



Mythopoeic Society

mythLORE

A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis,  
Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature

---

Volume 17  
Number 4

Article 9

---

Summer 7-15-1991

## An Inklings Bibliography (43)

Joe R. Christopher

Wayne G. Hammond

Follow this and additional works at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore>



Part of the [Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Christopher, Joe R. and Hammond, Wayne G. (1991) "An Inklings Bibliography (43)," *Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature*: Vol. 17 : No. 4 , Article 9.

Available at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol17/iss4/9>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Mythopoeic Society at SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact [phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu](mailto:phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu).

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to:  
<http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm>

SWOSU<sup>TM</sup>

---

## Mythcon 51: The Mythic, the Fantastic, and the Alien

Albuquerque, New Mexico • Postponed to: July 30 – August 2, 2021



### Abstract

Entries 42–59 in this series are written by Hammond (Tolkien material) and Christopher (Lewis and other material). See Hammond, Wayne G., for one later entry in this series.

# An Inklings Bibliography (43)

Compiled by Joe R. Christopher and Wayne G. Hammond

Authors and readers are encouraged to send copies and bibliographic references on: *J.R.R. Tolkien* — Wayne G. Hammond, 30 Talcott Road, Williamstown, MA 01267; *C.S. Lewis* — Dr. J.R. Christopher, English Department, Tarleton State University, Stephenville, TX 76402.

*Arda* 1986. Ed. Beregon, Anders Stenström. Uppsala: Arda-sällskapet, 1990. xviii + 278 pp. [Tolkien; Lewis 15, 16, 17, 19, 115-25; Williams 15, 16]

This issue contains:

(1) "The Clerkes Complainte Revisited," pp. 1-13. In English, with a Swedish introduction to the poem by Aldamrie, Florence Vilén. "The Clerkes Complainte," a poem in Middle English attributed to J.R.R. Tolkien, was reprinted in *Arda* 1984. Christopher Tolkien here confirms the authorship and comments on the manuscript of the poem, which is reproduced in facsimile. This is followed by close analyses, presumably by editor Stenström, of the physical manuscript and of the three existing versions of the poem: the *Gryphon* printing of December 1922, corrected by Tolkien in his copy; a typescript; and the manuscript reproduced.

(2) "Theology in Gandalf's Garden" by the Rev. Ian A. Muirhead, pp. 14-26. Reprinted (with editorial corrections noted on p. ix) from *The Modern Churchman* ns 16 (1973). In English with a summary in Swedish. An overt religious aspect is omitted from *The Lord of the Rings*, Muirhead asserts. To have provided overtly for religion in Middle-earth would have supported a Christian interpretation which would have interfered with the reader's "suspension of [dis]belief." "The total exclusion of anything which suggests a religious vocabulary" leaves some aspects of religion "expressed more directly and meaningfully" (p. 17). The ethics of *The Lord of the Rings* are like those in *Beowulf* "if less rugged in presentation, . . . the ethics of heroism, the somewhat chilly heroism of obedience at all cost and in face of apparently inevitable failure" (p. 19). In Tolkien's world there is freedom of choice but also destiny. Frodo is "chosen" to be the Ringbearer, and he accepts his fate. "He takes the apparent inevitability of his death upon himself in an act of courageous resolve, so giving his life a direction in place of its 'throwness' [as of thrown dice]" (p. 20). The final victory, however, belongs to Time, and to death. Though *The Lord of the Rings* ends in eucatastrophe, "it is still set in a sombre frame and Time is the Last Lord" (p. 21). The theological success of the work, what so many of its readers find satisfying, lies perhaps in what it says, obliquely, about man's situation, "the finitude from which there is no escape, the disorder, for the creation of which

his choices are in part responsible, and his reorientations towards genuine selfhood" (p. 24).

(3) "Något om Ringbärens dagar kring Spindelns Pass" ["Some Notes on the Ringbearer's Days around the Pass of the Spider"] by Beregon, Anders Stenström, pp. 28-99. In Swedish with summaries in English. A detailed, partly mathematical analysis of evidence in *The Lord of the Rings* concerning the movements of Frodo, Sam, Gollum, and the orcs from the hobbits' departure from the Crossroads in Ithilien to their escape from Cirith Ungol.

(4) "The Year's Work in Tolkien Studies," pp. 100-41, 143-52. A chronicle, in Swedish with a summary in English, of Tolkien-related publications and events in 1986, and reviews in Swedish or English with abstracts in translation, by Thomas M. Egan; Aldamrie, Florence Vilén; Beregon; Anders Stenström; Åke Bertenstam; and Christina Scull. The works reviewed are J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Shaping of Middle-earth*; Barbara Einhaus, *The Lord of the Rings: Logik der kreativen Imagination*; Marli SchGtze, *Neue Wege nach Narnia und Mittel Erde*; Judith A. Johnson, *J.R.R. Tolkien: Six Decades of Criticism*; Robert E. Morse, *Evocation of Virgil in Tolkien's Art*; Anne M. Pienciak, *J.R.R. Tolkien's The Hobbit & The Lord of the Rings; Lembas-extra 1986; and Inklings Jahrbuch* 4.

