An Investigation on the Students' Opinions of Bilingual Teaching in Universities of Western China

Yang Yuqian

Correspondence: Yang Yuqian, School of Foreign Languages and Literature, Wuhan University, Wuhan, China.

Abstract

In the western areas of China, bilingual teaching is in the beginning phrase, and hasn't reached the desirable outcomes. In order to know the development phase of bilingual teaching in less-developed areas of China, this paper chose students and teachers from two universities which respectively located in two provinces of the western areas of China and have different teaching levels as representative examples, and issued total of 352 valid questionnaires to reflect the bilingual teaching comprehensively. The research finds that learners have pessimistic attitude toward bilingual teaching and don't realize that the great importance of bilingual teaching in terms of personal development in the long run. The efficiency of bilingual teaching is affected by multitude of factors, including students' attitudes and learning methods, learning situation in and after class, teacher's levels, assessment methods and students' understanding levels. The thesis also investigates the evaluation systems of bilingual teaching and finds that students prefer the combination of oral and written exam.

Keywords: bilingual teaching, influencing factors, investigation

1. Introduction

1.1 Background of the Research

English has been widely used all over the world because of globalization. Having joined the World Trade Organization, China has more and more opportunities to participate in international business competition and cooperation.

In recent years, more talent people, who can be adept at professional knowledge and English at the same time, are in desperate need in China. Thus bilingual education appears to satisfy the need required by market. Bilingual education means teachers employ the second language or foreign language as the teaching language to teach professional knowledge which isn't linguistic teaching.

To ensure and encourage the bilingual education, the Ministry of Education of China once released a lot of documents to guide bilingual education. In August 2000, the department once promulgated S*ome Opinions on Enhancing the Teaching Qualities of Undergraduate in Higher Education,* which stated clearly undergraduate education should use foreign language to teach professional knowledge except linguistic classes. In August 2004, another document, A*ssessment Scheme of Teaching Quality in Undergraduate Universities,* stipulated outright bilingual education must be implemented in the fields of finance, law, information technology and so on. What's more, the excellent level will be available if the bilingual education classes can account for 10% of the total lessons (Huang Anyu, 2011). Therefore, a multitude of key universities in China has pioneered the special teaching model, followed by other universities. To support the teaching plan, some universities also put forward some guides according to their practical conditions. For example, Zhejiang University laid down two documents, that is, S*ome Opinions on Applying Foreign Original Edition Textbook of Bilingual Education on Undergraduate Universities* and S*ome Regulations on Implementing Bilingual Education by Using Foreign Edition Textbook.* During the investigation on high education of western China, a similar document, *Interim Regulation on Bilingual Education in Hubei University for Nationalities,* is also drawn up, which elaborates on the requirements of the class, teachers, curriculum construction and quality monitoring. From this perspective, it is clear that different departments draw high attention to bilingual teaching and make a clear and detail regulation in the mechanic level. The drafting of these documents signifies the remarkable progress of bilingual teaching made in China.

Although the Ministry of Education has put forward some documents, the practice among nationwide still exists imbalance in terms of different areas, especially between the East and the West. Being popular with students in the

eastern of China, bilingual teaching gains good social responses. By contrast, being the beginning phrase, it hasn't reached the desirable outcomes in the western areas of China for the limited economic, geographical reasons and lack of valid bilingual teaching models.

Concerning the current problems mentioned above, this paper chooses bilingual teaching in western China to study.

1.2 The Significance of the Research

Concerning the current problems mentioned above, this paper chooses students from two universities in less-developed areas, Guizhou Normal University and Hubei University for Nationalities, as respondents in order to reflect the bilingual teaching comprehensively in China. The two universities are chosen because both of them are located in western areas of China and one is first-level university while another is second-level, which can be more representative and comprehensive to reflect the real information of bilingual teaching in western areas of China.

To be more exact, the significance can be listed in the following.

Firstly, some effective learning methods and habits can be introduced. This paper is devoted to finding the influential factors which affected bilingual teaching quality from the perspective of students. Hereby students will adjust themselves to bilingual teaching model according to feedback of the study.

Secondly, it is beneficial for bilingual teachers to know the present learning situation of students. Interaction between students and teachers is of the most importance for teaching quality. This paper presents the scientific and real information to help teachers know the present learning situation of students in time and change their teaching methods properly.

Thirdly, the current problems can be found out. By investigation, it is helpful to know about the current situation of bilingual teaching in western areas of China, such as the students' attitude toward bilingual teaching, the specific policies that the department and universities involved have taken. Understanding these comprehensively, policy makers can have a clear look at bilingual teaching and take effective measures to promote the development of bilingual teaching in western areas of China.

