University of Massachusetts Boston ScholarWorks at UMass Boston

William Monroe Trotter Institute Publications

William Monroe Trotter Institute

10-1988

Human Rights, Women, and Third World Development

Winston E. Langley *University of Massachusetts Boston*, winston.langley@umb.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://scholarworks.umb.edu/trotter_pubs

Part of the Economic Policy Commons, Growth and Development Commons, Human Rights
Law Commons, Social Policy Commons, Women Commons, and the Women's Studies Commons

Recommended Citation

Langley, Winston E., "Human Rights, Women, and Third World Development" (1988). William Monroe Trotter Institute Publications. Paper 28.

http://scholarworks.umb.edu/trotter_pubs/28

This Research Report is brought to you for free and open access by the William Monroe Trotter Institute at ScholarWorks at UMass Boston. It has been accepted for inclusion in William Monroe Trotter Institute Publications by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks at UMass Boston. For more information, please contact library.uasc@umb.edu.

TROTTER INSTITUTE

Human Rights, Women, and Third World Development

Winston E. Langley, Ph.D.

RESEARCH REPORT

WILLIAM MONROE TROTTER INSTITUTE

UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS AT BOSTON BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS 02125-3393

ARCHIVES HQ 1870.9 L363 1988 Human Rights, Women, and Third World Development Winston E. Langley, Ph.D.

October 1988

Winston E. Langley is Professor of Political Science at the University of Massachusetts, Boston, and Research Associate at the William Monroe Trotter Institute.

Through this series of publications the William Monroe Trotter Institute is making available copies of selected reports and papers from research conducted at the Institute. The analyses and conclusions contained in these articles are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the opinions or endorsements of the Trotter Institute or the University of Massachusetts.

The Trotter Institute publishes its research through the Occasional Papers Series, the Research Reports Series, the Monographs Series, and the Institute's quarterly publication, the <u>Trotter Review</u>. For information on any of these publications or the William Monroe Trotter Institute, please contact us at the address below.

Wornie L. Reed, Director William Monroe Trotter Institute Harbor Campus Wheatley Bldg., 4th.Fl., Rm. 98 Dorchester, MA 02125

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	4
Introduction	6
Measures to Promote Equality for Women	8
The Condition of Women, 1975 to Present	15
The Condition of Women and the Promotion of Human Rights	38
Human Rights Promotion, the Condition of Women and Third World Development	46
Human Rights and the Improved Conditions of Women: A Strategy and Some Tactics	51
Appendix: An Open Letter from Women	61
Notes	69

PREFACE

This research project, in its present form, developed gradually. In early 1985, as I was completing an article on the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, the thought struck me that since the latter instrument does not spell out the rights of women to which it seems to refer, it would be informative to do some research on those rights. Then, as I began to grapple with the extensiveness of those rights, I thought of moving beyond the abstract legal and moral entitlements to see what governments were actually doing, especially in light of the fact that African states have not had the best of reputation for the promotion of human rights in general and the rights of women in particular. At the same time, I was doing some research on Brazil in another area and noticed the parallel between the condition of Black women there and Black women in the United States. So I thought I would broaden the compass of the study to include women in Africa and women in Brazil, with some emphasis on Black women in the latter country. But I found that, while it was academically respectable to look at women in Africa and Black women in Brazil, my own intellectual commitments and the facts I was uncovering suggested that I look at women in the Third World--and, even better, the world at large. Because of time limits, I had to confine myself to the Third World, although the condition of women in general, with few exceptions, bears such an unmistakable identity that I am embarrassed not to have looked at women on a global scale. I shall repair this breach of duty in the near future.

The project would not have reached its present form--it is not yet completed in some respects--without the help of many persons and institutions. But I dare not seek to mention all, for fear of leaving out some who ought to have been mentioned or of creating political problems for others. To the nuns and other religious groups of Brazil who exposed me to the favelas, I am profoundly indebted. So, too, I am to Drs. Salomon and Jennifer Blajberg of Institutos Unificados de

Relacoes Internacionais (IURI), Isabelle Smyth of Agencia Ecumenica de Notocias (AGEN), and to the professors mentioned in the body of the study. To Dr. E. Fracasso, the Moorland-Spingarn Collection at Howard University, the United Nations Publications Office, and Frances Stubbs of the Trotter Institute I say special thanks. I am particularly grateful to the latter institute for its financing of my trip to Brazil and for helping in a number of ways to facilitate the research.

A portion of this study will be appeared in the December 1987 issue of the Third World Law Journal.

INTRODUCTION

As part of the effort to inaugurate a new international socio-political order after World War II, international emphasis was given to certain moral and legal entitlements we have come to call human rights. That emphasis initially found its most forceful expression in the Charter of the United Nations, 1 which not only asserts its members' faith in fundamental human rights, in the dignity and worth of the human person, as well as in the equal rights of men and women of all nations, but also recites its members' commitment to employ international machinery for the promotion of the social and economic advancement of all peoples. Indeed, while assigning the General Assembly of the U.N. the task of conducting studies and making recommendations pursuant to the realization its purposes, the Charter also commits the U. N. as a whole--"with a view to the creation of conditions of stability and well-being which are necessary for peaceful and friendly relations among nations"--to "promote universal respect for, and observance of, human rights and fundamental freedom." Specific organs are then called upon to tender advice on the mode as well as the means by which the promotion is to be effected, and pledges are secured from member states to take joint and separate action, in cooperation with the U.N., to create the sought-after conditions of "social stability and well-being.2"

It is in large measure due to the assumed international obligation to take "joint and separate action" that, in 1948, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) was proclaimed and adopted,³ followed by the 1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights as well as that on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights—two international instruments that spell out specific human rights in accordance with the agreed-on, common standard represented by and elaborated in the UDHR.4 It is to that assumed obligation, too, that we owe certain

regional, human rights instruments such as the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms⁵ (1950), the American Convention on Human Rights⁶ (1969), and the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, officially named after the Gambian city where it was completed, the Banjul Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights⁷ (1981).

Despite the preceding measures taken on the regional and global level to promote and encourage respect for human rights, hardly a day goes by without our hearing or reading news of their violation or otherwise gaining information raising questions about the commitment of some nation-state to them. One particular area of violation and questionable commitment on the part of states that is frequently overlooked, however, is an area intimately linked to the norm of equality and nondiscrimination--the very starting point of all our liberties. That area concerns women.

Because of the historic deprivations visited on women as a group, the U. N. as we will subsequently see, recognized the need to take special measures designed to help eliminate these deprivations as well as their causes. Such measure notwithstanding--even in the midst of the United Nations Decade for Women (1975-1985), a report released by the latter organization entitled <u>The State of the World's Women</u>, 1979 made, among others, the following observations:

Women and girls constitute one-half of the world's population, one-third of its labor force. They perform two-thirds of the world's work hours. They earn, by estimate, only one-tenth of the world's income. They own less than one-hundreth of the world's property. World-wide, women attend school half as often as men. Two out of every three illiterates are female.9

The objective of this study is to look at some of the special steps taken by the U.N. to promote equality for women and to establish the extent to which, if any, these steps have moved, or materially promised to move, the condition of women toward greater equality with men. In particular, the study seeks to look at the

relationship of promoting human rights for women and the meaning of such promotion for development within the Third World. The approach the work will follow should observe the following steps: First, it will identify and evaluate the special international measures adopted since World War II to advance the equality for women. Second, it will look at the condition of women in certain selected areas of the Third World. Third, it will seek to examine the relationship between that condition and the state of human rights promotion. And, finally, it will try to make a link between the promotion of human rights, improvement in the condition of women, and Third World development; and to demonstrate that a tactic of global collaboration among women is the only means that promises rapid and effective relief for them as a group and for humankind as a whole.

MEASURES TO PROMOTE EQUALITY FOR WOMEN

Since human rights are, by nature, applicable to "all persons," "everyone," "every human being," "all members of the human family," women are, by definition, individually and collectively accorded protection under regional and global human rights instruments. As noted before, however, they suffer from historic deprivations—deprivations that have no bearing either on their capabilities or their social contributions. Accordingly, it has been adjudged just by the international community to fashion certain human rights instruments that bear uniquely on them. 10 These instruments are, in temporal order, the Convention on the Political Rights of Women, 11 the Declaration on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (DEDAW), 12 and the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW). 13 Collectively, they deal somewhat comprehensively with certain categories of rights—civil and political as well as economic, social and cultural. We will look at each in turn.

Civil and Political Rights

Apart from recognizing that women enjoy rights in civil matters identical to that of men--from the right to a fair trial and to life to that of freedom of conscience and expression--the relevant international instruments under consideration have highlighted other rights such as the right to vote in all elections and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies; to participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof; and to take part in nongovernmental organizations and associations concerned with the public life of nation-states. The latter states, on the other hand, pledge themselves to take "all appropriate measures" to ensure to women, on equal terms with men and without discrimination, the opportunity to represent their governments at the international level and to participate in the work of international organizations. 14

Part of the subcategory of rights dealt with in the preceding paragraph but in some ways related to the subclass of the social and the economic also is that concerning the nationality of women. The relevant international legal instruments impose a duty on states to recognize women as having equal rights with men to acquire, change, or retain their nationality; and, further, to ensure that neither marriage to an alien nor change of nationality by the husband during the marriage shall automatically modify the nationality of the wife, render her stateless, or force upon her the nationality of the husband. Finally, states are enjoined to grant women equal rights with men in respect of the nationality of their children.

Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights

In this subclass of rights, international instruments deal with matters ranging from employment, economic and social order, and education to health care, marriage, and the family.

As respects the area of employment, nation-states assume the obligation to eliminate discrimination against women and to ensure equality with men. In

particular, states pledge to recognize women as having the same right as men to employment opportunities, to the free choice of profession and employment, to promotion and job security, to receive vocational training, to equal remuneration and treatment with respect to work of equal value, and to obtain social security as well as employment and disability benefits. Women are also recognized to have a right to "protection of health and safety, in working conditions, including the safeguarding of the function of reproduction." 16

Noting that in the last-mentioned area, among others, women have peculiar needs, the applicable human rights instruments seek to prevent discrimination against women "on the grounds of marriage or maternity." So, in order to "ensure them the effective right to work," 17 states assume the obligation to take measures to "prohibit discrimination" against women on grounds of pregnancy or maternity leave or marital status. Nation-states further pledge themselves to introduce maternity leave with pay or comparable social benefits without loss of former employment seniority or social allowances and to encourage the development of supporting social services that are necessary to enable parents to combine family responsibilities with work obligations--a network of child-care facilities, for example. Finally, by way of protecting them in other "areas of (the) economic and social order" states vow to eliminate discrimination against women in the exercise of their right to family benefits, to bank loans, mortgages, and other forms of financial credit. (One should note here that special provisions are made for women in rural areas.) 20

In the area of health, women are recognized to enjoy the right to "appropriate services in connection with pregnancy, confinement, and the post-natal period," 21 with free services where necessary. They are also entitled to adequate nutrition during pregnancy and lactation. 22

In education, women are recognized as having the right to the same conditions as men for career and vocational guidance, for access to academic and other studies, and for the achievement of diplomas in educational institutions in and of all categories, in rural as well as urban area; they enjoy alike the right of access to the same curricula, the same examinations, teaching staff with qualifications of the same standard, and school premises as well as equipments of the same quality.²³ As laudable as the concerns that have informed the elaboration of the above-mentioned rights have been, they do not exhaust the areas of focus for equal opportunities for women. The relevant human rights instruments call for the elimination of stereotyped concepts of the role of men and women at all levels and in all forms of education through the encouragement of coeducation, through 🗻 the same benefits from scholarships and study grants, through the same access to continuing education, and through the same chances to participate actively in sports and physical education. States are also pledged to reduce the female student dropout rates and organize programs for girls and women who have left school prematurely.24

In the areas of marriage and family, Article 16 of CEDAW confers on women, on the basis of equality with men, the same rights to enter into marriage: to freely choose a spouse and enter into marriage only with their free and full consent, to decide freely on the number and the spacing of their children, and to have access to information, education, and other means to enable them to exercise these rights. Further, women share with men the same rights and responsibilities as parents, regardless of marital status, in matters relating to children as well as guardianship, wardship, trusteeship and adoption of children, or similar institutions where these concepts exist in legislation. Wives and husbands have the same personal rights, including the right to choose a family name, a profession, and an occupation; both spouses have the same right during and at the dissolution of a marriage; and both

have the same right in respect of the ownership, acquisition, management, administration, enjoyment, and disposition of property.²⁵

Concluding the subsection, the CEDAW makes bethrothal and the marriage of children legally null and void and requires states, by legislation and other action, to specify a minimum age for marriage and to make registration of marriages in an official registry compulsory.²⁶

A Brief Evaluation of Measures

In making an appraisal of the rights recognized, one should bear in mind the end that is being served: the equality of women. There are other ends, of course, that attend or are associated with the goal of equality for women--ends such as the universal equality of all peoples and persons and the spiritual as well as social liberation that should result from the achievement of that equality. We, however, cannot address all of them in this paper, although we will make some pressing comments on them; we must concentrate on the issue at hand. And in doing so, we will follow the order of the issues so far discussed.

On that of political rights, framers of the human rights instruments that have informed our discussion understood that women would have to take an active role in fashioning the equality women should enjoy and that the women's political empowerment would be an indispensable instrumental goal. It is in the latter connection that one should understand "the right to vote in all elections," to be "eligible for election to publicly elected bodies," and "to hold public office and exercise all public functions; "27 it is within that context, too, that one should see the emphasis on women's right to participate in public life at the international, national, local and community levels. As respects to the first level--and this includes diplomatic, consular, administrative and judicial activities--there was a time when women were rarely, if ever, participants. Today, a few are represented at that level. But as the policies of the international level increasingly shape what takes place

nationally and locally--especially in the area of political economy--the equal presence of women in international councils will be correspondingly important. On the whole, the linking of the right to vote with the right to actually formulate and implement public policy reflects the realization that, even in societies where the major features of patriarchy have been seriously questioned and challenged,²⁸ the right to vote by and of itself can be a mere formality, contributing little or nothing to the goal of equality.

