

# Primer and database choice affect fungal functional but not biological diversity findings in a national soil survey

George, Paul; Creer, Simon; Griffiths, Robert I.; Emmett, Bridgett A.; Robinson, David A.; Jones, Davey L.

#### **Frontiers in Environmental Science**

DOI: 10.3389/fenvs.2019.00173

Published: 01/11/2019

Peer reviewed version

Cyswllt i'r cyhoeddiad / Link to publication

Dyfyniad o'r fersiwn a gyhoeddwyd / Citation for published version (APA): George, P., Creer, S., Griffiths, R. I., Emmett, B. A., Robinson, D. A., & Jones, D. L. (2019). Primer and database choice affect fungal functional but not biological diversity findings in a national soil survey. *Frontiers in Environmental Science*, 7, [173]. https://doi.org/10.3389/fenvs.2019.00173

Hawliau Cyffredinol / General rights Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.

- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
   You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

- 1 Primer and database choice affect fungal functional but not biological diversity
- 2 findings in a national soil survey
- 3 Paul B.L. George<sup>\*,1,2</sup>, Simon Creer<sup>1</sup>, Robert I. Griffiths<sup>2</sup>, Bridget A. Emmett<sup>2</sup>, David A.
- 4 Robinson<sup>2</sup>, Davey L. Jones<sup>1,3</sup>
- <sup>5</sup> <sup>1</sup> School of Natural Sciences, Bangor University, Deiniol Road, Bangor, Gwynedd, LL57
- 6 2UW, United Kingdom
- 7 <sup>2</sup> Centre for Ecology & Hydrology, Environment Centre Wales, Deiniol Road, Bangor,
- 8 *Gwynedd, LL57 2UW, United Kingdom*
- 9 <sup>3</sup> School of Agriculture and Environment, University of Western Australia, Crawley,
- 10 Western Australia, WA6009, Australia
- 11
- 12 \*Corresponding author. School of Natural Sciences, Bangor University, Deiniol Road,
- 13 Bangor, Gwynedd, LL57 2UW, United Kingdom. *Email*: <u>afp67e@bangor.ac.uk</u>;
- 14 pblgeorge@gmail.com
- 15 British English formatting
- 16 **KEYWORDS:** UNITE; SILVA; identification bias; high-throughput sequencing;
- 17 Arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi; Archaeorhizomycetes
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23

#### 24 ABSTRACT

25 The internal transcribed spacer (ITS) region is the accepted DNA barcode of fungi. Its 26 use has led to a step-change in the assessment and characterisation of fungal communities 27 from environmental samples by precluding the need to isolate, culture, and identify 28 individuals. However, certain functionally important groups, such as the arbuscular 29 mycorrhizas (Glomeromycetes), are better characterised by alternative markers such as 30 the 18S rRNA region. Previous use of an ITS primer set in a nationwide metabarcoding 31 soil biodiversity survey revealed that fungal richness declined along a gradient of 32 productivity and management intensity. Here, we wanted to discern whether this trend 33 was also present in data generated from universal 18S primers. Furthermore, we wanted 34 to extend this comparison to include measures of functional diversity and establish trends 35 with soil types and soil organic matter (SOM) content. Over the 413 individual sites 36 examined (arable, grassland, woodland, moorland, heathland), we found congruent trends 37 of total fungal richness and  $\beta$ -diversity across land uses, SOM class and soil type with 38 both ITS and 18S primer sets. A total of 24 fungal classes were shared between datasets, 39 in addition to 15 unique to ITS1 and 12 unique to 18S. However, using FUNGUILD, 40 divergent trends of functional group richness became apparent, especially for 41 symbiotrophic fungi, likely driven by an increased detection rate of Glomeromycetes in 42 the 18S dataset. The disparate trends were also apparent when richness and  $\beta$ -diversity 43 were compared to soil properties. Additionally, we found SOM class to be a more 44 meaningful variable than soil type biodiversity for predicting biodiversity analyses 45 because organic matter was calculated for each sample whereas soil type was assigned 46 from a national soil map. We advocate that a combination of fungal primers should be

used in large-scale soil biodiversity surveys to capture important groups that can be
underrepresented by universal barcodes. Utilising such an approach can prevent the
oversight of ubiquitous but poorly described species as well as critically important
functional groups.

51

### 52 INTRODUCTION

53 Soil fungi are the dominant eukaryotic component of soil communities and are 54 known to perform crucial ecosystem functions (Peay et al., 2008). Characterising the 55 diversity of fungi within the landscape and their response to anthropogenic perturbation 56 therefore represents an important topic within ecology. High-throughput sequencing has 57 allowed the rapid estimation and identification of fungi by overcoming historical 58 limitations of culture isolation and classifying fruiting bodies (Tedersoo et al., 2015). 59 Using these DNA-based approaches it has been estimated that global fungal diversity in 60 soil ranges from 3.5-5 million species. Yet at the beginning of the present decade, only 61 around one-tenth of fungal diversity was thought to have been described (Rosling et al., 62 2011). In terms of ecosystem function, the majority of fungi are important in organic 63 matter turnover and nutrient recycling as they facilitate the conversion of complex 64 organic polymers into forms more readily accessible to other organisms (Peay et al., 65 2008; Nguyen et al., 2016). Consequently, they play a crucial role in regulating both 66 below- and above-ground productivity (Peay et al., 2008). Many soil fungi also form 67 important interactions with plants. Some form mutualistic relationships, best exemplified 68 by the wide range of mycorrhizas (Wang and Qui, 2006; Smith and Read, 2008; Nguyen 69 et al., 2016), whereas others are pathogens, responsible for numerous plant and animal

70 diseases within agriculture and forestry (Fisher et al., 2012; Nguyen et al., 2016).

71 Depending on environmental conditions or life stage, fungi are capable of taking on some

or all of these roles (i.e. saprotroph, symbiotroph, pathotroph) (Fisher et al., 2012).

73 Despite the recognition that fungi are extremely important in soil ecosystems,

characterising fungal communities has remained a challenge, exemplified by the

numerous studies on soil bacteria in comparison to fungi.

76 Fungal barcode sequences are found within the ubiquitous, multicopy ribosomal 77 RNA gene. Within this, the internal transcribed spacer (ITS) region has been accepted as 78 a universal barcode for fungi (Schoch et al., 2012). Recent development of ITS-based 79 databases such as UNITE (Kõjlalg et al., 2013) and Warcup (Deshpande et al., 2016) 80 have overcome limitations in collecting and assigning taxonomic identities to unknown 81 sequences, though database selection may introduce bias into results (Tedersoo et al., 82 2015; Xue et al., 2019). Yet ITS barcodes exhibit some limitations when dealing with 83 unknown or environmental samples. Generally, the ITS region cannot be aligned above 84 the family-level (Cavender-Bares et al., 2009), making phylogenies based on ITS 85 sequence data unreliable. Importantly, the ITS region has proven unreliable at 86 distinguishing certain fungal groups at the species-level, such as Glomeromycetes 87 (Stockinger et al., 2010). Such inconsistencies mean that ITS primers may not accurately 88 detect target organisms. For instance, Berruti et al. (2017), found that ITS primers 89 underestimated Glomeromycetes in bulk soil. Such uncertainty may confound 90 experimental results and lead to erroneous conclusions. 91 Despite the widespread use of ITS barcodes, other markers may better capture the 92 diversity of some fungal taxa. Primers targeting the small and large subunits as well as

93	the ITS regions of the rRNA gene have all been applied to fungi (Tedersoo et al., 2015;
94	Xue et al., 2019). For example, early diverging lineages such as Chytridiomycota
95	(Schoch et al., 2012; Tedersoo et al., 2015) and Glomeromycetes (Tedersoo, et al., 2015)
96	are poorly represented in ITS sequencing. Additionally, advancements in classification
97	have highlighted the shortcomings of environmental DNA barcoding. For example, the
98	Archaeorhizomycetes are a poorly understood but ubiquitous class of soil fungi and their
99	previously unidentifiable sequences have been major components of past soil biodiversity
100	assessments (Anderson et al., 2003; Rosling, et al., 2011). Overlooking these lineages
101	may potentially lead to erroneous assumptions of biological and functional diversity in
102	soils.
103	Underrepresentation of Glomeromycetes in particular exemplifies this issue.
104	Arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi (AMF) form symbiotic relationships with more than 80%
105	of vascular plant families and have been categorised into the monophyletic
106	Glomeromycetes (Schüßler et al., 2001). Unlike most fungi, the ITS region has
107	consistently demonstrated poor resolution in some closely related AMF species
108	(Stockinger et al., 2010) as it is too hyper-variable (Thiéry et al., 2016). As mentioned
109	previously, the ITS region underestimates Glomeromycetes in bulk soil (Berruti et al.,
110	2017). Instead, the 18S region is more commonly used for barcoding AMF, especially in
111	ecological studies (Öpik et al., 2014). Therefore it is important to recognise biases
112	inherent even in supposedly universal barcodes.
113	We previously undertook a nation-wide assessment of soil biodiversity across
114	Wales, representing a breadth of heterogeneous land uses, which included agricultural
115	land, grasslands, woodlands, and upland bogs. In this case, fungal richness and $\beta$ -

116 diversity were assessed using soil environmental DNA, utilising ITS1 primers (George et 117 al., 2019). Yet, from the earliest stages of experimental design, we were cognisant that 118 the ITS1 universal primer choice may not account for numerous functionally important 119 fungal groups, particularly AMF. Thus, the primary objective of the present study was to 120 assess whether observed fungal biodiversity (richness and  $\beta$ -diversity) across contrasting 121 land uses from the ITS1 dataset would differ when compared to a dataset derived from an 122 alternative choice of primer and database. We therefore sought to assess if primer choice 123 influenced fungal biodiversity across land use, soil type, and soil organic matter (SOM) 124 class. Our next aim was to critically evaluate the influence of climatic and edaphic factors 125 (e.g. soil pH, total carbon (C), nitrogen (N), phosphorus (P)) on fungal diversity arising 126 from the use of the two different primer sets. Our final aim was to look for differences in 127 coverage of taxonomic and functional diversity between the two primer sets across the 128 broad range of land uses and soil types evaluated.

129

# 130 MATERIALS AND METHODS

131 Study Design

132Data were collected as part of the Glastir Monitoring & Evaluation Programme133(GMEP). The GMEP initiative was established by Welsh Government to monitor their134most recent agri-environment scheme, Glastir, which involved 4,911 landowners over an135area of 3,263 km² (Fig. 1). Through the GMEP framework, survey teams collected136samples in 2013 and 2014 between April and October in each year (Emmett and the137GMEP Team, 2017). Sampling protocols were based on those of the UK-wide ecosystem138monitoring programme, Countryside Survey (Emmett et al., 2010). The survey design

losen
37
p by 4 cm
s were
on), pH
time in
$(m^3/m^3),$
r
rge et al.
μm
nd
1
oerature
cted from
et al.,
ormation)
OM class
ıdy was
).
n 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1

162 Briefly, vegetation was recorded by surveyors and used to classify each site into one of 163 the 8 Aggregate Vegetation Classes (AVCs) as described in Bunce et al. (1999; for 164 further details please see Supplementary Material). The AVCs have been shown to 165 follow a gradient of soil nutrient content from which productivity and management 166 intensity can also be inferred (see Supplementary Material and Bunce et al., 1999). There 167 were 7 AVCs identified in the present study. The AVCs in descending order of 168 productivity are: Crops/weeds (including arable land), Fertile grassland, Infertile 169 grassland, Lowland woodland, Upland woodland, Moorland grass-mosaic, Heath/bog 170 (Supplementary Table 1). Soil type based on the predominant major soil group 171 classification was extracted from the National Soil Map (Supplementary Material; Avery, 172 1980). Additionally, we classified soils on a per sample basis by organic matter content. 173 Each sample was grouped into one of four organic matter classes based on percent loss-174 on-ignition (LOI) following the protocols of the 2007 Countryside Survey (Emmett et al., 175 2010): mineral (0-8% LOI), humus-mineral (8-30% LOI), organo-mineral (30-60% LOI), 176 and organic (60-100% LOI). Mean values for each environmental variable were recorded 177 for each land use, soil organic matter class, and soil type.

