

2018

## Examining Buddhism in Unitarian Universalist Hymnals, 1894-2015

Jeff Wilson

*Renison University College, University of Waterloo*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://elischolar.library.yale.edu/yjmr>



Part of the [Religion Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Wilson, Jeff (2018) "Examining Buddhism in Unitarian Universalist Hymnals, 1894-2015," *Yale Journal of Music & Religion*: Vol. 4: No. 2, Article 4.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.17132/2377-231X.1097>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by EliScholar – A Digital Platform for Scholarly Publishing at Yale. It has been accepted for inclusion in *Yale Journal of Music & Religion* by an authorized editor of EliScholar – A Digital Platform for Scholarly Publishing at Yale. For more information, please contact [elischolar@yale.edu](mailto:elischolar@yale.edu).

# Examining Buddhism in Unitarian Universalist Hymnals, 1894–2015

Jeff Wilson

A quick initial look at *Singing the Living Tradition*, the current primary hymnal of the Unitarian Universalist Association, gives the impression that it is similar to other hymnals in countless American Protestant denominations. It shares the usual layout, with 415 hymns set to music, and another 317 readings for group ritual. There are venerable favor-ites, such as *Amazing Grace*, Christmas carols such as *O Come, All Ye Faithful*, and readings from the Gospels. But a closer look reveals that there are also hymns and readings of much less familiarity in America, such as *Be Ye Lamps unto Yourselves*, in which the Buddha counsels readers to rely only on their own consciences (not on faith or God), and *The Wind of Change Forever Blown*, which finds the poet-author wondering how we shall reach the “unknown nirvana” of the Buddha’s lotus throne.<sup>1</sup>

“What is available in the hymnal,” historian David Johnson (b. 1943) explains in his exploration of Unitarian Universalist hymnody, “[what is] chosen, or missing, the character, theological language, images, and quality and message of its words and music are critical in a congregation’s worship life. They are in great degree the face it presents to its people and the community, even *its understanding of itself*.”<sup>2</sup> Hymnals, therefore, are not simply tools for

use in ritual—they help to create communities by sharing and restricting resources, signal to insiders and outsiders what religious beliefs and values are held within, and give users tools with which to think about themselves in relation to the in-group and other religious groups.

This work is especially crucial for movements such as Unitarian Universalism: the strongly progressive nature of this religiously heterogeneous denomination makes it vulnerable to an accelerated pace of change and frequent soul searching about identity and common bonds. Furthermore, the hymnal may be the only truly shared book across Unitarian Universalist churches and individuals—a large percentage of contemporary Unitarian Universalists hold the Bible in no particular regard over other religious texts. Thus hymnals and their contents come to play a central, rather than auxiliary, role in the shaping and expression of Unitarian Universalist theology and identity. To examine the hymnal is in a very real sense to examine the trends and traditions of Unitarian Universalism today. With this in mind, what self-understandings are this Unitarian Universalist hymnal reflecting and reinforcing with this Buddhist material?

This article tracks the historical usage of Buddhism by hymnbooks published by American Unitarians and their latter-day organization, the Unitarian Universalist Association.<sup>3</sup> Examining a single religion

---

<sup>1</sup> T. J. Anderson, Mark L. Belletini, Jacqui James, Ellen Johnson-Fay, Helen R. Pickett, Mark Slegers, Barbara L. Wagner, and W. Frederick Wooden, eds., *Singing the Living Tradition* (Boston: Unitarian Universalist Association, 1993). The hymnal is unpaginated; *Be Ye Lamps unto Yourselves* is hymn 184 and *The Wind of Change Forever Blown* is hymn 183.

<sup>2</sup> David A. Johnson, *A Pilgrimage in Song: Unitarian and Universalist Hymnody* (Marlborough, MA: KMR & Company, 2016), 1 (italics added).

---

<sup>3</sup> The Universalists as a whole are not examined in this article because they did not include any Buddhist material in any of their premerger denominational hymnals, with the exception of one line in a 1937 joint hymnal issued by the American Unitarian Association and the Universalist Church of America. The work of

(Buddhism) allows insights into how this originally foreign phenomenon has been gradually incorporated, revealing patterns and providing a periodicization that may apply for other religions as well. Looking at Buddhism in Unitarian Universalist hymnals, we can partially discern the degrees, types, and limits of religious diversity within Unitarian Universalism, one of North America's primary liberal denominations. Specifically, examining the uses of Buddhism within Unitarian Universalist hymns reveals some of the opportunities and challenges involved in attempting to move Protestant-based denominations in post-Protestant directions. Do stated values of inclusivity and multiculturalism result in genuine inclusion and cross-cultural understanding, or are they more likely to result in tokenism and distortion, especially in white-majority, established religious traditions?

### Unitarian History

A combination of dissenting views arising in American churches with Arminian and Unitarian influences from abroad (primarily England), Unitarianism began to percolate in the American religious landscape in the late eighteenth century, finally achieving full emergence in the first quarter of the nineteenth century.<sup>4</sup> There was little evidence in Unitarianism's early American churches to suggest that they would one day be singing the words of the Buddha. Inheritors of the Protestant Reformation, they sought to purify Christianity of misunderstandings that had crept in over

---

dual-affiliated Unitarian and Universalist ministers Alfred Storer Cole and Kenneth Patton is considered below.

<sup>4</sup> John A. Buehrens, *Universalists and Unitarians in America: A People's History* (Boston: Skinner House Books, 2011), 15–19.

the centuries, and thus to produce biblically accurate and personally uplifting versions of Christianity. They acquired the label "Unitarian" from their theological foes, due to their insistence that the Trinity was not a biblical doctrine and their resulting focus on the unity of God in his singular role as father, stressing Jesus's humanity rather than divinity. Unitarians were strong believers in both close reading and personal interpretation of the Bible, often with knowledge of the original languages to refute or contextualize the interpretations of earlier ages. These, in turn, required confidence in one's ability to use reason and education to find truths often obscured by errant tradition.<sup>5</sup>

Over the course of the nineteenth century, these founding principles led to ever further progression away from common beliefs in human depravity, as Unitarians found that human beings had high capacities for ethical behavior and intellectual discernment. Naturally, therefore, they tended to de-emphasize the sinfulness of humankind and the need for atonement, and to affirm the worth of all people—eventually affirming the value of each individual, Christian or otherwise. Committed to the Protestant principle that each person had the capacity to approach God and the Bible without ecclesiastical interference, Unitarians became fiercely anticreedal, allowing a wide diversity of theological and anthropological perspective to flourish in their denominations. However, this did not necessarily imply affirmation of non-Christian cultures and religions as such, at least not at first.