2. Recent Studies on Bilingual Teaching

Due to the various national conditions, researches were conducted differently in aims. The immigrant countries such as American, Canada carried out bilingual teaching policies to integrate immigrants into their countries, to ease social conflicts, to maintain society stable and gain equal developmental opportunity, while in Singapore, India and Japan, the purpose of bilingual teaching is to strengthen international status, to heighten the International influence sphere. Hereby, the different methods were adopted in researches.

All in all, the researches in western countries have implemented for a long time, naturally achieving fruitful result, especially in theory. The Second Language Acquisition is one of the most influential theories which were applied in bilingual education. The theory was proposed by linguistics Krashen (1981) consisting of five linked hypotheses: input, acquisition/learning, monitor, natural order and affective filter. To be more exact, input hypothesis emphases the mastery of language's grammar and external forms while acquisition focuses on language proficiency in practical use (Krashen, 1999). Consequently, attaching great importance to the application of language in actual context was so popular that it was widely used in language teaching and had profound impact on bilingual teaching. In addition, Baker (1988) also applied another theory, input-output-context-process. In the model Baker (1988, 2001) further illustrated the result of bilingual teaching was influenced by teachers, students, study environment and student's attitudes.

Based on these theories, some teaching models occurred including: the immersion model, the transitional model, the maintenance model, the soakage model, the two-way bilingual model, and the progressive model (Siguan M et al, 1987; Backer, 1993). Among these models, the soakage model was widely used in Canada based on Krashen's Second Language Acquisition. It can be divided into three phases: firstly, the teacher uses the second language as the medium in class completely; secondly, after two or three years, the teacher just uses the 80 percent of the second language; thirdly, the proportion of the second language declines to 50%. Obviously, a great variety of bilingual teaching types are adopted to satisfy different needs of various groups to optimize the effect of bilingual education, and to promote the development of individuals and society. Until now, bilingual education abroad had a complete system, various teaching models, and comparatively much more mature theories.

What's more, abundant laws and educational regulations are intended to support the implementation of bilingual education. The American Congress passed the Bilingual Education Act in 1968. However, the Bilingual Education Act of 1968 was not specific and participation of schools was not voluntary, but further amendments were made to improve the validity and broaden its application in 1974, 1978, 1983, 1994 (Huang Anyu, 2011). In addition, some professional organizations were founded in Canada and America to monitor the execution of bilingual teaching.

Specifically, Oattes et al. (2018) employed questionnaires and interviews to collect data and gave an insight into Dutch bilingual history teaching. And also they highlighted the importance of interpersonal language in bilingual education. It found that history teachers who participated in bilingual history courses will enrich their professional teaching skills and have a positive influence on their job satisfaction. Concerning the belief that the America is an English-speaking country, bilingual education suffers strong controversies and criticism. Sarah Garrity et al. (2018) offered a sober reflection on bilingual education. The findings showed that Latino students and students who are capable of speaking more than one language favor bilingual education although the native language still continued to reflect the dominant role. Concerning the fact that bilingual education remains controversial, Ellen Bialystok (2016) discussed evaluating outcomes of the research from the perspectives of language and literacy levels, academic achievement, and suitability for children with special challenges. Kate Menken and Cristian Solorza (2014) analyzed the reason why more and more schools tend to abandon the bilingual education programs and adopt English-only policies is that city schools which implement bilingual education programs is often considered as low performing and risk sanctions.

There are also empirical studies on bilingual education which attempt to evaluate the specific influence of three theoretical models, that is, the threshold hypothesis, transfer theory, and time-on-task theory (Mac Swan, et al, 2017).

In China, Some schools offer bilingual courses, and some researchers have also participated in the studies on bilingual teaching. Cai et al. (2016) systematically evaluated nursing students' satisfaction with the textbooks, teachers, teaching methods and the overall teaching results in nursing bilingual teaching in China. The results suggest that the future directions for improving bilingual teaching in China include establishing suitable bilingual teaching materials, training teaching faculty members and adopting proper teaching methods. Deng (2017) attempted to compare bilingual teaching efficiency of expository teaching method and PBL teaching method in Prosthodontics. He founded that compared with expository teaching method, PBL teaching method is more efficiency. And PBL teaching method deserves popularization in bilingual class of prosthodontics. In order to perform a comprehensive evaluation of the effectiveness of bilingual teaching, Xiao (2017) proposed four first-level evaluation indicators and twelve second-level evaluation indicators measuring the quality of bilingual teaching in undergraduate colleges.

