

1-1-1981

## Book Review of Jeffrey Hopkins's "Tantra in Tibet" & Alex Wayman's "Calming the Mind and Discerning the Real: Buddhist Meditation and the Middle View"

Christopher Key Chapple

Loyola Marymount University, [cchapple@lmu.edu](mailto:cchapple@lmu.edu)

---

### Repository Citation

Chapple, Christopher Key, "Book Review of Jeffrey Hopkins's "Tantra in Tibet" & Alex Wayman's "Calming the Mind and Discerning the Real: Buddhist Meditation and the Middle View"" (1981). *Theological Studies Faculty Works*. 143.  
[http://digitalcommons.lmu.edu/theo\\_fac/143](http://digitalcommons.lmu.edu/theo_fac/143)

### Recommended Citation

Chapple, Christopher Key. Review of Tantra in Tibet, by Jeffrey Hopkins with Alex Wayman's Calming the Mind and Discerning the Real: Buddhist Meditation and the Middle View. In *Journal of Dharma*. Vol. 5, No. 2 (1981), pp. 331-334.

very faithful to the original text and the explanations are scholarly. Above all, the explanations are expressions of the religious convictions of the author about the message of love preached by the religious philosopher, Sri Caitanya (1486-1534). The mass *sankirtana* (hymn) movement initiated by Sri Caitanya is taken to be the best means to establish the cult of Lord Krishna, which is to bring peace and harmony among men.

"The Lord (Sri Caitanya) inaugurated this system of mass *sankirtana*, and leaders of all countries can take advantage of this spiritual movement in order to keep the mass of people in a pure state of peace and friendship with one another. This is now the demand of the present human society all over the world" (p. 32).

The reason for this preference for the path of *sankirtana* can be found in Caitanya's own words: "I have taken to *sankirtana* movement instead of the study of Vedanta because I am a great fool. And because I am a great fool, my spiritual master forbade Me to play with Vedanta Philosophy. He said that it is better that I chant the holy name of the Lord, for that would deliver Me from material bondage" (p. 35).

This was the beginning of a new type of spiritual movement which gave supreme importance to the chanting of the name of Krishna. The following citation beautifully brings out the central vision of Krishna-Consciousness movement: "In this age of kali there is no other religion but the glorification of the Lord by utterance of His holy name, and that is the injunction of all the revealed scriptures...So on the order of My spiritual Master, I chant the holy name of Hari, and I am now mad after this holy name. Whenever I utter the holy name I forget myself completely, and sometimes I laugh, cry and dance like a mad man. I thought that I had actually gone mad by this process of chanting, and therefore I asked my spiritual master about it. He informed Me that this was the real effect of chanting the holy name, which produces a transcendental emotion that is a rare manifestation. It is the sign of love of God, which is the ultimate end of life. Love of God is transcendental to liberation (*mukti*) and thus it is called the fifth stage of spiritual realization, above the stage of liberation" (p. 35).

Convinced by this teaching A. C. Bhaktivedanta Swami took upon himself the great mission of preaching *bhakti*, love of God, which is superior to liberation. His voluminous commentaries on *Bhagavata Purana* and other numerous works have this central aim. As the founder of International Society for Krishna Consciousness (3764

Watseka Avenue, Los Angeles, California, 90034), he is championing the cause of *sankirtana* movement in the Western world. Books forstering this movement are published by the Bhaktivedanta Book Trust, the publication wing of the society of Krishna Consciousness.

Thomas Kochumuttom

*Tsoñ-kha-pa,*

**Calming the Mind and Discerning the Real: Buddhist Meditation: and the Middle View from the *Lam rim chen mo* of Tsoñ-kha-pa,**

Translated by Alex Wayman (New York: Columbia University Press, 1978), pp. + ix 512.

*Tsong-ka-pa,*

**Tantra in Tibet: The Great Exposition of Secret Mantra,**

Introduced by His Holiness Tenzin Gyatso, the Fourteenth Dalai Lama; Translated and Edited by Jeffrey Hopkins, Associate editor for the Dalai Lama's commentary and Tsong-ka-pa's text: Lati Rinpochoy; Associate editor for Tsong-ka-pa's text: Geshe Gedün Lodrö; Assistant editor for the Dalai Lama's commentary: Barbara Frye. The Wisdom of Tibet Series 3. (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1977), 252 pp.

