

# Determinant's of Job Satisfaction & Employee Turnover in Pakistan Paint Industry

Usman Shami Nouman Ali Zohaib-ur-Rehman School of business and economics, university of management and technology, Lahore. Pakistan Email of the corresponding author; Usman shami10@yahoo.com

#### **Abstract**

#### **Purpose**

The aim of this research is to identify the factors that affect job satisfaction and turnover in the "Paint Industry" of Pakistan. Specifically, the study seeks to examine the relative effects of demographic and environmental factors on job satisfaction and turnover among the employees of such industries.

# Design/methodology/approach

A scale development process was used. The first stage was a review of the literature on the determinants of job satisfaction in order to generate a pool of items that reflect job satisfaction along with turnover construct. A list of items was then gathered to cover all facets of job satisfaction and turnover. In - depth interviews and thorough questionnaires were employed to generate additional items.

#### **Findings**

Overall, the findings show that in an Eastern culture such as the Pakistan, especially in the Paint Industry, internal factors play a more important role as the determinant's of job satisfaction or dissatisfaction that can lead to high or conversely, low turnover.

#### Originality/value

Given the importance of understanding the determinants of job satisfaction and turnover coupled with the dire need to fill the niche of research on the topic in our country; this study is of great importance to both academia and practitioners in the Paint Industry of Pakistan.

#### Introduction

This research paper highlights the role that environmental and demographic factors play in determining job satisfaction and turnover in the Paint Industry of Pakistan. Environmental factors include immediate job environment characteristics such as compensation and benefits, nature of work, supervisor support and relationship with co-workers. While demographic factors are associated with individual employees encompassing their age, gender, academic level and professional work experience. In the past, many studies and researches have been conducted to explore the determinants of job satisfaction and turnover in organizations (Spector 1997), however seldom research exists in this domain within the context of Pakistan. There have been numerous studies in the West, elucidating job satisfaction and turnover - but those studies cannot be directly applied to Pakistani organizations, especially the Paint Industries. This paper thus holds much significance as no prior study has been carried out pertaining to the Paint Industries of Pakistan. A large number of researchers and research bodies have claimed variance in the factors affecting job satisfaction and turnover across different cultures. (Spector, 2008; Kirkman and Shapiro, 2001; Diener et al., 2003; Vecernik, 2003; Kanungo and Wright, 1983; Lincoln and Kalleberg, 1985; Huang and Van de Vliert, 2004; Diener et al., 1995). Amalgamation of these factors hence now calls on researchers to consider the Eastern context while testing the determinants of turnover and job satisfaction. Comprehensively, this study is of great value for researchers and practitioners especially in the Paint Industry of Pakistan.

The prime objective of this study is to identify factors that affect job satisfaction and turnover in the Paint Industry of Pakistan. The study specifically targets the relative effects of environmental and demographic factors on job satisfaction and turnover among paint industry employees. This study is intended to make quite a few imperative contributions. Firstly as discussed earlier, all the studies that have been conducted so far are biased towards the western cultures - this study extends to form a similar line of research in Pakistan. Secondly, this study tries to overcome the limitation of research tools for determining job satisfaction and turnover, which are again strongly biased towards the Western societies. For this study, we expressly designed a job satisfaction and turnover questionnaire for Pakistani paint organizations. The questionnaire aimed at incorporating variables that have been reported to play a vital role in job satisfaction and turnover.

The remaining paper structure is as follows: the subsequent section includes a literature review of turnover and job satisfaction in which vital variables like determinants of job satisfaction and turnover are discussed and highlighted. The ext. section includes the methodology that describes the method of sampling and different steps that were used to build the research model. Towards the end, analyses presenting major findings of the research have been mentioned. Finally, the last section provides results and thus concludes the paper.



# Literature Review:

#### **Job Satisfaction:**

In 1976 Locke presented the most recognize definition of job satisfaction which state that, "job satisfaction as a pleasurable or positive expressive state resulting from the evaluation of the work of one person" the importance of this study of job satisfaction stems from two sets of important findings. First, job satisfaction is positive correlate with increased productivity and organizational commitment. job satisfaction is negative correlate with turnover intention and ultimately, with increased organizational effectiveness (Ellickson and Logsdon, 2001). The Second most important findings is that, low job satisfaction has negatively consequences, for instance leaving behavior and increased costs, declining profits and ultimately, customer dissatisfaction. (Zeffane and others, 2008). Researchers employ the term to indicate a mix of employee posture concerning different aspects of job satisfaction. For instance nature of work, career development, compensation and relationship with coworkers (Schermerhorn et, 2005, p.158).

In 1959, Herzberg and various factors coalesce to generate job satisfaction and dissatisfaction along with employees. Either motivators or hygiene factors are recognized by Herzberg. Job satisfaction is direct related to motivations, so motivators enhance employee job satisfaction. They consist of: (a) nature of work, (b) achievement, (c) recognition and reward (d) responsibility, and (e) career development. job satisfaction do not direct relate to hygiene factors among employees. On the other hand, nonappearance of hygiene factors may lead to employee job dissatisfaction. It consists of: (a) organization policy and strategy, (b) salary and compensation, (c) supervisor support, (d) relationship with co-workers, and (e) working condition. Both Motivators and hygiene factors are necessary to promote employee job satisfaction.

Salary has a gigantic tool to enhance employee job satisfaction. Many researchers are examined and tried to explore it (salary) impact on job satisfaction. Satisfy worker is the old belief due to this attention, "should they pay more". According to Rollinson(2008), there appears to be a link between pay and satisfaction if employees perceive their salary justice in relation to what other receives. Preceding investigations have establish that salary and job satisfaction is correlated when employee understand the fairness and salary justice (e.g. ellickson and logsdon, 2001; ting, 1997). Salary justice and fairness is an significant determinant of pay satisfaction than the actual amount of the payment (Williams et al,2006; Cohen-Charash and Spector, 2001). Employers gives a benefits in addition to salary is known as fringe benefits. Fringe befits can be financial recognition and/or non monetary, for instance accommodation, retirement plan, health insurance and travel tickets benefits (Aswathappa, 2005). The impact of fringe benefits on employee job satisfaction has been investigated less often, however previous studies strongly recommend that a positive relationship between fringe benefits and job satisfaction (Ellickson and Logsdon, 2001; barber et al, 1992).

