The Alberta Journal of Educational Research Vol. XLVI, No. 1, Spring 2000, 36-48

Verna St. Denis
University of Saskatchewan

Indigenous Peoples, Globalization, and Education: Making Connections

This article emphasizes the importance of including Indigenous people in discussions of globalization and education. It features two narratives based on ethnographic research that I, an Indigenous person from the first world—a Cree/Metis from Saskatchewan, conducted among an Indigenous people in the third world, the Ju/'hoansi[1] from the village of /Kae/kae in the Kalahari Desert of Botswana, Africa. I build on the concept of *globalization from below* to comment on these two narratives. Globalization from below can be said to consist of "an array of transnational social forces animated by environmental concerns, human rights, hostility to patriarchy, and a vision of human community based on the unity of diverse cultures seeking an end to poverty, oppression, humiliation, and collective violence" (Brecher & Costello, 1994, p. 80). Globalization from below provides a framework for the inclusion of voices such as those of Indigenous peoples, presently marginalized in the debate on globalization. It is in this larger context of globalization that Indigenous voices must be heard and addressed, especially as these peoples presently occupy land and are in possession of both knowledge and resources that are in high demand by transnational corporations (Shiva, 1991a, 1991b). This article explores a different aspect of marginalized voices than that discussed in the large body of postcolonial literature that theorizes the effects of Diaspora on various colonized people (Bhabha, 1994; Said, 1978; Spivak, 1988). Whereas these writers explore the movement of colonial subjects into the West, in this article I support the need for Indigenous people both to join this general discussion and to speak with one another across national boundaries.

The need for developing connections between Indigenous peoples in the context of globalization is reflected in my work with the Ju/'hoansi and highlights coalition-building as an important aspect of globalization from below. As Brecher and Costello (1994) suggest, resistance to globalization by the "formation of extraordinary coalitions" is occurring, but at this time those efforts of resistance are "still highly fragmented" (p. 83). They suggest that if the various forms of resistance occurring around the world are not directed and developed under both local and international coalitions, the resulting effect is fragmentation that "is easily exploited by those who would make workforces, peoples, and communities compete with each other in the 'race to the bottom'" (Brecher & Costello, 1994, p. 84). If efforts to make stronger connections between the

---

Verna St. Denis is an assistant professor in Indian and Northern education. She is a member of Beardy's First Nation in Saskatchewan and has been both a student and faculty member of Aboriginal teacher education programs in Saskatchewan. She is currently a doctoral candidate at Stanford University School of Education in social sciences in education.

various forms of resistance to globalization are not pursued, then it is likely that Indigenous people and those from the third world will continue to have their resources and land exploited.

The notion of a "community of sentiment" (Appadurai, 1996) provides another way to frame the experience of an Indigenous person from the first world in dialogue with Indigenous people from the third world. In discussions of the detrimental effects of globalization on the West and in an effort to respond to the necessity of building coalitions from below, Appadurai, a postcolonialist theorist from India, writes about the productive potential of developing a community of sentiment. Appadurai suggests that "imagination is the staging ground for action" (p. 7) and a community of sentiment is a "group that begins to imagine and feel things together ... capable of moving from shared imagination to collective action" (p. 8). Developing a community of sentiment that enables collective action is necessary for initiating concerted actions to counteract the negative effects of globalization. At the same time, this community of sentiment recognizes that globalization is inevitable and in fact has been going on for some time. Colonized and Indigenous people have been dealing for a long time with many of the currently identified effects of globalization, such as seizure of their lands and their resources, and their confinement into structures of cheap labor. Therefore, any consideration of globalization and its effects would benefit from understanding these people who have already experienced such effects, and my article seeks to contribute to that understanding.

Narrative Method

This article is based on ethnographic research I conducted in 1989 among the Ju/'hoansi. The article features a narrative of two stories. Both stories offer an example of developing a community of sentiment across first and third world members as well as an example of globalization from below. The first story, entitled "Call me by my Ju/'hoan name," describes a dialogue I had with a group of Ju/'hoansi about similar histories of oppression and contemporary struggles among Indigenous people. The second story, entitled "The school owns our dance," considers impacts of a national policy of multiculturalism as practiced through public education. Here the contradictory effects a multicultural policy can have on already marginalized peoples are discussed.

