

2001

New England Early Care and Education Workforce Models for Data Collection

Angie Herrick

Doug Baird
Associated Early Care and Education, Inc.

Tracy Cooley
Muskie School of Public Service

Jeantel DeGazon
Muskie School of Public Service

Julie Dennehy
Muskie School of Public Service

See next page for additional authors

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.usm.maine.edu/cyf>



Part of the [Social Welfare Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Herrick, Angie; Baird, Doug; Cooley, Tracy; DeGazon, Jeantel; Dennehy, Julie; Johnson-Staub, Christine; Oldham, Erin; Richards, Tammy; and Stavsky, Sasha, "New England Early Care and Education Workforce Models for Data Collection" (2001). *Children, Youth, & Families*. 37.
<https://digitalcommons.usm.maine.edu/cyf/37>

This Report is brought to you for free and open access by the Cutler Institute for Health & Social Policy at USM Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Children, Youth, & Families by an authorized administrator of USM Digital Commons. For more information, please contact jessica.c.hovey@maine.edu.

Authors

Angie Herrick, Doug Baird, Tracy Cooley, Jeantel DeGazon, Julie Dennehy, Christine Johnson-Staub, Erin Oldham, Tammy Richards, and Sasha Stavsky



NEW PARTNERS

NEW ENGLAND WORKFORCE PARTNERS FOR EARLY CARE AND EDUCATION

NEW ENGLAND EARLY CARE AND EDUCATION WORKFORCE MODELS FOR DATA COLLECTION



NEW ENGLAND EARLY CARE AND EDUCATION WORKFORCE MODELS FOR DATA COLLECTION

NEW Partners Staff who contributed to this document:

Doug Baird, Associated Early Care and Education, Inc.
Tracy Cooley, Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service
Jeantel DeGazon, Associated Early Care and Education, Inc.
Julie Dennehy, Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service
Angie Herrick, Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service
Christine Johnson-Staub, Associated Early Care and Education, Inc.
Erin Oldham , Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service
Tammy Richards, Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service
Sasha Stavsky, Associated Early Care and Education, Inc.

A Report by the New England Workforce Partners for Early Care and Education (NEW Partners) and funded by a Research and Policy Partnership grant awarded by the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children, Youth and Families, Child Care Bureau.

NEW Partners is a regional partnership among the **Institute for Child and Family Policy of the Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service at the University of Southern Maine** (Portland, ME), **Associated Early Care and Education, Inc.** (Boston, MA), the **Alliance for Children’s Care, Education and Support Services (ACCESS)** (Brunswick, ME), the **United States Association of Child Care (USA Child Care)** (Herndon, VA), and **participants from the six New England States.**

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS



We wish to express our thanks to our Partners, Consultants, Key State Contacts, and the team of individuals who reviewed and contributed greatly to this document.

Kate Arsenault, Office of Child Care Services, Massachusetts
Julie Atkins, Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service
Rachel Connelly, Bowdoin College
Tasha Davidson, Child Care Careers Institutes, Massachusetts
Anne Goldstein, USA Child Care
William Hager, Child Care Services of York County, Maine
Linda Hogan, USA Child Care
Donna Osuch, Connecticut Association for Human Services
Lee Parker, ACCESS
Sue Ryan, Worthy Wage Coalition, Vermont
Jason Sachs, Massachusetts Department of Education
Stefany Shaheen, New Hampshire Business Partners
Diane Stetson, State TA Specialist, NCCIC
Louise Stoney, Stoney Associates
Catherine Walsh, Rhode Island Kids Count

We would like to give special thanks to Jason Sachs, Research and Policy Analyst, Community Profiles, Massachusetts Department of Education, who contributed an abundant amount of time and work to this document and, wrote the appendix, “Data Collection: A Brief Overview”.



NEW PARTNERS

NEW ENGLAND WORKFORCE PARTNERS FOR EARLY CARE AND EDUCATION

bridging research and policy for the early care and education workforce

Institute for Child and Family Policy

Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service
Institute for Child and Family Policy
PO Box 15010
Portland, ME 04112-5010
207-780-5810
207-780-5817 fax

USA Child Care

297 Herndon Pkwy. Suite 104
Herndon VA 20170
703-709-0800
703-709-5672 fax

Associated Early Care and Education, Inc.

95 Berkeley Street
Suite 306
Boston, MA 02116
617-695-0700
617-695-9590 fax

ACCESS

44 Water St.
Brunswick, ME 04011
207-725-6506

**For copies of this report please contact the
Institute for Child and Family Policy at the address above.**

TABLE OF CONTENTS



Introduction	3
New England Workforce Partners	3
Why is it important to collect data?	4
How to Use This Document	4
Chapter I: Measuring Provider Salary	6
Why is provider salary important to quality care?	6
Measuring Center-Based Salary	8
Survey Options to Measure Center-Based Salary	9
Measuring Family Child Care Providers' Income and Expenses.....	11
Survey Options to Measure Family Child Care Providers' Income and Expenses.....	14
Survey Resources: Provider Salary.....	21
Chapter II: Measuring Employee Benefits.....	22
Why are employee benefits important to quality care?.....	22
Measuring Employee Benefits	22
Survey Options to Measure Employee Benefits.....	24
Survey Resources: Employee Benefits.....	29
Chapter III: Measuring Provider Education and Experience.....	29
Why are provider education and experience important to quality care?.....	30
Measuring Provider Education and Experience.....	31
Survey Options to Measure Provider Education	32
Survey Options to Measure Provider Experience	36
Survey Resources: Provider Education and Experience.....	41
Chapter IV: Measuring Professional Development and Training	32
Why are professional development and training important to quality care?.....	42
Measuring Professional Development and Provider Training.....	43
Survey Options to Measure Professional Development & Training	44
Participation	44
Interests	46
Accessibility	49
Barriers/Needs.....	53
Survey Resources: Professional Development and Training	55
Chapter V: Measuring Turnover.....	56
Why is turnover important to quality care?.....	56
Measuring Turnover	57
Survey Options to Measure Turnover	58
Concepts Related to Turnover:	61

Vacancy Rate	61
Experience	62
Reasons for Turnover	63
Exit Interviews	63
Entrance Interviews	65
Survey Resources: Turnover	67
Appendix I: Survey Resources and Contact Information.....	68
Appendix II: Data Collection: A Brief Overview	70

INTRODUCTION



New England Workforce Partners

In the fall of 2000, New England Workforce Partners for Early Care and Education (NEW Partners), a partnership of the University of Southern Maine's Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service, Associated Early Care and Education, Inc. (formerly Associated Day Care Services) of Greater Boston, ACCESS, USA Child Care, and the six New England states received funding from the federal Child Care Bureau to explore issues around early care and education workforce recruitment and retention in New England. Specifically, NEW Partners sought to answer the following questions:

- What is the status of the early care and education workforce in New England and in the region's individual states?
- What policies and projects are New England states implementing to address early care and education workforce challenges such as recruitment, retention, and staff qualifications?
- Do those policies appear to be having an impact?

In its first year, NEW Partners facilitated an unprecedented collaboration. Teams from all six New England states (Connecticut, Maine, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, Rhode Island, and Vermont) participated in a series of regional meetings to identify current workforce issues, discuss policies and programs being implemented, and talk about strategies for collecting data and evaluating those policies.

Among NEW Partners' earliest findings was that New England states were trying exciting new policies and programs – some of which were on the cutting edge nationwide – but by and large states and other stakeholders were not collecting the data necessary to measure change that may be resulting from those policies and programs. In response, NEW Partners set two priorities for its first year: 1) to help states, programs, and individuals develop ways to collect more detailed early care and education workforce data, and 2) to disseminate information about promising policies and programs states have implemented or are in the process of implementing. This document is one way NEW Partners aims to accomplish our first priority

Through this document NEW Partners will provide concrete examples of ways to collect early care and education workforce data as well as provide technical assistance in:

- Thinking about what data to collect;
- Building and expanding data collection systems;
- Collecting data for current advocacy and planning; and
- Developing long-term systems for data collection.

Why is it important to collect data?

Data are crucial for policy and program planning, as well as advocacy efforts. Systematic data collection can:

- Document the success and needs of the early care and education community;
- Provide information on existing resources and identify gaps in services;
- Inform policy and program planning;
- Allow for comparisons across programs, communities, states, or to a national average;
- Help plan for improvements and set benchmarks for the future;
- Offer justification for and accountability around the use of public funds or leverage other resources; and
- Advocate for policy and program changes when necessary.

It is hoped that this document will inspire early care and education practitioners, advocates, and policy makers to take bold steps in collecting the data they need to make more informed policy and programmatic decisions as well as to establish systematic data collection within their states and the region. The collection of relevant data – both before a new strategy is implemented and on an ongoing basis to track its effectiveness – is essential for long-term effective programming.

How to Use This Document

New England Early Care and Education Workforce Models for Data Collection is designed to make the process of data collection easier to understand and to help ensure that the information collected is as useful as possible. Each chapter in this document provides an outline of a major workforce-related issue on which one might want to systematically collect data (data elements). *The Data Document* has five chapters on the following workforce-related topics: **Salary; Benefits; Education and Experience; Professional Development and Training; and Turnover.**

Each chapter contains the following sections:

Introduction – an overview of how each data element relates to quality care and why it is important to measure.

Issues to Consider – a discussion of special issues to consider when measuring each data element (such as populations to survey or consistency in defining terms) and special considerations for collecting information from family child care providers.

How to Measure – examples of survey questions excerpted and sometimes edited from existing surveys, as well as a partial list of the advantages and disadvantages of each example.

Resources – a listing of citations for the data collection tools and research reports that were consulted in compiling the examples for each chapter.

The document also includes two appendices. **Appendix One** consists of a bibliography of survey resources used throughout this document. Contact information is provided within each citation to ensure that those resources can be accessed for those wanting more specific information. **Appendix Two** contains excerpts from a guide on “How to Collect Data” written by Jason Sachs for the Massachusetts Department of Education Community Profiles Project in which local community groups are intimately involved in the data collection process. This appendix provides additional research and statistical information and guidance for those who would like to pursue community-level data collection.

A Note of Caution

Although, *The Data Document* provides examples and suggestions for data collection, it is **not** intended to be a “how-to” manual. It is not advisable to cut and paste together survey examples listed in the chapters and consider the resulting document a “survey,” because the examples are presented out of context. Survey development is an important piece of research design. NEW Partners strongly encourages those who want to undertake research and data collection **to first invest the necessary resources and time as well as the expertise of trained researchers** to attain the most useful data possible – data that are valid, reliable, appropriately collected, and policy-relevant.

CHAPTER I: MEASURING PROVIDER SALARY



Why is provider salary important to quality care?