One of the more pronounced problems that has affected women is that of nationality. States, by law, required that a woman who married an alien (a citizen or national of another state) would automatically lose her former nationality and gain that of her husband. Should this marriage be subsequently dissolved, she could then lose her newly-gained nationality and, thereby, become a stateless person, with the loss of all the international protection that this status entails. The justification for this reguirement was the traditional principle of "unity of the family," but that unity, where it existed, was purchased at the price of and clearly reflected the inequality of women.

The convention on the Elimination of All Form of Discrimination against Women, in its elaboration of the right of women to acquire, retain, or change their nationality as they choose, represents the culmination of efforts since the 1930s ²⁹ to change the traditional law relating to nationality and replace it with the principle of independence and equality of women. Family unity on this basis is the only type worth supporting.

Any discussion of women's rights that overlooks the issues of employment, education, health, and marital relations would be unacceptably incomplete. So we will generally look on each in turn, although we can but touch the surface.

The focus on employment in the previously-mentioned human rights instruments should not be regarded as simply ensuring that women have jobs,

important as this is and has been. Employment should be seen in a more fundamental light: women, as in case of all human beings, have an equal right to pursue their material well-being and their spiritual development, in conditions of freedom and dignity as well as economic security; and material well-being, spiritual development, dignity, economic security, and a sense of freedom are significantly dependent on gainful employment.

To the extent that one understands the centrality of employment, one will understand the core importance of education, since without the skills that education helps to develop, equality of opportunity or equal employment prospects are mere abstractions, "words on the book," as one frequently hears. But education extends to all areas: to one's sense of one's possibilities, to one's felt competence to make an impact, "make a dent," to one's capacity to participate effectively in public life--from voting to the exercise of functions at the highest levels of government to the shaping of the general environment within which one lives and moves and has one's being.

With respect to family and the issue of health, we will use but a few illustrations to highlight their far-reaching impact. In case of the first, "matrimonial regimes" have historically been partial to men in respect of parental rights and obligations. For example, authority frequently belonged exclusively or principally to the father, and in some countries, if that authority were lost, it would not automatically pass to the mother. In many instances, in cases of dissolution of the marriage, custody of the child would be awarded the father "regardless of the merits of the case." Hence, the relevant human rights instruments support "the same rights and responsibilities of parents" in matters relating to children, guardianship, et cetera.

The field of health care, although on the surface appearing to concern itself primarily with pregnancy and child-bearing, is actually much broader. The above

areas are merely emphasized because they have special significance to the unequal socioeconomic standing of women. One of the particularly controversial areas to which further study is being given is that of operation on women based on custom. Should women, for example, have the right not to undergo "ritual operations" that results in their being genitally mutilated?

Because there is an interactive and reciprocal relationship between changes in "people's hearts and minds" and the changed application of the law, the social and cultural aspects of the human rights regime emphasize the changing of public attitudes and values about the role of women through a careful use of the communications media--unions, churches, cooperatives, and local newspapers.

THE CONDITION OF WOMEN, 1975 TO THE PRESENT

In dealing with this section, it should be useful to engage in some preliminary explanation. First, although we are focusing on the post-World War II period in general, specific emphasis is being placed on the post-1975 period because of two central factors: the United Nations Decade for Women, which began in 1975, and the fact that, the UDHR notwithstanding, the major human rights treaties did not become operative until the 1970s. (The CEDAW was not even adopted by the U.N. General Assembly until 1979.) Second, while specific areas of the world, as well as particular states, will be subjects of our discussion, the Third World as a whole will be dealt with in particular and general terms. Third, as we seek to capture the condition of women, we will look at some issue areas such as employment (in a broad sense), science and technology, the family, and education and culture. All these areas will be examined in light of a commitment, beginning in the middle 1970s, to "integrate women" to end separation or segregation, to bring into common and equal membership in society—into development, the overriding sociopolitical goal of Third World nations. Let us begin with employment.

Employment

Any reasonably objective look at the area of employment should disclose that women are being subjected to widespread discrimination. And this conclusion is supported by overwhelming evidence, whether one divides a society's economy into categories of the informal (the traditional, defined in terms of subsistence agriculture) and the formal (modern) sector or into the agricultural and nonagricultural areas.

In agriculture--and one has to begin here, since less developed countries (LDCs) are primarily agrarian societies--women's contribution to the labor force is impressive, with 46% in Sub-Sahara Africa, 45% in Asia, and 40% in the Caribbean. 32 (Latin America and the Middle East--although sometimes denied by persons in the latter region--also boast substantial contribution from women.)

Taking Africa as an example, one will find even more compelling statistics: while constituting slightly less than half of the farm labor force, women account for two-thirds of the time spent on agriculture; and if one examines their share of the tasks performed within the food systems, one finds that they are responsible for 50% of the planting, 60% of the harvesting and marketing, 70% of the weeding and hoeing, 80% of the transportation and the storing, and 90% of the processing. 33

And yet, the condition of women in the area of agricultural welfare is one of increased dependency on men and, consequently, social vulnerability. Why?

Discrimination.

First, women were not really included in the development programs. For example, in Nepal where women---depending on the product---provide from 60 to 100% of labor in many agricultural activities and make an estimated 40% of decisions relating to agriculture (from choosing the seeds to be planted to determining how much and what type of fertilizer to apply), a review of the 1983 plans of that government indicates that of all the agricultural advisors trained to

help villagers, only *one* was a woman and she was trained in "home economics," not agriculture.³⁴ Secondly, as has been the case with domestic work, much of women's agricultural work-especially as governments and men shift their emphasis to cash crops--is overlooked and unpaid. With respect to the latter, in Malawi and Bostwana, for example, over 70% of women work unpaid on the land. Men do, too, but in much smaller numbers. In Mali and Ghana, for instance, the ratio of women to men who do unpaid work is two to one, while in Liberia the ratio is four to one.³⁵ As regards the discriminatory practice of overlooking women's work, one has but to look at Pakistan for an example. Here women's "invisible" work such as laboring in vegetable gardens adjacent to the house, "carrying lunch to the fields at midday, sorting through, cleaning and drying crops as well as making bins," although consuming as much time and effort as the "visible" ones such as hoeing and weeding, is not counted as agricultural work.³⁶ The discrimination does not end there.

One finds lower wages, occupational concentration, longer hours of work, fewer fringe benefits, and less security.³⁷ Let us review a few of these issues and see how they affect women, as compared with men, in agriculture.

The issue of lower wages finds few, if any, exceptions in either the traditional or the modern economic sector. But the manner in which it is developing in the traditional sector--to quote a document on Africa, although the phenomenon is Third World -wide--may be pushing "women toward complete dependence on men." 38 This conclusion is supported by, among others, the fact that as the "modernization process" advances in the Third World, men and women are increasingly segregated in production function, with men moving to "cash crops" and women increasingly concentrated in traditional crops. The latter pays much less than the former. And as production of cash crops takes up more and more of the

land under cultivation, women's work in the fields does not only increase (longer hours, for example), but they are apt to have inferior land areas to cultivate.

The conduct of governments compounds the problems. Funding for women's activities has been either completely absent or meagre. In Brazil, "rural women get little to no help from the government." 39 Only .05% of total U.N. resources devoted to the agricultural sector have been spent on programs for rural women. 40 And even where governments do give help, the "tendency has been to help women farmers only in the skills that are associated with their domestic roles." So personnel trained to teach nutrition and food preparation are sent to help women agricultural workers. 41 On the other hand, men are trained to use modern techniques to produce cash crops. 42

With lower wages, reduced quality--sometimes quantity, too--of land to farm, men focusing on cash crops, and an increase in the number of hours worked to compensate for both the reduced quality and/or quantity of land, women find their income increasingly incapable of sustaining their traditional social responsibilities and interests. Worse, they become more dependent on their husbands' income (there is little or no relief here for single women who are heads of households), and on the good will of spouses to teach them limited skills for cash crop emphasis. This dependency generally breeds insecurity, especially in cases where increased migration to urban areas leave women to tend to rural concerns. We will return to this aspect of the discussion later.

If employment in the traditional sector exhibits discrimination against women, that of the modern sector does not offer much improvement. In some cases, the discriminatory conditions and practices of one sector are replicated in the other. We will briefly look at the modern sector, focusing on such factors as sex-typing, household related skills, and the notion of "man the provider."

As a result of efforts on the part of LDCs to industrialize, a considerable number of persons, including women, have been brought into the money economy. And as urbanization has grown a pace, the movement of women to urban centers has been ample. Discrimination, however, in the form of sex-typing (what we earlier called concentration) has been thwarting the opportunities of women to experience equal employment opportunities. For example, although statistics on professional employment will, in general, show that women in LDCs are well represented and, unlike most industrial societies, that representation is often greater than their share in clerical employment, a disaggregation of the "professional employment" category will reveal that this apparent good showing is caused by their overwhelming presence in two "female occupations:" nursing and teaching. This is found in all regions of the Third World. For example, in India, 90% of the women professionals are in nursing and primary or secondary school teaching; and, if one looks at Latin America and the Caribbean (Guatemala and Guyana, for instance), in Africa, or the Middle East, one will find little deviation in this pattern⁴³. On the other hand, women share few management and administrative posts. So, too, is the case in skilled jobs in the areas of production.

In respect of management and administrative positions, the percentage of women is very small. And even where (as in the case of a few states such as Bolivia, Guyana, Dominican Republic, Puerto Rico, and the Philippines) that percentage is relatively high (20% and above), when the statistics are analyzed to identify employees only, there is a precipitous drop (In Bolivia from 45.1% to 17.8% and in Nepal from 22.8% to 4.7%). The reason? Many of the positions classified as administrative/management are in fact self-employed--some spilling over into the informal sector. What this means is that women do not share any significant role in decision-making. Indeed, even in schools of education in Brazil where women

dominate, the deans of these schools, the heads of unions of teachers, with few exceptions not important to highlight, have been males⁴⁵.

A final area of sex-typing or sex-segregation is that of production work that includes a variety of manual occupations from unskilled to skilled. Generally, women do not find much of a representation in this area, but they constitute an exception in certain labor-intensive industries such as electronics, clothing, footwear, and toys, with countries such as Puerto Rico, the Dominican Republic, Barbados, Mexico in Latin America and the Caribbean, and Sri Lanka, Thailand, Singapore, South Korea, Taiwan, Hong Kong, and the Philippines in Asia playing pivotal roles. Indeed, while multinational corporations establish their research and development (R&D) centers in the U.S., Western Europe, and Japan, they seek women in the Third World (through the use of Export Processing or Free Trade Zones).46 Why women? They are prepared to work even more cheaply than men; they have "nimble fingers;" they are less complaining than men. In short, states, hungry for export earnings to support their modernization drive--and that is what these Export Processing Zones symbolize and represent--have "included" women in their programs of development because, as one cartoon suggests, they are "cheaper than men. "47 We will now turn to the issue of man-as-provider and householdrelated skills.

On the issue of man-as-provider--as we will later discuss under the topic of family--there is the widespread but factually unsupported view that men are the main if not the sole providers of their families' economic well-being.48 In the context of this very inaccurate view of the world, women are socio-economic dependents, sometimes supplemental income-earners who help to provide "extras" for the household. Thus, especially in the face of unemployment within the urban centers of Third World states, discrimination against women in employment can be justified. So, priority is given to men. Finally, and this may be included under job

segregation, employers tend to think that women are best suited to occupations requiring skills that parallel those used at home. In the West, we call them nurturing skills. Yet, when cooking, for example, becomes a well-paid job in the hotels of Nigeria and Ghana, women are not sought as employees. The employment goes to men. When catering services develop, men are given loans to support their business interests in this area.

Science and Technology

If there is some degree of general truth in the claim that technology is not socially neutral, it is certainly true that it is not gender-neutral--especially when one looks at it from the standpoint of equality and inequality. For a number of years now (perhaps the last 17 years or so), considerable public debate has taken place about what has come to be called appropriate technology--meaning that corpus of technical means that may complement the needs of "Third World states, as distinct from the sophisticated, capital-intensive emphasis which assures preponderant benefits to industrial nations. Little, if anything however, has been said about technology as it relates to the concerns of women. Rather, one detects a pattern of discrimination that surpasses anything one would ordinarily expect. It not simply that one finds hospitals in Kenya, India and Guatemala with the latest state-of-the-art-equipment in the midst of an environment where basic needs for food, clothing, and water go unmet; it entails circumstances where mechanized irrigation and tractors are available to men, while women must haul water and make do with hoes.

On occasions, attention is paid to areas of traditional concern to women. But that attention has nothing to do with women; it usually bears some other relationship with the issue of modernization. So women are again overlooked, if not deliberately discriminated against. For example, in Africa one would have to be socially unconscious not to recognize that women play the paramount role in water

supply. Certainly development planners know this. Yet, it is men who "are trained to construct and use pumps, wells, filtering systems, pipes and faucets." 49 One may claim that the technology just referred to in the preceding sentence relieves women of the burdens of having to carry water on their heads, for instance; but, why should the technology simultaneously reduce their power and their independence?

In circumstances where husbands seek to increase family productivity, they frequently help their wives to learn (husbands do the teaching) some of the new technology. But unmarried women--especially those who are heads of households-have less access to technology since there is no husband to help in the teaching of the skills.⁵⁰

- Of course, one has to be careful in dealing with "appropriate technology," since "small incremental improvements of food storage facilities, wheel barrows, food dryers, flour mills, and high-protein multivitamin food supplements"--all designed to help women in the Third World, 51 as observed by Elise Boulding--can be sold to women is such a way as to rob them of their cash surpluses. In other words, as women are increasingly drawn into the cash economy, technology designed to appeal to their concerns can be a basis for their increased impoverishment! They will have moved from subsistence farming seeking to gain improved social standing through the cash economy; but this very activity, without careful government planning, could be their undoing.

There is little doubt that the stereotypes which apparently influence planners and public policy experts to overlook women in the area of technology play a comparable part in the field of science. It is no accident that even in as highly a developed country as the U.S. women make up only 6% of persons with natural sciences and engineering degrees. In Brazil two professional women who work in health clinics reported that women would suffer less if they were more involved in the science and technology of birth control.⁵²

The Family

Although this area of focus could be indefinitely expanded with direct bearing on the issue of the human rights of women, the boundaries of discussion in this subsection (and this is somewhat arbitrarily done) will be confined to the questions of definition, maintenance, some specific rights, and a few special issues, including a degree of emphasis on Black women in Brazil. We will address these questions in the order of their mention.