Given the many changes in recent years regarding the production of ethnographic texts, it is no longer possible to take for granted what is meant by ethnography (Denzin, 1997). Increasingly the position of the ethnographer has come under scrutiny. As ethnographers have begun including themselves in a more obvious manner in their ethnographic writing, critics have suggested this form of experimental writing is "narcissistic, overly reflexive, and not scientific" (p. xv). But as is increasingly acknowledged, "ethnographic texts are always dialogical—the site at which the voices of the other, alongside the voices of the author, come alive and interact with one another" (p. xiii). Other researchers have suggested that reflective awareness with others provides opportunities for deepened relations (Witherell & Noddings, 1991) and that a focus on the personal nature of action and interaction can prepare the ground for access into broader social contexts (Goodson & Walker, 1991, p. 3)

The development of narrative research emphasizes and respects the knowledge imparted in stories and created through the process of storytelling and the sharing of experience. In this framework of knowledge production, "stories are recognized as a significant way of understanding human experience" (Witherell & Noddings, 1991, p. 3). Clandinin and Connelly (1990), two advocates of narrative research, define it as "the making of meaning from personal experience via a process of reflection in which storytelling is the key element" (p. 245). This notion of narrative research is also more reflective of Indigenous communities' way of relating to "knowledge." The importance of stories and one's life experiences and the effort to make sense from these, both individually and collectively, is still highly valued with Indigenous communities as ways to know and understand ourselves and the world (Cajete, 1994; Kawagley, 1995; Smith, 1999).

Although an increasing number of Indigenous people are trained as anthropologists, I was not one at the time of this 1989 research among the Ju/'hoansi. When we embarked on that research, I had just just completed my master's thesis, which explores the practice and principles of community-based participatory research among Indigenous people (St. Denis, 1989, 1992). I had feelings of ambivalence about the proposed Ju/'hoan research as my own thesis had explored the need for research to come from and benefit the people for whom the research is about. I realized that this basic principle of community-based research had been breached in that the focus and purpose had already been determined in the proposal for its funding. The proposed research could become another example of outsiders deciding, despite good intentions and sensitivity, what was good for Indigenous people, and as an Indigenous person I realized I should have known better. Once in the Kalahari I remained uncomfortable with the power we had as international researchers who had relatively easy access to researching in Ju/'hoan communities. As I now look back on that research, I realize I was both an outsider and insider, a researcher and an Indigenous person who shared some historical and contemporary struggles with the Ju/hoansi.

A Context for the Ju/'hoan Narratives

The following description of the sociohistorical context for the two narratives presented in this article is derived from a number of sources. A primary source is *Healing Makes Our Hearts Happy*, a book I co-authored (Katz, Biesele, & St. Denis, 1997), which reports the results of the 1989 research project in which I participated and during which the narratives were collected.[2] This National Science Foundation funded research project exploring recent changes among the Ju/'hoansi focused more particularly on the Ju/'hoan healing tradition and its relationship to various forms of social change occurring over the past 20 years. My two research colleagues and co-authors, Biesele who is fluent in the Ju/'hoansi language and Katz, my husband, have between them a number of years of experience working in the Kalahari and writing about the Ju/'hoansi, and both have been widely published (Biesele, 1993; Katz, 1982). Additional sources for this discussion of sociohistorical context are the writings of other anthropological researchers who have worked in the Kalahari with the Ju/'hoansi (Lee, 1979, 1993; Lee, Biesele, & Hitchcock, 1996).

The Ju/'hoansi are a group of Bushmen living in the western Kalahari Desert of Botswana and Namibia. The specific locale of the research project was in northwestern Botswana in the village of /Kae/kae, which has a population of approximately 200. The term *Bushman* has been used in the past by outsiders to refer derogatorily to the Ju/'hoansi, but today younger and more political Ju/'hoansi are using the term to refer to themselves. They draw on the original connotation of Bushmen, meaning an "independent and untamed" people, suggesting that term can be ennobled by how Ju/'hoansi choose to use it (Katz et al., 1997).

Until recently Ju/'hoansi lived primarily as hunter-gatherers, relying on the naturally occurring plants and animals around them, while accumulating little in the way of material possessions. Their often complex religious practices and social structures served their small groups' needs effectively. They have drawn on a great fund of environmental knowledge about Kalahari Desert ecology to produce a reliable and healthy, if spare, subsistence for themselves. Even today they continue to use literally hundreds of plant, animal, and insect species on a rotational basis through the seasons, although this is beginning to change.

Today the way of life of the Ju/'hoansi is undergoing increasing rapid and dramatic change, and not just in the obvious sense of their ability to hunt and gather. In a more subtle and pervasive sense their ability to maintain the spiritual and communal values that nourish and are nourished by their hunting and gathering approach to subsistence are under stress. Ju/'hoan attempts to forge new means for securing necessary resources meet obstacle upon obstacle. The threats and obstacles come from many factors, not least of which is a massive loss of land. More and more Ju/'hoansi have been forced to settle as landless and often unemployed squatters, either around other people's camps for grazing and watering cattle or around government centers.