(5) "Brev och kommentarer," pp. 154-59. Comments by Jonas Berggren, Alex Lewis, and Anders Stenström on the Ringwraiths in *The Lord of the Rings*, and on matches in Middle-earth. In Swedish or English with summaries in translation.

(6) "Supplement för 1985-1986 till En Tolkienbibliografi med tillägg och rättelser för tidigare år" = "Supplement for 1985-1986 to A Tolkien Bibliography, with Additions and Corrections for Earlier Years" by Åke Bertenstam, pp. 160-275. In Swedish and English. The third supplement to Bertenstam's bibliography of works by and about Tolkien. Its arrangement is here more elaborate, with new sections M and N listing Tolkien-related periodicals (e.g. *Mythlore* and *Mythprint*) and reviews of these periodicals. [WGH]

**Barker, Nicholas.** "C.S. Lewis, Darkly." *Essays in Criticism*, 40:4 (October 1990), 358-367.

A review of Kathryn Lindskoog's *The C.S. Lewis Hoax*. Barker resolves Lindskoog's charges into two. (1) "Hooper has been an irresponsible executor of the Lewis literary estate, [a] exaggerating his own contact with the master, [b] playing fast and loose with the texts, and [c] acting with unwarranted proprietorship in serving Lewis's memory" (359). Barker agrees that [a] is true; he says that, on [b], the texts of the Boxen works show curious editing but that they are within the limits of commercial publication, intended to make money for the estate (he is harder on the

1976 revised *Screwtape Letters* and the notes to the 1987 Bantam *Pilgrim's Regress*, and, on [C], that again Hooper's actions about the use of Lewisian materials are within the limits of commercial control. (2) "Hooper has committed both intellectual and literal forgery ..." (359). Here Barker adds some information to what has been known about the manuscripts of "The Dark Tower" (363) and "The Man Born to Be King" (363-64), but he judges them to have been written by Lewis. Of course, this latter judgment was given in reaction to Lindskoog's book and the manuscripts in the Bodleian, which have to be very good forgeries if they are forgeries; Barker does not refer to, nor seem to know of the publication of, Carla Faust Jones's "The Literary Detective Computer Analysis of Stylistic Differences between 'The Dark Tower' and C.S. Lewis' Deep Space Trilogy," *Mythlore*, 15:3/57 (Spring 1989), 11-15, with its stylistic comparison; nor could he have known of the more recent study by the Reverend A.Q. Morton — as yet unpublished so far as this bibliographer knows — which, like Jones's study, suggests that "The Dark Tower" is a forgery (although, in Morton's study, using three passages in "The Dark Tower," only two out of the three appear to be forgeries.) Barker's review is especially important for its new material on the inks used on the manuscripts of "The Dark Tower" and "The Man Born Blind," and the revisions of the latter in a different ink. [JRC]

**Burns, Marjorie.** "J.R.R. Tolkien: The British and the Norse in Tension." *Pacific Coast Philology* 25:1-2 (1990): [49]-59.

Tolkien's fiction is characterized by "doubleness" or "contradistency." This quality is apparent "in his complex approach to tradition and change, or in the tension between forest and garden, home and wayside, comradeship and solitude, risk and security, freedom and obligation" (p. [49]), all of which are embodied in Beorn in *The Hobbit*. On the one hand, Beorn is a pacifist in a secluded realm who "lives most on cream and honey"; but he is also a skin-changing berserker, a wide-ranging enemy of goblins and wargs. He is a being of two extremes, a blend "of the civilized English with the far more willful Nordic" (p. 52). He is linked to Bertilak in *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*, to *Beowulf*, and to Norse sagas.

Beorn seems to be the epitome of the Nordic ideal of independence and self-reliance. But with his animal servants he is neither truly alone nor truly self-reliant. Tolkien's "ideal independent figures" — Beorn, Tom Bombadil, and Treebeard — "are always somehow sovereign, and the solitude they experience is strongly bound to class. . . . Tolkien, for all his emphasis on Nordic independence, on freedom and free will and the call of the open road, always returns . . . to all those established roles [e.g., Beorn as governor of his entourage] that ultimately reinforce an English belief in class, inherited status, and a sense of knowing where you and your kind belong" (pp. 57, 58). [WGH]

**Doughan, David.** "In Search of the Bounce: Tolkien Seen through *Smith*." *Leaves from the Tree: J.R.R. Tolkien's*

*Shorter Fiction*. London: The Tolkien Society, 1991. 17-22.

