# 1 Title: *Elymus athericus* encroachment in Wadden Sea salt marshes is driven

## 2 **by surface-elevation change**

3 Author names and addresses: Stefanie Nolte<sup>\*a</sup>, Antonia Wanner<sup>a,b</sup>, Martin Stock<sup>c</sup>, Kai Jensen<sup>a</sup>

- a) University of Hamburg, Institute for Plant Sciences and Microbiology, Applied Plant Ecology,
- 5 Ohnhorstsr. 18, 22609 Hamburg, Germany; stefanie.nolte@uni-hamburg.de; kai.jensen@uni-
- 6 hamburg.de
- b) Naturpark Westensee-Obereider e.V., Eschenbrook 2, 24113 Molfsee, Germany;
- 8 wanner@naturpark-westensee-obereider.de
- 9 c) Administration of the Wadden Sea National Park Schleswig-Holstein, Schlossgarten 1, 25832
- 10 Tönning, Germany; martin.stock@lkn.landsh.de

### 11 Abstract:

- 12 Question: What are the main drivers of vegetation succession and the encroachment of *Elymus*
- 13 *athericus* (Link) Kerguélen in ungrazed Wadden Sea salt marshes? Is (1) elevation, a proxy for tidal
- 14 inundation and thus abiotic conditions, limiting the expanse of *Elymus*. Does sedimentation increase
- 15 the spread of *Elymus* by (2) leading to surface-elevation change or does it (3) add nitrogen and thereby
- 16 allows *Elymus* to grow in lower elevation?
- 17 Location: salt marsh at Sönke-Nissen-Koog, Wadden Sea National Park Schleswig-Holstein,
- 18 Germany
- 19 Methods: The experiment was established in 2007 in the high marsh and consisted of four blocks of
- 20 12 m x 8 m. The blocks differed in surface-elevation change during the experiment. Each block was
- subdivided into 24 plots of 1 m x 1 m. The original elevation of all plots in relation to the German
- 22 ordnance datum (NHN) was assessed at the start of the experiment. Plots within the blocks were
- randomly assigned to one of the three N-fertilisation treatments. Within each plot we planted five
- 24 randomly chosen individuals of *Elymus*. After four years of treatment, the vegetation composition and
- cover was recorded in all plots and aboveground biomass was collected.
- **Results:** Original elevation was found to be a main driver of succession favouring *Elymus* and other
  late successional plants. No effect of N-fertilisation, but a positive effect of surface-elevation change
  on *Elymus*-cover was detected.
- 29 **Conclusions:** We can therefore conclude that the positive effect of surface-elevation change on
- 30 *Elymus* is based on the resulting higher elevation and more favourable abiotic conditions caused by
- sedimentation, but not the addition of nitrogen with the freshly deposited sediment. This case,

32 therefore, is an example for an ecosystem in which encroachment is driven by a natural factor, rather

33 than anthropogenic eutrophication.

34 Keywords:

35 Biomass; *Halimione portulacoides;* N-deposition; N-fertilisation; *Puccinellia maritima*;

36 sedimentation; succession

#### 37 **1. Introduction**

The concept of succession, originally described by Clements (1916) as the unidirectional development 38 39 of vegetation through a series of stages until a stable climax vegetation is reached, has been extensively studied in vegetation ecology (van Andel et al. 1993; McCook 1994). The first vegetation 40 41 stage is often dominated by small pioneer plants which are then replaced by a diverse community of short herbaceous plants. These intermediate communities are then progressively replaced by later 42 43 successional stages, which are often dominated by taller plants such as grasses (Berendse and Elberse 44 1990), shrubs or trees (Eldridge et al. 2011). This replacement of small plants by tall ones in late 45 successional stages can be driven by belowground competition for nutrients (Chapin et al. 1994; 46 Casper and Jackson 1997) or aboveground competition for light (Olff et al. 1997; Veer and Kooijman 47 1997). In the latter case, taller plants reduce the amount of light available for small plants, which are then outcompeted. This invasion of tall plants is sometimes also defined as encroachment (Eldridge et 48 49 al. 2011) and can lead to a loss of plant species richness as only few competitive species prevail (Veer and Kooijman 1997). 50

51 The natural succession of the vegetation, however, can also be influenced by various other factors such as herbivory (van Andel et al. 1993). Herbivores reduce the standing biomass by grazing (Nolte 52 et al. 2014) and can open gaps in the canopy for seedling establishment (Bullock et al. 1994; Bakker 53 and Olff 2003). Thereby, herbivores decrease the light competition and enable small plants to persist 54 55 while tall grazing-sensitive species are unable to establish or are reduced (Kuijper et al. 2005). 56 Herbivores thus can halt or set-back vegetation succession (Kuijper and Bakker 2003). Therefore, 57 grazing with herbivores is sometimes used in nature conservation e.g. in semi-natural grasslands to 58 prevent encroachment of tall plants and maintain intermediate successional stages with a higher plant 59 species richness (Bouchard et al. 2003; Rook et al. 2004; Metera et al. 2010). In contrast to this set-60 back of succession, the addition of nitrogen to an ecosystem, e.g. by atmospheric N-deposition, was found to speed up succession and encroachment (Berendse and Elberse 1990; WallisDeVries and 61 Bobbink 2017). Especially in nutrient-poor habitats, a high N-availability can favour tall growing 62 plants (Gaucherand et al. 2006) and thereby enhances light competition leading to low plant species 63 64 richness (Veer and Kooijman 1997; Bird and Choi 2016; Soons et al. 2016).

