# Earth's Multi-scale Topographic Response to Global Mantle Flow

D.R. Davies<sup>1</sup>, A.P. Valentine<sup>1</sup>, S.C. Kramer<sup>2</sup>, N. Rawlinson<sup>3</sup>, M.J. Hoggard<sup>4</sup>, C.M. Eakin<sup>1</sup>, and C.R. Wilson<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Research School of Earth Sciences, The Australian National University, Canberra, Australia.

<sup>2</sup>Department of Earth Science and Engineering, Imperial College London, UK.

<sup>3</sup>Department of Earth Sciences-Bullard Labs, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, UK.

<sup>4</sup>Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Harvard University, MA, USA.

<sup>5</sup>Department of Terrestrial Magnetism, Carnegie Institution of Washington, Washington, DC, USA.

Earth's surface topography is a direct physical expression of our planet's dynamics. Most is *isostatic*, controlled by thickness and density variations within the crust and lithosphere, but a significant pro-2 portion arises from forces exerted by underlying mantle convection. This dynamic topography directly connects the evolution of surface environments to Earth's deep interior, but predictions from mantle flow simulations are often inconsistent with inferences from the geological record, with little consensus about its spatial pattern, wavelength and amplitude. Here, we demonstrate that previous comparisons between predictive models and observational constraints have been biased by subjective choices. Using measurements of residual topography beneath the oceans, and a hierarchical Bayesian approach to 8 performing spherical harmonic analyses, we generate a robust estimate of Earth's oceanic residual topog-9 raphy power spectrum. This indicates power of  $0.5\pm0.35~\mathrm{km^2}$  and peak amplitudes of  $\sim 0.8\pm0.1~\mathrm{km}$  at 10 long-wavelength ( $\sim 10^4$  km), decreasing by roughly one order of magnitude at shorter wavelengths ( $\sim 10^3$ 11 km). We show that geodynamical simulations can only be reconciled with observational constraints if 12 they incorporate lithospheric structure and its impact on mantle flow. This demonstrates that both deep 13 (long-) and shallow (shorter-wavelength) processes are crucial, and implies that dynamic topography is 14 intimately connected to the structure and evolution of Earth's lithosphere. 15

Between Earth's crust and core lies the mantle, a 2,900 km-thick layer of hot rock that constitutes greater than 16 80% of Earth's volume. Carrying heat to the surface, the convecting mantle is the 'engine' that drives our dynamic 17 planet: it is directly or indirectly responsible for almost all large-scale tectonic and geological activity [1]. As the 18 mantle flows, it transmits normal stresses to the lithosphere — Earth's rigid outermost shell — that are balanced by 19 gravitational stresses arising through topographic deflections of Earth's surface [2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9]. This so-called 20 dynamic topography is transient, varying both spatially and temporally in response to underlying mantle flow. As a 21 result, it is more challenging to isolate than *isostatic topography*. The relative importance of dynamic versus isostatic 22 topography varies according to setting: for example, the elevation of the Himalaya is principally isostatic, due to the 23 presence of Earth's thickest continental crust; but the broad excess elevation of the stable South African craton has been 24

attributed to dynamic topography, generated by mantle upwelling [10]. Dynamic topography is fundamental to Earth's gravitational field [5, 11] and also influences surface processes — including erosion, sediment transport and deposition — as recorded by stratigraphic sequences in sedimentary basins and river profiles [12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18]. It is directly connected to changes in sea level and continental flooding: as continents migrate over areas of positive dynamic topography, large vertical motions lead to the emergence of entire regions; similarly, encountering negative dynamic topography can induce rapid inundation of large areas [19, 20, 21, 22, 23]. Surface processes may also influence mantle flow: as the topography evolves, the convecting system must respond to maintain a force-balance [24].

Given the importance of dynamic topography, a number of attempts have been made to constrain its spatial pattern, 32 wavelength and amplitude. There are generally two ways to approach this: (i) estimation of so-called residual topography, 33 by removal of the isostatic contribution due to sediments, ice, crust and lithosphere from the observed topography [25, 26, 34 27, 28, 9]; or (ii) estimation of the surface deflections arising from mantle flow, via computational simulation ('predictive 35 modelling') [29, 30, 31, 8, 32, 33, 34]. However, the results obtained using these two approaches are inconsistent. 36 Predictive models generally exhibit peak amplitudes of 1-2 km. They are dominated by broad topographic highs 37 within the Pacific and African domains, separated by a band of topographic lows extending from Antarctica, through 38 the Americas to the Arctic and broadening beneath the Eurasian continent (an example, from [8], is illustrated in 39 Fig. 1a). Residual topography estimates, on the other hand, show smaller-scale structure, with key features including 40 lows at the Australian-Antarctic Discordance (AAD) and Argentine Basin, and highs under the central and western 41 Pacific Ocean, offshore southern Africa, the South China Sea and the North Atlantic (an example, from [9], is displayed 42 in Fig. 1b). The discrepancies between these two approaches are consistently seen across a number of independent 43 studies [8, 35] and may arise from a combination of uncertainty on key parameters and approximations made within the 44 analyses, many of which are common across studies. For example, most existing predictive models do not account for 45 the effects of uppermost mantle structure above 225–300 km depth, owing to the difficulties associated with inferring 46 density from seismic velocity in the vicinity of Earth's highly heterogeneous lithosphere. Furthermore, mantle viscosity 47 and its depth-dependence are a key material property in mantle flow simulations, but estimates vary by at least an 48 order of magnitude. Residual topography estimates also have large uncertainties, principally because the density and 49 thickness of Earth's crust and sedimentary cover, and especially lithospheric thickness variations, are all poorly resolved 50 on a global scale [8, 36, 28, 35]. It should also be noted that residual topography estimates cannot often be directly 51 compared to dynamic topography predictions, as the former regularly include unresolved isostatic contributions arising 52 from lithospheric thickness variations, whereas the latter do not. 53

In an attempt to better constrain residual topography, Hoggard *et al.* (2016) [9] compiled a database of point-wise estimates within the oceanic realm. At each point, care was taken to remove the isostatic consequences of variable sedimentary loading and crustal thickness from the observed topography, based upon analyses of magnetic anomaly patterns and characteristic acoustic architecture in seismic reflection and refraction profiles. Residual depth anomalies were subsequently calculated by removing the effects of ocean-floor cooling, using an empirical model [37] (although

isostatic contributions, arising from variations in lithospheric thickness and density unrelated to ocean-floor age, were not 59 removed). To generate a global spherical harmonic decomposition of residual topography, these point-wise constraints 60 were supplemented in the oceans by residual depth measurements from ship-track bathymetry, and on continents by 61 model that transformed free-air gravity anomalies to residual topography assuming a constant value for admittance. 62 а This database, illustrated in Supplementary Fig. 1, was then used to express Earth's residual topography in terms of 63 spherical harmonic functions, using a regularised least-squares inversion algorithm. This allowed the power spectrum of 64 residual topography to be obtained, as illustrated in Fig. 1(e – dotted line). Hoggard et al. (2016) [9] concluded that 65 their dataset could be accurately represented up to and including a maximum spherical harmonic degree of l = 30, with 66 peak power of  $0.1-0.3 \text{ km}^2$  at l = 1-3 (i.e. at wavelengths of  $\sim 10,000 \text{ km}$ ) along with significant residual topography, of 67 comparable power, at l = 15-30 (i.e. at shorter wavelengths of 1,000-2,000 km). In light of the sensitivity kernels that 68 illustrate how effective density anomalies at different depths and spherical harmonic degree are at creating topography 69 [38, 4, 5, 11, 39, 9], such a spectrum implies a major role for shallow mantle structure and flow. This is inconsistent 70 with most predictive models, which exhibit significant power at l = 2 and negligible power at shorter wavelengths — 71 characteristics that, instead, suggest deep mantle flow as the dominant driver for Earth's surface response [8, 9]. 72