Doughan questions T.A. Shippey's and Paul H. Kocher's views of *Smith of Wootton Major* as allegory but notes Tolkien's own allegorical interpretation of the work "Smith succinctly exhibits certain fundamental features of Tolkien's serious creative work which either attract or repel" (p. 18): not its prosaic names (Smith, Prentice, Alf, etc.) but its depiction of "the Fairy realm next door to the world," and its overall tone, grim yet not despairing. Doughan quotes from C.V. Cavafy to illustrate the theme of renunciation in *Smith*. [WGH]

**Eddison, E.R.** *The Worm Ouroboros*. Introduced and annotated by Paul Edmund Thomas. Foreword by Douglas E. Winter. New York: Dell, 1991. xlv + 448 pp. [Tolkien xii, xviii-xix, 406-7, 436; Lewis xv, 407]

Thomas compares Eddison's and Tolkien's uses of the term *Middle earth*, applies words and ideas from Tolkien's "On Fairy-Stories," and quotes Tolkien's remark that Eddison was "the greatest and most convincing writer of 'invented worlds' though his nomenclature [is] slipshod and often inept." Winter notes that Eddison's *Worm* and Tolkien's *Lord of the Rings* are inevitably compared, though "apart from their narrative ambition and epic sweep" they have little in common (p. xii). C.S. Lewis is mentioned in passing. [WGH]

**Ellison, John A.** "The 'Why,' and the 'How': Reflections on 'Leaf by Niggle.'" *Leaves from the Tree: J.R.R. Tolkien's Shorter Fiction*. London: The Tolkien Society, 1991. 23-32.

The subjects of "Leaf by Niggle," writes Ellison, are "skill, craftsmanship, technique; the essentials of bringing any large artwork to completion, be it painting, building, symphony, or *The Lord of the Rings*" (p. 24). He examines Tolkien's working method, which was to begin on a small or close scale "as with an individual word" and work outward to a larger form "an invented language or an imaginary world. But Tolkien found it difficult to reconcile a larger vision with its fragmentary details. Ellison explores the implications of "Leaf by Niggle," the story of a man who could paint leaves better than he could paint trees, in relation to Tolkien's struggles in writing *The Lord of the Rings* and *The Silmarillion*. [WGH]

**Farrell, Frances.** "Kindred Spirits: GKC & CSL." In a column called "Chesterton Close-Up." *Midwest Chesterton News*, 39/33 (10 June 1991), 10.

A familiar essay on the topic of similarities of ideas between Chesterton and Lewis. Farrell offers some generalized examples:

admiration for George McDonald [sic]; objections to pacifism; translating jargon into words of one syllable; dislike of literary moralizing; enjoyment of stormy weather; respect for tradition; belief in the possibilities of miracles; love of fairy tales and mythology; the importance of religious dogma, especially the doctrine of Original Sin.

(The third, fourth, fifth and final items need some qualifications to precisely fit Lewis; the faulty parallelism of the third item is in the original.) Farrell closes with anecdotes containing Lewis's and Chesterton's replies in debates with persons who raised difficulties about knowledge of what exists. [JRC]

**Fulk, R.D., ed. *Interpretations of Beowulf: A Critical Anthology*.** Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1991. xx + 283 pp. [Tolkien ix, xi-xii, xviii, 14-44, 91, 114, 186, 236, 253] Fulk includes in this anthology of Beowulf criticism, pp. 14-44, Tolkien's 1936 essay "Beowulf: The Monsters and the Critics," and in his preface defends it against current criticism that it "has become the object of mindless veneration, is over-anthologized, hopelessly retrograde, and much too long, and so can safely be set aside now to make way for more important matters" (p. xi). Tolkien's "explanation of the poem's larger structure . . . has never been bettered," his methodology "remains a model for emulation," and his view of the *Beowulf* poet as "an artist of an antiquarian bent" is still influential though "a major obstacle to dating the poem." Nor have "the monsters" become superfluous, though that issue is "not as pressing as it was in 1936" (p. xi-xii). Several of the writers included in this anthology refer to Tolkien's essay, pro and con. [WGH]

**Horne, Brian. "A Peculiar Debt: the Influence of Charles Williams on C.S. Lewis." *A Christian for All Christians: Essays in Honour of C.S. Lewis*.** Ed. Andrew Walker and James Patrick. London: Hodder and Stoughton (A C.S. Lewis Centre Book), 1990. 83-97, 229-231nn. [Coghill 84-85, 88-89, 96; Dyson 84; W.H. Lewis 84; Tolkien 84-85.]

Horne's essay is on an interesting topic, but unfortunately it is one of the weaker essays in the volume in which it appears: some of the points it makes have been made before in the discussions of Lewis and Williams — such as Lewis's use of the Doctrine of Exchange in *Till We Have Faces* (Horne cites some biographical studies of Lewis but no criticism of either author) — and some areas are not explored, such as Williams's influence, through *The Figure of Beatrice* (1943), on *The Great Divorce* (1945). Horne has two sections to his essay: the first is mainly biographical, and the second traces the influences. The first omits such things as Lewis's description of a London meeting with Williams, in Lewis's preface to *Essays Presented to Charles Williams*; but it is acceptable for a short sketch, and it nicely sums up the difference between Lewis and Williams: "For Lewis the natural tendency was always towards 'EITHER this OR that'; for Williams the tendency was always towards 'BOTH this AND that'" (88). In the second part Horne discusses these influences or possible influences: (1) the understanding of evil and of Satan in Williams's introduction to John Milton's poems in the World's Classics series, which has parallels in Lewis's *The Screwtape Letters*; (2) possible influences of *He Came Down from Heaven* on *Letters to Malcolm*; (3) some similarities of *That Hideous Strength* to Williams's novels (Horne gives three

similarities, and the two more certain ones have been pointed out before); (4) The Doctrine of Exchange used in *Till We Have Faces*. Despite Horne's forty-eight footnotes (two of which duplicate their information — nos. 13 and 43), this essay is not scholarly enough for the approach it takes. [JRC]