### 178 DNA Extraction

Soils used in DNA extraction were collected from 15 cm deep by 8 cm diameter
cores. Soil samples were transported in refrigerated boxes; samples were received at
Environment Centre Wales, Bangor within an average of 48 h post-extraction and frozen
at -80 °C upon arrival. Soils were then thawed and homogenised as they passed through a
sterilised 2 mm stainless steel sieve after which they were returned to a -80 °C freezer
until DNA extraction. Sieves were sterilised between samples by rinsing with tap water at

185	high pressure and an application of Vircon <sup>®</sup> laboratory disinfectant followed by UV-
186	treating each side for 5 minutes. DNA was extracted by mechanical lysis from 0.25 g of
187	soil per sample using a PowerLyzer PowerSoil DNA Isolation Kit (MO-BIO Inc.). Soils
188	were pre-treated with 750 $\mu L$ of a suspension of CaCO3 (1 M) following Sagova-
189	Mareckova et al. (2008) to improve PCR performances, especially for acidic soils.
190	Extracted DNA was stored at -20 °C until amplicon library preparation began. The
191	extractions and homogenisation steps were performed in triplicate. To check for
192	contamination in sieves, 3 negative control DNA extractions were completed as well as 2
193	negative control kit extractions using the same technique but without the CaCO <sub>3</sub> pre-
194	treatment. Aliquots of the resultant DNA were used to create amplicon libraries for
195	sequencing with each primer set.
196	

# 197 Primer Selection and PCR Protocols for Library Preparation

198 Amplicon libraries were created using primers for the ITS1 (ITS5/5.8S\_fungi) 199 area to specifically target fungi (Epp et al., 2012) and the V4 region of the 18S gene 200 (TAReuk454FWD1/TAReukREV3) (Behnke et al., 2011) targeting a wide range of, but 201 not all, eukaryotic organisms, including fungi. A two-step PCR following protocols 202 devised in conjunction with the Liverpool Centre for Genome Research was used as 203 described in George et al. (2019). Amplification of amplicon libraries was run in 204 triplicate on DNA Engine Tetrad<sup>®</sup> 2 Peltier Thermal Cycler (BIO-RAD Laboratories Inc.) 205 and thermocycling parameters for both PCR protocols started with 98 °C for 30 s and 206 terminated with 72 °C for 10 min for final extension and held at 4 °C for a final 10 min. 207 For the ITS1 locus, there were 15 cycles of 98 °C for 10 s; 58 °C for 30 s; 72 °C for 30 s.

208	For the 18S locus there were 15 cycles at 98 °C for 10 s; 50 °C for 50 s; 72 °C for 50 s.
209	Twelve $\mu$ L of each first-round PCR product were mixed with 0.1 $\mu$ L of exonuclease I, 0.2
210	of $\mu L$ thermosensitive alkaline phosphatase, and 0.7 $\mu L$ of water and cleaned in the
211	thermocycler with a programme of 37 $^{\circ}$ C for 15 min and 74 $^{\circ}$ C for 15 min and held at 4
212	°C. Addition of Illumina Nextera XT 384-way indexing primers to the cleaned first round
213	PCR products were amplified following a single protocol which started with initial
214	denaturation at 98 °C for 3 min; 15 cycles of 95 °C for 30 s; 55 °C for 30 s; 72 °C for 30
215	s; final extension at 72 °C for 5 min and held at 4 °C. Twenty-five $\mu L$ of second-round
216	PCR products were purified with an equal amount of AMPure XP beads (Beckman
217	Coulter). Library preparation for the 2013 samples was conducted at Bangor University.
218	Illumina sequencing for both years and library preparation for 2014 samples were
219	conducted at the Liverpool Centre for Genome Research.

. . . . . . . . .

10

**50 00 C** 

20

70 00 0

20

220

200

. 1

1001

. 1

1 -

1

# 221 Bioinformatics

222 Bioinformatics analyses were performed on the Supercomputing Wales cluster as 223 previously described in George et al. (2019). A total of 104,276,828, and 98,999,009 raw 224 reads were recovered from the ITS1 and 18S sequences, respectively. Illumina adapters 225 were trimmed from sequences using Cutadapt (Martin, 2011) with 10% level mismatch 226 for removal. Sequences were then de-multiplexed, filtered, quality-checked, and clustered 227 using a combination of USEARCH v. 7.0 (Edgar, 2010) and VSEARCH v. 2.3.2 (Rognes 228 et al., 2016). Open-reference clustering (97% sequence similarity) of operational 229 taxonomic units (OTUs) was performed using VSEARCH; all other steps were conducted 230 with USEARCH. Sequences with a maximum error greater than 1 and shorter than 200

bp were removed following the merging of forward and reverse reads for ITS1

sequences. A cut-off of 250 bp was used for 18S sequences, according to higher quality

scores. There were 7,242,508 (ITS1) and 9,163,754 (18S) cleaned reads following these

steps. Sequences were sorted and those that only appeared once in each dataset wereremoved.

236 Remaining sequences were matched first against the UNITE 7.2 (Kõljalg et al., 237 2013) and SILVA 128 (Quast et al., 2013) databases for the ITS1 and 18S sequences, 238 respectively. Ten per cent of sequences that failed to match were clustered *de novo* and 239 used as a new reference database for failed sequences. Sequences that failed to match 240 with the *de novo* database were subsequently also clustered *de novo*. All clusters were 241 collated and chimeras were removed using the uchime\_ref command in VSEARCH. 242 Chimera-free clusters and taxonomy assignment summarised in an OTU table with 243 QIIME v. 1.9.1 (Caporaso et al., 2010) using RDP (Wang et al., 2007) methodology with 244 the UNITE database for ITS1 data. Taxonomy was assigned to the 18S OTU table using 245 BLAST (Altschul et al., 1990) against the SILVA database and OTUs appearing only 246 once or in only 1 sample were removed from each OTU table. Based on DNA quality and 247 read counts, 413 samples were used for analyses of the ITS1 data and 422 for 18S data 248 (from the total of 438).

A Newick tree was constructed for the 18S tables using 80% identity thresholds and was paired with the 18S OTU table as part of analyses using the R package phyloseq (McMurdie and Holmes, 2013). Non-fungi OTUs were removed from both OTU tables. Read counts from each group were rarefied 100 times using phyloseq (as justified by Weiss et al. (2017)) and the resulting mean richness was calculated for each sample. The 254 ITS1 table was rarefied at a depth of 4,000 reads whereas the 18S table was rarefied to 255 10,000 reads. A subset of the 18S data was rarefied to 400 reads across 398 samples to 256 analyse Glomeromycetes OTUs separately. Samples with observed lower read counts 257 were removed before rarefaction. To assess functional diversity, both OTU tables were 258 processed using FUNGUILD (Nguyen et al., 2016) and the resulting matched OTU tables 259 were used to investigate functional roles based on trophic mode. Sequences have been 260 uploaded to The European Nucleotide Archive and can be accessed with the following 261 primary accession codes after the end of the data embargo: PRJEB28028 (ITS1), and 262 PRJEB28067 (18S). 263 264 Statistical Analysis 265 All statistical analyses were run using R v. 3.3.3 (R Core Team, 2017) following

266 rarefaction. For each data set, NMDS ordinations using Bray-Curtis dissimilarity were 267 created with the vegan package (Oksanen et al., 2016) to assess  $\beta$ -diversity. 268 Environmental data was fitted linearly onto each ordination of AVCs using the envfit 269 function. NMDS scores were plotted against these values for each variable to determine 270 the direction of associations. Differences in  $\beta$ -diversity amongst AVCs were calculated 271 with PERMANOVA and homogeneity of dispersion was also assessed. 272 Linear mixed models were constructed using package nlme (Pinheiro et al., 2016) 273 to show the differences in  $\alpha$ -diversity amongst AVCs, soil types, and LOI classification, 274 for both ITS1 and 18S fungal data sets. Sample year as fixed factors; sample square 275 identity was the random factor. This methodology was also used for the subsets of data 276 that matched to the FUNGUILD database. For each model, significant differences were

assessed by ANOVA and pairwise differences were identified using Tukey's *post-hoc*tests from the multcomp package (Hothorn et al., 2008).

279 Partial least squares regressions from the pls package (Mevik et al., 2016) were 280 used with the variable importance in projection (VIP) approach (Chong and Jun, 2005) to 281 sort the original explanatory variables by order of importance to identify the most 282 important environmental variables for richness. Such analysis is ideal for data where 283 there are many more explanatory variables than sample numbers or where extreme 284 multicollinearity is present (Lallias et al., 2015; George et al., 2019). Variables with VIP 285 values > 1 were considered most important. Relationships between important variables 286 and richness values for each group of organisms were investigated by linear regression. 287 Richness was normalised before regression when necessary.

288

289 **RESULTS** 

### 290 Soil Properties

291 Soil properties displayed a range of changes across land uses (Table 1). Notably, 292 total C ( $F_{6, 427} = 89.13 \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), total N ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0.001$ ), C:N ratio ( $F_{6, 427} = 61.03, \text{ p} < 0$ 293 94.41, p < 0.001), organic matter content (F<sub>6, 428</sub> = 107.02, p < 0.001), elevation (F<sub>6, 429</sub> = 294 78.42, p < 0.001), and mean annual precipitation (F<sub>6, 429</sub> = 72.6, p < 0.001), and moisture 295  $(F_{6,427} = 33.74, p < 0.001)$  increased with declining land use productivity. We also 296 observed a reduction in pH ( $F_{6, 428} = 69.56$ , p < 0.001), bulk density ( $F_{6, 428} = 79.87$ , p < 297 0.001), and clay content ( $F_{6, 344} = 19.54$ , p < 0.001) across the land use productivity gradient. Trends in other variables such as soil water repellency ( $F_{6, 428} = 22.08$ , p < 298 299 0.001), total P ( $F_{6, 424} = 7.1$ , p < 0.001), sand content ( $F_{6, 344} = 5.71$ , p < 0.001), stone

300 content (F<sub>6.427</sub> = 10.4, p < 0.001), and temperature at time of sampling (F<sub>6.429</sub> = 4.4, p < 301 0.001), though significant, were less clear across land uses however. These findings were 302 also apparent when samples were grouped from low-to-high organic matter content by 303 organic matter class (Supplementary Table 2). Overall, no clear trends were evident 304 across the different soil types (Supplementary Table 3). 305 306 Sequencing Data 307 A total of 7,582 and 4,408 fungal OTUs were recovered using the ITS1 and 18S 308 primer sets, respectively. Of these, 5,666 were assigned an identifier at the class-level in 309 the ITS1 dataset while 4,367 were assigned an identifier in the 18S dataset. There were 310 15 classes that were only found in the ITS1 dataset and 12 unique to the 18S data. 311 Endogonomycetes was the most abundant class found only in the ITS dataset (19 OTUs), 312 whereas Laboulbeniomycetes (17 OTUs) was the most abundant fungal class unique to 313 the 18S data. A total of 24 classes were present in both ITS1 and 18S data (Fig. 2A). 314 As reported in George et al. (2019), Agaricomycetes were the most abundant class 315 of fungi in the ITS1 dataset overall. There were also a large proportion of 316 Sordariomycetes (Fig. 2B). Archaeorhizomycetes was the most abundant class in the 18S 317 dataset (Fig. 2C). Proportionate abundances of Sordariomycetes and Agaricomycetes 318 followed contrasting trends, with the dominance of the former replaced by the latter in 319 lower productivity AVCs in the ITS1 data, as described previously (Fig. 3A). Although 320 Agaricomycetes and Sordariomycetes comprised smaller fractions of the 18S dataset 321 (Fig. 2C), this trend was still apparent (Fig. 3B). Additionally, the Archaeorhiozmycetes 322 from 18S data generally followed the same trend as the Sordariomycetes (Fig. 3B). The