Despite the fact that governments were arduously committed to carrying out bilingual education, bilingual education still attracted controversies in the course of history. Generally speaking, there are four kinds of controversies. Therefore, bilingual education was questioned and criticized in America, Australia, and Japan because bilingual teaching failed to improve students' grades. Besides, a large amount of money and resource has to put into the bilingual education field so that the normal teaching activities can work. The extension of bilingual teaching in China was seemingly hard to move on in Chinese-dominated society. On the one hand, teachers employ too much English to explain general terms, which will greatly spoil the teaching schedule and frustrate students' interest. On the other hand, most of universities are lack of bilingual teachers to undertake bilingual teaching tasks. To be more exact, only a few teachers satisfy the qualifications of bilingual teaching. In particular, these universities are located in less-developed areas of China. Universities often fail to satisfy the teaching conditions of bilingual teaching. Therefore, few studies pay attention to the bilingual teaching in western areas of China in order to reflect the bilingual teaching comprehensively in China.

3. Methodology

3.1 Research Subjects and Questions

The research subjects are students involved in bilingual teaching from Hubei University for Nationalities and Guizhou Normal University of China. The reason why the two universities are chosen is that both of them are located in western areas of China and one is first-level university while another is second-level, which can be more representative and comprehensive to reflect the real information of bilingual teaching in western areas of China. And the total number of questionnaires amounts to 352. The main content of the investigation contains three aspects as follows.

1) What are the students' opinions on and attitude towards bilingual teaching?

2) What factors affect the bilingual teaching quality, and how much do they influence?

3) How are the assessment methods used in bilingual teaching of western China?

3.2 Research Methods

To know how bilingual teaching performs in the universities of western parts China comprehensively, this paper took advantage of a multitude of research methods, including quantitative approach and qualitative approach.

Quantitative approach: the five–level Likert Scale questionnaire was adopted to collect data. At the same time, this paper makes full use of SPSS to analyze the data. Frequency analysis and descriptive statistics were employed to know the data distribution as a whole. To explore the main factors that influence the quality of bilingual teaching, Chi-square

Test, one-way ANOVA, correlation and regression analysis were applied to discuss the relationships among variables.

Qualitative approach: further interviews with several students, along with opinions and suggestions collected through opening questions in the questionnaires, is also made to obtain comprehensive understandings of bilingual teaching in the western areas of China. Most importantly, finding some problems that may exist in the teaching and learning process can be conducive to offer constructive advice.

3.3 Research Instruments

Students' questionnaires consist of three aspects: students' basic information, main content including 27 questions, and an opening question. All in all, the whole article refers to students' personal information, learning process, different ways of examination, teaching result evaluation (more details see Table 1).

Table 1. The Structure of Students' Questionnaires

content	corresponding question number
opinions	1、2、3、23、24、
study attitudes	7、8、9、
study methods	5、10-12、16、17
after-class study	13-15
ways of examination	19-21
present learning situation	4、6、22、25
satisfaction with teachers	26、27

To ensure the result of investigation more accurate and convincing, this paper took out a pre-test at the middle of fall semester in 2015. As planned, 56 questionnaires were given to students who have law English class where the teacher guides them to learn some important laws about America, of course, in English. The data is used to test the reliability and validity of the student's questionnaires. As a consequence, the reliability is 0.88 and validity is 0.7, which shows that the questionnaire can be acceptable. Having a pre-test, the thesis also made some revisions according to students' feedback, adding the definition of bilingual teaching so that students can understand the purpose of this investigation, and limiting the ranges of the possible answers as for the opening questions.

On the second day, the interview was carried out on time. Adopting semi-structured form, the interview is trying to figure out what are the differences between the attitudes and opinions among students whose English levels varied greatly. Every subject needs to answer three questions:

1) Will your English level influence your learning bilingual courses?

2) What matters most in the bilingual teaching?

3) Do the bilingual courses improve your professional skills and the future job?

3.4 Data Collection

Data distribution and collection were conducted at the ending of the fall semester in 2015. First of all, the teacher told students some requirements which were worth noticing. For example, filling out the investigation won't influence their grades. Therefore, all the students need to answer these questions according to their personal conditions.

The subjects of this investigation are 352 students from Hubei University for Nationalities and Guizhou Normal University of China. 449 questionnaires were distributed and 363 questionnaires were collected. The recovery percent reaches 80.84%. In fact, 352 questionnaires can be viewed as the valid questionnaires.

At first, all the data should be typed into the Excel, and then SPSS software will be employed to analyze the data scientifically. Different questions will be dealt with meticulously by various methods.

4. Data Analysis

4.1 The Present Learning Situation of Students

Four questions are designed to describe the present learning situation of students from the perspective of "class effect", "study pace", "study burden" and "professional knowledge" respectively.