Unitarians did not confine their reforms to belief alone. Changing beliefs called out for changes to practice as well. Ritual was tinkered

---

<sup>5</sup> David Robinson, *The Unitarians and the Universalists* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1985).

with, and from the start of the movement Unitarians quickly began producing their own hymnals, with hymns selected to meet their particular theological needs, or in some cases edited in order to bring them into line with evolving theological notions.<sup>6</sup> The Unitarians were also productive hymn writers, crafting many songs for congregational and home use.

As would be expected, the first 100 years of Unitarian hymnody remained strongly Christian, with theological developments occurring within the recognizable Protestant tradition, and often in relation to other developments in North American and European Christian music. But liberal Christianity, especially Unitarianism, was also subject to recurring internal struggles between relative conservatives who thought that Christian evolution had gone far enough, and radicals who wanted to throw out even more of the inherited tradition, often to allow room for other sources of inspiration.

The first of these radicals were the Transcendentalists, who pushed back at biblical Unitarianism in favor of a more romantic and emotional spirituality, seeking muses in nature and in the literature and archeology of the past, including non-European ancient cultures.<sup>7</sup> In 1844 Unitarian Elizabeth Palmer Peabody (1804–1894) was the first person to publish an extract of a Buddhist scripture in English, in the Transcendentalist journal *The Dial*, founded by former Unitarian minister Ralph Waldo Emerson (1803–1883).<sup>8</sup> Through the latter half

of the nineteenth century Unitarians and similar liberals debated the place of Christianity vis-à-vis other religions, as information about foreign cultures became increasingly available. Unitarians began to believe that all religions contained some degree of truth, as they were produced by humans reaching for the divine from within their individual cultural circumstances. The Buddha in particular began to appeal to Unitarians as a prophet of another tribe—they respected his intellectualism, self-control, ethical principles, and seeming avoidance of superstition and excessive ritual, as portrayed in some of the Theravada Buddhist scriptures being translated and circulated in European languages at that time.<sup>9</sup> Encounters with modernist Buddhists via the Unitarian mission to Japan (established in 1887) also led to deepening knowledge about Buddhism and awareness of its core principles.<sup>10</sup> Still convinced that Christianity was best and their form of Christianity superior, many Unitarians nonetheless afforded a place at the table for non-Christians, albeit as adherents of earlier and less developed forms of religion.

### **The Buddha as Prophet, Buddhists as Brothers: 1894–1948**

It was in this context of growing knowledge and appreciation of other traditions, on the one hand, and continuing confidence in the ultimate supremacy of Unitarian Christianity, on the other, that the Buddha made his first appearance in Unitarian hymns. The initial

---

<sup>6</sup> Alan Ruston, “James Martineau and the Evolution of Unitarian Hymnody,” in *Dissenting Praise: Religious Dissent and the Hymn in England and Wales*, ed. Isabel Rivers and David L. Wykes (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 173–96.

<sup>7</sup> Andrea Greenwood and Mark W. Harris, *An Introduction to the Unitarian and Universalist Traditions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), 173.

<sup>8</sup> Thomas A. Tweed, *The American Encounter with Buddhism, 1844–1912: Victorian Culture and the Limits of*

---

*Dissent* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2000), xxxi.

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>10</sup> Jeff Wilson, “A Brief History of Unitarian Universalist Buddhism,” in *Buddhist Voices in Unitarian Universalism*, ed. Wayne Arnason and Sam Trumbore (Boston: Skinner House Books, 2013), 22–25.

occasion was the 1894 publication of *The Thought of God in Hymns and Poems, Second Series* by two leading Unitarian ministers, Frederick Lucian Hosmer (1840–1929) and William Channing Gannett (1840–1923). Gannett was the pastor of the Rochester, New York, Unitarian congregation. The year before he had attended the World’s Parliament of Religions in Chicago, where he encountered Buddhist representatives who widely impressed the gathered crowds.<sup>11</sup> Not an official denominational hymnal, *The Thought of God in Hymns and Poems, Second Series* was a collection of hymn-type poems (none set to music) including Gannett’s *The Word of God*.

In keeping with increasingly common Unitarian notions that truth and divinity were best represented in the Unitarian Christian tradition but genuinely occurred elsewhere in human tradition, Gannett’s word of God is not confined to the biblical tradition. As his poem-hymn puts it,

From Sinai’s cliffs it echoed,  
It breathed from Buddha’s tree,  
It charmed in Athen’s market,  
It gladdened Galilee;  
The hammer-stroke of Luther,  
The pilgrim’s sea-side prayer,  
The oracles of Concord, one holy Word  
declare.<sup>12</sup>

Here the Buddha is rhetorically elevated to the level of Moses, Socrates, Jesus, Martin Luther, the venerated American colonists known as the Pilgrims, and Gannett’s Unitarian Transcendentalist spiritual ancestors. In the process, a rather pluralist message is delivered, suggesting that there is an eternal religious

order that informs or inspires all great religious messages, Christian or otherwise. Nothing is said, however, about the actual religion of Buddhists—the Buddha is revered as an icon, but his system is not directly evaluated.

It was a small start, but it was a start. Gannett’s composition quickly found life as a real hymn. In 1897 Pluma M. Brown (1858–1940) set it to music, retitled it *The Mission of the Word*, and included it in her hymnal *Song Hymnal of Praise and Joy*; perhaps ironically, Brown was a mainstream Christian, not a Unitarian.<sup>13</sup>

Sixteen years later, in 1913, *The Word of God* (now called by its opening line, “It sounds along the ages”) finally made it into a full-fledged Unitarian hymnal, when Gannett and Hosmer edited Unity Unitarian Church of Chicago’s aging hymnal. *Unity Hymns and Chorals, Revised and Enlarged, with Service Elements* included Brown’s title and musical arrangement.<sup>14</sup>

The following year brought a new official Unitarian denominational hymnal, *The New Hymn and Tune Book*. Gannett’s Buddha and his tree did not appear, but for the first time there was a presence for Buddhists, of a sort. *The New Hymn and Tune Book* included an 1890 composition by George Matheson (1842–1902), a Scottish Presbyterian. It was originally published as *One in Christ*, but this title proved unsatisfying to the non-Christocentric Unitarians. They renamed it *Gather Us In*, putting the emphasis on common human fellowship rather than the Lordship of Jesus Christ. The hymn proclaims, “Gather us in, thou Love that

---

<sup>11</sup> Jenkin Lloyd Jones, *A Chorus of Faith, as Heard in the Parliament of Religions Held in Chicago, Sept. 10–27, 1893* (Chicago: Unity Publishing Company, 1893).