In the last 30 or so years, the Ju/'hoansi have seen accelerations in the processes of change they were already experiencing as a result of outside pressures that began in the 1870s with the arrival of colonial explorers and the Herero and Tswana, pastoral peoples seeking land for seasonal grazing. The grazing activities of the Herero and Tswana, cattle-keeping agricultural people who each speak one of the Bantu languages, have had time to make a significant impact both on the local and sand veld ecology and on politics. In recent years, the Ju/'hoansi have begun to keep domestic stock and to plant gardens and fields, although still on a small scale. They have found it increasingly necessary to replace their extensive economy of hunting and gathering, which requires a large land area, with more intensive economies so they can continue to live on a land-base that is dwindling.

Growing legal and political disenfranchisement and an extremely repressive land tenure situation have made life for the Ju/'hoansi gradually less and less secure. Government practices of bringing Ju/'hoan people into the "mainstream"—through a series of interventions it defines as acts of "progress"—has led to further attacks on Ju/'hoan culture, such as forcing Ju/'hoan children to accept schooling either in a language not their own or no schooling at all. Newly introduced technologies such as machinery to dig wells, plows, and mechanical ground transport have had a major impact on the Kalahari ecosystem. Powerful cattle syndicates, using modern machinery to drill for the water needed to feed their livestock, have almost squeezed the Ju/'hoansi out of the land they once ranged as hunter-gatherers. The Ju/'hoansi of today find themselves in a situation in which the government and other outside forces increasingly control their lives. "We used to direct ourselves, but now the government directs us" says Kxao, a respected older man, who with his wife, is one of the most economically progressive Ju/'hoan families (Katz et al., 1997, p. 29).

When it gained independence from Great Britain in 1966, Botswana made a lasting commitment to regard all ethnic groups as legally "equal," and gave no land or resource tenure protection to groups unable to establish these land rights for themselves. In practice, this meant that groups with a strong central authority—for the most part pastoralists like the Tswana and Herero—received license to expand as far as they were able, often into areas historically used by Ju/'hoansi and other Bushmen. Coupled with the Ju/'hoansi's relative unfamiliarity with the European practices of land tenure adopted by Botswana and their long history of an egalitarian group structure, this has meant that the Ju/'hoansi have been effectively excluded from securing land (Lee et al., 1996).

In recent years Tswana and Herero expansion has created a new level of outside pressure on what were once regarded as isolated places like /Kae/kae. Because of /Kae/kae remoteness, the Tswana and Herero presence grew slowly over a number of decades. But the growing gulf between the Ju/'hoan people and the Tswana, the ruling ethnic group, as well as the Herero, the large cattle owners of their area, has given many Ju/'hoansi pause for thought about the viability of their own traditions in a change era. /Kaece, a man with a lot of experience working for Hereros, offered his pointed and poignant assessment: "If you work for a Herero, he calls you *matjuange*, which means 'my son.' That is your death sentence!" (Katz at al., 1997, p. 34).

One of the many ways harmony and consensus had been long maintained in Ju/'hoan society is the community healing dance (Katz, 1982). Historically, for the Ju/'hoansi the healing dance symbolized an entire way of life, one in which their knowledge, strength, and willingness to help one another asserted a secure sense of cultural identity. "N/om is our thing. It is a Ju/'hoan thing," states /Oma Djo, an experienced and respected healer. The healing dance has provided a social outlet for tensions, a spiritual vehicle for reinforcing the group's mutual reliance on one another, and a sense of place in their environment. The dance is celebratory, solidifying, and deeply healing, and all within earshot join in. While people with specific sicknesses may be healed, all those participating can experience a sense of joy, renewed social commitment, and spiritual connectedness.

Today, like other aspects of their life, the dance is increasingly under multiple stresses. Its future as a community healing vehicle can no longer be unquestionably assumed. Yet the dance continues, offering healing to the people. "N/om is just the same as long ago, even though it keeps on changing," says /Oma Djo (Katz et al., 1997, p. 47). Similarly, many important Ju/'hoan values, beliefs, and ceremonies persist from earlier times when hunting and gathering was more prevalent, even as they change.

The irony of the sociopolitical situation of the Ju/'hoansi is that they live as Indigenous people in the context of the third world, a third world populated by

Tswana and Herero who are themselves recovering from their own particular history of being colonized by the British and Germans respectively. But this is not the only irony evident among less politically and economically powerful groups. We must also pay attention to the potential of a hierarchy forming among Indigenous groups, whether from the third world or first world. This potential existed in my case, a first world Indigenous person who has the opportunity and privilege to travel and study among third world Indigenous people and who has the resources to represent them in the form of writing and scholarly works.

