

2006

## Remedies: Public & Private, 4th ed

David I. Levine

David J. Jung

David Schoenbrod

*New York Law School*, david.schoenbrod@nyls.edu

Angus Macbeth

Follow this and additional works at: [https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac\\_books](https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books)

---

### Recommended Citation

Levine, David I.; Jung, David J.; Schoenbrod, David; and Macbeth, Angus, "Remedies: Public & Private, 4th ed" (2006). *Books*. 79.

[https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac\\_books/79](https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books/79)

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty Scholarship at DigitalCommons@NYLS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Books by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@NYLS.

# REMEDIES: PUBLIC AND PRIVATE

Fourth Edition

By

**David I. Levine**

*Professor of Law  
University of California  
Hastings College of the Law*

**David J. Jung**

*Professor of Law  
University of California  
Hastings College of the Law*

**David Schoenbrod**

*Professor of Law  
New York Law School*

**Angus Macbeth**

*Sidley Austin  
Washington, D.C.*

AMERICAN CASEBOOK SERIES®

THOMSON  
—★—™  
WEST

# Table of Contents

---

	Page
PREFACE TO THE FOURTH EDITION .....	v
PREFACE TO THE FIRST EDITION .....	vii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .....	xi
TABLE OF CASES .....	xxvii
<b>Chapter 1. Introduction to the Law of Remedies</b> .....	<b>1</b>
A. A General Approach to Crafting a Remedy .....	2
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller Remedies in a Traditional</i>	
<i>Private Case</i> .....	4
B. Private Law and Public Law .....	4
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Remedies in a</i>	
<i>Public Law Case</i> .....	5
Abram Chayes, the Role of the Judge in Public Law Litigation...	5
Notes .....	8
C. "Where There's a Right, There's a Remedy"?	10
<i>Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of</i>	
<i>Narcotics</i> .....	13
Notes .....	18
<i>Schweiker v. Chilicky</i> .....	20
Notes .....	26
A Digression: Remedial Choice in the Statutory Context.....	28
<b>Chapter 2. The Nature, Availability, and Scope of Injunctions</b> .....	<b>33</b>
A. The Nature of an Injunction .....	33
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) The Choice Be-</i>	
<i>tween an Injunction and Damages</i> .....	33
B. The Plaintiff's Rightful Position as the Measure of an Injunction .....	37
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Defining the Right-</i>	
<i>ful Position</i> .....	37
<i>Mt. Healthy City School District Board of Education v. Doyle</i> .....	37
Notes .....	41
<i>Note on Rightful Position as Reconsideration or Remand in</i>	
<i>Administrative Law</i> .....	43
<i>Problem: The Racially Biased Election</i> .....	45
<i>Rizzo v. Goode</i> .....	46
Notes .....	51
<i>Newman v. Alabama</i> .....	52
Notes .....	54

	Page
C. The Prerequisites for Injunctive Relief .....	57
1. Threat of Harm .....	57
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) The Threat of Harm</i> .....	57
<i>Hecht Co. v. Bowles</i> .....	58
Notes .....	62
<i>Note on Mootness and Ripeness</i> .....	62
<i>City of Los Angeles v. Lyons</i> .....	64
Notes .....	73
<i>Note on Who is Protected by an Injunction</i> .....	77
<i>Note on the Relationship Between Threat of Harm and the Scope of an Injunction</i> .....	78
2. Inadequate Remedy at Law .....	80
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) The Choice Between Legal and Equitable Remedies</i> .....	80
<i>Note on the Maxims of Equity</i> .....	81
<i>Note on the Declining Importance of the Inadequate Remedy at Law Rule</i> .....	83
Douglas Laycock, <i>The Death of the Irreparable Injury Rule</i> ..	84
<i>Note on Whether to Abandon the Inadequacy Requirement</i> .....	85
Alan Schwartz, <i>The Case for Specific Performance</i> .....	87
Notes .....	89
<i>Note on Constitutional and Statutory Variations on the Inadequacy Requirement</i> .....	91
3. Practicality of Enforcement .....	93
D. Granting Less or More Than Plaintiff's Rightful Position .....	95
1. Granting Less Than Plaintiff's Rightful Position: Balancing the Equities .....	95
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Balancing the Equities</i> .....	95
<i>Note on When Injunctions are Efficient</i> .....	97
<i>Smith v. Staso Milling Co.</i> .....	100
Notes .....	103
<i>Brown v. Board of Education (Brown II)</i> .....	107
Notes .....	109
<i>Tennessee Valley Authority v. Hill</i> .....	112
Notes .....	119
<i>Weinberger v. Romero-Barcelo</i> .....	120
Notes .....	126
David Schoenbrod, <i>The Measure of an Injunction: A Principle to Replace Balancing the Equities and Tailoring the Remedy</i> .....	129
<i>Note on Balancing in Administrative Enforcement</i> .....	131
2. Granting More Than Plaintiff's Rightful Position: Prophylaxis and Impossibility .....	132
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Prophylactic Orders</i> .....	132
(a) The Abortion Protest Example .....	135
<i>Madsen v. Women's Health Center, Inc.</i> .....	135
Notes .....	155
(b) The School Desegregation Example .....	158

