), checks and balances (*Federalist Paper Number 51*), the importance of an independent judiciary (*Federalist Paper Number 78*), enumerated powers, rule of law, federalism, and civilian control of the military.
 6. Understand that the Bill of Rights limits the powers of the federal government and state governments.
2. **12.2 Students evaluate and take and defend positions on the scope and limits of rights and obligations as democratic citizens, the relationships among them, and how they are secured.**
1. Discuss the meaning and importance of each of the rights guaranteed under the Bill of Rights and how each is secured (e.g., freedom of religion, speech, press, assembly, petition, privacy).
 2. Explain how economic rights are secured and their importance to the individual and to society (e.g., the right to acquire, use, transfer, and dispose of property; right to choose one’s work; right to join or not join labor unions; copyright and patent).
 3. Discuss the individual’s legal obligations to obey the law, serve as a juror, and pay taxes.
 4. Understand the obligations of civic-mindedness, including voting, being informed on civic issues, volunteering and performing public service, and serving in the military or alternative service.
 5. Describe the reciprocity between rights and obligations; that is, why enjoyment of one’s rights entails respect for the rights of others.
 6. Explain how one becomes a citizen of the United States, including the process of naturalization (e.g., literacy, language, and other requirements).
3. **12.3 Students evaluate and take and defend positions on what the fundamental values and principles of civil society are (i.e., the autonomous sphere of voluntary personal, social, and economic relations that are not part of government), their interdependence, and the meaning and importance of those values and principles for a free society.**
1. Explain how civil society provides opportunities for individuals to associate for social, cultural, religious, economic, and political purposes.
 2. Explain how civil society makes it possible for people, individually or in association with others, to bring their influence to bear on government in ways other than voting and elections.
3. Discuss the historical role of religion and religious diversity.

4. Compare the relationship of government and civil society in constitutional democracies to the relationship of government and civil society in authoritarian and totalitarian regimes.

Students analyze the unique roles and responsibilities of the three branches of government as established by the U.S. Constitution.

1. Discuss Article I of the Constitution as it relates to the legislative branch, including eligibility for office and lengths of terms of representatives and senators; election to office; the roles of the House and Senate in impeachment proceedings; the role of the vice president; the enumerated legislative powers; and the process by which a bill becomes a law.
2. Explain the process through which the Constitution can be amended.
3. Identify their current representatives in the legislative branch of the national government.
4. Discuss Article II of the Constitution as it relates to the executive branch, including eligibility for office and length of term, election to and removal from office, the oath of office, and the enumerated executive powers.
5. Discuss Article III of the Constitution as it relates to judicial power, including the length of terms of judges and the jurisdiction of the Supreme Court.
6. Explain the processes of selection and confirmation of Supreme Court justices.

Students summarize landmark U.S. Supreme Court interpretations of the Constitution and its amendments.

1. Understand the changing interpretations of the Bill of Rights over time, including interpretations of the basic freedoms (religion, speech, press, petition, and assembly) articulated in the First Amendment and the due process and equal-protection-of-the-law clauses of the Fourteenth Amendment.
2. Analyze judicial activism and judicial restraint and the effects of each policy over the decades (e.g., the Warren and Rehnquist courts).
3. Evaluate the effects of the Court's interpretations of the Constitution in *Marbury v. Madison*, *McCulloch v. Maryland*, and *United States v. Nixon*, with emphasis on the arguments espoused by each side in these cases.
4. Explain the controversies that have resulted over changing interpretations of civil rights, including those in *Plessy v. Ferguson*, *Brown v. Board of Education*, *Miranda v. Arizona*, *Regents of the University of California v. Bakke*, *Adarand Constructors, Inc. v. Peña*, and *United States v. Virginia* (VMI).
6. **12.6 Students evaluate issues regarding campaigns for national, state, and local elective offices.**
 1. Analyze the origin, development, and role of political parties, noting those occasional periods in which there was only one major party or were more than two major parties.

2. Discuss the history of the nomination process for presidential candidates and the increasing importance of primaries in general elections.
 3. Evaluate the roles of polls, campaign advertising, and the controversies over campaign funding.
 4. Describe the means that citizens use to participate in the political process (e.g., voting, campaigning, lobbying, filing a legal challenge, demonstrating, petitioning, picketing, running for political office).
 5. Discuss the features of direct democracy in numerous states (e.g., the process of referendums, recall elections).
 6. Analyze trends in voter turnout; the causes and effects of reapportionment and redistricting, with special attention to spatial districting and the rights of minorities; and the function of the Electoral College.
7. **12.7 Students analyze and compare the powers and procedures of the national, state, tribal, and local governments.**
1. Explain how conflicts between levels of government and branches of government are resolved.
 2. Identify the major responsibilities and sources of revenue for state and local governments.
 3. Discuss reserved powers and concurrent powers of state governments.
 4. Discuss the Ninth and Tenth Amendments and interpretations of the extent of the federal government's power.
 5. Explain how public policy is formed, including the setting of the public agenda and implementation of it through regulations and executive orders.
 6. Compare the processes of lawmaking at each of the three levels of government, including the role of lobbying and the media.
 7. Identify the organization and jurisdiction of federal, state, and local (e.g., California) courts and the interrelationships among them.
 8. Understand the scope of presidential power and decision making through examination of case studies such as the Cuban Missile Crisis, passage of Great Society legislation, War Powers Act, Gulf War, and Bosnia.

Students evaluate and take and defend positions on the influence of the media on American political life.

1. Discuss the meaning and importance of a free and responsible press.
2. Describe the roles of broadcast, print, and electronic media, including the Internet, as means of communication in American politics.
3. Explain how public officials use the media to communicate with the citizenry and to shape public opinion.

Students analyze the origins, characteristics, and development of different political systems across time, with emphasis on the quest for political democracy, its advances, and its obstacles.