<sup>12</sup> Frederick L. Hosmer and William C. Gannett, *The Thought of God in Hymns and Poems, Second Series* (Boston: Roberts Brothers, 1894), 48.

---

<sup>13</sup> Pluma M. Brown, *Song Hymnal of Praise and Joy* (Jackson, MN: Pluma M. Brown, 1897), 167.

<sup>14</sup> William Channing Gannett and Frederick Lucian Hosmer, eds., *Unity Hymns and Chorals, Revised and Enlarged, with Service Elements* (Chicago: Unity Publishing Company, 1913). The hymnal is unpaginated; *It Sounds along the Ages* is hymn 136.

fillest all; gather our rival faiths within thy fold,” and continues in Matheson’s third verse:

Thine is the mystic life great India craves;  
thine is the Parsee’s sin-destroying beam;  
thine is the Buddhist’s rest from tossing waves;  
thine is the empire of vast China’s dream.<sup>15</sup>

This is a rather mixed message, as it accepts that Buddhists bend toward God, but characterizes them as followers of a rival religion that doesn’t know it actually yearns to worship the Christian deity. Thus this was an acknowledgement of the value of Buddhists, not Buddhism itself, which again receives no direct examination apart from the implication that it is quietist in nature.

In the years following *The New Hymn and Tune Book*, Unitarian hymnals came and went, without novel mention of the Buddha, Buddhists, or Buddhism. Most did not include either Gannett’s or Matheson’s hymns. In 1935 *The Beacon Song and Service Book*, published by the Unitarians for Sunday school use, included an abridged version of Matheson’s *Gather Us In* that cut out the reference to Buddhists altogether.<sup>16</sup> In 1937 the Unitarians and Universalists collaborated on *Hymns of the Spirit for Use in the Free Churches of America*, which included both Matheson’s *Gather Us In* (with the line about the Buddhist’s rest retained) and Gannett’s *The Word of God* under its original name, but now set to a 1640 tune by the Lutheran hymnist Johann Crüger (1598–1662).<sup>17</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup> Samuel A. Eliot, Henry Wilder Foote, Rush R. Shippen, and Lewis G. Wilson, eds., *The New Hymn and Tune Book* (Boston: American Unitarian Association, 1914). The hymnal is unpaginated; *Gather Us In* is hymn 449.

<sup>16</sup> Ruth E. Bailey, Vincent Silliman, Gertrude H. Taft, and Katherine I. Yerrington, eds., *The Beacon Song and Service Book* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1935).

<sup>17</sup> Henry Wilder Foote, Edward P. Daniels, Curtis W. Reese, Von Ogden Vogt, L. Griswold Williams, Alfred S. Cole, Edson R. Miles, and Tracy M. Pullman,

## Building a Universal Religion: 1949–1992

The watershed moment came in 1949, with the publication of *Unitarian Fellowship Hymn and Service Book*. The Fellowship Movement was a highly successful Unitarian outreach program that organized small, lay-led congregations throughout North America. Fellowships were also the growing edge of the humanist movement within Unitarianism, which by the 1940s was taking the denomination ever further from historic Christianity into a post-Christian, nontheistic direction. *Unitarian Fellowship Hymn and Service Book* contained the first truly Buddhist content to appear in the hymnal of a historic Christian denomination, though, as we will see, in a highly adulterated manner. The innovations were the inclusion of two responsive readings—not actual hymns, but still for liturgical use by the congregation during Sunday worship services.

The first, “The Sum of Righteousness,” was listed as arranged “from Buddhist sources.”<sup>18</sup> The nineteenth out of thirty-one responsive readings, it is presented as a single, coherent piece, with alternating sections to be read in call-and-response format by the leader and congregation. In actuality, the reading is a mash-up of various verses taken from many different sources:

Men of prayer belong to all countries. They are  
strangers nowhere. One should seek for others  
the happiness one desires for oneself.<sup>19</sup>

---

eds., *Hymns of the Spirit for Use in the Free Churches of America* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1937). The hymnal is unpaginated; *Gather Us In* is hymn 418, *The Word of God* is hymn 76.

<sup>18</sup> Carl Bihldorff, Lon Ray Call, Virginia Chace, Albert K. Herling, and Robert T. Whittlesey, eds., *Unitarian Fellowship Hymn and Service Book* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1949), 21.

<sup>19</sup> A free rendering of a stele edict by the third-century B.C.E. Buddhist king Ashoka.

The good man when reviled, reviles not again;  
when smitten he is not angry; when treated  
violently he returns love and good will.<sup>20</sup>

Overcome anger by love; evil by good. Hatred  
never ceases by hatred, but by love; for this is  
an old rule.<sup>21</sup>

As from the sources of little worth come the  
precious things of earth, even so it is with  
hearts that hold their fortune within; they need  
not lofty birth or noble kin; their victory is  
recorded.<sup>22</sup>

The true doctrine makes no distinction  
between high and low, rich and poor; it is like  
water which washes and purifies all alike; it is  
like the sky, for it has room for all.<sup>23</sup>

The good man's purpose is to increase the  
mercy, love, kindness and truth of all  
mankind.<sup>24</sup>

The law of Love is: never seek nor consent to  
receive personal salvation, never seek to enter  
bliss alone. In this world and in all worlds labor  
for the elevation and happiness of every living  
creature.<sup>25</sup>

These seven verses are from different Buddhist  
sources or, in the case of several that cannot be  
identified, conform to basic Buddhist senti-  
ments. However, the piece concludes with  
verses from beyond the Buddhist tradition:

---

<sup>20</sup> Source uncertain. This quote was circulating  
among Unitarians as a Buddhist saying as early as 1888,  
when it appeared in an editorial by Henry Martyn  
Simmons in *Unity* 21/22 (July 28, 1888): 287–89.

<sup>21</sup> From *The Dhammapada*, an early Buddhist  
scripture that has received multiple translations.

<sup>22</sup> Evidently from the *Pratyasataka*, a Sri Lankan  
text translated into English at least as early as Thomas  
Steele, *Kusa Jātakaya, A Buddhistic Legend: Rendered, for the  
First Time, into English Verse, from the Sinhalese Poem of  
Alagiyavanna Mobbāla* (London: Trubner and  
Company, 1871), 244. Steele's translation differs from  
the one in Schermerhorn.

<sup>23</sup> Source uncertain.

<sup>24</sup> Source uncertain.