65 An example for such an encroachment of a tall grass species which can lead to a loss of plant diversity is the invasion of *Elymus athericus* (hereafter referred to as *Elymus*) in salt marshes of the 66 Wadden Sea (Andresen et al. 1990; Leendertse et al. 1997; Kiehl et al. 2007; Esselink et al. 2009; 67 68 Veeneklaas et al. 2013). In the Wadden Sea area, most salt marshes along the mainland coast are the result of man-made sedimentation fields, which were built to create new land (Dijkema 1987). These 69 salt marshes are coastal, natural or semi-natural grasslands characterised by regular flooding with sea 70 71 water (Adam 1990) resulting in salt stress for plants. The frequency of tidal inundation, mainly 72 determined by the salt-marsh elevation, leads to a distinct zonation of vegetation along an elevation 73 gradient (Suchrow and Jensen 2010). The lowest zones are flooded frequently and are thus dominated 74 by halophytes such as Salicornia europea (Suchrow and Jensen 2010). The vegetation types of the 75 lowest elevation additionally represent the early stages of salt-marsh succession (Olff et al. 1997). 76 However, frequent tidal inundations in low elevations also deliver sediment to the marsh, thus leading 77 to a positive surface-elevation change of the marsh platform (Nolte et al. 2013a) and consequently less 78 frequent inundations. With higher elevation the vegetation composition shifts to intermediate and then 79 late successional stages in the high marsh zone, the latter often being dominated by the tall grass species *Elymus*. Thus surface-elevation change was identified as a main driver of succession in salt 80 81 marshes (Rupprecht et al. 2015b).

82 Salt marshes in the Wadden Sea region have been used for livestock grazing for centuries (Esselink et al. 2000). In the past decades, however, grazing has been stopped in many salt-marsh 83 areas to allow a more natural habitat and vegetation development within the National parks (Bakker et 84 al. 2003; Esselink et al. 2009; Stock and Maier 2016). This cessation of grazing led in many locations 85 86 to the encroachment of the tall, late-successional grass *Elymus* (Andresen et al. 1990; Kiehl et al. 87 2007; Rupprecht et al. 2015b). Elymus is a high-marsh species which grows in dense mono-specific stands and therefore locally reduces the plant species richness (Leendertse et al. 1997; Kiehl et al. 88 89 2007; Wanner et al. 2014) and is sensitive to grazing with livestock. In the last decades it has also 90 spread widely in areas that have never been grazed (Veeneklaas et al. 2013; Rupprecht et al. 2015b). 91 Therefore, researchers and nature managers were wondering which factors, next to the cessation of 92 grazing, are driving the encroachment of *Elymus* (Van Wijnen and Bakker 1999; Veeneklaas et al. 93 2013). The elevation as a proxy for flooding frequency and therefore also for abiotic conditions has 94 been identified as a major constriction for the distribution of *Elymus* (Bockelmann and Neuhaus 95 1999). Yet, *Elymus* has been found to expand into lower marsh areas over the last decades (Olff et al. 1997; Veeneklaas et al. 2013). 96

97 It has been argued that the encroachment of *Elymus* in the Wadden Sea salt marshes is driven or
98 sped up by eutrophication (Van Wijnen and Bakker 1999). Although salt marshes are relatively rich in
99 nutrients, the high stress environment with salt and hypoxia forces plants to respond physiologically
100 leading to a high nutrient cost (Adam 1990). The addition of nitrogen in a fertilization experiment

101 therefore led to an increase of biomass in *Elymus* and sped up vegetation succession (Van Wijnen and 102 Bakker 1999). Nitrogen is often added to ecosystems through anthropogenic atmospheric deposition, but in salt marshes it is also added naturally during inundations with sediment deposition. To 103 disentangle the effects of these two deposition pathways, Veeneklaas et al. (2013) analysed time series 104 105 of vegetation maps and chronosequence data of four naturally developed salt marshes varying in sediment deposition rates. They found that expansion rates of *Elymus* were highest on young salt 106 marshes which have high sediment deposition rates. This was interpreted by Veeneklaas et al. (2013) 107 108 as an indicator that *Elymus* expansion is mainly driven by spatially varying natural sediment 109 deposition rates and not by the evenly spread atmospheric deposition. However, in this observational 110 study it was not possible to disentangle whether the high sediment deposition rates affected the 111 encroachment of *Elymus* by the added N, or whether the positive effect of sediment deposition on the surface-elevation change (Nolte et al. 2013a) and thus elevation caused the shift. Yet, elevation as a 112 proxy for inundation frequency and abiotic conditions has previously been found to be an important 113 114 predictor of the distribution of *Elymus* (Suchrow and Jensen 2010).

115 The aim of this study is therefore to unravel the effects of experimental nitrogen fertilization, 116 elevation and surface-elevation change on the vegetation succession (i.e. the shift from early towards late successional plant-species composition), the cover of *Elymus* and plant biomass in an ungrazed 117 salt marsh. We hypothesize that (1) elevation as a proxy for flooding frequency is a driving factor of 118 119 succession, with a sufficiently high elevation allowing the establishment of *Elymus* and other late-120 successional plants with a higher biomass production. Additionally, we hypothesize that (2) Elymus is N-limited and therefore the experimental N-fertilisation will lower the elevation at which *Elymus* can 121 122 establish. Furthermore, we expect experimental N-fertilisation to speed up the succession towards the 123 late-successional plant communities, as it will increase the production of biomass. Finally, we 124 hypothesize that (3) a high surface-elevation change will lead to an increase in elevation, so Elymus will be able to establish, even if the original elevation at the start of the experiment was below the 125 126 establishment threshold. This high surface-elevation change furthermore increases the spread of other 127 late-successional plant communities with a higher biomass.

128 We carried out a field experiment in which different levels of experimental N-fertlisation were applied in blocks with a comparable range of elevation at the start of the experiment, hereafter referred 129 130 to as original elevation. Additionally, the plots were positioned along a gradient of surface-elevation change, which is caused by an increasing distance of plots to the sediments source (i.e. the edge of the 131 marsh). If the experiment shows both fertilisation and a high surface-elevation change to lower the 132 133 original elevation limit for *Elymus*, we can assume that the plant is indeed nitrogen limited. If, 134 however, no effect of experimental N-fertilisation, but an effect of surface-elevation change is found, 135 we can conclude that the positive effect of surface-elevation change at the end of the experiment is

- based on the resulting higher elevation, but not the addition of nitrogen with the freshly depositedsediments.
- 138 **2.** Material and Methods
- 139 2.1 Experimental design

140 The experiment was setup in the Sönke-Nissen Koog (SNK) salt marsh on the mainland coast of the

141 Wadden Sea in the North of Germany (Fig. 1). The area is characterised by an artificial drainage

system, but maintenance of ditches and livestock grazing stopped in 1991 after the salt marsh became

143 part of the Wadden Sea National Park in 1986 (Stock et al. 2005). The area has been previously

described in context of a grazing experiment in the Northern part of the marsh (Kiehl et al. 1996; Kiehl

145 et al. 1997; Nolte et al. 2013b).





