



Sacred Heart  
UNIVERSITY

Sacred Heart University  
**DigitalCommons@SHU**

---

School of Communication and Media Arts Faculty  
Publications

Communication and Media Arts (SCMA)

---

1990

## Materials

Sidney Gottlieb

*Sacred Heart University*, [gottliebs@sacredheart.edu](mailto:gottliebs@sacredheart.edu)

Follow this and additional works at: [http://digitalcommons.sacredheart.edu/media\\_fac](http://digitalcommons.sacredheart.edu/media_fac)

 Part of the [Curriculum and Instruction Commons](#), and the [Literature in English, British Isles Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Gottlieb, Sidney "Materials." *Approaches to Teaching the Metaphysical Poets*. Ed. S. Gottlieb. New York: Modern Language Association, 1990.

This Book Chapter is brought to you for free and open access by the Communication and Media Arts (SCMA) at DigitalCommons@SHU. It has been accepted for inclusion in School of Communication and Media Arts Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@SHU. For more information, please contact [ferribyp@sacredheart.edu](mailto:ferribyp@sacredheart.edu).

*Part One*

# MATERIALS

---

*Sidney Gottlieb*

---

## Editions

Many teachers find the choice of books for a course covering John Donne, George Herbert, Henry Vaughan, Richard Crashaw, and Andrew Marvell an agonizing decision, in part because of the inevitable compromises required. Teachers generally agree that the reading material in such a course should be comprehensive (either complete or including a substantial and representative selection of poems); well edited, with reliable texts, useful notes, and supplementary matter; and modernized (if at all) according to principles that are defensible and consistent and that do not disregard the shape, the arrangement, and the visual disposition or structure of the poems. That those high ideals are frequently met in individual volumes on each of the metaphysical poets is the cause for some celebration, but instructors cannot ask undergraduates to buy a full set of those increasingly expensive texts, especially for a course in which other books may be required. Anthologies provide a way out of the problem, but they raise as many problems as they resolve. Criticisms of anthologies in general as badly edited, cheaply printed, and idiosyncratically annotated have not disappeared completely, and those criticisms have been compounded by a new sensitivity to the role anthologies play in canon formation and canon restriction.

What follows is not an attempt to settle the implicit argument between those who (in the words of one colleague) “most certainly do not believe in using an anthology of seventeenth-century poetry” and those who, for one reason or another, choose to use an anthology. Nor is what follows a comprehensive list of all available editions and anthologies or a fully developed critical review of them. It is, rather, a brief description of those texts mentioned by respondents, including enough information to help instructors decide which texts suit their particular needs. (The focus is on paperback books, although some of the anthologies are hardbound.) The comments offered by the respondents are sometimes blunt, and I include them not to endorse or to damn a text but to give samples of the range of opinions.

For consistency and ease of reference, I modernize titles of works by the metaphysical poets—though this should not necessarily be taken as indicating that I prefer to teach from modernized texts. The spelling varies, however, in the individual essays in this volume; some contributors modernize spelling, others do not, according to the editions they prefer to use for teaching.

### *Individual Authors*

Instructors are fortunate to have a variety of Donne texts to choose from, a variety that diminishes considerably when we come to the other poets. Each

of the Donne editions has a particular attraction. Of the full collections, John T. Shawcross's *Complete Poetry of John Donne* is recommended by several respondents, especially because of its affordability and good notes. Some explanatory notes are inconveniently gathered at the end of the volume, but the notes beneath the poems are useful and occasionally provocative; the textual notes are particularly extensive and scrupulous. In *John Donne: The Complete English Poems* A. J. Smith uses modernized spelling, takes some liberties with the arrangement of the poems—the *Songs and Sonnets*, for example, are placed in alphabetical order—and is bolder than most other editors in making determinations about poems dubiously attributed to Donne. His main concern, Smith says, “is to make an old and difficult author as intelligible as is now possible to readers today” (15). He does so largely through a commentary covering more than three hundred pages.

The notes in C. A. Patrides's *Complete Poems of John Donne* are not as extensive, though they are certainly illuminating, but Patrides's edition contains features that may be especially useful for undergraduate readers. For example, Patrides includes a long critical introduction, touching briefly on Donne's metrics, conceits, dramatic devices, and lifelong concern for themes of love and death. Like Shawcross, Patrides includes a few elegies and commendatory poems on Donne but also reprints Alexander Pope's versions of “Satire 3” and “Satire 4.” And the forty-six page bibliography near the end is of interest not only to students but also to their teachers. The editions by Shawcross, Smith, and Patrides have collectively superseded Herbert J. C. Grierson's Oxford Standard Authors edition of *Donne: Poetical Works*, an offshoot of Grierson's pathbreaking textual work on Donne but lacking in critical annotations, which are essential in a modern student's text.

Of the editions of selected poetry by Donne, A. L. Clements's Norton Critical Edition, *John Donne's Poetry*, was the most popular with the respondents. Clements updates the punctuation, the spelling, and the capitalization, but, where an interpretive point is in question, he usually refers to the original in his textual notes. At first glance there seems to be an imbalance, as the poems take up only 100 pages of a 273-page book, but the selection is serviceable, including all the *Songs and Sonnets* and *Holy Sonnets*, seven elegies, “Satire 3,” *The First Anniversary*, *La Corona*, three religious hymns, several verse letters, and one epithalamium. The bulk of the volume is taken up with a valuable, though now somewhat dated, collection of critical essays: “Donne and Metaphysical Poetry,” “Donne's Love Poetry,” and “Donne's Divine Poems and the Anniversaries.” Clements includes the classic statements on those subjects by Dryden, Johnson, Coleridge, Grierson, and Eliot and modern commentaries by such critics as Cleanth Brooks, Joseph A. Mazzeo, Louis L. Martz, and Helen Gardner.

Marius Bewley's modernized edition *The Selected Poetry of Donne* does not have that critical apparatus, but it does contain a full introduction,

helpful notes, and a substantially broader selection than Clements's book, including all that the Clements volume contains and all the satires and elegies, *The Second Anniversary*, *The Progress of the Soul*, and other divine poems. Some respondents praised Frank J. Warnke's *John Donne: Poetry and Prose*, particularly because it is a reasonably priced paperback that contains both the poetry and a decent selection of prose, including the "Meditations" from *Devotions upon Emergent Occasions* and *Death's Duel* and two other sermons. That description also fits *John Donne: Selected Poetry and Prose*, edited by T. W. Craik and R. J. Craik, a modernized text that includes a generous variety of the secular and sacred poetry and six *Devotions* and extracts from ten sermons. The introduction, the commentary, and the notes are extensive and helpful.

Joseph H. Summers's *Selected Poetry of George Herbert* is long out of print but has been ably replaced by C. A. Patrides's edition, *The English Poems of George Herbert*, which was highly recommended by many respondents as a good teaching text with useful notes. Patrides reprints *The Temple* in full and the six poems that appear only in the Williams manuscript and the two sonnets to Herbert's mother printed in Izaak Walton's *Life of Herbert*. The introductory essay (focusing on the artful complexity just beneath Herbert's much-commented-on simplicity), short note on typography, the appendixes, and the full bibliography help make it a useful and attractive volume.

Gareth Reeves's *Selected Poems of George Herbert* suffers somewhat by comparison because it does not include *The Temple* in full: "The Church-Porch" and "The Church Militant" are excluded completely; since less than half of "The Church" is printed, the sequences and the patterns are inevitably disturbed. Reeves's introduction and commentary are extensive, though, and he also includes brief extracts from Herbert's prose work *The Country Parson*. The importance of that prose work and its relevance to *The Temple* is underscored by John N. Wall, Jr., as he includes both in their entirety (with modernized spelling and punctuation) in *George Herbert: The Country Parson, The Temple*. The second edition corrects the many errors of the imperfectly printed first edition but still makes no attempt to retain the original shape and line spacing of the poems, often a crucial aspect of Herbert's artistry. Wall's detailed introduction focuses on "the extent to which Herbert's didactic understanding of the priestly life underlies the contents" of his prose and poetry (27-28). Louis L. Martz's *George Herbert and Henry Vaughan* in the Oxford Authors series includes modernized texts of *The Temple*, supplementary poems, and *The Country Parson*. The convenience of having so much of Herbert and Vaughan (discussed below) in one volume, along with Martz's authoritative and detailed commentary, makes the edition extremely valuable.

Instructors have a few options in choosing an individual volume of Vaughan's poems. French Fogle's *Complete Poetry of Henry Vaughan* is

lightly annotated but carefully edited and printed to preserve the shape of the poems and the use of italics, often highly significant in Vaughan. Fogle includes translations of all the Latin poems (as well as the originals) and prints the full biblical text (in a footnote) on the many occasions when Vaughan gives a particular citation at the beginning or the end of a poem. Much more fully annotated is Alan Rudrum's *Henry Vaughan: The Complete Poems* which concludes with more than 260 pages of carefully documented, informative notes, backing up the prefatory claim that the book is "by far the most comprehensively annotated edition of Vaughan's poems yet to appear" (18). Rudrum modernizes the spelling but not the punctuation or the use of italics, and the edition is handsomely laid out and easy to read. Louis L. Martz's *George Herbert and Henry Vaughan* does not include all Vaughan's poetry, but it does contain a generous selection; there is nothing from *Olor Iscanus* and *Thalia Rediviva*, but both parts of *Silex Scintillans* (1650, 1655) are reprinted in their entirety, along with everything in Vaughan's earlier collection *Poems* (1646) except his translation of Juvenal's tenth satire. As in the Herbert section, the annotations on Vaughan are extensive, and Martz pays careful attention to alchemical imagery and allusions to both Herbert and the Bible.

