Effects of the Cloze Procedure as a Teaching Method in an Eighth Grade SLD Classroom,

Master's Project

Submitted to the School of Education

University of Dayton, in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree

Master of Science in Education

by

Roger Hartmann

School of Education

University of Dayton

April 1992



Acknowledgements

I wish to thank Doctor Gordon Anderson for his guidance and direction as an instructor and as my advisor for this project. Thanks also is extended to my wife for her encouragement and support throughout my graduate program.

Table of Contents

\sim	1	A			D
L.	Н	А	P^1	1 1	к

1.	INTRODUCTION
	Problem Hypothesis Definitions
H	REVIEW OF LITERATURE
111.	METHODOLOGY
	Subjects Assessment Instruments Assessment Procedures Instructional Methods and Materials Teacher-Made Materials Published Materials
IV.	ANALYSIS OF RESULTS
	Teacher-Made Cloze Tests Woodcock Reading Mastery Test - Revised, Form G
V.	SUMMARY 35
REFERENC	ES 38
APPENDICE	ES

Chapter One

Introduction

The main goal of an author is to convey meaning of the written language. Readers process information using prior knowledge and textual content. Through the use of graphophonic, syntactic and semantic information, the reader interprets a passage to understand the purpose. Reading is an interactive process and readers must be strategic learners who construct meaning from text and monitor their thinking to ensure comprehension (Paris, Lipson and Wixson, 1983). When the cloze procedure is used as a teaching method it will improve students' reading ability by enabling them to process information on their own.

The cloze procedure can be used as a teaching method to improve reading ability, or as an assessment device to evaluate reading comprehension. As a teaching method, the cloze procedure has a variety of techniques that can be used in the classroom to help students become better readers. These techniques improve various reading skills students need to become better readers such as predicting, inferring, and confirming. Using cloze procedure teaching methods in the classroom will increase student knowledge of vocabulary, sentence structure and the use

of contextual clues.

In order for the cloze procedure to work properly it must be presented and practiced effectively. Research indicates that explanations of a procedure are most effective when the instructor (1) carefully explains the procedure's purpose, (2) models its use, (3) provides ample practice and feedback for the students, and (4) encourages the independent transfer of these skills to new learning situations (Roehler and Duffy, 1984). The teacher plays an important role in improving reading comprehension by conveying the process and purpose of the cloze procedure to the students.

I. Problem

Students in the eighth grade Specific Learning Disabilities (SLD)
reading class have low-level reading abilities. The students' reading
skills will improve when the cloze procedure is implemented as a teaching
method in the classroom.

II. <u>Hypotheses</u>

Eighth grade SLD students who are exposed to the cloze procedure for 48 minutes twice a week will show a more rapid growth in reading skills than will comparable SLD students who are taught using other

conventional reading methods. Growth in reading skills will be measured using a teacher-made cloze pre-test, interim-test, and post-test and the standardized Woodcock Reading Mastery Test for both groups of SLD students.

III. Definitions

<u>Cloze Procedure</u> - a reading process used by educators to enhance a student's reading skills, or to determine a student's reading ability. The exercise is composed of a reading selection where every nth word is deleted and the student is to fill in the blanks.

<u>Comprehension</u> - the capacity for understanding written and oral language.

<u>Context Clues</u>- the parts of a sentence or paragraph which give meaning to a specific word.

Frustration Reading Level - a cloze test score of 43% or below with the criteria being less than 90% word recognition and 50% comprehension.

Graphophonic - the study of the shapes and sounds of letters and words.

Independent Reading Level - a cloze test score ranging from 58% to 100% with the criteria being 99% word recognition and 95% comprehension.

Instructional Reading Level - a cloze test score ranging from 44% to 57% with the criteria being 90% word recognition and 75% comprehension.

<u>Linguistics</u> - the scientific study of the structure and parts of language.

<u>Psycholinguistics</u> - the study of psychology and language together to help better understand the language process.

Readability - the grade level at which a reader is able to read and comprehend successfully.

<u>Semantic</u> - a term used in linguistics which refers to the meaning in language.

Syntax - the grammatical structure of sentences in language.

Chapter Two

Review of Literature

The cloze procedure was first introduced by Wilson Taylor in 1953. He devised this procedure for determining the readability of texts (Borodkin, 1987). The procedure is based on Gestalt psychology and the information processing theory. Gestalt psychology deals with the tendency a human has to complete an incomplete pattern. The information processing theory deals with the concept of how a word by itself can relate to the other words around it in a passage. When these two principles are focused together to measure reading ability, the idea that the author is communicating can be assessed by having the reader fill in deleted words from a passage.

The cloze procedure can be described as the use of a piece of writing in which certain words have been deleted and the pupil has to make maximum use of contextual clues available in predicting the missing words. The point of the cloze procedure is that words are deleted on a systematic basis so that enough information is provided for the reader to make a prediction. It is a random selection of words that are taken out (Vaughan, 1984). This is more than a gap-filling exercise where words are deleted

for a specific reason. Every nth (5th, 8th, etc.) word will be deleted so that comprehension of the text must be present to insert a correct response. The blanks must be of equal length to avoid any clue of what the word may be. The blanks must also be sequentially numbered to facilitate whole group/teacher examinations.

The cloze procedure can be used by teachers as a method of assessing their students' readability of texts. To do this a teacher can take a passage from a book or text and construct a cloze passage from it. The teacher will then present this passage to the students and have them complete it. Finally, the teacher will grade the students passages to determine their level of reading. The Cloze Test Guidelines (see Appendix A) can be used for evaluating each student's reading level. This assessment will give the teacher a good indication of the reader's ability to understand text.

The most widespread use of the cloze procedure in research is on the testing of proficiency in English as a Second Language (ESL) (Oller, 1979). There have been various cloze procedures researched as teaching methods. Much of the research done has been evaluated for reliability and validity as a teaching method. It appears that the results of these studies have

varied greatly over the years (Brown, 1983). Many changes have been made within and between these studies that have effected the results of the cloze procedure. However, there is evidence of reliability and validity of a teacher-made cloze reading test. Bormuth (1968 a,b), Taylor (1953) and Landsheere (1972) did studies which revealed reliability and validity coefficients ranging from .73 to .97.

