

Western  Graduate&PostdoctoralStudies

Western University  
Scholarship@Western

---

Electronic Thesis and Dissertation Repository

---

9-26-2019 1:15 PM

## No Coward Plays Hockey

Rachael Bishop  
*The University of Western Ontario*

Supervisor  
Schneider, Angela  
*The University of Western Ontario*

Graduate Program in Kinesiology  
A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree in Master of Arts  
© Rachael Bishop 2019

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/etd>



Part of the [Feminist Philosophy Commons](#), and the [Sports Studies Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Bishop, Rachael, "No Coward Plays Hockey" (2019). *Electronic Thesis and Dissertation Repository*. 6575.  
<https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/etd/6575>

This Dissertation/Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by Scholarship@Western. It has been accepted for inclusion in Electronic Thesis and Dissertation Repository by an authorized administrator of Scholarship@Western. For more information, please contact [wlsadmin@uwo.ca](mailto:wlsadmin@uwo.ca).

## Abstract

This thesis examined the landscape of women's hockey in Canada, and focused on the national women's hockey team, and how the treatment of female hockey players in the Canadian media, and in the eyes of the Canadian public, differs from the treatment of male hockey players. This thesis drew on three different research methods: an ethical/philosophical analysis, a media analysis and a narrative analysis.

The ethical analysis took a philosophical approach and discussed the different rules in men's and women's hockey. The ethical analysis also discussed other issues in hockey such as paternalism versus free will, and gender segregation in sport. The media analysis consisted of a content analysis centering on major Canadian newspapers published over the last 29 years, in order to see how these newspapers viewed female hockey players and women's hockey in general. Finally, this thesis included a narrative analysis. The narrative analysis consisted of two separate types of narratives: a story analyst approach; and a personal narrative approach. The story analyst approach acted as a continuation of the media analysis and examined key themes and ideas from the media analysis and created a story from those data. The personal experience narrative was told from the first person. In this section, I added to the narrative surrounding women's hockey in Canada by contributing my own stories from ten years of playing competitive girls' hockey in the Greater Toronto Area.

**Keywords:** Canada, hockey, women, paternalism, free will/liberty, Harm Principle, continuity thesis, separation thesis, International Ice Hockey Federation

### **Lay Summary**

As a former competitive hockey player, I wanted to examine the overall treatment of Canadian female hockey players compared to their male counterparts. This Master's thesis took a multidisciplinary approach, drawing upon key philosophical, sociological and feminist constructs. It used an ethical analysis (analytical analysis), a media content analysis and a narrative analysis. In particular, much of this thesis is dedicated to an exploration of the ideals of John Stuart Mill, a prominent 19th century British philosopher. His ethical concepts of Utilitarianism and Liberty are applicable to sports, and to hockey in particular. Overall, this thesis analyzed Canada's national sport using a variety of qualitative research methods not typically brought together in a single research study. It demonstrated the unequal treatment of women in hockey and evaluated the current state of the women's game in Canada.

### **Acknowledgements**

First and foremost, I would like to thank my thesis supervisor, Dr. Angela Schneider, for her support over these past two years; her help has been extremely beneficial. I would also like to thank the other members of my committee, Dr. Mac Ross and Dr. Bob Barney, for their insights on this thesis. Their excellent graduate-level courses enriched my experience at Western and made me a better scholar. They ensured my time in graduate school was productive and memorable. I know that everything I have learned at Western will help me immensely in the future.

I would also like to thank the rest of my professors and the entire Kinesiology Department at Western. I would be nowhere without their support and guidance; they have helped me become a more attentive, well-rounded student.

Last, I would like to thank my parents for their unwavering support and the countless hours they have spent reading my work, not only at the Master's level, but throughout my entire academic career. They burnt the midnight oil many more nights than one. I thank them for sticking with me throughout this process and giving up much of their free time to challenge my arguments as well as my prose. They ensured that I was able to submit a polished final product.

## Table of Contents

<b>Abstract</b> .....	<b>i</b>
<b>Lay Summary</b> .....	<b>ii</b>
<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	<b>iii</b>
<b>Chapter One</b> .....	<b>1</b>
I) Introduction.....	1
i) Statement of Research Question.....	4
ii) Brief History of Women’s Hockey in 20th Century Canada.....	4
iii) Methodology.....	9
iv) Methods.....	11
v) Delimitations and Limitations.....	16
<b>Chapter Two: Literature Review</b> .....	<b>17</b>
i) The Development of Canadian Women’s Hockey.....	17
ii) Women’s Hockey and Female Coaches at the Olympics.....	24
iii) A League of Their Own: The Golden Olympics and the Creation of the CWHL.....	26
iv) The Problem With Women’s Hockey: Two Team Domination Continues.....	31
v) Heartbreak in South Korea and Women’s Hockey Expansion.....	33
vi) Gender and Ethics in Women’s Hockey: Sociocultural Constructs.....	35
vii) The Struggle for Legitimacy: Gender Segregation in Sport.....	42
<b>Chapter Three</b> .....	<b>53</b>
I) Ethical and Philosophical Analysis.....	53
i) Utilitarianism and Liberty.....	53
ii) Philosophy of Sport.....	71
<b>Chapter Four</b> .....	<b>89</b>
I) Media Content Analysis.....	89
i) Media Methodology.....	91
ii) Media Findings .....	95
II) Narrative Analysis.....	103
i) Critical Discourse Analysis.....	103
ii) Summary.....	105
iii) Personal Narrative.....	114
<b>Chapter Five: Conclusion</b> .....	<b>130</b>
I) Recommendations for Future Research.....	139
<b>Bibliography</b> .....	<b>140</b>
i) Books.....	140
ii) Peer Reviewed Journal Articles.....	142
iii) Newspapers and Magazines.....	144
iv) Websites.....	148
v) Documentaries.....	154
vi) Miscellaneous/Other.....	154
<b>Curriculum Vitae</b> .....	<b>156</b>

## List of Appendices

<b>Appendix</b> .....	<b>157</b>
l) Key Words Frequency Table.....	157

## **Chapter One: Introduction, Methods, Methodology, Delimitations and Limitations**

### **Introduction**

The complex relationship between gender and sport is not a new subject. In fact, as this thesis suggests, gender issues have stirred debate in hockey for almost 50 years. The modern genesis is traceable to the unofficial Russian hockey anthem “No Coward Plays Hockey” — a song written during the Cold War era and made popular during the 1972 Canada-Russia Summit Series, a hockey series featuring extreme violence and mutual disregard.<sup>1</sup> As a former competitive hockey player, I am intrigued by the social and ethical constructs that appear in hockey, namely those surrounding gender, sport, violence, and masculinity/femininity.

Since Canadian women began to play hockey, over 125 years ago, they have struggled to gain the same respect amongst the general population as their male counterparts. The early days of women’s hockey consisted largely of recreational, informal play.<sup>2</sup> However, some scholars argue “there is evidence of a number of competitive women’s teams existing by the time of the First World War.”<sup>3</sup> The main reason for women’s participation in hockey in this early period was that men who would otherwise be playing hockey were away at war.<sup>4</sup>

While examining the history of women’s hockey in Canada more deeply, it is helpful to give a working definition of the term “sport” for this thesis. (The terms *sport* and *sports* are

---

<sup>1</sup> Roy Macskimming, *Cold War: The Amazing Canada-Soviet Hockey Series of 1972* (Vancouver, BC: Greystone Books, 1996), 193.

<sup>2</sup> Richard Gruneau and David Whitson, *Hockey Night in Canada: Sport Identities and Cultural Politics* (Toronto: Garamond Press, 1993), 169.

<sup>3</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid*

deemed equivalent in this thesis and are used interchangeably). However, defining sport is challenging because no consensus exists on what qualifies as sport. Bernard Suits, in his seminal work, *Grasshopper: Games, Life and Utopia*, provided the most accurate and appropriate definition of “play” and “game” — which is ultimately what sport is about, playing a game. He stated, “my conclusion is that to play a game is to engage in activity directed towards bringing about a specific state of affairs, using only means permitted by rules, where the rules prohibit more efficient in favour of less efficient means, and where such rules are accepted just because they make possible such activity.”<sup>5</sup> Suits further expanded this definition by creating four distinct elements of game playing. Namely, he argued that games are goal-oriented activities, which involve choice, “so ends (goal) and means are two elements involved in games.”<sup>6</sup> Additionally, players cannot reach their overarching goal if consistent rules are not in place on how to get there — thus rules make up the third element of a game. Finally, in order to have a proper game, willing participants must be present to play. Therefore, attitude/motivation, or what Suits labels “the lusory attitude,” is the final component of a ‘game.’ A game is a ludic activity or play.<sup>7</sup>

The official, most widely accepted international definition of “sport” comes from Sportaccord, the umbrella association that represents all the world’s major international sports organizations. Sportaccord also claims that sport includes four components. However, this definition is fully under debate, depending on one’s subject matter expertise, (historians, sociologists, etc., may have different definitions). Despite the debate, for the purposes of this thesis, the Sportaccord definition is the one that will be relied on more as this could be an

---

<sup>5</sup> Bernard Suits, *The Grasshopper: Games, Life, and Utopia* (Tonawanda, NY: Broadview Press, 2014), 36.

<sup>6</sup> *Ibid*, 37.

<sup>7</sup> *Ibid*, 37.



entirely separate thesis on the definition of sport itself and beyond the scope of this project on women's ice hockey. Sportaccord argues that a sport should have a competitive element against another opponent; sport cannot be harmful to any living entity; sport cannot be reliant on equipment provided by a single supplier/company, (with the exception of Arena Football and similar sports); and last, a sport cannot rely solely on luck as an element designed specifically into the sport.<sup>8</sup> However, as we know, luck is a factor in many sports, such as hockey, but luck is not designated as an element of hockey; it is a natural occurrence as in a number of other sports. One can argue that athleticism and use of the body are other key elements of sport.

Some of the ethical aspects pertaining to gender and hockey in Canada include the pay disparity of male and female athletes, different rules for male and female sports and gender segregation. Masculinity versus femininity and other issues are discussed in this thesis. Leslie Howe, Charlene Weaving, Torbjörn Tännsjö, Helen Lenskjy, M. Ann Hall, Jodi H. Cohen, Judy Davidson, and Tamar Z Semerjian were the main gender and sport ethics scholars or philosophers considered in this thesis. Important feminist sociologists such as R.W. Connell, Nancy Theberge, Julie Stevens, Carly Adams, Mary Louise Adams, Danielle Di Carlo, and Kelly Poniatowski provided vital theoretical and conceptual information—such as the concept of hegemonic masculinity, and how it can be applied in sports from a feminist perspective. In addition, a variety of supplementary sources such as academic journal articles, a CBC (Canadian Broadcasting Corporation) documentary mini-series, and various archives of newspaper and magazine articles were also analyzed in order to provide the reader with a basic understanding of the history of women's hockey.

---

<sup>8</sup> "Global Association of Sports Federation," *Sportaccord*, last modified October 2, 2018, <https://gaisf.sport>.

I further separated the sports ethics section in this thesis into two main categories: utilitarianism and liberty, namely using the famed 19<sup>th</sup> century British philosopher J.S. Mill and a general philosophy of sport section, using more contemporary philosophers.

### **Statement of the Research Question**

Utilizing an interdisciplinary approach comprising history, philosophy/sport ethics and sociology, the following research questions were answered:

- a) *What are the dominant messages and representations about Canadian women's hockey in an ethical context? How do these dominant messages and representations compare to the dominant messages and representations of Canadian men's hockey?*
- b) *What is the response of the Canadian media and the general public to such (ethical) representations?*
- c) *What narrative themes create the popular story about women in hockey and about the National Women's Hockey Team?*

### **A Brief History of Women's Hockey in 20<sup>th</sup> Century Canada**

Women's hockey has a long history, dating back to the very early days of the sport. Thanks to a newspaper clipping from *The Ottawa Citizen*, many sport scholars are in agreement that the earliest known recorded women's hockey game took place in Ottawa on February 11<sup>th</sup>, 1891 between two unknown teams, "simply designated one and two."<sup>9</sup> Of course, this being the late nineteenth century, hockey games were still predominately played outdoors on ponds and

---

<sup>9</sup> M. Ann Hall, *The Girl and the Game: A History of Women's Hockey in Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016), 57.

lakes as there were few indoor hockey rinks then. Women's hockey in Western Canada was also thriving at this time. Women's hockey in the West, Central Canada and the East was largely the same. The only real difference was that the teams in Ontario and Quebec consisted mainly of University-affiliated hockey teams, whereas the women who played hockey in Western Canada during the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> century mostly played on local, community teams.<sup>10</sup>

Women's hockey owes a debt to Lord Frederick Stanley, the British nobleman and sixth Governor General of Canada, the man famous for the eponymous Stanley Cup. Stanley's daughter Isobel was an avid hockey fan, and one of the first women's hockey players in Canada. Isobel was one of the women who played in that match in 1891 in Ottawa, and thanks to a photograph from the game shown in the *Ottawa Citizen*, with Isobel — a British noblewoman — playing hockey, women's hockey exploded in popularity across the country. In the early days of organized women's hockey, the games were often not open to the public, and the ones that were often were not well attended.<sup>11</sup> This shows that since the days of the sport's existence, female hockey players have had a very tenuous grip on hockey in Canada.

However, World War One changed everything, including the role of women in society. During the first World War, a semi-professional women's hockey league existed in Montréal in 1915, and women were paid to play hockey. However, women played in skirts and bloomers, and not in hockey pants as men did, as it was unheard of for a woman to wear pants at that time. Unfortunately, the league lasted a mere two years before it ceased operations in 1917, the year before World War One ended and professional men's hockey could return as a the cultural

---

<sup>10</sup> *Ibid*, 59.

<sup>11</sup> Johanna Avery and Julie Stevens, *Too Many Men on the Ice: Women's Hockey in North America* (Victoria: Polestar Book Publishers, 1997), 61-63.

norm.<sup>12</sup> Despite its brief lifeline, the league proved to be a success for women's sport, as some games attracted approximately 2,000 fans, which was a significant number of people for the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. This women's league even played full contact (body checking) hockey, with similar rules to those of the National Hockey Association (the NHA; the precursor to what is now the National Hockey League or NHL).<sup>13</sup>

Despite the fact that the professional women's league folded, there was still ample opportunity for women to play competitive amateur hockey throughout the country. The competitive amateur female hockey players played a rough and tumble style of hockey in the 1920s; play was brutally physical at times, and injuries were common.<sup>14</sup> Yet despite this history of physicality and aggression in women's hockey, men's hockey remains the present-day model for all elements of hockey, including physicality and violence.<sup>15</sup>

Women's hockey thrived in Canada until the late 1930s, when it disappeared for over two decades, before organized women's hockey finally reappeared in the 60s.<sup>16</sup> Even as late as the 1980s, women were discouraged from playing hockey; ringette was the sport of choice. Ringette is a sport similar to hockey that only females play. It is played with a ring instead of a puck and a full-face shield; it lacked the physicality of competitive boys' hockey. Toronto, for example, did

---

<sup>12</sup> Richard Gruneau and David Whitson, *Hockey Night in Canada: Sport Identities and Cultural Politics* (Toronto: Garamond Press, 1993), 169.

<sup>13</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>14</sup> Carly Adams, "Troubling Bodies: 'The Canadian Girl, the Ice Rink, and the Banff Winter Carnival,'" *Journal of Canadian Studies*, 48, no. 3 (2014): 200-220, <https://muse.jhu.edu/>.

<sup>15</sup> Richard Gruneau and David Whitson, *Hockey Night in Canada: Sport Identities and Cultural Politics* (Toronto: Garamond Press, 1993), 169.

<sup>16</sup> Wayne Norton, *Women on the Ice; The Early Years of Women's Hockey in Western Canada* (Vancouver: Ronsdale Press, 2009), 110-111.

have girls' hockey teams by the 1980s, but these teams were few in number. Girls' hockey lacked the competition and excitement of the boys' game, was similar to ringette, did not involve body checking, and required a full-face shield, no matter the level of play.<sup>17</sup>

Conversely, at this time the NHL did not require helmets. At the start of the 1979-1980 season, helmets were grandfathered into the league. This meant that all new players would have to wear a helmet until eventually every single player in the league wore a helmet. The last helmetless NHL player (Craig MacTavish) did not leave the rink until 1997.<sup>18</sup>

Girls' and women's hockey struggled for funding, access to arenas, prime ice time and good coaching. As future Olympians such as Hayley Wickenheiser, Cassie Campbell and Manon Rhéaume matured, funding improved. However, minor girls' hockey still lacked the status and respect afforded to minor boys' hockey. It was not until the first Women's World Hockey Championship, held in Ottawa in 1990 and televised nationally on The Sports Network (TSN), that Canada's National Women's Hockey team, sporting provocative pink jerseys, gained some nationwide recognition and respect from the media and general public.<sup>19</sup> The head coach of the 2002 gold medal Canadian Olympic women's hockey team, Danielle Sauvageau, claims that when she first started coaching girls' hockey, "the only person watching the games would be the Zamboni driver."<sup>20</sup>

---

<sup>17</sup> Richard Gruneau and David Whitson, *Hockey Night in Canada: Sport Identities and Cultural Politics* (Toronto: Garamond Press, 1993), 171.

<sup>18</sup> Bill Beacon, "NHL 100: Helmets, Power Plays Highlight Hockey's Evolution," *CBC Sports*, last modified January 10, 2017, <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/nhl/nhl-100-helmets-power-plays-long-way-1.3928952>.

<sup>19</sup> *Hockey, a People's History*, episode 8, "Hope and Betrayal," directed by Marcy Cuttler, aired October 8, 2006, on CBC, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=l0rO1o4oPb8&list=PLuXuCOif7-UJpJHNBVb6ZwRCKg1gy8pKi&index=9>.

<sup>20</sup> *Hockey, a People's History*, episode 10, "Reclaiming the Game," directed by Michael Claydon, aired October 15, 2006, on CBC, [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mTH3C6\\_unzU&frags=pl%2Cwn](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mTH3C6_unzU&frags=pl%2Cwn).

This is now, of course, no longer the case. Thanks to the 1990 Women's World Championships, Women's hockey was finally here to stay, some 100 years after women started playing the sport.<sup>21</sup> Yet it would take another 17 years for the first financially stable semi-professional women's hockey league to be created in Canada, the Canadian Women's Hockey League.<sup>22</sup> Moreover, it was not until 2017 that the CWHL was able to pay its players a small, albeit insufficient wage, with salaries ranging from \$2,000 to \$10,000 CDN a year for the first season.<sup>23</sup> However, the North American players playing in China were paid significantly more, (up \$60,000, a comfortable living wage), with all expensed covered, as the Chinese CWHL were separately owned and therefore not privy to the salary cap constraints of the CWHL.<sup>24</sup>

It is somewhat poetic that the first season that Canada's elite female hockey players finally got paid was the same year that the NHL celebrated its centennial anniversary—a league where the highest paid superstar now makes almost 16 million USD a year (John Tavares of the Toronto Maple Leafs).<sup>25</sup> Just two years after the CWHL started paying its players, the league ceased operations, citing an “unsustainable economic business model.”<sup>26</sup>

---

<sup>21</sup> Patrick A. Reid, and Daniel Mason, “Women Can't Skate That Fast and Shoot That Hard!,” *The International Journal of the History of Sport*, 32, no.14 (2016): 1678-1696, accessed August 16, 2018, <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/09523367.2015.1121867>.

<sup>22</sup> Toronto Star, “Players Form New Hockey League,” *The Toronto Star* (Sept. 27, 2007): [https://www.thestar.com/sports/2007/09/27/players\\_form\\_new\\_canadian\\_womens\\_hockey\\_league.html](https://www.thestar.com/sports/2007/09/27/players_form_new_canadian_womens_hockey_league.html).

<sup>23</sup> Rachel Brady, “Canadian Women's Hockey League Will Begin Paying Its Players,” *The Globe and Mail* (Sept. 1, 2017): <https://beta.theglobeandmail.com/sports/hockey/cwhl-will-pay-its-players-for-the-first-time-starting-this-season/article36139819/>.

<sup>24</sup> Kristina Rutherford, “Making it in China,” *Sportsnet*, last modified 2018, <https://www.sportsnet.ca/hockey/nhl/cwhl-china-hockey-krs-vanke-shenzhen/>.

<sup>25</sup> “Active Player Salaries,” *CapFriendly*, last modified October 16, 2018, <https://www.capfriendly.com/browse/active/2019/salary>.

<sup>26</sup> Kevin McGran, “The Canadian Women's Hockey League is Folding, Says Business Model Isn't the Right One,” *The Toronto Star* (March 31, 2019): <https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/2019/03/31/canadian-womens-hockey-league-is-folding-board-says-business-model-is-financially-unsustainable.html>.

## Methodology

After examining the existing research, three main thematic categories appeared to be the most prominent for further analysis: gender, violence, and masculinity versus femininity, with specific emphasis on women's hockey in Canada. Additionally, since this thesis used a variety of sources that overlap with different subject areas (history, sport ethics/sport philosophy), a mixed-methods, multidisciplinary analysis seemed most appropriate to answer the research questions I have described on page four. For the purpose of this thesis, a mixed-methods, multidisciplinary approach requires, in part, types of qualitative (non-numerical, non-statistical) research data. However, the first method of analysis is a critical philosophical and ethical analysis, which takes an analytical approach. Given that this thesis includes a sport ethics analysis, this is perhaps the important method used at a fundamental level. The most appropriate ethical framework I have found to fit this topic is John Stuart Mill's Harm Principle, especially fitting for sports and violence, one of the main topics of this thesis. The Harm Principle is instructive when contrasted with paternalism. In simplest terms, the Harm Principle states that as long as the action does no harm to others, then paternalism, or interference, is not justified.<sup>27</sup> This argument will be discussed in greater detail later in this thesis.

Additionally, in the anthology *Ethics in Sport*, J.S. Russell, a Philosophy/Ethics of Sport Professor at Langara College in Vancouver,<sup>28</sup> applied his own ethical lens to boxing: the separation versus continuity thesis.<sup>29</sup> Since hockey and boxing are both violent sports, many of

---

<sup>27</sup> Robert L. Simon, "Violence in Sports," in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 379-387.

<sup>28</sup> "Department of Philosophy: John Russell," *Langara College*, last modified February 21, 2019, <https://langara.ca/departments/philosophy/faculty.html>.

<sup>29</sup> J.S. Russell, "Broad Internalism and Moral Foundations in Sport," in *Ethics and Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 51-65.

the same ethical theories and analyses apply. I used this framework for my analysis to answer my first two-part research question: *What are the dominant messages and representations about Canadian women's hockey in an ethical context? How do these dominant messages and representations compare to the dominant messages and representations of Canadian men's hockey?*

Since much of my research involved media resources (newspapers, documentary video), one of the main methods I used in this thesis was media content analysis, which constitutes an analysis of language and communication in the media, in other words, the construction of meaning.<sup>30</sup> I applied media analysis to answer the second research question, which is a follow-up from the first research question: *What is the response of the Canadian media and the general public to such (ethical) representations?*

The third method I chose to examine regarding gender, masculinity/femininity and violence in Canadian women's hockey was narrative. Before an event or idea becomes reality in the media, it is formed as a narrative. I used two types of narrative analysis to answer the third research question: *What narrative themes create the popular story about women in hockey and about the National Women's Hockey Team?*

According to several scholars: Alan Bryman, the late British professor of organizational and social research at the University of Leicester in the UK;<sup>31</sup> Edward Bell, a political/statistical sociologist at Western University, Brescia College in London, ON;<sup>32</sup> and James Teevan, a former

---

<sup>30</sup> Alan Bryman, Edward Bell, and James Teevan, "Glossary," in *Social Research Methods*, (Ontario: Oxford University Press, 2012), 367-375.

<sup>31</sup> Bryman, Alan "In Memory of Alan Bryman," *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 21, no. 3 (2018) 267-274. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13645579.2018.1436428?journalCode=tsrm20>

<sup>32</sup> "Faculty: Dr. Edward Bell," *Brescia University College*, last modified 2018, <http://brescia.uwo.ca/about/our-people/our-faculty/faculty-dr-edward-bell/>.



sociology and research methods professor at Western University, there are four types of narrative analysis: **thematic, structural, interactional and performative.**<sup>33</sup> However, for the purpose of this thesis, I instead chose Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) for part one of the narrative analysis. A full definition of CDA is provided in the following Methods section. Unlike the prototypes of narrative analysis postulated by Bryman, Bell and Teevan, CDA offers the advantage of a single narrative theme that explores the content of a story. The second half of my narrative took the storyteller/autoethnographic approach, which was based upon my own personal experience.

### **Methods**

In order to reflect on the ethical issues surrounding gender and hockey in Canada, I applied an in-depth ethical/philosophical analysis. As mentioned earlier, Russell's continuity thesis, paternalism, and Mill's Harm Principle were the basis of this method. I applied the continuity thesis and the theme of paternalism to the Canadian women's hockey team and contrasted it with the Harm Principle. My analysis also covered a variety of issues in women's hockey, such as rule differences between men's and women's hockey, and the prohibition of bodychecking in women's hockey. I also examined gender segregation in sports, and whether it is ethical to continue this practice.

The continuity thesis supports paternalism and debunks liberty and free will or the Harm Principle, a term coined by the 19<sup>th</sup> century British philosopher John Stuart Mill. Mill, a strong

---

<sup>33</sup> "James J Teevan Obituary," *Your Life Moments*, last modified February 21, 2019, <http://yourlifemoments.ca/sitepages/obituary.asp?old=421503>.

proponent of individual free will, argued against paternalism.<sup>34</sup> He claimed that as long as a person's action does not harm/threaten others, or damage society, it is unjust to interfere with that action.<sup>35</sup> In other words, individuals have the right to freedom and autonomy, within reason, without any external interference, except when children are involved, or, as Mill put it, "the mentally incompetent." Paternalism, on the other hand, allows for external interference for a person's own good.<sup>36</sup> For example, the government has clear laws on the mandatory use of seat belts. With the exception of New Hampshire, it is illegal for adults not to wear a seat belt when riding in an automobile in Canada and the United States.<sup>37</sup> The government, and those in favour of paternalism, agree that since seat belts save lives and cost to society, the mandatory use of seatbelts serves an individual's and society's wellbeing. Not wearing seat belts causes immense harm to society due to injury and death that may result.

My analysis applies the concept of free will and liberty (Harm Principle) to the ethical issues in hockey I have mentioned previously. Although the primary focus of this thesis is women's hockey, men's hockey is discussed as a comparison, especially regarding violence in hockey. The separation versus continuity thesis is another topic examined in the ethical analysis. The separation thesis claims that morals and values found in sport stand on their own, unrelated to general Western societal morals and values.<sup>38</sup> On the other hand, the continuity thesis argues

---

<sup>34</sup> Christopher MacLeod, "John Stuart Mill," *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, last modified August 25, 2016, <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/mill/>.

<sup>35</sup> Robert L. Simon, "Violence in Sports," in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 379-387.

<sup>36</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>37</sup> "New Hampshire Debates Seatbelt Bill," *Associated Press*, last modified October 7, 2018, <https://www.seattletimes.com/nation-world/new-hampshire-debates-seat-belt-bill/>.

<sup>38</sup> J.S. Russell, "Broad Internalism and Moral Foundations in Sport," in *Ethics and Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 51-65.

that morals and values found in sport are reflective of morals and values found in Western society.<sup>39</sup> Using Russell, Simon and Mill, I attempted to answer following research questions: *What are the dominant messages and representations about Canadian women's hockey in an ethical context? How do these dominant messages and representations compare to the dominant messages and representations of Canadian men's hockey?*

In order to find the primary sources needed for my second research method—media content analysis—I conducted a Canadian daily newspaper search on the database LexisNexis. I chose LexisNexis because it offered me the widest scope of articles, and therefore gave me the most with which to work. Additionally, I targeted 1990 as my “start date” for this media analysis, the year of the first Women’s World Hockey Championship, held in Ottawa. The end date for this analysis is the current year 2019. These 29 years are the richest source for my analysis since women’s hockey did not get much media attention until the sport achieved its first major championship in 1990. Moreover, a duration of 29 years provided a significant time span for patterns to emerge.

For scope, I limited my search to the two main Canadian English dailies: *The Toronto Star* and *The Globe and Mail*, which are among the most widely circulated papers in the country. Other newspapers were consulted if they contained useful articles. To make sure my search was focused, yet not too narrow, I used key words such as “women’s hockey at the (add year) Olympics/World Championships,” “Canadian women’s hockey team,” and “women’s ice hockey” were also used. However, since my search is limited strictly to Canadian newspapers, the addition of “ice” was not necessary as Canadians do not call hockey “ice hockey,” but rather just “hockey.”

---

<sup>39</sup> *Ibid*

Had I had more time, I would have analyzed other forms of media, not just newspapers. For example, hockey broadcasts also provide an array of information needed to complete a media analysis. YouTube provided a limited number of historic hockey games posted for free public consumption on its website (YouTube hockey highlights are ample). Additionally, the CBC website (CBC broadcast the 2002, 2006, 2014 and 2018 Winter Olympics) contained archival video footage as well as articles dating back many years. Decades' worth of old newspapers and magazines were available at the Doc Seaman Hockey Hall of Fame Resource Centre in Toronto but were not used due to time constraints.

I utilized an inductive approach for my media content analysis (analyzing the general themes that emerged from the particular data, instead of trying to fit pre-existing themes into the data). However, some themes presented themselves early in my review of the existing literature; thus, I was able to create a hypothesis. I then coded my data. I measured how frequently certain words appeared in articles, keeping track of these words in a table in Microsoft Word. I then used these words and themes to create a coding manual and coding schedule on Microsoft Word to determine the frequency of each theme in each specific form of media (for example, how newspaper coverage may vary from paper to paper), to answer the following research question: *what is the response of the Canadian media and general public to such (ethical) representations?* The frequency table was included in the appendix.

My last and final method is a narrative analysis. As Bryman, Bell and Teevan stated, narrative analysis asks the question “how do people make sense of what happened?”<sup>40</sup> While it is typically used to examine an individual’s personal stories and histories through semi-structured

---

<sup>40</sup> Alan Bryman, Edward Bell, and James Teevan, “Qualitative Data Analysis,” in *Social Research Methods*, (Ontario: Oxford University Press, 2012), 257-270.

interviews, narrative is also used to examine the stories and histories of athletes through the media.<sup>41</sup> This is what I attempted to do with my narrative analysis. Using the frequency table, I looked for patterns and themes related to specific stories and how these stories were portrayed in the media. For example, one of the more prevalent surrounding themes that I found is the common, erroneous belief that women's hockey is not as rigorous and athletic as men's hockey.

Using an in-depth narrative analysis, I then discussed this theme further, by examining how women's hockey is portrayed in the media. As previously mentioned, I used critical discourse analysis (CDA) for this chapter as it examines the language and context of various texts. Thus, using CDA I discovered that the negativity surrounding women's hockey in the Canadian media exists because the general narrative regarding Canadian women's hockey is a negative one. This shows that media act as social constructs of male hegemonic society. Ultimately, I chose narrative analysis as my final research method as it acts as an extension of sorts to my media content analysis.

The second half of my narrative analysis comes from my ten years of experience playing competitive girls' hockey in the Greater Toronto Area, which I used to support the literature. As such, my personal experience narrative section acts an autoethnography of sorts. Using these two types of narrative analysis, I attempted to answer my third and final research question: *What narrative themes create the popular story about women in hockey and about the National Women's Hockey Team?*

---

<sup>41</sup> *Ibid*

### **Delimitations and Limitations**

The biggest delimitation in this thesis is my decision to restrict the newspaper search to only Canadian media sources. Since hockey in general and women's hockey in particular are more popular in Canada than elsewhere in the world, I assumed with reasonable confidence that the Canadian sources would be more thorough than American or global sources. Furthermore, since my focus is on women's hockey, I limited my searches to that topic. Men's hockey was examined only as a comparator (i.e., different rules in men's and women's hockey, gender sport segregation, etc.).

A limitation for this thesis was my lack of French. Since Canada is a bilingual country, and hockey is almost a religion in Québec, I can imagine that many sources would have been in French. Since I only speak English, and do not read or understand French at a high level, I was unable to examine what I am sure are numerous French language sources discussing masculinity/femininity, gender and violence in Canadian women's hockey.

## Chapter Two: Literature Review

### **The Development of Canadian Women's Hockey**

Carly Adams, one of the foremost sport history and gender scholars in the country, further examines the early days of Canadian women's hockey history. In her chapter from the edited book *Coast to Coast: Hockey in Canada to the Second World War*, Adams, an associate professor in the faculty of Kinesiology and Education at the University of Lethbridge, argued that historically women's hockey has struggled to maintain a place in the eyes of the Canadian public.<sup>42</sup> She discussed the connection between national identity, pride and hockey, Canada's winter sport. She argued that despite the national pride Canadians feel when it comes to hockey, this pride is only reserved for male hockey players. Even the most popular examples of hockey literature focus primarily on male hockey players; articles and books on women's hockey are much harder to find, and are more academic in nature.<sup>43</sup> This discussion about the lack of women's hockey coverage is examined in chapter three of this thesis, in the media content analysis.

In the second Carly Adams' piece used for this thesis, she continued her examination of women's hockey history in Canada. However, in her second peer-reviewed journal article, she carried out a case study as part of her qualitative research analysis. For her case study, she examined the former professional women's hockey team, the Preston Rivulettes. She analyzed the team, located in what is now Cambridge, in southwestern Ontario. The Rivulettes are historic, as the team had unprecedented success for the better part of the 1930s, winning 95 per

---

<sup>42</sup> "Carly Adams," *University of Lethbridge*, last modified August 22, 2019, <https://uniweb.uleth.ca/members/42>.

<sup>43</sup> Carly Adams, "Organizing Hockey for Women: The Ladies Ontario Hockey Association and the Fight for Legitimacy, 1922-1940," in *Coast to Coast: Hockey in Canada to the Second World War*, ed. John Chi-Kit Wong (Ontario: University of Toronto Press, 2009), 132-159.

cent of its games in the ten seasons the team was in existence. The Rivulettes also claimed four Dominion Cups (women's Stanley Cup for that era) and ten provincial titles. Adams and other scholars have argued that the team is one of the greatest professional hockey teams ever, and yet the team never received recognition given to iconic male hockey teams.<sup>44</sup> For example, the superstar female on that team, Hilda Ranscombe has yet to be inducted into the Hockey Hall of Fame, despite being the team's co-founder, along with her sister Nellie, and by far the best female hockey player of the decade the team lasted (1931-1940). Numerous NHL players, good players, but hardly superstars, have received induction honours. Adams noted that the fact that one of the game's original female superstars has yet to be inducted shows that despite a long and rich history, women's hockey is still not equal to men's hockey in the eyes of the Canadian public.<sup>45</sup>

Joanna Avery, an American journalist and hockey broadcaster<sup>46</sup> and Julie Stevens, an associate professor of Sports Management at Brock University,<sup>47</sup> support Adams in their book on the history and development of women's hockey in Canada and the United States. They argue that "almost singlehandedly, they (Preston Rivulettes) brought credibility, respect and admiration to women's hockey"<sup>48</sup>

---

<sup>44</sup> Carly Adams, "Queens of the Ice Lanes: The Preston Rivulettes and Women's Hockey in Canada, 1931-1940," *Sport History Review*, 39, no.1 (2008): 1-28, <https://doi-org.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/10.1123/shr.39.1.1>.

<sup>45</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>46</sup> Joanna Avery and Julie Stevens, *Too Many Men on the Ice: Women's Hockey in North America* (Victoria: Polestar Book Publishers, 1997), 11-12

<sup>47</sup> "Julie Stevens, Ph.D.," *Faculty of Applied Health Sciences*, last modified August 23, 2019, <https://brocku.ca/applied-health-sciences/sport-management/faculty-research/faculty-directory/julie-stevens-ph-d/#teaching>

<sup>48</sup> Joanna Avery and Julie Stevens, *Too Many Men on the Ice: Women's Hockey in North America* (Victoria: Polestar Book Publishers, 1997), 71.



