

Analysis Of The Perception Of Small Businesses On The Quality Of Routine Municipal Services In The City Of Tshwane, South Africa

Zelege Worku, Tshwane University of Technology (TUT) Business School, South Africa

ABSTRACT

A survey was conducted (2012 to 2014) in the City of Tshwane in order to assess and evaluate determinants of adequate municipal services that are routinely provided to operators of start-up business enterprises. Data used in the report come from 1, 058 small businesses. The aim of research was to assess and evaluate the relationship between the quality of services and sustained viability in small business enterprises. The study was conducted against the background of a high failure rate among newly established small businesses in the City of Tshwane. The study found that about 40% of the 1, 058 businesses in the study failed or were not profitable at the end of the 3-year study period. The study showed that there was a significant association between positive perception of business operators on the quality of municipal services provided to them and viability of businesses. The percentage of viable business enterprises that were satisfied with the quality of services provided to them was 87%. The percentage of non-viable business enterprises that were satisfied with the quality of services provided to them was only 13%. Profitability in business enterprises was significantly affected by lack of capacity for fulfilling the business and entrepreneurial needs of newly established businesses [Hazard Ratio = 3.58; P=0.000; 95% C. I. = (1.45, 5.46)], inappropriate policy [Hazard Ratio = 3.19; P=0.000; 95% C. I. = (1.39, 5.28)], and lack of tailor made training programmes directed at newly established small businesses [Hazard Ratio = 2.89; P=0.000; 95% C. I. = (1.24, 4.77)]. In-depth interviews conducted with business operators led to similar findings.

Keywords: City of Tshwane; Small Businesses; Municipal Services; Perception; Hazard Ratio

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO STUDY

The study was motivated by the need for isolating key barriers to profitability in start-up business enterprises in the Tshwane region of South Africa. Marivate (2014) and Khale (2015) has reported that more than 50% of all start-up Small, Micro and Medium-sized Enterprises (SMMEs) that conduct business in and around Tshwane fail in their first three years of establishment due to lack of entrepreneurial skills, lack of access to loans and lack of monitoring and evaluation programmes. Prior studies (e.g., Nenungwi (2012); Booyens (2011); Brownson (2014); Marivate (2014); Worku (2015); Khale (2015)) have shown that sustained growth and viability in start-up SMMEs conducting business in and around Tshwane is undermined by the lack of efficient municipal services, bureaucracy and over-regulation. Marivate (2014) and Khale (2015) have reported that start-up SMMEs in and around Tshwane do not benefit significantly from financial and non-financial assistance provided to them by the South African Small Enterprises Development Agency (SEDA). Brownson (2014) and Edoho (2015) have reported that over-regulation, too much bureaucracy and failure in incubation programmes rolled out by SEDA are key obstacles to profitability in start-up SMMEs operating in the various parts of Gauteng Province including Tshwane. The purpose of the study was to assess the strength of association between sustained viability in SMMEs and the provision of quality municipal services to small businesses operating in the various parts of the City of Tshwane based on a longitudinal study design (2012 to 2014). Lack of capacity in business incubation programmes that are financed and rolled out by SEDA is a key barrier in start-up enterprises that need hands-on assistance, coaching and mentoring on running SMMEs efficiently. Findings reported by Khale (2015), Marivate (2014) and Edoho (2015) indicate that the current high failure rate among start-up SMMEs in and around Tshwane is attributed to inefficient

municipal services, over-regulation, unnecessary bureaucratic procedures, lack of transparency, lack of good governance, lack of efficiency in the administration and management of license applications, inability to assess and evaluate tax, lack of entrepreneurial skills, lack of accounting and auditing and bookkeeping skills, inability to draw up business plans, inability to make oral presentations, inability to network with business rivals and competitors, difficulty in securing loans from commercial banks and micro-lending financial institutions and lack of infrastructure. This report is based on one of very few longitudinal studies that have been conducted in the Tshwane region of Gauteng Province in South Africa for assessing the impact of poor municipal service delivery on the viability of start-up SMMEs. The manuscript is structured as follows: introduction and background, a succinct review of the relevant literature, research questions and hypotheses, research methodology, results obtained from data analyses, a discussion of key findings of study, and recommendations based on findings obtained from the study.

