

1 **Title page**

2 *Title*

3 Recalibration of insect evolutionary timescale using Monte San Giorgio fossils suggests survival of  
4 key lineages through the End-Permian Extinction

5

6 *Authors*

7 Matteo Montagna<sup>1,\*</sup>, K. Jun Tong<sup>2</sup>, Giulia Magoga<sup>1</sup>, Laura Strada<sup>3</sup>, Andrea Tintori<sup>3</sup>, Simon Y. W.  
8 Ho<sup>2</sup>, Nathan Lo<sup>2</sup>

9

10 *Affiliations*

11 <sup>1</sup>Dipartimento di Scienze Agrarie e Ambientali, Università degli Studi di Milano, Via Celoria 2, I-  
12 20133 Milano, Italy.

13 <sup>2</sup>School of Life and Environmental Sciences, The University of Sydney, Sydney, NSW 2006, Sydney,  
14 Australia.

15 <sup>3</sup>Dipartimento di Scienze della Terra “Ardito Desio”, Università degli Studi di Milano, Via  
16 Mangiagalli 34, I-20133 Milano, Italy.

17

18 *\*Corresponding author*

19 Email: [matteo.montagna@unimi.it](mailto:matteo.montagna@unimi.it)

20

21 *Keywords*

22 fossil calibration, molecular dating, divergence times, relaxed molecular clock, phylogenomics

23

24 *Running title*

25 A revised evolutionary timescale for insects

26 **Abstract**

27 Insects are a highly diverse group of organisms and constitute more than half of all known animal  
28 species. They have evolved an extraordinary range of traits, from flight and complete metamorphosis  
29 to complex polyphenisms and advanced eusociality. Although the rich insect fossil record has helped  
30 to chart the appearance of many phenotypic innovations, data are scarce for a number of key periods.  
31 One such period is that following the End-Permian Extinction, recognized as the most catastrophic  
32 of all extinction events. We recently discovered several 240-million-year-old insect fossils in the  
33 Monte San Giorgio Lagerstätte (Switzerland-Italy) that are remarkable for their state of preservation  
34 (including internal organs and soft tissues), and because they extend the records of their respective  
35 taxa by up to 200 million years. By using these fossils as calibrations in a phylogenomic dating  
36 analysis, we present a revised timescale for insect evolution. Our date estimates for several major  
37 lineages, including the hyperdiverse crown groups of Lepidoptera, Hemiptera Heteroptera, and  
38 Diptera, are substantially older than their currently accepted post-Permian origins. We found that  
39 major evolutionary innovations, including flight and metamorphosis, appeared considerably earlier  
40 than previously thought. These results have numerous implications for understanding the evolution  
41 of insects and their resilience in the face of extreme events such as the End-Permian Extinction.

42

43 **1. Introduction**

44 Insects have diversified over the past ~400 million years (Myr) into an estimated 5.5 million species  
45 (ranging from 2.6 to 7.8 million species) [1] that occupy nearly all continental habitats. Insects were  
46 among the first animals to colonize the land following the establishment of plants, evolving an array  
47 of traits including flight, complete metamorphosis, and advanced sociality [2]. Among the hypotheses  
48 put forward to explain the extreme diversity of insects, two that have received support are the great  
49 antiquity of insects and a relatively low extinction rate [3,4].

50       Compared with other animal groups, insects appear to have been relatively unaffected by  
51 major extinction events [2], with possible exceptions being the catastrophic End-Permian Extinction

52 (EPE; 251.9 Ma) [5–7] and the Cretaceous–Paleogene mass extinction (66 Ma) [8]. In the case of the  
53 EPE, two distinct extinction events during an approximately 60,000-year period caused the  
54 disappearance of 80–96% of marine species and 70% of terrestrial vertebrate species [9–11]. Extant  
55 insect orders are generally represented in fossils post-Permian, whereas numerous extinct groups are  
56 only found in deposits from the Permian or earlier [5]. For example, a number of major insect groups  
57 (e.g., Palaeodictyoptera, Megasecoptera, and Archaeorthoptera) appear to have gone extinct at the  
58 end of the Permian, or soon afterwards. A similar pattern emerged from a recent phylogenomic study  
59 on insects [12], which estimated that a number of major groups, including Diptera and Lepidoptera,  
60 emerged after the EPE.

61 Reconstructions of insect diversity through evolutionary time are dependent on the presence  
62 of representative entomofauna across all stratigraphic stages since the origin of the group, estimated  
63 to have occurred during the late Silurian [2,13]. One period that is depauperate of insect fossils is that  
64 immediately following the EPE [2,14]. The relatively small number of fossils from this period  
65 presents a hindrance to our understanding of how insects responded to this mass extinction event.

66 Here we investigate the impact of eight exceptionally well-preserved fossil insects from the  
67 Monte San Giorgio (MSG) Lagerstätte (Italian-Swiss border; 240–239 Ma; Figure S1) on estimation  
68 of the insect evolutionary timescale. Although the MSG has been recognized for its important  
69 vertebrate assemblage [15], its entomofauna has received relatively little attention. Nonetheless, its  
70 importance has recently been highlighted by the discovery of the oldest representatives of some extant  
71 groups, including a jumping bristletail (Archaeognatha: Machilidae) [16,17] and a lace bug  
72 (Hemiptera: Tingidae) [18].

73 We performed a phylogenomic dating analysis of a sequence alignment of 220,615 amino  
74 acids generated by Misof et al. [12]. This data set has comprehensive coverage of insect ordinal  
75 diversity. Although there have been further intra-ordinal phylogenomic studies of insects over the  
76 past five years (e.g., [19]), we analysed the data set of Misof et al. [12] because their estimate of the  
77 evolutionary timescale is the most widely recognized.

