

1 **Contextual analysis and newspaper archives in management history research**

2

3 **David Bowie, Oxford Brookes University**

4

5 **Purpose**

6 The main aim of this article is to reveal how newspaper archives can support
7 contextualisation in management history research by providing quantitative and/or
8 qualitative, accurate, contemporary, cost-effective data which is not always available
9 elsewhere.

10

11 **Design/methodology/approach**

12 The article comprises a literature review which summarises research into contextual analysis
13 and newspaper archive theory; combined with content and textual analysis of articles
14 published in the Journal of Management History and Management and Organizational
15 History (2013-2017).

16

17 **Findings**

18 The findings reveal that the concept of contextualisation is absent from recent management
19 history articles and that few management historians utilise newspaper archival sources as a
20 data collection strategy.

21

22 **Research implications**

23 There is compelling evidence to suggest that contextual analysis can – perhaps should - be
24 incorporated into management historians' research strategies because managerial
25 organisations operate in open systems, which are influenced by external factors.

26

27 **Originality/value**

28 This article juxtaposes two neglected aspects of management history research, contextuality
29 and newspaper archives, and proposes that a key source for historic contextual analysis is
30 newspaper data.

31

32 **Key words**

33 Methodology; Research methods; Case study research; Mixed-methods; Trade publications.

34

35 **Introduction**

36 Historians are currently engaged in a philosophical debate about the uses of methodology in
37 management history and the relationship between theoretical/empirical perspectives and post-
38 modern critiques of history writing. One aspect of these debates is the role of contextual
39 analysis which incorporates external situational influences in management research (Galvin,
40 2014). Another aspect is the role of newspaper archives as source material, especially in case
41 studies which require multiple sources to support data collection and analysis (Batiz-Lazio,
42 2016). This article explores an often neglected data source in management history research -
43 newspaper¹ archives - and investigates how newspaper data can provide relevant
44 contemporary perspectives to support contextual analysis in management history research.

45 Academic interest in the conceptualisation of context has developed significantly
46 during the past two decades across a wide range of disciplines including management
47 research (Johns, 2017). The growth is especially noteworthy in organisational behaviour with
48 its rich stream of contextual driven research since Rousseau and Fried 's (2001) seminal
49 paper. Contextual analysis incorporates both a broader perspective of multiple environmental
50 dimensions and specific contextual variables to ensure that external organisational drivers are
51 fully recognised (Johns, 2006). Context is important because environmental influences have a
52 significant impact on management and organisations (Tsui, 2006). One of the reasons why
53 contextuality has emerged as a key construct in the design of management research is the
54 recognition that heterogeneity exists across a wide range of organisations and people, both
55 within and across countries; so much that one management journal actively encourages
56 context-specific research (Galvin, 2014). Indeed Bamberger's (2008, p839) call for
57 management and organisational scholars to engage in more contextualisation in theory

¹ Throughout this manuscript, the word newspaper/s refers to newspapers, magazines and trade print media.

58 development, and his suggestion that “context counts ... (and) ... shapes the phenomena and
59 relationships we study” is pertinent to management history researchers. Academics involved
60 with contextuality research methodologies recognise the value of newspaper archives as a
61 source of contemporary perspectives on the environmental context (Tsui, 2006).

62 The benefits of employing newspaper archive data in historical research are well-
63 documented. Newspapers offer an extensive range of easily accessible historic data (Hansen,
64 2004), providing a day-to-day chronology of events with contemporary political, economic
65 and social commentary that was significant to people at the time (Tosh, 2010). “Newspapers
66 provide long records of historical processes often not available” elsewhere and “much can be
67 gained from their use” (Franzosi, 1987, p.14). Indeed, important historical interpretations can
68 be based upon the evidence from newspapers - especially about companies (Hansen, 2004)
69 and management. Also, the “unique periodicity of the press” (Nicholson, 2013, p64) enables
70 the studying of continuity and change in a myriad of ways. Bingham (2010) explained that
71 because newspapers played a central role in British political, economic and cultural life, these
72 archives are now an important source for historians – and this feature of the press is
73 replicated in many other countries. Today, the ease with which academics studying American
74 and British history can access online digital newspapers from the 17th century onwards has
75 simplified the search function even further. So the advantages of using the press in historical
76 research are significant. Clearly newspaper archives provide relevant, rich, temporal data
77 which are utilised by historians in other fields (for example political history) to support their
78 discussion.

79

80 However, a survey of the management history literature reveals that many
81 management historians are reluctant to employ newspaper archives. The reason for this
82 remains unclear; perhaps it might be the complex issue of bias in print media. For example,
83 Lamberg et al's (2014, p241) Nokia case study in Management and Organizational History
84 (MOH) states all articles published in newspapers and business magazines were excluded
85 because "a set of exclusion criteria was established to reduce any bias related to subjectivity."
86 Because the theoretical benefits of contextualisation are well documented, the focus of this
87 paper is the following question: *How, if at all, can newspaper archives be used for the*
88 *purposes of contextualisation in management history research?*

89 The remainder of this paper is structured as follows. First, contextual analysis theory
90 and the newspaper archive literature is succinctly reviewed. This review is followed by a
91 description of the methodological procedure that was used to select and analyse publications
92 in the field of management history that have drawn upon newspaper archives. The paper then
93 discusses how newspaper archives are currently employed by management historians and
94 what role, if any, contextualization plays in it. The paper closes with a discussion/conclusion
95 section in which suggestions are made as to how newspaper archives can be successfully used
96 for purposes of contextualization and, indirectly, for the enhancement of management history
97 theory development.

98

99 **Literature review**

100 *Contextual Analysis*

101 Academic debate concerning 'the conceptualisation of context and its role in management
102 theory' has been discussed since the late 1970's (Bamberger, 2008, p839) and has produced a
103 rich stream of research in contextualisation theory that continues to this day. Indeed, in an
104 editorial for the Journal of Management and Organization, Galvin (2014, p1) explicitly called

105 for context-specific research stating that ‘context matters.’ Johns (2017), in his reflection on a
106 decade of incorporating context in organisational research, observed that numerous
107 disciplines as well as management studies have focused on the critical role of context as part
108 of a trend away from universalism.

