



Western Washington University
Western CEDAR

WWU Graduate School Collection

WWU Graduate and Undergraduate Scholarship

2010

Refashioning the past, reforming the present: visual culture and civic life in early modern Seville

Stephanie Stillo

Western Washington University

Follow this and additional works at: <https://cedar.wwu.edu/wwuet>

 Part of the [History Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Stillo, Stephanie, "Refashioning the past, reforming the present: visual culture and civic life in early modern Seville" (2010). *WWU Graduate School Collection*. 38.

<https://cedar.wwu.edu/wwuet/38>

This Masters Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the WWU Graduate and Undergraduate Scholarship at Western CEDAR. It has been accepted for inclusion in WWU Graduate School Collection by an authorized administrator of Western CEDAR. For more information, please contact westerncedar@wwu.edu.

Refashioning the Past, Reforming the Present: Visual Culture and Civic Life in Early Modern Seville

By
Stephanie Stillo
Accepted in Partial Completion
Of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Arts

Moheb A. Ghali, Dean of the Graduate School

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Co-Chair, Dr. Amanda Eurich

Co-Chair, Dr. Kimberly Lynn

Dr. Leonard Helfgott

Dr. Ricardo Lopez

MASTER'S THESIS

In presenting this thesis in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a master's degree at Western Washington University, I grant to Western Washington University the non-exclusive royalty-free right to archive, reproduce, distribute, and display the thesis in any and all forms, including electronic format, via any digital library mechanisms maintained by WWU.

I represent and warrant this is my original work, and does not infringe or violate any rights of others. I warrant that I have obtained written permissions from the owner of any third party copyrighted material included in these files.

I acknowledge that I retain ownership rights to the copyright of this work, including but not limited to the right to use all or part of this work in future works, such as articles or books.

Library users are granted permission for individual, research and non-commercial reproduction of this work for educational purposes only. Any further digital posting of this document requires specific permission from the author.

Any copying or publication of this thesis for commercial purposes, or for financial gain, is not allowed without my written permission.

Stephanie Stillo
2/18/2010

Refashioning the Past, Reforming the Present: Visual Culture and Civic Life in Early Modern Seville

A Thesis
Presented to
The History Department of
Western Washington University

In Fulfillment
Of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Arts

by
Stephanie Stillo
February 2010

Abstract

Visual media in Spain during the early modern period drew marked connections between religious devotion and civic allegiance. This project examines the formation and expression of civic devotion and historical memory in sixteenth and seventeenth century Seville. Public ceremonies, architectural renovations, and religious iconography promoted healthy urban societies through the formation of public images which spoke directly to civic life within the city. Public expressions of local history and civil authority lay at the nexus of various debates about civic life during the sixteenth and seventeenth century, such as the promotion of gendered civic hierarchy, anxieties about regional decline, and the close connections drawn between Spanish identity and antiquity. The fundamental goal of this research is to more thoroughly understand the conceptual frameworks which constructed human interaction in urban life during the early modern period.

Acknowledgements

I would like to extend my deepest gratitude to the members of my thesis committee, whose continued support and patience made this project possible. Also, an extra special thank you to Dr. Amanda Eurich and Dr. Kimberly Lynn for sharing both their expertise and friendship while helping me find my own voice in the present historiographic landscape.

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	iv
Acknowledgements.....	v
List of Illustrations.....	vii
Introduction.....	1
Chapter 1:	16
Chapter 2.....	37
Chapter 3.....	57
Conclusion.....	84
Glossary.....	89
Bibliography.....	90

Illustrations

Figure 1. *Saints Justa and Rufina*, by Hernando de Esturmio.....81

Figure 2. *The Giralda with Saints Justa and Rufina*, by Miguel de Esquivel.....82

Figure 3. *Saints Justa and Rufina with Giralda*, by Bartolomé Esteban Murillo.....83

Introduction

Our city of Seville, Universal Plaza of the world, where all nations that exist on earth come to see, to look and to take, not only of its worldly wealth of riches, jewels, pearls, silver, gold, merchandise and fruits of the earth...but also of its spiritual wealth and good example, devotion and holiness.¹

-Alonso Sánchez Gordillo, *Religiosas estaciones que frequenta la devoción sevillana: observaciones*

¹ Official date of *Religiosas estaciones que frequenta la devoción sevillana: observaciones* is unknown. Estimates are early seventeenth-century. See Lynn Matluck Brooks, *Dances of the Processions of Seville in Spain's Golden Age* (Kassel: Reichenberger, 1988), 11.

The following project examines the construction of civic devotion and historical memory in early modern Seville. Conquered by Fernando III of Castile in 1248, the city was an important part of the Reconquest in southern Spain. In the late medieval period Seville began construction on what would become one of the largest cathedrals in western Europe. In 1480 Ferdinand and Isabella established one of the original inquisitorial tribunals in the city, and Catholic orthodoxy remained a key component to Sevillian identity throughout the early modern period. After being named official site of the *Casa de Contratación* in 1503, Seville maintained a monopoly on Spanish-American trade and served as the gateway to Spain's Atlantic Empire. During the sixteenth-century, Seville was the largest city in Western Europe, dwarfing other metropolitan centers such as Paris, Naples and Venice.² Seville also remained the most populated Iberian city until it was overtaken by Madrid in late seventeenth-century. The city was also demographically varied and there remained significant economic differences between Seville's wealthy elite, the church, and a large transient population. Trade with the Americas brought new opportunities for merchant classes and the status of nobility became an increasingly flexible title. Consequently, having few comparable rivals within Spain, the city was commercial, metropolitan, and promoted a fervent Catholic orthodoxy. Contemporary authors called Seville "not a city, but a world" while polemicists hailed the bustling port as both the *Mother of Foreigners* and the *Great Babylon of Spain*.³

² Marry Elizabeth Perry, *Crime and Society in Early Modern Seville* (New Hampshire: The University Press of New England, 1980), 5.

³ See Introduction to Mary Elizabeth Perry, *Gender and Disorder in Early Modern Seville* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1990), 1-3. Also see Ronald Cueto, "The Great Babylon of Spain: Politics, Religion and Piety in the Seville of Velázquez," in *Velázquez in Seville*, ed. Michael Clarke (Edinburgh: National Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, 1996), 29-30.

Sevillian civic authorities sought to express their city's genealogy through various local histories, art treatises, architectural renovations, and religious iconography throughout the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century. The visual and textual construction of both ideal historical narratives and orthodox civic communities reveal city officials' anxieties about civic disorder in the city. This project will focus on the promotion of healthy civil society through the construction of visual media which spoke directly to civic life. Artist and intellectual Francisco Pacheco's seventeenth-century art treatise *El Arte de la Pintura, autos de fe*, and the deployment of the cult of Justa and Rufina all provide different vantages from which to explore Sevillian civic culture in the early modern period. Public images of local history and civil authority lay at the nexus of various debates about civic life during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries, such as the promotion of gendered civic hierarchy, anxieties about regional decline, and the close connections drawn between contemporary Sevillian identity and antiquity. In this sense, this project works to challenge traditional historiography regarding the utilization of religious pedagogy in urban settings by arguing that public displays of religious devotion also conveyed essential allusions about Seville's history, citizenry and place within the monarchy.

The difficulty of defining what is meant by "civic communities" in the early modern world suggests not only the challenges of studying Spanish urban centers during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries but also the difficulty of exploring early modern culture through a civil framework. Katie Harris defines civic culture as a "symbolically constituted sense of belonging to a deep-rooted community."⁴ The following three

⁴ Katie Harris, *From Muslim to Christian Granada: Inventing a City's Past in Early Modern Spain* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2007), xvi.

chapters will attempt to deconstruct and define this symbolism in Seville. Like other urban communities in Andalusia, symbolism regarding regional identity often relied on the reconstitution of historical memory. In Seville, the creation of historical narratives bypassed medieval Islamic rule in the city and created direct connections to antique history and Catholic orthodoxy. However, refashioning the past had everything to do with reforming the present. Like Harris suggests, the “discovery of history” reflected a satisfaction of some desire of contemporary authority.⁵ Local elites promoted an authorized history for the sake of legitimizing their place in Sevillian society, as well as Spain’s expanding empire. However, it should be noted, the following work does not intend to present (nor could it achieve) a cogent communal or individual identity for all of Seville. Instead, this thesis explores expressions of ideal communities by local authorities. The agenda behind such constructions unearth several urban complexities within the Spanish monarchy, specifically Seville’s relationship with (and distance from) monarchical authority, city officials’ personal commitment to their own regional authority, and the malleability of nobility and historical authenticity in the early modern period.

These themes will be explored in each chapter through different vantages of Sevillian civic life. The first chapter will focus on Seville’s network of seventeenth-century artists and intellectuals. Looking at the work of Francisco Pacheco, head of the Sevillian Academy and censor of sacred images to Seville’s inquisitorial tribunal, this chapter will explore how the construction of history defined and legitimized social status. Published nine years after his death, Pacheco’s two volume treatise *El Arte de la Pintura* functioned as a guide to both the construction of devotional artwork as well as the role of

⁵ Harris, xvi.

the Sevillian artist in civil society. Amassed over a lifetime of collaboration with fellow artists and intellectuals, Pacheco's work possessed an overt pride in both his *patria* and profession (*artífice supremo*).

Unsatisfied with Sevillian artists' close association with the mechanical rather than the liberal arts, Pacheco engaged in a methodical investigation of the genealogy of both artists and contemporary artistic method. The *Arte* weaved this genealogy through antique scholars, famed Renaissance artists and into the works of Seville's most influential artists and intellectuals.

The construction of Pacheco's argument suggests the same distinctive regionalism which preoccupied Sevillian public works throughout the early modern period. It also reveals the manipulation of authenticating tropes, such as close historical ties to antiquity for the purpose of establishing legitimacy. As the city underwent significant commercial changes during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries, new civic authorities sought to solidify their influence within the empire's commercial gateway. However, the class gradation within Seville during its formative years varied. The conversion of much of the merchant class into nobility during the sixteenth-century promoted new solidarities between old and new families, blurring traditional lines of descent within the city. The shallow genealogical tree of new nobility prompted both the deliberate construction of forged ancestral lines by new nobility, as well as the defense of preexisting lines by the older noble class. The Alcazár family, for example, commissioned Diego Ortiz de Zúñiga to forge their ancestral line, as well as discredit rumors of their *converso* lineage, in *Discurso Genealógico de los Ortizes de Sevilla*.⁶ Pacheco's close collaboration with local

⁶ Ruth Pike, *Aristocrats and Traders: Sevillian Society in the Sixteenth Century* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1972), 34-35.

humanist scholars like Francisco de Medina and Rodrigo Caro, both of whom wrote extensively about the city's antiquity and early conversion to orthodoxy, suggests the profound crosspollination between local elites and intellectual communities with the city.

Regardless of their personal history, the power of the nobility in Seville during the early modern period cannot be overstated. Local magnates, who were often historians, artists and intellectuals themselves, funded trade vessels and voyages from both sides of the Atlantic and monopolized seats in municipal offices ranging from chief constable to governor of the royal Alcázar. Pacheco's alliance with local elites determined to legitimize their social status certainly influenced his claim to artistic nobility. Prominent men such as the Duke of Alcalá, who held multiple positions in municipal government and traced his lineage back to Hercules and Julius Caesar, devoted his spare time to collecting books, studying Latin and renovating one of the city's most famous sites of pilgrimage, the Casa de Pilatos. He was also patron to Pacheco and other artists within the Sevillian academy, several of which helped establish his public image within the city. Pacheco's close connection to the local nobility illustrates not only the symbiotic relationship between history and art in early modern Seville, but also the networks utilized in the construction of civic culture.

This analysis is in agreement with Robert Bireley's assertion that urban reform integrated religious reform efforts after the Council of Trent. Bireley suggests that the rise of the state was a major factor in the evolution of early modern Catholicism. Seville's distance from Madrid and elevated role as gateway to the Atlantic allowed a sense of autonomous local authority from the capital. Therefore, the expansion of nascent state power seen in imperial capitals was mirrored in urban centers before the establishment of

a more cogent national culture in the nineteenth-century. However, even during the sixteenth-century, local and imperial authorities took a more active interest in the power of religious reform through areas such as jurisdiction, taxation, and ecclesiastical appointments. As chapter two and three will suggest, local Sevillian authority demonstrated the same political interest in religious reform.

This struggle for legitimacy most often played out in public spaces through visual media. Chapters two and three will address these expressions directly. The visual interpretations of history and civic authority put in place by local officials meant to position the city in opposition to the reality of its own history. Though the city was conquered by Fernando III of Castile in 1248, its urban landscape reflected its Islamic past. Architectural renovations which sought to reclaim civic spaces from the Mudéjar style during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries reveals the extent of this historical revision. Renovations to Seville's Alcázar, Giralda, and pilgrimage sites such as the Casa de Pilatos highlight attempts by local authorities to alter the city's historical reality, as well as their place within Sevillian history.

However, the visual construction of history did not limit itself to individual families. The renovations to public space also suggests a ritual reclaiming of communal spaces which belonged to all those who resided within the walls of the city. In this sense, history and genealogy were directly linked to the health and commitment of a city's *civitas*. To establish legitimate authority within a city, local officials had to establish historical ties to the community itself. For example, though the treatises of Pacheco and his academy were part of a larger discursive movement which attempted to define the efficacy of visual media, proper civic behavior still needed to be conveyed to the public.

Pacheco expressed this sentiment throughout his work. Despite his desire to insert himself into the city's elite class through the construction of historical ties to the community, the *Arte* functioned, most fundamentally, as an instructional manual on how to best educate the public via proper visual decorum. Further analysis of other visual media which possessed analogous goals will prove useful in delineating the similarities in theory and practice in Pacheco's work. It will also highlight the close alliance between the maintenance of spiritual health and civic allegiance.

Chapter two will explore this relationship through Seville's frequent utilization of *autos de fe*. *Autos* were one of the largest and most prolific public events of the early modern world. The multiple processions ordered by city officials and the local tribunal were meticulously planned. They began on the cathedral steps, marched past prominent public building, and ended in an ornate hierarchical arena specifically constructed to showcase local civic and religious authority. Revisionist scholars such as Henry Kamen have rightly addressed the ritual ceremonies connected with the *autos* from the vantage of inquisitorial bureaucracy. Though such theories have done much to discredit scholarship regarding inquisitorial irrationality, there is still much to be garnered from the *autos* elaborate public rituals. Therefore, chapter two will propose an elaboration to Kamen's theory by suggesting that the detailed public trials and processions of *autos de fe* provided deliberate public models of ordered legal justice and local civic hierarchy. The pomp and ostentation of the *autos* also sought to display civic authority through the visual juxtaposition of ordered hierarchy and the public shaming of those who stepped beyond the bounds of communal norms.

Images of public order displayed in *autos de fe* are in accord with Tamar Herzog's assertion that citizenship emerged in local Spanish communities through action. Her work argues that acceptance in a community depended most significantly on the maintenance of communal duties and the public demonstration of loyalty. Naturalization into a community was most often not conferred by legal procedures, especially in Seville where the population significantly varied. Though boundaries certainly marked the difference between residents and immigrants, *vicindad* and *naturaleza* were expressed "at the moment when people acted as if they felt attached to the community."⁷ Therefore, an individual's relationship to their community was based on action; "...nativeness was not a fixed condition. Rather than depending on birthplace, vassalage, or descent, nativeness was acquired, and lost, by way of performance."⁸ This theory functions on several levels in chapter two. *Autos* provided visual examples of those who acted in accordance with the community and those who "decided" to turn away from their commitment. The complete participation of the city – from civic officials, the secular and religious clergy, local inquisitorial tribunal, as well as invited guests and local residents, suggests the communal understanding of this visual vocabulary.

Cultural historians echo the connection between urban life and public rituals by suggesting that society was imagined, or reflected, through shared space. Edward Muir, whose work has significantly shaped contemporary ritual theory, suggests that public rituals created a new way of seeing. Public civic and religious rituals became the moment when the individual committed themselves to the community and good government was

⁷ Tamar Herzog, *Defining Nations in Early Modern Spain and Spanish America* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003), 7.

⁸ Tamar Herzog, "Communities Becoming a Nation: Spain and Spain America in the Wake of Modernity (and Thereafter)," *Citizenship Studies* 11, no. 2 (2007): 154.

personified and internalized. Early modern contemporary sight theory buttressed this supposition. Theorists conceived images as points of contact with supernatural powers and suggested that gazing at an image had the potential to place the observer under the direct influence of what they saw. Therefore, giant floats, mobile stages, actors and processions - such as those created for public ceremonies like the *autos de fe* - presented public models of social harmony and effectively blurred the line which separated subject (ritual) and object (participant).⁹

Like Pacheco's justification for nobility, the idea behind spectacles was rooted in both history and Catholic orthodoxy. Larger civic festivals such as Corpus Christi, saints' feast days, and the Holy Week processions certainly employed similar concepts of community present in *autos*. However, occasions for festivals varied from the foundation of convents to the arrival of new relics or special guests to the city. Chapter two will, therefore, attempt to position the *autos de fe* within the visual vocabulary which contributed to the communal understanding of its specific meaning. To do this, this chapter will explore how popular artwork, civic and religious processions, architecture and mnemonic devices often expressed a similar civic tenor to that of *autos de fe*, as well as Pacheco's *Arte*. By connecting the various visual media constructed for public consumption the connection between popular discourses about civic identity and the establishment of local authority in Seville becomes more apparent.