<sup>25</sup> Source uncertain.

Life of my life, I shall ever try to keep my body  
pure, knowing that thy living touch is upon all  
my limbs.

I shall ever try to keep all untruths out from my  
thoughts, knowing that thou art that truth  
which has kindled the light of reason in my  
mind.

And it shall be my endeavor to reveal thee in  
my actions, knowing it is thy power that gives  
me strength to act.

This is the sum of righteousness! Treat others  
as thou wouldst thyself be treated.

The first three verses above are from the  
reformist Hindu writer Rabindranath Tagore's  
(1861–1941) *Gitanjali*, while the final line is  
from the Hindu epic *Mahabharata*.<sup>26</sup>

These extracts are themselves taken from  
the 1914 edition of a compendium by  
Unitarian minister Martin Kellogg Schermer-  
horn (1841–?) titled *Sacred Scriptures of World  
Religion*.<sup>27</sup> Originally published in 1883, Scher-  
merhorn's *Sacred Scriptures* gathered materials  
mostly from the Bible, but by the third edition  
in 1914 it included a modest amount of non-  
Western writings. Schermerhorn's intent was to  
demonstrate the unity of the religious impulse  
in humankind, but he did not perceive non-  
Christian traditions as significantly truthful or  
valuable. The Buddhist material he included  
was simply random lines from translated works  
and newspaper articles, presented without care  
for their authorship, for readers to reflect on.

---

<sup>26</sup> Rabindranath Tagore, *Gitanjali (Song Offerings)*  
(London: MacMillan and Company, 1913); James  
Vaughan, *The Trident, the Crescent, and the Cross: A View of  
the Religious History of India during the Hindu, Buddhist,  
Mohammedan, and Christian Periods* (London: Longman,  
Green, and Company, 1876), 111. Tagore had both  
religious and social connections to the Unitarians, in  
part due to his involvement with the Unitarian-  
influenced Brahmo Samaj movement.

<sup>27</sup> Martin K. Schermerhorn, *Sacred Scriptures of  
World-Religion* (Cambridge, MA: Caustic-Claflin, 1914).

In lifting portions of the material from Schermerhorn's book and placing it in their hymnal, the Unitarians made several significant alterations of framing and form, mainly following the arrangement produced by Alfred Storer Cole (1893–1977), a Unitarian and Universalist minister and professor at Tufts College. First, they took what were explicitly disordered bits and pieces of unidentified Buddhist materials and welded them into a single document, with the implication that a united theme ran through the whole reading. It is likely that readers perceived the entire piece as a portion of a single sermon directly taken from the Buddha. Second, they took what had been readings for private enjoyment and turned them into liturgical materials for group ritual. This was a very significant development, as for the first time an officially sanctioned Unitarian body suggested that Buddhist materials were valuable enough in some fashion to merit inclusion in the church's worship services. Third, by failing to understand that nature of the sources they were working with, the hymnal committee actually mislabeled their sources and welded together Buddhist and non-Buddhist content. Including the Hindu extracts as part of a Buddhist piece results in a serious distortion of the Buddhist tradition at the exact moment that gestures of goodwill are being made toward Buddhism, as these theistic lines are completely foreign to Buddhist religiosity in content and intent. They are, however, in line with liberal theistic sentiments as held by many Unitarians of the time.

The second occurrence of Buddhist material in *Unitarian Fellowship Hymn and Service Book* is the immediately following reading, which is listed as taken "from Persian, Chinese, Buddhist and Roman scriptures." Two selections from "The Sum of Righteousness" are

included, alongside heterogeneous materials from many other (unattributed) religious traditions.<sup>28</sup> No attempt is made to indicate which sections are actually Buddhist. The effect of including Buddhist material alongside non-Buddhist is to render Buddhism as yet another generic monotheism, with ethical principles suspiciously identical to Christian ones. At the end of the process, Unitarians arguably know *less* about Buddhism than they did at the start, since their new understandings are significantly distorted compared to the actual mainstream Buddhist tradition.

An important bridge figure in the process of moving more Buddhist material into Unitarian worship services and their associated texts was Kenneth Leo Patton (1911–1994). Indeed, Patton was one of the key figures of Unitarianism in the second half of the twentieth century. Patton had been a Disciples of Christ minister, but his drift ever further from traditional Christianity first took him into the service of a Unitarian church and eventually led to his founding of the Charles Street Universalist Meeting House in Boston. Patton took the nineteenth-century Unitarian Christian conviction that there was a universal strand to human religion and transformed it from ontology to action plan: he sought to create a universal religion, forged from the best elements of traditional religions, the creative arts, ethical philosophy, and advancing scientific knowledge. These he welded to a thoroughly humanist rather than Christian frame, and enacted under the denominational moniker of Universalism. As Andrea Greenwood and Mark W. Harris note, Patton was building on "an understanding of faith that carried it beyond Christianity to a synthesis of all

---

<sup>28</sup> The editorial committee once again followed the lead of Alfred Cole in the arrangement of these diverse lines.



religious knowledge.”<sup>29</sup> Such a synthesis, to be complete, would require inclusion of some Buddhist material.

Patton was a voluminous chronicler of his practical efforts, producing countless pamphlets and books that described his worship experiments at the Charles Street church. In his 1951 book *Celebration of Life IV: Worship Elements*, he provides a set of skeletal service formats based on various themes.<sup>30</sup> One of these, “Outreach into Other Cultures,” suggests using a reading from the classic Buddhist text *Dhammapada* and the use of “The Sacred Jewel of Buddhism” as a symbol during the service. He also includes Chinese religion in this service, represented entirely by elements from the Daoist tradition. Another service, “The Four Spheres of Life,” suggests using “Buddhist Chanting” as a musical element related to transcendence. Presumably this would be from a recording, as Patton provides no actual Buddhist materials. His service for the theme “Readings and Music” suggests including material from the *Dhammapada* and using the “Lotus medallion of Buddhism” as a symbol while Hindu music plays. And in an untitled service format Patton suggests a reading about the birth of the Buddha from Edwin Arnold’s (1832–1904) book *The Light of Asia*, use of the Buddhist jewel, and materials taken from Judaism, Christianity, and other sources. In his 1957 *Readings for the Celebration of Life*, he mentions the Buddha in a responsive reading—in this case, the Buddha is included in a list of various prophets, acknowledged as a worthy person of the past, but seemingly

---

<sup>29</sup> Greenwood and Harris, *Introduction to the Unitarian and Universalist Traditions*, 155.