A system of compensation for a business is positive correlate with the employee job satisfaction, because monetary strategies based on compensation method should appreciate (Lai, 2011). According to Lai (2011), with the efficient compensation system which leads in organizational growth and development and reveal a positive correlation between job satisfaction and skill based pay, job based pay and performance based pay. Previous findings deduce that the motivation is intrinsic factors, consisting; recognition, nature of work, career development, responsibility, reward and good feeling about the business that has a considerable relationship with employee job satisfaction. Job satisfaction include a precise characteristics related to salary, benefits, career opportunities, working condition, supervisor support, link between co-workers and organizational policy and strategies(Misener et al., 1996). Moreover, employee who has more satisfied have more involve in inventive ideas in incessant quality improvement and more active involvement in decision making in organization dynamics (Kivimaki and Kalimo, 1994). Job satisfaction is also established to be a positive direct relationship with customer's satisfaction (Rad&Yarmohammadian, 2006).

According to Herzberg and others (1959) categorized the recognition is a important factor which impact on employee job satisfaction. For instance, recognition may be monthly or annually award, gifts or official letter of thanks. Recognition as reliant rewards that are not essentially monetary (financial)(spector, 1997). Rewards are link to job performance and employee feel better satisfaction when rewards are given in terms of above average linkage to job performance(Jacob and Solomon, 1977). Recognition is direct association with satisfaction, if the lack of appropriate recognition for a good performance by an employee appears to be major dilemma for many businesses. For instance, employee who has little recognition which is not aligned with his performance, then he becomes more dissatisfied and frustrate (Mitchell, 2000). According to Heery and Noon (2001:355) supervisor is responsible for administration of staff; it's also called as a front-line manger. Supervisor support is a main factor which directly impact on employee satisfaction. The previous studies shows the perceptions of responsible activities of leaders favor more supportive behavior with colleagues, which lead to good environment in the work situate (Herrbach and Mignonac, 2004). Employees whose level of job satisfaction is higher when they work in a cooperative relationship with their front line manager (supervisor) (ting, 1997). A recurring analysis and assessment of an individual employee job performance is known as performance appraisal (spector, 2008). It is a helpful factor, which gives a precise data about an employee



performance. Makes a decision, for instance salary increasing and promotion is depend upon a performance appraisal (Poon, 2004). Performance appraisal is a significant positive link with overall job satisfaction (Ellickson and Logsdon, 2001).

According to Rollinson (2008:143), satisfactory relationship with co-workers reveals a encouraging and socially competent in individual job assignment. In fact, under social context of work is possible to have a considerable impact on employee attitude and conduct. Such as, if employee is work under consistent and cooperative context then the level of employee job satisfaction is higher than those who do not work under cohesive and cooperative environment (Purohit, 2004). Ellickson and Logsdon (2001) found that the positive relationship with the co-workers is a significant factor of employee job satisfaction. Organizational justice or perceived injustice is directly link with employee job satisfaction. The greater perception of organizational justice then the higher level of job satisfaction it means that organizational justice is positive correlate with job satisfaction and perceived injustice is negative correlate with job satisfaction (Al-Zu'bi, 2010). Employee job performance and job satisfaction are reflected on key factors which impact the organizational performance. Now a day that there are highly competitive international businesses must struggle to recognize variables which affect the job satisfaction and organizational performance. For instance that variable should be organizational justice; which is directly affect the organizational performance and job satisfaction (Fernandes and Awamleh, 2006).

The definition of organizational policy is a conduct or principle for the exercise of administrates and supervision that they compel to achieve a organizational goals. Organizational policy makes a clear direction of employee to achieve the prospect goals and which is ultimate positive impact on employee job satisfaction Betts (1983: 81). According to Locke (1976), he point out through his work on organizational policy, which reveal that organizational policy influence the other variables, for instance salary, promotion, justice and reward; hence, the value of organizational policy a considerable influence on other variables that is ultimate affect on job satisfaction. Job stress or workload is adversely impact on employee job satisfaction (Laura McCann, Carmel M. Hughes, Colin G. Adair and Chris Cardwell, 2009).

#### **Turnover Intention**

According to Agnes (1999), employee turnover is the proportion of the numeral of employees that have to be substitute in a given time phase to the average number of employees. It is simply says that turnover is the action takes place from the worker departure to his or her being replaced. Employee turnover is a often indicator of company presentation and without difficulty be noted as a negative factor towards company competence and effectiveness (Bax and Glebbeek, 2004). Turnover definition given by Price (1977) as: it is the proportion of number in which employees who has left the organization during the specific period being considered divided through the average numeral of people in that organization during the specific period. According to Woods (1995), position vacated in organization and then filling a vacancy through hire a new employee. This replacement phase is called as turnover.

According to Greenberg (1990), La Lopa and Bai (2001) proposed that most of the employees will decide to disappear in the organization when the organization cut their salaries. Konovsky and Folger (1989) mentioned that the level of salary considerably linkage with the employees organizational commitment and then ultimate impact on turnover intention. Levine (1993) pointed out that negative association with the salary and employee turnover. Attractive pay packages is one of the extremely significant and vital factor of retention because it meets the pecuniary and material needs and also providing the means of social existence through employee rank and the position of command in the organization. Many scholars show that there is a great pact of variation between individuals in understanding the importance of pecuniary rewards to retain the employee (Pfeffer, 1998; Woodruffe, 1999). Reward system for an institution that can affect the performance of the employee and their desire to continue to work (for example, Bamberger and Meshoulam, 2000, MacDuffie, 1995). Scholars have recognized perceived organizational support, job characteristics, supervisor support, perceived justice and reward and recognition as antecedents of employee retention (Sak 2006).

Many of the studies referred to supervisor support are direct relationship with job satisfaction then this lead to lower turnover intention. Supervisor has to give support or selflessness for employee regard, if supervisor do not do this then negative supervisor-employee interaction be able to in lower gratification with work, reduced productivity and absenteeism (Ribelin, 2003). According to Mobley et al (1979) conferred the significant task of the supervisor support in a turnover process. Supervisory support is negative relationship with turnover and positive with job satisfaction (Price, 2001). Previous Studies shows that unfair processes make unenthusiastic result in the workplace which leads to low job satisfaction and high turnover (Cropanzano & Greenberg, 1997; Folger & Cropanzano, 1998). According to Aghaei, Najaf, et al, (2012) concluded in their study that there is a significantly negative linkage between distributed justices and turnover intention. And also show in this study that there is no statistically significant linkage between approach justice and turnover intention. In this study also shown that there is a negative relationship exists between interaction justice and employee turnover intention.

