UNIVERSITI TEKNIKAL MALAYSIA MELAKA

3D INTRINSIC SCENE CHARACTERISTICS EXTRACTION FRAMEWORK FOR A SINGLE IMAGE

HABIBULLAH AKBAR

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

2016

HABIBULLAH AKBAR **DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY** **2016**

UNIVERSITI TEKNIKAL MALAYSIA MELAKA

Faculty of Information and Communication Technology

3D INTRINSIC SCENE CHARACTERISTICS EXTRACTION FRAMEWORK FOR A SINGLE IMAGE

Habibullah Akbar

Doctor of Philosophy

2016

3D INTRINSIC SCENE CHARACTERISTICS EXTRACTION FRAMEWORK FOR A SINGLE IMAGE

HABIBULLAH AKBAR

A thesis submitted
in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Faculty of Information and Communication Technology

UNIVERSITI TEKNIKAL MALAYSIA MELAKA

2016

DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis entitled "3D Intrinsic Scene Characteristics Extraction Framework for a Single Image" is the result of my own research except as cited in the references. The thesis has not been accepted for any degree and is not concurrently submitted in candidature of any other degree.

Signature :

Name : Habibullah Akbar

Date :

APPROVAL

I hereby declare that I have read this thesis and, in my opinion, this thesis is sufficient in terms of scope and quality for the award of Doctor of Philosophy.

Signature :

Supervisor Name : Prof. Dr. Nanna Suryana Herman

Date :

DEDICATION

To my beloved mother, father, wife, daughter and sons

ABSTRACT

Three-Dimensional (3D) shape reconstruction is an important area of computer vision research because it has numerous potential applications from entertainment production to industrial inspection and clinical analysis. Existing 3D Intrinsic Scene Characteristics (3D-ISCs) extraction methods for a single image have focused solely on estimating diffuse characteristics, i.e. 3D shape, illumination, and reflectance models, of an object. As a result, they have neglected the specular characteristic, the shiny areas of a glossy surface. In reality, many real-world objects emit both specular and diffuse reflections, and thus the specular component may decrease the performance of the 3D-ISCs methods. This study has developed a framework to extract all of these characteristics. The framework combines a Specular Removal (SR) method and a Shape, Illumination, and Reflectance From Shading (SIRFS) method under a Bidirectional Reflectance Distribution Function (BRDF) model. Since the previous SR methods suffered from hue-saturation ambiguity, they are not suitable for this framework. To solve this problem, two SR methods were developed, evaluated, and compared with the standard SR methods. The proposed SR methods are referred as Chaotic Segmentation (CS) and Sparse Coding (SC) methods. To combine the SR and SIRFS methods, two BRDF models were also developed, evaluated, and compared. These models are referred as Modified Dichromatic Reflectance (MDR) and Modified Blinn-Phong (MBP) models. The performances of the proposed SR methods and the BRDF models for extracting 3D-ISCs were evaluated based on public datasets. The results showed that the SC method was more satisfactory compared to the CS and the benchmark method (iterative method). The accuracies of the diffuse and specular characteristics were improved by 7.6% and 53.5% respectively. Moreover, the combination of SC method and MDR model was capable of outperforming the SIRFS method. The computational speed was 19.2% faster. Meanwhile, the average accuracies of depth, surface normal, illumination, shading, and reflectance were improved by 11.4%, 6.5%, 50.5%, 35.2%, and 5.1% respectively. This study indicates that the specular reflection is an important aspect of 3D reconstruction from a single image. The proposed framework has also made considerable improvements in terms of accuracy and computational time of extracting 3D-ISCs.