1. Explain how the different philosophies and structures of feudalism, mercantilism, socialism, fascism, communism, monarchies, parliamentary systems, and constitutional liberal democracies influence economic policies, social welfare policies, and human rights practices.
2. Compare the various ways in which power is distributed, shared, and limited in systems of shared powers and in parliamentary systems, including the influence and role of parliamentary leaders (e.g., William Gladstone, Margaret Thatcher).
3. Discuss the advantages and disadvantages of federal, confederal, and unitary systems of government.
4. Describe for at least two countries the consequences of conditions that gave rise to tyrannies during certain periods (e.g., Italy, Japan, Haiti, Nigeria, Cambodia).
5. Identify the forms of illegitimate power that twentieth-century African, Asian, and Latin American dictators used to gain and hold office and the conditions and interests that supported them.
6. Identify the ideologies, causes, stages, and outcomes of major Mexican, Central American, and South American revolutions in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.
7. Describe the ideologies that give rise to Communism, methods of maintaining control, and the movements to overthrow such governments in Czechoslovakia, Hungary, and Poland, including the roles of individuals (e.g., Alexander Solzhenitsyn, Pope John Paul II, Lech Walesa, Vaclav Havel).
8. Identify the successes of relatively new democracies in Africa, Asia, and Latin America and the ideas, leaders, and general societal conditions that have launched and sustained, or failed to sustain, them.

12.10 Students formulate questions about and defend their analyses of tensions within our constitutional democracy and the importance of maintaining a balance between the following concepts: majority rule and individual rights; liberty and equality; state and national authority in a federal system; civil disobedience and the rule of law; freedom of the press and the right to a fair trial; the relationship of religion and government.

Principles of Economics

1. **12.1 Students understand common economic terms and concepts and economic reasoning.**
 1. Examine the causal relationship between scarcity and the need for choices.
 2. Explain opportunity cost and marginal benefit and marginal cost.
 3. Identify the difference between monetary and nonmonetary incentives and how changes in incentives cause changes in behavior.
 4. Evaluate the role of private property as an incentive in conserving and improving scarce resources, including renewable and nonrenewable natural resources.
 5. Analyze the role of a market economy in establishing and preserving political and personal liberty (e.g., through the works of Adam Smith).
2. **12.2 Students analyze the elements of America's market economy in a global setting.**

1. Understand the relationship of the concept of incentives to the law of supply and the relationship of the concept of incentives and substitutes to the law of demand.
2. Discuss the effects of changes in supply and/or demand on the relative scarcity, price, and quantity of particular products.
3. Explain the roles of property rights, competition, and profit in a market economy.
4. Explain how prices reflect the relative scarcity of goods and services and perform the allocative function in a market economy.
5. Understand the process by which competition among buyers and sellers determines a market price.
6. Describe the effect of price controls on buyers and sellers.
7. Analyze how domestic and international competition in a market economy affects goods and services produced and the quality, quantity, and price of those products.
8. Explain the role of profit as the incentive to entrepreneurs in a market economy.
9. Describe the functions of the financial markets.
10. Discuss the economic principles that guide the location of agricultural production and industry and the spatial distribution of transportation and retail facilities.

3. **12.3 Students analyze the influence of the federal government on the American economy.**

1. Understand how the role of government in a market economy often includes providing for national defense, addressing environmental concerns, defining and enforcing property rights, attempting to make markets more competitive, and protecting consumers' rights.
2. Identify the factors that may cause the costs of government actions to outweigh the benefits.
3. Describe the aims of government fiscal policies (taxation, borrowing, spending) and their influence on production, employment, and price levels.
4. Understand the aims and tools of monetary policy and their influence on economic activity (e.g., the Federal Reserve).

4. **12.4 Students analyze the elements of the U.S. labor market in a global setting.**

1. Understand the operations of the labor market, including the circumstances surrounding the establishment of principal American labor unions, procedures that unions use to gain benefits for their members, the effects of unionization, the minimum wage, and unemployment insurance.
2. Describe the current economy and labor market, including the types of goods and services produced, the types of skills workers need, the effects of rapid technological change, and the impact of international competition.
3. Discuss wage differences among jobs and professions, using the laws of demand and supply and the concept of productivity.
4. Explain the effects of international mobility of capital and labor on the U.S. economy.

5. **12.5 Students analyze the aggregate economic behavior of the U.S. economy.**
 1. Distinguish between nominal and real data.
 2. Define, calculate, and explain the significance of an unemployment rate, the number of new jobs created monthly, an inflation or deflation rate, and a rate of economic growth.
 3. Distinguish between short-term and long-term interest rates and explain their relative significance.

12.6 Students analyze issues of international trade and explain how the U.S. economy affects, and is affected by, economic forces beyond the United States's borders.

1. Identify the gains in consumption and production efficiency from trade, with emphasis on the main products and changing geographic patterns of twentieth-century trade among countries in the Western Hemisphere.
2. Compare the reasons for and the effects of trade restrictions during the Great Depression compared with present-day arguments among labor, business, and political leaders over the effects of free trade on the economic and social interests of various groups of Americans.
3. Understand the changing role of international political borders and territorial sovereignty in a global economy.
4. Explain foreign exchange, the manner in which exchange rates are determined, and the effects of the dollar's gaining (or losing) value relative to other currencies.

Appendix 5: California Social Studies Framework

HISTORY

SOCIAL SCIENCE

FRAMEWORK

FOR CALIFORNIA PUBLIC SCHOOLS

Kindergarten through Grade Twelve

Adopted by the California State Board of Education July 2016

Published by the California Department of Education Sacramento, 2017

CHAPTER 17

Principles of American Democracy (One Semester)

- What are the key elements of representative democracy, and how did they develop over time?
- What are the trade-offs between majority rule and the protection of individual rights?
- How much power should government have over its citizens?
- What rights and responsibilities does a citizen have in a democracy?
- How do people get elected?
- Why does the government work sometimes and not others?

What problems are posed by representative government, and how can they be addressed?

In this course, students apply knowledge gained in previous years of study to pursue a deeper understanding of American government. Although this course is traditionally taught for a semester, given the importance and breadth of this content area, teachers may want to expand it into a yearlong course. Students consider the role of and necessity for government as they think about **How much power should government have over its citizens?** They consider how government can attain goals sanctioned by the majority while protecting its citizens from the abuse of power by asking **What are the trade-offs between majority rule and the protection of individual rights?** They will review and expand their knowledge of the key elements of a representative form of democracy, such as the idea that the authority to govern resides in its citizens.