78 We used eight key MSG fossils (Figure 1; Table S1; Text S1) plus the fossils used by Misof  
79 et al. [12] to calibrate the molecular clock for our dating analysis (Table S2). Each of these fossils  
80 was chosen according to strict criteria [20]. Briefly, the eight MSG fossils that we used for additional  
81 calibrations were (Figure 1): *i*) the bristletail *Gigamachilis triassicus* [16], the oldest fossil of extant  
82 Machilidae; *ii*) the mayfly *Tintorina meridensis* [21]; *iii*) the oldest lace bug fossil, *Archetingis*  
83 *ladinica* [18]; *iv*) the adaphagan beetle *Praedodromeus sangiorgiensis* [22]; *v*) the stonefly  
84 MCSN8462 [22]; *vi*) the webspinner MCSN8457 [22], ~130 Myr older than the second-oldest  
85 confirmed webspinner, *Sorellembia estherae* [23]; *vii*) the polyphagan (not Staphyliniformia) beetle  
86 MCSN8464 [22]; and *viii*) a reticulated beetle elytron of *Notocupes* sp. [21] (detailed information for  
87 each fossil is provided in Text S1). In addition, due to their exceptional features, we report here an  
88 unusually large holometabolous larva MCSN8531 (Figure 1H) and a specimen with a grasshopper-  
89 like body plan MCSN8457 (Figures 1I and 1J); these fossils were not used for calibrations in our  
90 dating analysis because of their uncertain phylogenetic positions.

91 The MSG insect fossils are remarkable because of their preservation of soft tissues and  
92 internal organs, which are typically absent in invertebrate compression fossils. For example, in the  
93 stonefly nymph MCSN8462 (Figure 1E), there is clear preservation of part of the cerebrum, the  
94 suboesophageal ganglion, the meso- and metathoracic wing pads, and part of the alimentary canal  
95 (possibly the midgut). In the winged male webspinner MCSN8457 (Figure 1F), phosphatized  
96 enlarged basal fore-tarsomers (diagnostic of Embioptera) and leg muscular bundles are preserved. In  
97 association with the impression of the folded wings, these features suggest that the insect died  
98 suddenly in its burrow and was rapidly transported to an anoxic depositional basin, where  
99 phosphatization of organic matter and fossilization occurred. Within the abdomen of the grasshopper-  
100 like fossil MCSN8457 (currently unassigned; Figures 1I and 1J), Malpighian tubules are evident,  
101 representing the first case, to our knowledge, of preservation of this organ in compression fossils.

102

## 103 **2. Materials and Methods**

104 *Selection of fossils used for calibrations*

105 To calibrate our molecular date estimates, we included 35 fossils previously used by Misof et al. [12]  
106 and selected according to the criteria proposed by Parham et al. [20] (Table S2). In addition, we used  
107 eight MSG fossils for calibration (Figure 1; Table S1; Text S1). Descriptions of diagnostic characters  
108 and taxonomic assignments of the MSG fossils were provided in previous publications and a PhD  
109 thesis [16–18,21,22,24]; in addition, a brief description is reported in electronic supplementary  
110 material (Text S1). With the exception of *Notocupes* sp. [21] and the stonefly nymph [22], the MSG  
111 fossils satisfy the criteria proposed by Parham et al. [20] for reliable calibrations. Museum identifiers,  
112 taxonomic assignments, and references of the eight MSG fossils are provided in Table S1. The  
113 specimens included as calibrations are or will be deposited at Museo Cantonale di Storia Naturale in  
114 Lugano (CH).

115

116 *Genomic data set*

117 In order to evaluate the impacts of the MSG fossil entomofauna on phylogenomic estimation of the  
118 insect evolutionary timescale, we chose to focus on the genomic data set recently published by Misof  
119 et al. [12]. The transcriptomic data of 141 arthropod species consisting of 1,478 single-copy nuclear  
120 genes, from which we obtained the data set analysed in this study (220,615 aligned amino acids), are  
121 available from the Dryad Digital Repository (<https://doi.org/10.5061/dryad.3c0f1> [12,25]).

122 The genomic data set includes representatives of every major insect order, as well as  
123 springtails and proturans. Ten taxa were used as outgroups: seven crustaceans, two myriapods, and  
124 the tick *Ixodes*. Here we briefly repeat the methods used by Misof et al. [12] to prepare the data for  
125 analysis. A detailed description is provided on electronic supplementary material (Text S1).

126

127 *Estimation of divergence dates*

128 We described our calibration priors as uniform priors with soft minimum bounds, reflecting the  
129 uncertainty in fossil evidence in molecular dating [26]. The minimum age of each MSG fossil

130 corresponds to the age of the fossil deposit (i.e.,  $239.51 \pm 0.15$  Ma [27]). The maximum age of each  
131 calibration was set to either 580 Ma, which is the approximate estimated age of the origin of  
132 arthropods based on the oldest Ediacaran fossils; or to 450 Ma, when there was sufficient terrestrial  
133 food to support Hexapoda [28]. The former maximum age limit was applied to each of the oldest  
134 calibrated nodes, representing the split between two outgroup lineages and the split between the  
135 outgroup and ingroup lineages. The latter, younger age limit was used for every other calibration  
136 within the insect tree. Information on the nodes at which minimum age constraints were informed by  
137 the MSG fossils are reported in electronic supplementary material (Text S1; Table S2; Figure S3).

138 We ran five sets of phylogenomic dating analyses to compare the effects of the MSG fossils  
139 on estimation of the insect evolutionary timescale (details provided on electronic supplementary  
140 material; Text S1). The tree topology was fixed for all of these analyses, having been estimated using  
141 maximum likelihood by Misof et al. [12]. To infer the evolutionary divergence times in the tree, we  
142 used the Bayesian dating approach in MCMCTREE [29], which is able to use an approximate  
143 likelihood calculation to reduce computational burden [30,31]. For all of our phylogenomic dating  
144 analyses, we used a Dirichlet-gamma prior for the mean substitution rate, with  $\alpha=2$  and  $\beta=20$ , which  
145 represents a diffuse prior distribution. We used a uniform prior for the relative node times. The  
146 posterior distribution of node times was estimated using Markov chain Monte Carlo (MCMC)  
147 sampling. The first 100,000 MCMC steps were discarded as burn-in before we drew samples every  
148 50 steps over 2 million steps. For each of the five analyses, we combined all samples from the  
149 respective 85 meta-partitions before calculating the combined 95% credibility intervals for each node  
150 in the tree to produce a combined estimate of the evolutionary timescale.