City official's utilization of visual models not only reflected the important connection between sight and memory in early modern Catholicism, but also the ability of urban oligarchs to manipulate post-Tridentine reform for their own benefit. Drawing

⁹ Edward Muir, "The Eye of the Procession: Ritual Ways of Seeing in the Renaissance," in *Ceremonial Culture in Pre-Modern Europe* ed. Nicholas Howe (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 2007), 131.

from Michael Baxandall's work on the function of religious art in Italy, Carla Rahn Phillips' work on visualizing Spanish imperium suggests that visual imagery remained the most essential and authentic form of communication in Iberia in the early modern period. Even as the popularity print spread throughout the country, images remained the preferred method of communication advocated by domestic religious figures such as Teresa of Ávila and Ignatius Loyola.¹⁰ The vocabulary promoted by images spoke to everyone, regardless of literacy or language, and ideally centered the viewer on internal devotion rather than simple outward profession. Thus, the construction of visual decorum within the city relied heavily on the utilization of sight and memory.

William Christian's work on popular religion in Spain suggests that the urban construction of visual devotion was different in the city than in outlining provinces. This distinction is important. Firstly, city officials and metropolitan churches such as Seville could afford more elaborate processions, architectural projects, and feast days than provincial towns, making their celebrations far more imposing and subject to multivalent meaning. Seville's extraordinary wealth coming from the Americas during the early modern period allowed for a regular, and particularly commanding, processional cycle. However, the multifaceted utilization of visual media in urban centers was perhaps even more important than material wealth. As Christian explains, sacred space, as well as essential saints, were located within the city walls rather than outside.¹¹ The proximity of the sacred to essential civic and religious institutions provided conceptual space for the creation of a city's history. For example, chapter three will discuss how city officials

¹⁰ Carla Rahn Phillips, "Visualizing Imperium: The Virgin of the Seafarers and Spain's Self-Image in the early Sixteenth-Century," *Renaissance Quarterly* 58, no. 3 (2005): 819.

¹¹ William Christian, *Local Religion in Sixteenth Century Spain* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1981), 148-152.

utilized the Giralda in iconographic images of Saints Justa and Rufina to establish the sisters', as well as the city's, antique connection to Christian orthodoxy.

The final chapter will, therefore, be a synthesis of the notions of historical memory and visual media discussed in the first two chapters. It will explore the promotion of religious iconography in Seville during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries. Focusing most specifically on Saints Justa and Rufina, antique sister martyrs and patronesses of the city, this chapter will analyze the significance of their promotion in the context of Seville's rapid urbanization. Pulled from historical obscurity in the sixteenth-century by city officials and local intellectuals, Justa and Rufina became the city's foremost communicentric image. Their iconography emerged in architecture, processions, local histories, and broadsheets as well as paintings by famed artists from Bartolomé Esteban Murillo to Francisco Goya. In addition, histories and saints manuals written by local authors such as Rodrigo Caro and Antonio de Quintanadueñas suggest that Justa and Rufina were an important part of Seville's historical narrative.

This chapter will work to locate Justa and Rufina iconography within public anxieties about civic order, especially in regards to female piety. This comparison will illustrate the creation of historical memory for the sake civic reform. It will also assert that post-Tridentine religious iconography functioned as deliberate acts creation on the part of religious and political authorities.

However, the effectiveness of the sisters' iconography rested in its easily decipherable message of balanced hierarchy for both public and private life. Patriarchal families functioned as the anchor to political authority and the overall health of the *patria*. Women's misconduct threatened both private stability of the family as well as the

prescribed natural order between men and women. *Policia*, the contemporary term designated by political theorists about ideal urban society, dictated that ordered communities were largely based on personal comportment and the regulation of private life. Local authors and hagiographers addressed these anxieties by framing the sisters' history and orthodoxy as distinctly Sevillian. Evident in the majority of early modern renditions of saints' cults, the sisters' iconography personified visual expressions of historical memory within the city.

The conclusion will address the possibility of exploring these same themes in a transatlantic study of imperial centers in the Americas. Much like their Iberian counterparts, the social, political and religious institutions put forth by imperial authorities legitimized their role in society through a nuanced visual vocabulary. Like imperial centers in Spain, the construction of identity, as well as local history, materialized most prominently in urban settings. Seville provides a useful point for urban comparison. As mentioned, Sevillian magnates were often active in transatlantic trade. Merchant families such as the Alcázars, who commissioned the forged ancestral history, were active merchant traders in the New World and undoubtedly established local legitimacy using similar tactics. In addition, local authorities in colonial centers such as Lima and Mexico City often employed spectacle theaters such as *autos de fe* as a means of constructing local authority. The close association between Sevillian elites and colonial urban centers will prove useful in establishing the transatlantic construction of local authority. Saints cults were also employed for this same purpose. As previous studies on Josephine devotion suggest, the relationship forged through religious

iconography had the ability to travel between urban centers and often had a marked impact on Iberian visual culture.¹²

Despite their varying focus, each chapter brings to light similarities between the promotion of civic order within the city and the reform of visual imagery during the early modern period. Pacheco addressed how the physical construction of pedagogy affected what people saw and how they engaged in public life. The pomp and ostentation of the *autos de fe* sought to showcase civic hierarchy through the visual juxtaposition of local civic authority and those who had stepped beyond the bounds of communal norms. Justa and Rufina iconography attempted to protect patriarchal order by providing models of ideal civic communities through representations of the city's history and early conversion to Catholic orthodoxy.

The importance of this study is its ability to uncover the networks which promoted regional identity in a country as varied as Spain. Unfortunately this project does little more than set the foundation for further research on the formation of individual identity within Seville. It is certainly the goal of most historians to uncover the much sought after voice of the everyday. This study is no different. Future research on the popular promotion or rejection of saints' cults by the Sevillian public or the utilization of official processional culture for unsanctioned popular ritual will aid in defining the contours of identity in the early modern world. However, the deliberate construction of local identity was not wholly rejected by the people. *Autos* never wanted for attendance, architectural renovations within the city became some of the most famous sites of pilgrimage, and images of popular saints were often believed to possess transitive healing

¹² Charlene Villaseñor Black, *Creating the Cult of Saint Joseph: Art and Gender in the Spanish Empire* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2006), 13.

powers. Therefore, this thesis will optimistically view the construction of local identity by Sevillian elites as largely consensual. It will also serve as a future guide to research regarding the formation, manipulation and deployment of historical memory and the power of visual media in the early modern world.

Chapter One:

Civic Identity and the Christian Artist in Francisco Pacheco's *El Arte de la Pintura*

In 1617, during a procession celebrating the Immaculate Conception, members of the Colegio Mayor de Santa María de Jesus in Seville honored The Virgin Mary by including in the procession an allegorical personification of the concept Perspective. During the procession Perspective marched with other allegorical representations such as Mathematics, Astronomy, and of course, the Virgin and Child. Arising from popular Renaissance discourses regarding the essentiality of the arts, the presence of perspective highlighted Spain's intellectual preoccupation with the question – how do people see? Debates regarding optic theory were certainly not uncommon. Such theories usually found their textual inspiration from classical authors. For example, Plato's theory of extromission and Aristotle's later elaboration of intromission served as the basis of St. Augustine's hierarchical ranking of sight into corporeal, spiritual and intellectual. Later authors elaborated classical theory. Franciscan friar Roger Bacon, for example, posited the theory of "multiplication of species," while Peter Olivi, another Franciscan, as well as St. Bernard of Clairvaux emphasized the cooperation of the soul in the process of visual recognition.¹³ Spanish intellectuals elaborated on classical and medieval philosophers by addressing not only the physiological mechanisms of sight, but the spiritual and intellectual efficacy of the act of gazing. Such discussions were seen throughout the early modern period and often included prominent Spanish artists as well as their patrons.

Artist and intellectual Francisco Pacheco positioned himself at the forefront of these debates in seventeenth-century Seville. Just as the Colegio Mayor's procession emphasized the importance of Perspective, Pacheco's multi-volume treatise *El Arte de la*

¹³ Muir, *Ceremonial culture in Pre-Modern Europe*, 132.

Pintura highlighted the importance of proper artistic technique by stating, “So it is with the rest of the arts and sciences that when they are carried out by learned and excellent subjects they are greatly esteemed, whereas when they are carried out by the lowly and ignorant they are considered despicable and vile. So it is with painting, that it tends to be esteemed according to the knowledge and skill of its practitioners.”¹⁴

Pacheco’s emphasis on the power of images cannot be separated from his position as the official censor of sacred images to Seville’s inquisitorial tribunal. One of the chief concerns of the Spanish Inquisition during the seventeenth-century was discerning orthodoxy, especially in the formation of pedagogical models. The validity of sacred images was part of a larger Catholic preoccupation with streamlining popular religious practice. The post-Tridentine focus of the *Arte* highlighted the powerful devotional emphasis indicative of county-wide religious reform.¹⁵ Images, specifically devotional art, frequently met at the nexus of religious conflict. The sometimes violent Protestant rejection of religious iconography during the sixteenth-century prompted a detailed response during the final session of the Council of Trent in 1563. Pacheco’s work mirrored these concerns by reiterating famous artists’ representation of popular saints and sacred objects as well as the devotional efficacy of proper portrayals of Christ’s crucifixion.

Pacheco’s emphasis on technique was, therefore, an obvious elaboration on the question – how do people see? The *Arte*’s systematic approach to the proper formation of artwork suggested that Pacheco believed in a more fundamental question - how does the

¹⁴ Francisco Pacheco, *El Arte de la Pintura*, Book I, ed. Francisco J Sánchez Cantón (Madrid: Instituto de Valencia de D. Juan, 1956), 165.

¹⁵ Jeremy Roe, “The Preacher’s Perspicuitas and Velázquez’s ‘Truthful Imitation of Nature’: An Examination of Scholarly Attitudes to Religious Painting,” *Bulletin of Spanish Studies* 82, no. 4 (2005): 740.

act of creation influence *what* people see? Throughout the *Arte*, Pacheco attempted to delineate the specific “knowledge and skill” of a Christian artist through evidence of art’s efficacy and genealogies to antiquity. The method in which Pacheco crafts his justification for nobility is intriguing. He posited that the Christian artist, as well as their paintings, possessed intrinsic nobility. However, this nobility was not extended to every artist, or to every painting. It was only through proper technique, intention, and intellectual preparation that an artist could serve “the glory of God, our [artists] education, and the teaching of our neighbor.”¹⁶ The *Arte* methodically traced the artists, as well as his technique, through both Renaissance and classical exemplars and based claims of both art, as well as artists, nobility on the evidence gathered from these models.

Pacheco’s justification for artistic nobility has the potential to reveal much about the construction of historical memory in Seville. Pacheco bypassed the reality of artists’ background within the city and crafted an antique lineage not only for artists themselves but also the tools of their trade. The significance of Pacheco’s justifications is profound when compared to the construction of nobility by local elites, many of whom were patrons to Pacheco and the Sevillian academy. The city’s distance from the monarchy, elevated economic position, and overseas trade investments suggested that autonomy and legitimate political authority were an important element to Seville’s civic identity. Pacheco’s *Arte* thus reveals the networks at work in construction of the city’s past. It also exposes the tactics deployed by local authorities who wished to authenticate their role within the city, as well as the intellectual borrowing which occurred in elite circles in the formation of regional identity.

¹⁶ Pacheco, Book 1, 187.

Pacheco began his justification for artistic nobility by attaching the artists more thoroughly to the act of artistic creation and, consequently, devotion to both the church and the city. As post-Tridentine theology suggested, images were meant to inspire imitation and guide meditation. However, Pacheco based a painter's ability to create a true narration of abstract religious concepts on a methodical investigation of the subject at hand. Most certainly evoking the Aristotelian distinction between accident and substance, Pacheco stated "painting is not done by accident, but by the selection and art of the master. In order to move his hand to execution, an example or interior idea is needed. This resides in his imagination and understanding, and is drawn from the exterior and objective example."¹⁷ Pacheco's definition of a Christian artist was, thus, twofold. First, an artist must possess some form of natural skill from which to execute his trade. However, innate skill was not enough, as alone it remained accidental or impermanent. The defining feature of a true Christian artist was the intellectual preparation which occurred both before and during the act of creation, – what Pacheco referred to as "the imagination and understanding," but what could also be defined as the true substance, or essence, of a painting.

Pacheco's choice to accentuate intellectual preparation rather than natural ability highlights his deliberate attempt to valorize the physical act of painting, as well as reveal its close connection to classical intellectual models by defining them via classical theory. The essentiality of this process becomes clear to the reader only when it is in danger of being omitted. Because true understanding ultimately informed the finished product, if

¹⁷ Pacheco, Book I, 259.

such preparation was for some reason absent Pacheco stated that the artist's work could be considered "vile and without value."¹⁸

In an attempt to guide an artists' act of creation, Pacheco advocated for scholarly collaboration in the formation of devotional art. The *Arte* made the necessity of this close connection clear; "When they [artists] are asked for an antique or modern figure in history, they prepare themselves to point either by counsel from learned persons or by reading books, and thus forming their ideas; they fabricate whole from parts."¹⁹

Pacheco's systematic approach to the formation of pedagogical artwork was, therefore, based on evidentiary investigation. However, this objective could only be achieved through an intimate partnership with several classical disciplines. Pacheco himself often sought the counsel of scholars in the construction of his work. His painting *San Sebastian Attended by Saint Irene*, for example, was an intellectual collaboration with Francisco de Medina, a prominent Sevillian humanist whom Pacheco found useful in constructing devotional iconography.²⁰ In addition, years before the *Arte's* publication, Pacheco's *Libro de descripción de verdaderos retratos y memorable varones* commemorated local classical scholar, poets and theologians while simultaneously highlighting their close relationship to Sevillian artists. Local scholars such as Mal Lara and Fernando de Herrera also understood the efficacy of such collaboration. In their treatises which emphasized the necessity of a vibrant lettered community in Seville (Lara's *Filosofia vulgar* and

¹⁸ Pacheco, Book I, 187.

¹⁹ Pacheco, Book III, 2.

²⁰ Tanya J. Tiffany, "Visualizing Devotion in Early Modern Seville: Velázquez's Christ in the House of Martha and Mary," *Sixteenth Century Journal* 36, no. 2 (2005):448-49.

Herrera's *Anotaciones a Garcilaso*) both local scholars cited Pacheco's work as examples of this essential alliance.²¹

Pacheco's position as head of the Sevillian academy suggests the prominence and proliferation of his ideas in seventeenth-century Seville. The rise in popularity of academy training as apposed to traditional universities was a product of the dissolution of traditional Renaissance universities during the fifteenth- and sixteenth-centuries. As education become more socially desirable, institutions of learning become more diverse, incorporating regional branches of learning outside of traditional urban centers of intellectual activity. Such groups frequently modeled themselves after professional medieval guilds or confraternities and would meet informally to discuss pressing social or professional concerns. However, the integration of religious and political skepticism after Trent forced academies to take on a more institutional veneer – as was evident in the requisite oaths of allegiance to religious and political authorities during the late sixteenth-century.

Aided by the popularity of the printing press and the expansion of the educated class, these local academies became alternatives to university life for young intellectuals and created a forum through which ideas could be discussed, debated, and ultimately disseminated to the public. In light of their extreme localism, academies became an integral part of a city's social and political identity. Local artists, writers and intellectuals commented on prominent political and religious issues as well as established their credibility within the community. Usually headed by a leading member of the community

²¹ Juan Miguel Serrea, "Velazques and Sevillian Painting of his Time," in *Velázquez in Seville*, ed. Michael Clarke (Edinburgh: National Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, 1996), 38.

and financially supported by urban elites, local academies became local training grounds for young intellectuals.

The success of Pacheco's ideas about artistic nobility was largely dependent on both time and place. Though the Universities of Salamanca and Alcalá were essential to Spain's contemporary perception of proper intellectual training, seventeenth-century academies - such as the one headed by Pacheco - benefited from the deinstitutionalization of intellectual life and the decline of the traditional university system.²² Such local institutions were vital for the social stratification of cities such as Seville which were far from the imperial capital. Though Seville in no way lacked the religious flamboyance of Madrid, and Philip IV notably visited the city several times throughout his reign, it did not possess the innate privilege and prestige of the imperial court. The network of local and foreign nobility which accompanied the royal household in Madrid created indispensable social networks for artists, poets, musicians and playwrights; connections which were not easy accessible outside the imperial capital. The Sevillian academy effectively filled the vacuum created by the absence of court-based patronage networks. As will be discussed later, the potential social prestige of an active intellectual aristocracy did not escape local elites. The rivalry between patrons such as Don Fernando Enríquez Afán de Ribera, the Duke of Alcalá, and Gasper de Gunmán, Count of Olivares, often provided the funds necessary to promote Seville's elevated economic position within the empire, as well as their rightful place among other Spanish intellectual epicenters such as Toledo, Madrid and Salamanca.

²² Stephen Pumfrey and Paolo L. Rossi, *Science, culture and popular belief in Renaissance Europe*, ed. Maurice Slawinski (New York: St. Martin's University Press, 1994), 40-45.