ABSTRAK

Pembinaan semula bentuk Tiga-Dimensi (3D) merupakan bidang penting dalam penyelidikan visi komputer kerana ia mempunyai banyak aplikasi yang berpotensi daripada pengeluaran hiburan kepada pemeriksaan industri dan analisis klinikal. Kewujudan kaedah-kaedah pengekstrakan Ciri-ciri Paparan Instrinsik 3D (CPI-3D) untuk imej tunggal hanya tertumpu kepada ciri-ciri peresapan seperti model bentuk 3D, pencahayaan dan pembalikan sesuatu objek. Kaedah-kaedah ini mengabaikan ciri spekular (kawasan permukaan objek yang berkilat). Dalam keadaan realiti, kebanyakan objek sebenar memancarkan kedua-dua pantulan spekular dan peresapan, dan ini menjadikan komponen spekular mungkin mengurangkan prestasi kaedah CPI-3D. Kajian ini telah membangunkan kerangka kerja untuk mengekstrak CPI-3D. Kerangka kerja ini menggunakan kaedah Penyingkiran Spekular (PS) dan kaedah Bentuk, Pencahayaan serta Kepantulan dari Pembayangan (BPKP) di bawah model Fungsi Taburan Kepantulan Dwiarah (FTKD). Oleh kerana kaedah-kaedah PS sebelum ini mengalami kesamaran ketepuan warna, ia tidak sesuai untuk kerangka kerja ini. Bagi menyelesaikan masalah tersebut, dua kaedah PS telah dibangunkan, dinilai dan dibandingkan dengan kaedah standard PS. Kedua-duanya merujuk kepada Pensegmenan Camuk (PC) dan Pengkodan Bersela (PB). Bagi menggabungkan kaedah PS dan BPKP, dua model FTKD telah dibangunkan, dinilai dan dibandingkan. Kedua-duanya merujuk kepada Pengubahsuaian Kepantulan Dikromatik (PKD) dan Pengubahsuaian Blinn-Phong (PBP). Prestasi kaedah PS dan model FTKD yang dicadangkan untuk mengekstrak CPI-3D telah dinilai berdasarkan kepada set data awam. Keputusan menunjukkan kaedah PB lebih memuaskan berbanding PC dan kaedah penanda aras (kaedah lelaran). Ketepatan peresapan dan specular telah meningkat masing-masing sebanyak 7.3% dan 53.5%. Gabungan kaedah PB dan model PKD mampu menyaingi kaedah BPKP. Kelajuan pengiraan telah meningkat sebanyak 19.2% manakala ketepatan purata kedalaman, permukaan normal, pencahayaan, pembayangan serta kepantulan telah meningkat masing-masing sebanyak 11.4%, 6.5%, 50.5%, 35.2% dan 5.1%. Kajian ini menandakan bahawa kerangka kerja pengekstrakan CPI-3D cadangan telah menunjukkan kemajuan besar dari segi ketepatan dan masa pengiraan.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In the name of Allah, The Most Gracious and The Most Merciful. I wish to express my sincerest appreciation and gratitude to Prof. Dr. Nanna Suryana Herman for his valuable advice, patience, and support during my Ph.D. journey at Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka. With his vision and guidance, this thesis may never have been completed on time. My deepest appreciation also to Prof. Datuk Dr. Shahrin Sahib for his help in developing motivation, ideas, and for willingly sharing his expertise and in-depth knowledge. I appreciate their available time for solid discussion despite their tight schedule. I wish to thank all my fellow postgraduate students for their discussions, support, and friendship. I also thank the staff, lecturers, and technicians in the Faculty of Information and Communication Technology for their help, cooperation, and encouragement. My deepest appreciation also to my parents, Tasman Abbas and Djasminar Anwar, for their prayer, love, and care. I pray their efforts will be rewarded by Allah in this world and the hereafter. I would like to thank my brother, Abdullah Denovan, and my sister, Nila Novari. I would also like to thank my wife (Nancy Kuspriyati), my daughter (Aisyah Syarafana), and my sons (Izdihar Zidan and Ashraf Ruwaifi) for their love, support, and patience. This work was supported by Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka under Zamalah Scheme.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PAGE