151

### 152 **3. Results and Discussion**

#### 153 *Impact of MSG fossils and uniform calibration priors on estimated divergence times*

154 We performed five separate phylogenomic dating analyses in MCMCTREE to examine the effects of  
155 adding eight MSG fossils to a set of 37 fossils previously used in a phylogenomic analysis of insect

156 evolution [12] (Table S3). These analyses were performed using the same data set and fixed tree  
157 topology (Fig. 1 of Misof et al. [12]), but with five different sets of fossil calibration priors. A  
158 comparison of date estimates from three of these five analyses at 13 key nodes is shown in Fig. 2,  
159 with a full comparison for all 140 node times provided in Tables S3-S4.

160 We first replicated the analyses of Misof et al. [12], who used a total of 37 fossil calibrations.  
161 Lognormal priors were used for 20 of these calibrations, and uniform priors for the remaining 17  
162 calibrations (Analysis 1). The results of these analyses were similar to those previously reported; in  
163 terms of median posterior estimates, there was a mean difference of 8.16 Myr from the values across  
164 the 140 nodes reported in Table S25 of Misof et al. [12] (see Tables S3-S4 and grey bars in Fig. 2).  
165 Next, we added the eight MSG fossils with uniform calibration priors, retaining the original  
166 lognormal and uniform priors for the fossil calibrations used by Misof et al. [12] (Analysis 2; 43  
167 fossils used in total; note that two of the MSG fossil calibrations replaced those used by Misof et al.  
168 [12]). This set of calibrations led to notable increases in the median posterior ages of some nodes  
169 (Table S4), with an average increase of 13.4 Myr across the 140 internal nodes in the tree compared  
170 with Analysis 1.

171 The use of restrictive lognormal priors can lead to underestimation of node ages [26,32], so  
172 we performed two further analyses with uniform calibration priors only. The first analysis employed  
173 only the fossils used by Misof et al. [12] (Analysis 3; 37 fossil calibrations), and is equivalent to the  
174 analysis reported in Fig. 1B of Tong et al. [32] (see yellow bars in Fig. 2). The second analysis  
175 involved the addition of the MSG fossils (Analysis 4; 43 fossil calibrations; see red bars in Fig. 2).  
176 Median posterior node ages across the tree increased by an average of 42.9 Myr (Analysis 3) and 50.5  
177 Myr (Analysis 4) compared with Analysis 1 (in which 20 lognormal calibration priors were used;  
178 Table S3; Fig. 2). We discuss the results from Analysis 4 in detail in the following section. Finally,  
179 we performed an analysis using both sets of fossil calibrations (43 taxa) and an autocorrelated relaxed-  
180 clock model (Analysis 5). We did this analysis to allow comparison with the results of Analysis 4,  
181 which employed an uncorrelated relaxed-clock model. Analyses 4 and 5 produced similar estimates

182 of node ages (average difference of 4.3 Myr in median posterior node ages; Tables S3-S4). Each of  
183 the eight MSG fossils used for calibration was found to have a strong influence on the date estimate  
184 for its respective node, with the dates being pushed back in time past the EPE in Analyses 2, 4, and  
185 5 compared with Analyses 1 and 3 (Fig. S2).

186

### 187 *The evolution of early-branching insect lineages and key insect innovations*

188 The timescale of evolution estimated in our analysis that used uniform priors for 43 fossil calibrations  
189 (Analysis 4) is shown in Figs. 3, S3. The median posterior ages of a total of 63 out of 140 internal  
190 nodes, 32 of which represent the last common ancestors of major hexapod crown groups, increased  
191 by more than 50 Myr (maximum 147 Myr) compared with those estimated in Analysis 1 (which were  
192 similar to those reported in Misof et al. [12]). The median posterior ages of 96 internal nodes  
193 (including 49 major lineages) increased by more than 25 Myr compared with the node-age estimates  
194 from Analysis 1 (Table S4).

195 The increases in median ages between Analyses 1 and 4 were generally matched by similar  
196 increases in the lower and upper bounds of the 95% CIs of each analysis (average increases of 34.6  
197 and 62.6 Myr for the lower and upper bounds, respectively; Table S4). In the sections below, we  
198 focus on differences in median posterior node ages between the two analyses and those of other  
199 relevant studies. However, the 95% CIs for node ages across the tree were generally very wide (means  
200 of 101.6 and 129.6 Myr across all nodes for Analyses 1 and 4 respectively; Table S3), such that there  
201 was typically some overlap between the date estimates from the two analyses.

202 Our analysis supports an origin of crown group hexapods in the Cambrian to Ordovician  
203 (~504 Ma, 95% CI 469–540 Ma). This is earlier than previous estimates in the Silurian [33] but agrees  
204 with the results of other studies [12,32,39,40] (Fig. 2). We estimated that the last common ancestor  
205 of extant insects (Ectognatha) appeared in the Ordovician 465 Ma (95% CI 439–493 Ma),  
206 contemporary with the origin of land plants [41–44] (Fig. 3; Table S3). This result extends the median



207 estimate of the age of crown Ectognatha by ~20 Myr compared with some previous estimates [12,33]  
208 (Fig. 2; Table S3), but is consistent with the results of other studies [39,45].

209 Crown Collembola was estimated to have originated in the Carboniferous to Triassic (285  
210 Ma, 95% CI 209–365 Ma), with the median posterior age being ~30 Myr earlier than a previous  
211 estimate ([12]; Table S3). This raises the possibility of an origin of the group before the EPE. The  
212 last common ancestor of extant lineages of monocondylous insects (Archaeognatha) was estimated  
213 to have arisen during the Devonian to Triassic (290 Ma, 95% CI 227–388 Ma; Fig. 2–3), with a  
214 median posterior age ~140 Myr earlier than previously reported [12] (Table S3; Fig. 2–3). We  
215 estimated an origin of crown Palaeoptera, including damselflies, dragonflies, and mayflies in the  
216 Silurian to Carboniferous ~396 Ma (95% CI 327–439 Ma), with a median posterior age in the Early  
217 Devonian rather than in the Late Devonian to Carboniferous [12,33] (Table S3). This median  
218 posterior estimate is in agreement with those from other studies [32,39].