At present, George Walton Williams's *Complete Poetry of Richard Crashaw* is the only comprehensive volume of Crashaw's poems readily available to students. The poems are lightly annotated but glossed by numerous informative headnotes and illustrations. Williams arranges the poems in two main sections, sacred and secular, and part of the reason the volume is so bulky (more than seven hundred pages long) is that he includes all Crashaw's poems and translations (alternative versions as well), the texts Crashaw translated, and prose translations of his poetic works in Latin and Greek.

The volume of Marvell's poems most frequently recommended by the respondents was Elizabeth Story Donno's *Andrew Marvell: The Complete English Poems*. Donno modernizes the spelling, while retaining the original punctuation, and arranges the poems in chronological order. English translations of the Latin and Greek poems are reprinted from the authoritative edition of William A. McQueen and Kiffin A. Rockwell. Donno's notes on the poems, gathered at the end of the volume, are extensive and helpful. George deF. Lord's *Andrew Marvell: Complete Poetry* arranges the poems in the following sections: "Lyric Poems," "The Cromwell Era," "The Era of Charles II," "Poets and Heroes," "Poems in Latin and Greek" (with a translation following each poem), and "Poems of Doubtful Authorship." Lord gives few notes for the lyrics, but he annotates the overtly political and satiric poems much more fully to clarify for modern readers the seventeenth-century events and characters Marvell anatomizes. Lord's introduction is a

substantive summary of Marvell's characteristic themes and techniques, but his one-page bibliography basically lists only other editions and fails to steer the reader to any helpful critical works. Robert Wilcher's *Andrew Marvell: Selected Poetry and Prose* includes a substantive introduction, a selected bibliography, a critical commentary, and notes. Modernized texts of the poems are supplemented by a thirty-six-page sampling of Marvell's prose, including a few letters.

### *Anthologies*

Anthologies are an area of great concern, even a sore spot. Some respondents were adamant; one insisted, "I *never* use anthologies, especially about the metaphysical poets," and some complained that anthology selections are often skimpy, stale, or otherwise hard to work with. Other respondents were simply frustrated, asserting that no completely satisfactory anthology of metaphysical poetry is in print. But many respondents were more pleased with current anthologies, valuing them for their convenience, availability, and reasonable cost. Anthologies can carve up authors, leaving behind apparently permanent monuments of their greatest hits; but, some argue, anthologies can also help contextualize literary works (as opposed to single-author volumes, which may emphasize individuality) and effectively fulfill their purpose as *introductions* to a variety of authors.

The debate has by no means been resolved, but the survey of instructors showed that anthologies covering the metaphysical poets are used frequently. The most popular anthology among the respondents is volume 1 of *The Norton Anthology of English Literature* (gen. ed. Abrams). Some respondents said that they use it only because of departmental mandate and despite its poor notes and conservative canon, but it also received much praise as the best textbook available for such courses. The section "The Early Seventeenth Century (1603–1660)," edited by Robert M. Adams and George M. Logan, opens with an essay largely on the historical context and literary crosscurrents, and each author's section is introduced by a brief biographical headnote. Donne's *Songs and Sonnets* are fairly well represented by twenty poems, and the selection also includes two elegies, "Satire 3," "The Storm," *The First Anniversary* in full, nine poems from *Holy Sonnets*, "Good Friday, 1613," three hymns, three prose meditations, and one sermon. (Other sections of the volume contain brief extracts from Izaak Walton's *Life of Donne* and Johnson's "Life of Cowley.") The selections from Herbert have increased from previous editions and now total twenty-three poems, all from "The Church." Vaughan is represented by "A Rhapsody" and eight poems from *Silex Scintillans*. Crashaw is represented by seven poems, including "In the Holy Nativity of Our Lord God," "To . . . the Countesse of Den-

high," "The Flaming Heart," and four brief sacred epigrams. The metaphysical side of Marvell is captured in the thirteen poems selected from his works, but only "An Horatian Ode" stands in for the political verse that occupied much of his time. All the texts are modernized, and the annotations and appended brief bibliographies are helpful. Although readers will always complain about the light, somewhat transparent paper it is printed on, the *Norton Anthology* fulfills its aim of introducing students "to the excellence and variety of English literature" by presenting "accurate and readable texts" (xxix).

Nearly as popular with the respondents is *Seventeenth-Century Prose and Poetry*, edited by Alexander M. Witherspoon and Frank K. Warnke. This classic text (the first version dates back to 1929) provoked some serious criticism, including complaints that "the notes are inadequate, the modernizations are dubious, and the selections are dated" and that the book is "bad, bowdlerized, unperceptive." But praise for the anthology outweighed those comments, and it was described as "the best available," "convenient, cheap, comprehensive," and the "standard" text for the period. Its double-column format is growing increasingly unpopular, but only that layout and the decision to keep the notes at a minimum allowed a great deal of material to fit one volume. The selections from Donne include thirty-three poems from *Songs and Sonnets*, six elegies, "Satire 3," one verse letter, ten poems from *Holy Sonnets*, "Good Friday, 1613," and three hymns. In the prose section, Witherspoon and Warnke also print thirteen meditations, three complete sermons, extracts from twenty-two other sermons, and Walton's *Life of Donne*. The selections from Herbert include thirty-eight poems from "The Church," sections from "The Church-Porch," two sonnets to his mother, and brief extracts from *The Country Parson*, along with a substantial part of Walton's *Life of Herbert*. Vaughan is represented by twenty-six poems (all but one from *Silex Scintillans*), Crashaw by nine, and Marvell by sixteen, including an extract from "Upon Appleton House." The editors have modernized the texts, included brief headnotes and bibliographies, and compiled a useful "Critical Miscellany" as an appendix, gathering brief but important essays and comments by such critics as Samuel Johnson, T. S. Eliot, Morris Croll, Austin Warren, Louis L. Martz, Joseph A. Mazzeo, and Frank J. Warnke.

The respondents found much to praise in the Renaissance section of *The Oxford Anthology of English Literature*, edited by Frank Kermode and John Hollander. More than the Norton anthology and the Witherspoon and Warnke edition, the Oxford text (modernized throughout) offers extensive annotations, a detailed glossary, and a particularly attractive series of illustrations, including paintings, emblems, and engravings. Respondents noted that the "visuals are useful in teaching," the "notes are excellent," and the



selections are “comprehensive,” offering “ample enough materials for the student to browse in.” The Donne section contains one of his paradoxes (from *Juvenilia*), two elegies, twenty poems from *Songs and Sonnets*, “Satire 3,” part of *The Second Anniversary* (lines 254–300), six poems from *Holy Sonnets*, “Good Friday, 1613,” two hymns, two meditations, and one sermon; the section on prose contains part of Walton’s *Life of Donne*. Nineteen poems by Herbert (rearranged freely), seven by Vaughan, six by Crashaw (including parts of “The Flaming Heart”), and twelve by Marvell (including a long section from “Upon Appleton House,” 369–568) also appear in the Oxford anthology.

Mario A. Di Cesare’s Norton Critical Edition *George Herbert and the Seventeenth-Century Religious Poets* does not attempt to be as comprehensive as the previously mentioned anthologies: it does not include Donne (although it has a section on Thomas Traherne), and, while it contains some secular poems by Crashaw and Marvell, the focus is on religious verse. Respondents were particularly pleased by the carefully edited and modernized texts, “sensible and restrained footnotes,” and “good critical section.” Furthermore, Di Cesare’s suggestion that within seventeenth-century poetry there is a “school of Herbert” to be reckoned with neatly complements much current critical work. The anthology contains a large selection of poems by Herbert—eighty from “The Church” (although nothing from “The Church-Porch” or “The Church Militant”) and the two sonnets from Walton’s *Lives*—along with forty-five poems from Vaughan’s *Silex Scintillans*, sixteen poems by Crashaw, and eighteen by Marvell (including “Upon Appleton House” in full). Unlike many other Norton Critical Editions, the commentary section here focuses almost exclusively on modern criticism, and Di Cesare has compiled a useful collection of essays, including at least three on every poet in the anthology and an introductory overview by Anthony Low, “Metaphysical Poets and Devotional Poets.”

Among other texts mentioned less frequently in the responses to the survey, Louis L. Martz’s *English Seventeenth-Century Verse* (vol. 1) was the first choice of several instructors, but that excellent collection is now out of print. Of the hardcover comprehensive texts, *Seventeenth-Century Verse and Prose* (vol. 1)—edited by Helen C. White, Ruth C. Wallerstein, Ricardo Quintana, and A. B. Chambers—was adopted by a number of teachers, as were two paperback collections: Hugh Kenner’s *Seventeenth-Century Poetry: The Schools of Donne and Jonson*, recommended because it covers both groups of poems, and Helen Gardner’s *The Metaphysical Poets*, because it is inexpensive and has an adequate selection of the religious poetry of Donne, Herbert, Crashaw, Vaughan, and Marvell and samples from other seventeenth-century poets.

## Required and Recommended Readings for Students

Many of the instructors surveyed do not regularly assign supplementary readings; one observed, "Even in my upper level courses I am somewhat dubious of secondary reading." Because of time constraints within a semester and perhaps a lingering New Criticism orientation, some respondents said that they urged students to concentrate on the primary texts. But others offered detailed bibliographies to their students, sometimes assigning, sometimes simply recommending a core of readings that are accessible (although not always easy) and important introductions to Donne, Herbert, Vaughan, Crashaw, and Marvell. The majority of the works mentioned below contain discussions of or are otherwise relevant to all those poets, but I conclude with a few titles that focus specifically on them individually. For ease of reference I occasionally use a book's short title, but the complete title is given in "Works Cited" at the end of this volume.

