

# The Role of Church Networks in International Exchange: Kobe College Graduates as Students in the United States, 1887-1939

著者名(英)	Noriko K. Ishii
journal or publication title	Otsuna journal of comparative culture
volume	11
page range	12-29
year	2010
URL	<a href="http://id.nii.ac.jp/1114/00000509/">http://id.nii.ac.jp/1114/00000509/</a>

# **The Role of Church Networks in International Exchange: Kobe College Graduates as Students in the United States, 1887-1939**

**Noriko K. Ishii**

Several women's colleges in modern Japan in the early twentieth century were, in many respects, sites of international exchange. As women were excluded from the newly created universities funded by the government, the bright and ambitious Japanese women flocked to women's colleges with American support. A large share of such institutions was mission-sponsored, where American funds and American missionary teachers were sent by the Christian networks of women in the United States. In many cases, such institutions offered their students opportunities to study abroad.

Situated in the historical context in which Japan sought to modernize rapidly to gain parity with the Western civilized nations and U.S.-Japan relations changed dramatically between the 1880s and the 1930s, American missionary women and their Christian supporters in the United States developed various venues of international exchange for the Japanese students. Their efforts served three immediate purposes: to establish their schools under increasing Japanese governmental control, to produce graduates who would provide future leadership both in their missionary schools and in Japanese families and society at large; and finally to secure American funding amidst deteriorating U.S.-Japan relations after World War I.

This paper will explore the case of Kobe College, an example of what Mary Louise Pratt has termed "contact zone" or "the space of colonial encounters."<sup>1</sup> By examining Kobe College as a site of international exchange, this paper will examine the questions of how students were offered opportunities to study abroad, why the venues of international exchange expanded in the 1920s and how women functioned as agents of international exchange across the divides of war. Finally, the paper intends to shed light to the larger questions of what role the Christian networks played in these international exchanges and whether the international exchanges produced what Mary Louise Pratt had termed "autoethnography" or "instances in which colonized subjects undertake to represent themselves in ways that engage with the colonizer's own terms."<sup>2</sup>

Kobe College was one of the first women's colleges in Japan founded by American women missionaries. Originally founded in 1875 by two single women missionaries from the Congregationalist American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (hereafter the American Board), the school aspired in the late nineteenth century to establish a

collegiate department to train Japanese women educators and pastors' wives, and was renamed Kobe College in 1894.

Regardless of these early U.S.-Japan contacts, what has often been overlooked in past scholarship is the fact that Kobe College pioneered in sending Japanese girls to the United States for further higher education and served as a site of international exchange since the late nineteenth century. The first American Bachelor of Arts (B.A.) degree earned by a Japanese woman was by Yamakawa Sutematsu (later Oyama Sutematsu), Vassar College, B.A., class of 1882. Yamakawa was one of the five girls sent to the United States in 1871 with the Iwakura Mission on a full ten-year scholarship from the Japanese Meiji government, and she subsequently became an ardent supporter of Tsuda College and the advancement of Japanese women in general. Kobe College graduates became the next group of Japanese girls to earn Bachelor's degrees in the United States and return to Japan. Producing the first graduating class in 1882, Kobe College (Kobe Girls' School<sup>3</sup> at that time) began to send one or two of their graduates to the United States every year since 1887. *Jogaku zasshi*, a liberal Japanese magazine on women's education, reported in 1895 that between 1887 and 1892, seven Kobe College graduates went to the United States to study, two at Mount Holyoke College, two at Carleton College, one at Evanston College, one at Wilson College and the University of Pennsylvania and another at a Kindergarten Training School.<sup>4</sup> By 1894, three of them had earned bachelor's degrees in Arts and Science at Mount Holyoke College, Carleton College, and Wilson College.<sup>5</sup> Records indicate that from 1887 through the 1890s, at least twelve or approximately ten per cent of 132 graduates sailed to the United States for study. As Usui Chizuko pointed out, these women were among the first Japanese women, holding bachelor's degrees at American colleges.<sup>6</sup>

Building on this tradition of sending some graduates to women's colleges in the United States, Kobe College developed sister college relationships with American women's colleges in the 1920s and these connections promoted the international exchange even further. In 1921, the first sister college relationship with Rockford College of Illinois, the alma mater of Julia Dudley, a founding missionary of Kobe College, was established. In 1925, Kobe College entered into two more sister college relationships with Radcliffe College in Cambridge, Massachusetts and Lake Erie College in Painesville, Ohio.

The idea of sister college movement was a product of union college movement and the ecumenical movement that began after the World Missionary Conference at Edinburgh in 1910. The mission boards of different denominations united to establish women's union colleges across the globe in the 1910s. Woman's Christian College in Tokyo (later

