# Morphometric Separation Of Annual Cohorts Within Mid-Atlantic Bluefish, Pomatomus Saltatrix, Using Discriminant Function Analysis 

Herbert Austin<br>Virginia Institute of Marine Science

Daniel Scoles
Allison J. Abell

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.wm.edu/vimsarticles
Part of the Aquaculture and Fisheries Commons

## Recommended Citation

Austin, Herbert; Scoles, Daniel; and Abell, Allison J., "Morphometric Separation Of Annual Cohorts Within Mid-Atlantic Bluefish, Pomatomus Saltatrix, Using Discriminant Function Analysis" (1999). VIMS Articles. 585.
https://scholarworks.wm.edu/vimsarticles/585

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by W\&M ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in VIMS Articles by an authorized administrator of W\&M ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact scholarworks@wm.edu.


#### Abstract

Larval and tagging studies neither support nor refute the existence of two mid-Atlantic stocks of bluefish, Pomatomus saltatrix, one that spawns just south of Hatteras, North Carolina, in the spring, and the other off New England in the summer. Subsequent studies have suggested either a continuous spawning with two survival events, or two distinct spawning events, one in spring south of H atteras, NC, and a second in mid-summer from Long Island to New England. Genetic studies have supported a single stock because they show the existence of a single gene pool. A stepwise linear discriminant function analysis (DFA) of morphometrics of "spring-spawned" yearling ( $200-400 \mathrm{~mm}$ ) and older ( $>400$ mm ) bluefish did not classify fish by probable spawning cohort. It did, however separate the yearling fish (200400 mm ) by year class rather than geographic or seasonal spawning. Older fish ( $>400 \mathrm{~mm}$ ) showed less separation because multiple (2-10) year classes were present. The DNA studies have revealed genetic homogeneity among these fish. This finding suggests that the morphological characteristics are phenotypically plastic and are influenced each year by the physical environment during spawning and the early juvenile stages.


Manuscript accepted 14 August 1998. Fish. Bull. 97:411-420 (1999).

# Morphometric separation of annual cohorts within mid-Atlantic bluefish, Pomatomus saltatrix, using discriminant function analysis* 

Herbert M. Austin<br>Daniel Scoles

Allison J. Abell<br>School of $M$ arine Science<br>Virginia Institute of $M$ arine Science<br>College of William and $M$ ary<br>Gloucester Point, Virginia 23062<br>E-mail address (for H. M. Austin): Haustin@vims.edu

Thequestion of bluefish (Pomatomus saltatrix) stock composition along the east coast of the United States has been of considerable interest to fisheries scientists for 30 years and has recently (since 1986) becomethe focus of discussion by management agencies, primarily the Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission (ASMFC) and Mid-Atlantic Fisheries Management Council (MAFMC) (Anonymous, 1989). The problems of managing fisheries when the stock composition and boundaries are unclear have hampered effective management of weakfish, Cynoscion regalis, summer flounder, Paralichthys dentatus, surf clam, Spisula solidissima, and striped bass, Morone saxatilis by theASMFC or MAFMC (or both) because current management practices manage by unit (genetic) stock. Interstate management is further hampered when a unit stock exhibits differential spatial reproduction and migration patterns (e.g. weakfish, Scoles, 1990).

The stock structure of the bluefish (Pomatomus saltatrix) in the western mid-Atlantic region is not well understood. Lund (1961) recorded meristic counts of gill rakers along the first branchial arch of young fish and suggested that six separate stocks of bluefish occur
along the western north Atlantic coast of the United States. He later suggested the occurrence of several races in this region on the basis of results of two mark-recapturestudies (Beaumariage and Wittich, 1966; Lund and Maltezos, 1970). These results were not supportive of Lund's original six stock concept because they suggested that there might be a "Florida" or "South AtIantic Bight" and a "northern" or "mid-Atlantic Bight" stock. Subsequent analyses of temporal and spatial distributions of bluefish in the ichthyoplankton, and spawning times, suggested two north Atlantic stocks (Norcross et al, 1974; Kendall and Walford, 1979), in addition to a south Atlantic or Florida Stock (Collins and Stender, 1987).

Chiarella and Conover (1990), on the other hand, using back calculations of scales, demonstrated that most spawning in the north midAtlantic Bight (MAB) occurs during mid-summer (J uly) and is composed of spring-spawned fish, both of which suggest a single stock. They also found from back calculations that most yearling fish (260 mm ) collected in waters along Long

[^0]Island during 1986-87 were spring-spawned. Later, McBride and Conover (1991), looking at young-of-the-year bluefish in the New York Bight during the summers of 1987 and 1988, found two discrete size groups by late summer ( $150 \mathrm{~mm}, 75 \mathrm{~mm}$ ). Their otolith analyses confirmed that the fish represented both spring- and summer-spawned cohorts.

More recent larval studies (Smith et al., 1994; Hare and Cowen, 1993) suggest an alternate hypothesis, that of a continuous wave of spawning by a single stock from off Hatteras in April-May to off CapeCod or Block Island in J une-J uly with two survival events, one in spring and onelater in the summer as a result of oceanographic conditions. These survival events may have led to the previous hypothesis of two distinct spawning events. At any rate, the genetic anal yses of Graves et al. (1993), using mtDNA, have shown that progeny from both the spring and summer spawning were of the same stock, and that mid-Atlantic Bight bluefish composea singlegenetic stock. The various hypotheses have been revisited by J uanes et al. (1996) in a review of global bluefish early life history.