Despite the increased demand for child care, wages for child care providers are remarkably low. According to the Bureau of Labor Statistics, in 1997 child care workers earned an average of \$7.03 per hour, slightly less than parking lot attendants who earned an average of \$7.06 per hour. Child care workers earn considerably less than women in the general workforce who have the same level of education.ⁱ

Poor compensation results in difficulty recruiting and retaining qualified child care staff. Teaching staff earning the lowest wages were more than twice as likely to leave their jobs than were staff earning higher wages.ⁱⁱ Conversely, studies show that skilled teaching staff are more likely to stay if they earn higher-than-average wages. For instance, the National Child Care Staffing Study found that teachers who stayed on the job earned \$2.00 more than comparably educated teachers in the community who left their positions.ⁱⁱⁱ

Several studies have found that teacher wages are related to the quality of child care.^{iv} The Cost, Quality, and Outcomes Study found that teachers' wages were a better predictor of whether care was poor, moderate, or high quality than other variables, including teacher education and training.^v The Quality in Family Child Care and Relative Care Study found that the amount parents paid for care, which translated into providers' wages, was directly related to caregiver sensitivity.^{vi} Scarr, Eisenberg and Deater-Deckard found that teachers' wages were a better predictor of quality than other variables, including staff-child ratios.^{vii}

Why Measure Provider Salary?

Measuring child care workforce salary helps researchers, administrators, advocates, policy makers, and other groups that do not provide direct care to children, better understand the child care staffing crisis from an economic perspective. Measuring salary also provides context for other workforce issues that are constantly at the forefront of child care, such as turnover, retention and recruitment.

The Massachusetts Early Care & Education Recruitment and Retention Study was successful in receiving media attention for its findings and recommendations. *The Cape Cod Times* May, 9, 2001 issue wrote an extensive article about how low child care workers wages are, and the impact of low wages.

“Newly released state and national studies are reporting what directors of child care centers have long known. Child care centers are losing staff at a tremendous rate, and a key reason is low pay. And Cape Cod and Western Massachusetts report the lowest wage scales in the state.”^{viii}

Many other groups have also used these findings for public education and advocacy purposes and to advocate for policy changes that would increase providers' salaries.

In addition, systematic data collection of providers' salaries can help:

- Determine the effectiveness of policy initiatives to improve wages;
- Document the success and needs of the ECE community;
- Provide information on existing resources and identify gaps in services;

- Inform policy and program planning;
- Compare across programs, communities, states, or to a national average;
- Plan for improvements and set benchmarks for the future;
- Offer justification for the use of public funds or leverage other resources; and
- Advocate for policy and program changes when necessary.

NOTE: There are different factors and considerations to take into account when measuring the salaries of center-based providers and family child care. Therefore, these topics will be addressed separately.

CENTER-BASED, HEAD START AND SCHOOL AGE CARE PROVIDERS

Issues to Consider When Measuring Center-Based Salary

Annual salary vs. hourly wages

Many existing salary surveys ask for hourly wages. Hourly wages are typically used to compare those who work a different number of hours per week. It is also helpful to ask for (or to be able to calculate) annual wages since many indicators, such as the federal poverty level, are expressed in terms of annual earnings. However, if a survey asks for annual earnings, or if you intend on calculating annual salary from a reported hourly wage, it is essential to also ask hours worked.

Many wage surveys give respondents the choice of giving hourly rate plus hours worked per week **or** annual salary. The respondent is likely to know one or the other, but not necessarily both; and may inaccurately answer if the choice is forced – or not respond at all. So choice can improve response rate in this instance. However, it takes up more space and requires more work to standardize data on the analysis end.

Actual wages, average wages, or the range from lowest to highest wages

Although actual wages may be ideal, in that provides the most accurate account of wages, it can be difficult and time consuming for a respondent to complete for programs with multiple staff. Asking for average wages is useful, however it may not be easy for a respondent to calculate. A range of high and low wages provides the best vision of the entry-level wages and wage ceilings. However, when asking for either the average or the range, one should know that outliers (providers or programs with unusually high or low wages) may under- or overestimate the true picture.

Wages differentiated by job title

Asking questions that differentiate between teaching staff levels is helpful as there are often wide differences between the salaries of teaching assistants and head teachers, or starting salaries and the salary of the highest paid teacher on staff. However, it is important to recognize that job titles vary across and within states (i.e. head teacher vs. lead teacher). Therefore, it is necessary to clearly define terms.

Full-time staff and part-time staff

In collecting salary data on both full-time and part-time staff, it is important to make this distinction in the wording of survey questions. It is also necessary to clearly define how many hours per week constitute “full-time” and “part-time” work.

Survey Options to Measure Center-Based Salary

The following examples are different methods for measuring salary for center-based providers. Options given illustrate the different levels of detail a survey can obtain. Recall that the level of detail may vary depending on the purpose of the survey.

Option #1

Population to be surveyed: Child Care Center, Head Start Program, or School-Age Program Directors

Please enter the following information regarding staff in your program:

Position	Highest Paid Hourly Wage	Lowest Paid Hourly Wage
Director		
Full-time* Lead Teacher		
Part-time Lead Teacher		
Full-time* Teacher		
Part-time Teacher		
Full-time* Asst Teacher		
Part-time Asst Teacher		
Total # of Staff		

**Full-time denotes staff who work 30 hours or more per week*

Advantages:

- Includes different teaching levels / job titles.
- Defines full-time and part-time.
- Range gives actual minimum and maximum limit.
- Asked of directors who would be in best position to know the range of salaries paid.

Disadvantages:

- Ranges do not provide an actual sense of the average wage and may skew the true picture.
- Does not clearly define terms; cannot calculate weekly (and annual) wages without the number of hours per week and weeks per year.
- Job titles need to be defined in case providers use different terms/job titles.
- May not express the full range of salaries – i.e. starting salary may be lower than any currently “lowest paid” person at a position.

Option # 2

Population to be surveyed: Child Care Center, Head Start Program, or School-Age Program Directors

Salary and Wages

(To estimate an hourly wage, divide gross earnings for each pay period by the # of hours worked during that time. While we encourage annual salaries for child care personnel, we ask for hourly data to allow for work comparisons between staff who work different schedules.)

Teacher Salaries *(Teacher refers to persons in charge of a group or classroom of children)*

Do all teachers receive the same starting salary, regardless of education and experience?

yes: starting salary is \$____/hour

no: starting salary ranges from \$____/hour to \$____/hour
\$____per hour

What *hourly* wage does the *highest* paid teacher currently earn?

How many hours, on average, do teachers work each week?
(Include paid breaks and lunches in your calculation of hours worked each week.)

_____ hours **per week**
for full-time teachers

(This series of questions is repeated for each job title).

_____ hours **per week**
for part-time teachers

Advantages:

- Defines job titles.
- Question is asked of various job titles.
- Explains how to calculate an hourly wage.
- Distinguishes between full-time and part-time based on average number of hours worked per week.
- Indicates whether teachers are compensated for additional training or education.
- Can approximate highest paid teacher's weekly salary based on their hourly wage and the average number of hours worked per week (however, would still need to know how many weeks per year to approximate annual salary).
- Provides the range of salaries offered.

Disadvantages:

- Cannot calculate annual salary.
- Cannot calculate average teacher's salary unless this question is preceded by a question of how many teachers are employed under each job title.
- Confusing question; asks directors to make a calculation they may never have done before.

Option # 3

Population to be surveyed: Child Care Center, Head Start Program, or School-Age Program Teachers

To help us understand the adequacy of pay for the care of children, please answer the following questions.

What is your job title? Please check one.

- Lead teacher
- Teacher
- Assistant teacher
- Other (please specify) _____

What is your hourly wage? _____/hour

How many hours per week are you employed? _____/week

How many weeks per year do you work? _____/year

Advantages:

- Includes different job titles (but job titles are not defined, see disadvantages).
- Allows the calculation of annual salary.
- Clear and concise.

Disadvantages:

- Asked directly of teachers, which is fine if measuring a small and clearly defined group of teaching staff. However, it is difficult to identify and reach all teaching staff.
- Job titles are not defined.
- Cannot calculate average salary unless question about the number of teachers in each position is also included. However, individual teachers are not the appropriate respondent for questions about the full staff of the organization.

MEASURING FAMILY CHILD CARE PROVIDERS' INCOME AND EXPENSES

Issues to Consider When Measuring Family Child Care Providers' Income and Expenses

Defining Terms

Measuring the salaries of family child care providers is less straightforward than measuring center based compensation. Although they may charge individual families hourly fees, family child care providers are rarely paid what would be considered an hourly wage. In calculating an annual income, there are usually additional expenses that need to be factored in as well as direct income. In addition, a provider's fees may vary from week to week depending on the ages of the children he/she is serving (if variable rates are charged), children's attendance, and parents' ability to pay.

Therefore, it is important to capture all possible sources of **income** and **expenditures** for a family child care provider. And it is important to clearly and visibly define terms like income and expenditures so that respondents are certain about the questions being asked. For example, the term "expenditures" needs to be defined so that those items are identifiable by providers, and there is some level of consistency. Oftentimes questions are left unanswered because the question is phrased in a way that does not seem applicable to the provider.

Examples of Possible sources of income – not a full list:

- Parent fees/rates (full-time, part-time, by age of child)
- Special rates (early drop off, unplanned late pick-up, drop-in, absences, discounts, scholarships)
- State/federal subsidy rates
- Child and Adult Care Food Program (USDA)
- Grants, corporate sponsors

Examples of Possible expenditures - not a full list:

- Rent/mortgage
- Property taxes
- Repairs and maintenance
- Utilities
- Transportation (if provided)
- Professional membership fees or dues
- Health insurance
- Insurance (other than health, such as liability)
- Cost of consumable items (food, paper supplies, materials)
- Assistant/substitutes
- Savings for retirement
- Durable equipment (furniture, toys, etc.)

Direct and Indirect Expenses

Because Family Child Care businesses are often located in the provider's home, one needs to be careful about differentiating between direct and indirect expenses related to the child care business. A direct expense is a cost that is incurred by the child care business only. For example, educational or office supplies would be direct expenses and the total cost could be attributed to the business. However, the rent or mortgage paid to house the family as well as the business is an indirect expense. A portion of the mortgage payment pays for the space for the child care business but also pays to house the provider's family. To accurately reflect the portion of the mortgage payment attributable to the child care business you would also need to measure the dwelling and assign a proportion of the building to the business and to the home, then calculate what portion of the mortgage should be assigned to the business. ***This is a complicated calculation and we strongly recommend you consult with an economist to ensure the accuracy of these calculations.***

Comparability

It is often desirable to compare family child care provider's "salary" to that of a center-based provider. Calculating an hourly and an annual salary is useful for public education and advocacy purposes, because an hourly/annual salary is a common term and easily understood by the general public. It can also be easily compared to other fields, occupations, and the Federal Poverty Line.