While there is no agreed-on definition of the term family and/or household, there is one that appears to operate in the thinking of men and, especially, among development planners. It is one that assumes or contends that men head the family as husbands and are responsible for its economic welfare. Of course, we know that this is not true. As early as 1980, when the World Watch Institute in Washington, D.C. published a study on some 24 LDCs covering the subject, 53 it was clear that about one in every four household was de jure headed by a woman, with regional totals suggesting 22% for Sub-Saharan Africa, 20% for the Caribbean, and 16% and 15%, respectively, for the Middle East and Latin America. De facto figures are, of course, higher, with countries such as Bostwana, Kenya, Ghana, and Sierra Leone boasting numbers as high as 40%. Since 1980, the de jure figures have gone up to anywhere from a quarter to a third of the world's households (or families), 54 with single mothers, for example, making up "43 percent of all Chilean women 15 years and older." 55

Certainly, definitions of the family or the household that assume or give sociopolitical expressions to the view that those institutions are headed by men cannot but be prejudicial to the rights and interests of women. Of course, the households or families so inaccurately defined also suffer from that inaccuracy. Let us turn to the issue of family material maintenance, which is directly related to that of definition.

Because nation-states generally recognize the family as the basic social unit, 56 public policy--from tax laws, usages governing property ownership, distribution, and inheritance to credit and employment policies--often gives expression to that recognition. Indeed, material maintenance of the family (household), one incorrectly assumed to be headed by a man, has been used to justify lower pay for women (their incomes are but supplements to those of males), preferential employment for men (her work, also, supplements that of the man), assigning priority to the education of boys, and allotting to men those commercial or professional positions promising greater-incomes. Governments, as deliberate expressions of public policy--even when they consider themselves revolutionary, as in case of Ethiopia, for example--will engage in reforms of "domestic relations" but leave men the right to keep the tools, in case of divorce; to inherit farm lands (preference of a male kin to wife), in case of death; and to sign for credit on behalf of the family or co-operatives.⁵⁷ Let us look at a few examples.

In Brazil, if one looks at the history of dowry in Sao Paulo, for example, and its relationship to the economic standing of women, one will find that the percentage of daughters who had dowry at marriage declined from 92% in the seventeenth century to 28% in the nineteenth; by the century, the practice had experienced general disfavor. Concomitantly, one finds a reduced independence for women.

The dowry, initially, was ample, sometimes larger than a son's inheritance; it envisioned providing a material foundation for the new family in which the woman was seen as materially independent, having an obligation to help. The type of goods given in the dowry (reflecting changes in the relative independence of women) also underwent changes--from land, slaves, and gold to jewelry and furniture, et cetera. Correspondingly, as the percentage of daughters who had

dowry at marriage as well as the material amounts associated with dowry declined, legal and customary practices (public policy) shifted responsibilities for the material support of the family, including children, to the husband/father. Some of this, of course, will appear as the lifting of a burden from women, but what it really means is that women became more dependent on men, as men were more and more associated with the material maintenance of the family.⁵⁸

Even when women enjoy the capacity for material maintenance and do exercise it, they are not given much recognition. In Nigeria, judges claiming to be pursuing the ends of modernization, overruled a customary law among a group of Yoruba (people of Yagba) people, which allows childless women (assuming they have the material means) to marry another woman (for whom the former would pay a dowry to the latter's family) and thereby become a "husband." That husband would also be "father" to any child born of the sexual union between his "wife" and an approved male mate. The approved male mate has no right in the relationship and is said but to "enjoy the zest of mating."

In the case in question the mating male claimed to be husband to the wife of the woman-husband and, therefore, the father of the children resulting from the sexual union. The woman-husband protested that one who pays the dowry has a claim to the wife and children, but the court ruled that the requirements of modernization demanded an overruling and awarded the children to the man. No attempt was made to look at the needs of the family, the capacity of the woman for material maintenance, and even less attention was given the woman-wife.⁵⁹ Turning to the question of rights within marriage--within the family--there are many issues that merit discussion, but we are able to attend only a few: the right of women to the integrity of their person, to an equal say in matters affecting them as well as the family, and in matters respecting duties and responsibilities to the family.

In matters of duties and responsibilities to family, Third World women truly do "double duty," sometimes working between 18 and 19 hours per day. And especially in the countries of Africa and Asia that are beginning to experience rapid urbanization, the hours may even be longer. This is because some women have to move from urban to rural areas, tending to farms in order to assure their retention of the land (because in some cases the right to use the land can be revoked if the land is not cultivated), in the event the urban employment of the husband proves to be temporary or in order to complement her part-time job in the urban area where she has moved with (or without, in case of single women who are heads of households) her husband. Indeed, in the case of Africa, with husbands moving to urban centers, wives take over all areas of farming for at least six months of the year, during which they remain in the villages. All this work is done in addition to responsibilities at home. The other six months, these very women (wives, in many cases) go to the urban centers to be with their men.

If the "double duty" frowns at the notion of equality--and one should understand that the responsibilities of home referred to above includes cooking, gardening, water-carrying, et cetera--a glimpse at some of the other issues directly affecting women in particular and the family as a whole is no more morally palatable. These issues, including sex, marriage, and divorce, may be generally looked at by taking note of what has happened in Egypt recently. In May of 1985, the Supreme Court of that state overturned a 1979 law, which fundamentalist argue was inconsistent with *Sharia*, the 1300-year old Moslem code. That law, striking at some of the discriminatory attributes of polygamy (in Egypt a man can have four wives simultaneously, while a woman can have but one husband), gave the first wife the right to be officially notified that her husband is taking a second wife so that former can elect whether or not to divorce the husband. In other words, taking a second wife, under the 1979 law, was ground for divorce. The divorced wife

would also be entitled to alimony, to the custody of the young children, and to remain in the house or apartment (in this case, the man would have to leave), unless the divorced husband provides a new apartment for her and the children. The 1985 ruling reversed everything.

As in the case of a number of states within whose borders polygamy is practiced--and this includes a considerable number of nation-states in Africa and Asia60-- an Egyptian woman (wife) can now return "home" and find that she has been supplanted by another wife--she does not even have to be actually notified. And, should she wish to have a divorce, she will have to prove material injury--something that entails a protracted court proceedings. Of course, now that men in Egypt do not have to fear finding a "second flat" for a former wife--there are those who think that this requirement was perhaps the greatest deterrent to men⁶¹--polygamy will continue to grow in Egypt, as it has in recent years.

One ought not to look merely at polygamy as the culprit; even where it does not exist as an institution, discrimination against women in husband-wife relations take place. Another example of discrimination is the wide-spread expectation and practice among the Shona people of Zimbabwe that a husband's unfaithfulness be forgiven, without equivalent concession to women.⁶² In the areas of inheritance or property ownership, as we will later see, women enjoy few rights within the family.

Let us look at the question of the right to the integrity of one's person, with wife-beating and clitorectomy and infibulation as examples.

The woman in charge of the operation first takes hold of the child's labia majora and labia minora, separates then with her fingers and secures them with large thorns stuck through the flesh on the inner aspect of the things. She then takes a kitchen knife and slits the head of the clitoris (the prepuce), before cutting it off. While another women mops up the blood with a rag, the mother scrapes away the skin the whole length of the clitoris with her finger nail. Noone takes notice of the child's heart-rending screams. When the mother reaches the root of the clitoris, finally disengaging it, she resects it with the tip of her knife. Her assistant again mops up the blood which spurts out. The mother lifts up the skin, separating it completely from the flesh. Then, with her hand, she makes a deep hole, which bleeds profusely. All the

women of the neighborhood, who have been invited to watch that the operation is correctly performed, dip their finger, each in turn, into the wound, to make sure that the clitoris has been completely removed.

With one phase finished, the operation continues:

After a brief moment's respite, the mother picks up her knife again and cuts away the labia minora. . . . Next she abrades the edges of the labia majora with the knife, exposing raw flesh. . . . When the wound is quite open and raw, she makes several longitudinal incisions, then pricks it all over with the point of the knife. . . . Having thus completed the abrasion in the regulation manner, she brings the labia majora together while they are still oozing blood and joins them with long acacia thorns. The mother completes her operation, making sure to leave a very narrow orifice, just sufficient to allow for urination and menstruation. 63

What has been described above is clitorectomy and infibulation (sometimes called excision and infibulation), and it is widely engaged in from Malaysia to the Ivory Coast, with--aside from the latter state--Africa boasting the practice in Burkina Faso (Upper Volta), Mali, Sudan, Somalia, Ethipia, Senegal, among others. In the Middle East, we have Egypt, Saudi, Arabia, Joran, and Iraq, et cetera.

The origins of the practice is uncertain,64 but the motives behind it are not. Women are to be instruments of reproduction, with diminished enjoyment of the sexual act; and, by this very diminished enjoyment, rendered less likely to be unfaithful to their spouses. Painful though the experience is for women (we will later have the statements of one who has undergone the operation), it is so firmly etched in the ideological structure of the relevant societies that young girls see it as a means of gaining recognition and status within a given community. It was, in part, as an expression of the latter sentiment that a "revolutionary" Jomo Kenyatta would say that no "Kikuyu worthy of the name would want to marry a girl who has not been excised, as this operation is a prerequisite for receiving complete moral and religious education. "65 Let us, briefly, look at two women's experience.

I was excised when I was a child. I am talking about my own personal experience. Today, I'm glad I had the excision operation. The reason why I maintain this point of view is that it has fulfilled its function as far as I am concerned. I've been divorced for four years and I've never for one moment felt the desire to run after a man, or felt the absence of sexual relations to be a lack, a vital lack. That indicates to some extent the function of excision: it

allows a woman to be in control of her own body. And that is why I don't in any way consider it as a mutilation.66

The woman who gave the above response is in part seeking to defend the practice of her parents when she said she did not consider it mutilation. She indicated, however, that since she has had a chance to read and now knows better, she would not subject her daughters to the "operation." A second woman had a different view:

I had just turned 12 when I was excised. I still retain a very clear memory of the operation and the ceremony associated with it... The excisor was an old woman belonging to the blacksmith's caste. I did not know what excision was, but on several occasions I had seen recently excised girls walking. I can tell you it was not a pretty sight. From the back you would have thought they were little bent old ladies, who were trying to walk with a ruler balanced between their ankles, and taking care not to let it fall... 'Lie down there', the excisor suddenly said to me, pointing to a mat stretched out on the ground. No sooner had I lain down that I felt my frail legs tightly grasped by heavy hands and pulled wide apart. Two women on each side pinned me to the ground. My arms were also immobilized... A hand had grasped a part of my genital organs. My heart seemed to miss a beat. I would have given anything at that moment to be a thousand miles away; then a shooting pain brought me back to reality from my thoughts of flight. I was being excised... The operation seemed to go on forever, as it had to be performed 'to perfection'. I was in the throes of endless agony, torn apart physically and psychologically... I reacted immediately with tears and screams of pain. I felt wet. I was bleeding. The blood flowed in torrents... Never had I felt such excruciating pain... I felt exhausted, drained. As the supervising women who surrounded us (at the end of the operation) goaded us on (to dance)... I suddenly felt everything swimming around me. Then I knew nothing more. I had fainted.... Afterwards, the most terrible moments were when I had to defecate. It was a month before I was completely healed, as I continually had to scratch where the genital would itch. When I was better, everyone mocked me as I hadn't been brave, they said.67

One issue that we dare not pass by in this portion of our discussion is that of the so-called "wrongs of passion"--rape, wife-beating, and even killing. 68 In case of the former, we cannot even think of a national or regional focus, since it is so all-pervading. And that pervasiveness is due, in part at least, to the view expressed by Sir Mathew Hale, then a Chief Justice of seventeenth century England:

The husband cannot be guilty of rape committed by himself upon his lawful wife, for by their mutual matrimonial consent and contract the wife hath given up herself in this kind unto her husband, which she cannot retract.

A discussion of the problem with some Brazilian women disclosed that it does take place very often. They contend that the prevalent feeling on the part of a man is that "we belong to him, so our bodies also belong to him." 69 But, argued one woman, wife-beating is even worse. "If a woman attempts to be assertive, she may be attacked, be beaten." This claim is born out by interviews with a number of nuns, who work in the favelas of Sao Paulo. They contended that simple decisions on the part of women to leave the house during evenings to look at scheduled slides designed to teach them more about their bodies may be met with severe beating. "Men see this as a challenge to them, especially if the woman uses the knowledge gained to exhibit greater independence and assertiveness." 70 No statistical information is available, but the institution in Brazil of what is called women's police station 71 is said to be inducing a greater willingness on the part of women to disclose incidents of rapes by husbands as well as wife-beating. Women, feeling freer to disclose to other women their horror and humiliation, have been more disposed to report wife-beating and other abusive treatment.

Finally, to continue with Brazil, in the actual killing of wives, even until today, 72 one finds a social temper that has governed and reinforced this reprehensible behavior wherever it has taken place--a temper which, even in face of public policy embroidered in the guise of "reform" or "fighting against wife-killing," exhibits little concern for women. Why? A man who kills his wife, if he is caught in an act of "sexual betrayal" is undermining that order (as represented by the ideal of the family). So while legislative and other measures adopted to restrain or prohibit wife-killing, those measures have been prompted more by the social unrest unleashed by such killings (uncontrollable violence) than by efforts to deal with violence against women.

The final area on which we focus under the rubric of family is the status of Black women. We will do so only briefly, since the subject will again be looked at

under the heading of education and culture. Let it suffice to say that where Black women live within cultures that are not expressive of a Black majority 73 (in Brazil Blacks constitute about 45%, by conservative estimates), their condition is even worse than that of other women. It is as if they belong to a Fourth World. Thus, for example--even in occupations considered "feminine"--elementary school teaching, for example--- the Black woman is at a disadvantage.74 And what are the effects of such racial discrimination in the "racial democracy" of Brazil? Black women are disproportionately represented among the poor, whether one looks to the favelas of Sao Paulo or the unattended rural areas of the country; 75 and Black parents, especially women who are heads of households (families), find a disproportionate number of their children among the homeless in Brazil.

