View metadata, citation and similar papers at core.ac.uk
brought to you by CORE
provided by Canadian Woman Studies / les cahiers de la femme (E-Journal, York University)

scope beyond the strictly historical borders of the nineteenth century to include the adoption of the Constitution in the eighteenth century and the subsequent amendments that followed. In this way, she considers the various challenges to the notions of personhood and citizenship that came with the abolition of slavery, with calls for suffrage, with property reform, and with the Immigration Acts of the 1920s.

This book asks a series of questions that demonstrate the complexity of the concept of "belonging." Welke provides examples of the ways in which personhood and citizenship, while interrelated, are somewhat distinct considerations: personhood being the recognition of the individual specifically under law, the practices that constitute the rights of individual security and well-being, as well as self-ownership and mobility; and citizenship being the recognized set of formal practices and obligations to the law.

By acknowledging how white, able manhood was invested with full personhood, thus providing the framework for claims to land, liberty and law, Welke explores the ways that an individual may have the rights of citizenship, but be bereft of the rights of personhood. This understanding of personhood and citizenship illuminates how legal practices shape personal identity—with all its possibilities under law—but simultaneously thwart the exercise of an individual under that law.

The major assertion is that "the borders of belonging," built on legal practices of subordination and exclusion, are ultimately fragile; they must be constantly reaffirmed and redrawn in order to maintain their authority, and in this sense, the organization of the book follows this contention. The first chapter discusses the legal means and claims that construct the universal legal subject as able, white, and male. The second chapter considers the consequences of conceptualizing this universal subject for those not included in its definition. Particularly, it highlights how administrative regimes and categories of illegality dispose disabled persons, racialized Others, and women as people outside the borders of belonging. The third and final chapter discusses the means by which individuals challenge and resist these borders, and how those sanctioned under law attempt to defend them. What is striking here are the similarities between contestations and defenses. Welke points out, for instance, that like those challenging oppressive legal structures, those who defend them rely on a similar language of inclusion in order to mask privilege and make it less accessible to those subordinated under law.

Encompassing legal precedents and court cases, social histories, and published letters and memoirs, Welke's research is expansive and varied. At times, however, Welke relies on a somewhat evidentiary listing of cases for her argument. This is understandable given the technique of legal writing and defense, yet a sustained discussion of select legal cases or examples—many only alluded to in the chapters or their epigraphs—could add a more rigorous and nuanced means of exploring the discrepancies between legal language and practice.

One possibility for expansion on Welke's arguments is a more intricate elaboration on collective social or legal action and its role in contesting the limits of "belonging." Certainly, Welke's principle focus is individual rights, yet she contends that practices of exclusion also work to create community. Thus, collectivity lies at the heart of "belonging," and we can consider this, along with the questions that Welke raises, when thinking about emergent claims to legal rights in the twenty-first century.

Katharine Wrobel is a Ph.D. Candidate in English at York University. Her current research explores nineteenth-century political radicalism and representations of anger in the British novel during the Reform Acts.

BLUESTOCKINGS: WOMEN OF REASON FROM ENLIGHTENMENT TO ROMANTICISM

Elizabeth Eger
Houndsmills, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010

REVIEWED BY GISELA ARGYLE

Elizabeth Eger's group biography builds on and expands the focus of Sylvia Myers's study *The Bluestocking Circle: Women, Friendship, and the Life of the Mind in Eighteenth-Century England* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990). Myers used Carol Gilligan's analysis of female experience as typically structured like a web, rather than the male hierarchical structure, in order to demonstrate, with a series of case studies, that the guidance and support of female and male mentors and friends helped the original "bluestocking" women gain confidence and achieve autonomy as intellectuals. Myers counted three strands in the circle's preoccupations: female advocacy, wider social opportunities, and aspirations to the life of the mind. In chapters on the bluestockings' mentors, families, and friends, their choices and changing views of marriage, and their role as women writers, she provided a thorough and detailed social context for the bluestockings' pursuit of learning and virtue.

Eger relies on the reader's familiarity with Myers's portrait and concentrates on her own thesis that better recognition of the bluestockings' intellectual work across genres complicates the common dichotomies for eighteenth-century culture: "the public and the private; reason and feeling; masculine and feminine; local and national; the domestic and the civic; Enlightenment and Romanticism." Eger initiated an exhibition, "Brilliant Women: 18th-Century Bluestockings," in the