Pacheco's emphasis on intellectual preparation in the process of creation was most prominent in the training of the Sevillian academy pupils. The early education of Pacheco's son-in-law Diego Velázquez serves as an example. Under his mentor's tutelage the young Velázquez studied anatomy, physiognomy, perspective, geometry, arithmetic, architecture, as well as the treatises of several Italian art historians; Giorgio Vasari's *Live of Famous Painters* and Leon Battista Alberti *De Pictura* being the most ardently observed.²³ Though Velázquez' natural artistic ability certainly had much to do with his success, his early training in both humanism and visual theory moved him out of the realm of a mere painter. Velázquez' vocation was thus noble because it allied itself with other honorable "professions of study," giving him a wider breath of knowledge from which to accurately produce models based real evidence. This intellectual collaboration was, according to Pacheco, what defined the artist as truly "noble and worthy of esteem."²⁴

Pacheco justified the legitimacy of his academy, as well as his own artistic nobility, on a methodical genealogy. For example, when discussing of the importance of naturalism in the formation of a painting Pacheco referred to the designs of the most skilled painters; "Raphael's own master Leonardo da Vinci, did this as well, following the example of the ancients. When he had to invent history, he first investigated all the appropriate and natural gestures of the figure, in accordance with his idea."²⁵ Pacheco weaved the connection between Renaissance technique, antique models, and contemporary Spanish artists throughout his work. Sometimes these examples included those within his own intellectual circle. Jusepe Ribera and Velázquez, for example, were

²³ John Moffitt, *Spanish Painting* (London: Studio Visa, 1973), 30-32.

²⁴ Pacheco, Book I, 188.

²⁵ Pacheco, Book I, 251.

adjoined to both Da Vinci and Michelangelo by the artists' similar stylistic preference for natural models as apposed to synthetic mannequins. However, Pacheco's emphasis on replication was not simply to promote the successful technique of famous artists such as Rafael or Michelangelo. Rather, the *Arte* intended to extend, quite literally, the prestige of antique and Renaissance culture into contemporary Sevillian society.

Pacheco's preoccupation with genealogy was not without precedent. Markers of Iberia's relationship with both Greece and Rome, as well as their Renaissance reinventions, were not altogether uncommon. Pilgrims throughout the countryside may have come in contact with antique milestones or ruins, or traversed roads constructed by Roman legions.²⁶ In fact, the very concept of *Hispania*, though a largely geographical term, had survived since the Roman Republic. Monarchs such as Charles V, Philip II and his grandson Philip IV sought to bolster popular international support in Europe by popularizing, and in some cases fabricating, the monarchy's connection to such artifacts. For example, Alfonso el Sabio's thirteenth-century *Crónica General* credited the founding of Seville to Hercules and Julius Caesar. In the sixteenth-century Charles V ordered the *Crónica* undergo revisions to more thoroughly match the Habsburg's royal genealogy and contemporary expansion into new territories.²⁷ By the seventeenth-century the popularity of Alfonso's revised history, as well as official royal histories such as Juan de Mariana's *Historia General* and Herrera y Tordesilla's *Discurso y tratado de la historia*, had effectively integrated into local claims to identity.²⁸

²⁶ Sabine MacCormack, *On the Wings of Time: Rome, the Incas, Spain, and Peru* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2007), 1-10.

²⁷ Richard Kagan, "Clio and the Crown: Writing History in Habsburg Spain" in *Spain, Europe and the Atlantic World: Essays in Honor of John H. Elliott*, eds. Richard Kagan and Geoffrey Parker (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 77.

²⁸ Kagan, *Clio and the Crown*, 80-81.

Like imperial authors, Pacheco's preoccupation with both evidence and classicism were integrated authenticating devices. The historical claims made by Pacheco, as well as many other Sevillian scholars, architects, and historians, had to be substantiated through verifiable evidence. In cases concerning the reconstruction of history, authors often placed the burden of proof on Spain's historic connection to antiquity and its posterior intellectual movement, the Renaissance. Antique artifacts such artwork and manuscripts, as well as the discovery of ancient relics, often provided the physical proof for the monarchy's untarnished genealogy as well as ample justification for Spain's contemporary success in the Americas. In additions to imperial claims to antiquity, local municipal governments encouraged the writings of local antiquarians and scholars as a way to bolster their city's place in Spain's expansive empire.

Seville's extensive architectural renovations in Renaissance classicism buttressed the regional histories which claimed ancestral ties to antiquity. Rodrigo Caro, inspector of churches and member of the Sevillian academy, wrote *Antigüedad y principado de Sevilla*, a local history which suggested the city, as well as its outlining provinces, had been surrounded by ancient Roman settlements. Caro spent his career in Seville reestablishing the route of Roman legions throughout Spain's southern most region and attempted to establish his home town of Utrera as one of the earliest Roman settlement in Iberia.²⁹ In addition, Pedro Medina, famed Sevillian cosmographer and historian, wrote various treatises on the classic art of navigation as well as antique histories such as *Libro de las grandezas o cosas memorables de España*.³⁰

²⁹ Jonathan Brown, *Images and Ideas in Seventeenth-Century Spanish Paintings* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1978), 35-36.

³⁰ Jonathan Brown, *Painting in Spain: 1500-1700* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998), 40-46.

Caro and Medina's work bares striking resemblance to other regional histories throughout Spain. Modern scholars have recently begun to explore the construction of regional history and the centrality of genealogy to the formation of civic identity during the early modern period. Richard Kagan's work on the construction of imperial and regional histories in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Spain lends some clarity to the subject. Kagan suggests that local histories provided an accessible framework from which different cities showcased their superiority and expressed their autonomy. By creating a common past, replete with local heroes and familiar folklore, regional authors aided in the cohesion of regional communities by promoting a common historical narrative that fit into Spain's expansive empire.³¹ Such narratives were often reconstructed during religious holidays and annual commemorations and also found their way in popular art, music and theatrical performances. These constructions created a civic culture which could be debated, displayed and often replicated.

Though there was much in Pacheco's work which outlined preferential artistic style, material, and technique the first book of the *Arte* possessed marked similarities to regional histories. The opening heading of the first book made this connection clear. Pacheco's initial heading claimed to highlight the *Antigüedad y Grandezas del Arte de la Pintura*. Not only was the heading *antigüedad y grandezas* a common introduction utilized by classical authors, but also gained significant polarity in imperial histories during the seventeenth-century. Regional communities, sometimes no larger than villages, often proclaimed their *antigüedad y grandezas*. Richard Kagan explores these authenticating tropes in the cases of Luis Alverez' seventeenth-century publication of

³¹ Richard Kagan, *Urban Images of the Hispanic World 1490-1793* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000), 15-21.

Grandeza, antigüedad y nobleza de Barco de Avila and La Alberca's regional publication *Verdadera relación y manifiesto apologético de la antigüedad de las Batuecas*. He suggests that, despite connections to imperial authority imbedded in the majority of regional historical constructions, authors primarily promoted local identity (*obligación del amor del patria*).³² In this sense, local elites and intellectuals were essential to the dissemination of regional identity. The task of reconciling of an often divergent historical reality to "untarnished" genealogies was often left to craftsmen like Pacheco.³³ The *Arte*'s descriptions of the *origen y antigüedad de la pintura* or the artist's *antigüedad y grandezas* suggests that Pacheco both recognized his central role in fostering this new historical narrative as well as understood the popular means to promote its nobility.

Pacheco highlighted these connections in the most minute details in the *Arte*. For example, Pacheco formulated instruments and technique around a genealogical rubric. In his chapter concerning "illumination, estofado, and fresco painting, its antiquity and durability" Pacheco mapped the discovery of *estofado*, a popular technique during the seventeenth-century, through the travels of several sixteenth-century Italian painters who were filled with "a fervent desire to disinter the works of the great painters of antiquity."³⁴ Pacheco led the young painters through the grottos of Saint Peter in Vincula and into the rumored underground Palace of Titus in which were found the vestiges of the technique. He then traced *estofado* through many "worthy men" of Italy, into the city of Úbeda, through the Alhambra in Granada, and onto the altar of St. Joseph in Seville's

³² Richard Kagan, *Clio and the Crown*, 93.

³³ Paula Findlen, "Possessing the Past: The Material World of the Italian Renaissance," *American Historical Review* 103, no. 83 (1998):97-98.

³⁴ Pacheco, Book III, 21.

own Casa Profesa.³⁵ In the same book Pacheco defined *tempera*, the popular technique of binding pigment in egg, as one of the most antique styles of painting. Like *estofado*, the *Arte* traced *tempera*'s antiquity through the works of Pliny, into the painting of famed Renaissance artists – Pacheco claimed that Michelangelo wept when he learned that contemporary painters had replaced the classic style for oil paints – and into the esteemed work of Córdoba's Pedro de Céspedes and Seville's Luis Vargas, men whom Pacheco suggested possessed the rarest virtue.³⁶

Though at first a seemingly excessive elaboration, the construction of *tempera* and *estofado*'s genealogy was extremely pragmatic. Sixteenth-century Sevillian artists were predominantly commissioned by the church, divided into guilds, and lived off the wages from their trade.³⁷ They were certainly skilled, but far from possessing the grand lineage envisioned by Pacheco's seventeenth-century Christian artist. Their tools and techniques were considered sign of their labor, not their lineage. The *Arte*'s genealogical emphasis shifted this paradigm. Tools such as paints and brushes became the instruments through which artists achieved their purpose, but were in no way meant to obscure the excellence of the profession. Like the theologian to homilies, astronomers to compasses, or lawyers to paper and ink, Pacheco argued, artists became connected to the tools of their trade not as commissioned laborers but as capable scholars and “supreme artisans.”³⁸

³⁵ Francisco Pacheco, “El Arte de la Pintura,” in *Artists' Technique in Golden Age Spain: six treatises in translation*, ed. and trans. Zahira Veliz (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1986), 56-59.

³⁶ Pacheco, Book III, 21-23.

³⁷ Peter Cherry, “Artistic Training and the Painters' Guild in Seville,” in *Velázquez in Seville*, ed. Michael Clarke (Edinburgh: National Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, 1996), 67.

³⁸ Pacheco, Book I, 176.

Seville's municipal authority well understood the centrality of the artist to their new civil aesthetic. Seville's city council made this sentiment clear when it convened in the summer of 1626 to discuss Francisco de Zurbarán's commission for several monastic houses. After a brief discussion regarding monetary compensation, council member Rodrigo Suárez stated "painting is not among the lesser ornaments of a republic, but rather one of the greatest."³⁹ Pacheco expressed a similar sentiment throughout his treatise. The opening lines of the *Arte*'s third book read "Oh, illustrious Artífices, honor of the Spanish nation!"⁴⁰ Pacheco's integration into Spain's larger imperial body suggests his awareness of Seville's elevated position within the monarchy. Indeed the success of many of his fellow artists and apprentices who moved throughout Spain during his lifetime would suggest the necessity of this integration. However, in a later chapter concerning "some marvelous effects" of painting Pacheco more decisively delineated the role of Sevillian painters by stating that they possess in "their right hand the veneration of their *patria*, through their exemplary work and blessed life."⁴¹ The centrality of the *patria* was, therefore, a mirror of Suárez' republic, a claim buttressed by both members of the Sevillian academy and the local aristocracy who hailed the city as a New Rome.⁴²

However, like many cities throughout Andalusia, the challenge to most historical reinterpretations was history itself. Amanda Wunder's work on classicism and the construction of imperial Seville explores renovations to architectural sites which contradicted the city's new civic aesthetic. Wunder skillfully navigates through various

³⁹ Brown, *Painting in Spain: 1500-1700*, 135.

⁴⁰ Pacheco, Book III, 1.

⁴¹ Pacheco, Book 1, 176.

⁴² Vicente Lleó Cañal, "The Great Babylon of Spain: Politics, Religion and Piety in the Seville of Velázquez" in *Velázquez in Seville*, ed. Michael Clarke (Edinburgh: National Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, 1996), 23.

public renovation projects and local treatises to explore the convergence of classicism, evidence, and the formation of local history in Seville during the early modern period. Her work suggests that the conversion of public spaces which retained obvious medieval Islamic overtones aided in transforming Sevillian's conception of the city's antique historical lineage. Imperial authors displayed a similar tactic. Richard Mann outlines how the local histories of Toledan authors Pedro Salazar de Mendoza and Francisco de Pisa, the former being patron and close personal friend to El Greco, posited Toledo as a new Jerusalem and attributed its founding to one of the lost tribes of Israel – though both authors were quick to point out that the city was one of the first antique communities to convert to Christianity.⁴³ Katie Harris' significant contribution to the recent discussion of civic identity in early modern Granada elucidates the centrality of proof to the construction of community history. Her analysis of Francisco Bermúdez de Pedraza's *Historia eclesiástica* illuminates the author's attempt to recast Granadan history by establishing verifiable connections between ancient local martyrs, the Virgin, and Saints Peter and James. Harris suggests that the goal of Bermúdez' historical revisions were not simply to falsify the past, but to “recast the history of the city...into a Christian mold [and] create links to a mythical Christian past.”⁴⁴

These links punctuated Seville's urban and intellectual landscape. The city adopted Hercules as the Padre de Sevilla, while statues of both he and Caesar stood atop large columns at the entrance to Alameda Park as well as the Ayuntamiento in the center of the city. Classical authors such as Plato, Aristotle, and Cicero set the foundation for

⁴³ Richard Mann, “El Greco and his Patrons: three projects,” in *The Word Made Image: religion, art and architecture in Spain and Spanish America, 1500-1600*, ed. Jonathan Brown (Boston: Trustees of the Isabel Stewart Gardner Museum, 1998), 46-47.

⁴⁴ Katie Harris, “Forging History: The Polmos of Sacromonte of Granada in Francisco Bermudez de Pedraza's *Historia Eclesiastica*,” *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 30, no. 4 (1999): 949.

discourse about civic justice and social order, and the construction of urban centers often mimicked classical urban blueprints. In addition, the diffusion of Renaissance style in building and renovation projects such as the Colegio Mayor de Santa María de Jesús, Ayuntamiento, Archivo General de Indias, and Alcázar gave the public everyday reminders of their incorporation into a history that stretched beyond the geographic and chronological boundaries of neighboring countries.⁴⁵

Pacheco's involvement in important beautification projects throughout the city certainly reinforced his role as an essential ornament of Seville's republic. His close association with devoted patron Don Fernando Enríquez Afán de Ribera, Duke of Alcalá, exemplified this connection. Ribera's family home – locally known as the Casa de Pilatos – functioned as one of Seville's most famous sites of pilgrimage. The site served as an exact replica of Christ's walk to Calvary and hosted thousands of pilgrims every year. Though the palace underwent several renovations in the early sixteenth-century by Ribera's father, Pacheco was an active participant in the Pilatos' decorative redesign in the seventeenth-century. Despite the palace's classic Mudéjar architecture, the great halls introduced thousands of visitors to Spain's renewed emphasis on authentic heritage. The interior of the Pilatos touted Romanesque triumphal arches and imported artifacts from Italy and the Holy Land. Both secular and religious institutions throughout the city served as the famed Stations of the Cross, and great statues and classic busts lined the house's long hallways and formed unbroken genealogies of early Christian emperors, Spanish

⁴⁵ The results of these efforts were evident. Treatises on classic architecture from artists such as Alonso Berruete, Diego Siloe and Pedro Machuca eventually became so popular that they replaced most, though not all, of the traditional Mudéjar manuals of the medieval period. See Earl Rosenthal, "The Diffusion of the Italian Renaissance Style in Western European Art," *Sixteenth Century Journal* 9 (1978): 37.

imperial authorities, and local elites.⁴⁶ Like the *Arte*'s Christian artist, the Pilatos' forwent its true heritage to adopt a new genealogical narrative, one based on fictive connections between the city, local elites and classic iconography.

Therefore, the Pilatos highlighted the value of the artist, as well as their patrons, in the creation of a new social reality. In Seville this dissemination was, indeed, a partnership. Local elites who based their social and political success on the prestige of material possessions and close ties to the city's foundation necessitated local scholars to sustain their status. However, antique artifacts were indeed difficult to acquire, as is evidenced by the fact that many of the pieces displayed in the Pilatos were imported. Many famed painters throughout the early modern period attempted to remedy this dearth by focusing on replications. Pacheco's focus on the fusion of contemporary culture and classical motifs, as well as his claimed connection to famed Renaissance artists, thus aided in this reshaping of Sevillian history by providing measurable proof of local exceptionalism.

For example, the main interior chamber of the Pilatos housed Pacheco's *Apotheosis of Hercules*, a multi-paneled piece which envisioned the ancient hero being received by the twelve Olympians. Art historians have recently commented on the painting's stylistic similarity to Michelangelo's Last Judgment, an imitation that can be seen most specifically in the extreme definition of Hercules' bare legs and back.⁴⁷ Not unlike other urban centers throughout Iberia, Sevillians had a long standing relationship

⁴⁶ Amanda Wunder, "Classical, Christian, and Muslim Remains in the Construction of Imperial Seville 1520-1635," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 64, no. 2 (2003): 197-202.

⁴⁷ Despite the obvious allegorical nature of the *Apotheosis* the painting presented a surprisingly unorthodox overtone. This fact was never directly addressed by Pacheco in the *Arte*, though he did have brief technical notes on the painting itself. The subject has garnered surprisingly little debate among contemporary historians. See G. Kunoth, "Pacheco's Apotheosis of Hercules," *The Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 27 (1964): 337.

with the Herculean legend. In the thirteenth-century, Alfonso el Sabio's *Crónica General* reported that the hero had crossed a great ocean and landed on the future site of Seville. Bound by a prophecy that someone greater than himself would found the city, Hercules erected six marble columns which would serve as a marker to this great leader. According to Alfonso, Julius Caesar, while serving out his quaestorship in *Hispania*, discovered Hercules' six columns and founded the city on the spot. In the sixteenth-century two of the columns were rediscovered by local antiquarians and the city underwent a massive reconstruction project which placed them at the entrance of Alameda Park. This genealogy was substantiated by seventeenth-century authors such as Luis de Pereza who also claimed that the city was founded by Julius Caesar in the first century BC.⁴⁸

It was, therefore, no coincidence that Ribera claimed an ancestry which positioned his family in prominent positions in Seville since Caesar's earliest campaigns in the region. The classic busts which lined the hallways of the Pilatos sustained this assertion. From the fifth-century onward, many in the Alcalá family begun to claim direct descent from Hercules, some going so far as to adorn their family seal with the ancient hero's portrait. These claims were not unique. Regional authors throughout Spain posited the founding of their cities to Hercules, Caesar, Tubal (the grandson of Noah) or other ancient iconic figures. These genealogies were essential in promoting the antique status of the city as well as legitimizing the power of local nobility. Characteristically, Pacheco's devotion to establishing the Alcalá family's public perception was meticulous. For example, despite the painting's obvious genealogical reference, the piece was composed

⁴⁸ Kunothe, 138.

entirely in classic *tempera*; a fact which was an undoubtedly subtle allusion to the family's authentic antique heritage.

