

Inklings Forever

Volume 4 A Collection of Essays Presented at the
Fourth Frances White Ewbank Colloquium on C.S.
Lewis & Friends


Article 8

3-2004

The Season for the Hawthorn to Blossom

Robert Trexler

Follow this and additional works at: https://pillars.taylor.edu/inklings_forever

 Part of the [English Language and Literature Commons](#), [History Commons](#), [Philosophy Commons](#), and the [Religion Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Trexler, Robert (2004) "The Season for the Hawthorn to Blossom," *Inklings Forever*: Vol. 4 , Article 8.
Available at: https://pillars.taylor.edu/inklings_forever/vol4/iss1/8

This Essay is brought to you for free and open access by the Center for the Study of C.S. Lewis & Friends at Pillars at Taylor University. It has been accepted for inclusion in *Inklings Forever* by an authorized editor of Pillars at Taylor University. For more information, please contact pillars@taylor.edu.

INKLINGS FOREVER, Volume IV

A Collection of Essays Presented at
The Fourth

FRANCES WHITE EWBank COLLOQUIUM

ON

C.S. LEWIS & FRIENDS

Taylor University 2004
Upland, Indiana

The Season for the Hawthorn to Blossom

Robert Trexler

Trexler, Robert. "The Season for the Hawthorn to Blossom." Inklings Forever 4 (2004)
www.taylor.edu/cslewis

The Season for the Hawthorn to Blossom

Robert Trexler

In Chapter 5 of George MacDonald's *Lilith* Mr. Raven points to a hawthorn tree and asks Mr. Vane if he can see it. Initially Mr. Vane sees "a gnarled old man, with a great white head." On his second look he sees an ancient hawthorn blossoming and objects, "But this is not the season for the hawthorn to blossom!" Mr. Raven replies, "the season for the hawthorn to blossom is when it blossoms."

A Multiplicity of Meaning

You might be surprised at how many meanings can be derived from this passage. One straightforward explanation is that people don't always see what something really is at first sight. For example, the gospel of Mark describes another occasion when a viewer confused men and trees. Jesus attempts to heal a blind man and asks the man if he can see (Mk 8:22-26). At first, the man sees "men as if they were trees." After Jesus lays hands on the man a second time he sees people clearly. MacDonald attaches a moral to this story in his October 23rd sonnet in *Diary of an Old Soul*.

Things cannot look all right so long as I
Am not all right who see—therefore not right
Can see. The lamp within sends out the light
Which shows the things; and if its rays go wry,
Or are not white, they must part show a lie.
The man, half-cured, did men not trees
conclude,
Because he moving saw what else had seemed
a wood.

Mr. Vane is not "all right," so what he sees must partly "show a lie." MacDonald humorously reverses the progress described in the gospel so Mr. Vane first sees a man and then properly sees a tree.

Another lesson is that objects can be more than one thing. For example, Mr. Raven is a raven, a librarian, and Adam. When Mr. Vane sees "a gnarled old man, with a great white head" MacDonald could be referring to himself. Earlier manuscripts of *Lilith* (A,B,C,D,E) have this sentence: "a gnarled old man, with a great white head and beard."¹ When *Lilith* was published he was seventy-one years old with white hair and flowing white beard. If MacDonald is in some sense an ancient

hawthorn, he may be suggesting that even in his old age, he was capable of blossoming with the publication of his most ambitious romance fantasy. Additionally, the hawthorn (or a gnarled old man) may blossom when least expected because God's way often transcends our everyday expectations. But when Mr. Vane is told that the hawthorn tree in this world "is in the ruins of the church on your home farm," what could that mean? And why did MacDonald use the image of a hawthorn tree?

In this essay I will provide answers to these questions and hopefully shed some light on MacDonald's crowning work of fantasy, *Lilith*. There are allusions to be discovered in pagan folklore and legends, Arthurian legend, Christian legend and Puritan history. But the biggest surprise is the conclusion that MacDonald is paying tribute to the American author Nathaniel Hawthorne. The most convincing evidence for this is the uncanny parallel between Hawthorne's *The Blithedale Romance* and *Lilith, A Romance*.

