

THE EFFECT OF USING GRAPHIC ORGANIZERS AND ESTAFET WRITING IN TEACHING WRITING AT THE ELEVENTH GRADE STUDENTS OF SMAN 20 KABUPATEN TANGERANG IN THE ACADEMIC YEAR 2018/2019

Nensi Arfika Dewi¹, Hiqma Nur Agustina², Nirna Nirmala³

¹English Language Education, FKIP, Universitas Islam Syekh - Yusuf
email: nensidewi96@gmail.com

²English Language Education, FKIP, Universitas Islam Syekh - Yusuf
email: hiqma@unis.ac.id

³English Language Education, FKIP, Universitas Islam Syekh - Yusuf
email: nnirmala@unis.ac.id

Abstract

The aims of this research are to find out the significant effect of using graphic organizers on improving students writing ability, to find out the significant effect of using estafet writing on improving students writing ability, and to find out that graphic organizers has significant effect than estafet writing on improving students writing ability in teaching writing. The population of this research was the eleventh grade students at SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang. The sample are 60 students of XI IPS 3 and XI IPS 4. This research used quasi experimental group - non-equivalent control group design. The result of this research are: (1) The mean of the students' score in teaching writing that was taught by using graphic organizers was 83.87 higher than before treatment. (2) The mean of the students' score in teaching writing that was taught by using estafet writing was 78.53 higher than before treatment. (3) The result showed that graphic organizers technique has more significant effect than estafet writing technique. Therefore, graphic organizers is recommended for senior high school.

Keywords: *estafet writing, graphic organizers, writing ability.*

Abstrak

Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk menemukan pengaruh dari penggunaan *graphic organizers* terhadap peningkatan kemampuan menulis siswa, untuk menemukan pengaruh penggunaan menulis berantai terhadap peningkatan kemampuan menulis siswa, dan untuk membuktikan bahwa *graphic organizers* memiliki pengaruh yang lebih signifikan dibandingkan dengan menulis berantai terhadap peningkatan kemampuan menulis siswa dalam pengajaran menulis. Populasi penelitian ini adalah siswa kelas sebelas SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang. Sampel penelitian sebanyak 60 siswa XI IPS 3 dan XI IPS 4. Penelitian ini menggunakan kelompok quasi experimental – non – equivalent grup kontrol. Hasil dari penelitian ini adalah: (1) mean dari nilai siswa dalam pengajaran menulis yang diajarkan dengan menggunakan *graphic designers* adalah 83,8 lebih tinggi dari sebelum diberikan tindakan. (2) mean dari nilai siswa dalam pengajaran menulis yang diajarkan dengan menggunakan menulis berantai adalah 78,53 lebih tinggi dari sebelum diberikan tindakan. (3) hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa teknik *graphic organizers* memiliki pengaruh yang lebih signifikan dibandingkan dengan teknik menulis berantai. Oleh karena itu, *graphic organizers* direkomendasikan untuk sekolah menengah atas.

Kata kunci: *graphic organizers, kemampuan menulis, menulis berantai.*

1. Introduction

Writing is one of the most important skills that should be mastered by students. It is because writing has the important roles in education. The roles not only to conveying information, but also to transforming knowledge and create new knowledge for students. Having good writing will help them in their personal communication with people in the world because English is an international language. Furthermore, most of the subjects which are learned by students in the school are presented in written form. To get the good writing product, of course, students need good enough preparation such as the technique that will be used in writing process.

In this research, the writer intends to conduct the research at SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang. It is because the writer has implemented a “Praktek Pengalaman Lapangan (PPL)” at SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang from Januari - March 2018. During the PPL, the writer found many problems on the teaching and learning English in the class. One of the important problem comes from the students’ writing ability in SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang. There are many students who are not able to write in English well. It can be viewed from the amount of students who get the score under the standard of English score (KKM) which is 70 and only a few of students who get score above the KKM.

In the other words, there are some problems that students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang faced in writing; such as they still have difficulties in getting and developing an idea, less creative and lack of using grammar and vocabulary. They also feel bored when learning English because the activity and

technique was too old or conventional. So, it made students being passive and their English writing ability was not improve well.