From Table 2, as for the understanding level, 32.1% students choose "never" or "seldom" in the five-level Likert Scale. That is to say, about one third students have trouble in understanding the main content of bilingual courses. At the same

time, 31.3% students couldn't follow the teaching schedule. The same terrible situation goes for the "class effect". Only 33.8% students could make full use of bilingual courses to get more professional knowledge, widen their horizon, and deepen their understandings of knowledge. The phenomenon shows, so far, the teaching quality hasn't been satisfying. In the "study burden" respect, 36.4% students hold that bilingual courses "always" or "often" increase their study burden while only 9.4% students deny the former opinion. It further shows that bilingual teaching, as a new teaching form, demands students be equipped with overall qualities, especially English speaking and listening levels. To some degree, bilingual teaching imposes extra burden on students. Hereby, it's possible that students can get more from the bilingual courses as if teachers slow down the teaching pace.

Table 2. The Present Learning Situation of Students

	Frequency (%)				
	never	seldom	average	often	always
4. understanding level	6.0	26.1	46.9	16.8	4.3
6. follow the teaching pace	7.4	23.9	50.0	13.6	5.1
22. study burden	9.4	17.3	36.9	25.9	10.5
25. professional knowledge	6.3	19.0	40.9	21.0	12.8

In short, the present learning situation of students was daunting. What's worse, students seem not to be optimistic towards bilingual teaching. To make it clear what factors prevent students from absorbing knowledge in the bilingual courses, further efforts are made to investigate students' attitude towards bilingual teaching.

Besides, to describe the present learning situation precisely, this paper also tries to reveal the students' attitudes towards bilingual teaching by five questions (1, 2, 3, 23, and 24). To be more exact and concise, five questions were reduced to three aspects. That is, "necessity", "awareness" and "class effect". Having a correlation test, this paper found that awareness has a close relation with class effect.

In the Table 4 below, significant (bilateral) P < 0.01, correlation coefficients in the table can be regarded as evidence to illustrate the interrelationships among three variables. The correlation coefficients between necessity, awareness and professional knowledge are 0.332, 0.533, which suggests the more students know more about bilingual teaching and show their concerns about it, the more progress they would make in their major field. Specifically, when they answered the question --whether we need to carry out bilingual teaching in the western areas China, 70.2% students chose "always" or "often" while only 4.5% students chose "never" (see table 3). From the data, it's obvious that students, in fact, can accept bilingual teaching. However, 21% students claimed that they were familiar with the meaning, significance of bilingual teaching (see table 3). Many a student has no idea of bilingual teaching. Naturally, it indicates that students lack the basic awareness of bilingual teaching in all-round way (see Table 4).

Table 3. Students' Opinions on the Necessity of Bilingual Teaching

	Frequency (%)				
	never	seldom	average	often	always
1. Bilingual teaching should be implemented in western China?	4.5	6.3	19.0	34.1	36.1
2. How much do you know about bilingual teaching?	3.1	21.9	54.0	15.3	5.7

Table 4. The Students' Attitudes towards Bilingual Teaching

	necessity	awareness	professional knowledge
necessity	1.000	.317**	.533**
awareness	.317**	1.000	.322**
class effect	.533**	.332**	1.000

**In the confidence level (bilateral) 0.01, the correlation was significant.

Therefore, it's necessary for teachers and authorities to shed light on the bilingual teaching seriously to attract students' attention. However, when interviewed, some students frankly expressed their dissatisfaction with bilingual teaching with the reason that the bilingual course (Law English) has no connection with judicial examination which is the trump card to find a good job. Consequently, these students didn't take it seriously. Besides, it is generally acknowledged that west regions in China are in unfavorable position because of economic levels. Additionally, holding the conservative employment conception, college graduates in western China don't look forward to finding a good job just by bilingual courses. Actually, both schools' publicity and students' awareness are equally important, which also explained students don't perform very well in the last part. Furthermore, other factors were also taken into consideration, such as students, teachers, assessment methods and so on.

4.2 Relationship Between English Level and Major Learning

In this paper, we take the college English Test Band 4 and Band 6, which widely held in China to test the English levels of Chinese college students, as a standard to know about students' English levels. Judging by CET-4, CET-6, this thesis discusses the interplay between the English level and major learning.

First of all, according to students' personal information, the data shows that students' English levels stay in the relatively low level. In total, 352 students participated in this investigation, among whom 36.9% don't pass CET-4 and 80.1% don't pass CET-6 (see Table 5).

To confirm whether the English level will affect major learning or not, a correlation test is implemented. From Table 6, $P > 0.05$ means English level has no relation to major learning.

Table 5. Frequency Distribution of Students' English Levels

	frequency	percent	cumulative percent
no CET-4	130	36.9	36.9
pass CET-4	152	43.2	80.1
pass CET-6	60	17.0	97.2
pass other's test	10	2.8	100.0

Table 6. The Result of a Correlation Test in English levels

correlation coefficient	Sig (bilateral)	items
.102	.056	352

The conclusion that the English level has no relation with major learning seems to be opposite to what people consider. Generally speaking, students who have a gift for learning the language can benefit major learning and vice versa.