"Call me by my Ju/'hoan name"

I now tell the story of an experience I shared with the Ju/'hoansi. During our ongoing discussions with the people of /Kae/kae about their political situation, I would mention similar experiences with Indigenous First Nations peoples in Canada. As an Indigenous person who does research on and teaches about the historical and contemporary struggles of First Nations peoples, I spoke from both a personal and an academic perspective. This was a rare opportunity for those at /Kae/kae to hear first hand from an Indigenous person about other Indigenous peoples in a different part of the world. Although the thought of First Nations peoples may have seemed familiar to them as I compared and offered comments about common political struggles we shared as Indigenous peoples, I also realized that Canada, whose snow was practically impossible to describe in the heat of the Kalahari, remained a distant notion, and in part so did the First Nations peoples I talked about.

Many at /Kae/kae wanted to hear more. We set up a time for me to talk at length about First Nations peoples; everyone was invited, with a special effort extended to the healers we were working with and their spouses. I was excited about the opportunity we would have during that gathering to highlight what I regarded as the struggle we shared as Indigenous peoples, and that thought gave me strength and hope. With the time of the gathering approaching, I thought about ways to connect concretely with the Ju/'hoansi so that I could convey what I saw as our common experiences. Knowing that First Nations peoples in Canada shared a powerful history with Ju/'hoansi as hunters and gatherers as well as participants in the trading of hides and furs initiated through the colonization of our respective lands, I took out a pair of beaded moccasins, some beaded earrings, and a tape of powwow music I had brought with me. Maybe these artifacts of my culture would help them hear my words. As the Ju/'hoansi gathered in our camp, I saw that most of them were elders and I thought to myself, "Who am I, as a child, to address these elders?" Yet I was pleased they had come.

"Just as you have lived here in the Kalahari long before others arrived," I began, "so did my ancestors live in North America long before the Europeans came. And just as you live as hunters and gatherers, so too have my people." I talked about the animals we hunted, how all parts of the animals were used, and the respect given the animals. Then I took out the moccasins and described their construction from pieces of hide and sinew. "This was one way we used the animals," I said. People leaned forward to examine the moccasins as they were passed around the group. They touched the stitching, carefully tracing its pattern. Murmurs spread through the group, expressing a collective appreciation and a specific admiration for the actual fingers that sewed those moccasins. A new level of interest had emerged throughout the group; First Nations peoples in Canada became alive. Xumi N!a'an was the first to speak. "Oh, can it be," he exclaimed excitedly, "that there are people, even in Canada, that are like us!"

I further elaborated that "the sinew used to sew these moccasins was taken from along the spine of large animals, like the moose, somewhat similar in size to the wildebeest or eland you hunt." That brought further enthusiastic comments because sinew among the Ju/'hoansi is obtained from the same source, the long back sinews of those antelopes. "You also have warm-blooded animals, with skins like our animals, even in that cold place where you live?" several Ju/'hoansi asked at once. The discussion about sinew raised further meanings into our gathering because Ju/'hoansi feel that sinew is quintessential to their culture, serving as a metaphor for what it is that connects people, holds the fabric of life together, and makes us human. At this moment the Ju/'hoansi saw themselves as related to First Nations peoples, who at first seemed so far away.

Then, turning to the beaded earrings, which I passed around, I spoke about the arrival of Europeans in Canada and how they exchanged beads for furs. I detailed the oppressive trading relationship that was established and the eventual colonization of First Nations people and their land. Then I touched on how First Nations peoples have resisted this physical and spiritual invasion. The Ju/'hoansi remained involved in the discussion. I then became concerned about raising unrealistic expectations about the possibility of immediate change as well as realizing just how difficult the challenges are for any kind of political and economic change to occur among Indigenous peoples. I carried on talking more about the sociopolitical history of First Nations peoples, emphasizing their struggles and their aspirations.

For example, I described the pass and permit system, which regulated the movement and economic activity of First Nations peoples up to the 1950s, as well the numerous hunting and fishing restrictions now in place; and we made a connection to the hunting licenses and other restrictions that have recently come to /Kae/kae. I detailed the changes that residential schools and Christian missionaries wrought, robbing the people of their language and culture and forever changing their lives; and here we talked about the plans for a residential school for the /Kae/kae children. The Ju/'hoansi listened, their faces showing their gratitude. I felt humbled by the commitment and fullness of their response.