According to Villanueva & Djurkovic (2009) established that organizational commitment and



employee job satisfaction partly mediated the link between work-related stress and intent to depart. More study also investigate the intent to leave are extremely influenced by employee job dissatisfaction, job stress and not have commitment to the association Firth et al., (2004). A further study shows that job stress to have a direct and pessimistic outcome on employee job satisfaction, which, consequence in abridged organizational commitment and that lead to intent of leaving and then lastly the real leaving from organization Wunder et al., (2001). More of the studies have perform to explicate the work environment with different facets like employee job satisfaction (laffaldano & Muchinsky, 1985) and employee turnover, retention, commitment and involvement (Martin 1979 Sjoberg & Sverke 2000). Work environment is one of the most significant factors in employee retention (Zeytinoglu & Denton, 2005).

Growth opportunities is provided by the employers to reduced the turnover intentions of employees because lack of promotional opportunities and training is the main reason of high performer and skilled employees leave their company (Allen, Shore & Griffeth, 2003; Steel et al., 2002). Murphy and Cleveland (1991) to investigate their study to tell about the use of performance appraisal is a method by the organization to continue follow of the contribution of each employee, effective performance appraisal allow the organization to check the employee whether they perform well or not and it likely to be able to track down of employee performance. Thus, this effective performance appraisal process is likely to enable to reduce involuntary turnover.

# **Context of Study**

We collected data from employees of six major paint organizations of Pakistan. Interesting fact is that Pakistan's paint industry can be divided into sectors, one known as the organized sector and the other termed as unorganized sector. There are approximately 22 paint producing units in the organized sector, including both multinational and national companies. Whereas overall industry consists of six major players, comprising of three multinational companies and three national companies that are operating in the country. Regarding the unorganized sector, it comprises of 350 paint producing units, according to an estimate. Majority of these paint units have not registered themselves with the relevant tax authorities, so they are not covered under the tax net. In this way they offer very low prices to their customers in local markets but compromise heavily on the quality. Federal Bureau of Statistics findings showed that last year 87 paint units produced approximately 30,000,000 liters of paint. There is an organized body that oversees the problems of paint industry named as PPMA (Pakistan Paint Manufactures Association). This association holds its meetings twice a year to overlook the industry situation and to forward their concerns to the government bodies regarding the problems of the paint industry.

Pakistan is a south Asian Muslim country. The national language is Urdu but English is well understood and used for the purpose of communication. Official religion of the state is Islam, which heavily affects the social life of people. Local cultures have a very close match with the religion. Pakistani society derives its laws, norms and values mainly from the core teachings of Islam.

Paint industry in Pakistan started its operation in 1950's, when Berger Paints started its business and became the first organized paint company of the country. Initially the industry had few hundred employees and the all the products were being imported from UK. But since then the industry has showed a very steady growth and is now one of the main tax payer of the country. Keeping in view the nature of the industry, job satisfaction and employee turnover are some serious issues for the employees. Paint industry of Pakistan consists of around 25000 direct and indirect employees. Paint industry like any other industry has a dire need to develop a very positive relationship with its employees in order to achieve the set organizational goals. As there is no formal research prior to our study, so it was highly recommended to highlight the job satisfaction and turnover factor among the paint industry employees.

## Methodology

## The Process of Scale development

The process of scale development was completed in different phases. In order to generate set of elements that reflect job satisfaction construct first phase of scale development started with thoroughly reviewing the literature available on determinants of job satisfaction. By reviewing of literature a list of items was prepared that was covering all the aspects related to job satisfaction. In order to gather additional items mangers related to paint industry were interviewed this exercise helps in accomplishing following goals:

- 1. Additional items
- 2. Clarity of the items
- 3. Deletion of unnecessary and repeated items
- 4. Direction clarity of items and
- 5. Extra useful recommendations



In 2003 Corbetta stated that for research purposes two different methods are used; inductive (theory building) and deductive (theory testing). Normally, an inductive research approach that associates data and theory is linked with qualitative research, whereas a deductive research approach is linked with the quantitative research. Where descriptive and expressive answers of questions are required rather than just facts and figures qualitative research approach is suitable (Bryman and Bell, 2007). Keeping this in view, researchers of this study decided to use quantitative approaches so factors influencing employee satisfaction and turnover intention in paint industry could be researched in detailed manner.

Survey instruments that were used to measure overall job satisfaction include Job in General Scale (JIG) that was established in 1989 by Ironson et al., Job Satisfaction established by Hackman and Oldham in 1975, and Job Satisfaction Blank Number Five established in 1935 by Hoppock. Survey instruments like Job Satisfaction Survey (JSS) was developed in 1985 by Spector, and Job Descriptive Index (JDI) developed in 1969 by Smith et al. are used to measure facts of job satisfaction. Survey instrument used to measure turnover intention of employees was developed by Rahman and Nas in 2013.

Data that is used in the study is primary and collected with survey technique. The use of survey techniques is aligned with research methods. In the survey tool close ended questions were developed. Questionnaire is developed on Likert-style rating scale which is frequently used in rating questions and more reliable than Thurston scale (Sarantakos. 1988). To measure the degree of agreement with the statement researchers of the study used five-point Likert scale (1 strongly disagree, 5 strongly agree). Questionnaire of the study is developed in two parts. First part of the questionnaire is aimed at determinants that may affect employee satisfaction and turnover intention. While, to get personal and demographic information second part of the questionnaire is designed.

This survey tool has drawback of unclear responses (Saunders et al., 2007). Researchers of this study used very clear, simple and appropriate language to tackle this limitation of the survey tool.

Validity of the content was focused and to ensure these initial gathered items were given to three different experts of job satisfaction with construct's definition (DeVellis, 2003). Briefly presentation given to experts about the research context and asked them to rate all the content on the scale from 1 to 3 (1 not at all representative, 2 to some extent representative, 3 clearly representative) according provided definition. Major changes took place in factors after the opinion of reviewers. Scale of survey tool was also finalized after reviewers' opinion. Those factors were deleted that were not appropriate according to reviewers and some of them were altered.

After completing and finalizing survey tool it was decided to distribute questionnaire in targeted organization through online soft copies (google docs) and hard copies. Using two different mediums was intentionally in order to maximize responses for the research. A total number of 800 paint company employees and 6 different paint companies were asked to fill questionnaires, from which 500 were returned and all of these were usable for research.

