WALDEN UNIVERSITY
A higher degree. A higher purpose.

Instructional Design and Strategies for Multicultural Education: A Qualitative Case Study

Shamila Janakiraman
Purdue University

William R. Watson
Purdue University

Sunnie L. Watson
Purdue University

Papia Bawa
Butler University

With more people moving abroad for education and work, many countries are becoming multicultural in population. Hence, developing multicultural attitudes is becoming imperative to prevent negative thoughts and feelings toward minorities that may translate into discriminatory behaviors toward them. One way to ensure this is through multicultural education. The aim of multicultural education is to ensure that students from diverse racial, ethnic, and social-class groups will experience educational equality. This qualitative case study analyzes the course design and instructional strategies implemented by a professor in a multicultural education course offered in a U.S. university. We have examined how the professor taught about multicultural education, ensured educational equality in her class, and also successfully produced multicultural attitudes among her students.

Keywords: *multicultural education, instructional strategies, multicultural attitudes, five dimensions, case study*

Introduction

According to a U.S. Census Bureau report (Colby & Ortman, 2015), the U.S. population is expected to become majority-minority by 2044, with the minority population projected to rise to 56% of the total in 2060, compared to only 38% in 2014. The United States is becoming a more racially and ethnically diverse society, with the minority population comprising Native Americans, African Americans, Asian Americans, and Hispanics (Huda, Konabe, Jiaqi, & Hansel, 2015). If people possess negative thoughts and feelings toward minorities, then this emotion will produce discriminatory behaviors toward them (Del Barco, Castaño, Carroza, Delgado, & Pérez, 2007; Duckitt, 1992). The occurrence of social phenomena like discrimination, inequality, injustice, and poverty may derail the aspirations of many people (Huda et al, 2015), creating unrest and hence affecting the quality of life for everyone. This makes it imperative for people in the United States to understand multiculturalism and to develop attitudes that are conducive for living, working, studying and teaching in multicultural environments. Huda et al. (2015) defined multiculturalism as "attitudes, beliefs, values, and policies that affirm inclusivity of cultural and other life pattern differences" (p. 40). Moreover, with migrating workforces, students moving abroad for education, and the world shrinking into a global village, multicultural attitudes are becoming more imperative than ever before. Not only the United States but all "multicultural nation-states need to balance unity and diversity" (Banks, 2009).

Please address queries to: Shamila Janakiraman, Purdue University. Email: sjanakir@purdue.edu

How can we produce multicultural attitudes? Education is a valuable tool to produce multicultural attitudes. Multicultural education helps "reform schools, colleges and universities so that students from diverse racial, ethnic and social-class groups will experience educational equality" (Banks, 2015, p. 3). Teachers play a crucial role in ensuring that their students experience educational equality. Based on a quantitative study conducted in Turkey to determine teachers' attitudes toward multicultural education, Karacabey, Ozdere, & Bozkus (2019) recommended the need for research on how to develop and alter teaching methods and programs according to the principles of multicultural education and the need for qualitative research to establish a theoretical model for the development of an audience specific data collection tool. They also recommended studies to find if teachers' attitudes toward multicultural education affect students' academic achievement and social adaptation skills. We conducted a qualitative case study in a multicultural education course offered in a university to examine the course design and instructional strategies implemented by the professor that ensured educational equality and produced multicultural attitudes among her students, who may become future educators. We examined the course under the lens of the five dimensions of multicultural education (Banks, 1993, 2015).

Literature Review

Multicultural education is based on the basic egalitarian principles of democracy, which can be effective in implementing some of the objectives of American education (Huda et al., 2015). It is multidimensional and is not restricted to only providing relevant content or just reducing prejudice (Banks, 1993). Instructors must realize the differences among their students, like ethnicity, gender, religion, and transnationalism and be able to integrate diversity education into the entire curriculum (Alismail, 2016) and embody its values (Shannon-Baker, 2018). This is challenging given the many perspectives and opinions that exist. Also "ideological and/or political resistance, and high-stakes testing, and teacher accountability make any curriculum changes toward multiculturalism difficult" (Alismail, 2016, p. 139).

Multicultural Education and Multicultural Attitudes

Attitude is the psychological evaluation a person has about an object, person or event (Gagne, Briggs, & Wagner, 1992). This comprises the cognitive, affective, and behavioral components (Kamradt & Kamradt, 1999). The cognitive component of an attitude includes the psychological evaluations a person makes based on information, knowledge, and thoughts, whereas the affective component comprises a person's evaluations based on emotions or feeling. The predisposition to act forms the behavioral component (Kamradt & Kamradt, 1999; Simonson, 1979). Most often, attitudes do not affect behavior and people act in ways different from their attitudes (Ajzen, 2001); hence, a persuasive pedagogy is required in education (Sinatra, Kardash, Taasoobshirazi, & Lombardi, 2012).

Considering multiculturalism, Del Barco et al. (2007) described the three attitudinal components based on Breckler's (1984) definition. The cognitive component comprises beliefs, ideas, thoughts, and their expression or manifestations, including stereotyping, and beliefs loaded with negative values. The affective component consists of moods and negative feelings or emotions with respect to the outgroup or the absence of positive emotions toward them, whereas the behavioral component comprises tendencies, and actual behavior (Del Barco et al., 2007). The negative values and negative emotions harbored toward others leads to discriminatory behavior (Duckitt, 1992). It is difficult to affect the consciousness of people who have not experienced discrimination themselves, and for changing their perceptions and attitudes and to affect their consciousness, an intensive practical effort is required (Munroe & Pearson, 2006). Similarly, Alismail (2016) stressed the importance of thorough and balanced courses, besides giving relevant practice in multicultural education. If instructional activities and practices are slightly inconsistent with existing attitudes of learners and

slightly consistent with the target attitudes, then changes in attitude can be ensured (Kamradt & Kamradt, 1999).