It means that, to solve the problems, students in SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang need the new, modern, and interesting technique when they learn writing ability in the class. By the interesting techniques, students will be interested in writing, active in the class and all aspects of writing will be achieved.

Based on the problems above, the writer interest to use the new and modern techniques in teaching writing. There are graphic organizers and estafet writing techniques. Graphic organizer is one of the technique that can be used individually. While Estafet writing is a technique used in group. Graphic Organizer and Estafet writing can be the solution to solve the problems.

The most current research by Mahmudah and Jamilah (2015: 4) showed that the important of graphic organizers was seen from the improvement on students writing skill. The result showed that graphic organizers as the pre writing activity which made students active and creative in writing a text. Then, the most current research by Tayib (2014) graphic organizers had significantly improved the students’ writing ability and had positive impacted their attitudes towards this ability. On the other hand, the most current research by Piga (2016) showed that the important of estafet writing made the teaching and learning process funny and not boring, make students to have free drawing their ideas in a text, can improve students’ motivation in developing their imagination to write a text, and growing

up students' braveness in starting their imagination to write a text.

Based on the journals research above, the writer interest to do the different research that comparing both techniques of Graphic Organizers and Estafet Writing Technique in Teaching Writing. This interest is supported from the result of journals research that already done by the writer. After doing the journals research, the writer also have research expectation that Graphic Organizers is better in teaching writing than Estafet Writing. It is because journal reputation of Graphic Organizers technique is more and has better reputation than Estafet Writing technique.

Based on the explanation above, the writer concluded that the purpose of this research are: 1). To find out the significant effect of using Graphic Organizers. 2). To find out the significant effect of using Estafet Writing on improving students writing ability in teaching writing at the eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang. 3). To find out that Graphic Organizers has significant effect than Estafet Writing on improving students writing ability in Teaching Writing at Eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang.

2. Theoretical Description

Writing is the skill which can be use to accomplish a variety of goals. Writing as an effective way to extending and reinforcing knowledge. Harmer (2004:4-6) divides the process of writing into four stages: planning, drafting, editing, and final version. Final version in here is the product that is ready to be read by the readers. In this study, writing

skill is focus on Academic Writing. In the academic arena, (Scott & Vitale, 2003) Stated that academic writing needs knowledge of the topic of writing genre with its rule and writing format. Academic writing is more important than other types of writing, it involves selection of particular words to form sentences in creating essays or to write answers or reports.

In senior high schools, based on the curriculum 2013 (K13) students should be able to write several genres, such as narrative, descriptive, procedural, reporting, analytical exposition, and other genres of written form. Thus, in this study, the writer describes one of the genres in writing, namely analytical exposition text. An analytical exposition text evaluates a topic critically but focuses only on one side of an argument. This text that elaborates the writer's idea about the phenomenon surrounding. Communicatively, analytical exposition aims to convince the reader that the topic presented is an important topic to discuss or get attention by providing arguments or opinions that support the main idea or topic (Kemendikbud, 2017). Analytical ex position text can be found in scientific books, journals, magazines, newspaper articles, academic speech or lectures, research report and so on. The reason why the writer choose Analytical Exposition text as a genre in this research is because Analytical Exposition text has a role in developing students' writing ability in teaching writing.

According to Harmer (2004: 41-42), there are the tasks that the teacher needs to perform before, during, and after the students writing in the writing classroom; as a demonstrator, motivator, supporter, giving response, and giving

evaluation. Therefore, those five roles should be done by the teacher in teaching writing. The teacher should maximize their roles in the writing class so that the students' writing ability can be improved optimally using interesting techniques such as graphic organizers and estafet writing.