Moreover, women's hockey did not start with the Preston Rivulettes. As previously mentioned, women's hockey was played competitively long before the Rivulettes began dominating its competition. According to Patrick Reid and Daniel A. Mason, two prominent Canadian scholars in the area of sports management and kinesiology, women have been playing hockey since about 1850; however, the first women's world hockey championship did not occur until 1990, some 70 years after the first men's hockey championship in 1920.<sup>49</sup> It was not until some lobbying by the players themselves that women got their own tournament, which became the predecessor to what is now known as the Women's World Hockey Championships, staged by the International Olympic Committee (IOC), as a test run for the inclusion of women's hockey as a possible event at future Winter Olympics.<sup>50</sup>

Moreover, as Wayne Norton discusses in his book on the history of women's hockey in Western Canada, there were local tournaments with community teams long before the national championships, with the Dominion Cup acting as the most prestigious tournament of the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, before World War Two.<sup>51</sup> Local elite-level women's hockey teams from around Canada competed against one another for a chance to lift the trophy. This lasted until 1940, by which point, most women's hockey teams no longer existed in the country. Norton is unsure why women's hockey abruptly disappeared until the 1960s after having such a large impact on young women in Canadian society.<sup>52</sup> Perhaps it is, as Norton states, that "simply the generation coming

---

<sup>49</sup> Patrick A. Reid, and Daniel Mason, "Women Can't Skate That Fast and Shoot That Hard!," *The International Journal of the History of Sport*, 32, no.14 (2016): 1678-1696, <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/09523367.2015.1121867>.

<sup>50</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>51</sup> Wayne Norton, *Women on Ice: The Early Years of Women's Hockey in Western Canada* (Vancouver: Ronsdale Press, 2009).

<sup>52</sup> *Ibid*, 110-111.

of age in the late 1930s was not particularly interested in women's ice hockey."<sup>53</sup> In other words, women of the late Great Depression era may have rejected the concept of breaking boundaries and welcomed and supported traditional gender roles, with the male as the athlete and breadwinner. However, this argument seems somewhat specious. A more likely scenario is that it became less economically viable for women to play hockey in the post-World War II era.

The third resource I have chosen for this literature review is another by Julie Stevens. In a chapter from a book published in 2006, she also looked at the history of women's hockey; however, she took a different approach. Stevens examined the first controversial incident of a female hockey player on an all-boys' team. The incident in question concerns Abigail Hoffman, an eight-year-old girl, who in 1955, cut her hair short and went by the name of 'Ab.' She was able to get away with this as no one checked her birth certificate in the house league registration in the Toronto Hockey League. Stevens claims that Hoffman was able to "match her teammates and opponents stride for stride and was named to the league all-star team."<sup>54</sup> When she was found out, she was allowed to finish the season, but she faced much criticism and pressure from parents, coaches, players and league officials. Stevens argued that this pressure led to Hoffman joining a girls' team the following season, and eventually, led her to quit the sport altogether. Hoffman later became a Canadian Olympian in track and field.

This book chapter, titled "Women's Hockey in Canada: After the 'Gold Rush'" reiterates much of what has already been discussed here, that despite some progress being made, female

---

<sup>53</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>54</sup> Julie Stevens. "Women's Ice Hockey in Canada: After the 'Gold Rush,'" in *Artificial Ice: Hockey, Culture and Commerce*, eds. Richard Gruneau and David Whitson (Ontario: University of Toronto Press, Higher Education Division, 2006), 86.

hockey players still face discrimination, marginalization and countless barriers in their quest for equality in hockey in Canada.<sup>55</sup>

All of the authors mentioned above provided me with extra background knowledge on women's hockey history in Canada and the inadequate coverage and support that female hockey players still receive to this day, whether this is, as Adams discusses, in traditional hockey folklore and Canadian identity, or in the eyes of the larger hockey community and the Hockey Hall of Fame selection committee. Norton, in particular, was especially interesting as his book was the only book used in this thesis that did not have an Ontario-centric focus. Stevens and Adams' book is also helpful later in this thesis when I discuss the gender differences between men's and women's hockey and the struggle that female hockey players face to stay in the sport.

Reid, of the faculty of Physical Education and Recreation at the University of Alberta<sup>56</sup> and Mason, from Brock University, analyzed the increased interest in women's hockey that has happened in the decades since women's hockey made a comeback. They examined this not only from a spectator perspective, but from a participant perspective as well.<sup>57</sup>

They claimed that participation in women's hockey has increased tremendously since 1990, the year of the first Women's World Hockey Championship. For Reid and Mason, the 1990 World Tournament was the "watershed moment" of women's hockey. They observed that it was the first time that women's hockey had received any sort of extensive media coverage in Canada, despite initially not gaining any "widespread support" from the general public and

---

<sup>55</sup> *Ibid*, 85-99.

<sup>56</sup> "Patrick Reid, PhD," *Brock University: Faculty of Applied Health Sciences*, last modified February 21, 2019, <https://brocku.ca/applied-health-sciences/sport-management/patrick-reid/>.

<sup>57</sup> "Dan Mason, PhD," *University of Alberta: Faculty of Kinesiology, Sport and Recreation*, last modified February 21, 2019, <https://www.ualberta.ca/kinesiology-sport-recreation/about-us/faculty-staff/researchers/dan-mason>.

media.<sup>58</sup> However, as the tournament in Ottawa progressed, the general public got wind of the intense competition, and started attending games—to the point where the gold medal game between Team Canada and Team USA was sold out. The game became the best attended women’s hockey game at the time. The tournament put women’s hockey on the map and ignited the passion for women’s hockey in many Canadians. It also fueled perhaps the greatest rivalry in hockey: Team Canada and Team USA.<sup>59</sup>

As Reid and Mason concluded, one of the reasons why the tournament stands as such a watershed moment for women’s hockey in Canada goes beyond the fact that it was the first major women’s hockey tournament. Instead of the usual red and white that the national men’s hockey team wore (and the colours of the Canadian flag), the women on Team Canada donned pink jerseys.<sup>60</sup> At first glance, this decision appeared to be sexist. Women on the best hockey team in the world had to wear baby pink jerseys; make-up kits were given out as door prizes for spectators. The players, surprisingly, were not too upset with this decision; most important to them was that fans showed up to watch their games. Despite the pink jersey controversy, the decision turned out to be an effective marketing ploy, as the team received plentiful media coverage, and fans showed up to watch the women play. There is an argument to be made that had the women worn the traditional red, white and black jerseys of the men’s team, the general population would not have been aware that a women’s hockey tournament was taking place.

---

<sup>58</sup> Patrick A. Reid, and Daniel Mason, “Women Can’t Skate That Fast and Shoot That Hard!,” *The International Journal of the History of Sport*, 32, no.14 (2016): 1678-1696, <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/09523367.2015.1121867>.

<sup>59</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>60</sup> *Ibid*

Reid and Mason carefully analyzed the preparation and planning that went into the tournament, and thus provide the reader with a thorough, yet easy to understand ethical and historical analysis of one of the most important events in Canadian hockey history.<sup>61</sup>

The CBC documentary ten-part mini-series, *Hockey, a People's History*, gave the viewer a decidedly general hockey history, but it did devote some space to discussing women's hockey, and its emergence on the Canadian sport scene, starting with the 1990 Women's World Tournament, and culminating with the gold medal win by Team Canada in 2002 over the United States—the first Olympic gold medal for a Canadian women's hockey team (the team lost the gold medal game to the USA in 1998, the first year that women's hockey was an Olympic sport). While otherwise informative, the television series did not offer anything of significance to the pink jersey discussion.<sup>62</sup>

The series provided first-hand accounts from players and staff involved with the team. However, because the CBC program examined the overall history of hockey in Canada, and not just women's hockey, it is not helpful for an analysis of the 1990 Women's World Tournament, or even the 1998 and 2002 Winter Olympics, the first two Olympics to include women's hockey. Therefore, *Hockey, a People's History* could not be employed as a main source for this thesis and thus was only useful for additional background information and quotations. It is an interesting series for the average Canadian hockey fan, but for sport and gender ethics researchers, it is of little use.<sup>63</sup>

---

<sup>61</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>62</sup> *Hockey, a People's History*, episode 9, "Winter of Discontent," directed by Margaret Slaght, aired October 15, 2006, on CBC, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RivFmrtUwKA&frags=pl%2Cwn>.

<sup>63</sup> *Ibid*

### **Women's Hockey and Female Coaches at the Olympics (1992-1998)**

Initially the IOC's plan was to include women's hockey at the 1994 Olympics in Norway. Yet Norway was not interested in building a new hockey arena which would not be used after the Olympics. Instead, on November 8<sup>th</sup>, 1992, the IOC made an historic announcement: women's hockey would debut in Nagano, Japan at the 1998 Olympics. This decision gave other countries an additional four years to improve their programs in order to stay competitive with Canada and the United States.<sup>64</sup>

Newspaper articles from the appropriate time period (in this case the period between 1990 and February 1998), are considered a primary source and thus were also used in this thesis when discussing the history of women's hockey at the Olympics and how it affects the current status of women's hockey in Canada. A variety of articles, such as those written by Mary Ormsby,<sup>65</sup> Donna Spencer,<sup>66</sup> and Roy MacGregor,<sup>67</sup> discussed the process of including women's hockey in the Olympics, and how the sport's inclusion was not set in stone at first. As is the case with the media analysis, the newspapers were found with the database LexisNexis, considered one of the most important newspaper databases. I also used the database ProQuest to find the

---

<sup>64</sup> Patrick A. Reid, and Daniel Mason, "Women Can't Skate That Fast and Shoot That Hard!," *The International Journal of the History of Sport*, 32, no.14 (2016): 1678-1696, <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/09523367.2015.1121867>.

<sup>65</sup> Mary Ormsby, "Women's Hockey Gets Approval for '98," *The Toronto Star* (Nov. 18, 1992): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/436746829?accountid=15115>.

<sup>66</sup> Donna Spencer, "More Women Behind the Benches in Olympic Women's Hockey Tournament," *The Globe and Mail* (Feb 9, 2018): <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/sports/olympics/more-women-behind-the-benches-in-olympic-womens-hockey-tournament/article37918018/>.

<sup>67</sup> Roy MacGregor, "Women Start Something Special: A Little Bit of History is Made at the Olympic Hockey Rink, Despite the Many Critics, says Roy MacGregor," *The Ottawa Citizen* (Feb. 1, 1998): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/240173371?accountid=15115>.

newspaper articles discussed in this literature review and noted significant article overlap between the two research databases.

Hockey Canada and the IOC encountered resistance from the Nagano Olympic organizers for two main reasons: Japan would have to add extra days to the competition, for which the country had not planned, and perhaps, most importantly, Japan's women's hockey team required significant development, as witnessed at previous hockey tournaments.

MacGregor provided a first-hand account of the Olympic experience in February 1998 when women's hockey was included in the Olympics for the first time. Despite many lopsided scores at the hands of Team Canada, Team USA and Team Finland (the only three competitive countries at the time)—women were finally getting recognized on the world's biggest sporting stage, by playing a traditionally male-dominated sport.<sup>68</sup> As mentioned in the introduction to this thesis, the competition was not outstanding at first. However, in men's hockey, one-team dominance prevailed also. The Soviet Union "Red Army" National Hockey Team had won almost every Olympic and World Championship tournament from 1954-1991, and still managed to get a medal in the tournaments it did not win.<sup>69</sup>

MacGregor and Spencer, two of the most prominent sports journalists in Canada, provided direct quotations from female hockey players at the Winter Olympics about how compelling being included was to them, their team, and the public. Ultimately, MacGregor and Spencer concluded that the very presence of a women's hockey tournament at the Olympics is formative for women's hockey, as well for as minor girls' hockey. Young female hockey players

---

<sup>68</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>69</sup> *Red Army*, directed by Gabe Polsky (2014; United States: Sony Pictures Home Entertainment, 2014), Blu-Ray DVD.

growing up in Canada finally had some female role models. Not only did Nagano break barriers from a player standpoint, it also broke barriers from a coaching standpoint, as Team Canada had a female head coach; it was the only team in the 1998 Olympics to have a female head coach, Shannon Miller.<sup>70</sup> While Miller was ultimately not retained after the gold medal loss to the United States, national hockey federations have continued to hire more female coaches. At the most recent Winter Olympics in Pyeongchang, South Korea, nearly half of all the national women's hockey coaches were female (three out of eight). The previous high for female coaches at the women's hockey tournament at the Winter Olympics was one.<sup>71</sup>

While MacGregor's and Spencer's articles are obviously not written from an academic perspective, MacGregor and Spencer are two highly regarded sports journalists. Their knowledge of the game is strong. Therefore, these two articles are important and reliable journalistic records that strengthened my thesis.

### **A League of their Own: The Golden Olympics and the Creation of the CWHL (2002-2007)**

The final episode of *Hockey, a People's History* offered additional background information on the Olympics. The CBC documentary explained how Team Canada (Women's Hockey Team) finally won the gold medal in 2002 at the Salt Lake City Winter Olympics, four years after the loss in Nagano. The Canadians were led by superstar Hayley Wickenheiser, arguably the greatest female hockey player of all time. The documentary showed how the roles were reversed in 1998. Canada had been expected to win in 1998, and in 2002 Team USA was

---

<sup>70</sup> Roy MacGregor, "Women Start Something Special: A Little Bit of History is Made at the Olympic Hockey Rink, Despite the Many Critics, says Roy MacGregor," *The Ottawa Citizen* (Feb. 1, 1998): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/240173371?accountid=15115>.

<sup>71</sup> Donna Spencer, "More Women Behind the Benches in Olympic Women's Hockey Tournament," *The Globe and Mail* (Feb 9, 2018): <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/sports/olympics/more-women-behind-the-benches-in-olympic-womens-hockey-tournament/article37918018/>.



expected to win. The American team won nine of the ten games between the two teams leading up to the 2002 Olympics.<sup>72</sup> The documentary provided the viewer with interviews from the players on the 2002 team, as well as others involved in Hockey Canada. Despite the first-hand interviews with affiliated players, the documentary cannot be considered a primary source as it was filmed and produced after the conclusion of the Salt Lake Olympics by a third party (CBC).<sup>73</sup>

As previously mentioned, since it did not focus exclusively on women's hockey, the history mini-series offered limited information on women's hockey teams. The focus on men is more consistent and intense. This remained a notable flaw of the documentary for the purposes of my thesis. Perhaps it is fitting that even a source used for this thesis did not give men and women equal screen time, as the (lack of) equality in hockey is one of its main themes.

Writing for *The Montréal Gazette* in March of 2002, Ken Warren, a sports journalist based in Montréal, focused on the aftermath of the 2002 Gold Medal win. Many of the Canadian female hockey players returned to their regular jobs after Salt Lake. Unlike their NHL counterparts, the women on Canada's National Hockey Team did not have a professional hockey league in which to play, and thus many had to hold regular full-time jobs in order to pay the bills.<sup>74</sup>

---

<sup>72</sup> *Hockey, a People's History*, episode 10, "Reclaiming the Game," directed by Michael Claydon, aired October 15, 2006, on CBC, [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mTH3C6\\_unzU&frags=pl%2Cwn](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mTH3C6_unzU&frags=pl%2Cwn).

<sup>73</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>74</sup> Ken Warren, "Back to Reality for Women's Hockey: For Team Canada, There Are Careers to Restart and Money to Pay Back After the Olympics," *The Montréal Gazette* (Mar 8, 2002): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/433812285?accountid=15115>.

At the time of the 2002 Salt Lake City Winter Olympics, elite female hockey players had few choices: either to play college/university hockey while getting an education or playing in the oddly named National Women's Hockey League. It was oddly named as the league comprised only teams from Québec and Ontario. Despite the name, it was not affiliated with the NHL, and it was hardly professional; the league was run by the Ontario Women's Hockey Association (the minor girls' hockey organization in Ontario).<sup>75</sup> Players and coaches were not paid, and crowds were sparse. Thus, as Warren explained, these Olympic Gold medalists could not rely on their hockey playing skills to earn a living.<sup>76</sup>

Warren compared their situation with that of other elite winter Olympic athletes, who either benefited from multi-million-dollar NHL contracts, that is, Team Canada men's hockey players; or those athletes who as a result of their gold medal win had received lucrative endorsement offers. For example, pairs figure skaters David Pelletier and Jamie Salé received numerous endorsement offers and contemplated joining the professional skating circuit, a multi-million dollar business. Similar to MacGregor's and Spencer's pieces, Warren's article consisted of first-hand interviews with two players on the National Women's Hockey Team, both of whom had to return to their regular jobs after the Olympics. Even though Warren does not offer any analysis, his article showcased the difference between female gold medal winning hockey players and male gold medal winning hockey players. Further, it provided the reader with a

---

<sup>75</sup> Donna Spencer, "Women's Hockey Leagues in Trademark Dispute Over Rights to the NWHL," *The Globe and Mail* (April 27, 2016): <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/sports/hockey/womens-hockey-leagues-in-trademark-dispute-over-rights-to-nwhl/article29779490/>.

<sup>76</sup> *Ibid*

glimpse into the gender disparity that is involved in Canadian hockey, especially at the “professional” level.<sup>77</sup>

Not every article used for this thesis spoke positively about the merits of women’s hockey. Writing during the 2006 Winter Olympics, in his column for the BC based *Colonist Times*, Cleve Dheensaw, an award-winning sports journalist and author in Victoria, BC, asserted that women’s hockey at the Olympics was not competitive and argued for its removal from the Olympic program.<sup>78</sup> He contended that many incredible athletes train for years and never qualify for the Olympics. Italy (which had automatically gotten a berth as the host nation), and Russia somehow qualified for the Olympics, notwithstanding that neither of these countries had a strong women’s hockey team.<sup>79</sup>

Dheensaw pointed to the opening weekend of the 2006 women’s Olympic hockey tournament, which saw Canada beat Italy and Russia by a combined score of 28-0. He claimed that there was no point in having a tournament which is already determined before the puck even dropped; the gold medal game would pit Canada against the United States. It thus eliminated all the drama and excitement that comes from live sports. He argued that the Olympic Games “should be about the best in sports that are played widely. And played well widely.” Dheensaw argued that it was unfair to deserving athletes that do not qualify due to the popularity of their

---

<sup>77</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>78</sup> Mario Annicchiario, “Times Colonist Wins National Award,” *Colonist Times* (June 8, 2017): <https://www.timescolonist.com/sports/times-colonist-reporter-wins-national-award-1.20474003>.

<sup>79</sup> Cleve Dheensaw, “Women’s Hockey Should Get the Boot,” *Colonist Times* (Feb 13, 2006): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/348035340?accountid=15115>.

sport. He claimed that because women's hockey was not very popular worldwide, it was easy for countries like Russia to qualify.<sup>80</sup>

Writing less than a month after Dheensaw, Jonathon Gatehouse supported Dheensaw and claimed that the removal of women's hockey at the Olympics almost came to fruition. The Canadian women's hockey team would indeed go on to win gold at the 2006 Winter Olympics as well, which took place in Turin, Italy. However, for the first time since its inception, the women's gold medal hockey game did not feature Canada and the United States; rather the game was between Canada and Sweden. Furthermore, the game was not competitive in any way; Canada beat Sweden 4-1, and the next three Olympic finals once again featured Canada and the United States.<sup>81</sup> The Americans were upset by Sweden in the semi-finals in a shootout, and as a result, had to settle for the bronze medal. Gatehouse, who is more of an investigative journalist, (although he does delve into sports) argued that if it were not for this result (the Americans losing to Sweden), then women's hockey may have been eliminated from the Olympics, less than ten years after it had first appeared. In his article, Gatehouse wrote "it is the first time the US has lost to anybody but Canada, and it is the game that saves women's hockey."<sup>82</sup>

Gatehouse's article is important to this thesis as it offers support for Dheensaw, and the general view that women's hockey at the Olympics is not competitive and is merely a two-team

---

<sup>80</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>81</sup> Matthew Futterman, "U.S. Break Canada's Grip Hockey Gold," *The New York Times* (February 21, 2018): <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/02/21/sports/olympics/usa-womens-hockey-canada.html>.

<sup>82</sup> Jonathon Gatehouse, "The Girls Go Wild," *Maclean's* (Mar 6, 2006): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/218521423?accountid=15115>.

competition. Essentially, Gatehouse stated that the United States losing to Sweden in the semi-finals was the best thing that had happened to women's hockey up to that point.<sup>83</sup>

Ironically enough, the lack of parity and the success of the Canadian National Women's Hockey team at Turin led to the creation of the seven-team Canadian Women's Hockey League (CWHL) the following year. The National Women's Hockey League (NWHL) had suspended operations for financial reasons; the Western Women's Hockey League soon followed, closing its doors in 2011. This made the CWHL the premier semi-professional league for North American women hockey players.<sup>84</sup> It would remain the only such league until the revival of the NWHL. However, this time around the league consisted of five professional teams based in the Northeastern USA. The NWHL announced it would pay players from its inception in 2015. Unfortunately, player salaries were cut in half the following season due to lack of sustainability.<sup>85</sup> As mentioned in the introduction, at the time of the league's demise, the CWHL did pay its players. Its Toronto, Montréal, and Calgary teams have partnerships with four NHL teams based in those cities, which means that the Toronto Maple Leafs, Montréal Canadiens and Calgary Flames of the NHL provide funding for coaches, pay travel expenses and provide equipment for their respective CWHL teams.

---

<sup>83</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>84</sup> Satchel Price, "Canadian Women's Hockey League Expanding to China Next Season," *The Ice Garden*, last modified June 5, 2017, <https://www.sbnation.com/2017/6/5/15743370/cwhl-womens-hockey-china-expansion-franchise-2017>.

<sup>85</sup> Associated Press, "NWHL Cut Player Salaries in Half to Save Season," *Sportsnet*, last modified November 18, 2017 <https://www.sportsnet.ca/hockey/nwhl-cuts-player-salaries-half-save-season/>.

### **The Problem with the Women's Game: Two Team Domination Continues (2010-2017)**

The lack of parity in Olympic women's hockey continued during the next two Olympics, in Vancouver in 2010 and in Sochi, Russia in 2014. Jeff Lee of the *Vancouver Province* wrote in 2010 that the president of the International Olympic Committee (IOC) at the time, Jacques Rogge, claimed that women's hockey needed to improve if it was to continue as an Olympic sport. This is similar to the discussion that Gatehouse posited in 2006.<sup>86</sup> Lee, a former political journalist in Vancouver, suggested that Rogge understood that women's hockey needed more time to develop, and that he wanted it to remain an Olympic sport, but at the same time, the sport "cannot continue without improvement."<sup>87</sup> On the day he made his comments, Team Canada and Team USA faced off in the gold medal game for the third time in four Olympic tournaments, further emphasizing his point. Nine years after Rogge's comments, the sport is not any closer to becoming broadly competitive.<sup>88</sup>

Since this is a newspaper article and not an opinion piece, Lee did not offer anything in the way of an analysis or an opinion on this issue; he merely reported the facts. That aspect makes Lee's article very different from any other newspaper article (namely Dheensaw's and Gatehouse's articles) analyzed in this thesis so far, as Lee provided a factual account of the situation. His own biases and opinions did not come out in the article, which arguably made it a more valid and reliable primary source.

---

<sup>86</sup> Jeff Lee, "Women's Hockey Has to Improve, Says IOC," *The Vancouver Province* (Feb 26, 2010): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/269607437?accountid=15115>.

<sup>87</sup> Jeff Lee, "Jeff Lee," *The Vancouver Province* (July 26, 2016): <https://theprovince.com/author/jeffleevansun>.

<sup>88</sup> Jeff Lee, "Women's Hockey Has to Improve, Says IOC," *The Vancouver Province* (Feb 26, 2010): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/269607437?accountid=15115>.

In an anonymous article published in *The Toronto Star* in June of 2010, the writer examined the 2010 hockey summit—the first world hockey meeting of its kind—among international hockey members. The author wrote that women’s hockey and its place in the Olympics occupied a large portion of the summit. The main goal of the summit was to increase the critical mass of women’s hockey around the world, using a variety of strategies. The author wrote that Team Canada’s main issue with the lack of competition at the Olympics focused on countries simply not caring enough to invest in women’s hockey, a traditionally male sport.<sup>89</sup>

As with Lee, the author did not offer an analysis, but merely stated the facts, and quoted many involved with the decision. The information from this article is highly informative. For example, the writer mentioned that the men’s game took 30-40 years to develop properly, and that patience is needed in order to make the women’s game really strong.<sup>90</sup> Canada has always called for hockey summits when it determines that the country is in crisis due a lack of hockey success. For example, after the men’s hockey team finished fourth in Nagano in 1998, a meeting was called, experts wondering if the talent had stalled somehow. This was repeated after Vancouver in 2010, when the Olympics witnessed yet another gold medal game between Canada and USA. The author did not take a position on the summit issue, that women’s hockey has not shown incremental improvement.<sup>91</sup>

This article offered more support for the argument that women’s hockey should cease to be an Olympic sport, while at the same time offering relevant quotes from those working in

---

<sup>89</sup> Anonymous, “Improving Women’s Hockey on Agenda at Toronto Summit” *The Toronto Star* (June 2, 2010): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/356909450?accountid=15115>.

<sup>90</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>91</sup> *Ibid*

women's hockey who say the opposite: time, patience and more funding are needed in order to help create a level playing field.<sup>92</sup>

### **Heartbreak in South Korea and Women's Hockey Expansion (2018-2022)**

As Dan Barnes, a sports journalist who covers Alberta sports, argued in his 2018 article for the *National Post*, Canada and the USA are so far ahead of other countries in women's hockey that a Canada-USA gold medal game is inevitable at this point.<sup>93</sup> Team Canada has lost twice to Sweden, and once to Finland, and tied each country once in the 28 years of competitive international women's hockey, beating these countries a combined 147 times. Sweden and Finland are typically mentioned in the second tier of women's hockey nations, after the big two of Canada and the USA. Barnes demonstrated that despite the games between Canada and Finland and Canada and Sweden being closer than they used to be, it would still require a miracle for either one of those countries to beat Canada on a regular basis, or even be competitive.<sup>94</sup>

Barnes stated that the Canada-USA women's hockey rivalry should have gotten tiresome for the general public, as upsets are few and far between. However, he took the opposite view in this article. Barnes argued that the long rivalry has only ignited the passion of Canadian and American hockey players further and has actually improved women's hockey over time as the competition gets more intense.<sup>95</sup>

---

<sup>92</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>93</sup> "Author Profile: Dan Barnes," *The National Post* (September 12, 2018): <https://nationalpost.com/author/npdbarnes>.

<sup>94</sup> Dan Barnes, "It Should Be Stale by Now, But Canada-U.S. Women's Hockey Rivalry is Only Getting Better," *The National Post* (Feb 10, 2018): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/2000825719?accountid=15115>.

<sup>95</sup> *Ibid*



Ultimately, Barnes offered a very optimistic and perhaps too idealistic future for women's hockey, based on the facts he assembled. He noted that things have not notably improved since 1990, and there is little evidence to show that the competition will get much better over the next 28 years, unless countries aside from Canada or the USA make a significant commitment to improve their women's hockey programs. Finland, Sweden and, most recently, Switzerland remain a step above the rest of the competitors,<sup>96</sup> but they still remain far, far behind the dominant nations of Canada and the United States, the top two nations who are really in a league of their own.

This is especially important going into the 2022 Winter Olympics, awarded to Beijing, China, where most of the events will take place. (Snow events will take place in the Northern city of Zhangjiakou).<sup>97</sup> For the first time ever, the women's hockey tournament will include 10 teams, instead of eight, which means that more countries will have a chance to develop talent to help grow women's hockey. On the negative side, it also means that blowouts may be a daily occurrence, which once again may show a lack of parity and severe skills discrepancy in regard to international women's hockey.<sup>98</sup>

---

<sup>96</sup> "World Ranking," *International Ice Hockey Federation*, last modified May 2019, <https://www.iihf.com/en/worldranking>.

<sup>97</sup> "Beijing to Host 2022 Winter Olympics and Paralympics," *BBC Sport*, last modified July 31 2015, <https://www.bbc.com/sport/winter-olympics/33730477>.

<sup>98</sup> Josh Beneteau, "Olympic Women's Hockey Tournament Expands to Ten Teams," *Sportsnet*, last modified July 20 2018, <https://www.sportsnet.ca/olympics/olympic-womens-hockey-tournament-expands-10-teams/>.

## Gender and Ethics in Women's Hockey—Sociocultural Constructs

In her article entitled “Being and Playing, Sport and Valorization of Gender,” Leslie Howe’s main argument is that female hockey players face much more scrutiny in society than their male counterparts, based on the very nature of hockey itself.<sup>99</sup> She argued that the mere thought of a female hockey player challenges traditional gender constructs of masculinity and femininity, along with the idea of male dominance/hegemony in sport. Howe is a Philosophy of Sport Professor at the University of Saskatchewan in Saskatoon.<sup>100</sup> She claimed that tradition tells us that men are supposed to be “mind or spirit” and that a woman’s role is solely to be the body; alas, women exist as passive objects, primarily to look attractive, a deeply sexist idea.<sup>101</sup>

Howe claimed that the mere presence of the female athlete turns these constructs upside down, thus creating large conflicts for a society in which men have historically asserted their physical dominance *qua* masculinity. Howe believes that athletic women are a blow to the male

---

<sup>99</sup> Leslie A. Howe. “Being and Playing: Sport and the Valorization of Gender,” in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 331-345.

<sup>100</sup> “College of Arts and Science, Our People: Leslie Howe,” *University of Saskatchewan*, last modified February 21, 2019, <https://artsandscience.usask.ca/profile/LHowe#/research>.

<sup>99</sup> Leslie A. Howe. “Being and Playing: Sport and the Valorization of Gender,” in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 331-345.

<sup>100</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>101</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>102</sup> R.W. Connell, *Gender and Power: Society, The Person, and Sexual Politics* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1987).

<sup>103</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>104</sup> Tom Shakespeare, “Antonio Gramsci: The Dead Man on Holiday” *BBC*, last modified October 14, 2009, [http://www.bbc.co.uk/ouch/features/antonio\\_gramsci\\_the\\_dead\\_man\\_on\\_holiday.shtml](http://www.bbc.co.uk/ouch/features/antonio_gramsci_the_dead_man_on_holiday.shtml).

ego and are utterly confusing to male identity.<sup>102</sup> In order for society to erase this confusion and restore traditional gender order, any successful feminine or attractive female athlete is reconstructed in the public eye as a woman who happens to look good and can play sports; thus referring to the female as the body, a passive object, rather than the exceptionally skilled athlete that she is.<sup>103</sup>

Howe's article is highly relevant to this thesis, and moreover, her article acted as an inspiration of sorts. In this article, Howe described all of the major criticisms surrounding hockey, including the inherent antifeminine/pro masculine/homophobic culture of the sport. Hockey at its very core is the epitome of hegemonic masculinity.

In her book *Gender and Power: Society, Person and Sexual Politics*, Connell—who is a prominent Australian sociologist with a focus on gender studies, and known for her concept of hegemonic masculinity—presented the most prominent definition of hegemonic masculinity.<sup>104</sup> She defined hegemonic masculinity as a concept singularly typified by the dominant alpha male in society, 'the norm' who maintains his rigid, un-nuanced masculinity and who supports the complete subordination of femininity and feminine qualities.<sup>105</sup>

---

<sup>105</sup> Antonio Gramsci, *Prison Notebooks: Volume 1.*, ed. Joseph A. Buttigeng, Joseph, trans. Antonio Callari (New York: Columbia University Press, 2010).

<sup>106</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>107</sup> "Dr. Jodi H Cohen," *Bridgewater State University*, [https://services.bridgew.edu/Directory/search\\_person.cfm?personList=984](https://services.bridgew.edu/Directory/search_person.cfm?personList=984).

Hockey exudes female subordination and male hegemony perhaps like no other sport. Hegemony is a sociological concept made famous by 20<sup>th</sup> century Italian Marxist philosopher/sociologist Antonio Gramsci in his posthumous publication, *The Prison Notebooks*.<sup>106</sup> Gramsci developed the concept of hegemony during the Mussolini era of fascism in Italy. Gramsci claimed that hegemony is characterized by the state exercising control over individuals so thoroughly that the state negated the idea of being different or of rebelling against it.<sup>107</sup> In other words, Gramsci theorized that hegemony occurs when powerful state agents assert their dominance over citizens. Gramsci postulated that the understanding and epistemology of the elites (bourgeoisie) become the norm; as a result, even ordinary citizens (the proletariat) want to be part of the hegemonic culture.<sup>108</sup>

Hegemony is not just limited to cisgender athletes. In their article “The Collision of Trans-experience and the Politics of Women’s Ice Hockey,” Jodi H. Cohen and Tamar Z. Semerjian conducted four of their open-ended interviews with a Male to Female (MTF) transgender American athlete who was banned from competing in international sanctioned competitions by USA hockey as this athlete was biologically born male and was still in the process of completing her transition, and taking several hormone therapies. Cohen, a professor of sociology at Bridgewater State University<sup>109</sup> and Semerjian, a kinesiology professor at San José

---

<sup>108</sup> “Tamar Z Semerjian, Ph.D.,” *San José State University*, last modified February 18, 2019, <http://www.sjsu.edu/kinesiology/contacts-1/Profiles/Semerjian/>.

<sup>109</sup> Jodi H. Cohen, and Tamar Z. Semerjian, “The Collision of Trans-experience and the Politics of Women’s Ice Hockey,” *International Journal of Transgenderism*, 10, no.3-4 (2008): 133-145, doi: 10.1080/15532730802297322.

University,<sup>110</sup> stated that due to tradition and strict societal rules, we have always thought of society as two genders: male and female, and that an athlete who challenges this gender binary order as Angela does (the hockey player in their case study) is disrupting not only the notions of gender, but the Western concepts of masculinity and femininity.<sup>111</sup>

However, it is important to remember that gender and sex are not the same thing. Sex is biological and physiological, whereas gender is a social construct; so, in reality there is no such thing as a gender binary. The correct term should be a sex binary, something that the authors acknowledge, but unfortunately the general public is largely uninformed about this issue.

As my thesis does not focus on transgenderism, this article contained much information that I did not find useful. However, for the purposes of this thesis, I was able to identify certain sections that were helpful, in particular the authors' analysis of transgenderism and how this disputes the binary or traditional concepts of manhood and womanhood. Using Connell's theory of hegemonic masculinity, I analyzed this article by comparing the transgender hockey player experience to that of a cisgendered female hockey player; they both challenge hegemonic masculinity due to their participation in masculine sport of hockey. For example, Angela in the article tells Cohen and Semerjian that, despite knowing she was transgender from a young age, she kept playing sports as a male in order to assert her dominance and hegemonic masculinity.<sup>112</sup>

---

<sup>111</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>111</sup> Ann M. Hall, "The Present Reflecting the Past," in *The Girl and the Game: A History of Women's Sport in Canada*, (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016), 295-330.

The experience of Angela is the opposite of the experience that cisgendered lesbian hockey players discuss in M. Ann Hall's seminal book, *The Girl and the Game: A History of Women's Sport in Canada*. Hall is a professor Emeritus in the Faculty of Physical Education and Recreation at the University of Alberta.<sup>113</sup> As with other books and articles discussed earlier in this chapter, Hall's book is a history of the women's game. However, it is not for the historical analysis that I have included this book in the literature review. Hall's discussion of the struggle that lesbian hockey players can be elegantly compared and contrasted with the struggle that transgender hockey players such as Angela face. Towards the end of the book, using sociological research methods and ideas, Hall discussed the issues facing female athletes in Canada today. It is this section upon which I draw. Regarding these struggles, Hall claimed that professional women's sports, especially women's hockey teams and associations, have spent years "feminizing their athletes," so that the women can maintain their femininity and hence their social credibility, something that is especially important when competing in a masculine activity like hockey.<sup>114</sup>

One can argue that Helen Lenskyj (now known as Jefferson Lenskyj) is the inspiration for Hall and other feminist sport scholars. Lenskyj is a Professor Emerita at the University of Toronto in the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education (OISE).<sup>115</sup> Lenskyj's highly influential book, *Out of Bounds: Women, Sexuality and Sport*, is divided into two parts, the history of women in sports, and the biological reasons why female athletes have been historically frowned

---

<sup>113</sup> Ann M. Hall, "The Present Reflecting the Past," in *The Girl and the Game: A History of Women's Sport in Canada*, (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016), 295-330.