The Community Profiles project, from the Massachusetts Department of Education, developed a formula to estimate the salary of family child care providers. Their formula is as follows:

The total income including parent fees, subsidies, and USDA food subsidies divided by the number of hours spent caring for children and other FCC-business related time.

For example, a provider's weekly income is \$300. She works an average of 60 hours per week.
 $300/60 = 5$ Her hourly salary would be \$5 per hour.

This formula is effective for estimating an hourly salary, but does not fully and accurately account for all of the expenses associated with providing care in the home, such as mortgage payments and wear and tear on the house. However an estimate can still be worthwhile. The section that follows provides examples that would allow for capturing the necessary information to replicate this calculation, as well as other measures of FCC's income and expenses.

Survey Options to Measure Family Child Care Providers' Income and Expenses

The following examples are different methods for measuring Family Child Care **income and expenses**. Examples provided below illustrate the different levels of detail a survey can obtain. Recall that the level of detail may vary depending on the purpose of the survey.

Income from Parent Fees

Option # 1

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

Please complete for each child in your care.

Box #1: INFANTS (0-11 months)

Initials of each infant	Usual pay per week for child (If you do not receive pay for care write 0)	Usual # of hours per week
1. _____	\$ _____	_____ hours
2. _____	\$ _____	_____ hours
3. _____	\$ _____	_____ hours
4. _____	\$ _____	_____ hours
5. _____	\$ _____	_____ hours

(Same question and format for toddlers (12-35 months), pre-school (3 years - 4 years 11 months), and school age (5-12 years).)

Advantages:

- Broken down by child category to illustrate the fee differences by child's age.
- Weekly pay and number of children provide a sense of the provider's salary on a weekly basis.
- Clearly defines child age categories.

Disadvantages:

- None noted

Option #2

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

Full-time rates: If you charge different rates for different ages, complete this chart. Fill in only those columns that reflect how you charge. (*Disregard family discounts and sliding fee scale.*)

	Hourly rate	Full-day rate	Weekly rate
a) Infant care	\$ ____ . ____ per hour	\$ ____ . ____ per full day	\$ ____ . ____ per week
b) Toddler care	\$ ____ . ____ per hour	\$ ____ . ____ per full day	\$ ____ . ____ per week
c) Pre-school care	\$ ____ . ____ per hour	\$ ____ . ____ per full day	\$ ____ . ____ per week
d) Kindergarten care	\$ ____ . ____ per hour	\$ ____ . ____ per full day	\$ ____ . ____ per week
e) School-age care	\$ ____ . ____ per hour	\$ ____ . ____ per session	\$ ____ . ____ per week

(Question is repeated for part-time rates.)

Advantages:

- Good sense of the fee differences for each age group.
- Broken down by hourly, full-day and weekly rates just in case children are not on the same schedule.
- Same question is asked for part-time rates, capturing more detail.

Disadvantages:

- Assumes all children of the same age are charged the same parent fees.
- Need an additional follow-up question asking how many children served in each age group to calculate total parent fee income.
- Does not define age categories.
- It is a complicated table; it could be confusing for some respondents.
- By not counting sibling discounts and sliding fee scales, this question will capture the *potential* income of a provider but not the *actual* current income. Discounted fees would need to be incorporated into this question or through a follow-up question.

Income from Other Sources

Option #1

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

Using a financial statement or other records, please record your revenues below for ____ year. Please tell us how much your program received from each of the following sources. Please include cash income only, not in-kind donations. If your program does not receive funds from a particular source, enter \$0. Record in whole dollars, do not include cents.

Source of Funding	Amount of Funds Received
Total Parent Fees	\$
Fund Raising	\$
Local, state, and federal subsidies	\$
USDA Food Program Subsidies	\$
Other Cash income from any source please specify:	\$

Advantages:

- Collects, in a monetary way other sources of income for providers.
- Straightforward question, easy to understand and complete.

Disadvantages:

- Family Child Care providers may not have financial statements or records that calculate total income from parent fees. This question may be asking for information that a provider has never calculated before.

Hours Worked

Option #1

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

What are your hours of open? (Please circle the days that you are open and fill in the hours of operation for those days.)

	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	Saturday	Sunday
From							
To							

Advantages:

- Straightforward question, easy for providers to answer.

Disadvantages:

- Clearly captures hours of operation, but does not capture other work hours such as curriculum development, shopping for supplies and/or food.

Option #2

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

How many hours a week do you spend doing the following activities related to your child care business?

Activity	Number of Hours per Week
Providing direct care to children	
Curriculum development	
Set up/break down	
Cleaning	
Nutrition planning/food shopping	
Maintenance	
Record keeping/budgeting	
Other (please specify):	

Advantages:

- Collects work hours in addition to hours spent providing direct child care.
- Allows one to calculate total hours worked as well as average number of hours Family Child Care providers spend completing various activities.

Disadvantages:

- None noted.

Expenses

The following examples are different methods for measuring Family Child Care **expenses**. Options given illustrate the different levels of detail a survey can obtain. Recall that the level of detail may vary depending on the purpose of the survey.

Option # 1

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

In setting your rates, which of the following do you consider? *Check all that apply and then circle the 3 that are most important to you.*

- What other family child care providers near me charge
- My rent or mortgage
- Property taxes
- Repairs and maintenance
- My utility (heat, electricity, and water) costs
- Fees I pay because I provide child care (e.g. memberships, trainings, conferences)
- My health insurance
- My insurance (other than health)
- The cost of consumable items (e.g. meals, snacks, paper supplies)
- Paying child care assistant (s)
- Saving for retirement
- Any vacation time for myself
- The value of my own time
- Other: _____

Advantages:

- Detailed list of possible expenses that providers may/may not have considered.
- Illustrates the level of costs that go into family child care.

Disadvantages:

- Does not capture the cost in monetary terms

Option #2

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

Next, we want to ask about your expenses--what it costs you to provide child care. Use business records including tax forms, or provide your best estimate of how much you spend.

Do you know what your total deductible business expenses were last year? (IRS Schedule C, Line 28)

_____ yes, they were \$ _____

_____ no, not sure.

Please give us your best estimate \$ _____

This question is followed by several other questions relating to direct business expenses for child care, business use of their home, and gross/net annual income. The questions regarding direct business expenses and the business use of their home provide a list of possible expense categories (food, toys, equipment, etc. for direct business expenses, and utilities, repairs, etc. for business use of home) and ask for the amount per month or year spent on each category. The gross/net annual income question asks for an estimate for the year.

Advantages:

- Utilizes administrative data (i.e. tax forms), which may increase likelihood of the question being answered correctly by respondents, if it was calculate correctly according to the directions on the tax form itself.

Disadvantages:

- Assumes respondents know what “deductible business expenses” includes.
- Assumes providers filled out tax forms, or know how to fill out tax forms.
- May not be accurate if provider did not include all the possible expenditures in their tax forms.
- Refers to tax forms, may frighten or dissuade providers from responding to such questions.

Option #3

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

Please tell me what you actually spent in the most recent completed fiscal year on the following items, if anything. Round to the nearest dollar, do not include cents. Do not include in-kind donations.

Labor costs	
Salaries and wages for all staff	\$
Fringe benefits, payroll taxes (FICA, unemployment, etc.)	\$
Other Costs	\$
Rent/Mortgage/fee for space	\$
Utilities (including electric, heat, telephone)	\$
Repair and maintenance	\$
Costs for serving meals & snacks to children	\$
Educational materials	\$
Office materials	\$
Household Supplies used for the child care business	\$
Training	\$
Professional Fees	\$
Insurance (homeowners and/or liability)	\$
Contributions to Retirement for self	\$
Other	\$

Advantages:

- A substantial list of possible expenses and room for “other”.
- Written and formatted simply, collects a lot of information in a small amount of space and in easily understood language.

Disadvantages:

- Asks for costs that the provider may never have calculated before, may be difficult for provider to complete.
- Not all costs are direct costs and additional data will need to be collected to determine exactly how much of the cost is attributable to the child care business as opposed to the home. ***We recommend you consult with an economist to calculate this.***

Survey Resources: Provider Salary

- Associated Early Care and Education, Inc., *Boston EQUIP Center & Head Start Survey*, 1999
- Center for Child Care Workforce, *Child Care Center Salary and Working Conditions Survey*, 2000
- Center for Child Care Workforce, *Family Child Care Provider Income and Working Conditions Survey*, 2000
- Maine Roads to Quality Child Care and Early Education Career Development Center, Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service, University of Southern Maine, *MRTQ Baseline Survey*, 2000
- Massachusetts Office of Child Care Services, *Salary and Benefits Survey*, 2000
- Vermont Agency of Human Services, Child Care Services Division, *A Study of Wages, Credentials, Benefits and Market Rates*, 2000
- Wellesley Centers for Women and Abt Associates, Inc., *The Cost and Quality of Full Day, Year-round Early Care and Education in Massachusetts: Preschool Classrooms*, 2001

CHAPTER II: MEASURING EMPLOYEE BENEFITS



Why are employee benefits important to quality care?

Lack of employee benefits contributes to staff turnover. Stability (i.e. lack of turnover) among providers is an important indicator of quality care. Like many low-wage workers, child care providers often do not have access to benefits such as health insurance, paid vacation, sick time, or even child care assistance for their own children, which are important aspects influencing a worker's environment.^{ix} After low wages, child care workers cite insufficient or lack of employee benefits as one of the main reasons they leave the field. In addition, a recent study for *Success by 6* conducted in Massachusetts by the McCormack Institute of Public Affairs found that over half of the center-based child care classroom staff surveyed listed concerns over their health care benefits as a reason they had considered leaving the field.^x

Why measure employee benefits?

Documenting child care workers' access to employee benefits provides insight into difficulties with both recruiting and retaining staff. For example, the Massachusetts Office of Child Care Services Recruitment and Retention study found that 49% of center directors use the provision of health benefits as a way to recruit staff, and 57% use health benefits as a strategy to retain staff. When asked for statewide solutions to help recruit and retain classroom staff, 36% of center directors said that providing affordable benefits packages would be very helpful in recruiting and retaining teachers.^{xi}

Systematic data collection about employee benefits can help:

- Document the success and needs of the ECE community;
- Provide information on existing resources and identify gaps in services;
- Inform policy and program planning;
- Compare across programs, communities, states, or to a national average;
- Plan for improvements and set benchmarks for the future;
- Offer justification for the use of public funds or leverage other resources; and
- Advocate for policy and program changes when necessary.

Issues to Consider When Measuring Employee Benefits

Ask the most relevant questions and decide upon the level of detail needed.

Survey questions may range from asking the most basic information, such as the provision of health and dental insurance, to a more complete list of possible employee benefits. When designing a survey, consider what level of detail is necessary. For instance, in 1999, the Child Care Resource and Referral Network of New Hampshire was considering solutions for providing health insurance to providers. As information on health insurance in particular was needed, a telephone survey of every child care center in the state was completed asking specifically about the provision of health insurance; a full benefits survey was not needed at that time.