They were hearing "their story"; they were learning of their brothers and sisters in Canada, of the common struggle of Indigenous peoples. The parallels in the history of our two peoples were striking, but not really remarkable. The oppression at the hands of those who came to our respective places, seizing our lands, exploiting our resources such as furs and hides, and attempting to "civilize" us through church and schools was hauntingly similar. While I spoke, people nodded in agreement, offering at times descriptions of their own history to cement the solidarity of experience. It was disheartening to see and hear once again of the exploitation of Indigenous people.

Toward the end of our gathering, I spoke more about the emotional effects of the residential schools and how they separated children from their mothers and fathers, causing untold pain and contributing to the breakdown of families, and how the widespread use of corporal punishment and other forms of abuse left deep emotional scars. Then Xumi N!a'an, though a strong supporter of the recently established day school at /Kae/kae, passionately expressed his displeasure with the school's use of corporal punishment, which exists in stark contrast to the more nurturant Ju/'hoan style of discipline.

I returned to the growing realization among First Nations peoples of the importance of our languages, healing traditions, and community ceremonies in reclaiming our culture and our land. To provide a concrete example of similarities in our ceremonies, I played some powwow music. At first, people sat totally still, transfixed by the intensely spiritual tone of the lead singer and the strong, chantlike singing of the rest of the drum group that was playing the powwow songs. Then excited conversations broke out as people remarked on how much this sounded like their own healing dance. They were appreciative of the connection. Xuni N!a'an, one of /Kae/kae's best drum-makers, put some of this excitement into words: "These [First Nations] people hunt; we already know that. Now we see they also have a spiritual dance and they're passionate about it. These people [singing] are working, working really hard. There is strength in that music. It's different from ours ... but it is also like our healing dance music."

I felt satisfied realizing that a deep connection had been made as we moved surely and swiftly beyond a superficial display of cultural artifacts. The moccasins, beadwork, and now the powwow music took on real political and spiritual meaning as they were shared with a people who knew similar items as important parts of their lives. I wished these /Kae/kae people could meet other Indigenous people in the world, whom they could both be inspired by and inspire. My final words at the meeting were about specific political and legal ways First Nations peoples were reclaiming their land and insisting on political and legal representation at all levels of government. I wanted to end on a positive and, I hoped, a helpful note.

As the gathering was about to disperse, an older, usually quiet man, gained the group's attention. He spoke about his attempt to better himself and his family by raising goats and farming and how difficult it was to keep the traditional Ju/'hoan sharing ethic alive with these "new" subsistence activities. A woman, who liked what he said and how he spoke, wished to affirm his thoughts. "What Kodinyau just said is true," she offered, using the man's Herero name. Many Ju/'hoansi are given Herero names when they work for the Hereros, and those names tend to stick with the person. Kodinyau looked at her, reflected for a moment, and then without rancor but with great pride said, "Call me by my Ju/'hoan name. Call me Kxao, not by my Herero name."

The imposition of foreign names on less powerful people has been a common practice by which those in positions of economic and political power have asserted their domination. For example, the term *Indian,* used to refer to Indigenous peoples throughout North and South America, has until recently effectively erased Indigenous peoples' own way of naming and identifying themselves. And the term *Bushmen* to refer to the Ju/hoansi has been used to signify them as "wild," "uncivilized" and "primitive." The ability to rename a people has been an effective practice of "othering," of defining a people beyond the pale (Butler, 1993).

The reclaiming of Indigenous names by Indigenous peoples is increasingly a common form of resistance and an act of cultural and personal affirmation and political liberation. Names are still important for Indigenous people, their meanings rich and varied. Special names are often given in naming ceremonies that connect one to the spirit world. As well, ordinary names remain important in kinship, telling us who we are by telling us how we are related to each other. The ability to name oneself is an indicator of power, the power to determine how one is represented to oneself and to the world.

Later that day I reflected further on the old man's request: "Call me by my Ju/'hoan name" and realized that by that single gesture Kxao was connecting himself and his people to the worldwide struggle of Indigenous peoples for their lands, their culture, and their spiritual lives. I thought again about how wonderful it would be if /Kae/kae Ju/'hoansi could meet other Indigenous people and strengthen their own determination in sharing their stories and struggles. And I knew such meetings were inevitable and necessary, particularly in a world where globalization is accelerating. Having been at various international meetings of Indigenous peoples, I could hear some of the exchange that would probably occur. The land would remain the foundation of that exchange. "Our land is our life"—this is a fundamental vision shared by Indigenous peoples throughout the world.

