

1-1-1970

Analysis and evaluation of current materials at the intermediate grade level for the correction of word attack deficiencies

Mary A. Navin

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.stritch.edu/etd>

 Part of the [Education Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Navin, Mary A., "Analysis and evaluation of current materials at the intermediate grade level for the correction of word attack deficiencies" (1970). *Master's Theses, Capstones, and Projects*. 941.
<https://digitalcommons.stritch.edu/etd/941>

This Research Paper is brought to you for free and open access by Stritch Shares. It has been accepted for inclusion in Master's Theses, Capstones, and Projects by an authorized administrator of Stritch Shares. For more information, please contact smbagley@stritch.edu.

AN ANALYSES AND EVALUATION
OF CURRENT MATERIALS AT THE
INTERMEDIATE GRADE LEVEL FOR THE
CORRECTION OF WORD ATTACK DEFICIENCIES

by

Mary A. Navin

A RESEARCH PAPER
SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE
REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS IN EDUCATION (READING SPECIALIST)
AT THE CARDINAL STRITCH COLLEGE

Milwaukee, Wisconsin

1970

This research paper has been
approved for the Graduate Committee
of the Cardinal Stritch College by

Fr. M. Julitta O.S.F.
(Adviser)

Date Jan. 14, 1970

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The writer wishes to express her sincere gratitude to Sister M. Julitta, the adviser of this paper, for her help and guidance, and to all members of the Graduate Division faculty of The Cardinal Stritch College.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGMENT	iii
LIST OF TABLES	vi
Chapter	
I. THE PROBLEM	1
Introduction	
Statement of the Problem	
Objectives of the Study	
Significance and Justification	
Scope and Limitations	
Definition of Terms	
II. REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE	5
Importance of Word Attack	
Techniques of Word Attack Skills	
Context Clues	
Phonetic Analysis	
Structural Analysis	
The Dictionary	
Sequence of Word Attack Skills	
Principles of Word Attack	
Guidlines for an Efficient Word Attack Program	
III. THE PROCEDURE	27
The Purpose	
Word Attack Skills List	
Skill Analysis Procedure	
Selection of Materials	
Criteria for Evaluating Materials	
Procedure for Evaluating Materials	
IV. INTERPRETATION OF THE DATA	32
Skill Analysis of Workbooks	
Games and Audio-visual Aids	
Evaluating Materials	
Summary	
V. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	51
Summary	
Findings of the Study	

Implications of Study
Suggestions for Further Research

BIBLIOGRAPHY 55

APPENDIX 62

Bibliography of Workbooks Used in
Study
List of Publishers and Their Addresses
for Workbooks, Games, and Audio-visual
Aids Used in this Study

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1. Skill Analysis of Workbooks	33-34
2. Number of Pages Devoted to Specific Skills at the Intermediate Grade Level . .	37-38
3. Skill Analysis of Games	41-42
4. Skill Analysis of Audio-visual Aids	43
5. Evaluative Scale for Workbooks	46
6. Evaluative Scale for Group and Individual Games	48
7. Evaluative Scale for Audio-visual Aids	49

CHAPTER I
THE PROBLEM

Educators generally agree that total perception of the printed word is the ultimate goal of a successful reading program. Yet, for many children mastery of the code-breaking process to arrive at the printed word must be attained before this ultimate goal can be achieved.¹

As Gray suggests, we cannot expect children or adults to be able to comprehend, interpret, or react to ideas and opinions of authors if they are unable to identify the printed words that convey the ideas.²

Harris concurs that "the ability to recognize words quickly and accurately is fundamental to success in reading."³ He also contends that good comprehension cannot be achieved by one who has failed to develop skill in word recognition.

Statement of the Problem

Reading teachers are often lacking in time and facilities for getting a comprehensive overview of important skills and materials to be taught at the intermediate grade

¹Dorothy Flint, "Word Recognition Skills and the Problem Reader," Know Your World, (September, 1969), p. 1.

²William S. Gray, On Their Own in Reading (Chicago: Scott Foresman and Co., 1960), p. 13.

³Albert J. Harris, How to Increase Reading Ability (New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1961), p. 315.

level for guiding children in their efforts to acquire independence in word attack. The problem of this study was, therefore, to analyze, evaluate, and compile current materials consisting of workbooks, reading games, and audio-visual aids to ascertain which skills are presented to correct word attack deficiencies.

Objectives of the Study

Specific objectives forming the basis of this study are:

1. To analyze which word attack skills are presented in the materials examined for the intermediate grade level.
2. To critically evaluate the workbooks, reading games, and audio-visual aids according to simple criteria.

Significance and Justification

Authorities in the field of reading agree that word recognition is the most basic of all reading abilities and it is desirable to develop word attack skills in diverse ways. There is a great variety of material available to develop word attack skills at the intermediate grade level. It is of the opinion of the writer that an analytical and evaluative study of this material would facilitate use by reading teachers and would be of real service.

Scope and Limitations

The study is limited to workbooks independent of basal readers or of a complete reading program, reading games, and audio-visual materials at the intermediate grade level that are suitable for older remedial students in the elementary grades. The selection of materials examined in this study is further limited to current materials that can be used by teachers without necessitating special technical training and to those materials that are economically feasible within a normal school budget. Mechanical apparatus were not included since they are not obtained by most remedial teachers.

This selection of materials is not intended to be exhaustive but an attempt was made to include a representative sample of the word attack materials available at the intermediate grade reading level.

In addition to consultation with company representatives at a state exhibit and use of publishers' catalogues and examination copies, the Materials Centers at the Cardinal Stritch Reading Laboratory and the University of Chicago were checked.

A companion study was done by Letteney who analyzed and evaluated materials at the primary grade level.¹

¹Marjorie P. Letteney, "An Analyses and Evaluation of Current Materials at the Primary Grade Level for Correction of Word Attack Deficiencies." Unpublished Research Paper, Cardinal Stritch College, 1970.

Definitions of Terms

The writer feels it is necessary to define certain terms that are used in this study for greater clarity and understanding. The definitions for all terms are from Schubert's A Dictionary of Terms and Concepts in Reading.¹

Word Attack.--analyzing an unfamiliar printed word for clues to its sound and/or meaning. The term is synonymous with word analysis.²

Word Recognition.--The process of identifying words.³

Phonetic Analysis.--A method of analyzing a printed word to determine its pronunciation through the use of consonant and vowel sounds, blends, and syllables.

Structural Analysis.--A method of analyzing a printed word to determine its pronunciation by identifying meaningful parts-- roots, inflectional endings, syllables, prefixes, suffixes-- which in turn may be blended into the sound of the word.⁵

Workbook.--Supplementary practice books that are designed to provide additional practice in reinforcing mastery of the reading skills.⁶

Reading Games.--Frequently self-directive, designed to provide repetitive practice in certain reading skills such as word recognition, word analysis, meaning, vocabulary.⁷

Audio-visual Materials.--Visual and auditory teaching aids.⁸

¹Delwyn G. Schubert, A Dictionary of Terms and Concepts in Reading (Springfield, Illinois: Charles C. Thomas, 1964).

²Ibid., p. 17. ³Ibid., p. 215. ⁴Ibid., p. 16.

⁵Ibid., p. 16. ⁶Ibid., p. 296. ⁷Ibid., p. 103.

⁸Ibid., p. 144.

CHAPTER II
REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

Successful reading must be recognized as one of the most important factors in school achievement and everyday living. Without a good background in reading, the student is very apt to be deficient in all study areas. To become an efficient reader requires mastery of a number of reading skills. These skills are not to be isolated but are inter-related and dependent on each other. Gray suggests that one of the major goals of reading instruction is to help children develop competence in perceiving printed words easily and efficiently.¹ The purpose of a word attack program in reading is to develop a child fully so that he can become an independent reader and attack unfamiliar words successfully.

Importance of Word Attack

An examination of past research reveals that word attack skills play an important part in the reading program. Johnson has said:

The ultimate aim of the reading program in relation to word recognition ability should be the spontaneous recognition of virtually every word. Accompanying this ability to react effortlessly to the majority of words should be a reservoir of word attack skills to unlock the few unfamiliar words which are met from time to time.²

¹Gray, op. cit., p. 135.

²Marjorie S. Johnson, "Evaluating the Secondary School Reading Program," Reading Instruction in Secondary Schools, Perspectives in Reading, International Reading Association, (Newark, 1964), pp. 117-128.

Bond and Tinker¹, Harris², and Smith³ regard word recognition to be the most basic of all skill areas in reading as it is the foundation upon which the skills in all other growth areas are laid. Smith says: "Unless a child can recognize the words for which printed symbols stand, he can't read--period!"⁴ Clayton suggests that learning to read and being able to read requires word recognition skills.⁵

Vernon, too, places emphasis on word recognition skills as being important in the reading process when he says, "Clearly the ability to read must depend in the first place on reasonably accurate perception of printed words and the letters from which they are formed."⁶

Roswell and Chall⁷ have reported that inaccuracy in

¹Guy L. Bond and Miles A. Tinker, Reading Difficulties: Their Diagnosis and Correction (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1967) p. 304.