Table 7. The Result of One-way ANOVA Test in English Level

	sum of squares	df	mean square	F	Sig.
between groups	3.638	4	0.910	1.439	0.220
within groups	219.260	347	0.632		
total	222.898	351			

To test the conclusion, one-way ANOVA was applied. From Table 7, $P > 0.05$, the figure means that English level has no direct link with professional knowledge. So far, this paper has used completely different methods to test the interrelationships between the English level and professional knowledge. Surprisingly, the data reached consistent conclusion that there exists no clear connection between the two variables.

As for the strange phenomenon which seemingly goes against the experience and intuition, this paper attempts to talk with some students about the matter. According to their description, the reason why the English level has no connection with major learning is that bilingual courses are set up to meet the needs of major curriculum development. Therefore, there is no selection about students who they are able to master bilingual courses. Having two-year College English training, they still have difficulty in speaking and listening. During the bilingual courses, instead of guiding them in English all the time, teacher has to give up English teaching for most students who can't follow the class progress if he teaches the class in English only.

As a consequence, the teacher does not use an amount of English to demonstrate or display the new lore. Under many cases, the teacher shows new knowledge in English, and repeats the key words, or even explains complex or important matters in Chinese. Finally, he interprets them. There is no doubt that students can get across the teaching content without listening or having no knowledge of English.

But, is there no connection between students' English levels and major learning? This paper tries to find some clues from other aspects, such as "understanding level", "follow the teaching pace", "listening and speaking" (see Table 8).

Table 8. The Correlation Coefficient between Students' English Levels and Major

	major learning	understanding level	listening and speaking	follow the teaching pace
profession learning	1.000	.378**	.260**	.291**
understanding level	.378**	1.000	.419**	.499**
listening and speaking	.360**	.419**	1.000	.481**
follow the teaching pace	.291**	.499**	.481**	1.000

** In the confidence level (bilateral) 0.01, the correlation was significant.

In the Table 8, the correlation coefficients between major learning and other three aspects are 0.378, 0.260, 0.291, which is far higher than that of College English Test. In fact, bilingual teaching has higher requirements for English listening

and speaking. Besides, the listening and speaking abilities of English are closely associated with bilingual teaching. To be specific, the correlation coefficient between "listening and speaking" and "understanding level" is 0.419 while as for "follow the teaching pace", the correlation coefficient is 0.481.

Therefore, this paper concludes that although under most cases, bilingual courses use Chinese as a teaching medium language, students who aren't equipped with wonderful English linguistic skills can also obtain the knowledge without much trouble. Nevertheless, if a student is proficient at one aspect of linguistic performances, he is sure to benefit more.

Meanwhile, this paper chooses "grade" as an independent variable to discuss the influence of "grade" (see Table 9).

Table 9. The Influence of "Grade" on "Major Study"

	sum of squares	df	mean square	F	Sig.
between Groups	0.038	1	0.038	0.035	0.853
within Groups	386.459	350	1.104		
total	386.497	351			

In the Table 9, F=0.035, P > 0.05, the two numbers show no relation between "grade" and "major learning". The conclusion is consistent with teachers' answers in the opening question.

Hereby, it's sensible that linguistic lessons should be set up to encourage students to lay a solid foundation for further study according to various situations in different universities. For this investigation, bilingual courses are offered for seniors in two universities, such as, English Business Correspondence, Legal English Comprehension Course in Hubei University for Nationalities and Guizhou Normal University. However, bilingual courses in Guizhou Normal University are accessible to freshmen.

Until now, this paper has carefully talked about the influence imposed by English on major learning. On the contrary, the effect of English brought about major learning will be discussed later.

Generally, during bilingual course learning, students do not only have to master a multitude of general terms or jargons, but also have a good command of profession knowledge. With regard to students, how to deal with the relationship within limited time between them is of importance. Thus this paper makes a one-way ANOVA analysis between "English abilities" and "major learning" (see Table 10).

Table 10. A One-way ANOVA Analysis between "English abilities" and "Major Learning"

	sum of squares	df	mean square	F	Sig.
between groups	56.245	4	14.061	12.217	.000
within groups	399.380	347	1.151		
total	455.625	351			

In the Table 10, F = 12.217, P < 0.05 shows "English abilities" and "major learning" have a notably positive correlation. With the growth of profession knowledge, English abilities also improve and vice versa. Not disturbed by English--the language problems, the bilingual courses can exert deserved effects.

To sum up, the relationship between "English level" and "major learning" shows at least two points. On the one hand, the bilingual teaching is not typically one, and students can also understand the teaching contents even if they are not good at English. On the other hand, compared with traditional classes, bilingual teaching uses English more frequently, which enhances students' English performance.