Folklore

MacDonald was well versed in folklore, legend, and myth including the use of trees in pagan religions and rituals. Pagan religion considers the oak, ash, and hawthorn to be especially sacred trees. In *Phantastes* a country maiden advises Anodos, "Trust the oak, and the elm, and the great beech. Take care of the birch . . . but shun the ash and the alder, for the ash is an ogre."² MacDonald does not mention the hawthorn tree in this passage, but conflicting folklore traditions support it as either holy or evil.³

Hawthorn trees were used in Britain as hedgerows or natural fences. The word *hawthorn* comes from the word "haw," an old English word meaning *hedge*. The tree is also known as 'May.' When we read of knights and ladies "a-maying" they are gathering branches of hawthorn flowers to decorate the halls. Pagan folklore associates the tree with fertility, perhaps because of the arousing fragrance of its blossoms. In ancient Greece hawthorn wood was used for the marriage torch and girls wore hawthorn blossom crowns at weddings.

In some regions hawthorn was considered unlucky or evil. Witches were supposed to make their brooms from it and on May Day they could turn themselves into hawthorns. Christians may have devised some of these

evil connotations in order to discourage pagan rituals and customs.

Hawthorns are also one of the traditional thresholds of the Otherworld, standing over many of the holy wells in Britain. Scottish legends say the hawthorn is a meeting place for faeries. Even today in Wales and parts of Ireland it is a custom to weave crowns of hawthorn blossoms for angels and faeries that come at night and dance around them.⁴ In a 13th century Scottish ballad by Thomas the Rhymer, the poet is taken away by the Queen of Elfland as he sits beneath an ancient hawthorn. Thomas spent seven years in fairyland as the Queen of Elfland's lover, and when he returned he became a great poet and prophet. Thomas the Rhymer used to be considered the original author of Sir Tristan or Tristrem, an important story in Arthurian legend.

Merlin's Tomb

MacDonald undoubtedly knew the legend of the hawthorn as it appeared in some versions of the King Arthur story. The 1812 edition of Sir Walter Scott's book, *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*, is a collection of ninety-six traditional Scottish ballads along with historical pieces. In this book by Scott, a favorite author of MacDonald, Thomas the Rhymer locates the tomb of Merlin as being under a hawthorn tree. The poem "Merlin's Tomb" (1859) by Robert Buchanan follows the tradition of Merlin being enclosed in a hawthorn. Malory's version says Merlin was magically imprisoned under a rock and Tennyson's poem "Idylls of the King" says Merlin was imprisoned in an oak tree. Considering the seductiveness of the scene between Merlin and Viviane, a hawthorn seems a better poetic choice than a rock, or an oak.

In Buchanan's poem, Merlin falls in love with a water nymph (a "Lady of the Lake") named Viviane (or Vivien) who wants to learn one of Merlin's magic spells to enclose him in a hawthorn tree. Buchanan writes,

Anon they reached the fairest nook
In that fair wood, a bower
O'er which a hoary hawthorn shook
Odorous its blossom shower.

Although Merlin realizes a trap is being laid, he does not resist Viviane's charms. Tradition tells us that Merlin must lie asleep in the tree until he is needed again. The idea of symbolizing a prophetic voice from the past may have been in MacDonald's imagination as he wrote this scene in *Lilith*.



Edward Burne-Jones, "The Beguiling of Merlin," 1874.