OBJECTIVE OF STUDY

The overall objective of the study was to assess the relationship between the provision of efficient municipal services to start-up business enterprises and sustained profitability in start-up business enterprises in the City of Tshwane by using standard econometric procedures that are applicable to panel data analysis. The aim of study was to test the hypothesis that the provision of efficient municipal services to start-up businesses leads to sustained growth and profitability in newly established SMMEs in Tshwane. One of the specific objectives of study was to estimate economic indicators of sustained profitability in start-up business enterprises operating in and around Tshwane in South Africa.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Asah, Fatoki and Rungani (2015) have pointed out that although the South African SMME sector is a key contributor to national economic growth and development, the degree of support provided to the sector has so far been grossly inadequate by international standards. A report issued by the South African Chamber of Commerce and Industry (2016) indicates that 20% of all units exported by South Africa are produced by small and medium-sized enterprises. Although it is generally accepted that growing the SMME sector of the economy is vital for the alleviation of poverty and unemployment, the support provided to the sector since April 1994 has been grossly inadequate (Marivate, 2014). Edoho (2015) has reported that one of the most basic needs of start-up enterprises is the efficient delivery of municipal services. However, Khale (2015) and Marivate (2014) have pointed out that the current high failure rate among start-up enterprises is attributed to inefficient municipal services. Edoho (2015) and Brownson (2014) have found that inefficient municipal services, over-regulation and lack of management as well as financial skills constitute some of the key barriers to growth and profitability in small businesses. Henrekson (2014) has shown that development assistance programmes provided to small enterprises by SEDA are not tailor-made to the needs of SMMEs. Marivate (2014) has found that financial and non-financial assistance programmes that are offered to start-up business enterprises are poorly financed, monitored and implemented. The South African SMME sector is characterized by lack of entrepreneurial skills (Edoho, 2015; Worku, 2014; Seeletse, 2012; Asah, Fatoki & Rungani, 2015), over-regulation (Shree and Urban, 2012), too much bureaucracy (Henrekson, 2014), difficulty in securing loans (Brownson, 2014) and poor municipal services (Khale, 2015).

The annual report issued by the South African Chamber of Commerce and Industry (2016) for the financial year 2014/2015 has confirmed that problems of over-regulation and lack of good governance stifle growth and sustained profitability in start-up enterprises. Asah, Fatoki and Rungani (2015) have reported that lack of basic entrepreneurial skills, difficulty in securing loans, cumbersome bureaucracy and corruption hinder profitability in the SMME sector. Edoho (2015) has argued that it is essential to provide tailor-made skills based training opportunities to aspiring entrepreneurs as a means of addressing the critical shortage of business and entrepreneurial skills among black Africans. Reports published by Khale (2015) and Marivate (2014) have shown that poor service delivery by local governments and municipalities as well as lack of adherence to good governance principles stifle sustained development in SMMEs.

Based on a 5-yearlong study of South African SMMEs, Marivate (2014) has found that the South African curriculum does not adequately prepare young graduates for entrepreneurial activities. According to Henrekson (2014), Ladzani & Netswera (2009), Seeletse (2012), Marivate (2014), Brownson (2014), Shree & Urban (2012), Booyens (2011),

Bezuidenhout & Nenungwi (2012), Asah, Fatoki & Rungani (2012), Edoho (2015) and Worku (2014), the task of addressing the underlying causes of failure in start-up enterprises operating in various parts of South Africa requires policy-related intervention. A comprehensive review of the literature on South African SMMEs shows that the most notable causes of failure in start-up enterprises are lack of entrepreneurial skills, lack of access to loans, inefficient municipal service delivery, over-regulation, poor leadership, lack of efficiency in enforcing municipal bylaws on SMMEs, failure to adhere to good governance principles, lack of monitoring and evaluation programmes, and lack of relevance of government support programmes to the operational and developmental needs of start-up business enterprises.

RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND HYPOTHESES

The research was aimed at providing adequate answers to the following two key research questions:

- How satisfied are operators of SMMEs in Tshwane with the quality of municipal services that are provided to them by employees of the City of Tshwane?
- What socioeconomic indicators adversely affect sustained growth and development in start-up SMMEs that operate in the City of Tshwane?

One of the key aims of study was to test the hypothesis that the provision of efficient municipal services to start-up businesses leads to sustained growth and profitability in newly established SMMEs in Tshwane. To this end, the following null and alternative hypotheses were formulated:

Null hypothesis: Sustained growth and development in start-up SMMEs that operate in the City of Tshwane is not affected by the quality of municipal services provided by employees of the City of Tshwane

Alternative hypothesis: Sustained growth and development in start-up SMMEs that operate in the City of Tshwane is significantly affected by the quality of municipal services provided by employees of the City of Tshwane.

The strength of association between viability in start-up SMMEs and the quality of municipal services was assessed by using Pearson's chi-square tests of association (Hair, Black, Rabin & Anderson, 2010). At the 5% level of significance, the null hypothesis is rejected if the P-value obtained from data analysis falls below 5%.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The design of study was longitudinal (2012 to 2014) in which data were collected from start-up businesses operating in the various parts of the City of Tshwane as a means of assessing the quality of routine municipal services provided to start-up SMMEs. Monthly data were collected from 1, 058 SMMEs conducting business in Tshwane (Khale, 2015) by using a structured questionnaire on factors that are known to influence sustained profitability in start-up SMMEs. The businesses in the study were selected from the five geographical zones of Tshwane (central, east, west, north and south). Data was collected by trained enumerators. The perception of business operators on the quality of municipal services provided to them was assessed by using a 5-point ordinal scale. Other data were captured from business records. Standard econometric analyses were performed by using Pearson's chi-square tests of association (Hair, Black, Rabin & Anderson, 2010), the Cox proportional hazards model (Kleinbaum, Kupper, Nizam & Rosenberg, 2013), longitudinal data analysis with multilevel models (Heck & Thomas, 2015) and Markov Chain Monte Carlo (MCMC) algorithms (Browne & Goldstein, 2010). The statistical package STATA version 14 (Stata Corporation, 2015) was used for data entry and analyses.

The Cox Proportional Hazards Model

The hazard function for the Cox Proportional Hazards Model (Kleinbaum, Kupper, Nizam & Rosenberg, 2013) is given by:

$$h(t, X) = h_0(t) \exp \left(\sum_{i=1}^p \beta_i X_i \right)$$

where $X = (X_1, \dots, X_p)$ is a collection of p explanatory variables that affect survival time.

The Cox model uses survival times and censoring for the estimation of parameters. In Cox regression, the measure of effect is the hazard ratio, which involves only the β 's. Estimates of the β 's are maximum likelihood estimates.

$h_0(t)$ is the baseline hazard function. It involves t , but not the X variables. For the Cox Proportional Hazards Model, $h_0(t)$ is obtained by replacing all the X variables in $h(t, X)$ by zeroes. The proportional hazards assumption requires that the hazard rate is constant over time, or equivalently, that the hazard for one individual is proportional to the hazard for any other individual, where the proportionality constant is independent of time. The assumption of proportional hazards is tested using log-minus-log plots. Parallel curves show that the assumption is satisfied, while non-parallel curves show that the assumption is violated (Cleves, Gould & Gutierrez, 2004).

The expression $\sum_{i=1}^p \beta_i X_i$ involves the X variables, but not t . The X variables do not depend on the time t .

The Cox proportional hazards model is non-parametric because $h_0(t)$ is unspecified.