219 Our analyses show that several innovations critical to the success of insects, including the  
220 appearance of wings and complete metamorphosis, evolved earlier than previously proposed. We  
221 estimated that crown winged lineages (Pterygota) emerged during the Silurian (434 Ma, 95% CI 413–  
222 449). This median posterior estimate is at least ~30 Myr earlier than some estimates (e.g., [12,46];  
223 Table S3) but in agreement with others (e.g., [39,45,47]). Our results are consistent with the  
224 thermoregulatory hypothesis of insect winglet evolution and compatible with the evolution of insect  
225 flight during a period of high atmospheric pO<sub>2</sub> [48], which is estimated to have occurred in the Early  
226 to Middle Silurian [38]. The appearance in the ectothermic protopterygote of small winglets is  
227 believed to have led to an increase in body temperature [49], which might have conferred an adaptive  
228 advantage under the cool climate conditions prevalent during the Late Ordovician to Early Silurian  
229 (Fig. 3). On the basis of our estimates, the ability to fold wings (crown group Neoptera) evolved  
230 within ~10 Myr after their appearance (421 Ma, 95% CI 399–441).

231 We estimated the origin of insects exhibiting complete metamorphosis (crown Holometabola)  
232 to have occurred during the Devonian (~389 Ma, 95% CI 359–419), with a median posterior age more

233 than 40 Myr earlier than proposed in the majority of previous estimates (e.g., [12,33,50]; Table S3),  
234 but in agreement with a recent timescale inferred using transcriptome data [39]. The broader spectrum  
235 of available ecological niches provided by communities of vascular and macrophyllous plants from  
236 the Late Silurian to Early Devonian [43], as well as a global transition from hyperoxic to hypoxic  
237 conditions [38], might have been associated with the evolution of complete metamorphosis and the  
238 development of semaphoronts able to utilize different habitats and food resources.

239 The ancestor of crown polyneopterans, a group that includes, amongst others, ground lice,  
240 stoneflies, crickets, leaf insects, cockroaches, and termites, was estimated here to have appeared  
241 during the Devonian (389 Ma, 95% CI 347–428 Ma), with a median posterior age approximately 90  
242 Myr earlier than previous estimates [12,33] (Table S3). Similarly, we found that the ancestor of crown  
243 Zoraptera+Dermaptera, representing the sister lineage to the rest of the polyneopterans, occurred 345  
244 Ma (95% CI 245–414 Ma), ~170 Myr earlier than previous estimates ([12]; Table S3, Figs 2, 3). The  
245 last two node ages are in agreement with the results of Tong et al. [32], who included “roachoid”  
246 fossils from the late Carboniferous in one of their analyses. During the Ordovician to Late Devonian,  
247 the establishment of complex ecosystems dominated by woodland-like vegetation, fungi, and  
248 arthropods increased the availability of food resources and opened new ecological niches [6]. This  
249 might have promoted the appearance and diversification of crown polyneopterans, in agreement with  
250 the hypothesis of an early origin of these lineages [51].

251 Parasitism is a key trait among insects. We estimated that the last common ancestor of  
252 mosquitoes (based on representatives of *Anopheles* and *Aedes*) occurred 131 Ma (95% CI 62–229).  
253 This raises the possibility of co-evolution of these insects with live-bearing mammals, whose last  
254 common ancestor is thought to have originated in the Jurassic [52], or with a non-mammalian host.  
255 Our results indicate that crown parasitic lice (order Phthiraptera) appeared in the Mesozoic (~129 Ma,  
256 95% CI 54.5–213). This is inconsistent with the hypothesis that they diversified after the emergence  
257 of avian and mammalian hosts [12,53], but supports the alternative hypothesis that they evolved on  
258 feathered theropod dinosaurs [54].

259

260 *Multiple major insect groups may have survived the End-Permian Extinction*

261 Our finding that a large number of crown lineages potentially arose before the EPE (Figs 2, 3)  
262 suggests that the most catastrophic extinction event in Earth's history might not have reduced insect  
263 diversity to the same degree that it did in other animal groups. A similar finding was recently reported  
264 for plants [55], another major group of organisms inhabiting continental ecosystems, suggesting that  
265 these ecosystems were not as dramatically affected by the EPE as previously thought. The extensive  
266 species diversity of phytophagous insect groups, including Orthoptera, Lepidoptera, Coleoptera,  
267 Heteroptera, Hymenoptera, and Diptera, was previously thought to have been associated with the  
268 diversification of angiosperms [56–58]. However, our results and those of others [19,59–62] raise the  
269 possibility that these groups appeared prior to the EPE, and that their initial diversification occurred  
270 in association with gymnosperms [63] rather than with flowering plants, which are thought to have  
271 diversified in the Mesozoic [64,65].

272 Our median posterior estimate for the age of crown Hemiptera was in the Devonian to  
273 Carboniferous (358 Ma, 95% CI 317–401), rather than in the middle Carboniferous to Permian as  
274 previously estimated [12,32]. This is in accordance with a recent analysis of a comprehensive data  
275 set comprising 2,395 protein-coding genes from 193 hemipteroid taxa [62]. Our date estimate for  
276 crown Heteroptera (277 Ma, 95% CI 241–318) is consistent with the attribution of *Paraknightia*  
277 *magnifica* Evans 1943, a highly debated fossil from the Late Permian, to this group [66]. Although  
278 predation has been postulated as a plesiomorphic state of heteropterans [67,68], anatomical features  
279 suggest that *Archetingis ladinica* was phytophagous, possibly feeding on gymnosperms or horsetails.  
280 Therefore, it is possible that the ancestor of true bugs was phytophagous rather than predatory [67,68].  
281 Similar results were also obtained for crown Coleoptera, which we dated at 283 Ma (95% CI 257–  
282 305) in the Permian, with the last common ancestor of Coleoptera and Strepsiptera occurring in the  
283 late Carboniferous to Early Permian (301 Ma, 95% CI 279–313). These findings are consistent with  
284 other studies that placed the base of crown Coleoptera in the Permian [2,12,32,50,69–71].