These conclusions have been heavily debated. A number of studies indicate that admittance varies with wavelength 73 and location, with potential for large dynamic topography in the absence of free-air gravity anomalies [38, 11, 32]. This 74 invalidates the continental constraints used by [9], and calls the robustness of their results into question. Nonetheless, 75 if one generates a power spectrum using oceanic residual topography measurements only, or uses a model derived from 76 CRUST 1.0 [40] on continents, the general character of the power spectrum remains consistent [9]. This is also the 77 case using an updated compilation of oceanic (point-wise and ship-track) residual topography measurements, generated 78 herein by building on [41] (see Supplementary Information), where the effects of ocean-floor cooling are removed using 79 theoretical plate model rather than an empirical model: the spectrum remains reasonably 'flat' (Fig. 1e – solid black а 80 line). Taken together, these analyses lend continued support to the conclusions of [9]. 81

In further support of Hoggard et al. (2016) [9], [45] analysed the asymmetric subsidence of mid-ocean ridges, finding 82 only  $\sim 500$  m of long-wavelength dynamic topography. Moreover, recently developed models of mantle dynamics, which 83 account for shallow lithospheric structure and small-scale upper mantle convection, display significant power at shorter 84 wavelengths (l = 15 - 30) [39, 46], as expected from the aforementioned sensitivity kernels [38, 5, 11, 39, 9]. These 85 models, however, continue to generate long-wavelength residual topography that remains at apparent odds with the 86 observational constraints, displaying significantly more power at  $l \leq 2$  [39, 47]. This is also true of a recent model by 87 Yang & Gurnis (2016) [32], although they proposed that at least part of the long-wavelength discrepancy arises due to the 88 sparse nature of the observational constraints [41]. Their study also demonstrates that the conclusions of [9] are sensitive 89 to regularisation choices [44] and suggests that the maximum degree to which a spherical harmonic representation can 90 be inferred from the point-wise residual topography measurements is l = 5 [32]. We note that these claims have 91 since been refuted [41] and emphasise that the analyses of [9, 41] and [32, 44] are not directly comparable: power 92

Figures/Fig\_1.pdf

Figure 1: Predicted versus inferred topography: (a) simulated present-day dynamic topography from a time-dependent mantle flow simulation [8]; (b) inferred residual topography from observational constraints [9]; (c)/(d) simulated topography from our instantaneous-flow models, neglecting (c) and incorporating (d) shallow mantle and lithospheric structure, respectively; (e) spectral decomposition of published predictive models [29, 30, 31, 42, 8] and observation-based residual topography estimates [9, 41]. Note that predictive models cover Earth's surface at high-resolution and have not been regularised, but residual topography estimates have, using an automatic regularisation parameter selection algorithm [43]; (f) unregularised spectral decomposition of our simulations – spectra computed from the predictive models are not directly comparable with the observational constraints, since they omit effects introduced by irregular sampling and processing choices [44]. Comparisons that account for these effects are displayed in Fig. 2.

- <sup>93</sup> spectra are normalised and scaled differently between studies, and different regularisation approaches are employed; it
- <sup>94</sup> is therefore not surprising that different conclusions are being drawn. Consequently, we find ourselves at an impasse,
- <sup>95</sup> with little agreement on: (i) the spatial pattern, wavelength and amplitude of dynamic topography; and (ii) the relative
- <sup>96</sup> contributions to dynamic topography from shallow and deep mantle flow.

In this paper, we employ a new approach to performing spherical harmonic analyses [43], designed to be less dependent 97 on the subjective regularisation choices that have influenced previous studies [9, 41, 32, 44]. This allows us to obtain a 98 robust estimate of the power spectrum of Earth's oceanic residual topography field from an updated compilation of the 99 (point-wise and ship-track) dataset of [41]. Through consistent quantitative comparisons between this spectrum and a 100 suite of predictive models of mantle dynamics, we reveal how both deep and shallow mantle flow combine to dictate 101 Earth's oceanic residual topography expression. Finally, using these models as a basis, we isolate the flow-related (truly 102 dynamic) contribution towards Earth's residual topography, by estimating the isostatic effects of mapped lithospheric 103 thickness variations beneath the world's oceans. 104

# <sup>105</sup> The Power Spectrum of Residual Topography

Our procedure for inferring the power spectrum of topography, closely following that of [9], is described in the Methods. 106 It involves a regularised least-squares inversion of observational constraints to fit a spherical-harmonic expansion to the 107 topographic signal. As with any such approach, the choice of regularisation can have a significant influence on results. 108 To guide such choices, it is helpful to note that the least-squares procedure has a Bayesian interpretation, in which the 109 regularisation operator is identified as the covariance matrix of the prior distribution [48, 43]. Thus, the regularisation 110 operator encodes our assumptions in the absence of any data, and plays a key role in determining the character of any 111 solution. In [9], the regularisation operator was constructed to prefer low-amplitude, smooth solutions. We remark 112 that 'smooth' can be defined in different ways; [9] chose to penalise both the first derivative of the recovered field and 113 the total power contained within it (i.e. the sum of squares of model coefficients). The relative weights assigned to 114 each penalty term in this Tikhonov-style regularisation were governed by two tuneable parameters, which we denote 115 by  $\alpha$  (overall power term) and  $\beta$  (gradient term), as detailed in the Methods. Although [9] did not adopt an explicitly 116 Bayesian approach, it is instructive to do so, and generate samples from the prior distribution associated with this 117 regularisation. In Supplementary Fig. 2, we show the range of power spectra associated with  $10^6$  samples, for different  $\alpha$ 118 and  $\beta$  pairs: regardless of the values adopted, it is clear that this form of regularisation expresses an *a priori* preference 119 for a relatively 'flat' spectrum. The consequences of this are explored via a series of inversions of synthetic datasets and 120 observational constraints in the Supplementary Information, with key results illustrated in Supplementary Figs. 3 and 121 4. In short, these tests demonstrate that conclusions are predicated upon the assumptions implicit within the form of 122 regularisation operator, making it difficult to assess whether the power spectrum of [9] reflects signal in the data, or 123 simply the initial biases, as suggested by [44]. 124

To address this issue, we perform the inversion procedure using a different style of regularisation, which we refer to as 'Automatic Relevance Determination' (ARD) [43, 49]. This amounts to introducing one regularisation parameter for each spherical harmonic degree, and then tuning these to match the statistics of the data (see Methods). By doing so, we avoid imposing any constraints upon the expected form of the power spectrum, and allow the data to provide its Figures/Fig\_2.pdf

Figure 2: Power spectra obtained from simulated datasets and observational constraints using inversions regularised with Automatic Relevance Determination [43, 49]: solid lines denote results from (simulated) datasets with complete, high-density global coverage; dashed lines represent the mean results obtained using data only at the spot and ship-track locations of observational constraints, whilst shaded regions represent 50% and 99% confidence intervals around this mean (see Methods). Red colours denote inversions of a simulated dataset with no shallow structure (Fig. 1c); blue colours depict a simulated dataset with shallow structure present (Fig. 1d); grey colours represent results obtained from the observational constraints. Each dataset has been independently regularised. We see that simulations without shallow structure do not contain evidence for significant power above l = 8, whereas the observational constraints require throughout the remainder of the spectrum, they are broadly compatible with our simulation that contains shallow structure.