"The Beguiling of Merlin," a famous painting by the Pre-Raphaelite artist Edward Burne-Jones, depicts this scene under a hawthorn. Viviane is an example of the arch-typical *femme-fatal*. As such, the seductive property of the hawthorn prefigures the later seductions of Mr. Vane by Lilith. Tennyson gives the following serpentine description of the seductress:

And lissome Vivien, holding by his heel,
Writhed toward him, slid up his knee and
sat,
Behind his ankle twined her hollow feet
Together, curved an arm about his neck,
Clung like a snake

Burne-Jones' painting shows snakes braided into Viviane's hair. However at this stage of MacDonald's story, the emphasis is on the Merlin figure. Merlin waiting upon the need of a future time is a theme echoed in Burne-Jones' comment in a letter to Helen Mary Gaskell: "Every year when the hawthorn buds it is the soul of Merlin trying to live again in the world and speak—for he left so much unsaid."⁵

The Holy Thorn

One fascinating story Merlin might tell us is about the founding of Christianity in Britain. A hawthorn tree plays a prominent part in that story as well. Christian legend says Joseph of Arimathea (who took Christ from the cross to give him a proper burial) traveled to England in 65AD. Wanting a miracle to prove the truth of the gospel, he thrust his hawthorn staff (made from the same tree which provided Christ's crown of thorns) in the ground in Glastonbury. A tree miraculously bloomed from the staff, known thereafter as the Holy Thorn, a symbol of the birth of Christianity in England. Hawthorn trees derived from cuttings of the Holy Thorn still bloom inexplicably twice a year, during Christmas

and Easter season. At Glastonbury, also known by the name Avalon in the King Arthur legends, Joseph built a church, and later a monastery was erected. Thus viewed, the hawthorn symbolically fits with MacDonald's hope for the growth of Christianity in England and the world.⁶

The simultaneous presence of the hawthorn in the world Vane visits and in the ruins of a churchyard in England may be significant. Cromwell's soldiers cut down the Holy Thorn (located on the site of the ruined Abbey) around 1650 because they objected to the reverence paid to this holy relic. MacDonald focused a great deal of thought on this time in English history. The conflict was a symbol for MacDonald of both the horror of religious persecution and the promise of religious liberty. As such, he felt it contained important lessons for nineteenth-century Christians. His novel *St. George and St. Michael* takes place during the period of the Civil War.⁷ MacDonald's son Ronald wrote two historical novels of the Civil War, *The Broken Sword* (1901) and *The Kings Sword* (1902). MacDonald may have influenced his son's interest in this era of English history.



20th century British stamp depicting the famous Glastonbury Thorn. <http://www.time-scapes.co.uk/Glastonbury/josephofarimathe.html>

MacDonald would have known each of these hawthorn legends: as rooted in Celtic folklore and magic, in Arthurian tradition, and in the legend of the Holy Thorn. But another potential meaning of the hawthorn is not found in legendary history, but in literary history. And curiously enough, not in English literature but American literature. It is plausible that MacDonald in *Lilith* is showing his esteem for one of America's greatest writers, Nathaniel Hawthorne. It would be characteristic of MacDonald to find resonant meanings in the history and legend of a tree and an author of the same name. There is reason to believe that Hawthorne influenced MacDonald in the themes, characters, and structure of *Lilith*.

Hints of Hawthorne

The first hint of a relation to Hawthorne is in the preface to *Lilith*. MacDonald introduces his book with a selection from the essay "Walking" by Henry David Thoreau, a neighbor and friend of Hawthorne. Thoreau imagines a family in Concord, Massachusetts, whose "house was not obvious to vision, the trees grew through it." This parallels the scene with the hawthorn tree when Mr. Raven says it "is in the ruins of the church on your home farm." To see how Mr. Raven's property in the dimension of *Lilith* may be Mr. Vane's property in England, or the ruined Abbey in Glastonbury, or Hawthorne's property in New England we must know more about Hawthorn himself.

Hawthorne married in 1842 and lived in Concord until 1850. The New England transcendentalist writers Emerson and Thoreau were his neighbors. The Hawthornes called their house "The Old Manse," which indeed it was, being the former home of Congregationalist ministers and having a graveyard in the vicinity. Chapter five of *Lilith* is called "The Old Church," chapter six is "The Cemetery," and chapter seven "The Sexton's House." Thus several elements of Mr. Raven's environment are found in the environment of Hawthorne in Concord. Furthermore, Hawthorne and his wife Sophie had unusual nicknames for themselves, "Adam" and "Eve." These are also names for Mr. Raven and his wife. Would MacDonald have known this information? I think so.