	State of scale development	Source of data	Provides evidence for
Step1	Constructing a definition and content dimension	Literature review	Understanding the concept of job satisfaction and turnover
Step2	Generating an item pool	Literature review, in-depth interviews(n=70) and focus group(n=10)	Face validity and content validity
Step3	Determining the format for measurement	Literature review, in-depth interviews(n=70) and focus group(n=10)	Reliability
Step4	Judging of items by experts	Experts judges (n=5)	Face validity and content validity
Step5	Designing a scale and pilot testing	Pilot study (n=10)	Face validity and content validity
Step6	Evaluating and finalizing the scale	Survey (n=500)	Reliability (cronbach alpha)

Table 1: stage and guidelines in scale development



# Job satisfaction

Variables	No. of items	Sig	Cronbach alpha
Variable 1: relationship with co-workers	6	.006	.988
Variable 2: organization policy and strategy	8	.001	.987
Variable 3: nature of the work	7	.025	.995

Table 2: shows the reliability value of job satisfaction

# Turnover

Variables	No. of items	Sig	Cronbach alpha
Variable 1: compensation and benefits	9	.006	.935
Variable 2: perceived injustice	4	.023	.65
Variable 3: Supervisor support	7	.04	.964

Table 3: shows the reliability value of turnover

	Coefficients <sup>a</sup>							
Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.		
		В	Std. Error	Beta				
1	(Constant)	.243	.331		.735	.465		
	RCO	.941	.094	.761	10.035	.000		
2	(Constant)	462	.349		-1.322	.190		
	RCO	.542	.131	.439	4.129	.000		
	OPS	.577	.144	.425	4.000	.000		
3	(Constant)	776	.366		-2.121	.037		
	RCO	.400	.142	.324	2.826	.006		
	OPS	.508	.143	.375	3.551	.001		
	NW	.296	.129	.220	2.297	.025		
a. I	a. Dependent Variable: SAT							

# Regression (job satisfaction)

Table 4: result of regression analysis for determining job satisfaction

# Regression (turnover)

IXC	Regression (turnover)								
	Coefficients <sup>a</sup>								
Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.			
		В	Std. Error	Beta					
1	(Constant)	4.142	.405		10.227	.000			
	СВ	579	.119	496	-4.877	.000			
2	(Constant)	3.102	.625		4.961	.000			
	СВ	596	.116	510	-5.129	.000			
	PI	.329	.153	.214	2.147	.035			
3	(Constant)	3.594	.655		5.487	.000			
	СВ	409	.145	350	-2.824	.006			
	PI	.347	.150	.226	2.317	.023			
	SS	320	.153	259	-2.087	.040			
a. I	a. Dependent Variable: TOI								

Table 5: result of regression analysis for determining turnover

	Coefficients <sup>a</sup>							
Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.		
		В	Std. Error	Beta				
1	(Constant)	4.152	.399		10.411	.000		
	SAT	548	.110	504	-4.983	.000		
a. I	a. Dependent Variable: TOI							

Table 6: result of regression analysis between turnover (dependant var) and satisfaction (indep var)



## **Data Analysis**

We have found more than 30 variables which can affect job satisfaction and turnover intention through previous studies. So keeping in mind we conducted in-depth interviews with industrial experts that resulted in the extraction of determining factors that have a major impact on job satisfaction and turnover in paint industry of Pakistan. After doing in-depth interviews in the second phase we concluded 9 factors that can affect job satisfaction and turnover in paint industry of Pakistan.

- Factor 1: Compensation & Benefits
- Factor 2: Supervisor support
- Factor 3: Organizational Policy & Strategy
- Factor 4: Relationship with Coworkers
- Factor 5: Career development
- Factor 6: Nature of work
- Factor 7: Job Stress
- Factor 8: Performance appraisal
- Factor 9: Perceived Injustice

We ran step-wise regression analysis, in the first test our dependent variable was job satisfaction. Test results showed that there are 3 out of 9 variables can affect employee job satisfaction in paint industry. Three factors are as follow.

- 1. Relationship with co-workers
- 2. Organizational policy and strategy
- 3. Nature of work

Out of nine variables these above stated three variables are impacting job satisfaction in paint industry. Result showed that the highly variable impact on job satisfaction is organizational policy and strategy ( $\beta = 0.508$ , p < .05) and it shows a positive link between job satisfaction and organizational policy and strategy. And other significant variables are relationship with co-workers ( $\beta = .4$ , p<.05) and nature of work ( $\beta = .296$ , p < .05) also shows positive link between job satisfaction and relationship with co-workers and nature of work. ANOVA also shows and represent our model is significant.

In our second step-wise regression test our dependent variable was turnover. Test results showed that there are 3 out of 9 variables can affect employee job satisfaction in paint industry. Three factors are as follow.

- 1. Compensation and benefits
- 2. Perceived injustice
- 3. Supervisor support

These three independent variables out nine are impacting employee turnover in paint industry. Result showed the highly variable impact on employee turnover is perceived injustice ( $\beta = .347$ , p < .05) and which shows positive relationship with employee turnover. And other significant variables are compensation and benefits ( $\beta = .409$ , p < .05) and supervisor support ( $\beta = .32$ , p < .05) which shows a negative relationship with employee turnover in paint industry of Pakistan. ANOVA also shows and represent our model is significant.

In the second phase we ran linear regression test in which dependent variable is employee turnover and independent variable is job satisfaction. Result showed that there is negative relationship between employee turnover and job satisfaction and also called as inversely proportional ( $\beta = -.54$ , p < .05).

In the third phase we tested demographic factors with job satisfaction and employee turnover. The result shows that the demographic variables are not significant.

# Discussion

The main objective of this research is to highlight and identify the main determinants of job satisfaction among paint industry employees. By utilizing the regression analysis technique, we have tried to see the relative impact of environmental and demographic variables on job satisfaction and employee turnover. After reviewing these results, our data findings show that environmental factors are the main determinants of job satisfaction and employee turnover. The past researches done in the western context also indicate that the demographic factors have had a scarce impact on job satisfaction (e.g. Carlan, 2007; Ellickson and Logsdon, 2001; Zhao et al., 1999; Forsyth and Copes, 1994). These findings are substantial and can help future researchers regarding the impact of environmental factors on job satisfaction and turnover in Pakistan's paint industry. Relying on these findings, researchers and industry practitioners should focus more on environmental factors rather instead of the demographic ones – which shall enable them to understand the reasons of why some individuals show higher job satisfaction as compared to others.