<sup>129</sup> own definition of 'smooth'. In Fig. 2, we show results from applying this procedure to the oceanic residual topography <sup>130</sup> dataset, with maps of the resulting spherical harmonic model shown in Supplementary Fig. 5. Our analyses: (i) express <sup>131</sup> a preference for  $0.5 \text{ km}^2$  of residual topography power at long-wavelength (l = 2), likely in the range of  $0.25 - 0.85 \text{ km}^2$ , <sup>132</sup> with peak amplitudes of  $0.8 \pm 0.1 \text{ km}$  — larger than suggested by [9], smaller than predicted by [32, 44], but within error <sup>133</sup> of analyses by [45]; (ii) demonstrate that spectral power decreases by an order of magnitude from l = 2 to l = 30; and <sup>134</sup> (iii) support the presence of a low amplitude short-wavelength (l = 15 - 30) residual topography component, consistent <sup>135</sup> with [9, 41].

# <sup>136</sup> Geodynamical Model Comparisons

To quantify the relative contributions to our revised power spectrum from shallow and deep mantle flow, we also apply the ARD procedure to two end-member geodynamical simulations (see Methods for further details, including model

limitations): (i) a simulation that neglects density and thermal heterogeneity in the uppermost 300 km of the mantle, 139 with viscosity dependent upon depth only, allowing us to quantify the first-order topographic expression of deeper mantle 140 flow (Fig. 1c); and (ii) a simulation constrained by an estimate of lithospheric thickness (Supplementary Fig. 6), which 141 allows for the inclusion of shallow density heterogeneity and thermal structure, with viscosity dependent on both depth 142 and temperature, thereby accounting for shallow mantle flow and its interaction with the lithosphere (Fig. 1d). The 143 predicted topography from the first simulation shares many characteristics with published studies [30, 31, 42, 8, 33], 144 displaying long-wavelength topographic highs within the Pacific domain, Southern and Eastern Africa and the North 145 Atlantic, with lows extending across Central and South America, Europe, North West Africa and Asia. Spectral power 146 displays a clear peak at l = 2, with a rapid drop off at higher l (Fig. 1f). Predictions from the second simulation, 147 where the effect of ocean-floor cooling is removed using the plate model of [41], closely resemble those of [39], with 148 shorter-wavelength topographic features clearly visible. The Pacific domain, however, is generally associated with a 149 topographic high, albeit with a broad low off the west coast of South America and more localised lows in the northeast 150 Pacific. Large topographic highs are also visible in the western US, western Antarctica, East Africa, the South China 151 Sea, eastern Asia and adjacent to Iceland, with major lows focused along the AAD, the South Atlantic, the southern 152 Indian Ocean and southeast of Arabia. Spectral power also peaks at l = 2 (Fig. 1f), but it does not drop off significantly 153 at higher l and, in general character, is more consistent with the oceanic residual topography spectrum, albeit displaying 154 larger amplitudes as identified by [39]. Both simulations predict more power than the observational constraints at  $l \leq 2$ , 155 with this discrepancy largest in the model incorporating shallow structure. 156

These predictive models are next sampled at the locations of point-wise and ship-track oceanic residual topography estimates, thus enabling fully-consistent comparisons with the observational constraints, whilst the ARD procedure is performed independently for each inversion. Strikingly, the simulated dataset without shallow structure shows a sharp drop-off beyond l = 8 (Fig. 2): the topographic signal lies below the assumed noise level in the data and, accordingly, the ARD procedure determines that higher spherical harmonic degrees can be set to zero without affecting data fit. This is in partial support of arguments made by [32, 44], although it is noteworthy that this does not occur when applied to the observational constraints, demonstrating the robustness of the inferred short-wavelength residual topography signal.

The overall characteristics of the residual topography constraints are generally consistent with the simulation incor-164 porating shallow structure. In comparison to the simulation, the observational dataset displays significantly less power 165 at l = 1 (an offset of ~ 0.6 km<sup>2</sup>), and slightly less power throughout the remainder of the spectrum, but the overall 166 trend is well-matched, with the range of plausible models often overlapping (beyond l = 1, the offset is consistently 167 below 0.12 km<sup>2</sup>). When combined, these comparisons demonstrate that: (i) the l = 2 component of residual topography 168 is compatible with the l = 2 component of our predictive models, implying a key role for deep-mantle flow in dictating 169 Earth's topographic signature, consistent with [32, 44]; and (ii) although spectral power does decrease by an order of 170 magnitude from l = 2 to l = 30, the short-wavelength components are a direct manifestation of lithospheric structure 171 and uppermost mantle dynamics, supporting the conclusions of [9]. We therefore return to the standpoint that the 172

<sup>173</sup> long-wavelength components of residual topography, which are principally controlled by deep-mantle flow, dominate the spherical harmonic power spectrum. The shorter-wavelength components, dictated by lithospheric structure and uppermost mantle flow, are robust, albeit less significant, in terms of spectral power [38, 5]. Critically, the observational constraints support a crucial role for both deep and shallow mantle flow in dictating Earth's surface response.

## <sup>177</sup> Isolating the Flow-Related Component of Residual Topography

The observational constraints on residual topography utilised here are not solely a consequence of underlying mantle 178 flow (i.e. they are not fully dynamic in origin). As stated previously, to account for the effects of ocean-floor cooling 179 with age, an age-dependent theoretical plate model has been subtracted from the isostatically (crustal and sediment) 180 corrected topography [41]. The same procedure was applied to our simulation that incorporates shallow structure, to 181 generate a consistent synthetic estimate of residual topography and, thus, enable direct comparison with the observational 182 constraints. However, by doing so, we are assuming that, in the oceans, lithospheric thickness (and density) varies as a 183 function of ocean-floor-age only and, hence, are ignoring local deviations about this average behaviour that are apparent 184 in Supplementary Fig. 6. Accordingly, the effect of anomalous, non-age-dependent lithospheric thickness variations are 185 incorporated into the residual topography estimates. Such variability is likely isostatic in nature [46, 35] and not a direct 186 manifestation of present-day mantle flow. Indeed, as stated by [41], observational constraints on residual topography 187 represent an upper-bound on the flow-related dynamic topography component. 188

Given that our synthetic residual topography field is generally consistent with Earth's residual topography expression 189 (correlation = 0.4), it is of interest to isolate the dynamic (flow-related) component in our simulation, in an attempt 190 to better understand this partitioning on Earth. We do so using a simple approach, which assumes that lithospheric 191 thickness variations are thermal in origin (poorly constrained compositional variations are neglected) and have an 192 isostatic contribution that can be subtracted out (see Methods). Our approximation of the resulting dynamic topography 193 field is illustrated in Supplementary Fig. 7: this displays clear differences to the model that omits shallow structure (cf. 194 Fig. 1c). These differences are confirmed by an ARD-based inversion (solely within the oceanic realm at the locations 195 of spot and ship-track measurements): the general character of the resulting dynamic topography power spectrum is 196 broadly consistent with the residual topography spectrum, but distinct from the spectrum of the model neglecting 197 shallow structure (Fig. 3a). This indicates that the interplay between upper mantle flow and the base of Earth's 198 heterogeneous lithosphere plays a crucial role in generating dynamic topography and in controlling the character of the 199 power spectrum. 200

Closer examination of these spectra reveals another important trend (Fig. 3b): within the oceanic realm, at l = 2, greater than 80% of the synthetic residual topography signal is related to mantle flow, as opposed to mapped lithospheric thickness variations. Conversely, at higher l (particularly at  $l \ge 15$ ), greater than 50% of the residual topography signal can be attributed to isostatic effects arising from non age-dependent variations in lithospheric thickness. Our approach Figures/Fig\_3.pdf