A characterization of the seasonal movement and spawning of what was then (1977) considered the north Atlantic stocks was summarized by Wilk (1977). Before the advent of routine genetic testing, Wilk (1977) conducted a morphometric analysis of yearling fish from the North Carolina sounds and MiddleAtlantic Bight to test thehypothesis that two stocks of bluefish occurred in themid-Atlantic Bight. The preliminary data, results, and manuscript were lost in the 1984 NMFS/NOAA Sandy Hook Marine Laboratory fire. Wilk did find morphometric differences that were statistically significant (Wilk ${ }^{1}$ ). If these two geographically separate spawnings are by the same stock, as demonstrated by Graves et al. (1993), but exhibit morphological differences as suggested by Wilk, perhaps due to environmental phenotypic plasticity, then a potentially valuable tool for management exists, particularly if growth, and recruitment or harvest pressure (or both) are different. With this possibility in mind, we conducted a morphometric analysis of bluefish collected in the mid-Atlantic Bight of the U.S. east coast.

## Methods

A total of 1386 bluefish, ranging in size from 93 to 888 mm TL, were collected from April 1987 through

[^1]April 1990 from several locations between eastern Long Island, New York, and Beaufort, North Carolina. Samples were pooled on the basis of geography and date-year of collection (Tables 1 and 2). Most were collected from pound and gill nets, but several small fish were taken by $10.8-\mathrm{m}$ ( $30-\mathrm{ft}$ ) otter trawl. The majority of fish over 600 mm TL were collected by hook and line tournament fishermen.
Twenty two morphometric measurements were recorded from the left side of the fish with a meter stick or dial calipers to the nearest millimeter. Names of morphometric variables and abbreviations are provided in Table 3. Scales were removed from under the pectoral fin of each fish, mounted on acetate sheets, and ages were determined with a microfilm reader according to the techniques of Hill and Loesch. ${ }^{2}$
Samples were classified by using stepwise linear discriminant function analysis (DFA) (Fisher, 1936) with SPSS software program (Norusis, 1985). An excellent introduction to the statistics of discriminant analysis is presented by Klecka (1989) in which all assumptions and shortcomings of the methods are discussed. Allometric growth can cause bias, and although it is recognized that it is impossible to remove all allometric bias, Riest (1985), in a review of transformation methods, has offered Thorpe's (1975) as among the best in this situation. Schaefer (1990) and Scoles (1990) al so used this technique and found it satisfactory for removing size effects during morphometric analyses of tuna and weakfish.
Consequently, all measurements weretransformed following equations taken from Thorpe (1975) where

$$
\begin{gathered}
\hat{\hat{Y}}=10^{\hat{Y}} \\
\hat{Y}_{i}=\log _{10} Y_{i}-b\left(\log _{10} X_{i}-\log _{10} \overline{\bar{X}}\right)
\end{gathered}
$$

where $\hat{\hat{Y}}_{i}=$ the adjusted variable of the ith specimen;
$Y_{i}=$ the variable to be transformed of theith specimen;
b = the allometric coefficient;
$X_{i}=a$ standard measure of size of the ith specimen for which fork length was used; and
$\overline{\bar{x}}=$ the grand mean of standard lengths.
A third equation, combining the first two provides

$$
\log _{10}\left[Y_{i} / \hat{Y_{i}}\right]=\operatorname{bLog}_{10}\left[X_{i} / \overline{\bar{X}}_{i}\right],
$$

[^2]Table 1
Bluefish collection data: date, location, number of fish collected, and gear used in collection. L.I. $=$ Long Island; L.I.S. $=$ Long Island Sound.

| Date |  | Location | n | Gear |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Mar 1987 | Hatteras, NC | 8 | Gill net |
| 30 | Apr 1987 | Aberdeen Creek, VA | 10 | Gill net |
| 30 | Apr 1987 | Mobjack Bay, VA | 21 | Gill net |
| 17 | May 1987 | Chesapeake Bay, VA | 32 | Hook and line |
| 14 | J ul 1987 | Hatteras, NC | 16 | Seine |
| 8 | J ul 1987 | Mobjack, VA | 12 | Gill net |
| 2 | Oct 1987 | New J ersey | 11 | Trawl |
| 6 | Nov 1987 | Chesapeake Bay, V | 44 | Hook and line |
| 12 | Apr 1988 | Norfolk, VA | 20 | Gill Net |
| 19 | Apr 1988 | Rappahannock R. | 19 | Pound net |
| 1 | May 1988 | York River, VA | 10 | Pound net |
| 12 | May 1988 | York River, VA | 1 | Pound net |
| 16 | J un 1988 | Ches. Bay, VA | 58 | Hook and line |
| 18 | Jul 1988 | Pt. Lookout, L.I. | 50 | Gill net |
| 19 | J ul 1988 | Peconic Bay, L.I. | 24 | Gill net |
| 19 | J ul 1988 | Montauk, L.I. | 71 | Hook and line |
| 25 | J ul 1988 | York River, VA | 26 | Pound net |
| 28 | J ul 1988 | Hatteras, NC | 85 | Pound net |
| 3 | Aug 1988 | York River, VA | 8 | Pound net |
| 5 | Aug 1988 | York River, VA | 76 | Pound net |
| 5 | Aug 1988 | L.I.S., CT | 15 | Trawl |
| 9 | Sep 1988 | L.I.S., CT | 171 | Trawl |
| 9 | Sep. 1988 | Potomac R. | 69 | Hook and line |
| 4 | Apr 1989 | Pamlico Sound | 81 | Various |
| 4 | Apr 1989 | Oregon Inlet, NC | 169 | Various |
| 15 | J une 1989 | Reedville, VA | 86 | Hook and line |
| 25 | J uly 1989 | New York, NY | 51 | Various |
| 15 | Aug 1989 | York River, VA | 103 | Pound net |
| 9 | Sep 1989 | Hatteras, NC | 42 | Pound net |