Mutual Friends, Mutual Interests

During his American lecture tour, MacDonald spent considerable time in the company of friends and acquaintances of Hawthorne, including Longfellow and Emerson. On October 29, 1872, Louisa MacDonald wrote from Boston to their eldest daughter Lilia that she and George met Hawthorne's youngest daughter Rose.⁸

There were two or three pleasant bits in the evening—one a long chat with Mr. And Mrs. Lathrop *née* Miss Hawthorne, of course we talked of Ted Hughes. He did not know that his brother had been to Bruges with Ted. He had not heard of him for many months and was very glad to hear good things of him. She was very bright and interesting and appeared immensely glad to see P.⁹

Louisa's letter assumes Lilia knows who Miss Hawthorne is. Ted (Edward) Hughes, the nephew of MacDonald's favorite illustrator Arthur Hughes, was a close family friend and eventually was engaged to MacDonald's daughter Mary.¹⁰ Mr. Lathrop's brother,

The Season for the Hawthorn to Blossom • Robert Trexler

Francis, was an artist who studied in England from 1870-73 under Ford Maddox Brown and Burne-Jones, and worked in the school of William Morris. MacDonald had become “well-connected” by the 1870s when he was at the height of his popularity.

Hawthorne was at his peak as a writer in the 1850s (MacDonald was 26 years old in 1850). *Twice Told Tales* was published in 1837, *Mosses from an Old Manse* in 1846, *The Scarlet Letter* in 1850, *The House of Seven Gables* in 1851, *The Blithedale Romance* in 1852 and *Tanglewood Tales for Boys and Girls* in 1853. Hawthorne and his family lived as celebrities in England from 1853 to 1857. A search of Victorian periodicals for articles about Hawthorne’s life and works verifies his popularity in British literary circles.¹¹ Hawthorne and MacDonald held many common interests: seventeenth-century Puritan history, aspects of transcendentalist philosophy, children’s stories, and the use of folklore, the supernatural, and the grotesque in storytelling.

Hawthorne lived in Italy eighteen months, returning to America in 1859. After his death in 1864 his wife and daughters moved back to England. Una, the oldest daughter, joined an Anglican order of women (Society of All Saints Sisters of the Poor) before her death in 1877.¹² She also collaborated with other figures admired by MacDonald—Robert Browning and the Christian social worker Octavia Hill. George Lathrop, whom MacDonald met in Boston, wrote a biography of Hawthorne in 1877.¹³ Hawthorne’s son Julian wrote a two-volume biography in 1884 called *Nathaniel Hawthorne and His Wife* (could Greville MacDonald have had this in mind when titling his biography *George MacDonald and His Wife* in 1924?).

It seems likely that MacDonald read Hawthorne’s famous novels set in a period of history that intrigued him so much—the English Civil War and the resultant migration of Puritans to New England. Hawthorne’s ironic theme of religious freedom alongside religious persecution would have struck a deep chord with MacDonald, especially in light of the rejection he experienced during his pastorate and the hardships incurred by many friends including F.D. Maurice and Thomas T. Lynch.¹⁴ *The Scarlet Letter* was published at the beginning of the same decade when MacDonald and his friends suffered for their beliefs.

The Blithedale Romance

The Hawthorne book that bears a striking resemblance to *Lilith*, however, is *The Blithedale Romance*. Although MacDonald and Hawthorne never met, they both admired the poet Robert Browning. Browning, Hawthorne, and MacDonald all share a talent for exploring psychological and religious themes in their writing, sometimes using grotesque imagery.

Browning first met Hawthorne in 1856 and later their families spent time together in Italy. In his diary Hawthorne wrote he “was delighted to be told that of all his works *The Blithedale Romance* was Browning’s favorite.”¹⁵ It may have been MacDonald’s favorite too. Here are some similarities between *The Blithedale Romance* and *Lilith, A Romance*.