While the cloze procedure has generally not been proven to be a superior instrument for teaching reading comprehension, those studies that do report its superiority include teacher-led discussions (Kingston and Weaver, 1970; Rye, 1982). This is a very important aspect of the cloze procedure when it is being used as a teaching method. Students receive feedback on their choices and are able to distinguish why their responses were or were not acceptable. Teachers also have the opportunity to clarify meanings and define new words. Students and teachers are able to examine the students' earlier predictions and discuss how they were made.

Reading is not a passive activity. The reader must make a substantial and active contribution if he is to understand what is written. The cloze procedure actually encourages this activity by helping the reader to understand the text in order to fill in the blank correctly. There are

important points the reader should know before starting a passage. These points are as follows:

- words have been deleted from a passage, and they have to fill each gap with an appropriate word
- only one word is required in each gap
- they are common everyday words, not technical terms
- spelling mistakes do not matter, as long as the word is clear
- it helps to read through the passage first, before attempting to fill in the gaps (Vaughan, 1984, p.12).

It is important to note here that the length of time it takes for a person to complete a cloze passage is not significant. Learners should be allowed as much time as they need to complete a passage.

There are also some common generalizations about the nature of reading comprehension which may be useful when preparing a cloze procedure for instructional or assessment purposes. These generalizations include:

- 1. Reading comprehension involves the processing of information from printed (or written) sources.
- 2. Reading comprehension is similar to general thinking, reasoning and problem solving.
- Reading comprehension is an active process a dialogue between a writer and a reader, in which effective communication depends upon expectancies of both the sender and the receiver.
- 4. Reading comprehension is dependent upon the integration of two contexts or information sources, that is, (a) information on the printed page (linguistic) and (b) information inside the head of the reader (extra-linguistic or pragmatic).

- 5. The processing of information through reading depends greatly upon the ability to make inferences.
- 6. Reading comprehension is a process of pragmatically mapping new information into existing structures through assimilation or accommodation (Rankin and Helm, 1986, pgs. 47 & 48).

The cloze procedure is one teaching method that encompasses all of these generalizations in its strategy to improve reading comprehension.

Ashby-Davis (1985) argues that cloze reading is not like ordinary reading. She states that reading speed, eye movements, and overall reading strategies are changed during cloze testing. She also believes that strict cloze tests are not a valid measure of reading comprehension because they also measure writing ability. Writing, though, goes hand-in-hand with reading. As students become more proficient in one area, they concurrently become better in the other. The cloze procedure has strategies which can be used to improve both reading and writing skills. For this author's study we will adhere to strategies that are geared toward enhancing reading skills only.

Using the cloze procedure as an assessment device can give teachers a good indication of the reader's potential for understanding the context of a passage. It also tests a number of skills such as word recognition, semantic and syntactic clues, skimming to recap, scanning to find

unspecified information and finding meaning from outside an immediate sentence.

The cloze procedure tends to be used by many teachers and other professionals to assess reading comprehension for a few simple reasons. First, it is extremely flexible in its construction. The passage should contain a minimum of 100 words. Every nth word can be deleted or only specific words can be left blank to accommodate the proctor's purpose in administering the test.

The cloze procedure can also be adapted to any subject matter. For this reason the cloze procedures can be beneficial to those educators who teach subjects other than reading, as well as professionals who are not in the field of education. Professionals who develop their own assessment device are able to create a test that is suitable to their needs.

One other aspect of the cloze procedure as an assessment tool is its ease in administration. The test can be easily administered by one person to individuals or groups. This saves both time and money.

There are specific criteria that need to be considered in the construction of a cloze passage for testing. Vaughan (1984) cited certain criteria that are important when constructing a cloze test for classroom

use. Some of these criteria are-

- -they need to be relevant to student interest or class subject.
- -they need to be appropriate to the levels of student's reading ability.
- -they need to be as unthreatening as possible, so students can function normally.
- -they need to be kept up to date.

These criteria can be satisfied easily when creating a cloze assessment device

When assessing learners who are reading at a basic level, it is advisable to keep the cloze passages short. This will help the learner feel more relaxed and confident. The assessor is more likely to get a realistic indication of how well the learner reads if a "typical" learning situation is provided. Yet, maximum reliability will be gained from a cloze passage that has a minimum of 35 deletions.

The number of deletions in a cloze passage needs to be kept in perspective. Less than fifth word deletions do not give the reader enough information to process, while more than tenth word deletions would cause the test to be too simplistic.

Research has found that leaving the first and last sentence fully intact on a cloze assessment will make a significant difference in the scores. It also helps to set the scene for the reader.

The cloze procedure actually forces learners to do what good readers do. Good readers are those who are able to integrate not only their knowledge of the world with that of the text, but good readers are the ones who are continuously involved in predicting new information on the basis of that which is already available (Block, 1986).

Experts have agreed that the cloze procedure is a useful tool with which to find a reasonably accurate indication of a learner's readability. It also provides a basis on which to plan future work, development or direction (Rye, 1982).

Although there has been much research done on the cloze procedure as a reliable and valid assessment tool, in some cases it should not be used as the sole source of evaluating a student's readability. There are disadvantages, as with all assessments, involved when administered to find a readability level. The cloze procedure will only accurately record how the learner has performed at that particular time, on that particular passage. Other assessments should be included to verify results when making important decisions about a student's placement or grade level in reading.

Chapter Three

Methodology

I. Subjects

The subjects used for this cloze study included two eighth grade SLD

Language Arts classes. One class was designated as the experimental
group while the other class was called the control group. The
experimental group consisted of three girls and five boys. The control
group had only one girl and six boys. Both groups had reading levels
ranging from second grade through sixth grade. These reading levels were
obtained from the Woodcock Reading Mastery Test - Revised, Book G, taken
in March of 1991.

The experimental group was instructed during periods one and two of the school day. The control group was instructed during periods four and five of the school day, with their lunch break between those two periods.

This information needs to be noted so that it can be considered as a factor in determining the final results of the students' achievement.