109 Johns (2006, p386) defined context ‘as situational opportunities and constraints that
110 affect the occurrence and meaning of organizational behavior as well as functional
111 relationships between variables.’ Poulis et al (2013) suggest that context is a multi-
112 dimensional array of phenomena, sites and events as opposed to a monolithic, homogeneous
113 construct based on a single dimension. The external environment provides the context in
114 which organisations operate; and the organisational environment provides the context in
115 which individuals work. A contextual analysis means describing, understanding and
116 theorising the phenomena within it. Contextual phenomena simultaneously provide
117 opportunities and boundaries for organisations and individuals which can enable or constrain
118 actions (Welter, 2010, p165). Tsui (2006) argues that contextualisation is more than simply
119 evaluating environmental opportunities and constraints; contextualisation comprises
120 cognitions at the individual level, the organisation of role relations at the institutional level,
121 the values and beliefs at the societal level, and serendipity – described as major events such
122 as wars, famine, discoveries, which significantly influence historical development. For
123 example the September 11, 2001 terrorist attack in the USA is an example of an event which
124 has stimulated contextual analysis into work attitudes and behaviour (Johns, 2006). Context
125 also includes ‘the culture, the political and legal system, the stage of economic development,
126 or the economic system ... the history, the geography, its ecology ... and why a context is the
127 way it is today’ Tsui (2006, p1). Critically a contextual environment fluctuates between
128 periods of change and stability depending on the temporal dimension (Zahra et al, 2014).
129 Rousseau and Fried (2001, p2) emphasised the importance of contextualisation for

130 organisational behaviour research 'because it makes our models more accurate and our
131 interpretation of results more robust'.

132 Johns (2006, p391) suggests two different levels of contextual analysis: omnibus and
133 discrete. The omnibus dimension takes a broad perspective using many variables; whilst the
134 discrete focuses on a specific contextual variable. The discrete variable nests within the
135 omnibus context. Johns (2006) uses a journalistic story-telling analogy to explain an omnibus
136 approach – the who, what, where, when, why – to place events in a comprehensive setting;
137 and he draws on social and environmental psychology using task, social and physical
138 variables to express the discrete dimension. In their analysis of contextualisation in
139 international business case study research, Poulis et al (2013, p312-3) explore a wide range of
140 contextual dimensions including “consumers’ cultural diversity, industry/product category,
141 competitive, organisational, geographic, retail, and the temporal.”

142 From a historian’s perspective, the temporal dimension – “the time-frame associated
143 with causal effect” (Rousseau and Fried, 2001 p8) - is especially pertinent. Temporal factors
144 influence economic and social relationships which underpin organisational behaviour (Johns,
145 2006); and from an entrepreneurial viewpoint windows of opportunity which are time-
146 sensitive (Zhara et al, 2014). Johns (2006, p392) notes that “key contextual conditions
147 underlying time effects include secular trends, changing institutional patterns, evolving
148 technology (and) major organizational change.” The consequences of managerial strategic
149 decisions become more evident with the passage of time (Zhara et al, 2014), although “the
150 time lags in causal effects at the individual and firm levels probably differ” (Rousseau and
151 Fried 2001, p8). Bamberger (2008, p843) focuses on “how the meanings attached to different
152 organizational phenomena vary across situations, time frames, and social units”.

153 A key approach to contextual research is the emphasis on “rich detailed description
154 and informed reflection on the role that context plays in influencing meaning, variation and

155 relationships among variables” (Rousseau and Fried 2001, p7). This focus on rich description
156 at the micro level, linked to omnibus and/or discrete contextual variables, involves a multi-
157 level analysis incorporating micro/macro levels and potentially intermediate meso-levels
158 (Johns, 2006). Rich description is intrinsically connected to qualitative research methods and
159 such an approach is inherent to contextualisation (Rousseau and Fried 2001; Johns, 2006;
160 Poulis et al, 2013; Johns, 2017). The importance of contextual analysis is derived from the
161 fact that organisations are open systems which are palpably influenced by external factors
162 outside their control (Tsui, 2006); thus context is a major influence in understanding the
163 actions and behaviour of organisations and managers. Finally, Tsui (2006) suggests that to
164 develop deep knowledge of the contextual situation, the research strategy should incorporate
165 an analysis of relevant newspapers.

166

167 *Newspapers*

168 The locus of a newspaper ranges from the local, to the regional, national and international.
169 Local media focus on the local news and events affecting local government, local companies,
170 local people and organisations. Hansen (2004) suggests that local newspapers can provide a
171 strong contextual perspective about a company; adverts, advertorials, and press releases
172 which are authored by the business are a valuable data source for researchers. Some cities
173 have strong links to specific industries and their local newspaper will chart the development
174 of organisations, managers and the work force involved in that industry over generations.
175 Sheffield is internationally recognised as a centre for British cutlery manufacturing and its
176 local newspaper, the *Star*, was a key source in Tweedale’s (2013) qualitative analysis of 19th
177 century local family cutlery firms.

178 The financial media, newspapers and magazines like the *Financial Times*, *Wall Street*
179 *Journal* and the *Economist*, are significant sources of company, management and industry

180 data. Hansen's (2012) search for "shareholder value" in the *New York Times* from 1851 to
181 2011 revealed that the first time the phrase was used was in 1982. The phrase was then
182 repeated more and more frequently into the 21st century; thus demonstrating that the concept
183 of shareholder value has had a significant impact since the 1980's, but is not intrinsic to
184 capitalist society.

185 There are a vast number of special interest publications which provide in-depth
186 coverage of business, finance, literature, politics, society, hobbies, and specific sports. There
187 is a curious silence concerning the use of business and consumer magazines in the research
188 methods literature. This is surprising given the extensive number of publications devoted to
189 specialist subjects in magazine publishing – especially business magazines. In the UK alone
190 there are 5,100 business/trade magazine and 2,800 consumer titles (Magforum, 2018) and
191 many other countries also have comprehensive trade magazine archives. Mollan and Tennent
192 (2015, p1058) note that the "trade press typically operated to supply practitioners with
193 valuable information affecting their behaviour, giving us an insight into industry structure
194 and practices". Sedgewick et al (2014) relied upon the Australian film industry's weekly
195 trade journal *Everyones* to provide extensive qualitative and quantitative data to evaluate
196 competition in international film distribution in the 1930's.