For supplementary readings, instructors often turn first to classical or contemporary primary sources. Not many were as ambitious as one respondent, who required two book reports from each student on such topics as the *Canzoniere*, Martial, Juvenal, Horace, Persius, Sidney's poems, More's epigrams, Heywood's epigrams, Augustine on altars, Thomas Vaughan's works, recusant prose, classical eclogues, and various church fathers. But most respondents agreed that students should be acquainted with the Authorized Version of the Bible (especially the Book of Psalms), the Book of Common Prayer, samples of Petrarchan poems, and perhaps Continental models of metaphysical poetry (easily available in Frank J. Warnke's anthology *European Metaphysical Poetry*). Regarding secondary sources, many instructors wanted their students to read the two classic statements on metaphysical poetry, Samuel Johnson's comments in his "Life of Cowley" and T. S. Eliot's in his essay "The Metaphysical Poets." The one indispensable reference work is the *Oxford English Dictionary*, often used as the basis of an assignment (see Steven Marx's essay in this volume) or in tandem with demonstrations of the complexity of metaphysical and other forms of wit found in such studies as William Empson's *Seven Types of Ambiguity* and Cleanth Brooks's *Well-Wrought Urn*.

For general historical background, students may consult the following: Christopher Hill's *Century of Revolution, 1603-1714*, Godfrey Davies's *Early Stuarts, 1603-1660*, and G. P. V. Akrigg's *Jacobean Pageant*. Studies that consider early seventeenth-century poetry in the light of contemporary events and conditions include Cecily Veronica Wedgwood's *Poetry and Politics under the Stuarts*, Julia Briggs's *This Stage-Play World: English Literature and Its Background, 1580-1625*, and Graham Parry's

*Seventeenth-Century Poetry: The Social Context*. Three books in particular were recommended as introductions to the basic intellectual framework of the seventeenth century: E. M. W. Tillyard's *Elizabethan World Picture*, Basil Willey's *Seventeenth-Century Background*, and Louis I. Bredvold's *Intellectual Milieu of John Dryden*. But some instructors found those texts (particularly Tillyard) too dated, conservative, and misleading, and they recommended that their students become acquainted with the way the seventeenth-century world picture is repainted in such books as Stephen Greenblatt's *Renaissance Self-Fashioning* and Jonathan Dollimore's *Radical Tragedy*. Less contentious is Isabel Rivers's *Classical and Christian Ideas in English Renaissance Poetry*, which defines and explores key topics (such as cosmology, Protestantism, humanism, and allegory) in readable analytic essays, well-chosen extracts from primary sources, and a briefly annotated bibliography. The eleven essays in *The Age of Milton*, edited by C. A. Patrides and Raymond B. Waddington, can be consulted individually or collectively for information about such topics as seventeenth-century theology, science, fine arts, education, and politics.

Several literary histories were recommended as especially useful for students: Douglas Bush's *English Literature in the Earlier Seventeenth Century, 1600–1660* is magisterial; George Parfitt's *English Poetry of the Seventeenth Century* contains many fine insights but may be somewhat difficult for a student to consult for information on a particular poet because it is arranged by genre; and *From Donne to Marvell*, volume 3 of *The New Pelican Guide to English Literature*, edited by Boris Ford, is handy, wide-ranging, and inexpensive, though occasionally in need of updating. The two critical studies most highly recommended as essential were Louis L. Martz's *Poetry of Meditation* and Barbara Kiefer Lewalski's *Protestant Poetics and the Seventeenth-Century Religious Lyric*. Some instructors even suggested that the contrast between Martz's focus on the legacy of Catholic meditative techniques and Lewalski's emphasis on distinctively Protestant texts and techniques can be the basis of student essays or class discussions. Other critical studies recommended as helpful for students include Joan Bennett's *Five Metaphysical Poets*, A. Alvarez's *School of Donne*, Anthony Low's book *Love's Architecture*, and Earl Miner's *Metaphysical Mode from Donne to Cowley*. As indicated above, instructors who use Witherspoon and Warneke or one of the Norton Critical Editions frequently assign critical essays contained therein; William R. Keast's collection of modern essays in criticism, *Seventeenth-Century English Poetry*, was also praised as comprehensive and convenient.

The following studies, each focusing on an individual poet, were recommended as useful for students. The respondents noted that Walton's *Life of Donne* provides an important introduction, which some felt may be supple-

mented by John Carey's controversial *John Donne: Life, Mind, and Art*. Frank J. Warnke's Twayne volume on Donne provides an uncontroversial brief introduction to the life and works. James Winny's *Preface to Donne* is lively and well-illustrated. Two fine anthologies of criticism on Donne are out of print but usually available in libraries: *John Donne*, edited by Helen Gardner, in the Twentieth-Century Views series and *Discussions of John Donne*, edited by Frank Kermode.

For Herbert, the respondents overwhelmingly named Joseph H. Summers's *George Herbert: His Religion and Art* as the best place to begin a study of his life and works. Stanley Stewart's *George Herbert* in the Twayne series avoids, rather than emulates, the bland objectivity that surfaces in many of the other volumes in that series and presents an interesting argument for a less "Protestant" Herbert than many modern critics envision. Several respondents also admitted rather mischievously that they like to liven up class discussions by assigning readings from Stanley E. Fish's section on Herbert in *Self-Consuming Artifacts* or Barbara Leah Harman's *Costly Monuments: Representations of the Self in George Herbert's Poetry*. There is the Twayne series volume *Henry Vaughan* by Kenneth Friedenreich, but Jonathan F. S. Post's *Henry Vaughan: The Unfolding Vision* is equally accessible and more authoritative. Readers studying Crashaw are steered toward Austin Warren's *Richard Crashaw*, a fine biographical and critical study. Finally, George deF. Lord's Twentieth-Century Views series volume *Andrew Marvell* (out of print but widely available in libraries) contains highly recommended essays by T. S. Eliot and Joseph H. Summers among various other selections and provides a useful starting point for the study of that elusive poet. (The section "The Instructor's Library" lists many other general and specialized studies that a student can consult when doing more extensive work in the area.)

## Aids to Teaching

Many instructors were enthusiastic about the results of integrating audiovisual materials into their courses: as one respondent explained, "Students are so visual these days that it really helps to work through a visual medium, especially for undergraduates." In addition, critics have repeatedly stressed the importance of audiovisual dimensions in the metaphysical poets. Much attention, for example, has been paid to Donne's meditative composition of place, Herbert's interest in music and emblematic devices, Vaughan's visual descriptions of moments of illumination, Crashaw's debt to baroque art, and Marvell's emblems and complex use of voices in poetic dialogues and debates. The instructors sometimes exposed students to those contexts by requiring or recommending secondary sources, such as the following: Wylie Sypher's *Four Stages of Renaissance Style* and Arnold Hauser's *Mannerism: The Crisis of the Renaissance and the Origin of Modern Art* on contemporary painting, John Hollander's *Untuning of the Sky: Ideas of Music in English Poetry, 1500–1700*, Ernest B. Gilman's *Curious Perspective: Literary and Pictorial Wit in the Seventeenth Century*, Louis L. Martz's *Poetry of Meditation*, Barbara Kiefer Lewalski's well-illustrated discussion of Protestant emblematics in *Protestant Poetics and the Seventeenth-Century Religious Lyric*, Rosemond Tuve's iconographic *Reading of George Herbert*, and Marc F. Bertolasco's *Crashaw and the Baroque*.

More frequently, though, instructors work in class with primary sources. The respondents mentioned many visual aids, including some easily overlooked, such as the blackboard; one instructor wrote, "As simple as this seems, I have found that attempting to draw metaphysical conceits in front of the class is most effective." In addition, slides, prints of sixteenth- and seventeenth-century paintings, photographs of sculpture and architecture, and facsimiles of emblem books are helpful in suggesting backgrounds for or analogues of figurative expressions by the poets. One instructor used "slides of anamorphic paintings to get students to think about illusion in metaphysical poetry" and noted that "slides of baroque architecture, juxtaposed with slides of classical buildings, have worked well in encouraging students to think about metaphysical conceits." Teaching Crashaw in particular almost necessitates the use of visual aids, and various respondents noted that they used illustrations of Bernini's sculptures to help communicate to students some concept of the emotional force, deliberate asymmetry, and heavy reliance on illusion that characterize Crashaw's baroque artistry. Other instructors used portraits and photographs of estates and houses to give students a view of seventeenth-century men, women, and places. And a short animated film, *Damon the Mower*—made by George Dunning, the cartoon artist more widely known for his pop-art film *The Yellow Submarine*—is based on a Marvell poem.

Many metaphysical poems are meant to be scripts for astonishing rhetorical, dramatic, or musical performances, and instructors frequently read poems out loud in class, ask their students to read aloud, or play selections from the records and cassettes currently available. Perhaps the best known and most highly recommended record is Richard Burton's reading of poems by Donne, but also useful are the Caedmon recordings *Sermons and Meditations of John Donne* by Herbert Marshall and *Metaphysical Poetry* by Cedric Hardwicke and Robert Newton, which excludes Donne but includes (among others) eight poems by Herbert, three by Vaughan, and two each by Crashaw and Marvell. One instructor emphasized music, even inviting "a musicologist to give a lecture on the development of music during this period." Others examined musical settings for lyrical poems and played samples of contemporary music, such as Dowland lute songs. Instructors looking for information on music and metaphysical poetry may consult recent scholarly works by Louise Schleiner and Paul L. Gaston, which contain much information on seventeenth- and twentieth-century settings of poems by Herbert and Donne in particular.