Multicultural education should not be restricted to only the classroom experience but should encompass changes in curriculum, and institutional culture (Banks, 2015). Banks's transformative approach to multicultural education covers all three components of attitude: know, care, and act (Munroe & Pearson, 2006). By incorporating appropriate activities, educational experiences of students can be made meaningful by producing behavioral changes instead of simply providing content knowledge.

Instructional Strategies in Multicultural Education

Instructors should work professionally with students from diverse backgrounds. They should be skilled to integrate the different cultural experiences of students into classroom experiences and learn to plan their lessons intentionally (Alismail, 2016). Lewis and Ketter (2008) showed how teachers at a middle school, understood the representations of youth identity and culture by reading and discussing about multicultural literary texts. They experienced a shaping effect that changed their attitudes about how to teach in a multicultural class. Biography-driven instruction as a model of culturally responsive pedagogy was suggested by Herrera, Holmes, & Kavimandan (2012). This allows the observation of one's own attitudes and behaviors. Such reflection activities can produce affective changes in attitude (Bem, 1972). Reflection as a strategy works for both instructors and students. Griggs and Tidwell (2015) tried being mindful while discussing diversity issues with graduate students in an online multicultural education course. Mindfulness comprises compassion, empathy and deep listening (Nhat Hanh, 1991). Instructors must emotionally understand and notice the lives and reactions of others to establish an effective learning environment for all students (Griggs & Tidwell, 2015; Shannon-Baker, 2018).

To guide instructors on how to teach and to strengthen multicultural education, research should focus on teaching strategies, techniques, and learning environments (Alismail, 2016). This qualitative case study was an effort in this direction and was conducted 6 months after the course was completed by the students. Our recommendations based on student and instructor perspectives regarding course content, instructional design, activities, and instructional strategies applied in the course can serve as guidelines for instructors of multicultural education in the future to ensure educational equality and to produce multicultural attitudes.

Five Dimensions of Multicultural Education

Case studies are very conducive to be combined with a theoretical perspective and connecting it to the case analysis adds "philosophical richness and depth to a case study and provides direction for the design of the case study research project" and helps focus on the unit of analysis (Jones, Torres, & Arminio, 2014, p. 94). We applied the five dimensions of multicultural education (Banks, 1993; Banks, 2015) to study the instructional interventions applied by the instructor. The five dimensions are (a) content integration, (b) knowledge construction, (c) prejudice reduction, (d) equity pedagogy, and (5) empowering school culture and social structure.

Content integration includes the use of examples, data, and information from diverse cultures and groups for highlighting concepts, principles, generalizations, and theories related to multiculturalism (Banks, 2015). Knowledge construction dimension considers how teachers can help students understand the process of knowledge construction and the role played by race, ethnicity, gender, and social class in this process. Prejudice reduction is the third dimension (Banks, 2015) and covers strategies that instructors can use to enable students to develop more positive racial and ethnic attitudes. The fourth dimension, equity pedagogy, includes techniques and teaching methods that

can ensure academic achievement of all students irrespective of race, ethnicity, and social class. The last dimension, "empowering school and social structure," refers to the whole educational institution and how it can support multicultural education. In this case study, we examined how the instructor applied Banks' five dimensions of multicultural education.

> *Research Question:* How did the course design and instructional strategies implemented by the instructor ensure multicultural education or educational equality, and produce multicultural attitudes among learners enrolled in her multicultural education course?

Method

We used qualitative case-study methodology to analyze the course design and instructional interventions used by the instructor. Merriam and Tisdell (2016) stated that, "If a phenomenon you are interested in studying is not intrinsically bounded, it is not a case" (p. 39). Here, the multicultural class was our unit of analysis with finite number of participants belonging to different cultures, and this study was conducted to produce an "in-depth description and analysis" of the bounded system (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016), where we cannot separate the phenomenon's variables from the context (Yin, 2014). In this present descriptive case study, we studied a bounded system of 18 students enrolled in a multicultural education course taught by a professor, collected data from multiple sources, and reported on the case description (Creswell, 2013).

Setting and Context for the Study

The multicultural education course was offered in the fall of 2016 by Professor Jane (pseudonym) to a class of 18 students in a large Midwestern U.S. university. The course syllabus and weekly schedule were designed by Professor Jane. Students did not take any tests or exams and were assessed based on class participation, autobiography assignment, reflective responses based on readings, class discussions, and a group project. We examined how Jane's interventions ensured educational equality and were instrumental in producing multicultural attitudes among her students and recorded our findings in the following sections. We received institutional review board approval before recruiting participants.

Participants

Professor Jane had several years of experience offering this course at the university. Her research interests include studying multicultural education in diverse school contexts within the United States and abroad. She studies immigrant and minority student educational issues, language, ethnicity, social justice, diversity, equity, and ableism. Jane's lived experiences in an immigrant neighborhood as a child and as a student in a university with a diverse student population influenced her own multicultural attitudes, education, research and work. She stated, "subject becomes life, work becomes life." Jane's first-hand experiences trying to acclimatize in a foreign land with her family further enriched her experiences. She has published extensively in reputed journals and she has authored several book chapters, and books related to multiculturalism and multicultural education. She chairs and sits on the dissertation committees of students who are researching multiculturalism. Jane's education, research, teaching experience and her lived experiences encouraged us to analyze the unique perspectives she brought to the course making her and her class suitable for this qualitative case study.