197

198 *Newspaper Archives*

199 Although "archival holdings are essential to historical scholarship" (Tosh, 2010, p90), Decker
200 notes that the "methodological treatment of archival work are rare" (Decker 2013, p159); and
201 the methodological treatment of newspaper archives is even rarer. The Cambridge University
202 Press (2017) defines an archive as "a collection of historical records relating to a place,
203 organization or family." A key issue relates to the authenticity of the records in an archive.
204 Authenticity is dependent upon the provenance of the archival records from their creation and

205 ownership throughout time to the present day (Theimer, 2012); thus provenance is central to
206 archive management (Jordanova, 2006, p162). Despite bias and the ‘silence’ in archives
207 (silence is a media studies concept where print media deliberately or unintentionally omits
208 data, facts, and information when reporting an event), archival material remains integral to
209 historical research and “a sound anchoring in the past, the evidence, the archival record”
210 underpins the historical narrative of reconstruction and representation (Decker, 2013, p161).

211 The role of newspaper archives in historical research is dependent upon the
212 characteristics of the research question and the problem definition (Hansen, 2004). Since
213 newspapers and periodicals are public documents, which reflect issues relevant at the time of
214 publication, they are unable to provide data about confidential, internal organisational
215 matters. However, in the pre-internet era “newspapers ... often constitute the only available
216 source of information” (Franzosi, 1987, p6) and “are useful, sometimes indispensable
217 (sources) to the business historian” (Hansen, 2004, p99). Bingham (2010, p2) suggests that
218 “perhaps the greatest virtue of newspapers for scholars is the wealth and diversity of content”
219 and emphasises the enormous newspaper readership in the 19th and 20th centuries. This
220 readership must have included virtually all businessmen, managers, politicians and trade
221 union leaders. Indeed, newspapers are the most comprehensive and diverse public record of
222 important events, issues, and opinions – via the editorials and correspondence columns - of
223 the time; and this record of events is not obtainable from other sources (Tosh, 2010). There is
224 a strong tradition dating back to the mid-19th century of investigative journalists carrying out
225 in-depth research to highlight economic and social injustices (Tosh, 2010). Investigative
226 reporting includes exposes of business and management malpractices, especially in
227 broadsheets and the financial press. Journalists with established and credible reputations also
228 write informed articles at the intersection between the private sphere of a company and the
229 public sphere (Franzosi, 1987). A unique aspect of newspaper archives is their chronology of

230 events, as they happened and from multiple perspectives. This feature enables the historian to
231 analyse phenomena through the lens of the time, obtain deeper insights into the actions and
232 reactions of the key players involved, and use this circumstantial evidence to reveal hitherto
233 unknown insights (Hansen, 2004).

234

235 *Online newspaper archives*

236 The digitalisation of newspaper archives has transformed the search process and this
237 explosion of information on the web has changed how archives are used. Theimer (2011,
238 p61) suggests that archives are now “open not closed ... transparent not opaque ... (and) ...
239 user-centred not record centred”. Nicholson (2013) observed that the aggregation of online
240 multi-title databases coupled with individual major title sites has enabled access to thousands
241 of English language newspapers, magazines, and periodicals. Newspaper archives can be
242 used for quantitative and/or qualitative research; this flexibility enables historians to utilise
243 newspaper sources either as the principal data collection method or as part of a mixed
244 methods strategy. Batiz-Lazo (2016) cites numerous authors who support the strategy of
245 collating multiple sources of evidence, including newspapers and magazines, as relevant
246 sources for obtaining contemporary perspectives. For historians wishing to adopt a
247 triangulation methodology, which is relevant to case studies, the inclusion of newspaper
248 archival sources is particularly pertinent. The debate about the primacy of primary over
249 secondary data is less of an issue when employing newspaper archives in historical research.
250 Black and MacRaild (2007, p90-92) suggest that the distinction between primary and
251 secondary sources is “actually quite blurred” and separating sources into precise categories is
252 not helpful.

253

254

255 *Validity and bias*

256 A key issue for historical researchers is determining the authenticity of relevant documents –
257 this is called external criticism which focuses on the credibility of the date of the document
258 (Wood, 1990). Although there can be a problem with some forged historical documents, this
259 is less of an issue with newspapers. In the case of newspaper archives, the provenance of
260 titles and individual editions of a newspaper are well-established; it is rare for a newspaper
261 document to be challenged on the grounds of its authenticity.

262 Another fundamental challenge is to determine whether the details in the document
263 are credible – this is called internal criticism (Wood, 1990). Internal criticism focuses on
264 individual statements within the document and is based upon the source. Sources can either
265 be eye-witness or a non-witness. When an author is an eye-witness and therefore present at
266 the event they are a primary witness and they are regarded as more credible than non-
267 witnesses. This temporal proximity to the event lends credibility to the primary witness’s
268 account; the greater the time-distance from the event, the less credible the account (Wood,
269 1990). Additional and critical elements in evaluating the credibility of an account is whether
270 the primary witness was willing and able to tell the truth; and the competence of the witness –
271 witnesses with “expert knowledge” are deemed to be more credible. Another way to explore
272 the credibility of the witness is to understand the author’s motivation, the purpose of the
273 document and who was the intended audience (Wood, 1990).

274 Different newspapers have different political stances which cater for specific
275 audiences, influence how proprietors, editors and reporters respond to events, and
276 consequently shape how events are recorded. Hansen (2012) suggests that several documents
277 should be evaluated from different sources to provide comparative and competing versions of
278 an event; this helps to reduce the impact of bias from a single source. If possible, independent
279 corroboration of the primary witness’s details are required but sometimes so-called

280 independent sources have derived their data from a solo source, so researchers need to
281 explore and locate the origins of a source (Wood, 1990).

282 Bias in newspaper reporting can take many forms. The Gramscian perspective argues
283 that newspapers and mass media are an integral element of capitalist societies and that
284 journalism and news reflect the interests of the dominant economic group, especially when
285 reporting on class and labour issues (Franzosi, 1987). Clearly, newspaper owners and their
286 editors are selective in what and how events are reported in terms of political or social
287 agendas (Agiridas, 2015). Another perspective recognises that editorials and features, which
288 represent the newspaper’s viewpoint, are clearly prone to bias; but that the reporting of dates,
289 hard facts, and the people involved in an event are reasonably accurate (Franzosi, 1987).