<sup>30</sup> Kenneth L. Patton, *Celebration of Life IV: Worship Elements* (Boston: Meeting House Press, 1951). This book is unpaginated.

surpassed by Patton himself.<sup>31</sup> Patton’s pattern through his published works is consistent: he does not present actual Buddhist materials, but lists ones he has used in his services, and Buddhism never appears on its own—it is always paired thematically with other, unrelated traditions.

In 1961, the American Unitarian Association and the Universalist Church of America merged, forming a new organization: the Unitarian Universalist Association. This called for a new hymnal, and Patton was the “driving force” of the editorial committee.<sup>32</sup> In 1964 *Hymns for the Celebration of Life* appeared, with far more Buddhist content than any previous hymnal from a historically Christian denomination.<sup>33</sup> As the preface stated, “Here we celebrate our recognition that truth for living is in all religious traditions. We bring together from diverse times and cultures texts and music that have meaning for us.”<sup>34</sup>

There are seven Buddhist items in all, including the first arrangement as a genuine hymn. *Be Ye Lamps unto Yourself* is based on a very brief extract from the *Mahaparinibbana Sutta* (Great Final Nirvana Sermon), the last teaching ascribed to the Buddha:

Be ye lamps unto yourselves  
Be your own confidence  
Hold to the truth within yourselves  
As to the only lamp.<sup>35</sup>

---

<sup>31</sup> Kenneth L. Patton, *Readings for the Celebration of Life* (Boston: Meeting House Press, 1957), 105.

<sup>32</sup> Greenwood and Harris, *Introduction to the Unitarian and Universalist Traditions*, 154.

<sup>33</sup> Arthur Foote II, Lorraine W. Bays, Henry Leland Clarke, Ida M. Folsom, Christopher Moore, Kenneth Munson, Kenneth L. Patton, Robert L. Sanders, and Vincent B. Silliman, eds., *Hymns for the Celebration of Life* (Boston: Unitarian Universalist Association, 1964).

<sup>34</sup> Ibid. Most of the hymnal is unpaginated, including the preface.

<sup>35</sup> Ibid. *Be Ye Lamps unto Yourself* is hymn 110.

Set to an old Anglo-Catholic tune, the hymn is attributed to Gautama Buddha, the historical Buddha, but without a designated source or translator. It is in fact taken from *The Gospel of Buddha* by Paul Carus (1852–1919), an important fin-de-siècle liberal religious writer and advocate of Buddhism.<sup>36</sup> This source is noteworthy because Carus is unique in using the word “lamps,” rather than “islands,” as other contemporary sources have it. Furthermore, the original advises monks to hold to the Buddha’s teaching as their only island, whereas Carus renders the exhortation as a call to personal conscience. These lines well reflect the spirit of the entire book, as Carus’s Buddha is a model modern religious liberal: self-reliant in matters of faith, guided by an inner intuition, and uninterested in receiving worship.

The other Buddhist inclusions in *Hymns for the Celebration of Life* are readings, rather than full hymns set to music. *Be Ye Lamps unto Yourselves* is repeated in the section for benedictions and closing words.<sup>37</sup> Three readings come from the *Dhammapada*: “Self-Conquest” and “The Ways of the Dedicated Man” in the section on “The Life of Integrity and Wisdom,” and “Let a Man Leave Anger” in the “Love and Human Brotherhood” section.<sup>38</sup> The titles given to these extracts are suggestive of their contents, which include lines such as this from “Let a Man Leave Anger”:

Let a man overcome anger by love, let him  
overcome evil by good;  
Let him overcome the greedy by liberality, the  
liar by truth.

---

<sup>36</sup> Paul Carus, *The Gospel of Buddha* (Chicago: Open Court, 1894).

<sup>37</sup> Foote et al., *Hymns for the Celebration of Life*. It is reading 551.

<sup>38</sup> These are readings 379, 383, and 407, respectively.

Two readings are taken from Max Mueller’s (1823–1900) translation series *Sacred Books of the East*, while another is simply listed as “freely rendered” by Kenneth Patton.<sup>39</sup> Another reading in the “Love and Human Brotherhood” section, titled “Buddha’s Pity,” comes from the *Upāsaka Sīla Sutra* (Precepts for Laymen Sermon), via a translation by Arthur Waley (1880–1966) in his *Buddhist Texts through the Ages*.<sup>40</sup> Finally, there is one Buddhist reading in the “Affirmation” section. Titled “This Is the Greatest Blessing,” it is from the *Khuddaka Patha*, as translated by Robert C. Childers (1838–1876) in James Bissett Pratt’s (1875–1944) volume *The Pilgrimage of Buddhism and a Buddhist Pilgrimage*.<sup>41</sup>

Collectively, a number of observations can be made about these inclusions. First, they are all taken from scholarly and semischolarly books on Asia by white American and European authors, in many cases from the nineteenth century. Second, all have been tinkered with to some degree by the editorial committee, none of whom possess any training in Buddhism or Asian philology. Third, they strongly emphasize ethics and self-control, cardinal values of midcentury Unitarians. These passages briefly touch on concepts of nonviolence, self-restraint, meditation, and the Buddha, though not through the use of actual Buddhist terminology. All come from the earliest periods of Buddhist writing.

Finally, we can also note that *Hymns for the Celebration of Life* includes Gannett’s *Word of God* (now titled *It Sounds along the Ages*) and the

---

<sup>39</sup> Max Mueller, *Sacred Books of the East*, vol. 10 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1881).

<sup>40</sup> Edward Conze, I. B. Horner, David Snellgrove, and Arthur Waley, eds., *Buddhist Texts through the Ages* (New York: Philosophical Library, 1954). This reading is number 408.

<sup>41</sup> James Bissett Pratt, *The Pilgrimage of Buddhism and a Buddhist Pilgrimage* (New York: Macmillan, 1928).

abridged version of Matheson's *One in Christ*, with the Buddhist reference left out and the more hospitable title of *Gather Us In*.<sup>42</sup> Hymn 250, *Heritage*, refers to riches handed down from China and India (along with Sinai, Bethlehem, Greece, and Rome), and thus could be taken as an oblique reference to Buddhism. The implication is that these are part of the Unitarian Universalist heritage, to use and transmit as desired.