Tsoñ-kha-pa (A.D. 1357-1419) is considered to be one of the most important figures in the history of Tibetan Buddhism. However, until the recent publication of the above works by Professors Wayman and Hopkins, his work was largely unknown outside Tibet.

Tsoñ-kha-pa is noted for three great reforms: stricter application of the rules of monkhood in the Buddhist Saṅgha, revitalization of the tradition of scholarship, and synthesis of the various schools contained within the Buddhist tradition as known in Tibet. Throughout his adult life, Tsoñ-kha-pa was a prolific writer; his *Gsuñs'bum* or collected works run to eighteen volumes. Two of these stand out as principal works: the *Lam rim chen mo* and the *Shags rim chen mo*. Wayman's work includes a translation of part of the former; Hopkins' work includes a translation of part of the latter.

Throughout his writings, Tsoñ-kha-pa adheres to the Prāsaṅgika Mādhyamika view, in keeping with Buddhapaṇita's analysis of

Nāgārjuna's philosophy. In brief, the Prāsaṅgika position states that because all things arise dependent on conditions (*pratītya samūtpāda*) there can be no inherent self-nature (*svabhāva*) of self or other, as opposed to the Svātantrika view, which allows for a conception of essence. This philosophy was embraced by Tsoṅ-kha-pa as the best explanation of reality, allowing for the simultaneity of *nirvāṇa* and *saṃsāra*.

Alex Wayman, in his *Calming the Mind and Discerning the Real*, translates the second half of the *Lam rim chen mo*, which "constitutes Tsoṅ-kha-pa's reform of Tibetan non-tantric Buddhist meditation and philosophical position" (p. 4). In this work, Tsoṅ-kha-pa reconciles the way of meditation (*śamatha*) taught by the Yogācāra of Asaṅga with the way of discernment (*vipaśyana*), as advanced by Buddhapālita's interpretation of Mādhyamika. This synthesis, however, is not original, being an elaboration on the work of Atīśa (A.D. 982-1054). Rather, the original contribution of Tsoṅ-kha-pa lies in his thorough analysis of the Buddhist tradition; reference is made to over 90 Mahāyāna Buddhist texts to support his position. In his analysis, the teachings of the Yogācāra school—"Calming the Mind"—are seen as a preparatory stage to the level of insight found in the Prāsaṅgika Mādhyamika—"Discerning the Real." This insight, the Middle Way, allows for neither nihilism nor eternalism: "When one takes it in the way that here is utterly nothing (*ye med*) accomplished by self-nature (*svarūpa*) and continues that a *dharma* does not exist at all (*ye med*)—in that way, since there is positively nothing (*gtan med pa*) to posit of cause and fruit in the void which is void of self-existence—one falls into the extreme of nihilism. On the other hand, if one claims that a *dharma* exists and subsequently finds it necessary to maintain that it is accompanied by self-nature, in that way it does not happen that one regards as illusory-like the appearance there, which in fact is the cause and fruit without self-existence, and so one falls into the extreme of eternalism" (p. 203). Through his explication of the Prāsaṅgika position, Tsoṅ-kha-pa warns that absolute negation must be avoided, as well as absolute reification: all things exist dependent upon causes and in relation to one another.

The second of Tsoṅ-kha-pa's great works, the *Śāngs rim chen mo*, rather than dealing with problems inherent in the Mahāyāna, attempts to systematize a number of Buddhist paths, including the Vajrayāna and the so-called Hinayāna as well as schools of Mahāyāna. In his *Tantra in Tibet: The Exposition of Secret Mantra*, Jeffrey Hopkins translates the first part of this work, and includes an introduction by