Just as the Pilatos visually personified Spanish history, so did the true Christian artist convey identity through a finished product. In other words, if an artist was in fact quantifiable then his work must also be identifiable. For example, during the canonization of Fernando III, Sevillian artists Francisco López Caro and Bartolomé Esteban Murillo, both of whom were well acquainted with Pacheco and his academy, were asked to gather evidence in order to assess the validity of Fernando's cult in the city. The king's legendary thirteenth-century conquest of much of Andalusia gave the matter a particular significance to Sevillians. The exhaustive campaign included investigations into the style and technique of frescos, woodcarvings, embroidery, prints, colors, and borders as well as physical descriptions such as costume and hairstyle. When completed, the two artists presented their findings via sworn testimony at the archbishop's palace. The process took almost three years to complete.⁴⁹ The broad range of materials analyzed within the investigation suggests that the *Arte*'s emphasis on style, as well as tools and technique, had practical application in assessing devotional value. Surely guided by the criteria established in the Congregation of Rites, the artist's process of sanctification cited proofs and the utilization of evidence as the most effective modes of discernment.⁵⁰ The decision to include López and Murillo also reflected this systematic approach. The two were chosen not only because they possessed the knowledge of medieval and contemporary

⁴⁹ Amanda Wunder, "Murillo and the canonisation case of San Fernando, 1649-52," *Burlington Magazine* 143 (2001):674-675.

⁵⁰ For more on the Congregation of Rites, as well as the post-Tridentine emphasis on discerning sanctity, see Anne Jacobson Schutte, *Aspiring Saints: Pretense of Holiness, Inquisition, and Gender in the Republic of Venice, 1618-1750* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001), 71.

art, but because they were considered intellectual descendents of many of the artists whose pieces they appraised.⁵¹

In conclusion, claims to civic superiority were ubiquitous in seventeenth-century Seville. Public processions promoted religious and civic allegiance, regional and imperial authors posited new Spanish histories, while beautification projects infused the urban landscapes with classical architectural motifs. The artwork of Pacheco and his academy worked in concert with such projects and provided the devotional tools necessary for the overall health of a *Republica Christiania*. Because of this close alliance, Pacheco's emphasis on evidence and genealogy as the justification for intrinsic nobility became not simply a rubric from which to assess monetary value or contemporary artistic preference. His work was part of a larger discursive movement which attempted to fortify contemporary Spanish identity by allying it with antiquity. The discourses which underpinned Pacheco's notions of community, as well as the public mechanisms established to disseminate them, will be the subject of the following chapter.

⁵¹ Wunder, *Burlington Magazine*, 673.

Chapter 2:

***Autos de Fe* and Expressions of Civic Order in Spanish Visual Culture**

In 1522 Alejo Fernandez, a Flemish born artist residing in Seville, was commissioned to paint the *Virgen de los Navegantes*. The destination of the three paneled piece was Seville's Alcázar, home of the *Casa de Contratación*, Spain's official commercial and administrative center for trade with the Americas. The base of the dominant middle panel exemplified both the size and variation of Spain's extensive armada. Above the vessels stood prominent Spanish and Italian explorers and imperial authorities from the fifteenth-century and beyond. To both the right and the left of Charles V stood explorers such as Christopher Columbus and the Pinzón brothers, cartographers Américo Vespucio and Juan de la Cosa, as well as the first treasurer of the *Casa de Contratación*, Sancho de Matienza. The assembly was surrounded by four lateral boards which depicted Saints James, Sebastián, and Telemo. Similar to later paintings by Pacheco and Velázquez, and modeled after the iconic Virgin of the Kings, an enlarged portrait of the Virgin Mary dominated the uppermost section of Fernandez' painting. Depicted in a modest black robe and arms outstretched, the Virgin's extended cloak covered both the recognizable secular authorities as well as several unidentified followers who faded into the black of the her outstretched garment.

The *Virgen de los Navegantes* serves as an example of the utilization of visual culture by Spanish authorities during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries. The coalescence of religious and imperial themes in Fernandez' three-paneled painting highlighted the close relationship between religious orthodoxy and imperial identity. The visual representation of this alliance was essential during the formative years after the Council of Trent. However, as the previous chapter emphasized, the deep connection

between models of imitation and the overall health of the *patria* were intimately connected. Though the writings of prominent Spanish and Italian intellectuals certainly remained the primary textual authority regarding Spanish history and civic organization, images became an important channel through which such discourses found practical application. Therefore, in addition to the symbolic representation of imperial authority and Catholic orthodoxy promoted by domestic artists, this chapter will explore additional channels through which local identity was promoted. To accomplish this, a combination of popular visual and textual representations of ideal civic communities will be explored to highlight the overlap between discourses regarding civic order and the promotion of visual models.

Autos de fe was one of the largest and most prolific public events of the early modern Catholic world. By evoking the same religious and imperial themes prevalent in popular artwork such as the *Virgin de los Navegantes*, the elaborate public trials and processions operated as models of legal justice and social hierarchy. These images became a vehicle through which the local inquisitorial tribunal bolstered support in the community. They also provided opportunities for secular civic authorities to showcase their central role in a city's social hierarchy.

The city of Seville provides a useful vantage from which to explore the full utility of *autos de fe* in an early modern urban setting. Though slightly rivaled by imperial centers, Seville remained a bastion of the elaborate *autos*, celebrating almost sixty trials, in varying degrees of opulence, throughout the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries.⁵² However, despite the city's frequent utilization of the trials, modern scholarship is still faced with substantial dearth in translation regarding contemporary accounts for the city

⁵² E.N. Adler, "Auto de Fe and Jew," *Jewish Quarterly Review* 13, no. 3 (1901): 402-423.

of Seville. For this reason, the textual sources for this chapter will rely on the *relaciones* of other imperial centers such as Madrid, Toledo and, most significantly, Mexico City. Though a comparative study of the deployment of *autos* between imperial cities across the Atlantic would certainly be intriguing, the focus of this work is the construction and reinforcement of historical memory in Seville. City officials' renovations to public spaces, as well as textual fabrications of local history, suggests that Seville's *autos* would have been markedly similar to that of other imperial centers. Also, surviving *relaciones* of *autos*, both imperial and polemical, are strikingly similar in regards to the construction of the processions, arenas and public trials. Therefore, despite the regional variation which may exist in each account, *autos* possessed a similarly discernable visual vocabulary. These similarities were undoubtedly deliberate, as the *autos*' message were meant to be transparent and accessible to everyone, regardless of education or social status. It is the complexity behind these transparent expressions that the following will work to deconstruct.

Despite recent cultural historians' interest in the social impact of ritual culture, modern historiography regarding *autos de fe* is often tempered as a segregated religious study.⁵³ Of course *autos* contained numerous didactic valences, and chief among them was the suppression of heterodoxy. However, modern historiographic analysis has often failed to address the tandem promotion of Catholic authority and civic identity present in the visual vocabulary of the trial. This chapter will, therefore, offer an addition to recent

⁵³ See Francisco Bethencourt, "The Auto da Fé: Ritual and Imagery," *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 55 (1992): 155-168. Also see Maureen Flynn, "Mimesis of the Last Judgment: The Spanish Auto de fe," *Sixteenth Century Journal* 22, no. 2 (1991): 281-297. Also see Denise Helena Monteiro de Barros Carollo, "Auto-Da-Fé: A ceremony more than just words," *Revista de la Inquisición* 8 (1998):133-120.

scholarship, suggesting that the staging of events such as the *autos de fe* solidified the alliance between religion and politics, or civic devotion and Catholic orthodoxy, both of which were chief concerns among civil authorities. However, the vocabulary of the *autos* were, like most public events, specific to time and place. Therefore this chapter will propose a reevaluation of the *autos de fe* to include the larger context in which the public spectacles were performed.

Under the Habsburgs, Seville emerged as one of the preeminent urban centers of the early modern world. The city held the position as administrative seat for the *Casa de Contratación*, a status which ensured imperial interest, as well as foreign wealth, throughout the early modern period. Immigrants from throughout Iberia, as well as well as Italy, France and Flanders relied on the monetary benefits of extensive commercial trade with the Americas. Trade also produced a powerful merchant nobility, whose influence and monetary capabilities stretched to both sides of the Atlantic. Contemporary authors called it ‘not a city, but a world,’ and local authors such as Rodrigo Caro and Francisco Pacheco often cited the city’s importance to Spanish imperial authority in local histories. In addition, earlier imperial authors such as Alfonso el Sabio also cited the early Muslim capitulation in the thirteenth-century as a marker of the city’s central role in the Reconquest. However, the city of Seville was somewhat contradictory. Not unlike its urban Andalusian neighbors, the architectural landscape of Seville remained exceptionally varied. The classic Mudéjar architecture of the Mezquita of Córdoba, the Alhambra of Granada, as well as the Alcázar in the heart of Seville were visual markers of what was perceived as Islamic imperialism.

The city's population also varied. The colossal need for cheap labor brought thousands of slaves from Africa and created a somewhat contentious ethnic and religious diversity in a city otherwise dominated by western Europeans. In addition, rapid urbanization brought its own consequences. Transient laborers, housemaids, sailors, swindlers and other non-mercantile professionals presented significant challenges to a city which lacked any centralized *hermandad*.⁵⁴ In an attempt to combat the perceived threats to social order the monarchy, as well as the local aristocracy, relied on the permanent inquisition tribunal established in they city by Ferdinand and Isabella in the late fifteenth-century.

The announcement of an *auto de fe* was in no way discreet. Musicians paraded through the streets with trumpets and kettle drums while a cadre of local religious and secular authorities on horseback announced the impending spectacle. The real preparation for the event, however, began months prior. Evocative of the emphasis placed on community in Spanish processional culture, city officials contracted local guilds and confraternities for the construction of the massive arenas. The raised theater usually included three to four elevated mobile stages for optimum visibility. The first floors contained private dining halls for the elites, private confessionals, and secret passage ways for royal authorities, local nobility, visiting dukes and duchesses and other distinguished guests.⁵⁵ To add to the visual splendor, the platforms showcased paintings, tapestries, gigantic crosses and effigies, all of which attracted visitors and pilgrims for weeks before the official commencement. Evening prayers and devotionals around the

⁵⁴ See chapter on "Lawmen and Crooks" in Mary Elizabeth Perry, *Crime and Society in Early Modern Seville* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1980), 54-75.

⁵⁵ *Early Modern Spain: A Documentary History*, ed. Jon Cowans trans. Hans J. Hillerbrand (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003), s.v. "An Auto de Fe," 55-56.

Inquisition's green cross the evening before the event lasted well into the night. To accommodate the influx of thousands of visitors, city official established communal dining halls in public buildings and commandeered local houses as sleeping quarters.

On the day of the event, cathedral procession began in the morning, and often lured spectators to the city square as early as 4 o'clock with elaborate crosses illuminated by hundreds of lit candles. Comprised of the same amalgam of secular and religious authorities as the previous announcement procession, the coalition of religious and secular authorities emerged on the cathedral steps in accordance with their social rank. Following the esteemed brigade, men and women condemned by the Holy Office appeared, accompanied by inquisitorial familiars which numbered as many as "two to three hundred men, equipped with lances, well dressed and decorated."⁵⁶ Those who had escaped the punishment of the Holy Office were represented in lifelike effigies, one chronicler noting "such unique artistry and propriety that they could almost be taken for the original so great were their likeness."⁵⁷ To ensure equal justice for both the living and the dead, the bodies of individuals expired during their stay in the inquisitorial prison were exhumed. Their coffins, elaborately decorated, were hoisted on the shoulders of church officials and marched through the streets, side by side with the living.

Though often produced for polemical purposes, the surviving pictorial representations of victims can still reveal much about the rich vocabulary on which visual degradation relied. The condemned often wore miters decorated with flames and devils. If prisoners lacked a miter, their heads and feet were bare. Some held small green crosses or an unlit candle meant to symbolize the extinguished light of Christ. Almost all were

⁵⁶ Hillerbrand, 57.

⁵⁷ Mathias de Bocanegra, *Jews and the Inquisition of Mexico: The Great Auto de fe of 1649 as related by Mathias de Bocanegra*, trans. and ed. Seymour B. Liebman (Laurence: Coronado Press, 1974), 61-62.

subjected to the infamous *sanbenito*, which ranged in color and variation in accordance with the severity of the crime.⁵⁸ The legendary regalia was often decorated with flames, devils, scripture, and painted portraits of the unrepentant's face or body engulfed in the fire and smoke of a pyre. One author noted "*sanbenitos* decorated with flames and figures of demons, which appeared also on the *corozas*...with snakes and serpents all around. All these things indicated the great number of signs of being condemned to the infernal fire..."⁵⁹ These intricacies spoke directly to onlookers. They communicated the severity of the crime, intended sentence, and the reality of eternal punishment. As a reinforcement of the dangers of heretical activity the victims' *sanbenitos* often hung in the local church for years after their prescribed sentence.⁶⁰

Once in the theater, sermons highlighted the victory of Christ over heresy and reiterated the essentiality of the Spanish Inquisition to the spiritual health of the monarchy. After the sermon, the onlookers recited the Nicene Creed while choir music played in the background and candles burned around the massive crosses. After completing the oath of allegiance to the Holy Office a member of the local tribunal read the victim's offences to the crowd. As to publicly complete the full sacrament of penance, and convince the crowd of Christ's victory over sin, the physical act of satisfaction was immediately announced. These most often included punishments in the form of exclusion from public office, lashes, monetary fines, imprisonment, scouring, excommunication, *sanbenitos*, or compulsory service the Armada's galley or community hospitals.⁶¹

⁵⁸ Marvin Lunenfeld, "Pedagogy of Fear: Making the Secret-Jew Visible at the Public Autos de Fe of the Spanish Royal Inquisition," *Shofar: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Jewish Studies* 18, no. 3 (2000): 85.

⁵⁹ Bocanegra, 63.

⁶⁰ *Inquisition Reader 1478-1614: An Anthology of Sources*, ed. and trans. Lu Ann Homza (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc., 2006), s.v. "Public auto de fe celebrated in the city of Granada on the feast of the Ascension of Our Lord, Jesus Christ, May 27, 1593," 258-59.

⁶¹ Compulsory service in local hospital became more common in the seventeenth century.

The extravagant arena and hierarchical procession of *autos de fe* were evocative of similar religious and civic festivals of medieval and early modern Spain. Annual celebrations created powerful corporate experiences which were an important part of the city's ritual calendar. The *autos sacramental* were mainstays of Seville's sixteenth- and seventeenth-century visual culture. Processions such as Corpus Christi, Palm Sunday, and Holy Thursday created familiar mediums from which onlookers were physically connected with abstract dogmas. Led by church officials, these stages crowded urban streets with lifelike effigies and moving marionettes.⁶² The processions allegorically personified doctrines of humanity, grace, faith, and transubstantiation and effectively connected the individual onlooker to a world from which, prior to the sixteenth-century, they had been largely excluded.⁶³

Spanish monarchs were known for their theatrical proclivity and often provided links between religious orthodoxy and political authority with their grandiose festivals. Of course, civic festivals were evident as early as the thirteenth-century when Fernando III's Reconquest subjugated much of Iberia to Christian rule. However, sixteenth- and seventeenth-century festival patrons witnessed a considerable shift toward the unification of religious and political themes. Castilian festivals often celebrated the triumph of Christianity over the Moorish faith by touting actors dressed as Muhammad and the King of Morocco, both pitted in an elaborate battle against Christian knights. The end of the parody, which often lasted three to four hours in the city's public square, concluded with

⁶² See chapter on "Processional Sculpture" in Susan Verdi Weber, *Art and Ritual in Golden-Age Spain: Sevillian Confraternities and the Processional Sculpture of Holy Week* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press: 1998), 57-110.

⁶³ Bruce Wardropper, "The Search for a Dramatic Formula for the Auto Sacramental," *PMLA* 65, no. 6 (1950): 1200-1202.

the avowal and theatrical baptism of both Muhammad and a defeated Moroccan King.⁶⁴ Additionally, Granada's sixteenth-century Toma Festival celebrated the city's political and religious victory over Muslim kingship in 1492 by holding an annual civic procession and festival. The celebration usually included extravagant royal processions from the local cathedral to the town plaza and ended in community activities such as shared feasts and bull fighting.⁶⁵

The pedagogical synchronism of the *autos sacramental*, civic processions, and the *autos de fe* highlight civic authority's belief in the connection between aestheticism and internal devotion. This belief found significant elaboration in the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries due to post-Tridentine notions of aesthetic piety. Spanish intellectuals often emphasized the deep connection between external and internal piety. In his comprehensive instruction manual for young women, Juan Luis Vives advocated for proper education as the basis for spiritually healthy young women and the health of society as a whole. Devotional mnemonics also emphasized the spiritual art of memory in which individuals practiced visualizing images worthy of imitation. Seville's own Diego Velázquez' famous early seventeenth-century paintings personified the art of contemplation by highlighting recognizable faces, scenarios, and themes, many of which conformed to acceptable models of imitation.⁶⁶

Though civic and religious festivals throughout the early modern world can provide the ritual landscape surrounding *autos de fe*, they cannot serve as the guiding

⁶⁴ Teofilo Ruiz, "Elite and Popular Culture in Late Fifteenth Castilian Festivals: The Case of Jaen," in *City and Spectacle in Medieval Europe*, eds. Barbra A. Hanawalt and Kathryn L Reyerson (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1997), 296-97.