### **Buddhism as a Source of Spirituality: 1993–Present**

*Hymns for the Celebration of Life* had a nearly 30-year life in the Unitarian Universalist Association. During this time new local hymnals and supplements from the UUA appeared, but none with additional Buddhist content. For example, *Hymns in New Form for Common Worship* contained a modified version of Gannett's *It Sounds along the Ages* (updated to match strong feminist sensibilities that had taken hold in the denomination), while the hymnal supplement *Readings for Common Worship* contained no mention of Buddhism.<sup>43</sup>

When the new full hymnal finally appeared in 1993, it continued the trend of its predecessor. *Singing the Living Tradition* (still the current hymnal, as noted earlier) increased the number of Buddhist selections, though several are repeats or near repeats. *Be Ye Lamps unto*

*Yourselves* is included, now as hymn 184. A new inclusion is hymn 181, *No Matter if You Live Now Far or Near*. This is a free version of an extract from the *Metta Sutta* (“Loving Kindness Sermon”) of the Theravada Buddhist tradition. The final verse is:

Just as the goodly mother will protect her  
children, e'en at risk of her own life,  
So may we nurture an old mindfulness, a  
boundless heart beyond all fear and strife,  
A boundless heart beyond all fear and strife.

However, despite its origin in the Buddhist canon, *No Matter if You Live Now Far or Near* is not listed as Buddhist. The attribution is simply “Sutta Nopata,” without any explanation. This is a misspelling of “Sutta Nipata,” which is the larger collection of scriptures in which the *Metta Sutta* appears.<sup>44</sup> The translation is not very accurate, and without any clear label only a specialist would discern the Buddhist nature of the original.

Hymn 183, *The Wind of Change Forever Blown*, presents its own difficulties. The author, Sarojini Naidu (1879–1949), addresses her words to the Buddha, or quite possibly to a Buddha statue, as seen in the second verse:

For us the labor and the heat, the broken  
secrets of our pride,  
The strenuous lessons of defeat, the flower  
deferred, the fruit denied  
But not the peace, supremely won,  
Great Buddha, of the lotus throne.

But despite mention of both the Buddha and nirvana in the hymn, this is not, strictly speaking, a Buddhist text. Naidu was a prominent Hindu activist in the anticolonial movement, and in various ways the poem reflects Hindu concepts that are foreign to Buddhist spirituality. Its inclusion on the page opposite *Be Ye Lamps unto Yourselves*, however,

<sup>42</sup> *It Sounds along the Ages* is hymn 247, *Gather Us In* is hymn 249.

<sup>43</sup> John Corrado, Til Evans, Frederick E. Gillis, Adrian Mak, Marjorie Montgomery, Christopher Moore, Lucy Nave, Clarke Dewey Wells, Carl Seaburg, and Christopher Gist Raible, eds., *Hymns in New Form for Common Worship* (Boston: Unitarian Universalist Association, 1982); John Corrado, Til Evans, Frederick E. Gillis, Adrian Mak, Marjorie Montgomery, Christopher Moore, Lucy Nave, Clarke Dewey Wells, Carl Seaburg, and Christopher Gist Raible, eds., *Readings for Common Worship* (Boston: Unitarian Universalist Association, 1988).

<sup>44</sup> The music paired with the text is credited as “Old Indian song, harmony by Frédéric Mathil, 1950.”

makes it likely that most readers (and perhaps the editorial committee) would be unable to note the Hindu rather than Buddhist nature of the hymn. Thus we see an increase from one to three hymns that intersect with Buddhism in some way, though one is a poorly labeled, inaccurate translation and the other is actually Hindu. For good measure, Gannett's *It Sounds along the Ages*, a perennial favorite, appears as hymn 187.

Once again the readings section is where most Buddhist material is included. Reading 505 is taken from Vietnamese monk Thich Nhat Hanh's (b. 1926) book *Being Peace*.<sup>45</sup> The second two verses are:

Let us be aware of the source of being,  
common to us all and to all living things.  
Evoking the Great Compassion, let us fill our  
hearts with our own compassion—towards  
ourselves and towards all living beings.

Curiously, this short prayer ends with "Amen," a term not native to the Buddhist tradition. Reading 554, in the section on "Transience," is a very brief passage taken from Thich Nhat Hanh's book *Present Moment, Wonderful Moment*.<sup>46</sup> Its opening lines are:

Water flows from high in the mountains.  
Water runs deep in the Earth.  
Miraculously, water comes to us, and sustains  
all life.

Neither reading includes explicit Buddhist content, other than the usage of "Great Compassion," a reference to the bodhisattva Avalokiteshvara that few readers would be likely to grasp.

A section in the readings titled "Wisdom from the World's Religions" contains a short

<sup>45</sup> Thich Nhat Hanh, *Being Peace* (Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 1987).

<sup>46</sup> Thich Nhat Hanh, *Present Moment, Wonderful Moment: Mindfulness Verses for Everyday Living* (Berkeley, CA: Parallax Press, 1990).

subsection on Buddhism. The first entry is reading 595, "Free from Suffering," which prays, "May all sentient beings be well and enjoy the root of happiness: free from suffering and the root of suffering." It is labeled "Bodhisattva Vows (Adapted)," but this is incorrect; the actual source is the *Metta Sutta*, which belongs to a completely different form of Buddhism. Reading 596, "Boundless Goodwill," is also from the *Metta Sutta* (correctly identified this time). In fact, it comes from the same section as hymn 181, as a comparison of lines suggests:

Even as a mother watches over her child, so  
with boundless mind should one cherish all  
living beings,  
Radiating friendliness over the whole world,  
Above, below, and all around, without limit.

Reading 598, "Love versus Hate," is a pastiche of lines from various parts of the *Dhammapada*, including:

Let us overcome violence by gentleness;  
Let us overcome evil by good;  
Let us overcome the miserly by liberality;  
Let us overcome the liar by truth.

These lines were seen previously in *Hymns for the Celebration of Life's* reading 407. The final reading in the "Buddhism" section is 598, "Without Hate." It is simply attributed as "Buddhist," but is actually yet another extract from the same section of the *Metta Sutta* as hymn 181 and reading 595, including the lines:

Just as a mother, with her own life, protects  
her only child from hurt, so within yourself  
foster a limitless concern for every living  
creature.  
Display a heart of boundless love for all the  
world in all its height and depth and broad  
extent.

And as in *Hymns for the Celebration of Life*, the words for hymn 184, *Be Ye Lamps unto Yourselves*, are repeated as a reading in the

“Benedictions and Closing Words” section.<sup>47</sup> Whereas the hymn is attributed to Gautama Buddha, the reading is simply labeled “Buddhist.”