Figure 3: Dynamic (flow-related) component of synthetic residual topography within the oceanic realm: (a) power spectra of residual (blue) and flow-related (green) synthetic topography predictions from the model that incorporates shallow structure, using inversions regularised with ARD [43, 49]. Plotting conventions are as described in caption to Fig. 2, with spectra from a simulation with no shallow structure, identical to Fig. 2, displayed for ease of comparison. In isolating the dynamic component of residual topography an estimate of isostatic contributions resulting from variations in lithospheric thickness has been removed from the original synthetic residual topography field. The ratio between the mean of both power spectra, displayed in (b), demonstrates important differences: at low l, and particularly at l = 2 (vertical line), most of the synthetic residual topography is dynamic in origin, but greater than 50% of the signal can be attributed to mapped variations in lithospheric thickness at shorter wavelengths ( $l \ge 15$ ).

is simplified, but these results are intriguing, implying that although oceanic residual topography measurements are a reasonable reflection of flow-related dynamic topography at long-wavelength, that is not the case at shorter-wavelengths. A corollary to this is that efforts to extract the shorter-wavelength components of flow-related dynamic topography from the observational record will only be successful if isostatic effects, arising from variations in the thickness and density of Earth's lithosphere, can be carefully isolated and removed. Doing so will require a comprehensive, multi-scale understanding of the structure and composition of Earth's lithosphere. It is therefore timely that recent studies are demonstrating significant progress in this endeavour [50].

#### <sup>212</sup> Online Content

Any additional Methods, Supplementary Figures and Source Data are available in the online version of the paper;

references unique to these sections appear only in the online paper.

## 215 **References**

- [1] Davies, G. F. Dynamic Earth: plates, plumes and mantle convection (Cambridge University Press, 1999).
- [2] Pekeris, C. L. Thermal convection in the interior of the Earth. *Geophys. J.* **3**, 343–367 (1935).
- [3] Parsons, B. & Daly, S. The relationship between surface topography, gravity anomalies, and temperature structure of convection. J. Geophys. Res. 88, 1129–1144 (1983).
- [4] Richards, M. A. & Hager, B. H. Geoid anomalies in a dynamic Earth. J. Geophys. Res. 89, 5987–6002 (1984).
- [5] Hager, B. H. & Richards, A. M. Long-wavelength variations in Earth's geoid: Physical models and dynamical implications. *Phil. Trans. Roy. Soc. London, Ser. A.* **328**, 309–327 (1989).
- [6] Cazenave, A., Souriau, A. & Dominh, K. Global coupling of Earth's surface topography with hotspots, geoid and mantle heterogeneities.
   *Nature* 340, 54–57 (1989).
- [7] Braun, J. The many surface expressions of mantle dynamics. *Nature Geoscience* **3**, 826–833 (2010).
- [8] Flament, N., Gurnis, M. & Muller, R. D. A review of observations and models of dynamic topography. Lithosphere (2013).
- [9] Hoggard, M. J., White, N. & Al-Attar, D. Global dynamic topography observations reveal limited influence of large-scale mantle flow.
   Nat. Geo. 9, 456–463 (2016).
- [10] Lithgow-Bertelloni, C. & Silver, P. G. Dynamic topography, plate driving forces and the African superswell. Nature 395, 269–272 (1998).
- [11] Colli, L., Ghelichkhan, S. & Bunge, H.-P. On the ratio of dynamic topography and gravity anomalies in a dynamic Earth. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 43, 2510–2516 (2016).
- [12] Burgess, P. M. & Gurnis, M. Mechanisms for the formation of cratonic stratigraphic sequences. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 136, 647–663 (1995).
- [13] Petersen, K. D., Nielsen, S., Clausen, O., Stephenson, R. & Gerya, T. Small-scale mantle convection produces stratigraphic sequences in sedimentary basins. *Science* **329**, 827–830 (2010).
- [14] Shephard, G. E., Muller, R. D., Liu, L. & Gurnis, M. Miocene drainage reversal of the Amazon River driven by plate-mantle interaction.
   *Nature Geoscience* 3, 870–875 (2010).
- [15] Roberts, G. G. & White, N. J. Estimating uplift rate histories from river profiles using african examples. J. Geophys. Res. 2010, B02406 (2010).
- [16] Czarnota, K., Hoggard, M. J., White, N. & Winterbourne, J. Spatial and temporal patterns of Cenozoic dynamic topography around
   Australia. Geochem. Geophys. Geosys. 14, 634–658 (2013).
- [17] Czarnota, K., Roberts, G. G., White, N. J. & Fishwick, S. Spatial and temporal patterns of Australian dynamic topography from river
   profile modelling. J. Geophys. Res. 119, 1384–1419 (2014).
- [18] Eakin, C., Lithgow-Bertelloni, C. & Davila, F. M. Influence of Peruvian flat-subduction dynamics on the evolution of western Amazonia.
   *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 404, 250–260 (2014).
- [19] Mitrovica, J. X., Beaumont, C. & Jarvis, G. T. Tilting of continental interiors by the dynamical effects of subduction. Tectonics 8, 1079–1094 (1989).
- [20] Gurnis, M. Phanerozoic marine inundation of continents driven by dynamic topography above subducting slabs. Nature 364, 589–593 (1993).
- [21] Moucha, R. et al. Dynamic topography and long-term sea-level variations: There is no such thing as a stable continental platform.
   *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 271, 101–108 (2008).
- [22] Crameri, F. & Lithgow-Bertelloni, C. Abrupt upper-plate tilting during slab-transition-zone collision. *Tectonophys.* 746, 199–211 (2018).
- [23] Cao, W., Flament, N., Zahirovic, S., Williams, S. & Muller, R. D. The interplay of dynamic topography and eustasy on continental flooding in the late Paleozoic. *Tectonophysics* In Press. (2019).