²Harris, op. cit., p. 315.

³Nila Banton Smith, Reading Instruction for Today's Children (Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1963), p. 167.

⁴Ibid., p. 167.

⁵Kathleen K. Clayton, "Word Recognition Skills for the Junior High School," Forging Ahead in Reading, ed. J. Allen Figurel, International Reading Association Convention Proceedings, (Delaware, 1968), p. 59.

⁶M. D. Vernon, "Major Approaches to Word Perception," Education, LXXXVI, p. 459.

⁷Florence G. Roswell and Jeanne S. Chall, "Helping Poor Readers With Word Recognition Skills," The Reading Teacher, (April, 1967), p. 200.

word recognition is the major stumbling block among poor readers while Wilson view deficiencies in the area of word attack as the most outstanding weakness of problem readers.¹

Bond and Wagner further stress the importance of word recognition in the reading program as they suggest that in order to become independent as a reader, the child must build certain skills and techniques of word recognition.²

Because the medium for expressing thoughts and ideas is the printed symbol, it necessarily follows that children must be taught to identify and unlock that symbol.

Anderson, a specialist in child growth and development, has stressed:

...the fact that the work of the adult in guiding the development of a child is to help the child grow from the dependence of infancy to the independence of adulthood. In parallel terms, the purpose of the teacher, as far as the development of word recognition is concerned, should be to assist the pupil in growing from complete dependence on others in word recognition, that the beginning reader has, to the total independence in word recognition that the skilled adult reader has.³

Heilman, as do many others, concludes that, "Although

¹Robert M. Wilson, Diagnostic and Remedial Reading (Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill Publishing Co., 1967), p. 137.

²Guy L. Bond and Eva Bond Wagner, Teaching the Child to Read (London: The Macmillan Co., 1960), p. 135.

³Martha Dallman, "Developing Independence in Word Recognition," citing John Anderson, Notes given to Conference participants at Cardinal Stritch College Reading Conference, 1962, (mimeograph).

it is true that mere recognition of words is not reading, it must be remembered that the absence of this ability precludes reading."¹

Techniques of Word Attack Skills

A survey of the literature reveals that children can unlock unfamiliar words in a variety of ways. Studies suggest that no one way is magical and fool-proof. One technique may be effective in one situation, another technique may be more helpful in another situation. Smith, in her book on reading, stated, "...it may take a combination of two techniques to work out a certain pronunciation, or perhaps one technique will be needed to check another."² Evidence was provided from Bond and Tinker that many children are deficient in word recognition because they place too much dependence on one technique or because they fail to use the most efficient one.³ The child must have a repertory of techniques and adopt the one that is most suitable to the particular word he is attempting to pronounce.

In considering word recognition techniques, Bond and Wagner warn schools:

... it must be realized that some techniques are not effective, such as the spelling attack. Some

¹Arthur W. Heilman, Principles and Practices of Teaching Reading (Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill Pub. Co., 1957), p. 296.

²Smith, op. cit., p. 167.

³Bond and Tinker, op. cit., p. 327.

techniques can be detrimental--the letter by letter sounding attack. In all word recognition techniques, beginnings of words should be emphasized. Reading proceeds from left to right; an emphasis on endings may make reversal errors more likely to persist.¹

The majority of reading authorities believe that meaningful word wholes should be used as the starting point in reading instruction, that is, children should possess an adequate fund of sight words. The term sight words is used to denote those words that children learn to recognize by sight without the aid of the other identification techniques.²

The area of word recognition is complex and many learnings are interrelated when a child is attacking an unknown word. Bond and Tinker state, "It is the interaction of all the word-study skills that forms the foundation on which a competent reader builds his reading structure."³

Reading specialists such as Smith⁴, Gray⁵, and Strang⁶ agree that the techniques that are of real value to children in attacking unfamiliar words independently are use of context

¹Bond and Wagner, op. cit., p. 135.

²Evelyn Mason, Suggested Activities for Developing and Reinforcing Word Analysis Skills in the Reading Program, United States Department of Health, Education and Welfare Bulletin, (Washington, D.C.: Division of Curriculum and Supervision, 1968), p. 8.

³Bond and Tinker, op. cit., p. 332.

⁴Smith, op. cit., p. 168.

⁵Gray, op. cit., p. 16-28.

⁶Ruth Strang, Making Better Readers, (Boston: D.C. Heath Co., 1957), p. 30.

clues, phonetic analysis, structural analysis, and the dictionary.

Context Clues

The writer surveyed the literature concerning the value of context clues as a means of unlocking unfamiliar words. Experts in the field of reading agree that its use is an important component of an efficient and effective reading program.

Bond and Wagner believe that the use of context clues is the most important means of word recognition.¹ In Heilman's book on reading, he claims that context plus a minimal amount of analysis focused on the beginning of words is much superior to context alone.² Yoaken, a proponent of the use of context clues in the reading process, claims that working out the recognition of a strange word by reasoning or guessing from the context is a natural way of identifying a strange word and should be used from the very first occasion when a child fails to recognize a word when reading.³ Emans and Fisher state:

Used along with phonetic and structural analysis, context clues provide one of the best means for

¹Bond and Wagner, op. cit., p. 138.

²Heilman, op. cit., p. 145.

³Gerald A. Yoaken, Basal Reading Instruction (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1955), p. 135.

achieving the recognition of a word. Finding that unlocking of a previously unknown word makes sense in context, provides a check as to the pronunciation of a word.¹

Lewis further looks at the importance of context clues.

She identifies three kinds of contextual clues:

1. Oral context, the purpose being to give the child practice in using verbal clues to identify words.
2. Picture context, this activity is to give the child practice in using picture clues to identify words.
3. Printed context, the purpose being two-fold: to give the child practice in using printed context to identify new words, and to give the child practice in comprehension.

Lewis concludes, "Oral and picture context used along with printed context seems to be a means to an end---Reading!"²

McKee arrived at this conclusion regarding the use of context clues: the average child in fourth grade can use context clues to identify the meanings of an unrecognized word in his textbook about once in three times.³ Educators are in general agreement that the use of context clues alone is not sufficient for effective reading but it is an important aid to all readers.

Phonetic Analysis

Another technique employed by the reader to identify

¹Robert Emans and Gladys Mary Fisher, "Teaching the Use of Context Clues," Elementary English, (March, 1967), p. 243.

²Juanita Lewis, "A Critical Look at Instruction in Word Recognition at the Elementary School," Forging Ahead in Reading, ed. J. Allen Figurel, International Reading Association Conference Proceedings, (Delaware, 1968), p. 55.

³Paul McKee, The Teaching of Reading (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co. 1943), p. 75.

unfamiliar words is through the use of phonetic analysis. Phonics has been the subject of controversy throughout the history of the teaching of reading. People held two extreme views; some advocated instruction in reading with the exclusion of all phonic knowledge while others claimed that phonics was the only method necessary for learning to read. Today, however, the value of phonics is recognized in the reading program as providing one possible kind of help in identifying new and unknown words.¹

In noting the importance that phonics holds in the teaching of reading, Bagford stated:

The major reason for teaching phonics is to help children learn enough about speech sounds and their written representations to be able to recognize and pronounce words which they do not know as "sight words". The acceptance of such a purpose implies that it is not important to teach all that is known about phonics, nor is it important to retain the knowledge beyond the time when it is useful.

.....
To be worthy of inclusion in a reading program, phonics content must make the task of learning to read a more efficient process.²

McKee writes:

In spite of the fact that English is not necessarily a phonetic language, a knowledge of phonetic elements and principles is so basic to any person's identification and recognition of practically all printed words that

¹Dolores Durkin, Phonics and the Teaching of Reading (New York: Bureau of Publications, 1965), p. 10.

²Jack Bagford, Phonics: Its Role in Teaching Reading (Iowa City: Sernoll, Inc., 1967), i.

phonetic analysis is an essential part of an adequate program in independent identification of words.¹

Several reading authorities, many of whom were not associated with the phonic movement, stated that they:

consider phonics one of the essential skills that help children identify printed words that they have not seen before. Without phonics most children cannot become self-reliant, discriminating, efficient readers.²

Gray relates that the ability to use phonetic analysis is based on knowledge that consonants, vowels, and accent are basic elements of sound, which when blended together make words that express meaning. He also concurs that basic to using phonetic analysis is an understanding that there are certain visual clues that aid in determining consonant sounds, vowel sounds, syllabic divisions and accent.³ The main requirement in teaching an adequate method of attack is to aid the child in proceeding in a systematic left to right order to divide a word into recognizable syllables so as to arrive at the whole word.⁴

To make phonics functional for the child, Dolch relates that the most profitable approach to sounding is to see a group of letters and think of their sounds without the form-

¹McKee, op. cit., p. 239.

²James B. Conant, "A Report of a Conference of Reading Experts," Learning to Read, (Princeton, New Jersey: Educational Testing Service, 1962), p. 3.