"The school owns our dance"

The second story I would like to tell involves a look at how a policy of multiculturalism, despite its good intentions, can have contradictory effects. Beginning in the late 1960s and early 1970s as part of an international trend, particularly by those countries organized under the Commonwealth, official national policies of multiculturalism were increasingly adopted. In Canada the policy of multiculturalism has contributed to the depoliticization of the political claims of groups such as the French in Quebec and Aboriginal peoples. A national policy of multiculturalism reduces cultural groups to a common denominator of participating in activities involving food, dance, and song in annual folkfests whose form becomes decontextualized from political claims (Legare, 1995).

In Botswana the national policy of multiculturalism has also been manifested in a national traditional dance competition organized through public schools. In the early 1980s the deputy headmistress at the /Kae/kae school, a Tswana woman, began working with a school club whose activities included performing traditional dances. The headmaster, also a Tswana, encouraged her to enter the club's dance troupe in Botswana's traditional ethnic dance competitions. The /Kae/kae group was eventually named the /Uihaba Dancers after famous caves near the village.

When the dance group was first formed and entered the government competitions, people of /Kae/kae, especially the Ju/'hoansi, were quite pleased. Wearing traditional Ju/'hoan dance clothing complete with leather garments, beadwork, and dance rattles, the troupe performed dances based on the traditional Ju/'hoan healing dance. The songs were based on both Ju/'hoan healing and initiation songs. However, there was no healing in the dance, nor any !aia (enhanced state of consciousness) or behavioral imitations of the !aia experience. As Xumi said, "There is no n/om (spiritual energy) in that /Uihaba dance. It's meant only as a dance." The troupe included both Ju/'hoan and Herero dancers. Ju/'hoan healers and other elders played an important role in instructing the troupe.

The /Uihaba Dancers, who expressed the beauty and vitality of Ju/'hoan traditions, gave particular pride to the Ju/'hoansi at /Kae/kae. In 1986 the !Uihaba Dancers won at the district level, at the regional level, and then amazingly at the national level. They went all the way to the national finals and won first prize, which given the tiny size of /Kae/kae was a singular achievement. The people's pride expanded, and their joy was overwhelming.

With this new-found status and pride, the dance troupe and what it signified seemed to begin turning in a different direction. The Tswana teacher, who had always had institutional control over the dance troupe, now began exerting more pervasive control. Recalling her early involvement with the troupe, the deputy headmistress said that, "assisted" by several Ju/'hoansi, she "began by improving upon the traditional Ju/'hoan dance and thereby perfected it." By 1989 the Ju/'hoansi were no longer even assistants. Their presence had become peripheral. !Xoan and her husband Tshao N!aian, who were central figures in teaching the original dance troupe, were no longer consulted. "That Tswana teacher doesn't know how to sing the songs," lamented !Xoan. Furthermore, Herero school children were no longer in the group. The special pride the Ju/'hoansi felt in seeing children from this usually dominating ethnic group wear Ju/'hoan garments and perform a Ju/'hoan dance was dissipated.

In addition, the school, that had commissioned some of the finest dance regalia for the yearly national school dance competitions would not, to the dismay of the Ju/'hoansi, make these regalia available for actual village healing dances. Finally, those Ju/'hoan people who had eagerly supported the !Uihaba Dancers expressed concern about the school keeping the prize money won by the troupe in the competition. "Shouldn't we people, we who dance that dance, shouldn't we be getting some of that money ... we who need it so much?" Xumi N!a'an's angry question had a receptive audience among those gathered at his campfire. In fact when several schoolchildren requested some dance rattles for the next school competition, Xumi N!a'an refused to offer his. As he considered the way the school had taken over instruction of the dance and kept dance regalia and prize money for itself, Xumi N!a'an's anger was clear: "The school owns our dance. It is no longer ours."

Xumi N!a'an is a respected elder who is dedicated to improving conditions for Ju/'hoan people through schooling. His son, Tshao Xumi, is one of the few Ju/'hoansi who have graduated from the /Kae/kae school and one of five in the region who have attained Junior Certificate status. The son often speaks about the importance of his father's support in his educational achievements. Other respected members of the Ju/'hoan community are beginning to share Xumi N!a'an's concerns about the role and purpose of the school. In resistance, he suggests that the Ju/'hoansi will continue dancing for themselves, implying that the school does not own the n/om—the spiritual energy of the dance.

Conclusion

These stories of indigenous peoples and their imperiled conditions are connected to globalization and education in important ways, for example, providing documentation of the formation of a community of sentiment and the creation of possibilities for globalization from below. But I have no illusions about research endeavors of the kind I discuss in this article—they will benefit me more than the Ju/'hoansi. I am not, nor do I see myself, as a player in the arena of international Indigenous politics. But I now appreciate the value of sharing one person's experiences in making connections between disparate but related Indigenous communities. Documenting a community of sentiment has the potential to offer mutual inspiration and support.