- [24] Molnar, P. & England, P. Late Cenozoic uplift of mountain ranges and global climate change: chicken and egg? Nature 346, 29–34 (1990).
- <sup>258</sup> [25] Crough, S. T. Hotspot swells. Ann. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci. 11, 165–193 (1983).
- [26] Panasyuk, S. V. & Hager, B. H. Models of isostatic and dynamic topography, geoid anomalies, and their uncertainties. J. Geophys. Res. 105, 28199–28209 (2000).
- [27] Kaban, M. K., Schwintzer, P., Artemieva, I. M. & Mooney, W. D. Density of the continental roots: Compositional and thermal contributions. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **209**, 53–69 (2003).
- [28] Guerri, M., Cammarano, F. & Tackley, P. J. Modelling Earth's surface topography: decomposition of the static and dynamic components.
   *Phys. Earth Planet. Int.* 261, 172–186 (2016).
- [29] Ricard, Y., Richards, M. A., Lithgow-Bertelloni, C. & LeStunff, Y. A geodynamic model of mantle mass heterogeneities. J. Geophys. Res. 98, 21895–21909 (1993).
- [30] Steinberger, B. Effects of latent heat release at phase boundaries on the flow in the Earth's mantle, phase boundary topography and the dynamic topography at the Earth's surface. *Phys. Earth Planet. Int.* **164** (2007).
- [31] Conrad, C. & Husson, L. Influence of dynamic topography on sea level and its rate of change. Lithosphere 1, 110–120 (2009).
- [32] Yang, T. & Gurnis, M. Dynamic topography, gravity and the role of lateral viscosity variations from inversion of global mantle flow.
   271 Geophys. J. Int. 207, 1186–1201 (2016).
- [33] Rubey, M. et al. Global patterns in Earth's dynamic topography since the Jurassic: the role of subducted slabs. Solid Earth 8, 899–919 (2017).
- [34] Colli, L., Ghelichkhan, S., Bunge, H.-P. & Oeser, J. Retrodictions of Mid Paleogene mantle flow and dynamic topography in the Atlantic
   region from compressible high resolution adjoint mantle convection models: Sensitivity to deep mantle viscosity and tomographic input
   model. Gondwana Res. 53, 252–272 (2018).
- [35] Eakin, C. & Lithgow-Bertelloni, C. An overview of dynamic topography: The influence of mantle circulation on surface topography and landscape. *Mountains, Climate and biodiversity* 37 (2018).
- [36] Molnar, P., England, P. C. & Jones, C. H. Mantle dynamics, isostasy, and the support of high terrain. J. Geophys. Res. 120, 1932–1957 (2015).
- [37] Crosby, A. G. & McKenzie, D. An analysis of young ocean depth, gravity and global residual topography. *Geophys. J. Int.* 178, 1198–1219 (2009).
- [38] Hager, B. H. Subducted slabs and the geoid: Constraints on mantle rheology and flow. J. Geophys. Res. 89, 6003–6015 (1984).
- [39] Steinberger, B. Topography caused by mantle density variations: observation-based estimates and models derived from tomography and
   lithosphere thickness. *Geophys. J. Int.* 205, 604–621 (2016).
- [40] Laske, G., Masters, G., Ma, Z. & Pasyanos, M. Update on CRUST1.0 A 1-degree Global Model of Earths Crust. Geophysical Research Abstracts Abstract EGU2013–2658 (2013).
- [41] Hoggard, M. J., Winterbourne, J., Czarnota, K. & White, N. Oceanic residual depth measurements, the plate cooling model, and global dynamic topography. J. Geophys. Res. 122, 2328–2372 (2017).
- [42] Spasojevic, S. & Gurnis, M. Sea level and vertical motion of continents from dynamic Earth models since the Late Cretaceous. Am. Assoc. Petrol. Geol. Bulletin 10, 2037–2064 (2012).
- [43] Valentine, A. P. & Sambridge, M. Optimal regularisation for a class of linear inverse problem. Geophys. J. Int. 215, 1003–1021 (2018).
- [44] Yang, T., Moresi, L., Muller, R. D. & Gurnis, M. Oceanic residual topography agrees with mantle flow predictions at long wavelengths.
   *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 44, 10896–10906 (2017).
- [45] Watkins, C. E. & Conrad, C. P. Constraints on dynamic topography from asymmetric subsidence of the mid-ocean ridges. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 484, 264–275 (2018).
- [46] Arnould, M., Coltice, N., Flament, N., Seigneour, V. & Muller, R. D. On the scales of dynamic topography in whole-mantle convection
   models. Geochem. Geophys. Geosys. 19, 1–24 (2018).
- [47] Steinberger, B., Conrad, C. P., Osei Tutu, A. & Hoggard, M. J. On the amplitude of dynamic topography at spherical harmonic degree two. *Tectonophys.* In Press. (2019).
- [48] Tarantola, A. & Valette, B. Generalised non-linear inverse problems solved using the least squares criterion. *Rev. Geophys. Space Phys.* **20**, 219–232 (1982).
- <sup>303</sup> [49] MacKay, D. Bayesian interpolation. Neural. Comput. 4, 415–447 (1992).
- [50] Afonso, J. C., Salajegheh, F., Szwillus, W., Ebbing, J. & Gaina, C. A global reference model of the lithosphere and upper mantle from joint inversion and analysis of multiple data sets. *Geophys. J. Int.* 1602–1628 (2019).

### **306** Acknowledgments

- <sup>307</sup> We acknowledge support from the Australian Research Council, under grant numbers FT140101262, DP170100058 (both
- <sup>308</sup> DRD) and DE180100040 (APV). MJH acknowledges support from the National Aeronautics and Space Administration
- <sup>309</sup> grant NNX17AE17G. Numerical simulations were undertaken on the NCI National Facility in Canberra, Australia,
- <sup>310</sup> which is supported by the Australian Commonwealth Government. We thank two anonymous reviewers for careful and
- 311 constructive comments during the review process.

## **Author Contributions**

<sup>313</sup> DRD conceived this study, designed, setup and processed the geodynamical simulations and integrated all inter-<sup>314</sup> disciplinary components. APV developed the tools utilised for spherical harmonic analyses and supported with their <sup>315</sup> application and interpretation. SCK, CRW and DRD lead the development and validation of Fluidity. NR produced the <sup>316</sup> lithospheric thickness model, MJH provided the observational constraints on residual topography, whilst CME provided <sup>317</sup> insight on dynamic topography implications and comparisons across various datasets and models. DRD and APV wrote <sup>318</sup> the paper, following discussion with, and contributions from, all authors.

# **319** Author Information

320 The authors declare no competing financial interests.

# **Additional Information**

322 Supplementary information is available for this paper at:

- Reprints and permissions information is available at www.nature.com/reprints.
- <sup>324</sup> Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to DRD (Rhodri.Davies@anu.edu.au).

### 325 Methods

Global Mantle Flow Simulations – Approach & Limitations: We focus on two end-member simulations of global mantle flow. In the first, lateral variations in density and viscosity are ignored in the uppermost mantle (above 300 km depth), thus allowing us to quantify the first-order topographic expression of deeper mantle flow. In the second, we account for the effects of shallow mantle flow and its interaction with the lithosphere, by incorporating variations in density and temperature (and the associated variations in viscosity) for the entire convecting mantle and lithosphere.

We solve the equations governing instantaneous mantle convection (i.e. the present-day flow-field is computed in the 331 context of prescribed density and rheological variations) inside a spherical shell, using a modified version of Fluidity 332 [51, 52, 53, 54], recently validated against a range of analytical solutions and benchmarked against published results 333 from alternative spherical shell mantle convection codes [55, 56, 57]. In our simulations, the inner radius corresponds to 334 the core-mantle-boundary (CMB) and the outer radius to Earth's surface. Free-slip mechanical boundary conditions are 335 specified at each boundary. Consistent with a number of previous models [8, 39, 47], we assume incompressibility and 336 the Boussinesq approximation, with phase transitions neglected. Models employ a fixed icosahedral mesh with a lateral 337 resolution of  $\sim 50$  km at the surface. This is extruded in the radial direction, with radial spacing increasing linearly 338 from 10 km at the surface to 100 km at the CMB. 339

In our first model, density anomalies below 300 km depth are derived from the shear-wave tomography model 340 S40RTS [58], using the conversion factor  $d \ln \rho / d \ln V_S = 0.2$ . Density variations above this depth are neglected. This 341 model includes a simple depth-dependent viscosity, with 5 layers, as illustrated in Supplementary Fig. 8(a). Dynamic 342 topography is computed from radial stresses,  $\tau_{rr}$ , at the surface via:  $h = \tau_{rr}/(\Delta \rho_{\text{ext}} \cdot g)$ , where  $\Delta \rho_{\text{ext}}$  is the density 343 contrast between uppermost mantle density and air (continents: 3300 kg m<sup>-3</sup>) or water (oceans: 2300 kg m<sup>-3</sup>), and g34  $(9.81 \text{ m s}^{-2})$  is the gravitational acceleration (continents are defined as regions where the age-grid of [59] is undefined). 345 The surface topography computed from this model is therefore a direct manifestation of flow related normal stresses 346 (i.e. it is solely dynamic in origin). As illustrated in Fig. 1(c), topographic predictions share many characteristics with 347 several published predictive models [30, 31, 42, 8, 33]. 348

In our second model, we account for the first-order effects of lithospheric thickness, which allows us to approximate 349 density anomalies above 300 km depth, leading to more complete computations of mantle flow and the associated surface 350 topography. Lithospheric thickness is estimated using the method first described in [60], in which the depth-averaged 351 velocity in the upper mantle (to a depth of 350 km) is assumed to be proportional to lithospheric thickness. In this 352 case, the upper mantle Sv model SL2013sv [61] is used as input, with the resulting estimate of lithospheric thickness 353 illustrated in Supplementary Fig. 6. Our method reproduces the first-order characteristics of other global lithospheric 354 thickness models [62, 50], predicting that the lithosphere is generally thin beneath young oceans and thicker beneath 355 older oceans and continents. Within the oceans, there is a general trend of increasing lithospheric thickness with age. 356 Within the continents, cratonic regions generally have thicknesses of 250-300 km, with thinner regions found near areas 357 of recent or ongoing subduction or rifting (e.g. western USA and eastern Asia, northeastern Africa). We note that 358

lithospheric thickness models derived from SL2013sv have already been successfully applied in global models [39] and
regional studies of the North American lithosphere [63].