- 323 preceding trends observed across land uses are also evident across organic matter classes
- 324 (Fig. S1) but are not as clear across soil types (Fig. S2).
- When a class was present in both datasets, it was usually much more prevalent in
- one than the other (Supplementary Table 4). For example, there were 1858
- 327 Agaricomycetes and 915 Sordariomycetes OTUs in the ITS1, yet these numbers dropped
- to 646 and 417 OTUs in the 18S dataset. Similarly, Glomeromycetes accounted for 162
- 329 of the OTUs in the 18S data, but only 6 OTUs in the ITS1 dataset. Abundances of classes
- unique to the ITS1 and 18S datasets can be found in Supplementary Table 5 and
- 331 Supplementary Table 6, respectively.
- 332

### 333 Fungal Richness and $\beta$ -Diversity from ITS1 and 18S Data

We found that fungal richness followed the same trends across land use,

irrespective of primer set. As previously demonstrated in George et al. (2019), fungal

- OTU richness from ITS1 metabarcoding significantly declined ( $F_{6, 258} = 39.87$ , p < 0.001;
- Fig. 4A) from high to low productivity/management intensity. Richness in Fertile
- 338 grasslands was significantly greater than all other AVCs (p < 0.001) except Crops/weeds.
- In the 18S dataset, richness was also significantly higher ( $F_{6,267} = 82.73$ , p < 0.001) in
- 340 more productive/managed land uses and declined along this gradient. However, richness
- 341 in grasslands was highest in this dataset (Fig. 4B). For complete pairwise differences
- 342 between land uses see Supplementary Material.
- 343 The trend of declining richness with productivity was also apparent when samples
- 344 were categorised by organic matter content (Fig. 5). In both datasets, richness was
- 345 significantly greater ( $F_3$ ,  $_{259} = 48.13$ , p < 0.001;  $F_{3, 269} = 46.71$ , p < 0.001; for ITS1 and

346 18S, respectively) in mineral and humus-mineral than all other classifications (ITS1, Fig. 347 5A; 18S, Fig. 5B). There was no consistent pattern of richness when soils were 348 categorised by soil type (Fig. S3). Again pairwise differences between organic matter 349 classes and soil types are described in the Supplementary Material. 350 Community composition based on non-metric multidimensional scaling of Bray-351 Curtis distances also showed consistent trends between the datasets. Plots demonstrate 352 tight clustering of Crops/weeds, and grassland AVCs in both ITS1 (Fig. 6A) and 18S 353 (Fig. 6B) compared to the wide dispersal of other AVCs. Such results are supported by 354 PERMANOVAs, which show significant differences ( $F_{6, 406} = 10.74$ , p = 0.001;  $F_{6, 415} =$ 355 15.65, p = 0.001; however, analyses of dispersion were also significant (F<sub>6, 406</sub> = 41.30, 356 p = 0.001;  $F_{6,415} = 10.69$ , p = 0.001) as a result of the large disparity in replicates 357 between land uses.

358 When these results are visualised by organic matter classification, the tight 359 clusters are populated by mineral and humus-mineral samples, whereas organo-mineral 360 and organic samples are more common in the widely dispersed areas of the plots (Fig. S4 361 and Fig. S5). Soil types are more widely dispersed but Brown and Surface-water gley 362 soils are more common in the tightly grouped area (Fig. S6 and Fig. S7). Again, 363 significant results were observed for both PERMANOVA and dispersion of variance 364 across organic matter classes and soil types in both datasets. 365 366 Relationships Between Soil Properties and Fungal Biodiversity 367 Fungal richness showed similar relationships to soil properties in both datasets.

368 Across samples, PLS and VIP analyses highlighted strong correlations between fungal

369 richness and soil properties. There were significant, positive relationships of richness 370 with pH and bulk density; and significant, negative correlations between richness and 371 C:N ratio, organic matter, elevation, and mean annual precipitation (Table 2). Although 372 these results followed the same trend in ITS1 and 18S data, however, their relative 373 rankings varied. For example, fungal richness from ITS1 data was most strongly 374 correlated with bulk density and organic matter, while richness from 18S data was more 375 strongly correlated to C:N ratio and elevation in addition to bulk density (Table 2). 376 Furthermore, there were some relationships unique to each dataset. Significant negative 377 relationships were observed between richness and soil water repellency. Similarly, 378 richness derived from 18S data was negatively related to total C and sand content of soil 379 but also positively related to clay content. 380 We found pH was the best predictor of  $\beta$ -diversity from linear fitting for fungi no 381 matter what gene region is amplified (Table 3 and Table 4). All fitted variables were 382 significantly correlated to  $\beta$ -diversity, though most of these only weakly. It is likely that 383 they did not strongly influence the fungal communities. Variables followed similar 384 rankings in both the ITS1 and 18S data. Elevation, annual precipitation, soil moisture, C:N ratio, organic matter, and bulk density all had  $R^2$  values greater than 0.35, but their 385 386 relative order differed between datasets (Table 3 and Table 4). 387

507

# 388 Effect of Land Use on Functional Diversity

389 There was a distinct difference in trophic modes of OTUs that were successfully

390 matched to the FUNGUILD database between ITS1 and 18S datasets. In total, 3,402 and

391 1,783 OTUs from the ITS1 and 18S datasets respectively were matched to the

392 FUNGUILD database. Overall, saprotrophs were the most abundant trophic mode in 393 both datasets (Fig. 6); however, pathotrophs ranked second in ITS1 (Fig. 6A) data while 394 the pathotroph-saprotroph-symbiotroph multi-trophic group was second-most abundant in 395 18S data (Fig. 6B). Across land uses, proportions of pathotrophs and pathotroph-396 saprotroph-symbiotrophs fell with declining productivity (Fig. 7). In matches from the 397 ITS1 data, pathotroph-saprotrophs increased across the productivity gradient (Fig. 7A), as 398 did saprotrophs in the 18S data (Fig. 7B). The aforementioned trend in proportional 399 abundance of pathotrophs and pathotroph-saprotroph-symbiotrophs was also present 400 across organic matter classes (Fig. S8). Symbiotrophs appeared to follow an opposite 401 trend, increasing as productivity fell. Interestingly, this was the case for saprotrophs in 402 the 18S (Fig. S8B) but not the ITS1 (Fig. S8A) dataset. Proportional abundances of 403 fungal OTUs grouped by trophic modes did not follow a discernable pattern across 404 changing soil types (Fig. S9). For simplicity, we focused further analyses only on the 405 broadly defined saprotroph, pathotroph, and symbiotroph groups, ignoring all 406 combination groups; pairwise differences for all of the following comparisons are 407 described in the Supplementary Material.

408Across land uses, significant differences were observed in the richness of409saprotrophic fungi in both the ITS1 ( $F_{6,258} = 25.14$ , p < 0.001) and 18S ( $F_{6,267} = 31.10$ , p410< 0.001) data; however, there were differences between datasets (Fig. 8). In the ITS1</td>411dataset, richness followed the same trend as overall fungal richness, with the highest and412lowest values in the Crops/weeds and Heath/bog AVCs respectively (Fig. 8A). Although413this pattern was preserved in the 18S data (Fig. 8B), richness of saprotrophs was much414more even across AVCs in this case. Indeed, rather than the linear decline of richness

along the productivity gradient, there appeared to be 3 distinct levels in the data affiliated
with (i) grassland/agricultural sites, (ii) woodlands, and (iii) bogs.

417 The same pattern was also apparent across organic matter classifications in both 418 datasets (ITS1:  $F_{3, 260} = 32.86$ , p < 0.001; 18S:  $F_{3, 269} = 41.13$ , p < 0.001; Fig. 9). In the 419 ITS1 dataset, each class was significantly different from the others (Fig. 9A). In the 18S 420 data, saprotroph richness was significantly higher in mineral and humus-mineral soils 421 than organo-mineral and organic soils (all p < 0.001 except mineral – organo-mineral p =422 (0.02) (Fig. 9B). Again, the overarching trend of fungal richness was not apparent when 423 samples were grouped by soil type. Although there were significant differences across 424 soil types in both the ITS1 (F<sub>5, 259</sub> = 9.7, p < 0.001) and 18S (F<sub>5, 268</sub> = 10.73, p < 0.001) 425 datasets, these differences did demonstrate consistent patterns across soil types (Fig. 426 S10). 427 In the case of pathotrophic fungi, richness also followed a similar trend to the 428 saprotrophs across both datasets. In the ITS1 data, significantly ( $F_{6,258} = 26.11$ , p < 429 0.001) greater richness values were observed in Crops/weeds and grassland samples (Fig. 430 8A). Richness of pathotrophs was significantly highest in Crops/weeds sites. Again, this 431 trend was present, though not as clear, in the 18S dataset (Fig. 8B). Significant 432 differences ( $F_{6,267} = 52.26$ , p < 0.001) were observed between AVCs, with the highest 433 richness of pathotrophs occurring in the Fertile grassland and Crop/weeds land uses. 434 Across organic matter classes, significant differences were also observed in 435 pathotroph richness in the ITS1 ( $F_{3, 250} = 24.91$ , p < 0.001) and 18S ( $F_{3, 269} = 30.49$ , p < 436 0.001) datasets. However, in this case the trends were more apparent in the 18S data than 437 the ITS1 data (Fig. 9). Pathotroph richness was highest in mineral soils and lowest in

438	organic soils when compared to all other classes in the ITS1 data (Fig. 9A). However, all
439	organic matter classifications were statistically different from each other in the 18S data
440	(Fig. 9B), in descending order from mineral to peat soils. Again, trends were less clear
441	across soil types (Fig. S10). Significant differences were observed in the ITS1 data (F <sub>5</sub> ,
442	$_{259} = 6.93$ , p < 0.001) with the lowest pathotroph richness found in peat soils (Fig. S10A).
443	In the 18S data, differences between pathotrophic fungi across soil types were more
444	similar to those observed in other groups (Fig. S10B). Pathotroph richness was
445	significantly ( $F_{5, 268} = 13.6$ , p < 0.001) different across soil types with the highest values
446	found in brown soils and the lowest in peats.
447	The previously described trend of declining richness across the land use
448	productivity gradient (i.e. Fig. 4) was not apparent when considering symbiotrophs.
449	Furthermore, although significant differences were apparent in both the ITS1 ( $F_{6, 258}$ =
450	14.88, $p < 0.001$ ) and 18S (F_{6,267} = 55.13, $p < 0.001$ ) datasets they were by no means
451	identical (Fig. 8). Symbiotroph richness was highest in Lowland wood sites followed by
452	Upland wood. This trend was not apparent in the 18S dataset, however (Fig. 8B). Here
453	richness of symbiotrophs was greatest in grassland AVCs and lowest in Heath/bog sites
454	much like the overarching trend of total fungal OTU richness.
455	When samples were grouped by organic matter class, further discrepancies
456	became apparent between the datasets. Whereas the previously described trend of
457	decreasing richness with increasing organic matter content held true in the 18S data (F <sub>3</sub> ,
458	$_{269}$ = 36.28, p < 0.001; Fig. 9B), no significant differences were observed in the ITS1
459	dataset ( $F_{3, 260} = 1.88$ , p = 0.13; Fig 9A). In the 18S data, richness of symbiotrophs was
460	greater in mineral and humus-mineral soils when compared to organo-mineral ( $p = 0.002$ ,

461 p = 0.04, respectively) and organic (p < 0.001) soils (Fig. 9B). There were also no 462 significant differences ( $F_{5, 259} = 1.43$ , p = 0.21) in symbiotroph richness across soil types 463 in ITS1 data (Fig. S10A), though there were in 18S data ( $F_{5, 259} = 12.52$ , p < 0.001; Fig. 464 S10B). As described previously, richness was lowest in peat soils and highest in brown 465 soils.