<sup>114</sup> *Ibid*, 327.

<sup>115</sup> "About Helen Jefferson Lenskyj," *Helen Jefferson Lenskyj*, last modified 2016, <http://www.helenlenskyj.ca/about.html>.

upon. However, for the purposes of this thesis, it is the second half that I chose to analyze and examine. The unfortunate feature of her book, for my research, is that she writes too much about female biology, and sex testing, which is tangential to my thesis. Hence there were only a few sections of the book that proved fruitful for my purposes.<sup>116</sup>

However, towards the end of her book, Lenskyj argued that women in sport face pressure to maintain their heterosexuality and their femininity, similarly to what Hall discovered in her research three decades later. She claimed that masculine sports, such as hockey and football, turned boys into men while the traditionally female sports, such as figure skating and synchronized swimming, were meant to increase a woman's feminine qualities, namely their poise, grace, and beauty. She stated, as do other authors discussed in this literature review, that women who participate in these male dominated sports, ones that promote hegemonic masculinity, are "transforming sport" and challenging the traditional beliefs surrounding physically strong female athletes.<sup>117</sup> For these female athletes, however, there is a delicate balance to maintain between allegiance to gender stereotypes, such as by wearing make-up, and self-presentation as strong, aggressive and skilled players.

In her autoethnography based on her own hockey playing experiences, Judy Davidson discussed the struggle that lesbian female hockey players face, similarly to Hall's examination of heterosexuality in hockey. Davidson, a professor in the Faculty of Kinesiology, Sport and Recreation at the University of Alberta, wrote a narrative peer reviewed journal article detailing her experience on a recreational woman's hockey team at the university, *Booby Orrs*, and the

---

<sup>116</sup> Helen Lenskyj, *Out of Bounds: Women, Sport and Sexuality* (Toronto, ON: Women's Press, 1986).

<sup>117</sup> *Ibid*, 139-145.

team's experiment at the North American OutGames in Calgary, a multi-sport tournament consisting of LGBT2I+ athletes from across North America.<sup>118</sup>

The Booby Orrs were a recreational team moved up into the competitive division at the tournament as all of the recreational teams had dropped out. The team was terrible but had a reputation for being the “most fun” at the tournament, largely due to the game tactic that every time the team scored, one of its fans would flash the spectators at the arena, hence the name “Booby.” Just as Lensykj and Hall do before her, Davidson's narrative article discussed the openness of the players on her team and the fans, and soon players on opposing teams embracing the Boobies' sexual orientation and femininity in a sport and society where heteronormativity reigns supreme. As Davidson writes, by encouraging its female fans to show their breasts to the spectators, Boobies rejected the very notion of heteronormativity and the sexism that usually follows women who expose their skin, promoting the gesture as an act of celebration and happiness.<sup>119</sup>

Danielle DiCarlo's qualitative research study, conducted with female hockey players on men's hockey teams, rejected the findings from Lensykj, Hall and Davidson. Unlike the previous authors, DiCarlo, a research professor and invigilator at the University of Toronto Faculty of Physical Education and Kinesiology,<sup>120</sup> used qualitative sociological research methods instead of feminist theory. Using snowball sampling to find her target group of female athletes, DiCarlo is “interested in the detailed accounts of female ice hockey athletes' lived experiences within the

---

<sup>118</sup> Judy Davidson, “Lesbian Erotics at Women's Hockey: Fans, Flashing and the Booby Orrs,” *Journal of Lesbian Studies*, 13, no. 3 (2006): 337-348, doi: 10.1080/10894160902876820.

<sup>119</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>120</sup> “Danielle DiCarlo, Phd,” *LinkedIn*, last modified 2019, <https://ca.linkedin.com/in/danielle-dicarlo-phd-b5831765>.



production and reproduction of hegemonic discourses surrounding contemporary sport.”<sup>121</sup>

DiCarlo conducted a series of semi-structured interviews with her sample size. Interestingly enough, all of the women she interviewed did not appear to question hockey culture, thus rejecting the challenge of hegemonic masculinity and accepting the status quo of the sport, unlike the previous authors’ works in this section.<sup>122</sup>

Perhaps it is telling that the women accepted hockey culture and did not question the womanhood of the sport—this suggests to me that the influence of the dominant group (males) is so strong in hockey, that even the marginalized group starts believing the ideals—thus showing that these women are victims of hegemony. Therefore, this showcases the very problem with hockey culture that Hall, Lenskyj and Davidson work so hard to reject in their research.

### **The Struggle for Legitimacy: Gender/Sex Segregation in Sport**

In her book chapter, “The Game of Whose Lives...?”, Mary Louise Adams claims that hockey is not representative of Canada as a nation, given that white, privileged males still remain the dominant group and females struggle for respect and legitimacy in the sport. Adams, a professor of Kinesiology and Sociology and Sport at Queen’s University, discusses the lack of newspaper coverage that the 2002 Olympic gold medal winning Canadian women’s national team received.<sup>123</sup> The team was almost an afterthought, compared to the men’s team, which received pages and pages of coverage after its Olympic victory. For Adams, the problems of

---

<sup>121</sup> Danielle DiCarlo, “Playing Like a Girl? The Negotiation of Gender and Sexual Identity Among Female Ice Hockey Teams on Male Teams,” *Sport in Society*, 19, no..8-9 (2016): 1366, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/17430437.2015.1096260>.

<sup>122</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>123</sup> “Mary Louise Adams, PhD,” *Queens University: School of Kinesiology and Health Studies*, last modified 2019, <https://skhs.queensu.ca/people/faculty/mary-louise-adams-phd/>.

gender inequality in hockey went beyond media coverage. She also claimed that the lack of adequate ice time was an issue, something that other authors examined in this literature review mention as well. This discussion proved beneficial for me when I discussed my own years of hockey playing experiences in the narrative section of this thesis.<sup>124</sup>

However, the part of Adams' chapter that I found the most intriguing is her belief that female struggle for legitimacy in hockey goes back to childhood folklore stories about pond hockey. For most Canadians, hockey is at its best and purest form when played out on the pond, the game of "shinny" as it is commonly called. This is how hockey was first played; so for many, there is nothing more Canadian than wearing a toque and playing pond hockey with a group of friends out on a frozen lake.<sup>125</sup> The problem with this, M.L. Adams argues, is that the stories one hears about such activities consist of young, white boys. Thus, hockey at its very core is not representative of contemporary Canada. She claimed that female hockey players have struggled to gain respect in Canada from the earliest days of the sport, a belief that she shared with many other scholars discussed in this thesis.<sup>126</sup>

Nancy Theberge concurred with the position of M.L. Adams as Theberge also believed that female hockey players have struggled to gain "legitimacy," In her article entitled "Playing with the Boys: Manon Rhéaume, Women's Hockey and the Struggle for Legitimacy," Theberge, a prominent sociologist at the University of Waterloo in Waterloo, Ontario specializing in gender and sport, discussed the former Team Canada goaltender's experiences growing up playing

---

<sup>124</sup> Mary Louise Adams, "The Game of Whose Lives? Gender, Race and Entitlement in Canada's "National" Game" in *Artificial Ice: Hockey, Culture and Commerce*, ed. David Gruneau and Mark Whitson (Ontario: Higher Education Press, 2006), 71-84.

<sup>125</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>126</sup> *Ibid*

mostly boys' hockey.<sup>127</sup> This circumstance occurred largely because girls' hockey leagues were few in number and not well developed at competitive levels.<sup>128</sup> Many former National Team players struggled to gain respect as hockey players in a predominately male sport, even as recently as the mid 90s when Theberge wrote this article. As previously discussed, society deeply frowned upon women playing hockey, as it was a "rough boys sport." Girls growing up in Canada who wanted to skate were guided to figure skating or ringette.<sup>129</sup>

Theberge's main argument is that unless female hockey players competed against men at a high level successfully, as was the case with Manon Rhéaume, then they could not be taken seriously as athletes. She claimed that there is cruel sense of irony in this, because despite women showing that they can play a masculine and violent sport such as hockey, and play it well, the majority of funding and media coverage in Canada is focused on male hockey players, something which is still true 23 years after the appearance of Theberge's article.<sup>130</sup>

In an article published two years later, Theberge discussed physicality in women's hockey and the lack of body checking. Theberge interviewed female hockey players on an elite team in the Greater Toronto Area. Some women believed that women's hockey allowed the game to expand and to focus more on speed and skill rather than the strength and physical aspect

---

<sup>127</sup> "Kinesiology: Nancy Theberge Professor Emerita," *University of Waterloo*, last modified February 21, 2019, <https://uwaterloo.ca/kinesiology/people-profiles/nancy-theberge>.

<sup>128</sup> Nancy Theberge, "Playing with the Boys: Manon Rhéaume, Women's Hockey and the Struggle for Legitimacy," *Canadian Women's Studies*, 15, no.4 (1995): 37-41, [https://scholar.google.ca/scholar?hl=en&as\\_sdt=0%2C5&q=playing+with+the+boys+nancy+theberge&btnG=](https://scholar.google.ca/scholar?hl=en&as_sdt=0%2C5&q=playing+with+the+boys+nancy+theberge&btnG=).

<sup>129</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>130</sup> *Ibid*

of men's hockey, while some women who grew up playing men's hockey alternatively preferred the sport with bodychecking allowed.<sup>131</sup>

Theberge argued that the lack of bodychecking in women's hockey actually led to increased injuries amongst players as girls were not taught how to take a hit from a young age, so that when they finally did get body checked illegally (despite the no-body-checking rule, female players often commit a bodychecking offence), they are often in a vulnerable position and tend to get injured. However, Theberge recognized that there are two schools of thought in this regard: one that advocates for total gender equality when it comes to hockey (i.e., the inclusion of bodychecking). The second perspective argues for keeping women's hockey as it is, as the lack of bodychecking is what makes women's hockey unique. Regardless of which option one chooses, proper injury prevention methods and concussion awareness are needed. Theberge stated that "a more fully transformative vision of hockey would offer empowerment that rejects violence and the normalization of injury in favour of an ethic of care."<sup>132</sup>

In the other two Theberge sources chosen for this thesis, the 2000 book *Higher Goals: Women's Ice Hockey and the Politics of Gender*, and the 1997 article "No Fear Comes: Adolescent Girls, Ice Hockey and the Embodiment of Gender," the scholar discussed bodychecking as a form of male expression and domination, a "particularly dramatic expression of physicality in ice hockey."<sup>133</sup> In *Higher Goals*, Theberge carried out semi-structured interviews with 24 female players on a team called the Blades, an elite amateur junior team in

---

<sup>131</sup> Nancy Theberge, "It's Part of the Game: Physicality and the Production of Gender in Women's Hockey," *Gender and Society*, 11 no.1 (1997): 69-87, <https://doi-org.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/10.1177/089124397011001005>

<sup>132</sup> *Ibid*, 85.

<sup>133</sup> Nancy Theberge, *Higher Goals: Women's Ice Hockey and the Politics of Gender* (Albany: SUNY Press, 2000), 135.

Ontario competing in the Provincial Women's Hockey League. Teams in this league consist mostly of older midget-aged players (primarily 17-year-old youth, with a few elite 16-year-olds or even 15-year-old players). For many of the girls, this league is the final stop before four years at an NCAA Division One or Division Three college women's program, or a USports program in Canada.<sup>134</sup> Much of Theberge's work in this book was previously published in academic journals, including her research with the Blades hockey team, which is discussed in the previous paragraph.

In the final academic work by Theberge analyzed in this thesis, the author carried out a series of semi-structured interviews with teenage hockey players, most of them playing high level girls' hockey in their home province. The qualitative field study took place over six weeks in the summer during the course of some of the most famous and most respected hockey camps in Canada.<sup>135</sup>

Theberge found many of the same results as she did with her Blades study. Despite not being allowed to bodycheck, many of the girls still played an "aggressive" style of hockey with ample amounts of body contact. Many of the participants told Theberge that the distinction between body contact and bodychecking often becomes blurred; thus a physical game with considerable amounts of body contact can be just as physical as a game in which bodychecking is allowed and encouraged.<sup>136</sup> Ultimately, I have chosen more sources (four) by Theberge than

---

<sup>134</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>135</sup> Nancy Theberge, "No Fear Comes—Adolescent Girls, Ice Hockey and the Embodiment of Gender," *Youth and Society*, 34 no.4 (2003:) 497-516, doi:10.1177/0044118X03252592.

<sup>136</sup> *Ibid*

any other author as she is one of the leading experts in the field of sociology of gender and hockey, and the importance of her work cannot be overstated.

Torbjörn Tännsjö, a controversial Swedish Philosophy and Ethics Professor at Stockholm University, also supported Theberge in his article, claiming that the very notion of having different rules in sports for men and women is sexist and discriminatory.<sup>137</sup> However, he went one step further and argued that gender segregation in sports should not exist, rather that every sport should be co-ed, with the same rules.<sup>138</sup> His point is simply that if sexual discrimination is not ethically or morally acceptable in other aspects of life, then why is it acceptable in sports? The best athletes should compete together and train together, under the same roof, or the same field, regardless of sex.<sup>139</sup>

Tännsjö dispelled the notion that female sports represent a unique value, often an argument used by supporters of women's hockey and its lack of bodychecking. He did acknowledge that there are some cases where men will perform better than women in sports, as men may be biologically more suited to these sports, just as black competitors may perform better than Caucasian athletes in some sports. However, as Tännsjö, argued, this does not mean that sports should be separated by race or ethnicity. In some cases, the reverse happens, when women outperform men, such as in Equestrian (horseback riding only, not rodeo or thoroughbred racing) in which there has only been one male winner since 1968. Tännsjö claimed that there has

---

<sup>137</sup> "Department of Philosophy: Torbjörn Tännsjö," *Stockholm University*, last modified September 18, 2018, <https://www.philosophy.su.se/english/research/our-researchers/faculty/torbjörn-tännsjö-1.154907>.

<sup>138</sup> Torbjörn Tännsjö, "Against Sexual Discrimination in Sports," in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 347-358.

<sup>139</sup> *ibid*

been no reason to reintroduce gender segregation despite the lopsided dressage results in favour of female athletes.<sup>140</sup>

Charlene Weaving, a Professor of Philosophy at St Francis Xavier University in Antigonish, Nova Scotia,<sup>141</sup> specializing in gender and sport ethics, and Samuel Roberts, a former professional hockey player from St. John's,<sup>142</sup> also discussed the idea of gender segregation in hockey in their analysis of the lack of bodychecking in women's hockey. Using a feminist ethics perspective, they ultimately agreed with Tännsjö that men and women should play sports with the same rules; however, they did not explicitly advocate for complete gender integration as Tännsjö did.<sup>143</sup> Instead, they argued that the lack of bodychecking in women's hockey, as Theberge noted in her analyses in the 1990s, "reinforces a gender hierarchy in hockey and society."<sup>144</sup>

Weaving and Roberts claim that the addition of bodychecking in women's hockey will decrease sexism in the sport and create a more even playing field for men and women. Weaving and Roberts favour grandfathering bodychecking into women's hockey, in the same way that hockey helmets were grandfathered into the NHL; an idea which seems complicated and controversial. Similar to Howe and Tännsjö, Weaving and Roberts analyzed sports from an

---

<sup>140</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>141</sup> "Human Kinetics: Charlene Weaving," *St. Francis Xavier University*, last modified 2017, <https://www2.mystfx.ca/humankinetics/charlene-weaving>.

<sup>142</sup> "Samuel Roberts," *Elite Prospects*, last modified February 7 2019, <https://www.eliteprospects.com/player/41498/sam-roberts>

<sup>143</sup> Charlene Weaving and Samuel Roberts, "Checking In: An Analysis of the (Lack of) Body Checking in Women's Hockey," *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 83 no. 8 (2012): 470–478, doi: 10.1080/02701367.2012.10599882.

<sup>144</sup> Nancy Theberge, "It's Part of the Game: Physicality and the Production of Gender in Women's Hockey," *Gender and Society*, 11 no.1 (1997): 69-87, <https://doi.org/10.1177/089124397011001005>.

ethics and gender perspective, which is the broad theme of my thesis, and thus all three articles are highly relevant and valid for my research.<sup>145</sup>

Julie Stevens and Carly Adams employed qualitative methods similar to Theberge in their case study of a minor girls' hockey association that formed in the 1990s in Ontario. The difference between Theberge and Stevens and Adams is that Theberge analyzed the differences in boys' and girls' hockey by talking to the female hockey players themselves, Stevens and Adams examined the hockey organization from a governance standpoint; namely, they examined the organization to see how well it was run compared to a minor boys' hockey association.<sup>146</sup>

Ultimately, despite the difference in methodology, Stevens and Adams' findings are the same as Theberge. Even with the increase in female participation in hockey in Ontario, girls still face barriers that boys do not confront, such as less than ideal practice time, long travel for away games, and lack of access to proper coaches and excellent training.<sup>147</sup> As a former competitive girls' hockey player growing up in Ontario, I can relate to these struggles, and thus I use this article in the *narrative* section of this thesis.

Kelly Poniatowski, an Associate Professor of Communications at Elizabethtown College in Pennsylvania, took a different approach in her gender analysis. In the two articles I have chosen for this thesis, "'You're Not Allowed Bodychecking in Women's Hockey...'"<sup>148</sup> and

---

<sup>145</sup> Charlene Weaving and Samuel Roberts, "Checking In: An Analysis of the (Lack of) Body Checking in Women's Hockey," *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 83 no.8 (2012) 470–478, doi: 10.1080/02701367.2012.10599882.

<sup>146</sup> Julie Stevens and Carly Adams, "'Together We Can Make It Better': Collective Action and Governance in a Girls' Ice Hockey Association," *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*, 48 no.6 (2012): 658-672, doi: 10.1177/1012690212454466.

<sup>147</sup> *Ibid*



“The Nail Polish Under the Gloves,”<sup>149</sup> Poniatowski offered support for the other scholars examined in this thesis. In both articles, she carried out a textual media analysis of the NBC broadcast during every game of the national American women’s hockey team at the 2006 Winter Olympics and the 2010 Winter Olympics. She also conducted interviews with freelance journalist and NBC commentators.

While only her first article focused explicitly on Connell’s concept of hegemonic masculinity, I was able to link both articles to hegemonic masculinity. Poniatowski concluded that women’s hockey is seen as less physical and more ‘open’ than men’s hockey, and therefore more feminine and more inferior. One of her interviewees described bodychecking and open ice hitting as the heart and soul of the men’s game, and stated that because women’s hockey lacks this key element, it can never be as good as men’s hockey. She discovered that the commentators also made a point of emphasizing that women wear full face shields to play hockey, while men are only required to wear helmets, thus reinforcing hegemonic masculinity and gender stereotypes (i.e., female frailty). Poniatowski’s articles prove fruitful for my thesis as her research ultimately supported Theberge, M.L. Adams, and Weaving, all of whom are experts in the field of gender equality in sports.

The final two articles discussed in this literature review are both focused on the lack of adequate ice time and training that female hockey players in Ontario receive. The first article,

---

<sup>148</sup> Kelly Poniatowski, “‘You’re Not Allowed Bodychecking in Women’s Hockey’: Preserving Gendered and Nationalistic Hegemonies in the 2006 Olympic Ice Hockey Tournament,” *Women in Sport and Physical Activity*, 20 no.1 (2011): 39-52, <https://link-gale-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/apps/doc/A263258653/AONE?u=lond95336&sid=AONE&xid=756cb09f>.

<sup>149</sup> Kelly Poniatowski, “‘The Nail Polish Underneath the Hockey Gloves’: NBC’s Framing of Women Hockey Players in the 2010 Winter Olympics,” *Journal of Sports Media*, 9 no.9 (2014): 23-44, doi: <https://doi.org/10.1353/jsm.2014.0000>.

written by Bonnie Slade, a graduate student at the University of Toronto at the time and now a professor of women's studies and adult education at the University of Glasgow,<sup>150</sup> is a personal narrative analysis based on her own hockey playing experiences, similar to the second half of the *narrative* section in this thesis. Slade discussed the barriers she faced as a girl playing hockey in small town Ontario, including sexism and ridiculous travel times for games and practices,<sup>151</sup> the very same things that Megan Williams examined in her article, except Williams' research was based in Toronto.<sup>152</sup>

Williams, who is now the Rome correspondent for the CBC,<sup>153</sup> interviewed a female hockey player and executive in Toronto about the 1995 decision by Toronto Parks and Recreation to finally open its seven (at the time) city-owned arenas to girls and women. She concluded that the lack of ample opportunities is one of the main reasons that girls quit sports. Ultimately, she claimed that female hockey has managed to more or less survive since the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, despite very little support from the general public, a fact that has not changed 24 years later.<sup>154</sup> Thus, Williams was chosen as the final author for the literature review as her article brings forth the biggest issue facing women in hockey today: equality. Ironically, this has

---

<sup>150</sup> "School of Education: Dr Bonnie Slade," *University of Glasgow*, last modified 2019, <https://www.gla.ac.uk/schools/education/staff/bonnieslade/#/biography,researchinterests,grants,supervision,teaching,publications,articles,books,booksections>.

<sup>151</sup> Bonnie Slade, "'Not Just 'Little Ladies' in Hockey Gear': Hockey Experiences in a Small Town," *Canadian Woman Studies*, 21, no. 3 (2002): 155-156, <https://link-gale-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/apps/doc/A88761613/AONE?u=lond95336&sid=AONE&xid=59aa67da>.

<sup>152</sup> Megan Williams, "Women's Hockey: Heating Up the Equity Debate," *Canadian Woman Studies*, 15, no. 4 (1995): 78-81, <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/217455318?pq-origsite=summon>.

<sup>153</sup> "Megan Williams: Rome Correspondent," *CBC News*, last modified 2019, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/world/megan-williams-1.3614782>.

<sup>154</sup> Megan Williams, "Women's Hockey: Heating Up the Equity Debate," *Canadian Woman Studies*, 15, no. 4 (1995): 78-81, <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/217455318?pq-origsite=summon>.

been the same barrier that female hockey players have faced almost since the earliest days of the sport.

### Chapter Three

#### **Method One: Ethical and Philosophical Analysis--Utilitarianism and Liberty**

As mentioned previously, one can discuss the ethical implications of hockey using paternalism, free will/liberty (Harm Principle) and the continuity versus separation thesis. These issues were discussed by J.S. Russell and Robert L. Simon in *Ethics in Sport*, in regard to boxing. For the purpose of this thesis, I applied these issues to hockey, specifically when it came to gender, violence and masculinity versus femininity. Furthermore, my ethical and philosophical analysis attempted to answer the following questions: *What are the dominant messages and representations about Canadian women's hockey in an ethical context? How do these dominant messages and representations compare to the dominant messages and representations of Canadian men's hockey?*

One of the biggest ethical issues in hockey centres on concussions caused by the physicality and violence involved in the sport. As former NHL goaltender and Hall of Famer Ken Dryden explained on CBC Radio in 2017, "Concussions affect a life. They don't just affect the ability to play a sport."<sup>155</sup> The long-term health impact that concussions and violence in sports have on the athlete is the biggest reason to support paternalism. In his book excerpt about violence in sports, Simon, a philosophy of sport and ethics professor at Hamilton College in upstate New York until his death last year,<sup>156</sup> defines J.S. Mill's concept of paternalism as

---

<sup>155</sup> Ken Dryden, interview by Anna Maria Tremonti, *The Current*, 99.1 CBC Radio One, October 17, 2017. <https://www.cbc.ca/radio/thecurrent/the-current-for-october-16-2017-1.4354024/concussions-affect-a-life-ken-dryden-wants-hockey-rules-changed-to-save-players-lives-1.4354030>.

<sup>156</sup> "Robert L. Simon 1941-2018," *The International Association for the Philosophy of Sport*, last modified June 18, 2018, <https://iaps.net/uncategorized/robert-l-simon-1941-2018/>.

“interference with the liberty of agents for what is believed to be their (people’s) own good.”<sup>157</sup>

This is analogous to the way that the state ensures things like pure drinking water and a safe driving environment.

A counter argument to paternalism is Mill’s concept of liberty and free will. In his book *On Liberty*, Mill writes “there is no room for entertaining any such question when a person’s conduct affects the interests of no persons besides himself, or needs not affect them unless they like (all persons concerned being of full age and the ordinary amount of understanding). In all such cases, there should be perfect freedom, legal and social, to do the action and stand the consequences.”<sup>158</sup> Mill claims if the health or well-being of another person is at stake, then “the offender may be jointly punished, although not by law.”<sup>159</sup> In other words, liberty means that paternalism, even when an individual’s mental or physical health may be harmed, is unjustified.

This is known as the Harm Principle. Simon describes Mill as:

a utilitarian in ethics, committed to the view that that the sole criterion of right and wrong is the social utility of acts or practices. At first glance, utilitarianism does not seem to be particularly hostile to paternalism or especially protective of the freedom of the individual. It seems that paternalistic interference with liberty would be justified on utilitarian grounds whenever it produced better consequences for all affected than the available alternatives.<sup>160</sup>

The Harm Principle is amplified even further when one thinks about hockey’s gruesome past: there have been at least six violent incidents on the ice that have directly resulted in death, including one in the NHL and one in the National Hockey Association (the North American

---

<sup>157</sup> Robert L. Simon, “Violence in Sports,” in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 381.

<sup>158</sup> J.S. Mill, “Of the Limits to the Authority of Society Over the Well-Being of the Individual,” in *On Liberty, in Focus*, ed. John Gray, and G.W. Smith (United Kingdom: Routledge, 1991), 90.

<sup>159</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>160</sup> *Ibid*, 380.

hockey league that was the predecessor to the NHL)<sup>161</sup> These violent incidents included stick swings to an opponent, hits to the head, and fights; these acts of violence still occur in the NHL today and remain a large part of the Canadian hockey psyche.<sup>162</sup> The authors cited here, Stacey Lorenz, Geraint Osborne and Michael Robidoux, believe that promotion of violence as a form of masculinity remains the same as it did when many of these incidents occurred over 100 years ago.<sup>163</sup>

The current debate about fighting and head shots in hockey thus showcases Mill's Harm Principle, and concept of liberty and Simon's application of paternalism. The paternalistic view argues for a **complete ban** on all hits to the head in the National Hockey League and stronger penalties for fighting and head hits.<sup>164</sup> Dryden, a lawyer who won six Stanley Cups with the Montréal Canadiens in the 1970s as well as having played in the 1972 Canada/Soviet Union Summit Series, is a proponent of paternalism for the reasons mentioned above.<sup>165</sup>

During the 1972 Summit Series, Canada's brute force exerted over the more skilled Soviet team was celebrated, as the team was playing hockey 'the Canadian way.'<sup>166</sup> The Canadians did not start winning the series until Canada resorted to unsportsmanlike methods,

---

<sup>161</sup> Stacey L. Lorenz and Geraint Osborne, "Nothing More Than the Usual Injury: Debating Hockey Violence During the Manslaughter Trials of Allan Loney (1905) and Charles Masson (1907)," *Journal of Historical Sociology*, 30 (4) (2017): 698-723, doi: 10.1111/johs.12111.

<sup>162</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>163</sup> Michael A. Robidoux, "Imagining a Canadian Identity Through Sport: A (sic) Historical Interpretation of Lacrosse and Hockey," *The Journal of American Folklore*, 115 (456) (2002): 209-225, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4129220>.

<sup>164</sup> Robert L. Simon, "Violence in Sports," in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 379-387.

<sup>165</sup> "Ken Dryden: 100 Greatest NHL Players," *NHL* last modified January 1, 2017, <https://www.nhl.com/news/ken-dryden-100-greatest-nhl-hockey-players/c-285637088?tid=283865022>.

<sup>166</sup> Michael A. Robidoux, "Imagining a Canadian Identity Through Sport: A (sic) Historical Interpretation of Lacrosse and Hockey," *The Journal of American Folklore*, 115 (456) (2002): 209-225, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4129220>.

including those employed by Canadian forward Bobby Clarke. Clarke hit Soviet superstar Valeri Kharlamov over his ankle, breaking it, and thus knocked Kharlamov out of the series. Despite the fact that the team comprising Canadian NHL all-stars resorted to violence in order to win the eight-game series in overtime, it was the Soviet team that was viewed in a negative light in North America, even though the Soviets were clearly more talented and somewhat less violent than the Canadians.<sup>167</sup> In fact, the Canadian team did not receive any support from the public until they began playing dirty in order to win the series. In fact, the players were celebrated as heroes and the win was described by those in the media as “an orgy of self-congratulation about the triumph of ‘Canadian virtues’—individualism, flair, and most of all, character.”<sup>168</sup>

Just three years after the Summit Series, the NHL Players’ Association put forth a motion to the NHL owners and executives that recommended removing fighting from the NHL in the upcoming season for a trial run. To properly enforce the rule, the players suggested ejecting combatants from a game and a one game suspension for the following game. Repeat offenders would face lengthier suspensions. The owners and executives rejected this proposal. Almost 45 years later, there has been no appetite from the NHL to ban fighting, despite all of the knowledge we now have about the long-term impact that fighting has on hockey players. As Lawrence Scanlan, a Kingston based author,<sup>169</sup> argued in his book on hockey violence, “violence begets violence,” meaning that violence only causes more violence and in fact does not act as deterrent

---

<sup>167</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>168</sup> *Ibid*, 221.

<sup>169</sup> “Biography,” *Lawrence Scanlan*, last modified 2017, <http://www.lawrencescanlan.com/bio/>.

of any sort, despite the popular, ironic opinion that fighting prevents the players from getting out of control.<sup>170</sup>

Women's hockey organizations and leagues, as well as international hockey, take a much more paternalistic view when it comes to fighting and hitting another player on the head. Following Mill's liberty theory, the NHL argues for the **status quo**. *Why take away a player's free will? They know what they signed up for.* In women's hockey, of course, there is no bodychecking and thus no fighting allowed. Notably, the IIHF (International Ice Hockey Federation) does not permit fighting in men's hockey either. As a result, there is no aggressive violence/fighting at the Olympics or World Hockey Championships, regardless of gender.<sup>171</sup>

The only time Mill believed that paternalism should be applied is when others are at risk, children are involved, or the individual is "mentally incompetent."<sup>172</sup> Children and mentally ill people cannot consciously and appropriately make decisions; they lack the capacity to consent. In these instances, the Harm Principle allows intervention by others. The problem with Mill's exception is that we still do not have a clear definition of "mentally incompetent." How do we decide who is "mentally incompetent" and who is not? This is a difficult question, as every person and every jurisdiction may have different ideas and definitions of "mental incompetence." This exception to the Harm Principle becomes hard to monitor, as it creates more questions than answers. I believe a better distinction or qualification is awareness contrasted with ignorance.

---

<sup>170</sup> Lawrence Scanlan, *Grace Under Fire* (Toronto: Penguin Canada, 2003), 282.

<sup>171</sup> "IIHF Official Rule Book 2018-2022," *International Ice Hockey Federation*, last modified June 1, 2018, [https://www.iihf.com/IIHFMvc/media/Downloads/Rule%20Book/IIHF\\_Official\\_Rule\\_Book\\_2018\\_Web\\_v2.pdf](https://www.iihf.com/IIHFMvc/media/Downloads/Rule%20Book/IIHF_Official_Rule_Book_2018_Web_v2.pdf).

<sup>172</sup> Robert L. Simon, "Violence in Sports," in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 379-387.

One can argue that it is not that people (i.e., athletes) are incompetent; rather they are unaware of all potential dangers.

The NHL would argue that it is not its job to inform its athletes of any potential harm. However, both American<sup>173</sup> and Canadian<sup>174</sup> labour laws state that the employer has a moral responsibility to inform its employees about potential dangers at the workplace. However, instead of informing its employees (in this case, hockey players), leaked emails between NHL executives show that the NHL deliberately withheld information from its athletes for decades about the long-term impact of brain injuries (concussions).<sup>175</sup> Over 200 former NHL players eventually sued the league. However, the players were denied a class action lawsuit by an American federal judge, essentially ensuring the NHL got off completely free and could continue to deny the dangers of fighting and hits to the head in hockey.<sup>176</sup>

Simon discussed a second exception to the Harm Principle. This second exception occurs when, as Simon writes “paternalism is acceptable when its goal is not simply to benefit the people being interfered with, but rather is to protect their status as rational and autonomous agents.” This can be applied to fighting in hockey, as paternalism can be used to prevent a competent adult from participating in a fight as the multiple blows to the head may lead to

---

<sup>173</sup> “Employer Responsibilities,” *United States Department of Labor*, <https://www.osha.gov/as/opa/worker/employer-responsibility.html>.

<sup>174</sup> “Workplace Safety,” *Government of Canada*, <https://www.canada.ca/en/employment-social-development/services/health-safety/workplace-safety.html#s02>.

<sup>175</sup> Rick Westhead, “Link Between Fighting, Concussions, ‘Personal Tragedies’ Discussed in Unsealed NHL Emails,” last modified March 28, 2016, <https://www.tsn.ca/link-between-fighting-concussions-personal-tragedies-discussed-in-unsealed-nhl-emails-1.460651>.

<sup>176</sup> “Class Action Status Denied for NHL Concussion Lawsuit for Ex-Players,” last modified July 18, 2018, <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/sports/hockey/article-class-action-status-denied-for-nhl-concussion-lawsuit-by-ex-players/>.



severe, permanent brain damage, such as “punch drunk syndrome” or Chronic Traumatic Encephalopathy (CTE). Simon also discussed a third exception to the Harm Principle, which will be examined in more detail in this chapter, which involves social coercion.

Mill, a staunch believer in liberty and free will, advocated utilitarianism, which requires the individual to consider other people’s happiness, and points out that the interest of the individual should match the interest of society.<sup>177</sup> While Mill’s version of utilitarianism is popular, he cannot be credited with the invention of this philosophical ideal.

The term Utilitarianism (maximizing utility, well-being) was coined by the famed British philosopher and social reformer Jeremy Bentham, a teacher of Mill’s father, the economist, James Mill. For Bentham, utilitarianism is about two “masters:” pleasure and pain. The Stanford Encyclopedia provides a good definition of Bentham’s theory on its website; it states, “we seek pleasure and the avoidance of pain, they govern us in all we do, all we say, all we think.”<sup>178</sup> This is also known as hedonism.<sup>179</sup>

Bentham’s definition of hedonism claims that everything in life exists on a spectrum of pain versus happiness, and that “happiness is the ultimate good, and that happiness is pleasure and the absence of pain.”<sup>180</sup> Bentham is also famous for his greatest happiness principle, published in his 1776 book, *A Fragment on Government*. The greatest happiness principle was adopted and expanded by Mill some years later when, inspired by Bentham, he created his own version of utilitarianism, namely, that not all types of happiness are created equal. The greatest

---

<sup>177</sup> J.S. Mill, “What Utilitarianism Is,” in *Utilitarianism*, (London: Saville and Edwards Printers, 1864) 8-39.

<sup>178</sup> Julia Driver, “The History of Utilitarianism: Jeremy Bentham,” last modified September 22, 2014, <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/utilitarianism-history/#JerBen>.

<sup>179</sup> Dan Weijers, “Hedonism,” <https://www.iep.utm.edu/hedonism/#SH3a>.

<sup>180</sup> *Ibid*

happiness principle states “it is the greatest happiness of the greatest number that is the measure of right and wrong.”<sup>181</sup> In order to test how much pleasure and pain arises from certain actions, Bentham devised the Hedonic Calculus, a quantitative method for calculating potential pleasure and pain. This allowed him to contextualize moral action, to place morals in actual human relations.<sup>182</sup>

Mill argued that Bentham did not differentiate between different types of pain and pleasure. Thus, Mill believed that hedonism was too democratic and simplistic. Mill wondered “whether we should believe that a satisfied pig leads a better life than a dissatisfied human, or that a satisfied fool leads a better life than dissatisfied Socrates,” a belief that Bentham endorses.<sup>183</sup> Mill, in other words, does not support the common notion that *ignorance is bliss*.