1. Both use the word “Romance” in their titles. Hawthorne says in his preface that he was looking for a method to portray a “Faery Land” which has “an atmosphere of strange enchantment” and whose story is “essentially a daydream, and yet a fact—thus offering a foothold between fiction and reality.”¹⁶
2. Both are written in the first person by a poetic young male searching for his place in the world.
3. Both employ the device of dreams.
4. Both employ the device of the grotesque.
5. Both have a strong woman as a central focus of the story. For *Blithedale* it is Zenobia, named after the Jewish Queen of the fourth century A.D. known for her beauty, power, intelligence, and ruthlessness. *Lilith* is named for the Jewish folk-character also known for her beauty, power, intelligence, and ruthlessness.
6. Both have a virginal “ideal” woman who is related to the powerful female. In *Blithedale* it is Pricilla, unknown half-sister to Zenobia until late in the book. In *Lilith* it is Lona, who initially does not know that Lilith is her mother.
7. Both narrators are sexually attracted to the powerful woman, but in the end profess their love for the “pure” woman.
8. Both stories have a mysterious father/husband who “introduces” the narrator to the women characters. In *Blithedale* it is the evasive Mr. Moody, a/k/a Faunteroy, a/k/a Old Moody. In *Lilith* it is the evasive Mr. Raven a/k/a the old librarian, a/k/a Adam. This character appears and reappears to introduce information or act as an interpreter.
9. Both information givers / interpreters (Mr. Moody and Mr. Raven) have had two wives with a daughter resulting from each marriage.
10. Both stories have a “veiled lady.” In *Blithedale* it is the sorrowful Pricilla. In *Lilith* it is the sorrowful Mara.
11. Both stories have male characters criticized for their “philanthropy.” In *Blithedale* there is the character of Mr. Hollingsworth. In *Lilith* Mr. Vane has a dual role as the questing narrator and the willful philanthropist.
12. Both are, in part, commentaries on the sinful nature of man and the impossibility of a utopian

society brought about by philanthropy.

13. Both Zenobia and Lilith have a small wound on their left side under their hearts.
14. In both stories the powerful *femme-fatal* woman dies toward the end of the story. Zenobia by drowning suicide, with descriptions of her clenched fists when her body is discovered. Lilith by “assisted suicide” (if you will) whose death is only completed when her clenched fist is cut off.
15. Both stories are influenced by the second part of *Pilgrim’s Progress*.

Planting Hawthorne Seedlings

This list of similarities is merely a starting point for further study and reflection. I hope others will view this paper as an invitation to make more in-depth comparisons of Hawthorne and MacDonald’s writing. If scholarship focuses only on the theological and devotional, MacDonald will continue to be marginalized in the broader context of literary studies. Comparing and contrasting MacDonald with Hawthorne should increase appreciation for MacDonald, for his talents as a writer are frequently undervalued and misunderstood. To understand MacDonald’s artistry it is essential to better understand his aesthetic reasoning and reading some critical analysis of Nathaniel Hawthorne will help considerably.¹⁷ Because Hawthorne was also a myth-maker and symbolist, seedlings borrowed from Hawthorne scholarship may bear fruit in the ground of MacDonald studies.

There is no single interpretation of the hawthorn passage in Chapter 5. The meanings that suggest themselves to me may be part of MacDonald’s intention, but that is not a requirement for a proper interpretation according to MacDonald. As he says in *The Fantastic Imagination*, a genuine interpreter of his work “will imagine true things; what matter whether I meant them or not? They are there none the less that I cannot claim putting them there.”¹⁸ With that encouragement I will summarize what the hawthorn passage may legitimately mean in the overall context of *Lilith*.

If the person in the hawthorn tree is Merlin, then it may be MacDonald in the role of Merlin. As such, MacDonald identifies himself as a man of magical talent beguiled, like all men, with sensuous things. He has been silenced in death, yet he speaks to future generations symbolically. He may realize prophetically that his contemporaries will not understand his message (“the season for the hawthorn to blossom is when it blossoms”). He is enclosed in the hawthorn that symbolizes Christianity in England. The Holy Thorn the Puritans attempted to destroy, partly due to their faulty imagination, has appeared in literature once again. In

Lilith MacDonald reflects on his life and work, doubting it has been any more effective Mr. Vane’s philanthropy. He understands that no Utopia on earth or in heaven is produced by man’s efforts. The scent of the hawthorn blossoms may suggest false seduction, but more importantly God’s wooing of man that leads to a celestial union. Suffering, inherently represented by a thorn tree, is an integral part of his message. Perfect union requires suffering and a willing death.