Another important aspect of the study is to develop a measurement scale that can be used to calculate job satisfaction among paint industry employees. There are scales that are already present, but are all from the western context, hence this research specifically aims to create a more suitable scale for Pakistan.



Of the 9 variables that can affect job satisfaction, "organizational policy and strategy" is the strongest determinant of job satisfaction. Our findings showed that employees from paint industries paid great value to organizational policies. These policies and strategies included norms and values, clearly stated job descriptions, less bureaucratic environments and giving importance to internal and external customers. As stated by Locke (1976), it is thus evident that clear procedures and policies play a vital role in helping employees to clearly understand their organizational goals - if there is a lack of understanding, where employees are unaware of the goals, dissatisfaction and low motivation become manifest. Our research in the paint industry further reveals that employee's working in paint organizations appreciate clear objectives and goals; they feel very comfortable with properly defined hierarchies and lines of authority.

Our results showed that relationship with co-workers is the second significant determinant of job satisfaction. This finding is quite interesting as it asserts that social relations are very important and have an intense affect on job satisfaction. Employees in the paint industry, who have a strong and supportive relationship with their colleagues, reported higher levels of job satisfaction. Coherently, individuals with weak social relationships exhibited low levels of job satisfaction. As the research has been carried out in an ideological country like Pakistan, where religion predominantly shapes people's behaviors – we believe the aforementioned findings may be an outcome of the teachings of Islam which preach strong bonds among groups attributed to the collectivist culture of the Pakistani society. This finding is in accordance with research carried out in other collectivist cultures where individuals/employees are reported to give high importance to collective work efforts. (Huang and van de Vliert, 2004).

Our findings further highlighted that the "nature of work" is the third most important determinant of job satisfaction in the paint industry of Pakistan. This factor encompasses autonomy in performing different activities and satisfaction with different types of tasks that may require a variety of skills to perform certain kinds of work. This is because of the fact that the "nature of work" can itself provide a chance for variety and new ideas, enabling employees to enhance their knowledge and responsibility (Hackman and Oldham, 1975). Interestingly, our findings are in line with the previous studies in the western context that show that nature of work has a very important role in an employee's job satisfaction factor (e.g. Herzberg *et al.*, 1959; Hackman and Oldham, 1975; Judge and Church, 2000; Wong *et al.*, 1998; Luthans, 2005).

As our study focuses on job satisfaction and employee turnover determinants, the discussion can now be carried on to determinants of employee turnover. Out of the nine factors perceived, injustice emerged as the most important determinant of employee turnover in the paint industry of Pakistan. These findings suggest that paint industry employees pay a great deal of attention to the equity factor and how they are treated in the organization. Previous research done in the western context shows that unfair processes result in the formation of unenthusiastic workplaces, which then leads to low job satisfaction and high turnovers (Cropanzano & Greenberg, 1997; Folger & Cropanzano, 1998). Hence our results are consistent with earlier studies, and show that if employees are not treated fairly, high turnover in paint organizations will be witnessed. Another fascinating fact that is present in the equity theory is that motivation for a employee will be on a higher side, if he considers himself to be treated fairly when compared to others (Redmond 2010). Individuals want themselves to be compensated and treated fairly for their efforts when compared to their colleagues - this belief of what is fair and what is not, heavily affects employee motivation, their attitude and obviously their behavior.

The second most powerful determinant of turnover as revealed by our findings is the "compensation and benefits" factor. Employees of paint industry pay a great amount of attention to compensation factors: such as salary, allowances, fringe benefits, financial rewards, etc. Remuneration or compensation can mean different in different cultures. While in rich western countries salary is seen as a recognition source (Locke, 1976), for workers in developing economies, salary can simply mean security (Al-Saadi 1996). Findings show that individuals put a strong emphasis on the salary factor in Pakistan because of its impact on the standard of living and in providing job security (Aksu and Aktas 2005). The higher the compensation, the lower the turnover. Furthermore, the reinforcement theory also states that an action followed by an incentive or reward has higher chances to reoccur in future (Thorndike's Law of Effect). If the employee gets reward for his efforts, he will naturally be satisfied, and this satisfaction will minimize the turnover rate. Conversely, in a situation where the employee does not get compensation for his efforts, there are chances of high turnover.

The third most significant determinant of employee turnover is "supervisor support". Findings expectedly reveal that supervisors have a very important role to play when it comes to the turnover factor – especially in high power distance societies like Pakistan, where supervisors have a very crucial role in defining the working lives of their juniors (Abu Elanain, 2009; Kirkman and Shapiro, 2001; Huang and Van de Vliert, 2004; Diener et al., 2003). In line with the previous researches our finding also elaborates that a healthy supervisor support will lead to a satisfied employee which in turn will minimize the turnover rate. However, in a scenario where the supervisor doesn't give importance, respect and guidance to their juniors, a high turnover rate is much expected. Our study shows that in the Pakistan paint industry, scarce supervisor support is the major determinant of high turnover.



Conclusively our finding reveals that in Eastern cultures like Pakistan, intrinsic factors are a major source of job satisfaction or dissatisfaction which can lead to high or low turnover. This finding is in contrast to the previous researches which proposed that in collectivist cultures, source of job satisfaction for employees was rooted in extrinsic factors such as social perception of the job as compared to intrinsic factors such as nature of work (Adigun and Stephenson, 1992; Huang and Van de Vliert, 2004; Diener et al., 1995; Hui and Yee, 1999). Our research suggests that paint industry employees consider intrinsic factors as prime determinants of job satisfaction and turnover. Summarizing the research, it would not be wrong to assert that organizational policy and strategy are the strongest determinants of job satisfaction, whereas perceived injustice is the strongest determinant of turnover in the paint industry of Pakistan.

Our findings should be considered, keeping in view our research limitations, which also creates space for future research opportunities. Since there was no prior study on this industry, data collection was quite a difficult process. Our focus on the six major paint industry players also limits the generalizability of our results. This is noteworthy as a number of researchers (Vasu et al, 1998) stated that determinants of job satisfaction and turnover can be different in small and big organizations - hence widening horizons for researches to further study the determinants that can effect job satisfaction and turnover.