Figure 1: A) Map of the German Bight with the position of the Sönke-Nissen Koog (SNK) study site indicated. B) Aerial
photograph of the Sönke-Nissen Koog & Hamburger Hallig salt marsh area with the position of the experimental site. C) The
experimental site with the position of the 4 plots. World Imagery - Source: Esri, DigitalGlobe, GeoEye, Earthstar
Geographics, CNES/Airbus DS, USDA, USGS, AEX, Getmapping, Aerogrid, IGN, IGP, swisstopo, and the GIS User
Community.

The *Elymus* experiment was established in 2007 in the high marsh and consisted of four blocks of 12 x 8 m. A rectangular shape was chosen for the blocks to exclude former ditches, which still prevail in the marsh as depressions and are evenly spaced with a distance of 10 m. Each block had a comparable mean elevation at the start of the experiment (i.e. original elevation). Within plots the prevalent micro-topography lead elevation ranges between the lowest and highest point of the respective plot of 7.0 cm to 12.5 cm. Additionally, the plots were positioned along a gradient of surface-elevation change, which is caused by an increasing distance of plots to the sediments source 159 (i.e. the edge of the marsh; Schröder et al. 2002). Blocks were positioned close to sedimentationerosion bars (van Wijnen and Bakker 2001; Nolte et al. 2013a) previously installed by the National 160 161 Park administration along a transect from the intertidal flats to the seawall to monitor surface-elevation 162 change (Stock 2011). Measurements of surface-elevation change continued during the experimental period. From these data, mean surface-elevation change  $[mm yr^{-1}]$  for the duration of the experiment 163 was calculated and assigned to the blocks as surface-elevation change value. During the study period, 164 these values for the blocks one to four are 2.7 mm yr<sup>-1</sup>, 4.9 mm yr<sup>-1</sup>, 7.3 mm yr<sup>-1</sup>, and 8.1 mm yr<sup>-1</sup>, 165 166 respectively. Each block was subdivided into 24 plots of 1 m x 1 m separated by one metre wide 167 buffer zones. Thus while the original elevation represents the conditions at the start of the experiment, 168 the surface-elevation change assesses the mean increase of elevation as a result of sediment deposition 169 and soil autocompaction over the course of the experiment. The position of the plots was marked in 170 the field using plastic sticks. The original elevation of all plots in relation to the German ordnance 171 datum (NHN) was assessed at the start of the experiment using an optical levelling device (Nolte et al. 172 2013a).

173 A total number of 850 individual *Elymus* plants were collected close to the experimental 174 blocks in June 2007 from an area dominated by the plant. An automatic planting device with a diameter of 8 cm and depth of 16 cm was used for extraction and individuals were transplanted 175 together with the field substrate into pots of the same size. Pots were transported to the greenhouse 176 177 where plants were cut back and cultivated for 5 weeks. In case one pot contained more than one individual the surplus individuals were removed. Only intermediate sized individuals were further 178 used for planting. Within each plot we planted five randomly chosen individuals of *Elymus* on 179 180 24.07.2007. The automated planting device was used to remove the soil in the field to create a hole, so 181 that plants could be transplanted including their substrate. Previous to the experiment *Elymus* was not 182 present in the blocks. Vegetation composition in blocks 1 to 3 was heterogeneous with a mix of Aster 183 tripolium, Halimione portulacoides, Puccinellia maritima and Spartina anglica. Only block 4 was 184 characterised by the dominance of Halimione portulacoides in most plots. Almost 50% of all planted 185 individuals died in the autumn of 2007, probably due to extremely high precipitation. To continue the 186 experiment dead individuals were therefore replaced in April 2008.

187 Plots within the blocks were randomly assigned to one of the three N-fertilisation treatments, 188 namely 0 g N m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (control), 20 g N m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (N20) and 40 g N m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (N40), resulting in eight 189 replicates per treatment per block. These Nitrogen addition treatments were chosen to be relatively 190 high, as fertilisation treatments representing atmospheric N-input of 4 g N m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (Bockelmann and 191 Neuhaus 1999) or 5 g N m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (Van Wijnen and Bakker 1999) were found to have no effect. A 192 powdered slow-release N-fertilizer (Floranid® 32-0-0) was used and was dissolved in water obtained 193 from the closest salt-marsh creek. The same volume of creek water without fertilizer was added to control plots. Fertilizer was applied three times per year during the main growing season in Mai, Juneand July every year from the start of the experiment in 2007 to 2011.

After four years of treatment, the vegetation composition and cover was recorded in all plots
on 30.09.2011 using the Londo decimal scale (Londo 1976). Nomenclature follows (Haeupler and
Muer 2007). Additionally, total aboveground biomass was collected from a 20 cm x 20 cm subplot in
each plot on 30.09.2011 as an indicator of general light competition. Biomass was stored in perforated
permeable plastic bags (Sealed Air Cryovac) and air dried at 60°C for two days to constant weight.
Additionally, five empty bags were weighed and the mean weight used to subtract the weight of the
bag from the biomass samples.

#### 203 2.2 Statistical analyses

204 To assess succession (i.e. the shift from early towards late-successional plant-species composition 205 following Olff et al. (1997) and Petersen et al.(2014)) the effect of surface-elevation change, original elevation and N-fertilisation on plant-species composition in plots was analysed with redundancy 206 207 analysis (RDA). Species cover recorded using the Londo decimal scale was recalculated as a 208 percentage cover value, log(x+1)-transformed and centred. As environmental factors, we added 209 original elevation, surface-elevation change and N-fertilisation in a stepwise forward procedure to the 210 analysis. Both surface-elevation change and N-fertilisation were treated as factors, as they had only 211 four and three levels, respectively. Significance was tested based on Monte-Carlo permutation tests, 212 with 499 permutations.

In addition to the RDA we tested the effect of surface-elevation change, elevation and Nfertilisation on the cover of *Elymus* at the end of the experiment using a negative binomial generalized linear model (GLM). The full model included the cover of *Elymus* as a response variable and the explanatory variables original elevation, surface-elevation change and N-fertilisation, with the latter two being factorial variables. All interaction effects were included. Overdispersion was detected and therefore standard errors were corrected using a quasi-GLM model. Backward stepwise model selection was performed using the drop1 command based on  $\gamma^2$ -test (Zuur et al. 2009).