In the Cox proportional hazards model, the hazards ratio is estimated by $HR = \frac{\hat{h}(t, X^*)}{\hat{h}(t, X)} = \exp \left[\sum_{i=1}^p \hat{\beta}_i (X_i^* - X_i) \right]$

$$= \exp \left[\hat{\beta}_1 (X_1^* - X_1) + \hat{\beta}_2 (X_2^* - X_2) + \dots + \hat{\beta}_p (X_p^* - X_p) \right] = \Theta \quad (\text{Constant})$$

The expression for the hazard ratio does not involve the time t , because the baseline hazard has cancelled out.

$$\hat{h}(t, X^*) = \hat{\Theta} \hat{h}(t, X)$$

In the above expression, θ is a constant of proportionality, and does not depend on the time t . In panel data analysis, the econometric measure of effect is the hazards ratio. At the 5% level of significance, influential predictors of survival are characterized by hazard ratios that differ from 1 significantly, 95% confidence intervals of hazard ratios that do not contain 1, and P-values that are smaller than 0.05. Markov Chain Monte Carlo (MCMC) algorithms or Bayesian analysis (Browne & Goldstein, 2010) was conducted by creating a joint posterior density function as a product of a prior density function and a likelihood function. Bayesian analysis is highly recommended in cases where the assumption of normality is not satisfied. Regression coefficients that are estimated from Bayesian analysis are analogous to regression coefficients estimated from multiple linear regression analysis.

RESULTS

Results obtained from data analyses were summarized succinctly by using frequency tables, cross-tab analyses, panel data analyses and Bayesian analysis. Table 1 shows the basic socioeconomic characteristics of the 1, 058 businesses that were selected for the study. It can be seen from the table that about 60% of businesses were profitable, whereas about 40% of them were not profitable. The table shows that about 20% of entrepreneurs were not satisfied with the quality of municipal services provided to them by the City of Tshwane. About 63% of businesses were operated by men. About 20% of business operators had matric level academic qualifications or less. About 20% of businesses were operated by black entrepreneurs, whereas about 46% of businesses were operated by white entrepreneurs. Nearly 29% of businesses were started with own savings. About 34% of businesses were started with capital ranging from 300, 000 Rand to 500, 000 Rand (about 20, 000 to 34, 000 American Dollars). About 31% of entrepreneurs had attended at least one training opportunity in the past.

Table 1. Socioeconomic characteristics of SMMEs (n=1, 058)

| Characteristic of business enterprise | Frequency (Percentage) |
|--|---|
| Profitability | Yes: 631 (59.64%) No: 427 (40.36%) |
| Geographical location of business in Tshwane | Central: 268 (25.33%) East: 216 (20.42%) West: 198 (18.71%) North: 209 (19.75%) South: 167 (15.78%) |
| Gender of business operator | Male: 667 (63.04%) Female: 391 (36.96%) |
| Highest level of formal education | Matric or less: 209 (19.75%) Certificate: 212 (20.04%) Diploma: 236 (22.31%) Bachelor’s degree: 322 (30.43%) Master’s degree or more: 79 (7.47%) |
| Ethnic background of business operator | African: 308 (29.11%) White: 487 (46.03%) Coloured: 204 (19.28%) Indian: 59 (5.58%) |
| Start-up capital in Rand | 100, 000 or less: 154 (14.56%) 100, 001 to 300, 000: 279 (26.37%) 300, 001 to 500, 000: 356 (33.65%) 500, 001 to 1, 000, 000: 226 (21.36%) More than 1, 000, 000: 43 (4.06%) |
| Current capital in Rand | 100, 000 or less: 31 (2.93%) 100, 001 to 300, 000: 302 (28.54%) 300, 001 to 500, 000: 369 (34.88%) 500, 001 to 1, 000, 000: 288 (27.22%) More than 1, 000, 000: 68 (6.43%) |
| Attendance of past training programmes for owners and operators of SMMEs | Yes: 327 (31%) No: 731 (69%) |
| Age of business in months | Less than 12 months: 71 (6.71%) 13 to 36 months: 212 (20.04%) 37 to 60 months: 489 (46.22%) More than 60 months: 286 (27.03%) |
| Type of business | Footwear: 214 (20.23%) Textile: 218 (21.31%) Food outlet: 109 (10.30%) Automotive: 28 (2.65%) Accommodation: 47 (4.44%) Minimarket: 59 (5.58%) Convenience store: 146 (13.80%) Internet café: 24 (2.27%) Furniture store: 26 (2.46%) Construction: 46 (4.35%) Transport or tourism: 76 (7.18%) Secretarial services: 19 (1.80%) Hair dressing: 46 (4.35%) |
| Source of initial capital | Own savings: 302 (28.54%) Family or friends: 309 (29.21%) Loan: 389 (36.77%) Others: 58 (5.48%) |
| Perception on the quality of municipal services provided to business | Good: 87 (8.22%) Above average: 351 (33.18%) Average: 404 (38.19%) Below average: 102 (9.64%) Poor: 114 (10.78%) |