Education and Culture

Education, as viewed by individuals in both industrial and Third World states-especially by those who deal with socio-economic policy--is seen as an instrument
through which men and women can gain skills for increased participation in social
and economic life. When education is viewed in this manner, emphasis is
customarily placed on enrollment, ratios of literacy, skills distribution, et cetera.
Inasmuch as modernization entails changes in and reinforcement of certain
attitudes, education in the Third World is also seen as a tool to shape attitudes. One
may see education in another manner, however. From the perspective of the
individual, it may be seen as a process of "bringing out," of "developing," or the
means by which there is an "unfolding" of one's abilities and interests. In a societal
vein, education is the means by which a culture is disseminated and preserved. We
shall be looking at education in all respects mentioned above.

While the United Nations Educational Scientific Cultural Organization
(UNESCO) and other intergovernmental organizations can cite figures showing that
in 1985, 300 million more girls were enrolled in schools and universities than in

1950, basic elementary education is not yet available to a large portions of the world's children, especially girls. In Africa, for example, almost 60% of girls age 15 to 19 years of age are not in school. And if one looks at many nation-states in South Asia and Africa, four out of five women over 25 years of age have never been exposed to any schooling at all. 76 Further, if one were to compare female education as a percent of male's, using 1980 as a standard, one will find varying averages, with women seriously disadvantaged. When one disaggregates the statistics, however, one finds even more of an appalling situation.

Taking Guatemala in Latin America, Central African Republic in Africa, and Indonesia in Asia, as examples, one will find that the average percent of female to male education (adult literacy plus the first three levels of schooling) is 65%, 37%, and 67% respectively. These figures, however, mask the fact that as one moves from the first level of education to the third, females generally make up a lower percentage. So, while at the first level in each of the exampled countries one finds the percentages to be respectively 82%, 55%, and 85%, at the third level, these percentages are 40%, 17%, and 42%. In other words, in the Central African Republic, while girls' education at the first level is 55% of boys', at the third level that percentage falls to 17.77 In South Asia, where the educational advantage of males is quite substantial, it is said that it would take some 38 million new school places just to bring about female/male parity at the present time.⁷⁸ Of course, we know who gets left out of school as shortages of spaces develop.

If one were to look at the areas of teaching staff and fields of specialization, one would find a pattern not unlike the general discrimination we have been reviewing. Were Counba (a fictitious young woman) seeking to pursue a professional career, chances are 8 to 10 that she will be a teacher--usually a primary school teacher. From Brazil to the Philippines one finds the same pattern). And should she become that teacher, she would discover that while 77 to 80% of the

primary school teachers are women, they make up but 22% the principals; and at the secondary level, were one to take the Philippines as an example, only 12% of the principals. Women are generally provided with opportunities for education in "female occupation" of health, children, nutrition, sewing, handicraft, and home economics. And in the business area, women are frequently overlooked--whether we are dealing with banking, credit, co-operative management, or insurance. (The technical areas have already mentioned.)

At the university level (where even in countries like Germany and the United Kingdom women make up but 5% and 3% of full professors), women are guided into education, and the humanities, including fine arts. Why this condition for women? Another form of education—one which touches the broader cultural realm—and this realm extends from people's attitudes and the images they hold (including stereotypical ones) as well as the representations of popular culture to the more refined thinking of philosophy and the definitions of the social structure that reinforce those attitudes, those images, and the claims of popular culture.

We can also look at culture, in the view of English critic Raymond Williams, as part of the <u>ideal</u> world, that which partakes of our universal values and which defines and expresses aesthetic, intellectual, and moral standards of a given community. It also refers to the documentary world--that which records the experience of a people, intellectual, artistic, and other. Then it may refer to that which defines the social context and provides rules for everyday behavior, including that which is internalized as "typical patterns" of behavior.⁸⁰

Why do the above-described condition of women in exist. In the realm of attitudes--often shaped by tradition and the social context fashioned by it--one finds that women, even in their reduced enrollment when compared with men, drop out of school to help deal with domestic chores. Parents, knowing of the reduced value placed on females, are often reluctant to invest in a daughter's

education when the returns will not be to the family but to the future spouse. There is even the view that the role of nurturing--reinforced stereotype--does not require formal education but can be learned through what is communicated "from woman to woman." When a society defines what role a woman ought to play, there is also the fear of ridicule on the part of parents if their daughters were to grow up to behave outside that definition. Mallica Vajrathon gives us a bit of this definition:

Tradition has forced women to conform to codes that restrict their behavior and make them subservient to men--whether fathers, husbands or brothers. These codes were enunciated long ago in religious texts and elaborated in plays, poems and stories. In China, for example, Confucius and Mencius instructed women to adorn themselves, to please, to do housework willingly and not to talk too much. In India, Hindu literature taught male supremacy — and female submissiveness. Daughters were 'precious jewels lent to parents — a until their husbands claimed them'. In Latin America, the teachings of the Catholic Church relegated women to an inferior status and represented wives as belonging to their husbands. Buddhist literature portrays women as a cause of the craving, anxiety and unhappiness of men.81

In case of Islamic societies, women encounter profound legal and social limitations. They are forbidden, for example, to take an active part in economic and social life outside the home. 82 And when they do appear in public, they are expected to hide behind a veil. With few exceptions, to be later dealt with, their role is defined as that of mother and wife. Christianity, too--not only Roman Catholicism as mentioned above--has frowned on the right of women to hold religious office, and Hinduism--even until today--allows women to be viewed as disposable property. These social and legal codes and the traditions that sponsor them do *not* allow women to share in the *ideal* world that defines men and, as such, are responsible for subverting the life chances of women as made possible through education. Of course, one finds little help in the documentary world. In the words of Mallica Vajrathon, such codes actually "kill without drawing blood;" certainly they destroy the chances of women realizing their potential. 83

Let us look at popular culture, as transmitted by the media--the press, television, radio, film, et cetera--and give some emphasis to the images they convey, bearing in mind Nancy Goldenberg's accurate observation that images are "our psychic pictures in action."84 It is the media that, in contemporary societies, are our most powerful transmitters of images.

It should be instructive to look Brazil and its media. First, we will examine the T.V. variety program, Cassino do Chacrinha:

Its focus in almost entirely sexual, with the latter used to promote commercial interests. At one level surrounding the stage is what one may call a representative sample, in terms of age, of the T.V. audience--men and women, but especially the latter apparently chosen for their physical attractiveness. Although there are special times out to advertize products, commercialization runs rampant throughout the performances through various means: an empty bottle of soft drink in front of women, the earrings they wear--although the exhibition of the earrings is so subtle, one could confuse it for merely "a sexy turn of the head," the rings on their fingers, the watch on their wrist et cetera. The "master of ceremony" is an old man, who plays the role of different characters each week, with his dress corresponding to certain commercial focus. On the upper level surrounding the stage there are women dancing. They are scantily dressed, with little more clothing than the "dental floss" attire in that country. They are of exemplary physical accomplishment, apparently well trained to dance and to exhibit portions of their body-whichever portion is deemed to be sexually telling at particular musical junctures. During the dances, one rarely sees their faces; and even on those rare occasions, the face may not be distinct--simply an image with an accompanying earring floating by. To the onlooker--one who is participating as part of the T.V. audience--the explicit sexual movements of the dancers' bodies are not in question; it is simply whether he/she distinguishes those movements with their accompanying sexual suggestions from the human being engaged in the performance. In the midst of all this, there are intervals when--not unlike the Romans who, to incite greater ferocity among the lions, would throw them a few Christians--in order to incite greater sexual stimulation, various objects are thrown to the audience. These objects include cucumbers, bananas, pumpkins et cetera, each indistinguishable in shape from the penis. In the instance under review, a woman with bountiful endowments of breasts and a dress to accentuate them sang as all the other activities mentioned above were taking place. As she sang, balloons became the focus of the T.V. camera, and as she moved toward the ending of her performance, one saw the behinds of the dancers, the bouncing balloons, the heaving breasts of the singer, with people struggling in the studio audience to touch balloons which were released to correspond to the ending of the performance.85

What one noticed is that for women, their lips are not lips but surfaces on which lipstick is affixed for sexual attraction; their breasts are not breasts but balloons to be touched for easy play; their behinds are not behinds but winding, surging upheavals used for invitations to mate; and their ears not ears but anatomical extensions on which jewelry are hitched for the having. As for fingers, ankles.....?

Let us touch briefly on the treatment of Black women, using the popular magazine Veja (the Time magazine of Brazil) as well as Sao Paulo Tuia/Tourista as examples, the first reflecting what Brazilians read, generally, and the latter reflecting what is the staple of tourists. In case of the first (and I only examined the months of November and December of 1986,86 while there were a variety of images conveyed of women--some gardening, some professionally engaged, and others steep in the delights of lunch, dinner as offered by favorite restaurants, the lone discernible Black was a woman of exaggerated physical proportions holding a Caucasian baby in her hands, as she stood in a kitchen with pots and pans behind her. Of course, she was unmistakably happy, with a smile as ample as her physical proportions. In the Sao Paulo tourist guide, there was no reference at all to Blacks, except for a front page exhibit of Blacks as sexual symbols for the annual parade.

And this brings us to this annual parade, the annual carnival celebration.

In this event--and this is an area in which all persons I speak to agree--there is at least a loose alliance between the rich and the poor, with the former reaping much in material returns while the latter reaps little or nothing. While gaining little of material significance, Black women constitute the heart and soul of the celebration. For them, it is the time to be "visible" (or to escape invisibility), to be "admired," to be seen on T.V., to gain the opportunity to make a dent--something denied throughout the year on account of racism. But what does this event entail? The reinforcement of a negative stereotype that depicts Black women as sexual

objects. To attract tourists, enormous emphasis is placed on the carnival, with Black women advertized as competing with each other to present, in public, the most "erotic entertainment"--sometimes going topless, sometimes bottomless in the process. The fact that men, during this time more than any other, feel free "to take liberties with women and their bodies does not help."87 It is as if "there is social approval for a sort of release of pent up frustrations in a process which degrades women--particularly black women." The media, of course, wallows in it, and magazines distribute "the bodies (not the persons, contends one critic) worldwide."

Finally, we should see the issue of culture as discussed here--culture in its popular and other forms--as part of a world-wide network. Europe and America (the United Sates) are seen as cultural centers and that which emanates from those centers affect what is done in the Third World. Nowhere is this effect more long-lasting than the "refined" reflection of respected philosophers. And here we will look at the work of Jean Paul Sarte, the later French existentialist.

By its very terms existentialism contends--at least as elaborated by Sarte, Camus, and others--that human beings have no fixed or unchanging nature; they are not possessed of any permanent substrate that can relieve them of thier responsibility to define and/or redefine themselves. Certainly, for women who have, over centuries, been obliged to operate within fixed categories, define themselves or have themselves defined in terms of fixed roles, existentialism represented an important breakthrough. Yet, a careful reading of Sartre suggests something else as he wrestled with male and female principles, In-itself and Foritself.

For itself is suddenly compromised. I open my hands, I want to let go of the slimy and it sticks to me, it draws me, it sucks me. . . . It is soft, yielding action, a moist and feminine sucking. . . . it is a trap. Slime is the revenge of the Initself. A sickly-sweet feminine revenge which may be symbolized on another level by the quality of the sugary. 88

In other words, in very subtle ways, culture as reflected through philosophy of existentialism--the very outlook from which one should expect some liberation for women--is used to strap them and to question their capacity for transcendence. We will not signify slime and suction by discussing them here. For Sarte, far from having the ability to create herself, to define what she may or may not become, to frown at the view that there are patterns which the female character must follow, a woman's character and personality exhibit permanent features, fixed attributes from which she cannot escape!

In Brazil and a number of Caribbean countries, it is fashionable for intellectuals to speak of women as not being able "to help themselves"---it is "their nature." A Brazilian bookstore owner actually cited Sarte, "whose wife agreed with them," the man said, as <u>demonstrating</u> that women are an exception to the general existential notion that human being are free to define what they might become.

THE CONDITION OF WOMEN AND THE PROMOTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS

Now that we have, at least in part, presented the condition of women in the Third World, we should review those conditions in light of the human rights instruments we discussed in the first section. In other words, what is the relationship between the promotion of human rights for women and the condition of women as represented in the second portion of this study? We can best answer this question by approaching it from four perspectives: that of correspondence—the extent to which the human rights instruments adopted by the U.N. correspond to the needs of women as expressed in the condition identified; that of the response of nation-states to the instruments in question, especially as measured in terms of concrete action taken by national governments as well as international

organizations and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), to put the instruments in operation; and, finally, that of consciousness raising.

In respect of correspondence, there should be little doubt that the human rights instruments we have examined address the concerns of women. Whether we look at the issue of equality in the work place, equality in education—technical and other—access to credit, ownership and disposition of property, the elimination of stereotypical concepts respecting women as well as their roles, equal responsibilities of parents in relationship to children, the right to forego ritual operations, the right of rural women to have special measures adopted to complement their needs, or the right of women to serve in the highest political positions, the content of the human rights instruments mirror the needs of women.

What is more complex and important—especially from the standpoint of those who presently suffer from the conditions identified in the previous section—is the response of governments and other public institutions to the rights that women are said to possess. Here we have a very mixed record. If one defines concrete action in terms of ratification of or accession to the instruments in question, then states have done well, although not spectacularly. In the case of the most important convention, that on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, over 85 nation-states have ratified or acceded to it.89 Indeed, at the beginning of 1985, some 74 states were parties to it; but, in honor of the end of the U.N. Decade for Women, 90 some 30 or more states took the necessary steps to become parties thereto. However, ratification or accession, as important as they are, do not by themselves, mean much if nothing else is done. As before indicated, one woman dismissingly reacted to some of the abstract statements of rights by noting that they are but "words on the book." So we have to look to the presence or absence of more specific measures.

One of the states that has ratified CEDAW is Egypt; yet, in 1985, as before seen, many of the rights enjoyed by women under a 1979 law were eliminated by a court decision. China also ratified the above-cited convention, but it has not foregone its traditional preference for sons. One has but to note the sudden increase in "female infanticide (which) followed the enactment of a law restricting families to one child."91 And Zimbabwe, which is suppose to be one of the more progressive of Sub-Sahara African states, has a constitution that bans discrimination on the basis of race, tribe, geography of origin, political opinion, or religious persuasion but omits sex on the basis that to do otherwise would be to offend traditional culture. In fact, while under its recent resettlement program the government of Zimbawbwe has given widows about half of the land allocated to married men, most of that land was assigned to families, that is, male heads of households.92 Tanzania, another "progressive state" and one that has ratified a number of the human rights instruments designed to protect women, allows to women--through its customary law--limited rights to property, but puts the vesting of those property rights in the male line. Women's rights are, therefore, derived through men.93 And in Ghana, also a state that has ratified a number of the relevant human rights instruments under discussion, attempts to introduce reforms beneficial to women in the areas of marriage, divorce, and inheritance have on three occasions been defeated by an overwhelmingly male-dominated legislature. So, if one today looks at Ghana--as well as Nigeria--one will find, for example, that widows do not have the right to inherit from their spouses. 94 Finally, Burundi's family code has eliminated dowry but allows the wife to work outside the home only with the authorization of the husband; and Peru, Paraguay, and Bolivia, by custom, allow the allocation of a smaller portion of a father's land to the daughter than to the son.