4.3 Study Attitudes

The learning process is relatively complex. So, this part is determined to find out the features of bilingual courses from "study attitude", "study methods" and "after-school study" three aspects. In accordance with feedback from students, this paper is intended to explore the influential factors in bilingual teaching so that sensible advice can be put forward in bilingual teaching (see Table 11).

Table 11. The Other Influential Factors in Bilingual Teaching

	Frequency (%)					Chi-square	F Sig.
	never	seldom	average	often	always		
7. skip the class	40.9	31.3	16.2	8.2	3.4	16.550	2.249 P>0.05
8. preview	13.6	38.1	31.0	12.5	4.8	47.034	8.619 P<0.05
9. to look up new words and phrases in advance	9.9	24.4	36.6	21.3	7.7	52.791	7.384 P<0.05

To follow the teaching schedules, adequate preparation is the premise condition, especially for bilingual courses which

have many general terms, fast teaching tempo, less class time, and too many contents. Obviously, students may have trouble in following or understanding the knowledge without enough preparation. From Table 11, Sig<0.05, Chi-square values are 47.034, 52.791 respectively. Evidently, "preview" and "to look up new words and phrases in advance" have association with learning outcomes. As might be imagined, previewing the whole text can also equip students with the ability to tell apart the focuses and difficulties. What's more, to have a face-to-face talk with the teacher may solve the puzzles in time.

It can easily be noticeable that "skip the class" has no influence on bilingual courses learning. It's usually acknowledged that skipping the class, to some extent, ruins a good student. But now the data provokes an opposite conclusion which goes against people's common sense. By deep talks with students, the fundamental reason perhaps is that bilingual courses have different requirements for students and belong to special types of curriculum compared with traditional lessons. Currently, bilingual courses in western China are designed to widen students' horizon. They are major lessons but not specialized core courses, such as English Business Correspondence. In students' eyes, these courses go beyond professional knowledge. Take one student's opinion for example. Mr. Xiang, a senior student from law school in Hubei University for Nationalities, held that Legal English which introduces federal law system of USA has no relation at all with his professional knowledge. When it comes to the meaning or main contents of professional knowledge, he explained basically the Judicial Examination covers the core knowledge of his major. Above all, to pass the Judicial Examination can offer students a good job. That's their real thoughts--not for knowledge but a good job. So, it occurs to everyone that bilingual courses seemingly have no effect on profession knowledge learning. On the contrary, instead of having bilingual courses, they would like to prepare for other professional courses which may help them a lot. Moreover, similar to traditional courses, bilingual courses applied the closed-book exam to test their courses. Students who skip classes can also pass the exam as long as they review carefully. What's more, they can use information in Chinese edition and translate it into English in the final or formal test. In the view of this point, traditional assessment methods cannot adapt to the requirements of bilingual courses and also violate the original intention of bilingual courses.

Apparently, effective assessment methods are a key to encouraging students to learn more in bilingual courses, which is also another aspect in this investigation (please see more details in the fourth part of this chapter).

4.4 Study Methods

Three aspects can be concluded: improve English skills, actively participate in discussions, review and sort out notes. In fact, every single method has a big or small influence on study, especially methods closely linked with English. To be concrete, vocabulary is the foundation of ESP (English for specific purposes); listening and oral English is the guarantee of understanding classes; reading major-related Newspapers and watching programs provide the latest information with students.

Table 12. The Influence of Study Methods on Bilingual Teaching

	Frequency (%)					Chi-square	F Sig.
	never	seldom	average	often	always		
5. train listening and oral English	8.2	37.8	33.2	14.8	6.0	79.422	7.126 P<0.05
10. join in class discussion	8.2	30.1	41.8	12.5	7.4	48.386	6.221 P<0.05
11. ask teachers questions	16.5	35.5	30.7	13.4	4.0	37.442	4.550 P<0.05
12. take notes	4.0	17.0	38.9	29.5	10.5	57.570	4.274 P<0.05
16. read major-related magazines, Newspapers	9.4	35.8	32.7	17.0	5.1	38.655	3.991 P<0.05
17. watch major-related English programs	9.9	35.5	33.0	19.0	2.6	63.734	3.901 P<0.05

In addition, students' class performances affect learning outcomes, too. Chi-square values of "join in class discussion", "ask teachers questions" and "take notes" are 48.386, 37.442, and 57.570. The more students participate in the classes, the more knowledge they obtain. As a matter of fact, taking part in classes actively can be win-win matter which they do

not only enjoy free and equal atmosphere, but also enhance their profession lore.

Moreover, this paper also makes further researches in "after-school study". After-school study is to review, to summarize. From Table 14, various ways of After-school study can be of benefit. Nevertheless, to be noticeable, 12.1%, 4.8% and 4.5% respondents would always finish homework independently, always plan to review, always enhance knowledge in different ways respectively. It suggested a terrible result that most students didn't review to deepen their understanding of knowledge or to put what they learned into practice.