	Page
D. Granting Less or More Than Plaintiff's Rightful Position— Continued	
<i>Swann v. Charlotte-Mecklenburg Board of Education</i> .....	159
Notes .....	164
<i>Missouri v. Jenkins (Jenkins III)</i> .....	167
Notes .....	181
E. Specific Remedies Other Than Injunctions .....	183
<b>Chapter 3. Procedures for Formulating, Administering, and Enforcing the Injunction</b> .....	<b>187</b>
A. Obtaining Preliminary Injunctive Relief .....	187
1. Types of Injunctions .....	187
<i>Problem: Unauthorized Merchants</i> .....	190
2. Standards for Granting Preliminary Relief .....	190
<i>Schiavo ex rel. Schindler v. Schiavo (I)</i> .....	191
<i>Schiavo ex rel. Schindler v. Schiavo (II)</i> .....	195
Notes .....	202
<i>American Hospital Supply Corp. v. Hospital Products LTD.</i> ..	205
Notes .....	207
Problems .....	210
3. The Security Requirement .....	210
(a) The Amount of Security .....	211
(b) Collecting on the Security .....	212
B. Formulating and Administering the Injunction .....	213
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Drafting and Ad-</i> <i>ministering an Injunction</i> .....	213
1. Drafting the Injunction .....	213
<i>Portland Feminist Women's Health Center v. Advocates for</i> <i>Life, Inc.</i> .....	213
Notes .....	216
2. Administering the Injunction .....	220
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Determining</i> <i>Compliance With an Injunction</i> .....	220
James A. Henderson, Jr. & Richard A. Pearson, Implement- ing Federal Environmental Policies: The Limits of Aspira- tional Commands .....	221
Notes .....	224
Special Project—The Remedial Process in Institutional Re- form Litigation .....	225
Notes .....	228
<i>Illinois v. Costle</i> .....	230
Notes .....	232
Murray Levine, Charles P. Ewing & David I. Levine, The Use of Law for Prevention in the Public Interest .....	233
Notes .....	237
Michael S. Lottman, Enforcing Judicial Decrees: Now Comes the Hard Part .....	238
Problems .....	240
3. Accommodating Changing Circumstances: Interpretation and Modification of the Decree .....	240