When writing about the very subject, Mill claims:

No intelligent human being would consent to being a fool, no instructed person would be an ignoramus, no person of feeling and conscience would be selfish and base, even though they should be persuaded that the fool, the dunce, or the rascal is better satisfied with his lot than they are with theirs (...) Whoever supposes that this preference takes place at the sacrifice of happiness—that the superior being, in anything, like equal circumstances, is not happier than the inferior—confounds the two very different ideas of happiness and content (...) It is better to be a human being dissatisfied than a pig satisfied; better to be Socrates dissatisfied than a fool satisfied.<sup>184</sup>

While Bentham focused on the greatest good for the greatest number, Mill’s version of utilitarianism is more directly focused on the happiness of individuals themselves. Mill writes:

---

<sup>181</sup> J.H. Burns, “Happiness and Utility: Jeremy Bentham’s Equation,” *Utilitas*, 17, no.1 (2005): 46-61, doi: 10.1017/S0953820804001396.

<sup>182</sup> Dan Weijers, “Hedonism,” <https://www.iep.utm.edu/hedonism/#SH3a>.

<sup>183</sup> *ibid*

<sup>184</sup> John Stuart Mill, *Utilitarianism*, 6, <https://philosophy.lander.edu/intro/articles/mill.pdf>,

The great majority of good actions are not intended for the benefit of the world, but for that of individuals, of which the good world is made up (...) Except so far as is necessary to assure himself that in benefitting them he is not violating the rights (...) of anyone else. Those alone the influence of whose actions extends to society in general need concern themselves habitually about so large an object.”<sup>185</sup>

In other words, for Mill, the sole purpose or utility of utilitarianism is to find individual happiness, unless that action would improve the happiness of others; thus, still achieving the greatest purpose or utility.

By this definition, Mill should logically accept paternalism. Paternalism in its basic sense deals with ‘doing the right thing;’ utilitarianism, in its simplest form, deals with doing what will bring a person the most happiness. As Simon explains, “Mill was committed to the view that the sole criterion of right and wrong is the social utility of acts or practices.”<sup>186</sup> This belief seems to align with paternalism. Therefore, as Simon argues, Mill, despite being a strong advocate for utilitarianism, did not support it consistently. Simon explains that, in fact, what Mill was really advocating was efficiency.<sup>187</sup>

Mill believed that paternalistic interference is likely to be inefficient, and creates a society of intrusive busybodies. Individuals, despite their best efforts to do good, find themselves involved in situations that do not concern them, and often act for the wrong reasons.

Moreover, Simon claims that Mill was most likely supporting an argument that favours rule utilitarianism, which is discussed below. When discussing rule utilitarianism, it is important

---

<sup>185</sup> John Stuart Mill, “Utilitarianism,” in *Ethical Theory: An Anthology*, ed. Russ Shafer-Landau (Maine: Blackwell Publishing Ltd, 2007), 457-463.

<sup>186</sup> Robert L. Simon, “Violence in Sports,” in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 380

<sup>187</sup> *Ibid*, 379-387.

to understand act utilitarianism and the differences between the two. Similarly, to standard utilitarianism and hedonism, both rule and act utilitarianism agree that “our overall aim in evaluating actions should create the best results possible.”<sup>188</sup> However, the similarities between the two types of utilitarianism ends here. Act utilitarians believe that one should perform the action that will produce the greatest overall results. Act utilitarians believe that the basic principle of utilitarianism cannot be applied in a general sense, and instead should be applied on a case-by-case basis. Given a choice between multiple actions, act utilitarians will choose the one that provides one the greatest end happiness.<sup>189</sup>

Rule utilitarianism on the other hand “stresses the importance of rules.” For rule utilitarians, a specific action is acceptable as long as it a) “conforms to a justified moral rule,” and “a moral rule is justified if its inclusion into our moral code would create more utility than other possible rules (or no rule at all).”<sup>190</sup> To summarize, the main difference between rule utilitarianism and act utilitarianism is that act utilitarianism directly applies utilitarianism to evaluating specific individual actions, while rule utilitarianism believes in the application of utilitarianism to the evaluation of rules, followed by the evaluation of individual actions in order to see if these actions “obey or disobey those rules whose acceptance will produce the most utility.”<sup>191</sup>

---

<sup>188</sup> Stephen Nathanson, “Act and Rule Utilitarianism,” <https://www.iep.utm.edu/util-a-r/#H2>.

<sup>189</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>190</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>191</sup> *Ibid*

Act utilitarianism is closest to the classic utilitarian idea. Thus, it does seem odd that Mill, often considered one of the founders of utilitarianism is, at least according to Simon, a supporter of rule utilitarianism. Simon states:

a society following a rule prohibiting paternalistic interference will actually promote utility more efficiently than one adopting a rule allowing it, for, in the second society, the good produced by the few cases of justifiable paternalism will be swamped by harm promoted by unjustifiable paternalistic interferences constantly carried out by utilitarian busybodies.<sup>192</sup>

However, I would argue, (as does Simon), that paternalism is justified, even if there are only a few instances when it would do more good than harm. Hence, the interference is worth it for these few cases alone.<sup>193</sup>

Furthermore, he tries to explain Mill's side of things. Simon writes:

Finally, one can reinforce Mill's case by arguing that paternalism interferes with the fundamental moral right of individuals to control their own lives. Although moral rights may themselves be sometimes justified by the degree to which they promote utility, or as protections for autonomy, they can also be justified as basic moral commodities which protect individuals from being regarded as mere resources to be used for the good of the greater number.<sup>194</sup>

Simon continues to explain Mill's thoughts, he states:

In a sense, rights function as political and social "trumps," which individuals can play to protect themselves from being swallowed up in the pursuit of the social good. Individual rights to liberty protect the ability of persons to live their lives as they choose rather than as someone else, however benevolent, thinks such lives should be led.<sup>195</sup>

---

<sup>192</sup> Robert L. Simon, "Violence in Sports," in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 381.

<sup>193</sup> *Ibid*, 379-387.

<sup>194</sup> *Ibid*, 381.

<sup>195</sup> *Ibid*

In other words, the libertarian school of thought believes that paternalism infringes on self-determining rights, and even if the individual is at risk of being harmed, it is not up to outside sources or “utilitarian busybodies” to prohibit the person from doing what they want to do to. Hence, the Harm Principle should only be applied if someone else is in danger.

Simon discussed the Harm Principle and liberty in relation to boxing. However, many of the same arguments can be applied to hockey as well.<sup>196</sup> Specifically, as mentioned above, Simon discussed exceptions to the Harm Principle—cases where interference is justified. As an advocate for paternalism, I would argue that these exceptions offer a strong enough reason for paternalistic interference. As previously mentioned, Mill states that paternalism is justified when children or those with intellectual or mental disabilities are involved.<sup>197</sup> As examined earlier in this chapter, Simon also discussed a second exception to the Harm Principle, the idea that boxers cannot think rationally due to “punch drunk syndrome” as a result of repeated head trauma.<sup>198</sup> For me, this is the biggest reason for external interference when it comes to violence in hockey. Confronting a myriad of complex, unknown scientific factors, a person cannot consent in the legal meaning of this term.

While “punch drunk syndrome,” which is also known as Chronic Traumatic Encephalopathy (CTE), can only be diagnosed posthumously, sometimes athletes begin to show symptoms while still alive, including erratic behaviour and advanced dementia. CTE has been prevalent in the brains of former hockey players, with eight former NHL players having shown

---

<sup>196</sup> “Robert L. Simon 1941-2018,” *The International Association for the Philosophy of Sport*, last modified June 18, 2018, <https://iaps.net/uncategorized/robert-l-simon-1941-2018/>.

<sup>197</sup> J.S. Mill “What Utilitarianism Is,” in *Utilitarianism*, (London: Saville and Edwards Printers, 1864) 8-39.

<sup>198</sup> Robert L. Simon, “Violence in Sports,” in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 379-387.

symptoms of the disease, albeit in a very small sample size.<sup>199</sup> Interestingly, in the past year more former NHL players have pledged to donate their brains to science after death, including former National Women's Hockey Team superstar Hayley Wickenheiser.<sup>200</sup>

After football, hockey is the team sport with the highest frequency of CTE in the brains of former players,<sup>201</sup> and no sport has a higher rate of paraplegia and spinal cord injuries than hockey.<sup>202</sup> If an athlete suffers multiple serious concussions, can one really say that the athlete has the right to make their own decisions? If one cannot think rationally as a result of a traumatic brain injury (which is what a concussion is), how can the individual be expected to decide things for themselves? It is instances like these where I believe paternalism is the most justified. Simon uses paternalism to advocate for the prohibition of boxing, or at least much improved safety measures. I support Simon's promotion of paternalism, and I believe that just as boxing needs much improved safety measures, so does hockey. I also fully endorse Dryden's view that a complete ban on headshots in hockey is needed, as well as removing fighting from the sport. Acts of aggressive violence such as these are a rather archaic practice that, while they may be entertaining for some, cause lifelong pain and distress for many hockey players.

---

<sup>199</sup> Rick Westhead, "BU Finds Former NHL Player Had CTE, Contradicting Earlier Findings," *TSN*, last modified November 30, 2018, <https://www.tsn.ca/bu-finds-former-nhl-player-ewen-had-cte-contradicting-earlier-findings-1.1218836>.

<sup>200</sup> "Ice Hockey Legend Hayley Wickenheiser Pledges to Donate Brain to Concussion Legacy Foundation to Support CTE Research," *Concussion Legacy Foundation*, last modified Tuesday March 6, 2018, <https://concussionfoundation.org/media/press-releases/Wickenheiser-brain-pledge>.

<sup>201</sup> John Branch, "Former NHL Player Jeff Parker Posthumously Diagnosed With CTE, Confirming Family's Fears," *The New York Times* (May 3, 2018): <https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/2018/05/03/former-nhl-player-jeff-parker-posthumously-diagnosed-with-cte-confirming-family-s-suspicions.html>.

<sup>202</sup> Lawrence Scanlan, *Grace Under Fire* (Toronto: Penguin Canada, 2003), 282.

Despite the fact that many male hockey players have faced so many concussions that they may not be able to think rationally, and therefore cannot properly consent to playing such a violent sport, there is still the common notion in hockey that players ‘signed up for this’ and that they should be prepared to handle the risks that come with playing a violent sport. As introduced earlier in this chapter, Simon offered a third exception to the Harm Principle. As we have seen, the majority of boxers are young black men who come from severely poor socioeconomic backgrounds, and that for them, the choice (or lack thereof) is stark: they can find their way out of poverty by taking up boxing, winning enough money to move from the “ghetto” and hopefully gain enough respect in the eyes of the public so they are no longer a “victim of social and racial injustice and neglect.”<sup>203</sup>

Simon argued that in this scenario, boxers do not subscribe to utilitarianism, they are not autonomous individuals willingly choosing to go into a sport which they know will severely limit their brain capacity. Rather they are forced into this profession because they do not have any other prospects. Indeed, boxing for these athletes is a last resort—they are “victims of social coercion.” Simon claimed that boxers do not have a choice in the matter due to the two dire “options” before them.<sup>204</sup> This same example, while not an exact analogy, applies to hockey. Hockey is an elitist sport, meaning that those individuals from privileged socioeconomic backgrounds are more likely able to afford to play hockey.<sup>205</sup> Therefore, this example is not perfect, but it offers a close comparison of two aggressively violent sports in the relevant aspects

---

<sup>203</sup> Robert L. Simon, “Violence in Sports,” in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 383.

<sup>204</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>205</sup> John Steckley & Guy Kirby Letts, “Social Inequality,” in *Elements of Sociology: A Critical Canadian Introduction*, (Ontario: Oxford University Press, 2013).



for the purposes at hand. The income and status rewards are the same, with a sense of identity ingrained in the sport.

Just as Simon argued that boxers are forced into a career in boxing in order to escape poverty and racism, I argue that NHL players are forced to play high risk hockey, despite the strong possibility of lasting brain damage because there is no other way to play NHL hockey. For example, many youth in Canada grow up with a dream to play in the NHL, and in order to do that, they need to work their way up through the minor hockey and junior ranks. This means that young boys are often in hockey leagues with ample instances of fighting and hits to the head. In many cases, players are told to fight even when they do not want to.<sup>206</sup> Numerous former NHL enforcers (players paid to fight) hate fighting and the emotional and physical toll that it inflicts on their bodies, but many were told the only way they could have a career in the NHL was if they fought.<sup>207</sup> Not only is this an example of social coercion, it also offers support for Connell's concept of hegemonic masculinity; players who do not accept a fight challenge when offered one, are labelled 'soft' and feminine as they are not willing to fight another player to showcase their masculinity. This complex choice is examined with the example of former NHLer Paul Mulvey on the following page.

In addition, female hockey players face the opposite problem. Despite playing a physical style, albeit without hitting, female hockey players are not allowed to fight or bodycheck in hockey due to societal gender norms. In *Higher Goals*, Theberge argued that "the public is not

---

<sup>206</sup> Georges Laraque, "Fights," *Georges Laraque Official Site*, last modified 2016, <https://georgeslaraque.com/hk-fights.php>.

<sup>207</sup> Nick Boynton, "Everything's Not Okay," *The Players Tribune*, last modified June 13, 2018, <https://www.the.playerstribune.com/en-us/articles/nick-boynton-everythings-not-ok>.

ready to handle powerful images of women.”<sup>208</sup> Ethically, the public feels more uncomfortable watching women use physical violence. Yet males are encouraged to punch and hit each other, especially in a sport that is so reliant on these actions.<sup>209</sup>

Expanding further on this, Schneider examined the history of females, and the notion of the ideal female. These ideals go as far back as the Ancient Olympics; so, it is not a surprise that the stereotypical female in the eyes of many remains weak, nurturing and passive. These gender norms have been engrained into society for thousands of years. In her book chapter in Paul Davis’s edited book, she writes:

The traditional ideals of woman during the ancient Olympic Games and the revival of the modern Olympic Games (up to and including some current ideals) are intimately tied to a particular view of woman’s body. Some of these characteristics are soft, graceful, weak, and beautiful. The desirable qualities for a woman in the time of the ancient Olympics can generally be summarized as beauty, chastity, modesty, obedience, inconspicuous behaviour, and being a good wife, and a good mother (Lefkowitz & Fant 1985). Of course, these characteristics are tied to the roles of wife, mother, and daughter. They are not similar to those of the traditional ideal of man as hard, powerful, strong and rational, which are tied to the roles of leader, warrior and father. But, more importantly, if we examine the underlying characteristics of the traditional ideal athlete, we can plainly see that the ideal man and the ideal athlete are very similar, particularly in the role of warrior.<sup>210</sup>

However, many of those involved in women’s hockey, including some of the athletes that Theberge interviewed, believe that women’s hockey should maintain status quo as the sport represents a unique value without the inclusion of bodychecking.<sup>211</sup> In a book chapter on what he

---

<sup>208</sup> Nancy Theberge, *Higher Goals: Women’s Ice Hockey and the Politics of Gender* (Albany: SUNY Press, 2000), 137.

<sup>209</sup> Amy Winters, “Women, Kick, Punch, and Imagine Their Way Into the MMA Narrative,” *Fightland Blog: Vice Sports*, last modified December 13, 2013, <http://fightland.vice.com/blog/women-punch-kick-and-imagine-their-way-into-the-mma-narrative>.

<sup>210</sup> Angela Schneider, “On the Definition of ‘Woman’ in the Sport Context,” in *Philosophical Perspectives on Gender in Sport and Physical Activity*, ed. Paul Davis, (United Kingdom Taylor and Francis Group, 2009), 41.

<sup>211</sup> Nancy Theberge, *Higher Goals: Women’s Ice Hockey and the Politics of Gender* (Albany: SUNY Press, 2000).

calls “sexual discrimination in sports,” Tännsjö disagreed with Theberge’s interviewees and supported Theberge. He stated:

In many ways, female sports are no different from male sports. To a considerable and frightening extent, in many sports the male is simply the ideal. The good athlete is the hunter, the warrior, the man. And the conception of the masculine warrior is a narrow and simplistic one (...). To put it drastically, therefore, I think it is fair to say that, in many sports, women compete against each other in masculinity, narrowly conceived. It is hard to find any special feminine qualities in *such* competition.<sup>212</sup>

Theberge further supported her initial findings in a 2003 peer reviewed journal article “No Fear Comes...” As discussed in the *literature review* section of this thesis, she examines teenage female elite level hockey players in Ontario. Theberge, who has done much work on gender and hockey, wrote that “the accounts of adolescent players presented here suggest a powerful challenge to the historically gendered practice of sport in which men were empowered and girls largely excluded.”<sup>213</sup>

For male players, there are few options to elude violence. A 16-year-old boy living away from home for the first time playing junior hockey cannot very well go to his head coach and inform him that he does not wish to fight or be hit in the head, or if he does, he may face serious repercussions.<sup>214</sup> Many players will do anything to realize their childhood dream. Even if they do not like the option, they do not have a choice if they want the dream. Many boxers choose their

---

<sup>212</sup> Torbjörn Tännsjö, “Against Sexual Discrimination in Sports,” in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 353.

<sup>213</sup> Nancy Theberge, “No Fear Comes—Adolescent Girls, Ice Hockey and the Embodiment of Gender,” *Youth and Society*, 34 no.4 (2003): 514, doi:10.1177/0044118X03252592.

<sup>214</sup> In Ross Bernstein’s book, *The Code: The Unwritten Rules of Fighting and Retaliation in the NHL* (Chicago: Triumph Books, 2006), he offers the example of Pat Mulvey, a young 23-year-old enforcer playing for the LA Kings of the NHL. In January of 1982, Mulvey refused his coaches order to leave the bench to join in on a fight just before a bench clearing brawl broke out on the ice. Mulvey was sat out of practice and games as punishment. He was then waived by the team and sent down to the American Hockey League—the professional North American league a tier lower than the NHL. Mulvey then later sued the NHL for \$20 million USD. Mulvey lost the lawsuit and never played in the NHL again, having been all but blacklisted from the league.

sport as a last resort based on a limited education and set of skills. Similarly, less skilled hockey players often play hockey, a violent sport, as the designated fighter because they do not have any other option. Thus, the argument that ‘players signed up for this’ is not applicable. Players would be very reluctant, if not unwilling, to sign up to play a sport where the potential of severe long-term brain damage is a real possibility, especially for enforcers.

Therefore, Simon’s assessment of boxers as “victims of social coercion,” is applicable to hockey as well.<sup>215</sup> One can say that hockey players will do whatever it takes to make the NHL, even if they do not like what they have to do, because these are the rules of the game. Boys aspiring to play in the NHL do not have a choice in the matter. Until the rules of the game are changed, one can argue that the Harm Principle is not being applied to men’s hockey. Male players must submit to the rules, some of which include fighting and head contact.

Women’s hockey forbids fighting or bodychecking as previously mentioned. In fact, women also wear full face guards, instead of the open helmets or helmets with plastic visors that major junior, collegiate and professional male hockey players wear.<sup>216</sup> In the literature review, I mentioned that women’s hockey once included bodychecking. But this aspect of the women’s game was removed for the 1990 Women’s World Hockey Championship. The main reason for this was that the organizers wanted women’s hockey to be taken more seriously and thought that the sport might generate more interest if there was no bodychecking. Additionally, as Weaving and Roberts argue, the absence of bodychecking in women’s hockey “reinforces the stereotypes” (of female athletes)—that they are not strong enough to take the physicality required to play the

---

<sup>215</sup> Robert L. Simon, “Violence in Sports,” in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 383.

<sup>216</sup> IIHF (2018), “IIHF Official Rule Book 2018-2022,” *International Ice Hockey Federation*, last modified June 1, 2018, [https://www.iihf.com/IIHFMvc/media/Downloads/Rule%20Book/IIHF\\_Official\\_Rule\\_Book\\_2018\\_Web\\_v2.pdf](https://www.iihf.com/IIHFMvc/media/Downloads/Rule%20Book/IIHF_Official_Rule_Book_2018_Web_v2.pdf).

men's game. They argued that its absence in women's hockey is due to the common notion that women are fragile, and should women's hockey allow bodychecking, women would be more likely to get hurt, and in fact, all players are more likely to get hurt with it.<sup>217</sup>

The decision by the IIHF to ban bodychecking from the first Women's World Hockey Championship was interesting, as the one can argue the IIHF is an organization that like the NHL, supports liberty and the Harm Principle in hockey. Yet in this case, paternalism was applied. Tournament officials thought that their interference was justified when it came to women's hockey; yet neurologists have a hard time convincing the NHL that paternalistic interference is warranted when it comes to men's hockey. As previously discussed, Mill's concept of liberty and the Harm Principle state that paternalism is only justified when dealing with children or the "mentally incompetent," or when there is harm to others.<sup>218</sup> With regard to hitting in hockey, followers of the Harm Principle or Liberty state that external interference by do-gooders is not justified, as no non-hockey player should be telling the athletes what they can and cannot do. Notwithstanding, the overwhelming support in the hockey community for liberty disappears when it comes to female hockey players.

### **Philosophy of Sport**

In his ethics article on violence and in sport, J.S. Russell advocated for the continuity thesis in sport. As mentioned in the *methods* section, the separation thesis means most fundamental moral values found in sport stand on their own, unrelated to general Western

---

<sup>217</sup> Charlene Weaving and Samuel Roberts, "Checking In: An Analysis of the (Lack of) Body Checking in Women's Hockey," *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 83 (8) (2012): 470–478, doi: 10.1080/02701367.2012.10599882.

<sup>218</sup> Robert L. Simon, "Violence in Sports," in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 379-387.

societal morals and values. The continuity thesis, however, means morals and values found in sport are reflective of morals and values found in Western society.<sup>219</sup> Further discussing these two theses Russell writes:

For the claims of the separation to be interesting, there must be some more fundamental separation between at least some of the moral values in sport and moral values found outside of sport. Thus, the separation thesis must claim that something genuinely autonomous exists in some of the moral values found in sport; these values can neither be reflections nor extensions of more general moral values found outside of sport. In other words, the separation position must hold that sport, supports or stands for, or expresses moral values that are uniquely sports own.<sup>220</sup>

Support for the separation thesis is the main reason why the NHL does not have stiffer penalties for fighting and hits to the head. A fight between two players in the NHL incurs a five-minute major penalty. On the other hand, a brawl in a public place leads to criminal charges, as this is widely condemned. Fighting is seen by many as ‘part of the game,’ yet fighting only occurs at the North American junior level and in the NHL in hockey. As previously mentioned, international hockey and women’s hockey do not allow fighting. Can anyone cogently argue that fighting is ‘part of the game’?

Proponents of the continuity thesis argue sports and life are inter-related, that what happens in a hockey game will affect a person’s life just as much as if it occurred outside the rink. Supporters of this thesis believe that society must treat a hockey game as it treats everything else in life, with the same standard of morals and values. Very rarely is the continuity thesis actually applied to the NHL and to men’s hockey in general. Other sports leagues adhere

---

<sup>219</sup> J.S. Russell, “Broad Internalism and Moral Foundations in Sport,” in *Ethics and Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 51-65.

<sup>220</sup> *Ibid*, 53.

to the continuity thesis; the NHL is the only major professional sports league in North America that allows fighting as part of the game.<sup>221</sup>

The separation thesis/continuity opposition is not strictly related to fighting in hockey; it includes all forms of extreme violence and bodychecking in hockey. Russell's article noted that the NHL believes in its own policing system, separate from the courts, similar to the way that the military handles its own legal matters, separate from the Canadian or US judicial systems. The NHL insists that its league is a separate entity from society.<sup>222</sup> However, in extremely rare cases, the continuity thesis is applied to the NHL.

Russell examined this through two of the most infamous and violent incidents in the NHL's history. The first incident of note occurred in a game between the Vancouver Canucks and Boston Bruins in February 2000. The violent attack occurred when Marty McSorely, a former enforcer for the Boston Bruins, hit former enforcer Donald Brashear of the Vancouver Canucks over the head with a stick from behind, causing Brashear's helmet to fall off as he hit the ice and lost consciousness. The attack appeared to be unprovoked, despite the fact that the two had squared off in an earlier fight in that same game. McSorely was suspended for 23 games (the rest of the NHL season), which was the longest NHL suspension in history at the time. He was later charged in a British Columbia court with assault with a weapon (his stick) and was sentenced to 18 months' probation. McSorely never played in the NHL again.<sup>223</sup> The judge

---

<sup>221</sup> Ross Bernstein, *The Code: The Unwritten Rules of Fighting and Retaliation in the NHL* (Chicago: Triumph Books, 2006).

<sup>222</sup> J.S. Russell, "Broad Internalism and Moral Foundations in Sport," in *Ethics and Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 51-65.

<sup>223</sup> "Bruins McSorely Charged With Assault," *CBC Sports*, last modified March 8, 2000, <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/bruins-marty-mcsorely-charged-with-assault-1.200872>.

presiding over the case, Judge William Kitchen, stated that no rational individual would ever agree to be attacked in that manner, and that everyone could agree that a slash to the head should not be part of the sport of hockey. Examining this case further, Russell writes:

Judge William Kitchen observed that all parties agreed that an assault to the head with a stick was not part of the game, even taking into account the “unwritten” rules of professional hockey. Judge Kitchen held, further, that even a major stick slash to the shoulder of a vulnerable player was “too dangerous for the players to consent to” and thus fell out of the boundaries of the sport.<sup>224</sup>

Because of this, and because the attack seemed out of context within the game (no preceding incident occurred to suggest that Brashear ‘consented to being attacked’), Kitchen ruled that McSorely’s slash could be classified as a criminal act of assault with a weapon (stick).<sup>225</sup> McSorely eventually received a conditional discharge, clearing him of a criminal record. Had McSorely been found guilty, he would have faced up to 18 months in jail. Despite stating that the act could be classified as regular assault outside the world of hockey, Judge Kitchen exonerated McSorely, stating that McSorely’s “being forced to live with the stigma of the trial” was enough.<sup>226</sup>

A similar case that Russell examined occurred on March 8<sup>th</sup>, 2004, when former NHL player Todd Bertuzzi, who was playing for the Vancouver Canucks at the time, hunted down Steve Moore (a rookie on the Colorado Avalanche). Bertuzzi chased Moore down the ice, encircled him like a vulture and grabbed him from behind, tossed him to the ground and

---

<sup>224</sup> J.S. Russell, “Broad Internalism and Moral Foundations in Sport,” in *Ethics and Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 59.

<sup>225</sup> *Ibid*, 51-65.

<sup>226</sup> “McSorely Found Guilty, Gets Conditional Discharge,” *CBC News*, last modified October 7, 2000, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/mcsorley-found-guilty-gets-conditional-discharge-1.252239>.



violently sucker punched Moore multiple times.<sup>227</sup> Bertuzzi and the Canucks claimed that his actions were merely retribution for a meeting between the two teams two weeks prior when Moore had laid a vicious head hit on Canucks' captain Marcus Naslund, concussing him.<sup>228</sup> Even the most ardent supporters of violence in hockey denounced Bertuzzi's actions, stating they had no place in the game.<sup>229</sup>

Bertuzzi viciously attacked Moore, leaving him with extensive injuries, including a concussion and two fractured vertebrae. As a result, Bertuzzi was suspended indefinitely, at least for the remainder of the season and the 2004 Stanley Cup Playoffs, with a possibility of reinstatement before training camp in September of 2004. He was also not allowed to play in Europe during the NHL lockout the following season or represent Canada internationally.<sup>230</sup> Bertuzzi did not return to the NHL until September of 2005.<sup>231</sup> Moore, who was carried off the ice on a stretcher, never played hockey again; and 15 years later, he still struggles with post-concussion symptoms.<sup>232</sup>

---

<sup>227</sup> *The Todd Bertuzzi vs Steve Moore Saga*, "TSN Feature," directed by TSN, aired March 8, 2016, on TSN, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GEjdwIT6g7o>.

<sup>228</sup> *Todd Bertuzzi Sucker Punches Steve Moore- Full Incident (High Quality)*, directed by Sportsnet, aired March 8, 2004, on Sportsnet, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9yxMbWlnWV8>.

<sup>229</sup> "Todd Was Wrong," *CBC Sports*, last modified March 15, 2004, <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/todd-was-wrong-don-cherry-1.482223>.

<sup>230</sup> Rick Westhead, "Bertuzzi Suspended For Season and Playoffs," *The New York Times* (March 12, 2004): <https://www.nytimes.com/2004/03/12/sports/hockey-bertuzzi-suspended-for-season-and-playoffs.html>.

<sup>231</sup> "Bertuzzi Reinstated by NHL," *CBC News*, last modified August 8, 2005, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/bertuzzi-reinstated-by-nhl-1.566563>.

<sup>232</sup> Sean Leahy, "Almost 10 Years Later, Steve Moore Still Experiencing Concussion Symptoms, Now Helping Others," *Yahoo Sports*, last modified January 17, 2014, <http://ca.sports.yahoo.com/blogs/nhl-puck-daddy/almost-10-years-later-steve-moore-now-helping-003445795--nhl.html>.

Despite the lengthy ban from the NHL, Commissioner Gary Bettman was vehemently opposed to any legal investigation of Bertuzzi at the time, stating that “we believe we are adequately and appropriately policing our own game,” thus once again using the separation thesis.<sup>233</sup> Nonetheless, the case did go to trial, just as McSorely’s case had done six years prior, and Bertuzzi was eventually charged with assault causing bodily harm.<sup>234</sup> However, in December of 2004, after Bertuzzi changed his not guilty plea to a guilty plea, he was given a conditional discharge and sentenced to 80 hours of community service and one year of probation, effectively erasing his criminal record, an appalling slap-on-the-wrist level of punishment.<sup>235</sup> Bertuzzi caused extensive, and lasting damage to Moore, while Bertuzzi was allowed to continue to live out his boyhood dream in the NHL.

In both the McSorely/Brashear and the Bertuzzi/Moore cases, the NHL and the British Columbia justice system applied utilitarianism and the separation thesis. Bertuzzi’s lawyer argued that parents must be aware of the risks that come with placing their children in a violent sport like hockey, and that Bertuzzi’s attack merely came with the territory of playing a contact sport.<sup>236</sup> Furthermore, Russell discussed the consent principle, and:

Whether someone is actually a player or a participant in sport in a proper, full sense of the term. One is not properly a player or a genuine sport participant unless one consents to be a player or a participant. One can of course, can be coerced to participate in sporting activities (*see section on Mill and the Harm Principle*), but then one is not fully engaged in *sport* but rather in forced labour or punishment. The moral implications of the consent

---

<sup>233</sup> Rick Westhead. “Bertuzzi Suspended For Season and Playoffs,” *The New York Times* (March 12, 2004): <https://www.nytimes.com/2004/03/12/sports/hockey-bertuzzi-suspended-for-season-and-playoffs.html>.

<sup>234</sup> “Canucks Bertuzzi Charged with Assault,” *CBC News*, last modified June 25, 2004, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/canucks-bertuzzi-charged-with-assault-1.499287>.

<sup>235</sup> Rod Mickleburgh and Robert Matas. “Bertuzzi Receives Conditional Discharge,” *The Globe and Mail* (December 31, 2004): <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/national/bertuzzi-receives-conditional-discharge/article22508170/>.

<sup>236</sup> *Ibid*

principle run very deep; in particular this principle sets the moral boundary of permissible conduct in sport.<sup>237</sup>

However, as Russell explained, the cases differ because McSorely's incident appeared to be unprovoked and not within the context of the game, and therefore could be classified as an everyday assault, and the continuity thesis was deemed appropriate.<sup>238</sup> Bertuzzi's attack, on the other hand, was merely an act of retaliation that had "gone too far" and thus the separation thesis is allegedly more applicable in this scenario.<sup>239</sup> Personally, I am of the belief that the separation thesis should be applied to both heinous acts.

The NHL claims it likes to police its own game and that the sport is different from real life. Yet it is only men's hockey that seems to subscribe to utilitarianism and the separation thesis. International women's hockey has not allowed bodychecking since 1990; however, it was removed from Ontario university women's hockey in 1950.<sup>240</sup> As noted earlier, women's hockey also does not allow fighting.<sup>241</sup> According to Weaving and Roberts, hockey is one of the few sports that consists of different rules for men and women. They claim:

Due to existing rule discrepancies, female hockey players do not have the same chance to flourish as male players do. Because women are required to play without bodychecking, we argue that they cannot participate in the physicality the game demands--- they do not experience bodily agency. They are not afforded the experience of using their bodies in a

---

<sup>237</sup> *Ibid*, 59.

<sup>238</sup> J.S. Russell, "Broad Internalism and Moral Foundations in Sport," in *Ethics and Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 51-65.

<sup>239</sup> *Todd Bertuzzi Sucker Punches Steve Moore- Full Incident (High Quality)*, directed by Sportsnet, aired March 8, 2004, on Sportsnet, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9yxMbWInWV8>.

<sup>240</sup> Carolyn Schellenberg, "In the Absence of Body Checking," *The Manitoban*, last modified January 25, 2015, <http://www.themanitoban.com/2015/01/absence-body-checking/22427/>.

<sup>241</sup> Charlene Weaving and Samuel Roberts, "Checking In: An Analysis of the (Lack of) Body Checking in Women's Hockey," *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 83 (8) (2012): 470-478, doi: 10.1080/02701367.2012.10599882.

manner that exudes force, power and domination (...) if women check in hockey, they would challenge the stereotypical constructs of masculinity and femininity.<sup>242</sup>

As mentioned previously, the early days of professional women's hockey included bodychecking. Weaving and Roberts write:

It is critical to recognize that organized women's hockey, particularly from the early 1920s to 40s, included rough play and fighting (...). Heavy body checks, hooking, slashing, fighting were all part of the women's game, which emulated the contemporary male hockey model. In the early 1900s, women and men played by the same rules, and women were more than capable of handling the physicality of bodychecking.<sup>243</sup>

The IIHF removed bodychecking for the 1990 Women's World Championship so that less skilled and weaker teams had more of a chance against the most dominant women's hockey teams in the world (namely Canada and the USA). In making this decision, the IIHF hoped to make international women's hockey more competitive. From a feminist perspective one can argue that this decision is problematic as it reinforces gender stereotypes of the female as 'physically weak' and the male as 'physically strong' and more masculine, and athletically superior.<sup>244</sup> In her philosophical article on female hockey players, Howe also shared this viewpoint. She writes:

The woman's game, with its structural emphasis on skill over force, already incorporates a rejection of both stereotypically masculine and feminine characteristics; it embraces active self-assertion in a competitive environment while also emphasizing highly cooperative play—as well as the use of careful playmaking and precise control of the puck—over violence and goon tactics.<sup>245</sup>

---

<sup>242</sup> *Ibid*, 470.

<sup>243</sup> *Ibid*, 471.

<sup>244</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>245</sup> Leslie A. Howe, "Being and Playing: Sport and the Valorization of Gender," in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 342.

In her qualitative media analyses of the NBC broadcast commentary of 2006 American national women's hockey team, Kelly Poniatowski argues "the rise of women in sport threatens the ideological gender order of society."<sup>246</sup> Regarding the issue of violence and hegemonic masculinity in hockey, she argues that the violence in hockey is encouraged because it "idealizes what it means to be a man."<sup>247</sup>

Advocates of head contact and fighting in hockey reject paternalism and accept utilitarianism, as these individuals support Mill's Harm Principle. However, when it comes to women's hockey, the Harm Principle does not apply.<sup>248</sup> Proponents of paternalism in men's hockey are disregarded and told that players 'sign up for this (violence) when they make the NHL.' One can argue that the reason that women's hockey does not allow fighting or bodychecking is due to the common belief that, were these physical acts allowed, then there would be numerous injuries. The complete prohibition of bodychecking and fighting in women's hockey exists ostensibly to protect female hockey players from sustaining any serious injuries.<sup>249</sup> The notion that a woman would get an injury from a clean bodycheck in a hockey game suggests that female hockey players are not strong enough to take that kind of physical contact. The NHL and the IIHF believe strongly in the free will and liberty of its male athletes, yet the IIHF has not

---

<sup>246</sup> Kelly Poniatowski, "'You're Not Allowed Bodychecking in Women's Hockey': Preserving Gendered and Nationalistic Hegemonies in the 2006 Olympic Ice Hockey Tournament," *Women in Sport and Physical Activity*, 20 no.1 (2011): 41, <https://link-gale-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/apps/doc/A263258653/AONE?u=lond95336&sid=AONE&xid=756cb09f>.