**Leaves from the Tree: J.R.R. Tolkien's Shorter Fiction.** London: The Tolkien Society, 1991. 88 pp.

The proceedings of the fourth Tolkien Society Workshop, held in Beverley, England on 24 June 1989. The booklet includes ten papers (see individual Inklings Bibliography entries): Tom Shippey, "Tolkien and 'The Homecoming of Beorhtnoth'"; David Doughan, "In Search of the Bounce: Tolkien Seen through *Smith*"; John A. Ellison, "The 'Why,' and the 'How': Reflections on 'Leaf by Niggle'"; Alex Lewis, "The Lost Heart of the Little Kingdom"; John D. Rateliff, "Early Versions of *Farmer Giles of Ham*"; Christina Scull, "Dragons from Andrew Lang's Retelling of Sigurd to Tolkien's Chrysophylax"; Jessica Yates, "The Source of 'The Lay of Aotrou and Itrouin'"; Christina Scull, "Tom Bombadil and *The Lord of the Rings*"; Charles E. Noad, "The Natures of Tom Bombadil: A Summary"; and Patricia Reynolds, "The Real Tom Bombadil." [WGH]

**Lewis, Alex. "The Lost Heart of the Little Kingdom." *Leaves from the Tree: J.R.R. Tolkien's Shorter Fiction*.** London: The Tolkien Society, 1991. 33-44.

The Oxfordshire Tolkien kennel was marked by a growing population, expanded housing, and new roads and aerodromes. "The heart has gone out of the Little Kingdom," Tolkien wrote despairingly in 1945, referring to Oxfordshire by the name he used for it in *Farmer Giles of Ham*. But later his attitude softened. *Smith of Wootton Major* "heralded a new creative strand for the Little Kingdom" (p. 42). Lewis notes that there are several Woottons in and around Oxfordshire, and a village named Noke (like Nokes, a character in *Smith*) on the edge of Otmoor. [WGH]

**Mackey, Aidan. "The Christian Influence of G.K. Chesterton on C.S. Lewis." *A Christian for All Christians: Essays in Honour of C.S. Lewis*.** Ed. Andrew Walker and James Patrick. London: Hodder and Stoughton (A C.S. Lewis Centre Book), 1990. 68-82, 227-29nn.

One of the best essays on its topic — although its topic, despite its title, is more the spiritual parallelism of Chesterton and Lewis than the influence of the former on the latter. Mackey begins with the non-religious upbringing of Chesterton and the influence of George MacDonald's *The Princess and the Goblin* on Chesterton's spiritual development; Mackey does not develop Lewis's atheistic, or anti-theistic, period to the same extent, but does show the influence of MacDonald's *Phantastes* on Lewis's parallel development. Mackey quotes the basic passage about Lewis first reading Chesterton, but goes on to point to their parallel social attitudes, particularly their trust of the common person (Lewis's "Willing Slaves of the Welfare State" is quoted). Mackey suggests some parallel personality

traits between the two, and ends with an anecdote by Lewis about quoting *The Ballad of the White Horse* at an appropriate time in World War II. (The most obvious omission from the point of view of influence is the Distributist who shows up in *That Hideous Strength*.) [JRC]

**Maringer, Tom. "The Shire Post."** *The Poster* (journal of the Local Post Collectors Society), 19.2 (1991): [1], 4 + map. [Tolkien]

Maringer has expanded Tolkien's creation by devising his own Shire postmarks: "Waymoot Central P.O.," "Hobbiton W.F. [West Farthing]," etc. Twenty-one such marks illustrate this article. They are accompanied by a Shire "postal district map" drawn by Maringer which extends beyond the bounds of the *Lord of the Rings* Shire map. Maringer (as he informed WGH) did not see the Shire map in Karen Wynn Fonstad's *Atlas of Middle-earth* (1981), but picked up most of the same topographical references in Tolkien's text. The two cartographers differ in some respects: for example, Maringer places Gamwich in the South Farthing while Fonstad locates it in the West Farthing, near Tighfield (which Maringer omits). Their largest difference is in the level of detail. Maringer embellishes freely, raising hills, planting trees, and establishing new villages and landmarks, notably in the South Farthing, which stretches in the south almost to the Brandywine. His misidentifications of the "Fox Downs" and "Catbarion" (for Oatbarton) point to the Ballantine *Fellowship of the Ring* as his reference text. [WGH]

**Noad, Charles E. "The Natures of Tom Bombadil: A Summary."** *Leaves from the Tree: J.R.R. Tolkien's Shorter Fiction*. London: The Tolkien Society, 1991. 79-83.