Other audiovisual teaching aids vary in usefulness. Such television series as Jacob Bronowski's *Ascent of Man* and Kenneth Clark's *Civilisation*, available in many university and public libraries, contain sections that may help acquaint students with the intellectual and aesthetic concerns of the Renaissance and the seventeenth century. The Films for the Humanities videocassette *Milton and Seventeenth-Century Poetry* (virtually identical to their filmstrip of the same title) concentrates on the metaphysical poets, Milton, and the epic, but it is somewhat sketchy. Far more useful and informative are the Audio Learning cassettes containing discussions of metaphysical poetry (by Paulina Palmer and Paul Merchant), Herbert and Marvell (Palmer and Merchant), Donne's poetry (Barbara Hardy and A. J. Smith) and seventeenth-century literature, including a general overview of metaphysical poetry and a particular analysis of Donne and Marvell (Frank Kermode and A. J. Smith). Students are often willing to supplement class discussions and reading assignments with those interesting tapes.

The above paragraphs provide just a brief summary of the many teaching aids that may prove helpful in a course including Donne, Herbert, Vaughan, Crashaw, and Marvell. Further information can be found not only in the detailed list of books in the following section, "The Instructor's Library," but also in several essays in the section "Approaches." The importance of imaginative immersion into seventeenth-century life is discussed by both P. G. Stanwood and E. R. Gregory, and the essays by Albert C. Labriola, Huston Diehl, Faye Pauli Whitaker, Nicholas Jones, and John R. Roberts emphasize the centrality of visual- and aural-performance contexts for a full understanding of the metaphysical poets.

## The Instructor's Library

What follows is not a comprehensive bibliography or an evaluatively annotated list of essential secondary sources—a judgment that varies a great deal from one instructor to another. Instead, I am simply providing an overview of some of the material available on the metaphysical poets, both collectively and individually, that may be particularly useful to teachers and serious students. The focus is on book-length works recommended by the respondents to the questionnaire, but I have not hesitated to supplement the titles in a few places, especially to broaden the list in categories not covered specifically by the questionnaire. For ease of reference, each of the sections below first discusses general studies and then goes on to discuss works on the individual poets.

### Reference Works

The dramatic increase in scholarly and critical studies of the metaphysical poets since the 1920s is well documented in a number of specialized bibliographies, including Theodore Spencer and Mark Van Doren's *Studies in Metaphysical Poetry: Two Essays and a Bibliography* (covering up to 1939), Lloyd E. Berry's continuation, *A Bibliography of Studies in Metaphysical Poetry, 1939–1960*, and Arthur E. Barker's Goldentree Bibliography *The Seventeenth Century: Bacon through Marvell*, which is particularly useful because it lists many background studies, as well as works on individual authors. Also helpful are Douglas Bush's bibliographical listings in his *English Literature in the Earlier Seventeenth Century* and the relevant sections of A. E. Dyson's *English Poetry: Select Bibliographical Guides*. Much briefer but handy, especially because of its brevity, is John T. Shawcross's summary "Research and the State of Studies in Seventeenth-Century British Literature (1600–1660)."

In addition to consulting those comprehensive surveys, readers may want to turn to more detailed bibliographies for each individual poet. John R. Roberts's *John Donne: An Annotated Bibliography of Modern Criticism, 1912–1967* and *John Donne: An Annotated Bibliography of Modern Criticism, 1968–1978* are carefully researched and easy to use. Equally authoritative is Roberts's revised and expanded *George Herbert: An Annotated Bibliography of Modern Criticism, 1905–1984*. Readers looking for a less extensive survey will find a valuable resource in Jerry Leath Mills's "Recent Studies in Herbert," which was updated in a separate essay in the same series by Robert H. Ray. A full bibliography for Vaughan is available in E. L. Marilla's *Comprehensive Bibliography of Henry Vaughan* and E. L. Marilla

and James D. Simmonds's *Henry Vaughan: A Bibliographical Supplement, 1946-1960*. "Recent Studies in Henry Vaughan" by Robert E. Bourdette, Jr., provides a helpful brief overview. Crashaw is well served by John R. Roberts's *Richard Crashaw: An Annotated Bibliography of Criticism, 1632-1980* and Albert R. Cirillo's "Recent Studies in Crashaw." Dan S. Collins's *Andrew Marvell: A Reference Guide* is fully annotated and comprehensive, but Gillian Szanto's "Recent Studies in Marvell" is still a welcome guide.

For up-to-date references, readers should consult annual bibliographies, such as the *MLA International Bibliography, Year's Work in English Studies*, and the Modern Humanities Research Association's *Annual Bibliography of English Language and Literature*. Many scholarly journals regularly publish essays on the metaphysical poets, but a few specialize in the area: each Winter issue of *Studies in English Literature* contains essays on Renaissance and seventeenth-century authors and a lengthy review essay surveying the previous year's books in the field; *English Literary Renaissance* contains essays, texts, and bibliographical articles in a series titled "Recent Studies in the English Renaissance"; *Seventeenth-Century News* prints book reviews, notes, and abstracts of articles; *The Seventeenth Century* covers literature, history, theology, and philosophy, among many other subjects; and both the *John Donne Journal* and the *George Herbert Journal* include essays, notes, and reviews on a broader range of seventeenth-century topics than their titles indicate.

The one indisputably essential reference work for linguistic studies of the metaphysical poets is the *Oxford English Dictionary*. More detailed analyses are facilitated by concordances available for each poet: by Homer C. Combs and Zay R. Sullens for Donne, Mario A. Di Cesare and Rigo Mignani for Herbert, Imilda Tuttle for Vaughan's *Silex Scintillans*, Robert M. Cooper for Crashaw, and George R. Guffey for Marvell.

### ***Background Studies and Critical Works***

Some modern critics suggest that the notion of a background is more problematic than was previously believed. Indeed, it is often difficult to determine what constitutes a legitimate background and to analyze a fluid and complicated relation between text and context. In addition, researchers in metaphysical poetry should also bear in mind a somewhat more mundane reminder: the metaphysical age spans a long time, from Donne's birth in 1572 to Vaughan's death in 1695. The general studies listed below, therefore, apply unequally to the individual poets.

It would take a lifetime to master the historical works on the period, but a variety of useful and comprehensive introductions are available. Godfrey



Davies's *Early Stuarts, 1603–1660* and George N. Clark's *Later Stuarts, 1660–1714*, both part of the Oxford History of England series, are thorough and contain detailed bibliographies. Christopher Hill, in some respects the controversial dean of historians of seventeenth-century England, emphasizes economic developments and corresponding shifts in social relations in *The Century of Revolution, 1603–1714* and in the many important specialized studies collected in *Puritanism and Revolution* and *Society and Puritanism in Pre-Revolutionary England*. Conrad Russell's *Crisis of Parliaments: English History 1509–1660* surveys the growing and ultimately mismanaged tensions culminating in the Civil War, and David Ogg covers the post-Restoration period in overwhelming detail in *England in the Reign of Charles II* and *England in the Reign of James II and William III*. A general reader may not want to get mired in the often bitter controversies among historians over various seventeenth-century topics (the nature of parliament, the rise of the gentry, the causes of the Civil War, and so on), but it is helpful to know something about the current debate over revisionist interpretations of the period, summarized concisely (but with full references) by Christopher Hill in "Parliament and People in Seventeenth-Century England" (*Collected Essays* 3: 21–67). Each of the above historical works rewrites but does not replace several classics of seventeenth-century history still worth consulting: Samuel R. Gardiner's *History of England from the Accession of James I to the Outbreak of the Civil War* and G. M. Trevelyan's *England under the Stuarts*.

Studies of the social history of the period focused for a long time on the court and the nobility, and such works as G. P. V. Akrigg's *Jacobean Pageant: Or, The Court of King James I* and Lawrence Stone's *Crisis of the Aristocracy, 1558–1641* continue to be important. But the tremendous increase in attention to local history and the conditions and the culture of lower- and middle-class men and women has substantially broadened our view of seventeenth-century life. Louis B. Wright's literature-based *Middle-Class Culture in Elizabethan England* is a pioneering work in the field, and both Lawrence Stone's *Family, Sex and Marriage in England 1500–1800* and Richard L. Greaves's *Society and Religion in Elizabethan England* provide an extraordinary amount of material on the manners, habits, customs, and beliefs of the time. The title of Keith Thomas's great work *Religion and the Decline of Magic* does not capture the extent to which it is an encyclopedic work of social history.

Studies of intellectual history are particularly important for poets known to have ransacked many realms of human knowledge for words, images, and themes, some of which may be foreign to the modern mind. A number of works focus on the medieval heritage of the Renaissance mind; they include E. M. W. Tillyard's *Elizabethan World Picture*, A. O. Lovejoy's *Great*

*Chain of Being*, and C. S. Lewis's *Discarded Image*. C. A. Patrides gives a handy introduction to a dozen recurrent topics (such as the cessation of oracles, numerology, and the order of angels) in *Premises and Motifs in Renaissance Thought and Literature*. Renaissance psychology and the place of human beings in the created world are surveyed in J. B. Bamborough's *Little World of Man* and Theodore Spencer's *Shakespeare and the Nature of Man*. Perry Miller's *New England Mind* presents information about the old England mind as well, John R. Mulder's *Temple of the Mind* contains a brief introduction to the rhetorical and logical habits reinforced by seventeenth-century education, and Rosalie Colie focuses on contradiction and contrariety in *Paradoxia Epidemica: The Renaissance Tradition of Paradox*. The pivotal place of the seventeenth century in the transition from an aural-oral culture to a print culture is examined in Elizabeth L. Eisenstein's *Printing Press as an Agent of Change* and Walter J. Ong's *Presence of the Word and Interfaces of the Word*. Among the volumes that survey a variety of backgrounds, the following are especially useful: Isabel Rivers's *Classical and Christian Ideas in English Renaissance Poetry*, Joseph A. Mazzeo's *Renaissance and Revolution: Backgrounds to Seventeenth-Century Literature*, Basil Willey's *Seventeenth-Century Background*, Louis I. Bredvold's *Intellectual Milieu of John Dryden*, and *The Age of Milton*, edited by C. A. Patrides and Raymond B. Waddington.