Their study will be grounded in the understanding that all citizens have certain inalienable rights such as due process, what to believe, and where and how to live. This course is the culmination of the civic literacy strand of history–social studies that prepares students to vote and to be informed, skilled, and engaged participants in civic life.

As this course progresses, students will learn about the responsibilities they have or will soon have as voting members of an informed electorate. They consider the following question: **What rights and responsibilities does a citizen have in a democracy?** They will learn about the benefits to democracy of an electorate willing to compromise, practice genuine tolerance and respect toward others, and actively engage in an ethical and civil society. They will discover that all citizens have the power to elect and change their representatives—a power protected by free speech, thought, and assembly guarantees. They will learn that all citizens deserve equal treatment under the law, safeguarded from arbitrary or discriminatory treatment by the government. Students will review how these benefits developed in history, such as the broadening of the franchise from white males with property, to all white males, then to men and women of color, and finally, to eighteen- to twenty-one-year-olds.

Students will learn how the government works and how it is different from other systems of governance. Students will examine both the constitutional basis for and current examples of the fact that members of the government are themselves subject to the law; students also learn about the vital importance of an independent judiciary. As they study the electoral process, they will consider the question **How do people get elected?** In their study of the institutions of state, local, and federal governments, they ask **Why does the government work sometimes and not others?** They will compare the democratic system with authoritarian regimes of the past and today to understand the unique nature of American constitutional democracy.

Finally, students will conclude their study of American government by examining both the historical and modern problems of American democracy. In this final unit, students can investigate a variety of topics, such as the fight against corruption by monopolies or moneyed elites during the Progressive Era, the tension between national security and civil liberties—especially after 9/11, the battle over health care reform in the Clinton and Obama administrations, and efforts to promote environmental protection and combat climate change.

Fundamental Principles of American Democracy

Why do we need a government?

How much power should government have over its citizens?

What do the terms *liberty* and *equality* mean, and how do they relate to each other?

What are the dangers of a democratic system?

What are the trade-offs between majority rule and individual rights?

The semester begins with an examination of the ideas that have shaped the American democratic system. Students can start their studies by reviewing early experiments in democracy, such as the contributions of ancient Greek philosophers, direct but limited democracy in ancient Athens, and representative democracy in the Roman republic (and why it eventually failed). They explore the influence of Enlightenment ideas upon the Constitutional Framers' support of republicanism, content that was first introduced to students in the seventh grade and continued throughout the tenth- and eleventh-grade curriculum, focusing on key ideas such as John Locke's social contract and his concept of liberty and Charles-Louis Montesquieu's separation of powers.

To organize their study of this topic, teachers may have students consider questions to determine the role of government: **Why do we need a government? How much power should government have over its citizens? What do the terms *liberty* and *equality* mean, and how do they relate to each other? What are the dangers of a democratic system?** Through close reading and analysis of the Declaration of Independence, the *Federalist Papers* and the anti-Federalist response, the Constitution, and the Bill of Rights, students analyze the tension and balance between promotion of the public good and the protection of individual liberties.

The *Federalist Papers* explicate major constitutional concepts such as separation of powers, checks and balances, and enumerated powers as well as the Framers' understanding of human nature and the political process. In particular, *Federalist Paper Number 10* explains the role of organized interest, *Federalist Paper Number 51* outlines the rationale for checks and balances and separation of powers, and *Federalist Paper Number 78* centers on the role of the judiciary. Students should understand how these ideas shaped the American constitutional system and democratic behavior.

Alexis de Tocqueville wrote observations about these topics that students may find relevant and engaging. Students should be encouraged to construct compelling questions about these ideas and their application by using both historical and contemporary issues. In so doing, students should use deliberative processes and evidence-based reasoning in making judgments and drawing conclusions. Similarly, students might participate in mock ratification debates; construct writings or classroom presentations articulating arguments, claims, and evidence from multiple sources; or make classroom presentations.

Rights and Responsibilities of Citizens in a Democracy

What rights and responsibilities does a citizen have in a democracy? What does it mean to be a citizen?

How can citizens improve a democracy?

After reviewing the fundamental principles of American democratic thought and how democratic ideas and practices have developed historically, students focus their study on the question **What rights and responsibilities does a citizen have in a democracy?** Using the principles addressed

in the first unit—the tension between public good and individual liberty—students examine the individual liberties outlined in the Bill of Rights.

Teachers review the origins of each of the individual freedoms and then prompt their students to consider how certain liberties, such as the freedom of speech, religion, or privacy, have been and may be restricted in a democratic system. In addition to political liberties, students explore individual and societal economic, social, and cultural freedoms, including property rights, labor rights, children’s rights, patents, and copyright, as well as rights necessary to basic well-being, such as rights to subsistence, education, and health. They identify those rights that pertain to all persons in a democracy, citizens and non-citizens alike.

After studying the freedoms citizens enjoy in American democracy, students then consider the path to citizenship and its obligations—such as serving on a jury, paying taxes, and obeying the law—in an attempt to answer the question **What does it mean to be a citizen?** Students learn that democracies depend on an actively engaged citizenry—individuals who fully participate in the responsibilities of citizenship (such as voting, serving in the military, or regular public service)—for their long-term survival. To promote civic engagement and deepen student understanding of the rights and responsibilities of citizenship in this unit, teachers may employ structured group discussions, simulations, classroom debates, and civics-based service-learning activities, designed to provide students with concrete answers to the question **How can citizens improve a democracy?**

These activities can help students explore the multiple ways in which citizens engage with their communities. Students may also participate in classroom mock trials; visit courtrooms; serve as poll workers; participate in voter registration; simulate or visit city council meetings; conduct projects to identify, analyze, and address a community problem; and participate in service-learning at a local hospital, shelter, arts organization, library, or environmental project to study how to address community needs. When students engage with the community in these sorts of projects, teachers should be sure to have students connect their community service activity with their government classroom curriculum. They should answer questions, for example, such as *Where in the Constitution does it connect to the courtroom or voting booth experience? Where in the Constitution does it connect to rights guaranteed to all persons? What is the citizen’s role in ensuring these basic rights and protections to all?* In addition, students may gain a better understanding of the importance of citizenship by observing a naturalization ceremony, interviewing or speaking to a recently naturalized student or parent, or by speaking with legislators or other public officials concerning issues and public policy concerns.

