

# An initial comparison of the thermal anomaly detection products of MODIS and VIIRS in their observation of Indonesian volcanic activity

Blackett, M.

Author post-print (accepted) deposited by Coventry University's Repository

**Original citation & hyperlink:** 

Blackett, M. (2015) An initial comparison of the thermal anomaly detection products of MODIS and VIIRS in their observation of Indonesian volcanic activity. Remote Sensing of Environment, volume 171 : 75-82 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2015.10.002

DOI 10.1016/j.rse.2015.10.002 ISSN 0034-4257 ESSN 1879-0704

Publisher: Elsevier

NOTICE: this is the author's version of a work that was accepted for publication in Remote Sensing of Environment. Changes resulting from the publishing process, such as peer review, editing, corrections, structural formatting, and other quality control mechanisms may not be reflected in this document. Changes may have been made to this work since it was submitted for publication. A definitive version was subsequently published in Remote Sensing of Environment, [VOL 171, (2015)] DOI: 10.1016/j.rse.2015.10.002

© 2015, Elsevier. Licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International <u>http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/</u>

Copyright © and Moral Rights are retained by the author(s) and/ or other copyright owners. A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge. This item cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the copyright holder(s). The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

This document is the author's post-print version, incorporating any revisions agreed during the peer-review process. Some differences between the published version and this version may remain and you are advised to consult the published version if you wish to cite from it.

1 An initial comparison of the thermal anomaly detection products of MODIS and VIIRS in their

- 2 observation of Indonesian volcanic activity
- 3

4 Matthew Blackett, <u>m.blackett@coventry.ac.uk</u>

5 Centre for Disaster Management and Hazards Research, Coventry University, Coventry, CV1 5FB.

6

7 Abstract

8 The Suomi National Polar-orbiting Partnership satellite was launched in 2011. On-board this satellite 9 is the Visible Infrared Imaging Radiometer Suite (VIIRS) with thermal infrared detection capabilities 10 similar those of the earlier Moderate-Resolution Imaging Spectroradiometer (MODIS) sensors of the National Aeronautics and Space Administration Earth Observation System. Fire detection products 11 12 have been developed using the thermal infrared data for both VIIRS and MODIS and, although having 13 the observation of fire as their main objective, such products are also sensitive to the radiant 14 emissions of active volcanic surfaces, but a comparison of their capabilities in this regard remains 15 outstanding. Here, this comparison is conducted, with a focus on the volcanoes of Indonesia, and 16 findings are initially promising, suggesting that the VIIRS fire detection capability is an improvement 17 over that of its predecessor. For example, between 3 April 2012 and 14 July 2014, volcanic activity 18 was detected on 519 days by the VIIRS product, as compared with 308 days for the MODIS-Aqua 19 product (MYD14). Causes of this apparent enhanced sensitivity are explored and, with the 20 examination of additional data from the MODIS-Terra product and the MODVOLC system, are shown 21 to be the combined influence of spatial resolution, data processing steps, imaging scan width and the 22 fire product algorithm used. As greater quantities of data become available, a more comprehensive 23 comparison of these observations will be possible and will be undertaken at a global scale.

24

## 25 Introduction

In October 2011 the Suomi National Polar-orbiting Partnership (S-NPP) satellite was launched. It was to be an introductory, data collecting satellite for the National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA) and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), as part of their Joint Polar Satellite System (JPSS) Mission. With five sensing instruments, including the Visible Infrared Imaging

30 Radiometer Suite (VIIRS), S-NPP was to provide a continuation in the environmental satellite data 31 record. This record commenced in the late 1970s with NOAA's Advanced Very High Resolution 32 Radiometer (AVHRR) satellites and was most recently added to in 1999 and 2001 by NASA's 33 Moderate-Resolution Imaging Spectroradiometer (MODIS) on-board the Terra and Agua spacecraft 34 (Schroeder et al. 2014). These sensors each possess infrared detection capabilities which have been 35 harnessed to identify terrestrial thermal anomalies. Although commonly used in observing the 36 characteristic thermal signatures of active fires, such data also have utility in the observation of active 37 volcanic surfaces, and this has been utilised in various applications (e.g. Harris et al. 1998, Wright and 38 Flynn, 2003; Webley et al. 2008, Blackett, 2014). For MODIS, a fire detection algorithm has been 39 developed which utilises its infrared data to produce the Thermal Anomaly/Fire products: MOD14 (for 40 MODIS Terra) and MYD14 (for MODIS Aqua) (Justice et al. 2002, 2006; Giglio et al. 2003). An Active 41 Fire Product (AFP) has also been developed for infrared VIIRS data and using this, and the 42 MOD14/MYD14 algorithm, it also identifies active fires and, as such, any terrestrial thermal 43 anomalies, including those of volcanic origin (Justice et al. 2013; Csiszar et al. 2014).