A selection of speculations on the nature of Tom Bombadil, quoted from Tolkien-related magazines, from Humphrey Carpenter's biography of Tolkien, and from Tolkien's letters. Noad also expresses his own view, that "Bombadil is in a sense an incarnation of some aspect of Nature, more specifically . . . of the land itself," perhaps "a kind of transformation of the life with which the material creation was imbued, the 'Secret Fire' at the heart of the World" (p. 83). [WGH]

**Noonan, Peggy. *What I Saw at the Revolution: a Political Life in the Reagan Era*.** (1990.) New York: Ivy Books (Ballantine Books), 1991. [Lewis 324.]

Noonan describes her stint as a speech writer in the Reagan White House, with some material before and after — it is the *after* sequence which is important here. Chapter 17, "A Thousand Points of Light," describes her writing of George Bush's nomination acceptance speech, delivered at the Republican National Convention in New Orleans in 1988. In the speech she wrote:

This is America: ... a brilliant diversity spread like stars, like a thousand points of light in a broad and peaceful sky. (323)

Noonan invented the phrase "a thousand points of light," but

it became the source of controversy — about its source. She lists three suggested sources, and then a clear duplication:

Five months after the speech, in January, the "Inside the Beltway" section of the *Washington Times* said ... that the great C.S. Lewis had used the phrase "a thousand points of light" in one of his science-fiction books, which did surprise me. I haven't read it, but I assume the *Times* was right because it cited the page number of a specific edition, a show of confidence that suggests the writer had the book in his hands as he wrote. People ask me now if that's where it came from. I say no .... (324)

Two approximate phrases and another exact duplication are found subsequently: the second exact phrasing is from a turn-of-the-century engineer writing about electricity in a city (325). [JRC]

**Painting with Words: The Calligraphy of Donald Jackson.** Minneapolis: London Link, 1988. [28] pp. [Tolkien] In 1987-88 English calligrapher Jackson executed a commission to write out the Ring verse from *The Lord of the Rings*. In doing so he made at least one preliminary sketch and twelve variations. All of these are described, and three illustrated, in the catalogue of a show of Jackson's work at the Minneapolis Institute of Arts, 16 August-16 October 1988. The three illustrated variations are vigorously modern in style, and very different from one another. [WGH]

**Patrick, James. "Introduction."** *A Christian for All Christians: Essays in Honour of C.S. Lewis*. Ed. Andrew Walker and James Patrick. London: Hodder and Stoughton (A C.S. Lewis Centre Book), 1990. 1-5, 223nn. [Barfield, Tolkien, and Williams 4.]

Patrick discusses Lewis's importance, identifying him with other men of the 1930s who felt they lived in a period of "intellectual and spiritual barbarism" and comparing him to Boethius "who, like Lewis, lived in a barbarian time, gathering up the wisdom of the past for Christ, and presenting it in ways that made it live beyond the failure of his civilisation." Only in his final paragraph does Patrick tie his praise of Lewis to the purpose of the book he is introducing. [JRC]

**Purtill, Richard L. "Did C.S. Lewis Lose His Faith?"** *A Christian for All Christians: Essays in Honour of C.S. Lewis*. Ed. Andrew Walker and James Patrick. London: Hodder and Stoughton (A C.S. Lewis Centre Book), 1990. 27-62, 224-26nn. [Tolkien 54; Williams 53-54.]

Despite some loss of organization at the end, Purtill offers a very good reply to those writers who have said that Lewis lost his Christian faith: John Beversluis in *C.S. Lewis and the Search for Rational Religion* (1985) and "Beyond the Double Bolted Door" (1985); the British TV movie on Lewis's life, *Shadowlands* (1985); and, in a different way, Humphrey Carpenter in *The Inklings* (1978). (Purtill does not mention the stage version of *Shadowlands*, which no doubt post-dates his essay.)

Beversluis has said — and the movie more indirectly suggested — that Lewis's faith was shattered by the death

of Joy Davidman, and thus his earlier arguments for a rational Christianity were proved worthless. Purtill replies by distinguishing — on the basis of an extended passage from *Mere Christianity* — between reason and faith on the one hand and imagination and emotion on the other. Purtill does not deny that Lewis's emotions were greatly upset by Davidman's death and that his imagination — as reported in *A Grief Observed* — was morbid for a while; but Purtill points to the conclusion of *A Grief Observed*, to Lewis's letters in the period between Davidman's death and his own, to the essay "On Obstinacy in Belief," and to a passage on the resurrection in *Letters to Malcolm: Chiefly on Prayer*, for evidence that Lewis had not lost his faith. (The latter two are cited later in the essay than the basic discussion of this point.)