Graphic Organizers are visual representations which help gather and sort information. Parker (2006) stated that Graphic Organizer is the interactive technique which help students see patterns and relationship between information. With only a few words, concepts are clarified, information and ideas are organized, and complex relationships are shown between the elements. Also as an added bonus, graphic organizers help teachers figure out how students think. In short, Graphic organizer is appropriate for teaching students in the large classroom because it will be the interesting technique in teaching-learning writing. Hall and Strangman (2002), suggested Graphic Organizers divide in many different forms; each one is designed to suit a particular type of information as follows: Cause and Effect, Descriptive and Semantic Maps, Compare Contrast, Series of Event Chain. Robinson (2010), suggested that there are four examples of common types of Graphic Organizers; shapes, concept maps, flow diagrams, tree diagrams, and matrices.

Estafet writing or write chain including one of the learning technique or learning by doing which aims to enable students to associate learning as a fun activity (Rosaliana, 2014). This is a technique which involves the students learn by groups. In this learning technique students are actively involved

in a wide range of vocabulary to write in sequence. In addition, Estafet writing is a technique of active learning which involve students actively writing a text in a together or chain (Cahyono, 2011:14).

To support this research, the writer used some relevant research with this topic that have done by the previous researcher (Tayib, 2015; Mahmudah and Jamilah, 2014; Piga, 2017; Robinson, 2014; and Hulpa, 2016). The previous research have done to analyze each technique of graphic organizers and estafet writing. The result of previous research showed that Graphic Organizers and estafet Writing had significantly improved the students' writing ability.

3. Research Methodology

This research was conducted at SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang which is located on JL. Raya Pakuhaji KM.2, Desa/ Kelurahan Buaran Bambu, Kecamatan Pakuhaji, Kabupaten Tangerang, Banten, 15570. The research was conducted from July to August 2018.

The design of this research is a Quasi Experimental research - non-equivalent control group design. According to Fraenkle & Wallen, n.d (2012), Quasi Experimental design do not include the use of random assignment. The researchers who employ these designs rely instead on other techniques to control (or at least reduce) threats to internal validity.

Population in this research is all of students in eleventh grade at SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang in Academic Year 2018/2019. There are 240 students consist of 8 classes; there are students of XI MIPA in 4 classes and XI IPS in 4 classes. The number of sample are 60 students from two classes. The writer has

determined first experimental class is XI IPS 3 using graphic organizers, and second experimental class is XI IPS 4 using estafet writing. The writer took those classes because they are homogenous and has the same characteristic in learning achievements, intelligent, and abilities.

According to Fraenkle & Wallen (2012), The data collection techniques used in this study are as follows:

a. Test

The test of learning outcomes that play a role to know the knowledge of the initial concept and the final concept before and after learning is done. To collect data by the test, the writer used instrument. Instrument refers to the entire process of collecting data in a research investigation. Achievement Tests or ability test measure an individual's knowledge or skill in a given area or subject. They are mostly uses in schools to measure learning or the effectiveness. It used to measure the students' ability in analytical exposition text. The test is written test. The form of paragraph is analytical exposition text. The data of this research was the score of the students' writing ability in writing analytical exposition text that measured by using writing assessment used by the English teacher at SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang.

In this research, the writer used validity content and reliability test to test the instrument. The validity content test was done to test the instrument by the English teacher of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang. The validity content showed that the instrument was valid. It means that the data also reliable. So, the instrument of writing test can be used in this research.

b. Documentation

Documentation is a record of past events. Documentation may be in the form of writing, drawing, or monumental works of a person. Documents in the form of writing such as diaries, life histories, stories, biographies, regulations, policies. In this research, the documentation was took from the first until last meetings. It showed the writers' activity in doing the research.

To analyze the data of the research, there are some tests used as described follow.

1) The Test of The Analysis Assumption

a) Test of Normality data in first and second experimental class

Testing data normality is determined whether or not the data has normal data distribution. To know it, the writer used Liliefors test. The criteria of normality test are follows; the data was normal if the $sig > sig 0.05$, the data was not normally distributed if the $sig < sig 0.05$.

b) Test of Homogeneity Data

This test was attended to test the similarity of two variants of a normally distributed population. The method that was used to test was F test.

2) Data Analysis

According to Sugiyono (2010:223), to test the hypothesis, the writer used t-test. If both of data (first experimental class and second experimental class) was normally distributed, the t-test used parametric statistical method. While, if the data was not normally distributed, t-test used non parametric statistical method.