There are also states that have not ratified or acceded to--some have not even signed--the international human rights covenants dealing specifically with women. It is important to note (Washington's record here is not salutary, either) that if one were to look at Moslem countries (those whose populations are constituted by a Moslem majority) as a *group* they are the worst offenders, although Islam, properly understood, is one of the most equalitarian of religions known. Let us turn to the positive side of things.

A number of states--despite the ugly condition of women described in the previous section--have taken important steps at the national and transnational level to eliminate the discrimination against women. In respect to the national level, for example, by 1982 some 117 nation-states, in recognition of the need for job and compensation protection that must be accorded women as a result of pregnancy and maternity, have had legislation on maternity leave.95 In LDCs, legislation of the above type is quite general.96 Brazil, for example, not only has such legislation but accords a degree of help in the area of day care at the workplace. Equally important in Brazil is the creation in 1985 by the government of a National Council on Women's Rights. It is too early to pass judgment on it, but interviews with a number of women professors, some of whom had just returned from a workshop sponsored by the Council,97 and the writer's analysis of a position paper (called a letter) to the Constituent Assembly that has been deliberating on a new constitution, suggest that it has considerable promise.98 The Council itself has been organized into nine commissions covering specific areas of women's concerns such as work, education, violence, health, abortion, et cetera.

Bengladesh, in recognition of the human rights position that economic equality means, among other things, equal access to credit facilities, has had its Rural Development Board sponsoring credit cooperatives for rural women since 1975. Funds for the project come, in part, from the World Bank, through the Bank's

soft-loan window, the International Development Association. 99 Because credit is extended to individuals as well as cooperatives, women have the opportunity to establish their own credit worthiness as individuals. And, as of 1983, there were some 1,215 cooperatives, with a repayment record of over 90%--many with a 100% record. Equally important is the fact that these rural women have been learning skills, by being officers of the cooperatives, to develop and administer projects (from those that yield short-term returns such as the processing of chili and mustard oil to the more long-term efforts such as fish breeding and commercial poultry).

We should now take a look at African states. Faced with imminent social and economic disaster in the late 1970s, African states in 1981 adopted what has come to be called the Lagos Plan of Action, which urged prompt action to achieve the goal of self-sustaining socio-economic development for Africa. That Plan 100-- and we must emphasize that it is but a plan--acknowledges the need to give special attention (my emphasis) to women whose standing and concerns should not be "marginal or separate" from the overall question of development. 101 Specifically, the Plan calls for special emphasis on literacy programs in general and higher education in particular, on management skills, and on technical and vocational training. Further, it urges the development of research institutes to encourage and disseminate information about women, giving particular emphasis to the effectuation of changes in attitudes. Then, recognizing the need for action in the economic sphere, the Plan spells out the need to lend public assistance to the creation of credit facilities, to promote business training, to institute maternity leave policy, and to upgrade the skills of rural women as well as to reduce the many number of hours they have to work. Finally, to ensure that all of the above are brought into being, the Plan calls for special legislative and administrative action to modify family law and to provide legal aid to women. In the former area, protection for women against bride price, polygamy, and disadvantages in respect

of parental duties is urged; in the latter, focus should be on the training of administrative personnel.¹⁰²

In reviewing the behavior of states in respect of concrete action, we may also include their behavior within intergovernmental organizations such as the U.N. Indeed, we should be mindful that the U.N.'s actions are by and large extensions of the responses of states. In the latter respect, we may look at the attempt on the part of the U.N. to act in two areas: to serve as an example in placing women in greater positions of responsibility--especially in relationship to its own Decade on Women, and in the area of the general enforcement of the human rights of women.

As respects the first, one of the areas in which the taking of concrete action on the part of states has been most shamefully poor is that of having women in important decision-making position in the public forum. Women in cabinet positions in LDCs for example (and, except for the Nordic countries, developed states do not fare much better) constitute but 7% world wide, with 7% for Africa, 4% for Asia, and 9% for Latin America. When the U.N. launched its Decade for Women in 1975--a period during which it embarked on ten years of activities aimed at improving the status of women throughout the world, its General Assembly, to remove "the cinder from its own eye," ordered the Secretariat to appoint women to 25% of its top posts by 1982 and to increase this to 30% by 1990. On March 1987, the goal of 25% was reached, with the appointments including for the first time women to positions of Under-Secretary-General. This development will make a major difference.

Dr. Nafis Sadik of Pakistan, for instance, who was appointed to head the U.N. Fund for Population Activities (UNFPA) immediately upon assuming her position ruled that *all* proposals made by governments to the Fund must offer details concerning how women "will be included in all facets of an operation." 103 In this

effort by the U.N., a number of Third World states, giving strong support to the lead of Canada, made these appointments possible.

As regards implementation of the human rights instruments under discussion, we have the opportunity but to look at the 1983 decision, supported by states such as Nigeria, Honduras, Trinidad, and Tobago, to reaffirm the authority of the U.N.

Commission on the Status of Women to receive and consider confidential as well as nonconfidential communications in respect of discrimination against women. After examining these communications, should a pattern of reliably attested discrimination against women emerge, the Commission may report it to the Economic and Special Council (ECOSOC), which will then decide what course of action to take. This is also an important step. Many governments did not want the Commission to enjoy this jurisdiction, since they are frightened at being exposed as violating the human rights of women they are pledged to protect. Now, as was the case with the report of the Commission to the ECOSOC regarding violence against women in official custody, governments are going to be notified and exposed if necessary. 104

The final aspect of the condition of women and the promotion of human rights is that of consciousness raising. That aspect, in fact, may be the most important, since, ultimately, it is the pressure that politically aware persons bring to bear on government as well as the political process that determines socio-economic change. And, in the case of discrimination against women, it is so deeply encrusted in the social fabric that only conscious and unrelenting pressure on governments will assure its elimination.

From the 1952 opening for signature and ratification of the Convention on Political Rights of Women to the 1985 Nairobi conference to evaluate the achievements of the United Nations Decade for Women, people in general and women in particular have gained considerable political awareness about their

rights. True, there are many who only have a vague idea that the expression "human rights" bears with it some relationship to the prospect for improvement in their social welfare; there are those who either have not heard the expression or, having heard or used it, know that "it makes people in government look different." 105 But there are those who are reasonably well schooled in the nature and meaning of these rights and have been fighting for their implementation. It is to this awareness that we owe certain women's movements in Mexico, Ghana, India, Indonesia, and Kenya; it is to that awareness and the movements it sponsors that issues such as family planning, divorce, spousal rape, for example, have left the "private sphere" where governments thought they belonged and would prefer to leave them to assume their growing prominence in the public forum. And when we earlier referred to the three unsuccessful efforts in Ghana to have reforms favorable to women in marriage, divorce, and inheritance, the major pressure came from women's groups. Further, if one looks at groups such as the Association of African Women Research and Development (AAWORD) 106 or the Rural Advancement Committee of Bengladesh, the Self-Employed Women's Association (SEWA), and the Working Women's Forum (WWF) in India, one finds two things: they are the most progressive in advancing the rights of women, and they gained their development during and largely as a result of the Women's Decade. 107

What all of the preceding in respect of consciousness raising suggests is that the human rights movement has had a major bearing on women's awareness and their organizing on behalf of their rights as well as the relationship of those rights' implementation and the unfolding of what it means to be woman.

HUMAN RIGHTS PROMOTION, THE CONDITION OF WOMEN AND THIRD WORLD DEVELOPMENT

It is the contention of this section that there is a direct relationship between development and the promotion of human rights of women. That contention claims more: even if development were defined in the narrow sense of economic modernization, the Third World cannot realistically hope to realize that goal in the foreseeable future without the prompt implementation of those rights. A few specific examples should help in understanding that conclusion.

One of the areas of human rights dealt with is equality of educational opportunities for women. As seen in the second section, women are at a serious disadvantage. Yet, a 1980 World Bank study of some 33 countries, "which crosstabulated child survival and mother education," concluded that on the average, one additional year of schooling for mothers results in a reduction of nine per thousand in the mortality of her children. (The effect of an additional year in a father's education results in half the return of the mother's.) 108 Certainly, the survival of infants (potential producers, in the context of our definition) is important to modernization. But let us look further in this matter of education.

Women farmers with *four* years of *primary education* produce an average of 13% more than those with no formal education at all, assuming inputs of better seeds and some irrigation; even more impressive, without those inputs, they produce 8% more goods. Would universal primary education for women be a moral ideal or a prudent business investment?¹⁰⁹

Let us look at Africa, continuing this line of discussion. The states of that continent are among the least developed in the world--and that condition of underdevelopment does not result from a lack of natural resources but from the lack of technical and political resources. In agriculture--and the growth and

nurturing of this sector is of utmost significance for development of the Third World--women are, as seen before, responsible for over half of production. In case of food, rural women produce over 80%. Yet, if one looks at the education of females in Africa as a proportion of that of males, one finds that on the average they have but 57% of the education of males; and if one looks at post-secondary education, one finds figures in some states as low as 7%. How can African agriculture develop, not to mention become internationally competitive, if the group principally engaged in it receives such low priority in the field of education?¹¹⁰

One can also gauge the weight of the claim that there is a direct relationship between the implementation of human rights for women and economic development in the Third World if one looks at a few more examples, using education/technology, equal pay, scholarship, and what we may call human settlement as a basis for discussion.

In respect of education/technology, planners and public policy experts--as we previously indicated 111---in spite of the fact that women in Africa, for example, supply most of the water for food production and for the support of the home, trained men to construct pumps, filtering systems, pipes, faucets, and wells. The result? Among other things, the systems are not well maintained or repaired. Men are reluctant to maintain them because they (the men) are not directly involved in using those systems, thereby frustrating certain programs for development. How much more sensible it would have been if the human rights commitment that these states made were put into operation and the women who are directly involved in the water systems were taught the technical skills for the proper functioning and maintenance of these systems. Phrased differently, development is not going to be realized if the people who are directly engaged in the production of a commodity

(in this case water) are not allowed to acquire the skills necessary to support the production system.

As respects equal work for equal pay--equal work for equal value, as the human rights instruments under discussion require--we will use an example from India. In the Andhra Pradesh region of that country, it is estimated that 95% of the foreign exchange earnings from the export of handicraft are earned by women. 112

The government allows a payment of four rupees per week (less than 40 cents) to some 150,000 women who make lace goods that are exported to the U.K., Italy,

Denmark, the U.S., and Sweden--a wage that bears little or no relationship to the value of the work done. Men doing work of comparable value have had

government support for improvement in salary since the 1960s; no one has looked at these politically powerless women. But suppose they were to experience some improvement in wages, how much more would the government secure in tax revenues? How much more would the women have in purchasing power? And how beneficial would that purchasing power be in its spillover effect on the villages where they live? Finally, what would the aggregate of these effects be on development?

In the case of scholarship--a resulting product of education--we will confine our discussion to Islam and Moslem states. The human rights instruments, as seen before, are concerned about the change of attitudes people hold about women. These attitudes, as well as the views that inform them, are a fundamental part of the roots that imbred discrimination based on gender, and, therefore, must be uprooted if women are to be free to make contributions to development in proportion to their abilities. For example, the view that women are intellectually inferior to men is one that is shared by a considerable number of people. And even if women, as in the case of ancient Egypt, were to become business persons, civil servants, priestesses, treasurers, et cetera, there would still be some questions about

their intellectual capabilities. But, as in case of ancient Egypt where they served even as scribes (the very learned), 114 support for women scholarship should not only contribute to overall economic development but should help shatter faulty stereotypes and even correct some of the "scholarly work" of male-dominated socio-political systems.

Moslem countries are chosen because of the previously-described, reprehensible practice of clitorectomy and infibulation. As before indicated, its origin is uncertain; its continuation, however, has been supported by male interpretation of the sources of Islam, the *Qur'an*, the *Hadith* literature (oral traditions ascribed to Mohammed), and *Figh* (jurisprudence). Traditionally, women had no chance to venture an interpretation of these sources that would be found acceptable, because, among other things, they were not allowed to go to the religious schools that prepared scholars for such interpretations. Now, for the first time, there are Moslem scholars who are women, and they have begun to interpret the sources of Islam. 115 Result? They have found *no* support for the practice of clitorectomy. What we have here, as a result of education, is not simply the potential to stop an inhumane course of conduct, but, as well, the opportunity to remove from the heap of gender-based stereotypes the notion that women are intellectually inferior. Of course, it will enable a large number of persons to exchange truth for error.

But, we are getting away from our definition of development in this section.