II. Assessment Instruments

The assessment devices used in this study included a pre-test,

interim-test and post-test. This evaluation procedure was beneficial in noting the progression or regression of students' reading ability during the time the study was conducted. It was evident to the author that because of the range in student abilities, lower level passages should be used. This would help avoid the frustration students may encounter by not being able to pronounce words from a higher reading level. The three cloze tests that were administered were teacher-made using second grade level passages. All three of these tests contained approximately 250 words. The first and last sentences were fully intact, but beginning with the second sentence, every eighth word was deleted, leaving approximately 30 blank spaces in each passage. The tests were graded based on a key with one correct word for each blank.

Another assessment device used for this research was the Woodcock

Reading Mastery Test - Revised, Book G. This standardized test provided a

basis for evaluation of the students' reading ability helping to determine

the effect the cloze procedure had on the experimental group.

III. Assessment Procedures

The three teacher-made tests were administered to both the control

and then orally reading it to the students. Before each test, it was explained that only one word would fit in each blank, and students should skip blanks they could not answer and come back to them later. An answer sheet was provided after the passage was read orally so students would not begin filling in blanks before listening to the entire passage.

The study began at the beginning of the 1991-92 school year during the second week of school. A pre-test (see Appendix B) was given to both groups at this time. The following week cloze instruction began with the experimental group using various cloze procedures. While the control group was continuously instructed using traditional teaching methods of reading (e.g., oral reading, silent reading, workbooks, and Whole Language processes), the experimental group devoted two 48 minute instructional periods of their week to the cloze procedure. Although both groups were instructed using traditional reading methods, the control group was never exposed to instructional methods using the cloze procedure.

The interim-test (see Appendix C) was given during the second week of December. The purpose of the interim-test was to compare scores with

the pre-test to determine if either group had made significant changes during the three months of reading instruction.

The post-test (see Appendix D) was administered during the third week in March of 1992. It provided the necessary scores used to evaluate the end result of the study.

Students in this study were tested using The Woodcock Reading Mastery

Test - Revised, Book G in March of 1991 and again in March of 1992. Of the

six available scores from this test, two scores were used in evaluating

student achievement and are included in the Findings section of this

project—the Passage Comprehension score and the Total Reading score.

IV. <u>Instructional Methods and Materials</u>

There were six instructional cloze methods used to teach the students in the experimental group. Although there are many other ways to use the cloze procedure as an instructional method, the ones applied were conducive for learning and convenient for this project.

A. Teacher-Made Materials

The first instructional method consisted of handing out, then reading a teacher-made cloze passage orally with the students. The students were

to fill in the blanks on their own. Each student was provided with an answer sheet having three columns labeled My Choice, Group Choice, and Class Choice (see Appendix E). Most of the passages used for this exercise contained between 200 and 300 words. Blank spaces were provided every five to ten words, creating 20 to 30 missing words. After the students completed their Own Choice column of the answer sheet, they were divided into groups of two or three. During this session, they agreed upon one word for each blank—the Group Choice. When the groups decided on a Group Choice, the class worked together and mutually agreed upon one best word for each blank which was recorded under Class Choice.

This method seemed to work very well. Students were making their own decisions while working individually, making group decisions while working with a partner or two, and interacting among the entire class to make a decision on one best word choice for each blank.

This exercise dealt with more than just reading and comprehension skills. It involved social skills, communication skills, and cooperative skills. This method seemed not only to be one of the best techniques for teaching reading and vocabluary development, but one that helped students

learn to cooperate successfully with each other and strengthen their decision making abilities.

The second instructional method was taught by reading a teacher-made cloze passage orally to the students and having them fill in the blanks as the teacher read. This was somewhat more difficult for both the students and the teacher, as sentences continually needed to be re-read so the students could better understand the passage. Using this method, the students were not provided with a copy of the cloze passage that was being read. They used only an answer sheet to write down their choice for each blank (see Appendix F).

The third instructional method was the basic cloze procedure technique. A teacher-made cloze passage was typed on paper or written on the chalkboard. The teacher began by reading the passage orally to the students, making sure they understood the passage and any unfamiliar vocabulary. The students were then handed an answer sheet used to write down their word choices. When they finished, time was spent discussing their word choices. This gave students a clearer understanding of how words were chosen and which words seemed to fit best.

These three methods included a brief lecture and discussion of how to find a word for each blank. The instruction consisted of explaining that students must always read through the passage first and try to understand the main idea of the story, then during the second reading the word choices would be easier to identify. A definition of context was presented to explain how words around the blanks could be used to choose a word for each blank. If a student was unable to fill in a blank, the student should continue with the rest of the passage and come back to that blank later.

It was thoroughly explained that students should choose only one word to fit in each blank, and that there could be more than one correct answer. Students were told to make their own decision of the best word choice for each blank.

B. Published Materials

The next three instructional methods that were used with the experimental group are published cloze materials. This author was able to locate these cloze practice exercises in educational publishing company catalogs.

These cloze exercises were found to be very beneficial in training

of worksheets involved gave students the opportunity to choose one best word for each blank from four or five word choices presented. This also motivated students to read for comprehension.

The first of these cloze exercises is a book of practice sheets containing short passages of high interest. Each passage has seven or eight numbered blanks to be answered. Below each passage are four words to choose from for each numbered blank (see Appendix G). Students are asked to select the correct words from the multiple choices to fill in the blank spaces in each reading selection. This is a controlled vocabulary exercise designed to familiarize students with the cloze procedure and improve reading comprehension. It is a useful technique for improving literal comprehension by strengthening the student's ability to use semantic and syntactic cues in written language.

The passages in each book cover such topics as sports, famous personalities, trends and general interest subjects. Each book of practice sheets is identified by grade level. The readability of the passages progress in difficulty as the students proceed through the pages. For this

author's purpose, reading levels from third grade through sixth grade were used in this project.

These cloze exercises were developed by Steve Savitsky, M.S., City
University of New York and David Savitsky, M.S., Ferkauf School of
Education. Both are noted educators with teaching and supervisory
experience in the New York City Public School System. They have also
served as consultants to a number of educational companies and school
districts throughout the country. The <u>Cloze Practice Sheets</u> were
published by Learning WellTM of Roslyn Heights, New York.