DECLARATION
APPROVAL
DEDICATION
ABSTRACT i
ABSTRAK ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS iii
LIST OF TABLES v
LIST OF FIGURES vi
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS vii
LIST OF SYMBOLS ix
LIST OF PUBLICATIONS xi

CHAPTER 1
1 INTRODUCTION 1
1.1 Research Background 1
1.2 Problem Statement 6
1.3 Research Questions 7
1.4 Research Objectives 8
1.5 Research Scope 9
1.6 Thesis Structure 9

2 LITERATURE REVIEW 12
2.1 Overview 12
2.2 Bidirectional Reflectance Distribution Function (BRDF) 12
2.2.1 Lambertian Model 15
2.2.2 Oren-Nayar Model 16
2.2.3 Phong Model 17
2.2.4 Blinn-Phong Model 19
2.2.5 Dichromatic Reflectance Model (DRM) 20
2.3 Shape From Shading (SFS) 21
2.3.1 Analytical Approach 26
2.3.2 Approximation Approach 31
2.3.3 Optimization Approach 32
2.4 Intrinsic Image (II) 40
2.4.1 Retinex Approach 43
2.4.2 Machine Learning Approach 48
2.5 Specular Removal (SR) 50
2.5.1 Color Space Segmentation Approach 52
2.5.2 Specular-free Approach 53

2.5.3 Partial Differential Equation Approach 58
2.5.4 Inpainting Approach 59
2.5.4.1 Manual Thresholding 60
2.5.4.2 Automated Thresholding 61
2.5.4.3 Clonal Selection Algorithm (ClonalG) 64
2.5.4.4 Particle Swarm Optimization (PSO) 65
2.6 Research Methods in Computer Vision 66
2.7 Research Gap 68
2.8 Summary 69

3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 71
3.1 Overview 71
3.2 Quantitative Research Methodology 71
3.3 Research Phases 72
3.4 Problem Identification Phase 74
3.5 Literature Review Phase 76
3.6 Development Phase of 3D-ISCs Extraction Framework 78
3.6.1 Framework Description 79
3.6.2 Chaotic Segmentation Method 81
3.6.2.1 Formulation of Specular Removal Problem 81
3.6.2.2 Proposed Specular Removal Method 84
3.6.2.3 Chaotic ClonalG 89
3.6.2.4 Coherency Sensitive Hashing 96
3.6.3 Sparse Coding Method 97
3.6.3.1 Formulation of Specular Removal Problem 98
3.6.3.2 Proposed Specular Removal method 101
3.6.3.3 Specular-Free Images 102
3.6.3.4 XYZ color space 103
3.6.3.5 Dictionary Construction 105
3.6.4 Modified Blinn-Phong Model 107
3.6.4.1 Formulation of Proposed 3D-ISCs Extraction Framework 108
3.6.4.2 Proposed MBP Model 108
3.6.5 Modified Dichromatic Reflectance Model 110
3.6.5.1 Proposed MDR Model 113
3.6.5.2 3D Reconstruction 115
3.6.5.3 Reflectance Image 116
3.6.5.4 Illumination Estimation 117
3.6.5.5 Modified Dichromatic Reflectance Model 117
3.7 Experimental Phase 118
3.7.1 Data Collection 118
3.7.1.1 DECSAI, Berkeley, SIPI and Tennessee Dataset 119
3.7.1.2 MIT Intrinsic Images Dataset 119
3.7.1.3 MIT-Berkeley Intrinsic Images Dataset 119
3.7.1.4 MIT-Berkeley-UTeM Intrinsic Images Dataset 120
3.7.2 Method Comparison 120
3.7.3 Experimental Settings 121