³Gray, op. cit., p. 27.

⁴Harris, op. cit., p. 374.

ulation of rules.¹ Several reading authorities support Dolch in stating that because there are so many exceptions to the rules, it is wiser for children to use generalities.

Mason writes:

Teachers can make rule learning a burden. They should lead the pupil to recognize and remember the part of the rules which he can apply for word recognition. Providing prompt experience of the rules to reinforce retention should be the basic principle. Directing attention to exceptions of rules, will encourage the child to try context clues.²

There has been an extensive amount of research conducted in the field of phonics instruction. Smith compiled the following conclusions:

1. It cannot be assumed that all children need phonics.
2. Phonics is effective with children who need word recognition help, but its greatest effectiveness is attained when it is taught functionally and is related to children's reading needs.
3. It is advisable to delay intensive phonics instruction until a child has attained a mental age of seven years.
4. Phonics instruction is most valuable at the second and third grade levels.
5. The use of configuration clues and context clues should be supplemented with phonics.³

An examination of past research reveals that phonics instruction is one method of unlocking new or unfamiliar words in the reading process; not the method. It is an effective

¹Edward W. Dolch, "How a Child Sounds Out a Word," Elementary English Review, XXII, (November, 1945), p. 279.

²Mason, op. cit., p. 31.

³Nila Banton Smith, "What Research Tells Us About Word Recognition," Elementary School Journal, LV, (April, 1955), p. 445.

tool to aid the individual in reading, not a process of reading itself.

It is well to remember that an over-emphasis on phonics instruction can be detrimental to the reader. Heilman, in his book on phonics, aptly stated:

The reader is handicapped if he relies too heavily on phonic analysis when other modes of attack would be more economical. If a child can sound every word and does sound every word, he is, in all probability, an inefficient reader.¹

It is important to view phonics instruction in the proper light. Campbell and Quinn advocate the use of phonics in the reading program in this way:

The best use of phonics is a realistic one. Realistic teaching establishes phonics as a possible source of help in word identification. It also establishes phonics as a kind of help that functions most successfully when it is used in a flexible trial-and-error way; when the context in which an unfamiliar word appears is used to suggest or to check a pronunciation...²

Structural Analysis

An examination of past literature identifies that structural and phonetic analysis interact and are often combined by the reader to arrive at unknown or new words. Heilman points out:

...ex-, pre-, dis-, en-, pro-, -ed, -tive, -ment, -tion, and the like, when added to

¹Arthur W. Heilman, Phonics in Proper Perspective (Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill, Inc., 1964), p. 5.

²Bonnie Campbell and Goldie Quinn, Phonetic Analysis of Words in Grades 5 and 6, Bellevue Public Schools bulletin, (Bellevue, Nebraska: 1965), p. 13.

words, do produce structural changes. But each of these, and many more, are also phonic units.¹

When a reader is unlocking unfamiliar words, Gray concurs that "structural analysis logically precedes phonetic analysis in the word recognition process."² Smith is in agreement with Gray when she states, "Pupils should be encouraged to use structural analysis first in attacking an unrecognized word, and if that doesn't work, then use phonics."³

Gray points out:

...that ability to use structural analysis is based on two fundamental understandings of language. One is that a root word retains one of its basic meanings in inflected and derived forms and in compounds. The other understanding is that prefixes, suffixes, and inflectional endings are meaningful parts of words.⁴

The student must be instructed in these two basic thoughts before the use of structural analysis will become meaningful and made functional.

Syllabication is useful as an analytical technique. Bond and Wagner cite the advantages of using syllabication in their book on reading. They state the following points:

1. It is more desirable than letter-by-letter sounding, because it uses larger elements,

¹Heilman, op. cit., p. 5.

²Gray, op. cit., p. 75.

³Smith, op. cit., p. 216.

⁴Gray, op. cit., p. 27.

and the larger the elements that can be isolated and recognized, the more effective the study of words will be.

2. Often the larger parts are well-known smaller words.
3. Syllabication teaches the system that is employed in the dictionary.¹

Most authorities in the field of reading stress the importance of syllabication rules, but they advocate the importance of leading children to understand the rules, rather than memorizing them. Campbell and Quinn state:

It is more important that the child be able to use the rules to unlock words rather than to list the rules. Children should have sufficient practice in the use of rules so that they will become applicable.²

Smith claims that:

Syllabication skills can best be reviewed and maintained through continuous application to words met currently in reading context. Syllabication is such a complex and at the same time such an extremely important word identification skill that it is advisable to provide direct practice in establishing it.³

Structural analysis is but another tool in unlocking the door to the world of words. It is not to be used as an isolated technique but in combination with others.

The Dictionary

Educators agree that no one method of word attack is sufficient. In addition to the use of context clues,

¹ Bond and Wagner, op. cit., p. 159-160.

² Bonnie Campbell and Goldie Quinn, Phonetic Analysis of Words in Grades 3 and 4, Bellevue Public Schools Bulletin, (Bellevue, Nebraska: 1965), p. 13.

³ Smith, op. cit., p. 234.

phonetic and structural analysis, authorities emphasize the importance of the use of the dictionary in the word identification process. In a recent handbook published for parents concerned with the teaching of reading, the importance of the dictionary was noted. It said, "The dictionary is perhaps one of the most useful single reference books a child will ever have in his possession."¹

Heilman feels that, "Facility in the use of the dictionary paves the way for a number of potential breakthroughs in the struggle for independence in reading."² Gray is also in agreement with Heilman in the importance that the dictionary plays in the word attack area. Evidence was provided from his study that the dictionary is an indispensable tool in word attack. He states that:

Eventually there will come a time when the child will encounter in his reading the visual form of a word for which he has no speaking-meaning counterpart. Then the dictionary becomes indispensable as a means of associating sound and meaning with word form.³

Smith concludes that attitude enters into successful use of the dictionary. She states:

Attitude is of great importance in developing dictionary skills, as well as other skills. If effort is expended in developing word attack

¹What's New in Reading? A Handbook for Parents. (New York: American Book Co., 1968), p. 14.

²Heilman, op. cit., p. 386.

³Gray, op. cit., p. 106.

skills, a positive attitude toward using these skills should be developed simultaneously. Both attitudes and skills in dictionary usage are developed most effectively in 'on the spot' situations in which a doubt about a word exists. A teacher should take advantage of every opportunity to encourage pupils to develop their dictionary attitudes and skills and apply them in functional situations.¹

Before a child can be successful in using the dictionary, it is necessary that he learn a number of skills. Emans has outlined these skills:

. . . the student needs to recall in order the letters of the alphabet; employ guide words, and refer to the first, second, third or however many letters are necessary. To achieve the proper pronunciation, he should be able to interpret the phonetic spelling, employ the pronunciation key and accent marks, recognize syllabic divisions, and blend the sounds into whole words.²

Smith, in agreement with Emans, has stressed the importance of teaching the dictionary skills in clusters. Location skills should be developed first, followed by the meaning skills, and finally the pronunciation skills.³

Children usually are introduced to the fundamental aspects of dictionary work in the early years of formal schooling, but the clusters of skills are developed and refined

¹Smith, op. cit., p. 237.

²Robert Emans, "Identifying Significant Reading Skills in Grades Four Through Eight," Conference on Reading, ed. Helen M. Robinson, Supplementary Educational Monographs, No. 28 (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1966), pp. 38-39.

³Smith, op. cit., p. 237.

in the later grades. The dictionary is to be referred to when all other methods of word attack fail to aid the reader in attacking an unknown word.

Sequence of Word Attack Skills

Word recognition is a difficult and complex learning which involves the development of a highly integrated and flexible set of skills and abilities. This was endorsed by Bond and Tinker.¹ It is necessary that the reader maintains a proper balance and sequence in the development of skills. Dawson and Bamman outline three distinct stages in the development of skills: 1. the period of introduction; 2. the period of emphasis or reinforcement; and 3. mastery.²

A detailed breakdown of the sequence of skills in independent word attack is presented by levels. At the primary level, or period of introduction, the following skills should be developed:

1. Visual discrimination
2. Auditory discrimination
3. Phonetic Elements
 - a. Consonant Sounds
 - i. Initial
 - ii. Medial
 - iii. Final
 - b. Common blends and digraphs
 - c. Common phonograms
 - d. Vowels

¹Bond and Tinker, op. cit., p. 345.

²Mildred A. Dawson and Henry A. Bamman, Fundamentals of Basic Reading Instruction (New York: David McKay, Inc., 1963), p. 148.