The second cloze exercises were taken from a book entitled <u>The Cloze</u>

<u>Line</u> which included 56 worksheets of blackline masters. These

worksheets can be photocopied for use in the classroom. Each worksheet,
except for the last four, included a set of Key Words, a short paragraph,
and three to six questions (see Appendix H). In addition there were two
practice sheets available to help introduce the concept of the cloze
procedure to the students.

Each worksheet is numbered so that an accurate record can be kept of which worksheets students have attempted. It is recommended that the

worksheets be distributed sequentially. It was necessary to introduce some of the Key Words on the chalkboard and define them orally to make sure the students could understand and pronounce them.

These exercises were designed and planned for upper elementary and middle school students, and for slow students in special classes at the secondary level. They are constructed to help develop decoding skills and comprehension. This program was field tested with a variety of students from grades six through ten and found to be successful in achieving both goals.

<u>The Cloze Line</u> was written and developed by Robin Jones-Elgar. It was published by High Noon Books of Novato, California.

The third cloze exercises were taken from <u>Cloze Reading Practice</u>

<u>Exercises</u>, a set of 70 blackline masters that can be photocopied for use in the classroom. This set includes "The Survey of Strengths and Weaknesses," student answer and plan sheets, an explanation of context clues, 28 student instruction/guided practice sheets on cloze-type materials, a summary test for skill areas, and instruction and practice in "prediction strategy," a technique that encourages active reading.

This set of materials is designed to diagnose individual student weaknesses on cloze-type materials, plan an individualized program for improvement, provide instruction to eliminate weaknesses, and supply practice exercises and a test for mastery in the areas of instruction. This author used the exercises for the class as a group activity. Each skill area was read and discussed with the class, and the students worked on the activity sheets individually or with a partner.

The exercises consisted of seven skill areas to improve student reading comprehension (see Appendix I). Each skill area is described and provides training for students before guided practice exercises are completed. The description of each exercise was beneficial in helping students know what to look for when completing the guided practice exercises. Students were able to ask for clarification of specific concepts and understand why each skill area was important. An example of one skill area and guided practice exercise is provided (see Appendix J).

The <u>Cloze Reading Practice Exercises</u> was written and developed by Susan Breen. It was published by J. Weston Walch of Portland, Maine.

This author was able to make these instructional cloze exercises into

group learning activities by having students work with a partner to complete them. The correction process worked in the same manner when the worksheets were graded as a class.

Chapter Four

Analysis of Results

A. Teacher-Made Cloze Tests

The findings of this study produced interesting results. The teacher-made second grade level cloze test scores (Tables 1 and 2) did not seem to give acccurate results of the students' reading abilities. The experimental group and the control group scores showed that most of the students did better on the pre-test. Only two of all students, both from the experimental group, demonstrated a slight improvement from pre-test, to interim-test, to post-test. The fact that these two students were in the experimental group suggests that the cloze instruction employed was beneficial toward improving their reading skills, although the overall results proved unreliable.

Three of the eight students from the experimental group improved their test scores from the pre-test to the post-test, excluding the interim-test.

Two of the seven students from the control group improved their test scores in an identical manner. Two other students from the experimental group produced the exact same score on both the pre-test and the

Table 1
Teacher-Made Cloze Test Scores
Experimental Group

Student	Pre-test Score	Interim-test Score	Post-test Score
Sascha	81%	65%	70%
Andrea	48%	71%	48%
Heather	78%	74%	83%
Ryan	41%	18%	25%
Gwen	52%	62%	63%
David A.	78%	74%	70%
David B.	63%	68%	63%
James	52%	62%	68%

Table 2
Teacher-Made Cloze Test Scores
Control Group

Student	Pre-test Score	Interim-test Score	Post-test Score
Thomas	70%	50%	63%
Donal	78%	71%	58%
David C.	59%	35%	50%
Brian	59%	26%	48%
Scott	52%	74%	60%
Misty	37%	65%	53%
Ray	48%	38%	38%

post-test. Eight of the fifteen total students in this study scored higher on the pre-test than the post-test.

Using the Cloze Test Guidelines taken from Making Reading Possible

Through Effective Classroom Management by Ezra Steiglitz (see Appendix

A) to compare the post-test scores of the experimental group and the

control group provided a more favorable result for the experimental group.

Seventy-five percent of the students from the experimental group had

reading levels in the independent range. Only forty-three percent of the

students from the control group ranked in the independent reading level.

Thirteen percent of the students from the experimental group placed at the instructional reading level of the Cloze Test Guidelines, while forty-three percent of the students from the control group tested on this level. One student from each group scored at the frustration reading level on the post-test.

Although the teacher-made tests are not completely reliable or valid, the end result of the students' achievements showed better results from the experimental group than from the control group. This evidence compels the author to believe that the cloze instruction utilized with the

experimental group did have a positive effect.

B. <u>Woodcock Reading Mastery Test - Revised, Form G</u>

It was beneficial to provide a standardized test in addition to the teacher-made tests to attain a reliable and valid conclusion of the students' achievement over the duration of this study. The Woodcock Reading Mastery Test results (Tables 3 and 4) produced a more vivid picture of the students progression, or regression, in reading levels.

The increase of grade level scores from the 1991 and 1992 Passage

Comprehension and Total Reading sections were averaged from both

groups, then compared. A difference between the groups was calculated to
see if there had been an increase in either of the group's scores. The

difference was figured by substracting the lower grade level score

average from the higher grade level score average. The results showed a

higher average increase of scores from the experimental group.

The experimental group showed statistically significant improvement in their 1992 Passage Comprehension scores. They showed an average increase of one year and nine months over the 1991 scores. In comparison, the control group had an average increase of seven months, which gave the

Table 3
WOODCOCK READING MASTERY TEST - REVISED

BOOK G

Experimental Group

Student	Passage Comprehension Score		Total Reading Score	
	1991	1992	1991	1992
Sascha	3.5	3.7	4.3	4.1
Andrea	3.5	6.5	4.6	6.4
Heather	6.1	7.4	5.4	6.4
Ryan	2.5	3.7	2.7	3.0
Gwen	5.3	6.5	9.2	8.4
David A.	4.6	9.0	5.6	7.9
David B.	3.9	4.6	4.6	4.5
James	6.5	7.9	5.0	5.4

Table 4
WOODCOCK READING MASTERY TEST - REVISED

BOOK G
Control Group

	Passage Comprehension		Total Reading	
Student	•	ore 1992		ore 1992
Thomas	4.9	6.1	5.1	5.1
Donal	4.9	7.4	4.0	5.0
David C.	6.1	4.9	6.0	6.0
Brian	2.7	3.0	2.6	2.7
Scott	3.0	4.2	3.4	3.8
Misty	2.7	3.4	5.2	5.4
Ray	2.7	3.0	3.2	2.9

experimental group a one year and two month higher average increase in scores.