Within the history of ideas relevant to the metaphysical poets, studies of science are particularly important. The effects of the new science on a firmament of Christian humanism and optimism are examined in Herschel Baker's *Dignity of Man and The Wars of Truth*, Victor Harris's *All Coherence Gone*, R. F. Jones's *Ancients and Moderns*, and Marjorie Hope Nicolson's *Breaking of the Circle*. Although they do not discuss literature and science, the following books present information about seventeenth-century scientific developments: Thomas S. Kuhn's *Copernican Revolution*, Alexander Koyré's *From the Closed World to the Infinite Cosmos*, and A. A. Wolf's *History of Science, Technology, and Philosophy in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries*. Christopher Hill focuses on science and social transformations in *Intellectual Origins of the English Revolution*, as does Charles Webster in *The Great Instauration: Science, Medicine, and Reform, 1626–1660*.

The above general studies of the historical and intellectual contexts of the seventeenth century continue to be influential, but they are in the process of being reevaluated and, more than occasionally, attacked by some modern scholars and critics who focus on new sources of information (history from below, rather than from above, for example), challenge the notion of a basic unity and coherence in any seventeenth-century system of ideas, and analyze how poems often subtly undermine the ideology and the social relations they seem to celebrate. Cecily Veronica Wedgwood's *Poetry and*

*Politics under the Stuarts* and Jonathan Goldberg's *James I and the Politics of Literature* adopt radically different critical methods—Wedgwood is in most respects a traditional historian, and Goldberg writes under the spell of postmodern theories of textual indeterminacy—but both provide compelling evidence that even the court culture commissioned by or aimed at the king was shot through with subversion and discontent. Goldberg's *Voice Terminal Echo* is less directly concerned with historical matters but contains essays on Herbert and Marvell, among others, written from a poststructuralist perspective that he acknowledges is combative and controversial, as well as vital. Annabel M. Patterson's *Censorship and Interpretation* stresses that the pressures of censorship (surely very strong in the seventeenth century) greatly influenced not only what writers did not write about but also the peculiar language and the structures of what they did write about. Her notion that allegory and obscurity are political, as well as stylistic, strategies offers a new way of studying metaphysical wit. Christopher Hill also examines the political restrictions on writers caused by ecclesiastical and governmental censorship in volume 1 of his *Collected Essays*, which contains studies of Vaughan, Marvell, and many other seventeenth-century authors.

Other valuable books include Raymond Williams's *Country and the City*, David Norbrook's *Poetry and Politics in the English Renaissance*, Guy Fitch Lytle and Stephen Orgel's collection of essays *Patronage in the Renaissance*, and Leah Sinanoglou Marcus's *Politics of Mirth*. Arguably the two most provocative and influential recent studies in the field do not discuss metaphysical poetry directly but are being used as models for new studies of Donne, Herbert, and Marvell in particular: Stephen Greenblatt's *Renaissance Self-Fashioning* brilliantly examines the many countervailing forces that lie behind the difficult task of creating a poetic and public career; and Jonathan Dollimore's *Radical Tragedy*, though it focuses primarily on drama, contains an extensive critique of such "essentialist" works as Tillyard's *Elizabethan World Picture* and suggests that the great writers of the time questioned or subverted the ideology Tillyard champions. The variety of historical approaches to late sixteenth- and seventeenth-century literature and culture is displayed in four collections of essays: *The Historical Renaissance: New Essays on Tudor and Stuart Literature and Culture*, edited by Heather Dubrow and Richard Strier; *Renaissance Historicism: Selections from English Literary Renaissance*, edited by Arthur F. Kinney and Dan S. Collins; *"The Muses Common-Weale": Poetry and Politics in the Seventeenth Century*, edited by Claude J. Summers and Ted-Larry Pebworth; and *Politics of Discourse: The Literature and History of Seventeenth-Century England*, edited by Kevin Sharpe and Steven N. Zwicker. Taken together, those volumes confirm that the "old" historicism is not dead but is capable of remarkable flexibility and revision and that the "new" historicism is alive and well and is anything but monolithic or dogmatic.

As several essays later in this volume note, the relation between metaphysical poetry and the various fine arts is important. The influence of emblem books is discussed in Rosemary Freeman's *English Emblem Books* and Rosalie Colie's *Resources of Kind*. Mario Praz's *Studies in Seventeenth-Century Imagery* is essential for any serious study of emblems, and Jerome S. Dees's "Recent Studies in the English Emblems" lists many other works. Clark Hulse's "Recent Studies of Literature and Painting in the English Renaissance" is a handy checklist, and important works in the field include Wylie Sypher's *Four Stages of Renaissance Style*, Jean Seznec's *Survival of the Pagan Gods*, Ernest B. Gilman's *Curious Perspective: Literary and Pictorial Wit in the Seventeenth Century*, and Louis L. Martz's "English Religious Poetry, from Renaissance to Baroque." The term *baroque* remains slippery, but it is examined with reference to various arts, as well as literature, in Carl Friedrich's *Age of the Baroque* and H. James Jensen's *The Muses' Concord: Literature, Music, and the Visual Arts in the Baroque Age*. Finally, John Hollander's *Untuning of the Sky: Ideas of Music in English Poetry, 1500-1700* is a comprehensive introduction and may be supplemented by works listed in Louise Schleiner's "Recent Studies in Poetry and Music of the English Renaissance."

The precise theological context of metaphysical poetry continues to be a topic of much controversy. Horton Davies provides a comprehensive overview in *Worship and Theology in England*, volumes 1, *From Cranmer to Hooker, 1534-1603*, and 2, *From Andrewes to Baxter and Fox, 1603-1690*. In *The Protestant Mind of the English Reformation, 1570-1640*, Charles H. George and Katherine G. George emphasize the broad spectrum of agreement on basic theological matters that they think characterized the early seventeenth century. That position is reinforced by Patrick Collinson's *Religion of Protestants: The Church in English Society 1559-1625*, in which he warns that we must be careful not to read the later sects and divisions into the early prerevolutionary period. Nicholas Tyacke's book on the rise of Arminianism expands on the main thesis of his influential article "Puritanism, Arminianism, and Counter-Revolution": that the rise of a powerful Arminian party in the 1620s, headed by William Laud, precipitated the breakup of what had been a flexible consensus. J. Sears McGee's *Godly Man in Stuart England* is a study of some key differences between Puritanism and Anglicanism, and William Haller's *Rise of Puritanism* is still useful. Before engaging in a serious study of those hotly debated issues, scholars should look over Richard L. Greaves's long review essay "The Puritan-Nonconformist Tradition in England, 1560-1700: Historiographical Reflections," an extensive critical review of scholarship in the area.

Works on seventeenth-century religious issues that may be of particular interest to literary scholars include C. A. Patrides's *Grand Design of God: The Literary Form of the Christian View of History*, Helen C. White's

*English Devotional Literature, 1600–1640*, and Malcolm M. Ross's *Poetry and Dogma: The Transfiguration of Eucharistic Symbols in Seventeenth-Century English Poetry*. The reference points for an ongoing critical debate are Louis L. Martz's *Poetry of Meditation*, which emphasizes the centrality of Roman Catholic devotional techniques to seventeenth-century poets, and Barbara Kiefer Lewalski's analysis of an alternative tradition in *Protestant Poetics and the Seventeenth-Century Religious Lyric*.

Several modes of thought and expression are vital to an understanding of the metaphysical poets. For a full introduction to typology, one can consult Jean C. Daniélou's *From Shadows to Reality: Studies in the Typology of the Fathers* and William G. Madsen's *From Shadowy Types to Truth*. Other useful studies are Paul J. Korshin's *Typologies in England 1650–1820*; a collection of essays edited by Earl Miner, *Literary Uses of Typology*; and Ira Clark's *Christ Revealed: The History of the Neotypological Lyric in the English Renaissance*. The standard works on allegory are Rosemond Tuve's *Allegorical Imagery: Some Medieval Books and Their Posterity* and Angus Fletcher's *Allegory: The Theory of a Symbolic Mode*. Itrat Husain examines the mystical in great detail in *The Mystical Element in the Metaphysical Poets of the Seventeenth Century*. Wit is one of the characteristic marks of metaphysical poetry, and there are important explanations of the backgrounds of wit (see especially T. S. Eliot's essay "The Metaphysical Poets," S. L. Bethell's "Nature of Metaphysical Wit," Earl Miner's *Metaphysical Mode from Donne to Cowley*, and Joseph A. Mazzeo's "Critique of Some Modern Theories of Metaphysical Poetry") and stunning demonstrations of how wit functions in a poem (see especially William Empson's *Seven Types of Ambiguity* and Cleanth Brooks's influential reading of Donne's "Canonization" in *The Well-Wrought Urn*).

The growth in critical studies of the metaphysical poets has been astonishing (analyzed in a monograph, *The Revival of Metaphysical Poetry*, by Joseph E. Duncan). Works that provide substantial general introductions to Donne, Herbert, Vaughan, Crashaw, and Marvell include: A. Alvarez's *School of Donne*, Joan Bennett's *Five Metaphysical Poets*, J. B. Leishman's *Metaphysical Poets*, Helen C. White's *Metaphysical Poets*, George Williamson's *Donne Tradition and Six Metaphysical Poets: A Reader's Guide*, Joseph H. Summers's *Heirs of Donne and Jonson*, and Anthony Low's study *Love's Architecture*. Several useful anthologies of criticism are those edited by Frank Kermode, *The Metaphysical Poets*; William R. Keast, *Seventeenth-Century English Poetry: Modern Essays in Criticism*; Malcolm Bradbury and David Palmer, *Metaphysical Poetry*; Harold Bloom, *John Donne and the Seventeenth-Century Metaphysical Poets*; and Claude J. Summers and Ted-Larry Pebworth, "Bright Shootes of Everlastingness": *The Seventeenth-Century Religious Lyric*.