Two more glancing blows with Buddhism merit mention. Reading 621, “Why not a Star,” by Unitarian Universalist minister Margaret Gooding (1922–2003), mentions the Buddha alongside Jesus and Zarathustra, continuing the motif of the Buddha as a type of prophet seen in Gannett’s nineteenth-century *It Sounds along the Ages*. More intriguing is Unitarian Universalist minister Barbara J. Pescan’s (b. 1945) responsive reading 534, “Gloria,” which uses various sacred or significant words from different traditions. Alongside “amen,” “alleluia,” “allahu-akbar,” and so on, we also find “Om” and a Buddhist mantra:

Shalom  
Love that persists.

Nam myo-ho rengo kyo  
Calm that is the seed in the dark.

Amen  
For endings that are beginnings,  
for beginnings that are endings.

“Om” may have come from either Buddhism or Hinduism, but “Nam myo-ho rengo kyo” is the central mantra of the Nichiren Buddhist tradition—specifically, this spelling is associated with Soka Gakkai International, a Japanese Buddhist New Religious Movement. Its use here is analogous to that of the Buddha in *It Sounds along the Ages* and “Why not a Star”: whereas those place the Buddha among other religious leaders, “Gloria” places Buddhist syllables alongside sacred words of various other religions, implying a continuity to religion that transcends its specific manifestations.

---

<sup>47</sup> It is reading 679.

*Singing the Living Tradition* received an official supplement in 2005, *Singing the Journey*.<sup>48</sup> Hymn 1031 is *Filled with Loving Kindness*, which draws yet again on the same section of the *Metta Sutta* seen in readings 595 and 598.<sup>49</sup> It is attributed as a “Traditional Buddhist Meditation,” adapted by Unitarian Universalist minister Mark W. Hayes, with music by Unitarian Universalist minister Ian W. Riddell. *Filled with Loving Kindness* was also included in a 2009 collection, *Come Sing a Song with Me: A Songbook for All Ages*.<sup>50</sup> A supplement of readings for *Singing the Living Tradition* was released in 2015, *Lifting Our Voices: Readings in the Living Tradition*.<sup>51</sup> It contains no Buddhist material, though there is a sprinkling of authors who happen to be Buddhist (not identified as such in the text, and there is nothing in their words to indicate their affiliation). The section on “World Religions” includes texts that are explicitly Muslim and Hindu, but no Buddhist texts.

“Hymnody shapes itself to the spirit of every time and place, every hunger and hope, every human purpose however great or small, hurtful or full of life, good or ill,” writes David

---

<sup>48</sup> Leon Burke, Jeannie Gagne, Dennis Hamilton, Ken Herman, Jason Shelton, Barbara Wagner, Deborah Weiner, eds., *Singing the Journey* (Boston: Unitarian Universalist Association, 2005).

<sup>49</sup> Hymn 1009, *Meditation on Breathing* by Sarah Dan Jones, is sometimes remarked upon as employing themes similar to those found in Buddhism. However, there is no direct Buddhist influence on the hymn (personal communication with Sarah Dan Jones, March 6, 2017).

<sup>50</sup> Melodie Feather, ed., *Come Sing a Song with Me: A Songbook for All Ages* (Boston: Skinner House Books, 2009).

<sup>51</sup> Mark Belletini, Kendyl Gibbons, Angela Herrera, Abhi Janamanchi, and Hope Johnson, eds., *Lifting Our Voices: Readings in the Living Tradition* (Boston: Unitarian Universalist Association, 2015).

Johnson.<sup>52</sup> “Thus hymnals are creatures of the time and place wherein they are set.” What times and places, hungers and hopes are revealed through investigating the use of Buddhism in Unitarian hymnals?

Adoption of Buddhist material in the hymnals was a long-term process, rooted in nineteenth-century quests for human brotherhood and a universal element in religion, believed to exist in all genuine traditions but best expressed in liberal Protestantism. There is a periodicization observable in the evolution of Buddhism by Unitarian Universalist hymnals, from mentioning the Buddha as a prophet, to including small bits of jumbled Buddhism, to using several sources for ethical inspiration. These seem to reflect, in a rough manner, the evolution of religious pluralism observed by historian William Hutchison in *Religious Pluralism in America: The Contentious History of a Founding Ideal*. As he noted, pluralism seems to have moved from a begrudging tolerance to a limited inclusion to attempts at permitting full participation by nondominant religious groups.<sup>53</sup> A somewhat similar trajectory is at work within the Unitarian and Unitarian Universalist traditions, as token respect for the Buddha gave way to Unitarian Universalists themselves—in a very partial way—participating in the practice and transmission of elements of Buddhism.

And it is pluralism that fueled this drive to include Buddhist materials, as Sharon Mirchandani, writing in *The Hymn* in 2000, made clear: “A unique trait of the Unitarian Universalist

Church is its goal of religious pluralism.”<sup>54</sup> This is especially manifested, she argued, in the hymnal:

*Singing the Living Tradition (SLT)* is a fascinating model of both textual and musical diversity and inclusiveness. The hymnal expresses a full range of spiritual imagery by including texts and music from six continents and a variety of religions: Christian, Jewish, Wicca, Native American, Muslim, Hindu, Buddhist, and others. It also uses both masculine and feminine images for the divine, positive references to homosexuality, African American spirituals, and numerous languages. Not only does *Singing the Living Tradition* express the objectives of the UU church, it also provides a valuable model for the many other types of organizations currently grappling with multiculturalism.<sup>55</sup>

For Mirchandani, *Singing the Living Tradition* achieves the Unitarian Universalist goal of religious pluralism. Certainly there is a wide diversity of source material in the hymnal, more so than in any other denominational hymnal, Christian, Unitarian Universalist, or otherwise. But when examined beneath the surface, the success of this attempt to achieve pluralism appears more equivocal.

Among the Buddhist material in *Singing the Living Tradition*—and the earlier hymnals too, for that matter—there is actually a very limited, nonrepresentative selection of Buddhism on view. Virtually all of the selections come from the Theravada tradition of Buddhism—there are none from the Vajrayana tradition, and the only Mahayana representation (Thich Nhat Hanh) contains virtually no identifiable Mahayana content as such. The range of specific sources is furthermore extremely limited, confined mainly to multiple adapt-

---

<sup>52</sup> David A. Johnson, *A Pilgrimage in Song: Unitarian and Universalist Hymnody* (Marlborough, MA: KMR & Company, 2016), 123.

<sup>53</sup> William R. Hutchinson, *Religious Pluralism in America: The Contentious History of a Founding Ideal* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2003), 6–9.

---

<sup>54</sup> Sharon Mirchandani, “Looking for Diversity and Inclusiveness in the Music of the Unitarian Universalist Church,” *The Hymn* 51/2 (2000): 24.