290 There is also the issue that bias in the mass media consists of emphasis and silence. The press
291 as a source of historical data might omit information rather than be erroneous; and of course
292 information can be manipulated and distorted by the use of language – “language is the tool
293 of media manipulation” (Franzosi, 1987, p7). A caveat concerns the relationship between
294 companies and the media. Press statements, business personality profiles, and adverts are an
295 “expression of the company’s view” and constructs of the desired “public image” of the
296 company which therefore need to be treated with caution (Hansen, 2004, pp 109-110).

297 Whilst bias is inherent in newspapers, bias can be managed. Since the partisan
298 opinions of a newspaper are discernible, authors should be able to balance differing political
299 perspectives to reduce any potential bias by ensuring that multiple sources are incorporated in
300 the analysis of an event. Although Mollan and Tennent (2015, p1057) recognised the “risk of
301 the subjectivity of journalists and editors,” they justified the use of newspaper articles as an
302 established business history research technique, particularly where corporate archives are
303 non-existent or difficult to access. They selected *The Times*, *Financial Times* and *Economist*
304 as key sources because “they generally provided reliable business reporting ... they also

305 operated as industry journals for finance in this period.” Indeed in a JoMH editorial note,
306 Bowden (2016) argues that researchers need to know their sources; understand the historical
307 context of the events and people involved; and use multiple sources to cross match evidence.
308 The use of multiple sources enables authors to avoid the potential bias of depending upon
309 only one source to represent press opinion of the time.

310 Despite the apparent potential for newspaper archives to move history-writing and
311 management theory forward, there appears to be limited discussion of contextualisation in the
312 management history literature. In fact, a key word search of ‘contextual analysis’,
313 ‘contextuality’, and ‘situational analysis’ in two leading management history journals, the
314 *Journal of Management History* (JoMH) and *Management and Organizational History*
315 (MOH), between 2013 and 2017 revealed that no article matched these words or phrases.
316 Subsequent content and textual analysis of methodology sections confirmed that management
317 historians did not incorporate contextual or situational analysis as a formal element in their
318 research strategies. The absence is puzzling given that contextual analysis has become such
319 an important concept in the organisational literature. This suggests that two neglected aspects
320 of management history, the theory of contextual analysis and the role of newspaper archives
321 as a data collection strategy, require further research.

322

323 **Data and method**

324 A survey of research in management history was undertaken to establish the extent to which
325 management historians utilise newspaper archives as a data collection method and to explore
326 how management historians can adopt contextual analysis as an element in their research
327 methodologies.

328 The process of reviewing the use of newspaper archives in the management history
329 literature was akin to a systematic literature review (Fink, 2005), where a comprehensive

330 search incorporated a wide range of journal databases and included articles published in two
331 leading management history journals: JoMH and MOH. These journals were selected because
332 of their close relationship in historical subject matter (Booth and Rowlinson, 2006). To
333 ensure that a comprehensive coverage of historians' output was achieved (Stemler, 2001), a
334 proximate 5-year time period was considered; and to ensure contemporary currency
335 (Crawley, 2007), data collection was focused on the years 2013 through 2017. The editorials;
336 a special 20th anniversary celebratory edition of JoMH reflecting aspects of the Journal's
337 development; and five interview articles with senior scholars were excluded from the study.
338 The JoMH's article guidelines clearly states how newspaper articles should be referenced:
339 "Surname, Initials (year), "Article title", *Newspaper*, date, pages. e.g. Smith, A. (2008),
340 "Money for old rope", *Daily News*, 21 January, pp. 1, 3-4" (Journal of Management History,
341 2018). This enables easy identification of the vast majority of newspaper sources in the text,
342 notes, and references. Occasionally when an international source was not easily identified,
343 then an online search provided clarification; for example *De Stentor* in de Jong et al (2017)
344 was identified as a Zwolle-based Dutch regional newspaper. In the articles where newspapers
345 sources were integral to data collection, the approach was discussed in the methodology – for
346 example Varje, Anttila and Väänänen's (2013, p36) analysis of job advertisements in the
347 Finnish newspaper *Helsingin Sanomat* was explained in depth.

348 The number of newspaper sources referenced in each article was manually counted.
349 The coding scheme (Franzosi, 1987) comprised four categories: no newspaper references;
350 minimal (1-4); modest (5-10); and substantial references (over 10). Table 1 provides a
351 summary of recent newspaper archive usage by management historians in JoMH and MOH.

352

353

	No. of newspaper sources				Total	
	0	1-4	5-10	>10		
<i>JoMH</i>	72	19	9	6	106	Table I. Analysis of newspaper sources in <i>JoMH</i> and <i>MOH</i> , 2013-2017
<i>MOH</i>	70	20	5	5	100	
Total	142	39	14	11	206	
%	69	19	7	5		

354

355

356

357

358

359

360

361

362

363

364

365

The 11 articles with more than 10 newspapers sources were analysed in depth to evaluate how, if at all, newspaper archives can be used for the purposes of contextualisation in management history research. Content analysis (Krippendorff, 1989) of articles was the prime method used to analyse how management historians utilise newspaper archives as a data collection method. Each article in the database was read, and the notes and references, were carefully scrutinised to determine the extent of newspaper, magazine and trade press sources. One of these articles, Tikhomirov (2017) has not been included in the detailed analysis and discussion because its focus on F W Taylor’s publication strategy for his Principles of Scientific Management in the American Magazine does not incorporate contextuality.

366

367

368

369

370

371

372

373

374

375

Textual analysis was then used to analyse each of the remaining 10 articles to evaluate elements of contextuality in the texts. This “involves a prolonged engagement of the chosen text using ... narrative ... approaches to qualitative analysis” (Fursich 2009, p240). The articles were analysed using the dimensions (omnibus or discrete); levels (macro, meso, micro); and variables (geographic, political, economic, social, cultural, organisation, and competition) discussed in the contextual analysis literature. All but one of the articles adopted an omnibus dimension; there were 7 macro and 3 micro studies; and a wide range of variables were used, but only 1 variable was included in all the studies – the economic context. Table 2 provides a succinct summary of these articles.