Thus, from an enchanted hawthorn (perhaps as an “ancient” Nathaniel Hawthorne and a figure of Merlin) MacDonald relates a fantastic, multi-faceted, tender, and grotesque story that whispers to the conscience of its reader. There is no single meaning, but each possibility leads us to recognize our own inadequacies and willfulness, while it bolsters our faith in God’s steadfast love.



Julia Margaret Cameron, “Vivien and Merlin,” London, 1875. Illustrations to Tennyson’s *Idylls of the King* and Other Poems.

Notes

¹George MacDonald, *Lilith: A Variorum Edition*, ed. Rolland Hein. (Whitehorn, CA: Johannesen Printing and Publishing, 1997)

John Doherty, in his book *The Literary Products of the Lewis Carroll-George MacDonald Friendship*, 2nd ed. (The Edwin Mellon Press, 1995), 388, says the figure in the hawthorn tree recalls Blake’s tree-man in *The Marriage of Heaven and Hell* (11). Doherty’s study is the single most important book to read to appreciate the complexities of *Phantastes* and *Lilith*. Also recommended is Deirdre Haywood’s essay “George MacDonald and Jacob Boehem: *Lilith* and the Seven-Fold Pattern of Existence,” *Seven* 16 (1997): 123-44.

²George MacDonald, *Phantastes and Lilith* (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1964), 21.

³MacDonald is not an allegorical writer in the sense

that his images do not present a one-to-one interpretation. MacDonald writes in *England's Antiphon*, "Allegory has her place, and a lofty one, in literature; but when her plants cover the ground and run to seed, Allegory herself is ashamed of her children: the loveliest among them are despised for the obtrusiveness of the family. Imitation not only brings the imitated into disrepute, but tends to destroy what original faculty the imitator may have possessed." (p 54) Varying interpretations of MacDonald's symbolism should be reconcilable to each other and not incongruous to the overall meaning. After previewing this essay, Joshua Pong pointed out that bad luck is a means to good luck in MacDonald's universalistic scheme. Whether or not the hawthorn figures immediate evil or immediate good, it must figure ultimate good.

⁴Myths and legends surrounding May Day or Beltane can be found at <http://www.mythinglinks.org/Beltane.html>.

⁵http://www.the-athenaeum.org/artworks/art_detail.php?ID=249

⁶"This word has its origin in the name of the demi-god of the underworld, Avalloc or Avallach. The legend says that Avalon, where the sea meets the land, was the meeting place of the dead, where they passed to another level of existence." http://www.nullens.org/jesus/annexes/jch_anx4.htm

"Henry VIII closed all the 800 Catholic monasteries that had existed before in Britain; 10,000 monks and nuns were thrown out and the crown seized their buildings and their land. Glastonbury Abbey followed the general rule and was closed in 1539." The Church of England purchased the ruined Abbey in 1907. Visit this site for more information on the history and legends of Glastonbury: <http://www.pinkink3.250x.com/essays/arthur.htm>

I am indebted to John Doherty for his observation that in the novel *Thomas Wingfold* MacDonald uses the old shorter name Glaston with the character Joseph as a type of Joseph of Arimathea. John also personally confirms that the Holy Thorn blooms at Christmastime while still bearing the fruits from its spring flowering.

⁷Pilgrims came to New England for freedom of religion and to escape the persecution of fellow Christians. While it may seem unlikely that MacDonald chose the hawthorn tree symbol with Puritan associations in mind it may not be impossible. The English ship the Mayflower (named for the hawthorn blossom) carried the Separatist Puritans, later known as pilgrims, to Plymouth, Mass., in 1620. There 41 men signed the Mayflower Compact. Although it falls outside the scope of this essay to describe links between *Lilith* and the

period of the English Civil War, I hope to attempt that topic in a future essay.