The students' Total Reading scores did not have as large of an average increase in scores. The experimental group showed an average increase of almost six months, while the control group had only a two month gain in reading grade level, a four month difference.

The Woodcock Reading Mastery Test scores indicated the cloze instruction methods used with the experimental group improved reading skills more rapidly than the use of conventional instruction reading methods. Regular use of cloze procedures in the classroom significantly improved these students reading skills.

Chapter Five

Summery

The results of this study proved the hypothesis true. That is, the students in an eighth grade SLD classroom where the cloze procedures were utilized showed a more rapid growth in their reading skills than a comparable group of SLD students who were taught using other conventional reading methods.

The teacher-made cloze tests produced inconsistent results, making them less reliable and valid for assessment purposes. However, the results from the standardized Woodcock Reading Mastery Test showed a higher increase in reading levels from those students who were instructed using cloze methods. These results indicate that instruction of the cloze procedure was beneficial in developing the necessary skills for improving student reading ability. Although the teacher-made cloze pre-test, interim-test and post-test were of no statistical merit, the Woodcock Reading Mastery Test proved invaluable for evaluating the results of this study.

The instructional cloze methods which were implemented throughout the year had a strong impact in the development and progression of

students' reading skills. Students were able to get a better understanding of what they were reading when working with the cloze procedure. Among students who worked with the cloze procedure, improvement of comprehension was evidenced, as well as other reading skills such as vocabulary development, silent reading and grammatical structure of sentences and paragraphs.

The group activities involved with certain cloze procedures helped students develop other useful skills as well. Through working together to complete cloze exercises, students read cloze passages aloud to each other, improving their oral reading skills. The decision making process of choosing a group answer helped students develop better communication and cooperative learning skills.

It is important for the teacher to play an active role interpreting and illustrating the functions of the cloze procedure. The teacher must present material that is suitable for the students being taught. The materials used for cloze exercises should be relevant to students to promote interest in the reading selections presented and to reduce frustration level. The manner in which the teacher presents material to the students is also important. The exercises should be explained

thoroughly and vocabulary should be defined and discussed to help students understand the process.

The cloze procedure is a unique method of reading, which produces improved strategies, skills and comprehension in reading through the use of various instructional techniques. It can be presented to students working independently, in small groups or as a class.

References

- Ashby-Davis, C. (1985). <u>Cloze and comprehension: A qualitative analysis and critique</u>. <u>Journal of Reading</u>, 28, 585-89.
- Block, E. (1986). <u>The comprehension strategies of second language</u> readers. <u>TESOL Quarterly</u>, 20 463-494.
- Bormuth, J.R. (1968a). <u>Cloze test readability: Criterion reference scores</u>. <u>Journal of Educational Measurement</u>, 5, pp. 189-96.
- Bormuth, J.R. (1968b). <u>The cloze readability procedure</u>. <u>Elementary English</u>, 45, pp. 429-36.
- Borodkin, Thelma. (1987). <u>A reachable/teachable goal</u>. Doctrine from Conference on College Composition and Communication.
- Brown, James D. (1983). <u>A cloze is a cloze is a cloze?</u> Doctrine from the Annual Convention of Teachers of English to Speakers of Ohter Languages.
- Landsheere, G. de. (1972). <u>Application du cloze test de W. L. Taylor a la langue française</u>. <u>Scientia Paedagogica Experimentalis</u>, 9 pp. 207–56.
- Oller, Jr. J.W. (1979). Language tests at school. New York: Longman.
- Paris, Scott G., Marge Y. Lipson and Karen Wixson. (1982). <u>Becoming a strategic reader</u>. <u>Contemporary Education Psychology</u>. vol. 8, no. 3, pp. 293–316.
- Rankin, Earl F., and Phoebe Helm. (1986). <u>The validity of cloze tests in relation to a psycholinguistic conceptualization of reading comprehension</u>. Forum for Reading; v17, no.2, pp.46-59.

- Roehler, Laura, and Gerald Duffy. (1984). <u>Direct explanation of comprehension processes</u>. <u>In comprehension instruction</u>: <u>Perspectives and suggestions</u>, edited by Gerald Duffy, Laura Roehler, and Jana Mason. New York, NY: Longman.
- Rye, James. (1982). <u>Cloze procedure and the teaching of reading</u>. Heinemann Educational Books, Ltd. London.
- Stieglitz, Ezra. (1980). <u>Initial assessment for Individualization</u>, <u>Making reading possible through effective classroom management</u>, Newark, DE: International Reading Association, pp. 100–102.
- Taylor, W. L. (1953). <u>Cloze procedure: A new tool for measuring readability</u>. Journalism Quarterly, 30, pp. 415-33.
- Vaughan, Judy. (1984). <u>Assessing reading</u>. <u>Using cloze procedures to assess reading skills</u>, Doctrine from Adult Literacy and Basic Skills Unit, London (England).

Commercial Publications

- Breen, Susan. (1985). <u>Cloze reading practice exercises</u>. Portland, ME: J. Weston Walch.
- Jones-Elgar, Robin. (1989). The cloze line. Novato, CA: High Noon Books.
- Savitsky, Steve, and David Savitsky. (1981). <u>Cloze practice sheets</u>. Roslyn Heights, NY: Learning WellTM.

Assessment

Woodcock, Richard W. (1987). <u>Woodcock reading mastery tests-revised</u>, Form G. Circle Pines, MN: American Guidance Service.