Consider collecting information on the sources of benefits

While many child care workers may not be receiving benefits through their employer, they may have access to benefits (particularly health and dental insurance) from other sources, such as their spouses' employers or public programs. If you are interested in determining how many providers have any access to benefits - through their employers or otherwise - include questions about other sources of health insurance on the survey.

Specify the population to be surveyed

Because of the independent nature of their work, family child care providers – particularly those not affiliated with a network – may have less access to employee benefits than center-based providers. Therefore, it may be necessary to treat these populations differently in the way they are surveyed. One can design a survey to address all the different ways both center-based and family child care providers access employee benefits, or it may be more useful to develop a separate survey to collect information about benefits from one specific population.

SURVEY OPTIONS TO MEASURE: EMPLOYEE BENEFITS

The following examples are different methods for measuring employee benefits. Options given illustrate the different levels of detail a survey can obtain. Recall that the level of detail may vary depending on the purpose of the survey.

Option #1:

Population to be surveyed: Child care programs, such as Child Care Centers, Head Start Programs, or School Age Program Directors

Do you offer any of the employee benefits listed below?

- No Yes (*If yes, check the benefits your center offers in the chart below.*)

	Full-time employees	Part-time employees
Medical insurance		
Dental insurance		
Disability insurance		
Retirement plan		
Paid vacation		
Paid sick time/personal days		
Paid staff break		
Reduced rates for staff's children		
Financial assistance to cover courses for credit		
Financial assistance for in-service workshops, conferences, etc.		
Paid parental leave		
Other: (please specify)		

Advantages:

- Compiles detailed information on which benefits and the range of benefits that are offered.
- Gives differences between benefits offered to full-time and part-time employees.
- Well-formatted; gathers detailed information using a relatively small amount of space.
- Easy for respondent to answer.

Disadvantages:

- Definitions of full-time and part-time employees may vary by program. Therefore, it is important to state specifically what constitutes full and part-time staff.
- Collects information on what benefits programs offer their employees; cannot tell how many individual employees use these benefits.
- Does not tell (for medical, dental, or disability) whether employer contributes to the cost of the plan or if the plan is offered and employees pay full premium.

Option #2:

Population to be surveyed: Child Care Centers, Head Start Programs, or School Age Program Directors

What is your center's policy regarding insurance coverage for employees? (Check all that apply.)

	Full-time employee	Part-time employee
Fully paid insurance for employee only	<input type="checkbox"/> Medical <input type="checkbox"/> Dental	<input type="checkbox"/> Medical <input type="checkbox"/> Dental
Fully paid insurance for employee and dependents	<input type="checkbox"/> Medical <input type="checkbox"/> Dental	<input type="checkbox"/> Medical <input type="checkbox"/> Dental
Partially paid insurance for employee only	<input type="checkbox"/> Medical (program pays ____%) <input type="checkbox"/> Dental (program pays ____%)	<input type="checkbox"/> Medical (program pays ____%) <input type="checkbox"/> Dental (program pays ____%)
Partially paid insurance for employee and dependents	<input type="checkbox"/> Medical (program pays ____%) <input type="checkbox"/> Dental (program pays ____%)	<input type="checkbox"/> Medical (program pays ____%) <input type="checkbox"/> Dental (program pays ____%)

Advantages:

- Gives differences between benefits offered to full-time and part-time employees.
- Collects data regarding what percentage of health and dental insurance the employee pays, and what percentage the center pays.
- Well-formatted; gathers detailed information using a relatively small amount of space.

Disadvantages:

- Definitions of full-time and part-time employees may vary by program. Therefore, it is important to state specifically what constitutes full and part-time staff.
- Collects information on what benefits programs offer to their employees, cannot tell how or if providers may receive these benefits through other means.
- Provides detailed information on health and dental insurance but not other types of benefits.
- Provides no information on the scope of benefits.
- Does not include information on employee paid insurance offered through employer.

Option #3:

Population to be surveyed: Center-based or Family Child Care Providers

Which of the following benefits do you have? (check all that apply.)

- | | |
|---|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Health insurance | <input type="checkbox"/> Self Paid |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Dental insurance | <input type="checkbox"/> Employer Paid |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Retirement | <input type="checkbox"/> Through Spouse |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Life insurance | <input type="checkbox"/> Other |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Disability insurance | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Paid Family leave | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Paid vacation time | _____ days per year |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Unpaid vacation time | _____ days per year |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Paid holidays | _____ days per year |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Unpaid holidays | _____ days per year |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Staff training days | _____ days per year |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Tuition | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Other (Please Specify) | |

Advantages:

- Provides information on a variety of benefits.
- Collects information on different ways providers can access benefits, including coverage by a spouse.
- Short length, does not require a lot of space.
- Easy for respondent to answer.

Disadvantages:

- Question assumes that all benefits are provided through one source.
- Survey question needs to be clarified to determine if question is asking if employees “are offered” or “have taken advantage of” the following benefits.
- Information not given on whether provider works full or part-time (unless question regarding hours of employment is added to address this).
- It is difficult to locate all teaching staff within a program to ask a survey question of them directly.

Option #4:

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

Please indicate which benefits are available to you. Indicate whether or not this benefit is provided by your Family Child Care business, i.e. as part of a larger family day care system, or if the benefits come from another source, such as a working spouse.

	Through your own Family Child Care business	Through your spouse or other source
Vacation		
Sick time		
Paid holidays		
Paid maternity and/or paternity leave		
Health care		
Disability		
Life insurance		
Retirement package		
Tuition assistance		
Liability insurance		
Other (please specify)		

Advantages:

- Provides information on several types of benefits.
- Collects data on source of benefits.
- Short length.
- Easy for respondent to answer.

Disadvantages:

- Collects limited information on source of benefits; not detailed enough if, for example, you want information on utilization of state program that allows FCC providers to access benefits.
- Does not collect data on what percentage of health and dental insurance the provider pays and what percentage the employer pays.
- Information not given on whether provider works full or part-time (unless question regarding hours of employment is added to address this).

Option #5:

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

- A. Do you currently have health insurance coverage?
- (1) no, go to Question B
 - (2) yes, *for yourself only*, go to Question C
 - (3) yes, for dependents only, go to Question C
 - (4) yes, for self and dependents, go to Question C
- B. If no, in the past year have you been covered by:
- (1) Medicaid, Medicare or other public health insurance program
 - (2) other health insurance that is no longer in effect
 - (3) no plan for the last year or more
- C. Do you receive assistance with health coverage costs from any of the following sources? Please read all options before selecting your response. (Check only one.)
- (1) no assistance
 - (2) yes, full coverage cost for self and dependents paid by spouse/partner's employer
 - (3) yes, full coverage cost for self only paid by spouse/partner's employer
 - (4) yes, partial coverage for self and dependents paid by spouse/partner's employer
 - (5) yes, partial coverage for self only paid by spouse/partner's employer
 - (6) yes, Medicaid/Medicare eligible
 - (7) yes, coverage for dependents only from state plan, (e.g., SCHIP)
 - (8) other, please specify:

Advantages:

- Provides detailed information on sources of health insurance including Medicaid/Medicare usage.
- Provides information on provider's coverage in the past year.
- Provides detailed information on the extent of insurance coverage, including dependents.

Disadvantages:

- Formatting takes a lot of space and wording is complex.
- Difficult for respondent to complete.
- Does not collect data on what percentage of health and dental insurance the provider pays, and what percentage the employer pays.
- Information not given on whether provider works full or part-time (unless question regarding hours of employment is added to address this).

Survey Resources: Employee Benefits

- Center for Child Care Workforce, *Family Child Care Provider Income and Working Conditions Survey*, 2000
- Maine Roads to Quality Child Care and Early Education Career Development Center, Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service, University of Southern Maine, *MRTQ Baseline Survey*, 2000
- Massachusetts Department of Education *Community Profiles, Family Child Care Survey*, 2000-01
- Massachusetts Office of Child Care Services, *Salary and Benefits Survey*, 2000
- Vermont Agency of Human Services, Child Care Services Division, *A Study of Wages, Credentials, Benefits and Market Rates*, 2000

CHAPTER III: MEASURING PROVIDER EDUCATION AND EXPERIENCE



Why are provider education and experience important to quality care?

There is a growing body of research that finds provider education, specifically early childhood education, paired with experience caring for children are strong predictors of high quality child care.^{xiii} Despite this knowledge, the 1997 National Child Care Staffing study found that only 25% of participating child care centers required teachers to have a Bachelor's degree, and only 19% required teaching assistants to have completed any college work.^{xiii} In addition, 31 states do not require providers to have any early childhood training before they work in child care centers, and 41 states do not require training for family child care providers.^{xiv}

Why measure provider education and experience?

Gathering data on the qualifications of child care workers can act as one proxy to determine the quality of the care provided in a state. Because of low compensation for child care workers, directors and other administrative staff have found it difficult both to recruit and retain highly qualified teachers and providers. For example, the 1999 Survey of New Hampshire Family and Center-Based Child Care Programs found that high turnover among teachers led to hiring teaching assistants to replace them.^{xv} This finding was significant in that teacher assistants on average had less education than teachers. The collection and analysis of turnover data with information on education by position allowed the state to recognize this trend.

In addition, systematic data collection on child care workers' education and experience can help:

- Document the success and needs of the ECE community;
- Provide information on existing resources and identify gaps in services;
- Inform policy and program planning;
- Compare across programs, communities, states, or to a national average;
- Plan for improvements and set benchmarks for the future;
- Offer justification for the use of public funds or leverage other resources; and
- Advocate for policy and program changes when necessary.

Issues to Consider When Measuring Provider Education and Experience

Highest level of education completed versus on-going or current enrollment

Collecting information on the highest level of education completed gives a snapshot of the qualifications of child care workers at a given point in time. Studies have shown (cited previously) that specialized education in early care and education leads to higher quality care. Therefore survey questions should specify field and specialization as well as degree. Further, if paired with salary questions, collecting the highest level of education attained allows one to compare salary as related to level of education and degrees.

Collecting information on ongoing professional development toward a degree or certificate program may provide a sense of what the field *might* look like at some point in the near future in terms of its qualifications and expertise. It can also show current child care workers' commitment to improving their education. However, this is not a reliable way to measure provider education, as students enrolled may not finish their degree program or may leave the field after completing a degree.

All child care experience, not just experience at one job

Because of the high rate of turnover in child care, asking how long a child care worker has worked at their current position can underestimate his or her total experience working in the child care field. Questions that ask for total months/years of experience in the field, in addition to time working in the current position are more informative.

Survey Options to Measure Provider Education

The following examples are different methods for measuring provider education. Options given illustrate the different levels of detail a survey can obtain. Recall that the level of detail may vary depending on the purpose of the survey.