Second, Purtill generally considers Beversluis's arguments that Lewis's arguments for Christianity are flawed. He quotes a review he wrote of Beversluis's book, finding the book seriously flawed, but more effectively he quotes a review by Thomas V. Morris, a philosopher at Notre Dame University who thinks Lewis is a better writer than philosopher; Morris also finds Beversluis lacking, particularly in tone and in depth of consideration. Within the space limits of Purtill's essay, this is quite effective. (Outside of the particular line of argument being pursued by Purtill is a very interesting statement by Morris: he refers to Lewis's argument for the divinity of Christ as given in *Mere Christianity*, saying it is "[s]ometimes known as the Lewis Trilemma" [42]; if it is famous enough to be known by such a verbal shorthand, then it obviously has been very effective. Certainly, Morris shows that Beversluis's treatment of it is inadequate.)

Third, Purtill turns to Lewis's debate with Elizabeth Anscombe over part of his argument in *Miracles*. He discusses the background of the debate in some detail and quotes various persons: George Sayer, in *Jack*, and Carpenter, in *The Inklings*, suggest that Lewis felt he was decisively defeated in the debate and was emotionally upset — and perhaps even, according to Carpenter, giving up reason as a guide (Carpenter quotes others about Lewis's reaction; Sayer quotes Lewis directly); Anscombe, in her *Collected Philosophical Papers*, Vol. 2, downplays emotional reactions, not having noticed any upset in Lewis at the time or at a subsequent social meeting, and discusses his revision of the third chapter of *Miracles*. But Purtill denies (quite correctly) that this episode has anything to do with a loss of faith generally or a lack of trust in reason as an aid to faith specifically: it was over precision of argument and the changes of the period in how philosophy was carried on. It is at this point that "On Obstinacy in Belief" is cited, to back up the point about Lewis's continued trust in reason — although the discussion immediately afterwards returns to Beversluis, and so broadens — or perhaps digresses — to the general topic of the essay.

Fourth, Purtill considers briefly "whether the case for

rational religion depends on ... Lewis's success in defending it." Purtill spends four paragraphs here, saying there are other defenders of this cause — so the logical answer is *no* — but Lewis's writing abilities make his defense particularly important, and thus Purtill has thought it worthwhile to discuss the claims of Beversluis, the movie, and Carpenter.

Purtill announced the fourth topic to be his "final" one, but next he turns, "[f]inally," to conjectures as to why some have spread "untruths about Lewis." He suggests three reasons: spiritual envy, dislike for rationality being claimed for faith, and dislike for conservative Christianity. Purtill also draws some morals for his reader at the end of the essay. [JRC]

**Rateliff, John D.** "Early Versions of *Farmer Giles of Ham*." *Leaves from the Tree: J.R.R. Tolkien's Shorter Fiction*. London: The Tolkien Society, 1991. 45-48.

A brief discussion of the manuscript versions of *Farmer Giles of Ham* with casual but insightful remarks on the story. Rateliff notes that "the tale is structured around the Oxford academic calendar" (p. 47), and that it is a Christmas tale as well as (at least in part) a parody of *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*. [WGH]

**Reynolds, Patricia.** "The Real Tom Bombadil." *Leaves from the Tree: J.R.R. Tolkien's Shorter Fiction*. London: The Tolkien Society, 1991. 85-88.

Reynolds describes a "Dutch doll" since Tolkien's character Tom Bombadil initially was derived from one. Some of Bombadil's Dutch doll-ness is apparent in *The Lord of the Rings*, in his apple-red face, thick brown hair, and distinctive clothes. The article includes a photograph of a Dutch doll in the Museum of London dressed very like Tom Bombadil. [WGH]



Scull, Christina. "Tom Bombadil and *The Lord of the Rings*." *Leaves from the Tree: J.R.R. Tolkien's Shorter Fiction*. London: The Tolkien Society, 1991. 73-77.

Scull relates Tolkien's 1934 *Oxford Magazine* poem "The Adventures of Tom Bombadil" to *The Lord of the Rings* and his 1962 *The Adventures of Tom Bombadil*, with reference to the manuscript published in *The Return of the Shadow*. She also looks briefly at sources for Tom Bombadil's adventures. [WGH]

Shippey, Tom. "Tolkien and 'The Homecoming of Beorhthoth.'" *Leaves from the Tree: J.R.R. Tolkien's Shorter Fiction*. London: The Tolkien Society, 1991. 5-16.

"Beorhthoth," "Leaf by Niggle," *Smith of Wootton Major*, and *Farmer Giles of Ham* each creates "a dialogue between a real world and a fantasy world" (p. 6) which at the same time is a dialogue between Tolkien and himself for and against using fantasy. The works are "authorisations," "written by Tolkien in order to give himself permission to write fantasy" (p. 6). Moreover, they show increasing insecurity and doubt in Tolkien whether his fantasy-writing was legitimate. In "Beorhthoth" Tolkien suggests that heroic tradition, as expressed in Old English poetry, created in the historical Beorhthoth a "diabolical pride" which led him to fight his Viking foes on even terms, with disastrous consequences. He "let them cross the causeway, so keen was he/to give minstrels matter for mighty songs," says Tolkien's character Tidwald. Shippey notes, however, that this idea is not present in *The Battle of Maldon*, which inspired "Beorhthoth," "it is purely a hypothesis or speculation by Tolkien without evidence to support it" (p. 10). Tolkien was concerned about the relationship between the Northern heroic spirit and the Christian spirit, and in "Beorhthoth" tried to discredit the former so that he could write *The Lord of the Rings* with "an alternative and Christianised image of a heroic style" (p. 15). [WGH]

Williams, Charles. "Outlines of Romantic Theology": with Which Is Reprinted "Religion and Love in Dante: the Theology of Romantic Love." Ed. and intro. by Alice Mary Hadfield. Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans, 1990. [Lewis 80, 86, 94n; Tolkien 86.]