The students were diverse with respect to college majors, comprising doctoral, graduate, and undergraduate students. Five White American, one Latina, and one Native American student were citizens of the United States. The international students in the class comprised three Chinese, three Korean, one Arab, one Canadian, one Indian, one Nigerian, and one student from Honduras. This

multicultural mix of students presented a unique sample to study the effects of multicultural education, providing the intrinsic (Stake, 1995) interest for us to study this case. The specification of the unit of analysis helped us establish internal validity (Tellis, 1997).

Data Collection

Case studies record the viewpoints of participants using multiple sources of data to establish data triangulation (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016; Tellis, 1997). To increase the construct validity of data collection methods in case studies, Yin (1994) recommended six common sources of evidence: documents, archival records, interviews, direct observations, participant observations, and physical artifacts. We used questionnaires to survey students. We interviewed the instructor to gain insights into her course design intentions. We examined the readings, books, course syllabus, schedule, assignments, videos, and parts of movies that were used during the classes. We collected data about instructional interventions like guest lectures, activities, and class discussions from the interview and surveys. Student autobiographies were analyzed to understand their lived experiences and prior knowledge about multicultural education and multiculturalism, while final group project ideas revealed their aspirations and future endeavors that developed as a result of the course. The course syllabus, schedule, and other course material were analyzed to learn why Jane had selected them, how she designed the course, and how she planned every class from introduction to homework. Table 1 outlines the data sources that constituted our case study database (Yin, 2017).

Table 1. *Sources of Data*

Evidence Used	Examples
Digital documents	Student autobiographies
	Group project titles and abstracts
	Course syllabus
	Course schedule
	Weekly readings
	Videos and films
	Assignment descriptions
Physical artifacts	Books
	1. Critical ethnography of immigrant students/parents in schools in the U.S.
	2. A memoir of growing up in the U.S. as an Asian American.
Interviews	Interview with instructor
Surveys	Questionnaire to students

We emailed questionnaires containing 12 open-ended questions about student experiences, attitudes, knowledge, feeling, and behaviors to the students during the summer of 2017. We received responses from nine students helping us gain insights from the special experiences of the sample (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016). The data obtained from the students clearly explained their thought processes while engaging with the content and while completing course activities. One of the researchers interviewed Jane. The interview lasted for an hour and was semistructured (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016) with no specific order or wording. The interview was recorded and transcribed verbatim. Interview questions were based on Banks's (2015) five dimensions of multicultural education. Attitude related questions were based on definitions provided by Gagne et al. (1992) and Kamradt and Kamradt (1999).

The syllabus provided a list of course objectives and the schedule provided the execution plan. We also collected weekly readings, activities list, assignment prompts, videos, films, and group projects. Required readings included two books: a critical ethnography of immigrant students/parents in U.S.

schools and a memoir of growing up in the United States as an Asian American. These books highlighted the problems that immigrant populations encounter when they start living in the United States owing to reasons beyond their control.

Data Analysis

We analyzed all the resources to assess their quality and how they connected to the course. We then reviewed student responses to the survey, followed by Jane's interview transcript. We also analyzed the autobiographies composed by students and the abstracts of their group projects. The case study analysis was by categorical aggregation (Creswell, 2013) which means that we collected "individual instances from the data" or pulled the data apart and put "them back together in meaningful ways" (p. 199).

Our team of four researchers analyzed the survey data to understand the meaning making process of the students, and their prior attitudes and knowledge regarding multiculturalism. This helped us decipher how their attitudes changed during and after the course. Jane's interview data highlighted her intentions in using various instructional interventions. We first reviewed the survey and interview data to arrive at preliminary codes. Then we divided the data into meaningful units and compared with the codes from the preliminary review. This helped us create a coding scheme based on the responses that the participants gave to our questions. The themes that guided our data analysis were how students experienced changes to the cognitive, affective, and behavioral components of attitude, and how Jane intentionally used interventions to produce these changes. Considering each theme, we grouped our open codes using axial coding methods and arrived at categories and subcategories (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016) based on the five dimensions of multicultural education (Banks, 2015) as a theoretical framework. Case analysis using a theoretical perspective adds depth to a case study and provides direction for the research design and helps focus on the unit of analysis (Jones et al., 2014). We coded the data at the word and sentence levels to glean maximum information. The coding was done independently and compared for agreement to establish intercoder reliability (Creswell, 2014; Merriam & Tisdell, 2016; Yin, 1994). Also, emergent codes enabled us to glean new insights into how each event could produce different experiences for different people.

Our research team included two professors who are experts in instructional design, a faculty member, and a doctoral student in instructional design. This enhanced the strength of the research study because we collected and analyzed data independently and met several times to compare findings and build consensus about the instructional design of the course and activities (Denzin, 1978; Patton, 2015). We conducted a semistructured interview (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016) with Jane covering instructional design, learning activities and strategies that provided a rich source of qualitative data. One researcher spoke to Jane directly without using a data collection instrument to get closer to reality, to enhance research rigor and also to strengthen internal validity (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016). Examining multiple sources of data from surveys, interview, digital documents, artifacts like books and assignments, films, and videos provided corroborating evidence and helped us establish data triangulation (Denzin, 1978; Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Merriam, 1988; Miles & Huberman, 1994). After we completed the data analysis process, we shared the manuscript draft with Jane for member checking (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Maxwell, 2013; Merriam, 1988; Merriam & Tisdell, 2016). We have quoted participants' own words without paraphrasing them, enabling readers to connect with participant opinions. These quotes will provide clear and persuasive descriptions to the reader along with the general description (Erickson, 2012). We followed the steps mentioned here to ensure internal validity.