National Portrait Gallery, London, 2008; she organized it with the help of Lucy Peltz, with whom she also co-authored the accompanying book of essays of the same title. She frames her present study with two visual representations: Richard Samuel's idealizing group portrait, *The Nine Living Muses of Great Britain,* and Thomas Rowlandson's caricature, *Breaking Up of the Bluestocking Club*. The first, exhibited at the Royal Academy in 1779, groups nine major contemporary women writers and artists in an idealized, classicist style below a statue of Apollo, god of the arts, as proof of Great Britain's glory, whereas the second, a print of 1815, satirizes the bluestockings as "unsex'd" brawling slatterns. This historical trajectory parallels the changing meaning of their moniker: "bluestocking" (which denotes working men's worsted hose and had formerly been a derogatory name for Cromwell's Little Parliament), was first applied to the casual dress permitted to male guests at Lady Montagu's assemblies, after which it came to designate, positively, the women there who sought intellectual company. As their cultural work prospered and provoked male anxiety, the name took on negative connotations, as in Byron's satire *The Blues: A Literary Eclogue* (1821).

In her first chapter, "Living Muses: The Female Icon," Eger discusses the intersecting of the allegorical and symbolic representation of the liberal arts as women with the view of historical women as muses. She argues that like the classical Muses and unlike twentieth-century conceptions of them as passive and sexualized, the British "muses" were active and creative participants in "a demotic and diffuse Enlightenment, which incorporated journalists, Johnsonian coffee-house philosophers, writers of the bluestocking circle, Unitarian ministers, collectors and connoisseurs, scientists and educators, as well as moral philosophers such as Shaftesbury and Adam Smith." Her case studies illustrate the "'feminist' dimension of Enlightenment culture." For an example, she cites Angelica Kauffmann's historical paintings, typically a masculine genre, and her self-portraits as a professional painter. She organizes her case studies in three chapters, focusing on six women selected from the "nine living muses": Elizabeth Montagu, Elizabeth Carter, Elizabeth Griffith, Charlotte Lennox, Anna Barbauld, and Lucy Aiken. The first chapter, entitled "The Bluestocking Salon: Patronage, Correspondence and Conversation," establishes these three activities as fulfilling the moral philosophers' prescription of sociability and sympathy as requisite for the new commercial society. All three activities "occupy a space between public and private spheres of discourse," which may explain their neglect by literary historians and critic. They expand Jürgen Habermas's definition of the public sphere in terms of print culture alone.

Practicing what was called the "bluestocking philosophy," Lady Montagu used the wealth derived from her husband's coal mines and ably administered by her when widowed to fulfill her social duty through the patronage of literature and culture. Her patronage included architecture, in the building of her new, second London mansion, designed to accommodate the growing bluestocking circle (c. 1756-75). Bringing the informal sociability of country houses and spas to town and cutting across boundaries of social rank, political affiliation, vocation, and gender, her inclusive salon united the guests in the life of the mind. Among prominent male guests were Samuel Johnson and James Boswell, Edmund Burke, David Garrick, Sir Joshua Reynolds, and Horace Walpole. From the correspondence between Montagu and her intimate friend, Elizabeth Carter, Eger concludes that the genre of letters transcends the boundary between private and public. Their correspondence "celebrated a friendship of profound spiritual and intellectual importance, which fed into, and helped define, their broader sense of female literary community." Lastly, Eger argues that for the bluestockings conversation on the model of Socratic dialogue served women's education and was a substitute for men's training in oratory. (Margaret Fuller would call her extra-mural course of studies for women in Boston from 1839 to 1844, "Conversations.")

Besides her role as hostess—"Queen of the Blues," in the words of Dr. Johnson—Montagu distinguished herself through an essay on Shakespeare. In the second chapter, "Female Champions: Women Critics of Shakespeare," Eger gathers together Montagu, Charlotte Lennox, actress, playwright, translator, and editor, and Elizabeth Griffith, author of epistolary novels, who each contributed a distinct perspective to the emerging, and decidedly masculine, field of Shakespeare criticism. Montagu defended Shakespeare's genius, especially in the tragedies, in reply to Voltaire's negative comparison with French drama. Her essay was very well-received in England, as well as in Germany and in France, where she was invited to the Académie française. Griffith praised especially the moral philosophy that informed Shakespeare's female characters. Differing from both Montagu's and Griffith's approach, Lennox critiqued the hierarchy of genres by promoting romance as defining national literature. Unlike classical literature, Shakespeare's plays, in the "mother tongue," were readily accessible to women, and their critical studies were consequently not received as threatening to male prerogative. By Eger's account, these women's role in English canon formation still needs studying.