220 The effect of surface-elevation change, original elevation and N-fertilisation on the biomass was analysed using Analysis of Covariance (ANCOVA) as assumptions of normality and homogeneity 221 222 of variance were met by the data. Original elevation, surface-elevation change and N-fertilisation, as 223 well as all possible interaction terms, were included as explanatory variables. To compare the biomass 224 between treatments, we used a Tukey posthoc-test. No spatial autocorrelation was detected in the 225 models when variograms of the residuals were plotted (Zuur et al. 2009). All statistical analyses 226 except for the RDA were performed using the statistical software 'R' version 3.2.4 (R Development 227 Core Team 2017). The RDA was performed using the statistical software CANOCO 5 (Smilauer and 228 Lepš 2014)

#### **3. Results**

#### 230 3.1 Plant-species composition

231 In the RDA we found that 32.2 % and 8.4 % of the variation in the plant-species composition were explained by the first and second axis, respectively. The final model included surface-elevation 232 233 change, original elevation and N-fertilisation and was significantly different from a random model (pseudo F = 13.5; p = 0.002). The single values of the surface-elevation change factor are organised 234 along the first axis, with the surface-elevation change 4.9 mm yr<sup>-1</sup> and 2.7 mm yr<sup>-1</sup> positioned 235 relatively close together (Fig. 2). The second axis corresponds with the single values of the N-236 237 fertilisation factor, with N 20 being close to the centre of the plot. Original elevation lies between axes. *Elymus* corresponds with the first axis. This indicates that *Elymus* cover is mainly explained by 238 239 surface-elevation change, with the highest percentage covers at the surface-elevation change 8.1. 240 Furthermore, cover of *Elymus* in plots is positively correlated with original elevation, while the N-241 fertilisation seems to have little influence on the cover of *Elymus*. The same pattern can be observed 242 for Halimione protulacoides, another late-successional species. Here it needs to be noted, however, that Halimione portulacoides already had a higher percentage cover in the respective block with 243 244 surface-elevation change 8.1 at the start of the experiment. Characteristic pioneer and low marsh species such as Salicornia europea L. s. I. and Puccinellia maritima lie close to the low surface-245 246 elevation change values and are negatively correlated with original elevation. The typical mid-marsh 247 species such as Aster tripolium, Spergularia maritima and Limonium vulgare are clustered around the mid-elevations and intermediate surface-elevation change value. The high N-fertilisation seems to be 248 249 positively associated only with Suaeda maritima, while most species cluster around the N 0 and N 20 250 treatment.



Figure 2: Biplot of the RDA analysis illustrating the effect of the environmental variables surface-elevation change (SEC)

- and N-fertilisation ( $\blacktriangle$ ), as well as original elevation range (elevation, open arrow) on species composition. Species
- 254 abbreviations: ArtMar Artemisia maritima, AstTri Aster tripolium, AtriPro Atriplex prostrata, AtrLit Atriplex littoralis,
- 255 ElyArt Elymus athericus, FesRub Festuca rubra, GlaMar Glaux maritima, HalPor Halimione portulacoides, LimVul

- 256 Limonium vulgare, PlaMar Plantago maritima, PucMar Puccinellia maritima, SalEur Salicornia europea, SpaAng Spartina
- 257 anglica, SpeMar Spergularia maritima, SuaMar Suaeda maritima, TriMar Triglochin maritimum
- 258 3.2 Cover of *Elymus*
- 259 The final model explaining the percentage cover of *Elymus* included a significant interaction of
- surface-elevation change and original elevation (Tab. 1), while N-fertilisation did not remain in the
- 261 model. If surface-elevation change is low, *Elymus* is only present with a low percentage cover at the
- highest original elevation of the elevation range within the blocks (Fig. 3 A & B). With a higher
- surface-elevation change of 7.3 mm yr<sup>-1</sup> *Elymus* is present more often, but cover percentage is higher
- only in the highest elevation within this block (Fig. 3 C). At a high surface-elevation change of 8.1
- 265 mm yr<sup>-1</sup> *Elymus* is present at all original elevations within the plot (Fig. 3 D), and its percentage cover
- increases along the elevation range within the blocks with increasing original elevation.
- TABLE 1 Summary statistics of GLM analyzing effects of N fertilization, original elevation and surface elevation change (SEC) and their interactions (\*) on the percentage cover of *Elymus*
- 269

	estimate	t-value	Р
Ν			ns
Elev	4.18 ± 1.22	3.42	< 0.001
SEC	107.6 ± 32.31	3.33	< 0.01
N*Elev			ns
N*SEC			ns
Elev*SEC	-0.51 ± 0.15	-3.31	<0.01
N*Elev*SEC			ns

270



Figure 3: Point plots illustrating the effect of the range of original elevation within blocks on the percentage cover of *Elymus*at four different rates of surface-elevation change (SEC) in mm yr<sup>-1</sup> (A-D).

275 3.3 Biomass

The ANCOVA results (Tab. 2) showed N-fertilisation and surface-elevation change to be the factors explaining the total biomass within plots. Furthermore, post-hoc tests showed biomass to be lowest at a surface-elevation change of 7.3 mm yr<sup>-1</sup> and highest at surface-elevation change of 8.1 mm yr<sup>-1</sup>, while both low surface-elevation change values showed an intermediate biomass (Fig. 4 A). Nfertilisation was found to have a positive effect on biomass compared to the control treatment, but the

amount of fertiliser had no effect in our experiment (Fig. 4B). Elevation had no effect on biomass (Fig

282 4C).

283

285 TABLE 2 Summary statistics of ANCOVA analyzing effects of N fertilization, original elevation and surface elevation change (SEC) and their interactions (\*) on the total biomass in plots

287

	DF	F-value	Р
N	2	4.49	< 0.05
Elev			ns
SEC	3	30.65	< 0.001
N*Elev			ns
N*SEC			ns
Elev*SEC			ns
N*Elev*SEC			ns

288

289



290

Figure 4: A) and B) boxplots illustrating the effect of surface-elevation change (SEC) and N-fertilization on biomass in plots.
Boxplots represent: median (middle line), interquartile range (box), 1.5 times interquartile range (bar) and outliers (dots).
Letters indicate significant differences between treatments based on PostHoc-tests. C) Point plot illustrating the effect of the
range of original elevation on total biomass.