3.7.4 Performance Measures 121
3.8 Application Phase 123
3.9 Summary 123

4 EXPERIMENTAL RESULTS AND DISCUSSION 125
4.1 Overview 125
4.2 Experimental Results of Chaotic Segmentation 125
4.2.1 Results and comparative performance of Segmentation Step 125
4.2.1.1 Fitness evaluation 126
4.2.1.2 Stability comparison 126
4.2.1.3 Efficiency comparison 132
4.2.2 Result on Images with Significant Specularity 135
4.2.3 Result on Synthetic Images 143
4.2.4 Result on Images without Significant Specularity 145
4.2.5 Discussion 147
4.3 Experimental Results of Sparse Coding 148
4.3.1 Result on Images with Significant Specularity 148
4.3.2 Result on Synthetic Images 154
4.3.3 Result on Images without Specularity 156
4.3.4 Discussion 156
4.4 Experimental Results of Modified Blinn-Phong Model 159
4.4.1 Specular from Reflectance Image 159
4.4.2 Results on Images with Significant Specularity 161
4.4.3 Discussion 164
4.5 Experimental Results of Modified Dichromatic Reflectance Model 165
4.5.1 Results on Images with Significant Specularity 165
4.5.2 Results of Real-World Images 170
4.5.3 Discussion 172
4.6 3D Rendering Applications of the Proposed Framework 173
4.6.1 Optimal Linear Direction 174
4.6.2 Rendering Engine for Highlight image 176
4.6.3 Blinn-Phong Extension 177
4.6.4 Dichromatic Editing 177
4.6.5 Object Recoloring based on Intrinsic Image Estimation 177
4.7 Summary 178

5 CONCLUSIONS 180
5.1 Overview 180
5.2 Review of Research Objectives 180
5.3 Conclusions 181
5.3.1 Conclusion related to *RO 1.* 181
5.3.2 Conclusion related to *RO 2.* 182
5.3.3 Conclusion related to *RO 3.* 183
5.3.4 Conclusion related to *RO 4.* 185
5.3.5 Conclusion related to *RO 5.* 185
5.4 Research Contributions 186

5.5 Recommendation for Future Research 187
5.6 Summary 188

REFERENCES **189**

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE	TITLE	PAGE
2.1	List of Constraints to Modify the Functional	34
2.2	Different Types of Specular-free Images	57
2.3	A Comparison of Computer Vision Methods with regard to Different Types of Characteristics	69
4.1	Ground Truth Value by an Exhaustive search (Otsu Method) for the Test Images	130
4.2	Mean Values and Standard Deviation of the Objective Function for 50 Runs	133
4.3	Thresholds Value of the Algorithms	134
4.4	Mean Values of the Computational Time and Iteration (it) for 50 Runs	136
4.5	Accuracy Performance of PSO, ClonalG, CS Methods on Images with Significant Specularity	139
4.6	Speed Performance of PSO, ClonalG, CS on Images with Significant Specularity	141
4.7	Accuracy Performance of PSO, ClonalG, CS on Synthetic Images	143
4.8	Speed Performance of PSO, ClonalG, CS on Synthetic Images	144
4.9	Accuracy Performance of PSO, ClonalG, CS on Images without Significant Specularity	146

4.10 Speed Performance of PSO, ClonalG, CS on Images without Significant Specularity 146
4.11 Accuracy Performance of MZK06, YCK06, YWA10, SC09 on Images with Significant Specularity 150
4.12 Speed Performance of MZK06, YCK06, SC09 on Images with Significant Specularity 150
4.13 Accuracy Performance of SF1, SF2, Both SF on Images with Significant Specularity 153
4.14 Speed Performance of SF1, SF2, Both SF methods on Images with Significant Specularity 153
4.15 Accuracy Performance of SF1, SF2, Both SF on Synthetic Images 154
4.16 Speed Performance of SF1, SF2, Both SF on Synthetic Images 155
4.17 Accuracy Performance of SF1, SF2, Both SF on Images without Significant Specularity 157
4.18 Speed Performance of SF1, SF2, Both SF on Images without Significant Specularity 157
4.19 Accuracy Performance of SIRFS, SIRFS-MZK06, SIRFS-YCK06, SIRFS-MBP on Images with Significant Specularity 162
4.20 Speed Performance of MZK06, YCK06, MBP Both SF on Images without Significant Specularity 162
4.21 Accuracy Performance of SIRFS, MZK06-SIRFS, YCK06-SIRFS, MDR-SIRFS on MIT-Berkeley Intrinsic Images Dataset 166