which more clearly shows $Y_{i}$ is an estimate of the average $Y_{i}$ for an individual of fork length $X_{i}$.

Following transformation, each variable was regressed against fork length (FL). The slope of each transformed variable on FL was zero or insignificant in all cases; therefore effects of allometry were disregarded. The results were plotted for visual inspection of outliers which were removed before subsequent analyses if they were outside the range of biologi cal possibility, and thus suggested measurement error. Consequently, two subgroups of data were developed. The first included bluefish between 200 and 400 mm fork length (yearlings), to remove young-of-the-year from the data which are in the stage of growth most likely to show allometry and to dupli-
cate the size range used by Wilk and Wal ford in 1964 (Wilk, 1977). The second group included bluefish greater than 400 mm fork length.
The linear discriminant function used here is of the form

$$
D=B_{1} X_{1}+B_{2} X_{2}+B_{3} X_{3}+\ldots \ldots \ldots . B_{n} X_{n}+C
$$

and is similar to a multiple linear regression
where $\mathrm{D}=$ the discriminant function that characterizes each reference group;
$\mathrm{X}_{\mathrm{n}}$ ' $\mathrm{s}=$ the independent variables (individual measurements) selected at in a stepwise fashion; and

Table 2
Discriminant function analysis sample groupings by location, year, and size category. Ches Bay = Chesapeake Bay.

| Group | Year | ID number | Sample size and length range ( mm , in parentheses) |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | 200-400 mm | $>400 \mathrm{~mm}$ |
| Summer Hatteras | 1987 | 1 | 14 (303-382) | 2 (417-441) |
| Summer Ches Bay | 1987 | 2 | 10 (258-316) | 37 (448-884) |
| Spring Hatteras | 1987 | 3 | - | 8 (684-765) |
| Spring Ches Bay | 1987 | 4 | 15 (325-385) | 30 (801-852) |
| Summer Ches Bay | 1988 | 5 | 11 (225-382) | 106 (570-830) |
| Summer Long Isl. | 1988 | 6 | 7 (219-395) | 174 (555-811) |
| Spring VA Coast | 1988 | 7 | - | 13 (471-731) |
| Spring Ches Bay | 1988 | 8 | - | 26 (471-757) |
| Summer Ches Bay | 1988 | 9 | 104 (245-291) | - |
| Summer Hatteras | 1988 | 10 | 85 (235-321) | - |
| Spring Hatteras | 1989 | 11 | 42 (357-398) | 101 (477-784) |
| Summer Ches Bay | 1989 | 12 | 128 (215-352) | 51 (405-525) |
| Summer Long IsI. | 1989 | 13 | - | 44 (418-734) |
| Summer Hatteras | 1989 | 14 | - | 29 (412-516) |
| Spring Pamlico | 1989 | 15 | 71 (357-398) | 7 (402-715) |
| Spring Ches Bay | 1990 | 16 | $26^{1}$ | $30^{1}$ |
|  |  |  | 524 (215-398) | 658 (402-884) |

${ }^{1}$ Length data lost.

Table 3
List of morphometric measurements on bluefish. Abbreviations and name of variable are those used in text.

| Abbreviation | Description |
| :--- | :--- |
| PMX | Premaxilla |
| MAX | Maxilla |
| IOB | Interorbital |
| POB | Postorbital |
| POP | Preoperculum ("cheek") |
| OPC | Operculum |
| HDP | Head depth |
| PCO | Pectoral fin origin |
| PCI | Pectoral fin insertion |
| PLO | Pelvic fin origin |
| PLI | Pelvic fin insertion |
| VNT | Vent |
| AFO | Anal fin origin |
| AFI | Anal fin insertion |
| D1O | First dorsal fin origin |
| D1I | First dorsal fin insertion |
| D2O | Second dorsal fin origin |
| D2I | Second dorsal fin insertion |
| GTH | Girth |
| TOL | Total length |
| FKL | Fork length |
| STL | Standard length |
| DSP | First and second dorsal space |
|  |  |
|  |  |

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathrm{B}_{\mathrm{n}} \mathrm{~S}= & \text { the coefficients or "unstandardized } \\
& \text { function coefficients"; and } \\
\mathrm{C}= & \text { a constant. }
\end{aligned}
$$