#### 295 **4. Discussion**

296 In line with our first hypothesis, original elevation was found to be a main driver of succession favouring Elymus and other late successional plant species such as Halimione portulacoides, as well as 297 298 increasing the cover of *Elymus*. Contrastingly, no effect of original elevation on biomass could be 299 found. N-addition increased the biomass in comparison to the control treatment, but had no effect on succession as seen in the RDA, or the cover of *Elymus*. We therefore find no support for hypothesis 2 300 and conclude that *Elymus* is not N-limited. In support of hypothesis 3 we found that surface-elevation 301 302 change is a main driver of succession as seen in the RDA. The significant interaction effect of original 303 elevation and surface-elevation change on the cover of *Elymus* indicates that a high surface-elevation 304 change quickly raises the original elevation to a level, at which *Elymus* can establish. Thus as no effect 305 of N-fertilisation, but an effect of surface-elevation change was detected, we can conclude that the

positive effect of surface-elevation change on *Elymus* is based on the resulting higher elevation caused
 by sedimentation, but not the addition of nitrogen with the freshly deposited sediments.

#### 308 4.1 Elevation

Elevation is clearly one of the most important factors determining the succession and therefore also 309 the presence and dominance of *Elymus* in Wadden Sea salt marshes (Olff et al. 1997; Suchrow and 310 311 Jensen 2010; Davy et al. 2011; Rupprecht et al. 2015b). Generally, a high elevation is interpreted as a proxy for low flooding frequency and duration and therefore also for favourable abiotic conditions for 312 313 high-marsh plants such as *Elymus* (Suchrow and Jensen 2010). In these less stressful parts of the marsh, the dominance of *Elymus* is often explained with its high biomass and the competitive 314 exclusion of other species based on the limitation of light for shorter plants (Olff et al. 1997). Yet, we 315 316 found no effects of original elevation on biomass which thus means that elevation might not favour tall 317 plants and could indicate that light competition plays no role. However, the plots were chosen to be 318 very similar in elevation and therefore only represent a small part of the entire elevation gradient in salt marshes. Additionally, biomass might not be the most suitable indicator to quantify light 319 competition between species, because there is no clear linear relationship between biomass and the 320 relative absorbed irradiance (Rupprecht et al. 2015a). Therefore, we cannot rule out light competition 321 322 as a driving mechanism of succession in this case.

323 Furthermore, we are unable to rule out effects of belowground competition, as this study only included the assessment of aboveground biomass. An experiment using the grass species Agrostis 324 325 *capillaris* for example, showed that the negative effect of this invasive species on the native vegetation 326 was driven by belowground competition (Broadbent et al. 2017). Interestingly, the authors found this 327 effect regardless of N-availability. Yet, in a mainland salt marsh in Germany with clay soil, N-328 availability was found to have no effect on the fine-root mass (Redelstein et al. 2018). However, the 329 fine-root mass was significantly lower in the *Elymus*-dominated high marsh, compared to the low 330 marsh (Redelstein et al. 2018). Both Redelstein et al. (2018) and Ford et al. (2016) found the fine-root 331 mass to increase with plant species richness, probably because the species in the more diverse low-332 marsh community also represent diverse belowground space occupation strategies. Yet, the total fineroot mass of a group of species does not rule out potential belowground competition and therefore 333 334 these interactions should be further investigated in salt marshes.

335 4.2 N-fertilisation vs. surface-elevation change

336 We found no effect of N-fertilisation on the cover of *Elymus* and on succession. Likewise,

Bockelmann and Neuhaus (1999) found no effect of N-fertilisation on *Elymus* in their study in a

mainland salt marsh, thus drawing the conclusion that *Elymus* is not N-limited. In contrast, a positive

- effect of N-fertilisation on the succession and the relative contribution of *Elymus* to the total biomass
- 340 was found by Van Wijnen and Bakker (1999) in a back-barrier island salt marsh. Thus, these

341 contrasting results might be explained by the differences between mainland salt marshes and island 342 salt marshes, with the latter being characterised by a much shallower clay layer on top of the sandy 343 subsoil (de Groot et al. 2011; Elschot et al. 2013). The thickness of the clay layer was found to be a good predictor of the N-pool (Olff et al. 1997). Therefore, *Elymus* might be N-limited in island salt 344 marshes (Van Wijnen and Bakker 1999), but not in mainland salt marshes (Bockelmann and Neuhaus 345 1999) such as in this experiment. In an indirect approach, comparing time series of vegetation maps 346 347 and chronosequence data of four island salt marshes differing in sediment deposition rates, it was also 348 concluded that *Elymus* expansion is mainly driven by spatially varying natural sediment deposition 349 rates including the resulting N-addition, and not by the evenly spread atmospheric N-deposition 350 (Veeneklaas et al. 2013). We can now corroborate this conclusion by the results of our experiment that 351 sedimentation leading to a high surface-elevation change enabled *Elymus* to grow at originally lower 352 elevation, while N-fertilisation had no effect. Sediment deposition rate in our study area is 2.8 - 8.3 kg 353  $m^{-2}$  yr<sup>-1</sup> (Nolte et al. 2013b). Furthermore, we know that the N-content of the freshly deposited 354 sediment collected using sediment traps is around 0.28% of the total mass (Mueller et al. unpublished 355 data). Therefore the input of N via sediment deposition in the study site ranges roughly between 7.8 and 23.0 g m-2 yr-1 and thus is representative of the lower N-fertilization treatment. For comparison, 356 357 on a back-barrier island in the Netherlands sediment deposition rate was found to range from roughly 358 1.0 to 2.5 kg m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (Elschot et al. 2013). No data on the N-content of freshly deposited sediment is available for this specific site, but assuming similar values to those of Mueller et al. (unpublished 359 data), the input of N via sediment deposition would range between 2.8 and 7.0 g m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>. This 360 361 illustrates that natural N-input in these island marshes is probably much lower and can thus, together with the resulting shallower clay layer, explain that *Elymus* is limited by Nitrogen in these 362 363 salt marshes. Furthermore, surface-elevation change can also vary between mainland marshes. This is 364 in accordance with a landscape scale study of succession in the salt marshes of the Schleswig-Holstein 365 Wadden Sea coast, which found early successional stages to be more persistent in the northern 366 Wadden Sea (Rupprecht et al. 2015b). It is argued that this is due to large scale gradients of e.g. 367 surface-elevation change (Rupprecht et al. 2015b), which was found to be lower in the North 368 (Suchrow et al. 2012) and might therefore reduce *Elymus* encroachment.