- i. Short sounds
 - ii. Long sounds
 - iii. Diphthongs
 - iv. Final y
- e. Soft c and g
- 4. Structural
 - a. Common word parts and derivatives
 - b. Compound words
 - c. Common prefixes and suffixes
- 5. Visual clues to sound
 - a. Final e
 - b. Two vowels
 - c. Controlling consonants
- 6. Readiness for major sequences¹

At the intermediate grade level there is a constant carry-over and refinement of the primary skills. Durrell, in his study, cites the importance of word attack skills at the intermediate grade level. He states:

Instruction in word attack is of even greater importance in the intermediate grades than in the primary grades. The intermediate grade child encounters an endless succession of words he has not read before. If he is to be successful in reading, he must be very rapid and accurate in word attack.²

In addition to the carry-over of the primary skills, the intermediate grade level places stress on the development of specific skills in independent word attack. A breakdown of the sequence of skills taught at the intermediate grade level follows:

- 1. Phonetic
 - a. Definite help in vowels
 - b. Additional vowel sounds

¹Sister M. Julitta Fisch, "What to Teach in Development of Independent Word Attack," Notes for class in Improvement of Reading Instruction, (Mimeograph).

²Donald D. Durrell, Improving Reading Instruction (New York: Harcourt, Brace and World, 1956), p. 267.

2. Structural
 - a. Practice in syllabication
 - b. Prefixes and suffixes
 - c. Inflectional forms
3. Visual clues to vowel sounds
 - a. Open syllable
 - b. Closed syllable
4. Visual clues to accent
 - a. Prefixes and suffixes
 - b. Two syllable words ending in y
 - c. Syllable before many suffix endings
 - d. Words with prefixes--root following
5. Complementary word activities
 - a. Glossaries and dictionaries
 - i. Alphabetical order
 - ii. Guide words
 - iii. Vocabulary entries
 - iv. Respelling
 - v. Diacritical marks¹

Research shows that teachers at the intermediate grade levels often assume that children at this level have mastered word attack skills. Dawson concludes:

We may assume that the average child will have been exposed to most of the skills of attack and recognition by the end of the fourth grade but it is likely that those skills have not yet been solidified and will not become solidified for many years.²

After surveying the literature, the writer concluded that it is the responsibility of teachers to determine the skills each child needs and present them in a sequential balanced program.

¹Sister M. Julitta Fisch, op. cit. Mimeograph Notes.

²Dawson and Barman, op. cit., p. 148.

Principles of Word Attack

Certain principles and suggestions of specialists will aid the teacher in developing flexible word attack skills. Bond and Wagner describe the following principles of word recognition:

1. Adjust instruction in word recognition techniques to the individual.
2. Undertake the more analytical types of word recognition techniques only after the child is aware of the meaningful nature of reading; after he has established the habit of recognizing words as whole words, and has built a small sight vocabulary.
3. Teach the ability to locate a new word recognition element in known words before applying the use of that element in identifying new words.
4. Always teach word recognition in meaningful material.
5. Teach word recognition in situations where it is important to the child to recognize the word.
6. Be sure that the child knows the meanings of the words he is trying to identify or has the background necessary to derive their meaning.
7. Avoid isolated drill and artificial teaching devices.
8. Build the habit of inspecting words rapidly, thoroughly, and systematically from left to right.
9. Teach the child to analyze the word visually before he attempts to sound it.
10. Develop the habit of noticing similarities and differences among words.
11. Teach word recognition in material that is at the child's reading level.¹

¹Bond and Wagner, op. cit., p. 173.

Gray further states:

A good reading program helps a child acquire word attack skills and understandings and also provides youngsters with many opportunities to apply them. The ultimate goals in word perception are to bring to the level of instantaneous perception a maximum number of highly useful words that are common to different types of materials that a child wants and needs to read and to develop understandings, skills, and abilities that enable him to attack unfamiliar words independently and thus be on his own in reading.¹

Guidelines for an Efficient Word Attack Program

The purpose of word attack and recognition skills in the reading program is to aid a child in pronouncing unknown words. There are a variety of techniques that the reader has at his disposal to use. Dawson states that, "The good reader employs several word attack skills simultaneously, without thinking consciously just how he did attack the word."² The current literature is in agreement that certain dependable guidelines should be set up for the teaching of word attack skills. Dawson cites the following:

1. Never teach a word in isolation, unless you are sure that the repetition of known parts or elements of the word will lead to understanding of new words.
2. Always associate any word attack skill with the meaning of the word under consideration.
3. Provide sequential training in all of the word attack skills.
4. Do not assume that all children need the same amount or emphasis upon a particular skill. Some children appear to gain a thorough knowledge of word attack skills without formal

¹Gray, op. cit., p. 33.

²Dawson, op. cit., p. 149.

training; others will need constant guidance and repetition in order to see the reasonableness and application of the skill to actual reading.

5. Teach the skill as the need arises and it can be applied in the daily work of the children.¹

Dawson further states:

There is no quantity or combination of word attack skills which is known to be sufficient for all children. Each child will have specific needs for the different types of skills, at different stages of their development.²

Summary

Throughout the literature, reference is constantly made to the importance of the sequential development of word attack skills. If children are to become masters of words, they must first be able to identify words, and use the tools available to them to unlock unfamiliar words. As Hester states, "The value of interest and the relationship of material to the life of a child cannot be underestimated as factors in the learning process."³ An examination of past research in the area of materials was made by Letteney.⁴ Through these materials an individual can gain the skills necessary to unlock the door to the wonderful world of words.

¹Ibid., p. 149-50.

²Ibid., p. 173.

³Kathleen B. Hester, Teaching Every Child to Read (New York: Harper and Row, 1964), p. 132.

⁴Letteney, op. cit., Unpublished Research Paper.

This chapter summarized the importance of word attack skills, described the four skills that can help a child unlock unfamiliar words independently, and reported the sequence, principles, and guidelines for efficient word attack skills.

CHAPTER III

THE PROCEDURE

A survey of the literature revealed that word recognition is the most basic of all reading abilities and it is desirable to develop word attack in diverse ways. There is a great variety of material available to develop word attack at the intermediate grade level, but to be used successfully, care must be taken in their selection and usage.

Purpose

The purpose of the present study was to analyze, evaluate, and compile current materials consisting of workbooks, reading games, and audio-visual aids to ascertain which word attack skills were developed, and at the same time to evaluate these materials according to simple criteria.

To achieve this purpose it was necessary to construct a list of word attack skills and to design objective evaluative criteria. In order to acquire the necessary background to do this, an extensive review of the literature concerning word attack skills and materials was made. This review and the background obtained in reading courses enabled the writer to devise the skills list and the evaluative criteria to be used as appraisal instruments.

Word Attack Skills

A list was devised that included the essential skills

a child needs in order to attain a considerable degree of independence in word recognition.

List of Skills

The following list of skills was used by the writer to analyze the materials at the intermediate grade level:

Phonetic Analysis

Consonants
 Blends
 Silent
 Vowels
 Short
 Long
 Variant
 Generalizations

Structural Analysis

Endings
 Compounds
 Base words
 Prefixes
 Suffixes
 Syllabication
 Accents

Contextual Clues

Dictionary

Alphabetization
 Guide words
 Pronunciation key
 Syllabication

Skill Analysis Procedure

Workbooks

A careful examination of each workbook was made to determine which skills were presented. At the particular grade level that a skill was first introduced, the symbol

"I" was recorded on the skill analysis table. When a skill was extended for further reinforcement, the symbol "X" was recorded.

A compilation of the number of pages devoted to specific skills was made. A page count was made for each skill on the skills list to determine the number of pages devoted to each skill. This was done to enable teachers to determine which workbooks emphasize which skills.

Games

Each game was examined to determine its classification in two areas: skills and use. In the skills area only the symbol "X" was employed because a game would be used for reinforcing a skill or skills rather than for initially teaching them. This symbol was placed on the table to designate which skills were reinforced through the playing of the game. In the area of use, it was determined whether a game was for individuals or groups. The game was then listed on the table under the appropriate heading.

Audio-visual aids

Each audio-visual aid was examined to determine which skills would be developed through its use. Since the writer felt that the use of audio-visual aids is better adapted to the reinforcement of skills, only the symbol "X" on the table was used to indicate which skills were presented.

Materials

Selection

The selection of materials examined in the study was limited to current materials that could be used by teachers without necessitating special technical training and to those materials that would be economically feasible within a normal school budget. Mechanical apparatus were not included since they are not economically possible for a number of remedial teachers.

The workbooks, games and audio-visual aids were selected after consultation with company representatives at an extensive state exhibit, careful perusal of publishers' catalogues* and use of examination copies, and study of materials at the Cardinal Stritch Reading Laboratory, the University of Chicago's Materials Center, Dixon School, and The University School of Milwaukee.

This selection was not intended to be exhaustive but an attempt was made to include a representative sample of the word attack materials available at the intermediate grade reading level.

Criteria for Evaluating

Any evaluation is a subjective process, but by using the carefully designed instruments of appraisal, the writer sought to be as objective as possible. Special care was given to prepare the following criteria for the evaluation of the materials.

*Appendix I, p. 62.