Option #1:

Population to be surveyed: Child Care Center Teachers and/or Family Child Care Providers

Please check the highest education level you have completed.

- Some high school – highest grade completed _____
- GED or High School Diploma
- Some college courses
- Child Development Associate (CDA) credential
- One Year Certificate in Early Childhood Education (ECE)
- Associate of Arts (AA) degree in ECE
- Associate of Arts (AA) in: _____ (major)
- Bachelor’s (BA or BS) degree in ECE
- Bachelor’s degree in: _____ (major)
- Some graduate work
- Master’s degree in ECE
- Master’s degree in: _____ (major)
- Doctorate (Ph.D.) in ECE
- Doctorate (Ph.D.) in: _____ (major)
- Other (please specify) _____

Advantages:

- Collects detailed information on level of education
- Can be used with different types of providers (center-based and Family Child Care)
- Easy for respondent to complete

Disadvantages:

- Question is asked of individual teachers. Although they may be the best people to answer such a question about their own education level, it is extremely difficult to obtain a full list of all teachers or providers (unless surveying a very small area.)

Option #2:

Population to be surveyed: Child Care Center Directors

Please list the number of each type of staff who has attained the following highest level of education.

	Assistant Teachers	Teachers	Lead Teachers	Director
Less than high school diploma or GED	_____	_____	_____	_____
GED or high school diploma	_____	_____	_____	_____
Child Development Associate credential	_____	_____	_____	_____
Associate of Arts degree	_____	_____	_____	_____
Bachelor's degree in Educ. or related field	_____	_____	_____	_____
Bachelor's degree in unrelated field	_____	_____	_____	_____
Master's degree in Educ. or related field	_____	_____	_____	_____
Master's degree in unrelated field	_____	_____	_____	_____
Advanced/Professional degree	_____	_____	_____	_____
Total number of staff	_____	_____	_____	_____

Advantages:

- Collects detailed information on level of education
- Information is broken down by type of position
- Easy for respondent to answer

Disadvantages:

- Does not define job titles, for example assistant teachers, teachers, lead teachers; many programs use different job titles

Option #3:

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

Please indicate the highest level of education that you have completed: (Please check only one.)

	You	Your Assistant
Less than high school diploma or GED	_____	_____
GED or high school diploma	_____	_____
Child Development Associate (CDA) credential	_____	_____
Associate of Arts (AA) degree	_____	_____
Bachelor's degree in education or related field	_____	_____
Bachelor's degree in unrelated field	_____	_____
Master's degree in education or related field	_____	_____
Master's degree in unrelated field	_____	_____
Advanced/professional degree	_____	_____

Advantages:

- Collects detailed information on level of education
- Includes information on for Family Child Care assistants
- Easy for respondent to complete

Disadvantages:

- None noted

Option #4:

Population to be surveyed: Child Care Center Directors

<p>Indicate the number of teachers on your staff who have attained the following level of education:</p> <p>Indicate only the highest level of education achieved.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Less than high school diploma or GED <input type="checkbox"/> High school diploma or GED <input type="checkbox"/> Some college courses <input type="checkbox"/> Two year college degree <input type="checkbox"/> Four year college degree <input type="checkbox"/> Some graduate school <input type="checkbox"/> Graduate degree</p>
<p>Indicate the number of teachers on your staff who have attained the following level of early childhood education (ECE) or child development education:</p> <p>Indicate only the highest level of education achieved.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> No ECE or child development beyond high school <input type="checkbox"/> 6 units/credits or less of ECE or child development <input type="checkbox"/> 12 units/credits of ECE or child development <input type="checkbox"/> 24 units/credits of ECE or child development <input type="checkbox"/> AA in ECE or child development <input type="checkbox"/> BA/BS in ECE or child development <input type="checkbox"/> Graduate degree in ECE or child development <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____</p>

Advantages:

- Collects detailed information on level of education, including credits earned in child development
- Well formatted, collects a lot of detailed information on a number of caregivers using little space

Disadvantages:

- Does not provide break down job classification (e.g. teacher, assistant teacher, etc.) unless question is repeated for every position and each position is clearly defined
- Asks for a tabulation that a center director may never have calculated.

Survey Options to Measure Provider Experience

The following examples are different methods for measuring provider experience. Options given illustrate the different levels of detail a survey can obtain. Recall that the level of detail may vary depending on the purpose of the survey.

Option #1:

Population to be surveyed: Child Care Center Directors

How long have you been employed as a director/program administrator of this program?

_____ Months **OR** _____ Years

How long have you been a director outside of this program?

_____ Months **OR** _____ Years

Advantages:

- Measures experience inside and outside the current program

Disadvantages:

- Measures experience only in the position of director, does not capture other child care position experience the director may have
- Asking “Length of Employment” with options for years OR months can be confusing and will inevitably lead to respondents who will fill in both which will necessitate a time consuming data cleaning effort. It is easier and safer to ask for one increment of time.

Option #2:

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

How long have you been taking care of children in your home for pay?
_____ # of years **OR** _____ # of months

Have you ever been employed as a teacher, assistant or director of a child care center?
_____ yes _____ no

Advantages:

- Measures prior experience providing child care outside of current Family Child Care position

Disadvantages:

- Does not measure length (time) of child care experience outside of current Family Child Care position
- Asking “Length of Employment” with options for years OR months can be confusing and will inevitably lead to respondents who will fill in both which will necessitate a time consuming data cleaning effort. It is easier and safer to ask for one increment of time.

Option #3:

Population to be surveyed: Center-based Child Care Providers/Directors

We are interested in the length of time different teachers have been working in your program. Indicate the number of teachers who have been employed in your program for:

- _____ Less than 6 months
- _____ At least 6 months but less than one year
- _____ At least 1 year but less than 2 years
- _____ At least 2 years but less than 3 years
- _____ At least 3 years but less than 5 years
- _____ At least 5 years but less than 10 years
- _____ More than 10 years

Advantages:

- Measures experience in current program
- Captures a lot of information for multiple staff in small amount of space

Disadvantages:

- Measures experience only of the position, does not capture other child care experience employees may have
- Does not measure experience for different positions unless question is repeated for each type of position (e.g. lead teacher, assistant teacher)
- Measures intervals, does not allow calculation of an average

Option #4:

Population to be surveyed: Center-based Child Care Providers/ Directors

Please enter the following information regarding staff in your program:

Position	Length of Employment	
	Years	OR Months
Director		
Full-time Lead Teacher		
Part-time Lead Teacher		
Full-time Teacher		
Part-time Teacher		
Full-time Assistant Teacher		
Part-time Assistant Teacher		

Advantages:

- This option is another way of formatting the experience question.
- Information regarding all staff length of employment is gathered in one question.

Disadvantages:

- Measures length of employment in current position not overall experience.
- Does not account for multiple teachers in each position (i.e. if a program has two full-time lead teachers, is the respondent expected to add their years of experience together?)
- Asking “Length of Employment” with options for years OR months can be confusing and will inevitably lead to respondents who will fill in both which will necessitate a time consuming data cleaning effort. It is easier and safer to ask for one increment of time.

Option #5:

Population to be surveyed: Center-based Child Care Providers/Directors

Are the new staff that you hire typically coming from other centers or are they new to the field?

___% from other centers

___% former family child care providers

___%new to the field

___% other

Advantages:

- Measures prior experience of newly hired staff and where experience was gained

Disadvantages:

- Asking for a response in percentages can be confusing. Some respondents may not know how to calculate percentages or may write in the number of staff instead of percent. It is easier and safer to ask for whole numbers, and in this case one would also need to ask for the total number of new staff in order to calculate percent.

Survey Resources: Provider Education and Experience

- Center for Child Care Workforce, *Family Child Care Provider Income and Working Conditions Survey*, 2000
- Lyon, Mary E. and Patricia M. Canning, Mount Saint Vincent University, *The Child Care Management Study 1999*
- Maine Roads to Quality Child Care and Early Education Career Development Center, Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service, University of Southern Maine, *MRTQ Baseline Survey*, 2000
- Massachusetts Department of Education, *Community Profiles, Center & Head Start Survey*, 2000-01
- Massachusetts Department of Education, *Community Profiles, Family Child Care Survey*, 2000-2001
- Mills & Pardee, Inc. prepared for the Massachusetts Office of Child Care Services, *The Massachusetts Early Care and Education Staff Recruitment and Retention Research and Recommendations*, 2000

CHAPTER IV: MEASURING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT AND TRAINING



Why are professional development and training important to quality care?

Study after study demonstrates that teacher training has positive impacts on the quality of care provided in early care and education settings. Some research findings are summarized below:

- Teachers with more training and education are more likely to be rated as more sensitive and as having classrooms with higher quality care.^{xvi}
- Early childhood training, compared to years of service and formal education, was the most significant predictor of higher quality child care.^{xvii}
- The completion of at least 12 to 20 hours of community college coursework resulted in significantly more developmentally-appropriate beliefs and practices for teachers compared to a group of teachers who did not attend college.^{xviii}

Why measure professional development and training?

Several strategies are currently being employed to promote improved skills and qualifications of current child care workers. The most common approach is through professional development programs, which are designed to provide child care workers with access to continued and/or expanded training opportunities. For example, Connecticut Charts-A-Course and Maine Roads to Quality are two early care and education professional development programs in New England. These programs incorporate training, provider registries, career counseling, accreditation support, and articulation programs to provide a full support network for providers who are seeking to increase their skills and professionalism.

Another strategy to promote professional development is the implementation of apprenticeship programs. Apprenticeship programs combine class work, on-the-job-training, and mentoring. Apprenticeship programs also guarantee an increase in wages tied to the development of skills. Several New England States are involved in development and implementing apprenticeship programs, including Connecticut, Maine, New Hampshire, Rhode Island, and Vermont.

Measuring professional development and training can provide valuable information for program and policy planning as well as the effectiveness of programs and policies. For example, prior to fully implementing the Maine Roads to Quality Career Development Center (MRTQ), the program staff undertook a survey of child care providers in Maine to learn more about their career goals, their training interests, and supports they need in order to participate in training programs. From the information gathered through this survey MRTQ was able to develop a program intended to serve the training and career development needs of the early care and education community throughout the state.

Systematic data collection on provider's training and professional development can also help:

- Document the successes and needs of the ECE community;
- Provide information on existing resources and identify gaps in services;
- Inform policy and program planning;
- Compare across programs, communities, states, or to a national average;
- Plan for improvements and set benchmarks for the future;
- Offer justification for the use of public funds or leverage other resources; and
- Advocate for policy and program changes when necessary.

Issues to Consider When Measuring Professional Development and Provider Training

Ask the most relevant questions and decide upon the level of detail needed.

There are many different questions related to provider training and professional development. Be specific about what information is needed and how the information will be used. For example, are you interested in measuring **participation in training, training needs or topics of interest, and/or accessibility of training?** This chapter covers all of these issues, but your interests or needs may not.