	Page
B. Formulating and Administering the Injunction—Continued	
Timothy S. Jost, <i>From Swift to Stotts and Beyond: Modification of Injunctions in the Federal Courts</i> .....	241
<i>Note on Interpretation and Modification of a Decree</i> .....	242
<i>Problems</i> .....	244
<i>Firefighters Local Union No. 1784 v. Stotts</i> .....	245
<i>Notes</i> .....	254
<i>Rufo v. Inmates of Suffolk County Jail</i> .....	254
<i>Notes</i> .....	267
<i>Note on Binding Successors in Office with a Consent Decree</i> .....	269
4. Retaining and Closing a Case .....	271
(a) Judicial Direction to Terminate Jurisdiction .....	271
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Obtaining Release From an Injunction</i> .....	271
<i>Board of Education of Oklahoma City Public Schools v. Dowell</i> .....	272
<i>Notes</i> .....	277
(b) Legislative Direction to Terminate Jurisdiction .....	281
<i>Miller v. French</i> .....	282
<i>Notes</i> .....	296
C. Enforcement of the Decree .....	299
1. The Contempt Power .....	300
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Civil or Criminal Contempt</i> .....	300
<i>Hicks on Behalf of Feiock v. Feiock</i> .....	301
<i>Notes on In Personam Versus In Rem Enforcement</i> .....	308
<i>Notes on the Classification of Contempt Proceedings</i> .....	309
<i>United Mine Workers v. Bagwell</i> .....	310
<i>More Notes on the Classification of Contempt Proceedings</i> .....	321
<i>Notes on the Elements of Contempt</i> .....	323
<i>Notes on Sanctions</i> .....	325
<i>Notes on Procedures</i> .....	327
2. When Are Parties Bound? .....	329
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Violating an Anticipated Order</i> .....	329
<i>Griffin v. County School Board of Prince Edward County</i> .....	329
<i>Notes on Getting Tricky With a Court</i> .....	334
3. The Collateral Bar Rule .....	336
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) The Collateral Bar Rule</i> .....	336
<i>In re Providence Journal Co.</i> .....	336
<i>Notes on the Collateral Bar Rule</i> .....	343
4. Who Is Bound? .....	347
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Injunctions That Coerce Persons Who Are Not Parties</i> .....	347
<i>State University of New York v. Denton</i> .....	347
<i>United States v. Hall</i> .....	350
<i>Notes on Injunctions Against Nonparties</i> .....	354
<i>Note on Washington v. Washington State Commercial Passenger Fishing Vessel Association</i> .....	358

	Page
C. Enforcement of the Decree—Continued	
<i>Note on Notice</i> .....	359
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Injunctions That Harm Persons Who Are Not Proven Violators</i> .....	360
<i>Note on Non-Violators</i> .....	360
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Injunctions That Harm Persons Who Are Not Proven Violators and Are Not Parties</i> .....	362
<i>Note on Martin v. Wilks</i> .....	362
5. Enforcement Against the Government .....	365
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Injunctions That Require the Cooperation of Public Officials</i> .....	365
<i>Note on How Politics Complicates Enforcement</i> .....	367
<i>Note on How Immunity Complicates Enforcement</i> .....	371
<i>Missouri v. Jenkins (Jenkins II)</i> .....	377
<i>Notes</i> .....	385
<i>United States v. City of Yonkers</i> .....	387
<i>Spallone v. United States</i> .....	395
<i>Notes on Tactics to Override Legislative Decisions</i> .....	403
<i>Alexander Bickel, The Least Dangerous Branch</i> .....	410
<i>Notes</i> .....	414
<b>Chapter 4. Declaratory Judgment</b> .....	<b>418</b>
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Declaratory Judgment</i> .....	420
<i>Aetna Life Insurance Co. v. Haworth</i> .....	421
<i>Notes</i> .....	424
<i>Poe v. Ullman</i> .....	425
<i>Notes</i> .....	429
<i>Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc. v. Pfizer, Inc.</i> .....	430
<i>Notes</i> .....	437
<i>Morrison v. Parker</i> .....	438
<i>Notes</i> .....	443
<i>Note on Jurisdiction over Declaratory Judgment Actions in Federal Court</i> .....	446
<i>Note on Reformation</i> .....	449
<b>Chapter 5. Criminal and Civil Sanctions</b> .....	<b>451</b>
A. Distinguishing Criminal and Civil Sanctions .....	451
<i>Kennedy v. Mendoza-Martinez</i> .....	452
<i>United States v. Salerno</i> .....	456
<i>Hudson v. United States</i> .....	462
<i>Notes</i> .....	467
<i>Notes on Differences Between Civil and Criminal Proceedings</i> .....	469
B. Proportionality in Sentencing .....	472
<i>Ewing v. California</i> .....	472
<i>Notes</i> .....	486
C. Punitive Damages .....	489
<i>Grimshaw v. Ford Motor Co.</i> .....	491
<i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell</i> .....	498
<i>Notes</i> .....	510