Tokyo Woman's Christian College) was founded in 1918 as one such example in Japan. It was established as one of the seven Union Colleges of the Orient.<sup>7</sup> As an offspring of this campaign, to make sister college relationship meant the following: "American college student body adopts an Oriental college as a Christian enterprise" and cultivates friendship and a share of support.<sup>8</sup> Therefore, the initiative to foster sister college relationships with these three American colleges actually came from the American colleges and not Kobe College. Records indicate that in the case of Rockford College, President William A. Maddox suggested the affiliation and he invited an American Board woman missionary sent to India who was on furlough and back in U.S. at the time to come and talk to the student body. The students decided to adopt Kobe College as its sister college because one of the founders was an alumna of Rockford College. The students pledged money as initial gift for Kobe College, and this culminated into a fund for a room in the new Kobe College campus that was built in 1934. For both Radcliffe and Lake Erie Colleges, an alumna who had long been interested in the foreign missionary work of the American Board and who herself had visited Kobe College in Japan made the suggestions to the student government associations and they voted to make the sister college contacts. In both cases, the students corresponded with Kobe College students, sent gifts and accumulated their annual gifts to fund a room in the new Kobe College campus. On occasions of anniversary celebrations, people from both institutions visited and made personal contacts. When Lake Erie College at Painesville, Ohio adopted Kobe College as its sister college in November 1925, a worker of the Woman's Board of Missions of the Interior (hereafter WBMI) who had visited Kobe College before suggested the affiliation and Makiko Hitotsuyanagi Vories, a Kobe College alumna to be discussed later, attended the ceremony. In a same manner, the Young Women's Christian Association (YWCA) at Kobe College adopted the Means School in Dondi in Portuguese West Africa and raised money at their annual Easter sales and sent them the annual gift. At Kobe College, the English Speaking Society kept regular contact with the sister college relationships and exchanged letters and gifts.<sup>9</sup> Thus the Christian networks played an important role in fostering the sister college relationships. As we shall see, Charlotte B. DeForest, who served as the fifth and the last missionary President of Kobe College between 1915 and 1940, saw such relationships as pivotal cornerstones to promote mutual understandings as U.S.-Japan relations deteriorated in the 1920s.

In addition to the promotion of sister college relationships, Charlotte B. DeForest wrote and published a book entitled, *The Woman and the Leaven in Japan* in 1923 as a textbook to be used for the meetings of Christian women's groups in local societies

as well as young women's organizations and college groups in the United States. In writing this book, DeForest had a clear vision to distribute it among Christian women in the U.S. to enhance their missionary support and strengthen the U.S.-Japan Christian church networks. Hence she asked five Japanese women who had studied abroad and "knew western viewpoints" to read and criticize each chapter. These five women had graduated from the few women's colleges that were sites of international exchange in the early twentieth century. Yasui Tetsu from Tokyo Women's Higher Normal School had studied at Cambridge University by government scholarship and served as the Dean of the Woman's Christian College in Tokyo at the time. Yamada Koto and Kawai Michi were both recipients of American Scholarship and had graduated from Vassar and Bryn Mawr Colleges respectively. In 1923, Yamada was teaching at Tsuda College and Kawai Michi was the General Secretary of the Japan YWCA and she subsequently founded her own girls' school Keisen Jogakuen (Keisen Girls' School) in 1929. Finally, two women, Tsukamoto Fuji and Makiko Hitotsuyanagi Vories were from Kobe College. Tsukamoto had double degrees of B.S. and B.A. from Wilson College and the life of Makiko Hitotsuyanagi Vories will be discussed below.<sup>10</sup>

Charlotte B. De Forest took the leadership to enhance mutual understanding between U.S. and Japanese cultures and actively promoted student exchanges between Kobe College and these three colleges once the sister college relationships were made. The reason why she promoted such program so earnestly was that she wanted to ameliorate the two major crises she had faced after she assumed the Presidency in 1915. First, the American Board faced an unprecedented financial crisis during the two years between 1917 and 1919 because of the waning missionary interest during World War I. In addition to the growing indifference toward foreign missionary movement in general, the deteriorating popular images of Japan since the Japanese victory over Russia in the Russo-Japanese War in 1905 shrank the financial resources for the missionary work in Japan even further. Finally, the deteriorating U.S.-Japan relations had culminated in the Japanese exclusion clause in the Immigration Act of 1924.

In 1905 when Social Darwinism prevailed in American culture, the victory of "yellow" race over the "white" race reversed the Darwinian racial hierarchy. This upsetting cultural turmoil or the fear of yellow peril was created by Japan's emergence as an imperial power, coinciding with the sudden increase of Japanese immigrant farmers in California and their image as an economic threat to American farmers. Historian Joseph M. Henning poignantly observed that Meiji Japan had offered an intellectual challenge to Americans because it undermined the belief that "modern civilization and progress

were white, Christian birthrights.”<sup>11</sup> Through a nuanced study of how American images of Meiji Japan were rewritten in different and sometimes contradictory ways, Henning demonstrated how unsettling a successful embrace of modern civilization by the non-Western Japanese people was for the American people. In such a debate, Henning argues that Japanese clergymen, Japanese officials, American missionaries and scholars including the “prominent American experts on Japan” were forced to reinvent the “white race” and “Christendom” and “reposition Japan within them.” Therefore, when President Theodore Roosevelt skillfully intervened to mediate between Japan and Russia and successfully brought the two nations to the peace conference in Portsmouth, New Hampshire in 1905 despite the rising anti-Japanese sentiment on the Pacific Coast, he reinvented Japan as a civilized nation with Christian virtues and in contrast accused Russian Orthodox Church of “ecclesiastical semi-barbarism.”<sup>12</sup> At the same time, Roosevelt welcomed the Gentlemen’s Agreement of 1907 to 1908 in which Japan offered to “voluntarily restrict emigration by refusing passports to Japanese laborers” in order to subdue the anti-Japanese sentiment. Hence Japanese statesmen, Japanese clergymen and American missionaries allied together to rewrite the racial categorization of the Japanese by American public. They argued that Japanese were more similar to America than Russia in terms of civilization and Christianity because “Japanese proved remarkably capable of assimilating Western civilization.”<sup>13</sup> Public perceptions of Japan’s victory linked with the notion of “yellow peril” persisted, however, and could not be reconciled so easily.

