



University of Groningen

## Obstacles to linking emissions trading systems in the EU and China

Zeng, Yingying

**IMPORTANT NOTE:** You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

### *Document Version*

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

### *Publication date:*

2018

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

### *Citation for published version (APA):*

Zeng, Y. (2018). Obstacles to linking emissions trading systems in the EU and China: A comparative law and economics perspective. [Groningen]: University of Groningen.

### **Copyright**

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

### **Take-down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

# **OBSTACLES TO LINKING EMISSIONS TRADING SYSTEMS IN THE EU AND CHINA**

*A Comparative Law & Economics Perspective*

**YINGYING ZENG**



© Yingying Zeng 2018

ISBN: 978-94-034-1225-2

ISBN: 978-94-034-1224-5 (electronic version)

Cover Art: Yingying Zeng

Cover Picture Design: Lysbert Schuitema & Manqi Zhao

Layout Design & Printing: Ridderprint BV, the Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior written permission of the author.



university of  
 groningen

# Obstacles to Linking Emissions Trading Systems in the EU and China

A Comparative Law and Economics Perspective

PhD thesis

to obtain the degree of PhD at the  
University of Groningen  
on the authority of the  
Rector Magnificus Prof. E. Sterken  
and in accordance with  
the decision by the College of Deans.

This thesis will be defended in public on

Thursday 6 December 2018 at 12.45 hours

by

**Yingying Zeng**

born on 1 October 1990

in Hubei, China

## **Supervisors**

Prof. S. E. Weishaar

Prof. H. H. B. Vedder

## **Assessment Committee**

Prof. K. J. de Graaf

Prof. M. Duan

Prof. M. G. Faure

*Pour MH370*

*Va, Vis & Deviens*

## **Paranymphs**

Charis A. van den Berg

Xingyu Yan



# CONTENTS

<i>LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES</i>	x
<i>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</i>	xi
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background of the study	1
1.2 Research question	5
1.3 Methodology	6
1.4 Dissertation outline	14
<b>PART I ETS LINKING IN THE BIG PICTURE: THEORETICAL AND LEGAL BACKGROUND</b>	
2 ETS AND ETSS LINKING: A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE	17
2.1 ETS in the climate policy mix	17
2.2 Linking ETSs: theoretical background and linking practices	23
2.3 Conclusion	32
3 LEGAL CONSIDERATIONS ON AN EU-CHINA ETS LINKAGE	33
3.1 Climate change regulatory framework in the EU and China	33
3.2 A comparison of ETS designs in the EU and China	43
3.3 Legal constraints on linking the EU ETS to the China ETS	48
3.4 Conclusion	55

4	POTENTIAL OBSTACLES TO A ‘DIRECT AND FULL’ EU-CHINA LINKAGE: LAW & ECONOMICS CONSIDERATIONS	57
4.1	Analytical framework of the dissertation	57
4.2	ETS designs as obstacles to linking?	59
4.3	Carbon regulatory features as linking barriers?	67
4.4	Conclusion	69

## **PART II DIFFERENCES IN THE ETS DESIGNS: LINKING OBSTACLES?**

5	DIFFERENCES IN THE CAP DESIGN AND LINKING	71
5.1	Introduction	71
5.2	Elements of cap setting	73
5.3	Examining the legal framework: an analysis of cap setting in the EU and China	75
5.4	A Law & Economics analysis of the caps	89
5.5	Implications of linking the EU ETS to the Chinese national ETS: a qualitative cost-benefit analysis	92
5.6	Conclusion	96
6	DIFFERENCES IN THE MRV PRACTICES, CARBON LEAKAGE AND ETSS LINKING	99
6.1	Introduction	99
6.2	Electricity regulation and double counting in China	103
6.3	Electricity leakage implications in the China ETS: evidence from the regulatory framework of inter-regional electricity trade	109
6.4	Linking the China ETS to the EU ETS: implications of China ETS’ electricity leakage for the EU	124
6.5	Conclusions and policy implications	127

## **PART III CARBON REGULATORY FEATURES AS LINKING HURDLES?**

7	CARBON ETS REGULATORY FEATURES AND LINKING	131
7.1	Determinations to initiate and implement an effective ETS?	133
7.2	Concerns over the ETS enforcement: obstacles to linking?	134
7.3	‘Carbon governance structure’ as linking barriers?	140
7.4	Conclusions	143

8	INDIRECT DOUBLE REGULATION (IDR) AND LINKING: CASE OF COAL-FIRED GENERATION	145
8.1	Introduction	145
8.2	Examining the carbon regulatory framework for coal-fired power: evidence of IDR	148
8.3	Mixed effects of the IDR in the EU and China: a Law & Economics justification?	161
8.4	Linking the China ETS to the EU ETS: implications of IDR for its linked partner	170
8.5	Conclusions and policy implications	173
<b>PART IV PAVING THE ROAD TOWARDS LINKING</b>		
9	CONCLUSIONS AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS	179
9.1	Original findings: identifying incompatibility issues	180
9.2	Addressing system incompatibility: room for compromise?	184
9.3	Policy recommendations: whether, when & how to link?	186
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	190
<b>APPENDICES</b>		
	ENGLISH SUMMARY	228
	NEDERLANDSE SAMENVATTING	232

## LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

Table 3-1	List of referencing normative documents in the China ETSs	39
Table 3-2	A comparison of ETS designs and carbon regulatory features in the EU and China	43
Figure 4-1	Analytical framework	58
Table 5-1	Ex-post adjustment rules in the Chinese pilots	82
Table 5-2	Clarity and transparency of cap setting in the Chinese pilots	86
Table 5-3	Comparison of cap setting between the EU and China	88
Table 6-1	Potential regional differences of the ETS rules in the Chinese electricity sector (Phase I)	114
Figure 6-1	Electricity flow from regions with high REEFs to regions with lower REEFs in China (2011)	118
Table 8-1	A comparison of 'carbon tax' (on coal and coal-fired power) between the EU and China	151
Table 8-2	CO <sub>2</sub> emission intensity for coal-fired generation by high emitting countries in the EU (gCO <sub>2</sub> /kWh) (2010-2014)	153
Table 8-3	ETS cost burdens by high emitting countries in the EU (EUR/MWh) (2010-2014)	153
Figure 8-1	Effective energy tax rates on electricity in the EU (business use)	154
Figure 8-2	Effective energy tax rates on electricity in the EU (non-business use)	154
Table 8-4	Double carbon cost burdens (ETS-tax) by high emitting countries in the EU (EUR/MWh) (2014)	156
Figure 8-3	Resources tax rates on coal and provincial coal production in China	157
Figure 8-4	Double carbon cost burdens by 10 largest coal-producing provinces in China (Bituminous coal-5000 Kcal/kg) (CNY/tCoal)	159
Figure 8-5	Double carbon cost burdens by 10 largest coal-producing provinces in China (Anthracite-5500Kcal/kg) (CNY/tCoal)	159
Table 8-5	Projected ETS cost burdens on generators from coal-combustion in the Chinese national ETS (CNY/tCoal)	160
Table 8-6	Double carbon cost burdens on coal-fired generators in China (EUR/MWh)	168