CLOZE TEST GUIDELINES*

Cloze % Scores	Reading Level	Level	Bett's Criteria
58% to 100%	Independent	ent	99% Word Recognition 95% Comprehension
44% to 57%	Instructional	ional	90% Word Recognition 75% Comprehension
43% or below	Frustration	ion	Less than 90% Word Recognition 50% Comprehension
Example:			
Graded Passages	Material Grade Level	Cloze % Score	Reading Level
Passage 1	3.0	75%	Independent
Passage 2	4.0	60%	Independent
Passage 3	5.0	48%	Instructional
Passage 4	6.0	20%	Frustration
	•		

Through Effective Classroom Management, Newark, Delaware: International Reading Association, 1980, pp. 100-102.

Appendix B

The Right Gift by Tom Mellers

Some people said he would end up in jail. Dennis did not think so. Oh,
he1 the law all right. He did it2 the time. But
he was smart. They3 never catch him.
Take right now. That4 he was going to Carla's house fo
5for the first time. He was going6 meet her
mother. He wanted to7 Carla a gift. Not just any gift, but
8 nice gift. A gift that cost a9 of money.
At the moment, Dennis was10 a woman with a silver pin
on11 coat. He could see that it might12 just
the right gift for Carla.
Stealing13 pin was easy. It was just as14
thought it would be. He followed the15 until she turned down
an empty street16 he ran after her and pushed her
17 He pulled the pin from her coat18 was just
like picking up a penny19 the street. The woman didn't even
get good look at him. After that he21 an hour
to kill before he went22 Carla's. He wanted to go right away.
23 dinner was not until six. It would24 bad
manners for him to show up25 early. He didn't want Carla to
think26 had bad manners. So for an hour27
walked around. He thought about smart he was

Appendix C

The Follower

We called him the Follower. He never did follow us. It just
1that way. Every day when James and2 got on
the ferry, we saw him3 he was looking at us. Sometimes he
4not. It just seemed that every time5 looked
up, he was there. One6James said, "I think that fellow is
following7" That is when we started to call8
the Follower.
The Follower looked all right9 wore a nice suit. He had a
10 But he did a funny thing. He11 up people's
old newspapers. People are always12 their newspapers on
the boat. The Follower13 walk all over picking them up.
Most14 the time he would just put them15
his briefcase. It was funny though. No16 but James and me
ever seemed to17him. Sometimes he would sit next to
18 and wait for them to finish reading19 papers.
Then he would swoop down on20
We used to fool him. We would21 our paper on the seat
next to22 We would act as if we were23 to
leave it. Sometimes we would even24 up and start to walk
away. Just25 the Follower went to get it, we26
pick it up.
27 day something happened. James and I were
28 for the other people to leave before29 got off
the boat> The Follower was30 around picking up papers.
Then he came31 over to where we were sitting. He
32 not say a word to us or33 look at us. He just
put his34 down beside us. Then he walked away.

Appendix D

<u>HAWK</u>

People call me Hawk. That is a kind of bird, you1 It is a bird
that hunts for 2 food. It eats chickens and other small 3. It
just flies down out of the4_ and grabs them. It does anything it
I did <u>6</u> give myself that name. John named me. <u>7</u> named
me the day I pushed his8 in the mud because he went out9 my
girl. I grabbed him by the I said, "John, stay away from what
mine." Then I held his face in mud and counted to ten.
Slowly. When13let go, John just sat there. At14he could
not talk.
"You will always15" he began to say something smart. I
16he thought better of it, though, because17 stopped.
Finally, he looked me right in <u>18</u> eye and said: "Do you know what
the country. Who about the country? There is nothing there
trees and noisy birds and things like24
People like John like the country. And 25 girl does too. They
went off in <u>26</u> woods with the rest of the class. <u>27</u> could
hear them all laughing and having <u>28</u> good time. After a while they
all 29 out. John called out to me, "Look 30 in the trees. There
is a hawk31 there."
I looked up. For the first 32 in my life, I saw a hawk. 33
would have known what it was even34 John hadn't told me. The
hawk did 35 just sit on that bare branch. It 36 the branch as
though it owned it.
"There are no other 39 in the trees," he said. "The hawk 40
all alone. That is why I call you Hawk."

Appendix E

Answer Sheet

			Name
	MY CHOICE	GROUP CHOICE	CLASS CHOICE
1.			
2.			
3.			
4.			
5.			
6.			
7.			
8.			-
9.			
10.			
11.			
12.			
13.			
14.			
15.			
16.			
17.			
18.			
19.			
20.			
21.			
22.			
23.			
24.			
25			

Appendix F

Answer Sheet

Name _____

1,	26
2	27
3	28
4	29
5	30
6	31
7	32
8	33
9	34
10	35
11	36
12	37
13	38
14	39
15	40
16	41
17	42
18	43
19	44
20	45
21	46
22	47
23	48
24	49
25	50

STUDENT'S NAME	D-13
DIRECTIONS: Please circle the word that best completes each	blank space.
In England there is a group of large, tall rocks 1 in a are 2 Stonehenge and have been there for about three tho No one is 3 why they were built. Some say the 4 we to form a calendar, so people could tell the days of the seasons. Other people 6 that Stonehenge was built so the of England could pray to the sun.	usand years. re put there 5 and the
1. A. flying B. standing C. waving D. dripping 2. A. called B. clipped C. explained C. certain D. bothered 3. A. empty B. afraid C. certain C. bir D. bothered D. sto	its t ds nes
6. A. believe 7. A. forests B. year B. know B. animals C. sport C. see C. people D. track D. forget D. servants	
One of the most popular songwriting and 1 groups of too as the Bee Gees. This 2 is made up of three brothers, and Maurice. They not only write their own 3, but write 4 as well. "Night Fever" is one of the many hit 5 have written for the movie, "Saturday Night Fever". It seems all over the world are 6 the songs that the Bee Gees 7	char beobie
B. daring B. drink B. music B. her C. dancing C. crowd C. frame C. sin D. singing D. film D. season D. aco	gers
B. beasts C. dresses D. songs 6. A. covering C. A. freeze B. baking C. know D. songs D. enjoying D. hear	
Reggie Jackson played baseball for the New York Yankees. He one of the best. Many people 2 with him. But some people Reggie's bragging. Reggie 3 during the World Series in an of 4 he was. He hit three home runs in one 5 three in a row! Even the people who didn't 6 Reggie Jackmire his 7 .	e don't like
A. thought B. agree B. proved B. C. feared C. eat C. excused C. D. chooses D. meet D. explained D.	fellow diver
6. A. know 7. A. boasting B. bat B. hate B. friendship C. hit C. like C. glide D. pitch D. guess D. playing	