285 Our analysis placed the crown age of true flies (Diptera) in the late Carboniferous to early  
286 Triassic (~282 Ma, 95% CI 233–333), in agreement with the results of certain previous studies [32,72]  
287 but not of others [12,50]. On the basis of our estimates, the last common ancestor of extant  
288 Lepidoptera occurred ~271 Ma (95% CI 208–331). This is slightly earlier than the first glossatan  
289 fossilized wing scales, recently discovered in an Upper Triassic deposit [73], but well before the first  
290 fossils reliably identified as members of the Lepidoptera dated to the Early Jurassic [74–77].  
291 Therefore, suctorial mouthparts for feeding on gymnosperm pollination drops might have evolved  
292 earlier than generally thought. Molecular estimates of the age of crown Lepidoptera range from the  
293 Early Cretaceous [12,50] to the Late Triassic [35] and the Middle Permian (this study; 32), suggesting  
294 the potential benefits of further analyses of a more comprehensive data set, both in terms of taxa and  
295 molecular data. The crown group of butterflies (here included as members of the genera *Polyommatus*  
296 and *Parides*) was estimated to have appeared in the Cretaceous to Paleogene (82.8 Ma, 95% CI 36.1–  
297 134 Ma), with a median posterior age approximately 45 Myr after the earliest appearance of eudicots  
298 [35,64,78] and almost in agreement with a recent study based on ~6000 nucleotides [79].

299

#### 300 **4. Conclusions**

301 Our phylogenomic dating analysis, calibrated using new MSG fossils from the Middle Triassic,  
302 provides a revised timescale for the appearance of key insect innovations, shifting the median  
303 estimates and 95% CIs for several nodes to substantially earlier than reported by previous studies.  
304 Our results raise the possibility that the EPE had a lower impact on insect evolution than previously  
305 thought. Our results indicate that terrestrial or amphibiotic protopterygotes evolved ~435 Ma, and  
306 that the appearance of complete insect metamorphosis followed the origin of vascular plants (~390  
307 Ma). A number of hyperdiverse crown groups such as Lepidoptera, Hymenoptera, Diptera,  
308 Sternorrhyncha, and Heteroptera may have evolved prior to the EPE and were not strictly associated  
309 with the evolutionary diversification of angiosperms. We tentatively propose that the EPE had only  
310 a limited impact on insect evolution and on the faunal turnover postulated to have occurred following

311 this tremendous upheaval of Earth’s biodiversity. Our results provide an updated timescale for  
312 comparative analyses of insect evolution.

### 313 **5. Acknowledgements**

314 We thank C. Lombardo for her contribution in the fieldwork and to the study of fossils from the  
315 Kalkschieferzone. We sincerely thank the anonymous reviewers for their suggestions and comments.  
316 The authors acknowledge the Dipartimento del territorio del Cantone Ticino through the Museo  
317 Cantonale di Storia Naturale in Lugano (CH) that supported excavations.

### 318 **6. Funding**

319 The study was partially supported by Linnean Society of London and the Systematics Association  
320 (Systematics Research Fund 2016 assigned to M.M.). SYWH and NL were supported by ARC Future  
321 Fellowships (FT160100167 and FT160100463).

322

### 323 **7. References**

- 324 1. Stork NE, McBroom J, Gely C, Hamilton AJ 2015 New approaches narrow global species  
325 estimates for beetles, insects, and terrestrial arthropods. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **112**, 7519–  
326 7523.
- 327 2. Grimaldi D, Engel MS 2005 *Evolution of the Insects* (Cambridge Univ. Press).
- 328 3. Farrell, B.D. “Inordinate fondness” explained: Why are there so many beetles? *Science* 281, 555–  
329 559 (1998).
- 330 4. Mayhew PJ 2007 Why are there so many insect species? Perspectives from fossils and phylogenies.  
331 *Biol. Rev.* **82**, 425–454.
- 332 5. Labandeira CC, Sepkoski JJ 1993 Insect diversity in the fossil record. *Science* **261**, 310–315.
- 333 6. Labandeira CC 2005 Invasion of the continents: cyanobacterial crusts to tree-inhabiting arthropods.  
334 *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **20**, 253–262.
- 335 7. Condamine FL, Clapham ME, Kergoat GJ 2016 Global patterns of insect diversification: towards  
336 a reconciliation of fossil and molecular evidence? *Sci. Rep.* **6**, 19208.

- 337 8. Labandeira CC, Johnson KR, Wilf P 2002 Impact of the terminal Cretaceous event on plant-insect  
338 associations. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **99**, 2061–2066.
- 339 9. Raup DM 1979 Size of the Permo–Triassic bottleneck and its evolutionary implications. *Science*  
340 **206**, 217–218.
- 341 10. Benton MJ, Twitchett RJ 2003 How to kill (almost) all life: the end-Permian extinction event.  
342 *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **18**, 358–365.
- 343 11. Song HJ, Wignall PB, Tong J, Yin H 2013 Two pulses of extinction during the Permian-Triassic  
344 crisis. *Nat. Geosci.* **6**, 52–56.
- 345 12. Misof B et al. 2014 Phylogenomics resolves the timing and pattern of insect evolution. *Science*  
346 **346**, 763–767.
- 347 13. Toussaint EFA, Condamine FL 2016 To what extent do new fossil discoveries change our  
348 understanding of clade evolution? A cautionary tale from burying beetles (Coleoptera:  
349 Nicrophorus). *Biol. J. Linn. Soc.* **117**, 686–704.
- 350 14. Nel P, Bertrand S, Nel A 2018 Diversification of insects since the Devonian: a new approach  
351 based on morphological disparity of mouthparts. *Sci Rep.* **8**, 3516.
- 352 15. Tintori A 1990 The actinopterygian fish Prohalecites from the Triassic of N Italy. *Palaeontology*  
353 **33**, 155–174.
- 354 16. Montagna M, Haug JT, Strada L, Haug C, Felber M, Tintori A 2017 Central nervous system and  
355 muscular bundles preserved in a 240 million year old giant bristletail (Archaeognatha:  
356 Machilidae). *Sci. Rep.* **7**, 46016.
- 357 17. Montagna M 2019 Comment on Phylogenetic analyses with four new Cretaceous bristletails  
358 reveal inter-relationships of Archaeognatha and Gondwana origin of Meinertellidae. *Cladistics*  
359 doi:10.1111/cla.12387.
- 360 18. Montagna M, Strada L, Dioli P, Tintori A 2018 The Middle Triassic lagerstätte of Monte San  
361 Giorgio reveals the oldest lace bugs (Hemiptera: Tingidae): *Archetingis ladinica* gen. n. sp. n. *Riv.*  
362 *Ital. Paleontol. S.* **124**, 35–44.