Article	Period	Country/ries	Sector/Industry	Field of study	Method	Dimension	Contextuality	
							Level	Variables
<i>JoMH</i> Varje, Turttainen and Väimänen (2013b)	1949-2009	Finland	Advertising	Psychological management	Longitudinal, mixed methods study of 1,305 manager job advertisements in Finnish newspaper, with quantitative and qualitative analysis examining the evolution of ideal manager traits	Omnibus	Macro	National Political Economic Social Cultural International
Riad (2014)	100-1963	West Europe and the USA	Literature and film	Leadership	A longitudinal qualitative analysis of leadership retelling the story of Anthony and Cleopatra within the social and economic context of the Roman, Elizabethan, Georgian and Hollywood eras	Omnibus	Macro	Political Economic Social Cultural
McLarty and Rosen (2014)	1906-1911	USA	Meatpacking factories	Employee and public health	A qualitative study of archival newspaper clippings, original journal articles and books written by physician Dr Caroline Hedger, which helped improve working and living conditions of American workers	Omnibus	Micro	Local Political Economic Social
Prieto and Phipps (2016)	1898-1951	USA	Financial services	Management philosophy and practice	A longitudinal study analysing the influence of Charles Clinton Spaulding, a prominent black business leader, based on his own writings published in history journals and newspapers	Omnibus	Macro	National Economic Cultural Organisation
de Jong <i>et al.</i> (2017)	1971-2001	The Netherlands	Health technology	Marketing communication and financial performance	A quantitative and qualitative longitudinal case study examining the relationship between CEO strategic announcements and share price reactions; data obtained from 451 articles in the Dutch financial newspaper <i>Het Financieele</i> <i>Dagblad</i>	Discrete	Micro	National Economic Organisation
Terment (2017)	1918-1995	UK	Public transport	Profit- maximisation	Longitudinal, archival, micro case study of British municipal tramways response to the political and economic context using multiple sources	Omnibus	Micro	Local Political Economic Organisation
<i>MOH</i>								(continued)

377 **The use of newspaper archives in the recent management history literature**

378 The textual analysis of those articles which employed substantial data from newspaper
379 archives provides evidence to support the proposition that newspaper archives can facilitate
380 elements of contextual analysis in historical research, even though the authors did not
381 formally research contextuality. The key newspaper archival sources used in these articles
382 were broadsheets like the *Guardian* and *New York Times* (Riad, 2014) and the Chicago
383 Tribune (McLarty and Rosen, 2014); financial and business media like *Het Financieele*
384 *Dagblad* (de Jong et al, 2017); local newspapers such as the *Yorkshire Post* and *York Evening*
385 *Press* (Tennent, 2017); specialist technical print media like *The Horological Journal*
386 (Proctor, 2013); and professional organisations' publications such as *Indústria Portuguesa*
387 and *Pessoal* (Matos, 2016).

388 The articles demonstrate the wide range of rich sources available in newspaper
389 archives which is not available from other sources. In some studies newspaper data was the
390 key source and integral to the data collection strategy. Newspaper data was the primary data
391 source for Varje, Anttila and Väänänen (2013) and Varje, Turtiainen and Väänänen's (2013)
392 in their analysis of ideal manager characteristics in Finland; and for de Jong's (2017) study of
393 Philips' share price movements following CEO strategic announcements. At least 4 of the
394 studies adopted a mixed methods data collection strategy with 3 including a quantitative
395 element as well as qualitative (Batiz-Lazo, 2016).

396 Riad's (2014) analysis of Cleopatra and Anthony's conspicuous consumption
397 demonstrates different moral perspectives on leadership, ostentation, and social responsibility
398 across centuries. Riad (2014) used 21st century newspaper archives to analyse contemporary
399 contextual data and her comparative analysis using diverse sources effectively illustrates how
400 meanings vary across several temporal dimensions (Bamberger, 2008).

401 McLarty and Rosen’s (2014) study of the physician Dr Caroline Hedger’s description
402 of the appalling working and living conditions of meat packers in the USA in 1906 includes
403 several direct quotes from newspapers, illustrating the unhealthy environment of the
404 factories and nearby housing. For example “The poor health of these children is directly
405 traceable to bad sanitary conditions . . . both along Bubbly Creek and surrounding this dump
406 at Forty-seventh and Robey streets,” Chicago Tribune, 1909 (McLarty and Rosen, 2014,
407 p66). McLarty and Rosen’s newspaper archival research provides historians with a richer
408 understanding of Dr Hedger’s motivations to improve the working/living conditions of
409 families. The complex contextual environment which Dr Hedger presented in her newspaper
410 articles emphasised the significance of context (Galvin, 2014) in addressing the well-being of
411 workers and their families.

412 de Jong et al (2017) evaluated the financial performance of Philips following the
413 public announcements of their strategic decisions using quantitative and qualitative methods.
414 Philips announcements in *Het Financieele Dagblad*, the Dutch daily business and finance
415 newspaper, and share price movements were analysed between 1971 and 2001. Adopting the
416 event study method which measures share price changes following new market data, de Jong
417 et al (2017) analysed 451 announcements and subsequent share price reactions. This article
418 incorporated contextual data from multiple sources, including financial broadsheets, to
419 explore the relationship between CEO public announcements and the market’s reaction
420 measured by share price fluctuations.

421 Tennent (2017) analysed the changing political, economic and technological
422 environments which impacted on British public transport systems between 1918 and 1935,
423 using the City of York as a case study. Local newspapers, such as the *Yorkshire Post* and
424 *York Evening Press*, provided contextual data on economic facts such as tram fares and

425 routes; and political controversies within the York Corporation (the local government
426 authority) – for example quoting councillors’ detailed comments in committee meetings.

427 Matos (2016) explored fluctuations in the dominant managerial discourses in
428 Portuguese businesses, between 1959 and 1986, by analysing articles in the magazine
429 *Indústria Portuguesa* published by the Portuguese Industrial Association and *Pessoal*
430 published by the Association of Portuguese Personnel Heads and Directors. The turbulent
431 political and economic context during this period in Portugal is critical to Matos’s (2016)
432 analysis of managerial discourses and relevant data is derived from these professional
433 magazines.