The conversion of seismic velocity to density inside the lithosphere is complicated by contrasting thermal and chemical 361 effects. We take a simple approach, first prescribing a thermal structure within the lithosphere, based upon an error 362 function temperature profile that corresponds to the lithospheric thickness model (assuming a thermal diffusivity,  $\kappa =$ 363  $7.5 \times 10^{-7}$  m<sup>2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>). Temperatures are subsequently converted to density using a linearised equation of state:  $\rho =$ 364  $\rho_0(1 - \alpha \Delta T)$ , where  $\rho_0 = 3300 \text{ kg m}^{-3}$  and  $\alpha = 2.5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ K}^{-1}$ . Continental roots are seismically fast, but are 365 likely neutrally buoyant [64, 65]. Accordingly, we follow the approach of [66] and set density anomalies of the mantle's 366 upper 300 km smoothly to zero beneath continental regions, defined as those regions where  $d \ln V_S > 4\%$  at 100 km 367 depth in the SL2013sv model [61]. Masking out continental roots introduces a compositional anomaly, c, which is unity 368 everywhere below 300 km and tends toward zero inside old continental regions. Sub-lithospheric density anomalies are 369 derived from S40RTS [58], consistent with our first model. Sub-lithospheric temperatures are also derived directly from 370 tomography [58], using the conversion factor  $\Delta T/d \ln V_S = -80 \text{ K}/\%$ . For this model, we assume a temperature- and 371 depth-dependent viscosity, following the relation:  $\mu_r \cdot \exp[E(0.5 - T^*)]$ , where  $T^*$  is the non-dimensional temperature, 372 E = 18.42, whilst  $\mu_r$  varies with depth and is set to ensure a mean viscosity consistent with the first model. Resulting 373 viscosities are displayed in Supplementary Fig. 8(b). 374

The inclusion of shallow structure, via a lithospheric thickness estimate, implies that the topography computed from 375 radial stresses at the surface incorporates subsidence of the ocean-floor. Accordingly, to allow for direct quantitative 376 comparisons with our residual topography dataset, the effect of ocean-floor subsidence is subtracted out using an identical 377 plate model and ocean-floor age grid. Where the age-grid is undefined (i.e. on continents) we follow [39] and assume 378 an age of 175 Myr, such that synthetic topography predictions display no dramatic steps across the continent-ocean 379 boundary. Resulting topographies are subsequently adjusted to ensure a global mean of zero. We note that the resultant 380 synthetic topography prediction incorporates the effects of non-age-dependent lithospheric thickness variations, as is the 381 case for the observational constraints, the significance of which is examined in the main text. As illustrated in Fig. 1(d). 382 topographic predictions from the second model closely resemble those of [39], who also incorporate shallow mantle and 383 lithospheric structure. 384

Whilst this paper focuses on the aforementioned cases, we have analysed a series of simulations, with systemati-385 cally increasing complexity. The starting point is the first model above, which neglects all (density and rheological) 386 heterogeneity above 300 km depth. To this, we have added lateral (temperature- and pressure-dependent) variations 38 in viscosity throughout the computational domain. The resulting topographic field is illustrated in Supplementary 388 Fig. 9(c), with the difference to the starting model highlighted in Supplementary Fig. 9(d). Spectral decomposition 389 of both models (Supplementary Fig. 9b, red lines) yields similar results, suggesting that topographic predictions are 390 only weakly sensitive to lateral variations in viscosity within the convecting mantle and lithosphere. We note that this 301 result is at odds with [67], the reasons for which require further investigation. In Supplementary Fig. 9(f), we illustrate 392

the difference between this model and a model where we incorporate shallow density heterogeneity based upon our 393 global estimate of lithospheric thickness (Supplementary Fig. 9e). The difference field closely resembles the full model 394 (Supplementary Fig. 9e), demonstrating the dominant role of shallow structure in generating topography, as expected 395 from the sensitivity kernels that illustrate how effective density anomalies at different depths and spherical harmonic 396 degrees are at creating topography [38, 5, 11, 39]. In Supplementary Fig. 9(g), we explore the effect of a different surface 397 velocity boundary condition, prescribing present-day plate velocities from the dataset of [68]. As noted by [39], this 398 change has an important effect at long wavelengths (increasing spectral power marginally at l < 5), causing a decrease in 399 topography beneath mid-ocean ridges, particularly at fast spreading centres (e.g. the East Pacific rise) and an increase 400 in topography within the Western and Central Pacific. It remains unclear whether prescribed or free-slip boundary 401 conditions are the most suitable for simulations of this nature: if plate motions are prescribed but are inconsistent with 402 the forces acting on these plates, the computed topography may be inappropriate, hence our decision to focus on the 403 simulation with free-slip boundary conditions herein. 404

We emphasise that fine details of the predicted topography in our simulations and their associated power spectra 405 are sensitive to several model parameters. These include: (i) the depth- and lateral-dependence of mantle viscosity, 406 which remain poorly constrained [69, 70, 71, 72], and may influence both coupling between upper and lower mantle and 407 the transmission of stress across the asthenosphere to the lithosphere; (ii) the seismic tomography model used as basis 408 for defining the mantle's density and thermal structure – although tomographic models now show broad similarity in 409 the distribution of heterogeneity at a large-scale [73], they differ in amplitude and in the distribution of smaller-scale 410 heterogeneity; (iii) our approach for converting seismic velocity to density and temperature, noting that the constant 411 conversion factor used does not account for the non-linear sensitivity of seismic velocity to pressure, temperature. 412 composition and phase [74, 75, 76, 77, 78, 79]; and (iv) the lithospheric thickness estimate utilised, variations to which 413 will modify how mantle flow interacts with shallow structure [39, 62]. Nonetheless, our models are based upon a 414 reasonable set of parameters that allow us to illustrate the likely roles of shallow and deep mantle flow in generating 415 Earth's surface response: our raw numerical predictions are generally consistent with time-dependent and instantaneous 416 flow models from published studies [8, 39] as they have been executed in a similar parameter space. With our current 417 understanding of the uncertainties surrounding these parameters and the associated sensitivities [30, 39, 47], it appears 418 unlikely that our conclusions would be modified substantially. However, we acknowledge that this should be explored, in 419 detail, in the future, in both time-dependent models of mantle flow that exploit, for example, time-integrated histories 420 of Phanerozoic plate subduction [8] and present-day tomographic constraints [42, 34], and instantaneous flow models 421 that better-account for tomographic and mineral physics uncertainties. 422