Let us turn to the idea of human settlement. Instead of speaking of states, we could do equally well speaking of human settlements--institutions providing various community services to people, whether these services be defined in terms of composing social and economic differences or providing health care, housing, education, and transportation. One may even define human settlements in more dynamic terms--as an aggregate of institutions designed to facilitate the arranging

and rearranging of a social order that can provide these services. Defined in the above terms, we can better appreciate the term development. States that are said to be undergoing that process are engaging in the act of human settlement. And the latter conclusion becomes more persuasive when one considers that these very LDCs, which currently house more than 70% of the world's population, will experience 90% of the world's population increase by the year 2000. They are the ones, also, that between 1975 and 2000, will have had to absorb into their urban communities an estimated additional one billion persons. And they are the ones within whose cities—one has but to reflect on the favelas of Sao Paulo and the slums of Calcutta—more than half the population "lives in slums and squatter settlements." 116

Certainly, the limited resources of these cities--resources for housing, schools, health care, water supply, energy, transportation, employment, to name a few-cannot accommodate the burden. So, public policy experts, urban planners, international donors, and others must seek to improve the conditions and the prospects of those who live in rural areas so that they will not feel compelled to flee to the cities. But, even if there is less than the expected flow to the cities, means will have to be found to deal with the wealth of poverty that currently resides there. In short, governments must be prepared to deal with the matter of human settlements. And they can succeed if they realize that:

Women are the backbone of human settlements. Changes to the physical environment of poor communities are a great deal more likely to result in long-term improvement if they reflect the choices of women in defining their own needs. Women's view should be determinant in the design of human settlements and programs. Women have a particular insight in this area: they think in terms of the family as a whole; they, often more than men, work long hours within settlements, as opposed to going outside of them for their normal daily life; their lives tend to be more intimately shaped by the strengths and weaknesses of those settlements. They have a very immediate understanding of such matters as housing structure,...the effect of housing on family relationships, and the suitability of the location of water and other communal facilities.... 117

How do we gain the benefit of women's abilities as described in the above quote? Give them their human rights, including that of being coparticipants in the process of decision making (policy formulation) and every step of policy implementation. In more specific terms, helping women to acquire the skills to improve their agricultural output, for example, also means involving them more intimately in the entire process of economic transformation. In so doing, they will not only increase their output and thus reduce the need to flock to urban centers, but, by so doing, lower the strain on urban resources, including monies to subsidize food prices. Such subsidies, of course, generally mean paying the farmer very little, thus discouraging food output, for instance. With lowered demands on the meagre urban resources, there may even be a decrease in the rate at which foreign debts are contracted, and at the emphasis on "cash crops" to pay off that debt or on subsistence wage in the electronic industry to earn foreign exchange can be tempered and more emphasis given to internal social problems.

HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE IMPROVED CONDITION OF WOMEN: A STRATEGY AND SOME TACTICS

If, as sometimes asserted, the human story is not generally one of success, so too is the story of the post-1945 efforts to promote human rights. Violations of those rights continue to occur on a massive scale almost everywhere in the world, and as a result of those violations, the life, liberty, as well as the economic, social, and cultural welfare of billions of human beings--primarily women--are being adversely affected. As should be perceived from the preceding discussions, the international community, as prinicipally represented by the United Nations, has established standards for the behavior of states, but since that behavior is most often influenced more by the interests of powerful social groups than by normative

requirements of the global community, the goals of the human rights movement have, thus far, been largely frustrated.

True, from the preceding discussions, it should be obvious that certain states have taken steps to give effect to certain women's rights. But what has been done pales before the enormity of the challenge posed by the conditions presented in the second section. The patterns of extreme inequality between and among individuals as well as groups is not a matter of the past; it is present shame, a social stain, a moral insult on our contemporary socio-political systems. We will not rid ourselves of that insult and that stain, however, without a willingness on the part of decision makers to introduce the type of structural changes necessary to give effect to the obligations assumed by states under the human rights instruments. Further, that willingness will be absent unless it is supplied by the organized pressure of women, along with the help of enlightened men. Strategy for that organized pressure? Global collaboration in the area of human rights.

The emphasis on global is elected for three reasons: the ideological/philosophical assumptions of the post-World War II order that gave birth to the human rights movement; the scope of discrimination against women; and the relationship between the condition of women and the world's poor. Let us review them in the reverse order of their mention.

As respects the issue of poverty, one who speaks of the Third World states invariably associates them with that condition. And that association is correct. For example, in 1975, 93% of the world's industrial production, as measured by the volume of output, was concentrated in the rich nations, with the Third World-housing over 70% of the world's population--having but 7%. (At a conference held in Peru that year, it was decided to make efforts to transform that ratio to 75: 25 by the year 2000.)118 This poverty, whether found in Brazil or India, is, in the words of Hannah Arendt:

more than deprivation, it is is a state of constant want and acute misery whose ignominy consists in its dehumanizing force; poverty is abject because it puts (people) under the absolute dictate of their bodies, that is, under the absolute dictate of necessity....¹¹⁹ [author's emphasis]

Acting from necessity, from the dictates of the body, that dehumanizing reality is not confined to the Third World, however; it is largely worldwide in its reach. And as the final report of the 1985 Nairobi Conference on Women contends, the world is faced with the threatened feminizing of poverty. 120

Moving to the scope of discrimination against women, the measure of the discrimination against women is not simply that it results in their increasing poverty, in their finding themselves excluded from the more important--financially speaking--positions in employment, their relatively high rates of illiteracy, or low levels of education--although it entails all of these. Neither is it their unrecognized contributions to the economies of their countries, the postponement of their health needs, their lack of social status--something that is frequently so keenly felt that they will give birth to more children (where doing so is a basis for social recognition) even when such births further complicates and impoverishes them. It is rather that worldwide, the very social *structure* is not designed to support the welfare of women. In all areas, they are the most vulnerable (the least able to protect themselves and their interests). So, whether it be droughts, floods, famines, inflation, debt burden, budget cuts, International Monetary Fund (IMF) adjustment programs, they are the ones that are most severely affected.

Since the scope of the problems is both global and structural, it follows that any proposed solution to them must be coextensive--something structural and global.

One may at this juncture say that what is being proposed here--especially the global--is not out of keeping with the efforts of three international women's conferences between 1975 and 1985. This assertion would, at best, be but partially

true. The three conferences referred to--the 1975 World Conference of the International Women's Year in Mexico City, the 1980 World Conference of the United Nations Decade for Women in Copenhagen, and the 1985 Nairobi World Conference, which reviewed and appraised the U.N. Decade for Women--made important international contributions to the elimination of discrimination against women. To the first we owe international consciousness raising about the profound nature and the complexity of the discrimination against women; to the second, we owe the program of action that linked the advancement of women to plans for development and the establishment of networks among women on a worldwide scale; and to the last, we owe, among other things, a forward-looking strategy that envisions that by the year 2000 "all governments should have adequate, comprehensive and coherent national women's policies to abolish all obstacles to the full and equal participation of women in all spheres of society." 121 All these conferences, however, did not really have a global strategy-merely an international one--and there is a major difference. The latter type of strategy has a state-centric focus and the former a cosmopolitan one.

In case of the state-centric conferences, women and women's groups generally identify with the states of which they are citizens or nationals, because they are persuaded by an ideological school that holds that the state is not only the basic unit of international society but the standard by which the legal and moral appropriateness off any and all international conduct must be measured. In addition, the primary (and sometimes the exclusive) responsibility of governments is to promote the national interest, however defined. By identifying with such an outlook, even where there is cooperation among women's groups, they tend to have a national, and even regional, bias. That is what happened at Nairobi, where groups had North-South orientations as well as state-focused gazes. The state-

centric focus is international in character and, as such, is inconsonant with the sought new order that informed the launching of the human rights movement.

The ideology of that sought order is cosmopolitanism, which contends that the world is morally a universal society or cosmopolis. In this universal community, the individual--not the state-- is the basic unit and the community of human beings is morally prior to the society of states, which is but the particular political form in which the human family has organized itself in modern times. 123 The moral and legal validity of any interstate conduct, therefore, must be judged by the extent to which it accommodates the interest of all human beings. The socio-political focus of cosmopolitanism is, therefore, global, and it is this emphasis that is being recommended as a strategy--the collaboration of women, viewing the world as one 🕳 community in which states are but derivative in significance, but means to an end. Only such an outlook can truly gain the ends sought by the human rights regime, which imposes obligations on nation-states on behalf of all human beings--not citizens, or Moslems, or socialists, or men. Within that broad, strategic context, a number of tactics are urged in order to gain the most varied and comprehensive coalition of support to bring pressure on the social and economic elites who have, thus far, largely disregarded the requirements of the human rights regime. The structural aspect--the removal of the nation-state as the basic unit of relations among peoples, for example--will be effected as wholesale implementation of human rights take place.

The first tactic is to emphasize the universality of the human rights focus and the profound implications of that universality for specific and dearly held values. This can be done by noting that the "inherent dignity and equal rights... of all members of the human family is the foundation of freedom, justice and peace in the world;" 124 and that these members--human beings---"are endowed with reason and conscience and should act in the spirit of sisterhood/brotherhood." 125 The

second approach should be that of focusing on the standing of the state in relationship to those rights. It is not their source--as some public officials in Brazil and Iran would have people think; they are inherent to humans. The state is merely an instrument to recognize, promote, and protect them. As such, it is the state's duty to give effect to the content of human rights; and the state's legitimacy, its authority to exercise power, is based on the degree to which it conducts its policy to benefit, not just its citizens, but all members of the human family. But with what content of human rights are we dealing? This takes us to the third tactic--that of identifying a minimum core area that can be easily communicated to people and enjoys the potential to mobilize the broadest possible social support. That core should look like the following:

Every person has a <u>right to life</u> and a right not to be arbitrarily deprived of it; a <u>right to life-supporting</u> goods and services such as food, shelter, clothing, medical care; a right to be a member of and a participant in one's community. (The latter would carry with it equality before the law as well as the cultural right to an education, since one cannot exercise the political right of participation in the life of the community, freedom of speech, press and assemblage, without a minimum level of education; a right to be free from <u>degrading treatment</u>--from the violation of one's conscience one's religious commitments to the right to be free from torture, rape and arbitrary arrest. 126

The next step is to advance the grounds for the core--the legal and moral grounds--citing in particular the basis for the economic and social rights, since these are rarely mentioned through the media centers of the world. For this Article 25 of the UDHR and Article 11 of the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights may serve as examples. In case of the first, it reads as follows:

Everyone has the right to a standard of living adequate for the health and well-being of himself and of his family including food, clothing, housing and medical care and necessary social services, and the right to security in the event of unemployment, sickness, disability, widowhood, old age and other lack of livelihood in circumstances beyond his control.¹²⁷

And in case of the above-mentioned Covenant, the specific article, in part, reads:

- The State Parties to the present Covenant recognize the "right of everyone to an adequate standard of living for himself and his family, including adequate food, clothing and housing, and to the continuous improvement of living conditions." The States Parties will take appropriate steps to ensure the realization of this right, recognizing to this effect the essential importance of international co-operation based on free consent.
- The States Parties to the present Covenant, recognizing the fundamental right of everyone to be free from hunger, shall take, individually and through international cooperation, the measure, including specific programs, which are needed..." 128

Within the context of the above tactics, the specific concerns of women should now be emphasized, so that they become one with the interests of the broader coalition to be formed. Finally, in order to give effect to all the preceding tactics, efforts must be made to see that all states ratify the human rights conventions. For American women, this is particularly important, because if their government were to ratify the relevant conventions, the passage of the proposed equal rights amendment would not even be necessary, given the fact that the human rights instruments would assure them the same rights they now seek under the proposed amendment. 129

What are the chances of those tactics succeeding? Reasonably good, for political, economic, social, psychological, and moral/religious reasons. We will be able to give but a brief explanation of each.

In respect of the political reasons, the tactic of the core rights should be particularly helpful, because it combines both the economic, social and cultural rights as well as the civil and political ones. As such, it eliminates the traditional division among states and groups that, in the West, emphasize the civil and the political and, in the South and the East, tend to focus on the economic, social, and cultural. In an affirmative vein, states such as the U.S. would not be able to present themselves as champions of human rights, while harboring at home and giving little attention to those who have no medical care, who are without employment or

education, who are without housing. From the standpoint of power, the core rights with which most would be familiar would serve as a referent 130--something by which people will measure and compare the conduct of government--so that people can educate themselves about the extent to which the action of governments parallels the norms of human rights. In the case of American women, were they to be successful in pressuring their government to ratify the relevant human rights conventions, that development would be most influential abroad.

As regards the economic, the strategy of the global cause and the emphasis of the human rights treaties on equality are most appropriate. The emergence of transnational corporations has made international society more and more like its domestic counterpart in that social cooperation is promoting increased international identity of interests, because it makes possible a better life for all than each person or country would enjoy if each were to live solely on its own efforts. From cooperation, too---whether in the form of trade, research, investment, et cetera--springs conflicts of interests, with each party preferring to gain a larger than a lesser share of the realized benefits. Unlike national society, however, the international does not have institutions to define some fair distribution of benefits. So inequality at the international level outpaces that at the national. 131 Over time, however (and women suffer at both levels, as we have seen), the increasing importance of the transnational (one has but to look at the shift in production from higher wage areas to the lower) will penetrate the national in such a way as to undermine the latter's modicum of fair distribution. So, an emphasis on the global approach will not only mirror what, in economic terms, has been happening but evoke the latent sentiments that seek institutions that correspond to the global nature of production.

The social area is the area that wombs the potential for the greatest degree of support--from those who fight religious fundamentalism in the U.S., Bengladesh,

and Egypt to those who grovel in poverty and the misfortune of old age; from Black families in Boston¹³² to those in Sao Paulo and Bahia, Brazil; from the homeless of Calcutta, the rural women in Nigeria, to the electronic worker in Korea, Taiwan, and Mexico, and the army of women who find themselves elbowed out of an opportunity for meaningful participation in the life of social communities. And what of all women in industrial societies who find themselves second-class citizens?

The psychological area will also help to assure success. Some of the consequences of poverty and powerlessness are the utter loss of a sense of dignity, the presence of an aspiratory vacuum, and the absence of self-esteem. The products of such consequences vary from the growth of teenage pregnancy, 133 the acceptance of personal abuse (spousal rape to wife-beating, for example), inability to exercise authority--in the home and elsewhere--to the fear of attempting action that may even be beneficial to one. Part of the thrust of the human rights movement is to restore to people the sense of their inherent dignity. And nothing could be more helpful here than people gaining the view that their poverty is not their fault; that their low pay, when compared with men, has nothing to do with obligations; that the food, clothing, health care, housing that they secure is not the result of "frowned on" welfare system or its equivalent but a right to be boldly asserted not unlike that to speak, to assemble, to exercise one's religious persuasion. The psychological aspect bears some importance in another vein: as in case of those who accepted the principles of the Protestant Reformation, the position of Black women preachers in the U.S., or the force of the doctrine of selfdetermination--to mention but a few, general principles that become applicable to all relevant parties, whether individuals, states, or others--tend to confer a sense of equality and empowerment. The early Protestants felt that God spoke to people directly and that each person could interpret the Bible, God's word; one did not need to be dependent on the "superior" intervention of Priests and Bishops; the

Black women ministers, contended that if God revealed Himself to all the faithful and they were part of the faithful, then there was no difference between them and the males--so why only male ministers? In case of human rights, the principles do not only apply to all but they transcend governments and states; indeed, one does not need the intermediary of the state to have them--they inhere in all, and governments are but duty-bound to protect them. Armed with this knowledge, people become empowered to assert their rights instead of feeling beholden to powerful social groups.