369 4.3 Individual establishment vs. clonal growth

370 In this experiment planted individuals of *Elymus* were used to assess which factors drive the

encroachment of the species. In natural succession, however, vegetative propagation was found to be

an important pathway for *Elymus*, especially in young marshes (Veeneklaas et al. 2011). The spread of

373 *Elymus* along the coast of Schleswig Holstein was also found to be positively affected by a shorter

distance to the nearest established *Elymus* patch (Rupprecht et al. 2015b), which might also indicate

the importance of vegetative spreading. Vegetative spreading can enable plants to grow into

unfavourable habitats as daughter ramets can be supported by the adult plants via the rhizome

- 377 (Hutchings and Bradbury 1986). This physiological integration can increase the chance of survival for
- daughter ramets in stressful conditions (D'Hertefeldt and Jónsdóttir 1999; Zhou et al. 2014).
- 379 Furthermore, clonal grasses such as e.g. *Leymus scalinus*, were found to adapt the length of their
- 380 ramets under different conditions, switching to the so-called guerrilla growth form with spreading
- ramets in patches with low nutrient supply (Ye et al. 2006). Whether *Elymus* is also using
- 382 physiological integration to invade the otherwise unfavourable low marsh, remains to be further
- 383 investigated.
- 384 4.4 Succession in salt marshes

Our results highlight that elevation and the change of elevation through sedimentation (i.e. surface-385 386 elevation change) is a key driver of the succession from mid-successional low marsh communities to a 387 late successional high marsh community dominated by *Elymus*. The elevation as a key variable 388 determining the distribution of salt-marsh plant species in Wadden Sea salt marshes (Olff et al. 1997; 389 Schröder et al. 2002; Suchrow and Jensen 2010) and the increase in elevation over time as a main 390 factor leading to vegetation change has been widely described here (Leendertse et al. 1997; Olff et al. 1997; Veeneklaas et al. 2013; Rupprecht et al. 2015b). However, while the zonation represents the 391 392 succession in mainland salt marshes (de Leeuw et al. 1993), this is not necessarily true for back-barrier 393 island salt marshes (de Leeuw et al. 1993; Olff et al. 1997). Here the marsh elevation is a result of the 394 underlying sand layer and the clay sediment that deposited on top of it (Olff et al. 1997; Bakker 2014). 395 Additionally, the thickness of the clay layer in back-barrier island marshes is a good predictor of the 396 N-pool (Olff et al. 1997). This might explain why studies with N-fertilization found much clearer 397 effects in island salt marshes with a thin clay layer (van Wijnen and Bakker 2001), compared to 398 mainland salt marshes with a thick clay layer (Bockelmann and Neuhaus 1999).

#### 399 4.5 Conclusions

We can conclude that the main driver of the *Elymus*-encroachment in the ungrazed Wadden Sea 400 mainland salt marshes is a high surface-elevation change, raising the original elevations and thereby 401 402 probably generating more favourable abiotic conditions. In contrast to many other studies on grass 403 encroachment, N-fertilisation had no effect on the encroachment of *Elymus* in this mainland salt marsh 404 and we therefore conclude that eutrophication by atmospheric N-deposition probably plays only a 405 minor role. This case, therefore, is an example for an ecosystem in which encroachment is driven by a 406 natural factor, rather than anthropogenic eutrophication. Thus, when attempting to halt or slow down 407 grass or shrub encroachment, we suggest nature managers to assess different potential causes of the 408 development before decisions on actions such as grazing, cutting or burning are made. In case of the 409 Wadden Sea salt marshes, it furthermore needs to be monitored whether *Elymus* is indeed the climax vegetation. On the oldest parts of the island salt marshes, *Elymus* has been partly replaced by stands of 410 411 Phragmites australis and Juncus gerardii, probably due to waterlogging and low rates of sediment

412 413	deposition and thus low sediment supply. Whether this development will also lead to a reduced encroachment or even reduction of <i>Elymus</i> in mainland salt marshes, remains to be seen
414	
415	Acknowledgements:
416 417 418 419 420	We would like to thank Jasmin Fleiner, Nina Pohlmann and Katharina Kleiß for field work and data collection. The ,Bauer-Hollmann-Stiftung' for partially funding this research. We would also like to acknowledge the Administration of the Wadden Sea National Park of Schleswig-Holstein (Tönning) for kindly permitting us to conduct this experiment.
421	Data availability statement:
422	Data is available in PANGAEA. https://doi.org/10.1594/PANGAEA.899893
423	
424	Literature
425	Adam P (1990) Saltmarsh ecology. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
426 427	Andresen H, Bakker JP, Brongers M, et al (1990) Long-term changes of salt marsh communities by cattle grazing. Vegetatio 89:137–148.
428 429	Bakker ES, Olff H (2003) Impact of different-sized herbivores on recruitment opportunities for subordinate herbs in grasslands. J Veg Sci 14:465–474.
430 431	Bakker JP (2014) Ecology of salt marshes - 40 years of research in the Wadden Sea. Wadden Academy
432 433 434	<ul> <li>Bakker JP, Bos D, de Vries Y (2003) To graze or not to graze : that is the question. In: Wolff WJ,</li> <li>Essink K, Kellermann A, van Leeuwe MA (eds) Challenges to the Wadden Sea - Proceedings of the 10th international scientific Wadden Sea Symposium. pp 67–87</li> </ul>
435 436 437	Berendse F, Elberse WT (1990) Competition and nutrient availability in heathland and grassland ecosystems. Perspect plant Compet 93–116. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-294452- 9.50010-2
438 439	Bird EJ, Choi YD (2016) Response of native plants to elevated soil nitrogen in the sand dunes of Lake Michigan, USA. Biol Conserv. doi: 10.1016/j.biocon.2016.12.001
440	Bockelmann AC, Neuhaus R (1999) Competitive exclusion of Elymus athericus from a high-stress