Results

Answering the research question through a case-study approach has helped us gain knowledge about effective instructional strategies and instructional design techniques for establishing educational equality and for producing multicultural attitudes among students enrolled within a multicultural education course. The class we studied was truly multicultural, representative of different populations, as emphasized by Jane in her interview. Jane implemented many components of the five dimensions of multicultural education prescribed by Banks (2015). The results of our study have been grouped under these dimensions.

Content Integration

This dimension recommends the use of examples, data and information from diverse cultures and groups for highlighting concepts, principles, generalizations and theories related to multicultural education. The syllabus and schedule reflect this dimension as they described the course design, content, and activities. Jane stated in her syllabus that she wanted her students to understand multicultural education as (a) an ongoing reform process that addresses social justice issues, (b) a lens to view educational concerns, and (c) an approach that offers ideas that can be used to affect and implement change in our work, schools, and society. The value Jane holds for her syllabus was evident when she said, "...it carries such weight to me, creating the syllabus."

The course schedule clearly outlined course goals, weekly activities, assignments, submission due dates, media, and details about invited guest speakers belonging to diverse groups. Jane allocated one topic to each week which was discussed, debated, and analyzed in detail. She used different articles, books, poems, movies, interviews with experts, and workshops to provide the content that emotionally affected her students. The readings to be read before class were picked based on the weekly topics about a particular cultural group. The two books she picked were narrated in the first person and showed the trials and tribulations that immigrants face in a new country where they land, sometimes without any choice.

Jane was well informed about multiculturalism. She took relevant courses under experts, immersed herself in literature from an early age, and had experienced life as a minority in a foreign land trying to acclimatize to that culture. Her research and writing were focused on multiculturalism, and hence, Jane understood the difficulties faced by people especially young students, when placed in alien environments and cultures. She wondered aloud,

> How do people acculturate, how did people become comfortable in a new language and culture and environment, how do they change, how do they assimilate and retain their own language and culture, their own ways of being…I heard a lot of struggles around that.

This feeling of empathy helped her recognize the privileges she enjoyed that transferred to her teaching. She integrated content from lived experiences where appropriate.

It is easy to provide cognitive knowledge by reading and sharing experiences so that "students recognize oppression when it happens," but it is difficult to produce affective changes in attitude, opined Jane. She read poems and short stories or passages at the beginning of each class to provide a historical perspective so that students could learn from past mistakes committed by humans, where people of other cultures were marginalized and oppressed. She did not restrict her focus to marginalization in the United States alone. Jane stated,

> These protest songs are about people's experiences and how marginalized they are but to me they get you in the heart. So that's what I wanted to do, engage people's heart as well as mind because that's what I feel, if you cannot somehow connect, it is easier to give the academic cognitive kind of knowledge, think, than it is to dismiss, this is someone's personal experiences, so I try to choose readings like the little readings I did in class or the little bit of poetry.

The scholarly articles she provided every week and the two nonfiction books written by authors from different ethnicities were "purposefully selected" and were analyzed in small group discussions by the students. These readings captured the "essence of the experience from the perspective of the person," said Jane. She found it relevant to learn even from "knowledge that is not academically created." One student mentioned that "after taking the course and doing close readings I was exposed to the historical background which made me understand better the reasons for such sensitivities."

Jane invited guest speakers who addressed the class in person or through telepresence. Either way, class participation was enthusiastic, as reported by the students and Jane. Guest lecturers, according to Jane, provided a first-person perspective giving an authentic voice. Jane stated,

> How am I supposed to teach a class with 5 different ethnic or racial groups and I don't know about, but if you don't know yourself, why don't you turn to members of that community, to moving forward ideas, so I think they will be experts in their own kind of research and I think it has much more power and much like memoirs and I also hope that it touches the heart and the mind kind of idea.

The list of invited guests included Native American professors, professors who identified themselves as homosexual, and researchers who were Muslims, African Americans and Hispanics. One student said, "The different topics in the seminar kept me intrigued in addition to the speakers that were invited to give talks and facilitate discussions. I gained a better understanding from scholars who were conducting research on the different topics covered."

This aligns with what Jane said about providing "authentic voices," and "first-hand perspectives." The short films and videos showcased different people and different problems. As one student said, "We view a series of films that develop our understanding of multicultural issues in the USA and internationally. The different speakers and short films opened my eyes to the struggles minorities faced in the U.S."

Jane "directly and purposefully" used technology in the class for integrating content. She avoided Microsoft PowerPoint slides to instruct students; instead, she allowed them to learn from discussions and experiences. About using telepresence (Skype), to connect to experts, she said, "it can be a beautiful way to connect, if it was not possible for guests to come in person considering time and expenses." Jane used the course Learning Management System to upload weekly readings, the syllabus, and schedule only, because she did not see any purpose from that technology otherwise.