This volume has the two titular works by Williams, together with additional matter by Hadfield. "Outlines of Romantic Theology" was written in 1924; this is its first publication. It is complete except, as Hadfield notes, for some missing quotations at one point, which Williams never supplied. "Religion and Love in Dante" was published as a pamphlet in 1941 in Britain and as a book in 1978 in the United States (the latter — Norwood, Pennsylvania: Norwood Editions — is not listed in the bibliography at the end of this volume). Hadfield provides an "Introduction: the Writing of 'Outlines of Romantic Theology'" (vii-xiv) to the earlier work, and a "Sequel" (74-88) between the two works; her accounts are primarily but not exclusively biographical. She also footnotes the first work by Williams, doing an excellent job with Biblical references and those to the Book of

Common Prayer; she does not identify a quotation from Coventry Patmore (36) or an allusion to a novel by G.K. Chesterton (39), but does identify many of the other references. In addition, as indicated above, there is a checklist, "Principal Works of Charles Williams" (112-13).

"Outlines of Romantic Theology," written after Williams had married Florence Conway in 1917 and very shortly before he fell in love with Phyllis Jones (after which Williams probably would not have written it the same way), is a discussion of "marriage" (romantic love) as being, in some sense, Christ. Although Williams adds some necessary qualifications to this statement in Chapter II, "The Principles," his comparison of marital love to the life of Jesus (Chapter III, "The New Testament in Romantic Theology") and to the celebration of the Eucharist (Chapter IV, "The Mass in Romantic Theology") illustrates the basic similarity.

Of the other four chapters in this treatise, the most important is Chapter VI (the number, no doubt by accident, is omitted), "Doctors and Documents." Williams discusses the Biblical "Song of Songs" (at the end of the chapter), Dante, Sir Thomas Mallory, John Donne (with Robert Herrick and Thomas Carew), and Coventry Patmore. Although Dante and Mallory are the bases of later non-fiction by Williams, probably Patmore is the most important at this point in Williams's development — some of Williams's early poems are in Patmore's tradition. Indeed, as the present bibliographer has suggested in a brief review of this book elsewhere, "Outlines of Romantic Theology" is likely to have been Williams's attempt to replace the *Sponsa Dei* which Patmore wrote and then destroyed.

"Religion and Love in Dante: the Theology of Romantic Love" can be considered as either a special approach to the romantic theology of the previous work or as a forerunner to *The Figure of Beatrice*, which followed it by two years — or, of course, as both. Williams surveys *La Vita Nuova* and the *Commedia* in terms of romantic love, treating, for example, the sins of the *Inferno* generally, and sometimes specifically, as distortions of romantic love. One of the oddities of Williams's emphasis is that he never clearly indicates that Paolo and Francesca were adulterers, while discussing them once and mentioning them several times more; they become for him an example of romantic love gone wrong, not of vows violated: their sin "is a too great indulgence, a too long lingering in permitted delight, a lawless concentration on each other" (100) — perhaps "lawless" is meant to suggest their breaking of vows, *The Purgatorio* Williams implies at the end is the process of becoming "adult in love" (106). "The whole of the *Paradiso* is, as might be expected, greatly beyond our common knowledge. Not until many more lovers have set themselves to follow that Way will it become known and (as far as it ever can) common" (107). Mainly, Williams, discusses the *Paradiso* as an in-godding process, which is also an in-loving.

The importance of this book is "Outlines of Romantic



Theology," since it has not been published before. To what degree it can be used to explain Williams's works — beyond some of his early marital lyrics, as noticed by Hadfield — doubtless will be explored. But the essay is interesting outside of the Williams context, both as a period piece tied to the Patmore/late Victorian celebration of domestic eros, and as a particular type of the Way of Affirmation of Images. [JRC]

**Yates, Jessica.** "The Source of 'The Lay of Aotrou and Itrou.'" *Leaves from the Tree: J.R.R. Tolkien's Shorter Fiction*. London: The Tolkien Society, 1991. 63-71.