In such a context, the threatened white farmers organized and supported the exclusionist movement. The staunch nativists and exclusionists petitioned for restriction against Japanese immigration and developed the theory that Japanese were “aliens ineligible to citizenship.”<sup>14</sup> Japanese diplomats, American business interests in Japan, the powerful Christian organizations as well as the U.S. State Department opposed such movement.<sup>15</sup> Despite the efforts of Christian goodwill by Christian networks among American missionaries and Japanese clergymen, the Congress passed the Immigration Act of 1924 with the Exclusion clause and nullified the Gentlemen’s Agreement. It was evident that the target of the Act was to ban Japanese immigration. Consequently as historian Mae M. Ngai contends, the 1924 Immigration Act solidified the concept that Chinese, Japanese, Indians and other Asians were “racially ineligible for naturalized citizenship.” Moreover, these racial formations produced new categories of racial difference of what Ngai termed “alien citizens” or “Asian Americans and Mexican Americans born in the United States with formal U.S. citizenship but who remained alien in the eyes of the nation.”<sup>17</sup>

Japan considered the passage of Immigration Act of 1924 as a national humiliation

and the Japanese public was shaken by it. Devastated by the passage, the American and Japanese faculty at Kobe College responded with profound indignation. Deploring the passage deeply, they decided to make two statements for publication, one by the Japanese and the other by the Americans. It was the first time in history that Kobe College faculty was divided along the line of nationalities. The two separate statements were made, however, to show clearly how the two groups were united fundamentally. Excerpts of the resolutions are as follows:

“RESOLUTIONS passed by the Faculty of Kobe College, Kobe, Japan, stating its attitude on the Japan-American Question.” June 19, 1924

“We, the American Teachers of Kobe College, greatly regret the unfriendly action of the United States Congress towards Japanese immigration as opposed to the spirit of the Christian message. . . . We feel that the fundamental and permanent cure for acts of unbrotherliness between nations is the spirit of Christ in men’s hearts; that His message and His influence are needed all over the world more than ever before. . .”

“Translation of the statement by the Japanese Faculty of Kobe College”

“We, the Japanese Teachers of Kobe College, hereby announce that we are firmly opposed to the anti-Japanese measure that recently passed the Senate of the American Congress, because we consider it to be inconsistent with the great principles of humanity and the spirit of Christianity. . . . We wish to take our stand with all Japanese that believe in internationalism, to encourage the Americans that embrace the same principles, . . . to bring about soon the abolition of this discriminatory anti-Japanese measure and thus advance a step further toward international peace and mutual human love.”<sup>18</sup>

In addition, when the news of the Exclusion Act was first published in Japan on May 9, Dean Hatanaka Hiroshi spoke at a special student assembly and reminded the students of their own responsibilities:

We need to oppose racial prejudice and all unfairness wherever found, with the broad viewpoint of world citizens. The good in all nations would combine to fight the bad in all. . . . . The beginnings of your responsibility for world citizenship are here and now.<sup>19</sup>

Facing these crises, De Forest anticipated the need to transfer financial and administrative control of Kobe College from the mission board to independent secular corporations with endowments and then eventually to the Japanese to ensure the survival and development of Kobe College in future. As a process to ease the transfer of the management to the Japanese hands, Kobe College Corporation based in Chicago was

founded in 1920 and Kobe College Foundation in Kobe was founded in 1925.<sup>20</sup> The two organizations on both sides of the Pacific cooperated in the relocation and expansion of Kobe College at the new Okadayama campus in 1934. The Kobe College Foundation in Kobe provided the land and Kobe College Corporation based in Chicago raised \$700,000 for construction of the buildings. When the Kobe College Corporation completed raising the building fund, the members, who mostly consisted of former WBMI officials, looked for new ways to strengthen the “international bridge” that they had built. As a result, the “Friends of Kobe” program was launched in 1930, which initially consisted of cultural projects to promote the understanding of Japanese culture among the American public. It was funded by the annual dues paid by the members. “Friends of Kobe” program also supported the project of exchange fellowships between Kobe College and the sister colleges. “Friends of Kobe” supported about two American fellowship students a year to work on their projects at Kobe College for a year. They were students of the sister colleges and they majored in Japan-related disciplines including Oriental art and Japanese literature. “Friends of Kobe” also arranged six scholarships for Kobe College alumnae in American colleges. Through both programs, “Friends of Kobe” produced a number of future academic scholars.<sup>21</sup> With the sister college relationships, “Friends of Kobe” program and the traditional study-abroad scholarship programs combined, approximately forty Kobe College graduates traveled to the United States for further study and training between 1887 and 1939. By no means was this a small number for a single Japanese college to send its alumnae to the United States prior to World War II.