As concerns the moral, we will simply note the moral aspect is the undergirding of the human rights movement, seeking as it does justice and dignity for all. In a world of the amoral, religious groups, ethicians, and moral philosophers should find it easy to lend support. Most important, since human beings need to know that what they do is right and good, knowledge of the norms of human rights--on a global scale--will serve as galvanizing on behalf of women

Having posed the above strategy, the writer is not unawake to the problems that will attend gaining the broad-based cooperation called for. Some women in Brazil, for example, think of the National Council on Women's Rights as radical, some see it as primarily middle class, and one man claimed that it is already seeking to distort Brazilian history by demanding that Afro-Brazilian and African history be made compulsory in early education. Women in the United States, unless they are minorities, tend to think that the "feminizing of poverty" is a Third World phenomenon that does not affect them, although their own government information contends that the proportion of poor families maintained by women in 1984 was 48% 134--and it is growing. In the West, in general, there is the tendency to boast of our health care, especially when compared with the Third World, but women suffer alike in all respects, including in the matter of wages. In industrialized world 70% of the health care for old people is provided by women at

home. And again, it is women who are forced to choose between domestic work, children, and employment. In the U.K., for example, an estimated 300,000 women remain unmarried and childless so that they can care for aging parents. 135 One frequently hears how Islamic fundamentalism is turning back the clock on women's rights without looking at like movements in Israel, in Germany, in Japan and elsewhere, including Christian fundamentalism in the U.S., which seek to do the same thing. In short, consciousness raising must be continued at a rapid pace; the networking that has been taking place across continents must be increased and reinforced; and the attempts to pose certain experiences as being peculiar should be unmasked for what they are. The battle is joined.

APPENDIX

AN OPEN LETTER FROM WOMEN

In November 1985 the National Council on Women's Rights launched the Campaign of Women and the Constitutional Assembly. Since then, the Council (CNDM) has traveled the country, listened to Brazilian women, and enlarged the channels of communication between the [women's] social movement and the mechanisms of political decision making, seeking out sources of inspiration for the new legal status wanted now. In this Campaign, one thing became clear: to be worth anything, the Constitutional Assembly must include the words of women.

For us women, the full exercise of citizenship signifies, of course, the right to representation, to a voice, and to our turn in public life. But, at the same time, it also implies dignity in daily life, inspired and secured by law; the right to education, health, safety, and family life without trauma. Women's votes bring with them this twofold demand: an egalitarian political system, and civic life free of authoritarian control.

We women are conscious that this country will only be truly democratic and its citizens truly free when equal treatment is guaranteed without regard to sex, race, color, class, sexual orientation, political or religious creed, physical condition or age, and when there is equal opportunity for access to the streets, platforms, workshops, factories, offices, assemblies, and [government] palaces.

At this important moment, the whole society is mobilized to reconstitute its laws. We would like to remember, lest it be repeated, what women have said in the past: "If due attention is not given to women, we will foment a rebellion, and we will not feel obliged to obey laws in which we had neither a voice nor representation." (Abigail Adams, 1776)

Today, two centuries after these words were first said, Brazilian society faces the task of elaborating a new Constitution. We women, a majority still suffering discrimination, demand special consideration of our cause.

We are confident that the Brazilians, both men and women, who make up the Constitutional Assembly will incorporate the proposals of this historic Campaign of the National Council on Women's Rights. On the Constitutional Assembly weighs the great responsibility of reflecting the aspirations of a suffering people anxious for better conditions of life.

Here is what we women, meeting together in a National Conference on August 26, 1986, want:

GENERAL PRINCIPLES

To make the principle of equality effective it is fundamental that the future Brazilian Constitution:

- 1. Establish a precept which automatically revokes all legal provisions involving discriminatory classifications;
- 2. Determine that an offense against the principle of equality constitutes a crime for which bail is not available:
- Observe without reservation international agreements and treaties to which the country is signatory regarding the elimination of all forms of discrimination;
- Recognize that organized social movements, unions, associations and entities of civil society are entitled to act in defense of their collective interests. Supplemental laws and regulations must guarantee this principle.

II. SPECIFIC DEMANDS

THE FAMILY

The new Constitution must inspire various changes in civil legislation, establishing:

 Full equality between spouses regarding rights and duties as to the direction of the conjugal society (who heads the household), the administration of the couple's goods and property, responsibility in

- relation to their children, the location of the family domicile, parental authority;
- 2. Full equality between spouses in the registration of children;
- Full equality among the children whatever the bond existing between the parents;
- The protection of the family whether it be civil or common law;
- 5. Access of rural women to property title under the Agrarian Reform Project whatever their marital status is;
- State protection for the maternal and paternal roles as basic social values;
- 7. Prohibition by law of violence in family relations, as well as of the abandonment of minor children.

WORK

- Labor legislation based on the principle of equality must guarantee:
 - 1. Equal pay for equal work;
 - 2. Equality of access to the labor market and professional advancement;
 - 3. Full extension of labor rights and benefits to domestic and rural workers;
 - 4. Equal benefits for men and women. Protection for mothers and children should be the principle focus of labor legislation through such measures as:
 - guarantee of employment for pregnant women;
 - extension of the right to day care in the workplace and housing for children from 0 to 6 years old, who are children of male and female workers;
 - 5. [Job] stability for pregnant women;
 - Pre- and post-natal paternity leave for fathers;
 - Special leave for people at the time of adopting children, without prejudice to employment or salary, independent of the age of the adopted child;
 - Protection for old age by means of a full salary in cases of retirement or survivor pension;
 - Elimination of age limits for the award of payments from public contests/competitions;

- Right of a husband or male companion to receive the benefits resulting from the contribution of a wife or female companion;
- 11. Extension to rural workers of the right to benefits enjoyed by urban workers, both men and women;
- 12. Right of rural workers to a special retirement age: 50 years old for women and 55 for men, as well as retirement with full salary for 25 years of service for women, and 30 years of service for men;
- 13. Right of government employees to unionize;
- 14. Family salary compatible with reality, extending to minors 18 years old.

HEALTH

- 1. When applied specifically to women, the principle that "health is everyone's right and the duty of the Government" must guarantee that health services rendered to the population be understood as acts of coparticipation between everyone and the Government, involving rights and duties for both.
 - 1.1. The creation of a single health care system established under a new national health policy and implemented by collective public health services integrated with medical assistance. Private health care services will submit to the Government's directives and controls.
 - 1.2. The single health care system must be created and overseen by the population at large organized through Community Councils by which they will participate in decisions on programs and budget.
- Complete health care for women in all life's stages, independent of their biological or procreative condition, must be guaranteed through government programs debated, implemented and controlled with women's participation.
- Prohibition of all and any experimentation on women and men with health-threatening narcotics, drugs, contraceptives without the users' full knowledge, and without oversight by public authority and the general population.
 - 3.1. Oversight of the production, sale, distribution, and commercialization of chemical and hormonal means of contraception; prohibition of the commercialization of drugs in the experimental phase by national or multinational firms.
- In social welfare programs, guarantee of equal treatment of all citizens, men and women, whether they are contributors or recipients by entitlement.
- 5. Any and all action imposed by the Government or a national or foreign entity which interferes with the exercise of sexuality will be forbidden. In the same way, the Government and national or foreign, public or private entities will be forbidden to promote birth control.

- The right of a woman to know and make decisions about her own body will be guaranteed.
- 7. The right of a woman to breastfeed her children will be guaranteed.
- 8. The Government will recognize maternity and paternity as relevant social roles and will guarantee parents the means necessary for the education, day care, health, nutrition and safety of their children.
- Guarantee of free choice about maternity, encompassing pre-natal, delivery, and post-natal care as well as the right to avoid or interrupt pregnancy without endangering the woman's health.
- 10. It is the duty of the Government to offer conditions of free access to contraceptive methods. The government must develop educational means to clarify the consequences, indications and counter-indications, advantages and disadvantages (of contraceptive methods), enlarging the possibility for choices appropriate to each woman as an individual with an individual history and life at a given moment of time.

EDUCATION AND CULTURE

- Education is the right of all and the duty of the Government Education envisions the person's full development, within the ideals of preserving democracy, elaborating human rights, freedom, or living together in society.
 - 1.1. Education will emphasize sexual equality, the struggle against racism and all forms of discrimination, affirming the multicultural and multiracial characteristics of the Brazilian people.
 - 1.2. Teaching African history and Afro-Brazilian culture will be required from elementary school on.
- 2. Education is a national priority. The Government is responsible for making universal, public, and free education available at all levels and at all times, from a child's first year.
 - 2.1. It is the Government's duty to combat illiteracy.
- Public resources must be used exclusively for public schools, with the aim
 of improving and maintaining the quality of education.
 - The Government must pay special attention to the training and working conditions of teachers with a view to the quality of education.
- 4. The Government must pay special attention to physically or mentally handicapped students.
- The Government must guarantee urban and rural women access to basic education, as well as training for re-tooling or for professional development.

- The Government must be vigilant that education and the means of communication are at the service of an egalitarian society.
 - 6.1. The Government will guarantee that the image of woman projected in society will be that of worker, mother, and citizen responsible for the nation's destiny, in conditions of equality with men, independent of ethnic and racial origins.
- The Government will guarantee freedom of thought and expression; freedom of the production, distribution, and advertising of the products of culture through the communication media, provided they are not the vehicle for discrimination and stereotypes.
- Official statistics and studies should incorporate data relative to sex, race, and color.

VIOLENCE

- 1. Acts involving physical, psychological, or sexual violence towards women, in or out of the home, should be considered crimes.
- Sexual crimes should be considered crimes against the person and not crimes against customs, independent of sex, sexual orientation, race, age, religion, occupation, physical or mental condition or political ideology.
- 3. Any forced sexual act or relationship should be considered rape, whatever the relationship between agressor and victim, the place where it happens, or whether or not the victim is a virgin.
- In its penalties the law will not differentiate between rape and indecent assault.
- 5. The term "honest woman" will be expunged from the law.
- The Government will guarantee medical, legal, social, and psychological assistence to all victims of violence.
- The person, man or woman, who sexually exploits a woman will be punished, together with all those who lead her into prostitution.
- 8. The crime of adultery will be expunged from the law.
- The Government will be responsible for creating and maintaining shelters for battered women, and for aid in providing sustenance for them and their children.
- 10. In the case of rape, proof of penetration can be obtained from a report by any state or private physician.
- A woman will have full autonomy in registering complaints, independently of her husband's authorization.

12. The creation of a Commission on Women in all the nation's towns, even those in which there is no woman appointed.

NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL ISSUES

- The text of the Constitution will include International Treaties and Conventions subscribed to by Brazil which consecrate fundamental human and social rights, among which are those prohibiting discriminatory treatment.
- 2. Agrarian Reform which distributes land to those who work it, with a guarantee of necessary technical and credit assistance.
- Sovereignty in negotiating the foreign debt, safeguarding national interests and the interests of the Brazilian people.
- Tax reform to benefit towns.
- 5. Freedom and autonomy of labor unions.
- 6. Extending the right to strike to all professions.
- 7. A responsible policy of environmental protection.
- 8. A technological development policy which preserves the environment and national sovereignty.
- The definition of a policy to maintain the integrity of indigenous populations, preventing the genocide to which they have been subject.
- Democratization of the Government and its institutions by revoking the National Security Act and all repressive legislation.
- 11. Access to the records of individuals maintained by Government information agencies.
- 12. Peace in international relations, support of positions against the arms race, prevention of nuclear experimentation in Brazil.
- A foreign policy based on the principle of self-determination and noninterference. Any participation in foreign aggression, except in defense of national territory, shall be forbidden.
- Policy of absolute non-involvement with countries who practice racial discrimination.
- Respect for the principle of separation among the Legislative, Executive, and Judicial branches, striving for the principle that all power emanates from the people.

TO BE WORTH ANYTHING, THE CONSTITUTIONAL ASSEMBLY MUST INCLUDE WOMEN'S RIGHTS [In Portuguese it rhymes!]

NOTES

- ¹Langley, W. (1983). Human Rights: Aspects of Their Global Significance. <u>Imprint</u>, <u>4</u>, 9.
- ²See Articles 1, 8, 13, 56, 62, 68 of the United Nations Charter.
- 3See General Assembly Resolution 217 (III), U.N. Doc. A/810 at 71 (1948).
- 4See General Assembly Resolution 2200 (XXI), U.N. Doc. A/6316, reprinted in (1967). 6 International Legal Materials, 360, 368.
- 5213 United Nations Treaty Series, 221.
- 6See Organization of American States Treaty Series No. 36 at 1, OAS Off. Rec. OEA/Ser. L/V/II. 23 Doc. 21 rev. 6 (1979). Reprinted in (1970). 9 <u>International Legal Materials</u>, 673.
- 7See text in (1981). 21 International Legal Materials, 59.
- ⁸Ramcharan, B.G. (1981). Equality and Non-Discrimination. In L. Henkin (Ed.), <u>The International Bill of Rights</u>, New York: Columbia University Press, p. 247.
- 9See summary by Dunlop, B., (1980), World's Women Share Grim Lot, in The DeMoines Register, cited in B. Weston, R. Falk & A. D'Amata (Eds.), International Law and World Order, St. Paul: West Publishing Co., p. 578.
- 10The European Social Charter is a regional instrument of considerable significance in this area of discussion. See text in European Treaty Series No. 35.
- 11193 United Nations Treaty Series 135 (1953).
- 12General Assembly Resolution. 2263 (XXII), U.N. Doc. A/6880 (1968).
- ¹³Adopted by the United Nations General Assembly, December 8, 1979, General Assembly Resolution 34180 (XXXIV), United Nations Document A/0000 (1979).
- 14See Articles 1, 2, 3 of the Convention on the Political Rights of Women. See also note 13; Article 4 of the Declaration on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (DEDAW), note 14; and Articles 7 and 8 of the Covention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), note 15.
- 15See Article 5 of the DEDAW, note 14; and see also Article 9 of CEDAW, note 15.
- ¹⁶See Article 11 of CEDAW; see also Article 10 of DEDAW.
- 17lbid. Note also Article 25 (2) of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), which states that "motherhood and childhood are entitled to special care and assistance."