<sup>247</sup> *Ibid*, 42.

<sup>248</sup> Charlene Weaving and Samuel Roberts, "Checking In: An Analysis of the (Lack of) Body Checking in Women's Hockey," *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 83 (8) (2012): 470-478, doi: 10.1080/02701367.2012.10599882.

<sup>249</sup> Robert L. Simon, "Violence in Sports," in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 379-387.

provided its female hockey players with the same ‘choices’ when it comes to bodychecking, as it remains banned in the women’s version of the game. Mill’s Harm Principle and utilitarianism are absent in women’s hockey; paternalism is normative.

Ironically, hockey is the only team sport where men and women have different rules. American football and rugby, two other traditionally masculine and violent sports are equally intense and physical in both the men’s game and women’s game. Rugby is a sport perhaps even more brutal than hockey, and female rugby players are not deemed to be too weak to play by the same rules as their male counterparts. Rugby, like women’s hockey, is dominated by only a few countries, yet the rules remain the same for both men and women. Hockey, perhaps more than any other sport, retreats from challenging gender norms and hegemonic masculinity. Some scholars argue that men might feel threatened by the idea of a “powerful, aggressive female,” and thus may believe that their masculinity is under attack. Maintaining status quo allows traditional masculinity to remain the dominant societal perspective.<sup>250</sup> As Weaving and Roberts argued:

Women’s hockey has grown tremendously since the late 1990s, and current play at the Olympic level is of high quality. However, it seems that female hockey players continue to be treated in a paternalistic manner. Because women participate in other highly physical sports, such as full-contact football and rugby, it is unreasonable to argue that female hockey players are ill equipped to handle a parallel form of physicality as men.<sup>251</sup>

---

<sup>250</sup> Charlene Weaving and Samuel Roberts, “Checking In: An Analysis of the (Lack of) Body Checking in Women’s Hockey,” *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 83 (8) (2012): 470–478, doi: 10.1080/02701367.2012.10599882.

<sup>251</sup> *Ibid*, 474.

Because men's NHL hockey has included fighting for so long, it has become ingrained for many hockey fans,<sup>252</sup> and it is argued that removing fighting completely would be “pussifying the game.”<sup>253</sup> “Pussy” is a derogatory sexualized term for something that is feminine or un-masculine;<sup>254</sup> it is not uncommon in the hockey world to tell a fellow player ‘don’t be a pussy,’ suggesting that there is something wrong with being feminine or female.<sup>255</sup> Once again, one can see how important the notion of masculinity is in hockey, and how the whole culture surrounding the sport is based on hegemonic masculinity. Not shockingly given its history, the NHL prides itself on ‘selling hate,’ and for many, ‘hate’ is synonymous with on-ice violence, including head shots and fighting.<sup>256</sup> This follows the old adage, “I went to a fight and a hockey game broke out.”

There has been ample research to support the notion that hockey has always been an aggressive and violent sport; it has a history of violence as an expression of masculinity that dates back over 100 years.<sup>257</sup> Thus, it is hard for hockey traditionalists to see the sport any other

---

<sup>252</sup> Daniel Goffenberg, “Blue Jackets Tortorella Laments Friendly NHL, ‘There’s No Hate,’” *Sportsnet*, last modified October 26, 2018, <https://www.sportsnet.ca/hockey/nhl/blue-jackets-tortorella-laments-friendly-nhl-theres-no-hate/>.

<sup>253</sup> “Pussification of the NHL-When Did It Start?” *Hockey Fights*, last modified October 20, 2010, <http://www.hockeyfights.com/forums/f8/pussification-nhl-when-did-start-148384>.

<sup>254</sup> “Pussy,” *Oxford Dictionary*, last modified January 25, 2019, <https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/pussy>.

<sup>255</sup> “Leafs Morgan Rielly Apologizes After “Girl Comment,” *CBC News*, last modified February 20, 2015, <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/nhl/leafs-morgan-rielly-apologizes-after-girl-comment-1.2965604>.

<sup>256</sup> Adam Proteau, “We Sell Hate: North American Hockey’s Long and Baffling Proud History of Violence,” in *Fighting the Good Fight: Why on Ice Violence is Killing Hockey*, (Mississauga: John Wiley & Sons, 2011), p.32-50.

<sup>257</sup> Stacey L. Lorenz and Geraint Osborne, “Nothing More Than the Usual Injury: Debating Hockey Violence During the Manslaughter Trials of Allan Loney (1905) and Charles Masson (1907),” *Journal of Historical Sociology*, 30 (4) (2017): 698-723, doi: 10.1111/johs.12111.

way.<sup>258</sup> As Angela Schneider, a professor of Kinesiology at Western University, argued, there is no reason for women not to play the same sport as men; however this does not mean that women and men should be competing against each other. She states:

Is there any reason why women should not participate in sports that men have traditionally played? It is instructive to look at what could possibly count as a morally acceptable answer. If there were a sport practised by men that was physiologically impossible for women, it would count as a reason for women not participating. But there is no such sport.<sup>259</sup>

Torbjörn Tännsjö, (as discussed in the *literature review*), expands on this further. He believed that not only should men and women athletes play with the same rules, but they should play together, and that gender sport segregation should not exist. He stated:

Even within sports, sexual discrimination is morally objectionable. No sexual discrimination should take place within sports. At least, the International Olympic Committee (IOC) and the leading national sports organisations should give it up. The reasons for giving up sexual discrimination within sports, and for allowing individuals of both sexes to compete with each other, is simple. In sports, it is crucial that the best person wins. Then sexual differences are simply irrelevant (...). Sexual discrimination within sports does not have any better rationale than sexual discrimination in any other fields of our lives.<sup>260</sup>

Despite not being an expert in the field of sports, Tännsjö continued his belief that men and women should play all sports together with the same rules:

Certainly, this abolition of sexual discrimination is consistent with there remaining a possibility for those who like to arrange sports competitions for one sex exclusively, just as there exists a possibility for arranging special sports competitions for certain races, political beliefs or sexual orientations. However, in more official settings there should exist a strict ban on *all* such sorts of (from the point of view of sports itself) irrelevant discriminations. It should be incumbent upon the sports organisations themselves to make

---

<sup>258</sup> Michael A. Robidoux, "Imagining a Canadian Identity Through Sport: A (sic) Historical Interpretation of Lacrosse and Hockey," *The Journal of American Folklore*, 115 (456) (2002): 209-225, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4129220>.

<sup>259</sup> Angela Schneider, "On the Definition of 'Woman' in the Sport Context," in *Sport and Physical Activity*, ed. Paul Davis (United Kingdom Taylor and Francis Group, 2009), 41.

<sup>260</sup> Torbjörn Tännsjö, "Against Sexual Discrimination in Sports," in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 347.



sure that such a ban becomes a reality. And it should also be a condition of obtaining public funding that a sport organisation does not discriminate between men and women.<sup>261</sup>

Ultimately, I actually find Tännsjö's ideas too radical and unfortunately too idealistic, as women would be left behind should gender segregation in sports cease to exist. The best thing about the Olympics Games in recent years has been the increase in female sports and female athletes. Should all sports be made co-ed, then the number of female athletes competing in the Olympics and in professional sports leagues would decrease. Schneider offered a perfect counter example to Tännsjö in her response to his book chapter. She writes:

If Tännsjö's vision in Chapter 7 – of sport transformed – fits into a long line of utopian visions of societies transformed. If we lived in Plato's Republic, where philosophers were kings, there would be no reason to segregate men's and women's sport (...) If we lived in a utopia like Plato's Republic we might be able to have Tännsjö's vision of sport. But unfortunately we do not. The proposal contained in Tännsjö's chapter is dangerous, because it masquerades as a genuine proposal for changing sport as it is currently practised, whereas it is really a utopian fantasy, first of a society – and then of sport – transformed. If the world were a radically different place, then yes, the vision of sport where discrimination is based on ability not on gender (or weight or size, for that matter) would be good.<sup>262</sup>

She argued, that in childhood, sports should not be segregated, as sport for children is “merely about creating opportunities for pleasure. There is no reason to segregate sport for young children.” However, as children grow older and reach adolescence, Schneider argued that the situation becomes trickier, as society's idea of gender roles becomes more fixed than they ever will be. Boys will want act more masculine, girls may become self-conscious, and thus,

---

<sup>261</sup> *Ibid*, 357.

<sup>262</sup> Angela Schneider, “A Postscript to Tännsjö's Radical Proposal,” in *Values in Sport: Elitism, Nationalism, Gender Equity and the Scientific Manufacturing of Winners*, ed. T. Tännsjö and C. Tamburinni (United Kingdom: Taylor and Francis Group, 2000), 135.

females will begin to lose confidence in their academic abilities, despite performing better than their male counterparts in school up until this point. She asks:

What is sport for at this age? I would argue that its primary function is still to allow young people to experience the joy of physical activity and competition. Should we segregate sport at this age? If this is the means of encouraging young people to continue to play and enjoy sport – then yes.<sup>263</sup>

Despite being the most competitive league in terms of talent, the NHL is the only professional hockey league that promotes and ‘sells hate’ (Professional European hockey leagues do not permit fighting).<sup>264</sup> Critics of fighting and head shots are told to “watch women’s hockey” or “figure skating;” essentially those who do not support the culture of violence that the NHL promotes are told that they are not manly enough to watch men’s (NHL) hockey. In other words, fighting remains in men’s hockey because hockey is a sport for men, and those who do not like it, are “pussies.”<sup>265</sup> It is interesting to note, nevertheless, that the most-watched hockey games in Canada are those at the Olympic Winter Games, a tournament, that per International Ice Hockey Federation (IIHF) rules, does not allow fighting.<sup>266</sup>

Based on the evidence discussed above, one can say that the dominant messages and representations of women’s hockey are negative, a stark contrast to the generally positive representation of men’s hockey, whether or not men’s hockey actually deserves its positive representation. Hence, despite the widespread popularity of the women’s hockey tournament at the Olympics, (millions of Canadians tune in every four years to watch Team Canada), there is

---

<sup>263</sup> *Ibid*, 136.

<sup>264</sup> Adam Proteau, “We Sell Hate: North American Hockey’s Long and Baffling Proud History of Violence,” in *Fighting the Good Fight: Why on Ice Violence is Killing Hockey*, (Mississauga: John Wiley & Sons, 2011), 32-50.

<sup>265</sup> Michael A. Robidoux, “Imagining a Canadian Identity Through Sport: A (sic) Historical Interpretation of Lacrosse and Hockey,” *The Journal of American Folklore*, 115 (456) (2002): 209-225, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4129220>.

<sup>266</sup> *Ibid*

still the overarching belief of hockey fans and those working in hockey that the fighting and aggressive violence in hockey are what makes it a “man’s game.”<sup>267</sup> Thus, because women’s hockey does not include bodychecking and fighting, it is not truly hockey, and the traditional hockey fan would argue that those who paternalism are supporting a “pussified” version of a masculine sport.

Moreover, despite the negative perception of women’s hockey, Schneider does not believe that women and men should play hockey together. In fact, she does not support Tännsjö’s radical opinion that gender segregation in elite sports should be abolished. In what is an extremely convincing counter argument on the subject, she writes:

If we desegregate sport we eliminate women from sporting competition at most Olympic events. Would this be a good thing? (...) Given the sports that currently dominate our attention (and why we value these sports rather than others is an interesting inquiry), it would not help our view of either women or men only to see images of men in elite athletic competition. Seeing, and valuing, strong athletic women provides not only an example to younger women of the range of the possible for women, but it also changes our social views of what is appropriate and good for women to do. This is a good thing. (...) <sup>268</sup>

In other words, she argued that gender segregation would actually be counterproductive as it would eliminate female athletic role models, and thus fewer girls would take up sports as a result, as there would never be any female athletes for them to gain inspiration from. She continued her response to Tännsjö:

Tännsjö looks at one little argument based on the pursuit of excellence, in one small context – that of sport functioning at the highest possible level – and he concludes that there is no place for discrimination on the basis of sex. In a world that was fair, and

---

<sup>267</sup> Adam Proteau, “We Sell Hate: North American Hockey’s Long and Baffling Proud History of Violence,” in *Fighting the Good Fight: Why on Ice Violence is Killing Hockey*, (Mississauga: John Wiley & Sons, 2011), 32-50.

<sup>268</sup> Angela Schneider, “A Postscript to Tännsjö’s Radical Proposal,” in *Values in Sport: Elitism, Nationalism, Gender Equity and the Scientific Manufacturing of Winners*, ed. T. Tännsjö, and C. Tamburinni (United Kingdom: Taylor and Francis Group, 2000), 137.

where there was no systematic discrimination on the basis of sex, he would be right. But we do not live in that world. We live in a world where women are systematically denied positions of power and public attention. We live in a world where men's efforts are systematically praised and rewarded. We live in a world where the aptitudes and achievements of women tend to go largely unrecognised and unheralded. In our world, excluding women from the publicity that comes from the highest levels of sporting achievement would merely serve to reinforce women's systemic subservience to men.<sup>269</sup>

Hockey, for many, is the epitome of hegemonic masculinity; it is "is a hypermasculine sport premised on male virility."<sup>270</sup> In her book chapter on gender and Canadian hockey culture, sports and gender sociologist Mary Louise Adams claims that "if hockey is life in Canada, then Canada remains decidedly masculine and white." As analyzed in the *literature review*, M.L. Adams is making the case that is ironic that hockey is the national winter sport, as the sport is not representative of Canada as a nation at all.<sup>271</sup> As Howe writes:

Hockey, as it is commonly conceived, as it is sold to the public and as it is taught to young boys, is a hypermasculine game. Playing hockey, where it is a culturally significant sport, carries ultimate social validation for males. To play hockey is to be a man. In fact, the virtues extolled for hockey players are those most central to the traditional conception of masculinity ("manliness): strength, courage, physical skill, solidarity, and, especially, aggression (...). One must not show any weakness, physical or otherwise, as will be constructed as a failure of masculinity, which failure demonstrates one to be unfit for the game. Hockey defines itself not only in terms of exaggerated masculine traits, but it interprets those traits as being in absolute opposition to any that might, in the remotest way, be thought of as being feminine, or more to the point, effeminate. Thus, at the most fundamental level, hockey excludes as antithetical to itself any trace of the feminine and exalts itself as the pinnacle of purely masculine attainment.<sup>272</sup>

---

<sup>269</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>270</sup> Laura Robinson defines *virility* as "the quality of having strength, energy, strong sex drive and manliness" in Laura Robinson, *Crossing the Line: Violence and Sexual Assault in Canada's National Sport*, (Toronto: McLelland & Stewart, 1998), 12.

<sup>271</sup> Mary Louise Adams, "The Game of Whose Lives? Gender, Race and Entitlement in Canada's "National" Game" in *Artificial Ice: Hockey, Culture and Commerce*, ed. D. Gruneau and M. Whitson (Ontario: Higher Education Press, 2006), 71.

<sup>272</sup> Leslie A. Howe, "Being and Playing: Sport and the Valorization of Gender," in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 332.

In one of three articles written by Carly Adams examined in this thesis, she writes, “historically hockey has been a male preserve—the rightful place of boys and men. The sport was characterized by rough, aggressive physicality, a site where men and boys learned the celebrated values of manhood.”<sup>273</sup> In other words, to remove this distinctive feature defeats the entire purpose of the sport, and turns men’s hockey, a celebration of male identity and masculinity, into women’s hockey, a clearly far inferior version of the sport. Moreover, the NHL has continued to deny the link between hockey and on-ice-violence, and the resultant CTE and concussions, despite overwhelming evidence, thus enabling the league to justify fighting and headshots in the NHL.<sup>274</sup>

In another Adams article, an historical account of the Preston Rivulettes, one of the best women’s hockey teams in the hockey history, she examined the exclusion of the Rivulettes and its players from the Hockey Hall of Fame.<sup>275</sup> She offers support for the notion that sports, and in particular violent sports like hockey are the quintessential example of manhood. Adams writes “historically, sport fields, as a social space for competitive and leisure physical activities have been viewed as the rightful place of men and boys. The longstanding dynamic legitimizing of sport as a masculine enclave secured an insider status for men—the welcomed recipients of public recognition.”<sup>276</sup> Howe offers support for Adams when she claims that:

Woman’s participation in athletic endeavour of any sort presents a problem for traditional concepts of gender and for traditional conceptions of appropriate sexual identity. Female

---

<sup>273</sup> Carly Adams, “Organizing Hockey for Women: The Ladies Ontario Hockey Association and the Fight for Legitimacy, 1922-1940,” in *Coast to Coast: Hockey in Canada to the Second World War*, ed. John Chi-Kit Wong (Ontario: University of Toronto Press, 2009), 134.

<sup>274</sup> Ken Belson, “In Concussion Lawsuit, Gary Bettman Opts to Fight,” *The New York Times* (July 24, 2018): <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/07/24/sports/nhl-concussion-lawsuit-gary-bettman.html>.

<sup>275</sup> Carly Adams, “Queens of the Ice Lanes: The Preston Rivulettes and Women’s Hockey in Canada, 1931-1940,” *Sport History Review*, 39, no.1 (2008): 1-28, <https://doi-org.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/10.1123/shr.39.1.1>.

<sup>276</sup> *Ibid*

athleticism challenges male sexual priority by supplanting the active role that is central to the traditional conception of male sexual identity. Traditional conceptions of woman emphasize her existence as body, with man as mind or spirit. This gets turned on its head by woman's participation in sport. For although woman is (supposedly) body, she is also defined as passive body. This is clearest in her definition as fundamentally sexual, where this sexuality is conceived as primarily receptive, and hence, again, passive. Yet an athletic woman is clearly active and, as we have seen above, aggressive in her activity.<sup>277</sup>

Angela Schneider shared these opinions and continued her discussion of gender

segregation in sports in her book chapter, "On the Definition of Woman in the Sport Context." In the book chapter she takes a philosophical approach to the study of women in sports. She writes:

The female athlete must also face challenges regarding the mental requirements of sport competition, aggression and violence. Male athletes also face these challenges, but it is considered 'normal' for men and 'abnormal' for women to engage in violence. One argument against integration (of women in men's sports) is that women have to accept the current selection of sports, primarily designed for and practised by men, with an established culture with rewarding and recognising values (such as sport as a battleground on which one conquers one's foes) that most women do not hold; whereas separation might allow women the freedom to create sport based on the values they choose. If we think that women athletes either act as men, if they accept the male ideal, or must be separate and generate their own ideal, the sport experience is highly gender-specific. But, the two views of sport – sport as competition (agon), a test against others to overcome; or as connected co-questers searching and striving for excellence – may well be logically independent of the gender of the athlete.<sup>278</sup>

Chapter Four expands further on this common belief (that women's hockey is an inferior version of the sport) using media content analysis. Content analysis directly follows the ethical analysis as the two research questions are very closely linked to each other. Ethical analysis only provides me with a very basic understanding of the portrayal of female hockey players. Thus, I expanded on the ethical analysis in my media content analysis and as a result, I was able to get a much clearer picture of the male/female dichotomy with regard to Canadian hockey players.

---

<sup>277</sup> Leslie A. Howe, "Being and Playing: Sport and the Valorization of Gender," in *Ethics in Sport*, ed. William J. Morgan (Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007), 337.

<sup>278</sup> Angela Schneider, "On the Definition of 'Woman' in the Sport Context," in *Philosophical Perspectives on Gender in Sport and Physical Activity*, ed. Paul Davis, (United Kingdom: Taylor and Francis Group, 2009), 46-47.

## Chapter Four

### **Method Two: Media Content Analysis**

This chapter seeks to prove that the dominant messages and representations of women's hockey in the media are that women's hockey is an inferior version of men's hockey. However, while I did examine articles about men's hockey as a comparison, I did not complete a full-fledged media content analysis of newspaper articles about men's hockey in Canada. Rather, I discovered a pattern of pervasive, pejorative opinions about women's hockey in the newspaper articles. I then used coding to uncover my themes, which allowed me to answer my research question, that women's hockey is portrayed in a negative way by the media. I cannot say for certain that men's hockey is portrayed in a positive way as I did not complete a full media content analysis of articles about men, but the additional newspaper articles that I examined throughout this thesis all spoke highly of men's hockey in comparison to women's hockey. Therefore, I can reasonably assume that the Canadian media believe that women's hockey is inferior to men's hockey. The ethical analysis completed in Chapter Two underscored the pervasiveness of this belief among Canadian journalists and the general public.

This chapter supports this claim through a media analysis, by searching through archival newspapers to reach a conclusion. This chapter was originally intended to examine many different types of media; however, due to efficiency, I decided only to analyze newspapers. Amongst the many different methodologies of media analysis, I chose content analysis. Content analysis is the most applicable to this research. Chapter Two stated that media (structural) analysis was the media analysis method of choice; however, upon further research, I decided that (media) content analysis was better suited to this research, as it is the most accessible based on the constraints and limitations that I was working with. Furthermore, I was then able to use the

key words and themes from the media content analysis in my narrative analysis, which would have been harder to do had I chosen media structural analysis. In addition, the aim of this chapter was to prove absolute claims (yes or no, something is absolutely true, or something is not true) to answer the key research questions.

According to Bertrand and Hughes, media content analysis asks: “how well does this message capture the real world through codes?”<sup>279</sup> This chapter focuses on the context of each newspaper in order to discuss how the media and the general public view women’s hockey compared to men’s. This chapter, using media content analysis, complete with coding, addressed the following question: *what is the response of the Canadian media and general public to such (ethical) representations (of women’s hockey as discussed in chapter two).*

This research focuses on two major Canadian newspapers: *The Toronto Star*, and *The Globe and Mail*. These two newspapers were chosen because one of them is a national newspaper, meaning that the paper has country-wide circulation (*The Globe and Mail*). The other paper is *The Toronto Star*. Although it is a Toronto-based and Toronto-focused newspaper, it is the largest newspaper in the country by circulation, and it reaches the largest and most diverse population base in Canada (the Greater Toronto area), and runs seven days a week (unlike *The Globe*, which publishes six days a week). Both of these newspapers are among the top ten in terms of readership in the country, and this should have resulted in a rich variety of articles to examine.<sup>280</sup>

---

<sup>279</sup> Ina Bertrand and Peter Hughes, “Part Three: Research on Texts,” in *Media Research Methods*, (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.) (London: Palgrave MacMillan, 2018), 223-227.

<sup>280</sup> “Top 10 Canadian Newspapers,” *Agility PR Solutions*, last modified January 2019. <https://www.agilitypr.com/resources/top-media-outlets/top-10-canadian-print-outlets/>.



As this research commenced, the assumptions were that women's hockey would not only have less media coverage than men's hockey, but also that coverage would paint women's hockey in a more negative light compared to men's hockey. I predicted that *The Toronto Star* would have the most positive female-centric articles about Canadian female hockey players, as it is not only the largest newspaper, but the most left-wing paper of the two (centre-left); it is more likely to offer positive female-centric hockey coverage, due to its liberal beliefs. Moreover, I also hypothesized that *The Toronto Star* would have more female sports reporters than *The Globe and Mail*. *The Globe and Mail* is the main centre-right paper in Canada, and one could assume that *The Globe* has fewer positive female-centric sports articles as well as fewer sports articles written by women.

### **Media Methodology**

It took a few attempts on the archival newspaper database LexisNexis to find the appropriate search terms: "women's ice hockey in Canada," despite that the word "ice" is not commonly used to describe hockey among Canadians.

This chapter used LexisNexis over other newspaper databases such as Factiva and Canadian Newsstand Major Dailies (CNMD) as LexisNexis is much easier to use than Factiva, and it provides a larger sample of archival articles with which to work than both Factiva and CNMD. After experimenting with several key words, the search finally became successful when I used the phrase mentioned above as it was the most appropriate and provided me with the largest selection of findings. The findings were then narrowed down into a smaller, more manageable number.

On LexisNexis, the articles were ranked from least recent to most recent, as this made them easier to organize during the research process. This also made it easy to eliminate articles

that were written before 1990, as 1990 is the year of the first Women's World Hockey Championship, and therefore the start of the chosen time period for this media analysis. Once pre-1990 articles were eliminated from the LexisNexis search of *The Toronto Star* articles, one is left with a total of 857 articles that had the key words "women's" "ice hockey" and "Canada." These words made up my inclusion criteria for my LexisNexis article search. The 857 articles were the population size of the research. I then used systematic random sampling in order to choose the sample size of articles. Systematic random sampling means one selecting every *n*th article to analyze; in this case, I chose every tenth article.<sup>281</sup>

Using every tenth article and eliminating the articles that were not relevant, as well as any possible duplicates, left a total of 39 articles from *The Toronto Star* for my sample size. A sample size of approximately 30 is ideal, as it is a big enough sample to yield significant results, yet it is a small enough sample that remains workable. Therefore, this was a satisfactory number of articles to enable me to carry out the media content analysis.

With some surprise, after I completed the systematic random sampling, 47 *Globe* articles were left, compared to the 39 from *The Star* as previously mentioned. This disproved the initial hypothesis that the more left-wing newspaper would have increased coverage of Canadian women's hockey. As discovered in this research, because a newspaper is more left-wing does not necessarily mean it is more feminist.

However, *The Globe and Mail's* sample contained 15 articles written by female reporters as opposed to 16 *Toronto Star* articles written by women—hardly a difference-- and *The Globe and Mail* had a larger sample size. Regrettably, female hockey writers were sorely

---

<sup>281</sup> Alan Bryman, Edward Bell, and James Teevan, "Glossary," in *Social Research Methods*, (Ontario: Oxford University Press, 2012), 367-375.

underrepresented in both newspapers; even when covering a female sport, the journalist was more likely to be male.

Furthermore, because many of the articles were journalistic articles and not by-line columns, it is hard for me to tell which newspaper saw women's hockey in a more positive light. Both *The Star* and *The Globe* examined the lack of parity in women's international hockey and why this was an issue. However, multiple *Star* reporters advocated for women to be enshrined in The Hockey Hall of Fame in downtown Toronto, and there are no noticeable articles of such a nature in *The Globe*. It is difficult to discern which newspaper took a more positive view of women's hockey as both demonstrated inadequate coverage of the sport; therefore, it is impossible to make absolute claims as was the initial plan with media content analysis.

Moreover, the chosen sampling method, systematic random sampling, is not an exact science. Some of the articles were not relevant to this topic, and the systematic random sampling was not always consistently random. Articles on the database that were not about women's Canadian hockey were skipped as many irrelevant articles appeared on the database final results page (the key word-search meant that articles containing any of the key words "women," "ice hockey," "Canada," were randomized, not necessarily any articles containing my exact phrase "women's ice hockey in Canada"). This meant that LexisNexis generated many articles that were not related to Canada's national hockey team, particularly during Winter Olympic years when there were many articles about Canadian women winning medals. However, the sample method consisted mostly of systematic random sampling, with some purposive sampling, due to the specific nature of this research.

Bertrand and Hughes define purposive sampling as “selecting to test the theory, a sample that is perhaps deliberately extreme or deviant.”<sup>282</sup> For example, this chapter attempts to support a theory that Canadian women’s hockey lacks attention in the media, and when it is portrayed, it is seen in a negative light. Therefore, articles unrelated to Canadian women’s hockey cannot be analyzed. This means at times this chapter was not analyzing every tenth article, but more often, every 15<sup>th</sup>, 20<sup>th</sup>, or even the 30<sup>th</sup>, if the previous articles were not relevant to the research.

Once I identified all the articles, they were sorted into two files (one per newspaper and in order of year). This made it easier to analyze key words that emerged from the data and then further break down the articles into key themes that emerged from the key words. Once I found all of the key words, I then created a frequency table and began phase one of the content analysis: counting the prevalence of each of the main words that were chosen, using Bertrand and Hughes’ example of content analysis. After a brief survey of each article, there were seven key words that appeared the most often throughout the 86 chosen articles. They are as follows: *women/women’s/female, Canada/Canadian, United States/US/USA/American, Olympics, blowout/lopsided/rout, skill, Manon Rhéaume and Hayley Wickenheiser.*

I then re-examined each article and counted how many times each word appeared in each respective article. The final count is shown in the frequency table in the appendix. (The chart was too large to fit into the actual thesis document). I then examined the table for context in order to determine the themes from the key words and other pre-existing data. This media analysis consisted of inductive analysis or discovering themes that emerge from the data. Inductive media analysis is more straightforward than deductive media analysis (trying to find data to fit into pre-

---

<sup>282</sup> Ina Bertrand and Peter Hughes, “Chapter 10: Gathering and Analysing Textual Data,” in *Media Research Methods*, (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.) (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2018), 267.

determined themes), although I did have an a priori hypothesis before commencing with the content analysis.

## **Media Findings**

### **Key Words and Themes Highlighted from Initial Table (seen in coding table in Appendix)**

**Nationalism (Canada):** The two biggest newspapers are most likely to focus on Team Canada in a positive light and mention the United States as an enemy. As such, Canada is mentioned 432 times, and the United States is mentioned 177 times. In total, the key words are mentioned 1,539 times throughout the 86 articles, an average of almost 18 key words per article. In many cases, the articles are written from a perspective of ‘us vs them,’ including articles written by a reporter as opposed to a columnist. There were a few articles that focused on American superstars—former USA player and Hockey Hall of Famer, Cammi Granato, was the focus of two articles, which was an interesting change. However, the majority of articles saw the United States as Canada’s biggest and (only) true rival and were written from this point of view.

Surprisingly, the words **blowout/rout/lopsided** were only mentioned a total of five times combined. Many articles mentioned or implied that women’s hockey struggled to find parity, and the Olympics saw repeated efforts by Olympic officials to decide whether to keep women’s hockey or remove it. Therefore, while the words blowout/rout/lopsided were not explicitly mentioned, the implication existed. Some of the newspaper columnists themselves stated that women’s hockey is undeservedly in the Olympics, while many worthy female softball players and ski jumpers were sitting at home as their sports were not yet in the Olympic program. Softball was included as an Olympic sport from 1996-2008. It was removed for the London 2012 Olympics and the Rio 2016 Olympics, and it has been recently reinstated along with baseball for

the 2020 Olympics in Tokyo.<sup>283</sup> Even in non-Olympic years, this seemed to be a concern in all the articles, as with the exception of the 2006 Turin Olympics, every major international tournament has featured only two specific teams in the gold medal game: Canada and the United States.

**Struggle for women’s hockey players:** Many articles focused on women’s leagues and the lack of professional opportunities for women and suggested that the competing leagues created a problem. Whether it was women’s hockey leagues fighting for survival, folding and getting reinstated, merging and de-merging (together), or Canadian women trying to play professional men’s hockey, it is clear from the 86 articles that women have traditionally faced an uphill battle. Given the recent news of the Canadian Women’s Hockey League (CWHL) folding in April 2019, this is a battle that continues today. In her 1995 article on gender equity in hockey, Megan Williams writes “the game of our lives (hockey) has really been the game of their lives, a game from which the half country have (*sic*) been coolly shutout. It is time to open the doors and welcome the ebullient (enthusiastic) female rush toward the ice. It is time for women and girls to claim our place in Canada’s national pastime.”<sup>284</sup> Unfortunately, my media content analysis shows that this quote can still be used to describe the state of women’s hockey in 2019.

Another key sub theme that emerged from the articles concerned star female players, such as Hayley Wickenheiser, Manon Rhéaume, Charline Labonté, and Shannon Szabados, playing either major junior hockey or professional men’s hockey. The articles discussed each

---

<sup>283</sup> “IOC Approves Five New Sports for Olympic Games Tokyo 2020,” *International Olympic Committee*, last modified August 3, 2016, <https://www.olympic.org/news/ioc-approves-five-new-sports-for-olympic-games-tokyo-2020>.

<sup>284</sup> Megan Williams, “Women’s Hockey: Heating Up the Equity Debate,” *Canadian Woman Studies*, 15, no. 4 (1995): 81, <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/217455318?pq-origsite=summon>.

athlete's notable feat; however, in each instance the woman was later released from her contract. Unless the article was written in an Olympic year, the newspaper coverage of these star women evaporated. This is discussed further in the final theme, which is called "lack of coverage of the women's game in general."

**Women's hockey being less exciting:** Even when superstars such as Hayley Wickenheiser and Manon Rhéaume were discussed (the word 'Wickenheiser' is seen a total of 89 times and the word 'Rhéaume' was mentioned a total of 29 times through 86 articles), skill was rarely used to analyze a player's ability. Instead, descriptors such as 'first woman to play in the NHL, or score a goal in professional men's hockey,' or 'greatest female ever,' 'superstar' were used. Although skill is implied when authors discussed greatness, the word 'skill' is not used explicitly. There was one time in *The Star* when skill was used negatively (describing other countries whose players were less skilled at hockey, and how the skill level in women's hockey was not where it needs to be).

In total, the word 'skill' is used 17 times between the two newspapers. It would be interesting to do a media comparison with regard to male hockey players and see how many times the word 'skill' appears. One can assume that it would be used more than 17 times in 86 articles from Canada's two largest newspapers. One can also assume that 'skill' would be used to describe a talented player or a talented team; for example, if one were to ask fellow NHLers who the best players in the league are, most players would describe their co-players as being "so skilled."

**Subtle praise, or indifference to star players:** While every article was not explicitly pro men's hockey (many were supportive of the women's game), some stated that there were serious problems with the women's game, failing to recognize that the men's game had many of these

same issues. Furthermore, while some superstars were praised, the praise was subdued compared to the praise for men. Even the captains discussed in the articles, Cassie Campbell, Wickenheiser and, later on, Caroline Ouellette, were described as simply ‘captains’ and were not described as possessing any notable leadership qualities. On the contrary, former men’s national team captains Ryan Smyth and Sidney Crosby<sup>285</sup> have been described in the media as ‘fantastic leaders’ numerous times over the course of one Olympics or at other international hockey tournaments.<sup>286</sup> In fact, Smyth was even called “Captain Canada” by Hockey Canada itself, signaling that the organization thought he was the ultimate Canadian captain and leader.<sup>287</sup> Every time a major international tournament took place, sports reporters and columnists heaped praise on numerous male hockey players. Rarely were female players in these articles given the same treatment, unless the journalist was a female. This brings the chapter to its penultimate major theme.

**Author:** The author of each newspaper article appeared to make a difference. Whilst a significant majority of sports writers were male, there were a few female writers for both newspapers who wrote more positively about female hockey. All of the negative comments about the lack of parity in international women’s hockey came from male journalists. In general, there were very few female journalists, which was surprising as women are more likely to want to cover women’s hockey, as mentioned earlier. Only 29 articles (from both newspapers

---

<sup>285</sup> Jonas Siegal, “Sidney Crosby Named Canadian Captain for World Cup of Hockey,” *The Toronto Star* (August 25, 2018): <https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/2016/08/25/sidney-crosby-named-canadian-captain-for-world-cup-of-hockey.html>.

<sup>286</sup> Carol Schram, “Sidney Crosby Enjoying Role on Team Canada at World Hockey Championship,” *The Toronto Star* (May 13, 2015): <https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/2015/05/13/sidney-crosby-enjoying-role-on-team-canada-at-world-hockey-championship.html>.

<sup>287</sup> Paul Edmonds, “Captain Canada,” *Hockey Canada*, last modified June 17, 2018, <https://www.hockeycanada.ca/en-ca/news/parallax/2018-hcf-ohc-ryan-smyth>.



combined) were written by a female. This is a signal that one reason why there may be a lack of women's hockey coverage is due to a lack of female sports journalists. This takes the chapter to its final theme of the media content analysis.

**Lack of coverage of the women's game in general:** During Olympic years, the articles about Canada's national women's hockey team increased, except for the first ten years of my chosen time frame (1990-2000), when the articles about women's hockey were consistently frequent throughout the year. One can imagine that this is because women's international hockey was still in its infancy at the time, and the initial public interest was still there. Oversaturation with regard to Canada/USA storylines was not yet an issue.