Fundamental Principles of Civil Society

What is a civil society, and why do we want to have one? What are the limits of individual liberty?

What are the dangers of majority rule?

What is the role of religion in a democracy?

How do government actions impact civil society?

The rights that students learned about in the first two units can exist only in a system dedicated to their preservation. After considering the rights and responsibilities of citizens in the United States, students next explore the core principles and values of a civil society by asking **What is a civil society, and why do we want to have one?** Once again, they return to the tension between majority rule and individual freedom, by considering the importance of free association in a democratic society and the power that such associations can have in fostering a civil society and in influencing the U.S. government. Students consider **What are the limits of individual liberty and the dangers of majority rule?** Students review the historical relationship between religion and government, seeking connections between the free exercise of religion outlined in the First Amendment and how that has fostered diversity in response to the question **What is the role of religion in a democracy?** They also explore the responsibility of the government to protect its citizens and promote social order.

The three Branches of Government as Established by the U.S. Constitution

Why does the Constitution both grant power and take it away? What is the most powerful branch of government?

Why does it take so long for government to act?

Deriving its power from the governed and the principles of a civil society, the U.S. Constitution delineates the unique roles and responsibilities of the three branches of the federal government and the relationship between the federal government and the states. Students begin their in-depth study of the legislative, executive, and judicial branches by considering the question **Why does the Constitution both grant power and take it away?** Students focus their study on Articles I, II, and III of the Constitution to both clarify the individual responsibilities of each branch and, at the same time, detail the connections between branches and the system of separation of powers and checks and balances. Students do this in order to highlight the Constitution's dual purpose—to enumerate power and to limit the abuse of that power.

As students investigate the individual powers of each branch (and the checks upon those powers), they develop their own answer to the question **What is the most powerful branch of government?** by using both historical and current evidence to support their interpretation. Throughout their study, students should be encouraged to investigate the issue of government gridlock, using the question **Why does it take so long for government to act?**

Article I: The Legislative Branch

In this unit, students examine the work of Congress. Article I of the Constitution has the longest list of enumerated powers of all of the three branches of government. Students can construct a pie chart of the major responsibilities designated to the legislative branch of government, filling in the other two branches as they get to them. They may also explore how this balance of power has shifted over time.

After receiving an overview of the mechanics of legislation, specific powers, eligibility and length of terms of members of Congress, and an introduction to current legislative leaders and their current representatives, students consider case studies of recent issues. They do research on topics such as health care or labor law reform, economic stabilization policies, immigration policy, environmental protection laws, and antiterrorism legislation in order to answer a variety of questions, such as **What can Congress do? Why is it so hard to get a law passed? Who gets elected to Congress, and who does not? Who has power in Congress? Besides members of the House and Senate, who else can affect the legislative process? Which house of Congress is the most democratic? Which house is the most effective? How can individual citizens actually participate in the legislative process?** They may consider how a topic is affected through the committee system, lobbying, the media, and special interests.

Students can examine the complex, important, and, sometimes controversial relationship between legislators (and other government officials) and professional lobbyists who advocate their clients' interests. Students can research the different types of organizations and individuals who hire lobbyists (including corporations, unions, nonprofit organizations, and private citizens), the benefits of an active and engaged lobbying effort (such as protection of the interests of views not in the majority, and access to experts in a given field), and the potential for corruption (such as those clients willing to buy access and influence, clients whose interests are directly opposed to the public interest, or lobbyists who represent their own needs over their clients').

Finally, students study how individual citizens can inform, gain access to, and influence the legislative policymaking process. Students conduct research, evaluate resources, and balance predicted outcomes and consequences to create position papers on proposed legislation, present oral arguments in favor of or in opposition to specific federal legislation, write letters or e-mails stating and supporting positions on pending legislation, engage in a simulated congressional hearing or session, or design campaigns for virtual candidates for office.

Article II: The Executive Branch

In this unit, students document the evolution of the presidency and the growth of executive powers in modern history. Like their study of Article I, students first develop a basic understanding of how the president is elected, the requirements for the office, how a president can be removed, and the specific executive powers enumerated in Article II. Teachers then turn to case studies to give students the opportunity to analyze presidential campaigns, the handling of international crises, and the scope and limits of presidential power (both foreign and domestic) in depth. Close reading of and comparing State of the Union addresses across administrations, analyzing factors that influence presidential public approval ratings as well as the successes and failures of presidential policies, and using role play, simulation, and interactive learning can illuminate the process of presidential decision making.

As students study the executive branch, certain guiding questions can connect case studies and discrete examples: **How has the role of the presidency expanded? What are the factors that seem to help presidents win election? How does the president interact with the other branches of government, and how has that changed over time?**

Article III: The Judiciary

To begin their study of the judiciary, students consider the powers of this branch as outlined in Article III, the eligibility and length of service of judges, and the process of selection and confirmation of Supreme Court justices. Exclusive to the U.S. Supreme Court is the sole authority to definitively interpret the Constitution and the ability to use the supremacy clause.

Unlike the other two branches, however, members of the federal judiciary are not elected, leading some students to ask **How are Supreme Court justices selected? Why do they have unlimited terms? Is an unelected Supreme Court really democratic?** Students can examine controversies over the selection and confirmation of Supreme Court justices and federal judges and the nature of an independent judiciary through structured classroom discussions and deliberations. In the next unit, the constitutional explanation of the judiciary will provide the context for the high court's more notable rulings and shifts.

Interpreting the Constitution: The Work of the U.S. Supreme Court

What is judicial review, and how does it work?

What makes a law or an action unconstitutional, and does that determination ever change?

The courts play a unique role among the three branches in that the Framers intended the courts to be insulated from public opinion in order to independently interpret the laws. Students begin their study of the work of the Court by reviewing *Marbury v. Madison* (1803), to answer the question

What is judicial review, and how does it work? Students concentrate on how the courts have interpreted the Bill of Rights over time, especially themes such as due process of law and equal protection as guaranteed by the Fourteenth Amendment, by answering the question **What makes a law or an action unconstitutional, and does that determination ever change?**

Whenever possible, students should learn through illustrations of the kinds of controversies that have arisen because of challenges or differing interpretations of the Bill of Rights. For example, the unit can be organized around case studies of specific issues, such as the First Amendment's cases on free speech, free press, religious liberty, separation of church and state, academic freedom, and the right of assembly or the Fourth Amendment's warrant requirements and protections against unreasonable search and seizure.