18lbid.

19See Article 13 of CEDAW, note 15.

²⁰See Article 14 of CEDAW, note 15.

²¹Article 12 of CEDAW, note 15.

22lbid.

23See Article 10 of CEDAW, note 15.

24lbid.

25See Article 16 of CEDAW; see also, Article 6 of DEDAW, note 14.

²⁶See Article 16 (2) of CEDAW, note 15.

27See note 16.

28Newland, K. (1979). The Sisterhood of Man. (New York: W. W. Norton & Company.)

²⁹The League of Nations Treaty Series, CLXXIX No. 4137 at 89.

30United Nations. (1983). <u>The United Nations Action in the Field of Human Rights</u>. New York: Author. P. 103.

31See note 27.

³²Spivack, N. & Florini, A. (1986). <u>Food on the Table</u>. New York: UNA-USA.

33Ibid. One may wish to note that estimates of the percentage of agricultural work done by women in Africa is as high as 75%. See Taylor, D. (Ed.), (1985), Women: A World Report, New York: Oxford University Press, p. 16.

34lbid. P. 19.

35lbid. P. 17.

36lbid, P. 18.

³⁷Sivard, R.L. (1985). <u>Women: A World Survey</u>. Washington, D.C.: World Priorities. P. 16.

³⁸See (No Date) <u>Women in Africa: Modernization Means More Dependency,</u>
Doc. A/396/W 842, Washington, D.C.: Howard University, Moorland-Spingarn
Collection.

³⁹Interview with Lelia Gonzales, unsuccessful candidate for Congress, coordinator of DAWN, and a representative to the National Council on Women's Rights.

40Spivak & Florini. Food on the Table. P. 63.

- 41Taylor. Women: A World Report. P. 19.
- 42Muntemba, M.S. (1984). Dispossession and Counterstrategies in Zambia, 1930-1970. <u>Development</u>, 4, 15-17.
- 43Anker, R. & Hein, C. (1986). <u>Sex Inequalities in Urban Employment in the Third World</u>. A study prepared for UNESCO. New York: St. Martin's Press. Pp. 63-115.
- 44lbid. P. 84.
- 45Discussions with a woman dean in Sao Paulo, Brazil.
- 46United Nations Conference on Trade and Development. (1983). Export Processing Free Zones in Developing Countries: Implications for Trade and Industrial Policies. Doc. TD/B/C.2/211. Geneva: Author.
- 47See International Information & Communication Services, (1984), Women in <u>Development</u>, pp. 25032. See also Fuentes, A. & Ehrenreich, B., (1984), Women <u>in the Global Factory</u>, Philadelphia, PA: New Society Publishers. Also Mitter, S., (1984), The Global Assembly Line: Women and Multinationals, <u>Development</u>, 4, 31-33.
- 48Anker & Hein. Sex Inequalities. Pp. 40-41.
- 49lbid, P. 90.
- 50 Muntemba. Dispossession and Counterstrategies. P. 16.
- ⁵¹See Carr, M., (1978), <u>Appropriate Technology for African Women</u>, <u>Addis Ababa:</u> UNESCO. See also Boulding, E., (1980), <u>Women: The Fifth World</u>, New York: Foreign Policy Association, p. 51.
- ⁵²Interview December 15, 1986. The parties wish not to be mentioned, since they were the only two women professionals at the clinic, and they could be easily identified.
- ⁵³Newland, K. (1980). <u>Women and the Division of Labor</u>. Washington, D.C.: Worldwatch Institute.
- 54Sivard. Women: A World Survey. P. 11.
- 55Hahn, N.D. (1984). Losing the Land. <u>Development, 4</u>, 27.
- ⁵⁶See UDHR, Article 16(3).
- ⁵⁷Hahan. Losing the Land. Muntemba. <u>Dispossession and Counterstrategies</u>.
- 58I am indebted to Professor Muriel Nazzari of Indiana University for some of this information. She presented a study on these matters on a panel entitled "Toward the Conjugal Family in Brazil" at the Seventh Berkshire Conference on the History of Women, Wellesley College, June 19-21, 1987. Mr. Joao Burin of Rio de Janeiro also helped me in this assessment.

- ⁵⁹Staff. (1971, June). When A Woman Weds a Woman. <u>African Progress</u>. Pp. 22-24.
- 60Howard-Merriam, K. (1987, June 19). "Islamic Fundamentalism and the Law of Egypt." Paper presented at Berkshire Conference on Women. See also Staff, (1985, June 10), <u>The New York Times</u>, p. A8. See also Thiam, A., (1986), <u>Black Sisters, Speak Out: Feminism and Oppression in Black Africa</u>, London: Pluto Press, pp. 88-98.
- ⁶¹Interview with Jihan Hussein on June 20, 1987 at Berkshire Conference on the History of Women, Wellesley College, June 19-21, 1987.
- 62Weinrich, A.K.H. (1979). Women and Racial Discrimination in Rhodesia. A UNESCO study. Paris: UNESCO. P. 61.
- 63Thiam. Black Sisters, Speak Out. Pp. 56-57.
- 64It is said that Sara, in her anger over Abraham's bearing a child with her maid Hagar, had excised the maid. See Genesis 16. Excision is also said to be mentioned by Mohamed in the Hadiths, but he did not urge the practice.
- 65Thiam. Black Sisters, Speak Out. P. 82. For some other treatment of the subject see Abdalla, R.H.D.; (1982), Sisters in Affliction: Circumcision and Infibulation of Women in Africa, London: Zed Press; Firestone, S., (1972), The Dialectics of Sex, New York: Bantam Books; and Boulware-Miller, K., (1985), Female Circumcision: Challenge to the Practice as a Human Rights Violation, Harvard Women's Law Review, 8, 155-97.
- 66Thiam. Black Sisters, Speak Out. P. 66.
- 67lbid. Pp. 62-63.
- 68Martin, D. (1976). <u>Battered Wives</u>. San Francisco: Glide Publications. Russell, D. (1982). <u>Rape in Marriage</u>. New York: The Macmillan Press. James, S. & Kertesz, J. (1981). The Rapist Who Pays the Rent. Bristol: Falling Wall Press.
- 69See note 52.
- 70Interview with nuns in Sao Paulo, Brazil. They worked among the less fortunate, especially the homeless.
- 71They are actually part of the traditional police stations, which are supervised and controlled by women.
- 72Interview with an editor of the alternative news agency (AGEN) in Sao Paulo.
 One will also find instructive Besse, S., (1987), Crimes of Passion: The
 Campaign Against Wife Killing in Brazil, 1910-1940. See note 58.
- 73One may question the extent to which even the culture of Bahia reflects its black majority.
- 74deBairros, L. (1986, July, August) O Negro na Forca de Trabalho (The Negro in the Work Force). <u>Cadernos de Ceas, 104, 55-61</u>. I had an opportunity to interview the author of the article, and she was far more forceful in her verbal representations than in her written ones.

- 751 was disabused of the notion that the condition of urban blacks in Brazil is worse than that of those who live in rural areas by Professor Lelia Gonzalez.
- 76Sivard. Women: A World Survey. Pp. 18-20.
- 77lbid. P. 23.
- 78lbid. P. 19.
- ⁷⁹Derrek, V. (1979). The Comparative Functionality of Formal and Non-Formal Education for Women, Final Report. Washington, D.C.: Agency for International Development. Pp. 60-65.
- 80Giele, J. (1978). Women and the Future. New York: The Free Press. P. 306. For the social context, a very helpful volume is Frieze, H., (1978), Women and the Sex Roles, New York: W.W. Norton & Company.
- 81Vajrathon, M. (1976). Toward Liberating Women: A Communications Perspective. <u>Women and Development</u>. Washington, D. C.: Overseas Development Council. P. 95.
- 82Interviews with Moslem women yield a downplaying or denying of work outside the home when it occurs.
- 83 Vajrathon. Toward Liberating Women. P. 95.
- 84Goldenberg, N. (1976, Winter). A Feminist Critique of Jung. Signs, II, 449.
- 85Review of Cassino de Chacrinha, December 13, 1986. [?]
- 86Although one cannot draw scholarly conclusions from this small sample, the latter confirms studies by others; for example, Moore, Z., (1986, April), <u>Blacks in Contemporary Popular Culture in the 1980s</u>, paper presented at the Conference on Popular Culture in Latin America, New Orleans.
- 87Interviews in Salvador and Porto Alegre.
- 88Sarte, J.P. (1957). Being and Nothingness. London: Methuen & Co.
- 89United National Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women, 64th Meeting. (1986, March 10). Press Release. New York: United Nations. WOM/351 at 2. Of states that have ratified there are 21 from Africa, 12 from Asia, and 23 from Latin America.
- 90United Nations. (1985). Report of the World Conference to Review and Appraise the Achievements of the United Nations Decade for Women: Equality, Development and Peace. Doc. A/Conf. 116/28/Rev. 1. New York: United Nations.
- 91Sivard. Women: A World Survey. P. 33.
- ⁹²Jacobs, S. (1983). Women and Land Resettlement in Zimbabwe. <u>Review of African Political Economy</u>, 27/28, 41.

93Kikopa, J.R.K. (1981). <u>Law and the Status of Women in Tanzania</u> (UNESCO Research Series, U.N. Doc. E/CN.14/ATRCW/Res/81/04). New York: United Nations. P. 51.

94lbid.

- 95See certain games people play in <u>School Committee of Brockton vs. Massachusetts Commission Against Discrimination</u> 386 N.E. Rep. at 1240. Also see the American Supreme Court ruling in <u>California Federal Savings & Loan Association vs. Guerra in Labor Relations Representative</u>, January 19, 1987.
- 96See International Labor Organization (ILO), (1983), Maternity Leave Laws, Women at Work, Geneva: ILO. Also see Sivard, Women: A World Survey, p. 32.
- 97Interview with Professors G.L. Louro, R.J. Pinto, and M.N.C. Brito, December 10 and 11, 1986.
- 98See Carta das Mulheres, An Open Letter from Women, Appendix I.
- ⁹⁹International Bank for Reconstruction and Development. (1984). <u>World Development Report</u>, 1984. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank. P. 175.
- 100Organization of African States. (1981). <u>Lagos Plan of Action for Economic</u> Development of Africa, 1980-2000. New York: OAS.

1011bid. P. 111.

102lbid. Pp. 111-17.

- 103Gannon, J.D. (1987, June/July). Women at the U.N.: Making Room at the Top. Interdependent, 13. 3:6.
- 104See United Nations Document E/CN.6/1984/12 (CSW Rep. on the Twentieth Session SS COR 1984 Supp. No. 5). P. 34.
- 105Interview with "street people" in Salvador, Bahia, December 6, 1986.
- 106[Author] (1982). The Experience of the Association of African Women for Research and Development. Development Dialogue, 1 & 2, 101-13.
- ¹⁰⁷Rounaq, J. (1987, July). Women in South Asian Politics. <u>Third World Quarterly</u>, 864.
- 108This is significant if one considers that infant mortality rate among poor states has been as high as 125 per 1,000 as compared to 25 per 1,000 for rich states. See World Bank, (1975), Prospects for Developing Countries, 1976-1980, Washington, D.C.: The World Bank. Also see Cartley-Carlson, M., (1984), Oversights, Insights and New Sites, Development, 4, 82.

1091bid.

- ¹¹⁰Note that African states have begun to emphasize agriculture, according to The Christian Monitor, September 11, 1986, p. 14.
- 111Anker & Hein. Sex Inequalities. Pp. 40-41.
- 112Meis, M. (1984). Capitalism and Subsistence: Rural Women in India. <u>Development</u>, 4, 22.
- 113The author is aware that if the wage is too high there may be disincentives for those who invest in the making of the product.
- 114See Briffault, R., (1959), <u>The Mothers</u>, <u>London</u>: Allen & Unwin. Also see White, E.M., (no date), <u>Women In World History</u>. For more recent coverage of the subject, see Lesko, B.S., (1987), <u>Women of Egypt and the Ancient East</u>, in R. Bridenthal, et al (Ed.), <u>Becoming Visible</u>, Boston: Houghton-Mifflin, pp. 41-77.
- 115 Hassan, R. (1987, January-May). Equal Before Allah. <u>Harvard Divinity Bulletin</u>, 2-4.
- 116See World Bank, World Development Report, 1979, Washington, D.C.: The World Bank, pp. 81-112.
- 117 Catley-Carlson. Oversights, Insights. P. 83.
- 118Singer, H.W. (1979). <u>Industry and Development.</u> P. 1. At the Second General Conference of the United Nations Industrial Development Organization held in Lima, Peru, there was an agreement to effect this change.
- ¹¹⁹Arendt, H. (1981). On Revolution. New York: Penguin Books. P. 60.
- 120United Nations. (1985). Report of the World Conference to Review and Appraise the Achievements of the Untied Nations Decade for Women: Equality, Development and Peace. U.N. Doc A/CONF. 116/28/Rev. 1. New York: United Nations.
- 121Ibid. P. 23.
- 122See Nardin, T., (1983), <u>Law, Morality and Relations of States.</u> Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, p. 43-44.
- 123lbid.
- 124See Preamble of UDHR.
- 125See Article 1 of UDHR.
- 126See Langley, W. (1981). Human Rights and World Policy. New Directions, 8,4:27.
- 127See Article 25 of UDHR.
- 128See Article 11 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.

- 129This conclusion is offered in light of the case Filartiga vs. Pena-Irela 630 F.2d. 878.
- 130Frieze. Women and Sex Roles. P. 301.
- 131Beitz, C. (1979). Political Theory and International Relations. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press. P. 44-45.
- 132Malson, M.R. Black Families in Boston. In P.L. Clay (Ed.). (no date). The Emerging Black Community of Boston. Boston: Institute for the Study of Black Culture, University of Massachusetts. Pp. 81-109.
- 133Conclusion of Deborah Jackson, Executive Director of Roxbury Comprehensive Community Health Center, Roxbury, MA, at her presentation at the November 14-15, 1987 Conference at Boston University on "The Quality of Black Life in Boston in the Twenty-First Century."
- 134U.S. Department of Labor. (1986). <u>Facts on Women Workers.</u> Fact Sheet 86-1. Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office. P. 2.
- 135Taylor. Women: A World Report. P. 15.