	Page
C. Punitive Damages—Continued	
<i>Dunn v. HOVIC</i> .....	514
Notes .....	525
D. Civil Economic Sanctions.....	529
William Drayton, Economic Law Enforcement.....	529
Notes .....	536
E. Forfeiture.....	539
<i>Austin v. United States</i> .....	541
<i>United States v. Bajakajian</i> .....	548
Notes .....	556
<b>Chapter 6. Damages</b> .....	<b>558</b>
A. Introduction .....	558
The Nature of the Subject.....	558
<i>Memphis Community School District v. Stachura</i> .....	559
Notes .....	565
<i>Note on Nominal Damages</i> .....	568
<i>Note on Monetary Relief in Law and Equity</i> .....	570
<i>Note on the Right to a Jury Trial</i> .....	572
B. The Basic Issues.....	574
1. A Roadmap to Damages .....	574
Charles McCormick, Handbook on the Law of Damages.....	574
Notes.....	575
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) The Damages</i> Option .....	582
<i>Note on Election of Remedies</i> .....	582
2. Value .....	585
<i>Problems: Valuing the Plaintiff's Loss</i> .....	585
<i>State v. Bishop</i> .....	586
Notes.....	588
<i>Ohio v. Department of the Interior</i> .....	590
Notes.....	599
C. An Overview of Tort Damages.....	602
<i>Ayers v. Jackson Township</i> .....	604
Notes .....	616
1. Elements of the Award .....	625
<i>Bell v. City of Milwaukee</i> .....	625
Notes.....	630
<i>Note on Loss of Consortium</i> .....	634
2. Measuring the Damages.....	635
<i>Tullis v. Townley Engineering &amp; Manufacturing Co.</i> .....	635
Notes.....	638
<i>Walker v. Ritchie</i> .....	643
Notes.....	646
3. Limits on Recovery: Foreseeable, Certain and Unavoidable ...	649
<i>Steinhauser v. Hertz Corp.</i> .....	649
<i>Dillon v. Evanston Hospital</i> .....	651
Notes .....	654
<i>Munn v. Southern Health Plan, Inc.</i> .....	656
Notes.....	661



	Page
C. An Overview of Tort Damages—Continued	
4. Managing Damages Actions: The New Public Law Litigation?	665
Peter H. Schuck, The Role of Judges in Settling Complex Cases: The Agent Orange Example	665
Notes	670
Abram Chayes, The Role of the Judge in Public Law Litigation	670
Richard L. Marcus, Public Law Litigation and Legal Scholarship	670
Notes	674
D. An Overview of Contract Damages	677
1. The Basic Rules	677
<i>Great American Music Machine, Inc. v. Mid-South Record Pressing Co.</i>	677
Notes	684
Charles J. Goetz & Robert E. Scott, Measuring Sellers' Damages: The Lost Profits Puzzle	693
Justin Sweet, Liquidated Damages in California	694
Notes	697
2. Contract or Tort? The Uncertain Boundary	698
<i>Freeman &amp; Mills, Inc. v. Belcher Oil Co.</i>	698
Notes	708
<i>Eura Corp. v. Swiss Bank Corp.</i>	712
Notes	719
E. Adjustments to the Damage Award	722
1. Time and Value: Prejudgment Interest	722
Problem: <i>Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Prejudgment Interest</i>	722
<i>Kansas v. Colorado</i>	722
Notes	728
2. Time and Money: Discounting to Present Value	732
<i>Jones &amp; Laughlin Steel Corporation v. Pfeifer</i>	732
Notes	739
<i>Energy Capital Corp. v. United States</i>	740
Notes	743
3. Taxation of Damage Awards	743
<i>Commissioner of Internal Revenue v. Banks</i>	743
Notes	748
<b>Chapter 7. Restitution and Restitutory Remedies</b>	<b>752</b>
A. Introduction	752
Restatement of Restitution	752
Douglas Laycock, The Scope and Significance of Restitution	752
<i>Note on Approaching Restitution Cases</i>	754
B. Restitution and Unsolicited Benefits	758
Problem: <i>Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Restitution for Benefits Conferred</i>	758
<i>Kossian v. American National Insurance Co.</i>	758
Notes	761