⁸It is interesting to note that George and Rose Lathrop converted to the Catholic Church and after Mr. Lathrop's death Rose founded a Dominican order of nuns to care for the poor with cancer in New York City. Cardinal Edward Egan introduced her cause for canonization in 2003.

⁹Glenn Sadler, *Expressions of Character* (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1992), 219.

¹⁰William Reaper, *George MacDonald* (Great Britain: Lion Publishing, 1987), 334-36.

¹¹Kenneth Walter Cameron, *Hawthorne Among His Contemporaries* (Transcendental Books, 1968) A four page review of *The Blithedale Romance* appeared in the London Times newspaper. Anthony Trollop wrote concerning Hawthorne's *The Marble Faun*, "The great fault of the book lies in the absence of an arranged plot." "The Genius of Nathaniel Hawthorne" *North American Review*, CXXIX (September, 1879), 203-22. The lack of an arranged plot is common complaint against *The Blithedale Romance*, *Phantastes*, and *Lilith*.

¹²Like MacDonald's beloved daughter Lilia MacDonald, a single young woman who died in 1891, age 39, while caring for a sick friend.

¹³George Lathrop, *A Study of Nathaniel Hawthorne* (1876)

¹⁴Maurice was expelled from teaching at King's College over a controversy regarding the meaning of eternal life and eternal punishment, essentially saying that eternity was not time extended but time abolished. He also argued against Mansel about the meaning of revelation. See: Alex R. Vidler, *F.D. Maurice and Company* (London: SCM Press, 1966), 28.

Thomas T. Lynch caused one of the most publicized theological controversies in the nineteenth century with the publication of *The Rivulet; A Contribution to Sacred Song* (1855). Songs from *The Rivulet* were considered unsuitable for public worship primarily because the lyrics were not directly from scripture or referring to scripture themes. Lynch's songs often use nature (human nature as well as exterior nature) to stimulate wonderment and curiosity about God, rather than for didactic or pedagogical aims.

¹⁵Maisie Ward, *Robert Browning and His World, Volume One* (London: Cassell & Company LTD, 1967), 272.

¹⁶Nathaniel Hawthorne, *The Blithedale Romance* (New York: Penguin Classics, 1986), 2.

Hawthorne also explains this method of writing in his story "The Threefold Destiny." He says he began by "imagining a train of incidents in which

the spirit and the mechanism of the fairy tale legend should be combined with the characters and manners of familiar life.” Quoted by author Martin Terence, *Nathaniel Hawthorn* (Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1983), 46. Terence goes on to comment “Hawthorne’s imagination withdraws into history, then returns to the present with meaning distilled from the past.” p 49. Hawthorne once wrote in a letter, “In writing a romance, a man is always, or ought to be always, careering on the utmost verge of a precipitous absurdity, and the skill lies in coming as close as possible without actually tumbling over.” Quoted by Marjorie J. Elder, *Nathaniel Hawthorne, Transcendental Symbolist* (Ohio University Press, 1969), 68.

¹⁷A few more books worth mentioning include:

James K. Folsom, *Man's Accidents and God's Purposes; multiplicity in Hawthorne* (New Haven, CT: College and University Press, 1963)

Randall A. Clark, *The Marriage of Heaven and Earth: alchemical regeneration in the works of Taylor, Poe, Hawthorne, and Fuller* (Greenwood Press, 2000).

Marian Montgomery, *Why Hawthorne Was Melancholy (The Prophetic Poet and the Spirit of the Age, Vol 3 of a Trilogy)* other volumes are: *Why Poe Drank Liquor*, and *Why Flannery O'Connor Stayed Home* (Sherwood Sugden & Co, 1983).

¹⁸George MacDonald, *A Dish of Orts* (Whitehorn, CA: Johannesen Printing and Publishing, 1996), 320.