4.22 Speed Performance of SIRFS, MZK06-SIRFS, YCK06-SIRFS, MBP-SIRFS on MIT-Berkeley Intrinsic Images Dataset 166

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE	TITLE	PAGE
1.1	An Example of a Commercial 3D Scanner, Manufactured by *Breuckmann Opto-TOP HE*	2
1.2	The Best Method in (Zhang et al., 1999) Review: (left) (Zheng and Chellappa, 1991) Method and (right) (Lee and Kuo, 1993) Method	3
1.3	The Best Method in (Durou et al., 2008) Review: (left) (Falcone and Sagona, 1997) Method and (right) (Daniel and Durou, 2000) Method	4
1.4	The original Pepper image (Petitcolas, 2014)	5
1.5	(a) input image, (b) orientation of surface normals, (c) illumination, and (d) reflectance	5
1.6	Thesis Structure	10
2.1	Bidirectional Reflectance Distribution Functions: adopted from (Kurihara and Takaki, 2001)	15
2.2	Phong model	19
2.3	a) An ideal of a shading image and (b) the corresponding 3D model.	22
2.4	(Weiss, 2001) Intrinsic-images: (a) an input image, (b) reflectance image, (c) shading image	42

2.5 (a) Input image. (b) Kim et al. (2013) result. (c) Dark channel. (d) Result of (Tan and Ikeuchi, 2005) 57

3.1 Overview of Research Phases 73

3.2 A visualization of 3D-ISCs extraction problem in this study. Given a single input image, the task is to derive the object into these characteristics: (b) diffuse, (c) reflectance, (d) illumination, (e) specular, (f) shading, and (g) 3D shape characteristics. 75

3.3 3D Intrinsic Scene Characteristics Extraction Framework 79

3.4 The Extraction process of diffuse and specular characteristics using CS method. Initially, the input image is segmented into diffuse and specular pixels using the proposed SR method. Then, the specular pixel is replaced based on the information from the neighbors using inpainting method. 85

3.5 The curve of mutation rate is affected by the value of parameter ρ 88

3.6 Diagram of logistic map bifurcation (Bresten and Jung, 2009) 91

3.7 Distribution of logistic map 92

3.8 Comparison of histogram of logistic map distribution and Matlab pseudo-random number distribution. (a) Logistic Map with uniform distribution, (b) Matlab random generator with uniform distribution 92

3.9 The Extraction process of diffuse and specular characteristics using SC method. Initially, the input image is processed using specular-free methods. The output is the n specular-free images. These images then are used to reconstruct a dictionary. From the dictionary, the SC method generates the diffuse and specular images. 101

3.10 The Extraction Process of 3D-ISCs using MBP Model. Initially, the input image is processed using SIRFS method. The output is the shading and reflectance image. The shading is rendered using a shader from the 3D shape and illumination model. The SR method then process reflectance image to extract specular and diffuse characteristics. 109

3.11 The extraction process of 3D-ISCs using MDR Model. Initially, the input image is processed using SR method. The output is the diffuse image. The SIRFS then extract the reflectance and shading image. From the shading image is rendered using a shader from the 3D shape and illumination model. 111

3.12 Pixel histograms of filter output from diffuse (left) and from specular (right). It is clearly that the filter output histograms have distinctly noticeable difference shape between diffuse and specular reflection. 114

4.1 Original image and their histogram 127

4.2 Original image and their histogram (continued) 128

4.3 Original image and their histogram (continued) 129

4.4 Thresholded image obtained by CS (a) represents K = 3, (b) represents K = 4, (c) represents K = 5 137

4.5 Thresholded image obtained by CS (a) represents K = 3, (b) represents K = 4, (c) represents K = 5 (continued) 138

4.6 The Ground Truth Images. (top) Input images, (middle) Diffuse Images, (bottom) Specular Images. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 139

