

Colonial Latin American Historical Review

Volume 14

Issue 3 *Volume 14, Issue 3 (Summer 2005)*

Article 6

6-1-2005

William F. Jaenike, Black Robes in Paraguay: The Success of the Guarani Missions Hastened the Abolition of the Jesuits

Robert H. Jackson

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/clahr>

Recommended Citation

Jackson, Robert H.. "William F. Jaenike, Black Robes in Paraguay: The Success of the Guarani Missions Hastened the Abolition of the Jesuits." *Colonial Latin American Historical Review* 14, 3 (2005): 316. <https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/clahr/vol14/iss3/6>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Colonial Latin American Historical Review by an authorized editor of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact amywinter@unm.edu.

to their former jobs.

In the conclusion, Yun links the racial contract that the coolies exposed as "a cloaking institution and as a globalizing legal structure for a new form of slavery" with today's new forms of indenture (pp. 230-31). In all, *The Coolie Speaks*, which includes an interesting addendum with selected petitions, a bibliography, and notes, is a fascinating study that will open the reader's eyes to the true nature of the coolie trade, as well as to new identitarian conceptions of what it means to be Cuban, Caribbean, and Latin American. *The Coolie Speaks* is of interest not only for Chinese diaspora studies but also for Latin American, Caribbean, and Pan-African studies and literary criticism. This book is bound to become a seminal work for the study of the Chinese presence in the Americas.

Ignacio López-Calvo
School of Social Sciences, Humanities, and Arts
University of California, Merced

Black Robes in Paraguay: The Success of the Guarani Missions Hastened the Abolition of the Jesuits. By William F. Jaenike. (Minneapolis: Kirk House Publishers, 2008. 356 pp. Illustrations, maps, bibliography, notes, index. \$35.00 cloth, \$25.00 paper.)

In 1767, King Carlos III (1759-1788) ordered the expulsion of the members of the Society of Jesus (Jesuits) from all Spanish dominions. The motives for the expulsion are, and will forever remain, a mystery wrapped in an enigma, because Carlos III declined to state the reasons for his decision. Several generations of scholars have analyzed the motives for the expulsion and generally have viewed Carlos' III decision against the backdrop of enlightened reform and the drive to increase royal authority, at the expense of the Catholic Church. The expulsion of the Jesuits from Spanish dominions was not an isolated action. Portugal (1759) and France (1764) also expelled the Jesuits, and in 1774 the Papacy suppressed the order.

William F. Jaenike, an electronics engineer by training, the retired head of a trust company, and a self-identified amateur historian of the "Guaraní Republic" in Paraguay, offers his own insights on the expulsion of the Jesuits in the volume reviewed here. Jaenike contends that the "success" of the Paraguay missions and problems associated with the implementation of the Treaty of Madrid (1750) between Spain and Portugal contributed to the decision to expel the Jesuits. This volume exhibits many of the problems found in books written by amateur historians: it is disjointed and rambling, and summarizes many details that are not relevant to the book's central hypothesis.

The story of the Jesuit expulsion, and the development of the Paraguay missions, is well known, and a number of important recent studies, none cited in the author's bibliography, have provided important new insights.

For example, Barbara Ganson's fine study, *The Guaraní under Spanish Rule*, which is still available in print in English, is much more informative than Jaenike's tome. Moreover, there has been an important series of conferences held about every three years since 1982 entitled "Jornadas Internacionales Sobre las Misiones Jesuíticas" (the next will be held in Buenos Aires in 2009) with which the author is not familiar. The conference proceedings from each of the Jornadas contain the most recent research on the Paraguay missions.

Jaenike relies primarily on Robert Southey's 1822 *History of Brazil*, R.B. Cunninghame-Graham's 1901 study, *A Vanished Arcadia*, and on his notes from lectures given by W. Michael Mathes during a 2003 tour of the Paraguay mission sites. These are the sources, curiously cited as "Primary Sources," for the author's discussion of the Paraguay missions. The author perpetuates the archaic and inaccurate concept of the "Guaraní [mission] Republic," and relies on Southey and Cunninghame-Graham without filtering the Eurocentric biases of these authors. Jaenike refers to the "success" of and the "Golden Years" of the Paraguay missions without defining what he means by these terms, which are central to his thesis that the "success of the Guaraní missions hastened the abolition of the Jesuits."

This work fails to contribute anything new to this topic. The history of the development of the Paraguay missions and the expulsion of the Jesuits has been the subject of many scholarly books that are readily available to the public. Those with an avocational or "amateur" interest in the Paraguay missions would be better served reading scholarly works that critically evaluate Eurocentric views of authors such as Southey and Cunninghame-Graham. In the acknowledgments to the book, Jaenike notes that his original intent was to visit the Paraguay mission sites during the 2003 tour and prepare a photo essay. The photographs in the book the author took in 2003, while not reproduced in acceptable quality in the book, would be suitable for some type of photo publication, which would have been a more useful exercise.

Robert H. Jackson
Independent Scholar
Mexico City

Imposing Harmony: Music and Society in Colonial Cuzco. By Geoffrey Baker. (Durham: Duke University Press, 2008. x + 308 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. \$79.95 cloth, \$22.95 paper)

This monograph by Geoffrey Baker aims to bring a comprehensive assessment of musical life in one of the most important colonial cities in Latin America: Cuzco, Peru. Specifically, Baker's interest is to problematize the upheld conception of the cathedral as the central institution of religious authority, whose influence extended unchallenged during the process of evangelization to all surrounding territories under its jurisdiction. According to