466 We suspected that the differences in functional diversity observed between 467 datasets might be a result of differential coverage of important groups. We were able to 468 confirm this when we analysed the richness of OTUs identified as Glomeromycetes 469 present in the 18S dataset (Fig. 10). All of the 162 Glomeromycetes OTUs were assigned 470 as highly-probable symbiotrophs through FUNGUILD. Across land uses, richness of 471 Glomeromycetes followed similar trends to those of symbiotrophs and saprotrophs from 472 18S data. There were significant ( $F_{6,244} = 33.47$ , p < 0.001) differences across land uses, 473 though they appeared, like the saprotroph richness to be tiered between grasslands, 474 woods, and bogs (Fig. 10A). Richness of Glomeromycetes was higher in grasslands than 475 all other AVCs except Crops/weeds and lowest in Heath/bog sites. Again, when grouped 476 by organic matter class (Fig. 10B) and soil type (Fig. 10C), Glomeromycetes richness 477 followed the same trend as saprotrophs and symbiotrophs from the 18S dataset. Richness 478 was significantly ( $F_{3,246} = 37.65$ , p < 0.001) greater in mineral and humus-mineral soils 479 than all others. Across soil types, richness of Glomeromycetes was significantly ( $F_{5, 245} =$ 480 8.65, p < 0.001) lower in peat soils when compared to most other soil types. 481

482 Relationships Between Soil Properties and Fungal Functional Diversity

483 Across all samples, PLS and VIP analyses highlighted strong correlations 484 between fungal richness and soil properties by trophic groups. Richness of pathotrophs 485 showed similar relationships to soil properties in both datasets. There were significant, 486 positive relationships of richness with pH and bulk density; and significant negative 487 correlations between richness and total C, C:N ratio, organic matter, elevation, and mean 488 annual precipitation (Table 5). As with the total fungal data, the relative rankings of the 489 strength of relationships between pathotroph and each property varied between datasets. 490 Organic matter was most strongly correlated with pathotroph richness from ITS1 data 491 whereas pH was most strongly correlated with pathotroph richness in the 18S data (Table 492 5). Also soil moisture content was also negatively correlated with pathotroph richness in 493 the ITS1 dataset only.

494 Organic matter, elevation (both negative), pH, and bulk density (both positive) all 495 showed significant relationships with saprotroph richness in both datasets (Table 5). The 496 correlations between richness of saprotrophs and both bulk density and pH were the 497 strongest observed in the ITS1 data. There were also negative correlations between 498 saprotroph richness and total C, mean annual precipitation, soil moisture, soil water 499 repellency, and mite abundance in the ITS1 data. However, it again should be noted that 500 the correlation with mites was extremely weak. C:N ratio was strongly and positively 501 correlated with saprotroph richness in the 18S data. Similarly, richness from 18S data 502 was negatively related to total C and sand content of soil but also positively related to 503 clay content. In addition, there was a significant, positive, but weak correlation between 504 sand content and saprotroph richness.

505	In both datasets, symbiotroph richness was significantly correlated with pH and
506	C:N ratio (Table 5). Interestingly, the relationships were positive in the case of C:N ratio
507	and negative for pH in ITS1 data but the opposite was apparent in the 18S data. There
508	were also many more relationships unique to each dataset. Weak but significant positive
509	relationships were observed between symbiotroph richness and rock volume, Collembola
510	abundance, and temperature as well as a negative correlation to soil moisture. In the 18S
511	data, stronger relationships were observed between symbiotroph richness and bulk
512	density (positive) and elevation (negative). Furthermore a weakly negative correlation
513	was observed with sand content in addition to weak positive correlations with clay
514	content and total P.
515	
516	DISCUSSION
516 517	DISCUSSION Primer Choice and the Total Fungal Community
516 517 518	DISCUSSION Primer Choice and the Total Fungal Community We observed congruent patterns in total fungal OTU richness across land uses,
516 517 518 519	DISCUSSION Primer Choice and the Total Fungal Community We observed congruent patterns in total fungal OTU richness across land uses, organic matter classes and soil type when measured with either ITS1 or 18S primer sets.
516 517 518 519 520	DISCUSSION Primer Choice and the Total Fungal Community We observed congruent patterns in total fungal OTU richness across land uses, organic matter classes and soil type when measured with either ITS1 or 18S primer sets. Richness was greater in arable and grassland land uses, which are highly productive,
516 517 518 519 520 521	DISCUSSION Primer Choice and the Total Fungal Community We observed congruent patterns in total fungal OTU richness across land uses, organic matter classes and soil type when measured with either ITS1 or 18S primer sets. Richness was greater in arable and grassland land uses, which are highly productive, intensively managed and declined in the less productive, largely unmanaged bogs.
516 517 518 519 520 521 522	DISCUSSIONPrimer Choice and the Total Fungal CommunityWe observed congruent patterns in total fungal OTU richness across land uses,organic matter classes and soil type when measured with either ITS1 or 18S primer sets.Richness was greater in arable and grassland land uses, which are highly productive,intensively managed and declined in the less productive, largely unmanaged bogs.Although these findings had been previously known from the ITS1 dataset (George et al.,
516 517 518 519 520 521 522 523	DISCUSSION Primer Choice and the Total Fungal Community We observed congruent patterns in total fungal OTU richness across land uses, organic matter classes and soil type when measured with either ITS1 or 18S primer sets. Richness was greater in arable and grassland land uses, which are highly productive, intensively managed and declined in the less productive, largely unmanaged bogs. Although these findings had been previously known from the ITS1 dataset (George et al., 2019), it is important to note that the trend was also present in the fungal OTUs identified
516 517 518 519 520 521 522 523 524	DISCUSSION Primer Choice and the Total Fungal Community We observed congruent patterns in total fungal OTU richness across land uses, organic matter classes and soil type when measured with either ITS1 or 18S primer sets. Richness was greater in arable and grassland land uses, which are highly productive, intensively managed and declined in the less productive, largely unmanaged bogs. Although these findings had been previously known from the ITS1 dataset (George et al., 2019), it is important to note that the trend was also present in the fungal OTUs identified from 18S sequencing. A similar trend was observed across organic matter classes. Here,
516 517 518 519 520 521 522 523 524 525	DISCUSSION Primer Choice and the Total Fungal Community We observed congruent patterns in total fungal OTU richness across land uses, organic matter classes and soil type when measured with either ITS1 or 18S primer sets. Richness was greater in arable and grassland land uses, which are highly productive, intensively managed and declined in the less productive, largely unmanaged bogs. Although these findings had been previously known from the ITS1 dataset (George et al., 2019), it is important to note that the trend was also present in the fungal OTUs identified from 18S sequencing. A similar trend was observed across organic matter classes. Here, fungal richness fell as organic matter increased. Fungal a-diversity is known to be greater
516 517 518 519 520 521 522 523 524 525 526	DISCUSSION Primer Choice and the Total Fungal Community We observed congruent patterns in total fungal OTU richness across land uses, organic matter classes and soil type when measured with either ITS1 or 18S primer sets. Richness was greater in arable and grassland land uses, which are highly productive, intensively managed and declined in the less productive, largely unmanaged bogs. Although these findings had been previously known from the ITS1 dataset (George et al., 2019), it is important to note that the trend was also present in the fungal OTUs identified from 18S sequencing. A similar trend was observed across organic matter classes. Here, fungal richness fell as organic matter increased. Fungal α-diversity is known to be greater in arable soils than in grasslands or forests (Szoboszlay et al., 2016). Potential

528	(Szoboszlay et al., 2016), and (ii) beneficial disturbance from tillage and other standard
529	agricultural practices. The latter is consistent with the intermediate disturbance
530	hypothesis whereby high levels of diversity are maintained by consistent interruption of
531	successional processes (Connell, 1978).
532	Soils rich in organic matter, especially peats, found in upland moors, bogs, and
533	other wetlands across harbour distinct fungal communities from neighbouring habitats
534	(Anderson et al., 2003). Fungi dominate microbial communities in bogs (Thormann and
535	Rice, 2007) although their proportional abundance drops sharply below the first 5 cm of
536	bog habitats (Potter et al., 2017). Yet, richness in bogs is consistently low, perhaps due to
537	environmental pressures such as high acidity, highly recalcitrant SOM, low nutrients and
538	oxygen levels (Rousk et al., 2010; Tedersoo et al., 2010) or reduced competition within
539	the fungal community.
540	In comparison to AVC and SOM levels, differences in fungal communities were
541	not as clear across soil types as defined by the National Soil Map (Avery, 1980), which is
542	inline with previous work on microbial activity across the UK (Jones et al., 2014).

543 Richness was highest in brown soils and was lowest in peats. Brown soils commonly

544 support grassland communities across Wales (Avery, 1980; Rudeforth et al., 1984).

545 Nearly half of the Fertile and Infertile grasslands surveyed in GMEP were categorised as

546 brown soils. The absence of other major trends besides these may be due to the use of the

547 dominant soil type and lack of resolution for the soil classification. The soils map used in

this study simply does not provide enough resolution (1:63, 360; Avery, 1980) for soil

549 type to be an effective category. Furthermore, this system heavily uses subsoil properties

to determine soil type (Avery, 1980), while our work only involved the upper 15 cm.

However, it is our opinion that the use of organic matter classification is more effective
and simple metric that can be easily implemented in large-scale studies in lieu of finescale maps.

554	Results of PLS analyses demonstrates that soil properties and associated
555	environmental factors influencing fungal richness are consistent across ITS1 and 18S
556	datasets. Major drivers included pH, bulk density, C:N ratio, organic matter, elevation,
557	and mean annual temperature (Table 2). Such results from 18S data are consistent with
558	previous findings from the ITS1 data (George et al., 2019). However, there were certain
559	properties that were significant in only one of the datasets and the relative importance of
560	these properties does vary between the two datasets. There are several possible
561	explanations for this. Firstly, 9 more samples were used in the 18S dataset ( $n = 422$ ) than
562	the ITS1 data ( $n = 413$ ), which may have introduced the discrepancy in relative
563	importance of the data. However, it is much more likely that a differential coverage of
564	fungal groups between the two datasets caused these discrepancies.
565	Community composition showed consistent clustering across land uses, organic
566	matter classes, and soil types in both data sets. As in George et al. (2019), communities
567	were most similar in the grassland and arable sites and more spread out across woodlands
568	and upland habitats. This was likely driven by environmental factors across Wales. In
569	both datasets, pH was the most important environmental variable influencing community
570	composition and although the remaining properties followed similar patterns, their
571	relative importance again differed in the dataset. The importance of pH, elevation, C:N
572	ratio, and precipitation in determining fungal community composition fits well in the
573	wider context of soil fungi biogeography. Tederoo et al. (2014) previously highlighted

the importance of these variables in the distribution of fungi at the global scale.

575 Furthermore, the strong positive correlation with C:N ratio is indicative of the expected

576 fungal dominance (de Vries et al., 2006) of nutrient-poor, acidic soils (Bloem et al.,

577 1997).

578

# 579 Primer Choice and Fungal Functional Diversity

580 Differences between richness of trophic modes of fungi, used here as a proxy for 581 functional diversity, showed some discrepancies across land uses and soil classification 582 between data sets. Saprotrophs made up the largest proportion of the 3 functional groups 583 studied and generally exhibited the same trends as total richness across soils and land 584 uses. This was also the case for pathotrophs. Indeed, correlations between environmental 585 variables with pathotroph and saprotroph richness were largely consistent across datasets. 586 However, we observed divergent trends in symbiotroph richness across land uses and 587 soils. Symbiotroph richness was highest in woodlands in the ITS1 dataset whereas it was 588 highest in grasslands according to the 18S data (Fig. 7A and 7B). A similar increase in 589 richness within grasslands in the 18S data is repeated when Glomeromycetes were 590 considered on their own (Fig. 9); AMF are the predominant mycorrhizal fungi in 591 grassland systems (Smith and Read, 2008). The symbiotroph peak in the ITS1 data may 592 be explained by an increase in coverage of ectomycorrhizas which are the most common 593 group to associate with trees and shrubs (Smith and Read, 2008). Despite these 594 differences, both datasets suggest that symbiotroph richness was low in arable land, 595 which is in line with previous findings demonstrating high susceptibility of mycorrhizal 596 fungi to disturbance, for example tillage (Schnoor et al., 2011; Säle et al., 2015), and the

addition of fertilizers, which decreases the receptiveness of many agricultural plants tomycorrhizal infection (Smith and Read, 2008).