A number of critical studies emphasize a particular theme or approach

while discussing the entire group of metaphysical poets. Seventeenth-century poetic theory and styles are the focal points in Rosemond Tuve's *Elizabethan and Metaphysical Imagery*, Ruth Wallerstein's *Studies in Seventeenth-Century Poetic*, Earl Miner's volumes *The Metaphysical Mode from Donne to Cowley* and *Seventeenth-Century Imagery: Essays on Uses of Figurative Language from Donne to Farquhar*. M. M. Mahood examines the legacy of Renaissance humanism in *Poetry and Humanism*, Stanley Stewart traces a recurrent image and theme in *The Enclosed Garden: Tradition and Image in Seventeenth-Century Poetry*, and Harold Toliver discusses the importance of place in general in *Lyric Provinces in the English Renaissance*. Camille Wells Slight discusses *The Casuistical Tradition in Shakespeare, Donne, Herbert, and Milton*, and Patrick Grant examines the metaphysical poets' responses to Augustinianism in *The Transformation of Sin: Studies in Donne, Herbert, Vaughan, and Traherne*. Michael McCauley's *Dialectical Criticism and Renaissance Literature* establishes a dialectical model to resolve the apparent split between formalist and historicist approaches to literary analysis; more influential is Stanley E. Fish's *Self-Consuming Artifacts: The Experience of Seventeenth-Century Literature*, which has persuaded a whole generation of critics to look for ways in which metaphysical poetry teases and tricks its readers and sets up structures only to tear them down. Louis L. Martz analyzes variations on the theme of human and divine love in *The Wit of Love: Donne, Carew, Crashaw, Marvell, and Leah Sinanoglou*. Marcus's *Childhood and Cultural Despair: A Theme and Variations in Seventeenth-Century Literature* contains many observations on the poetic, psychological, and political significance of images of childhood in seventeenth-century poetry. The essays in *Poems in Their Place: The Intertextuality and Order of Poetic Collections*, edited by Neil Fraistat, range from classical to modern, but several authors examine the idea of the book in seventeenth-century poetry and the interpretive importance of a poem's location within a larger collection. William Halewood's *Poetry of Grace: Reformation Themes and Structures in English Seventeenth-Century Poetry* (written before Lewalski's *Protestant Poetics*) emphasizes the Protestant backgrounds of the major metaphysical poets, while Anthony Raspa's *Emotive Image* argues, not entirely successfully, for the importance of a Jesuit poetics in early seventeenth-century poetry in England.

### *Studies of Individual Poets*

The following sections discuss works that focus on individual poets and that supplement the brief review of such critical studies at the end of "Required and Recommended Readings for Students." Many of the books listed in

"Reference Works" contain chapters on or discussions of the individual poets; I have generally not repeated citations to those books. Occasionally, I mention individual articles, but the emphasis is on book-length critical works, although some of the most valuable work on the poets comes out in articles not always expanded into books. (The prose works of Donne, Herbert, and Vaughan in particular are essential to a full understanding of those writers but lie outside the scope of this volume.) Since the respondents repeatedly emphasized the authoritative modern editions and biographies of each poet, I begin each section with a quick survey of those works.

*Donne.* For vital information about the texts of Donne's poems and much learned and provocative commentary, teachers may consult the following editions: Helen Gardner, *The Divine Poems and The Elegies and the Songs and Sonnets*; Wesley Milgate, *The Epithalamions, Anniversaries and Epicedes and The Satires, Epigrams and Verse Letters*; Theodore Redpath, *The Songs and Sonnets of John Donne*; and Frank Manley, *The Anniversaries*. A long-term Donne variorum project is currently under way; it will completely reexamine and reedit the texts and summarize centuries of critical discussion. R. C. Bald's *John Donne: A Life* remains the standard biography, although Edward S. Le Comte's *Grace to a Witty Sinner* and John Carey's controversial *John Donne: Life, Mind, and Art* offer additional lively opinions. Arthur F. Marotti's *John Donne, Coterie Poet* presents persuasive readings of many poems in the light of Donne's biographical background and social-historical position.

The most frequently recommended general introduction to Donne was J. B. Leishman's *Monarch of Wit*, which provides a comprehensive overview of Donne's life and work. Leonard Unger's brief book *Donne's Poetry and Modern Criticism* surveys modern definitions of the term *metaphysical* and examines a variety of poems by Donne to assert that their complexity resists reduction to any one critical term. James Winny's *Preface to Donne* (mentioned above as recommended to students) contains materials on numerous contemporary contexts of Donne's poems, while Wilber Sanders's *John Donne's Poetry* is a much more text-centered study, examining the modulations of voice and wit in the entire range of Donne's poetry. Clay Hunt focuses on a more limited number of poems in *Donne's Poetry: Essays in Literary Analysis* and uses detailed close readings to examine the characteristic and intriguing "strangeness" in seven key texts. Other specialized studies of Donne's style include Pierre Legouis's *Donne the Craftsman*, Arnold Stein's *John Donne's Lyrics: The Eloquence of Action*, and Murray Roston's *Soul of Wit: A Study of John Donne*. Each of those studies emphasizes the seriousness and the integrity of Donne's art; Legouis counters the claims that Donne was an untidy craftsman, Stein dramatizes Donne's

rhetorical and logical structures, and Roston notes that we need to pay more attention to Donne's continuity, rather than to the breach between his secular and his sacred poems.

Donne's poems always attract critics seeking to fathom the biographical and psychological complexities that lie behind them; for example, in *The Progress of the Soul* Richard É. Hughes uses the poetry and the prose to study what he calls in his subtitle *The Interior Career of John Donne*; and much of Judith Stampfer's *John Donne and the Metaphysical Gesture* is taken up with analyzing the deeply private and personal components of Donne's verse. Other important critical works, however, focus on the poetic and the intellectual backgrounds vital to an understanding of Donne. For example, Donne's Petrarchan heritage is examined in Donald L. Guss's *John Donne, Petrarchist: Italianate Conceits and Love Theory* and in Silvia Ruffo-Fiore's book *Donne's Petrarchism: A Comparative View*. A similar comparative view is taken in L. Elaine Hoover's study of Donne and a contemporary Spanish poet *John Donne and Francisco de Quevedo: Poets of Love and Death*. N. J. C. Andreason's *John Donne: Conservative Revolutionary* argues that Donne's style was new in many respects but that the *Elegies* and *Songs and Sonnets* still fit neatly into traditional categories of Ovidian, Petrarchan, and Christian Platonic verse.

In the essays collected in *The Disinterred Muse: Donne's Texts and Contexts*, David Novarr argues eloquently for the necessity of responsible scholarly work to understand Donne's poems and to save him from being "kidnapped" by readers with intriguing but faulty, unhistorical approaches. (That whole topic is the subject of much debate these days.) Scholarly studies of the historical and intellectual backgrounds of Donne's poems include Charles M. Coffin's *John Donne and the New Philosophy*, an influential study of Donne's interest in what he termed the "new science"; Dwight Cathcart's *Doubting Conscience: Donne and the Poetry of Moral Argument*, stressing the role of casuistry in Donne's thought; William Zunder's *Poetry of John Donne*, an ambitious though brief reading of Donne's works in the context of "literature and culture in the Elizabethan and Jacobean period"; and Terry G. Sherwood's *Fulfilling the Circle: A Study of John Donne's Thought*, an analysis of Donne's views on epistemology and psychology. Thomas Docherty's *John Donne, Undone* relies heavily on modern post-structural theory and examines Donne in the context of a troublesome historical moment when the major systems of discourse—political, socio-cultural, and aesthetic—were unstable.

If book-length studies of Donne focus on any one genre, most—like Patricia Garland Pinka's *This Dialogue of One: The Songs and Sonnets of John Donne*—focus on the lyrics. But there are two notable exceptions: M. Thomas Hester's *Kinde Pitty and Brave Scorn: John Donne's Satyres* and



Barbara Kiefer Lewalski's *Donne's "Anniversaries" and the Poetry of Praise: The Creation of a Symbolic Mode*.

Apart from the anthologies of criticism already noted in previous sections, several collections of essays on Donne are particularly important. A. J. Smith's *John Donne: The Critical Heritage* gathers many commentaries up to the twentieth century. Twentieth-century criticism is well represented in John R. Roberts's *Essential Articles for the Study of John Donne's Poetry*, which contains thirty-nine previously published articles on a variety of themes. Other useful volumes are *John Donne: Essays in Celebration*, edited by A. J. Smith, which contains sixteen original essays; *A Garland for John Donne*, edited by Theodore Spencer, eight essays in honor of the tercentenary of Donne's death; *Just So Much Honor*, eleven essays collected by Peter Amadeus Fiore; and *The Eagle and The Dove: Reassessing John Donne*, fifteen essays edited by Claude J. Summers and Ted-Larry Pebworth.