Table 13. The Influence of Review on Bilingual Teaching

	Frequency (%)					Chi-square	F Sig.
	never	seldom	average	often	always		
13. finish homework independently	5.1	15.1	38.4	29.3	12.1	45.314	5.050 P<0.05
14. plan to review	6.8	27.6	44.3	16.5	4.8	58.906	11.273 P<0.05
15. enhance knowledge in different ways	6.5	30.4	42.0	16.5	4.5	48.362	7.940 P<0.05

4.5 Teachers' Qualities

Designed to collect students' opinions on teachers' qualities, two questions are to be presented as follows. First, are the students satisfied with teachers' professional levels? Second, are the students pleased with teachers' English levels? This paper is determined to find out the relationship between teachers' qualities and students learning outcomes (see Table 14).

The correlation coefficients between teachers' qualities and students' English levels are 0.244, $P < 0.01$, 0.343, $P < 0.01$. Obviously, it indicates that notable correlations exist among these factors. The more students are satisfied with teachers' qualities, the more outstanding they will be. Meanwhile, teachers have to meet the higher requirements.

Table 14. The Relationship between Teachers' Qualities and Students Learning Outcomes

	teachers' professional levels	teachers' English levels	student profession learning	students' English levels
teachers' professional levels	1.000	.683** Sig .000	.125* Sig .019	.343** Sig .000
teachers' English levels	.683** Sig .000	1.000	.157** Sig .003	.244** Sig .000
student profession learning	.125* Sig 0.019	0.157** Sig 0.003	1.000	.358** Sig .000
students' English levels	.343** Sig .000	.244** Sig .000	.358** Sig .000	1.000

** In the confidence level (bilateral) 0.01, the correlation was significant.

* In the confidence level (bilateral) 0.05, the correlation was significant.

4.6 Assessment Methods

Generally speaking, assessment methods are one of important norms which test students learning outcomes. A proper assessment method can develop students' abilities, stimulate the students' interest. To find an assessment method suitable for students' current abilities, this paper plans to test the effectiveness of three assessment methods by Chi-square test, one-way ANOVA.

In the Table 15, with much bigger Chi-square values and F values, the oral+ written test is popular with students. And it is certain that the oral+ written test plays a positive role in promoting students learning knowledge. With a line chart showing below, the similar conclusion can be reached, too. The chart can be described in this way. That is, with the increasing usage of it, students' professional knowledge keeps growing, too.

Table 15. The Assessment Methods for Students' Current Abilities

	Frequency (%)					Chi-square	F Sig.
	never	seldom	average	often	always		
19. the oral+ written test	7.4	17.6	37.5	25.0	12.0	77.775	15.844 0<0.05
20. English short essay	8.5	20.5	37.2	23.6	10.2	40.440	5.474 0<0.05
21. open-book test	8.2	13.1	33.5	26.7	18.5	35.464	0.349 0.845>0.05

Besides, 45.2% students choose "often" or "always" with the idea that it would be better for them to take open-book exam. However, popular as it is, together with $P > 0.05$, the Chi-square value of the test is much smaller than that of another two assessments. It is sufficient to say open-book exam is not worth being advocated with the fact that the small correlation coefficient exists between the test and professional knowledge learning.

Many possible factors which may affect the teaching results of bilingual teaching have been discussed seriously. However, this paper still fails to know the certain key factors that directly influence bilingual teaching and its consequence. With the help of regression analysis, this paper is engaged in solving the problems in the part.

Table 16. The Conditions of Conducting Regression Analysis

	sum of square	df	mean square	F	sig
regression	163.622	3	54.541	85.160	.000
residual	222.876	348	0.640		
total	386.497	351			

From Table 16, with the result of F test, it is indicated that the positive linear equation established in the below is acceptable and efficacious.

Table 17. The Results of Regression Analysis

	B	t	Sig	tolerance	VIF
constant	.467	2.328	.020		
attitude	.444	10.647	.000	.872	1.147
understanding level	.315	6.465	.000	.931	1.075
the oral+ written test	.144	3.386	.000	.841	1,189

From Table 17, on the one hand, if the significance level is 0.05, $P < 0.05$, this paper has to refuse the original hypothesis that there is no positive correlation between these variables. On the other hand, by the values of "tolerance" and "VIF", it's proper to establish the linear equation. So, "students' attitude", "understanding level" and "the oral+ written test" are involved in the linear equation and correlation coefficients are 0.444, 0.315, and 0.144 respectively. And the linear equation follows:

$$Y=0.467+0.444X_1+0.315X_2+0.144X_3 \tag{1}$$

Notice: X_1–attitude，X_2– understanding level, X_3–the oral+ written test.