In addition, scattered records indicate that Kobe College was a site of international exchange in another dimension. In a Project Information report to the American Board, entitled “Christmas at Kobe, 1936,” DeForest wrote that the city of Kobe was very cosmopolitan and that they were “most proud” because “Chinese, Korean and Japanese students” and the American teachers “can work together happily, all good friends in a family that is trying to follow The Prince of Peace” even if their “governments and politicians may be at odds.”<sup>22</sup> Even in the year before Nanking Massacre took place and the atrocities of Japanese army in China escalated, Kobe College managed to create a space of Christendom in which the students from Asian countries at war could foster Christian friendship. In sum, the Christian networks of American women including the missionaries at Kobe College and their supporters of WBMI, Kobe College Corporation, “Friends of Kobe” and affiliated women’s colleges, created various venues of international exchange to foster mutual understanding, Christian friendship and academic development. They developed these webs of networks with the hopes to develop Kobe College and to



ameliorate deteriorating U.S.-Japan relations. In the second part, the paper will discuss in what ways these Japanese women utilized their experiences of studying abroad. After pointing out what they shared in common, this paper will discuss the case of Makiko Hitotsuyanagi Vories, Class of 1908 and argue that Japanese women were not what Mary Louise Pratt termed “autoethnography” or docile diplomats of American domesticity and Christianity but were instead self-conscious individuals who invented their own ways to utilize their experiences in multiple ways.

Overall, the Kobe College graduates who studied in the United States for several years or longer became educators at Kobe College or other missionary girls’ schools across the country or at universities in Japan. If we focus on the first decade of the 1890s, we discover that a notable number of women specialized in the training of kindergarten education.<sup>23</sup> Another striking fact is that a number of them majored and obtained degrees in Science. Most of those with B.S. degrees returned to Japan to become science teachers but some others developed and taught domestic science courses at missionary girls’ schools including Kobe College.<sup>24</sup>

First, in general, Kobe College graduates went to American colleges where they had a special bond or affiliation. Many of them went to Mount Holyoke College, because a number of missionaries were from Mount Holyoke. Moreover, the President of WBMI, who had supported Kobe College from the very beginning in 1874 until WBMI merged with the American Board in 1927, was also from Mount Holyoke College and had served as the president of the Mount Holyoke Alumnae Association. In the 1900s, many of the graduates of the Music Department went to Oberlin Conservatory because some of their teachers were from Oberlin.

As these examples show, the church networks of the missionaries and the woman’s boards played a decisive role in making the connections with American women’s colleges. According to De Forest, Mills and Oberlin took the largest number of Kobe College graduates, eleven for each and Mount Holyoke came next with seven. The chief institutions that took in Kobe College students in the early years were Carleton, Mount Holyoke, Oberlin and Mills. The first three, Carleton, Mount Holyoke and Oberlin were the alma maters of the missionary teachers at Kobe College and as for Mills, the missionaries wrote to ask for special scholarships. Many of the American colleges had generously supplied scholarships and opportunities for self-help so that they could support themselves on campus and in many cases, the missionaries negotiated with the colleges for such plans.

Kobe College girls also went to theological schools. Otake Masuko, Class of

1933, who studied at Hartford College, Oberlin Theological Seminary (M.A.), Union Theological Seminary and who had finally earned Ph.D. at Yale University in 1951 in Comparative Education was an example. She worked as an advisor in the survey of religion for Civil Information and Education Section (CIE) of the General Headquarters, the Supreme Commander for the Allied Powers (GHQ/SCAP) during the Occupation years after World War II. She became the first Kobe College graduate to assume tenured professorship at Kyushu University, one of the national universities. Another academic who studied theology was Cho Takeda Kiyoko, Class of 1937. A recipient of the “Friends of Kobe” scholarship, she studied at Olivett College as an exchange student and then studied under Reinhold Niehbur at the Union Theological Seminary when the war broke out and she was obliged to return to Japan. She has served as professor as well as Director of the Institute of Asian Cultural Studies at International Christian University.

In many cases, Kobe College graduates who took degrees in American colleges became ardent Christians and educators themselves and many of them, thirty out of forty married with Christian educators/pastors who shared common purposes. Thus they utilized their education to educate the next generation. Therefore, despite gaining more advanced education than general Japanese women of their generation, few sought to expand and utilize their social role in the public sphere of politics and business. Accordingly, these women educators emulated the role model of their missionary teachers and devoted themselves to the elevation of Japanese women’s status through education and Christianity.

Sharing the common spirit of social reform, these women chose diverse fields and even invented new venues to make themselves useful for the society and people at large. Beginning with Watanabe Tsune, the first Class of 1882, with the first American B.S. degree from Carlton College in 1891 to Mibai Sugi, Class of 1915, Mills College B.A., University of Michigan, M.A., Ph.D. in Experimental Psychology and Otake Masako, Yale University Ph.D. in comparative education mentioned above, they all fell in this category. Mibai Sugi who finally assumed the Presidency of Baika Junior College, further advanced the spirit to another dimension. She held public office in 1948 when she was elected to the Prefectural School Board as the only woman elected.<sup>25</sup> De Forest called her the “career woman” of the Board of Trustees of Kobe College. According to her autobiography, Mibai stood out among other alumnae in the fact that she was impoverished and worked out her way by being hired as an office girl in Baika Girls’ School.<sup>26</sup> What initially motivated her was not religion but an incessant desire to acquire more knowledge and thoughts and she became the first Barbour Fellowship student from Japan. Eventually