However, post- 2000, the lead-up to the 2002 Salt Lake City Olympics exhibited coverage, yet a lack of coverage was amplified after Salt Lake and, subsequently, after each Winter Olympics. Every Olympic year was rife with coverage, yet the three non-Olympic years in between had little to no coverage at all. This supports the initial hypothesis that there still remains a major gap in women's hockey media coverage, and that, with the exception of the Olympics, which only occurs every four years, women's hockey is rarely discussed in Canadian media at all (at least mainstream print media representative of Canada's two largest newspapers).

In fact, during one of the searches, my analysis showed that *The Toronto Star* had a nearly four-year gap in its women's hockey coverage at one point, between the 2010 and 2014 Olympics. *The Globe and Mail* was not much better, with a two-year gap in coverage during that same time period. On the contrary, both newspapers have an article about men's hockey in the paper almost every single day of the year, whether it is NHL coverage, World Junior coverage, or World Championship coverage. Even the dull offseason is usually discussed with regard to

free agent signings, trades and potential prospects for the upcoming season. Men's hockey coverage is ubiquitous. Significance hardly matters.

During the Stanley Cup playoffs, the majority of *The Toronto Star* sports section is full of playoff coverage, especially if the Toronto Maple Leafs are in the post-season. Sometimes, during the playoffs, the Leafs are given front page treatment with the main headline and main photograph featuring the result of the previous night's game. This happens with the Canadian men's hockey team during the Olympics, or in some cases when the roster is announced; it is debated and extensively examined (especially if NHL players are involved).<sup>288</sup> The National World Junior team (U-20) also receives similar treatment if the team is victorious, (or even if not, in some cases) in the IIHF World Junior hockey championship that takes place every Christmas season.<sup>289</sup>

Women's hockey struggles to gain the same attention, and as predicted, does not often receive positive attention in the press. Even the Pittsburgh Penguins received extensive Toronto-based press coverage during the NHL season, most likely due to its captain, Sidney Crosby, also the captain of the national team and arguably, the foremost hockey player in the world.<sup>290</sup>

In comparison, the recent Clarkson Cup playoffs for the former Canadian Women's Hockey League were barely mentioned in the media, and only the final championship game

---

<sup>288</sup> Dave Feschuk, "Sochi 2014: Canada's Roster Superlative, As Long as They Win: Feschuk," *The Toronto Star* (January 8, 2014): [https://www.thestar.com/sports/sochi2014/hockey/2014/01/08/sochi\\_2014\\_team\\_canadas\\_roster\\_superlative\\_s\\_o\\_long\\_as\\_they\\_win\\_feschuk.html](https://www.thestar.com/sports/sochi2014/hockey/2014/01/08/sochi_2014_team_canadas_roster_superlative_s_o_long_as_they_win_feschuk.html).

<sup>289</sup> Kevin McGran, "Canada Loses World Junior Heartbreak to Finland in OT," *The Toronto Star* (January 2, 2019): <https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/worldjuniors/2019/01/02/game-centre-canada-loses-overtime-heartbreaker-to-finland.html>.

<sup>290</sup> *The Toronto Star*, "Sidney Crosby," (April 11, 2019): <https://www.thestar.com/search.html?tag=Sidney%20Crosby&pagenum=1>.

between Les Canadiennes de Montréal and the Calgary Inferno received any newspaper coverage. Some of the articles that discussed the Clarkson Cup were ones used for my media content analysis, and some of them were additional supplementary articles chosen to support the findings from the content analysis; however, all of these articles were written within the chosen time frame, 1990-2019.<sup>291</sup> Of course, when the CWHL folded a week later,<sup>292</sup> coverage in Canadian newspapers ramped up.<sup>293</sup> By comparison, *The Toronto Star* sports writers annually make predictions for the upcoming Stanley Cup Playoffs,<sup>294</sup> even if there is not a single Canadian team in the post-season, as was the case in the 2016 playoffs.<sup>295</sup>

All of these themes answered, in part, the second research question in this thesis: *what is the response of the Canadian media and the general public to such ethical representations (of women's hockey as discussed in chapter two)?* The hypothesis for this question that women's hockey is seen as an inferior version of men's hockey as seen through the media, can be somewhat supported. However, many of the articles were not columns, but more factual stories, and it was hard to find explicit bias and opinions throughout. The lack of newspaper coverage in general leads one to believe that women's hockey is not covered because of general public

---

<sup>291</sup> Kevin McGran, "Clarkson Cup Contenders are Happy to Be Under the Spotlight of the CWHL Final," *The Toronto Star* (March 23, 2019): <https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/2019/03/23/clarkson-cup-contenders-are-happy-to-be-under-the-spotlight-of-the-cwhl-final.html>.

<sup>292</sup> Kevin McGran, "The Canadian Women's Hockey League is Folding, Says Business Model Isn't the Right One," *The Toronto Star* (March 31, 2019): <https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/2019/03/31/canadian-womens-hockey-league-is-folding-board-says-business-model-is-financially-unsustainable.html>.

<sup>293</sup> Edward Keenan, "Hey Rich Folk: For a Relative Pittance, You Could be the Conn Smythe of Women's Hockey," *The Toronto Star* (April 5, 2019): <https://www.thestar.com/opinion/star-columnists/2019/04/05/hey-rich-folks-for-a-relative-pittance-you-could-be-the-conn-smythe-of-womens-hockey.html>.

<sup>294</sup> Kevin McGran, "Breaking Down the First Round of the NHL Playoffs," *The Toronto Star* (April 9, 2019): <https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/2019/04/09/breaking-down-the-first-round-of-the-nhl-playoffs.html>.

<sup>295</sup> Jesse Campigotto, "NHL Playoffs Will Have No Canadian Teams This Year," *CBC Sports*, last modified March 31, 2016. <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/nhl/no-canadian-teams-nhl-playoffs-1.3513988>.

disinterest, but perhaps, it is more attributable to the public's lack of familiarity with the majority of the players, except when interest peaks during the Olympic years. Furthermore, the general public only really has knowledge of the superstar players and future hall of famers such as Hayley Wickenheiser, arguably the most skilled female hockey player of all time, and Manon Rhéaume, largely due to her brief NHL exposure, an accomplishment which faded quickly once it was revealed that it was a publicity stunt.

There were limitations involved in this media content analysis. Due to the nature of the research, it was hard to get a clear-cut answer for the second research question. Had there been more opportunity for expansion, this chapter could have used multiple individuals to carry out a full-scale coding qualitative analysis, using inter-coder reliability. Additionally, the scope is limited; if one were to expand on this further, one could analyze multiple forms of media, not just newspapers. One could examine magazines, television, radio, even digital media, although admittedly this would be much harder to do if one wanted to examine archival footage, as no database exists for old television and radio archives.

Once the ethics analysis and media analysis were complete, I then moved onto the final piece of the analysis, the narrative analysis. Logically, the narrative analysis makes sense as the last of the three forms of analysis, as the narrative in itself tied multiple disciplines together. The ethical and media analysis contributed to the narrative, which is broad, as it is “an approach focused on the search for and analysis of stories that people use to understand their lives and the world around them.”<sup>296</sup>

---

<sup>296</sup> Alan Bryman, Edward Bell, and James Teevan, “Glossary,” in *Social Research Methods*, (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 2012), 370.

### **Method Three: Narrative Analysis**

As previously mentioned, the narrative analysis was the third and final type of qualitative analysis. It unified everything from the two previous types of analysis. It allowed me to answer my third and final research question: *c) What narrative themes create the popular story about women in hockey and about the National Women's Hockey Team?* This chapter acted as an extension of the inductive media content analysis and examined the work of important narrative scholars.

Ultimately, the narrative analysis is all about telling a story, and after completing both my ethical and media analysis, the major recurring themes were the coverage or (lack thereof) given to female hockey players, and the general public's opinion of women's hockey. As such, these themes formed the main story of this chapter.

### **Critical Discourse Analysis/Story Analyst Approach**

I determined that this chapter will focus on the difference between men and women's hockey; what remained was to decide how I would tell this story. Just as there are multiple kinds of media analysis, there are also multiple kinds of narrative, as there are many different ways to tell a story. This chapter used critical discourse analysis.

Additionally, the first part of this narrative took a 'story analyst' approach as opposed to a 'storyteller' approach. This means that the author is not telling her own story through the first person, but rather, analyzing the stories of others. The second part of this narrative took a 'storyteller' approach, meaning that I drew upon my own personal experiences to complement the narrative. Normally the story analyst narrative approach is done through interviews; however, one can also use thematic narrative analysis to examine newspapers, and other texts in similar

fashion to media content analysis.<sup>297</sup> Due to the pre-existing research, this chapter examined the same newspapers (used for the media analysis) to conduct the narrative analysis. Specifically, this narrative focused on the language of both newspapers. As mentioned in the first paragraph, this practice is called critical discourse analysis (CDA)—an interdisciplinary narrative approach to the study of language/discourse (the language can be spoken, as is the case with interviews, or it can be written, as is the case with this CDA). The most common and well known CDA method is the one made famous by Norman Fairclough in 1995. That is the model chosen for this paper’s narrative CDA. Fairclough categorizes his process into three dimensions:

1. *The object featured for analysis (written text, visual text, oral communication).*
2. *How the message is portrayed to human subjects.*
3. *“The sociocultural practices, including the economics of the media and the wider cultural context.”<sup>298</sup>*

This method allows the writer the latitude to create his/her own story based on what they already have examined.

In her step by step description of CDA, Janks wrote that each one of Fairclough’s three dimensions requires a different type of analysis. They are as follows: *a description of the text (analysis), an interpretation of the text (processing analysis), finally an explanation of the text*

---

<sup>297</sup> Brett Smith, “Narrative Analysis,” in *Analyzing Qualitative Data in Psychology* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.), ed. Evanthia Lyons and Adrian Coyle (United Kingdom: Sage, 2016), 202-221.

<sup>298</sup> Ina Bertrand and Peter Hughes, “Chapter 10: Gathering and Analysing Textual Data,” in *Media Research Methods* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.), (London: Palgrave MacMillan, 2018), 285.

(*social analysis*).<sup>299</sup> This chapter consisted of deconstructing or unpacking the text, similar to the way one does a close reading of a novel or a textual passage in order to find the underlying meaning. With the CDA method, this chapter explored the deeper, underlying meaning of the newspaper articles, and/or magazines selected for this study. The CDA used the same newspaper articles previously employed for the media content analysis, as this chapter dealt with familiar data.

## Summary

Using Fairclough's methods, this narrative examined the 'object' of choice—written text (newspapers).<sup>300</sup> The main message in each newspaper article was slightly different as all are about the different themes, but the overall narrative was that women's hockey simply is not as skilled as men's hockey. Therefore, the public only cares about women's hockey every four years during the Winter Olympics, as this is when the majority of the articles in *The Star* and *The Globe* were published.<sup>301</sup> A case in point illustrated this dynamic: the female head coach and all of the staff involved with the women's national hockey team were dismissed after the gold medal loss to the Americans at the 1998 Nagano Winter Olympics. The women's program was put on hold.<sup>302</sup> The men's team did not even qualify for the gold medal game, and yet its head coach

---

<sup>299</sup> Hilary Janks, "Critical Discourse as a Research Tool," (2019): <https://www.uv.es/gimenez/Recursos/criticaldiscourse.pdf>.

<sup>300</sup> Ina Bertrand and Peter Hughes, "Chapter 10: Gathering and Analysing Textual Data," in *Media Research Methods* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.), (London: Palgrave MacMillan, 2018), 285.

<sup>301</sup> James Christie, "Playing with the Big Boys: Hayley Wickenheiser Invited to Attend Workouts with Flyers, Prospects, Draftees," *The Globe and Mail* (May 28, 1998): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.

<sup>302</sup> David Naylor, "Rockets Considering Hiring Sauvageau National Women's Team Coach to Discuss Job," *The Globe and Mail* (May 6, 1999): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.

(Mark Crawford) had his NHL head coaching job with the Colorado Avalanche to return to after Nagano, despite the fact that his coaching decisions arguably cost Canada a chance at a gold medal.<sup>303</sup> Since the object examined in this narrative was newspaper articles, each message is portrayed in written form, following the steps of the narrative format methodology.

Another common narrative seen in the newspaper articles is that women's hockey is not real hockey as it does not consist of bodychecking. However, as Susan Fennell, former mayor of Brampton and president of the now-defunct National Women's Hockey League (Canada), pointed out, this is a very North-American-centric viewpoint. European hockey players favour speed and skill over physicality, the same traits that make up women's hockey, and that does not make these players inferior to their North American counterparts—in fact some of the best hockey players ever to play have been European: Niklas Lidstrom, Peter Forsberg, Alexander Ovechkin, Evgeni Malkin.<sup>304</sup>

Former Canadian national team goaltender Danielle Dubé also compared women's hockey to European playing style. In the case study on both Team Canada and Team USA by Joanna Avery and Julie Stevens, Dubé tells the researchers “women's hockey has a more European style. It's a smarter game, a passing game. You don't get the big shots as much as you

---

<sup>303</sup> Mike Brophy, “98 Problems: How it All Went Wrong for Canada's Olympic Hockey Team in Nagano,” *CBC Sports Longform*, last modified February 3, 2017. <https://www.cbc.ca/sportslongform/entry/1998-olympic-hockey>.

<sup>304</sup> Susan Fennell, “Women's League Deserves Exposure,” *The Toronto Star* (February 21, 2001): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.



do with the guys and you don't get the big hits, because there is no hitting. So, it is a smarter game where you get a European style with passes, the pretty plays."<sup>305</sup>

Moreover, coaches of the national women's team have to juggle a full-time coaching career with a money-generating full-time job, as coaching women's hockey, even at the highest level, does not pay the bills, no matter for how many gold medal teams the coach is responsible.<sup>306</sup> Male coaches do not have to worry about struggling to make ends meet as every NHL coach hired by Hockey Canada is a multi-millionaire.<sup>307</sup>

Furthermore, the opportunities for women to play hockey at an elite level simply do not exist in the same way as they do for men. As Wayne Norton discusses in his book on the subject, the opportunities for elite level and professional hockey in Western Canada is worse than it is in Ontario, this is most likely due to the smaller population; however it ensures that a large group of Canadian female hockey players are left out in the cold.<sup>308</sup>

Moreover, the recent collapse of the CWHL and the subsequent boycott of North American women's hockey leagues by 200 elite female hockey players, many of them American, Canadian and European Olympians, is another example of this narrative: women's hockey does not receive the same respect or funding as men's hockey.<sup>309</sup> Until that changes, these women

---

<sup>305</sup> Joanna Avery and Julie Stevens, *Too Many Men on the Ice: Women's Hockey in North America* (Victoria: Polestar Book Publishers, 1997), 245.

<sup>306</sup> David Leeder, "Sauvageau Plans to Give Up the Bench for Her Badge," *The Globe and Mail* (June 18, 2002): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.

<sup>307</sup> "Coaches," *CapFriendly*, last modified June 19, 2019 <https://www.capfriendly.com/coaches/history>.

<sup>308</sup> Wayne Norton, *Women on Ice: The Early Years of Women's Hockey in Western Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016).

<sup>309</sup> Seth Berkman, "CWHL Folds, Leaving North America With One Women's League," *The New York Times* (March 31, 2019): <https://www.nytimes.com/2019/03/31/sports/cwhl-womens-hockey.html>.

have refused to play hockey anywhere in North America in the 2019-20 year, knowing that they may be jeopardizing their careers. These women decided on this collective action after the CWHL folded, despite the presence of another professional women's hockey league in the United States (National Women's Hockey League). They hope that by sitting out this upcoming season, they are paving the way for future generations of North American female hockey players, so that they can have more viable options to play professional women's hockey.<sup>310</sup>

The women have also created a players' union, similar to the NHL Players' Association. The hope is that the women will now have someone to advocate for them in order to ensure that a professional league does not fold without any of the players knowing about the decision, as was the case with the demise of the CWHL. Jaclyn Gibson, a female hockey player picked by the Toronto Furries in the 2016 CWHL draft, explained that she was surprised to hear of the league's demise:

(I'm) in shock and disbelief that this is actually happening. For me growing up playing hockey, there were limited opportunities; my mom would take me to hockey camps, where I was the only female player on the ice. The CWHL has been a great catalyst for growing the game.<sup>311</sup>

Because of the meager opportunities for female hockey players in Canada, some women have turned to men's hockey for the chance to keep playing. These former women's national team players have experienced success at elite men's levels, including goalie Charline Labonté, who played a season for the Acadie-Bathurst Titan in the Québec Major Junior Hockey League

---

<sup>310</sup> Seth Berkman, "Women Hockey Players Seeking a Better League, Say They'll Sit Out," *The New York Times* (May 2, 2019): <https://www.nytimes.com/2019/05/02/sports/female-hockey-players-boycott.html>.

<sup>311</sup> Brittany Rosen, "Female Hockey Players Devastated After League Folds," *Global News*, last modified April 8, 2019, <https://globalnews.ca/news/5141928/female-hockey-players-react-cwhl-folds/>.

(QMJHL,) one of the best major junior hockey leagues in the world. Labonté was the first female to be drafted and play in that league, and as her former teammate Jules-Edy Laraque said at the time: “it’s been hard for them (our opponents) to take, being stopped by a girl.”<sup>312</sup>

Shannon Szabados, Team Canada’s starting goalie at the 2010 and 2014 Winter Olympics, briefly played with men in the Southern Professional Hockey League, and was quite successful for just over two seasons;<sup>313</sup> however, she was unceremoniously released from the team for being a distraction; as she was “too friendly” with another player on her team.<sup>314</sup> Based on these circumstances, one can assume that if she were male, she never would have been released from the team. This is another example to support the narrative that women’s hockey is not as serious or important as men’s hockey. This decision signals that the head coach already wanted to remove Szabados from the team and was waiting for his opportunity to do so. He claimed it was because neither she nor the other goalie on the team had played well. However, each goalie had only played two games. It was still very early in the season to make such a momentous decision. It is important to remember that Szabados was playing on a different team than the one with which she originally signed (Columbus Cottonmouths); therefore her final two games of her professional men’s hockey career were for a completely new team and new coach.<sup>315</sup> To judge her performance based on two games was premature and unfair.

---

<sup>312</sup> David Naylor, “Goalie Labonté Faces Overwhelming Attention as Well as the Pucks,” *The Globe and Mail* (October 30, 1999): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/Inacademic/>.

<sup>313</sup> The Canadian Press, “Shannon Szabados Returns to Canadian Women’s Hockey Team,” *The Globe and Mail* (November 23, 2016): <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/sports/hockey/shannon-szabados-returns-to-canadian-womens-hockey-team/article33004626/>.

<sup>314</sup> Doug Harrison, “Shannon Szabados Package Deal Was Cancerous’ Ex-Coach,” *CBC Sports*, last modified October 27, 2016, <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/nhl/shannon-szabados-package-deal-peoria-1.3824018>.

<sup>315</sup> *Ibid*

Hayley Wickenheiser, arguably the finest female hockey player ever to play the game, also played against men professionally in Finland and in Sweden, despite much opposition from those in the hockey community, including the president of the International Ice Hockey Federation (IIHF), René Fasel, who, in 2003, claimed that there needs to be a rule in place to stop women from playing men's hockey.<sup>316</sup>

The other main narrative prevalent in the newspapers is that women's hockey remains a two-country sport between Canada and the United States. There is no reason to believe that the sport will become competitive any time soon, as it remains one of the most traditionally masculine of all sports. Until women's hockey was at the Olympics, female hockey players had no external help as did men, since only Olympic sports qualify for Canada's Athlete Assistance Program, which provides federal funding for Olympic competitors.<sup>317</sup> As Poniatowski observed in her second media analysis, this time, focusing on NBC broadcast from the 2010 Winter Olympics; some experts believe that Canada and the United States make up 88 per cent of all registered world's female hockey players.<sup>318</sup> Therein lies the problem, the rest of the female hockey world cannot be expected to catch up if only two countries are producing almost all of the women's hockey players on the planet.

---

<sup>316</sup> Randy Starkman, "Wickenheiser's Real Feat Lies in Chasing Her Dream," *The Toronto Star* (January 13, 2003): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.

<sup>317</sup> Mary Jollimore, "Women's Hockey Shut Out of the Olympics Until at Least 1998," *The Globe and Mail* (September 21, 1992): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.

<sup>318</sup> Kelly Poniatowski, "'The Nail Polish Underneath the Hockey Gloves': NBC's Framing of Women Hockey Players in the 2010 Winter Olympics," *Journal of Sports Media*, 9 no.9 (2014): 23-44, doi: <https://doi.org/10.1353/jsm.2014.0000>.

It took until the fall of 2008 for Sweden, considered one of the stronger countries in women's hockey, to beat Canada; this supports the narrative that the gap between the top two countries in women's hockey (United States and Canada) and the rest of the world is very large.<sup>319</sup> Had Sweden continually beaten Canada, one could say that the rest of the world is catching up; however, Sweden constantly loses to Canada, and in fact, Sweden is not as strong a women's hockey country as it once was.<sup>320</sup>

Furthermore, at the 2010 Vancouver Olympics, Canada beat Slovakia, the 15<sup>th</sup> ranked team in the world, 18-0. This lopsided score supports the narrative that women's hockey is extremely uncompetitive worldwide. Women's hockey is further criticized when one remembers that there are hundreds of female softball players worldwide sitting at home instead of playing, because softball, a more popular sport globally, was removed from the Olympics after the 2008 Beijing Olympics.<sup>321</sup> The potential women's Olympic crisis has reached the point that the top four female hockey nations in the world act as mentors to the teams ranked fifth through 15<sup>th</sup>. Yet this has clearly not made much of a difference since the lack of competition in women's hockey still looms large.<sup>322</sup>

---

<sup>319</sup> Eric Duhatschek, "Hockey a Family Tradition for Mikkelson, Other Hopefuls," *The Globe and Mail* (January 29, 2009): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.

<sup>320</sup> "World Ranking," *International Ice Hockey Federation*, last modified May 2019, <https://www.iihf.com/en/worldranking>.

<sup>321</sup> Matthew Sekeres, "Canadians Romp in Opener; Hosts Set Record While Rolling to Double – Digit Lead after 30 Minutes," *The Globe and Mail* (February 14, 2010): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.

<sup>322</sup> Rachel Brady, "Big Fish Throw Minnows a Line; Canada, U.S. Take Part in Program Aimed at Improving Level of Women's Game Worldwide," *The Globe and Mail* (April 14, 2012): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.

As Julie Stevens and Carly Adams discuss in their case study on the governance and management of a girls' hockey association in Ontario, even in Ontario, Canada's largest province, girls' struggle to maintain proper funding the local community and the government. Furthermore, because these girls' hockey leagues and organizations are run by men, instead of women, they may not necessarily receive appropriate financial and moral support. However in Ontario, girls' hockey is in a good place, with the increase in training, and non-volunteer parent coaches.<sup>323</sup> Granted, girls' wishing to play hockey in Canada have more opportunity now than ever before, with the increase of organizations and elite level hockey camps; however as Julie Stevens argued in her book chapter on the history of women's hockey, "the irony is though, that despite the ongoing professionalization of women's hockey, many people still devalue the game as an inferior version of men's hockey."<sup>324</sup>

Popularity and talent affect one another. If more women's hockey games were shown on TV, then more young girls might be encouraged to play hockey worldwide, not just in Canada, and the level of competition would increase. A common misconception is that the general public is not interested in women's hockey; thus, it should not be shown on TV. However, unless the games are shown on TV and no one tunes in to watch, then one cannot say that this is accurate. One thing is for certain: the interest level for women's hockey is not nearly at the level of men's hockey, and it may never will be. However, the 2019 CWHL Clarkson Cup Championship game

---

<sup>323</sup> Julie Stevens and Carly Adams, "'Together We Can Make It Better': Collective Action and Governance in a Girls' Ice Hockey Association," *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*, 48 no.6 (2012): 658-672, doi: 10.1177/1012690212454466.

<sup>324</sup> Julie Stevens, "Women's Ice Hockey in Canada: After the 'Gold Rush,'" in *Artificial Ice: Hockey, Culture and Commerce*, eds. Richard Gruneau and David Whitson (Ontario: University of Toronto Press, Higher Education Division, 2006), 94.

(Canadian Women's Hockey League) had the most viewers ever in Canada in the history of the Canadian Women's Hockey League.<sup>325</sup>

Although public interest is limited, it is growing, and it does exist. However, it is easier to find international track and field and swimming events on CBC—sports that are hardly popular in Canada in non-Olympic years—than it is to find women's hockey on Canadian television sports networks. If the IIHF truly wants to grow the game, then broadcasters need to have the game available for girls and women to watch at regular intervals. Viewing opportunities cannot be restricted to just a few times a year for international tournaments, oftentimes in the wee hours of the morning in North America, depending on where the tournament is being held. Some members of the public who wrote letters and opinion-editorials in the newspapers also exhibited this point of view.<sup>326</sup>

Furthermore, despite the fact that admitting women to the Hockey Hall of Fame was discussed as early as 1995, the first women were not inducted into the Hockey Hall of Fame until 2010.<sup>327</sup> The International Ice Hockey Hall of Fame inducted its first female athletes in 2007, showing that women hockey players still do not have the respect of the world's hockey leaders.<sup>328</sup> Even now, while a male player is inducted every year, in some years not a single

---

<sup>325</sup> Robson Fletcher, "They Won the Championship. Then the League Folded. But the Calgary Inferno Aren't Giving Up on Women's Hockey," *CBC Sports*, last modified April 1, 2019, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/calgary/canadian-womens-hockey-league-closure-calgary-inferno-react-1.5079707>.

<sup>326</sup> Courtenay Parlee, "Letters to Sportsweek: World Champs," *The Globe and Mail* (May 2, 1994): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.

<sup>327</sup> Mary Ormsby, "Hockey Hall for Female?" *The Toronto Star* (April 29, 1995): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.

<sup>328</sup> Damien Cox, "Recognition for Female Pioneers Long Overdue," *The Toronto Star* (December 21, 2007): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.

woman is inducted into the Hockey Hall of Fame, despite the abundance of many worthy female candidates.<sup>329</sup>

All of these narratives are examples of a social analysis of the newspapers. This is step three of the CDA methodology as described by Fairclough/Janks.

### **Personal Narrative/Storyteller Approach**

The second half of the narrative developed from a storyteller point of view is based on my own personal experiences as a former competitive hockey player. Since the account emerges from a personal point of view, this chapter is written in the first person as opposed to the third person voice previously used in this chapter. Because I drew upon personal experience, I am aware that there may be some danger of confirmation bias, (confirmation occurs when a person wishes something to be true; therefore, she looks for evidence to support her belief).<sup>330</sup> However, I did my best to combat this and to maintain an accurate, factual perspective. Obviously, because this part of the chapter originates from personal experience, it does not follow an established methodology as did the first half of this chapter with Fairclough's CDA.

Hockey formed a significant part of my childhood. I began playing at six years of age and started playing competitively as a goalie at the age of nine. I started to play because my older brother played hockey as a goaltender, and I wanted to follow in his footsteps. As a female playing a traditionally male- dominated sport, I faced much criticism from people (primarily

---

<sup>329</sup> "New Pinnacle for Women's Hockey: James, Granato Join Hall of Fame," *The Toronto Star* (June 23, 2010): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.

<sup>330</sup> Shahram Heshmat, "What is Confirmation Bias?" *Psychology Today*, last modified April 23, 2015, <https://www.psychologytoday.com/ca/blog/science-choice/201504/what-is-confirmation-bias>.



males) about girls' hockey being boring due to the lack of bodychecking. Many of my male peers would ask me why girls' hockey did not have hitting and would claim that girls' hockey was 'soft.'

In addition, although I never faced criticism regarding my sexual orientation, based on stereotypical expectations, this is a reality that many female hockey players constantly face, comparable to the way that the sexual orientation of male figure skaters and cheerleaders is discussed. Homophobic comments would get tossed around my team's dressing room while I was a teenager, when my teammates and I criticized other girls on opposing teams. In their books on women's sport and gender, Helen Lenskjy and M. Ann Hall argued that for female hockey players, the fear of being called 'butch' is very real,<sup>331</sup> and that for female athletes, especially hockey players, "there has been a deliberate effort to distance the athletes from even the suspicion of lesbianism by stressing their femininity and heterosexual attractiveness."<sup>332</sup> Bonnie Slade also offered support for Lenskjy and Hall in her article detailing her experience as a hockey player in small town Ontario. Similar to my own experience in Toronto, Slade stated that her girls' teams struggled for ice time. Interestingly, Slade said she did not realize it at the time she was playing (in the early 70s), but re-visiting the experience in 2003, she recognizes that the two women who coached her hockey team were a couple who had to mask their sexuality in public. Slade writes:

the homophobia was so pervasive that it was completely invisible; it never occurred to anyone that they (the coaches) were a couple. As coaches of a girls' hockey team, they would have encountered terrible repercussions from the community if the truth were

---

<sup>331</sup> Helen Lenskjy *Out of Bounds: Women, Sport and Sexuality* (Toronto: Women's Press, 1986).

<sup>332</sup> M. Ann Hall, *The Girl and the Game: A History of Women's Sport in Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016), 327.

known. For players too, heterosexism was a strong force. However powerful we were on the ice, we were expected to wear dresses and look like young ladies at the annual banquet.<sup>333</sup>

By contrast, in her autoethnography, Judy Davidson explained how she and her hockey teammates on the Booby Orrs, a recreation women's hockey team based in Edmonton, were able to embrace their femininity and sexual orientation at the 2007 OutGames hockey tournament in Calgary. Davidson argued that the negative stereotype of lesbian hockey players should be abandoned in favour of celebration with more tournaments for LGBT2I plus players such as the OutGames. Davidson added that such events provide "a sporting context for public expression of same-sex desire, which is then reproduced metaphorically by others at this *lesbigay* tournament, resediments (sic) it as an expression of *lesbigay* solidarity and celebration."<sup>334</sup>

As previously mentioned in the literature review, the female hockey players on boys' hockey teams in Danielle DiCarlo's qualitative research study did not feel the same pressure as other female hockey players to defend their sexual orientation and femininity, nor did they appear to question Canadian hockey culture. DiCarlo's article did not support the other, reverse argument of academic journals and books in my study.<sup>335</sup> Di Carlo's research also included interviews with female hockey players who had previously played hockey on all girls' hockey teams. Some of the female athletes were of the opinion that the best players on these all girls'

---

<sup>333</sup> Bonnie Slade, "'Not Just 'Little Lades' in Hockey Gear': Hockey Experiences in a Small Town," *Canadian Woman Studies*, 21, no.3 (2002): 55, <https://link-gale-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/apps/doc/A88761613/AONE?u=lond95336&sid=AONE&xid=59aa67da>.

<sup>334</sup> Judy Davidson, "Lesbian Erotics at Women's Hockey: Fans, Flashing and the Booby Orrs," *Journal of Lesbian Studies*, 13, no. 3 (2006): 347, doi: 10.1080/10894160902876820.

<sup>335</sup> Danielle DiCarlo, "Playing Like a Girl? The Negotiation of Gender and Sexual Identity Among Female Ice Hockey Teams on Male Teams," *Sport in Society*, 19, no..8-9 (2016): 1366, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/17430437.2015.1096260>.

teams were “butch,” and “more manly” with “built, broad shoulders.” These were the same adjectives that my teammates and I used when describing the stronger female hockey players on the other teams, or the ones who appeared to be less stereotypically feminine.<sup>336</sup>

Moreover, when asked to describe a typical female athlete, the players in DiCarlo’s study stated that, to them, female athletes have a “manly body with muscle.” They did not picture female athletes as “very thin, skinny or (with) a feminine body.”<sup>337</sup> These quotes show that even the female hockey players themselves may have subscribed to the gender stereotypes and heteronormativity of the sport. I can attest to this as well, as I played competitive hockey on girls-only teams. Once we were in high school (aged 14 years and up) several girls on my team would come to hockey games and practices wearing makeup which they would re-apply at the rink, therefore offering support for Hall’s discussion about females playing masculine sports trying to parade their femininity.<sup>338</sup>

My high school aged hockey playing experience exemplifies what Connell calls “emphasized femininity.” She believes that women themselves cannot be the dominant group, and therefore there is no such phenomenon as hegemonic femininity. Connell describes “emphasized femininity” as “the level of mass social relations, that is based on women’s compliance with their subordination to men and oriented to the interests and desires of men.”<sup>339</sup>

---

<sup>336</sup> *Ibid*, 1369.

<sup>337</sup> *Ibid*, 1369.

<sup>338</sup> M. Ann Hall, *The Girl and the Game: A History of Women’s Sport in Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016), 327.

<sup>339</sup> Deirdre Kelly et al, “Skater Girlhood and Emphasized Femininity: ‘You Can’t Land an Ollie Properly in Heels,” *Gender and Education*, 17 no.3 (2005): 129, doi: 10.1080/09540250500145163.

Cammi Granato, the former American women's hockey captain and Hockey Hall of Famer, provides a good example of this. She stated that "I like to look good when I play, and makeup sends the message that athletes can be feminine and still play a game aggressively." Granato's testimony may support the emphasized femininity of girls on my hockey teams who would apply makeup in the change room before games and practices.<sup>340</sup>

Paul Davis, a senior lecturer specializing in gender and ethics in the Sociology of Sport at the University of Sunderland in England,<sup>341</sup> distinguished between sexuality and sexualization. This thesis has focused largely on sexuality thus far; however, it is important to understand sexualization when examining female athletes. Concerning the reaction of male swimmers to the photograph of a female swimmer, Davis wrote:

Consider another phenomenon, a not uncommon one, that might look at first like another clear case of sexualization: that of (male) swimmers at a club who feel a sexual interest in a locker room photograph of a prolific (female) swimmer in the act of swimming. This case is ambiguous. It would be highly premature to regard it as simply another instance of sexualization. In this context, the photograph is infused with an important generality of meaning. The picture is inscribed with the message that our sport—swimming, in this case—is sexy, that swimming is a sexy thing to do. In addition, there is a critical particularity about the photograph and the sexual stimulus elicited. Swimming is something those who enjoy the picture can identify with deeply, something that excites them at a fundamental level and probably has done so since a point in their lives at which talk of sexual responses is not an issue. Not just any picture will do, nor is the sexual response of club members an undifferentiated excitation. The sexual response is highly precise and is uniquely caused by the sight of a quality swimmer in the act of swimming.<sup>342</sup>

---

<sup>340</sup> Vikki Krane, "We Can Be Athletic and Feminine, But Do We Want To?," *Quest*, 53, (2001): 115, doi: 10.1080/00336297.2001.10491733.

<sup>341</sup> "Dr. Paul Davis, Senior Lecturer in the Sociology of Sport," *University of Sunderland*, last modified June 11, 2019, [https://www.sunderland.ac.uk/about/staff/sport-and-exercise-sciences/pauldavis/#group\\_book=5Fsection](https://www.sunderland.ac.uk/about/staff/sport-and-exercise-sciences/pauldavis/#group_book=5Fsection).

<sup>342</sup> Paul Davis, "Sexualization and Sexuality in Sport," in *Philosophical Perspectives on Gender in Sport and Physical Activity*, ed. Paul Davis (United Kingdom: Taylor and Francis, 2009), 58.

In other words, one could find a particular image sexy, in this case, that of the female swimmer, without the photograph being purposefully sexual. Talking specifically about gender roles in sport, Davis continued:

Consider sport. Here too the embodiment of the person is the object of our interest. Here too we are, as performer or spectator, interested in neither bodies nor immaterial soul, but the person as body-subject. In its well-documented non-instrumentality, sport is, indeed, a celebration of the body-subject. The athlete is conceived, *qua* athlete, as a perspectival, freely willing, and responsible being (for that reason, spectators tend to be disappointed by a competitor, and especially a victor, who looks robotic). Again, the athlete seeks the unity of self and body. At the ideal limit of sport, also, a person is profoundly united with his or her body; free will, responsibility, and the rest roundly converge with materiality (...) It is, indeed, the shared centrality of the body that makes sport as a practice particularly vulnerable to performance-specific sexualization.<sup>343</sup>

In other words, an athlete needs his or her mind and body to work together in order to be completely in control as the body-subject, as opposed to the body-object. Often, due to societal gender norms, as discussed by other scholars in this thesis, women are seen as body-objects, instead of body-subjects. This means that a female athlete is seen as the woman first and the athlete second as opposed to the athlete first and the female second, which is how male athletes are usually treated by the public and the media.