⁶⁵ Katie Harris, *From Muslim to Christian Granada: Inventing a City's Past in Early Modern Spain* (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2007), 88-107.

⁶⁶ Tiffany, 433-453.

model. Festivals such as those celebrating Reconquest annually commemorated specific religious events or landmarks in a city's history. Their meaning was set and interruption or adaptation was usually unwelcome. Conversely, *autos de fe* had no fixed event which anchored its significance. Rather, celebrations drew ritual meaning from their easily decipherable message, one which could adapt and change according to local need. The celebration's change over time bears this theory out. For example, an *auto* celebrated in Toledo in 1486 touted over 700 reconciliations during one festival. The author described the procession as efficient and noted the quick progression from the church of St. Peter Martyr to the cathedral. With little ceremony the author recounted the delivery of the sermon, reading of offences and publicly allotted penance. The ordeal was concluded by two in the afternoon.⁶⁷ Later authors describe a more dynamic atmosphere. A 1649 Mexico City narrative noted "the galaxy of invitees including the princes, the magistrates, the clergy, the religious, the tribunes, the judges, and the people of quality... There were numberless crowds from all the cities... To see such care in supplying provisions, such lavishness in expense, such richness in splendor."⁶⁸ A 1680 description of an *auto* celebrated in Madrid described grand processions, raised amphitheatres, precursory singing of Psalms, masses celebrated throughout the night and the many ambassadors, nobility, gentry and ladies of quality who appeared in the balconies.⁶⁹

Contemporary pictorial representations suggest that the visual availability of the procession, sermon and public reconciliations were the most important elements of the celebration. Pedro Berruguete famous late fifteenth-century painting *Auto-da-fé* was an

⁶⁷ Helen Rawlings, *The Spanish Inquisition* (Madlen: Blackwell Publishing, 2006), 37-41.

⁶⁸ Bocanegra, 53.

⁶⁹ Henry Kamen, *The Spanish Inquisition: A Historical Revision* (London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 1997), 208-09.

early version of this perception. His painting emphasized the presence of Dominicans in the celebrations by placing members of the order, most prominently St. Dominic, in elevated scaffolding. Occupying only a small space on the right side of the painting, two unrepentant heretics - deemphasized by their extreme miniaturization - await execution. Additionally, Francisco Rizi's famous painting of an *auto de fe* celebrated in Madrid's Plaza Mayor in 1680 favored the festive atmosphere, esteemed guests, and elaborate scaffolding rather than those being publicly sentenced. Rizi depicted no executions.

Both Berrugete and Rizi's paintings suggest that even as early as the late fifteenth-century the focus of *autos de fe* varied much more than images promoted by popular polemicists, who focused primarily on the extreme, often frenzied eradication of heterodoxy, would have believed. Though not always absent from Spanish pictorial representations, executions and extreme bodily mortification were not the central theme of most visual accounts.⁷⁰ The reason for their exclusion was simple. The unrepentant represented a failure of the church to reconcile the sinner to the greater Christian community. The failure was not only in the eyes of the church but also city officials who based their claim to legitimacy on the health of their community, or *patria*.

However, contemporary representations did not totally preclude the victim in descriptions or images of the celebrations. Rather than depicting those on display as physically broken or burned, individuals in the processions and public trials were more often portrayed as intentionally separate from the community. As noted previously, local officials and church officials spent much time fashioning attire that spoke to onlookers regarding crimes against the *patria*. This vocabulary manifested most specifically during the initial cathedral procession. Inverted models of imitation during the march from the

⁷⁰ This vocabulary becomes more complex when analyzing polemical accounts.

cathedral to the main theater created an essential pedagogical mnemonic. To prepare onlookers for the transformation, the inquisitorial tribunal cloistered the condemned for months before their appearance on the cathedral steps. When they finally emerged on the steps of the cathedral, the prisoners, divorced from their traditional role as friend, neighbor, or family member, stood unprotected from onlookers. Men, women and children received the same punishments. As they walked the streets bare headed they lacked any visual indication of their previous status. In its place, they wore a *sanbenito* indicating only their crime and possibly their punishment. The representation was deliberate. Those in the procession became not only purveyors of heterodoxy but a visual tear in the social fabric of Sevillian identity. They were segregated strangers, their actions shunned, their physical person objectified as well as rejected by local authority and their previous community. They were, in essence, the personification of a non-citizen, the model or inverse of proper civic order presented by the initial procession. Therefore, this display communicated an ideal community by creating its inverse. Or, more plainly, *autos* created a powerful visual model of activities which were not acceptable components of the city's larger corporate body. Popular discourse about ideal civic organization elucidated the meaning of this mnemonic.

By the seventeenth-century, Spanish intellectuals considered cities as centers of civilized life. Definitions of civility were based most notably on classical models, the adoption of Aristotle's polis or *respublica* to the Christian models promoted by Augustine and Aquinas being the most prominent examples. This type of urban classification was not distinctly Spanish. Italian humanists Matteo Palmieri had long advocated for the public promotion of the Aristotelian concept of the *bene comune* as the

basis for both secular and religious authority in the public sphere.⁷¹ As *El Arte de la Pintura* suggests, Spanish intellectuals believed Spain to be the rightful heir to an ancient imperial legacy, and thus possessed a natural political obligation to its citizens. City officials, as well as imperial authorities, maintained this citizenry through a close alliance between political order and aesthetic piety. The *Arte*'s justification for nobility indicated the necessity of constructing guidelines for hierarchy and social status through art. Pacheco accomplished this by adopting the same standard which applied to scholarly discourses about civic and religious order. Just as a *Republica Christiana* was guided by classical texts and exemplar, the *Arte*'s ideal community was based on an ordered set of laws. According to these guiding principles, a true Christian artist would naturally create intrinsically noble artwork because he adhered to a codified body of rules which were handed down by the ancients and adopted to contemporary technique.

Law, order and morality were some of the many benefits of living in an urban setting – or *policía*. A contemporary critical definition can provide further clarification. As defined in the *Tesoro de la lengua castellana*, *policía* emphasized the well-being of the community over the individual.⁷² The suppression of the individual for the interest of the community was only guaranteed by the rigorous promotion of civic order, which was manifested in the establishment of laws and enforcement of customs. Therefore *policía* represented ideal individual behavior and suggested an acceptance of membership in a community through the adherence of communal laws.⁷³

⁷¹ Michelle Fontaine, "For the Good of the City: The Bishop and the Ruling Elite in Tridentine Modena," *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 28, no. 1 (1997):31-32.

⁷² Richard Kagan, *Urban Images of the Hispanic World 1490-1793*, 27-28.

⁷³ Kagan, 28.

The definition of membership within a community began with Aristotelian philosophy. In *Politica* Aristotle made the marked distinction between the city dweller (*politicus*) and the non-city dweller (*rusticulus*), suggesting the former to be a naturally superior “political animal” while the latter remained a “tribeless, lawless...natural outcast” and “lover of war.”⁷⁴ The *Tesoro de la lengua castellana* notes the early modern adaptation of the Latin *rusticulus* as villain (*rústico*).⁷⁵ The evolution of the etymology between *rusticulus* (an individual who lives outside of a community) and *rústico* (an individual who is defined as a social outcast or criminal) is intriguing. Both distinctions underpinned the idea that a city was defined not by geography, but a legitimate political community. To be part of the community meant the adoption and adherence to “civilized” law and a commitment to a range of political rights and legal obligations.⁷⁶ To be separate from this political community, as both definitions suggest, meant to be separate from civilized culture, or an ordered hierarchical urban center. This type of classification is often deployed in contemporary scholarship regarding Spain’s expansive colonies, however, sixteenth- and seventeenth-century authors’ use of Aristotelian tropes in Spanish vernacular regarding the urban tribeless, lawless natural outcast (*rústico*) suggests its nuance was not lost on those living in urban centers in Spain. Banishment or perpetual infamy via *sanbenitos* created an urban “natural outcast” by ensuring ostracism from urban social and political life. One author noted “And that they were not to become moneychangers, shopkeepers, or grocers or hold any official post whatsoever. And they were not to wear silk or scarlet or colored cloths or gold or silver or pearls or coral or any

⁷⁴ Aristotle, *Politics*, (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Library, 2001), <http://etext.virginia.edu/toc/modeng/public/AriPoli.html>.

⁷⁵ See Sebastián de Covarrubias, *Tesoro de la lengua castellana o española* (1611; fac. Ed., Madrid, 1979), 1418.

⁷⁶ Edward Muir, *Ritual in Early Modern Europe* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 232.

jewels. Nor could they stand as witness.”⁷⁷ Therefore, the stigma of someone who participated in an *auto de fe*, or whose name hung alongside a *sanbenito* in the city’s cathedral, created what Aristotle called “the worst of all” – a man who was “separated from law and justice” because of his unwillingness to adhere to the natural political order.

The demographic makeup of those placed in *autos de fe* in Seville highlight the individuals whom secular and religious authorities felt had turned away from their communal obligation. Though tribunals throughout the early sixteenth-century were largely preoccupied with clandestine *morisco* and *converso* populations, the seventeenth-century presented a demographic more inline with the problems of rapid urbanization.

Statistics of those placed on trial in Seville during the sixteenth-century suggest that well over half of those convicted were charged with either morality infractions or some other heterodoxy besides practicing Judaism.⁷⁸ These types of crimes were often a direct result of Seville’s burgeoning trade with the Americas. The extended absence of spouses on trading ventures, the influx of unskilled transients, and the constant coming and going of trade vessels and their crew made morality offences such as bigamy and prostitution a prominent concern for the city. Seville’s role as the center for all sea trade also left the city vulnerable to reformed theology and foreign religious practices from abroad, both of which threatened civic and religious influence within the city. Though the local inquisitorial tribunal was concerned chiefly with religious offences, there was a trend toward changing the descriptions of secular offences to fit into the rubric of moral transgressions. For example, common lay expressions such as *gente de mal vivir*, meaning ‘bad people’, or *refianes*, translated quite literally into ‘thugs’, were often

⁷⁷ Bocanegra, 72.

⁷⁸ Adler , 402-419.

commandeered by Seville's church officials to describe moral offences.⁷⁹ Certainly almost all public *autos* performed in the city during the seventeenth-century included individuals suspect of practicing Judaism or Islam, however secular crimes also became a preoccupation due to their mounting frequency. The appropriation of language allowed the tribunal to work in concert with secular authorities, as well as to solidify the intrinsic connection between religious orthodoxy and proper civic order.

The perceived consequence of exclusion or separation from the community due to improper behavior manifested both during and after the ritual shaming of the *autos*. Banishment, or perpetual infamy within the community, was a common punishment during the *autos* formative years (the latter usually included wearing the *sanbenito* for a set period of time after which it would hang in the local cathedral as a reminder of their crime). There were several cues which signaled concerns over local identity in this particular punishment. Besides the crime, a *sanbenito* would often note not only an individual's crime but also their city of origin. *Relaciones* conveyed similar information, though usually embellishing the circumstances which led the individual's appearance in the *auto*. Not surprisingly, the city which performed the *auto de fe* rarely claimed many of the victims as *naturales*, even if they had been residing in the city when the crime was committed. When the attire finally retired to the local cathedral the conceptual separation from the community remained. The participant's place of birth, current residence and place of death (if appropriate) were noted either on the garment or a small placard beneath as a means of noting the entire family's perpetual exclusion.

⁷⁹ See chapter on "The Underworld" in Ruth Pike, *Aristocrats and Traders: Sevillian Society in the Sixteenth Century* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1972), 192-214. Also see Mary Elizabeth Perry, *Crime and Society in Early Modern Seville* (New Hampshire: The University Press of New England, 1980), 19.

To make this separation clear a personification of ideal civil authority followed the initial cathedral procession. The parade possessed a striking similarity in most sixteenth- and seventeenth-century accounts, even polemical ones. To commemorate the craftsmanship of the scaffolding, the procession began with those who either funded or built the theater, usually members of the local guild. Following guild members were members of the local orders, followed by high ranking secular and religious authorities. The parade began with “Ministers and clergymen of the Inquisition on horseback...followed by a sumptuous and most solemn accompaniment of nobility...then came the Consulate...the Royal University...and crowning this magnificent hierarchy was the...Calificador of the Holy Office”⁸⁰ Nobility and local imperial representatives were given the task of holding the standard of the Inquisition. Standard bearers often maintained the position from year to year and passed it down to family members upon the death of a patriarch. Authors often noted the bearers’ ancestral history and claimed them as “hereditary protectors” of the city.⁸¹

Lavish descriptions of the cathedral procession were essential to most contemporary *relaciones* and pictorial representations. As David Kertzer aptly notes “beauty, like pain, aids memory.”⁸² *Autos de fe* uniquely contained both. The visual shaming of those convicted by the Inquisition was made more compelling by their proximity to ornate representations of civic and religious authority. In this way, the prisoners were necessary to the event’s overall message. Their crimes, made public by the *sanbenitos* and sentencing, proved the essentiality of the city’s tribunal to civic order. However, the notable presence of local and imperial authority in the procession

⁸⁰ Bocanegra, 66.

⁸¹ Bocanegra, 67.

⁸² David Kertzer, *Ritual, Politics and Power* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988), 175.

personified the notion that civic harmony relied on an alliance between religious and secular officials. The procession's parade around prominent landmarks such as the cathedral, administrative buildings and center square - physical locations which defined the city as truly urban and thus possessing a natural political order - reified this message. Exposing the public to the danger of living outside civic order, the procession and public trials acted as both a model *of* and model *for* civic harmony. Its simplistic message created an opportunity wherein the individual became the community and power of legitimate civic government and religious orthodoxy became visually manifest.

In her book on crime and society in early modern Seville M.E. Perry notes that the language of the church was a “depository for the traditional metaphors and imagery by which people expressed ideas and attitudes about themselves, their city, indeed all of life.”⁸³ The language of *autos de fe* fits this model. The celebration's public ritual gave Seville's civic authority a physical and recognizable form. The victim's physical separation and visual denigration became a powerful message of civic order when juxtaposed to the cathedral procession and hierarchical theater. These memories empirically defined the individual, the city, and imperial and religious authority against improper civic action. From the construction of the scaffolding, the elevation of the stage, meticulously planned processions, visual ostentation, and physical separation of the crowd and condemned, the *auto de fe* personified the legitimacy of Sevillian civic authority. By celebrating the visual personification of this authority, *autos de fe* provided a template for what society should be, while simultaneously juxtaposing itself to what it should not.

⁸³ Perry, *Gender and Disorder in Early Modern Seville*, 56.

In sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Seville, *autos de fe* also became a fortification against the pitfalls of urbanization. It exemplified the intrinsic connection between church and crown, civic identity and religious orthodoxy, visual instruction and internal piety. As public morality and, consequently, civic order concerned both religious and secular authority, urban oligarchies in Seville created public venues which showcased their own civic legitimacy. Therefore, the performance of an *auto de fe* contributed to a broader visual vocabulary in urban centers throughout the early modern period. Devotional art focused on conquest and lineage, renovations to contemporary architecture reclaimed physical space, while religious and imperial displays such as the *autos* effectively suppressed the personal shortcomings of the individual for the greater interest of the community.

Chapter Three:

Saints among Sinners: Civic Health, Historical Memory and Religious Iconography in Early Modern Seville

After graduating from Cambridge in 1839, Scottish born writer William Stirling Maxwell traveled to Spain and the Levant to collect material for his joint appointment as contributing essayist to London's literary journal *Frazier's Magazine* and weekly publication of the *Examiner*. In 1891, after years of research, Maxwell completed his almost two thousand page opus entitled the *Annals of the Artists of Spain*. The four volume commemoration contained numerous famed portraits, an extensive collection of wood, steel and mezzotint engravings, as well as a rich anthology of popular biographies about Spain's most notable artists. Though Maxwell's biography often employed a theatrical tone when describing subjects such as artists' "playful humor" or the "versatility of [their] genius", his work adopted a particularly dramatic intonation when discussing the subject of Seville's cathedral.⁸⁴ Maxwell described a series of frescos around the outer courtyard created by famed Sevillian artist Luis de Vargas. Though the majority of frescos had since faded, Maxwell claimed that the image of the cathedral's bell tower, the Giralda, upheld by Saints Justa and Rufina, antique sister martyrs and patronesses of the city, could still be clearly seen. Quoting from seventeenth-century Sevillian historian Licenciado Don Pablo de Espinosa de los Monteros, Maxwell's chapter digressed into the well-known Spanish fable about the celestial battle which occurred during Seville's 1504 earthquake. As the earth shook, Maxwell described, demons chanted "down with it [the Giralda], down with it!" Over the roar of the tempest, the demons confessed their inability to topple the tower "for Justa and Rufina are upholding it".⁸⁵

⁸⁴ Sir William Stirling Maxwell, *The Annals of the Artists of Spain* (London: Printed for John Olliver, 1891), 379.