Measuring current enrollment in degree or certificate programs

Collecting information on ongoing professional development toward a degree or certificate program may provide a sense of what the field ***might*** look like at some point in the near future in terms of its qualifications and expertise. It can also show current child care workers' commitment to improving their education. However, this is not a reliable way to measure provider education, as students enrolled may not finish their degree program or may leave the field after completing a degree.

Collecting information on the highest level of education completed gives a snapshot of the qualifications of child care workers at a given point in time. Studies have shown (cited previously) that specialized education in early care and education leads to higher quality care. Therefore survey questions should specify field and specialization as well as degree. Further, if paired with salary questions, collecting the highest level of education attained allows one to compare salary as related to level of education and degrees.

These issues are covered more fully in Chapter 3, "Measuring Provider Education and Experience."

Survey Options to Measure Professional Development & Training

The following examples are different methods for measuring professional development and training. Options given illustrate the different levels of detail a survey can obtain. Recall that the level of detail may vary depending on the purpose of the survey.

Participation

Option #1:

Population to be surveyed: Center-Based Child Care Directors

How many teachers received 20 clock hours or more of child development or related training in the last 12 months, e.g., courses, local workshops, conferences, in-service training?	_____ teachers
---	----------------

Advantages:

- Includes numerous types of informal training (workshops, in-service, etc)
- Specifies training in the past year

Disadvantages:

- Needs to be paired with questions related to the number of teaching staff in order to calculate the percentage of teachers participating in training
- Does not specify what type of training

Option #2:

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

In calendar year 2000, approximately how many hours of training did you attend? _____ hours

Advantages:

- Simple, short question, easy to understand

Disadvantages:

- Not specific in terms of what types of training

Option #3:

Population to be surveyed: Center-Based Child Care Directors

How many teachers (lead teachers, teachers, and assistant teachers) have received 15 hours or more of training for which they earned college credit in the past twelve months?

_____ # Director	_____ # of Teachers
_____ # of Lead Teachers	_____ # of Assistant Teachers
_____	_____

Advantages:

- Specifies training in the past year
- Gathers information on whether college credit was awarded as result of training
- Collects information by job position type

Disadvantages:

- Content of training is not specified (can't tell whether it is child development, or other).

Interests

The following examples are needs assessment questions regarding providers interest in training, not a survey of the current situation.

Option #1:

Population to be surveyed: Center-Based Child Care or Family Child Care Directors

Which training topic areas are you and your staff most interested in (please check top 3):

- | | |
|---|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Arranging the physical learning environment | <input type="checkbox"/> Legal/labor laws |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Assessment | <input type="checkbox"/> Literacy development for staff |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Behavior and classroom management | <input type="checkbox"/> Literacy development for children and families |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Building positive relationships with parents | <input type="checkbox"/> Parental involvement |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Computers | <input type="checkbox"/> Preschool development |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Diversity/multiculturalism | <input type="checkbox"/> Running your business |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Financial management | <input type="checkbox"/> School-age development |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Health, safety, and nutrition | <input type="checkbox"/> Skilled communication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Helping families under stress | <input type="checkbox"/> Special needs/disabilities |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Hiring/interviewing | <input type="checkbox"/> Staff motivation |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Infant and toddler development | <input type="checkbox"/> Stress management for you and your staff |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Interfacing with community agencies | <input type="checkbox"/> Supervision/evaluation |
| | <input type="checkbox"/> Other, please specify: |

Advantages:

- Extensive list of options with space for other ideas
- Can be easily modified to be used with different types of providers

Disadvantages:

- Program Director's priorities may differ from staff

Option #2:

Population to be surveyed: Center and Family-based Child Care Providers

Please list 1-3 priority training topics you would attend.

Advantages:

- Open-ended questions allow for including topic areas survey designer might not have thought of.
- Can be used with different types of providers.

Disadvantages:

- Difficult to code and quantify responses if this is sent to a large number of providers.
- A list of options and a space to fill in other interests is more effective and efficient as it may help respondents consider topics they might not think of themselves and helps to prioritize options.

Option #3:

Population to be surveyed: Center-based Child Care Staff and/or Family Child Care Providers

If you are currently enrolled or working on a degree or certificate, please check which program.

- Not currently enrolled or working towards a degree or certificate
- GED or High School Diploma
- Child Development Associate (CDA) credential
- One Year Certificate in ECE
- Associate of Arts (AA) degree in ECE
- Associate of Arts (AA) in: _____ (major)
- Bachelor's (BA or BS) degree in ECE
- Bachelor's degree in: _____ (major)
- Some graduate work
- Master's degree in ECE
- Master's degree in: _____ (major)
- Doctorate (Ph.D.) in ECE
- Doctorate (Ph.D.) in: _____ (major)

Advantages:

- Gathers detailed information on professional development/education interests and goals, particularly those that are articulated toward a degree, and specifies whether training and education is in early childhood education or some other field.
- Measures if the workforce is seeking and working towards more training or education.
- Can be used with different types of providers.

Disadvantages:

- Does not provide information on what the education of the workforce will be in the future. Anything could happen in the future, and those currently enrolled may never complete their degree or may leave the field for any number of reasons.
- Should be paired with a question concerning the highest level of education achieved.

Accessibility

The following are various examples of questions to determine the availability of training.

Option #1:

Population to be surveyed: Center-Based Child Care Directors

Example 1:

Do you and your staff have adequate training opportunities? _____ Yes _____ No

Advantages:

- Good introductory question to a series of training opportunities questions.

Disadvantages:

- Doesn't give enough information about what "adequate" means. Do you mean the number of trainings, the location of trainings, the type or quality of trainings?

Option #2:

Population to be surveyed: Center-Based Child Care Directors

Example 2:

Are Early Childhood Education degree programs accessible in your geographic area?

- Yes No

Advantages:

- A more specific question than previous example that would identify if geography is a barrier.
- Question must be paired with "What is your county (or other location of interest)?" in order to pinpoint which areas may be most in need.

Disadvantages:

- Doesn't define "geographic area." Do you mean county, region, or town?
- Doesn't define "accessible". Do you mean available, offered, easy to find or in a convenient location?

Option #3

Population to be surveyed: Center-based Staff and/or Family Child Care Providers

Do you feel that you have adequate training opportunities?

- (1) Yes
- (2) No

If no, what problems are there with your current training opportunities? (Check all that apply)

- My community does not have enough courses or workshops.
- The cost of training is too high.
- The quality of existing training is poor.
- Most opportunities are offered during the day. It is difficult to take time off from work during daytime training.
- Because I work long hours, I don't have enough time for additional training.
- There is no pay-off to getting more training.
- Other (please explain): _____

Advantages:

- A more detailed option. Clearly defines what aspects of “access” one is interested in. (See pages 9-10 of this section for more examples of questions related to barriers to accessing care.)

Disadvantages:

- None Noted

Option #4:

Population to be surveyed: Center-based Staff and/or Family Child Care Providers

From whom did you receive your training last year? (Check all that apply)

- Family Child Care System or Network provided training
- Resource & referral Agency (R&Rs)
- Community College
- FCC support group
- Workshop at a professional association meeting/conference
- Food organization
- Public schools
- Cooperative extension
- Don't know
- Other _____

Advantages:

- Information will allow identification of systems where providers are accessing training.
- Can be used with different types of providers.

Disadvantages:

- Does not measure what types of training only where the training is being offered and utilized.

Option #5

Population to be surveyed: Center-based Staff and/or Family Child Care Providers

When you attend training, do you prefer to attend: (Please check all that apply)

- In your center/home (place of employment)
- In your community
- During the day time
- In the evening or on your own time
- On the weekend

Advantages:

- Can be used with different types of providers.

Disadvantages:

- Would be a better question if the where and when aspects of the question were divided into 2 questions, allowing for more details about both aspects.
- Option “in your community” is very vague would be better if you specified options such as “in a community college”, “in a public school”, “through R&R”, as in Option #4.

Barriers/Needs

The following examples help measure the barriers providers face when trying to access or participate in training opportunities.

Option #1:

Population to be surveyed: Center-based Staff and/or Family Child Care Providers

What problems, *if any*, are there with your current training opportunities? (Check all that apply)

- None
- There are not enough courses or workshops available.
- The cost of training is too high.
- The quality of existing training is not good.
- Instructors are not familiar with family child care.
- The courses and workshops offered do not meet my needs or interests.
- Most opportunities are during the day and it is difficult to take time off to attend.
- I do not have enough notice about trainings to arrange for coverage.
- I am unable to leave my family or my program to take more training.
- There is no pay-off to getting more training.
- Other (please explain) _____

Advantages:

- A thorough list of possible barriers, with room for write-in responses.

Disadvantages:

- None noted

Option #2:

Population to be surveyed: Center-based Staff and/or Family Child Care Providers

What supports do you need to access training and educational opportunities? *(Please check all that apply)*

- None
- Tuition reimbursement
- Transportation
- Available and trained substitutes
- Interactive television (ITV)
- Computer based training
- Other (please specify) _____

Advantages:

- A positive approach to address some of the barriers to accessing training opportunities.

Disadvantages:

- None Noted

Survey Resources: Professional Development and Training

- Center for Child Care Workforce, *Family Child Care Provider Income and Working Conditions Survey*, 2000
- Lyon, Mary E. and Patricia M. Canning, Mount Saint Vincent University, *The Child Care Management Study 1999*
- Maine Roads to Quality Child Care and Early Education Career Development Center, Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service, University of Southern Maine, *MRTQ Baseline Survey*, 2000
- Massachusetts Department of Education, *Community Profiles, Center & Head Start Survey*, 2000-01
- Massachusetts Department of Education, *Community Profiles, Family Child Care Survey*, 2000-2001
- Mills & Pardee, Inc. prepared for the Massachusetts Office of Child Care Services, *The Massachusetts Early Care and Education Staff Recruitment and Retention Research and Recommendations*, 2000

CHAPTER V: MEASURING TURNOVER



Why is turnover important to quality care?

Staff retention is a significant problem for child care centers around the country. Most centers experience a high rate of turnover and have difficulty finding skilled staff to fill positions. In 1998, the National Child Care Staffing Study reported a 31% turnover rate for all teaching staff in the previous year.^{xix} This turnover rate was almost twice the turnover rate for all jobs in the United States^{xx}, and considerably higher than the turnover rates for all public school teachers (6.6%), public kindergarten teachers (3.1%) and private kindergarten teachers (16%).^{xxi} The family child care field is similarly affected by a high rate of turnover, estimated to be between 40% and 60%.^{xxii}

Several studies have suggested that staff turnover is detrimental to the development of children. These studies have found that being in unreliable or unstable arrangements in the first two years of life may have a negative impact on children's attachment to their caregiver, adjustment to the child care setting, behavior, language, and social development.^{xxiii} Turnover among family child care staff potentially affects children in a more extensive way than turnover among center providers. In a child care center, loss of staff does not necessarily result in a change of the child care setting itself. However, when a family child care provider leaves the field the child in that person's care will lose not only that specific caregiver but also that particular home setting as well.^{xxiv}

Why measure turnover?