*Herbert*. The standard edition of Herbert's writings is F. E. Hutchinson's *Works of George Herbert*, which lacks complete textual notes and translations of the Latin and Greek works but contains a full biographical and critical introduction and an extensive commentary. The modern translation *The Latin Poetry of George Herbert* (including the Greek poems) by Mark McCloskey and Paul R. Murphy is handy, as are facsimile editions with full critical introductions of the two important manuscript versions of Herbert's poems, The Williams manuscript (ed. Amy M. Charles) and the Bodleian manuscript (ed. Amy M. Charles and Mario A. Di Cesare). A fully annotated edition of the poems for the Longman series is in preparation. Amy M. Charles's meticulous and carefully documented *A Life of George Herbert* is the definitive biography, but other useful lives of the poet include Marchette Chute's *Two Gentle Men: The Lives of George Herbert and Robert Herrick*, aimed at the common reader; Stanley Stewart's volume *George Herbert* in the Twayne series, and T. S. Eliot's brief but influential and provocative pamphlet *George Herbert* in the Writers and Their Work series.

Among the respondents, by far the most often and most highly recommended study of Herbert was Joseph H. Summers's *George Herbert: His Religion and Art*, which contains extensive chapters on Herbert's life, influence, religious background, poetic form, and metrical inventiveness. Consonant with Louis L. Martz's sections on Herbert in *The Poetry of Meditation*, which emphasize the influence of Catholic meditative texts and structures in *The Temple*, Rosemond Tuve's *Reading of George Herbert* demonstrates that many of Herbert's themes and figures, inexplicable to the modern reader, were clear to the seventeenth-century reader schooled in readily available medieval iconography and Bible commentaries. A number of re-

cent studies directly challenge Martz and Tuvé and focus on Herbert's debt to Protestant theology and meditative practices: Herbert is one of Barbara Kiefer Lewalski's central figures in her encyclopedic study *Protestant Poetics and the Seventeenth-Century Religious Lyric*; Richard Strier stresses Herbert's debt to Lutheran theology in *Love Known: Theology and Experience in George Herbert's Poetry* and provides insightful analyses of many key poems; A. D. Nuttall envisions Herbert's confronting a Calvinist God in *Overheard by God: Fiction and Prayer in Herbert, Milton, Dante and St. John*; Gene Edward Veith, Jr., examines the broad background of Protestant theology and its effect on Herbert in *Reformation Spirituality: The Religion of George Herbert*; and Donald R. Dickson explores how a Protestant interpretation of a common typological figure affects the imagery and the arrangement of Herbert's poems in *The Fountain of Living Waters: The Typology of the Waters of Life in Herbert, Vaughan, and Traherne*. Unhappy with the limitations of the Martz versus Lewalski polarity, John N. Wall, Jr., in *Transformations of the Word: Spenser, Herbert, Vaughan*, focuses on the liturgical background of Herbert's poems and attempts to place Herbert in an Anglican church that is a "distinctive 'third stream' within Western Christendom alongside Roman Catholicism and the reformed church traditions" (2-3).

Other studies recommended by the respondents reflect the wide variety of critical approaches to Herbert. Helen Vendler offers detailed close readings of many lyrics in *The Poetry of George Herbert* and analyzes Herbert's penchant for writing poems of reinvention and self-correction. Stanley E. Fish's *Living Temple: George Herbert and Catechizing* grounds in catechetical practices the recurrent pattern in which Herbert's speakers and poems undo themselves, a theme also discussed in Fish's earlier chapter on Herbert in *Self-Consuming Artifacts: The Experience of Seventeenth-Century Literature*. While differing from Fish in several ways, Barbara Leah Harman similarly emphasizes the ways Herbert's poems collapse and dissolve and the problems his speakers have in telling coherent stories in *Costly Monuments: Representations of the Self in George Herbert's Poetry*. More tradition-minded critics are by no means blind to the problems and difficulties addressed in *The Temple* but approach them from different angles and set them in a framework of poetic order and stability: Margaret Bottrall's *George Herbert* stresses his harmony and joyous devotional spirit, and both Robert B. Shaw's *Call of God: The Theme of Vocation in the Poetry of Donne and Herbert* and Diana Benet's *Secretary of Praise: The Poetic Vocation of George Herbert* examine Herbert's achievements in his dual vocation of priest and poet. Recent critics, though, have begun to emphasize the "world of strife" that Herbert lived in and presented in his writings. Marion White Singleton goes far beyond Shaw and Benet in studying how Herbert trans-

formed, rather than simply abandoned, secular goals and codes of conduct in the strenuous process of fashioning himself in his life and his poems as "God's courtier." Studies of how deeply Herbert's writings are embedded in the social and political circumstances of his times include articles by Sidney Gottlieb, Cristina Malcolmson, and Michael C. Schoenfeldt.

Herbert's style attracts attention, and, apart from Joseph H. Summers's *George Herbert: His Religion and Art*, the two major studies of Herbert's poetic skill are Mary Ellen Rickey's *Utmost Art: Complexity in the Verse of George Herbert*—a wide-ranging analysis of Herbert's classical allusions, puns, purposeful titles, thoughtful revisions, and overall deceptive simplicity—and Arnold Stein's *George Herbert's Lyrics*, which discusses Herbert's prosody, "art of plainness," and creation of a lyric mode that allows for the expression and the mastery of powerful personal feelings. In *Equivocal Predication: George Herbert's Way to God*, Heather A. R. Asals argues, with key references to Augustine, that Herbert's language and poetics are thoroughly Anglican, sacramental, and incarnational; through divine equivocation, the unrelenting dual focus of words, his poems bridge the gap between human beings and God. Other books that explore Augustinian backgrounds include Mark Taylor's *Soul in Paraphrase: George Herbert's Poetics* and Richard Todd's *Opacity of Signs: Acts of Interpretation in George Herbert's The Temple*. Coburn Freer explains some of Herbert's poetic inventiveness in terms of the many psalm translations in *Music for a King: George Herbert's Style and the Metrical Psalms*, and in *Spelling the Word: George Herbert and the Bible* Chana Bloch emphasizes the centrality of the Bible for Herbert as a source of themes, images, and poetic techniques. Bart Westerweel's *Patterns and Patterning: A Study of Four Poems by George Herbert* is an exhaustive illustrated study of sources and visual analogues for two of Herbert's most obviously shaped poems, "The Altar" and "Easter-wings," and two of his less obviously patterned narratives, "The Pilgrimage" and "Love" (3). Robert H. Ray's *Herbert Allusion Book* is an invaluable listing of allusions to Herbert in the seventeenth century and provides important material on Herbert's immediate reputation and influence.

Allusions to and critical comments on Herbert from the early seventeenth century to the first part of the twentieth century are gathered in *George Herbert: The Critical Heritage*, assembled by C. A. Patrides. *Essential Articles for the Study of George Herbert's Poetry*, edited by John R. Roberts, reprints thirty-four modern essays; "Too Rich to Clothe the Sunne": *Essays on George Herbert*, edited by Claude J. Summers and Ted-Larry Pebworth, contains fifteen new essays; *Like Season'd Timber: New Essays on George Herbert*, edited by Edmund Miller and Robert DiYanni, contains twenty-one essays, many of which cover neglected topics, such as Herbert's

prose and his influence in the eighteenth century; and *A Fine Tuning: Studies of the Religious Poetry of Herbert and Milton*, edited by Mary Maleski, includes six essays on Herbert. Together, those collections give a panoramic view of much of the work that constitutes the modern critical revival of interest in Herbert.

*Vaughan*. L. C. Martin's *Works of Henry Vaughan* remains the standard scholarly edition for the study of Vaughan, but it has been supplemented and in some respects corrected and improved by several modern editions that follow up on Martin's pathbreaking work. French Fogle's texts of the English and Latin poems in *The Complete Poetry of Henry Vaughan* are the result of a more extensive collation of early editions than Martin was able to undertake, and E. L. Marilla's *Secular Poetry of Henry Vaughan* and especially Alan Rudrum's *Henry Vaughan: The Complete Poems* take into account the current research on Vaughan in their extensive annotations. Vaughan's life continues to attract attention, and many critical articles focus on his conversion from secular to sacred poetry, his relationship with his brothers, and his experiences during the civil war. The major book-length biography is F. E. Hutchinson's *Henry Vaughan: A Life and Interpretation*. Kenneth Friedenreich's Twayne series volume *Henry Vaughan* similarly blends biography and criticism.

The two critical studies recommended most highly by the respondents to the questionnaire were E. C. Pettet's *Of Paradise and Light: A Study of Silex Scintillans* and Jonathan F. S. Post's *Henry Vaughan: The Unfolding Vision*. Pettet offers insightful analyses of some individual poems but is also attentive to sequences, clusters of images, and large structural patterns that connect parts 1 and 2 of the collection. Post provides a comprehensive, integrating view of Vaughan's body of work and does a better job than most other critics of emphasizing the poet's relationship to Herbert without turning Vaughan into a derivative epigone. James D. Simmonds's *Masques of God: Form and Theme in the Poetry of Henry Vaughan* is also a valuable study of the continuity of Vaughan's secular and sacred poetry.

Many critical works focus on Vaughan's mysticism or his reliance on alchemical imagery. Elizabeth Holmes stresses the influence of hermeticism in general and his brother Thomas in particular in *Henry Vaughan and the Hermetic Philosophy*; those subjects are also pursued in Thomas O. Calhoun's *Henry Vaughan: The Achievement of Silex Scintillans*. R. A. Durr defines Vaughan's central theme as a quest for regeneration in *On the Mystical Poetry of Henry Vaughan*. In *Henry Vaughan: Experience and the Tradition* and *The Unprofitable Servant in Henry Vaughan*, Ross Garner does not deny Vaughan's quest for regeneration or his frequent flights from reason but situates them in orthodox contexts: they are themes sanctioned

not only by hermetic philosophers but also by Augustine and key biblical texts. Louis L. Martz's work on Vaughan, in *The Poetry of Meditation* and *The Paradise Within*, also emphasizes the importance of Augustine and later meditative practices. The chapter on Vaughan in Donald R. Dickson's *Fountain of Living Waters* focuses on an important typological figure in Vaughan's poems; and, in a long chapter in *Transformations of the Word*, John N. Wall, Jr., studies how allusions to the Bible, the Book of Common Prayer, and Herbert's *Temple* allowed Vaughan to keep alive the idea of an Anglican church that was physically under siege during the time of Puritan rule.