Supreme Court and other federal court decisions may be debated or simulated in the classroom, following readings of original source materials, including excerpts from the cases of *Texas v. Johnson* (Flag burning), *West Virginia v. Barnette* (flag salute in schools), *Tinker v. Des Moines* (symbolic speech in schools), *New York Times Co. v. United States* (press prior restraint), *Engel v. Vitale* (school prayer), and *Mapp v. Ohio* (search and seizure). These cases once again reject tensions

between individual rights and societal interests; they also illustrate how each case involved real people and how the present laws resulted from the debates, trials, and sacrifices of ordinary people.

In examining the evolution of civil rights under the equal protection clause of the Fourteenth Amendment, students can draw upon their knowledge of the Civil War and the passage of the Reconstruction-era amendments. Students may examine the changing interpretation of civil rights law from the *Plessy v. Ferguson* decision of 1896 to the *Brown v. Board of Education* decision of 1954. Although it is not possible to analyze every decision that marked the shift of the Supreme Court from 1896 to 1954, critical reading of the *Yick Wo v. Hopkins*, *Korematsu v. United States*, *Mendez v. Westminster School District* (U.S. Circuit Court of Appeals, 1947), and *Sweatt v. Painter* decisions remind students that racial discrimination affected not only African Americans but other groups as well, including Asian Americans and Hispanics.

Subsequent Court cases addressed the rights of women (*Reed v. Reed*, 1971), American Indians (*Morton v. Mancari*, 1974) and the lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender community (*Lawrence v. Texas*, 2003, and *Obergefell v. Hodges*, 2015). The *Brown* decision and the cases of *Bakke v. Regents of the University of California* and *Grutter v. Bollinger* provide students with the opportunity to deliberate and debate whether affirmative action is an appropriate way to address inequality. School-related cases of *Tinker v. Des Moines* (1969), *Fricke v. Lynch* (1980), *New Jersey v. T.L.O* (1985), *Henkle v. Gregory* (2001), or the 2013 Resolution Agreement announced by the United States Department of Education in *Student v. Arcadia United School District* over additional perspectives relevant to students on free speech, privacy, nondiscrimination, and civil rights for students in schools.

Students may use materials from these cases and others to analyze majority and minority opinions; participate in classroom courts; write simple briefs extracting the facts, decisions, arguments, reasoning, and holding of the case or editorial pieces stating their views; and using evidence to support their conclusions about the decision.

The Electoral Process

How do you get elected?

Who gets elected, and who does not?

What impact do polls, political parties, and PACs have upon elections? How can I get involved in a campaign?

Why should I vote?

In today's society, individuals participate as citizens by voting, jury service, volunteerism, serving as members of advisory bodies, in military service, in community organizations, and by engagement in the electoral and political process. In this unit, students study the role of political parties, the nomination process for presidential candidates, including the primary system, and the role of polls, campaign advertising and financing, the Electoral College, and methods of direct democracy utilized in California and various states. They do this by considering the following questions: **How do you get elected? Who gets elected, and who does not?** and **What impact do polls, political parties, and PACs have upon elections?**

Students also learn about how citizens participate in the political process through voting, campaigning, lobbying, filing legal challenges, demonstrating, petitioning, picketing, and running for office. Because most students will be eligible to vote for the first time in a year of taking this course, questions like **Why should I vote?** and **How can I get involved in a campaign?** seem particularly relevant. This unit lends itself to utilizing real-world examples, case studies, and debates while students address the material.

Students can study current elections and campaigns, take part in the Secretary of State's Poll Worker program, and serve as campaign volunteers during an election. Students can also analyze proposed initiatives, controversial issues surrounding campaign financing, voter identification laws, redistricting, and negative campaign ads. To learn more about how the election process affects them and their education, students might be encouraged to study a school board race, candidate positions on education, or a local school bond or parcel tax campaign.

As a practical matter, students should know how to register to vote—both online and by mail—what the requirements are for registration; how to request, fill out, and return an absentee ballot; what to expect on election day; how to find a polling place; and where and how to access and understand the voter information pamphlet and other materials to become an informed voter.

Federalism: Different Levels of Government

Why are powers divided among different levels of government?

What level of government is the most important to me—local, state, tribal, or federal?

What level of government is the most powerful—local, state, tribal, or federal?

In this unit, students analyze the principles of federalism. They should identify key provisions of the U.S. Constitution that established the federal system including enumerated powers, Article I restrictions on states' powers, and the Ninth and Tenth Amendments. Teachers can emphasize how power and responsibilities are divided among national, state, local, and tribal governments and ask students to consider this question: **Why are powers divided among different levels of government?** Students should understand that local governments are established by the states, and tribal governments are recognized by constitutional provisions and federal law. The following questions help students consider the central principles: What are the major responsibilities of the various levels, and what are their revenue sources? What kinds of issues does each level of government handle?

At the federal level, examples might include regulation of interstate commerce and international trade, national defense, foreign policy, and antiterrorism, especially with the expansion of presidential and vice-presidential powers after the 9/11 attacks. Students can come to understand the scope of presidential power and decision making through case studies such as the Cuban Missile Crisis, the Bosnian intervention, the formulation and passage of the Great Society legislative program, the War Powers Act, and congressional authorizations of force in the Gulf War and the wars in Iraq and Afghanistan.

Students should also identify typical responsibilities of state government, including education, infrastructure such as roads and bridges, criminal and civil law, and regulation of business. The state also oversees and regulates local governments and the services provided such as re and police protection, sanitation, local public schools, public transportation, housing, and zoning and land use.

Nevertheless, what happens when there is overlapping jurisdiction? Matters such as education, health care, transportation, and housing often have multiple government agencies regulating and funding them. Students may explore questions such as these: How is public policy made at these various levels? How do regulatory departments and agencies function, and how do state and local regulatory agencies differ from those at the federal level? Students should examine the important realms of law and the courts (for example, criminal justice, family law, environmental protection, and education) that remain largely under state and county control.