- 441 habitat in a European salt marsh. J Ecol 87:503–513.
- Bouchard V, Tessier M, Digaire F, et al (2003) Sheep grazing as management tool in Western
  European saltmarshes. C R Biol 326:148–157. doi: 10.1016/S1631-0691(03)00052-0
- Broadbent A, Stevens CJ, Peltzer DA, et al (2017) Belowground competition drives invasive plant
  impact on native species regardless of nitrogen availability. Oecologia. doi: 10.1007/s00442-017-
- 446 4039-5
- Bullock JM, Hill BC, Dale MP, Silvertown J (1994) An experimental study of the effects of sheep
  grazing on vegetation change in a species-poor grassland and the role of seedling recruitment
  into gaps. J Appl Ecol 31:493–507.
- Casper BB, Jackson RB (1997) PLANT COMPETITION UNDERGROUND. Annu Rev Ecol Syst.
   doi: 10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.28.1.545
- Chapin FSII, Walker LR, Fastie CL, Sharman LC (1994) Mechanisms of primary succession
  following deglaciation at Glacier Bay, Alaska. Ecol Monogr. doi: 10.2307/2937039
- 454 Clements FE (1916) Plant Succession.
- D'Hertefeldt T, Jónsdóttir IS (1999) Extensive physiological integration in intact clonal systems of
  Carex arenaria. J Ecol 87:258–264. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2745.1999.00345.x
- 457 Davy AJ, Brown MJH, Mossman HL, Grant A (2011) Colonization of a newly developing salt marsh:
  458 disentangling independent effects of elevation and redox potential on halophytes. J Ecol
  459 99:1350–1357. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2745.2011.01870.x
- de Groot A V, Veeneklaas RM, Kuijper DPJ, Bakker JP (2011) Spatial patterns in accretion on
  barrier-island salt marshes. Geomorphology 134:280–296.
- de Leeuw J, de Munck W, Olff H, Bakker JP (1993) Does Zonation Reflect the Succession of SaltMarsh Vegetation a Comparison of an Estuarine and a Coastal Bar Island Marsh in the
  Netherlands. Acta Bot Neerl 42:435–445.
- 465 Dijkema KS (1987) Geography of Salt Marshes in Europe. Zeitschrift Fur Geomorphol 31:489–499.
- Eldridge DJ, Bowker MA, Maestre FT, et al (2011) Impacts of shrub encroachment on ecosystem
  structure and functioning: Towards a global synthesis. Ecol. Lett. 14:709–722.
- Elschot K, Bouma TJ, Temmerman S, Bakker JP (2013) Effects of long-term grazing on sediment
  deposition and salt-marsh accretion rates. Estuar Coast Shelf Sci 133:109–115.
- 470 Esselink P, Petersen J, Arens S, et al (2009) Salt Marshes. Thematic Report No. 8. In: Marencic H, de

- Vlas J (eds) Quality Status Report 2009. Wadden Sea Ecosystem No. 25. Common Wadden Sea
  Secretariat, Trilateral Monitoring and Assessment Group,
- Esselink P, Zijlstra W, Dijkema KS, van Diggelen R (2000) The effects of decreased management on
  plant-species distribution patterns in a salt marsh nature reserve in the Wadden Sea. Biol Conserv
  93:61–76.
- Ford H, Garbutt A, Ladd C, et al (2016) Soil stabilization linked to plant diversity and environmental
  context in coastal wetlands. J Veg Sci. doi: 10.1111/jvs.12367
- Gaucherand S, Liancourt P, Lavorel S (2006) Importance and intensity of competition along a fertility
  gradient and across species. J Veg Sci 17:455–464. doi: 10.1658/11009233(2006)17[455:IAIOCA]2.0.CO;2
- 481 Haeupler H, Muer T (2007) Bildatlas der Farn- und Blütenpflanzen Deutschlands. Verlag Eugen
  482 Ulmer
- 483 Hutchings MJ, Bradbury IK (1986) Ecological Perspectives On Clonal Perennial Herbs. Bioscience
  484 36:178–182. doi: 10.2307/1310305
- Kiehl K, Eischeid I, Gettner S, Walter J (1996) Impact of different sheep grazing intensities on salt
  marsh vegetation in northern Germany. J Veg Sci 7:99–106.
- 487 Kiehl K, Esselink P, Bakker JP (1997) Nutrient limitation and plant species composition in temperate
  488 salt marshes. Oecologia 111:325–330.
- 489 Kiehl K, Schröder H, Stock M (2007) Long-term vegetation dynamics after land-use change in
  490 Wadden Sea salt marshes. Coastline Reports 7:17–24.
- Kuijper D, Dubbeld J, Bakker J (2005) Competition between two grass species with and without
  grazing over a productivity gradient. Plant Ecol 179:237–246.
- Kuijper DPJ, Bakker JP (2003) Large-scale effects of a small herbivore on salt-marsh vegetation
  succession A comparative study on three Wadden Sea islands. J Coast Conserv 9:179–188.
- Leendertse PC, Roozen AJM, Rozema J (1997) Long-term changes (1953-1990) in the salt marsh
  vegetation at the Boschplaat on Terschelling in relation to sedimentation and flooding. Plant Ecol
  132:49–58.
- 498 Londo G (1976) The Decimal Scale For Releves Of Permanent Quadrats. Vegetatio 33:61–64.
- McCook LJ (1994) Understanding ecological community succession: Causal models and theories, a
  review. Vegetatio 110:115–147.