His Holiness Tenzin Gyatso, the Fourteenth Dalai Lama and current head of the Dge Lugs Pa sect which Tsoṅ-kha-pa originated. In the *Śāngs rim*, the various paths are hierarchically arranged, with the Hinayāna designated as the lesser vehicle, the Mahāyāna the greater, and the Vajrayāna the best. The Mahāyāna is further divided into the Perfection Vehicle (*Pāramitāyāna*), the beginning stage; the Yogācāra, the intermediate stage; and the Prāsaṅgika Mādhyamika as the culmination of the Mahāyāna. Similarly, the Vajrayāna is divided into four progressive tantras: *kriyā*, *caryā*, *yoga*, and *anuttarayoga*. The "lesser" tantras (*kriyā*, *caryā*, *yoga*) require dependence on some external support for meditation, while at the level of *anuttarayoga* the practitioner unites with his chosen deity, thus effecting enlightenment. Tsoṅ-kha-pa, quoting from the *Vajradāka Tantra*, emphasizes that the practice of deity yoga yields the final achievement: "Oneself is all Buddhas and all the Heroes. Through union with one's own deity, its nature is thoroughly achieved" (p. 137).

Although Tsoṅ-kha-pa advances a system of eight stages leading to enlightenment, beginning with the Hinayāna and culminating in *anuttarayoga*, he nonetheless states that all the paths share a common goal. However, he does acknowledge differences in intensity between the paths: "...just as many rivers flow to a great ocean from different approaches, so all the water of the three vehicles flows into the great ocean of Tathagatahood. Still, it is correct that these methods differ in completeness and incompleteness and in the speed of their paths and so forth due to the superiority or inferiority of the trainees" (p. 104). Thus, Tsoṅ-kha-pa attempts to synthesize and, perhaps, homogenize diverse Buddhist schools, with Prāsaṅgika Mādhyamika and the Vajrayāna regarded as the "superior" vehicles.

These two translations make an important contribution to the field of Buddhist studies, being the first major English translations of Tsoṅ-kha-pa's work. However, neither is without its problems. Wayman's translation is uneven; in some places it is very clear, while in others the syntax is awkward and the meaning obscure (e.g., "If it were not that way, it would not be possible for the nonfluxional path to arise from the fluxional path, so an ordinary person could never attain the noble state, because the cause and fruit are not alike" (p. 406). Hopkins, on the other hand, although his quality of translation is uniform and generally clear, is prone to over-translating, using English terms for Sanskrit words which are easily recognized by even the beginning student of Buddhism, such as Truth Body for *dharmakāya*. Similarly, he gives priority to his own English translation of various

Sūtra titles, which are more readily familiar in the original Sanskrit. However, both Hopkins and Wayman provide English-Sanskrit-Tibetan glossaries and detailed bibliographies which are very helpful.

The contributions of native Tibetan scholars such as Tsoñ-kha-pa, which have long gone unheralded, provide important insights into the history and philosophy of Buddhism. Hopefully, these two translations will lead to further study in this relatively new field.

Christopher Chapple

## OUR CONTRIBUTORS

*William Cenkner*, Ph.D., is associate professor in the Department of Religion and Religious Education of the School of Religious Studies, the Catholic University of America, Washington, D.C. 20064.

*Paul Kalluveetil* is a member of the Department of Scriptural Studies at Dharmaram Pontifical Institute, Bangalore. He took his doctorate in Scripture from Pontifical Biblical Institute, Rome. His doctorate dissertation under the title *Declaration Formulae in Old Testament Secular Covenants* will be published shortly by the Biblical Institute.

*Thomas Kalam*, professor of Moral Theology at Dharmaram Pontifical Institute, holds post-graduate degrees in Moral Theology (Alfonsianum, Rome) and Psychology (University College, Dublin) and at present is finalizing his doctoral thesis in psychology of moral and religious development at the University of Lancaster, England.

*Puruṣottama Bilimoria* is lecturer in the Department of Religious Studies in School of Humanities at Deakin University. He teaches an interdisciplinary and 'Open Campus' course under the title 'Religious Experience'. His special field of study in Indian Philosophy is the *Pramāṇas*. He also teaches at La Trobe University, Victoria, Australia.

*Xavier Irudayaraj* is teaching in the Department of Theology, St. Paul's Seminary, Trichy 620 001, Tamil Nadu, India. He holds a doctorate in Theology from the Institute Catholique de paris. His field of specialization is Saiva Siddhanta tradition.

*Ishwar C. Harris* is teaching in the Department of Religion at Rutgers, the State University of New Jersey. He took his Ph.D. from Claremont Graduate School, California (1974). His book *Radhakrishnan: The Profile of a Universalist* will be published soon.