Measuring turnover, especially over time, can provide useful and important information for program planning and policy implementation. For example, the Department of Defense which regulates and oversees military-based child care programs believes that the efforts it has made in increasing wages, standardizing training, and providing oversight to all child care settings has contributed to an increase in quality among its programs and a decrease in staff turnover. Prior to these changes made in 1990, the annual turnover rate for center based staff was approximately 300%. Now it is less than 40%.^{xxv}

Further, systematic data collection regarding turnover rates, causes, and solutions can help:

- Document the success and needs of the ECE community;
- Provide information on existing resources and identify gaps in services;
- Inform policy and program planning;
- Compare across programs, communities, states, or to a national average;
- Plan for improvements and set benchmarks for the future;
- Offer justification for the use of public funds or leverage other resources; and
- Advocate for policy and program changes when necessary.

Defining Turnover:

Turnover refers to the stability of caregivers in a program over time. One of the goals of measuring turnover is to get a "turnover rate." Turnover rate equals the percentage of teaching staff that leave a program during a given period of time (usually 12 months).

Turnover Rate = the number of teaching staff who have left the center in the past 12 months divided by the number of teaching staff on the center payroll when the program is fully staffed.

For example, a program employs 10 teaching staff. 2 teachers have left in the past year. This program experienced a 20% turnover rate in its teaching staff. $(2/10=.2)$

Issues to Consider When Measuring Turnover

Definitions

The Center for Child Care Workforce defines three types of turnover in its report, *Taking on Turnover*.^{xxvi}

- ❑ **Position Turnover** refers to a teacher moving to a different classroom within the same program or a different site within an agency.
- ❑ **Job Turnover** refers to a teacher leaving a child care center or agency to work somewhere else within the child care field.
- ❑ **Occupational Turnover** refers to a teacher leaving a child care center or agency, a child care provider closing their business, and taking a job outside of the child care field.

Note: *The examples and discussion in this chapter deal with job and occupational turnover.*

Who Should Measure Turnover?

The answer who or what organization should measure turnover varies depending on how the information will be used. For example, a program administrator could conduct exit interviews asking for the reasons people are leaving the program in order to inform human resource policies promoting retention. If a state is interested in developing a policy to decrease the turnover rate in the child care field, it would be most appropriate for the state child care administrative office to collect information about the turnover rate – *before and after* the policy is implemented. Independent third parties, such as universities or research institutions, can provide a different perspective on turnover, for example, the impact of turnover on the quality of child care or on child outcomes.

Consistency in Definition of Job Titles

Different states, as well as many programs within a single state, use different job titles for similar job functions. When measuring turnover rate by position, it is important to clearly define job titles in each survey. Involving child care providers, representatives from resource and referral agencies, or representatives from licensing agencies in the survey design can help ensure that job titles accurately reflect the community that is being surveyed.

Special Consideration for Family Child Care

Calculating a turnover rate for family child care providers is difficult without an accurate and timely list of closed programs. It may be possible to use administrative data, such as state licensing lists, to compile a list of closed programs. This is possible only if the state keeps these records over time (that is, records are not purged from year to year). Comparing lists over time can help determine which programs have closed each year. This method, however, is reliant on the accuracy of the licensing list and how frequently it is updated. For instance, for its biannual survey, Boston EQUIP uses state licensing lists to compile a random sample of family child care homes. Through the process of mailing out surveys and follow-up phone calls to providers, EQUIP has encountered many instances where family child care providers have moved or are no longer offering care although they are still appearing on licensing lists.

Survey Options to Measure Turnover

The following examples are different methods for measuring turnover. Options given illustrate the different levels of detail a survey can obtain. Recall that the level of detail may vary depending on the purpose of the survey.

Option #1

Population to be surveyed: Child Care Center, Head Start Program, or School-age Program Directors

a. What is the total number of staff positions in your center (including director, full-time lead teacher, part-time lead teacher, full-time teacher, part-time teacher, full-time assistant teacher, part-time assistant teacher) = _____.

b. How many staff have left the program in the last 12 months? _____

Advantages:

- Allows one to calculate an overall turnover rate.

Disadvantages:

- Does not allow level of specificity to determine turnover by position. Therefore, if one position, part-time assistant teacher for example, had a lot of turnover in the past year, this program's turnover rate would be inflated by one position.

Option #2

Population to be surveyed: Child Care Center, Head Start Program, or School-age Program Directors

Please enter the following information regarding the teaching staff in your program:

Position	Total Number of Staff Positions	Number of staff in this position that have left your program in last 12 months
Director		
Full-time lead teacher		
Part-time lead teacher		
Full-time teacher		
Part-time teacher		
Full-time assistant teacher		
Part-time assistant teacher		
Total number of staff		

Advantages:

- Allows one to calculate a turnover rate for the program as a whole and by teaching position.

Disadvantages:

- Does not provide information about why a provider left and where, if at all, they are working now.

Option #3

Population to be surveyed: Head Start Program Directors (HPIR Report)

- a. Total number of teachers and family child care providers, teachers' aides, and home visitors _____
- b. Of the child development staff above, the number hired during the program year due to staff turnover (only count staff hired between the dates of this report, do not count staff hired due to expansion) _____
- c. Number of staff (include all classroom staff, home visitors, bus drivers, office staff, etc.) _____
- d. Of the number of staff above, the number who left your program and were replaced during the operating year? _____

Advantages:

- Allows one to calculate a turnover rate.
- Collects information about turnover in child development staff as well as other support staff (cooks, office staff, bus drivers, etc.)
- Is a standardized report that is collected regularly.

Disadvantages:

- Does not allow level of specificity to determine turnover by position.
- Does not count current vacancies.

Option #4

Population to be surveyed: Family Child Care Providers

It is difficult to measure turnover among family child care providers. The following are some commonly asked questions of family child care homes that are related to turnover or try to predict what turnover in this field might be.

- a. How long have you been taking care of children in your home for pay? _____
- b. How long have you been a licensed family day care provider? Number of years ___ or Number of months ____
- c. How long do you plan to continue offering child care in your home? Please Circle one.
1 more year or less 1-3 more years 3 or more years

Advantages:

- Measures years of providing care in their home – a proxy for stability of care.

Disadvantages:

- Does not measure turnover of family child care homes.
- Predictions – question “C”- are commonly used, but are poor measures of reality. Anything could happen and despite a respondent circling option “3 or more years”, they could close tomorrow.

***Concepts Related to Turnover:
Vacancy Rate, Experience, and Reasons for Turnover***

Many surveys include a series of questions labeled turnover questions that are actually related concepts such as vacancy and experience. These related types of questions (examples listed below) give very important information but **cannot be substituted for turnover and cannot be used to calculate a turnover rate.**

Vacancy Rate

Option #1

Population to be surveyed: Child Care Center Directors

In your center, how many of the following classroom staff positions are currently vacant?

Number of vacant full-time positions _____

Total number of full-time staff positions _____

Number of vacant part-time staff positions _____

Total number of part-time staff positions _____

Advantages:

- Provides information on staff vacancies or unfilled positions.

Disadvantages:

- Cannot be used to calculate a turnover rate.
- Does not tell you why position is vacant or for how long the position has been unfilled.

Experience

(For a more detailed look at experience, please see Chapter 3: Measuring Education and Experience.)

Option #2

Population to be surveyed: Child Care Center Directors or Family Child Care Providers

The following questions are used to ask about the years of experience a provider has:

We are interested in the length of time different teachers have been working in your program. Indicate the number of teachers who have been employed in your program for:

- ___ less than 6 months
- ___ at least 6 months but less than one year
- ___ at least 1 year but less than 2 years
- ___ at least 2 years but less than 3 years
- ___ at least 3 years by less than 5 years
- ___ at least 5 years but less than 10 years
- ___ more than 10 years

Advantages:

- Provides information about stability of the workforce (i.e. how long they have been teachers with their current employer).
- Provides a measure of the average tenure per center.

Disadvantages:

- Cannot be used to calculate a turnover rate.
- Does not measure overall experience, only experience in current position.

Reasons for Turnover

Determining why child care workers enter, stay in, and leave the field does not provide information on the turnover rate, however, it can inform the recruitment and retention strategies of programs, systems, or states attempting to moderate turnover. **Exit** and **Entrance Interviews** can be a way for program directors, and/or state administrators to learn more about why child care workers enter, stay in, and leave the field.

Exit Interviews

Exit interviews are interviews or surveys conducted with staff once they have decided to leave a program. The Human Resources Department or Center Director usually conducts these surveys/interviews. Exit interviews are one way to understand job and occupational turnover. Below are some examples of typical questions asked during an exit interview.

Exit Interview Example #1

Please rate your satisfaction/dissatisfaction with the following aspects of the staff position you are leaving. Please use a scale of 1 to 7: 1 being very dissatisfied, 7 being very satisfied.

- ___ with my job.
- ___ with the working conditions.
- ___ with the pay.
- ___ with the training I received.
- ___ with the support I received from my supervisor.
- ___ with the amount of work required of me.
- ___ with the quality of work required of me.
- ___ with my opportunities for promotion.
- ___ with the cooperation of my co-workers.

Additional remarks: _____

Advantages:

- Gathers information on a variety of aspects related to work environment, and an overall job satisfaction rating.

Disadvantages:

- Scale of 1 – 7 may be too large to discern any difference, i.e. most respondents consistently report a score of 3 or 4.
- Does not specify exactly why a provider/teacher is leaving.

Exit Interview Example #2

1. Reason for termination (check all that apply)

- Career advancement
- Career change
- Pay
- Benefits
- Work Schedule
- Family
- Supervision
- Education
- Leaving the area/moving
- Other:

Comments:

2. Comparing your job with work in similar organizations, how would you rate your pay? (please circle one)

Better than average

Average

Below average

3. How would you rate our benefits package? (please circle one)

Better than average

Average

Below average

4. What did you like best about working with this organization?

5. What did you like least?

6. What changes would you like to see made at this organization?

Advantages:

- Specifies why a provider has chosen to leave, and allows for multiple reasons.
- Allows for comparison to industry.
- Gathers feedback on what could be improved at the organization, which could provide insight into recruitment and retention strategies.

Disadvantages:

- Does not ask respondents to rank reasons for termination.

Entrance Interviews

In 2000, the Massachusetts Office of Child Care Services commissioned Mills & Pardee, Inc., to conduct a staff recruitment and retention study. Among other surveys designed for this study, an “interview of newly hired staff” survey was developed to inform recommendations about future directions for recruitment and retention initiatives in Massachusetts. These interviews sought information that would illuminate child care workers’ reasons for entering the field of child care, their current levels of satisfaction with their career choice, how long they plan to stay in the field, and the issues that have potential to drive them out of the field. Below are excerpts from the newly-hired staff survey.