The workbooks were evaluated on the following bases:

1. Variation in exercises
2. Clearly stated directions
3. Appropriate readability
4. Sequential development of skills
5. Interesting format for remedial students

The games were evaluated on the following bases:

1. Attractive appearance
2. Effective teaching tool
3. Interesting to remedial students

The audio-visual aids were evaluated on the following bases:

1. Well designed format
2. Effective teaching tool
3. Interesting to remedial students

Procedure for Evaluating

All the materials included in this study were objectively evaluated according to the criteria listed previously. A rating scale was designed consisting of the numerals 1, 2, 3, with 1 being the highest rating. Each material was carefully examined and given a 1, 2, or 3 rating for each of the stated criteria. This information was recorded on the evaluative tables.

CHAPTER IV

INTERPRETATION OF THE DATA

It is the purpose of the present chapter to consider the data related to the analysis and evaluation of current materials useful in developing word attack proficiency. The materials examined were classified into three main categories: workbooks, reading games and audio-visual aids.

Skill Analysis of Materials

Workbooks

The skill analysis of the workbooks examined in this study are presented in Table 1. The information contained in this table indicates the names of the workbooks analyzed and describes whether the word attack skill was initially introduced in a particular workbook or further extended and reinforced.

It is the consensus of opinion of reading authorities that the greater percentage of basic skills are formally introduced during a child's primary school years and are further extended and reinforced during the intermediate years. The information contained in Table 1 further emphasizes this concept.

Table 1 indicates that phonetic analysis is emphasized in most of the workbooks studied. The data show that no new phonetic skills are introduced at the intermediate grade level. The major stress is on the extension and reinforcement of

TABLE 1

SKILL ANALYSIS OF WORKBOOKS

SKILLS	Be A Better Reader			Barnell Left, Ltd.			Webster		Webster	Basic Phonics Program	
	Book A	Book B	Book C	Working With SdsC	Working With SdsD	Using Context D	Using Context E	Using Context F	The Magic World of Dr. Spello	Conquests in Reading	Middle Grades Phonics Workbook
<u>Phonetic Analysis</u>											
Consonants	x	x	x						x	x	x
Blends	x	x	x	x	x				x	x	x
Silent		x	x	x	x				x	x	I
Vowels				x	x				x	x	x
Short	x	x	x	x	x				x	x	x
Long	x	x	x	x	x				x	x	x
Variant	x	x	x	x	x				x	x	x
Generalizations											
<u>Structural Analysis</u>											
Endings				x	x	x			x	x	x
Compounds	I	x	x	x	x				x	x	
Base words	I	x							x	x	
Prefixes	I	x	x		x				x	x	x
Suffixes	I	x	x		x				x	x	x
Syllabication	I/x	x	x	x	x				x	x	I
Accents	I	x	x		x				x		
<u>Contextual Clues</u>											
							x	x	x		
<u>Dictionary</u>											
Alphabetization	I		x								
Guide Words	I	x	x								x
Pronunciation key	I	I	x						x		
Syllabication											

I-Introduced

X-Reinforced

TABLE 1--Continued

Phonics We Use			Building Reading Skills			Ginn Word Enrichment			Developing Reading Skills		Houghton Mifflin Company
Book E	Book F	Book G	Rocket Book	Atomic Submarine	Spaceship Book	Sounds and Syll.	More Sounds and Syl	Working With Words	Book A	Book B	Unlocking Strange Words Book A
x	x	x	x	x	x						x
x	x	x	x	x	x	x					
x	x	x	x	x	x	x			x	x	x
x	x	x	x	x	x	x			x	x	x
x	x	x	x	x	x	x			x	x	x
x	x	x	x	x	I/x	x	x	x	x	x	x
x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x			
x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x			
x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x			
x	x	x	x	I/x	I/x	x	x	x			I/x
x	x	x	x	I/x	I/x	x	x	x			I/x
x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x			
x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x			
			x	x	x	x		x			x
							x				
x	x	x					x		I	x	
x	x	x					x		I		
x	x							x	I	x	

skills.

In most of the workbooks studied, emphasis is placed on the development of structural analysis skills, including word endings, compound words, base words, prefixes and suffixes. These skills are generally presented in sequential order following a review of phonetic analysis.

Major stress is placed on the reinforcement and development of syllabication generalizations and accents. Two of the workbooks analyzed initially introduced these techniques while the others reinforced skills that were introduced at a previous level.

One series was designed solely for the development and extension of context clues. Very few of the workbooks examined included exercises in contextual clue development per se, but this skill was incorporated in exercises presented for the development of other skills.

The data in Table 1 indicate that some of the workbooks used in this study include dictionary skill work. It was found that these skills were presented in sequence when they were treated in the workbooks, beginning with alphabetization, followed by exercises to develop use of guide words and the pronunciation key.

Briefly summarizing the data in Table 1, it is apparent that most phonetic skills have been introduced in earlier grade levels and presented for practice and review at the intermediate

grade level. The majority of workbooks examined in this research paper extend and reinforce phonetic analysis, particularly the sounds of the consonants and vowels. Major stress was given to structural analysis skills. Strong emphasis was given to the development of prefixes, suffixes, syllabication and accent work. It is apparent, too, that a few of the workbooks do contain exercises designed to develop context clues and dictionary skills, but generally the workbooks studied were found to be lacking in these two areas.

To be of aid to reading teachers, it was necessary to compile the number of pages devoted to specific skills in the workbooks studied. After careful examination, it was found that these materials are adaptable to middle grade students at the fourth, fifth, and sixth grade levels. This compilation of pages is presented in Table 2.

The data in Table 2 show that a great majority of the workbooks analyzed in this study further extend and reinforce word attack skills at each succeeding level. All but three of the workbooks presented an extension of phonics work. Each of them had pages to review the initial and final sounds of the consonants and consonant blends. There were very few pages devoted to the reinforcement of silent consonants. Heavy stress was given to vowel sound development with a majority of the workbooks devoting many pages to the extension of the short and long sounds of the vowels. Major stress was given to the reinforcement of vowel variants.

TABLE 2

NUMBER OF PAGES DEVOTED TO SPECIFIC SKILLS
AT THE INTERMEDIATE GRADE LEVEL

SKILLS	Be A Better Reader A	Be A Better Reader B	Be A Better Reader C	Rocket Book	Spaceship Book	Atomic Submarine Book	Using Sounds-Book C	Using Sounds-Book D
<u>Phonetic Analysis</u>								
Consonants	3	4	2	3	3	3		
Blends	4	3	4	12	10	10	7	1
Silent		1	2	1	1	1	2	2
Vowels								
Short	11	2	5	17	6	6	10	4
Long	9	2	4	4	4	4	7	4
Variant	1	1	4	17	17	17	5	6
Generalizations								
<u>Structural Analysis</u>								
Endings		1					3	4
Compounds	1	2	1	1	1	1	3	3
Base Words	1	1		2	1	1		
Prefixes	1	4	2	3	6	6		3
Suffixes	1	4	2	4	6	6		6
Syllabication	6	9	7	14	11	11	13	17
Accents	1	1	5	3	4	4		3
<u>Contextual Clues</u>								
Dictionary	2		1		1	1		
Alphabetization	2	1	1					
Guide words		2	1					
Pronunciation key	2							
Syllabication								

The data in Table 2 further show that the great majority of workbooks studied placed the greatest emphasis on structural analysis skills. Most of the workbooks devoted a few pages to base words, compound words and word endings. The data show that heavy stress was placed on the reinforcement and further development of prefixes and suffixes. The data show that the greatest emphasis was given to the development of syllabication and accent work in the workbooks for the intermediate grade child.

After viewing Table 2 it is apparent that contextual clues were slighted in most of the workbooks examined. One entire series was designed exclusively to the development of that skill. It was found that one of the workbooks developed other word attack skills in a contextual setting, stressing the use of context throughout the book.

The data in Table 2 show that there are very few pages designed to develop dictionary skills. It was found that dictionary skills were introduced, but not strongly reinforced. Eleven of the workbooks studied presented a few exercises for developing alphabetization, while eight of them devoted pages to the use of guide words and only six made mention of the pronunciation key.

A brief resume of the data in Table 2 indicates that there are several workbooks available which can be used to develop the independent word attack skills stressed by reading authorities. It was found that the majority of workbooks

examined in this study reinforced and extended phonetic analysis and placed major stress on structural analysis, particularly syllabication and accent work. Context clues and dictionary skills were slighted in most of the workbooks studied. Many of the workbooks examined are adaptable to remedial students who are at fourth, fifth, or sixth grade level.

Games

In table 3 are presented the basic skills which are reinforced and developed through the playing of group and individual reading games.

The data indicate that the majority of games examined at the intermediate grade level reinforce phonetic analysis skills, particularly stressing consonant and vowel sounds.

The information contained in Table 3 shows that several of the games analyzed in this study develop structural analysis techniques, stressing word endings, base words, and syllabication principles.

A further analysis of Table 3 indicates a lack of games designed to reinforce context clues and dictionary skills.

Data in Table 3 demonstrate that most of the games involved in the present study are conducive for group play while only a few games are adaptable to individual use.