⁸⁵ Maxwell, 367-68.

Maxwell's literary reenactment reflected both the longevity of Justa and Rufina's popularity, arising out of the early modern period, as well as the power attributed to their supernatural protection within Seville's popular imagination. A closer look at the deliberate construction of the sisters' iconography during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century will reveal that religious symbolism, like that presented in *autos de fe*, often carried profound allusions to social order. This connection, largely neglected by current historiography, suggests fruitful new ways in which to explore how gender shaped civic discourse in Spain's urban centers.

Present during holidays, civic festivals and a variety of pedagogical mediums from cathedral paintings to broadsides, sisters Justa and Rufina were an essential part of Sevillian visual culture throughout the early modern period. The sisters' martyrdom maintained a moderate degree of fame among Christians in medieval Seville, though their popularity reached a particular height during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries. Though the rich symbolism presented by Justa and Rufina suggests a variety of unexplored areas of research regarding Sevillian religious iconography, this chapter will work to locate the sisters' imagery within larger debates and anxieties about civic order, especially in regards to female piety.

As the previous chapter suggests, anxieties about social order manifested most noticeably in the formation and promotion of pedagogical models. Justa and Rufina provided female images that spoke to the reality of women in the public sphere. Though their image expressed traditional female chastity prevalent during the early modern period, the reality of Seville's urban setting prompted the promotion of exemplars which could also cope with the city's urban troubles. Accounts which highlighted the sisters'

aggressive defense of Catholic orthodoxy and fervent devotion to their city attempted to combat these very problems. Thus, Justa and Rufina's iconography was not solely concerned with pushing women back into the private sphere. Rather, their images served as a model for the hierarchy which existed in both public and private life. The prescriptive nature of Justa and Rufina's imagery elucidates this act of creation and provides a unique vantage from which to explore concerns about women's obligations to society as well as the shared conceptual space of gender and civic health in early modern Spain.⁸⁶

Justa and Rufina's third-century martyrdom represented the city's close ties to antiquity as well as its early conversion to orthodoxy. In this sense, Justa and Rufina were distinctly Sevillian. They lived and worked in their city and died to prove the powerful orthodoxy of its citizenry. The miraculous healing powers of sites associated with the sisters' death fortified these beliefs. However, the particular effectiveness of the sisters' image relied on a transparent connection with one of the city's most famed Catholic symbols, the Giralda. Claimed for Christian worship in 1248 by Fernando III of Castile, the converted mosque served as the cathedral bell tower and a visual reminder of the city's close ties to the Reconquest and commitment to Christian orthodoxy. The portrayal of the sisters as patrons of the Giralda, an architectural structure not at all contemporaneous with their time, suggests the same deliberate construction of historical memory promoted by Francisco Pacheco's *El Arte de la Pintura*. Therefore, to regard the alliance between the sisters and the Giralda as solely a matter of promoting female piety would be to truncate the full potential of their iconography. I argue that the sisters' image promoted an ideal vision of civic hierarchy which was dependent on both female and

⁸⁶ Perry, *Gender and Disorder in Early Modern Seville*, 23.

male piety and rooted in historical ties to the city's past. Such representations were a reflection of the connection between healthy civil communities, a bulwark against Seville's social reality, and attempts to convey and normalize the natural order between men and women through the aid of religious iconography and historical memory.

The public boundaries established for women, both before and after the Council of Trent, suggested that the social hierarchy within which proper behavior functioned was based on a rigid gender distinction between men and women. Sermons, catechisms, and public images conveyed the essentiality of these distinctions to the public. Joan Scott has rightly suggested that refining definitions of sexual difference has often been a crucial way to reinforce social order and hierarchy.⁸⁷ The following analysis will adhere to the same principle. It will argue that Justa and Rufina iconography substantively constructed notions of natural (or normalized) gender distinctions through the promotion of a healthy civic community. The manifest religious component to the sisters' imagery – which drew marked connections between piety, hierarchical order, and gender – established the divine authority behind these distinctions. It is, therefore, essential to examine Justa and Rufina imagery not only as a model of female piety in Seville but also as an image which promoted the overall health of the city's civic community.

In his seventeenth-century text devoted to Sevillian martyrs (*Santos de la ciudad de Sevilla y su arcobispado: Fiestas, que su Santa Iglesia Metropolitana celebra*), Antonio de Quintanadueñas posited that in the late third-century, Justa and Rufina, sister virgins and native Sevillians, sold pottery in a shop at the center of town earning just enough money to feed themselves and give to the poor. Quintanadueñas documented that

⁸⁷ Joan Wallach Scott, *Gender and the Politics of History* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), 41-50.

the event which embroiled the sisters in controversy occurred during a procession celebrating Venus in 287.⁸⁸ As a procession dedicated to the goddess passed their shop, the sisters denied the devotees alms for their pagan worship. In retaliation for their insolence the followers of Venus attacked the shop and smashed the sisters' pottery. Emphasizing the degree of their Christian orthodoxy, Quintanadueñas noted that Justa and Rufina took to street and shattered the passing statue of Venus. They were immediately arrested and jailed by the local Roman Prefect.⁸⁹ Eighteenth-century biographer Arana de Varflora embellished the sisters' imprisonment and torture, documenting that Justa died in prison, though not before receiving several encouraging visions from Christ.⁹⁰ Quintanadueñas concluded their story by describing how the Prefect, desirous of public recompense for the sisters' crimes, threw Rufina to the lions. Impressed by Rufina's courage, the lions miraculously bowed at her feet after which the Prefect had her publicly burned.⁹¹

The story of Justa and Rufina fit Pacheco's conception of Seville's historical genealogy. As chapter one suggests, local magnates such as the Don Fernando Enríquez Afán de Ribera, the Duke of Alcalá, advocated for an antique lineage which fostered not only a sense of continuity with the Roman empire, but also the early stages of Christian orthodoxy in the region. Rodrigo Caro's early seventeenth-century local history *Antigüedades, y principado de la ilustrissima ciudad de Sevilla* placed the sisters among

⁸⁸ Antonio de Quintanadueñas, *Santos de la ciudad de Sevilla y su arcobispado: Fiestas, que su Santa Iglesia Metropolitana celebra* (Seville: F de Lyra, 1637), 83.

⁸⁹ Quintanadueñas, 84.

⁹⁰ Peter Cherry notes the biographical reference by Arana de Varflora in 1791. See Peter Cherry, "Santas Justa y Rufina: una nota iconográfica," in *En torno a Santa Rufina: Velázquez de lo íntimo a lo cortesano*, eds. Benito Navarrete Prieto, Alfonso E. Pérez Sánchez, Peter Cherry, and Carmen Garrido (Seville: Centro Velázquez, Focus Abengoa, 2008), 128, 133. A more general synthesis of the sisters' martyrdom may also be seen in Perry, *Gender and Disorder in Early Modern Seville*, 33-52.

⁹¹ Quintanadueñas, 84.

civic fathers, Hercules and Caesar, to emphasize their place within the city's founding pantheon.⁹² However, Justa and Rufina's martyrdom set them apart from the pagan worship of both the Greeks and Roman, and thus highlighted Seville's early move from paganism to Christianity. The close connections drawn in Sevillian intellectual circles regarding the city's relationship to antiquity, as well as Christian orthodoxy, is essential to understanding how and why Justa and Rufina fit so well into the city's physical and conceptual landscape.

Sevillian artist Hernando de Esturmio's 1555 painting of the sisters illustrates this close connection.⁹³ (Fig. 1) Esturmio placed Justa and Rufina within an atemporal frame, an approach which allowed him to highlight a variety of important moments in the sisters' hagiography. Justa and Rufina stand in the forefront of the image draped in humble attire and gently displaying the different varieties of pottery sold in their shop. Their background is amalgamated. Roman ruins flank an unfinished Giralda while figures at the base of the tower enact the procession which brought the sisters to their fame. The ruins surrounding the unfinished tower suggest a dual meaning. Though certainly evocative of Seville's connection to antiquity, the Giralda also signals the city's emergence from paganism at the hands of the sisters' Catholic faith. The Giralda, still in the early stages of construction, however, bypasses its traditional Islamic inception and instead focuses on the construction of the tower – and thus the establishment of orthodoxy within the city - as contemporaneous to that of Justa and Rufina.

⁹² Rodrigo Caro, *Antigüedades, y principado de la ilustrissima ciudad de Sevilla* (Seville: A. Grande, 1634), 25.

⁹³ Esturmio's version represents an older vision of the sisters, one which emphasized their antiquity and close connection to the city's history. Later versions made more marked distinctions between the sisters and the Giralda, the latter towering well above them to mark its dominance.

Esturmio's inaccuracy was surely deliberate. The sisters died years before the first brick was laid for the mosque, much less the grand cathedral which was to follow. However, this association is also clear. Justa and Rufina stood for Seville's antiquity, its orthodoxy and the city's ideal citizenry. The linkage between the sisters' antique history and the Giralda provided their images with the same sense of cultural superiority which often accompanied local histories and architectural renovations throughout the sixteenth-century.⁹⁴ Such projects attempted to remind Sevillians of their grand lineage. Justa and Rufina's early Christian martyrdom indicated this same distinctiveness by highlighting the city's historic superiority to other locations within the Spanish monarchy.

Justa and Rufina's antique hagiography and presence in local histories was undoubtedly part of their appeal to both the artists who promoted their image and the religious authorities which supported them. Sevillian artists' choice to adopt images of the sisters as the standard for the city corresponds to the sense of artistic exceptionalism discussed in the first chapter. Certainly many of the sisters' images were commissioned by private patrons, though even they fostered the city's antique status through funding expensive public and private renovations to showcase their city's history. However, the popularity of their image by many prominent Sevillian artists suggests the attractiveness of their particular iconography.

Though Pacheco never addressed the sisters directly in the *Arte*, his particular emphasis on religious iconography indicated his preoccupation with the creation of sanctioned images. Pacheco's interest in the formation of religious pedagogy elucidates

⁹⁴ Interesting correlations between exceptionalism and identity can be seen in Magali M Garrera, "Affections of the Heart: Female Imagery and the Notion of the Nation in Nineteenth-Century Mexico," in *Women and Art in Early Modern Latin America*, eds. Kellen Kee McIntyre and Richard E. Phillips, 47-72 (Boston: Brill, 2007).

the elevated role of iconography in early modern Seville. In his lifetime Pacheco addressed everything from paintings of the Holy Family, which included the banning of Saint Anne in the mid seventeenth-century due to her somewhat dubious marital record, to how many nails should be represented when recreating Christ's crucifixion.⁹⁵ Pacheco's unyielding attention to iconographic detail reflected both the power and purpose of visual media in early modern Seville. In an age which lacked mass media and high literacy rates, visual culture became the foremost method of communication with the public. The city's strong claims to Catholic orthodoxy, as well as the close alliance between the Sevillian Academy and the Inquisition, made the construction of iconography a deliberate and approved communication between local civic and religious authorities and the people.

The popularity of this communication cannot be overstated. Religious symbols functioned as a way to facilitate the transmission of theological tenets and reinforce orthodoxy behavior.⁹⁶ In addition to paintings, civic processions, *autos de fe*, and the *autos sacramental* consistently brought the city together in celebration of their communal orthodoxy. This symbolism created an essential framework for ideal human relationships. The religious component to the majority of visual culture also provided a sense of divine security, a protection which was preserved by safeguarding the Christian hierarchy.

The connection between aestheticism and internal devotion contributed to the perception of a deep connection between visual models and internal piety. Pacheco made this close connection clear in the *Arte* by noting that images were meant to "...govern the mind, move the will, and refresh the memory of divine things...acts of patience, acts of

⁹⁵ Pacheco, Book II, 234.

⁹⁶ Perry, *Gender and Disorder in early modern Seville*, 44.

justice, acts of chastity, gentleness, mercy, and disdain for this world...which are the principle paths that lead to blessedness.”⁹⁷ Therefore, Pacheco advocated for a direct connection between images and action. In regards to women, this meant that naturally unruly or improper behavior – supposedly inherent to women - could be replaced by modesty and humility if given the proper training and examples.⁹⁸ Devotional mnemonics emphasized this assumption by encouraging individuals to practice the spiritual art of memory by visualizing images worthy of imitation. In fact, Pacheco’s son-in-law, Diego Velázquez’ famous early seventeenth-century paintings personified the art of contemplation by highlighting recognizable faces, scenarios, and themes, many of which conformed to acceptable models of imitation.⁹⁹ Though Velázquez never painted the sisters in tandem, his singular portraits of Rufina suggested his adherence to this model. Therefore, the use of the sisters’ iconography by local religious authorities and institutions publicly signified the behavior, as well as well as boundaries, appropriate to women at a time when the city was in somewhat unfamiliar territory due to rapid urbanization.

Richard Kagan’s book on urban images in Spain and the early Americas adds an additional complicating factor to Justa and Rufina’s iconography. Kagan advocates for a communicentric view of urban centers. Communicentric images promoted the notion of idealized civic environments in the urban imagination. Though Kagan’s analysis fundamentally focuses on Spanish cartography in the Americas, his inclusion of communicentric images is an important addition. He argues that cartography represented

⁹⁷ Pacheco, Book 1, 189.

⁹⁸ James R. Farr, “The Pure and Disciplined Body: Hierarchy, Morality, and Symbolism in France during the Catholic Reformation,” *Journal of Interdisciplinary History* 21, no. 3 (1991): 391-95.

⁹⁹ Tiffany, 453.

a variety of perspectives, from architectural fantasies of civic authorities to travelers' interpretations of foreign and domestic cities. Cartographic images thus embodied an element of the civilizing process as conceived in the minds of city planners. In comparisons, communicentric images exaggerated the civilizing message behind cartography. They abandoned objectivity and topographic accuracy and celebrated ideal expressions of civility within their respective cities. These representations were purposefully distorted, presenting an enhanced vision of certain objects, people or locales deemed essential to local history or civic pride.¹⁰⁰ As the last two chapters have suggested, prescriptive imagery emphasized not only an antique history but also an ideal Christian orthodox present. The emphasis artists placed on communicentric views of female chastity in Justa and Rufina iconography spoke to the city's more global anxieties about social order. This anxiety, which Kagan calls a sentiment "perched somewhat perilously on the symbolic frontier separating and protecting Christianity from barbarism," stimulated the desire for ideal reflections of civic communities.¹⁰¹

The close association between commissioned artists, local authors and inquisitorial censors allied the relationship between civic health and Christian orthodoxy more ardently. However, the fact that Justa and Rufina were women, and women of incredible popularity, is a unique point. Mary Elizabeth Perry writes that in 1525 a Venetian ambassador visited the city and matter-of-factly wrote in a description of his travels that Seville had "fallen into the hands of women!"¹⁰² Commercial trade with the Americas had changed Seville, especially for women. Rapid urbanization, immigration, poverty, and plague created the perception that the family was in decline. Though the

¹⁰⁰ Kagan, *Urban Images of the Hispanic World 1493-1793*, 109.

¹⁰¹ Kagan, *Urban Images of the Hispanic World 1493-1793*, 27.

¹⁰² Perry, *Gender and Disorder in early modern Seville*, 14.

establishment of additional orphanages and halfway houses helped remedy such issues, their presence also fomented fears regarding social decline. In addition, men traveled abroad and created new opportunities for women at home in the form of property ownership, independent business transaction and legal affairs. Due to the ready availability of materials such as cloths, silks, and tapestries, the city was also known for its opulence, as well as the charm and beauty of local women.¹⁰³ Economic changes in the city, therefore, signaled fundamental shifts in women's visibility in public life, an issue which exacerbated moralists' anxieties over disrupting the natural order between men and women. Post-Tridentine ideology regarding this relationship relied heavily on patriarchal authority. As patriarchy functioned as the anchor to political authority, moralists often cited the disintegration of the family as the forerunner to urban, and ultimately monarchical, decline.¹⁰⁴

The popularity of Justa and Rufina's images reflected the tension which resulted from the cleavage between the real and the ideal and the genuine fear that women would not abide by Catholic dictates.¹⁰⁵ It also arose out of the necessity of women's prominent role in Seville's economic reality, and the concurrent Christian guideline of excluding them on the basis of a social stability. Anthropologist Mary Douglas suggests that excising female sexual pollution became a greater concern in the seventeenth-century

¹⁰³ Laura Bass and Amanda Wunder, "Veiled Ladies of the Early Modern Spanish World: Seduction and Scandal in Seville, Madrid, and Lima," *Hispanic Review* 77, no. 1 (2009): 112-122.

¹⁰⁴ Villaseñor Black, 117-133.

¹⁰⁵ See "Embodiments of Female Virtue" in Joan Landes, *Visualizing the Nation: Gender, Representations, and Revolution in Eighteenth Century France* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2001), 81-130. Landes' argument regarding the deployment of female images in promotion civic devotion is an essential to currently historiography about women and visual culture in the early modern world. A more extensive engagement with Landes' theory – as well as its limitations within early modern Spain – will be discussed later in this chapter.

than it had previously.¹⁰⁶ The convening sessions of the Council of Trent solidified the connection between personal comportment and social stability, though such notions had been around for centuries before their Post-Tridentine incarnation. The reforms enacted by the Council promoted this desired stability by emphasizing a faith based on fortified gender distinctions between men and women. This call to action set official boundaries for women in both public and private, and honor became tied to female chastity and obedience. In this sense, the moral reforms which dominated the Council's sessions in the mid sixteenth-century greatly contributed to the normalization of the (unequal) relationship between men and women and the essentiality of patriarchy to the overall health of the community.