I nitially we intended to follow the 1960s methods of Wilk (1977) by assigning a spring-southern and summer-northern a priori reference designation. We were unable however, to collect a reference group of spring- and summer-spawned yearling bluefish. From the length frequencies of the yearling fish (211382 mm ) that we collected, it appeared that all were "spring-spawned" (Chiarella and Conover, 1990). As a result we made no effort a priori to separate "spring- spawned" from "summer-spawned" yearling fish on the basis of scale back calculations as Chiarella and Conover (1990) had done but assumed all were spring-spawned. A priori assignment of reference or learning groups is often used to determine the discriminant function which is then used to classify theindividuals of known origin to one or the other reference groups. If, however, more than two stocks are present, theindividuals of the third stock will be "force fitted" into one of the reference groups. Rather than forcing a priori assignments of two groups, and to identify possible additional stocks (from the south [McBride et al. 1993]) or morphometrically distinct


Figure 1
Scatterplot of canonical discriminant functions 1 and 2 for bluefish 200-400 mm showing locations of group centroids for 1987-90 by geographic area of collection.
groups as Wilk (1977) found, we conducted the DFA without a priori assignments.

Finally, an unweighted paired group method (UPGM) of clustering with arithmetic averages, a form of cluster analysis, was run to examine the relative distance between group centroids. Centroids that appear in a cluster are morphologically similar.

## Results

The first five canonical functions are listed because they carry the analysis through the $95 \%$ cumulative percentage for fish 200-400 mm (Tables 4 and 5); seven functions are included for the fish $>400 \mathrm{~mm}$; however, the eigenvalues (Tables 5 and 6 ) show that only the first two functions are important in each case. The discriminant scores and centroids from functions 1 and 2 were plotted against each other to develop a graphic representation of the relationship among groups (Figs. 1 and 2).

Wilk's 1960's (1977) analysis found that the interdorsal space was a discriminating character. To provide a comparison, we computed an "inter-dorsal

Table 4
Summary of stepwise discriminant function analysis for 16 groups and 16 morphometric characters. Fish were 200400 mm FL. See Table 3 for definitions of variables.

|  |  |  | Minimum |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Step <br> no. | Variable <br> entered | Wilk's <br> lambda | P | D | P |
|  |  | PLI | 0.44335 | $<0.0001$ | 0.00764 |
| 1 | HDP | 0.34477 | $<0.0001$ | 0.23817 | 0.8081 |
| 2 | MAX | 0.25160 | $<0.0001$ | 0.65660 | $<0.0001$ |
| 3 | DSP | 0.16585 | $<0.0001$ | 0.87455 | 0.0001 |
| 4 | OB | 0.13113 | $<0.0001$ | 1.20062 | $<0.0001$ |
| 5 | OPC | 0.12388 | $<0.0001$ | 1.29810 | $<0.0001$ |
| 6 | PCO | 0.10184 | $<0.0001$ | 1.44335 | $<0.0001$ |
| 7 | AFO | 0.09450 | $<0.0001$ | 1.47319 | $<0.0001$ |
| 8 | D2I | 0.08292 | $<0.0001$ | 1.55493 | $<0.0001$ |
| 9 | D1O | 0.07776 | $<0.0001$ | 1.62040 | $<0.0001$ |
| 10 | AFI | 0.07325 | $<0.0001$ | 1.67691 | $<0.0001$ |
| 11 | POB | 0.06806 | $<0.0001$ | 1.69120 | $<0.0001$ |
| 12 | POP | 0.06544 | $<0.0001$ | 1.70979 | $<0.0001$ |
| 13 | PMX | 0.05928 | $<0.0001$ | 1.72065 | $<0.0001$ |
| 14 | PLO | 0.05329 | $<0.0001$ | 1.72103 | 0.0001 |
| 15 | D1I | 0.04386 | $<0.0001$ | 1.72130 | 0.0001 |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |

Table 5
Summary of first five canonical discriminant functions. Fish were $200-400 \mathrm{~mm}$ FL.

| Function | Eigenvalue | Cumulative <br> percent | Canonical <br> correlation | Wilk's <br> lambda | Chi <br> squared | df | P |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 2.29051 | 48.91 | 0.834324 | 0.15912 | 935.6 | 150 | $<0.0001$ |
| 2 | 1.16710 | 73.84 | 0.733863 | 0.34483 | 541.6 | 126 | $<0.0001$ |
| 3 | 0.54375 | 85.45 | 0.593486 | 0.53234 | 320.9 | 104 | $<0.0001$ |
| 4 | 0.28451 | 91.53 | 0.470633 | 0.68379 | 193.5 | 84 | $<0.0001$ |
| 5 | 0.14586 | 94.64 | 0.356785 | 0.78354 | 124.2 | 66 | $<0.0001$ |

Table 6
Summary of the first seven canonical discriminant functions. Fish were $>400 \mathrm{~mm}$ FL.

| Function | Eigenvalue | Cumulative <br> percent | Canonical <br> correlation | Wilk's <br> lambda | Chi <br> squared | df | P |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 1.4858 | 42.4 | 0.77312 | 0.1880 | 1072.9 | 180 | $<0.0001$ |
| 2 | 0.8153 | 65.6 | 0.67016 | 0.3413 | 690.1 | 154 | $<0.0001$ |
| 3 | 0.4462 | 78.4 | 0.55546 | 0.4936 | 453.2 | 130 | $<0.0001$ |
| 4 | 0.2595 | 85.8 | 0.45387 | 0.6217 | 305.1 | 108 | $<0.0001$ |
| 5 | 0.1682 | 90.6 | 0.37945 | 0.7263 | 205.3 | 88 | $<0.0001$ |
| 6 | 0.0900 | 93.1 | 0.27740 | 0.7917 | 149.9 | 70 | $<0.0001$ |
| 7 | 0.0769 | 95.4 | 0.26722 | 0.8526 | 102.4 | 54 | $<0.0001$ |

