

evidence.

Melissa Girard
Loyola University Maryland

Barry Wright, Eric Tucker, and Susan Binnie, eds., *Security, Dissent, and the Limits of Toleration in War and Peace, 1914-1939, Canadian State Trials*, vol. IV (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2015). xv+517pp. Hardcover \$50.00.

This important volume of eleven essays and three appendices carries the extraordinary Canadian State Trials (CST) project resolutely on to the terrain of Hobsbawm's *Age of Extremes, the Short Twentieth Century*. This collection is the fourth in the series that commenced with *Law, Politics and Security Measures, 1608-1837* (1996) and was followed by *Rebellion and Invasion in the Canadas, 1837-1839* (2002) and *Political Trials and Security Measures, 1840-1914* (2009). The late F. Murray Greenwood began the path-breaking project in the 1990s and co-edited the first two volumes before his death in December 2000. His co-editor on those volumes, Barry Wright, has continued with co-editors Susan Binnie on volumes III and IV and Eric Tucker on volume IV.

The rationale for the series, and a fascinating account of its 18th and 19th century British predecessors, appeared in the first volume:

The way is open to return to the tradition of the libertarian state trial editors, where a critical eye may be cast at the contradictions between repressive or partisan practices and claims made about the impartiality of the law...Security cases highlight an ongoing tension between the rule of law and the discretionary exercise of executive measures and reveal something about the role of law in the exercise of power.
(CST, I, 9)

Wright has consistently maintained the breadth of interpretation established in the wide selection of material for inclusion under the rubric "state trials" and has also continued the valuable addition of archival explanation and commentary (Judi Cumming), as well as a selection of major legal documents. Indeed, in the case of this volume, such additional materials are extended to include an analysis of the significant problems faced by researchers owing to Canada's sadly out-dated Access to Information legislation (Patricia I. McMahan).

Following an excellent introduction by the editors, the essays fall into three unacknowledged groupings: four on the crises of World War I, three related to the post war Labour Revolt, and three on state repression of labour and the left during the Depression. An eleventh essay by John McLaren on the trials and near deportation of Doukobor leader Peter Verigin might loosely be associated with the latter three as the Canadian Government tried to deport him on similar grounds to those

used against labour radicals.

The World War I group of essays opens with an examination of the treatment of enemy aliens by Bohdan S. Kordan, who has also published on the Ukrainian internments of World War II. Not surprisingly the treatment of ethnic new Canadians during the Great War has eerie echoes of contemporary issues of refugees and other migrants in the post 9/11 world. Australian Peter McDermott then offers a comparative chapter on the legal complexities of the treatment of enemy aliens in his home country, the United Kingdom, and Canada during the war years. Jonathan Swainger presents a fine empirical study of prosecutions in Western Canada for seditious language that provides perhaps the only occasion in this entire volume where the courts provided some relief against the jingoistic excesses of “patriotic” Canadians in search of a Fifth Column. Not so kind to notions of justice and legal procedures is the appalling tale offered by Patricia McMahan of a Department of Justice willing to “stack the deck in as many ways as possible to achieve its desired result” (157), which in this case led to the unjust (and probably illegal) imprisonment of a conscript soldier in order to insure that the Military Service Act would remain free from further legal challenge. The further irony in this case is that the Department of Justice, with the complicity of Library and Archives Canada, is still throwing up every possible constraint to prevent suitable historical scrutiny of these scandalous proceedings. (See McMahan’s informative appendix on her Access to Information misadventures.)

Acting as a useful segue from War to the post-war Labour Revolt, Ben Isitt describes the events surrounding the Quebecois troops who mutinied in Victoria in a futile effort to avoid the Canadian intervention on the White side in the post Russian Revolution Civil War, and their subsequent court-martial proceedings at Vladivostok. Building on their excellent *When the State Trembled* (2010), Reinhold Kramer and Tom Mitchell explore the extraordinary judicial persecutions against the leaders of the Winnipeg General Strike. As they argue, it was “only through the conjunction of the private-prosecution provisions of the Criminal Code, A.J. Andrew’s ideological and procedural gambits, and Justice Minister Doherty’s willingness to use fiscal sleight-of-hand that the Citizens’ Committee of 1000 was ultimately able to criminalize the Winnipeg General Strike” (244). In a similarly detailed study of the 1923 seditious libel trial of Cape Breton miners’ leader J.B. McLachlan, David Frank finds that “the law had been used not only to curtail freedom of speech but more pointedly to undermine and discredit labour radicalism” (283). Both these excellent case studies provide considerable ammunition to explode many of the myths surrounding judicial independence and showing that the explosive class struggle of the Canadian Labour Revolt demanded a degree of state repression beyond that previously experienced by Canadian workers. It was no accident that in these same years the RCMP was created and developed the framework of its security and intelligence apparatus.

Andrée Lévesque provides another bridging essay with her useful survey of state repression in Quebec during both the Labour Revolt and the Great Depression. Her descriptions of the repressive policing by both the Montreal Red Squad and its provincial equivalents remind us to look beyond the RCMP, although archival sources remain scant. While Duplessis' Padlock Law and the virulent anti-communism of the Roman Catholic Church might seem *sui generis*, the activities in Ontario surrounding the 1931 prosecutions of the Communist Party of Canada leadership under Section 98 of the Criminal Code, and strikingly similar behaviour on the part of Toronto's Red Squad and their Ontario Provincial Police equivalents later in the decade, demonstrate the prevalence of the ideological assault on labour radicalism and the strength of the defence of capital. Dennis Molinaro provides an excellent chapter on *Rex v. Buck* making a strong case for viewing section 98 as a wartime measure permitting political policing that became normalized in peacetime:

The most important issue regarding the section 98 trials was not whether or not they were fair, which they clearly weren't, or whether they constituted violations of civil liberties, which they clearly did. It was the way in which a wartime emergency had become a part of everyday Canadian society, allowing the government to equate the expression of ideas and thoughts as criminal acts (352).

The implicit prosecution of Bennett's Iron Heel continues in Bill Waiser's excellent chapter on the On-To-Ottawa Trek and the Regina Riot. As he so eloquently and unequivocally writes: "The government and the police chose brute force over a reasonable solution to the Regina impasse and provoked one of the worst riots in twentieth-century Canadian history." "The real crime" was the failure to address the needs of the "thousands of single, homeless unemployed," one of whom he notes was his father (432).

Wright, Tucker, and Binnie have done all Canadians a significant service in continuing the work started by Greenwood in the 1990s. We look forward to volume V on the events of World War II and the Cold War with enthusiastic expectations.

Gregory S. Kealey
University of New Brunswick

John Tully, *Silvertown: The Lost Story of a Strike that Shook London and Helped Launch the Modern Labor Movement* (New York: Monthly Review Press, 2014). 288pp. Hardcover \$28.95.

In constructing an entire narrative around a negative—a defeated strike—Tully has taken on an unusual challenge, and meets it with zest. Yet, while impressive in its historical detail and commitment to the strikers' cause, *Silvertown* ultimately refuses to acknowledge the failure of this poignant struggle. The book's bold title cannot