- 363 19. Peters RS et al. 2017 Evolutionary History of the Hymenoptera. *Curr. Biol.* **27**, 1013–1018.
- 364 20. Parham JF et al. 2012 Best practices for justifying fossil calibrations. *Syst. Biol.* **61**, 346–359.
- 365 21. Krzeminski W, Lombardo C 2001 New fossil Ephemeroptera and Coleoptera from the Ladinian  
366 (Middle triassic) of Canton Ticino (Switzerland). *Riv. Ital. Paleontol. Strat.* **107**, 69–78.
- 367 22. Strada L, Montagna M, Tintori A 2014 A new genus and species of the family Trachypachidae  
368 (Coleoptera, Adephaga) from the upper Ladinian (Middle Triassic) of Monte San Giorgio. *Riv.*  
369 *Ital. Paleontol. S.* **120**, 183–190.
- 370 23. Engel MS, Grimaldi DA 2006 The earliest webspinners (Insecta: Embiodea). *Am. Mus. Novit.*  
371 **3514**, 1–15.
- 372 24. Strada L 2015. The Triassic Insects from Monte San Giorgio: systematics and paleoenvironmental  
373 implications. Università degli Studi di Milano, Doctoral Thesis, 92 pp.  
374 <http://hdl.handle.net/2434/265521>
- 375 25. Misof B et al. 2014 Data from: Phylogenomics resolves the timing and pattern of insect evolution.  
376 Dryad Digital Repository. <https://doi.org/10.5061/dryad.3c0f1>
- 377 26. Warnock RCM, Parham JF, Joyce WG, Lyson TR., Donoghue PCJ 2015 Calibration uncertainty  
378 in molecular dating analyses: there is no substitute for the prior evaluation of time priors. *Proc. R.*  
379 *Soc. B* **282**, 20141013.
- 380 27. Stockar R, Baumgartner PO, Condon D 2012 Integrated Ladinian biochronostratigraphy and  
381 geochronology of Monte San Giorgio (Southern Alps, Switzerland). *Swiss J. Geosci.* **60**, 239–  
382 269.
- 383 28. Labandeira CC 1994 A compendium of fossil insect families. *Milw. Public Mus. Contrib. Biol.*  
384 *Geol.* **88**, 1–71.
- 385 29. Yang Z 2007 PAML 4: Phylogenetic analysis by maximum likelihood. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **24**, 1586–  
386 1591.
- 387 30. Thorne JL, Kishino H, Painter IS 1998 Estimating the rate of evolution of the rate of molecular  
388 evolution. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **15**, 1647–1657.

- 389 31. dos Reis M, Yang Z 2011 Approximate likelihood calculation on a phylogeny for Bayesian  
390 estimation of divergence times. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **28**, 2161–2172.
- 391
- 392
- 393 32. Tong KJ, Duchêne S, Ho SY, Lo N 2015. Insect phylogenomics. Comment on "Phylogenomics  
394 resolves the timing and pattern of insect evolution". *Science* **349**, 487.
- 395 33. Wheat CW, Wahlberg N 2013 Phylogenomic insights into the cambrian explosion, the  
396 colonization of land and the evolution of flight in arthropoda. *Syst. Biol.* **62**, 93–109.
- 397 34. Ronquist F, Klopfstein S, Vilhelmsen L, Schulmeister S, Murray DL, Rasnitsyn AP 2012 A total-  
398 evidence approach to dating with fossils, applied to the early radiation of the hymenoptera. *Syst*  
399 *Biol.* **61**, 973–999.
- 400 35. Wahlberg N, Wheat CW, Peña C 2013 Timing and patterns in the taxonomic diversification of  
401 Lepidoptera (butterflies and moths). *PLoS One* **81**, e80875.
- 402 36. Cohen KM, Finney SC, Gibbard PL, Fan JX 2013 (updated) The ICS International  
403 Chronostratigraphic Chart. *Episodes* **36**, 199–204.
- 404 37. National Research Council of the National Academies 2011 Understanding Earth's Deep Past:  
405 Lessons for Our Climate Future. The National Academies Press, Washington, D.C.
- 406 38. Schachat SR, Labandeira CC, Saltzman MR, Cramer BD, Payne JL, Boyce CK 2018 Phanerozoic  
407 pO<sub>2</sub> and the early evolution of terrestrial animals. *Proc. R. Soc. B.* **285**, 20172631.
- 408 39. Rehm P, Borner J, Meusemann K, von Reumont BM, Simon S, Hadrys H, Misof B, Burmester T  
409 2011 Dating the arthropod tree based on large-scale transcriptome data. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.*  
410 **61**, 880–887.
- 411 40. Rainford JL, Hofreiter M, Nicholson DB, Mayhew PJ 2014 Phylogenetic distribution of extant  
412 richness suggests metamorphosis is a key innovation driving diversification in insects. *PLoS One*  
413 **9**, e109085.



- 414 41. Sanderson MJ, Thorne JL, Wikstrom N, Bremer K 2004 Molecular evidence on plant divergence  
415 times. *Am. J. Bot.* **91**, 1656–1665.
- 416 42. Kenrick P, Wellman CH, Schneider H, Edgecombe GD 2012 A timeline for terrestrialization:  
417 consequences for the carbon cycle in the Palaeozoic. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. Lond. B Biol. Sci.* **367**,  
418 519–536.
- 419 43. Magallón S, Hilu KW, Quandt D 2013 Land plant evolutionary timeline: gene effects are  
420 secondary to fossil constraints in relaxed clock estimation of age and substitution rates. *Am. J. Bot.*  
421 **100**, 556–573.
- 422 44. Nie Y et al. 2019 Accounting for uncertainty in the evolutionary timescale of green plants through  
423 clock-partitioning and fossil calibration strategies. *Syst Biol.* **pii**, syz032. doi:  
424 10.1093/sysbio/syz032 [Epub ahead of print].
- 425 45. Rota-Stabelli O, Daley AC, Pisani D 2013 Molecular timetrees reveal a Cambrian colonization  
426 of land and a new analysis for ecdysozoan evolution. *Curr. Biol.* **23**, 392–398.
- 427 46. Gaunt MW, Miles MA 2002 An insect molecular clock dates the origin of the insects and accords  
428 with palaeontological and biogeographic landmarks. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **19**, 748–761.
- 429 47. Engel MS, Grimaldi DA 2004 New light shed on the oldest insect. *Nature* **427**, 627–630.
- 430 48. Dudley R 2000 The biomechanics of insect flight: form, function, evolution. (Princeton: Princeton  
431 University Press).
- 432 49. Kingsolver JG, Koehl MAR 1985 Aerodynamics, thermoregulation, and the evolution of insect  
433 wings: differential scaling and evolutionary change. *Evolution* **39**, 488–504.
- 434 50. Wiegmann BM, Trautwein MD, Kim JW, Cassel BK, Bertone MA, Winterton SL, Yeates DK  
435 2009 Single-copy nuclear genes resolve the phylogeny of the holometabolous insects. *BMC Biol.*  
436 **7**, 34.
- 437 51. Legendre F, Nel A, Svenson GJ, Robillard T, Pellens R, Grandcolas P. 2015 Phylogeny of  
438 Dictyoptera: dating the origin of cockroaches, praying mantises and termites with molecular data  
439 and controlled fossil evidence. *PLoS One* **10**, e0130127.