Table 7
Summary of stepwise discriminant function analysis for 16 groups and 16 morphometric characters. Fish were $>400$ mm FL. See Table 3 for definitions of variables.

|  |  |  | Minimum |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Step <br> no. | Variable <br> entered | Wilk's <br> lambda | P | D | P |
|  |  | D1I | 0.7177 | $<0.0001$ | 0.0007 |
| 1 | D1I | 0.9364 |  |  |  |
| 2 | POP | 0.6367 | $<0.0001$ | 0.0288 | 0.8088 |
| 3 | PLO | 0.4628 | $<0.0001$ | 0.2543 | 0.0520 |
| 4 | DSP | 0.4326 | $<0.0001$ | 0.4455 | 0.1638 |
| 5 | HDP | 0.2946 | $<0.0001$ | 0.6365 | 0.0008 |
| 6 | AFO | 0.2645 | $<0.0001$ | 0.7851 | 0.0237 |
| 7 | PCO | 0.2483 | $<0.0001$ | 0.8786 | 0.0225 |
| 8 | PLI | 0.1813 | $<0.0001$ | 1.0243 | $<0.0001$ |
| 9 | D1O | 0.1653 | $<0.0001$ | 1.2288 | $<0.0001$ |
| 10 | POB | 0.1323 | $<0.0001$ | 1.2774 | $<0.0001$ |
| 11 | IOB | 0.1090 | $<0.0001$ | 1.3481 | $<0.0001$ |
| 12 | D2I | 0.1025 | $<0.0001$ | 1.4211 | $<0.0001$ |
| 13 | OPC | 0.0994 | $<0.0001$ | 1.4769 | $<0.0001$ |
| 14 | MAX | 0.0996 | $<0.0001$ | 1.5093 | $<0.0001$ |
| 15 | PMX | 0.0776 | $<0.0001$ | 1.5274 | $<0.0001$ |
| 16 | AFI | 0.0756 | $<0.0001$ | 1.5402 | $<0.0001$ |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |

space" term (DSP), as the difference between the first dorsal insertion (D1I) less the second dorsal origin (D2O). When the analysis was run with this new variable(DSP), it was selected as an important term in the functions (Tables 4 and 9).
The centroids for yearling fish do not fall into two classes, which would have suggested either a geographic north-south or temporal spring-summer spawned classification (Fig. 1); rather they fall into three clusters of cohorts by year class, regardless of geography of collection site (Table 10). F or example, collections during 1987 at Hatteras, North Carolina, and Chesapeake Bay, Virginia (the 1986 year class), are separate and distinct from both the 1988 and 1989 collections (1987 and 1988 year classes) and also from theHatteras and ChesapeakeBay collections. Further, the 1989 collections (1988 year dass) wereclassified into two groups, one of which was the same as the 1988 collection. The 1990 collection (1989 year class) fell in between 1988 and 1989, overlapping both.
The centroids of the large fish ( $>400 \mathrm{~mm}$ ), a mixture of up to 10 year classes in a sample, showed little geographic, temporal, or year-class classification (Fig. 2).


Figure 2
Scatterplot of canonical discriminant functions 1 and 2 for bluefish $>400 \mathrm{~mm}$ showing locations of group centroids for 1987-90 by geographic area of collection.

## Discussion

Several authors (Nyman and Conover, 1988; McBride, 1989; Simpson et al., 1990) working in the Long Island region and analyzing length-frequency data, reported exclusively spring-spawned young-of-theyear during 1985-86. Both spring-spawned and some late arriving summer-spawned young-of-the-year were collected therein 1987, and then a shift occurred to predominantly summer-spawned fish during the summer-fall of 1988.

Because ratios continued to be similar for the yearling fish in our collections and because length frequencies were also similar, our 1987 samples from Hatteras and the Chesapeake Bay were apparently from the predominantly spring-spawned 1986 year class. Our 1988 samples, the 1987 year class, were also predominantly spring spawned but were classified morphologically separate from the 1986 year class.

Our 1989 samples (the 1988 year class) from Hatteras, Chesapeake Bay, and Long Island showed a split classification, some the same as our 1988
samples (the 1987 year class) and the rest, separate from both 1987 and 1988 year classes. The 1990 samples, from a dominant 1989 year class, collected in the Chesapeake Bay, overlapped slightly between the 1987 and 1988 year classes (Fig. 1).
If the shift from spring-spawned to summerspawned young-of-theyear noted by the above authors for L ong Island holds for Chesapeake-H atteras yearling fish, then the morphol ogically distinct 1986 year class from our 1987 collections was composed of spring-spawned fish. The 1988-90 collections of the 1987-89 year classes, may be a mix of springand summer-spawned fish but show no separation. As stated earlier, however, our length frequencies of yearling fish in all years (1987-90) suggest that our samples were all spring-spawned fish (Table 2). An alternate explanation is that the morphologically distinct yearling fish, representing separate year classes or annual cohorts, and spawned in differing envi ronments each year are demonstrating environmental or phenotypic plasticity. That is, that their morphological characters are environmentally determined and are different each year.