434 Clearly these management historians have effectively utilised newspaper archives as a
435 key source in their data collection research strategies. However, although there are elements
436 of contextualisation derived from newspaper data in the articles, the authors do not formally
437 discuss contextual analysis in the methodology sections of the articles.

438

439 **Discussion and Conclusion**

440 The focus of this research is to examine *how, if at all, can newspaper archives be used for the*
441 *purposes of contextualisation in management history research?* The evidence from the
442 survey of management history articles suggests that newspaper archives can be used to
443 research contextuality in management history research. The contextualisation theory
444 discussed in the literature review provides several justifications as to why management
445 historians might adopt contextual analysis in their research strategies. Such justifications
446 include the fact that management organisations are open systems which are influenced by
447 external factors (Tsui, 2006); that a contextual environment fluctuates between different
448 temporal periods (Zahra et al, 2014), which consequently influences changing contexts in
449 management history research; that the ‘meanings’ of different organisational phenomena

450 change through time (Bamberger, 2008); and finally contextual analysis engages in rich,
451 qualitative research (Johns, 2006) which is also a feature of much management history
452 research. This is a convincing argument for management historians to incorporate
453 contextualisation, where appropriate, into their research strategies - and one data collection
454 tool which is available to help facilitate contemporary contextual analysis is newspaper
455 archives.

456 Much of the research undertaken by management historians involves businesses and
457 organisations which operate in open systems and are therefore influenced by external factors.
458 Relevant newspaper archives are an effective research tool to assess contemporary awareness
459 and opinions about political, economic, socio-cultural and technological external factors. This
460 data enables researchers to develop a deeper understanding of the context in which
461 organisations and individuals are working. Lubinski's (2015) analysis of the Indian
462 gramophone market between 1890 and 1914 included American, British and German trade
463 journal archives, Indian newspaper advertisements, and different companies' record
464 catalogues which helped her to capture deep insights into PEST drivers and international
465 corporate competitor strategies in the Sub-Continent's record market.

466 The temporal focus of many research studies in management history range
467 across decades and even centuries. Given the fluctuating contextual environment between
468 different temporal periods, newspaper archives are uniquely capable of providing contextual
469 macro and micro-level temporal data about environmental and societal influences relating to
470 explanations of individual or organisational behaviour (Johns, 2006; Johns, 2017). Because of
471 the extensive period of many local and national print publications (*The Times, London*, has
472 been continuously printed since 1785), newspaper archives are especially suited to
473 longitudinal research which can reveal a chronology of events, as and when they happened
474 from multiple perspectives (Hansen, 2004). Examples of management history longitudinal

475 research using local newspaper archives include Tennent's (2017) micro analysis of public
476 transport in a British city over a 17-year period, which utilised newspaper archives to chart
477 political developments in York; and Varje, Anttila and Väänänen (2013) and Varje,
478 Turtiainen and Väänänen's (2013) analysis of job advertisements in *Helsingin Sanomat*
479 between 1949 and 2009 which explored the changing qualities of ideal managers in Finland.

480 Given how much management history research spans generations, another complex
481 and critical issue for our research is to recognise how the meanings of phenomena change
482 through time (Bamberger, 2008). An interesting example of how meanings can change in
483 different eras in the management history literature is Riad's (2014) analysis of how Cleopatra
484 and Anthony's conspicuous consumption was interpreted in the Roman, Elizabethan,
485 Georgian and 1960's Hollywood periods. Although Riad (2014) only uses newspaper
486 archives for a comparative contemporary 21st century political and social context, clearly data
487 derived from newspaper archives can help support contextual analysis from the late 17th and
488 18th century onwards.

489 In this analysis of management history articles, the concept of rich, qualitative
490 research seems to be well embedded in the research strategies of management historians (for
491 example: McLarty and Rosen, 2014; Riad, 2014; Lubinski, 2015; Matos, 2016; Prieto and
492 Phipps, 2016; Tennent, 2017; and de Jong et al, 2017). Since rich, qualitative data is also
493 embedded in contextuality (Johns, 2006), this aspect of contextual analysis seems to be a
494 natural fit with existing management history research strategies.

495 Newspaper archive research could also support contextualisation in management
496 history fields such as, but not only, colonialism; gender issues; labour relations; historical
497 process research; institutional theory; and organisational identity. Potential studies could
498 include cross-sectional research, historical process research, institutional theory research and
499 organisational identity research. For example cross-sectional research into high-profile labour

500 disputes, which have been extensively reported in newspapers across the political spectrum,
501 and could provide in-depth coverage from multiple perspectives to illustrate how different
502 sections of society responded to labour conflicts (Franzosi, 1987).

503 Historical process research, which explores changes in ‘the processes of management
504 in organisations’ over time from a social construction perspective (Foster & Suddaby, 2018,
505 p1), clearly requires an element of contextualisation which print media can provide within the
506 corresponding time-line of the period under study. Institutional theory research, which is
507 predicated upon the premise that individuals create organisational social structures out of
508 shared assumptions about the nature of reality (Suddaby et al, 2014), requires an
509 understanding of the historical context of the period and this can also be derived from an
510 analysis of newspaper archives. As times change, so newspapers reflect the changing values
511 which underpin the rules and belief systems of the environment in which they exist
512 (Weerakkody et al, 2009). In organisational identity research, Foster & Suddaby (2018, p10)
513 observe the close links between organisational identity and organisational history and - since
514 “constant identity adaptation and change is a *sine qua non* of organisational life” (Balmer,
515 p1475) - both planned corporate communications and extempore events, which are chronicled
516 in print media over time, can be researched in newspaper archives.

517 Newspaper archives are an accessible source for at least two reasons. First, they
518 provide an extensive range of data, with a day-to-day chronology of events seen from the
519 perspectives of people living at that time. This long period of historical processes is not
520 available from any other source and, because of the central role of print media as the
521 principal communication medium in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, newspapers
522 enable management historians to research the facts of events and the opinions of
523 contemporaries. Indeed, one eminent historian researching in the field of political biography
524 revealed that newspaper archives are an essential source, providing a veritable “treasure

525 trove” of data to mine (Howell, 2018). Newspaper archives can be used in quantitative and
526 qualitative research; and as a principal research method or in mixed method case studies. This
527 flexibility, combined with the emergence of online access to multiple newspaper archive
528 databases, provides management historians with a powerful research tool which could be
529 more utilised.