Yates argues that Tolkien did not decide to write a poem in the form of a Breton lay, then cast about for a subject; rather, he wanted to write a version of the "Clerk Colvill" story (about a young man and a water-nymph), was intrigued by the translations he found of the analogous Breton "Lord Nann" ballad in F.J. Child's *Ballads*, and used them as the source for his poem "The Lay of Aotrou and Itrou," which he wrote in the octosyllabic form of a Breton lay. Yates shows how Tolkien reshaped the versions of "Lord Nann," in particular "Lord Nann and the Corrigan" in a collection by Hersart de la Villemarqué), to suit his own ends. [WGH]

**Vanauken, Sheldon.** "C.S. Lewis." *A Christian for All Christians: Essays in Honour of C.S. Lewis*. Ed. Andrew Walker and James Patrick. London: Hodder and Stoughton (A.C.S. Lewis Centre Book), 1990. v.

Vanauken prefaces this volume with a verse epigram on Lewis, a quatrain made up of two heroic couplets, saying that Lewis became Christlike. [JRC]

"Sailing West" Sources, *continued from page 20*  
Bitel, Lisa M. *Isle of the saints: Monastic settlement and Christian community in early Ireland*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1990.

Buechner, Frederick. *Brendan*. NY: Atheneum, 1997. (A beautifully written novel.)

Carpenter, Humphrey. *Tolkien: A biography*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1977.

Davidson, H. R. Ellis. *Gods and myths of northern Europe*. Harmondsworth, Middlesex, England: Penguin Books, Ltd., 1964.

Davidson, H. R. Ellis. *Myths and symbols in pagan Europe: early Scandinavian and Celtic religions*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1988.

Dumville, David N. "Echtrae and immram: Some problems of definition." *Eriu*, 27 (1976), pp. 73-94.

Flieger, Verlyn. *Spinterted Light: Logos and Language in Tolkien's World*. Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1983.

Hughes, Kathleen, and Ann Hamlin. *Celtic Monasticism: The Modern Traveler to the Early Irish Church*. New York: Seabury Press, 1981.

MacCulloch, John A. *The Celtic and Scandinavian Religions*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1973, 1948.

Meyer, Kuno, ed. *The Voyage of Bran son of Febal to the Land of the Living*. With an essay upon the Irish vision of the happy otherworld and the Celtic doctrine of rebirth by Alfred Nutt. New York: AMS Press, 1973, 1895.

Mowat, Farley. *Westroking: the Ancient Norse in Greenland and North America*. Boston: Little Brown & Co., 1965.

Oskamp, H. P. A. *The Voyage of Mael Duin: A study in Early Irish Voyage Literature*. Followed by an edition of *Imram curraig Maele Duin* from the Yellow Book of Lecan in Trinity College. Groningen: Wolters-Noordhoff, 1970.

Ramage, Edwin S. *Atlantis: Fact or Fiction?* Bloomington and London: Indiana University Press, 1978.

Sale, Kirkpatrick. *The Conquest of Paradise: Christopher Columbus and the Columbian Legacy*. New York: Knopf, 1990.

Selmer, Carl, editor. *Navigatio Sancti Brendani Abbatis: from Early Latin Manuscripts*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1959. (Publications in Mediaeval Studies, Volume XVI.)

Shippey, T. A. *The Road to Middle-earth*. Boston: Houghton-Mifflin Company, 1983.

Severin, Tim. *The Brendan Voyage*. NY: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1978.

Stefansson, Vilhjalmur. *Ultima Thule: Further Mysteries of the Arctic*. New York: MacMillan, 1940.

Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Book of Lost Tales, Part Two*. Edited by Christopher Tolkien. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1984. (The history of Middle-earth, II.)

Tolkien, J. R. R. "Imram." *Time and Tide*, 3 December 1955, p. 1561.

Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Lost Road and Other Writings: Language and Legend before 'The Lord of the Rings'*. Edited by Christopher Tolkien. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1987. (The History of Middle-earth, V.)

Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Monsters and the Critics and Other Essays*. Edited by Christopher Tolkien. London: George Allen & Unwin, 1983.

Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Silmarillion*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1977.

Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Tolkien Reader*. New York: Ballantine, 1966.

Webb, J. F., translator. *The Age of Bede*. Edited with an introduction by D. H. Farmer. Harmondsworth, Middlesex, England: Penguin Books Ltd, 1983, 1965. (Contains translation of *Navigatio Sancti Brendani*.)

Webb, J. F., translator. *Lives of the Saints*. Harmondsworth, Middlesex, England: Penguin Books Ltd, 1965. (Contains translation of *Navigatio Sancti Brendani*.)

## BENEFACTORS

Bene factors support the improvement and outreach of *Mythlore* making donations of \$25 or more beyond the cost of membership/subscription. For this much appreciated support they are listed for four issues. You are encouraged to become a Benefactor and show your support.

Robert Hall, Jr.  
Geoffrey F. Brenny  
Grace Funk  
Anne Osborn  
Dr. Marlene McKinley  
Angelee Anderson  
Edna Montemayor  
William Hart  
Don King

Ithaca, NY  
Buena Park, CA  
Lumby, B.C.  
Riverside, CA  
Middlesex, MA  
Westminster, CA  
Chicago, IL  
Lake Charles, LA  
Black Mountain, SC

Thank You For Your Support