Entrance Interview Example:

1. What were you doing before you started this job?
2. What were your primary reasons for taking this job? (Choose top 3 choices, please.)
 - I like working with children
 - It fits my work-family needs
 - Distance to my home/location
 - I knew people who worked here
 - My child attends school here
 - I have training in early childhood education
 - I did my internship here
 - Other
3. How much longer do you plan to work in your present job?
 - Less than 1 year
 - 1-3 years
 - 3-5 years
 - more than 5 years
4. How much longer do you plan to work as a child care provider?
 - Less than 1 year
 - 1-3 years
 - 3-5 years
 - more than 5 years
5. What would keep you in the field longer than (however long they said above)?
 - Salary
 - Benefits
 - Medical/dental
 - Life insurance
 - Retirement benefits
 - Time off benefits
 - Discounted child care
 - Credit union
 - Education
 - Financial contribution
 - Time off to attend
 - Flexibility
 - Career opportunities
 - Good relationship with my co-workers and supervisor
 - Other
 - Nothing would keep them

Advantages:

- Learn about new employees' experience prior to this position.
- Identifies new employees' priorities for job satisfaction.
- Provides insight into employees' employment intentions, i.e. is this a temporary position or career advancement.

Disadvantages:

- Predictions – questions 3, 4, and 5 – are commonly used, but are poor measures of reality and are unreliable.

Survey Resources: Turnover

- Associated Early Care and Education, Inc., *Boston EQUIP Center & Head Start Survey*, 1999
- Center for Child Care Workforce, *Child Care Center Salary and Working Conditions Survey*, 1998
- Center for Child Care Workforce, *Family Child Care Provider Income and Working Conditions Survey*, 2000
- Lyon, Mary E. and Patricia M. Canning, Mount Saint Vincent University, *The Child Care Management Study* 1999
- Maine Contracted Agencies “Reporting Requirements”
- Maine Roads to Quality Child Care and Early Education Career Development Center, Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service, University of Southern Maine, *MRTQ Baseline Survey*, 2000
- Massachusetts Department of Education, *Community Profiles, Center & Head Start Survey*, 2000-01
- Massachusetts Department of Education, *Community Profiles, Family Child Care Survey*, 2000-01
- Mills & Pardee, Inc. prepared for the Massachusetts Office of Child Care Services, *The Massachusetts Early Care and Education Staff Recruitment and Retention Research and Recommendations*, 2000
- National Network for Child Care, *Child Care Program Evaluation 4*, 2001
- People’s Regional Opportunity Program, *Exit Interview Survey*, 2001

ⁱ Whitebook, M., Howes, C., & Phillips, D. (1989). Who Cares? Child Care Teachers and the Quality of Care in America. Oakland, CA: Child Care Employee Project.

ⁱⁱ Whitebook, M., Howes, C., & Phillips, D. (1989). Who Cares? Child Care Teachers and the Quality of Care in America. Oakland, CA: Child Care Employee Project.

ⁱⁱⁱ Whitebook, M., Howes, C., & Phillips, D. (1998). Worthy Work, Unlivable Wages: The National Child Care Staffing Study, 1988-1997. Washington, D.C.: Center for the Child Care Work Force.

^{iv} Cost, Quality, and Outcome Study Team. (1995). Cost, Quality, and Child Outcomes in Child Care Centers. Denver: University of Colorado at Denver.

Kontos, S., Howes, C., Shinn, M., & Galinsky, E. (1995). Quality in Family Child Care and Relative Care. New York: Teachers College Press, Columbia University.

Scarr, S., Eisenberg, M., & Deater-Deckard, K. (1994). Measurement of quality in child care centers. Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 9:131-151.

^v Cost, Quality, and Outcome Study Team. (1995). Cost, Quality, and Child Outcomes in Child Care Centers. Denver: University of Colorado at Denver.

^{vi} Kontos, S., Howes, C., Shinn, M., & Galinsky, E. (1995). Quality in Family Child Care and Relative Care. New York: Teachers College Press, Columbia University.

^{vii} Scarr, S., Eisenberg, M., & Deater-Deckard, K. (1994). Measurement of quality in child care centers. Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 9:131-151.

^{viii} McCormick, Cynthia. "Child Care In Massachusetts High Turnover Tied to Meager Wages." The Cape Cod Times May, 9, 200.

^{ix} Whitebook, M., Howes, C., & Phillips, D. (1998). Worthy Work, Unlivable Wages: The National Child Care Staffing Study, 1988-1997. Washington, D.C.: Center for the Child Care Work Force.

Whitebook, M., & Phillips, D. (1999). Child Care Employment: Implications for Women's Self-Sufficiency and for Child Development. New York: Foundation for Child Development.

^x Wilson, R., Werby, E., and Haig-Friedman, D. (1999). Are We Shortchanging Those Who Care for Our Children? A Massachusetts Survey. United Way of Massachusetts Bay Success by 6 Initiative.

^{xi} Mills, L.C., Goodman, I.F., Michelove, J. Boston, S., Close, L., Hanrahan, J., Mohrle, K.R., Phelps, F.A. (2001). The Massachusetts Early Care & Education Staff Recruitment and Retention Research and Recommendations. Concord, MA: Mills & Pardee, Inc.

^{xii} Cassidy, D., Buell, M., Pugh-Hoese, S., Russell, S. (1995). The effect of education on child care teachers' beliefs and classroom quality: Year one evaluation of the TEACH early childhood associate degree scholarship program. Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 10:171-183.

Dunn, L. (1993). Proximal and distal features of the day care quality and children's development. Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 8:167-192.

Fischer, J. & Eheart, B. (1991). Family day care: A theoretical basis for improving quality. Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 6:549-563.

Honig, A.S. & Hirallal, A. (1998). Which counts more for excellence in childcare staff - years in service, education level, or ECE coursework? Early Child Development and Care, 145:31-46.

Howes, C. (1997). Children's experiences in center-based child care as a function of teacher background and adult-child ratio. Merrill-Palmer Quarterly, 43(3):404-425.

Kontos, S. Howes, C., & Galinsky, E. (1996). Does training make a difference to quality in family child care. Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 11:427-445.

Kontos, S., Howes, C., Shinn, M., & Galinsky, E. (1995). Quality in Family Child Care and Relative Care. New York: Teachers College Press, Columbia University.

Kontos, S., Hsu, H.C., & Dunn, L. (1994). Children's cognitive and social competence in child care centers and family day care homes. Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology, 15:87-111.

Saracho, O.N. (1999). Attitudinal effects of the Child Development Associate program. Early Child Development and Care, 148:51-62.

^{xiii} Whitebook, M., Howes, C., & Phillips, D. (1998). Worthy Work, Unlivable Wages: The National Child Care Staffing Study, 1988-1997. Washington, D.C.: Center for the Child Care Work Force.

^{xiv} Blank, H., Schulman, K., & Ewen, D. (1999). Key Facts: Essential Information about Child Care, Early Education, and School-Age Care. Washington, D.C.: Children's Defense Fund.

^{xv} Caring for New Hampshire's Children: A Report on New Hampshire Child Care Providers. Frankel, S., Wauchope, B. and Dwyer, M.C., August 1999.

^{xvi} Howes, C. (1983). Caregiver behavior in center and family day care. Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology, 4:99-107.

Phillipsen, L., Burchinal, M., Howes, C., and Cryer, D. (1997). The prediction of process quality from structural features of child care. Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 12:281-303.

Ruopp, R., Travers, J., Glantz, F., and Coelen, C. (1979). Children at the Center: Final Results of the National Day Care Study. Cambridge, MA:Abt Associates.

Whitebook, M., Howes, C., and Phillips, D. (1989). Who Cares? Child Care Teachers and the Quality of Care in America. Oakland, CA: Child Care Employee Project.

^{xvii} Honig, H., and Hirallal, A. (1998) Which counts more for excellence in childcare staff – years of experience, educational level, or ECE coursework? Early Childhood Development and Care, 145:31-46.

^{xviii} Cassidy, D., Buell, M., Pugh-Hoese, S., and Russell, S. (1995). The effect of education on child care teachers' beliefs and classroom quality: Year one evaluation of the TEACH early childhood associate degree scholarship program. Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 10:171-183.

^{xix} Whitebook, M., Howes, C. and Phillips, D. (1998) "Worthy Work, Unlivable Wages: The National Child Care Staffing Study, 1988-1997." Washington, D.C.: Center for the Child Care Workforce.

^{xx} Whitebook, M. and Bellm, D. (1999) "Taking on Turnover: An Action Guide for Child Care Center Teachers and Directors." Washington, D.C.: Center for the Child Care Workforce.

^{xxi} Whitebook, M., Howes, C. and Phillips, D. (1998) "Worthy Work, Unlivable Wages: The National Child Care Staffing Study, 1988-1997." Washington, D.C.: Center for the Child Care Workforce.

^{xxii} Kontos, S. (1992). "Family Child Care: Out of the Shadows and into the Limelight (research monograph vol. 5)." Washington, D.C.: National Association for the Education of Young Children.

^{xxiii} McCartney, K., Scarr, S., Rocheleau, A., Phillips, D., Abbott-Shim, M., Eisenberg, M., Keefe, N., Rosenthal, S. and Ruh, J. (1997). Teacher-child interaction and child care auspices as predictors of social outcomes. Merrill-Palmer Quarterly, 43(3), 426-250.

Mueller, C.W. and Orimoto, L. (1995). Factors related to the Recruitment, Training, and Retention of Family Child Care Providers. Child Welfare, 75(6), 1205-1221.

NICHD Early Child Care Research Network. (1998). Early child care and self control, compliance, and problem behavior at 24 and 36 months. Child Development, 69(4), 1145-1170.

Raikes, H. (1993). Relationship duration in infant care: Time with a high-ability teacher and infant-teacher attachment. Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 8, 309-325.

Whitebook, M., Howes, C., and Phillips, D. (1989) "Who Cares? Child Care Teachers and the Quality of Care in America." Oakland, CA: Child Care Employee Project.

^{xxiv} Deery-Schmitt, D.M. and Todd, C.M. (1995). A Conceptual Model for Studying Turnover Among Family Child Care Providers. Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 10, 121-143.

^{xxv} Early Education Clearinghouse "Facts in Action" web-only article <http://factsinaction.org/brief/brmay002.htm> March 11, 2002.

^{xxvi} Whitebook, M. and Bellm, D. (1999) "Taking on Turnover: An Action Guide for Child Care Center Teachers and Directors." Washington, D.C.: Center for the Child Care Workforce.



Institute for Child and Family Policy
Edmund S. Muskie School of Public Service
University of Southern Maine
Portland, Maine 04103

April 2002