Mibai also became an ardent Christian. In the several decades between 1887 and 1939, Kobe College graduates who studied abroad, tended to abide by what Nancy F. Cott termed as the “separate spheres ideology” that divided social life into two mutually exclusive spheres of “women’s private world of home and family versus men’s public world of business and politics.”<sup>27</sup> Inheriting this ideology from the American missionary teachers, they managed to create new spaces to utilize their education for others in their communities. The limited exceptions to those who became educators and/or pastor’s wives include Horiuchi Shizu, College 1889, who had represented Japanese women at the Chicago Columbian Exposition in 1893 and who later married a diplomat and served as the wife of the Japanese Ambassador to the United States and Kusama Sera, College 1913, who had taken two degrees at Mills College and who also married a diplomat, worked in Paris in the Committee for Intellectual Cooperation of the League of Nations or Hori Tsuya, Class of 1923, who worked as YWCA counselor in Los Angeles.<sup>28</sup>

Nevertheless there were cases in which Japanese women self-consciously chose their life courses and maneuvered to cross the boundaries of race, class and gender. The life of Makiko Hitotsuyanagi Vories, Class of 1908 demonstrated such a case. For Makiko, her choice to enter a missionary girls’ school and her subsequent study in the United States were both self-conscious acts of her own. As her case illustrates, I would argue that Japanese women were not passive recipients who would blindly follow American women missionaries’ aspirations and act as exponents of the ideology of domesticity and become “autoethnography.” Instead, some of the self-conscious individual women made choices on their own and invented new ways to integrate and theorize the balance of religion, gender and education.

Makiko Hitotsuyanagi Vories, class of 1908, is of particular interest, because although she was from the nobility, she made important choices by herself, regardless of a number of obstacles those decisions entailed. She decided to leave her home in Tokyo where she was born, enter Kobe College, reject marriage offers from Japanese men, study abroad in the United States for nine years, marry William Merrell Vories, an American missionary-architect of Omi Mission and finally to dedicate herself to educational work, especially the pre-school education at Omi Brotherhood Academy in Omi Hachiman. An adopted daughter of Tsuda Umeko’s friend Alice M. Bacon, Makiko attended the Preparatory Course for Bryn Mawr College for three years and spent a year at Bryn Mawr College with scholarship in 1912, Class of 1916, but dropped out because of the illness of typhoid fever.

With her ideologies of gender and race shaped during her nine-year sojourn in the

United States, Makiko not only crossed the boundaries of class, race, religion and gender but she also developed a new outlook on the ways to overcome racism and to cohabit with other multiple races in her later career. Developing an innovative theory, Makiko even declared that her views of Christianity and its practice were far superior to those of the other Americans.

Makiko's life was remarkable in the following three points. First, Makiko's marriage to Vories in 1919 at the age of 35 was sensational and attracted public attention as the marriage crossed the boundaries of class, race and citizenship. Makiko was from the aristocratic class in Japan because her father Viscount Hitotsuyanagi Suenori served for 34 years as a member of the Upper House. Vories, on the other hand was a commoner-missionary with little monetary means, and was a white American. Because Makiko was from the aristocratic class, the marriage involved legal sacrifices in terms of the citizenship of the couple. Makiko first renounced her registry from the Imperial Household and became a commoner to get married. In addition, by marrying an American, her Japanese citizenship was renounced. Furthermore, marriage to Vories outside of the United States poses a questionable status. Historian Peggy Pascoe points out that the miscegenation law prohibiting marriages between white Americans and Asians existed in a number of states in the United States in 1919 when they were married. Pascoe also suggests that the enforcement of the law varied according to the discretion of the local county clerk's offices.<sup>29</sup> Makiko herself states that she acquired American citizenship by marrying Vories in Tokyo.<sup>30</sup> Without further documentation that proves their marriage, the legal status of their marriage remains questionable. But even if she did acquire her American citizenship automatically by her marriage, this was again taken away from her when the Immigration Act of 1924 with the Exclusion clause for the Orientals passed the Senate. Hence Makiko was deprived of citizenship from any country for seventeen years. When Vories obtained Japanese citizenship in 1941, only several months before Pearl Harbor, Makiko's citizenship as a commoner was finally restored.

Second, Makiko's faith and strength lay in Christianity. What is striking is that her religious commitment to Christianity was also what she had sought after and gained by her own choice. The most decisive factor that motivated Makiko to Christianity, her own marriage and her subsequent career in Christian pre-school education lay in her familial background. Perhaps because she was from the nobility class, she grew up in a large household where she cohabited with her father's three concubines, her mother who was her father's legal wife and all the children including the three born by the concubines. Concubines conferred prestige and the concubine system prevailed most among the elite

intellectuals, who were considered leaders of the new Meiji state. Kuroda Kiyotaka, for example, had proposed to send five Japanese girls including Tsuda Umeko to the United States in 1871 for the purpose of developing women's education in Japan. Although he was such a liberal enlightened intellectual, he could legally in his private life, kill his wife and replace her with another seventeen-year old girl he raped two years later.<sup>31</sup> Ito Hirobumi, the first Prime Minister of Japan, kept concubines. Such cases demonstrated the double standard the liberal political leaders had on the advancement of women's status. They were deemed as promoters of women's education in their policies, but in their own private lives kept concubines. After all, marriage since Edo era had been considered as an integration of two *ie* (house) with the priority to keep the linear succession of male heirs. Thereby concubines were legally and socially accepted as means to produce male heirs when the legal wife could not do so.

Makiko's father, Viscount Hitotsuyanagi Suenori, was no exception. Although he was a promising newly-elected politician and a former student of James C. Hepburn, Guido Verbeck and Fukuzawa Yukichi at Keio, and thus a liberal, enlightened intellectual attracted to Western learning and Christianity, and a proponent of liberal education for girls at Protestant missionary schools, he kept concubines at home. In his case, his legal wife had produced four sons, so there was no excuse for his licentiousness.