## Table 8

Canonical discriminant function coefficients linear discriminant equation (Norusis, 1985): $D=B_{0}+B_{1} X_{1}+B_{2} X_{2}+$ $B_{3} X_{3} \ldots \ldots . B_{n} X_{n}$. See Table 3 for definitions of variables.

| Variable | Unstandardized function coefficients |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $200-400 \mathrm{~mm} \mathrm{FL}$ function |  | $>400 \mathrm{~mm} \mathrm{FL}$ function |  |
|  | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 |
| PMX | -11.3805 | -7.5218 | -5.8925 | -27.9831 |
| MAX | 1.2972 | 4.1059 | 8.0311 | 30.1133 |
| IOB | 11.3277 | -0.4940 | 2.0227 | 24.8566 |
| POB | -6.1778 | -18.1707 | -5.7929 | -45.9063 |
| POP | 6.1848 | 4.7921 | -5.1122 | 25.7729 |
| OPC | -26.3362 | 6.4774 | -2.5250 | -29.3489 |
| HDP | -0.6669 | 29.7938 | 26.4669 | 17.4505 |
| PCO | 36.7537 | -2.9036 | 1.8195 | -20.8899 |
| PLO | 10.1294 | -13.7243 | 20.1050 | -4.4471 |
| PLI | 26.8615 | 31.4590 | -57.1219 | 26.6134 |
| AFO | -31.2089 | 8.5720 | 42.9709 | -2.0460 |
| AFI | 31.6723 | 35.3519 | -24.5871 | 12.8353 |
| D10 | 4.0019 | -3.4074 | -35.3567 | -8.2396 |
| D11 | 12.8394 | -22.4628 | 48.7193 | $-14.1872$ |
| DSP | 0.2674 | 3.7165 | 1.3185 | 1.3386 |
| D21 | 32.9298 | -6.5686 | 3.9964 | 39.1365 |
| CONSTANT | -212.7263 | -118.6822 | -45.9465 | -78.7146 |

The larger fish in this study are a composite of at least ten year classes ( $2-11$ years); therefore separation or classification would be expected to be less precise. Indeed there was considerable overlap in classification of the larger fish (Table 10).

From results of the DFA, and in light of the back calculations of Chiarella and Conover (1990) and the genetic data of Graves et al. (1993), it would appear that there is only one stock of bluefish in the midAtlantic Bight and that the morphometric differences among bluefish cohorts are a result of phenotypic plasticity. Because the environment at the time of spawning and juvenile development varies geographically and interannually, so too will morphometric features. As the fish grow, their plastic morphological characters, expressed as an index of character length versus fish length, become less and less reliable; when year classes mix, as in our $>400 \mathrm{~mm}$ sample, they provide no discriminant characterization unless separated by individual year class.

Although a single genetic stock, the two MAB cohorts (spring- and summer-spawned), may exhibit interannual differential recruitment success and survival to yearlings. In addition, the reported differ-

Table 9
Canonical discriminant function group centroid means. * $=$ no collections from this size group

| Group | $200-400 \mathrm{~mm}$ |  | $>400 \mathrm{~mm}$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Function 1 | Function 2 | Function 1 | Function 2 |
| 1 | -1.1747 | -2.4628 | 2.2954 | -4.1523 |
| 2 | -1.8353 | -4.8299 | -0.7644 | -2.2536 |
| 3 |  | * | -0.9446 | 0.5734 |
| 4 | -1.4581 | -2.4707 | -0.4563 | -2.1051 |
| 5 | 0.2588 | 1.6696 | 0.9954 | 0.6740 |
| 6 | -0.4975 | 0.3665 | 1.3013 | -0.0488 |
| 7 |  | * | 0.8351 | -0.6780 |
| 8 |  | * | 1.4361 | -0.1726 |
| 9 | -1.4280 | -0.0648 |  | * |
| 10 | -1.0596 | 0.8962 |  | * |
| 11 | -0.7187 | 1.0913 | -0.0650 | 0.3479 |
| 12 | 2.2186 | -0.3778 | -1.1776 | 0.1391 |
| 13 |  | * | -1.5116 | 0.4816 |
| 14 | 2.7864 | 1.0578 | -1.3068 | 1.6483 |
| 15 | -0.2675 | 0.3093 | -0.7993 | 0.5799 |
| 16 | 1.1706 | -0.0615 | -1.9122 | 0.4894 |

ences in growth, seasons and location of spawning, migration routes, and variations in fishing mortality along the MAB can complicate management efforts if the two cohorts are managed as a single stock. Even for a single mid-Atlantic genetic stock, recruitment variations between spring and summer cohorts may be significant, year to year, and consideration should be given to monitoring the annual contribution of the spring-spawned and summer-spawned cohorts as the stock may be healthier when the spring-spawned predominate for several years running (Chiarella and Conover, 1990). The morphometric separation by year class provides evidence that the environment likely affects bluefish size and shape; this may prove to be a useful tool in separating yearling bluefish by the geographic area in which they spent their first year of devel opment.