Globalization and its potential impact on public education in a democratic society is connected to the condition of Indigenous peoples in other ways. To develop this analysis it is necessary to explore the potential negative impact of globalization on education within the general phenomenon of globalization (Moll, 1997). For example, Kuehn (1997) identifies three related themes that characterize globalization: unrestrained global competition; potential restrictions on democracy; and possible distortions of the social purposes of education toward a too-close relationship to the economy, "converting community values to values of the market," and making students "human capital to be prepared for 'global competition'" (p. 71). All these trends combined can negatively affect all world citizens, but Indigenous people seem particularly vulnerable because they are presently marginalized in the political and economic world order. To invite Indigenous people into the arena of global competition against the background of colonization and neo-colonization that cuts them off from the resources needed to compete can serve to perpetuate the status quo.

The potential challenges of addressing the particular marginalization of Indigenous peoples can be inferred from Kuehn (1997), who argues that globalization pushes to the side the social, cultural, and ethical goals of education. I suggest that in this trend, the demands that Indigenous peoples make on inclusion in educational curriculum, can be seen as being in opposition with demands to produce a citizenry who can participate in global competition. The emergence of a "politics of resentment" (Moll, 1997) becomes more likely, encouraging a climate of resentment toward marginalized groups in our society "because they might have an equal chance at a job" (p. 8) or because they are intent on claiming space in education curriculum.

What is necessary in the context of such a politics of resentment is "to direct our efforts to the conditions of communication and knowledge production that prevail, calculating not only who can speak and how they are likely to be heard but also how we know what we know and the interest we protect through our knowing" (Razack, 1998, p. 10). In other words, rather than moving away from social and cultural analysis of how inequality is reproduced, we must continue to provide analysis of practices of domination and how these function both locally and globally. So in the example of the /Uihaba dance troupe, although it is fine to participate in educational practices that aim to celebrate cultural differences, Razack suggests that the "culturalization of differences [can] mask relations of power and enable dominant groups to maintain their innocence, even while such [a] construct simultaneously empowers subordinate groups" (p. 17). Certainly there have been no visible changes in the status and power of the Ju/'hoansi at /Kae/kae; they remain politically and economically marginalized in a state committed to multiculturalism.

Winner (1997) suggests that what is "needed instead is a vision of education strongly connected to the enduring needs, concerns and increasingly urgent problems of society as a whole, especially to people left behind by the upheavals involved in building a twenty-first century economy" (p. 184). Indigenous peoples can no longer be left behind by these upheavals, nor exploited at the expense of maintaining the economic and educational order of the first world. Kuehn (1997) suggests that "in the face of globalization, we must not let ourselves be overwhelmed. The alternative is to keep focused on the politics of possibility" (p. 75). To this end,

> a pressing task in our time is to think about our global society—its strengths, virtues, needs, and current troubles—in ways that involve all people living on the planet. We must seek to understand how other people around the world experience the kinds of problems that engage our attention at home. Rather than compete with them in a race to the bottom, we need to join with them in asking some down-to-earth questions: What kinds of economy should be organized to meet the needs of everyday life? How should democracies act to realize a decent, sustainable future? (Winner, 1997, p. 186)

To "involve all people living on the planet," to understand how others experience the problems "that engage our attention at home," persons from the presently dominant groups have the responsibility to learn more about the challenges that face marginalized groups like Indigenous people and understand how dominant groups are often implicated in that marginalization. As Razack (1998) suggests, "The challenge of radical education becomes how to build critical consciousness about how we, as subjects, position ourselves as innocent through the use of such markers as identity as good activist" (p. 18). Given the different challenges for the diverse groups of people negatively affected by globalization, the potential of productively meeting those challenges can benefit from a concept like globalization from below, which fueled by communities of sentiment can redirect the emphasis of globalization toward a sustainable future where solidarity can include opposing forms of domination while advancing social justice in a global ecology.

Notes

1. What follows is a brief explanation of Ju/'hoan language excerpted from Katz, Biesele, and St. Denis (1997). The Ju/'hoan alphabet is similar to the English one, except that it has four extra consonants for "clicking" sounds. Each of these clicks is as precise a tool for Ju/'hoan speakers as, for example, our letter b is to us. The clicks are sounds produced with an ingressive air stream when the tongue is drawn sharply away from the roof of the mouth at four specific points of articulation described below. The dental click ("/") sounds like "tsk, tsk," the English expression of irritation. It is made by putting the tongue just behind the front teeth. The alveolar click ("=") is a soft pop made by putting tongue just behind the ridge located behind the front teeth. The alveolo-palatal click ("!") is a sharp pop made by drawing the tongue down quickly from the roof of the mouth. The lateral click ("//") is a clucking sound like that made in English to urge on a horse.