These results show how Jane effectively implemented instructional strategies for content integration by providing a voice to diverse cultures through the readings, videos, guest lectures, and films. These helped students connect with content that they could relate to and that was relevant to them. This also encouraged them to voice their opinions freely in class. A student from a minority culture in the United States said that the instructor allowed her to speak about certain topics and issues because she had a lifetime of knowledge and stories that the class would benefit from: "This experience gave me the confidence to speak up, to take opportunity to educate others." Students belonging to different cultures felt connected to content that were closely related to their own experiences and

this served to integrate content. Jane's intention was that students "will leave the class and never think the same, inevitably, even if it is not their central focus it will creep into their thinking."

Knowledge Construction Process

This dimension discusses the procedures used to create knowledge about multiculturalism. We examined if Jane provided direct instruction about multiculturalism in a lecture format or whether she allowed students to construct their own knowledge by scaffolding the process. Using a collaborative constructivist approach, Jane allowed her students to "challenge assumptions and question beliefs," "step out of comfort zones" and be ready to "disagree with one another," feel "mutual respect for each other," and to "be open to change." In her syllabus, Jane stated,

> I take a constructivist approach to the generation of knowledge and understand that dialogue and writing to be essential aspects of meaning making. I see multicultural issues as directly connected not only to our work, but to our lives, to the communities in which we live, and to the larger global society.

By encouraging multicultural attitudes, Jane wished to "develop an orientation to diversity" that would "benefit everyone's lives, teaching and other work." Jane's intentions to allow students to construct their own knowledge, through discussions, were effective. All students mentioned how it was powerful to learn about other's experiences in firsthand. "This was more impactful than readings and hearing about it," a student noted.

Knowledge construction does not mean only seeing and listening to others. In this case, Jane asked the students to perform an action, that is, write an autobiography. She wanted students to analyze issues that "arise owing to differences that exist among social class, race, ethnicity and gender causing inequality and marginalization of minorities, affecting education and normal life all over the world." The autobiography was a "super intentional" assignment that Jane used to emphasize that "if you don't understand the multiple self you cannot really understand the multiple others." Through this assignment she wanted students to "deconstruct a little bit and…. look within," and "recognize their positionality in this world based on family, culture, language, history and national context, and understand notions about privilege and how that provides the lens with which to see others."

In her assignment a Chinese student wrote, "the autobiography allowed me to self-reflect, but required great strength to put it down on paper at the same time it helped me prepare for my future journey." A White American student reflected on his past and wrote how he recognized privilege and how he discovered that his close friendships with an Arab student and an African American in his college days helped him excel in his career as a high school teacher. He wrote, "Throughout my entire life, I have been told that I had it easy. In my youth, I was given many benefits that millions of children throughout do not receive." This recognition of privilege was the essence of this assignment.

Another White American student revealed how she grew up with grandparents who were racist against particular ethnicities and parents who were the opposite. Her emotion-laden autobiography showed how she addressed different phases of her life; how she navigated differences arising due to financial position, gender, beauty, and religion; and what she felt about her privilege and who she was. One international student said in the survey, "The autobiography assignment helped me reflect on my life; it opened my eyes to how wonderful my life has been and how I have become who I am now." Two students have converted this assignment into a journal submission, an indication of the intensity of reflection that the assignment prompts produced among students. This assignment, as Jane mentioned, encouraged deep exploration about one's personality, privilege, and experiences

that shaped his or her character, career, and life. Impactful activities like discussions and writing an autobiography will facilitate knowledge construction more effectively than lectures.

Prejudice Reduction

This dimension includes instructional strategies that would help students develop positive attitudes toward people different from themselves and reduce the effects of negative stereotyping. This was an interesting dimension because the class we studied was truly multicultural. The goal of the course, according to Jane, was not to teach students "how to deal with diversity, overcome diversity, or how to make it less of an issue." She said this course was the "best resource you can ever have" that will teach "there is no one perspective in the world and there are multiple perspectives and they all have value…they are not irrational."

From living abroad, Jane learned that "people are not idiotic, you cannot condemn a whole group…. what it is that they think is good for them, good for their culture, works for the people and works for themselves." To enable students to understand different perspectives, she implemented small group discussions relevant to a week's topic.

Students discussed issues that others were dealing with, in small groups of four or five members. They learned that "culture can mean different things for different people" and learned about "differences in family traditions in other cultures." Some students found similarities between their problems and those of others. International students expressed surprise at the many subcultures and different family structures that existed in the United State. After understanding the roots of multiculturalism in the United State, they perceived the uniqueness and the urgency to deal with it. "I had little knowledge about Native Americans, so the knowledge I built facilitated my understanding of their cause in the U.S. context," an international student remarked.

Students commented that they developed a "critical approach to each topic," and believed that they "learned to understand how others think differently." All this shared knowledge resulted in students changing their attitudes. "My attitudes were changing continuously with every discussion," said one student, and another student emphasized, "the discussions were intellectually stimulating and engaging." A student belonging to a dominant culture in her country said, "I was able to acknowledge my own privileges, I learned especially not to judge a book by its cover. Everyone has their story and unless you have walked in their shoes, you have no right to judge." Jane accomplished her goal to make all her students, domestic and international, acknowledge the privileges they enjoyed. As for reducing prejudice, this quote about race made by an international student, summarizes what most students felt about the course:

> I never understood the sensitivities attributed to this issue [race] in the U.S., and before taking the course I underestimated its importance and I honestly thought that it is being exaggerated and dramatized. However, after taking the course and doing close readings I was exposed to the historical background which made me understand better the reasons for such sensitivities.