3) The Statistical Hypothesis

The statistical hypotheses in this research are as follow:

a) $H_0 : \rho = 0$ (Null Hypotheses)

(1) There is no significant effect of using graphic organizers on improving students writing ability in teaching writing at eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang for academic year 2018/2019.

(2) There is no significant effect of using estafet writing on improving students' writing ability in teaching writing at eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang for academic year 2018/2019.

(3) There is no significant effect of graphic organizers than estafet writing in teaching writing at eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang for academic year 2018/2019

b) $H_a : \rho \neq 0$ (Alternative Hypotheses)

(1) There is a significant effect of using graphic organizers on improving students writing ability in teaching writing at eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang for academic year 2018/2019.

(2) There is a significant effect of using estafet writing on improving students' writing ability in teaching writing at eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang for academic year 2018/2019.

(3) There is a significant effect of graphic organizers than estafet writing in teaching writing at

eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang for academic year 2018/2019

4. Research Findings

In this part, the writer showed the result of the analysis in this research using SPSS 22 version. The result of the analyzing data can be seen in table 1.

Table 1. Descriptive Statistics of Post-test First and Second Experimental Classes

	N	Min	Max	Sum	Mean	Std. Deviation
FE Class	30	4	40	583	19.43	8.533
SE Class	30	4	40	472	15.73	8.785

It showed from the mean score of first experimental class is 19.43 and the mean score of post-test in second experimental class is 15.73. The standard deviation of first experimental class is 8,533 and the standard deviation of second experimental class is 8,785. The difference minimum score of first experimental class and second experimental class is 4. The difference maximum score of first experimental class and second experimental class is 40. Total score difference of first experimental class is 583 and second experimental is 472.

A. The Test of Analysis Assumptions

1) Testing of Data Normality

In this test, the writer used the Kolmogorov test Liliefoers of Shapiro and Wilk with SPSS version 22.0 to find out the normality of the data in students' writing ability in first experimental class and second experimental class. Guidelines for decision-making on this test is if the value of significance (Sig) > 0.05. The complete result of the normality test can be seen in a table 2.

Table 2. Tests of Normality in First and Experimental Class

	Kolmogorov-Smirnov ^a			Shapiro-Wilk		
	Statistic	Df	Sig.	Statistic	Df	Sig.
FE Class	.140	30	.137	.960	30	.315
SE Class	.155	30	.065	.928	30	.044

a. Lilliefors Significance Correction

From table 2, it can be seen that the data in first experimental class was normally distributed. While in second experimental class, the data was not normally distributed. Then, for complete result data of first and second experimental class, it can be concluded that the data was not normally distributed, it is because the data for the second experimental class produces a significant value of 0.044 which indicates that the value of $0.044 < 0.05$.

2) Testing of Data Homogeneity

After calculating the test of homogeneity by using Fisher-test SPSS 22.0, the complete result of this test can be seen in table 3.

Table 3. Testing of data Homogeneity in difference value of first and second experimental class

Levene Statistic	df1	df2	Sig.
.000	1	58	.984

Based on table 3, it is known that $\text{Sig} = \rho\text{-value } 0.984 > 0.05$. It showed that the variant data of writing score in first experimental class using graphic organizers and second experimental class using estafet writing is homogenous.

B. Testing of the Research Hypothesis

a) Testing of Research Hypothesis

The writer testing the hypothesis test (t-test) formula to find out the effect of using graphic organizers and estafet writing in teaching writing at eleventh grade students. The purpose of this test was to compare the pre-test and post-test score in each class (first experimental class using graphic organizers and second experimental class using estafet writing).

There are three testing the hypotheses test (t-test):

(1) First Experimental Class

The writer used paired sample test to testing the t-test in the first experimental class because the data was normally distributed. It was found that the result of the t-test could be seen in table 4.

Based on table 4, it is known that $t_{\text{count}} < -t_{\text{table}} (-12.185 < -1.699)$ with $\text{sig} = 0.000 < 0.05$, so it can be concluded that H_0 is rejected and H_a is accepted. It means there is a significant difference between pre-test and post-test in first experimental class using graphic organizers at the eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang.