Name		Date		
KEY WORDS				
buses	strong	bedrock	build	
diverted	dam	safe	site	

The Large Dam

The state decided to a new dam outside of Centerville.
The old dam, the state said, was no longer Mr. Wells decided to
take his class to see the of the new and much larger
The history class from Centerville High School went up into the mountains in
three school When they got to the new site, the boss for
the construction company explained what had to be done to make the new
dam a and safe one. The first thing, he said, was that Wild
River had to be until his men could dig down deep to
When finished, he said it would be a wonderful dam.
The state decided to build a new power plant outside of Centerville. tear down the old hotel near the center of town. build a new dam outside of Centerville.
Mr. Wells wanted to take the history classes from Centerville High School to
help build the new dam.
watch the men work on the new dam.
see the site for the new dam.
The boss of the job said that the first thing his men had to do was to divert Wild River. plant a lot of trees to hold in the soil. see if there was oil in the ground.

Name	Date				
- VEV WODDS					
KEY WORDS		1			
	•		suggested	senior	
yard	penny	seniors	prom	everyone	
	Т	he Car W	ash		
Casey looked ove	r at Hal and s	aid, "You kno	w what? The ser	nior is	
coming up in four	months, and tl	ne	class does	sn't have more than	
\$40 to get it going	,,,				
"I've been th	inking about tl	hat, too," Hal	answered. "And	I've been thinking	
	_			Let's	
		_		hool gym at 3:30."	
That Monday, when was together Bill and Steve					
they ask Mr. Carter, the school principal, if they could use					
the school for the car washes. Mrs. Wilson, the school secretary, said					
she thought it wou				•	
"Fine. Then let's get an announcement out that we'll have the first car wash					
next Saturday. And	next Saturday. And all will have to help," Bill said.				
Casey said the seni		Th	e idea for a car w		
——was la			Mrs. Wi	lson.	
	d have a dance.		——— Hal.		
had or	niy ≱ 40.		Casey.		
To get the idea go	ing, the seniors	Th	e first car wash w	as scheduled for	
went t	o see Mr. Carte	r.	Wedne	sday.	
had a	meeting.		Monday	γ.	
picket	ed the school.		Saturda	y.	
Mr. Carter could no	ot attend the	W/I	y do vou think	ho conione mantad	
meeting, but			raise money?	he seniors wanted	
	and Jayne we	re	to split	amongst them	
there.			to hire	_	
	arter attended.	1	to pay		
was th	cretary, Mrs. Wi iere.	ison,	expens	0 0	

Contents

Teacher's Guide and Answer Ke	Tea	cher'	s Gui	de an	d An	swer	Key
-------------------------------	-----	-------	-------	-------	------	------	-----

To the Teacher v

Scoring the Survey of Strengths and Weaknesses x

Preparing a Plan of Study for the Student xi

Answer Key xii

Teacher's Master Plan Sheet xv

Reproducible Student Materials	Master(s)
Answer Sheet for the Survey of Strengths and Weaknesses	1
Individual Plan Sheet	2
The Survey of Strengths and Weaknesses	3–9
Understanding Context Clues	10-11
Student Activity Sheets for Part One	
Skill A: Time/Sequence Words	12-18
Skill B: Conclusion Words	19-25
Skill C: Support Words	26-31
Skill D: "Turn-Around" Words	32-38
Skill E: Noun Replacers	39-50
Summary Test for Skills A-E	51-52
Student Activity Sheets for Part Two	
Skill F: One-Sentence Strategy Errors	53-63
Prediction Strategy	64-70

Skill C: Support Words

1. Recognizing Support Words

When authors wish to join ideas that are alike within a paragraph, they sometimes use certain words to make the reader aware that similar ideas are being linked together.

These words help to show that something spoken of in the first sentence may be close in meaning to something written in the last sentence. When authors wish to show that one idea in a paragraph is like another, they may use "support words."

SUPPORT WORDS TO LOOK FOR WHEN YOU ARE READING

also as well as too likewise in addition similarly furthermore another

for example

2 Instruction and Guided Practice

Support words can help you see that the ideas you are reading in a paragraph are not changing. Some context clues warn you that a change in thinking is coming. However, support words tell you that the ideas are staying the same.

Study the sample below. Look for the support words. Try to notice how the ideas they link are the same and how they support other similar ideas within the paragraph.

The Subpo Word

links the Similar Ideas of big

farm horses and large CITCUS horses Racehorses are fast and usually not too big. Farmhorses and police horses are strong and big.

Likewise parade and circus horses are large and can carry great weight.

There are many different kinds of horses in

the world. They are used for many things. Their

size, speed, and strength are important in de-

The ideas in these sentences termining how they will be used by people. are linked by the word

"Likewise"

NAME	DATE	27

Now you are ready to try some practice exercises. Look for the support words. Support words link ideas and facts that are alike within a paragraph. Remember, they tell you that the ideas are staying the same and not changing.

GUIDED PRACTICE IN THE USE OF SUPPORT WORDS

Directions:	Read each paragraph below. Circle the word on the right that best
	completes the sentence containing the blank space.

- 1. The air that moves close to the earth can be gentle or strong. Types of air are given names according to their strength. There are some air currents that are gentle and soft called breezes. Also, there are stronger ____(1)___ called hurricanes.
- 2. Wolves and dogs are in the same family of animals. Their sizes and their looks are very much alike. They have ears and jaws that are the same. In addition, both have bushy and drooping (2)
- 3. X rays are useful in many ways. They are used by doctors and dentists. In addition, some businesspeople use X rays to find problems in the machines they use. Furthermore, X rays are ______ in art. They can make it easier to find real paintings that have been covered up by fake paintings.
- 4. Prisons serve more than one purpose. We often think of prisons only as places where people are kept after they have broken the law. As well as being jails, prisons ____(4)___ a home for criminals. Prisoners must live inside prisons until they are allowed to return to society once again. Prisons aren't only jails.