Only two students reported "no change in attitude" because their research was in multiculturalism and they possessed multicultural attitudes already. Jane made sure that students did not form groups with friends. During each class, she came up with different ways to form small groups of four to five students. This way, she made sure that all students were given the chance to interact with different peers throughout the course. These small group discussions helped students understand each other's perspectives and reduce negative stereotyping.

Equity Pedagogy

The fourth dimension is "equity pedagogy" and includes instructional techniques and teaching methods that can ensure academic achievement of all students irrespective of race, ethnicity and social class. One student from a historically underrepresented community in the United States commented,

> I was feeling confident enough to educate my teacher in return. I had a moment in class where…. I was put on the spot by the instructor due to my identity and asked to talk about a very sensitive topic. She would rather I speak about certain topics and issues because I have a lifetime of knowledge and stories that the class would benefit from. This experience gave me the confidence to speak up, to take opportunity to educate others.

The same student participated in a protest march and on return she was made to share her story. She said, "That really did mean a lot to me, and it gave me a chance to educate my peers on a current issue directly impacting me." A Chinese student highlighted the freedom and safe space that students enjoyed in Jane's class. She said, "this class provided the students an open place to share and discuss the thoughts and perceptions of certain topics that we would not discuss outside the classroom."

However, one student observed, "an international classmate was shut down publicly in the class due to a cultural misunderstanding. It was a powerful moment as it reinforced the ideals of intercultural competence, specifically in learning to control emotions." He also observed the dichotomy in student engagement with topics, among the international students and the American students and the gender imbalance in the class.

Empowering School and Social Structure

Empowering school and social structure refers to the whole educational institution and how it can support multicultural education and empower all students. We examined whether this course produced feelings of student empowerment and equality. Evidence included the final student groups projects: "Social Justice in Social Studies Education," "Making a Case for Culturally Relevant Nutrition Education," "Women in STEM: Invisible Challenges," "A Brief Review of Multicultural Development in China," "Effects of Poverty on Literacy Learning," and "Representation of Multiculturalism in Korean English Textbook and Intercultural Learning: Definitions and Assessment Tools." From the project abstracts, we learned that all students felt empowered to try innovative solutions to existing problems and also implement what they learned from this course into their other classes, life, and work.

We looked at how students felt empowered to implement their learning in their life, work, or teaching after 6 months of completing the course. Although one student said that learning from one course may not change attitudes immediately, there were others who reported attitudinal changes while in the course. Most students reported developing "empathetic attitudes toward the plight of minorities." One international student stated, "I discuss multiculturalism with my students. My students feel comfortable that I am familiar with their context and its embedded intricacies." A student in English education converted an assignment paper from this course into a publication to explain how young readers learn better when a cultural component is included. One student said, "I also discuss multiculturalism topics with my American colleagues because some of them have research interests like mine." He also discussed current events related to multiculturalism with others more confidently now and preferred to learn from associates than rely on biased news agencies. A student reported that her worldview was broadened, and she "began to use similarities

as bridges to do collaborative work and projects with other cultural centers and student organizations on campus."

Although 6 months may not be long enough to judge change in multicultural attitudes, we learned from Jane about students in earlier cohorts, who were making changes in educational systems and societies in the United States and abroad. One group improved an evaluation system for undergraduate science, technology, engineering, and mathematics education for their project, by adding a new principle based on diversity and inclusion. Jane said, "adding another piece to it and making it multiculturally relevant…that's the sign I look for…are you picking this generic knowledge that you are learning and applying that within your own life or own discipline or your own research." A past student from South Korea, after completing her doctoral research on multicultural education, went to teach the first multicultural education course in her university. Jane concluded, "So, I have a few people who incorporated it into their research and into their practice….overtly in terms of their research and covertly in terms of their teaching."

An emergent theme was how some international students changed their attitudes toward White American students. An international student said, "I stopped judging Americans being too dramatic. I underestimated the grievances shared on daily basis about whiteness." After taking this course, he learned not to judge people based on his own personal context. One student observed that he perceived a lack of engagement among international minorities which may be because of the narrow focus of diversity issues to U.S. contexts alone, in this course. This was corroborated by another student who said, "The course is clearly framed through an American perspective of what is 'normal' and 'what counts as different.'"

Another emergent theme was how White American students felt during class participations. One student said, "I found I was unusually quiet in this course because it was one of the first times, I was a minority in a university classroom,..….I felt like I also didn't know what to say at times without re-centering whiteness." These themes revealed how important it was to address the needs of students from dominant populations as well.

Looking through the lens of Banks's (1993) five dimensions of multicultural education, we could derive implications for instructional design that ensures that "students from diverse racial, ethnic and social-class groups will experience educational equality" (Banks, 2015, p. 3). Furthermore, we were able to see how Jane was able to produce multicultural attitudes among her students. This, we believe, will enable Jane's students to implement educational equality in their future teaching careers.

Discussion and Conclusions

Examining the instructional strategies used by an experienced instructor in a face-to-face multicultural education course under the lens of the five dimensions of multicultural education (Banks, 2015) helped us gain insights into how instruction can be effective in producing multicultural attitudes while teaching about multicultural education and ensuring educational equality. The syllabus and schedule were very detailed and purposefully created by Jane. The reading materials were chosen to bring awareness about the problems faced by immigrants in a foreign land. Also, the materials covered various cultural groups and supported guest lectures and small group discussions. The weekly breakdown of topics, about a particular culture, helped her pick readings, activities, technology, and guest speakers to provide multiple perspectives to construct knowledge (Driscoll, 2014). This clear planning provides a valuable implication for other instructors.