Source: Worku (2014)

Table 2 compares profitable businesses with non-profitable businesses. The table compares 631 profitable businesses (59.64%) with 427 non-profitable businesses (40.36%) with regards to 6 key predictors of viability in small businesses. The table shows that the perception held by owners and operators of viable businesses were relatively more positive in comparison with the perceptions held by the owners and operators of non-viable businesses with regards to capacity, policy, the suitability of training programmes provided to newly established businesses, the ease of securing loans, entrepreneurial skills and past history of bankruptcy. Viable businesses were operated by owners and managers with relatively higher levels of entrepreneurial skills. Non-viable businesses were characterized by inability to secure loan needed for business operation (65%) and past history of bankruptcy (54%). The corresponding figures for viable businesses were only 27% and 13% respectively.

Table 2. Comparison of SMMEs with regards to sustained profitability (n=1, 058)

| Indicator of profitability | Profitable (n=631) | Non profitable (n=427) |
|---|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Perception on the quality of municipal services provided to newly established SMMEs | Positive: 87% Negative: 13% | Positive: 14% Negative: 86% |
| Capacity for fulfilling the business and entrepreneurial needs of newly established SMMEs | Adequate: 71% Inadequate: 29% | Adequate: 28% Inadequate: 72% |
| Policy used for supporting newly established small businesses | Adequate: 56% Inadequate: 44% | Adequate: 31% Inadequate: 69% |
| Presence of tailor-made training programmes for owners and operators of SMMEs | Adequate: 69% Inadequate: 31% | Adequate: 34% Inadequate: 66% |
| Ease of obtaining loan from money lending institutions | Yes: 73% No: 27% | Yes: 35% No: 65% |
| Level of entrepreneurial skills of business owners and operators | Adequate: 74% Inadequate: 36% | Adequate: 33% Inadequate: 65% |
| Past history of bankruptcy | Yes: 13% No: 87% | Yes: 54% No: 46% |

Source: Worku (2014)

Table 3 provides hazard ratios estimated from Cox regression. It can be seen from the table that profitability is influenced by negative perception on the quality of municipal services provided to newly established businesses [Hazard Ratio = 3.58; P=0.000; 95% C. I. = (1.45, 5.46)], inappropriate policy [Hazard Ratio = 3.19; P=0.000; 95% C. I. = (1.39, 5.28)], and lack of tailor made training programmes directed at newly established small businesses [Hazard Ratio = 2.89; P=0.000; 95% C. I. = (1.24, 4.77)]. The hazard ratios were adjusted for geographical location, age of owner and gender. Adjusted and unadjusted hazard ratios were fairly similar with each other, thereby showing that the estimates were not distorted. The variables negative perception on the quality of municipal service delivery and profitability were negatively and significantly associated with each other ($r = 0.47$). The corresponding values for the variables inappropriate policy and lack of tailor-made training programmes were equal to -0.41 and -0.37 respectively.