599 The divergent trend in symbiotroph richness and discrepancies in relationships 600 between functional groups and environmental variables likely stem from primer biases. 601 Primer biases have been well recognised as a confounding factor in categorising 602 communities from environmental DNA (Cai et al., 2013; Elbrecht and Leese, 2015; 603 Tedersoo et al., 2015). Tedersoo et al. (2015) assessed the effectiveness of fungal 604 barcodes from the ITS, 18S, and 28S rDNA regions and found that primer choice did not 605 affect richness or  $\beta$ -diversity results of soil fungi communities from Papua New Guinea, 606 although fewer OTUs were recovered by 18S primers than ITS primers. In silico analyses 607 suggests such findings are the result of lumping of sequences in the 18S that may 608 predominantly affect rare sequences, thereby strengthening community matrices. 609 Similarly, results were similar enough for all primers to be suitable for analyses at the 610 class-level (Tedersoo et al., 2015). Although the 18S primers used here were designed to 611 cover the breadth of eukaryotes and may lack specificity to fungi (Behnke et al., 2011), 612 our results show strong congruence to the ITS1 data across total richness and indeed most 613 functional groups. 614 Unlike Tedersoo et al. (2015) we observed considerable differences in the

proportions of fungal classes between the ITS1 and 18S data sets. We suspect that such differences stem from the need to use appropriate databases to assign taxonomy to OTUs to each dataset (Xue et al., 2019). Perhaps only 30%-35% of Glomeromycetes are present in 18S and ITS databases, respectively (Hart et al., 2015), and although sequences are continuously being uploaded to such repositories, it is likely the majority of AMF are not

620	identifiable from environmental samples (but see Öpik et al., 2014). Similarly we suspect
621	that, although not studied in detail, primer choice may lead to biases in other groups.
622	Archaeorhizomycetes accounted for nearly 25% of the 18S sequences but less than 1%
623	from the ITS1 data (Fig. 1B). Primer bias has been recognised for Archaeorhizomycetes
624	even before the class' formal description; approximately 19% of 18S sequences collected
625	from Anderson et al. (2003), have been matched to Archaeorhizomycetes, whereas none
626	were recovered from the same samples using ITS primers. Despite its recent description,
627	Archaeorhizomycetes are ubiquitous components of soil communities. Strong
628	associations have been observed with trees, yet precise functional roles of these fungi
629	have yet to be determined (Rosling et al., 2011). Subsequently, such biases likely account
630	for divergent relationships between functional group richness and environmental
631	properties.

632

#### 633 Conclusions

634 Our comparison of the use of ITS1 and 18S primers and their respective databases 635 in a nationwide metabarcoding survey of fungi yielded 3 major findings. First, the 636 congruent findings of total richness and β-diversity across land use and their relationships 637 to environmental variables confirmed our previous research (George et al., 2019). 638 Second, soil organic matter was found to be a more sensitive metric than soil type in our 639 survey design. Third, biases from the combination of primer and database choice became 640 apparent for certain classes of fungi, including Glomeromycetes and 641 Archaeorhizomycetes, which strongly influenced functional group richness across land 642 uses as well as their relationships with environmental variables. It is therefore important

643 to recognise the sensitivity of metabarcoding to primer choice, even when using universal 644 primers. Without simultaneous analyses of environmental DNA using both primers and 645 databases, the presence of AM fungi as well as the newly characterised 646 Archaeorhizomycetes would have been overlooked and unquantified in this survey. 647 Furthermore, since the majority of soil biodiversity is undescribed (Ramirez et al., 2015), 648 utilising multiple primers will elucidate a more complete picture of belowground 649 biodiversity by revealing shortcomings in existing probes and revealing the presence of 650 as yet undescribed organisms. We therefore advocate that future nation-wide surveys 651 included both a sample-based metric of soil type (i.e. organic matter classification) and 652 multiple primers for fungal biodiversity. Such measures should not be arduous to 653 implement, especially if researchers can identify specific fungal groups of particular 654 interest to accommodate.

655

# 656 AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

657 P.B.L.G., D.L.J., D.A.R. and S.C. conceived this project. Bioinformatics and statistical

analyses were led by P.B.L.G. with assistance from S.C. and R.I.G. P.B.L.G. wrote the

659 first draft of the manuscript and S.C., D.A.R., and D.L.J. contributed to subsequent

revisions. All authors read and approved the final draft of the manuscript.

661

#### 662 FUNDING

663 This project was supported as part of the Welsh Government funded Glastir Monitoring

664 & Evaluation Programme (Contract reference: C147/2010/11) and by the UK Natural

665 Environment Research Council (NERC) through the RC/Centre for Ecology &

666 Hydrology (CEH Project: NEC04782). PBLG was supported by a Soils Training and

667 Research Studentship (STARS) grant from the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences

668 Research Council and NERC [Grant number NE/M009106/1]. STARS is a consortium

669 consisting of Bangor University, British Geological Survey, Centre for Ecology and

670 Hydrology, Cranfield University, James Hutton Institute, Lancaster University,

671 Rothamsted Research and the University of Nottingham.

## 672 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 673 This research was supported under the Glastir Monitoring & Evaluation Programme
- 674 (Contract reference: C147/2010/11) and by the UK Natural Environment Research
- 675 Council (NERC) through the RC/Centre for Ecology & Hydrology (CEH Project:
- 676 NEC04782). We thank the GMEP Team for their contribution in collecting the data and
- 677 the laboratory staff of Environment Centre Wales, especially Delphine Lallias, for sample
- 678 processing and DNA extraction. Thanks also to Fiona M. Seaton for assistance with
- 679 statistical analyses. We thank Supercomputing Wales for support and training on their
- 680 system for bioinformatics analyses. We thank John G. Kenny and Richard M. Eccles for
- 681 generating sequence data at the Centre for Genomic Research, University of Liverpool.
- 682 SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL
- 683 The Supplementary Material for this article can be access online at: []

## 684 DATA AVAILABILITY

Data associated with this paper will be publically published in the National Environment

- 686 Research Council (NERC) Environmental Information Data Centre (EIDC). Data are also
- available from the authors upon reasonable request with permission from the Welsh
- 688 Government. Sequences with limited sample metadata have been uploaded to the

- 689 European Nucleotide Archive and can be accessed with the following primary accession
- 690 codes after the end of data embargo: PRJEB28028 (ITS1), and PRJEB28067 (18S).

#### 691 REFERENCES

- 692 Altschul, S. F., Gish, W., Miller, W., Myers, E. W., and Lipman, D. J. (1990) Basic local
- 693 alignment search tool. J. Mol. Biol. 215, 403-410. doi: 10.1016/S0022-694 2836(05)80360-2
- 695
- Anderson, I. C., Campbell, C. D., and Prosser, J. I. (2003). Diversity of fungi in organic 696 soils under a moorland - Scots pine (Pinus sylvestris L). Environ. Microbiol. 5, 1121-697 1132. doi: 10.1046/j.1462-2920.2003.005522.x
- 698 Avery, .W. (1980). Soil classifications for England and Wales (Higher Categories). Soil 699 Survey Technical Monograph No 14. Harpenden, UK.
- 700 Behnke, A., Engel, M., Christen, R., Nebel, M., Klein, R. R., and Stoeck, T. (2011). 701 Depicting more accurate pictures of protistan community complexity using 702 pyrosequencing of hypervariable SSU rRNA gene regions. *Environ. Microbiol.* 13,
- 703 340-349. doi: 10.1111/j.1462-2920.2010.02332.x
- 704 Berruti, A., Desirò, A., Visentin, S., Zecca, O., Bonfante, P. (2017). ITS fungal barcoding 705 primers versus 18S AMF-specific primers reveal similar AMF-based diversity patterns 706 in roots and soils of three mountain vineyards. Environ. Microbiol. Rep. 9, 658-667.
- 707 Bloem, J., de Ruiter, P. C., and Bouwman, L. A. (1997). "Soil food webs and nutrient 708 cycling in agroecosystems," in Modern soil microbiology, eds. van Elsas, J. D., 709 Jansson, J. K., and Trevors, J. T. (Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press), 245–278.
- 710 Bunce, R. G. H., Carr, C. J., Gillespie, M. K., Howard, D. C., Scott, W. A., Smart, S. M., 711 Van de Poll, H. M., and Watkins, J. W. (1999). Vegetation of the British countryside -712 the countryside vegetation system. (Department of the Environment, Transport and the 713 Regions, London).
- 714 Cai, L., Ye, L., Tong, A. H. Y., Lok, S., and Zhang, T. (2013). Biased diversity metrics 715 revealed by bacterial 16S phylotags derived from different primer sets. *PLoS ONE* 8, 716 e53649. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0053649
- 717 Caporaso, J. G., Kuczynski, J., Stombaugh, J., Bittinger, K., Bushman, F. D., Costello, E. 718 K., Fierer, N., Peña, A. G., Goodrich, J. K., Gordon, J. I., Huttley, G. A., Kelley, S. T.,
- 719 Knights, D., Koenig, J. E., Ley, R. E., Lozupone, C. A., McDonald, D., Muegge, B.
- 720 D., Pirrung, M., Reeder, J., Sevinsky, J. R., Turnbaugh, P. J., Walters, W. A.,
- 721 Wildmann, J., Yaysunenko, T., Zaneveld, J., and Knight, R. (2010). QIIME allows
- 722 analysis of high-throughput community sequencing data. Nat. Methods 7, 335-336. 723 doi: 10.1038/nmeth.f.303
- 724 Cavender-Bares, J., Kozak, K, H., Fine, P. V. A., Kembel, S. W. (2009) The merging of 725 community ecology and phylogenetic biology. Ecol. Lett. 12, 693-715. doi: 726 10.1111/j.1461-02548.2009.01314.x
- 727 Connell, J. H. (1978). Diversity in tropical rain forests and coral reefs. Science 199, 1302-728 1310. doi: 10.1126/science.199.4335.1302
- 729 Chong, I.-G., and Jun, C.-H. (2005). Performance of some variable selection methods
- 730 when multicollinearity is present. Chemometr. Intell. Lab. Syst. 78, 103-112. doi:
- 731 10.1016/j.chemolab.2004.12.011