## Conclusion

Studying and scrutinizing the determinants of job satisfaction and employee turnover has been a major task for the human resource realm and organizational behavior scholars for many decades. Unfortunately however, it has received little or no attention in the eastern part of the World especially in Pakistan. This study has thus taken an important step ahead by identifying the major determinants of job satisfaction and employee turnover in Pakistan. Our study has examined the impact of different HR factors on job satisfaction and turnover – the results of which have revealed that in comparison to demographic factors, environmental factors have had far more significance in determining job satisfaction and turnover in Paint industries. Moreover, the findings also elucidate that organizational policies are the prime determinant of job satisfaction, whereas perceived injustice is the key determinant of turnover. In contrast to similar researches that have been previously carried out in the West – those that propose that extrinsic factors are a source of job satisfaction and turnover in collectivist country employees, our findings conversely project that it is the intrinsic factors which play a major role in defining job satisfaction and turnover. We hope that our findings are tested in other private and public companies in Pakistan and stretch across numerous Eastern countries - that in turn further reveal job satisfaction and turnover determinants. Such rigorous research in this domain shall aid the process of acquiring greater and detailed understanding of the "determinants of job satisfaction and turnover" in Pakistan.

# References

Ellickson, M. C., & Logsdon, K. (2001). Determinants of job satisfaction of municipal government employees. *State & Local Government Review*, 173-184.

Zeffane, R., Ibrahim, M. E., & Al Mehairi, R. (2008). Exploring the differential impact of job satisfaction on employee attendance and conduct: the case of a utility company in the United Arab Emirates. *Employee Relations*, 30(3), 237-250.

Abdulla, J., Djebarni, R., &Mellahi, K. (2011). Determinants of job satisfaction in the UAE: A case study of the Dubai police. *Personnel review*, 40(1), 126-146.

Herzberg, F. M. (1959). B. &Snyderman, B.(1959). The Motivation to Work.2, li.

Rollinson, D. (2008). Organisational behaviour and analysis: An integrated approach. Pearson Education.

Cohen-Charash, Y., & Spector, P. E. (2001). The role of justice in organizations: A meta-analysis. Organizational behavior and human decision processes, 86(2), 278-321.

Aswathappa, K. (2005). Human resource and personnel management. Tata McGraw-Hill Education.

Barber, A. E., Dunham, R. B., &Formisano, R. A. (1992). The impact of flexible benefits on employee satisfaction: A field study. *Personnel Psychology*, 45(1), 55-74.

He, Y., Lai, K. K., & Lu, Y. (2011).Linking organizational support to employee commitment: evidence from hotel industry of China. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 22(01), 197-217.

Kivimäki, M., Kalimo, R., & Lindstrom, K. (1994). Contributors to satisfaction with management in hospital wards. *Journal of Nursing Management*, 2(5), 229-234.

Rad, A. M. M., &Yarmohammadian, M. H. (2006). A study of relationship between managers' leadership style and employees' job satisfaction. *Leadership in Health Services*, 19(2), 11-28.

Spector, P. E. (1997). Job satisfaction: Application, assessment, causes, and consequences (Vol. 3). Sage.

Jacobs, R., & Solomon, T. (1977). Strategies for enhancing the prediction of job performance from job satisfaction. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 62(4), 417.

Heery, E., & Noon, M. (2001). A Dictionary of Human Resource Management: Oxford University Press Inc.

Herrbach, O., & Mignonac, K. (2004). How organisational image affects employee attitudes. Human Resource



- Management Journal, 14(4), 76-88.
- Herrbach, O., Mignonac, K., &Gatignon, A. L. (2004). Exploring the role of perceived external prestige in managers' turnover intentions. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 15(8), 1390-1407.
- Poon, J. M. (2004). Effects of performance appraisal politics on job satisfaction and turnover intention. *Personnel review*, 33(3), 322-334.
- Abdulla, J., Djebarni, R., &Mellahi, K. (2011). Determinants of job satisfaction in the UAE: A case study of the Dubai police. *Personnel review*, 40(1), 126-146.
- Al-Zu'bi, H. A. (2010). A study of relationship between organizational justice and job satisfaction. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 5(12), p102.
- Ting, Y. (1997), "Determinants of job satisfaction of federal government employees", Public Personnel Management, Vol. 26 No. 3, pp. 313-34.
- Fernandes, C., & Awamleh, R. (2006). Impact of organisational justice in an expatriate work environment. *Management Research News*, 29(11), 701-712.
- Spector, P.E. (1985), "Measurement of human service staff satisfaction: development of the Job Satisfaction Survey (JSS)", American Journal of Community Psychology, Vol. 13, pp. 693-713.
- McCann, L., Hughes, C. M., Adair, C. G., & Cardwell, C. (2009). Assessing job satisfaction and stress among pharmacists in Northern Ireland. *Pharmacy world & science*, 31(2), 188-194.
- Tietjen, M. A., & Myers, R. M. (1998). Motivation and job satisfaction. Management decision, 36(4), 226-231.
- Locke, E.A. (1976), "The nature and causes of job satisfaction", in Dunnette, M.D. (Ed.),
- Handbook of Industrial and Organisational Psychology, Rand McNally, Chicago,
- Glebbeek, A. C., &Bax, E. H. (2004). Is high employee turnover really harmful? An empirical test using company records. *Academy of Management Journal*, 47(2), 277-286.
- Ghiselli, R., La Lopa, J., &Bai, B. (2001). Job satisfaction, life satisfaction, and turnover intent among food-service managers. *The Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly*, 42(2), 28-37.
- Skarlicki, D. P., &Folger, R. (1997). Retaliation in the workplace: The roles of distributive, procedural, and interactional justice. *Journal of applied Psychology*, 82(3), 434.
- Folger, R., &Konovsky, M. A. (1989). Effects of procedural and distributive justice on reactions to pay raise decisions. *Academy of Management journal*, 32(1), 115-130.
- Pfeffer, J. (1998). The human equation: Building profits by putting people first. Harvard Business Press.
- Pfeffer, J. (1998). Seven practices of successful organizations. Org Dev&Trng, 6E (Iae), 460.
- Woodruffe, C. (1999). Winning the talent war: A strategic approach to attracting, developing and retaining the best people. John Wiley and Sons.
- Bamberger, P. A., & Meshoulam, I. (2000). Human resource strategy: formulation, implementation, and impact.
- Ribelin, P. J. (2003). Retention reflects leadership style. *Nursing Management*, 34(8), 18-19.
- Price, J. L. (2001). Reflections on the determinants of voluntary turnover. *International Journal of Manpower*, 22(7), 600-624.
- Folger, R., & Cropanzano, R. (2001). Fairness theory: Justice as accountability. *Advances in organizational justice*, *I*, 1-55.
- Aghaei, N., Moshiri, K., &Shahrbanian, S. (2012). Relationship between organizational justice and job burnout in employees of Sport and Youth Head Office of Tehran. *AdvApplSci Res*, *3*, 2438-2445.
- Villanueva, D., &Djurkovic, N. (2009). Occupational stress and intention to leave among employees in small and medium enterprises. *International Journal of Stress Management*, 16(2), 124.
- Firth, L., Mellor, D. J., Moore, K. A., &Loquet, C. (2004). How can managers reduce employee intention to quit? *Journal of managerial psychology*, 19(2), 170-187.
- Iaffaldano, M. T., &Muchinsky, P. M. (1985). Job satisfaction and job performance: A meta-analysis. *Psychological bulletin*, 97(2), 251.
- Sjöberg, A., &Sverke, M. (2000). The interactive effect of job involvement and organizational commitment on job turnover revisited: A note on the mediating role of turnover intention. *Scandinavian Journal of Psychology*, 41(3), 247-252.
- Zeytinoglu, I. U., Denton, M., Davies, S., Baumann, A., Blythe, J., & Boos, L. (2007). Deteriorated external work environment, heavy workload and nurses' job satisfaction and turnover intention. *Canadian Public Policy*, 33, S31-S47.
- Allen, D. G., Shore, L. M., &Griffeth, R. W. (2003). The role of perceived organizational support and supportive human resource practices in the turnover process. *Journal of management*, 29(1), 99-118.
- Maertz, C. P., Griffeth, R. W., Campbell, N. S., & Allen, D. G. (2007). The effects of perceived organizational support and perceived supervisor support on employee turnover. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 28(8), 1059-1075.