Makiko's early experiences of concubines haunted her and made a dreadful traumatic imprint on her because several more tragic events took place. When she was only four years old, her own babysitter bore the child of her father and she witnessed a concubine at home. Even more traumatic for her was that her loving mother, who took loving care of all the children including those of the concubines and for whom Christianity had provided salvation, died after sickness when Makiko was only nine years old. Due to these tragic incidents, Makiko decided to leave her home in Tokyo, entered Kobe College and graduated in 1908, as one of the first class of the music department. Rejecting marriage offers from Japanese men, she was sent to the United States with the prospect of studying at Bryn Mawr, Class of 1916. After dropping out from college due to illness, she was adopted by Alice Mabel Bacon, who had remembered teaching her at Tokyo Women's Normal School. Alice M. Bacon, the host sister of Oyama Sutematsu and a friend of Tsuda Umeko, was invited to Japan by Tsuda Umeko to teach at three different girls' schools, the Peeresses' School, Tokyo Women's Higher Normal School and Tsuda College. Spending the total of three years and eight months in Japan, Bacon wrote and published *Japanese Girls and Women* in 1891, which was the first English-written and widely-read book on Japanese women. Makiko helped Alice's work including the multiracial summer camps

she ran in Squam Lake, New Hampshire every summer.

Third, building on her own motivation to get rid of concubines in the Japanese society and her strong faith in Christianity, Makiko managed to create a new field of work in Omi Mission by combining what she had learned from Alice M. Bacon at her multiracial summer camps and the vision Merrell Vories had in his work in Omi Mission.

Makiko was determined to get rid of concubines and sexual double standards and to formulate what she considered an “ideal marriage.” At the same time, she was sensitive to prejudices and racism and endeavored to create a harmonious and productive community out of diverse group of people with different power in wealth, ability, race, class and other social categories. For this end, she found hints in Alice M. Bacon’s effort to create a democratic community with 100 men, women and 30 African-American part-time teachers at her Squam Lake multiracial summer camps. Determined to put herself into God’s service, Makiko learned an important lesson from Alice that strong conviction and disciplined lifestyle were essential to develop a happy and peaceful union of people of different races, classes and powers. She also found in Merrell Vories, the same democratic mind as that of Alice, to be on equal footing with the Japanese Christian men in their work for Omi Mission.

William Merrell Vories was a missionary and an architect who had founded Omi Mission in Omi Hachiman, Shiga prefecture in 1905. The mission was unique in that it was not attached to any denomination or any mission board, but that it had started from a small Bible group Merrell Vories had begun. The most innovative characteristic was that Omi Mission integrated business activities in their evangelical work and supported itself by its profits. By undertaking architecture business in 1908 and the sale and manufacturing business of Mentholatum in 1920, they employed an economic system in which all profits were turned into Omi Mission and were spent each year for spreading Christianity.<sup>32</sup> Except for personal expenses necessary for food, clothing and lodging, no private property was accepted. In addition to this self-supporting evangelistic work, another characteristic of Omi Mission was that Merrell held to democratic ideal. All the members of the mission were regarded as equals, equals as the sons of God, and thus no hierarchical relations existed between the American missionaries and Japanese Christians. Reminded of Alice Bacon’s vision, Makiko was attracted to this democratic vision Merrell pursued.

In addition, Merrell had the vision of “man of culture,” which he defined as a man who possessed “spiritual power to be able to make rational and sober judgment on any event in life, and thereby cultivate one’s own capacity and devote his talent to advance

social welfare and to promote evangelical work so that God's Kingdom may come."<sup>33</sup> Makiko interpreted this "man of culture" as "Christians with creativity and self-controlling power." Incorporating these ideas, Makiko theorized that Omi Mission's goal of an ideal human being was "a completely free person" or "a free perfect man whose body is completely controlled by the spiritual power just like Christ is" and that such "perfect free man" should possess the following four elements of ideal marriage, the equality of human beings across race and nationalities, early childhood education that instills "inner power of self-control" and a "disciplined life with a well-balanced triad of spirit (mental power), intellect (intelligence) and body (freedom of body)."<sup>34</sup>

The key concept Makiko embraced in this vision was the "self-controlling power." To be independent, responsible and actively be of God's service, she found "self-controlling power" as the crucial discipline that one had to be trained in. She further theorized that such discipline of "self-controlling power" could not be instilled unless the training began in early childhood. Thus she found in the concept of "self-controlling power" an important key factor that could possibly combat the practices of concubine system, the sexual double standard and the sexual exploitation of women so that "ideal marriages" will prevail in Japan. After Makiko married with Vories in June 1919, she opened a playground where "the children could play constructively and be educated," and after Seiyu Nursery School was officially authorized to open in 1922, she dedicated herself to preschool education, the training of kindergarten teachers, lifestyle reform movement and the education of the disabled children. The goal of Makiko's preschool education was to develop the three elements of body, intellect and spirit in a well-balanced harmony and instill and shape "the self-controlling power" from early childhood. In order to achieve this, Makiko employed Vories' idea that the "rational lifestyle" is when "we make the most effective use of body, mind and spirit that were bestowed to us from God."<sup>35</sup> Thus Makiko taught the children to keep early hours and to keep everything tidy and clean so that she could strictly train them to lead a "physiologically correct life" and a "disciplined life." With such "self-controlling power" trained from early childhood, Makiko envisioned that her vision of "ideal marriage" in which "two independent and respectable characters will be united spiritually" and create "a new integrated character" would be possible. Makiko further added that such union of two characters should be freely selected by the couple themselves and to achieve an equal and well-balanced unity, the distance of "respect" should be maintained between the two characters.<sup>36</sup> In sum, Makiko's original visions of "self-controlling power," "ideal marriage," and the goals of early childhood education reflects an integration of Puritan concepts of discipline and Japanese traditional myth of

*“mitsugo no tamashii hyakumade”* or in Wordsworth’s words, “the child is father to the man.”