- 1. a) blows
- b) clouds
 - c) swells
- d) puffs
- e) winds
- 2. a) tails
- b) collars
- c) feet
- d) owners
- e) noses
- 3. a) useless
- b) helpful
- c) worthless d) beautiful
 - e) safe
- 4. a) save
- b) provide
- c) deny
- d) buy
- e) steal

- 5. Boats have served humanity for thousands of years. Today, they are widely enjoyed as a means of travel. In addition, they are also _______ in sports. They have pleased people in the past and will continue to do so for many years to come.
- 5. a) heavy
- b) popular
- c) light
- d) wasted
- e) harmful

CHECK YOUR ANSWERS

- 1. (e) "Winds" is related to the words "air" and "breezes." The support word "also" links "air" and "breezes" with "winds."
- 2. (a) Dogs and wolves can only have either noses, feet, or tails alike. However, only "tails" makes sense in the sentence.
- 3. (e) The author states that X rays are useful. The sentence with the blank uses the support word "furthermore" to back up this idea. The sentence after the blank also hints that the answer is "helpful."
- 4. (e) The sentence that contains the blank and begins with "As well as" supports the idea that prisons are something besides jails.
- 5. (b) The sentence beginning with "In addition" supports the idea stated in the second sentence that boats are enjoyed.

3. Additional Class or Home Practice

The following pages provide added practice exercises. They are very much like the cloze-type materials you will see in workbooks and on exams.

Remember:	R -	F-	T
	ę	i	h
	a	n	i
	d	d	n
			E.

Directions: Read each passage below. Circle the word on the right that best completes the sentence containing the blank.

PRACTICE #1

It would be hard to put a price on blood. It is so important that the human body must have it to live. Blood has many jobs. Blood gives food and energy to the body. In addition to giving food to the body, blood ____(1)__ chemicals that the body's cells need. Another way in which blood is ____(2)__ stems from the way it cleans the body. It removes things the body doesn't need.

The human body is warm. You can thank blood for this, for it also helps the body

(3) heat. The way the blood keeps heat in the body is the way it, similarly, helps to keep

(4) in the body. If the body is cut, the blood will clot in order to prevent the body from losing too much blood.

Blood is a fighter, too. It ______ with germs that try to enter and harm the body. Sometimes, to keep germs out, blood also fights them by ______ these enemies that attack the body. It doesn't digest them the way the stomach does, yet it does destroy them.

In addition to all the other ways the blood does good for the body, it plays an important role in giving the body _______. This helps the body to breathe and to stay well. It also cleans and feeds the body.

- 1. a) uses b) wants
 - c) wastes d) takes
 - e) supplies
- 2. a) harmful b) evil
 - c) careful d) useful e) spiteful
- 3. a) maintain b) reject
 - c) remove d) take e) burn
- 4. a) germs b) water
 - c) itself d) drugs e) food
- 5. a) plays b) battles
 - c) argues d) lives e) stays
- 6. a) eating b) liking
 - c) protecting d) seeinge) hiding
- 7. a) disease b) germs
 - c) drugs d) colds e) oxygen

PRACTICE #2

There are thousands of bees known to peo-
ple. It is interesting that while there are so many
different types, they still have many things in
common. One way in which they are alike is the
way their hair branches out on their bodies.
Another(1) thing about them is their
usefulness to people. They bring pollen to food
crops, making it possible for the vegetables and
fruit trees to grow food for people to eat. Like-
wise, they by bringing pollen to
flowers. Without pollen, new flowers would not
grow.
Bees also do a(3) thing for people when they make honey. Many of us eat honey on

Bees also do a _______ thing for people when they make honey. Many of us eat honey or bread and use it in cooking. Furthermore, bees are useful to people when they give us their _______. Candles and furniture polish are made from it.

While bees have many things in common with each other, they also have many things in common with other insects. Bees, like other insects, have six legs. In addition, other insects have a pair of ______ that help them to get from one place to another, just as the bee does.

As well as those things, many bees have

(6)
, too. They stick people when
they are afraid of being attacked and want to
protect themselves from harm. Last but not least,
they all

(7)
the same kind of buzz.
We can often hear them long before we see
them.

- 1. a) harmful b) evilc) hateful d) similare) simple
- 2. a) hurtb) helpc) eatd) growe) play
- 3. a) badb) funnyc) cuted) safee) good
- 4. a) wingsb) stingersc) germsd) diseasese) wax
- 5. a) shoes b) feet c) toes d) wings e) legs
- 6. a) glands b) tonguesc) jaws d) stingerse) feelers
- 7. a) share b) feelc) show d) leavee) fear

PRACTICE #3

Shoemaking has been around for about the same length of time as have feet. For as long as we've had shoes, we've also had _____(1) ____. These people give us many kinds, colors, and sizes of shoes.

While the way shoes look has changed, many things about shoes have stayed the same over the years. In addition to their always having had straps or something to hold them onto the feet, shoes also have always had ______.

We would hurt the bottoms of our feet if shoes didn't have them.

Sandals were the first shoes. The sandals worn years ago were very much like those worn today. Today's sandals also have bottoms and ______ across the tops which help to hold them onto the feet.

At one point, in earlier times, people began to see the need for stronger shoes. In addition to sandals for the feet, people made _____(4) ____.

These were heavier than sandals and protected the feet while people traveled or hunted. These, as well as sandals, were made of _____(5) ___.

Though this material was soft, it was also strong, lasted a long time, and kept the feet from harm.

- 1. a) carpentersb) shoemakersc) doctorsd) leathere) boots
- 2. a) satinb) bucklesc) solesd) bowse) stitches
- 3. a) vinylb) heelsc) solesd) strapse) bows
- 4. a) hatsb) glovesc) beltsd) bagse) boots
- 5. a) clothb) leatherc) plasticd) cardboarde) glass
- 6. a) added b) savedc) returned d) strippede) erased
- 7. a) failingb) playingc) forgettingd) neglectinge) attempting