- Steel, R. P. (2002). Turnover theory at the empirical interface: Problems of fit and function. Academy of Management Review, 27(3), 346-360.
- Cleveland, J. N., & Murphy, K. R. (1992). Analyzing performance appraisal as goal-directed behavior. Research in personnel and human resources management, 10(2), 121-185.
- Corbetta, P. (2003). Social research: Theory, methods and techniques. Sage.
- Bell, E., &Bryman, A. (2007). The ethics of management research: an exploratory content analysis. British Journal of Management, 18(1), 63-77.
- Ironson, G.H., Smith, P.C., Brannick, M.T., Gibson, W.M. and Paul, K.P. (1989), "Constitution of a job in general scale: a comparison of global, composite, and specific measures", Journal of Applied Psychology, Vol. 74, pp. 193-200.
- Hackman, J. and Oldham, R. (1975), "Development of the diagnostic survey", Journal of Applied Psychology, Vol. 60 No. 2, pp. 159-70.
- Hoppock, R. (1935), Job Satisfaction Blank Number Five, Harper, New York, NY.
- Spector, P.E. (1985), "Measurement of human service staff satisfaction: development of the Job Satisfaction Survey (JSS)", American Journal of Community Psychology, Vol. 13, pp. 693-713.
- Smith, P.C., Kendall, L.M. and Hulin, C.L. (1969), The Measurement of Satisfaction in Work and Retirement: A Strategy for the Study of Attitudes, Rand McNally, Oxford.
- Rahman, W., &Nas, Z. (2013). Employee development and turnover intention: theory validation. European Journal of Training and Development, 37(6), 564-579.
- Sarantakos, S. (1988), Social Research, 2nd ed., Palgrave, New York, NY.
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P. and Thornhill, A. (2007), Research Methods in Business Studies, 4th ed., Prentice-Hall, Harlow.
- DeVellis, R. (2003), Scale Development: Theory and Applications, 2nd ed., Sage, Thousand Oaks, CA.
- Carlan, P. E. (2007). The search for job satisfaction: a survey of Alabama policing. American Journal of Criminal Justice, 32(1-2), 74-86.
- Zhao, J., Thurman, Q., & He, N. (1999). Sources of job satisfaction among police officers: A test of demographic and work environment models. Justice Quarterly, 16(1), 153-173.
- Forsyth, C. J., & COPES, J. H. (1994). Determinants of job satisfaction among police officers. International Review of Modern Sociology, 109-116.
- ARMENTOR, J., & FORSYTH, C. J. (1995). Determinants of job satisfaction among social workers. International Review of Modern Sociology, 51-63.
- Huang, X., &Vliert, E. V. D. (2004). Job level and national culture as joint roots of job satisfaction. Applied Psychology, 53(3), 329-348.
- Saari, L. M., & Judge, T. A. (2004). Employee attitudes and job satisfaction. Human resource management, 43(4), 395-407.
- Judge, T. A., & KLINGER, R. (2008). Job satisfaction. The Science of Subjective Well-Being, 393.
- Luthans, F., Avolio, B. J., Avey, J. B., & Norman, S. M. (2007). Positive psychological capital: Measurement and relationship with performance and satisfaction. Personnel Psychology, 60(3), 541-572.
- Cropanzano, R., & Greenberg, J. (1997). Progress in organizational justice: Tunneling through the maze. International review of industrial and organizational psychology, 12, 317-372.
- Folger, R., &Cropanzano, R. (2001). Fairness theory: Justice as accountability. Advances in organizational justice, 1, 1-55.
- Folger, R., & Cropanzano, R. Organizational justice and human resource management, 1998.
- Redmond, B. (2010). Lesson 5: Equity theory: Is what I get for my work fair compared to others. Work Attitudes and Motivation.. The Pennsylvania State University World Campus.
- Al-Saadi, K.H. (1996), "The roots of satisfaction: the case of Sultan Qaboos University: a new university in a developing country", PhD thesis, University of Exeter, Exeter.

  Aksu, A. and Aktas, A. (2005), "Job satisfaction of managers in tourism: cases in the Antalya region of Turkey",
- Managerial Auditing Journal, Vol. 20 No. 5, pp. 479-88.
- Abu Elanain, M.H. (2009), "Job characteristics, work attitudes and behaviors in a non-Western context", Journal of Management Development, Vol. 28 No. 5, pp. 457-77.
- Kirkman, B. and Shapiro, D.L. (2001), "The impact of cultural values on job satisfaction and organizational commitment in self-managing work teams: the mediating role of employee resistance", Academy of Management Journal, Vol. 44, pp. 557-69.
- Huang, X. and Van de Vliert, E. (2004), "Job level and national culture as joint roots of job satisfaction", Applied Psychology, Vol. 53, pp. 329-48.
- Diener, E., Oishi, S. and Lucas, R.E. (2003), "Personality, culture, and subjective well-being: emotional and cognitive evaluations of life", Annual Review of Psychology, Vol. 54, pp. 403-25.
- Adigun, I.O. and Stephenson, G.M. (1992), "Sources of job motivation and satisfaction among British and



Nigerian employees", Journal of Social Psychology, Vol. 132, pp. 369-76.