- 440 52. dos Reis M 2012 Phylogenomic datasets provide both precision and accuracy in estimating the  
441 timescale of placental mammal phylogeny. *Proc. R. Soc. B* **279**, 3491–3500.
- 442 53. Light JE, Smith VS, Allen JM, Durden LA, Reed DL 2010 Evolutionary history of mammalian  
443 sucking lice (Phthiraptera: Anoplura). *BMC Evol. Biol.* **10**, 292.
- 444 54. Smith VS, Ford T, Johnson KP, Johnson PC, Yoshizawa K, Light JE 2011 Multiple lineages of  
445 lice pass through the K-Pg boundary. *Biol. Lett.* **7**, 782–785.
- 446 55. Nowak H, Schneebeili-Hermann E, Kustatscher E 2019 No mass extinction for land plants at the  
447 Permian-Triassic transition. *Nat Commun.* **10**, 384.
- 448 56. Ehrlich PR, Raven PH 1964 Butterflies and plants: a study in coevolution. *Evolution* **18**, 586–  
449 608.
- 450 57. Mitter C, Farrell BD 1991 Macroevolutionary aspects of insect/plant relationships. In *Insect-plant*  
451 *interactions Volume 3*, E. Bernays, ed. (Boca Raton: CRC Press), pp. 35–78.
- 452 58. Moreau CS, Bell CD, Vila R, Bruce Archibald S, Pierce NE 2006 Phylogeny of the ants:  
453 diversification in the age of Angiosperms. *Science* **312**, 101–104.
- 454 59. Zhang SQ, Che LH, Li Y, Dan Liang, Pang H, Ślipiński A, Zhang P 2018 Evolutionary history  
455 of Coleoptera revealed by extensive sampling of genes and species. *Nat. Commun.* **9**, 205.
- 456 60. Haug JT, Labandeira CC, Santiago-Blay JA, Haug C, Brown S 2016 Life habits, Hox genes and  
457 affinities of a 311 million-year-old holometabolan larva. *BMC Evol. Biol.* **15**, 208.
- 458 61. Feng Z, Wang J, Rossler R, Slipinski A, Labandeira CC 2018 Late Permian borings reveal an  
459 intricate network of ecological relationships. *Nat. Commun.* **18**, 556.
- 460 62. Johnson KP et al. 2018 Phylogenomics and the evolution of hemipteroid insects. *Proc. Natl. Acad.*  
461 *Sci. U S A* **115**, 12775–12780.
- 462 63. Labandeira C 2014 Why did terrestrial insect diversity not increase during the angiosperm  
463 radiation? Mid-Mesozoic, plant-associated insect lineages harbor clues. In *Evolutionary biology:*  
464 *genome evolution, speciation, coevolution and origin of life*, P. Pontarotti, ed. (Cham: Springer  
465 International Publishing), pp. 261–299.

- 466 64. Magallón S, Gómez-Acevedo S, Sánchez-Reyes LL, Hernández-Hernández T 2015 A  
467 metacalibrated time-tree documents the early rise of flowering plant phylogenetic diversity. *New*  
468 *Phytol.* **207**, 437–453.
- 469 65. Foster CSP, Sauquet H, van der Merwe M, McPherson H, Rossetto M, Ho SYW 2017 Evaluating  
470 the impact of genomic data and priors on Bayesian estimates of the angiosperm evolutionary  
471 timescale. *Syst. Biol.* **66**, 338–351.
- 472 66. Evans JW 1950 A re-examination of an Upper Permian insect, *Paraknightia magnifica*. *Ev. Rec.*  
473 *Aust. Mus.* **22**, 246–250.
- 474 67. Cobben RH 1978 Evolutionary trends in Heteroptera. Part 2: mouthpart structures and feeding  
475 strategies. (Wageningen: Veenman).
- 476 68. Schuh RT, Weirauhc C, Wheeler WC 2009 Phylogenetic relationships within the Cimicomorpha  
477 (Hemiptera: Heteroptera): a total evidence analysis. *Syst. Entomol.* **34**, 15–48.
- 478 69. Crowson RA 1981 The biology of Coleoptera (Academic Press, London, 1981).
- 479 70. Hunt T et al. 2007 A comprehensive phylogeny of beetles reveals the evolutionary origins of a  
480 superradiation. *Science* **318**, 1913–1916.
- 481 71. McKenna DD et al. 2015 The beetle tree of life reveals that Coleoptera survived end-Permian  
482 mass extinction to diversify during the Cretaceous terrestrial revolution. *Syst. Entomol.* **40**, 835–  
483 880.
- 484 72. Wiegmann BM et al. 2011 Episodic radiations in the fly tree of life. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA*  
485 **108**, 5690–5695.
- 486 73. van Eldijk TJB, Wappler T, Strother PK, van der Weijst CMH, Rajaei H, Visscher H, van de  
487 Schootbrugge B 2018 Triassic-Jurassic window into the evolution of Lepidoptera. *Sci. Adv.* **4**,  
488 e1701568.
- 489 74. Skalski AW 1990 An annotated review of all fossil records of Lower Lepidoptera. *Bull. Sugadaira*  
490 *Montane Res. Cent.* **11**, 125–128.