501 502	Metera E, Sakowski T, Sloniewski K, Romanowicz B (2010) Grazing as a tool to maintain biodiversity of grassland - a review. Anim Sci Pap Reports 28:315–334.
503	Nolte S, Esselink P, Smit C, Bakker JP (2014) Herbivore species and density affect vegetation-
504	structure patchiness in salt marshes. Agric Ecosyst Environ 185:41–47. doi:
505	10.1016/j.agee.2013.12.010
506	Nolte S, Koppenaal EC, Esselink P, et al (2013a) Measuring sedimentation in tidal marshes: a review
507	on methods and their applicability in biogeomorphological studies. J Coast Conserv 17:301–325.
508	doi: 10.1007/s11852-013-0238-3
509 510 511	Nolte S, Müller F, Schuerch M, et al (2013b) Does livestock grazing affect sediment deposition and accretion rates in salt marshes? Estuar Coast Shelf Sci 135:296–305. doi: 10.1016/j.ecss.2013.10.026
512	Olff H, de Leeuw J, Bakker J, et al (1997) Vegetation succession and herbivory in a salt marsh:
513	Changes induced by sea level rise and silt deposition along an elevational gradient. J Ecol
514	85:799–814.
515	Petersen J, Kers B, Stock M (2014) TMAP-Typology of Coastal Vegetation in the Wadden Sea Area.
516	Wilhelmshaven
517	R Development Core Team (2017) R Development Core Team.
518	Redelstein R, Dinter T, Hertel D, Leuschner C (2018) Effects of Inundation, Nutrient Availability and
519	Plant Species Diversity on Fine Root Mass and Morphology Across a Saltmarsh Flooding
520	Gradient. Front Plant Sci. doi: 10.3389/fpls.2018.00098
521 522	Rook AJ, Dumont B, Isselstein J, et al (2004) Matching type of livestock to desired biodiversity outcomes in pastures – a review. Biol Conserv 119:137–150. doi: 10.1016/j.biocon.2003.11.010
523	Rupprecht F, Möller I, Evans B, et al (2015a) Biophysical properties of salt marsh canopies —
524	Quantifying plant stem flexibility and above ground biomass. Coast Eng 100:48–57. doi:
525	10.1016/j.coastaleng.2015.03.009
526	Rupprecht F, Wanner A, Stock M, Jensen K (2015b) Succession in salt marshes - large-scale and long-
527	term patterns after abandonment of grazing and drainage. Appl Veg Sci 18:86–98. doi:
528	10.1111/avsc.12126
529 530	Schröder HK, Kiehl K, Stock M (2002) Directional and non-directional vegetation changes in a temperate salt marsh in relation to biotic and abiotic factors. Appl Veg Sci 5:33–44.
531	Smilauer P, Lepš J (2014) Multivariate Analysis of Ecological Data using CANOCO 5.

- Soons MB, Hefting MM, Dorland E, et al (2016) Nitrogen effects on plant species richness in
  herbaceous communities are more widespread and stronger than those of phosphorus. Biol
  Conserv. doi: 10.1016/j.biocon.2016.12.006
- 535 Stock M (2011) Patterns in surface elevation change across a temperate salt marsh platform in relation
  536 to sea-level rise. Coastline Reports 17:33–48.
- 537 Stock M, Gettner S, Hagge H, et al (2005) Salzwiesen an der Westküste von Schleswig-Holstein 1988
  538 2001. Boyens Medien GmbH & Co. KG, Heide (Schriftenreihe / Nationalpark Schleswig539 Holsteinisches Wattenmeer, 15)
- 540 Stock M, Maier M (2016) Salzwiesenschutz im Nationalpark Wattenmeer ein Überblick.
  541 Vogelkundliche Berichte Niedersachsen 44:131–156.
- Suchrow S, Jensen K (2010) Plant Species Responses to an Elevational Gradient in German North Sea
  Salt Marshes. Wetlands 30:735–746. doi: 10.1007/s13157-010-0073-3
- Suchrow S, Pohlmann N, Stock M, Jensen K (2012) Long-term surface elevation changes in German
  North Sea salt marshes. Estuar Coast Shelf Sci 98:71–83. doi: 10.1016/j.ecss.2011.11.031
- van Andel J, Bakker JP, Grootjans AP (1993) Mechanisms of vegetation succession: a review of
  concepts and perspectives. Acta Bot. Neerl. 42:413–433.
- van Wijnen HJ, Bakker JP (2001) Long-term Surface Elevation Change in Salt Marshes: a Prediction
  of Marsh Response to Future Sea-Level Rise. Estuar Coast Shelf Sci 52:381–390. doi:
- 550 10.1006/ecss.2000.0744
- Van Wijnen HJ, Bakker JP (1999) Nitrogen and phosphorus limitation in a coastal barrier salt marsh:
  the implications for vegetation succession. J Ecol 87:265–272. doi: 10.1046/j.13652745.1999.00349.x

Veeneklaas R, Bockelmann A, Reusch T, Bakker J (2011) Effect of grazing and mowing on the clonal
structure of Elytrigia atherica: A long-term study of abandoned and managed sites. Preslia
83:455–470.

- Veeneklaas RM, Dijkema KS, Hecker N, Bakker JP (2013) Spatio-temporal dynamics of the invasive
   plant species Elytrigia atherica on natural salt marshes. Appl Veg Sci 16:205–216.
- Veer MAC, Kooijman AM (1997) Effects of grass-encroachment on vegetation and soil in Dutch dry
  dune grassland. Plant Soil 192:119–128. doi: 10.1023/A:1004280300820
- WallisDeVries MF, Bobbink R (2017) Nitrogen deposition impacts on biodiversity in terrestrial
   ecosystems: Mechanisms and perspectives for restoration. Biol. Conserv.

- Wanner A, Suchrow S, Kiehl K, et al (2014) Scale matters: Impact of management regime on plant
  species richness and vegetation type diversity in Wadden Sea salt marshes. Agric Ecosyst
  Environ 182:69–79. doi: 10.1016/j.agee.2013.08.014
- Ye XH, Yu FH, Dong M (2006) A trade-off between guerrilla and phalanx growth forms in Leymus
  secalinus under different nutrient supplies. Ann Bot 98:187–191. doi: 10.1093/aob/mcl086
- Zhou C, Zhang Z, Wang Z, Yang Y (2014) Difference in capacity of physiological integration
  between two ecotypes of Leymus chinensis underlies their different performance. Plant Soil
  383:191–202. doi: 10.1007/s11104-014-2169-7
- Zuur AF, Ieno EN, Walker NJ, et al (2009) Mixed effects models and extensions in Ecology with R.
  Springer Science+Business Media