Instructors' attitudes and mindfulness (Griggs & Tidwell, 2015) also play a significant role in the delivery of the course because this topic requires the transfer of empathetic feelings and eliminating

discriminatory behavior (Duckitt, 1992), more than conveying knowledge. We learned that owing to her education, personal attitudes, experiences, and exposure to foreign cultures, Jane possessed appropriate attitudes to teach this topic. It may not be possible for all instructors to gain first-hand experience. However, as Jane stated, even by reading relevant literature (Lewis & Ketter, 2008) it is possible to be mindful about cultural differences and prejudices to transfer appropriate attitudes to students. Jane used various readings and media that were instrumental in breaking prejudices and stereotypes (Breckler, 1984; Del Barco et al., 2007). She also facilitated her students to construct knowledge from vicarious experiences. She stated in her syllabus, "To generate knowledge I encourage you not to rely solely on academic knowledge (articles/books) but also other forms of knowledge not traditionally explored in academic contexts (memoirs, novels, music, poetry, art, film, etc.)." Providing authentic voices through guest lectures, "had a profound impact on me," one student said, proving that content integration in multiple ways was a highly effective strategy (Banks, 2015).

Jane emphasized the need to understand oneself deeply, analyze privileges and "talk about diversity as they see it." Her autobiography assignment as a reflection activity (Herrera et al., 2012) helped achieve this. This assignment was described as impactful by all students as it helped them observe themselves (Bem, 1972) and construct knowledge about others. Activities that are slightly inconsistent with existing attitudes and slightly consistent with target attitudes (Kamradt & Kamradt, 1999) do affect learners. Instructors of multicultural education should consider this autobiography assignment at the beginning of the course to help students to construct knowledge about multiculturalism. This will help understand one's privilege.

To reduce the effects of stereotyping, "what is important is developing a little bit of a community in class," said Jane. Her small group discussions gave a voice to even shy students. Discussions helped clarify notions about other cultures and reduced prejudice because students received information directly from people belonging to a particular culture. Exposure (Zajonc, 2001) to different cultures and diverse experiences (Greenwald & Banaji, 1995) produced multicultural attitudes and changed student behaviors toward others. A lecture could not have produced this change, and so we recommend that instructors should facilitate small group discussions intentionally.

Creating an egalitarian safe space (Banks, 1993) in the classroom where all students can voice their opinions and concerns without fear is imperative. All students acknowledged that they sensed a supportive environment where they could freely share experiences. An international student felt that she was confident to discuss "touchy" topics more freely in class than outside of class. We suggest integrating different cultural experiences into classroom experiences (Alismail, 2016) so that students can freely discuss sensitive issues such as gender, race, sexuality, nationality, and ethnicity. This will also transfer into students' classrooms in their future teaching careers and in other workspaces.

Despite dichotomy in student engagement because of nationality and gender, most students expressed their opinions freely. However, a White American student disagreed. She became a silent spectator because she looked at the sum of all minority groups as one large group and felt like the minority, although White Americans formed the single largest group. Instructors should encourage them to share their perspective and not always project them as the dominators, so everyone can learn from their experiences as well. Munroe and Pearson (2006) stated that it is difficult to affect the consciousness of people who have not experienced discrimination. However, in this case, we found that most students have experienced discrimination of some kind.

Although some students opined that the course should include diversity issues in other countries, we feel it is impractical to implement. Also, the final project paper and presentation allowed international students to discuss diversity issues existing in their countries, which we think is enough and feasible. Most students were confident to discuss multicultural issues in the classes they

taught, in their scholarly publications, and while talking to friends and colleagues, well after they completed the course as was seen in this study. Students belonging to U.S. minority groups started working with other culturally divergent groups in collaborative projects. Their narrow focus on only issues facing their culture was replaced by a broader outlook. Such multicultural attitudes will produce social action skills and instigate changes in education and society (Banks, 2015).

Limitations and Future Research

This case study was conducted in a truly multicultural class. This may not occur always, and the above instructional strategies and interventions may not suit classes where all the students belong to one minority population or only dominant cultures. The knowledge about multiculturalism that Jane possessed owing to her personal experiences from living abroad and her voracious reading habits may not be a characteristic of all instructors. Also, she had friends in every culture who were faculty or research scholars in educational institutions. This helped her provide "authentic voices with scholarly background." As a professor in a large university, the technology affordances she enjoyed, such as seamless Internet connectivity and other video facilities, may not be replicable in some cases. However, instructors can find alternate solutions by thinking creatively to provide similar instructional interventions. Jane belonged to the majority population in the United States, and it will be interesting to see how these instructional strategies would have worked if she belonged to a different ethnicity. Another limitation is that two of the researchers were former students who took the course taught by Jane.

We suggest that similar studies be conducted in multicultural education courses taught by professors from different ethnicities and in different regions of the United States and abroad. It would also be worthwhile to see if a similar study conducted within a community college that was attended by students belonging to one culture would produce the same results. It would be interesting to use Banks's five dimensions of multicultural education to examine the strategies that instructors implement to establish educational equality when they teach courses other than multicultural education. We suggest that a focus group session be conducted first to ascertain if that class would be a good sample to study.

This case study approach, "as an inductive investigative strategy," allowed us to gain insights into how effective the instructor's interventions were in ensuring educational equality and in producing multicultural attitudes among her students in a classroom environment and in producing this "richly descriptive end product" (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016, p. 37). We can confidently conclude that this course produced multicultural attitudes among students, and ensured educational equality establishing the effectiveness of the instructional strategies implemented. Instructors of multicultural education classes and other courses aimed at producing attitude change can model their instructional interventions on Professor Jane's course. Referring to the recent events in the United States, Jane said, "past mistakes should not be repeated…. the path to the future is the purpose of multicultural education."