Diener, E., Diener, M. and Diener, C. (1995), "Factors predicting the subjective well-being of nations", Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, Vol. 69, pp. 851-64.

Hui, C.H. and Yee, C. (1999), "The impact of psychological collectivism and workgroup atmosphere on Chinese employees' job satisfaction", Applied Psychology, Vol. 48, pp. 175-85.

## Appendix

# **Questionnaire:**

# Variable 1: Compensation and benefits

My Salary is adequate for my living expenses?

Period between my pay rises is reasonable?

I feel appreciated by the organization when I think about what they pay me

My organization has an appropriate salary scale

All necessary fringe benefits are provided in my organization (e.g. health insurance, travel, tickets, accommodation and allowances)

The performance recognition system in my organization is as good as in most other organizations

There are adequate financial rewards for those who work here

Regarding salary, I feel that I am treated fairly compared with colleagues in my organization who have similar qualifications and who have served a similar number of years

Regarding fringe benefits, recognition and rewards I feel that I am treated fairly

## Variable 2: supervisor support

My supervisor is available when needed

My supervisor shows consideration for subordinates' feelings

My supervisor gives me the opportunity to participate in important decision-making

Communication between me and my immediate supervisor is good

I receive regular feedback about my performance

The feedback I receive from my supervisor is useful

The form my supervisor uses accurately evaluates my performance

#### Variable 3: organization policy and strategy

The procedures in my organization do not interfere with good job performance

The general policy for my organization is congruent with moral values

This organization is doing a good job of providing steady employment

The organization takes proper precautions to ensure a safe and healthy workplace

The working conditions (e.g. air conditioning, lighting and workplace) are comfortable

My organization gives considerable attention to public needs (e.g. running annual surveys)

My organization gives proper attention to complaints by the public

My organization has a clear strategy to improve public service quality delivery

# Variable 4: relationship with co-workers

I receive an assignment with the proper staffing to complete it

I work with a team who operate quite consistently

I do not receive incompatible requests from all of my supervisors

Honest competition exists between workers in this organization

There is no bickering and fighting at work

I do not have difficulty in my job because of the competence of the people with whom I work

# Variable 5: career development

The organization provides me with enough work-related training

The organization provides me with adequate resources and chances to develop myself professionally (e.g. workshops, courses and conferences)

My organization practices job rotation (that is, the rotation of workers between different tasks to acquire skills)

I am given the chance to try out some of my own ideas

Regarding opportunities for professional development, I feel that I am treated fairly compared with colleagues in my organization who have similar qualifications and who have served a similar number of years

# Variable 6: nature of work

My work is varied and is not routine

My job requires the use of a number of skills

The work I do contributes to the organization's goals

A lot of other people can be affected in some way by my work

My job gives me the opportunity to work independently



My job requires me to be very creative

My job goals are clear

# Variable 7: job stress

My job does not require me to work extra hours

Work assignments are not out of my specialized field

My job does not interfere with my family and social life

# Variable 8: performance appraisal

My performance appraisal is conducted on time each year

I always receive a copy of my annual performance appraisal

Regarding performance appraisal, I feel that I am treated fairly compared with colleagues in my organization who have similar qualifications and who have served a similar number of years

# Variable 9: perceived injustice

Some people at my workplace received special treatment because they are friendly with supervisor

People at my workplace sometimes get credit for doing than they actually do

People at my workplace sometimes putt off finishing tasks so that they don't get assigned additional work

The work in my department is often more difficult than it need to be because people in other departments do not do their job the best they could

# Variable 10: turnover

I would like to leave my present job

I am looking for a new job

I plan to leave my present organization as soon as possible.

## Variable 11: job satisfaction

I am satisfied with my current job

My work environment is pleasant

I am extremely glad that I chose this organization to work for, over other organizations



# **Demographics:**

- 1. Your Gender
  - Male
  - Female
- 2. Please mark below your current Age (Years)
  - 25 − 30
  - 31 − 35
  - 36-40
  - 40 above
- 3. Your current Designation is
- 4. Your Qualification
  - Bachelors
  - Masters
  - PhD
  - Other please specify
- 5. Professional experience (Years)
  - 0 − 5
  - 6 − 10
  - 11 − 15
  - 15 above
- 6. Experience in paint industry (Years)
  - 0 − 5
  - 6 − 10
  - 11 15
  - 15 above
- 7. Total number of employees in your organization
  - Less than 100
  - 101 − 300
  - 301 1000
  - 1001 3000
  - 3000 Above
- 8. Nature of your organization
  - National organization
  - Multi-national organization
- 9. Ownership of your organization
  - Family owned
  - Board of Directors

The IISTE is a pioneer in the Open-Access hosting service and academic event management. The aim of the firm is Accelerating Global Knowledge Sharing.

More information about the firm can be found on the homepage: http://www.iiste.org

## **CALL FOR JOURNAL PAPERS**

There are more than 30 peer-reviewed academic journals hosted under the hosting platform.

**Prospective authors of journals can find the submission instruction on the following page:** <a href="http://www.iiste.org/journals/">http://www.iiste.org/journals/</a> All the journals articles are available online to the readers all over the world without financial, legal, or technical barriers other than those inseparable from gaining access to the internet itself. Paper version of the journals is also available upon request of readers and authors.

## MORE RESOURCES

Book publication information: <a href="http://www.iiste.org/book/">http://www.iiste.org/book/</a>

Academic conference: <a href="http://www.iiste.org/conference/upcoming-conferences-call-for-paper/">http://www.iiste.org/conference/upcoming-conferences-call-for-paper/</a>

# **IISTE Knowledge Sharing Partners**

EBSCO, Index Copernicus, Ulrich's Periodicals Directory, JournalTOCS, PKP Open Archives Harvester, Bielefeld Academic Search Engine, Elektronische Zeitschriftenbibliothek EZB, Open J-Gate, OCLC WorldCat, Universe Digtial Library, NewJour, Google Scholar

