530 Second, the use of newspaper archives as a data source is not dependent upon a
531 historian’s epistemological and ontological perspective. Although many of the articles
532 analysed for this paper adopt a reconstructionist form of narrative, constructive and
533 deconstructionist researchers (Godfrey et al, 2016) can also utilise data derived from
534 newspaper archives. Researchers who want to adopt a positivist or a phenomenological, or a
535 mixed-methods approach to their data collection can incorporate newspaper archive analysis
536 in to their research strategy. Since newspaper archives reflect the authentic voices of people
537 involved with, or commentating on, events at that moment in history - almost in real-time –
538 they provide an opportunity to capture those attitudes and opinions of actors and observers in
539 a variety of different genres of management history research.

540 There are a number of limitations to this research. Newspaper data is not appropriate
541 for certain categories of management and organisational history research. Topics covering
542 pre-newspaper publication eras or in countries where newspapers were not produced, or were
543 produced but not effectively archived, clearly cannot be researched in newspaper archives.
544 Also, subjects which were not in the public domain at the time, such as confidential
545 government or internal organisational issues, will not have been published in newspapers;
546 and of course silence in the archives can inhibit data collection on some topics. The author is
547 an English speaking, solo researcher based in the UK; this means that the review of the
548 literature could not incorporate research in to newspaper archives written in other languages.
549 Another limitation is that the viewpoint of research-active management historians is absent; a

550 survey exploring the opinions of management historians towards research methods in general
551 and the use of newspaper archives in particular would be revealing.

552 Hopefully, the argument and evidence presented in this article is sufficiently
553 compelling to demonstrate to management historians that the newspaper archives can provide
554 quantitative and/or qualitative, accurate, cost-effective and insightful data to support
555 contextual analysis, as well as other research objectives, and help to enhance management
556 history theory development. It is hoped that the article will stimulate significant interest in the
557 use of newspaper archives by management historians in their future research strategies, and
558 that Toft's (2010, p. 78) declaration that the 'most important source for the historian is the
559 press' will also apply to research in management history.

560

561

562

563

564

565

566

567

568

569

570

571

572

573

574

575

576

577 **References**

578 Agiridas, C. (2015). What drives media bias? New evidence from recent newspaper closures.

579 *Journal of Media Economics*, Vol 28, 123–141.

580 Balmer, J., M., T. (2017). "The corporate identity, total corporate communications,

581 stakeholders' attributed identities, identifications and behaviours continuum", *European*

582 *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 51 Issue: 9/10, 1472-1502.

583 Bamberger, P. (2008). From the editors beyond contextualization: Using context theories to

584 narrow the micro-macro gap in management research. *Academy of Management*

585 *Journal*, 51(5), 839-846.

586 Batiz-Lazo, B. (2016). The case study method and the methodology of business history.

587 *Contribuciones Científicas y Tecnológicas*. Cecta,cl.

588 Black, J., and MacRaild, D. M. (2007). *Studying History*. 3rd ed., Basingstoke; Palgrave

589 Macmillan.

590 Bingham, A. (2010). The digitisation of digital archives: opportunities and challenges for

591 historians. *Twentieth Century British History*, Vol. 21 No. 2, 225–231.

592 Booth, C. and Rowlinson, M. (2006). Management and organizational history:

593 Prospects. *Management & organizational history*, 1(1), 5-30.

594 Bowden, B. (2016). Editorial and note on the writing of management history. *Journal of*

595 *Management History*, 22(2), pp.118-129.

596 Cambridge University Press. (2017). Cambridge Dictionary. Available at:

597 <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/archive> (accessed 8 December 2017).

598 Crawley, C. E. (2007). Localized debates of agricultural biotechnology in community
599 newspapers: a quantitative content analysis of media frames and sources. *Science*
600 *Communication*, Vol 28, Issue 3, 314-346.

601 Decker, S. (2013). The silence of the archives: business history, post-colonialism and
602 archival ethnography. *Management and Organizational History*, Vol 8 No. 2, 153-173.

603 Fink, A. (2005). *Conducting Research Literature Reviews: From the Internet to Paper* (2nd
604 ed.). Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.

605 Franzosi, R. (1987). The press as a source for socio-historical data. *Historical Methods*, Vol
606 20 No.1, 5-16.

607 Foster, W. and Suddaby, R. (2018). Processing History: Bringing Process-oriented Research
608 to Management and Organizational History. *Routledge Companion to Management and*
609 *Organizational History*, 363-371.

610 Fursich, E. (2009). In defence of textual analysis; restoring a challenged method for
611 journalism and media studies. *Journalism Studies*, Vol 10, NO. 2, 238-252.

612 Galvin, P. (2014). A new vision for the Journal of Management & Organization: The role of
613 context. *Journal of Management & Organization*. 20(1), pp.1-5.

614 Godfrey, P.C., Hassard, J., O'Connor, E.S., Rowlinson, M. and Ruef, M. (2016). What is
615 organizational history? Toward a creative synthesis of history and organization
616 studies. *Academy of Management Review*, 41(4), pp.590-608.

617 Hansen, P. (2004). "Writing business history without an archive. Newspapers as sources for
618 business history – possibilities and limitations". In *Markets and embeddedness. Essays in*
619 *honour of Ulf Olsson*, Edited by: Gadd, C.-J., Granér, S. and Jonsson, S. pp.99–120.

620 Hansen, P. (2012). Business history: a cultural and narrative approach. *Business History*
621 *Review*, vol 86, issue 4, 693-717.

622 Howell, D. (2018). "In conversation at York University, England, UK". Unpublished
623 transcript with author, 23 June 2018.

624 Johns, G. (2006). The essential impact of context on organizational behavior. *Academy of*
625 *management review*, 31(2), pp.386-408.

626 Johns, G. (2017). Reflections on the 2016 decade award: incorporating context in
627 organizational research. *Academy of Management Review*, 42(4), pp.577-595.