Finally, students should explore the ways people interact with and influence state government and local government. **What level of government is the most important to me—local, state, tribal, or federal?** and **What level of government is the most powerful—local, state, tribal, or federal?** Lawyers, judges, or public officials can be invited into the classroom to participate in simulations and activities concerning the justice and court systems or municipal government. Examples of local government may be the school board, city council, county supervisors, and superior courts. Besides simulation, other options with more relevance for participation in democracy include participation in campaigns, voter registrations, and voting drives, as well as assistance in writing policy for local and state agencies. Students may attend and participate in public hearings. Students can be assigned project-based learning in which they identify and analyze a community problem in terms of its causes, effects, and policy implications; propose solutions; and take civic actions to implement those solutions, including the creation of evidence-based and multimedia presentations.

The Fourth Estate: The Role of the Media in American Public Life

To what extent are the press and the media fulfilling a watchdog role? Do media outlets provide enough relevant information about government and politics to allow citizens to vote and participate in a well-informed way?

How has the Internet revolution impacted journalism, and what are its effects on the coverage of public affairs and current issues?

Students also scrutinize the current role of the press in American democracy. Students may be presented with a series of compelling questions about the press (and its changing role in American political life over time) and be encouraged to form their own questions. **To what extent are the**

press and the media fulfilling a watchdog role? Do media outlets provide enough relevant information about government and politics to allow citizens to vote and participate in a well-informed way? How has the Internet revolution impacted journalism, and what are its effects on the coverage of public affairs and current issues? How do elected officials and candidates for public office utilize the mass media to further their goals? Students may begin to answer these questions with a brief review of the First Amendment's freedom of speech and of the press clauses and key U.S. Supreme Court press cases such as *Near v. Minnesota* (1931), *New York Times Co. v. Sullivan* (1964) and *Hazelwood v. Kuhlmeier* (1988).

Students should also discuss the responsibility of citizens to be informed about public issues by using the various media wisely. Students can engage in current-event and multimedia projects that would enable them to explore issues. For example, students may select a current issue of interest and research it by using multiple print and electronic media sources and analyze factual differences, bias, point of view and conclusions of each source. Based on their research, students could then write an evidence-based opinion piece on the issue.

Comparative Governments and the Challenges of Democracy

Do citizens have rights that the state must respect; if so, what are they?

What is the role of civil dissent and when is it necessary?

Why have some revolutions been followed by purges of dissidents, mass arrests of political opponents, murder of "class enemies," suppression of free speech, abolition of private property, and attacks on religious groups?

Why do authoritarian governments spy on their citizens and prevent them from emigrating? Why do they jail or harass critics of their government? Why is only one party allowed in an authoritarian state? Why do ordinary people risk their lives to flee or transform authoritarian states?

How do individual countries combat terrorist organizations that do not recognize international norms or boundaries? How can individual citizens or nongovernmental organizations improve civil society? How can multinational alliances work together to combat climate change?

This unit begins with a review of the major political and economic systems encountered by students during their previous years' studies (particularly in seventh, eighth, tenth, and eleventh grades): feudalism, mercantilism, socialism, fascism, communism, capitalism, monarchy, and parliamentary and constitutional liberal democracies in order to understand the historical context

for both democratic and autocratic systems. Students can study the philosophies of these systems and the ways in which they influence economic policies, social welfare policies, and human rights practices.

Teachers may emphasize that most nations combine aspects of different philosophies. When studying the variety of forms that democracies take, students can compare systems of shared powers—such as the United States where power is shared among the executive, legislative, and judicial branches of government—with parliamentary systems.

Students should also discuss the advantages and disadvantages of federal, co-federal, and unitary systems of government. Students can also examine how some Western democracies have “mixed” systems of capitalism and state socialism and contemporary politics has been marked by movements toward more market-based systems in the developing world and democratic socialism in the industrialized world.

Students examine nondemocratic and tyrannical forms of government, the conditions that gave rise to them in certain historical contexts, and the ways in which they functioned in countries like Italy, Japan, Haiti, Nigeria, Cambodia, and Iraq. Students may also define and identify illegitimate power and explore how dictators have gained and held onto office. The fundamental components that typically distinguish democracies from dictatorships include control of the media, lack of political and personal freedoms, corruption of public officials, lack of governmental transparency, and the lack of citizens’ access to changing the government. Case studies should be included in this unit in order to consider the economic, social, and political conditions that often give rise to tyranny. **Does such a government rest on the consent of the governed? Do citizens have rights that the state must respect; if so, what are they? What is the role of civil dissent, and when is it necessary?**

To answer these questions, students refer to aspects of democracy, such as tolerance for dissent, political equality, engaged participation, majority rule with protection of minority rights, the underpinnings of civil society, and individual freedom. They can also explore the importance of the rule of law and the unique role of an independent judiciary in a democracy, the need for civilian control of military and police, and the desirability of popular petitions, rallies, and other forms of participation.

Recent events can be incorporated in analytical projects and group debates and discussions and deliberations. For example, students may develop analysis papers on the success of democratic movements based on the above criteria in various countries such as Afghanistan, China, Zimbabwe, or Argentina. Learning about different forms of nonelected governments can help students understand their antithesis, democracy, and the relative success of democratic reforms in places like Botswana and Costa Rica. Further analysis into the characteristics of nondemocratic systems may highlight the dangers of concentrating power in a small group of elites, widespread governmental corruption, a lack of due process, and demagoguery. Such characteristics can be seen in both official nation-states (such as Syria under Assad) or in nongovernmental terrorist groups (such as the self-proclaimed Islamic State).

Students can use what they learned in grade ten about communism, the Russian Revolution, the dictatorship of Joseph Stalin, and the expansion of Soviet power after World War II to recall the

components of nonelected government in twentieth-century Russia. Alternatively, students can review what they learned in grade ten about the development of fascist dictatorships in Germany and Italy and how they systematically eliminated civil liberties, subverted the role of the military, and quashed political dissent.