Table 3. Hazard ratios obtained from Cox regression

| Predictor | Hazard Ratio | P-value | 95% C.I. |
|--|--------------|---------|--------------|
| Negative perception on the quality of municipal services | 3.58 | 0.000 | (1.45, 5.46) |
| Inappropriate policy | 3.19 | 0.000 | (1.39, 5.28) |
| Lack of tailor made training programmes | 2.89 | 0.000 | (1.24, 4.77) |

Source: Worku (2014)

The adjusted hazard ratio of the variable “Negative perception on the quality of municipal services” is 3.58. This shows that businesses that were owned or operated by people with a negative perception on the quality of municipal services provided to newly established businesses were 3.58 times as likely to fail in comparison with businesses that were owned or operated by people with a positive perception on the quality of municipal services provided to newly established businesses. The adjusted hazard ratio of the variable “inappropriate policy” is 3.19. This shows that businesses that were owned or operated by people with the perception that the City of Tshwane was implementing inappropriate policy on the growth and development of newly established SMMEs were 3.19 times as likely to fail in

comparison with businesses that were owned or operated by people with the perception that the City of Tshwane was implementing an appropriate policy on the growth and development of newly established SMMEs. The adjusted hazard ratio of the variable “lack of tailor made training programmes” is 2.89. This shows that businesses that were owned or operated by people with the perception that the City of Tshwane did not have a tailor made training programme for newly established SMMEs were 2.89 times as likely to fail in comparison with businesses that were owned or operated by people with the perception that the City of Tshwane has a tailor made training programme for newly established SMMEs”.

Results Obtained from Makov Chain Monte Carlo (MCMC) Algorithms

Makov Chain Monte Carlo (MCMC) algorithms (Browne and Goldstein, 2010) were used for performing bootstrapping simulations. MCMC algorithms are used for solving multilevel problems that involve the construction of constrained variance matrices in cases where linear estimation techniques fail to produce theoretically reliable estimates of parameters. MCMC algorithms are used extensively as part of Bayesian analysis. Table 4 shows adjusted regression coefficients estimated from MCMC algorithms.

Table 4. Adjusted linear regression coefficients estimated from MCMC algorithm

| Predictor variable | *Adjusted linear regression coefficient | 95% Confidence Interval | P-value |
|--|---|-------------------------|---------|
| Negative perception on the quality of municipal services | 1.29 | (0.79, 3.41) | 0.000 |
| Inappropriate policy | 1.18 | (0.76, 3.39) | 0.000 |
| Lack of access to tailor made training programmes | 1.08 | (0.64, 3.27) | 0.000 |

Source: Worku (2014)

A hazard ratio is theoretically equivalent to the exponential value of the corresponding regression coefficient. The exponential values of the 3 influential linear regression coefficients shown in Table 4 above are fairly similar in magnitude to the 3 hazard ratios shown in Table 3. This indicates that the results obtained from MCMC algorithms and Bayesian analysis are fairly similar to estimates obtained from panel data analysis.

DISCUSSION

The key results obtained from data analyses were succinctly summarized. The study has shown that about 40% of the 1, 058 businesses in the study failed or were not profitable. All in all, about 20% of entrepreneurs in the study were not satisfied with the quality of municipal services provided to them by the City of Tshwane. The results showed that 87% of viable businesses were satisfied with the quality of routine municipal services that were provided to them by the City of Tshwane. The corresponding figure for non-viable businesses was only 14%. Viable businesses were run by owners and operators who felt that the quality of municipal services provided to newly established SMMEs was generally satisfactory, whereas non-viable SMMEs were run by owners and operators who felt that the quality of municipal services provided to newly established SMMEs was not satisfactory. In general, the perception held by owners and operators of viable businesses were relatively more positive in comparison with the perceptions held by the owners and operators of non-viable businesses with regards to the quality of municipal service delivery, capacity, policy, the suitability of training programmes provided to newly established businesses, the ease of securing loans, entrepreneurial skills and past history of bankruptcy. Viable businesses were operated by owners and managers with relatively higher levels of entrepreneurial skills. Non-viable businesses were characterized by inability to secure loan needed for business operation (65%) and past history of bankruptcy (54%). The corresponding figures for viable businesses were only 27% and 13% respectively.