References

Ajzen, I. (2001). Nature and operation of attitudes. *Annual Review of Psychology, 52*, 27–58.

Alismail, H. M. (2016). Multicultural education: Teachers' perceptions and preparation. *Journal of Education and Practice, 7*, 139–146.

Banks, J. A. (1993). Multicultural education: Development, dimensions, and challenges. *The Phi Delta Kappan, 75*, 22–28.

Banks, J. A. (2009). Diversity and citizenship education in multicultural nations. *Multicultural Education Review, 1*, 1–28.

Banks, J. A. (2015). *Cultural diversity and education.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Bem, D. J. (1972). Self-perception theory. *Advances in Experimental Social Psychology, 6*, 1–62.

Breckler, S. J. (1984). Empirical validation of affect and cognition as distinct components of attitude. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 47*, 1191–1205.

Colby, S. L., & Ortman, J. M. (2015). *Projections of the size and composition of the U.S. population: 2014 to 2060: Report prepared for U.S. Census Bureau.* Retrieved from https://www.census.gov/content/dam/Census/library/publications/2015/demo/p25-1143.pdf

Creswell W. J. (2013). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative and mixed method approaches.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Creswell, J. W. (2014). *A concise introduction to mixed methods research.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Del Barco, B., Castaño, E., Carroza, T., Delgado, M., & Pérez, C. (2007). Scale of attitudes of schoolchildren toward immigrant pupils. *European Journal of Psychology of Education, 22*, 439–454.

Denzin, N. K. (1978). *The research act: A theoretical introduction to sociological methods* (2nd ed.). New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.

Driscoll, M. P. (2014). *Psychology of learning for instruction.* Essex, United Kingdom: Pearson.

Duckitt, J. (1992). Psychology and prejudice: An historical analysis and integrative framework. *American Psychologist, 47*, 1182–1193.

Erickson, F. (2012). Qualitative research methods for science education. In B. Fraser, K. Tobin, & C. J. McRobbie (Eds.) *Second international handbook of science education* (pp. 1451–1469). Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Springer.

Gagne, R., Briggs, L., & Wagner, W. (1992). *Principles of instructional design.* Belmont, CA: Wadsworth/Thomson Learning.

Greenwald, A. G., & Banaji, M. R. (1995). Implicit social cognition: Attitudes, self-esteem, and stereotypes. *Psychological Review, 102*, 4–27.

Griggs, T., & Tidwell, D. (2015). Learning to teach mindfully: Examining the self in the context of multicultural education. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, *42,* 87–104.

Herrera, S. G., Holmes, M. A., & Kavimandan, S. K. (2012). Bringing theory to life: Strategies that make culturally responsive pedagogy a reality in diverse secondary classrooms. *International Journal of Multicultural Education, 14*(3), 1–19.

Huda, S., Konabe, B., Jiaqi, L., & Hansel, B. (2015). Raising cultural awareness of fifth-grade students through multicultural education: An action research study. *Multicultural Education, 22*, 39–45.

Jones, S. R., Torres, V., & Arminio, J. (2014). *Negotiating the complexities of qualitative research in higher education: Fundamental elements and issues.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Kamradt, T. F., & Kamradt, E. J. (1999). Structured design for attitudinal instruction. In C. M. Reigeluth (Ed.), *Instructional design theories and models: A new paradigm of instructional theory* (Vol. 2, pp. 563–590). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Karacabey, M. F., Ozdere, M., & Bozkus, K. (2019). The attitudes of teachers toward multicultural education. *European Journal of Educational Research, 8*, 383–393.

Lewis, C., & Ketter, J. (2008). Encoding youth: Popular culture and multicultural literature in a rural context. *Reading & Writing Quarterly: Overcoming Learning Difficulties, 24*, 283–310. doi:10.1080/10573560802004217

Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Merriam, S. B. (1988). *Case study research in education: A qualitative approach*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2016). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation* (4th ed.). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Miles, M. B. & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Munroe, A., & Pearson, C. (2006). The Munroe Multicultural Attitude Scale Questionnaire: A new instrument for multicultural studies. *Educational and Psychological Measurement, 66*, 819–834. doi:10.1177/0013164405285542

Nhat Hanh, T. (1991). *Peace is every step: The path of mindfulness in everyday life*. New York, NY: Bantam Books.

Patton, M. Q. (2015). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Shannon-Baker, P. (2018). A multicultural education praxis: Integrating past and present, living theories, and practice. *International Journal of Multicultural Education, 20*, 48–66. doi:10.18251/ijme.v20i1.1518

Simonson, M. R. (1979). Designing instruction for attitudinal outcomes. *Journal of Instructional Development, 2*, 15–19.

Sinatra, G. M., Kardash, C. M., Taasoobshirazi, G., & Lombardi, D. (2012). Promoting attitude change and expressed willingness to take action toward climate change in college students. *Instructional Science, 40*, 1–17.

Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Tellis, W. M. (1997). Application of a case study methodology. *The qualitative report, 3*, 1–19.

Yin, R. K. (2014). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Yin, R. K. (2017). *Case study research and applications: Design and methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Zajonc, R. B. (2001). Mere exposure: A gateway to the subliminal. *Current Directions in Psychological Science, 10*, 224–228.