Frank Kermode's "Private Imagery of Henry Vaughan" is only one brief article in the midst of many long studies arguing for Vaughan's debts to systems of mystical philosophy, but it restores a certain balance by focusing on his lyric and literary powers. Mary Ellen Rickey's "Vaughan, *The Temple*, and Poetic Form" examines Vaughan's impressive debt to Herbert—impressive not only because it is extensive but also because it involves complex imitations and transformations of poetic structures. I note those two essays in particular because they are not included in Alan Rudrum's collection *Essential Articles for the Study of Henry Vaughan*. Also useful is the *George Herbert Journal* special issue on Vaughan, edited by Jonathan F. S. Post, which comprises eight essays on such topics as Vaughan's versification, neglected poems and prose, and sense of self in *Silex Scintillans*.

*Crashaw*. The standard edition of Crashaw's poems is L. C. Martin's *Poems, English, Latin, and Greek, of Richard Crashaw*. George Walton Williams's *Complete Poetry of Richard Crashaw* is also authoritative and in some respects particularly handy to use because Williams reorders the poems according to two categories—secular and sacred—includes brief but useful explanatory headnotes, and puts English translations of the Latin and Greek poems on facing pages. The best biography is also one of the most highly recommended critical works, Austin Warren's *Richard Crashaw: A Study in Baroque Sensibility*. Paul A. Parrish's Twayne volume *Richard Crashaw* surveys the poet's life and works and, while not discounting Crashaw's baroque sensibility, argues that the concept does not completely explain his talent and interests.

George Walton Williams's *Image and Symbol in the Sacred Poetry of Richard Crashaw* was frequently recommended by the respondents for its examination of recurrent images—water, dust, the colors white and red—that are central to Crashaw's religious poems. Ruth Wallerstein also emphasizes the intense power of images in the poems; her *Richard Crashaw: A Study in Style and Poetic Development* traces Crashaw's special debts to Giambattista Marino, Jesuit epigrams, religious music, and emblems as he

composes poems that are provocatively sensuous and emotional. In *Rhyme and Meaning in Richard Crashaw*, Mary Ellen Rickey is aware of possible models and backgrounds for Crashaw's style but focuses primarily on his artistry, especially his use of rhyme to structure poems.

Most of the book-length studies of Crashaw explore his relationship to European movements in art and religious devotion and attempt to define his style as baroque—a term as slippery as it is necessary. The long section on Crashaw in Mario Praz's influential *Flaming Heart* places the poet squarely in the Continental Counter-Reformation tradition and suggests that in his enthusiastic wit, daring conceits, and erotic and devotional enthusiasm he outdoes even Marino, one of his crucial models. (For a more detailed comparison of the two poets, see Claes Schaar, *Marino and Crashaw: Sospetto d'Herode: A Commentary*.) Robert T. Petersson similarly emphasizes the energetic, "ecstatic" qualities of Crashaw's poetry in *The Art of Ecstasy: Teresa, Bernini, and Crashaw*; Petersson uses the autobiography of Saint Teresa of Avila and Bernini's Cornaro Chapel in Rome as key analogues and interpretive contexts for Crashaw's "Hymn to Saint Teresa." A different view is evident in Marc Bertonasco's revisionary *Crashaw and the Baroque*, which emphasizes not turbulent sensuousness but a controlled and thoughtful but still affective devotional style akin to that of Saint Francis de Sales. Other devotional models for Crashaw are also proposed: Patrick Grant offers a comparison in "Richard Crashaw and the Capucins" (*Images* 89-128), and Anthony Raspa argues for the influence of the Ignatian mode of meditation on Crashaw and others in *The Emotive Image: Jesuit Poetics in the English Renaissance*. R. V. Young interprets Crashaw against the background of Spanish culture and poetry in *Richard Crashaw and the Spanish Golden Age*.

Important essays on Crashaw can be located easily by referring to the annotated bibliographies by Cirillo and Roberts. No anthology presents the "essential articles on Crashaw," but the twelve original studies in Robert M. Cooper's *Essays on Richard Crashaw* cover key poems and themes, including the funeral elegies and the musical and emblematic aspects of Crashaw's style.

*Marvell*. The standard scholarly edition of Marvell's poetry is H. M. Margoliouth's *Poems and Letters of Andrew Marvell*, revised in 1971 by Pierre Legouis and E. E. Duncan-Jones with added textual notes and annotations. Elizabeth Story Donno's commentary in *Andrew Marvell: The Complete English Poems* is detailed and authoritative. William A. McQueen and Kiffin A. Rockwell have edited and translated *The Latin Poetry of Andrew Marvell*. The best place to study Marvell's later satires is in volume 1 of *Poems on Affairs of State: Augustan Satirical Verse, 1660-1714*, edited

by George deF. Lord, where the satires not only are heavily glossed but also appear alongside the contemporary poems to which they frequently respond. Pierre Legouis's *Andrew Marvell: Poet, Puritan, Patriot* remains the fullest biographical study; other useful surveys of the life and works include M. C. Bradbrook and M. G. Lloyd-Thomas's *Andrew Marvell*, John Dixon Hunt's *Andrew Marvell: His Life and Writings*, and Michael Craze's *Life and Lyrics of Andrew Marvell*. John Press's pamphlet *Andrew Marvell* in the Writers and Their Work series is a good introduction, as is Lawrence W. Hyman's more detailed treatment in his Twayne series volume *Andrew Marvell*. William Empson's *Using Biography* contains three essays that investigate several biographical cruxes vital to an understanding of the historical context and the transmission of Marvell's poems.

The critical study of Marvell most highly recommended by the respondents was Rosalie Colie's "*My Ecchoing Song*": *Andrew Marvell's Poetry of Criticism*, which contains extensive analyses of how such key poems as "The Garden" and "Upon Appleton House" absorb but also undermine and transform emblematic and generic conventions. Also highly recommended were J. B. Leishman's *Art of Marvell's Poetry*, which offers close readings of numerous poems in their literary (rather than social-historical) context, and Ann E. Berthoff's *Resolved Soul: A Study of Marvell's Major Poems*, which explores the recurrent theme of the pressures the personae face in a time-bound world. Harold Toliver emphasizes Marvell's habitual attempt to balance, rather than reconcile, opposite viewpoints in *Marvell's Ironic Vision*; and Robert Wilcher uses a variety of critical approaches to synthesize much modern scholarly work in his introductory study *Andrew Marvell*.

Many specialized studies focus on the aesthetic, philosophical, and political contexts of Marvell's poems and either explicitly or implicitly challenge the common New Critical approach that separates the poems from the poet's historical circumstances. The second part of Ruth Wallerstein's *Studies in Seventeenth-Century Poetic* argues for the importance of Neoplatonism and traditional Christian imagery and thought by analytic readings of "An Horatian Ode," "Upon Appleton House," and "The Garden." R. I. V. Hodge focuses not so much on political as on intellectual and scientific revolutions in his study *Foreshortened Time: Andrew Marvell and Seventeenth Century Revolutions*. Marvell's relation to the pastoral tradition is explored in Patrick Cullen's *Spenser, Marvell, and Renaissance Pastoral*, Donald M. Friedman's book *Marvell's Pastoral Art*, and Michael Long's intriguing comparative study *Marvell, Nabokov: Childhood and Arcadia*. The often-neglected religious context of Marvell's poems is discussed in Bruce King's book *Marvell's Allegorical Poetry*, John Klausé's *Theodicy and the Moral Imagination of Andrew Marvell*, and Warren L. Chernaik's *Poet's Time: Politics and Religion in the Work of Andrew Marvell* (though that last work is

primarily concerned with analyzing Marvell's responses to the revolution and its aftermath). Margarita Stocker interprets the major poems in the light of contemporary ideas on the Second Coming in *Apocalyptic Marvell*. Two studies of the political aspects of Marvell's writings were highly recommended by the respondents: John M. Wallace's *Destiny His Choice: The Loyalism of Andrew Marvell*, which relates Marvell's independent stance to his providential beliefs; and Annabel M. Patterson's *Marvell and the Civic Crown*, which not only presents detailed analyses of the Cromwell poems and later satires but also attempts to resolve the split between the poems that fall into the different phases of Marvell's career.

The history of critical responses to Marvell until the early twentieth century is captured in Elizabeth Story Donno's *Andrew Marvell: The Critical Heritage*. The critical anthologies edited by John Carey and Michael Wilding, both titled *Andrew Marvell*, begin with seventeenth-century commentaries and thus overlap Donno's volume, but both contain substantial selections from the twentieth century that reflect the controversy over historical versus New Critical approaches to such poems as "An Horatian Ode" and "The Nymph Complaining for the Death of Her Fawn." The Twentieth-Century Views volume *Andrew Marvell*, edited by George deF. Lord, comprises ten essays. More recent collections of original essays on Marvell, prompted by the tercentenary of his death in 1978, are *Approaches to Marvell: The York Tercentenary Lectures*, edited by C. A. Patrides (fifteen essays); *Andrew Marvell: Essays on the Tercentenary of His Death*, edited by R. L. Brett (four essays); and *Tercentenary Essays in Honor of Andrew Marvell*, edited by Kenneth Friedenreich (thirteen essays).