628 de Jong, A., van der Poel, M., and Wolfswinkel, M. (2017). "The changing relation
629 between CEOs and shareholders: A case study on Royal Philips NV, 1971-
630 2001". *Journal of Management History*, Vol. 23 No. 4, 375-400.

631 Jordanova, L., J. (2006). *History in practice*. 2nd ed., London. Bloomsbury.

632 *Journal of Management History*. (2018). "Author guidelines, references," available at
633 http://emeraldgrouppublishing.com/products/journals/author_guidelines.htm?id=jmh#23
634 (accessed 11 October 2018).

635 Krippendorff, K. (1989). Content analysis. In E. Barnouw, G. Gerbner, W. Schramm, T. L.
636 Worth, & L. Gross (Eds.), *International encyclopedia of communication* (Vol. 1, 403-407).
637 New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

638 Lamberg, J-A., Laukia, A., and Ojala, J. (2014). The anatomy and causal structure of a
639 corporate myth: Nokia by the book, *Management & Organizational History*, 9:3, 235-255.

640 Lubinski, C. (2015) Local responsiveness in distant markets: Western gramophone
641 companies in India before World War I. *Management & Organizational History*, 10:2, 170-
642 188.

643 Magforum. (2018). UK Magazines. Available at:
644 <http://www.magforum.com/ukmagazines.htm> (accessed 16 January 2018).

645 Matos, J.N. (2016). The making of Portuguese Human Resources Management (1959–1986):
646 regime change and the prevalence of normative discourse. *Management & Organizational*
647 *History*, 11(3), pp.298-317.

648 McLarty, B. D., and Rosen, P., A. (2014) "The physician of Packingtown: the life and impact
649 of Dr Caroline Hedger. *Journal of Management History*, Vol. 20 Issue: 1, pp.62-80

650 Mollan, S. and Tennent, K., D. (2015). International taxation and corporate strategy: evidence
651 from British overseas business, circa 1900–1965. *Business History*, 57:7, 1054-1081.

652 Nicholson, B. (2013). The digital turn: exploring the methodological possibilities of
653 digital newspapers archives. *Media History*, Vol 19, No. 1, 59-73.

654 Okoli, C. and Schabram, K. (2010). A guide to conducting a systematic literature review of
655 information systems research. *Sprouts: Working Papers on Information Systems*, 10(26).
656 <http://sprouts.aisnet.org/10-26>.

657 Poulis, K., Poulis, E., and Plakoyiannaki, M., E. (2013). The role of context in case study
658 selection: An international business perspective. *International Business Review*, 22 (1). 304 -
659 314.

660 Prieto, L. C., and Phipps, S. T. C. (2016). Re-discovering Charles Clinton Spaulding's "The
661 Administration of Big Business": Insight into early 20th century African-American
662 management thought. *Journal of Management History*, Vol. 22 Issue: 1, pp.73-90.

663 Proctor, T. (2013). Production and marketing problems of nineteenth-century
664 UK watchmakers and the industry's ultimate fate. *Management & Organizational History*,
665 8:4, 371-386.

666 Riad, S. (2014). Leadership in the fluid moral economy of conspicuous consumption: Insights
667 from the moralizing tales of Cleopatra and Antony, *Journal of Management History*, Vol. 20
668 Issue: 1, pp.5-43.

669 Rousseau, D., M., and Fried, Y. (2001). Location, location, location: contextualizing
670 organizational research. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 22, 1-13.

671 Sedgwick, J., Pokorny, M. and Miskell, P. (2014). Hollywood in the world market—evidence
672 from Australia in the mid-1930s. *Business History*, 56(5), pp.689-723.

673 Stemler, S. (2001). An overview of content analysis. *Practical Assessment, Research &*
674 *Evaluation*, 7(17). Available at: <http://PAREonline.net/getvn.asp?v=7&n=17> (accessed on 13
675 April 2018).

676 Suddaby, R., Foster, W. and Mills, A., J. (2014). Historical institutionalism. *Organizations in*
677 *time: History, theory, methods*, 100-123.

678 Theimer, K. (2011). What is the meaning of archives 2.0? *The American Archivist*, Vol.
679 74 pp. 58 – 68.

680 Theimer, K. (2012). Archives in context and as context. *Journal of Digital Humanities*,
681 Vol 1 No. 2.

682 Tosh, J. (2010). *The pursuit of history: aims, methods, and new directions in the study of*
683 *modern history*. 5th ed., Harlow. Pearson Longman.

684 Tikhomirov, A. A. (2017). Mythology remains: one more tale behind *The Principles of*
685 *Scientific Management*, *Management & Organizational History*, 12:1, 30-46.

686 Tsui, A, S. (2006) Editorial Contextualization in Chinese Management, *Research*
687 *Management and Organization Review* 2:1 1–13.

688 Tweedale, G. (2013). Backstreet capitalism: An analysis of the family firm in the nineteenth-
689 century Sheffield cutlery industry, *Business History*, 55:6, 875-891.

690 Varje, P., Anttila, E., and Väänänen, A. (2013). Emergence of emotional management:
691 changing manager ideals in Finnish job advertisements from 1949 to 2009. *Management and*
692 *Organizational History*, 8:3, 245-261.

693 Varje, P., Turtiainen, J., and Vaananen, A. (2013b). "Psychological management: changing
694 qualities of the ideal manager in Finland 1949-2009". *Journal of Management History*,
695 Vol. 19 No. 1, 33-54.

696 Weerakkody, V., Dwivedi, Y.K. and Irani, Z. (2009). The diffusion and use of institutional
697 theory: a cross-disciplinary longitudinal literature survey. *Journal of Information*
698 *Technology*, 24(4), 354-368.

699 Welter, F. (2011). Contextualizing entrepreneurship—conceptual challenges and ways
700 forward. *Entrepreneurship theory and Practice*, 35(1), pp.165-184.

701 Wood, W. (1990). Ethnohistory and Historical Method. *Archaeological Method and*
702 *Theory*, 2, 81-109.

703 Zahra, S.A., Wright, M. and Abdelgawad, S.G. (2014). Contextualization and the
704 advancement of entrepreneurship research. *International small business journal*, 32(5),
705 pp.479-500.

706