Later in 1925 and 1954, Makiko went to the United States to participate in international conferences. Observing the social problems of immigration, racial segregation and machine civilization in the United States, Makiko pointed out that “human weakness is universal both in the United States and in Japan” and said that the United States also should pursue the early childhood education that Makiko developed, in which children should be trained in developing “the self-controlling power” from early childhood. She proudly maintained that “it is now our turn to teach Western people our methods. We should not be passive anymore but we should now exchange ideas as equal partners.”<sup>37</sup> Here Makiko proudly addressed that her views and outlook of Christianity was superior to those of Americans in general.

To conclude, Kobe College provided a site of international exchange since the late nineteenth century. In the early years, Kobe College graduates went to the United States to gain further advanced education in women’s colleges and institutions of specialized education in order to become educators of the missionary schools in Japan. Beginning in the 1920s, however, the Christian church networks of missionary women and American supporters in the United States designed and promoted programs of international student exchange for the purpose to mitigate the deteriorating U.S.-Japanese relations. Overall, from 1887 to 1939, approximately forty Kobe College graduates went to American colleges and graduate schools. Most of them returned to Japan and utilized their overseas education in their work as educators at missionary schools and government institutions of secondary and higher education. Many of them were Christians despite declining Christian rate over time at Kobe College at large, and most of them were married. A few exceptions utilized their overseas education to promote international relations as wives of diplomats and businessmen. Almost none of them actively pursued to contribute in the public sphere of politics or business. In this regard, most of these Kobe College graduates seemed to emulate the role models of their missionary teachers. Yet, as the case of Makiko Hitotsuyanagi Vories demonstrated, a significant few managed to actively use these sites of international exchange to newly create an original space and theory in which reconfigurations of Japanese gender relations became possible.



An earlier version of this paper was presented at the Asian Studies Conference Japan at Sophia University, Tokyo, Japan on June 21, 2009. I would like to thank Anne Walthall, Sally A. Hastings, Patricia Sippel of the panel and the audience for their invaluable questions and comments.

- 1 Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (Albion and New York: Routledge, 1992), 6-7. Pratt coined the term and defined it further as “the space in which peoples geographically and historically separated come into contact with each other and establish ongoing relations, usually involving conditions of coercion, radical inequality and intractable conflict.”
- 2 Ibid., 7.
- 3 The English name of the institution changed over time as follows: Kobe Home from 1873 to 1880, Kobe Girls’ School from 1880 to 1894, and Kobe College from 1894 to present. In this paper, the term Kobe College would be used regardless of the time period, to avoid unnecessary confusions.
- 4 *Jogaku zasshi*, vol. 417 (1895), 460.
- 5 Two from the first Class of 1882 at Kobe College earned the first two bachelor’s degrees at American colleges. Hirata Toshi (Martha Gulick, a Chinese orphan adopted by the American Board missionary, J.T. Gulick), Class of 1882 (Kobe College), B.A., Class of 1890, Mount Holyoke College and Seminary; Watanabe Tsune, Class of 1882 (Kobe College), B.S. Class of 1891, Carleton College; Tsukamoto Fuji, Class of 1886 (Kobe College), B.S. and B.A., Class of 1894, Wilson College, Pennsylvania. Tsukamoto did another year of graduate work at the University of Pennsylvania. For a follow-up study of the first graduating class and a brief biographical data of the early graduates, see *Megumi*, (Kobe College Alumnae Bulletin), vol. 55 (March 1913), 1-14, Kobe College Library. Michio Okamoto, “Kindai Nihon no Joshi Kyouiku to Kobe Jogakuin,” Kobe College, ed. *Kobe Jogakuin Hyakunennshi- Kakuron*, 1981, 204-212.
- 6 Usui Chizuko, *Joshi Kyoiku no Kindai to Gendai: Nichibei no Hikakukyokuigakuteki Shiron* (Kindai Bungei Sha: 1994), 38-39.
- 7 Kohiyama Rui, “Yujo no Teikoku: ‘Toyo no Nanatsu no Joshi Daigaku’ ni miru Amerika teki ‘Teikokushugi no Bunnka’”, Chapter 4, Kihira Eisaku, Yui Daizaburo, ed., *Gurobarizeshon to Teikoku* (Kyoto: Minerva Shobo, 2006), 89-114.
- 8 Charlotte B. DeForest, *History of Kobe College* (Nishinomiya: Kobe College, 1950), 71.
- 9 Ibid., 71-72.
- 10 Charlotte B. DeForest, *The Woman and the Leaven in Japan* (West Medford: The Central Committee on the United States of Foreign Missions, 1923), 8. Makiko Hitotsuyanagi Vories was the fifth recipient of the Philadelphia scholarship, yet she resigned after a bout of typhoid fever. Louise Ward Demakis, “No Madame Butterflies: The American Women’s Scholarship for Japanese Women,” *The Journal of American and Canadian Studies* No.4(Autumn 1989), 24.
- 11 Joseph M. Henning, *Outposts of Civilization: Race, Religion, and the Formative Years of American-Japanese Relations* (New York and London: New York University Press, 2000), 1-6.
- 12 Ibid., 137-149.
- 13 Mae M. Ngai, *Impossible Subjects: Illegal Aliens and the Making of Modern America* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004), 39.
- 14 Henning, 143.
- 15 Ngai, *Impossible Subjects*, 5-9.