(2) Second Experimental Class

To test the t-test, the writer used Wilcoxon signed rank test in related sample test because the data was not normally distributed. It was found that the result of the test could be seen in table 5.

It is known the asymptotic significances of the pre-test and post-test in second experimental class is $0.000 < 0.05$. It can be concluded that there is a significant difference between pre-test and post-test in second experimental class using estafet writing at the eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang.

Table 4. Paired Samples Test First Experimental Class

	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference		T	Df	Sig. (2-tailed)
				Lower	Upper			
				Pre-post test	-19.600			

Table 5. Related Sample Test-Second Experimental Class

	Null Hypothesis	Test	Sig.	Decision
1.	The median of differences between pre-test 2 and post-test 2 equals 0.	Related-samples Signed Rank Test	Wilcoxon .000	Reject the null hypothesis

(3) Different Values of First and Second Experimental Class

The writer analyzed the t-test using independent samples – Man Whitney U Test in non-parametric statistical method. It used because the data was not normally distribute. It was found that the result of the test could be seen in table 6.

Table 6 shows that Asymp. Sig. 0.008 is smaller or $0.008 < 0.05$. It

means that, there is graphic organizers has significant effect than estafet writing on improving students' writing ability in teaching writing at eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang. So, graphic organizers is better than estafet writing on improving students' writing ability.

Table 6. The T-Test of Hypotheses

	Null Hypothesis	Test	Sig.	Decision
1.	The distribution of Exam result is the same across categories of class.	Independent samples Mann-Whitney U Test	.008	Reject the null hypothesis

Asymptotic significances are displayed. The significance level is .05.

5. Discussion

From the students' analysis of writing ability taught by using graphic organizers and estafet writing in different experimental class, the writer has found the result of students' writing ability in teaching writing. The writer gave the pre-test, treatments, and post-test in order to know the students' writing ability.

In first experimental class taught by the writer using graphic organizers. The result of test was compute by using SPSS 22 version that can be seen the lowest score is 72 and the highest score is 96. Then, the mean is 83.87 and the standard deviation 6.431. The result showed that teaching writing analytical exposition text by the writer using

graphic organizers is good because the students have significant differences between pre-test and post-test score. All of the students reaction about graphic organizers is positive because students felt graphic organizers can guide them in writing a text. The score of post-test was high than pre-test. All of the students in first experimental class can pass KKM values. In other words, graphic organizers in first experimental class was very useful for the students especially to improve students' writing ability.

In second experimental class taught by the writer using estafet writing. The result of test was compute by using SPSS 22 version that can be seen the lowest score is 68 and the highest score is 92.

Then, the mean is 78.53 and the standard deviation is 81.69. The result showed that teaching writing analytical exposition text by the writer using estafet writing is good because the students have significant differences between pre-test and post-test score. Almost all of the student's reaction about estafet writing is positive because students felt estafet writing make them active to learn in groups. The score of post-test was high than pre-test. Almost all of the students in second experimental class can pass KKM values. In other words, estafet writing in second experimental class was useful but the students have difficulty in applying this technique because their proficiency.

In this research, when compared first experimental class using graphic organizers and second experimental class using estafet writing, there is a significant effect of graphic organizers than estafet writing in teaching writing at eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang in academic year 2018/2019. It showed from the mean of students' score in each class. The mean of students' score in first experimental class using Graphic Organizers was 83.87 while in second experimental class using Estafet Writing was 78.53. As the conclusion, there is the difference of using graphic organizers and estafet writing in teaching writing at eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang.

Based on the result and theories in this research, Tayib (2015) concluded that graphic organizers had significantly improved the students' writing ability and had positive impacted their attitudes towards this ability. Then, Piga (2017) concluded that estafet writing can make

the teaching and learning process funny and not boring, make students to have free drawing their ideas in a text, and can improve students' motivation in developing their imagination to write a text. In this research, it can be concluded that graphic organizers and estafet writing can give good effect based on both techniques. And also, this techniques can make the students more to be active because in this techniques guide the students to write a text.