	Page
C. Restitution and Wrongfully Acquired Benefits .....	766
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) A Restitution Op-</i> <i>tion?</i> .....	766
<i>Ollwell v. Nye &amp; Nissen</i> .....	767
Notes .....	769
D. Restitution and Solicited Benefits .....	776
<i>Hutchison v. Pyburn</i> .....	776
Notes .....	778
<i>EarthInfo, Inc. v. Hydrosphere Resource Consultants, Inc.</i> .....	783
Notes .....	789
E. Equitable Restitutionary Remedies .....	794
<i>Problem: Moore v. Regents of the University of California</i> .....	794
<i>Latham v. Father Divine</i> .....	795
<i>Snepp v. United States</i> .....	795
Notes .....	801
<i>Torres v. Eastlick (In Re North American Coin &amp; Currency,</i> <i>Ltd.)</i> .....	805
Notes .....	807
<i>The Corporation of the President of the Church of Jesus Christ</i> <i>of Latter-Day Saints v. Jolley</i> .....	809
Notes .....	811
<i>In re Mushroom Transportation Company, Inc.</i> .....	815
Notes .....	820
<i>A Tracing Problem</i> .....	822
<b>Chapter 8. Collection of Monetary Judgments .....</b>	<b>823</b>
A. Provisional Relief .....	823
<i>Connecticut v. Doehr</i> .....	824
Notes .....	835
<i>United States v. James Daniel Good Real Property</i> .....	839
Notes .....	852
B. Post-Judgment Relief .....	854
1. Basic Collection Strategy .....	854
James J. Brown, Collecting a Judgment .....	854
Notes .....	857
<i>Kahn v. Berman</i> .....	859
Notes .....	864
2. Exempt Property .....	865
<i>Gutterman v. First National Bank of Anchorage</i> .....	865
Notes .....	870
<i>Laws v. Laws</i> .....	872
Notes .....	875
3. Foreclosure Sales .....	877
<i>Griggs v. Miller</i> .....	877
Notes .....	879
4. Body Execution .....	881
<i>Landrigan v. McElroy</i> .....	881
Notes .....	884
<b>Chapter 9. Conduct of the Plaintiff: Bars to Obtaining</b> <b>Relief .....</b>	<b>886</b>
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Plaintiff's Conduct</i> .....	887

	Page
A. Unclean Hands and in Pari Delicto .....	888
<i>Keystone Driller Co. v. General Excavator Co.</i> .....	889
Notes .....	892
<i>Clinton E. Worden &amp; Co. v. California Fig Syrup Co.</i> .....	894
Notes .....	896
<i>Bateman Eichler, Hill Richards, Inc. v. Berner</i> .....	898
Notes .....	904
B. Estoppel .....	906
<i>Johnson v. Williford</i> .....	906
Notes .....	910
<i>Note on the Government as Plaintiff</i> .....	914
C. Laches and Statutes of Limitations .....	916
<i>TRW Inc. v. Andrews</i> .....	917
Notes .....	924
<i>Pro-Football, Inc. v. Harjo</i> .....	928
Notes .....	932
<b>Chapter 10. Attorney's Fees</b> .....	<b>935</b>
A. The Power of the Court to Award Attorney's Fees .....	936
<i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Paying the Attorneys</i> .....	936
<i>Bernhard v. Farmers Insurance Exchange</i> .....	939
Notes .....	946
B. The Parties That Congress Has Made Eligible for Attorney's Fees .....	948
<i>Buckhannon Board and Care Home, Inc. v. West Virginia Department of Health and Human Resources</i> .....	949
Notes .....	963
C. The Measure of the Fees .....	967
1. What Work Is Compensable? .....	968
<i>Sullivan v. Hudson</i> .....	968
Notes .....	975
2. The Rate of Compensation .....	978
(a) Superior Performance .....	979
(b) Risk of Loss Contingency .....	980
(c) Contingency Fee Contract .....	981
Notes .....	983
3. Applying the Lodestar Method .....	985
<i>Gratz v. Bollinger</i> .....	985
Notes .....	1000
D. Conflicts of Interest .....	1002
<i>Evans v. Jeff D.</i> .....	1003
Notes .....	1009
APPENDIX: SELECTED FEDERAL RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE .....	1012
INDEX .....	1027