- 16 Ibid., 47-49.
- 17 Ibid., 7-9.
- 18 Charlotte B. DeForest, *History of Kobe College*, 68.
- 19 Ibid., 69.
- 20 When the three Woman's Boards (among the three Congregational Woman's Boards, the WBMI or the Woman's Board of Missions of the Interior had assumed the responsibility of missionary work at Kobe College since 1874) were merged with the American Board in 1927, most of the remaining officers of the WBMI including the WBMI President, Emily White Smith transferred to Kobe College Corporation. As De Forest had anticipated, the two corporations created in the 1920s enabled a smooth transition of management from the mission board to the Japanese and provided the foundation when the Presidency was transferred from De Forest to Hatanaka in 1940, a year before the Pearl Harbor Attack. See Noriko Kawamura Ishii, *American Women Missionaries at Kobe College, 1873-1909: New Dimensions in Gender* (N.Y. and London: Routledge, 2004), Epilogue.
- 21 Charlotte B. DeForest, *History of Kobe College*, 72-73.
- 22 Charlotte B. DeForest, "Project Information, American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions, Christmas at Kobe, Kobe, Japan, 1937, Personal Papers, "Charlotte B. DeForest," Japan Mission, 1903-51, ABCFM Papers, Houghton Library, Harvard University.
- 23 Koga Fuji, Class of 1882 (first class), Miss C. C. Vories' kindergarten training school, Laura Fisher's school in Boston. Koga became the first head of Homei Kindergarten attached to the Japan Women's University from 1906. See Noriko Kawamura Ishii, *American Women Missionaries at Kobe College*, 155.
- 24 Mase Yae, Class of 1902, B.S. Mills College, Mount Holyoke College, chaired the Home Economics Department at Doshisha Girls' School. Noriko Kawamura Ishii, *American Women Missionaries at Kobe College*, 164.
- 25 Charlotte B. De Forest, *History of Kobe College* (Kobe: Kobe College, 1950), 212.
- 26 Mibai Sugi, *Kore mo Issho* (Toyonaka: Baika Gakuen Dosokai, 1958).
- 27 Nancy F. Cott, *The Bonds of Womanhood: "Woman's Sphere" in New England, 1780-1835* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1977).
- 28 Hori Tsuya was also shocked by her father holding a concubine. Her father had deserted his family, and fled with his concubine to Beijing, where he died. Tsuya sailed to Beijing alone to care for her dying father, and gained confidence that she could travel overseas alone. Because of the indignation against concubines, she went to the United States, where she had earned the B.A. degree at Mills College and worked for the YWCA in Los Angeles. When WWII broke out, she was interned in a Japanese American Internment Camp. Tsuya assumed a job of teaching Japanese for the civilian training unit of the U.S. army in Colorado where she recruited Hori Minoru, who had been the President of the Los Angeles Chamber of Commerce, a leader of the Japanese American community in Los Angeles and who had also been interned with his daughters. Later in 1943, they were married when Tsuya was forty-two and Minoru was forty-nine years old. Author's interview with Tanimura Reiko, a niece of Hori Tsuya, June 21, 2009, and January 8, 2010, Tokyo. Makimi Kambayashi, "Issei women: Life Histories of Six Issei Women," M. A. thesis, UCLA, 1984.
- 29 Peggy Pascoe, *What Comes Naturally: Miscegenation Law and the Making of Race in America* (Oxford,

New York: Oxford University Press, 2009).

- 30 Grace Nies Fletcher, *Love is the Bridge* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1968), 146. This fairy-tale depiction of the relationship of the couple written by a fiction-writer poses question of authenticity. Evidently Makiko commissioned the work, but she claims it to be true.
- 31 Murakami Nobuhiko, *Meiji Josei Shi*, Jo kan, Rironsha, 1969-1972, reprint, (Tokyo: Rironsha, 1980), 152-53.
- 32 Okamura Naohiko, "W.M. Vorisu no Keizai Shiso: 'Omi Misshon' no Sangyoteki Jissen," *Kirisutokyo Shakai Mondai Kenkyu* 31(1983): 109-140.
- 33 W. Mereru Borisu, "Kyouiku no Riso," *Kohan no Koe*, vol.224 (October 1931), 6-10.
- 34 Mereru Borisu, "Jinsei no Igi - Wagaya no Seikatsu (26)," *Kohan no Koe*, vol. 211 (September, 1930), 26.
- 35 Ibid.
- 36 Hitotsuyanagi Makiko, "Konyakusha e no Osusume," *Hitotsuyanagi Makiko Bunshu*, 132.
- 37 Borisu Fujin, "Beikoku Tanshin," *Kohan no Koe*, vol.153, 10-11: vol.472 (November, 1954).