6. Conclusion

Based on formulation of the problem, the research objective, the hypotheses testing and analysis result, it can be concluded that:

- a. The students' score in first and second experimental class are increased, but the students' score in first experimental class using graphic organizers is higher than students in second experimental class using estafet writing. It showed from the first experimental class, the mean of students score was $83.87 >$ before treatment. While in second experimental class, the mean of students score was $78.53 >$ before treatment.
- b. There is a significant difference between pre-test and post-test in first experimental class using graphic organizers in teaching writing at eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang for Academic Year 2018/2019.
- c. There is a significant difference between pre-test and post-test in second experimental class using estafet writing in teaching writing at eleventh grade students of SMAN 20

- Kabupaten Tangerang for Academic Year 2018/2019.
- d. If compared first experimental class using graphic organizers and second experimental class using estafet writing, there is a significant effect of graphic organizers than estafet writing in teaching writing at eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang in academic year 2018/2019.
 - e. It can be concluded that there is difference between using graphic organizers and estafet writing in teaching writing at eleventh grade students of SMAN 20 Kabupaten Tangerang for academic year 2018/2019. Then, the writer expectation about graphic organizers is better than estafet writing was accepted. It is because the statistical result showed that from the score of first experimental class using graphic organizers is higher than score of students in second experimental class using estafet writing.
- b. For teacher, the writer suggest them to use the best technique and method in teaching English to improve the students' English achievement. The teacher must be a creative and good facilitator for the students to improve and stimulate students' skill.
 - c. For students, the students are suggested to have a high discipline, creative, active in classroom activity. They also suggested to pay attention to the teachers' instruction on teaching process in order to make students easily to understand the material in learning process.
 - d. For the future, the writer who are going to do a quasi- experimental research or going to do the research which is related to graphic organizers or estafet writing techniques in students' achievement, this research can be used as the source to conduct future research. Take time to read, it is the principal of wisdom.

7. Suggestion

The writer would like to state some suggestion are given to the English teachers, students, school, and future writers as follows:

- a. For School, the writer suggested to provide and improve facilities in the school to give a pleasure in teaching learning process.

9. References

- Cahyono, A. (2011). *Pembelajaran Menulis Sastra dengan Metode Estafet Writing di SMA*. <http://risecahyono.blogspot.com>. Accessed on April 9th 2018.
- Fraenkel, J. R., & Wallen, N. E. (2009). *How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education* (7th ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Hall, T. & Strangman, N. (2002). *Graphic Organizers*. Wakefield MA: National Center on Assessing the General Curriculum.

8. Acknowledgement

Thanks to the writer's advisors, lecturers, parents, friends in English Language Education, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, Universitas Islam Syekh-Yusuf Tangerang for their motivation and support in finishing this article.

- Harmer, J. (2004). *How to Teach Writing*. England: Pearson Longman
- Iqlima, M., & Jamilah, Dra, M.Pd. (2014). Using Graphic Organizers to Improve the Writing Skill of IX Grade Students of SMPN 9 Yogyakarta in the Academic Year of 2014/2015, p. 3-4.
- Piga, G. H. (2016). Improving the eleventh grade students of SMAN 1 Rajua in writing narrative text through estafet writing teaching model in academic year 2016/2017. *International Journal of English and Education*. Issue.3, p.1-8.
- Robinson, D. H. (2010). Graphic Organizers as Aids to Text Learning. 37:2, 85-105. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/19388079809558257>.
- Rosalina, P. A. (2014). Keefektifan Metode Estafet Writing Dalam Pembelajaran Keterampilan Menulis Bahasa Peserta Didik Kelas XI Di SMA Negeri 1 Sedayu Bantul. Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta.
- Scott, B. & Vitale, M. (2003). *Teaching the writing process to students with LD. Interventions in School and Clinic*. 38(4), 220-226.
- Sugiyono. (2010). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan: Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Tayib, A. M. (2015). The Effect of using Graphic Organizers on Writing. Vol.3, No.1, pp. 15-36.