- 732 Deshpande, V., Wang, O., Greenfield, P., Charleston, M., Porras-Alfaro, A., Kuske, C.
- 733 R., Cole, J. R., Midgley, D. J., and Tran-Dinh, N. (2016). Fungal identification using a 734 Bayesian classifier and the Warcup training set of internal transcribed spacer 735 sequences. Mycologia 108, 1-5. doi: 10.3852/14-293.
- 736 Edgar, R. C. (2010). Search and clustering orders of magnitude faster than BLAST. 737 Bioinformatics 10, 2460-2461. doi: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btq461
- 738 Elbrecht, V., and Leese, F. (2015). Can DNA-based ecosystem assessments quantify
- 739 species abundance? Testing primer bias and biomass-sequence relationships with an 740 innovative metabarcoding protocol. PLoS ONE 10, e0130324. doi:
- 741 10.1371/journal.pone.0130324
- 742 Emmett, B. A. & the GMEP Team. (2017). Glastir Monitoring & Evaluation Programme. 743 Final Report to Welsh Government (Contract reference: C147/2010/11. NERC/Centre 744 for Ecology & Hydrology (CEH Project: NEC04780/NEC05371/NEC05782).
- 745 Emmett, B. A., Reynolds, B., Chamberlain, P. M., Rowe, E., Spurgeon, D., Brittain, S.
- 746 A., Frogbrook, Z., Hughes, S., Lawlor, A. J., Poskitt, J., Potter, E., Robinson, D. A.,
- 747 Scott, A., Wood, C., and Woods, C. (2010). Countryside Survey: Soils Report from 748 2007. NERC/Centre for Ecology and Hydrology (CS Technical Report No. 9/07, CEH 749 Project Number: C03259).
- 750 Epp, L. S., Boessenkool, S., Bellemain, E. P., Haile, J., Esposito, A., Riaz, T., Erséus, C., 751 Gusarov, V. I., Edwards, M. E., Johnsen, A., Stenøien, H. K., Hassel, K., Kauserud, 752 H., Yoccoz, N. G., Bråthen, K. A., Willerslev, E., Taberlet, P., Coissac, E., and 753 Brochmann, C. (2012). New environmental metabarcodes for analysing soil DNA: 754 potential for studying past and present ecosystems. Mol. Ecol. 8, 1821-1833. doi: 755 10.1111/j.1365-294X.2012.05537.x
- 756 Fisher, M. C., Henk, D. A., Briggs, C. J., Brownstein, J. S., Madoff, L. C., McCraw, S. 757 L., and Gurr, S. J. (2012). Emerging fungal threats to animal, plant and ecosystem 758 health. Nature 484, 186-194. doi: 10.1038/nature10947
- 759 George, P. B. L., Lallias, D., Creer, S., Seaton, F. M., Kenny, J. G., Eccles, R. M.,
- 760 Griffiths, R. I., Lebron, I., Emmett, B. A., Robinson, D. A., and Jones, D. L. (2019). 761 Divergent national-scale trends of microbial and animal biodiversity revealed across 762 diverse temperate soil ecosystems. Nat. Commun. 10, 1107. doi:10.1038/s41467-019-763 09031-1
- 764 Hart, M. M., Aleklett, K., Chagnon, P.-L., Egan, C., Ghignone, S., Helgasson, T., 765 Lekberg, Y., Öpik, M., Pickles, B. J., and Waller, L. (2015). Navigating the labyrinth: 766 a guide to sequence-based, community ecology of arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi. New 767 Phytol. 207, 235-247. doi: 10.1111/nph.13340
- 768 Hothorn, T., Bretz, F., and Westfall, P. (2008). Simultaneous inference in general 769 Parametric Models. Biometrical J. 50, 346-363. doi: 10.1002/bimj.200810425
- 770 Jones, D. L., Simfukwe, P., Hill, P. W., Mills, R. T. E., Emmett, B. A. Evaluation of 771 dissolved organic carbon as a soil quality indicator in national monitoring schemes. 772 *PLoS One* 9(3):e90882. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0090882
- 773 Kõljalg, U., Nilsson, R. H., Abarenkov, K., Tedersoo, L., Taylor, A. F. S., Bahram, M., 774
- Bates, S. T., Burns, T. D., Bengtsson-Palme, J., Callaghan, T. M., Douglas, B.,
- 775 Drenkhan, T., Eberhardt, U., Dueñas, M., Grebenc, T., Griffith, G. W., Hartmann, M.,
- 776 Kirk, P. M., Kohout, P., Larsson, E., Lindahl, B. D., Lücking, R., Martín, M. P.,
- 777 Matheny, P. B., Nguyen, N. H., Niskanen, T., Oja, J., Peay, K. G., Peintner, U.,

- Peterson, M., Põldmaa, K., Saag, L., Saar, I., Senés, C., Smith, M. E., Suija, A.,
- Taylor, D. L., Telleria, M. T., Weiss, M., and Larsson, K.-H. (2013). Towards a
  unified paradigm for sequence-based identification of fungi. *Mol. Ecol.* 22, 5271-
- 781 5277. doi: 10.1111/mec.12481
- Lallias, D., Hiddink, J., G., Fonseca, V. G., Gaspar, J. M., Sung, W., Neill, S. P., Barnes,
  N., Ferrero, T., Hall, N., Lambshead, P. J. D., Packer, M., Thomas, W. K., and Creer,
  S. (2015). Environmental metabarcoding reveals heterogeneous drivers of microbial
- eukaryote diversity in contrasting estuarine ecosystems. *ISME J.* 9, 1208-1221. doi:
  10.1038/ismej.2014.213
- Martin, M. (2011). Cutadapt removes adapter sequences from high-throughput
  sequencing reads. EMBnet.journal. 2011. Date of access 04/07/2017. *EMBnet* 17, 1012. doi: 10.14806/ej.17.1.200
- McMurdie, P. J., and Holmes, S. (2013). phyloseq: an R package for reproducible
  interactive analysis and graphics of microbiome census data. *PLoS ONE* 8, e61217.
  doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0061217
- Mevik, B-H., Wehrens, R., Liland, K. H., and Hiemstra, P. (2016). pls: Partial Least
   Squares and Principal Component Regression. R package version 2.6-0.
   <a href="https://cran.regionalize">https://cran.regionalize</a> https://cran.regionalize
- Nguyen, N. H., Song, Z., Bates, S. T., Branco, S., Tedersoo, L., Menke, J., Schilling, J.
  S., and Kennedy, P. G. (2016). FUNGuild: an open annotation tool for parsing fungal community datasets by ecological guild. *Fungal Ecol.* 20, 241-248. doi: 10.1016/j.funeco.2015.06.006
- Oksanen, J., Blanchet, F. G., Friendly, M., Kindt, R., Legendre, P., McGlinn, D.,
  Minchin, P. R., O'Hara, R. B., Simpson, G. L., Solymos, P., Henry, M., Stevens, H.,
  Szoecs, E., and, Wagner, H. (2016). Vegan: community ecology package. R package
  version 2.4-0. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package1/4vegan.
- 804 Öpik, M., Davison, J., Moora, M., and Zobel, M. (2014). DNA-based detection and
  805 identification of Glomeromycota: the virtual taxonomy of environmental sequences<sup>1</sup>.
  806 *Botany* 92, 135-147. doi: 10.1139/cjb-2013-0110
- Peay, K. G., Kennedy, G., and Bruns, T. D. (2008). Fungal community ecology: a hybrid
  beast with a molecular master. *BioScience* 58, 799-810. doi: 10.1641/B580907
- Pinheiro, J., Bates, D., DebRoy, S., Sarkar, D., EISPAK authors, Heisterkamp, S., Van
  Willigen, B., and R Core Team (2016). nlme: Lineral and Nonlinear Mixed Effects
- 811 Models. R package version 3.1e138. <u>https://CRAN.R-project.org/package1/4nlme</u>
- 812 Potter, C., Freeman, C., Golyshin, P. N., Ackermann, G., Fenner, N., McDonald, J. E.,
- Ehbair, A., Jones, T. G., Murphy, L. M., and Creer, S. (2017). Subtle shifts in
- 814 microbial communities occur alongside the release of carbon induced by drought and
- 815 rewetting in contrasting peatland ecosystems. *Sci. Rep.-UK* 7, 11314. doi:
- 816 10.1038/s41598-017-11546
- Quast, C., Pruesse, E., Yilmaz, P., Gerken, J., Schweer, T., Yarza, P., Peplies, J., and
  Glöckner, F. O. (2013). The SILVA ribosomal RNA gene database project: improved
  data processing and web-based tools. *Nucl. Acids Res.* 41 (D1), D590-D596. doi:
  10.1093/nar/gks1219
- 821 R Core Team (2017). R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R
- 822 Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria (2017). <u>https://www.R-</u>
- 823 project.org/.

- Ramirez, K. S., Leff, J. W., Barberán, A., Bates, S. T., Betley, J., Crowther, T. W., Kelly,
- E. F., Oldfield, E. E., Shaw, E. A., Steenbock, C., Bradford, M. A., Wall, D. H.,
- Fierer, N. (2015). Biogeographic patterns in below-ground diversity in New York
- 827 City's Central Park are similar to those observed globally. *Proc. R. Soc. B.* 281,
  828 20141988. doi: 10.1098/rspb.2014.1988
- 829 Robinson, E. L., Blyth, E., Clark, D. B., Comyn-Platt, E., Finch, J., and Rudd, A. C.
- 830 (2017). Climate hydrology and ecology research support system meteorology dataset
- for Great Britain (1961-2015) [CHESS-met] v1.2. NERC Environmental Information
  Data Centre.
- Rognes, T., Flouri, T., Nichols, B., Quince, C., and Mahé, F. (2016). VSEARCH: a
  versatile open source tool for metagenomics. *PeerJ* 4, e2584. doi: 10.7717/peerj.2584
- Rosling, A., Cox, F., Cruz-Martinez, K., Ihrmark, K., Grelet, G.-A., Lindahl, B. D.,
  Menkis, A., and James, T. Y. (2011). Archaeorhizomycetes: unearthing an ancient
- class of ubiquitous soil fungi. *Science* 333, 876-879. doi: 10.1126/science.1206958
  Rousk, J., Bååth, E., Brookes, P. C., Lauber, C. L., Lozupone, C., Caporaso, J. G.,
- Kousk, J., Baain, E., Brookes, T. C., Lauber, C. L., Eozupone, C., Caporaso, J. C.,
  Knight, R., and Fierer, N. (2010). Soil bacterial and fungal communities across a pH
  gradient in an arable soil. *ISME J.* 4, 1340-1351. doi: 10.1038/ismej.2010.58
- Rudeforth, C. C., Hartnup, R., Lea, J. W., Thompson, T. R. E., and Wright, P. S. (1984).
  Soils and their use in Wales. Harpenden: Lawes Agricultural Trust (Soil Survey of
- 843 England and Wales).
- Sagova-Mareckova, M., Cermak, L., Novotna, J., Plhackova, K, Forstova, J., and
  Kopecky, J. (2008). Innovative methods for soil DNA purification tested in soils with
  widely differing characteristics. *Appl. Environ. Microb.* 74, 2902-2907. doi:
  10.1128/AEM.02161-07
- Säle, V., Aguilera, P., Laczko, E., Mäder, P., Berner, A., Zihlmann, U., van der Heijden,
  M. G. A., and Oehl, F. (2015). Impact of conservation tillage and organic farming on
  the diversity of arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 84, 38-52.
- doi:10.1016/j.soilbio.2015.02.005
- Schoch, C. L., Seifert, K. A., Huhndorf, S., Robert, V., Spouge, J. L., Levesque, C. A.,
  Chen, W., and the Fungal Barcoding Consortium, (2012). Nuclear ribosomal internal
  transcribed spacer (ITS) region as a universal DNA barcode marker for Fungi. *P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA.* 109, 6241-6246. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1117018109
- Schnoor, T. K., Lekberg, Y., Rosendahl, S., and Olsson, P. A. (2011) Mechanical soil
  disturbance as a determinant of arbuscular mycorrhizal fungal communities in seminatural grassland. *Mycorrhia* 21, 211-220. doi: 10.1007/s00572-010-0325-3
- Schüβler, A., Schwarzott, D., and Walker, C. (2001). A new fungal phylum, the *Glomeromycota*: phylogeny and evolution. *Mycol. Res.* 105, 1413-1421. doi:
- 861 10.1017/S0953756201005196
- Smith, S. E., and Read, D. J. (2008). Mycorrhizal Symbiosis 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. London: Academic
  Press.
- Stockinger, H., Krüger, M., and Schüβler, A. (2010). DNA barcoding of arbuscular
  mycorrhizal fungi. *New Phytol.* 187, 461-474. doi: 10.111/j.1469-8137.2010.03262.x
- 866 Szoboszlay, M., Dohrmann, A. B., Poeplau, C., Don, A., and Tebbe, C. C. (2017). Impact
- 867 of land-use change and soil organic carbon quality on microbial diversity in soils
- across Europe. *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.* 93, fix146. doi: 10.1093/femsec/fix146