Extraction of Dynamic (Flow-Related) Component from Synthetic Residual Topography Field: The definition of dynamic topography excludes topography isostatically supported through crustal thickness variations. However, it is less clear whether or not topography supported by density anomalies within the mantle lithosphere, or lithospheric thickness variations, should be included [9, 41, 39, 35]. Both the observational constraints on residual topography and the

synthetic residual topography estimates utilised herein (for the model with shallow structure) incorporate topographic 427 contributions arising from lithospheric thickness and density variations (i.e. deviations from a plate cooling model) as 428 well as present-day mantle flow (i.e. dynamic topography directly due to normal stresses imposed by underlying mantle 429 flow). It is of interest to isolate the dynamic (flow-related) component in our synthetic residual topography field, in an 430 attempt to better understand this partitioning on Earth. To do so, we take the following steps: (i) assuming that litho-431 spheric thickness variations are thermal in origin, we invert our lithospheric thickness model for a map of lithospheric 432 age, based upon the half-space cooling approximation (noting that continental regions are assigned a constant age of 175 433 Myr); (ii) under the assumption that lithospheric thickness variations make an isostatic contribution towards residual 434 topography, we subtract point-wise estimates of subsidence based upon this lithospheric age map and the following 435 relationship between age and depth: d = 2.6 + 0.25 (age)<sup>1/2</sup> (with age in Myr), with the resulting global topography 436 field adjusted to ensure a mean of zero. This differs to subtracting an ocean-floor-age-dependent plate model from 437 our topographic prediction, and yields an approximation to the flow-related component of topography, illustrated in 438 Supplementary Fig. 7. The associated spherical harmonic spectral decomposition (carried out solely within the oceanic 439 realm at the locations of spot and ship-track observational constraints) is displayed in Fig. 3 of the main manuscript. 440

Computation of Power Spectra and Uncertainties: Our approach is based on that set out in [9]. We assume that the topographic signal can be represented in terms of a spherical harmonic expansion up to degree  $l_{\text{max}}$ , omitting the spherically-symmetric (degree-0) term. We therefore write  $f(\theta, \phi) = \sum_{l=1}^{l_{\text{max}}} \sum_{m=-l}^{l} c_{lm} \mathcal{Y}_{lm}(\theta, \phi)$ , where  $\mathcal{Y}_{lm}$  is a real surface spherical harmonic as defined in Section B.6 of [80]; note that these are normalised to have unit power. We then perform a regularised least-squares inversion to recover the  $[(l_{\text{max}} + 1)^2 - 1]$  coefficients of this expansion. In all cases, we invert for a model up to maximum spherical harmonic degree  $l_{\text{max}} = 50$ , but plot results only up to l = 30. In doing so, we aim to minimise effects arising from spectral leakage [81].

We follow [48], and note that least-squares inversion can be framed as a Bayesian inference procedure. We use **m** 448 to denote a vector containing all the coefficients  $c_{lm}$ . Our prior probability distribution for m—that is, our state of 449 knowledge before seeing any data—has Gaussian form, with zero mean, and is characterised by a prior model covariance 450 matrix  $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{m}}$ . Our vector of observations,  $\mathbf{d}$ , is assumed to be subject to random noise described by a zero-mean Gaussian 451 with covariance matrix  $C_d$ . For this study, we assume that the noise has no spatial correlations, so that the covariance 452 matrix has non-zero elements only on the leading diagonal; we base these on the uncertainty estimates reported by [9] 453 (including in cases where the 'data' being inverted are the output of a numerical simulation). Given these assumptions, 454 the information obtained from the observations leads us to a posterior probability distribution of Gaussian form centred 455 on  $\mathbf{m} = \left(\mathbf{A}^{T}\mathbf{C}_{d}^{-1}\mathbf{A} + \mathbf{C}_{m}^{-1}\right)^{-1}\mathbf{A}^{T}\mathbf{C}_{d}^{-1}\mathbf{d}$ , with covariance matrix  $\left(\mathbf{A}^{T}\mathbf{C}_{d}^{-1}\mathbf{A} + \mathbf{C}_{m}^{-1}\right)^{-1}$ . The matrix  $\mathbf{A}$  here is defined 456 such that  $[\mathbf{A}]_{ij} = \mathcal{Y}_{l_j m_j}(\theta_i, \phi_i)$ , where  $(\theta_i, \phi_i)$  represents the location associated with the *i*-th element of **d**, and where 457  $l_i$  and  $m_j$  denote the degree and order of the spherical harmonic coefficient represented by the j-th element of **m**. The 458 power at degree l is then defined as  $P_l = \sum_{m=-l}^{l} c_{lm}^2$ ; this is the quantity we plot when we show spectra. 459

To complete the specification of our inversion procedure, it is necessary to define  $C_m$ . Our approach here builds on

[43], and a full discussion of the issues surrounding regularisation can be found in that study. We employ two different 461 forms of model covariance matrix in this paper. The first is as used in [9], and is most conveniently specified by stating 462 a parametric form for the inverse covariance matrix,  $\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{m}}^{-1} = \alpha^2 \mathbf{I} + \beta^2 \mathbf{H}$ , where  $\alpha$  (overall power term) and  $\beta$  (gradient 463 term) are tuneable hyperparameters, **I** is an identity matrix, and where  $[\mathbf{H}]_{ij} = l_i(l_i+1)\delta_{ij}$ . As described in [9], this **H** 464 penalises steep gradients in the recovered field. We refer to this form of covariance matrix as 'Tikhonov-style'. Results 465 from inversions of this nature are described in the Supplement. The second form of regularisation employed, which 466 we refer to as Automatic Relevance Determination (ARD) following [49], amounts to choosing  $[\mathbf{C}_{\mathbf{m}}^{-1}]_{ii} = \xi_{l_i} \delta_{ij}$ , with 467  $l_{\text{max}}$  tuneable hyperparameters  $\xi_i$ . Thus, all spherical harmonics of a given degree (i.e. all m for fixed l) are treated 468 identically, but no relationships are enforced between separate degrees. In both cases, a hierarchical Bayesian approach 469 described fully in [43] allows us to assess the probability that any particular choice of hyperparameters is consistent 470 with the data; we can then identify the most-probable hyperparameters to use in inversion. Results utilising this form 471 of inversion, using point-wise and ship-track locations, are included in the main manuscript. 472

The posterior distribution provides insight into the extent to which the coefficients  $c_{lm}$  are constrained by the data. 473 While the posterior distribution on coefficients has Gaussian form, the power spectrum depends on the squared coeffi-474 cients, and its posterior follows a generalized- $\chi^2$  (i.e., non-Gaussian) distribution. This has a number of counter-intuitive 475 features, including the fact that the most-probable spectrum for a given dataset is not necessarily similar to the spectrum 476 obtained from the most-probable set of coefficients. To provide a readily-understood quantification of uncertainty on 477 spectra produced using Tikhonov-style regularisation, we: (i) generate 1,000 representative hyperparameter pairs ( $\alpha, \beta$ ) 478 by sampling the hyperparameter probability distribution as described in [43]; (ii) perform an inversion of the dataset for 479 each hyperparameter pair, to obtain a posterior Gaussian distribution for each; (iii) generate 100,000 random samples 480 from each of these posterior distributions; (iv) convert each of these to a power spectrum; and (v) for each spherical 481 harmonic degree, show the ranges spanned by the central 99% of the full set of samples, and the central 50% (i.e. the 482 inter-quartile range). Steps (i) and (ii) ensure that our error bars take regularisation uncertainty into account. For ARD 483 regularisation, we perform a similar process, except that we approximate the hyperparameter probability distribution 484 using a multidimensional Gaussian with covariance inferred from the curvature of the true distribution at its peak (as 485 discussed in [43]). This avoids practical difficulties associated with sampling an arbitrary multidimensional distribution. 486

#### 487 References

[51] Davies, D. R., Wilson, C. R. & Kramer, S. C. Fluidity: a fully unstructured anisotropic adaptive mesh computational modelling framework for geodynamics. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosys.* **120**, Q06001 (2011).