<sup>55</sup> *Ibid.*, 25.

ations of the same few texts—indeed, the same few sections of those texts. Except for the two short poems by Hanh, most selections appear to come from academic books on Buddhism by white Western scholars, rather than from contact with Buddhist primary materials, despite there being living Buddhist communities in the United States throughout the entire time period examined in this article. More to the point, Buddhists have been writing and publishing Western-style hymns since the late nineteenth century, and English-language Buddhist hymnals have been available in the United States since 1924.<sup>56</sup> Additionally, contact with Buddhists and even participation in Buddhist practice by some Unitarians and Unitarian Universalists steadily increased throughout the twentieth century.<sup>57</sup> But Unitarian Universalists involved with Buddhism were never called upon to contribute to the creation of hymnals, and Buddhist hymnals were never consulted by Unitarian Universalists seeking hymns and readings for their own use. For that matter, the musical arrangements in Unitarian Universalist hymnals were always Western ones, rather than the actual tonal chants or musical accompaniments that are used in Buddhist practice.

The effect of including only these few small samplings of Buddhism is the distortion of the historical Buddhist traditions. These hymns and readings carry almost none of the central concepts that make Buddhist sects and denominations Buddhist: there is no karma, no rebirth, no enlightenment, nothing about cosmology, no doctrines of no-self, suffering, or impermanence, no cosmic savior buddhas

and bodhisattvas. It would be impossible to “reverse engineer” any of the ancient or living schools of Buddhism or even an abstract, generalized Buddhism from these hymns and readings, and were they not labeled as Buddhist, they could all be easily passed off as Christian, humanist, Jewish, Muslim, or any other religion.

Furthermore, Buddhism is actively transformed in these selections: in *Unitarian Fellowship Hymn and Service Book*, Buddhism is portrayed as monotheistic, whereas in *Singing the Living Tradition* it has been transmuted into a purely ethical system, without metaphysics or devotion of any type. This is ironic, as regular Buddhist practice—though highly diverse, given the great range of Buddhist traditions—is primarily liturgical, and that liturgy is mainly devotional.<sup>58</sup> There are vast riches that could have been mined for hymnal use, but they are excluded. It is only possible to speculate about reasons, but one likelihood is that such mainstream Buddhist chants and prayers are unappealing to the strongly humanist and agnostic composition of modern Unitarian Universalism, and furthermore that in their specificity (prayers to Vajrapani, Samantabhadra, and Manjushri, for instance) and seeming foreignness (represented, for example, by unfamiliar phrases like “Namo Amida Butsu”), they are poor fits for the structure of generalized “one world” spirituality being sought in this quest for pluralism. The result is that the Buddhism that is built by Unitarian Universalists ends up looking very much like Unitarian Universalism, rather than any actual

---

<sup>56</sup> Keiko Wells, “Shin Buddhist Song Lyrics Sung in the United States: Their History and Expressed Buddhist Images,” part 1: “1898–1939,” *Amerika Taiheiyō Kenkyū* 2 (2002): 75–99.

<sup>57</sup> Wilson, “A Brief History of Unitarian Universalist Buddhism,” 27–30.

---

<sup>58</sup> Buddhism is often associated with meditation in the popular Western imagination. But meditation has never been a practice for the majority of Buddhists, whereas all historical schools of Buddhism have promoted daily devotional activities for both monks and laypeople.

Buddhism. Is this religious pluralism, or simply a reflection as from a mirror?

While a large percentage of the denomination would have agreed with Mirchandani's celebration of religious inclusivity, not everyone was so sanguine about Unitarian Universalist approaches to pluralism. "Since time immemorial," Unitarian Universalist minister Marjorie Bowens-Wheatley (1949–2006) wrote in 1995, "religions have borrowed from each other."<sup>59</sup> But, as she pointed out,

Unitarian Universalists, we are indeed unique in our approach to embracing other religions in worship, programming, and religious education. We intentionally seek to learn about world religions and to share other cultural rituals and traditions. We lack depth, however, in our understanding of the historical, racial, cultural, and religious context, as well as sensitivity to these contexts. At worst, our approach is assimilationist, a combination of voyeurism and thievery, which, in effect, seems to say: from the distance of time and space, we have permission to take a myopic look at whatever culture we choose, and to beg, borrow or steal whatever we like, and make it our own.<sup>60</sup>

Bowens-Wheatley did not directly address Unitarian Universalist uses of Buddhism. As she made clear in her article, she had in mind the especially fraught examples of African, Native American, and Jewish borrowings by a denomination that was overwhelmingly white and of Christian background. Still, the critique, when juxtaposed with Mirchandani's enthusiasm for the diverse hymnal, offers a

compelling second voice to the conversation about Unitarian Universalist uses of Buddhism.

Of course, alteration and adaptation of hymns and other service elements is a venerable part of the liberal religious tradition. Every hymnal has modified pre-existing Christian material to make it suit the theological or temperamental whims of the author and his or her times. However, a difference may be noted between modifying one's own tradition and changing that of others.

The primary take-away is that, above all else, Unitarian and Unitarian Universalist use of Buddhism in their hymnals was always for their own purposes, divorced from actual usage by Buddhists.<sup>61</sup> It may have been triumphalistic, inclusive, or allegedly post-colonial, but it always actually served the predetermined purposes of Unitarian Universalists rather than changing them in any substantial way. It allowed Unitarian Universalists to maintain a self-understanding of themselves as broad-minded, tolerant, and inclusive in their spiritual quests and gathered communities.

---

<sup>59</sup> Marjorie Bowens-Wheatley, "Kwanzaa, Cornrows, and Confusion: The Dilemma of Cultural Racism and Misappropriation," in *A Documentary History of Unitarian Universalism*, vol. 2: *From 1900 to the Present*, ed. Dan McKanan (Boston: Skinner House Books, 2017), 418. Originally published in *Liberal Religious Education*, Fall 1995: 7–19.

<sup>60</sup> *Ibid.*, 420.

---

<sup>61</sup> In the twenty-five years since the last major hymnal, Buddhism has made significant inroads into Unitarian Universalism, as reflected by the growth of the Unitarian Universalist Buddhist Fellowship, the 2013 anthology *Buddhist Voices in Unitarian Universalism*, and the frequency with which Buddhism is referenced in Sunday sermons. Would this result in greater diversity or more accurate usage if a new hymnal was produced today? It is impossible to do anything other than speculate, but it seems worth noting that the recent supplements to *Singing the Living Tradition* continue the patterns of the past, suggesting that Buddhist influence among Unitarian Universalists may be less than is sometimes imagined.