- 869 Tedersoo, L., Anslan, S., Bahram, M., Pólme, S., Riit, T., Liiv, I., Kõljalg, U., Kisand,
- 870 V., Nilsson, R. H., Hildebrand, F., Bork, P., and Abarenkov, K. (2015). Shotgun
- metagenomes and multiple primer pair-barcode combinations of amplicons reveal
  biases in metabarcoing analyses of fungi. *MycoKeys* 10, 1-43. doi:
- 873 10.3897/mycokeys.104852
- 874 Tedersoo, L., Bahram, M., Põlme, S., Kõljalg, U., Yorou, N. S., Wijesundera, R., Ruiz,
- L. V., Vasco-Palacios, A. M., Thu, P. Q., Suija, A., Smith, M. E., Sharp, C., Saluveer,
- 876 E., Saitta, Al., Rosas, M., Riit, T., Ratkowsky, D., Pritsch, K., Põldmaa, K.,
- 877 Piepenbring, M., Phosri, C., Peterson, M., Parts, K., Pärtel, K., Otsing, E., Nouhra, E.,
- 878 Njouonkou, A. L., Nilsson, R. H., Morgado, L. N., Mayor, J., May, T. W., Majuakim,
- 879 L., Lodge, D. J., Lee, S. S., Larsson, K.-H., Kohout, P., Hosaka, K., Hiiesahu, I.,
- Henkel, T. W., Harend, H., Guo, L., Greslebin, A., Grelet, G., Geml, J., Gates, G.,
- B81 Dunstan, W., Dunk, C., Drenkhan, R., Dearnaley, J., de Kesel, A., Dang, T., Chen, X.,
- Buegger, F., Brearley, F. Q., Bonito, G., Anslan, S., Abell, S., and Abarenkov, K.
- 883 (2014). Global diversity and geography of soil fungi. *Science* 346(6213): 1256688.
- doi: 10.1126/science.1256688
- Thiéry, O., Vasar, M., Jairus, T., Davison, J., Roux, C., Kivistik, P.-A., Metspalu, A.,
  Milani, L., Saks, Ü., Moora, M., Zobel, M., and Öpik, M. Sequence variation in
  nuclear ribosomal small subunit, internal transcribed spacer and large subunit regions
  of *Rhizophagus irregularis* and *Gigaspora margarita* is high and isolate-dependent. *Mol. Ecol.* 25, 2816-2832. doi: 10.1111/mec.13655
- Thormann, M. N., and Rice, A. V. (2007). Fungi from peatlands. *Fungal Divers*. 24, 241299.
- de Vries, F. T., Hoffland, E., van Eekeren, N., Brussard, L., and Bloem, J. (2006).
  Fungal/bacterial ratios in grasslands with contrasting nitrogen management. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 38, 2092-2103. doi: 10.1016/j.soilbio.2006.01.008
- Wang, B., and Qui, Y.-L. (2006). Phylogeneitc distribution and evolution of mycorrhizas
  in land plants. *Mycorrhiza* 16, 299-363. doi: 10.1007/s00572-005-0033-6
- Wang, Q., Garrity, G. M., Tiedje, J. M., and Cole, J. R. (2007). Naïve Bayesian classifier
  for rapid assignment of rRNA sequences into the new bacterial taxonomy. *Appl. Environ. Microb.* 73, 5261-5267. doi: 10.1128/AEM.00062-07
- 900 Weiss, S., Xu, Z. Z., Peddada, S., Amir, A., Bittinger, K., Gonzalez, A., Lozupone, C.,
- 201 Zaneveld, J. R., Vázquez-Baeza, Y., Birmingham, A., Hyde, E. R., and Knight, R.
- 902 (2017). Normailzation and microbial differential abundance strategies depend upon
  903 data characteristics. *Microbiome* 5, 1-18. doi: 10.1186/s40168-017-0237-y
- 904 Xue, C., Hao, Y., Pu, X., Penton, C. R., Wang, Q., Zhao, M., Zhang, B., Ran, W., Huang,
- Q., Shen, Q., and Tiedje, J. M. (2019). Effect of LSU and ITS genetic markers and
  reference databases on analyses of fungal communities. *Biol. Fert. Soils* 55, 79-88.
  doi: 10.1007/s00374-018-1331-4
- Yuste, J. C., Peñuelas, J., Estiarte, M., Garcia-Mas, J., Mattana, S., Ogaya, R., Pujol, M.,
   and Sardans, J. (2011). Drought-resistant fungi control soil organic matter
- decomposition and its response to temperature. *Glob. Change Biol.* 17, 1475-1486. doi
  10.1111/j.1365-2486.2010.02300.x
- 912
- 913 Captions

914 Fig. 1. Map of sites selected for GMEP monitoring. To protect landowner anonymity,

915 each triangle gives an approximate location of every 1 km<sup>2</sup> plot from which samples were
916 taken

917

918	Fig. 2.	Composition	of fungal	classes from	ITS1 and	18S	datasets. A)	Venn	diagram
-----	---------	-------------	-----------	--------------	----------	-----	--------------	------	---------

919 denoting total number of shared and unique classes in each data set, following exclusion

920 of unknown sequences. Sankey diagrams of proportional abundances of fungal OTUs

921 from all samples from **B**) ITS1 data and **C**) 18S data. Arms denote proportions of OTUs

922 of the most populous classes.

923

924 Fig. 3. Proportionate abundances of fungal OTUs for A) ITS1 and B) 18S data across

925 Aggregate Vegetation Class. Aggregate Vegetation Classes are ordered from most

926 (Crops/weeds) to least (Heath/bog) productive.

927

928 Fig. 4. Boxplots of fungal OTU richness for A) ITS1 and B) 18S datasets plotted against

929 Aggregate Vegetation Class. Aggregate Vegetation Classes are ordered from most

930 (Crops/weeds) to least (Heath/bog) productive. Boxes cover the first and third quartiles

and horizontal lines denote the median. Black dots represent outliers beyond the

932 whiskers, which cover 1.5X the interquartile range. Notches indicate confidence interval

around the median. Overlapping notches are a proxy for non-significant differences

934 between medians. Black dots are outliers.

935

936 Fig. 5. Boxplots of fungal OTU richness for A) ITS1 and B) 18S datasets plotted against 937 organic matter class. Organic matter classes are listed in order of increasing percent 938 organic matter. Boxes cover the first and third quartiles and horizontal lines denote the 939 median. Black dots represent outliers beyond the whiskers, which cover 1.5X the 940 interquartile range. Notches indicate confidence interval around the median. Overlapping 941 notches are a proxy for non-significant differences between medians. Black dots are 942 outliers. 943 944 Fig. 6. Non-metric dimensional scaling ordinations of fungal community composition

across GMEP sites. Samples are coloured by Aggregate Vegetation Class. Data from

946 ITS1 (stress = 0.13) is shown in A); Data from 18S (stress = 0.11) is shown in B).

947

948 Fig. 7. Proportionate abundances of fungal OTUs matched to FUNGuild trophic groups

for A) ITS1 and B) 18S data across Aggregate Vegetation Classes. Aggregate Vegetation

950 Classes are ordered from most (Crops/weeds) to least (Heath/bog) productive.

951 Abbreviations for multi-trophic mode groups are as follows: Path.-Sap. (Pathotroph-

952 Saprotroph); Path.-Sap.-Sym. (Pathotroph-Saprotroph-Symbiotroph); Path.-Sym.

953 (Pathotroph-Symbiotroph); Sap.-Path.-Sym (Saprotroph-Pathotroph-Symbiotroph); Sap.-

954 Sym. (Saprotroph-Symbiotroph).

955

956 Fig. 8. Boxplots of richness of fungal OTUs matched to the pathotrophic, saprotroph, and

957 symbiotroph trophic modes in FUNGuild for A) ITS1 and B) 18S datasets plotted against

958 Aggregate Vegetation Class. Aggregate Vegetation Classes are ordered from most

959 (Crops/weeds) to least (Heath/bog) productive. Boxes cover the first and third quartiles960 and horizontal lines denote the median. Black dots represent outliers beyond the

961 whiskers, which cover 1.5X the interquartile range. Notches indicate confidence interval

around the median. Overlapping notches are a proxy for non-significant differences

963 between medians. Black dots are outliers.

964

**Fig. 9.** Boxplots of richness of fungal OTUs matched to the pathotrophic, saprotroph, and

symbiotroph trophic modes in FUNGuild for A) ITS1 and B) 18S datasets plotted against

967 organic matter class. Organic matter classes are listed in order of increasing percent

968 organic matter. Boxes cover the first and third quartiles and horizontal lines denote the

969 median. Black dots represent outliers beyond the whiskers, which cover 1.5X the

970 interquartile range. Notches indicate confidence interval around the median. Overlapping

notches are a proxy for non-significant differences between medians. Black dots are

972 outliers.

973

Fig. 10. Boxplots of richness of Glomeromycetes OTUs plotted against A) Aggregate
Vegetation Class; B) organic matter class; C) soil type. Aggregate Vegetation Classes are
ordered from most (Crops/weeds) to least (Heath/bog) productive. Organic matter classes
are listed in order of increasing percent organic matter. Soils are listed in increasing order
of moisture retention. Boxes cover the first and third quartiles and horizontal lines denote
the median. Black dots represent outliers beyond the whiskers, which cover 1.5X the
interquartile range. Notches indicate confidence interval around the median. Overlapping

- 981 notches are a proxy for non-significant differences between medians. Black dots are
- 982 outliers.
- 983
- 984

Environmental	Crops/weeds	Fertile grassland	Infertile grassland	Lowland wood	Upland wood	Moorland grass-	Heath/bog
variable						mosaic	
Total C (%) <sup>L</sup>	3.87 (± 0.83)d	4.75 (± 0.2)d	5.85 (± 0.33)d	5.78 (± 1.07)d	9.7 (± 2.25)c	12.19 (± 2.07)b	23.57 (± 1.88)a
Total N (%) <sup>L</sup>	0.32 (± 0.05)d	0.45 (± 0.02)d	0.49 (± 0.02)d	0.4 (± 0.06)d	0.58 (± 0.1)c	0.83 (± 0.11)b	1.05 (± 0.09)a
C:N ratio <sup>s</sup>	11.44 (± 0.81)cd	10.49 (± 0.13)d	11.62 (± 0.27)cd	$13.92 (\pm 0.75)$ bc	15.86 (± 0.7)b	14.41 (± 0.42)b	20.65 (± 0.94)a
Total P (mg/kg) <sup>8</sup>	1103.44 (± 145.47)ab	1194.9 (± 45.53)a	1045.5 (± 43.3)ab	601.68 (± 77.68)c	762.45 (± 61.95)bc	930.49 (± 57.5)ab	769.63 (± 50.04)ab
Organic matter (% LOI) <sup>L</sup>	7.53 (± 1.62)d	9.39 (± 0.34)d	11.25 (± 0.55)d	10.71 (± 1.7)d	18.79 (± 4.16)c	22.99 (± 3.72)b	39.26 (± 3.6)a
pH (CaCl <sub>2</sub> )	4.73 (± 0.26)b	5.2 (± 0.08)a	4.73 (± 0.05)b	4.31 (± 0.26)b	3.57 (± 0.1)cd	3.85 (± 0.09)c	3.84 (± 0.1)d
Soil water repellency <sup>*</sup>	4077.56 (± 3990.72)abc	264.01 (± 73.28)c	781.68 (± 137.58)b	2975.47 (± 2108.12)abc	1965.87 (± 698.61)a	4186.13 (± 798.48)a	3186.4 (± 812.15)a
Volumetric water content (m <sup>3</sup> /m <sup>3</sup> )	0.23 (± 0.03)bc	0.35 (± 0.01)b	0.34 (± 0.01)b	0.22 (± 0.02)c	0.36 (± 0.03)b	0.46 (± 0.02)a	0.52 (± 0.02)a
Rock volume (mL)	3.95 (± 1.11)abc	5.25 (± 0.45)b	5.44 (± 0.42)b	9.13 (± 2.49)a	4.41 (± 0.57)ab	3.25 (± 0.39)c	1.87 (± 0.21)c
Bulk density (g/cm <sup>3</sup> )	1.03 (± 0.09)a	0.9 (± 0.02)a	0.8 (± 0.02)b	0.71 (± 0.08)b	0.56 (± 0.04)c	0.5 (± 0.04)c	0.47 (± 0.03)d
Clay content (%) <sup>A</sup>	22.25 (± 1.85)ab	25.46 (± 0.65)a	23.18 (± 0.64)ab	17.47 (± 1.34)ab	17.82 (± 1.82)ab	18.12 (± 1.27)c	11.76 (± 2.24)d
Sand content (%) <sup>A</sup>	30.97 (± 4.66)ad	24.88 (± 1.25)d	29.21 (± 1.44)bd	42.99 (± 4.01)ac	40.23 (± 4.15)abc	29.5 (± 3.0)b	45.15 (± 7.61)a
Elevation (m)	88.71 (± 47.69)cd	109.38 (± 8.62)d	167.28 (± 8.65)c	119.06 (± 16.38)cd	297.83 (± 20.62)b	406.63 (± 19.22)a	380.55 (± 19.7)a
Mean annual	968.44 (± 69.01)c	1078.19 (± 24.71)c	1177.05 (± 18.91)c	1100.12 (± 52.28)c	1405.33 (± 65.35)b	2027.23 (± 74.39)a	1771.2 (± 58.19)a
precipitation (mL)							
Temperature (°C)	12.64 (± 1.18)ab	12.09 (± 0.41)b	13.44 (± 0.29)a	15.80 (± 0.87)a	14.53 (± 0.53)a	14.51 (± 0.36)a	13.87 (± 0.29)a