[52] Kramer, S. C., Wilson, C. R. & Davies, D. R. An implicit free-surface algorithm for geodynamical simulations. *Phys. Earth Planet. Int.* **194**, 25–37 (2012).

- 492 [53] Davies, D. R. & Rawlinson, N. On the origin of recent intra-plate volcanism in Australia. Geology 42, 1031–1034 (2014).
- [54] Davies, D. R., Le Voci, G., Goes, S., Kramer, S. C. & Wilson, C. R. The mantle wedge's transient 3-D flow regime and thermal structure.
   *Geochem. Geophys. Geosys.* 17, 78–100 (2016).
- [55] Zhong, S., McNamara, A., Tan, E., Moresi, L. & Gurnis, M. A benchmark study on mantle convection in a 3-D spherical shell using
   CitcomS. Geochem. Geophys. Geosys. 9, Q10017 (2008).
- <sup>497</sup> [56] Tackley, P. J. Modelling compressible mantle convection with large viscosity contrasts in a three-dimensional spherical shell using the
   <sup>498</sup> Yin-Yang grid. *Phys. Earth Planet. Int.* **171**, 7–18 (2008).
- <sup>499</sup> [57] Davies, D. R. *et al.* A hierarchical mesh refinement technique for global 3D spherical mantle convection modelling. *Geosci. Mod. Dev.* <sup>500</sup> **6**, 1095–1107 (2013).

- [58] Ritsema, J., van Heijst, H. J., Deuss, A. & Woodhouse, J. H. S40RTS: a Degree-40 shear velocity model for the mantle from new Rayleigh wave dispersion, teleseismic traveltimes, and normal-mode splitting function measurements. *Geophys. J. Int.* 184, 1223-1236 (2011).
- [59] Richards, F. D., Hoggard, M. J., Cowton, L. R. & White, N. J. Reassessing the thermal structure of oceanic lithosphere with revised global inventories of basement depths and heat flow measurements. J. Geophys. Res. 123, 9136–9161 (2018).
- [60] Davies, D. R., Rawlinson, N., Iaffaldano, G. & Campbell, I. H. Lithospheric controls on magma composition along Earth's longest continental hotspot track. *Nature* 525, 511–514 (2015).
- [61] Schaeffer, A. J. & Lebedev, S. Global shear speed structure of the upper mantle and transition zone. *Geophys. J. Int.* **194**, 417–449 (2013).
- [62] Steinberger, B. & Becker, T. W. A comparison of lithospheric thickness models. *Tectonophysics* **746**, 325–338 (2018).
- [63] Kaban, M. K., Tesauro, M., Mooney, W. D. & Cloetingh, S. A. P. L. Density, temperature, and composition of the north american lithospherenew insights from a joint analysis of seismic, gravity, and mineral physics data: 1. density structure of the crust and upper mantle. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.* 15, 4781–4807 (2014).
- <sup>514</sup> [64] Jordan, T. H. Composition and development of the continental tectosphere. *Nature* **274**, 544–548 (1978).
- [65] Griffin, W. L., O'Reilly, S. Y., Afonso, J. C. & Begg, G. C. The composition and evolution of lithospheric mantle: a re-evaluation and its tectonic implications. J. Petrology 50, 1185–1204 (2009).
- [66] Becker, T. W. On the effect of temperature and strain-rate dependent viscosity on global mantle flow, net rotation and plate-driving forces. *Geophys. J. Int.* 167, 943–957 (2006).
- [67] Osei Tutu, A., Steinberger, B., Sobolev, S. V., Rogozhina, I. & Popov, A. A. Effects of upper mantle heterogeneities on the lithospheric stress field and dynamic topography. Solid Earth 9, 649–668 (2018).
- [68] Muller, R. D. et al. Ocean Basin Evolution and Global-Scale Plate Reorganization Events Since Pangea Breakup. Ann. Rev. Earth
   Planet. Sci. 44, 107–138 (2016).
- [69] Rudolph, M. L., Lekik, V. & Lithgow-Bertelloni, C. Viscosity jump in Earth's mid-mantle. Science 350, 1349–1352 (2015).
- [70] Marquardt, H. & Miyagi, L. Slab stagnation in the shallow lower mantle linked to an increase in mantle viscosity. Nat. Geo. 8, 311–314 (2015).
- [71] Lau, H. C. P. et al. Tital tomography constrains Earth's deep-mantle buoyancy. Nature 551, 321–326 (2017).
- [72] Ballmer, M. D., Houser, C., Hernlund, J. W., Wentzcovitch, R. & Hirose, K. Persistence of strong silica-enriched domains in the Earth's lower mantle. Nat. Geo. 10, 236–241 (2017).
- [73] Lekic, V., Cottaar, S., Dziewonski, A. & Romanowicz, B. Cluster analysis of global lower mantle tomography: A new class of structure and implications for chemical heterogeneity. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **357**, 68–77 (2011).
- [74] Cammarano, F., Goes, S., Vacher, P. & Giardini, D. Inferring upper-mantle temperatures from seismic velocities. *Phys. Earth Planet. Int.* 138, 197–222 (2003).
- [75] Goes, S., Cammarano, F. & Hansen, U. Synthetic seismic signature of thermal mantle plumes. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 218, 403–419 (2004).
- [76] Stixrude, L. & Lithgow-Bertelloni, C. Thermodynamics of mantle minerals I. Physical properties. *Geophys. J. Int.* 162, 610–632 (2005).
- [77] Stixrude, L. & Lithgow-Bertelloni, C. Thermodynamics of mantle minerals II. Phase Equilibria. Geophys. J. Int. 184, 1180–1213 (2011).
- [78] Styles, E., Davies, D. R. & Goes, S. Mapping spherical seismic into physical structure: biases from 3-D phase-transition and thermal boundary-layer heterogeneity. *Geophys. J. Int.* 184, 1371–1378 (2011).
- [79] Davies, D. R. *et al.* Reconciling dynamic and seismic models of Earth's lower mantle: the dominant role of thermal heterogeneity. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **353–354**, 253–269 (2012).
- 543 [80] Dahlen, F. A. & Tromp, J. Theoretical Global Seismology (Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1998).
- [81] Trampert, J. & Snieder, R. Model estimations biased by truncated expansions: Possible artifacts in seismic tomography. Science 271, 1257–1260 (1996).

## 546 Data Availability

- 547 The compilation of observational constraints on residual topography utilised herein, which builds on the database and
- methodology of [41], is available at https://github.com/drhodrid/Davies\_etal\_NGeo\_2019\_Datasets. Synthetic topogra-
- <sup>549</sup> phy predictions from our geodynamical simulations are also included.

## 550 Code Availability

- <sup>551</sup> Fluidity is available under the GNU Lesser General Public License (LGPL). The source code and manual can be found at:
- <sup>552</sup> http://fluidityproject.org. The optimal regularisation routines utilised for our spherical harmonic analyses are available
- <sup>553</sup> from: https://github.com/valentineap/optimal-regularisation.

(a) Time-dependent simulation: from ref. 8

(b) Inferred residual topography: from ref. 9



- (c) Instantaneous-flow simulation: no shallow structure
- (d) Instantaneous-flow simulation: with shallow structure



and the second second



(e) Power spectra (previous studies)

(f) Unregularized power spectra (this study)