The last chapter, "The Bluestocking Legacy in the Romantic Era," re-examines the notion of a "lost generation" of women poets purveyed by recent anthologies. In fact, women dominated the field in the late eighteenth century. Eger attributes the long-term loss of their names to the new conservatism and cultural anxiety produced by the French Revolution, and the conse-

quent sexist attitudes to intellectual women that, for instance, Byron, Wordsworth, and Hazlitt exhibit. She also blames common but simplistic scholarly dichotomies that oppose the Enlightenment to Romanticism in alignment with reason versus imagination and feeling, and therefore exclude women from Romanticism. The subjects of her case study are Anna Barbauld, a sometime member of the original bluestocking circle, and her niece and pupil Lucy Aikin, both of whom combined reason and sympathetic imagination in their educational writings. Eger argues that Barbauld's books for children nurtured the mass readership for Wordsworth's *Lyrical Ballads*. In her *Epistles on Women* (1810), on the four stages of civilization, Aikin proposed continued progress for women, but circumscribed and dependent on men's help. In contrast, Barbauld imagined a dystopian future for British culture, where London has become a mere tourist attraction, like the ruins of classical antiquity. As though to prove her point, savage misogynist attacks were directed against her. Eger concludes her book with the reaction, illustrated by Rowlandson's caricature, to the bluestockings' economic success and cultural visibility. She remarks that feminist history is divided in its impulse both to celebrate exceptional role models and to deplore the political status of women qua class. In support, she quotes Mary Wollstonecraft's much-cited dictum: "I wish to see women neither heroines nor brutes; but reasonable creatures."

When Eger suggests that the several bluestockings who were named Elizabeth—Montagu, Carter, and Griffith—would have connected their aspirations with their royal namesake, she is silent on her own connection, a further link in the "mutual relationship between writing *about* women and writing *by* women." Her book complements her predecessor Myers's group biography. Eger adds a substantial use of Montagu's unpublished letters, especially for her account of the friendship between Montagu and Carter. She also adds contemporary literary and visual material to illustrate the changing reception of the bluestockings. Her book is more thesis-driven than Myers's, which results in redundant repetition of her main arguments with every new aspect of bluestocking activities. Overly anxious citation of other critics clutters the text (instead of notes), and quotations tend to be followed by unnecessary and sometimes flat explications. However, her concluding point is well earned and well taken: "One of the costs of recognizing the bluestockings' success is to lose any simple sense of the history of feminism as a story of progress."

Gisela Argyle, Senior Scholar of Humanities at York University in Toronto, has published Germany as Model and Monster: Allusions in English Fiction, 1830s-1930s *(Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2002), another book and articles on Victorian literature and comparative literature, as well as literary translations from German into English and the converse.*

BECAUSE I AM A GIRL

Tim Butcher, Joanne Harris, Xiaolu Guo, Kathy Lette, Deborah Moggach, Marie Phillips, Irvine Welsh
London: Vintage, 2010

REVIEWED BY IFRAH ABDILLAHI

Because I am a Girl is an anthology of work by various authors enlisted by Plan International, a child-centered development organization, in order to convey the difficulties young girls experience around the world. Each of the seven stories is written by a different author and expresses their impressions and interpretations of the lives and struggles faced by young women in Togo, Sierra Leone, Ghana, Brazil, Cambodia, Uganda, and the Dominican Republic. The collection as a whole is a hit and miss as far as accomplishing the intended objective stated by Marie Staunton, Chief Executive of Plan UK to "make girls visible in a way that reports and statistics cannot." Some stories such as the one by acclaimed writer Kathy Lette on her visit to Brazil come across as offensive and insulting in their criticism of the country and its inhabitants. Lette, in an overly simplistic analysis, describes the young girls she encounters as "little more than a life support to their ovaries—reduced, by lack of contraception and lack of access to abortion, into breeding cows." In a country gripped by extreme poverty and a fierce doctrine of Catholic values, in which abortion is illegal but paedophile tourism is endemic, this contributor's chapter, entitled *Ovarian Roulette,* is at times difficult to read due to a narrative steeped in condescension. Other chapters, such as the one offered by filmmaker and novelist Xiaolu Guo, are of a fictional nature, this one in particular accounting the life of a Cambodian police officer who grew up as an orphan and soldier. Her story of a man who later in life gets married and has a daughter whom he loves but goes missing, while interesting, is somewhat difficult to understand and leaves the reader puzzled us to how young girls factor into the story or what the overall message regarding their circumstance is. Still, others such as the piece by Irvine Welsh, broach the theme of migration and prostitution in a unique and insightful manner. His chapter "Remittances" is through a narration by two sisters whose opportunities and outcomes in life vary drastically despite having been raised within the same household. His protagonist offers a nuanced account and insight into the complexities of women's lives in the Dominican Republic, and the negotiations necessary in their roles as mothers, daughters, providers, and prostitutes. By far, however, the most impactful and moving account is offered by literary newcomer Marie Phillips. Phillips travels to Uganda for six days on a visit to the Plan regional offices and tours their programs within the country. Having been