Towards the end of his book chapter, Davis compared the example of the photograph of the swimmer to a that of a female tennis player. He writes:

Contrast this with the other cases described in this chapter. Imagine a familiar example of an opportunistically captioned tabloid shot of a female tennis player whose lunge with her racquet reveals a little cleavage. This is sexualization, and is objectionable, for two interrelated reasons: it involves an artificial focus on particular, sexually significant body parts, a focus that temporarily detaches the body from the rich and precise bodily agency on display on the tennis court and reconfigures it into something trivially titillating or comic (or both). An observer could experience the intended titillation or amusement without any appreciation of the game of tennis. Conversely, the essentially precise sexual

---

<sup>343</sup> *Ibid*, 60-61.

response of the swimmers could not be paralleled with innocuous tennis films or photography if the respondent does not have a serious appreciation of tennis.<sup>344</sup>

While Davis's examples do not specifically focus on hockey, his examples of the swimmer and the tennis player prove to be beneficial in this thesis as female hockey players often feel pressure to maintain their femininity, as I have discussed previously with examples of makeup and the pink jerseys of the 1990 Canadian women's hockey team.

Furthermore, it is not only cisgendered female athletes that are under immense pressure to maintain their femininity and sexuality. Transgendered hockey players also face much criticism and pressure to maintain their heterosexuality. In a fascinating case study, which consists of an interview with a male to female transgender American hockey player, Jodi H. Cohen and Tamar Z. Semerjian argue that a transgender athlete disrupts the traditional gender binary in hockey, something the sport is not used to. Angela, the subject of the authors' interview, related that while growing up, she continued playing sports as a boy in order to assert her dominance and hegemonic masculinity, despite identifying as female.<sup>345</sup>

However, it is very important to have girls-only hockey leagues as I believe it encourages young girls to take up the sport. If girls are only playing with boys, then they may become discouraged to continue with the sport, as they may not have as much success as they would in girls' hockey, due to the sheer physicality of boys' hockey. Girls who continue to play boys' hockey may be seen as particularly 'weak' and 'soft' if they get injured, and then miss

---

<sup>344</sup> *Ibid*, 61-62.

<sup>345</sup> Jodi H. Cohen, and Tamar Z. Semerjian, "The Collision of Trans-Experience and the Politics of Women's Ice Hockey," *International Journal of Transgenderism*, 10, no.3-4 (2008), 133-134, doi:10.1080/15532730802297322.

significant playing time. In the eyes of the general public, or in the eyes of their teammates, they are not true hockey players as they did not ‘suck it up’ and take it like a ‘man.’

Despite having played solely on girls-only hockey teams, I never once had a female coach. The only female members of the coaching staff—volunteers as they were not paid—were the trainer and the manager, and they did not do any coaching whatsoever. Sometimes my teams would have female skating coaches, but these coaches operated their own private businesses and they worked with multiple girls’ hockey teams in the Greater Toronto Area. These sessions and weekly goalie lessons run by the girls’ hockey organizations constituted the only time I was exposed to female coaches in Toronto in the 2000s. My team goalie coaches were always male as well; my brother, for example, was our team goalie coach for a few seasons.

A goalie needs to have goalie-specific training, as goaltending is a highly specialized position. However, due to the very nature of the sport and the position, there is no such thing as a girls’ only hockey goaltending school (at least in the Greater Toronto Area.) Therefore, most of the time I was training on and off the ice with boys, usually of a higher talent level than myself. At many of these elite hockey camps, I faced shots from professional male hockey players, or major junior hockey players, the same shooters that the boys (and sometimes men) with whom I was training would face. This allowed me to grow as an athlete, and it was very beneficial for improving my game. None of the girls at the elite-level camp faced any sort of criticism for being female. In fact, one of the goalies that who instructed me as a child and with whom I interacted several times is Jordan Binnington. Binnington, an NHL rookie in 2018-2019, was the starting goalie of the 2019 Stanley Cup Champions, the St. Louis Blues.

When I later got a job working as an instructor for the same hockey goalie school (located in Vaughan, Ontario, just north of Toronto), I was not given the same treatment by the boys I was instructing as my male counterparts received. It was a challenge to get the young boys (mostly pre-teens and teenagers) to listen to me when I tried to show them the skating drills. I received ample amounts of resistance when I tried to explain things. The male instructors for the most part had no such problems, as the boys were attentive to their every word. The owners and co-founders of the goalie school, Franco Canadian Goalie School would have to come around and give the male students a talking to, as the boys were likely to listen to them, but not very likely to listen to me.<sup>346</sup>

I later got a job working for an all-girls goalie school in Toronto, the same goalie school that I attended during the hockey season for most of my hockey playing career. I noticed that the young girls I was instructing were much more supportive and much better listeners than the young boys I had instructed at the co-ed goalie school in Vaughan. This may lend weight to my hypothesis that female hockey players are not taken as seriously or given the same respect as their male counterparts in male or co-ed settings, even when they are in a position of power, such as an instructor at a hockey camp.

While completing this master's degree from 2017-2019 at Western University, I was a sports volunteer at Radio Western, the on-campus radio station of Western. I was the play-by-

---

<sup>346</sup> "Camps," *Franco Canadian Goalie School*, last modified June 19, 2019, <http://www.francocanadian.com/camps/>.



play voice of the first all-female live radio sports broadcast in Canada in January of 2019.<sup>347</sup>

Other radio and television stations had done this, but only the on-air personalities were female. Radio Western hosted the first-ever 100% live sports female broadcast, meaning that all voices, including those heard on the in-game promos during the women's hockey game, were female. Furthermore, the behind-the-scenes support, including the photographer and the social media coordinator, were also women. Radio Western was able to repeat this later in the season as well; we ensured that the all-female radio broadcast was not just a one-off. Unfortunately, the station experienced some unfortunate Facebook comments on the article about the initiative posted by *The London Free Press*, criticizing the decision. Many readers questioned our knowledge of hockey, a masculine sport. Despite the fact that it was 2019, women still faced discrimination and sexism in the sports world, whether it was the female athletes themselves or female journalists and reporters covering sports, especially a masculine sport like hockey.

Many girls' hockey organizations relied more heavily on team fundraisers than their male counterparts. For example, one of the organizations for which I played in Toronto had to rely on team sponsorships and charitable fundraisers in order to pay for team tournaments, ice time, and other budget items. Furthermore, when we travelled to out-of-town hockey tournaments, we stayed in ordinary hotels, and had to drive with our parents, at their cost, instead of staying in four-star hotels and taking a team bus (or for the most elite teams, a plane for tournaments farther away,) as did the competitive boys' teams. My older brother, who also played high-level hockey in the Greater Toronto Area, was afforded these luxuries on boys' teams, luxuries that I never

---

<sup>347</sup> Jennie Malone, *Western Mustangs 6 vs Laurentian Voyageurs 0 (All- Women's Broadcast)*, Rachael Bishop, Emily Renneberg, Emma Jones, Radio Western, January 12, 2019, radio broadcast, 2:16:27, <https://soundcloud.com/chrwradio/western-mustangs-6-vs-laurentian-voyageurs-0-all-womens-broadcast>.

enjoyed on girls' teams. In addition, we missed out on the camaraderie and team bonding that comes with team bus trips to out-of-town hockey tournaments.

In general, my experience supported the narrative discussed in the first part of this chapter. Female hockey players are not held in the same regard as male hockey players and women's/girls' hockey is seen as 'lesser' than boys' hockey. Although my athleticism was generally well regarded, I realized that there were advantages in the realm of boys' and men's hockey that I would never experience.

Furthermore, growing up as a female hockey player meant that there were little to no options for me past minor amateur hockey and university hockey. With the recent folding of the CWHL, there is currently no professional women's hockey league in Canada. Even before the league folded, it was not a realistic career for most of its hockey players as it did not pay them a liveable wage, and the players were forced to work full-time jobs in order to make ends meet. Even the American rival, the National Women's Hockey League, which had paid its players since its first year of existence in 2015, was forced to cut its already meagre salaries in half in 2016 in order to save the league.<sup>348</sup> In both instances, unless the player is a Canadian Olympian and receives money all year around from endorsement deals as well as from the Canadian government, then the players have to work at full-time jobs on the side as they cannot economically support themselves on solely playing hockey in North America, unlike professional male hockey players can.

---

<sup>348</sup> Seth Berkman, "Pay Cuts Jolt Women's Pro League and Leave its Future Uncertain," *The New York Times*, (November 22, 2016): <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/11/22/sports/hockey/nwhl-pay-cut-salary.html>.

This is not a solely North American issue, as women's hockey players in Europe, particularly in Sweden and Finland, are also not paid a living wage, if they are even paid at all, as every league and team has its own rules regarding salary for female hockey players. Despite having a hockey history almost as rich as that of Canada, neither Sweden nor Finland, two countries often considered at the forefront of social change, is able to pay its female hockey players enough to for the women to sustain themselves financially.<sup>349</sup>

The collapse of the CWHL this year provides an interesting example of the struggle for professional women's hockey in North America. No one aside from the league's Board of Directors saw the collapse coming. The reasons for the league's demise appear to be twofold: first, the expansion to China in the summer of 2017 indirectly led to the league folding; second, the withdrawal of financial and strategic support from corporate donors and other influential hockey advisors. With the expansion of the CWHL to China, the league had a much larger operating budget, (the budget increased by 1.5 million dollars) that permitted players to be paid for the first time in league history. Furthermore, both Chinese teams paid an expansion fee to join the league and also covered all expenses for the North American teams travelling to and from China. However, the travel meant that the North American teams had to spend a week in China during the season, often requesting time off work from their day jobs to do so. On the other side, the players on the Chinese-based teams were essentially living in suitcases during the

---

<sup>349</sup> Meredith Foster, "What #FortheGame Could Mean for Nordic Hockey," *The Ice Garden*, last modified May 10, 2019, <https://www.theicegarden.com/2019/5/10/18529929/could-for-the-game-work-overseas-sdhl-sweden-naisten-liiga-finland-europe>.

season as they made frequent trips to Canada and the United States to play the remaining CWHL teams.<sup>350</sup>

Thus, while the CWHL budget increased, the Chinese expansion was a logistic nightmare for the league, as many aspects of the China experiment were disorganized; and the home arena in Shenzhen in which the two teams played was run down and barely cold enough. However, despite all of disorganization, the players received a first-class living environment.<sup>351</sup> The increased operating budget that the CWHL received should have meant that the league was financially healthy, yet the CWHL folded just two years after the Chinese expansion. As Chelsea Purcell, the General Manager of the 2017 Clarkson Cup winners, the Markham Thunder, stated, “I think it’s funny that we last 10 years without China’s money, and then China comes in and it’s like you get a bunch of money, and all the budgets increase, and then that’s when you fail.” She compared the expansion and then the subsequent folding of the CWHL to when a person becomes rich very fast and then spends all of their money too quickly, thus falling into bankruptcy.<sup>352</sup> The Chinese teams were merged into one team for what would turn out to be the CWHL’s final season in 2018-2019, thereby removing some of the financial stability that had come with the two-team expansion.<sup>353</sup>

---

<sup>350</sup> Michelle Jay, “How the Canadian Women’s Hockey League Fell Apart,” *SBNation*, last modified September 3, 2019, <https://www.sbnation.com/2019/9/3/20804377/cwhl-womens-hockey-league-history-collapse>.

<sup>351</sup> Kristina Rutherford, “Making it in China,” *Sportsnet*, last modified 2018, <https://www.sportsnet.ca/hockey/nhl/cwhl-china-hockey-krs-vanke-shenzhen/>.

<sup>352</sup> Michelle Jay, “How the Canadian Women’s Hockey League Fell Apart,” *SBNation*, last modified September 3, 2019, <https://www.sbnation.com/2019/9/3/20804377/cwhl-womens-hockey-league-history-collapse>.

<sup>353</sup> *Ibid*

Moreover, the league's sudden decision to eliminate the Board of Governors (essentially important people in the business or hockey community who acted as league advisors), meant that the most ardent supporters of women's hockey, as well as its greatest financial contributors, were no longer involved in the league. These luminaries included Team Canada captain Cassie Campbell, former NHL General Manager Brian Burke, and Graeme Roulston, a capitalist and former chairman of Bauer Hockey, an equipment-making company, who were no longer involved in the league.<sup>354</sup>

Roulston withdrew his financial support from the league shortly after the league eliminated the Board of Governors and shortly before the league announced its new Board of Directors. Roulston had been involved with the league from the beginning as the first corporate donor and he was the league's most important and largest investor. Roulston's fatal decision was a massive blow to the CWHL, and when combined with the merging of the two Chinese teams, Roulston's withdrawal meant that the league had significantly less money for the 2018-2019 season than it did the season before.<sup>355</sup>

Based on the abrupt demise of the CWHL and the experience of many female Canadian hockey players, the future of professional women's hockey in North America looks bleak. As previously mentioned, 200 of the world's top, Olympic-calibre female hockey players have refused to play anywhere in North America for the 2019/2020 season, until there is "a single professional women's ice hockey league in North America that showcases the greatest product of professional ice hockey in the world." These women have formed the first women's hockey

---

<sup>354</sup> *ibid*

<sup>355</sup> *ibid*

union, the Professional Women's Hockey Players Association. The PWHPA members do not believe in the business model of the National Women's Hockey League, the professional women's hockey league in the United States, and the sole professional women's hockey league in North America. NWHL teams play only one game a week and have a single practice each week. Furthermore, the league does not offer any insurance for players, and as a result they have to work a full-time and are often on their own when it comes to expenses and basic necessities, such as healthcare.<sup>356</sup>

There are those in the women's hockey community who want the NHL to get involved and create its own league, similar to the way the National Basketball Association created the very successful Women's National Basketball Association in 1996. However, the NHL has refused to step in until there no women's professional hockey league exists in North America. Therefore, so long as the NWHL exists, the NHL will not get involved as it does not want to set up a competing league.

I would personally offer some caution when it comes to the NHL's involvement. The first caution is that NHL executives know nothing about running a women's hockey league. I firmly believe that it should be up to the women themselves to create and run this league in a manner similar to the way the CWHL operated (it was founded by a group of female hockey players and relied on corporate money for support). The WNBA, although initially created by the NBA, is run completely by women as every president and commissioner of the league has been female.<sup>357</sup> Secondly, I do not believe that the NHL itself is very well run, and I do not have much

---

<sup>356</sup> "Next Stop...," *PWHPA*, last modified 2019, <http://pwhpa.com>.

<sup>357</sup> Mechelle Voepel, "WNBA Taps CEO Englebert as 1<sup>st</sup> Commissioner," *ESPN*, last modified May 15, 2019, [https://www.espn.com/wnba/story/\\_/id/26754371/wnba-tabs-ceo-engelbert-1st-commissioner](https://www.espn.com/wnba/story/_/id/26754371/wnba-tabs-ceo-engelbert-1st-commissioner).

faith the league will be able to operate a women's league effectively and efficiently. The NHL can barely run its own league properly. This is a league that has endured three player lockouts in 26 years, losing a total of 146 games, including the 2004/2005 season that was cancelled entirely. All of these lockouts occurred under the divisive watch of the current NHL Commissioner, Gary Bettman.<sup>358</sup> The WNBA has been successful, in part, because the NBA has been mostly uninvolved in both day-to-day operations and decisions, ceding control to the WNBA organization itself. Furthermore, the NBA has historically been the best-run major professional sports league in North America.<sup>359</sup>

This narrative of girls' and women's inequality in hockey was the overarching theme of this thesis and has been discussed in every chapter using three different types of research. I will discuss these results further in the concluding part of the thesis.

---

<sup>358</sup> Bill Beacon, "Boos and Bucks," *CBC*, last modified January 31, 2018, <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/nhl/gary-bettman-nhl-commissioner-25-years-1.4513360>.

<sup>359</sup> Angel Diaz, "Why the NBA Has Surpassed the NFL as 'America's Sport'," *Complex*, last modified October 15, 2018, <https://www.complex.com/sports/2018/10/why-the-nba-has-surpassed-the-nfl-as-americas-sports>.

## **Chapter Five: Conclusion**

Overall, women's hockey, despite having a long and storied history in Canada, continues to struggle to gain the respect that men's hockey has in this country. This lack of respect for women's hockey is seen in the general public, in the media, and amongst those in the hockey community. The aim of this thesis was to answer the following research questions:

- a) How are the dominant messages and representations about the Canadian Women's Hockey Team conveyed in an ethical context?*
- b) What is the response of the Canadian media and general public to such (ethical) representations?*
- c) What narrative themes create the popular story about women in hockey and about the National Women's Hockey Team?*

Since these research questions are quite similar, and this is a broad topic, each of these questions was answered using a different type of qualitative analysis, and using several disciplines, as one subject discipline is insufficient to properly examine this large research area. Additionally, since I am familiar with multiple academic subjects, it was reasonable and advantageous to take a multidisciplinary approach to the examination of the Canadian women's team. This approach made the analysis stronger and richer than if this thesis had been written using just one subject area. As such, I used history, philosophy, ethics and sociology in order to create this analysis of women's hockey in Canada. I answered the research question labeled a) using an ethical analysis from an analytic approach; I answered the second research question labeled b) using a media content analysis; I answered the third research question labeled c) using narrative analysis (critical discourse analysis). In addition, since the history of women's hockey



is multifarious and important, the first two pages of this thesis were dedicated to the history of Canadian women's hockey and how it compares to the history of men's hockey in Canada. For this brief history, I drew from works by key hockey historians and sociologists such as Richard Gruneau, David Whitson, Carly Adams, and Wayne Norton.

However, before this thesis even started to discuss women's hockey, I provided an official definition of 'sport' in chapter one of the thesis (Introduction). Arguably, the two most applicable definitions came from Bernard Suits and the sports organization Sportaccord, the umbrella organization that represents all of the major world international sports organizations. Suits claims sport is ultimately about playing a game. In his famous book, *Grasshopper: Games, Life and Utopia*, he created four distinct elements of game play. He argued that games are a type of activity constructed around a goal, which games involve choice—thus this dyad makes up the first two elements of a 'game,' the end goal and the means with which to get there. The third element of a game is the rules; as players cannot reach their overarching goal if consistent rules are not in place on how to achieve that goal. Last, in order to have a proper game, willing participants must be present to play.<sup>360</sup> Therefore, attitude or motivation is the final component of a game. Suits called this the "lusory attitude."<sup>361</sup>

Sportaccord's definition is more straightforward, and as a result it offers one of the most widely accepted international definitions of 'sport.' Sportaccord also claimed that sport includes four components. It contends that a sport should have a competitive aspect against another opponent; sport cannot be harmful to any living being; and sport cannot be dependent on

---

<sup>360</sup> Bernard Suits, *The Grasshopper: Games, Life, and Utopia* (Tonawanda, NY: Broadview Press, 2014), 36.

<sup>361</sup> *Ibid*, 37.

equipment provided by one single supplier or company (a few sports are exceptions to this rule); and last, a sport cannot rely solely on luck as a specific element of the sport's makeup. Hockey is interesting, because while luck plays a large role, it is subsumed as a specific element of hockey, which conceptualizes that luck occurs naturally. The definition of sport, the research questions, and the brief history of women's hockey in 20<sup>th</sup> century Canada were all included in the introduction section of this thesis.

Chapter One also included the methodology and methods for this thesis; the methodology section consisted of a brief summary of how I planned to carry out this multidisciplinary study. The methods section discussed my intentions in larger detail, which as previously noted, consisted of an ethical and philosophical analysis, a media content analysis and two different types of narrative analysis, the first type being a discourse analysis, and the second part being a personal narrative based on my hockey-playing experiences.

Chapter Two consisted solely of my literature review, as I did research in all of these three disciplines. In fact, after examining all of the peer-reviewed journal articles and book chapters that I consulted, I discovered that there were three main themes that kept reappearing in the literature. They are as follows: gender, violence, and masculinity versus femininity, with specific emphasis on women's hockey in Canada. Thus, I was able to carry out my mixed methods research using these three themes throughout the thesis.

The first half of the literature review dealt with the historical context of women's hockey, starting from the early days of women's hockey at the end of the 18<sup>th</sup> century to the present day. The key authors discussed in this section included many prominent hockey and gender historians, such as Carly Adams, a Kinesiology professor at the University of Alberta, Julie

Stevens, a Kinesiology professor at Brock University, Wayne Norton, a prominent British Columbia historian, and Dan Mason and Patrick A. Reid, also Kinesiology professors at the University of Alberta. I also used many articles by important hockey journalists such as Roy MacGregor, formerly of *The Globe and Mail*, and Mary Ormsby formerly of *The Toronto Star*. While Ormsby and MacGregor are not academics, their work still remained beneficial to this thesis as their writings provided a real time, first-hand account of many of the issues that 20<sup>th</sup> century female hockey players faced and continue to confront into the 21<sup>st</sup> century.

The second half of Chapter Two concluded the literature review. This section of the chapter dealt with authors writing from feminist and theoretical perspectives. This section inspired much of the thesis as it achieved its formative direction and where I deployed much of my critical analysis. The second half of the literature review examined works from some of the most prominent feminist and sociological scholars. The academics discussed in this section of the *literature review* included but were not limited to Nancy Theberge, one of the most respected and important gender and women's hockey sociologists, as well as R.W. Connell, whose definition of hegemonic masculinity provided one of the main theoretical constructs of my thesis. Of course, Antonio Gramsci, who first developed the concept of hegemony during the Mussolini era in Italy, was crucial as one cannot discuss gender, masculinity and hockey without discussing hegemony. I also used the work of key scholars and historians Helen Lenskyj and M. Ann Hall, although not from an historical perspective, but from a gender and sociological perspective instead, as this was the focus of the chapter. This section of the literature review laid much of the groundwork for the various forms of analysis that comprised the majority of this Master's thesis.

Chapter Three consisted of my first research method, the ethical and philosophical analysis. Once again, I postulated two main themes; the first theme is Mill's concepts of utilitarianism and liberty. I also compared Mill with this mentor Bentham, as Mill does not exist without Bentham and as result, both philosophers must be discussed in order to fully understand utilitarianism. In the first half of the chapter I also examined paternalism as discussed by Robert Simon in William J. Morgan's book on ethics and compared it to utilitarianism. As an advocate for paternalism, in his paper, Simon took the example of boxing and questioned whether or not it should be banned. Since my thesis is about hockey, another violent sport with possible long-lasting repercussions, Simon's discussion of paternalism in boxing and of utilitarianism was an appropriate topic for me to analyze for the first half of my ethical analysis in chapter three. My main goal in this chapter was to answer the first research question: *What are the dominant messages and representations about Canadian women's hockey in an ethical context? How do these dominant messages and representations compare to the dominant messages and representations of Canadian men's hockey?*

The remainder of Chapter Three consisted of a general philosophical and ethical analysis of hockey using sports philosophers and gender scholars. Some of the key academics discussed in this section include J.S. Russell and his article on the separation versus continuity thesis in sports. Russell's chapter proved to be extremely helpful as he directly references both the Marty McSorely and Todd Bertuzzi incidents; thus, I was able to expand on his analysis for my own examination of the separation versus continuity thesis. To fully analyze the ethics involved in hockey, I had to examine both men's and women's hockey. I also examined Torbjörn Tännsjö's chapter from Morgan's *Ethics in Sports* anthology. Tännsjö, a controversial Swedish philosopher with admittedly not a large sports background, examined what he deems "sex discrimination" in

sports. Angela Schneider, another important gender and sports scholar, offered a cogent counter argument to Tännsjö in her response to him. She also wrote another article about what it means to be a ‘woman’ in the sport context and provided some compelling quotations on the differences between men’s and women’s sports, which is the main theme of the second half of chapter two.

In this section I also reviewed the other gender and ethics scholars first mentioned in the literature review, including Leslie Howe, whose chapter on women’s hockey in Morgan’s book was one of the most important academic pieces that I used in this thesis. Another relevant article that I used in this section was Charlene Weaving and Samuel Roberts’ chapter on the lack of body checking in women’s hockey. Weaving is one of the most important gender and ethics scholars; her work yielded insights when I attempted to answer the research question listed above. Furthermore, I discussed the aforementioned authors with regard to hockey, gender, violence and masculinity versus femininity. Ultimately, discussing these issues, I was able to answer my first research question, written above, albeit from a theoretical standpoint. In Chapter Three, I was able to answer my second research question using some empirical evidence from my media content analysis to get a more concrete answer.

As mentioned above, Chapter Four consisted of the second type of analysis, media content analysis, with a close examination of the context of each media source in order to discuss the how women’s hockey is seen through the eyes of the media compared to men’s hockey. Using media content analysis, I attempted to answer the following research question: *what is the response of the Canadian media and the general public to such representations of women’s hockey (as discussed in chapter three)?* The media format that I chose for this analysis included some scrutiny of two major Canadian newspapers (*The Toronto Star* and *The Globe and Mail*)

with articles written between the years 1990 and 2019. These newspapers were analyzed using the LexisNexis newspaper database and systematic random sampling for the most part; however, I had to use some purposive sampling to achieve my sample size as systematic random sampling sometimes left me with irrelevant articles. Therefore, my chosen articles were not often as random as I would have liked, which could have affected the validity of the media content analysis. Overall, once I found my sample size and completed my inductive analysis and coding of the data, the findings partially answered my second research question listed on the previous page.

In addition, my hypothesis that women's hockey is seen as an inferior version of the sport compared to men's sport through the eyes of the media, garnered some support. My basic media findings showcased the lack of coverage that women's hockey receives in the media, especially from male sports reporters. Female reporters and sports writers are more likely to cover women's hockey, yet female sports reporters are few in number and prominence. However, I was not able to answer the second research question as clearly as I would have liked. This could be due, in part, to the general lack of coverage of women's hockey during non-Olympic years.

The second half of Chapter Four consisted of my third analysis, the narrative analysis. I chose the narrative analysis as the final section as it brings the other two forms of research together in a more experiential way. Narrative analysis is very broad; according to Alan Bryman, Edward Bell and James Teevan, it is "an approach focused on the search for and analysis of stories that people use to understand their lives and the world around them."<sup>362</sup> For my narrative

---

<sup>362</sup> Alan Bryman, Edward Bell, and James Teevan, "Glossary," in *Social Research Methods*, (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 2012), 370.

analysis, I attempted to answer the following research question: *c) What narrative themes create the popular story about women in hockey and about the National Women's Hockey Team?*

I chose two themes or two different types of analysis for this section. The first half of my narrative analysis consisted of Norman Fairclough's Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA), or the 'story analyst approach.' The second half of the narrative included my personal experiences playing competitive girls' hockey in Ontario for much of my childhood. This section may also align with the 'storyteller approach.' Since for my narrative analysis I did not validate the approach with empirical evidence as was the case for the media analysis, I relied on theoretical evidence based on several important gender and sport scholars, such as Paul Davis, as well as some of the same newspaper articles I previously used in my media analysis, as I was examining written narrative. There was considerable overlap among several of the sources, which served to validate the approach.

I also supported my CDA with articles and book chapters by Julie Stevens, an important sport management and kinesiology scholar, and by Carly Adams, one of the most prominent female hockey historians. Their work is highly important when discussing the narrative surrounding women's hockey and female hockey players. Thus, using Davis, Stevens, Adams as well as the newspaper and web articles of well-regarded hockey journalists Mary Ormsby, Damien Cox and Rachel Brady, I was able to answer my third and final research question.

Ultimately the general narrative surrounding women's hockey is that women's hockey is perceived as not as being as 'good' a version of the sport as men's hockey. The indolent induction of women into the Hockey Hall of Fame and the International Hockey Hall of Fame supports this general narrative that women still struggle to gain respect in not only the media, but

in the hockey world and among the general public. I did not intend to provide any new findings from my personal narrative analysis, as I was telling a story based on my lived hockey-playing experiences, and my experiences are notably similar to the findings uncovered in the content analysis and the CDA. Nevertheless, I was able to support my own experiences with articles from several key gender and sport scholars, including, M. Ann Hall, Judy Davidson, Bonnie Slade, Jodi H. Cohen and Tamar Z. Semerjian, and Danielle DiCarlo.

Moreover, the narrative analysis relies on telling a story, and after completing both the ethical and media analysis, the dominant recurring themes were the coverage or (lack thereof) of women's hockey, and the general public opinion of women's hockey. Therefore, these themes stood as the main story of this chapter. Acting as an extension of the previous section on media content analysis and using CDA from the both the story analyst and storyteller approach, my narrative analysis was able to answer the third and final research question of this thesis described on the previous page.

It can be argued that this thesis offered support for my hypotheses regarding the inequality of women in hockey and how most key external actors, the male hockey establishment, journalists and the general public, see women in hockey as lesser athletes. Using pre-existing literature and additional qualitative research methods, this thesis was able to support my hypotheses. Furthermore, this thesis also contributed to some of the popular discussion of hegemonic masculinity by examining the rule differences between men's hockey and women's hockey.

This begs the question: *will we ever see the reintroduction of bodychecking in women's hockey?* Ultimately, I think that with the wealth of information we now have about concussions and the long-term impact of multiple concussions, we may not see the reintroduction of



bodychecking in women's hockey. Certainly, the reintroduction of bodychecking is unlikely to occur until there are better resources and programs in place to ensure the health and safety of elite women hockey players. Furthermore, in many conservative countries, women playing masculine sports still encounter disapproval; thus, many IIHF sanctioned countries would not allow their female hockey players to play with full contact. Last, until the culture of Canadian hockey changes, hegemonic masculinity will continue, and no matter how dominant the women's hockey team and individual players are, they will continue to face criticism from the media, the IIHF, the IOC and the general public. The introduction of bodychecking will not change this sociological reality.

### **Recommendations for Future Research**

While this thesis provided qualitative background material on women hockey players themselves, I was not able to utilize other forms of media for my media content analysis, such as magazines and television broadcasts. However, I did use Kelly Poniatowski's articles on American and Canadian women hockey players as portrayed by major broadcast networks. Another key gap in the literature that I did not discuss is the treatment of females who cover sports themselves, sports journalists and broadcasters, although I did briefly discuss my experience working as a female broadcaster in hockey in my personal narrative section. One of the issues I examined in my media content analysis was the lack of female sports journalists writing about women's hockey. An expansion of this thesis could include the study of the treatment of females working in sports media, especially in male-dominated sports such as hockey. For a future study, it would be useful to evaluate and compare their experiences with those of elite female hockey players.

## Bibliography

### Books

- Adams, Carly. "Organizing Hockey for Women: The Ladies Ontario Hockey Association and the Fight for Legitimacy, 1922-1940," in *Coast to Coast: Hockey in Canada to the Second World War*, edited by John Chi-Kit Wong, 132-159. Ontario: University of Toronto Press, 2009.
- Adams, Louise, Mary. "The Game of Whose Lives? Gender, Race and Entitlement in Canada's "National" Game" in *Artificial Ice: Hockey, Culture and Commerce*, edited by David Gruneau and Mark Whitson, 71-84. Ontario: Higher Education Press, 2006.
- Avery, Joanna and Stevens, Julie. *Too Many Men on the Ice: Women's Hockey in North America*. Victoria: Polestar Book Publishers, 1997.
- Bernstein, Ross. *The Code: The Unwritten Rules of Fighting and Retaliation in the NHL*. Chicago: Triumph Books, 2006.
- Bertrand, Ina and Hughes, Peter. "Part Three: Research on Texts," in *Media Research Methods*, (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). London: Palgrave MacMillan, 2018.
- Bertrand, Ina and Hughes, Peter. "Chapter 10: Gathering and Analysing Textual Data," in *Media Research Methods*, (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2018.
- Bryman, Alan. Bell, Edward., & Teevan, James. "Glossary," in *Social Research Methods* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). Toronto: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- Connell, R.W. *Gender and Power: Society, The Person, and Sexual Politics*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1987.
- Davis, Paul. "Sexualization and Sexuality in Sport," in *Philosophical Perspectives on Gender in Sport and Physical Activity*, edited by Paul Davis, 57-63. United Kingdom: Taylor and Francis, 2009.
- Gramsci, Antonio. *Prison Notebooks: Volume 1*. Edited by Joseph A. Buttigeng. Translated by Antonio Callari. New York City: Columbia University Press, 2010.
- Gruneau, Richard and Whitson, David. *Hockey Night in Canada: Sport Identities and Cultural Politics*. Toronto: Garamond Press, 1993.
- Hall, Ann, M. *The Girl and the Game: A History of Women's Hockey in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016.
- Howe, A. Leslie. "Being and Playing: Sport and the Valorization of Gender", in *Ethics in Sport*, edited by William J. Morgan, 331-345. Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007.

- Lenskyj, Helen. *Out of Bounds: Women, Sport and Sexuality*. Toronto: Women's Press, 1986.
- Macskimming, Roy. *Cold War: The Amazing Canada-Soviet Hockey Series of 1972*. Vancouver: Greystone Books, 1996.
- Mill, J.S. "What Utilitarianism Is," in *Utilitarianism*. London: Saville and Edwards Printers, 1864.
- Mill, J.S. "Of the Limits to the Authority of Society Over the Well-Being of the Individual," in *On Liberty, in Focus*, edited by John Gray, and G.W. Smith, 90-108. United Kingdom: Routledge, 1991.
- Mill, J.S. "Utilitarianism," in *Ethical Theory: An Anthology*, edited by Russ Shafer-Landau, 457-463. Massachusetts: Blackwell Publishing, 2007.
- Norton, Wayne. *Women on the Ice; The Early Years of Women's Hockey in Western Canada*. Vancouver: Ronsdale Press, 2009.
- Proteau, Adam. "We Sell Hate: North American Hockey's Long and Baffling Proud History of Violence" *Fighting the Good Fight: Why On- Ice Violence is Killing Hockey*. Mississauga: John Wiley & Sons Canada Ltd., 2011.
- Robinson, Laura. *Crossing the Line: Violence and Sexual Assault in Canada's National Sport*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Inc., 1998.
- Russell, J.S. "Broad Internalism and the Moral Foundations of Sport," in *Ethics in Sport*, edited by William J. Morgan, 51-66. Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007.
- Scanlan, Lawrence. *Grace Under Fire*. Toronto: Penguin Canada, 2003.
- Schneider, Angela. "A Postscript to Tännsjö's Radical Proposal," in *Values in Sport: Elitism, Nationalism, Gender Equity and the Scientific Manufacturing of Winners*, edited by Torbjörn Tännsjö and Claudio Tamburinni, 134-137. United Kingdom: Taylor and Francis Group, 2000.
- Schneider, Angela. "On the Definition of 'Woman' in the Sport Context," in *Philosophical Perspectives on Gender in Sport and Physical Activity*, edited by Paul Davis, 40-44. United Kingdom Taylor and Francis Group, 2009.
- Simon, L. Robert. "Violence in Sports," in *Ethics in Sport*, edited by William J. Morgan, 379-387. Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007.
- Smith, Brett. "Narrative Analysis," in *Analyzing Qualitative Data in Psychology* (2<sup>nd</sup> edition), edited by Evanthisa Lyons and Adrian Coyle, 220-221. United Kingdom: Sage, 2016.

Steckley, John & Letts Kirby, Guy. *Elements of Sociology: A Critical Canadian Introduction*, Toronto: Oxford University Press, 2013.

Stevens, Julie. "Women's Ice Hockey in Canada: After the 'Gold Rush,'" in *Artificial Ice: Hockey, Culture and Commerce*, edited by Richard Gruneau and David Whitson, 85-99. Ontario: University of Toronto Press, Higher Education Division, 2006.

Suits, Bernard. *The Grasshopper: Games, Life, and Utopia*. Tonawanda: Broadview Press, 2014.

Theberge, Nancy. *Higher Goals: Women's Ice Hockey and the Politics of Gender*. Albany: SUNY Press, 2000.

Tännsjö, Torbjörn. "Against Sexual Discrimination in Sports," in *Ethics in Sport*, edited by William J. Morgan, 347-358. Illinois: Human Kinetics, 2007.

### Peer Reviewed Journal Articles

Adams, Carly. "Queens of the Ice Lanes: The Preston Rivulettes and Women's Hockey in Canada, 1931-1940." *Sport History Review*, 39, no.1 (2008): 1-28, <https://doi-org.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/10.1123/shr.39.1.1>.