- 491 75. Ansorge J. 2002 Revision of the “Trichoptera” described by Geinitz and Handlirsch from the  
492 Lower Toarcian of Dobbertin (Germany) based on new material. *Nova Suppl. Entomol.* **15**, 55–  
493 74.
- 494 76. Huang D, Nel A, Minet J 2010 A new family of moths from the Middle Jurassic (Insecta:  
495 Lepidoptera). *Acta Geol. Sinica* **84**, 874–85.
- 496 77. Zhang W et al. 2013. New fossil Lepidoptera (Insecta: Amphiesmenoptera) from the Middle  
497 Jurassic Jiulongshan Formation of northeastern China. *PLoS One* **8**, e79500.
- 498 78. Heikkilä M, Kaila L, Mutanen M, Peña C, Wahlberg N 2012 Cretaceous origin and repeated  
499 tertiary diversification of the redefined butterflies. *Proc. R. Soc. B* **279**, 1093–1099.
- 500 79. Chazot N et al. 2019 Priors and posteriors in Bayesian timing of divergence analyses: the age of  
501 butterflies revisited. *Syst. Biol.* doi: 10.1093/sysbio/syz002.

502

### 503 **Figure legends**

504 **Figure 1.** Macro photographs of the MSG fossil insects. **a**, *Gigamachilis triassicus* (Archaeognatha:  
505 Machilidae). **b**, *Tintorina meridensis* (Ephemeroptera: Tintorinidae). **c**, *Archetingis ladinica*  
506 (Hemiptera: Tingidae). **d**, *Praedodromeus sangiorgiensis* (Coleoptera: Trachipachidae). **e**,  
507 Completely phosphatized stonefly nymph (Plecoptera), with a total length of 9.38 mm. **f**,  
508 Phosphatized webspinner (Embioptera) of 18.3 mm in length, preserved in ventral view; fore basitarsi  
509 swollen, three segmented tarsi, hindlegs with enlarged femora; muscles and tendons are visible within  
510 the legs. **g**, Coleoptera Polyphaga (not Staphyliniformia) of 2.9 mm in length preserved in  
511 dorsal/lateral view. **h**, Phosphatized e holometabolous larva (MCSN8531) of ~4 cm in length (not  
512 complete), not assigned to an order. **i**, Phosphatized specimens with grasshopper-like body plan;  
513 within the abdomen, at its end, a group of tubules is visible, possibly identifiable as the Malpighian  
514 tubules; in **j**, a magnification of these structures, scale bar=200 µm. Details of image acquisition are  
515 reported in electronic supplementary material (Text S1).

516

517 **Figure 2.** Comparison of age estimates for 13 key nodes obtained from three analyses employing  
518 different fossil calibration priors. For each lineage, vertical bars show the 95% credibility intervals  
519 of the age estimates; circles denote median values, and the red triangle corresponds to the age of MSG  
520 fossils. The purple dashed line corresponds to the Permo-Triassic boundary. The main comparisons  
521 are between the results of Analysis 1 (grey bars, replicating the calibration scheme used by Misof et  
522 al [12]), Analysis 3 (yellow bars, replicating the calibration scheme used to produce Fig. 1B in Tong  
523 et al. [32]), and Analysis 4 (red bars, based on the addition of the MSG fossil calibrations). We also  
524 include estimates for some nodes obtained by Wheat and Wahlberg [33] (purple bars), Ronquist et  
525 al. [34] (green bars), and Wahlberg et al. [35] (blue bars); for some of these, squares denote estimated  
526 mean values. The periods and epochs from the International Chronostratigraphic Chart v 2019/05  
527 [36] are shown on the left. Abbreviations: Hexa=Hexapoda; Ecto=Ectognatha; Pter=Pterygota;  
528 Holo=Holometabola; Arch=Archaeognatha; Poly=Polyneoptera incl. Zoraptera; Phth=Phthiraptera;  
529 Orth=Orthoptera; Hemi: Hete=Hemiptera: Heteroptera; Hymenopt=Hymenoptera;  
530 Lepidopt=Lepidoptera; Dipt=Diptera; Mississip.=Mississippian; N=Neogene;  
531 Pennsylv.=Pennsylvanian; Q=Quaternary; S=Silurian.

532  
533 **Figure 3.** Time-calibrated phylogenetic tree of insect evolutionary relationships. Tips show the names  
534 of taxa at ordinal and sub-ordinal levels. Bars on nodes correspond to the 95% credibility intervals of  
535 node-age estimates, with red indicating the lineages for which the origin is pushed back by more than  
536 50 Myr. Green stars indicate the nodes calibrated with MSG fossils; yellow circles indicate nodes  
537 calibrated with other fossils. Two key evolutionary innovations in insects (wings and complete  
538 metamorphosis) are shown at the relevant nodes. Red triangles indicate Hexapoda and Insecta. Below  
539 the tree the following are shown: i) bars with periods and epochs from the International  
540 Chronostratigraphic Chart v 2019/05 [36]; ii) scale axis of the tree expressed in Myr; iii) origin of  
541 plant groups; iv) bar with warmer (red) and cooler (light-blue/dark-blue) periods [37]; and, v) plot of  
542 O<sub>2</sub> concentration vs time according to [38]. Abbreviations as in Fig. 2.



544 **Electronic supplementary material**

545

546 **Supplementary information**

547 **Text S1.** This file includes supplementary information on i. *Monte San Giorgio fossil collection*; ii.  
548 *The eight MSG fossils used for calibration*; and iii. *Image acquisition and figure preparation*

549

550 **Supplementary Tables**

551 **Table S1.** Monte San Giorgio fossils used in the analyses for estimating divergence dates and  
552 calibration point prior settings.

553

554 **Table S2.** Age constraints used for fossil calibrations. Minimum ages, maximum ages, and priors for  
555 each calibration are listed.

556

557 **Table S3.** Estimated divergence dates of the five performed simulations.

558

559 **Table S4.** Comparisons of five phylogenomic dating analyses using different calibration schemes  
560 and clock models with the original Misof et al. [12] estimates.