Audio-visual Aids

The word attack skills presented in the audio-visual aids examined in this study are summarized in Table 4.

After studying Table 4 it is apparent that consonant and

TABLE 3

SKILL ANALYSIS OF GAMES

SKILLS	Consonant Lotto	Vowel Lotto	SMA Reading Laboratory Word Games	Sight Syllable Solitaire	Take--Sets I and II	Phonic Rummy	No Nonsense	Cross Country	Toll Road	Cagey	Spell-o-grams	Baffle
<u>Phonetic Analysis</u>												
Consonants	x		x	x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x
Blends	x		x	x	x	x						
Silent												
Vowels		x	x	x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x
Short		x	x	x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x
Long		x	x	x		x		x		x	x	x
Variant		x	x			x	x	x	x	x		x
Generalizations		x	x		x	x						
<u>Structural Analysis</u>												
Endings			x	x			x	x	x			
Compounds	x		x	x								
Base words			x	x			x	x	x			
Prefixes			x	x								
Suffixes			x	x			x	x	x			
Syllabication			x	x			x	x	x			
Accents												
<u>Contextual Clues</u>												
<u>Dictionary</u>												
Alphabetization												
Guide words												
Pronunciation key												
Syllabication												

TABLE 3--Continued

				x x		Quizmo
				x x	x x x x	Phonetic Word Builder
						Fun With Words-C
						Digraph Whirl
						Vowel Dominoes
						Old Itch
						Spin Hard-Spin Soft
						Magic Teacher Sets I, II, and III
						Pronoun Parade
						Quiet Pal
						End-in-E Game
						Word Blends
						Word Prefixes
						Word Suffixes
						Ideal Phonic Drill Cards

Individual Games

TABLE 4

SKILL ANALYSIS OF AUDIO-VISUAL AIDS

SKILLS	Words and Word Parts (Film)	Imperial's Our Daily Words (Filmstrip)	Webster Word Charts	Singing With Sounds (Record)	Webster Goals in Spell- ing (Filmstrips)	Phonics Development Transparencies	Word-Co-Round	Vowel Sounds (Flashcards)	Dictionary Skills (Transparencies)	Your Dictionary and How to Use It (Filmstrips)	Syllable Rules and Accent Clues (Charts)
<u>Phonetic Analysis</u>											
Consonants		X		X	X	X	X	X			
Blends		X		X	X			X			
Silent											
Vowels		X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	
Short		X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	
Long		X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	
Variant		X	X		X	X		X			
Generalizations		X				X		X			
<u>Structural Analysis</u>											
Endings											
Compounds	X	X				X					
Base words	X	X									
Prefixes	X	X	X			X					
Suffixes	X	X	X			X					
Syllabication		X	X		X	X				X	X
Accents		X									X
<u>Contextual Clues</u>											
<u>Dictionary</u>											
Alphabetization								X		X	
Guide words								X		X	
Pronunciation key								X		X	
Syllabication								X			

vowel sound reinforcement is made available through the use of films, filmstrips, charts, transparencies, and flash cards.

The data in Table 4 indicate that a few of the audio-visual aids examined in this study reinforce structural analysis, particularly prefixes, suffixes, and syllabication principles.

Two of the materials studied placed major emphasis on the sequential development of dictionary skills, beginning with alphabetization followed by exercises to give review to the use of guide words and the pronunciation key.

It was found that no audio-visual aid examined stressed context clues only, but many of the other skills were practiced in a contextual setting. The data in Table 4 also show that very few aids included reinforcement of accent work.

In summary, the major emphasis of word attack skills reinforced through the use of audio-visual aids is placed on phonetic analysis, followed by structural analysis and dictionary skill development.

Evaluation of Materials

Workbooks

The workbooks used in this study were objectively evaluated on a rank basis from 1 to 3 according to the criteria established. Each series was ranked using the numerals 1, 2, 3, with 1 being the highest rating. These rankings are summarized in Table 5.

When the workbooks involved in this study were a part of a series, they were considered as one type and evaluated by series.

The data in Table 5 show that all but one of the workbooks studied have an exceptional rating for having appropriate size of print. The majority of workbooks evaluated have appropriate readability. Of the series of workbooks studied, only six were found to have clearly stated directions while the others relied upon teacher stated directions.

The data in Table 5 indicate that many of the workbooks involved in this study contain a sequential development of skills. It was found that three of the workbooks evaluated presented a review of one skill on a page and then proceeded to another skill without reinforcement and in no particular order.

Only one series of workbooks studied received an exceptional rating for having a variety of exercises. The greater majority of workbooks tended to present the skills in one or two types of exercises.

Because some of the workbooks were not specifically designed to be used with remedial students, but for developmental use, it was found that the workbooks varied as to interesting format for remedial students. Two of the workbooks studied received an exceptional rating in this area, while five were given a satisfactory rating.

TABLE 5

EVALUATIVE SCALE FOR WORKBOOKS

MATERIALS	Clearly Stated Directions	Appropriate Readability	Interesting Format for Remedial Student	Sequential Development of Skills	Appropriate Size of Print	Variation in Exercises
Phonics We Use	1	3	3	1	2	3
Building Reading Skills	3	1	2	1	1	2
Ginn Word Enrichment	2	1	1	1	1	2
Developing Reading Skills	1	1	2	3	1	3
Unlocking Strange Words	1	1	2	1	1	3
Be A Better Reader	1	1	1	2	1	1
Barnell Loft, Ltd.	3	1	3	1	1	3
Dr. Spello	1	1	2	1	1	2
Conquests in Reading	3	2	3	2	1	3
Middle Grades Phonics	1	1	2	1	1	2

1- High
 2- Average
 3- Low

Games

The group and individual games evaluated in this research paper are shown in Table 6.

Generally speaking, the data in Table 6 demonstrate that the vast majority of the group and individual games have an attractive appearance with almost half of them having an exceptional rating.

The data show that the games evaluated in this study have a high appeal to remedial students and because of their inherent interest, were judged to be exceptionally valuable as teaching tools. Only one of the games examined was found to be deficient in these two areas.

It should be noted, however, that games in and of themselves are interesting to remedial students.

Audio-visual Aids

The audio-visual aids examined in this study were objectively evaluated according to the criteria shown in Table 7.

The data in Table 7 demonstrate that the majority of audio-visual aids evaluated in this research paper were found to have a well-designed format, to be effective teaching tools, and to be interesting to remedial students. Since children are accustomed to receiving messages through auditory-visual techniques, it would seem to follow that the audio-visual materials would have a high appeal.

According to the three criteria listed, eight of the

TABLE 6

EVALUATIVE SCALE FOR GROUP AND INDIVIDUAL GAMES

MATERIALS	Attractive Appearance	Effective Teaching Tools	Interesting to Remedial Students
Group			
Consonant Lotto	2	2	2
Vowel Lotto	2	1	1
SRA Reading Lab. Word Games	2	1	1
Sight Syllable Solitaire	2	1	2
Take--Sets I and II	1	1	1
Phonics Rummy	2	2	1
No Nonsense	1	1	1
Cross Country	1	1	1
Toll Road	1	1	1
Cagey	1	1	1
Spell-o-grams	1	1	1
Baffle	1	1	1
Quizmo	2	1	1
Phonetic Word Builder	3	2	3
Fun With Words-C	2	1	1
Digraph Whirl	1	1	1
Vowel Dominoes	1	1	1
Old Itch	1	1	1
Spin Hard-Spin Soft	1	1	1
Individual			
The Magic Teacher Puzzle Plans	1	1	1
Pronoun Parade	2	1	2
Quiet Pal	2	1	2
End-in-E Game	2	1	2
Word Blends	2	1	2
Word Prefixes	2	1	2
Word Suffixes	2	1	2
Ideal Phonic Drill Cards	2	1	2

1-High
2-Average
3-Low

TABLE 7
EVALUATIVE SCALE FOR AUDIO-VISUAL AIDS

MATERIALS	Well-designed Format	Effective Teaching Tools	Interesting to Remedial Students
Words and Word Parts (Film)	2	1	1
Imperial's Our Daily Words	1	1	1
Webster Word Charts	1	1	1
Singing With Sounds	1	2	1
Goals in Spelling (Filmstr)	1	1	1
Phonics Development (Trans)	2	1	1
Word-Go-Round	1	1	1
Vowel Sounds (Flashcards)	3	2	2
Dictionary Skills (Trans.)	1	1	1
Your Dictionary and How to Use It	1	1	1
Syllable Rules and Accent Rules	1	1	1
Webster Word Wheels	1	1	1
Phonetic Word Wheels	2	1	3
Phonetic Word Drill Cards	1	2	2
Fun With Words-F	2	1	1

1-High
2-Average
3-Low

materials examined can receive the highest rating.

Summary

In Chapter IV can be found the names of the workbooks, reading games and audio-visual aids selected for this study, with a detailed analysis of the word attack skills presented in each. It is possible to observe the wealth of materials available to reinforce and extend phonetic and structural analysis skills to better prepare the remedial reader. In this chapter, too, are summary tables indicating the skills developed in each of the materials as well as the rating each received according to the criteria listed.