The image of chastity and devotion to orthodoxy conveyed by images of Justa and Rufina was a manifestation of this belief. Sevillian artist, Miguel de Esquivel's 1620 version of the sisters is a case in point. (see Fig. 2) Esquivel's painting places the sisters under the Giralda. It is interesting to note that Esquivel depicted the sisters as higher than the original mosque component of the structure but well below the Catholic addition of the bell tower. The young, ornately clothed sisters each stretch out one arm to support the tower. One looks up to the Giralda while the other looks down on the city below. Both possess halos and exaggerated martyr palms, emphasizing their devotion to the Catholic faith and commitment to the city.

This image suggests that the sisters became what Scott refers to as "privileged operators" for transmitting meaning.¹⁰⁷ Justa and Rufina's juxtaposition with the Giralda signified their position in the city's Christian imagination. Through their outstretched

¹⁰⁶ Mary Douglas, *Purity and Danger: An Analysis of Concepts of Pollution and Taboo* (New York: Routledge, 1966), 7-29.

¹⁰⁷ Scott, 48-49.

arms, the sisters fortified orthodoxy and personified the prescriptive chastity and obedience of a Christian patriarchy. As no division between sex and gender existed during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries, the notion of divinely inspired qualities reinforced these seemingly natural differences. As shown by Esquivel's halos, the sisters' devotion to both their faith and their home seemed natural. It also spoke to the post-Tridentine dictate which emphasized chastity and obedience as women's domain both in and outside the home.

The sisters' virginity was an effective way to convey this ideal. Marian iconography had long been an essential subject of reflection. However, despite Catholic images of an obedient and chaste Virgin, Marian iconography revolved around a reserved and mournful mother. Justa and Rufina presented an alternate vision of chastity, one which spoke more directly to the everyday Sevillian. The sisters' virginity was an essential part of this iconographic message. The significant rise in number of handbooks and manuals designed to inform women of their moral duty during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries testifies to the pervasiveness of this belief. However prescriptive literature written by moralist prior to the Council's session provided the early rubric from which Post-Tridentine tenants based the connection between civil society and Christian hierarchy.

Pre-Tridentine moralist literature provided the groundwork for the post-Tridentine emphasis on a more stringently integrated social, political and religious landscape. As a result, personal comportment became a public concern and was cited by moralists as a measure of the overall health of a community.¹⁰⁸ Though spending much of his life outside of Spain, the Valencian born humanist Juan Luis Vives offers some insight into

¹⁰⁸ Kagan, *Urban Images of the Hispanic World 1490-1793*, 26-28.

the intersection of gender and civic discourse in the early modern Spain. Vives wrote his *Instrucción de la mujer cristiana* for then Princess Mary of England in 1523, around the same time Esturmio painted the sisters in their antique surroundings. Though geography greatly separated the two, Vives' writing and Esturmio's painting possess enough similarities to suggest, at least, a discursive relationship. This intersection highlights how discourses which defined women's social and intellectual limitations also possessed essential allusions about the formation and maintenance of civic life. Vives alluded to this relationship when he described how relations between men and women were fundamentally connected to the formation and well being of the state. Vives notes "there is nothing so troublesome as sharing one's life with a person of no principles. And if this can be said with good cause of states, all the more justly can it be said of the individual household."¹⁰⁹

Vives highlighted the necessity of a well ordered household (or society), through the notion of virginity. Vives described virginity as the "most great and noble subject" and devoted an entire chapter of his work to its praise.¹¹⁰ However, what made this model so effective, according to Vives, was its adaptability. Virginity was not bound to the corporal body, rather a state of "integrity of the mind."¹¹¹ More closely allied with contemplation and an intellectual purity, Vives made virginity an essential point of reflection for all women. By engaging in activities which fostered this particular

¹⁰⁹ Juan Luis Vives, *The Education of a Christian Women: a sixteenth century manual*, ed. and trans. Charles Fantazzi (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000), 45.

¹¹⁰ Vives, 80-86.

¹¹¹ Vives, 80.

intellectual purity, Vives suggested that every woman could be a “spouse of Christ by virtue of integrity of the mind.”¹¹²

Vives illustrated the efficacy of female integrity through historical precedent. He noted prominent Athenian and Roman women who “preserved a chaste mind” and noted “History is full of examples, as is the common experience of life.”¹¹³ Esturmio’s painting of the antique virgin martyrs similarly conveyed these connections through Seville’s history and connection to antique Christian orthodoxy. Similar to the allusions presented by Vives, Justa and Rufina’s life and death reflected the necessary integrity of Sevillian women in a time when the Christian hierarchy seemed threatened by urban life. Vives’ emphasis on virginity as a state of mind rather than a state of body indicated the malleability of notions of chastity and integrity. Certainly aware that not all women would remain virgins, Vives advocated for fortification of the mind as a means of regulating sexuality and ensuring proper decorum in public life. To this life Vives attributes so much admiration that “lions stand in awe of it.”¹¹⁴ Rufina’s experience in the lion’s den makes Vives’ emphasis intriguing. Though Vives wrote prior the height of Justa and Rufina iconography, the popularity of *Instrucción de la mujer cristiana* could have easily framed the sisters’ hagiography, a fact which would highlight the imagery’s instructional purpose.

The devotional nature of Sevillian art suggests that Vives’ emphasis on instruction would have been welcome. Despite popular perceptions regarding the city’s opulence, Seville also projected a fervent orthodoxy. The city was home to one of the original inquisitorial tribunals established by Ferdinand and Isabella in the fifteenth

¹¹² Vives, 80.

¹¹³ Vives, 84.

¹¹⁴ Vives, 83.

century, as well nearly fifty monastic houses, and one of the largest cathedrals in western Europe. As gateway to Spain's commercial empire, city officials considered themselves an important part of the spread of commerce, culture and, most importantly, Catholicism. The perception of Seville as a bastion of Catholic orthodoxy was also present in Justa and Rufina iconography.

Hagiographers suggested that after the 1504 earthquake the sisters became intimately linked with the Giralda, the city's bell tower. The impressive persistence of this story is highlighted by William Stirling Maxwell's late nineteenth-century description of the battle between the sisters and the demonic tempest. However, the deliberate pairing of Justa and Rufina with one of the city's most recognizable pieces of historic architecture adds an important nuance to the sisters' allegory. Like Vives' prescriptive literature regarding unregulated women, the sisters' unification with one of the city's most Catholic symbols reveals the necessity of their containment within regulated, or orthodox, institutions.

Bartolomé Esteban Murillo's representation of the sisters embodied this sentiment. (Fig. 3) Murillo, one of the city's most famous seventeenth-century artists, was a close associate of Pacheco and the Sevillian Academy. He also served on the canonization campaign for Fernando III in the seventeenth-century, an investigation which dominated the artist's life and expertise for nearly three years. Like most representations of Justa and Rufina, Murillo depicted the sisters as modestly dressed, holding martyr palms, and surrounded by earthenware.¹¹⁵ Shown more dramatically than

¹¹⁵ Earlier and later renditions of the sisters differ only slightly. As previously seen, Hernando de Esturmio's sixteenth century painting included an antique background meant to evoke both the city's genealogy and the sisters' moment of triumph. Such depictions remained consistent well into the modern period. Francisco Goya's version, painted in the late eighteenth century, includes a lion bowing at the

in earlier paintings, Murillo depicted the sisters physically holding the Giralda. A brief explanation of the bell tower's history elucidates this meaning.

Beginning in the thirteenth-century, the Giralda maintained a close association with the Reconquest, and thus the historical precedent for Seville's Catholic orthodoxy. It was popularly believed that Fernando III claimed the Giralda, the then highest mosque in Spain, for Christian worship after conquering the city in 1248. He also laid the groundwork for one of the largest cathedrals in western Europe, a task which began at the base of the great tower. Though Sevillians eventually adopted the king as official co-patron in the late seventeenth-century, San Fernando's cult was under investigation throughout the early modern period. The relationship between the thirteenth-century king and the sisters in Seville's popular imagination was deeply entwined and could have functioned to bolster the popularity of their individual cults. Though more research into the promotion and investigation of Fernando's cult would be necessary to make this point absolute, the popular myth regarding the connection between the sisters and the King of Castile would certainly support this assumption. San Fernando supposedly evoked the power of the sisters when he moved to recapture the city from Muslim monarchs in the thirteenth-century. Sevillian author Alonso Morgado noted in his *Historia de Sevilla* that after conquering the city, Fernando III also erected a cathedral and convent, both of which were dedicated to the sisters, on the site of their former prison. Pilgrimages to the cemetery attached to the convent were believed to bring miraculous visions of the saints on their feast day.¹¹⁶

sisters' feet as well as a broken statue of Venus among scattered pottery. Therefore, despite slight artistic variations, the Giralda remained a consummate companion.

¹¹⁶ Peter Cherry, *Santas Justa y Rufina: una nota iconográfica*, 30-35.

Dianne Webb's work on saints in medieval Italy suggests, urban centers magnified problems, enhanced visibility, and compounded and concentrated social anxiety.¹¹⁷ Cities were fundamentally based on a rigid hierarchy between men and women, largely due to the necessity of accessing and controlling women's sexuality. Improper access threatened the social fabric and, consequently, patriarchal stability.¹¹⁸ Thus, anxieties regarding social decline often revolved around gender. Such anxieties were fomented by fears regarding urban living, particularly the absence of the traditional regulating forces of close-knit families and social communities present in provincial towns.

Framing the sisters' imagery and hagiography within their urban setting helps to explain the close association with the Giralda, and thus the city's Catholic orthodoxy. It also aids in highlighting the social atmosphere and human interaction which fostered gender distinctions in city life. The steps taken by moralists and the church openly reinforced these binary gender distinctions by emphasizing not only the natural differences between men and women, but also the hierarchical relationship between the two. Therefore, civic and religious authorities maintained social order only by their ability to control women's chastity.¹¹⁹ As mentioned previously, though the sisters protected the Giralda through their ultimate sacrifice, they were also contained by it. In Murillo's version, as in most, the tower is deliberately higher. This demonstrated the natural superiority – and protection- of the Catholic faith over Justa and Rufina's actions

¹¹⁷ Diana Webb, "Introduction" in *Saints and Cities in Medieval Italy*, ed. and trans. Diana Webb, (New York: Manchester University Press, 2003), 17-23.

¹¹⁸ Pia F. Cuneo, "Jörg Breu the Elder's Death of Lucretia: History, Sexuality and the State," in *Saints, Sinners and Sisters: Gender and Northern Art in Medieval and Early Modern Europe*, eds. Jane L Carroll and Alison G Steward (Burlington: Ashgate, 2003), 30-32.

¹¹⁹ Perry, *Gender and Disorder in early modern Seville*, 97-118.

as well as signified the reason for their sacrifice. As Vives suggested, the sisters and the Giralda expressed a purity and focus of mind, meant to remind onlookers of their connection to a combination of both history and orthodoxy.

Therefore, images which paired Justa and Rufina with the city's most recognizably Catholic monuments reflected an ideal vision of the city; one which balanced civic order by maintaining gender distinctions and upholding Christian hierarchy. The civic order promoted by Justa and Rufina iconography achieved its accessibility through the reinforcement of gendered categories. Adherence to a natural, divinely mandated role meant being part of a healthy body politic, while deviation threatened social order. In this sense, gendered hierarchy also determined an individual's relationship to civic authority. Joan Landes' work on women in revolutionary France argues that men in the early modern world defined themselves by what they were not – women.¹²⁰ Landes also suggests that the purpose of female iconography, or the universal anonymous female, was to encourage male citizens to embrace *la patrie*. The allure of a young, chaste, female France worked on both rational and emotional levels to reconstitute the body politic by encouraging men to become fathers and reinforcing the maternal role of women. This encouragement was also present in Spain via the promotion of the Holy Family during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries. However, Landes also rightly contends that the perceived necessity of women's exclusion from the public sphere made the manipulation of their image substantially easier. While French women were defining new identities for themselves as authors, club members, and public speakers, images promoted by nationalists resisted their attempts by substituting a mute image of chastity

¹²⁰ Landes, 37.

for the reality of a rising self-determined class.¹²¹ Justa and Rufina reflect the same social tension. Though images of the sisters provided models for female chastity, their iconography consistently placed them under the regulating influence of Catholic orthodoxy and effectively blunted their independent entry into the public sphere.

The deliberate construction of Justa and Rufina iconography fits the Catholic promotion of native saints as exemplars to individual communities. Examples of this type of promotion can be seen throughout the early modern period. The elevations of Saint Joseph in the colonies as well as Iberia, Isidro Labrador and San Julián were just a few saints who gained significant popularity throughout Spain's composite monarchy. In addition, saints who had fallen into historical obscurity, much like Justa and Rufina, were recalled by local authorities to establish both the orthodoxy of a community and also harness its civic commitment.

Peter Burke's work on counter-Reformation sainthood suggests, saints were not simply a random sampling of the population. Rather, their personal attributes worked to serve the community in a particular way and their career had to conform to a community's stereotypes of sanctity.¹²² They also had to coincide with the specific safeguarding needs of a community. Saint Julián, for example, rose to popularity after sixteenth-century plagues in Cuenca decimated much of the population. Julián became the official guardian against illness within the community and went on to become patron.¹²³ Other campaigns created intercessors based on both local need and regional

¹²¹ See "Possessing la *patrie*: Nationalism and Sexuality in Revolutionary Culture" in Landes, 135-168.

¹²² Peter Burke, "How To Be a Counter-Reformation Saint," in *Religion and Society in Early Modern Europe 1500-1800*, ed. by Kaspar von Greyerz (Boston: George Allen & Unwin, 1984), 45-47.

¹²³ Sara Nalle, "A Saint for All Seasons: The Cult of San Julián," in *Culture and Control in Counter-Reformation Spain*, eds. Anne J. Cruz and Mary Elizabeth Perry (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1992), 43-47.

popularity. Juan de Ribera's promotion of local intercessors in Valencia prior to the expulsion of the *morisco* population in the late sixteenth-century suggests that local spiritual needs and historical memory were essential components to public support.¹²⁴ Though the popularity of Justa and Rufina is difficult to assess prior to the middle of the sixteenth-century, Seville's consistent grappling with problems associated with urbanization and plague during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries suggested that the desire for native examples, as well as protectors, would have been present among city officials. In addition, the sisters' antique lineage, which supposedly signaled the rise of Christian orthodoxy in the region, corresponded with the city's persistent claim to antique history.

Justa and Rufina's late arrival in Sevillian hagiography and local histories also suggest their deliberate formation. Despite their popularity in the seventeenth-century, their story was omitted in Pedro de Ribadenerira's popular 1616 compendium, *Flos Sanctorum* due to the sisters' original absence from the *Roman Breviary*, the church's official liturgical guidebook. However, Justa and Rufina did make an appearance in the first volume of Alonso de Villegas' early seventeenth-century version of the *Flos sanctorum*, where their lives were reinvigorated as part of the reformed *Breviary* and their story positioned in the chapter devoted to the "Life of Christ and the Lives of the Saints."¹²⁵ In 1637, Antonio de Quintanadueñas, popular devotional literature writer and hagiographer, published his *Santos de la ciudad de Sevilla y su arcobispado: Fiestas, que su Santa Iglesia Metropolitana celebra* in 1637 to stress Sevillian's natural obligation to worship the saints as well as recounted their deaths. He also emphasized the importance

¹²⁴ Ben Ehlers, *Between Christians and Moriscos: Juan de Ribera and Religious Reform in Valencia 1568-1614* (Baltimore: John's Hopkins University Press, 2006), 67-72.

¹²⁵ Cherry, *Santas Justa y Rufina: una nota iconográfica*, 127.

of their feast day on the eighteenth of July, the midpoint between Justa's death on the seventeenth and Rufina's death two days later.¹²⁶ Proving the popularity of their story in the seventeenth-century, their hagiography was also included in Rordrigo Caro's local history, *Antigüedades, y principado de la ilustrissima ciudad de Sevilla*. As mentioned previously, Caro was a well known antiquarian and close associate of Francisco Pacheco. His historical account of the city placed Justa and Rufina next to Hercules and Julius Caesar as essential architects of the city's history. Though, unlike their Greek and Roman counterparts, Justa and Rufina were examples of the city's antique orthodoxy, a claim which Caro was fond of repeating.¹²⁷

The popularity of the sisters' image in Seville throughout the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries has the potential to add much to current historiography about the city during the early modern period. Though many saints gained popularity in post-Tridentine Spain, Justa and Rufina's iconography remain one of the most intriguing. Their patronage extended to several cities throughout Spain and eventually traveled into the Caribbean where they become the patronesses of Trinidad. For Seville the image of the sister martyrs was a reflection of the city's prominence within the Catholic Monarchy. The fact that Sevillian artists and city officials included women in their ideal representations of both Catholic orthodoxy and civic life complicates traditional divisions between public and private and suggests that images of women played an important role in shaping civic discourse.

Unfortunately, the entry of Justa and Rufina into the urban imagination of Sevillian society does little to capture the much sought after voice of Sevillian women.

¹²⁶ Quintanadueñas, 83-84.

¹²⁷ Caro, 21-30.