## Conclusions

Previous larval and tagging studies neither support nor refute the existence of one or more MAB bluefish stocks, one that spawns just south of Hatteras, North Carolina, in the spring and the other off New England in the summer. The mtDNA analysis by Graves et al. (1993) suggests that there is one midAtlantic stock which from our results produces several environmentally induced morphotypes.

Table 10
Classification results by geographic area and year for fish 200-400 mm FL and fish $>400 \mathrm{~mm} \mathrm{FL}$. SU = Summer; SP =Spring; HA = Hatteras; CB =Chesapeake Bay; LI =Long Island; PS =Pamlico Sound, NC.


| 200-400 mm FL |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| SU/HA/87 | 1 | 14 | 64 | 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 7 |  |  | 7 |  |  | 14 |  |
| SU/CB/87 | 2 | 10 |  | 100 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| SP/CB/87 | 4 | 15 | 7 |  |  | 47 |  |  |  |  | 27 | 13 |  |  |  |  | 7 |  |
| SU/CB/88 | 5 | 11 |  |  |  |  | 46 |  |  |  |  | 27 |  |  |  |  | 9 | 18 |
| SU/LI/88 | 6 | 7 |  |  |  | 29 | 14 |  |  |  | 29 |  | 14 |  |  |  |  | 14 |
| SU/CB/88 | 9 | 104 | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 76 | 14 | 3 |  |  |  | 3 | 2 |
| SU/HA/88 | 10 | 85 |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 19 | 61 | 7 | 1 |  |  | 11 |  |
| SP/HA/89 | 11 | 42 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2 | 36 | 55 | 2 |  |  | 5 |  |
| SU/CB/89 | 12 | 128 |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 5 | 2 | 2 | 79 |  | 2 | 3 | 6 |
| SU/HA/89 | 14 | 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 64 |  | 27 | 9 |  |
| SP/PS/89 | 15 | 71 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 13 | 16 | 1 | 1 |  |  | 69 |  |
| SU/CB/90 | 16 | 26 | 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 4 | 15 |  |  |  | 4 | 69 |
| $>400 \mathrm{~mm} \mathrm{FL}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| SU/HA/87 | 1 | 2 | 100 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| SU/CB/87 | 2 | 37 |  | 73 |  | 14 |  | 8 |  |  |  |  |  | 3 |  |  |  | 3 |
| SP/HA/87 | 3 | 8 |  |  | 88 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 12 |  |  |  |  |  |
| SP/CB/87 | 4 | 30 |  | 13 |  | 70 | 7 | 7 |  | 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| SU/CB/88 | 5 | 106 |  |  |  | 1 | 53 | 26 |  | 2 |  |  | 9 | 4 |  | 1 | 1 | 3 |
| SU/LI/88 | 6 | 174 |  | 1 |  |  | 8 | 76 | 1 | 1 |  |  | 12 | 1 | 1 | 1 |  |  |
| SUNC/88 | 7 | 13 |  |  |  |  |  | 54 | 39 |  |  |  |  | 7 |  |  |  |  |
| SP/CB/88 | 8 | 26 |  | 4 |  | 4 | 8 | 27 | 8 | 35 |  |  | 15 |  |  |  |  |  |
| SP/HA/89 | 11 | 101 |  | 2 |  |  | 2 | 5 | 1 | 3 |  |  | 66 | 7 | 6 | 5 |  | 4 |
| SP/CB/89 | 12 | 51 |  | 2 |  | 4 | 4 | 6 | 2 |  |  |  | 33 | 35 | 6 | 6 | 2 |  |
| SU/LI/89 | 13 | 44 |  | 2 | 2 | 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 41 | 5 | 41 | 5 |  | 2 |
| SU/HA/89 | 14 | 29 |  |  |  |  | 10 |  |  |  |  |  | 10 |  | 4 | 69 |  | 7 |
| SU/PS/89 | 15 | 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 14 |  |  | 86 |  |
| SU/CB/90 | 16 | 30 |  | 7 |  |  |  | 3 |  |  |  |  | 11 | 12 | 7 | 7 |  | 47 |

## Acknowledgments

We wish to acknowledge the field assistance of Ana Beardsley and J an McDowell, as well as the officials of the various Virginia bluefish tournaments that made samples available to us. Critical review was provided by J ohn Graves and J ack Musick of VIMS. The most helpful comments of an anonymous reviewer strengthened the manuscript and weare most grateful to this anonymous colleague. The work was supported by a grant to the Virginia Institute of MarineScience from the U. S. Fish and WildlifeService, through the Virginia Marine Resources Commission, grant n number $\mathrm{F}-60-\mathrm{R}$.

## Literature cited

## Anonymous.

1989. Bluefish Fisheries Management Plan, Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission, Wash., D.C., 54 p.

## Beaumariage, D., and A. Wittich.

1966. Returns from the 1964 Schlitz tagging program, Florida. Board Cons. Tech. Ser. 47, 50 p. Florida Dep. Natural Resources, St. Petersburg, FL.

## Chiarella, L. A., and D. O. Conover.

1990. Spawning season and first-year growth of adult bluefish from the New York Bight. Trans. Am. Fish. Soc. 119:455-462.