CHAPTER V

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Word recognition is the most basic of all reading abilities and it is desirable to develop word attack in various ways. There is a great variety of material available to develop word attack at the intermediate grade level.

The purpose of this study was to analyze selected materials consisting of workbooks, reading games and audio-visual aids at the intermediate grade level to ascertain which word attack skills were presented and to evaluate these materials according to simple criteria.

Specific objectives forming the basis of this study were:

1. To analyze which word attack skills are presented in the materials examined for the intermediate grade level.
2. To critically evaluate the workbooks, reading games, and audio-visual aids according to simple criteria.

Prior to the evaluation of the materials an extensive survey of the literature relating to word attack skills was made. Past research has revealed word recognition to be the most basic of all reading abilities as it is the foundation upon which the skills in all other growth areas are laid. The literature also suggests that children can unlock new or unfamiliar words in a variety of ways. Reading specialists agree that the techniques that are of real value to children in attacking unfamiliar words independently are use of context

clues, phonetic analysis, structural analysis, and the use of the dictionary.¹

In order to develop this analytical and evaluative study, it was necessary to construct a list of word attack skills to ascertain which skills were presented in the materials. Then a compilation of the number of pages devoted to each particular skill was made. It was then necessary to design objective evaluative criteria for evaluating the workbooks, reading games and audio-visual aids involved in this study.

Findings of the Study

After analyzing the data, the following conclusions can be made within the scope and limitations of this study:

Workbooks

1. Consonant sounds were reinforced in 57% of the workbooks studied.
2. There are pages devoted to the review and practice of vowel sounds in 83% of the selected workbooks.
3. Seventy-eight percent of the workbooks involved in this study were found to be concerned with structural analysis techniques-- with major emphasis on syllabication, prefixes and suffixes.
4. Contextual clues were slighted in most of the workbooks studied, with the exclusion of one series which was designed exclusively to the development of this skill.
5. It was found that dictionary skills were introduced but not strongly reinforced in the

¹Supra., p. 10.

materials studied. There were a few pages devoted to dictionary skills in 50% of the materials studied in this research paper.

Games

1. It was found that 96% of the games examined stress phonetic analysis skills.
2. In the games selected for this study, 33% stressed structural analysis.
3. No games examined develop context clues or dictionary skills.

Audio-visual Aids

1. Phonetic analysis skills were stressed in 73% of the audio-visual aids examined in this study.
2. It was found that 64% of the materials stressed structural analysis.
3. Eighteen percent of the materials in the audio-visual section of this research paper developed use of the dictionary.

After constructing the list of word attack skills, it was necessary to devise objective evaluative criteria. Special care was given to design objective instruments of appraisal. After careful evaluation was made, the following conclusions were drawn.

Workbooks

1. Ninety percent of the workbooks evaluated appeared to have appropriate size of print and appropriate readability.
2. Directions were clearly stated in 60% of the workbooks examined, while the other 40% either had no stated directions or relied on teacher applied directions.
3. It was found that only 10% of the workbooks

examined presented exercises is a variety of ways and only 20% were found to be given the highest rating for interest to remedial students.

After evaluating the group and individual games examined in this study, the following points were noted:

1. It was found that 96% of the games evaluated had an attractive appearance.
2. One hundred percent of the games were found to be effective teaching tools.
3. Ninety-six percent of the games were rated as being interesting to remedial students.

A critical evaluation of the audio-visual aids concerned in this study demonstrate that:

1. Ninety-five percent of the aids examined in this research paper have a well-designed format.
2. One hundred percent of the materials were found to be effective teaching tools.
3. Of the audio-visual materials evaluated, 95% were found to have a high interest appeal to remedial students.

Implications

Implications which follow from this study are:

1. Reading teachers who are guiding intermediate grade level children in their efforts to acquire independence in word attack have a wealth of materials available to them. These materials can be used to vary their reading programs.
2. Because of the variety of materials available to teachers today, it is necessary that they be selected wisely to meet the individual needs of children.
3. Since some of the materials do not contain exercises to develop certain phases of word

attack skills, teachers need to resort to varied materials in order to reinforce all necessary word analysis skills.

Suggestions for Further Research

Further studies that might result from this research

are:

1. An analytical and evaluative study of current materials to develop word attack at the Junior High and Senior High School level.
2. An experimental study to ascertain which type of material--workbooks, reading games, or audio-visual aids--are more effective with remedial readers at the intermediate grade level.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books

- Bagford, Jack. Phonics: Its Role in Teaching Reading. Iowa City: Sernoll, Inc., 1967.
- Bond, Guy L., and Tinker, Miles A. Reading Difficulties: Their Diagnosis and Correction. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1967.
- Bond, Guy L., and Wagner, Eva Bond. Teaching the Child to Read. London: The Macmillan Co., 1960.
- Botel, Merton. Revised Guide to the Botel Reading Inventory. Chicago: Follett Publishing Co., 1966.
- Brake, Rachel G., ed. Language Arts Tools. Detroit: Wayne County Board of Education, 1967.
- Dawson, Mildred A. and Bamman, Henry A. Fundamentals of Basic Reading Instruction. New York: David McKay, Inc., 1963.
- DeBoer, John J., and Dallman, Martha. The Teaching of Reading. New York: Henry Holt and Co., 1960.
- Dechant, Emerald V. Improving the Teaching of Reading. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1964.
- Dolch, Edward. A Manual for Remedial Reading. Champaign, Illinois: The Garrard Press, 1939.
- Durkin, Dolores. Phonics and the Teaching of Reading. New York: Bureau of Publications, 1965.
- Durrell, Donald D. Improving Reading Instruction. New York: World Book Co., 1956.
- Gans, Rosa. Common Sense in Teaching Reading. Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1963.
- Gates, Arthur I. The Improvement of Reading. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1937.
- Gray, William S. On Their Own in Reading. Chicago: Scott Foresman and Co., 1960.

- Harris, Albert J. How to Increase Reading Ability. New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1961.
- Heilman, Arthur W. Phonics in Proper Perspective. Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill Pub. Co., 1964.
- Heilman, Arthur W. Principles and Practices of Teaching Reading. Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill Pub. Co., 1967.
- Hester, Kathleen B. Teaching Every Child to Read. New York: Harper and Row, 1964.
- Kottmeyer, William. Teacher's Guide for Remedial Reading. St. Louis: Webster Pub. Co., 1959.
- McKee, Paul. The Teaching of Reading. Chicago: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1948.
- Otto, Wayne, and McMenemy, Richard A. Corrective and Remedial Teaching. Boston, Mass.: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1966.
- Schubert, Delwyn G. A Dictionary of Terms and Concepts in Reading. Springfield, Ill.: Charles C. Thomas, Pub., 1964.
- Smith, Nila Banton. Reading Instruction for Today's Children. Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1963.
- Spache, George D. Reading in the Elementary School. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1964.
- Strang, Ruth. Making Better Readers. Boston: D. C. Heath and Co., 1957.
- Wilson, Robert M. Diagnostic and Remedial Reading. Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill Pub. Co., 1967.
- Witty, Paul A.; Freeland, A.M.; and Grotberg, E.H. The Teaching of Reading. Boston: D. C. Heath and Co., 1966.
- Yoaken, Gerald A. Basal Reading Instruction. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1955.

Articles and Periodicals

- Arnold, R.D. "Four Methods of Teaching Word Recognition to Disabled Readers." Elementary School Journal, LXVIII (1968), 269-74.

- Bennett, Arnette. "An Analysis of Errors in Word Recognition Made by Retarded Readers." Journal of Educational Psychology, (Jan., 1942), 25-38.
- Breen, L.D. "Vocabulary Development by Teaching Prefixes, Suffixes, and Word Derivatives." The Reading Teacher, XIX, (November, 1960), 93-97.
- Brown, Don. Remedial Reading Activities--An Idea Book. Curriculum Bulletin, (Feb., 1967), 1-20.
- Dolch, F.W. "How a Child Sounds Out a Word." Elementary English Review, XXII, (November, 1945), 275-80.
- Emans, Robert. "Usefulness of Phonics Generalizations Above the Primary Grades." The Reading Teacher, XX, (February, 1967), 419-25.
- Emans, Robert and Fisher, Gladys Mary. "Teaching the Use of Context Clues." Elementary English, (March, 1967), 243-46.
- Gagon, G.S. "Modern Research and Word Perception." Education, LXXVI, (1966), 464-72.
- Glass, Cerald G. "A Look at the Teaching of Word Analysis." Elementary School Journal, (October, 1958), 35-8.
- Goodman, K.S. "A Linguistic Study of Gues and Miscues in Reading." Elementary English, XLII, 1965, 639-43.
- Gunderson, Doris V. "Reading Problems: Glossary of Terminology." Reading Research Quarterly, IV, Sum.1969, 534-47.
- Hackney, Ben H. Jr. "Reading Achievement and Word Recognition Skills." The Reading Teacher, (March, 1968), 515-18.
- Jaranko, Arreta. "Danger Points in Reading Instruction." The Reading Teacher, XXII, (March, 1969), 507-09.
- Roswell, Florence G. and Chall, Jeanne S. "Helping Poor Readers with Word Recognition Skills." The Reading Teacher, X, (April, 1957), 200-03.
- Russell, David H. "Teacher's Views on Phonics." Elementary English, XXXII, (1955), 371.
- Smith, Nila Banton. "What Research Tells Us About Word Recognition." Elementary School Journal, IV (April, 1955), 440-46.