Therefore, "students' attitude", "understanding level" and "the oral+ written test" are the key factors in influencing the teaching results of bilingual teaching in terms of students.

5. Conclusion

From the perspective of students, the student's questionnaire is designed to investigate the present situation of bilingual teaching in western China. Thanks to 352 students who gladly answer questionnaires, this paper finished the investigation, collected the data and information by interview, class observation, questionnaires, and analyzed the data by SPSS. The research has three findings.

1) The research finds that learners have pessimistic attitude toward bilingual teaching and don't realize that the great importance of bilingual teaching in terms of personal development in the long run.

2) The efficiency of bilingual teaching is affected by a multitude of factors, including students' attitudes and learning methods, learning situation in and after class, teacher's levels and assessment methods, especially, students' understanding level.

3) The thesis also investigates the evaluation systems of bilingual teaching and finds that students prefer the combination of oral and written exam.

Based on the result of this survey, this paper tries to put forward several suggestions to settle these problems.

1) It's necessary for universities, teachers to give publicity to bilingual teaching to arouse students' interest and change their negative attitudes towards bilingual teaching.

2) By undertaking small-class teaching, students are encouraged to seize opportunities of taking part in class discussions in English.

3) Do not confine the assessment methods within the written test. Combined with other assessment methods, the oral + written test may gain unexceptional consequences.

4) Seeking bilingual teachers who possess multi-culture backgrounds and solid professional foundation, universities had better make strategies to improve the teachers' qualities. At the same time, training opportunities should be provided with teachers.

Acknowledgements

References

Baker, C. (1988). *Key Issues in Bilingualism & Bilingual Education*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Baker, C. (1993). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. New York: Multilingual Matter Ltd.

Baker, C. (2001). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. Clevedon: Multilingual Matter Ltd.

Baker, C. (2001). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. Philadelphia: Multilingual Matter Ltd.

Bialystok, E. (2016). Bilingual education for young children: review of the effects and consequences. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 1-14.

Cai, C., Zhang, C., Wang, Y., Xiong, L., Jin, Y., & Jin, C. (2016). Nursing students' satisfaction with bilingual teaching in nursing courses in China: A meta-analysis. *Nurse education today, 44*, 51-58. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2016.05.014

Colin, B., & Sylv, I. P. J. (2006). *Encyclopedia of Bilingualism and Bilingual Education*. Frankfurt Lodge: Multilingual Matters Ltd.

Deng, B. (2017). *Bilingual Teaching Efficiency of Prosthodontics in Different Teaching Methods*. In Humanity and Social Science: Proceedings of the International Conference on Humanity and Social Science (ICHSS2016), 96-101. https://doi.org/10.1142/9789813208506_0014

Garrity, S., Aquino-Sterling, C. R., Van Liew, C., & Day, A. (2018). Beliefs about bilingualism, bilingual education, and dual language development of early childhood preservice teachers raised in a Prop 227 environment. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, *21*(2), 179-196. https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2016.1148113

Hornber, N. H. (1998). *Encyclopedia of Language and Education*. New York: Springe, Ltd.

Huang, A. (2011). *A Study on Bilingual Education Theories and Practices*. Shanghai: Shanghai People's publishing House.

Jack, C. Richard, J. P., & Heidi, P. (1992). *Longman Dictionary of Language Teaching & Applied Linguistics*. London: Longman Group UK Limited.

Krashen, S. (1981). *Second Language Acquisition and Second Language Learning*. Oxford: Pergam.

Krashen, S. (1982). *Principles and Practice in Second Language Acquisition*. Oxford: Pergam.

Krashen, S. (1999). *Condemned without a Trial: Bogus Arguments against Bilingual Education*. Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann.

MacSwan, J., Thompson, M. S., Rolstad, K., McAlister, K., & Lobo, G. (2017). Three theories of the effects of language education programs: An empirical evaluation of bilingual and English-only policies. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics, 37*, 218-240. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0267190517000137

Menken, K., & Solorza, C. (2014). *No child left bilingual: Accountability and the elimination of bilingual education programs in New York City schools. Educational Policy, 28*(1), 96-125. https://doi.org/10.1177/0895904812468228

Oattes, H., Oostdam, R., de Graaff, R., & Wilschut, A. (2018). The challenge of balancing content and language: Perceptions of Dutch bilingual education history teachers. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 70*, 165-174.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2017.11.022

Siguan, M., & Mackey, W. F. (1987). *Education and Bilingualism*. Paris, in association with UNESCO.

Xiao, W. W., & Wang, L. L. (2017). Effectiveness evaluation model of bilingual teaching in undergraduate colleges. *Journal of Discrete Mathematical Sciences and Cryptography, 20*(6-7), 1333-1337. https://doi.org/10.1080/09720529.2017.1395151