Results obtained from panel data analysis and Bayesian analyses showed that failure in newly established small businesses was significantly influenced by 3 predictor variables. These 3 influential predictor variables were: negative perception on the quality of municipal services provided to newly established businesses [Hazard Ratio = 3.58; P=0.000; 95% C. I. = (1.45, 5.46)], inappropriate policy [Hazard Ratio = 3.19; P=0.000; 95% C. I. = (1.39, 5.28)], and lack of tailor made training programmes directed at newly established small businesses [Hazard Ratio = 2.89; P=0.000; 95% C. I. = (1.24, 4.77)], in a decreasing order of strength. The study has shown how detrimental poor municipal

service delivery and inappropriate policy are to start-up SMMEs in Tshwane. Findings of the study call for policy-related intervention by the City of Tshwane. The natural remedial action is to ensure the provision of readily accessible, user-friendly, transparent, objective, accountable, fair and highly efficient municipal services to start-up SMMEs operating in all parts of Tshwane. The proportional hazards assumption made in Cox regression was tested for validity by using log-minus-log plots (Kleinbaum, Kupper, Nizam & Rosenberg, 2013). Findings obtained from the study are in agreement with results reported by Ladzani and Netswera (2009), Seeletse (2012), Marivate (2014), Brownson (2014), Henrekson (2014), Shree and Urban (2012), Booyens (2011), Bezuidenhout and Nenungwi (2012), Asah, Fatoki and Rungani (2012), Worku (2014) and Edoho (2015).

The null hypothesis tested by the study has been duly rejected. That is, results obtained from the study have clearly shown that sustained growth and development in start-up SMMEs that operate in the City of Tshwane is affected significantly by the quality of municipal services that are provided by employees of the City of Tshwane to customers. The main difference between the current study and all other previous studies is that the current study is based on a longitudinal study design, and has produced hazard ratios that are theoretically more reliable than crude estimates that are obtained from studies that are based on cross-sectional study designs. Moreover, the sample size of study is quite large (n=1, 058). As such, estimates obtained from this study carry relatively more weight.

RECOMMENDATION

The study has found that the majority of non-profitable start-up businesses in the study were characterized by the perception of poor municipal service delivery. As such, it would be in order for the City of Tshwane to improve the quality of routine municipal services that are required by start-up businesses with a particular emphasis on businesses that are poorly organized. Findings reported by Khale (2015), Marivate (2014) and Edoho (2015) indicate that it would be appropriate for the City of Tshwane to ensure the provision of readily accessible, user-friendly, transparent, objective, accountable, fair and highly efficient municipal services to start-up enterprises that operate in all parts of Tshwane. In light of findings reported by Asah, Fatoki and Rungani (2015), it would be prudent for the City of Tshwane to provide skills based and tailor-made training programmes to employees whose duty is to interact with operators and owners of SMMEs. Such training programmes must be conducted on a continuous basis, and must be carefully monitored and evaluated by officials of the City of Tshwane. Key principles of good governance such as accountability, transparency and objectivity must be promoted with vigour as a means of improving the quality of municipal services that are provided to operators and owners of SMMEs.

AUTHOR BIOGRAPHY

Professor Zeleke Worku is a South African academic working at the Business School of Tshwane University of Technology (TUT) in Pretoria, South Africa. He holds a Ph.D. in statistics (University of the Orange Free State in Bloemfontein, South Africa) and a second Ph.D. in sociology (Aalborg University, Denmark). Professor Worku's key research interests are in small businesses, project management, service delivery, econometrics, monitoring and evaluation, statistical data mining, biostatistics, epidemiology and public health. Before he joined TUT Business School, Professor Worku has worked at the University of Natal in Durban (1998 to 1999), Vista University in Pretoria (2000), University of Pretoria (2001 to 2007), and University of South Africa (2008 to 2009). Professor Worku lives and works in Pretoria with his wife and two children.