## Collins, M. R. and B. W. Stender.

1988. Larval king mackerel (Scomberomorus cavalla), Spanish mackerel (S. maculatus), and bluefish (Pomatomus
saltatrix) off the southeast coast of the United States, 19731980. Bull. Mar. Sci., 41:822-834.

Fisher, R.
1936. The use of multiple measurements in taxonomic problems. Ann.-Eugenics 7:179-188.
Graves, J. E., J. R. McDowell, A. M. Beardsley, and D. R. Scoles.
1993. Population genetic structure of the bluefish, Pomatomus saltatrix, in Atlantic coastal waters. Fish. Bull. 90:469-475.
Hare, J. A., and R. K. Cowen.
1993. Ecological and evolutionary implications of the larval transport and reproductive strategy of bluefish, Pomatomus saltatrix. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 98:1-16.
J uanes, F., J . A. Hare, and A. G. Miskiewicz.
1996. Comparing early life history strategies of Pomatomus saltatrix: a global approach. Mar. Freshwater Res. 47:365-379.
Kendall, A., and L. Walford.
1979. Sources and distribution of bluefish, Pomatomus saltatrix, larvae and juveniles off the east coast of the United States. Fish. Bull. 77(1):213-227.

## Klecka, W. R.

1989. Discriminant analysis. Series: Quantitative applications in the social sciences. Sage Publ., Inc., Thousand Oaks, CA, 70 p.

## Lund, w.

1961. A racial investigation of bluefish, Pomatomus saltatrix of the Atlantic Coast of North America. Bol. del Inst'o. Oceanog. Venezuela 1(1):73-129.

## Lund, W, and G. Maltezos.

1970. Movements and migrations of the bluefish, Pomatomus saltatrix tagged in waters of New York and southern New England. Trans. Am. Fish. Soc., 99(4):719-725.
McBride, R. S.
1971. Comparative growth and abundance of spring- versus summer- spawned young-of-the-year bluefish, Pomatomus saltatrix, recruiting to the New York Bight. M.S. thesis submitted to the State Univ. of New York at Stony Brook, NY, 56 p.
McBride, R. S., and D. O. Conover.
1972. Recruitment of young-of-the-year bluefish Pomatomus saltatrix to the New York Bight: variation in abundance and growth of spring- and summer-spawned cohorts. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 78:205-216.
McBride, R. S., J. L. Ross, and D. O. Conover.
1973. Recruitment of bluefish Pomatomus saltatrix to es-
tuaries of the U.S. South Atlantic Bight. Fish. Bull. 91:389-395.
Norcross, J. J., S. L. Richardson, W. Massman, and

## E.J oseph.

1974. Development of young bluefish, Pomatomus saltatrix and distribution of eggs and young in Virginia waters. Trans. Am. Fish. Soc. 103(3):477-497.

## Norusis, M.

1985. SPSS advanced users guide. SPSS Inc., Chicago, IL, 474 p.
Nyman, R. M., and D. O. Conover.
1986. The relation between spawning season and the recruitment of young-of-the-year bluefish, Pomatomus saltatrix, to New York. Fish. Bull. 86(2):237-250.

## Riest, J. D.

1985. An empirical evaluation of several univariate methods that adjust for size variation in morphometric data. Can. J. Zool. 63:1429-1439.

## Schaefer, K. M.

1990. Geographic variation in morphometric characters and gill-raker counts of yellowfin tuna, Thunnus albacares, from the Pacific Ocean. Fish. Bull. 89:289-297.

## Scoles, D. R.

1990. Stock identification of weakfish, Cynoscion regalis, by discriminant function analysis of morphometric characteristics. M.S. thesis submitted to the College of William and Mary, School of Marine Science, Virginia Institute of Marine Science, Gloucester Point, VA 23062, 51 p.

## Simpson, D. G., P. T. Howell, and M. W. J ohnson.

1990. Assessment of bluefish in Long Island Sound with reference to the coastwide stock. Section 2, job 6 in A study of marine recreational fisheries in Connecticut., p 83104. Connecticut Dep. Environ. Cons., Hartford, CT.

## Smith, W., P. Berrien, and T. Pottoff.

1994. Spawning patterns of bluefish, Pomatomus saltatrix, in the northeast continental shelf ecosystem. Bull. Mar. Sci. 54(1):8-16.

## Thorpe, R.S.

1975. Quantitative handling of characters useful in snake systematics with particular referenceto intraspecific variation in the ringed snake, Natrix natrix. Biol. J . Linn. Soc. 7:27-43.

## Wilk, S.

1977. Biological and fisheries data on bluefish, Pomatomus saltatrix. U.S. Dep. Commer., NMFS/NOAA, Tech. Ser. Rep. 11, 55 p.

[^0]:    * Contribution 2143 from the Virginia Institute of Marine Science, College of William and Mary, Gloucester Point, VA.

[^1]:    ${ }^{1}$ Wilk, S. 1989. Sandy Hook Marine Laboratory, National Marine Fisheries Service, NOAA, Sandy Hook, NJ. Personal commun.

[^2]:    ${ }^{2}$ Hill, B., and J. Loesch. 1989. Striped bass research in Virginia: characterization of Virginia commercial fisheries. Annual Report 88-89, 22 p. Virginia Institute of Marine Science, P.O. 1346, Gloucester Point, VA 23062.