985 **Table 1.** Mean values ( $\pm$  SE) of soil physical and chemical variables for each Aggregate Vegetation Class. Following normalisation on **Selected** variables (see below), ANOVAs and Tukey's *post-hoc* tests were performed.

987 Note: <sup>A</sup> denotes Aitchison's log<sub>10</sub>-ratio transformation; <sup>L</sup> denotes log<sub>10</sub>-transformation; square-root-transformation; \*Soil water

repellency was derived from median water drop penetration times (s) and log<sub>10</sub> transformed

989

**Table 2.** Results of partial least squares regressions for fungal richness against environmental variables. Positive relationships are underlined; negative relationships are written in italics. \*\*\* indicates P < 0.001, \*\* 0.001 > P < 0.01, \* 0.01 > P < 0.05, blank indicates P > 0.05.

Soil and environmental variables	Fungi (ITS)	Fungi (18S)
Total C <sup>L</sup>	0.44	$1.03 (R^2 = 0.38^{***})$
Total N <sup>L</sup>	0.93	0.56
C:N ratio <sup>s</sup>	1.64 (R <sup>2</sup> = 0.28***)	$1.71 (R^2 = 0.41^{***})$
Total P <sup>s</sup>	0.70	0.87
Organic matter (% LOI) <sup>L</sup>	1.13 (R <sup>2</sup> = 0.29***)	$1.17 (R^2 = 0.38^{***})$
pH (CaCl <sub>2</sub> )	<u>1.52 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.23***)</u>	<u>1.55 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.37<sup>***</sup>)</u>
Soil water repellency <sup>L</sup>	$1.23 (R^2 = 0.13^{***})$	0.82
Volumetric water content (m <sup>3</sup> /m <sup>3</sup> )	0.60	0.70
Rock volume (mL)	0.64	0.43
Bulk density (g/cm <sup>3</sup> )	<u>1.41 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.29***)</u>	$1.33 (R^2 = 0.41^{***})$
Clay content (%) <sup>A</sup>	0.84	$1.19 (R^2 = 0.11^{***})$
Sand content (%) <sup>A</sup>	0.6	$1.11 (R^2 = 0.1^{***})$
Elevation (m)	$1.68 (R^2 = 0.22^{***})$	$1.83 (R^2 = 0.41^{***})$
Mean annual precipitation (mL)	$1.44 (R^2 = 0.18^{***})$	$1.52 (R^2 = 0.27^{***})$
Temperature (°C)	0.56	0.52

Note: <sup>A</sup> denotes Aitchison's  $log_{10}$ -ratio transformation; <sup>L</sup> denotes  $log_{10}$ -transformation; <sup>S</sup> denotes square-root-transformation.

Variable		Correlation	
	$\mathbb{R}^2$	Axis1	Axis2
pH (CaCl <sub>2</sub> )	$0.6^{***}$	-	+
C:N ratio <sup>S</sup>	$0.47^{***}$	+	-
Elevation (m)	$0.41^{***}$	+	-
Volumetric water content (m <sup>3</sup> /m <sup>3</sup> )	$0.41^{***}$	+	-
Mean annual precipitation (mL)	0.39***	+	-
Bulk density (g/cm <sup>3</sup> )	0.38***	-	+
Organic matter (% LOI) <sup>L</sup>	$0.37^{***}$	+	-
Total C <sup>L</sup>	0.31***	+	-
Clay content (%) <sup>A</sup>	$0.28^{***}$	-	+
Soil water repellency <sup>L</sup>	$0.24^{***}$	+	-
Total N (%) <sup>L</sup>	$0.21^{***}$	+	-
Sand content (%) <sup>A</sup>	0.19***	+	+
Total P (mg/kg) <sup>S</sup>	$0.11^{***}$	-	-
Rock volume (mL)	$0.07^{***}$	-	+
Temperature (°C)	$0.04^{***}$	-	+

**Table 3.** Summary of relationships amongst environmental factors and fungal communities based on ITS data. +/- signify the direction of association between each variable and respective NMDS axes.

Note: <sup>A</sup> denotes Aitchison's log<sub>10</sub>-ratio transformation; <sup>L</sup> denotes log<sub>10</sub>-transformation; <sup>S</sup> denotes square-root-transformation

Variable		Correlation	
	$\mathbb{R}^2$	Axis1	Axis2
pH (CaCl <sub>2</sub> )	0.61***	-	+
Elevation (m)	$0.50^{***}$	+	-
Mean annual precipitation (mL)	$0.46^{***}$	+	-
Volumetric water content (m <sup>3</sup> /m <sup>3</sup> )	$0.45^{***}$	+	-
C:N ratio <sup>S</sup>	0.43***	+	+
Organic matter (% LOI) <sup>L</sup>	0.43***	+	+
Bulk density (g/cm <sup>3</sup> )	0.39***	-	-
Total C <sup>L</sup>	0.34***	+	+
Clay content (%) <sup>A</sup>	$0.30^{***}$	-	+
Total N (%) <sup>L</sup>	$0.28^{***}$	+	-
Soil water repellency <sup>L</sup>	$0.21^{***}$	+	-
Sand content (%) <sup>A</sup>	$0.14^{***}$	+	+
Total P (mg/kg) <sup>S</sup>	$0.10^{***}$	-	-
Rock volume (mL)	$0.06^{***}$	-	+
Temperature (°C)	$0.05^{***}$	_	+

**Table 4.** Summary of relationships amongst environmental factors and fungal communities based on 18S data. +/- signify the direction of association between each variable and respective NMDS axes.

Note: <sup>A</sup> denotes Aitchison's log<sub>10</sub>-ratio transformation; <sup>L</sup> denotes log<sub>10</sub>-transformation; <sup>S</sup> denotes square-root-transformation

**Table 5.** Results of partial least squares regressions for richness of OTUs classified by trophic mode from FUNGUILD analysesagainst environmental variables. Positive relationships are underlined; negative relationships are written in italics. \*\*\* indicates P < 0.001, \*\* 0.001 > P < 0.01, \* 0.01 > P < 0.05, blank indicates P > 0.05.

Soil and environmental variables	Saprotrophs (ITS)	Saprotrophs (18S)	Pathotrophs (ITS)	Pathotrophs (18S)	Symbiotrophs (ITS)	Symbiotrophs (18S)
Total C (%) <sup>L</sup>	$1.1 (R^2 = 0.24^{***})$	0.89	$1.07 (R^2 = 0.17^{***})$	$1.0 (R^2 = 0.25^{***})$	0.24	0.99
Total N (%) <sup>L</sup>	0.99	0.10	0.82	0.64	$1.17 (R^2 = 0.02^{**})$	0.10
C :N ratio <sup>s</sup>	0.95	$2.31 (R^2 = 0.28^{***})$	$1.22 (R^2 = 0.16^{***})$	$1.41 (R^2 = 0.25^{***})$	<u>1.69 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.01*)</u>	$2.47 (R^2 = 0.34^{***})$
Total P (mg/kg) <sup>s</sup>	0.07	0.86	0.75	0.75	1.38	<u>1.31 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.02<sup>*</sup>)</u>
Organic matter (% LOI) <sup>L</sup>	1.36 (R <sup>2</sup> = 0.28***)	$1.02 (R^2 = 0.24^{***})$	1.38 (R <sup>2</sup> = 0.21***)	$1.16 (R^2 = 0.28^{***})$	0.37	0.92
pH (CaCl <sub>2</sub> )	<u>1.34 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.21***)</u>	<u>1.27 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.14<sup>***</sup>)</u>	<u>1.4 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.16<sup>***</sup>)</u>	<u>1.98 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.4<sup>***</sup>)</u>	$2.35 (R^2 = 0.05^{***})$	<u>1.45 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.2<sup>***</sup>)</u>
Soil water repellency <sup>L</sup>	1.28 (R <sup>2</sup> = 0.15***)	0.36	0.84	0.98	0.3	0.62
Volumetric water content	1.46 (R <sup>2</sup> = 0.22***)	0.56	1.38 (R² = 0.17***)	0.99	$1.42 \ (R^2 = 0.05^{***})$	0.40
(m <sup>3</sup> /m <sup>3</sup> )						
Rock volume (mL)	0.68	0.06	0.8	0.59	<u>1.09 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.02<sup>**</sup>)</u>	0.10
Bulk density (g/cm <sup>3</sup> )	<u>1.42 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.28***)</u>	<u>1.23 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.2<sup>***</sup>)</u>	<u>1.71 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.12***)</u>	<u>1.29 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.27***)</u>	0.51	$1.48 (R^2 = 0.26^{***})$
Clay content (%) <sup>A</sup>	0.71	0.74	0.90	<u>1.17 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.1***)</u>	0.49	<u>1.05 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.03<sup>**</sup>)</u>
Sand content (%) <sup>A</sup>	0.18	1.71 (R <sup>2</sup> = 0.05***)	0.05	0.32	0.21	<u>1.63 (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.08<sup>***</sup>)</u>
Elevation (m)	1.58 (R <sup>2</sup> = 0.25***)	$1.13 (R^2 = 0.13^{***})$	$1.6 (R^2 = 0.19^{***})$	1.98 (R² = 0.39***)	0.37	$1.07 (R^2 = 0.17^{***})$
Mean annual precipitation (mL)	$1.45 (R^2 = 0.23^{***})$	0.81	$1.38 (R^2 = 0.16^{***})$	$1.49 (R^2 = 0.24^{***})$	0.00	0.69
Temperature (°C)	0.09	0.49	0.21	0.43	$1.17 (R^2 = 0.01^*)$	0.53

Note: <sup>A</sup> denotes Aitchison's log<sub>10</sub>-ratio transformation; <sup>L</sup> denotes log<sub>10</sub>-transformation; <sup>S</sup> denotes square-root-transformation

















Trophic Mode 🛑 Pathotroph 🚔 Saprotroph 🚔 Symbiotroph

**Aggregate Vegetation Class** 