Vernon, M.D. "Major Approaches to Word Perception." Education, LXXXVI (1966), 459-63.

Proceedings

- Clayton, Kathleen K. "Word Recognition Skills for the Junior High School." Forging Ahead in Reading, ed. Figurel, J. Allen, International Reading Association, (Delaware, 1968), p. 13.
- Emans, Robert. "Identifying Significant Reading Skills in Grades Four Through Eight." Conference on Reading, ed. Robinson, H. Alan, Supplementary Educational Monographs, No. 28 (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1966), 37-41; 59-63.
- Johnson, Marjorie S. "Evaluating the Secondary School Reading Program," Reading Instruction in Secondary Schools, Perspectives in Reading, International Reading Association, (Newark, 1964), 117-28.
- Lewis, Juanita. "A Critical Look at Instruction in Word Recognition at the Elementary Level." Forging Ahead in Reading, ed. Figurel, J. Allen, International Reading Association, (Delaware, 1968), 55-9.

Unpublished Material

- Brogan, Sister Ann Josephine. "A Survey of Reading Skills Emphasized by Teachers of Grades Four, Five and Six in Selected Schools of Three Midwestern States." Unpublished Master's Thesis, Cardinal Stritch College, 1963.
- Burke, Robert J. "An Analytical Study of Consumable Reading Workbooks in the Seventh, Eighth, and Ninth Grades." Unpublished Master's Thesis, Cardinal Stritch College, 1963.
- Jettenev, Marjorie P. "An Analyses and Evaluation of Current Materials at the Primary Grade Level for Correction of Word Attack Deficiencies." Unpublished Research Paper, Cardinal Stritch College, 1970.

Other Sources

- Campbell, Bonnie and Quinn, Goldie. Readiness and Phonetic Analysis of Words in Grades K-2. Bellevue Public Schools Bulletin, Nebraska: 1965.

- Campbell, Bonnie and Quinn, Goldie. Phonetic Analysis of Words in Grades 3 and 4. Bellevue Public Schools Bulletin, Nebraska: 1965.
- Campbell, Bonnie and Quinn, Goldie. Phonetic Analysis of Words in Grades 5 and 6. Bellevue Public Schools Bulletin, Nebraska: 1965.
- Dallman, Martha. "Developing Independence in Word Recognition." Notes given to Conference participants at Cardinal Stritch College Reading Conference, 1962. (Mimeograph).
- Fisch, Sister M. Julitta. "What to Teach in Development of Independent Word Attack." Notes for class in Improvement of Reading Instruction, Cardinal Stritch College, 1969, (Mimeograph).
- Flint, Dorothy. "Word Recognition Skills and the Problem Reader." Know Your World, (September, 1969), p. 1.
- Mason, Evelyn. Suggested Activities for Developing and Reinforcing Word Analysis Skills in the Reading Program. United States Department of Health, Education and Welfare Bulletin, Washington, D.C.: Division of Curriculum and Supervision, 1968.
- Mickel, Margaret Ann. Variations in Basic Word Study Procedures for Primary Grades. Northampton Language Arts Program, Boston: United States Office of Education, 1967.
- Moody, Barbara J. ed. et al. Recipes for Reading. Conn.: Cooperative Educational Services Center, 1968.

APPENDIX

BIBLIOGRAPHY OF MATERIALS IN STUDY

Workbooks

<u>Title</u>	<u>Author</u>	<u>Publisher</u>
Basic Phonics Program	Lowry, M.	Daniel Reardon
Be A Better Reader	Smith, N. B.	Prentice-Hall
Building Reading Skills	Hargrave, R. Armstrong, L.	McCormick-Mathers
Conquests in Reading	Kottmeyer, W. Ware, K.	Webster-McGraw Hill
Developing Reading Skills	Poquet, L. Foster, I.	Laidlaw Brothers
Ginn Word Enrichment	Clymer, T. Barrett, T.	Ginn and Company
Magic World of Dr. Spello	Kottmeyer, W. Ware, K.	Webster-McGraw Hill
Phonics We Use	Halvorsen, M. et al.	Lyons and Carnahan
Unlocking Strange Words	Durr, W. Hillerich, R.	Houghton Mifflin
Using the Context Working With Sounds	Baning, R.	Barnell Loft, Ltd.

Games

<u>Title</u>	<u>Publisher</u>
Baffle	Lyons and Carnahan
Cagey	Lyons and Carnahan
Cross Country	Lyons and Carnahan
Consonant Lotto	Garrard
Digraph Whirl	Lyons and Carnahan

End-in-E Game	Ideal
Fun With Words-C	Dexter and Westbrook
Ideal Phonic Drill Cards	Ideal
Magic Teacher-Sets I, II, III	Garrard
No Nonsense	Lyons and Carnahan
Old Itch	Lyons and Carnahan
Phonetic Word Builder	Milton Bradley
Phonic Rummy	Garrard
Pronoun Parade	Dexter and Westbrook
Quiet Pal	Ideal
Quizmo	Milton Bradley
Sight Syllable Solitaire	Garrard
Spell-o-grams	Lyons and Carnahan
Spin Hard-Spin Soft	Lyons and Carnahan
SRA Reading Laboratory Games	Science Research Association
Take-Sets I and II	Garrard
Toll Road	Lyons and Carnahan
Vowel Dominoes	Lyons and Carnahan
Vowel Lotto	Garrard
Word Blends	Kenworthy
Word Prefixes	Kenworthy
Word Suffixes	Kenworthy

Audio-visual Aids

<u>Title</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Publisher</u>
Dictionary, Syllable and Accent Transparencies	Transparencies	Garrard

Imperial's Our Daily Words	Filmstrip	Carlton
Phonics Development	Transparencies	Milliken
Singing With Sounds	Record	Bowmar
Vowel Sounds	Flashcards	Webster-Mc Graw Hill
Webster Word Charts	Charts	Webster-McGraw Hill
Goals in Spelling	Filmstrips	Webster-McGraw Hill
Words and Word Parts	Film	Coronet
Word-Go-Round	Word Wheel	Harper Row
Syllable Rules and Accent Clues	Charts	Ideal
Your Dictionary and How to Use It	Filmstrips	Society for Visual Education

LIST OF PUBLISHERS

Barnell Loft, Ltd.	Barnell Loft., 111 South Center Ave., Rockville Centre, L. I., New York
Bowmar	Bowmar Educational Records, 10515 Burbank Blvd., North Hollywood, Cal.
Carlton	Carlton Films, 2870 Bartells Drive, Beloit, Wisconsin 53511
Coronet	Coronet Films, 65 E. South Water Street, New York, N. Y. 10036
Dexter	Dexter and Westbrook, Ltd. Rockville Centre, N. Y.
Garrard	The Garrard Press, Publishers, 510-522 N. Hickory Street, Champaign, Ill.
Ginn	Ginn and Company, Statler Bldg. Back Bay P. O, 191, Boston, Mass. 02117
Harper Row	Harper Row Publishers, 2500 Crawford Avenue, Evanston, Ill. 60201

Houghton Mifflin	Houghton Mifflin Company, 1900 South Batavia Ave., Geneva, Ill. 60134
Ideal	Ideal Publishers, Oak Lawn, Ill. 60453
Kenworthy	Kenworthy Educational Service, Inc., Buffalo 1, N. Y.
Laidlaw	Laidlaw Brothers, 328 S. Jefferson Street, Chicago, 6, Ill.
Lyons and Carnahan	Educational Publishers, 407 East 25th Street, Chicago, Ill. 60616
McCormick-Mathers	McCormick-Mathers Pub. Co., 300 Pike St., Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
Milliken	Milliken Pub. Co., 611 Olive St., St. Louis, Missouri 63101
Milton Bradley	Milton Bradley, 443 Shaker Rd., E. Long Meadow, Mass., 01028
Prentice-Hall	Prentice-Hall, Inc., Englewood Cliffs, N. J. 07632
Reardon	Daniel Reardon Publishing Co., 20401 Chagrin Blvd., Cleveland, Ohio 44122
SRA	Science Research Association, Inc., 259 E. Erie Street, Chicago, Ill. 60611
Society for Visual Education	Society for Visual Education, Inc., 1345 Diversey Parkway, Chicago, Ill. 60614
Webster-McGraw-Hill	Webster-McGraw Hill, 330 W. 42nd Street, New York, N. Y., 10036