2. The ethnographic sections of this article, including the two stories, are based on material from Katz, Biesele, and St. Denis (1997), for which I had primary authorial responsibility.

References

Appadurai, A. (1996). *Modernity at large: Cultural dimensions of globalization.* Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.

Biesele, M. (1993). *Women like meat: The folklore and foraging ideology of the Kalahari Ju/'hoan.* Johannesburg: University of Witwatersrand Press; and Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

Bhabha, H. (1994). *The location of culture.* New York: Routledge.

Brecher, J., & Costello, T. (1994). *Global village or global pillage: Economic reconstruction from the bottom up.* Boston, MA: South End Press.

Butler, J. (1993). *Bodies that matter: On the discursive limits of "sex."* New York: Routledge.

Cajete, G. (1994). *Look to the mountain: An ecology of Indigenous education.* Durango CO: Kivaki Press.

Clandinin, J.D., & Connelly, M.F. (1990). Narrative, experience and the study of curriculum. *Cambridge Journal of Education, 20,* 241-253.

Denzin, N.K. (1997). *Interpretive ethnography: Ethnographic practices for the 21st century.* Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Falk, R. (1993). The making of global citizenship. In J. Brecher, J. Brown Childs & J. Cutler (Eds.), *Global visions: Beyond the new world order.* Boston, MA: South End Press.

Goodson, I.F., & Walker, R. (1991). *Biography, identity and schooling: Episodes in educational research.* London: Falmer Press.

Katz, R. (1982). *Boiling energy: Community healing among the Kalahari Kung.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Katz, R., Biesele, M., & St. Denis, V. (1997). *Healing makes our hearts happy: Spirituality and cultural transformation among the Kalahari Ju/'hoansi.* Rochester, NY: Inner Traditions.

Kawagley, O.A. (1995). *A Yupiaq worldview: A pathway to ecology and spirit.* Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press.

Kuehn, L. (1997). Globalization, trade agreements, and education. In M. Moll (Ed.), *Tech high globalization and the future of Canadian education: A collection of critical perspectives on social, cultural and political dilemmas* (pp. 65-75). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Lee, R.B. (1979). *The !Kung San: Men, women, and work in a foraging society.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Lee, R.B. (1993). *The Dobe Ju/hoansi* (2nd ed.). Fort Worth, TX: Harcourt Brace.

Lee, R.B., Biesele, M., & R. Hitchcock. (1996). Thirty years of ethnographic research among the Ju/hoansi of northwestern Botswana: 1963-1993. *Botswana Notes and Records, 28.*

Legare, E. (1995). Canadian multiculturalism and Aboriginal people: Negotiating a place in the nation. *Identities* 1(4), 347-366.

Moll, M. (1997). (Ed.). *Tech high globalization and the future of Canadian education: A collection of critical perspectives on social, cultural and political dilemmas.* Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Razack, S. (1998). *Looking white people in the eye: Gender, race, and culture in the courtrooms and classrooms.* Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Said, E. (1978). *Orientalism.* London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Shiva, V. (1991a). *The violence of the green revolution: Third world agriculture, ecology and politics.* London: Zed Books.

Shiva, V. (1991b). *Biodiversity: Social and ecological perspectives.* London: Zed Books.

Spivak, G. (1988). *In other worlds: Essays in cultural politics.* New York: Routledge.

St. Denis, V. (1989). *A process of community-based participatory research: A case study.* Unpublished master's thesis, University of Alaska Fairbanks.

St. Denis, V. (1992). Community-based participatory research: Aspects of the concept relevant for practice. *Native Studies Review* 8(2), 51-74.

Smith, L.A. (1999). *Decolonizing methodologies: Research and Indigenous peoples.* London: Zed Books.

Winner, L. (1997). The handwriting on the wall: Resisting technoglobalism's assault on education. In M. Moll (Ed.), *Tech high globalization and the future of Canadian education: A collection of critical perspectives on social, cultural and political dilemmas* (pp. 167-188). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Witherell, C., & Noddings, N. (1991). Prologue: An invitation to our readers. In C. Witherell & N. Noddings (Eds.), *Stories lives tell: Narrative and dialogue in education* (pp. 1-12). New York: Teachers College Press.