Students can also address authoritarian regimes in recent times and places like Cuba, Laos, Vietnam, North Korea, Sudan, Syria, and China. Their similarities and differences, including the need for control of information, and the difficulties such regimes face in maintaining control of information given modern technology, such as the Internet and cell phones, may be the focus. Authoritarian governments in these contexts often come to power because they are supported by groups that believe that revolution or radical change can reform their societies.

Through this, students can study the concept of the total state in which the government, the military, the educational system, all social organizations, the media, and the economy are controlled by the regime. They may also consider the challenges of sustaining these kinds of governments—both within, from dissidents and without, from the Internet. Students should come away with both an understanding of the contexts in which different kinds of governments arise and also with a sense of the value of a free press, open educational institutions, free labor unions, and free speech in democratic regimes.

To deepen their understanding of authoritarian regimes, students should also examine the condition of human rights: **Why have some revolutions been followed by purges of dissidents, mass arrests of political opponents, murder of “class enemies,” suppression of free speech, abolition of private property, and attacks on religious groups? What are fundamental human rights are widely recognized throughout the world community? Why does denial of human rights so often accompany a violent change of government? Why do many artists and intellectuals defect to nonauthoritarian nations? Why do authoritarian governments spy on their citizens and prevent them from emigrating? Why do they jail or harass critics of their government? Why is only one party allowed in an authoritarian state? Why do ordinary people risk their lives to flee or transform authoritarian states?** Students can analyze why communism collapsed and study the governments that arose in the former Soviet Union and Eastern Europe.

Students should also examine international efforts to protect human rights (e.g., the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, jurisdiction of the World Court and International Criminal Court) and current relevant issues such as protection of civilian populations during wartime, oppression of minority groups, and forced removal or genocide. Students can read and analyze the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights and compare it to the 1776 Bill of Rights, noting similarities and differences for additional discussion (e.g., group rights versus individual rights).

Attention also should be given to historical and contemporary movements that overthrew tyrannical governments and/or movements toward democratic government in countries such as Spain, Poland, Mexico, Argentina, Chile, the Philippines, South Korea, Guatemala, El Salvador, South Africa, Turkey, and Egypt.

However, as each case illustrates, democracy is a process and must be understood on a spectrum and in its own geopolitical and temporal context. Questions like **How do government actions impact civil society?** can engage students in this unit. Teachers may conduct structured discussions in which students deliberate on issues that might impact America's vision of a civil society, such as globalization, international and internal migrations, environmental change, or technological innovation. They can consider the degree to which given movements were successful in establishing democratic governments. Students can also be assigned multimedia or writing projects on specific movements and draw evidence-based conclusions on their success.

Finally, students should understand the range of actors beyond the nation-state that influence today's world including nongovernmental organizations, multinational corporations, and international and regional alliances, economic bodies, and associations. Contemporary problems such as the environment, economics, and terrorism cross state borders and demand a different kind of national and international community than the world of the twentieth century. Students can consider questions such as **How do individual countries combat terrorist organizations that do not recognize international norms or boundaries? What challenges do efforts to combat nonstate terrorist organizations create for the operation of international humanitarian law? How can individual citizens or nongovernmental organizations improve civil society? How can multinational alliances work together to combat climate change?**

Compelling Questions and Contemporary Issues

This course provides opportunities for students to formulate compelling and supporting questions and analyze tensions in a constitutional democracy between key concepts and ideals such as majority rule and individual rights, liberty, and equality; state and national authority in a federal system; civil disobedience and the rule of law; freedom of the press and the right to a fair trial; and the relationship of religion and government.

This course also provides opportunities for students to discuss, analyze, and construct writings on contemporary local, national, and international issues; participate in simulations of governmental processes; and apply what they have learned in addressing real-world problems. Opportunities may be offered inside and outside the classroom. Structured classroom discussions and writing activities challenge students to discuss current events and issues of their choosing by analyzing various perspectives, researching causes and effects, evaluating policy options, and stating and supporting reasoned and evidence-based opinions. These activities can also focus on the significance of elections and the roles that students might play as voters engaged in electoral politics.

Topics for discussion may include technology (such as nuclear proliferation or the effect of the Internet on the political process or on intellectual property), the environment (such as global warming, preservation of wildlife, or alternative energy sources), human rights (such as the use of torture, or immigration and refugee policies), politics (such as tax policy, voting and representation, campaign financing, or the fight against government corruption and efforts to improve government competence), foreign policy (such as responses to terrorism, or standards for foreign intervention), health (such as childhood obesity, health care reform, or responses to the spread of AIDS), the law (such as the constitutional scope and limits of presidential power, relations

between law enforcement and the communities they protect, judicial independence, racism and sexism, discrimination against members of the LGBT community, or protection of civil rights in times of war or national crisis) and economic issues (such as government regulation of markets, labor laws, free trade and fair trade, or debt relief to developing countries).

In debating, discussing, or writing about these issues, students consider the local, national, and global aspects.

Teachers encourage students to consider multiple perspectives that stretch across political, geographic, and class divides. Throughout the course, incorporating a range of activities and simulations of governmental processes will help students understand that being an active citizen means applying their knowledge beyond the textbook. They will have an opportunity to practice participating in community issues and civic dialogue. For example, when studying the role of Congress or a city council, students can participate in mock legislative hearings and debates; when studying the courts, they may take part in mock trials, moot-court simulations, or conflict-resolution mediations; or when studying international issues they can take part in model United Nations activities.

In addition, participating in elections, volunteering as poll workers, taking part in school governance and extracurricular activities, competing in civic-writing activities, and conducting service-learning projects with civic outcomes provide students with hands-on experiences with the political process and government.

Among the persistent issues facing the United States and California, in particular, is how to balance individual rights and liberties with the common good in matters related to land as well as water, air, and other natural resources. Students examine case studies that embody the struggle to find this balance and consider the spectrum of factors that influence policy decisions about natural resources and natural systems (see appendix G for Environmental Principle V). Students learn that many conflicts over environmental issues result from competing perspectives involving individual rights and the common good, an illustrative example of the reciprocity between rights and obligations. (See Education and the Environment Initiative curriculum unit “This Land Is Our Land,” 12.2.)