As Landes suggests, the popularization of their image could, in fact, imply a pushing back by city officials against women in the public sphere. Though such theories certainly have a place in any study regarding female iconography, to push Landes' conclusions too far in early modern Spain would be incorrect. Unlike the anonymous female figures of the eighteenth-century, Justa and Rufina had a face and history, both of which were distinctly Sevillian. Their popularity did not rest solely on their ability to, as Pacheco suggests, "move the will" of female chastity. Rather, their image stood as a marker of the city's history, its civility, and its place within a global empire. Most importantly, the collective acceptance of Justa and Ruina's image provided a framework for conceptualizing not only important landmarks within the city, but also the civility of the people who resided within Sevillian walls.

Figure 1

Hernando de Esturmio, 1555. Image found in Santiago Montoto, *La Catedral y el Alcázar de Sevilla* (Madrid: Editorial Plus-Ultra, 1948), 23.



Figure 2

Miguel de Esquivel, 1620. Image found in Richard Kagan, *Urban Images of the Hispanic World 1493-1793* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000), 62.



Figure 3

Bartolomé Esteban Murillo, 1665. Image found in Arsenio Moreno Mendoza, *Museo de Bellas Artes de Sevilla* (Sevilla: Ediciones Galve, 1993), 45.



Conclusion: Thoughts for Future Research

In 1598, while viewing the catafalque erected for Phillip II in Seville's great Cathedral, Miguel de Cervantes noted "what a shame it is that all this will not last a century, oh great Seville, a Rome triumphant in your spirit and nobility."¹²⁸ Though Cervantes' words were meant to deride Seville's opulence during the sixteenth century, his mockery alludes to the perception, even among outsiders, of the city's position as a formidable actor within Spain's imperial theater. Local merchants found fortune on both shores of the Atlantic and Sevillian culture moved readily through ports throughout the Americas. As the last three chapters have shown, Sevillian authorities during the sixteenth and seventeenth century promoted an image commensurate with its distinction as bearer of wealth, orthodoxy, and culture.

This research has focused on the promotion of civil society through the deployment of deliberately constructed religious cults and processions, such as those performed during *autos de fe*, one of the largest public events of the early modern world. Public displays of local history and authority lay at the nexus of various debates about civic life, such as the promotion of gendered hierarchies, anxieties about regional decline, and the centrality of history to urban identity. Though both religious and secular officials vied for the public eye, historiography regarding early modern visual culture argues that the utilization of religious pedagogy in urban settings was largely the concern of religious authorities, specifically the Inquisition. This project has worked to challenge such assumptions by suggesting that local oligarchs sought to harness the established power behind traditional religious symbolism to convey essential allusions about Seville's history, citizenry and place within the monarchy.

¹²⁸ J.H. Elliot, "The Seville of Velázquez," in *Velázquez in Seville*, ed. Michael Clarke (Edinburgh: National Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, 1996), 20.

Particularly important in Seville was the cult of Justa and Rufina, late-Roman sister martyrs and patronesses of the city. Native authors such as Rodrigo Caro and Antonio de Quintanadueñas presented Justa and Rufina as central to Seville's antique historical narrative. Paintings, broadsheets, public festivals and local liturgy devoted to the sisters' cult promoted a similar historical memory of Seville rooted in ancient Christian origins. However, Justa and Rufina were an appropriate conduit due to their close association, and containment, within the city's Giralda, or Cathedral bell tower. The relationship between the sisters and co-patron San Fernando III, King of Castile, as well as other saints within the city, is topic unexplored by current historiography and will certainly play a key role in future research.

One of the goals of this project has been to understand the deep relationship between images and action in the eyes of religious and secular authorities. Spanish sermons and devotional mnemonics often emphasized the spiritual art of memory by encouraging individuals to visualize recognizable faces, scenarios, and allegories which personified models worthy of imitation. Likewise, city officials and inquisitors meticulously planned *autos de fe*, beginning on the Cathedral steps, marching past prominent municipal buildings, and ending in an ornate arena specifically constructed to showcase civic authority through the visual juxtaposition of ordered hierarchy and the public shaming of those who stepped beyond the bounds of communal norms.

The next logical stage in this project is to place it within a transatlantic lens. Seville's religious and civic culture provided a model for urban centers across the Atlantic. Like imperial centers in Spain, the construction of identity, as well as local history, materialized most prominently in urban settings. Sevillian magnates active in transatlantic trade often transplanted their city's traditions in the Americas through a rich visual vocabulary. This

connection was most profound in Mexico. The replication of Sevillian architecture such as Vera Cruz' Tepeaca Rollo, modeled after the hallmark of Seville's commercial strength, the Torre de Oro, as well as Mexico City's metropolitan Cathedral suggests the extent of this cultural borrowing. In addition, the Sevillian Academy had close connections to the formation of religious iconography meant to shape indigenous peoples' relationship to Mexico's viceregal authority. As in Seville, city officials in colonial capitals such as Lima and Mexico City often employed saints cults and spectacle theaters such as *autos de fe* as a means of emphasizing social hierarchy. The diffusion of Seville's civic life had special appeal in America as an urban model rooted in global commerce, Catholic orthodoxy, and a social hierarchy based on Spain's imperial aspirations. Contemporary scholarship has not fully explored the transatlantic appeal of Sevillian saints, ceremonies and architectural renovations. Such comparisons will allow us to examine the symbiotic construction of both Iberian and colonial identity.

Having studied various artists involved in the Sevillian Academy, as well as the efforts of city officials and local nobility regarding the construction of Seville's local history, I have come to share their view of the city's exceptionalism. Seville held an undeniably unique place within the Spanish empire at a time of considerable religious turmoil on the continent and territorial expansion abroad. The significance of this project is its potential to tap into the changing sense of identity which occurred during this process. Particular anxieties which erupted in urban centers - as well as the steps taken to correct them- functioned as a gauge to changing notions of civic authority as well perceived social failures on both sides of the Atlantic. Both sentiments are essential to understanding how local authorities conceptualized their place within an expanding

empire, but also the reality of how the everyday Sevillian connected to – and utilized - the changing world around them. In this sense, the fundamental goal of this research is to more thoroughly understand the conceptual frameworks which constructed human interaction in urban life during the early modern period. The inclusion of a transatlantic lens in this study has the potential to further complicate center-periphery arguments as well as nuance the colonial landscape by suggesting a more dynamic relationship between Spain and its urban colonies.

Glossary of Terms

Autos de fe – Act of faith; Public inquisitorial trials

Civitas - Civic community

Converso – Christianized Jews

Hermanadad - Police force

Morisco – Christianized Muslims

Mudéjar – In medieval Spain the term designated Islamic monarchies, however, after the fourteenth-century the term was used to refer to traditional Islamic architecture

Naturaleza – Nativeness

Patria - Regional fatherland

Vicindad - Local belonging; Citizenship

Bibliography

- Adler, E.N. "Auto de Fe and Jew." *Jewish Quarterly Review* 13, no. 3 (1901): 392-437.
- Aristotle, *Politics*. Charlottesville: University of Virginia Library, 2001.
<http://etext.virginia.edu/toc/modeng/public/AriPoli.html>.
- Bass, Laura and Amanda Wunder. "Veiled Ladies of the Early Modern Spanish World: Seduction and Scandal in Seville, Madrid, and Lima." *Hispanic Review* 77, no. 1 (2009): 97-144.
- Bethencourt, Francisco. "The Auto da Fé: Ritual and Imagery." *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 55 (1992): 155-168.
- Bocanegra, Mathias de. *Jews and the Inquisition of Mexico: The Great Auto de fe of 1649 as related by Mathias de Bocanegra*. Translated and Edited by Seymour B. Lieberman. Laurence: Coronado Press, 1974.
- Brown, Jonathan. *Painting in Spain: 1500-1700*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998.
- _____. *Images and Ideas in Seventeenth-Century Spanish Paintings*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1978.
- Burke, Peter. "How To Be a Counter-Reformation Saint." In *Religion and Society in Early Modern Europe 1500-1800*, edited by Kaspar von Greyerz, 45-55. Boston: George Allen & Unwin, 1984.
- Cherry, Peter. "Artistic Training and the Painters' Guild in Seville." In *Velázquez in Seville*, edited by Michael Clarke, 67-77. Edinburgh: National Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, 1996.
- _____. "Santas Justa y Rufina: una nota iconográfica." In *En torno a Santa Rufina: Velázquez de lo íntimo a lo cortesano*, edited by Benito Navarrete Prieto, Alfonso E. Pérez Sánchez, Peter Cherry, and Carmen Garrido, 127-135. Seville: Centro Velázquez, Focus Abengoa, 2008.
- Christian, William. *Local Religion in Sixteenth Century Spain*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1981.
- Caro, Rodrigo. *Antigüedades, y principado de la ilustrissima ciudad de Sevilla*. Seville: A. Grande, 1634.

- Covarrubias, Sebastián de. *Tesoro de la lengua castellana o española*. 1611; fac. Edited in Madrid, 1979.
- Cueto, Ronald. "The Great Babylon of Spain: Politics, Religion and Piety in the Seville of Velázquez." In *Velázquez in Seville*, edited by Michael Clarke, 29-37. Edinburgh: National Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, 1996.
- Cuneo, Pia F. "Jörg Breu the Elder's Death of Lucretia: History, Sexuality and the State." In *Saints, Sinners and Sisters: Gender and Northern Art in Medieval and Early Modern Europe*, edited by Jane L Carroll and Alison G Steward, 26-43. Burlington: Ashgate, 2003.
- Cañal, Lleó Vincente. "The Great Babylon of Spain: Politics, Religion and Piety in the Seville of Velázquez." In *Velázquez in Seville*, edited by Michael Clarke, 23-29. Edinburgh: National Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, 1996.
- Douglas, Mary. *Purity and Danger: An Analysis of Concepts of Pollution and Taboo*. New York: Routledge, 1966.
- Ehlers, Ben. *Between Christians and Moriscos: Juan de Ribera and Religious Reform in Valencia 1568-1614*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2006.
- Elliot, J.H. "The Seville of Velázquez." In *Velázquez in Seville*, edited by Michael Clarke, 15-21. Edinburgh: National Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, 1996.
- Farr, James R. "The Pure and Disciplined Body: Hierarchy, Morality, and Symbolism in France during the Catholic Reformation." *Journal of Interdisciplinary History* 21, no. 3 (1991): 391-414.
- Findlen, Paula. "Possessing the Past: The Material World of the Italian Renaissance." *American Historical Review* 103, no. 83 (1998):83-114.
- Flynn, Maureen. "Mimesis of the Last Judgment: The Spanish Auto de fe." *Sixteenth Century Journal* 22, no. 2 (1991): 281-297.
- Fontaine, Michelle. "For the Good of the City: The Bishop and the Ruling Elite in Tridentine Modena." *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 28, no. 1 (1997): 29-43.
- Garrera, Magali G. "Affections of the Heart: Female Imagery and the Notion of the Nation in Nineteenth-Century Mexico." In *Women and Art in Early Modern Latin America*, edited by Kellen Kee McIntyre and Richard E. Phillips, 47-72. Boston: Brill, 2007.
- Harris, Kati. "Forging History: The Polmos of Sacromonte of Granada in Francisco Bermudez de Pedraza's *Historia Ecclesiastica*." *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 30, no. 4 (1999): 945-66.

- _____. *From Muslim to Christian Granada: Inventing a City's Past in Early Modern Spain*. Baltimore: John's Hopkins University Press, 2007.
- Herzog, Tamar. *Defining Nations in Early Modern Spain and Spanish America*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003.
- _____. "Communities Becoming a Nation: Spain and Spain America in the Wake of Modernity (and Thereafter)." *Citizenship Studies* 11, no. 2 (2007): 151-172.
- Hillerbrand, Hans J. ed. and Jon Cowans trans. *Early Modern Spain: A Documentary History*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003.
- Homza, Lu Ann. ed. and trans. *Inquisition Reader 1478-1614: An Anthology of Sources*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc., 2006.
- Kagan, Richard. "Clio and the Crown: Writing History in Habsburg Spain." In *Spain, Europe and the Atlantic World: Essays in Honor of John H. Elliott*, edited by Richard Kagan and Geoffrey Parker, 73-100. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- _____. *Urban Images of the Hispanic World 1490-1793*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000.
- Kamen, Henry. *The Spanish Inquisition: A Historical Revision*. London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 1997.
- Kunoth, G. "Pacheco's Apotheosis of Hercules." *The Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 27 (1964): 335-337.
- Kertzer, David. *Ritual, Politics and Power*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988.
- Landes, Joan. *Visualizing the Nation: Gender, Representations, and Revolution in Eighteenth Century France*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2001.
- Lunenfeld, Marvin. "Pedagogy of Fear: Making the Secret-Jew Visible at the Public Autos de Fe of the Spanish Royal Inquisition." *Shofar: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Jewish Studies* 18, no. 3 (2000): 77-92.
- MacCormack, Sabine. *On the Wings of Time: Rome, the Incas, Spain, and Peru*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2007.
- Mann, Richard. "El Greco and his Patrons: three projects." In *The Word Made Image: religion, art and architecture in Spain and Spanish America, 1500-1600*, edited

- by Jonathan Brown, compiled by Isabel Stewart Gardner Museum, 46-64. Boston: The Trustees of the Isabel Stewart Gardner Museum, 1998.
- Maxwell, Stirling Willian Sir. *The Annals of the Artisits of Spain*. London: Printed for John Olliver, 1891.
- Moffitt, John. *Spanish Painting*. London: Studio Visa, 1973.
- Monteiro de Barros Carollo, Helena Denise. "Auto-Da-Fé: A ceremony more than just words." *Revista de la Inquisición* 8 (1998):133-120.
- Muir, Edward. "The Eye of the Procession: Ritual ways of Seeing in the Renaissance." In *Ceremonial culture in Pre-Modern Europe*, edited by Nicolas Howe, 129-155. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 2007.
- _____. *Ritual in Early Modern Europe*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Nalle, Sara. "A Saint for All Seasons: The Cult of San Julián." In *Culture and Control in Counter-Reformation Spain*, edited by Anne J. Cruz and Mary Elizabeth Perry, 25-50. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1992.
- Pacheco, Francisco. *El Arte de la Pintura*. Edited by Francisco J Sánchez Cantón. Madrid: Instituto de Valencia de D. Juan, 1956.
- _____. "El Arte de la Pintura." In *Artists' Technique in Golden Age Spain: six treaties in translation*, edited and translated by Zahira Veliz, 35-106. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1986.
- Perry, Mary Elizabeth. *Crime and Society in Early Modern Seville*. Hanover: University Press of New England Press, 1980.
- _____. *Gender and Disorder in Early Modern Seville*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1990.
- Phillips, Carla Rahn. "Visualizing Imperium: The Virgin of the Seafarers and Spain's Self-Image in the early Sixteenth-Century." *Renaissance Quarterly* 58, no. 3 (2005):815-856.
- Pike,Ruth. *Aristocrats and Traders: Sevillian Society in the Sixteenth Century*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1972.
- Pumfrey, Stephen and Paolo L. Rossi. *Science, culture and popular belief in Renaissance Europe*. Edited by Maurice Slawinski. New York: St. Martin's University Press, 1994.

- Quintanadueñas, Antonio de. *Santos de la ciudad de Sevilla y su arcobispado: Fiestas, que su Santa Iglesia Metropolitana celebra*. Seville: F de Lyra, 1637.
- Rawlings, Helen. *The Spanish Inquisition*. Malden: Blackwell Publishing, 2006.
- Roe, Jeremy. "The Preacher's Perspicuitas and Velázquez's 'Truthful Imitation of Nature': An Examination of Scholarly Attitudes to Religious Painting." *Bulletin of Spanish Studies* 82, no. 4 (2005): 735-751.
- Rosenthal, Earl. "The Diffusion of the Italian Renaissance Style in Western European Art." *Sixteenth Century Journal* 9 (1978): 33-45.
- Ruiz, Teofilo. "Elite and Popular Culture in Late Fifteenth Castilian Festivals: The Case of Jaen." In *City and Spectacle in Medieval Europe*, edited by Barbra A. Hanawalt and Kathryn L Reyerson, 296-318. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1997.
- Schutte, Jacobson. *Aspiring Saints: Pretense of Holiness, Inquisition, and Gender in the Republic of Venice, 1618-1750*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001.
- Scott, Joan Wallach. *Gender and the Politics of History*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1999.
- Serrea, Miguel Juan. "Velazques and Sevillian Painting of his Time." In *Velázquez in Seville*, edited by Michael Clarke, 37-44. Edinburgh: National Trustees of the National Galleries of Scotland, 1996.
- Tiffany, Tanya J. "Visualizing Devotion in Early Modern Seville: Velázquez's Christ in the House of Martha and Mary." *Sixteenth Century Journal* 36, no. 2 (2005): 433-453.
- Villaseñor Black, Charlene. *Creating the Cult of St. Joseph: Art and Gender in the Spanish Empire*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2006.
- Vives, Juan Luis. *The Education of a Christian Women: a sixteenth century manual*. Edited and Translated by Charles Fantazzi. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000.
- Wardropper, Bruce. "The Search for a Dramatic Formula for the Auto Sacramental." *PMLA* 65, no. 6 (1950): 1196-1211.
- Webb, Diana. "Introduction." In *Saints and Cities in Medieval Italy*. Edited and Translated by Diana Webb. New York: Manchester University Press, 2003.

Weber, Susan Verdi. *Art and Ritual in Golden-Age Spain: Sevillian Confraternities and the Processional Sculpture of Holy Week*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press: 1998.

Wunder, Amanda. "Classical, Christian, and Muslim Remains in the Construction of Imperial Seville 1520-1635." *Journal of the History of Ideas* vol. 64, no. 2 (2003): 195-212.

_____. "Murillo and the canonisation case of San Fernando, 1649-52." *Burlington Magazine* 143 (2001): 670-675.