Adams, Carly. "Troubling Bodies: The Canadian Girl, the Ice Rink, and the Banff Winter Carnival." *Journal of Canadian Studies*, 48, no. 3 (2014): 200-220. <https://muse.jhu.edu/>.

Burns, J.H. "Happiness and Utility: Jeremy Bentham's Equation." *Utilitas*, 17, no.1 (2005): 46-61. Doi: 10.1017/S0953820804001396.

Cohen, H. Jodi, and Semerjian, Z. Tamar. "The Collision of Trans-experience and the Politics of Women's Ice Hockey." *International Journal of Transgenderism*, 10, no.3-4 (2008): 133-145. Doi: 10.1080/15532730802297322.

Davidson, Judy. "Lesbian Erotics at Women's Hockey: Fans, Flashing and the Booby Orrs." *Journal of Lesbian Studies*, 13, no. 3 (2006): 337-348, Doi: 10.1080/10894160902876820.

DiCarlo, Danielle. "Playing Like a Girl? The Negotiation of Gender and Sexual Identity Among Female Ice Hockey Teams on Male Teams." *Sport in Society*, 19, no..8-9 (2016): 1366, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/17430437.2015.1096260>.

Kelly, Deidre, Pomerantz, Shauna and Currie, Dawn "Skater Girlhood and Emphasized Femininity: 'You Can't Land an Ollie Properly in Heels.'" *Gender and Education*, 17 no.3 (2005): 129. Doi: 10.1080/09540250500145163.

Krane, Vikki. "We Can Be Athletic and Feminine, But Do We Want To?" *Quest*, 53, (2001): 115. Doi: 10.1080/00336297.2001.10491733.

- Lorenz, L. Stacey, and Osborne, Geraint. "Nothing More Than the Usual Injury: Debating Hockey Violence During the Manslaughter Trials of Allan Loney (1905) and Charles Masson (1907)." *Journal of Historical Sociology*, 30 (4) (2017): 698-723. Doi: 10.1111/johs.12111.
- Poniatowski, Kelly. "'You're Not Allowed Bodychecking in Women's Hockey': Preserving Gendered and Nationalistic Hegemonies in the 2006 Olympic Ice Hockey Tournament." *Women in Sport and Physical Activity*, 20 no.1 (2011): 39-52. <https://link-gale-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/apps/doc/A263258653/AONE?u=lond95336&sid=AONE&xid=756cb09f>.
- Poniatowski, Kelly. "'The Nail Polish Underneath the Hockey Gloves': NBC's Framing of Women Hockey Players in the 2010 Winter Olympics." *Journal of Sports Media*, 9 no.9 (2014): 23-44. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.1353/jsm.2014.0000>.
- Reid, A. Patrick, and Mason, Patrick. "Women Can't Skate That Fast and Shoot That Hard!" *The International Journal of the History of Sport*, 32, no.14 (2015): 1678-1696. Doi: 10.1080/09523367.2015.1121867
- Robidoux, Michael A. "Imagining a Canadian Identity Through Sport: A (sic) Historical Interpretation of Lacrosse and Hockey." *The Journal of American Folklore*, 115 (456) (2002): 209-225. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4129220>.
- Slade, Bonnie. "'Not Just 'Little Ladies' in Hockey Gear': Hockey Experiences in a Small Town." *Canadian Woman Studies*, 21, no. 3 (2002): 155-156. <https://link-gale-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/apps/doc/A88761613/AONE?u=lond95336&sid=AONE&xid=59aa67da>.
- Stevens, Julie, and Adams, Carly. "'Together We Can Make It Better': Collective Action and Governance in a Girls' Ice Hockey Association." *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*, 48 no.6 (2012): 658-672. Doi: 10.1177/1012690212454466.
- Theberge, Nancy. "Playing with the Boys: Manon Rhéaume, Women's Hockey and the Struggle for Legitimacy." *Canadian Women's Studies*, 15, no.4 (1995): 37-41. <https://cws.journals.yorku.ca/index.php/cws/article/view/9361>.
- Theberge, Nancy. "It's Part of the Game: Physicality and the Production of Gender in Women's Hockey." *Gender and Society*, 11 no.1 (1997): 69-87. <https://journals-sagepub-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/doi/pdf/10.1177/089124397011001005>.
- Theberge, Nancy. "No Fear Comes—Adolescent Girls, Ice Hockey and the Embodiment of Gender." *Youth and Society*, 34 no.4 (2003): 497-516. Doi:10.1177/0044118X03252592.
- Weaving, Charlene and Roberts, Samuel. "Checking In: An Analysis of the (Lack of) Body Checking in Women's Hockey." *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 83 no. 3. (2012): 470–478. Doi:10.1080/02701367.2012.10599882.

Williams, Malcolm and Uprichard, Emma. "In Memory of Alan Bryman." *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 21, no. 3 (2018) 267-274.  
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13645579.2018.1436428?journalCode=tsrm20>.

Williams, Megan. "Women's Hockey: Heating Up the Equity Debate." *Canadian Woman Studies*, 15, no. 4 (1995): 78-81. <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/217455318?pq-origsite=summon>.

### Newspapers/Magazines

Anonymous. "Improving Women's Hockey on Agenda at Toronto Summit." *Toronto Star* (June 2, 2010): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/356909450?accountid=15115>.

Annicchiario, Mario. "Times Colonist Wins National Award", *Colonist Times* (June 8, 2017): <https://www.timescolonist.com/sports/times-colonist-reporter-wins-national-award-1.20474003>.

"Author Profile: Dan Barnes", *The National Post* (September 12, 2018): <https://nationalpost.com/author/npdbarnes>.

Associated Press. "New Hampshire Debates Seatbelt Bill." *Seattle Times* (Feb. 7, 2018): <https://www.seattletimes.com/nation-world/new-hampshire-debates-seat-belt-bill/>.

Barnes, Dan. "It Should Be Stale by Now, but Canada-U.S. Women's Hockey Rivalry is Only Getting Better." *National Post* (Feb 10, 2018): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/2000825719?accountid=15115>.

Belson, Ken. "In NHL Concussion Lawsuit, Gary Bettman Opts to Fight." *The New York Times* (July 24, 2018): <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/07/24/sports/nhl-concussion-lawsuit-gary-bettman.html>.

Berkman, Seth. "Pay Cuts Jolt Women's Pro League and Leave its Future Uncertain." *The New York Times* (November 22, 2016): <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/11/22/sports/hockey/nwhl-pay-cut-salary.html>.

Berkman, Seth. "CWLHL Folds, Leaving North America With One Women's League." *The New York Times* (March 31, 2019): <https://www.nytimes.com/2019/03/31/sports/cwhl-womens-hockey.html>.

Berkman, Seth. "Women Hockey Players Seeking a Better League, Say They'll Sit Out." *The New York Times* (May 2, 2019): <https://www.nytimes.com/2019/05/02/sports/female-hockey-players-boycott.html>.

- Brady, Rachel. "Big Fish Throw Minnows a Line; Canada, U.S. Take Part in Program Aimed at Improving Level of Women's Game Worldwide." *The Globe and Mail* (April 14, 2012): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.
- Brady, Rachel. "Canadian Women's Hockey League Will Begin Paying Its Players." *Globe and Mail* (Sept. 1, 2017): <https://beta.theglobeandmail.com/sports/hockey/cwhl-will-pay-its-players-for-the-first-time-starting-this-season/article36139819/>.
- Branch, John. "Former NHL Player Jeff Parker Posthumously Diagnosed With CTE, Confirming Family's Fear." *The New York Times* (May 3, 2018): <https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/2018/05/03/former-nhl-player-jeff-parker-posthumously-diagnosed-with-cte-confirming-familys-suspicious.html>.
- "Bruins McSorley Charged with Assault". *CBC Sports*. Last modified March 8, 2000. <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/bruins-marty-mcsorley-charged-with-assault-1.200872>.
- The Canadian Press. "Shannon Szabados Returns to Canadian Women's Hockey Team." *The Globe and Mail* (November 23, 2016): <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/sports/hockey/shannon-szabados-returns-to-canadian-womens-hockey-team/article33004626/>.
- Christie, James. "Playing with the Big Boys: Hayley Wickenheiser Invited to Attend Workouts with Flyers, Prospects, Draftees." *The Globe and Mail* (May 28, 1998): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.
- Cox, Damien. "Recognition for Female Pioneers Long Overdue." *The Toronto Star* (December 21, 2007): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.
- Dheensaw, Cleve. "Women's Hockey Should Get the Boot." *Colonist Times* (Feb 13, 2006): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/348035340?accountid=15115>.
- Duhatschek, Eric. "Hockey a Family Tradition for Mikkelson, Other Hopefuls." *The Globe and Mail* (January 29, 2009): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.
- Fennell, Susan. "Women's League Deserves Exposure." *The Toronto Star* (February 21, 2001): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.
- Feschuk, Dave. "Sochi 2014: Canada's Roster Superlative, As Long as They Win: Feschuk." *The Toronto Star* (January 8, 2014): [https://www.thestar.com/sports/sochi2014/hockey/2014/01/08/sochi\\_2014\\_team\\_canadas\\_roster\\_superlative\\_so\\_long\\_as\\_they\\_win\\_feschuk.html](https://www.thestar.com/sports/sochi2014/hockey/2014/01/08/sochi_2014_team_canadas_roster_superlative_so_long_as_they_win_feschuk.html).
- Futterman, Matthew. "U.S. Break Canada's Grip Hockey Gold." *The New York Times* (February 21, 2018): <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/02/21/sports/olympics/usa-womens-hockey-canada.html>.

- Gatehouse, Johnathon. "The Girls Go Wild", *Maclean's* (Mar 6, 2006): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/218521423?accountid=15115>.
- Jollimore, Mary. "Women's Hockey Shut Out of the Olympics Until at Least 1998." *The Globe and Mail* (September 21, 1992): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.
- Keenan, Edward. "Hey Rich Folk: For a Relative Pittance, You Could be the Conn Smythe of Women's Hockey." *The Toronto Star* (April 5, 2019): <https://www.thestar.com/opinion/star-columnists/2019/04/05/hey-rich-folks-for-a-relative-pittance-you-could-be-the-conn-smythe-of-womens-hockey.html>.
- Lee, Jeff. "Jeff Lee", *The Vancouver Province* (July 26, 2016): <https://theprovince.com/author/jeffleevansun>.
- Lee, Jeff. "Women's Hockey Has to Improve, Says IOC." *The Vancouver Province* (Feb 26, 2010): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/269607437?accountid=15115>.
- Leeder, David. "Sauvageau Plans to Give Up the Bench for Her Badge." *The Globe and Mail* (June 18, 2002): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.
- MacGregor, Roy. "Women Start Something special: A Little Bit of History is Made at the Olympic Hockey Rink, Despite the Many Critics, says Roy MacGregor." *The Ottawa Citizen* (Feb. 1, 1998): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/240173371?accountid=15115>.
- McGran, Kevin. "Canada Loses World Junior Heartbreak to Finland in OT." *The Toronto Star* (January 2, 2019): <https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/worldjuniors/2019/01/02/game-centre-canada-loses-overtime-heartbreaker-to-finland.html>.
- McGran, Kevin. "Clarkson Cup Contenders are Happy to Be Under the Spotlight of the CWHL Final." *The Toronto Star* (March 23, 2019): <https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/2019/03/23/clarkson-cup-contenders-are-happy-to-be-under-the-spotlight-of-the-cwhl-final.html>.
- McGran, Kevin. "The Canadian Women's Hockey League is Folding, Says Business Model Isn't the Right One." *The Toronto Star* (March 31, 2019): <https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/2019/03/31/canadian-womens-hockey-league-is-folding-board-says-business-model-is-financially-unsustainable.html>.



- Mickleburgh, Rod and Matas, Robert. "Bertuzzi Receives Conditional Discharge." *The Globe and Mail* (December 23, 2004):  
<https://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/national/bertuzzi-receives-conditional-discharge/article22508170/>.
- Naylor, David. "Rockets Considering Hiring Sauvageau National Women's Team Coach to Discuss Job." *The Globe and Mail* (May 6, 1999):  
<http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.
- Naylor, David. "Goalie Labonté Faces Overwhelming Attention as Well as the Pucks." *The Globe and Mail* (October 30, 1999):  
<http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.
- "New Pinnacle for Women's Hockey: James, Granato Join Hall of Fame." *The Toronto Star* (June 23, 2010): [http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic](http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/).
- Ornsby, Mary. "Women's Hockey Gets Approval for '98." *The Toronto Star* (Nov. 18, 1992):  
<https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/436746829?accountid=15115>.
- Ornsby, Mary. "Hockey Hall for Female?" *The Toronto Star* (April 29, 1995):  
<http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.
- Parlee, Courtenay. "Letters to Sportsweek: World Champs." *The Globe and Mail* (May 2, 1994):  
<http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.
- "Players Form New Hockey League." *The Toronto Star* (Sept. 27, 2007):  
[https://www.thestar.com/sports/2007/09/27/players\\_form\\_new\\_canadian\\_womens\\_hockey\\_league.html](https://www.thestar.com/sports/2007/09/27/players_form_new_canadian_womens_hockey_league.html).
- Sekeres, Matthew. "Canadians Romp in Opener; Hosts Set Record While Rolling to Double – Digit Lead after 30 Minutes." *The Globe and Mail* (February 14, 2010):  
<http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/lnacademic/>.
- Schram, Carol. "Sidney Crosby Enjoying Role on Team Canada at World Hockey Championship." *The Toronto Star* (May 13, 2015):  
<https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/2015/05/13/sidney-crosby-enjoying-role-on-team-canada-at-world-hockey-championship.html>.
- Siegal, Jonas. "Sidney Crosby Named Canadian Captain for World Cup of Hockey." *The Toronto Star* (August 25, 2018):  
<https://www.thestar.com/sports/hockey/2016/08/25/sidney-crosby-named-canadian-captain-for-world-cup-of-hockey.html>.
- "Sidney Crosby." *The Toronto Star* (April 11, 2019):  
<https://www.thestar.com/search.html?tag=Sidney%20Crosby&pagenum=1>.

- Spencer, Donna. "More Women Behind the Benches in Olympic Women's Hockey Tournament." *The Globe and Mail* (Feb 9, 2018): <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/sports/olympics/more-women-behind-the-benches-in-olympic-womens-hockey-tournament/article37918018/>.
- Starkman, Randy. "Wickenheiser's Real Feat Lies in Chasing Her Dream." *The Toronto Star* (January 13, 2003): <http://www.lexisnexis.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/hottopics/Inacademic/>.
- "Players Form New Hockey League." *The Toronto Star* (Sept. 27, 2007): [https://www.thestar.com/sports/2007/09/27/players\\_form\\_new\\_canadian\\_womens\\_hockey\\_league.html](https://www.thestar.com/sports/2007/09/27/players_form_new_canadian_womens_hockey_league.html).
- Warren, Ken. "Back to Reality for Women's Hockey: For Team Canada, There Are Careers to Restart and Money to Pay Back After the Olympics." *The Montréal Gazette* (Mar 8, 2002): <https://search-proquest-com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/433812285?accountid=15115>.
- Westhead, Rick. "Bertuzzi Suspended for Season and Playoffs." *The New York Times* (March 12, 2004): <https://www.nytimes.com/2004/03/12/sports/hockey-bertuzzi-suspended-for-season-and-playoffs.html>.
- Westhead, Rick. "Link Between Fighting, Concussions, 'Personal Tragedies' Discussed in Unsealed NHL Emails." *TSN*. Last modified March 28, 2016. <https://www.tsn.ca/link-between-fighting-concussions-personal-tragedies-discussed-in-unsealed-nhl-emails-1.460651>.
- Websites**
- "About Helen Jefferson Lenskyj." *Helen Jefferson Lenskyj*. Last modified 2016. <http://www.helenlenskyj.ca/about.html>.
- "Active Player Salaries." *CapFriendly*. Last modified October 16, 2018. <https://www.capfriendly.com/browse/active/2019/salary>.
- Associated Press, "NHL Cut Player Salaries in Half to Save Season." *Sportsnet*. Last modified November 18, 2017. <https://www.sportsnet.ca/hockey/nwhl-cuts-player-salaries-half-save-season/>.
- Beacon, Bill. "Boos and Bucks." *CBC*. Last modified January 31, 2018. <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/nhl/gary-bettman-nhl-commissioner-25-years-1.4513360>.
- "Beijing to Host 2022 Winter Olympics and Paralympics," *BBC Sport*. Last modified July 31 2015. <https://www.bbc.com/sport/winter-olympics/33730477>.
- "Bertuzzi Reinstated by the NHL." *CBC News*. Last modified August 8, 2005. <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/bertuzzi-reinstated-by-nhl-1.566563>.

“Biography.” *Lawrence Scanlan*. Last modified 2017. <http://www.lawrencescanlan.com/bio/>.

Brophy, Mike. “98 Problems: How it All Went Wrong for Canada’s Olympic Hockey Team in Nagano.” *CBC Sports Longform*. Last modified February 3, 2017. <https://www.cbc.ca/sportslongform/entry/1998-olympic-hockey>.

“Bruins McSorely Charged with Assault.” *CBC Sports*. Last modified March 8, 2000. <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/bruins-marty-mcsorley-charged-with-assault-1.200872>.

Boynton, Nick. “Everything’s Not Okay.” *The Players Tribune*. Last modified June 13, 2018. <https://www.theplayertribune.com/en-us/articles/nick-boynton-everythings-not-ok>.

Campigotto, Jesse. “NHL Playoffs Will Have No Canadian Teams This Year,” *CBC Sports*. Last modified March 31, 2016. <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/nhl/no-canadian-teams-nhl-playoffs-1.3513988>.

“Camps.” *Franco Canadian Goalie School*. Last modified June 19, 2019, <http://www.franco-canadian.com/camps/>.

“Canucks’ Bertuzzi Charged with Assault.” *CBC News*. Last modified June 25, 2004. <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/canucks-bertuzzi-charged-with-assault-1.499287>.

“Coaches.” *CapFriendly*. Last modified June 19, 2019 <https://www.capfriendly.com/coaches/history>.

“College of Arts and Science, Our People: Leslie Howe.” *University of Saskatchewan*. Last modified February 21, 2019, <https://artsandscience.usask.ca/profile/LHowe#/research>.

“Dan Mason, PhD.” *University of Alberta: Faculty of Kinesiology, Sport and Recreation*. Last modified February 21, 2019. <https://www.ualberta.ca/kinesiology-sport-recreation/about-us/faculty-staff/researchers/dan-mason>.

“Danielle DiCarlo, Phd.” *LinkedIn*. Last modified 2019, <https://ca.linkedin.com/in/danielle-dicarlo-phd-b5831765>.

Department of Philosophy: John Russell.” *Langara College*. Last modified February 21, 2019. <https://langara.ca/departments/philosophy/faculty.html>.

Diaz, Angel. “Why the NBA Has Surpassed the NFL as ‘America’s Sport’.” *Complex*. Last modified October 15, 2018. <https://www.complex.com/sports/2018/10/why-the-nba-has-surpassed-the-nfl-as-americas-sports>.

“Dr. Jodi H Cohen.” *Bridgewater State University*. [https://services.bridgew.edu/Directory/search\\_person.cfm?personList=984](https://services.bridgew.edu/Directory/search_person.cfm?personList=984).

Driver, Julia. "The History of Utilitarianism." *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Last modified September 22, 2014. <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/utilitarianism-history/#JerBen>.

"Dr. Paul Davis, Senior Lecturer in the Sociology of Sport." *University of Sunderland*. Last modified June 11, 2019. [https://www.sunderland.ac.uk/about/staff/sport-and-exercise-sciences/pauldavis/#group\\_book=5Fsection](https://www.sunderland.ac.uk/about/staff/sport-and-exercise-sciences/pauldavis/#group_book=5Fsection).

Edmonds, Paul. "Captain Canada." *Hockey Canada*. Last modified June 17, 2018. <https://www.hockeycanada.ca/en-ca/news/parallax/2018-hcf-ohc-ryan-smyth>.

"Employer Responsibilities." *United States Department of Labor*. <https://www.osha.gov/as/opa/worker/employer-responsibility.html>.

Fletcher, Robson. "They Won the Championship. Then the League Folded. But the Calgary Inferno Aren't Giving Up on Women's Hockey." *CBC Sports*. Last modified April 1, 2019. <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/calgary/canadian-womens-hockey-league-closure-calgary-inferno-react-1.5079707>.

"Forums." *Hockey Fights*. Last modified October 25, 2010. <http://www.hockeyfights.com/forums/f8/pussification-nhl-when-did-start-148384>.

Foster, Meredith. "What #FortheGame Could Mean for Nordic Hockey." *The Ice Garden*. Last modified May 10, 2019. <https://www.theicegarden.com/2019/5/10/18529929/could-for-the-game-work-overseas-sdhl-sweden-naisten-liiga-finland-europe>.

Goffenberg, Daniel. "Blue Jackets Tortorella Laments Friendly NHL: "There's No Hate,"" *Sportsnet*. Last modified October 26, 2018. <https://www.sportsnet.ca/hockey/nhl/blue-jackets-tortorella-laments-friendly-nhl-theres-no-hate/>.

Heshmat, Shahram, "What is Confirmation Bias?" *Psychology Today*. Last modified April 23, 2015. <https://www.psychologytoday.com/ca/blog/science-choice/201504/what-is-confirmation-bias>.

Harrison, Doug. "'Shannon Szabados Package Deal Was Cancerous' Ex-Coach." *CBC Sports*. Last modified October 27, 2016. <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/nhl/shannon-szabados-package-deal-peoria-1.3824018>.

"Ice Hockey Legend Hayley Wickenheiser Pledges to Donate Brain to Concussion Legacy Foundation to Support CTE Research." *Concussion Legacy Foundation*. Last modified Tuesday March 6, 2018. <https://concussionfoundation.org/media/press-releases/Wickenheiser-brain-pledge>.

Janks, Hilary. "Critical Discourse as a Research Tool." (2019): <https://www.uv.es/gimenez/Recursos/criticaldiscourse.pdf>.

- Jay, Michelle. "How the Canadian Women's Hockey League Fell Apart." *SBNation*. Last modified September 3, 2019. <https://www.sbnation.com/2019/9/3/20804377/cwhl-womens-hockey-league-history-collapse>.
- "Julie Stevens, Ph.D." *Faculty of Applied Health Sciences*. Last modified August 23, 2019. <https://brocku.ca/applied-health-sciences/sport-management/faculty-research/faculty-directory/julie-stevens-ph-d/#teaching>.
- "Ken Dryden: 100 Greatest NHL Players." National Hockey League. Last modified January 1, 2019. <https://www.nhl.com/news/ken-dryden-100-greatest-nhl-hockey-players/c-285637088?tid=283865022>.
- "Kinesiology: Nancy Theberge Professor Emerita." *University of Waterloo*. Last modified February 21, 2019. <https://uwaterloo.ca/kinesiology/people-profiles/nancy-theberge>.
- "IIHF Official Rule Book 2018-2022." *International Ice Hockey Federation*. Last modified June 1, 2018. [https://www.iihf.com/IIHFMvc/media/Downloads/Rule%20Book/IIHF\\_Official\\_Rule\\_Book\\_2018\\_Web\\_v2.pdf](https://www.iihf.com/IIHFMvc/media/Downloads/Rule%20Book/IIHF_Official_Rule_Book_2018_Web_v2.pdf).
- IOC Approves Five New Sports for Olympic Games Tokyo 2020." *International Olympic Committee*. Last modified August 3, 2016, <https://www.olympic.org/news/ioc-approves-five-new-sports-for-olympic-games-tokyo-2020>.
- Laraque, Georges. "Fights." *Georges Laraque Official Site*. Last modified 2016. <https://georgeslaraque.com/hk-fights.php>
- "Leafs' Morgan Rielly Apologizes After Girl Comment." CBC Sports. Last modified February 20, 2015. <https://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/nhl/leafs-morgan-rielly-apologizes-after-girl-comment-1.2965604>.
- Leahy, Sean. "Almost 10 Years Later, Steve Moore Still Experiencing Concussion Symptoms, Now Helping Others." *Yahoo Sports*. Last modified January 14, 2014. <http://ca.sports.yahoo.com/blogs/nhl-puck-daddy/almost-10-years-later-steve-moore-now-helping-003445795--nhl.html>.
- MacLeod, Christopher. "John Stuart Mill." *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Last modified August 25, 2016. <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/mill/>.
- "Mary Louise Adams, PhD." *Queens University: School of Kinesiology and Health Studies*. Last modified 2019. <https://skhs.queensu.ca/people/faculty/mary-louise-adams-phd/>.
- "McSorely Found Guilty, Gets Conditional Discharge." *CBC News*. Last modified October 7, 2000. <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/mcsorley-found-guilty-gets-conditional-discharge-1.252239>.

- “Megan Williams: Rome Correspondent.” *CBC News*. Last modified 2019.  
<https://www.cbc.ca/news/world/megan-williams-1.3614782>.
- Mill, J.S. “Utilitarianism by John Stuart Mill. *Philosophy Readings: Article Series*.  
<https://philosophy.lander.edu/intro/articles/mill.pdf>
- Nathanson, Steven. “Act and Rule Utilitarianism.” *Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.  
<https://www.iep.utm.edu/util-a-r/#H2>.
- Next Stop...,” *PWHPA*. Last modified 2019. <http://pwhpa.com>.
- “Patrick Reid, PhD.” *Brock University: Faculty of Applied Health Sciences*. Last modified February 21, 2019. <https://brocku.ca/applied-health-sciences/sport-management/patrick-reid/>.
- “Professor Raewyn Connell.” *The University of Sydney School of Education and Social Work*. Last modified February 21, 2019.  
[http://sydney.edu.au/education\\_social\\_work/about/staff/profiles/raewyn.connell.php](http://sydney.edu.au/education_social_work/about/staff/profiles/raewyn.connell.php).
- “Robert L. Simon 1941-2018.” *The International Association for the Philosophy of Sport*. Last modified June 18, 2018. <https://iaps.net/uncategorized/robert-l-simon-1941-2018/>.
- Rosen, Brittany. “Female Hockey Players Devastated After League Folds.” *Global News*. Last modified April 8, 2019. <https://globalnews.ca/news/5141928/female-hockey-players-react-cwhl-folds/>.
- Rutherford, Kristina. “Making it in China.” *Sportsnet*. Last modified 2018.  
<https://www.sportsnet.ca/hockey/nhl/cwhl-china-hockey-krs-vanke-shenzhen/>.
- “School of Education: Dr Bonnie Slade.” *University of Glasgow*. Last modified 2019.  
<https://www.gla.ac.uk/schools/education/staff/bonnieslade/#/biography,researchinterests,grants,supervision,teaching,publications,articles,books,booksections>.
- Schellenberg, Carolyn. “In the Absence of Body Checking.” *The Manitoban*. Last modified January 25, 2015. <http://www.themanitoban.com/2015/01/absence-body-checking/22427/>.
- Shakespeare, Tom. “Antonio Gramsci: The Dead Man on Holiday.” *BBC*. Last modified October 14, 2009.  
[http://www.bbc.co.uk/ouch/features/antonio\\_gramsci\\_the\\_dead\\_man\\_on\\_holiday.shtml](http://www.bbc.co.uk/ouch/features/antonio_gramsci_the_dead_man_on_holiday.shtml).
- Sportaccord. “Global Association of Sports Federation.” Last modified October 2, 2018.  
<https://gaisf.sport>.

- Price, Satchel. "Canadian Women's Hockey League Expanding to China Next Season." *The Ice Garden*. Last modified June 5, 2017.  
<https://www.sbnation.com/2017/6/5/15743370/cwhl-womens-hockey-china-expansion-franchise-2017>.
- "Pussy." *Oxford Dictionary*. Last modified January 25, 2019.  
<https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/pussy>.
- "Tamar Z Semerjian, Ph.D." *San José State University*. Last modified February 18, 2019,  
<http://www.sjsu.edu/kinesiology/contacts-1/Profiles/Semerjian>.
- "Todd Was Wrong." *CBC Sports*. Last modified March 15, 2004.  
<https://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/todd-was-wrong-don-cherry-1.482223>.
- "Top 10 Canadian Newspapers." *Agility PR Solution*. Last modified January 2019.  
<https://www.agilitypr.com/resources/top-media-outlets/top-10-canadian-print-outlets/>.
- Voepel, Mechelle. "WNBA Taps CEO Englebert as 1<sup>st</sup> Commissioner." *ESPN*. Last modified May 15, 2019. [https://www.espn.com/wnba/story/\\_/id/26754371/wnba-tabs-ceo-engelbert-1st-commissioner](https://www.espn.com/wnba/story/_/id/26754371/wnba-tabs-ceo-engelbert-1st-commissioner).
- Yaccato, Bruce. "All the Rage: Women's Hockey in Central Canada 1915-1920." *The Canadian Encyclopedia*. Last modified March 4, 2015.  
<https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/all-the-rage-womens-hockey-in-central-canada-19151920>.
- Yaccato, Bruce. "Albertine Lapensée." *The Canadian Encyclopedia*. Last modified March 4, 2015. <https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/albertine-lapensee>.
- Weijers, Dan. "Hedonism." *Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.  
<https://www.iep.utm.edu/hedonism/#SH3a>.
- Westhead, Rick. "BU Finds Former NHL Ewen Had CTE, Contradicting Earlier Findings." *TSN*. Last modified November 30, 2018. <https://www.tsn.ca/bu-finds-former-nhl-player-ewen-had-cte-contradicting-earlier-findings-1.1218836>.
- Winters, Amy. "Women Punch, Kick and Imagine Their Way into the MMA Narrative." *Fightland Blog, Vice Sports*. Last modified December 13, 2013.  
<http://fightland.vice.com/blog/women-punch-kick-and-imagine-their-way-into-the-mma-narrative>.
- "World Ranking." *International Ice Hockey Federation*. Last modified May 2019.  
<https://www.iihf.com/en/worldranking>.

“Workplace Safety.” *Government of Canada*. Last modified August 26, 2019.  
<https://www.canada.ca/en/employment-social-development/services/health-safety/workplace-safety.html#s02>.

### Documentaries

Claydon, Michael, dir. *Hockey, a People's History*. Season one, episode 10, “Reclaiming the Game.” Aired October 15, 2006, on CBC.  
[https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mTH3C6\\_unzU&index=11&list=PLuXuCOif7-UJpJHNBVb6ZwRCKg1gy8pKi](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mTH3C6_unzU&index=11&list=PLuXuCOif7-UJpJHNBVb6ZwRCKg1gy8pKi).

Cuttler, Marcy, dir. *Hockey, a People's History*. Season one, episode 8 “Hope and Betrayal.” Aired October 8, 2006, on CBC.  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=l0rO1o4oPb8&list=PLuXuCOif7-UJpJHNBVb6ZwRCKg1gy8pKi&index=9>.

Polsky, Gabe, dir. *Red Army*. 2014; United States: Sony Pictures Home Entertainment, 2014. Blu-Ray DVD.

Slaght, Margaret, dir. *Hockey, a People's History*. Season one, episode 9 “Winter of Discontent.” Aired October 15, 2006, on CBC.  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RivFmrtUwkA&frags=pl%2Cwn>.

### Miscellaneous/Other

Dryden, Ken. *The Current*. By Anna Maria Tremonti. 99.1 CBC Radio One, October 17, 2017.  
<https://www.cbc.ca/radio/thecurrent/the-current-for-october-16-2017-1.4354024/concussions-affect-a-life-ken-dryden-wants-hockey-rules-changed-to-save-players-lives-1.4354030>.

Malone, Jennie. *Western Mustangs 6 vs Laurentian Voyageurs 0 (All- Women's Broadcast)*. Rachael Bishop, Emily Renneberg, Emma Jones. Radio Western. January 12, 2019. Radio Broadcast. 2:16:27. <https://soundcloud.com/chrwradio/western-mustangs-6-vs-laurentian-voyageurs-0-all-womens-broadcast>.

Sportsnet, dir. *NHL on Sportsnet*. “Todd Bertuzzi Sucker Punches Steve Moore- Full Incident (High Quality)”. Aired March 8, 2004 on Sportsnet,  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9yxMbWlnWV8>.

TSN, dir. *SportsCentre*. “The Todd Bertuzzi vs Steve Moore Saga- TSN Feature (HD)”. Aired March 8, 2016 on TSN, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GEjdwIT6g7o>.



## Appendix

## Media Content Analysis Newspaper Frequency Table

Toronto Star	Globe and Mail	Total
<b>39 articles</b>	<b>47 articles</b>	<b>86 articles</b>

## Media Content Analysis Key Word/s Frequency Table

Women/Women's/Female	Canada/Canadian	United States/US/USA/American	Olympics	Blowout/lopsided/Routed	Skill	Manon Rhéaume	Hayley Wickenheiser
The Toronto Star: <b>290</b>	The Toronto Star: <b>156</b>	The Toronto Star: <b>85</b>	The Toronto Star: <b>105</b>	The Toronto Star: <b>2</b>	The Toronto Star: <b>9</b> (one of them in a negative context)	The Toronto Star: <b>26</b>	The Toronto Star: <b>21</b>
The Globe and Mail: <b>280</b>	The Globe and Mail: <b>276</b>	The Globe and Mail: <b>92</b>	The Globe and Mail: <b>115</b>	The Globe and Mail: <b>3</b>	The Globe and Mail: <b>8</b>	The Globe and Mail: <b>3</b>	The Globe and Mail: <b>68</b>
<b>Total: 570</b>	<b>Total: 432</b>	<b>Total: 177</b>	<b>Total: 220</b>	<b>Total: 5</b>	<b>Total 17</b>	<b>Total: 29</b>	<b>Total: 89</b>

## RACHAEL BISHOP

### SKILLS SUMMARY

- A self-directed, analytical individual with a passion for people, sports and women's rights
- Conscientious, reliable and hard-working with an energetic, outgoing personality
- Strong interpersonal and time management skills; relates well to people from diverse backgrounds

### WORK EXPERIENCE

#### June 2019-August

*Western University Research Assistant*

Research Assistant for Dr. Angela Schneider at Western University in London, Ontario.

- Edited documents from conferences,
- Helped create a portfolio of the conference information, including the document script and list of participants

#### Fall 2017—April 2019

*Western University Teaching Assistant*

Teaching Assistant in the Faculty of Health Sciences (Kinesiology) at Western University in London, Ontario

- Proctored in class exams as well as exams during the December and April exam periods
- Led one class a week (seminar class) and was responsible for grading the undergraduate seminars

#### Franco Canadian Goalie School & Inside the Mask Goalie School 2011— 2014

*Ice Hockey Goalie Instructor*

- Enthusiastic and passionate goaltending instructor
- Worked with boys and girls between the ages of seven and 16

### MEDIA EXPERIENCE

#### Radio Western: December 2017 to Current

*Sports Volunteer-Rinkside Reporter, Colour Analyst, and Play by play commentator*

- Developed live on-air Radio skills
- Used strong interview skills to conduct post-game videos with players and coaches as well as interviews via telephone

- Edited post-game interviews audio using Adobe Audition software
- Utilized my strong writing skills to write game recaps for the Radio Western website

### **Dalhousie Gazette: August 2016— April 2017**

#### *Sports Reporter*

- Responsible for interviewing players and coaches in between periods and after the games
- Utilized my strong writing skills to write game recaps for the Dalhousie Gazette website and print newspaper

## **EDUCATION**

### **Western University: September 2017 — Present**

- Completing a Master of Arts degree in Kinesiology — Sociocultural Studies

### **Dalhousie University: September 2013 — April 2017**

- Earned a four-year honours degree in Sociology
- Dean's list at Dalhousie University in April 2016 and April 2017 with a 3.8 GPA
- Completed academic exchange at the University of Liverpool, UK: January — June 2016
- Completed the Explore French Immersion Bursary Program at the Université du Québec à Montréal — June 2015

### **Parkdale Collegiate Institute: September 2009 — June 2013**

- Completed the International Baccalaureate Program

## **AWARDS AND CERTIFICATIONS**

### **Educational Awards**

- Academic scholarship to M.A. program at Western University, 2017 — 19

**October 2019**