4.7 Thresholded image obtained by CS (a) represents K = 1, (b) represents K = 2, (c) represents K = 3 140
4.8 Thresholded image obtained by CS (a) represents K = 1, (b) represents K = 2, (c) represents K = 3 (continued) 141
4.9 PSO: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 142
4.10 ClonalG: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 142
4.11 CS: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 142
4.12 PSO: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 144
4.13 ClonalG: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 144
4.14 CS: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 145
4.15 PSO: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 146
4.16 ClonalG: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 147
4.17 CS: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 147

4.18 The Ground Truth Images. (top) Input images, (middle) Diffuse Images, (bottom) Specular Images. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 149
4.19 MZK06: (left) Original, (middle) Diffuse, and (right) Specular 151
4.20 YCK06: (left) Original, (middle) Diffuse, and (right) Specular 151
4.21 YWA10: (left) Original, (middle) Diffuse, and (right) Specular 152
4.22 SC09: (left) Original, (middle) Diffuse, and (right) Specular component 152
4.23 Proposed Method: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 153
4.24 Proposed Method: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 155
4.25 MZK06: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 155
4.26 YCK06: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 156
4.27 Proposed Method: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 157
4.28 MZK06: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 158
4.29 YCK06: (top) Diffuse Results, (bottom) Specular Results. From left to right: Apple, Pear, Potato, Teabag1, Teabag2 158
4.30 Intrinsic Scene Characteristics from SIRFS for pear 160
4.31 Intrinsic Scene Characteristics from SIRFS for potato 161

4.32 Intrinsic Scene Characteristics from SIRFS for teabag1 161

4.33 MZK06: From top-left to top-right is the diffuse images of pear, potato, and teabag1 while from bottom-left to bottom-right is the specular images of pear, potato, and teabag1 163

4.34 YCK06: From top-left to top-right is the diffuse images of pear, potato, and teabag1 while from bottom-left to bottom-right is the specular images of pear, potato, and teabag1 163

4.35 MDR: From top-left to top-right is the diffuse images of pear, potato, and teabag1 while from bottom-left to bottom-right is the specular images of pear, potato, and teabag1 164

4.36 MZK06-SIRFS on Pear: (left to right) diffuse, reflectance, shading, surface normals, and illumination images 167

4.37 MZK06-SIRFS on Potato: (left to right) diffuse, reflectance, shading, surface normals, and illumination images 168

4.38 MZK06-SIRFS on Teabag1: (left to right) diffuse, reflectance, shading, surface normals, and illumination images 168

4.39 YCK06-SIRFS on Pear: (left to right) diffuse, reflectance, shading, surface normals, and illumination images 168

4.40 YCK06-SIRFS on Potato: (left to right) diffuse, reflectance, shading, surface normals, and illumination images 169

4.41 YCK06-SIRFS on Teabag1: (left to right) diffuse, reflectance, shading, surface normals, and illumination images 169

4.42 MDR-SIRFS on Pear: (left to right) diffuse, reflectance, shading, surface normals, and illumination images 169
4.43 MDR-SIRFS on Potato: (left to right) diffuse, reflectance, shading, surface normals, and illumination images 170
4.44 MDR-SIRFS on Teabag1: (left to right) diffuse, reflectance, shading, surface normals, and illumination images 170
4.45 Results of ISC estimation using the proposed model on real-world Pebbles image, manually cropped color images of objects. 171
4.46 Results of ISC estimation using the proposed model on real-world Toy image, manually cropped color images of objects. 171
4.47 Results of ISC estimation using the proposed model on real-world Fruits image, manually cropped color images of objects. 172
4.48 Results of ISC estimation using the proposed model on real-world Toothpaste image, manually cropped color images of objects. 172
4.49 Specular highlight on sphere for different type of light source 174
4.50 Dichromatic Editing of Pear 178
4.51 Reflectance Editing of Pear 178