REFERENCES

- Asah, F., Fatoki, O. O. & Rungani, E. (2015). The impact of motivations, personal values and management skills on the performance of SMEs in South Africa. *African Journal of Economic and Management Studies*, 6(3), 308-322.
- Bezuidenhout A. & Nenungwi, A. L. (2012). A competency framework for the small business sector in Johannesburg, South Africa. *African Journal of Business Management*, 6(47), 11658-11669.
- Booyens, I. (2011). Are small, medium- and micro-sized enterprises engines of innovation? The reality in South Africa. *Science and Public Policy*, 38(1), 67-78.
- Browne, W. J. & Goldstein, H. (2010). MCMC sampling for a Multilevel model with non-independent residuals within and between cluster units. *Journal of Educational and Behavioural Statistics*, 35(1), 453-473.
- Brownson, C. D. (2014). Does constituent of entrepreneurial culture differ in individuals? *International Journal of Small Business and Entrepreneurship Research*, 2(2), 22-27.

- Edoho, F. M. (2015). Entrepreneurialism: Africa in transition. *African Journal of Economic and Management Studies*, 6(2), 127-147.
- Hair, J. F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J. & Anderson, R. E. (2010). *Multivariate Data Analysis: A Global Perspective*. London: Pearson.
- Heck, R.H. & Thomas, S.L. (2015). *An Introduction to Multilevel Modelling Techniques: MLM and SEM Approaches Using Mplus*. New York: Routledge.
- Henrekson, M. (2014). Entrepreneurship, innovation, and human flourishing. *Small Business Economics*, 43(3), 511–528.
- Hosmer, D. W. & Lemeshow, S. (2013). *Applied Logistic Regression Analysis*. New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Khale, S. (2015). Assessment of the quality of municipal services in the City of Tshwane, South Africa. *Journal of Corporate Ownership and Control*, 13(1), 678-695.
- Kleinbaum, D., Kupper, L., Nizam, A. & Rosenberg, E. (2013). *Applied regression analysis and other multivariable methods*. New York: Nelson Education.
- Ladzani, W. M. & Netswera, G. F. (2009). Support for rural Small Businesses in Tshwane, South Africa. *Development Southern Africa*, 26(2), 14-21.
- Marivate, S. P. (2014). The impact of entrepreneurial skills on the viability and long-term survival of small businesses: a case of the city of Tshwane, South Africa. *European Journal of Business, Economics and Accountancy*, 2(2), 53-72.
- Seeletse, S. M. (2012). Common causes of small businesses failure in the townships of West Rand district municipality in the Gauteng Province of South Africa. *African Journal of Business Management*, 6(44), 10994-11002.
- Shree, S. & Urban, B. (2012). Internationalisation of South African SMEs: The role of capital factors. *Acta Commercii*, 12(1), 186-199.
- South African Chamber of Commerce and Industry. (2016). *Business confidence index – Press release*. Retrieved from: <http://www.sacci.org.za/>
- South African National Department of Trade and Industry. (2013). *SMME Development*. Retrieved from <http://www.thedti.gov.za/>
- South African Small Enterprise Development Agency (SEDA). (2013). *SAIE learning loop: Why the loop?* Retrieved from <http://www.entrepreneurship.co.za/>
- Stata Corporation. (2015). *User's Guide for STATA version 14*. College Station, Texas, USA: Stata Corporation.
- Worku, Z. (2014). Differential factors of long-term survival in small and medium-sized business enterprises in Pretoria, South Africa. *Journal of Business and Economics*, 5(11), 2091-2104.

NOTES