The course may culminate in an activity in which students analyze a local, state, national, or international political or social problem or issue. Teachers may assign a research paper or a multimedia project in which students analyze a problem or issue; consider its civic, economic, geographic, and/or historical dimensions; research it by examining multiple sources and points of view; evaluate the sources; critique and construct claims and conclusions based on the evidence; and present and defend their conclusions. Alternately, the activity might be a civics-based service-learning project in which students identify local problems or issues of concern; research and analyze them in terms of causes and effects and multiple points of view; identify, discuss, and evaluate public policies relating to the issues, including interacting with public officials; and construct a project to address it or a multimedia presentation to educate about it.

Appendix 6: Moral Foundations Dictionary

⌘

01	HarmVirtue
02	HarmVice
03	FairnessVirtue
04	FairnessVice
05	IngroupVirtue
06	IngroupVice
07	AuthorityVirtue
08	AuthorityVice

09 PurityVirtue
 10 PurityVice
 11 MoralityGeneral

⊘

safe* 01
 peace* 01
 compassion* 01
 empath* 01
 sympath* 01
 care 01
 caring 01
 protect* 01
 shield 01
 shelter 01
 amity 01
 secur* 01
 benefit* 01
 defen* 01
 guard* 01
 preserve 01 07 09

harm* 02
 suffer* 02
 war 02
 wars 02
 warl* 02
 warring 02
 fight* 02
 violen* 02
 hurt* 02
 kill 02

kills	02
killer*	02
killed	02
killing	02
endanger*	02
cruel*	02
brutal*	02
abuse*	02
damag*	02
ruin*	02 10
ravage	02
detriment*	02
crush*	02
attack*	02
annihilate*	02
destroy	02
stomp	02
abandon*	02 06
spurn	02
impair	02
exploit	02 10
exploits	02 10
exploited	02 10
exploiting	02 10
wound*	02
fair	03
fairly	03
fairness	03
fair-*	03
fairmind*	03
fairplay	03

equal*	03
justice	03
justness	03
justifi*	03
reciproc*	03
impartial*	03
egalitar*	03
rights	03
equity	03
evenness	03
equivalent	03
unbias*	03
tolerant	03
equable	03
balance*	03
homologous	03
unprejudice*	03
reasonable	03
constant	03
honest*	03 11
unfair*	04
unequal*	04
bias*	04
unjust*	04
injust*	04
bigot*	04
discriminat*	04
disproportion*	04
inequitable	04
prejud*	04
dishonest	04

unscrupulous	04
dissociate	04
preference	04
favoritism	04
segregat*	04 05
exclusion	04
exclud*	04
together	05
nation*	05
homeland*	05
family	05
families	05
familial	05
group	05
loyal*	05 07
patriot*	05
communal	05
commune*	05
communit*	05
communis*	05
comrad*	05
cadre	05
collectiv*	05
joint	05
unison	05
unite*	05
fellow*	05
guild	05
solidarity	05
devot*	05
member	05

cliqu*	05
cohort	05
ally	05
insider	05
foreign*	06
enem*	06
betray*	06 08
treason*	06 08
traitor*	06 08
treacher*	06 08
disloyal*	06 08
individual*	06
apostasy	06 08 10
apostate	06 08 10
deserted	06 08
deserter*	06 08
deserting	06 08
deceiv*	06
jilt*	06
imposter	06
miscreant	06
spy	06
sequester	06
renegade	06
terroris*	06
immigra*	06
obey*	07
obedien*	07
duty	07

law	07
lawful*	07 11
legal*	07 11
duti*	07
honor*	07
respect	07
respectful*	07
respected	07
respects	07
order*	07
father*	07
mother	07
motherl*	07
mothering	07
mothers	07
tradition*	07
hierarch*	07
authorit*	07
permit	07
permission	07
status*	07
rank*	07
leader*	07
class	07
bourgeoisie	07
caste*	07
position	07
complian*	07
command	07
supremacy	07
control	07
submi*	07

allegian*	07
serve	07
abide	07
defere*	07
defer	07
revere*	07
venerat*	07
comply	07
defian*	08
rebel*	08
dissent*	08
subver*	08
disrespect*	08
disobe*	08
sediti*	08
agitat*	08
insubordinat*	08
illegal*	08
lawless*	08
insurgent	08
mutinous	08
defy*	08
dissident	08
unfaithful	08
alienate	08
defector	08
heretic*	08 10
nonconformist	08
oppose	08
protest	08
refuse	08

denounce	08
remonstrate	08
riot*	08
obstruct	08
piety	09 11
pious	09 11
purity	09
pure*	09
clean*	09
steril*	09
sacred*	09
chast*	09
holy	09
holiness	09
saint*	09
wholesome*	09 11
celiba*	09
abstention	09
virgin	09
virgins	09
virginity	09
virginal	09
austerity	09
integrity	09 11
modesty	09
abstinen*	09
abstemiousness	09
upright	09 11
limpid	09
unadulterated	09
maiden	09

virtuous	09
refined	09
decen*	09 11
immaculate	09
innocent	09
pristine	09
church*	09
disgust*	10
deprav*	10
disease*	10
unclean*	10
contagio*	10
indecen*	10 11
sin	10
sinful*	10
sinner*	10
sins	10
sinned	10
sinning	10
slut*	10
whore	10
dirt*	10
impiety	10
impious	10
profan*	10
gross	10
repuls*	10
sick*	10
promiscu*	10
lewd*	10
adulter*	10

debauche*	10
defile*	10
tramp	10
prostitut*	10
unchaste	10
intemperate	10
wanton	10
profligate	10
filth*	10
trashy	10
obscen*	10
lax	10
taint*	10
stain*	10
tarnish*	10
debase*	10
desecrat*	10
wicked*	10 11
blemish	10
exploitat*	10
pervert	10
wretched*	10 11
righteous*	11
moral*	11
ethic*	11
value*	11
upstanding	11
good	11
goodness	11
principle*	11

blameless	11
exemplary	11
lesson	11
canon	11
doctrine	11
noble	11
worth*	11
ideal*	11
praiseworthy	11
commendable	11
character	11
proper	11
laudable	11
correct	11
wrong*	11
evil	11
immoral*	11
bad	11
offend*	11
offensive*	11
transgress*	11