44

## 45 Volcanic context

46 Given the huge utility of fire detection products for hazard management agencies on the ground, both 47 MODIS and VIIRS have been compared in terms of their observation of active fires, and initial 48 comparisons have shown consistency in near coincident data, even at varying view angles (e.g. Justice 49 et al. 2013; Csiszar et al., 2014; Schroeder et al. 2014). However, given the higher nominal spatial 50 resolution of the VIIRS, and its enhanced scanning and sampling techniques, a higher sensitivity to 51 thermal anomalies would be expected and indeed, has been confirmed for fires (Csiszar et al. 2014; 52 Schroeder et al. 2014). What is absent in the literature however, is a comparison of the volcanic 53 observational capabilities of the MODIS and VIIRS thermal anomaly products, and that is what this 54 paper seeks to undertake. The chief differences between observing active volcanic surfaces, as 55 compared with fires, are that: 1) the temperature ranges are likely to be higher (with both fresh and 56 cold, or cooling, lava present), 2) the heat sources are likely to be more pervasive and, 3) there is 57 likely to be a greater temperature contrast between hot surfaces and surrounding non-volcanic, high-58 altitude surfaces.

60 The comparison conducted here focuses on observations of the volcanoes of Indonesia. This 61 archipelago consists of 78 historically active volcanoes which formed as a result of subduction along 62 the Sunda Arch (Smithsonian Institution 2013). Since the launch of the S-NPP satellite in October 63 2011, many Indonesia's volcanoes have been particularly active (see Figure 1). In 2012, Mount 64 Semeru erupted and generated multiple pyroclastic flows that warranted a ban on visitors, and 65 Mount Soputan emitted an ash plume that extended 9000 m into the atmosphere (CVGHM, 2012; 66 Darwen VAAC, 2012). Mount Paluweh commenced a period of prolonged activity in early 2013, killing 67 six and forcing evacuations throughout the year and later, in the same year, the eruption of Mount 68 Sinabung forced flight cancellations and the evacuation of 17,000 people (Jakarta Post, 2013; 69 International Business Times, 2013). In 2014, Mounts Kelud and Sinabung erupted, killing tens of 70 people and forcing the rerouting and cancellation of flights (National Geographic 2014; Jakarta Post, 71 2014); Mount Sangeang Api also erupted, displacing thousands and forcing flight diversions (The 72 Guardian, 2014). The extreme vulnerability of Indonesia to the volcanic hazard is reflected by the fact 73 that two-thirds of the global population exposed to the volcanic hazard are concentrated in Indonesia 74 (UNISDR, 2015).

75

## 76 Sensors and algorithms

77 The MODIS instruments possess mid- and thermal-infrared bands with a spatial resolution of 1 km at 78 nadir, a swath width of 2330 km and a twice-daily repeat period (Table 1 shows the bands of MODIS). 79 The MODIS Thermal Anomaly/Fire products (MOD14 and MYD14) extract pixels that display the 80 characteristics of thermal anomalies at the surface. These characteristics are based on data from 81 bands 21 or 22 (3.929–3.989 µm), band 31 (10.780–11.280 µm) and the application of a fire detection 82 algorithm initially developed by Justice et al. (2002) and enhanced by Giglio et al. (2003). The 83 algorithm applies background and contextual threshold tests to identify those pixels representing 84 potential thermal anomalies, although the precise algorithm differs marginally between day and 85 night-time applications. The rationale for this difference is that all objects of ambient temperature 86 (including the Earth's surface) emit detectable levels of infrared radiation, even in the absence of 87 solar heating and sunlight. Planck's Law however, determines that emissions from ambient objects will be greater in the thermal infrared (i.e. band 31) than in the mid-infrared (i.e. bands 21 and 22); the reverse will be true for hotter surfaces. These facts mean that the contrast between hot and ambient surfaces is lower in the daytime, thereby requiring stricter steps to differentiate them from the background. As such, an initial screen is applied in the algorithm whereby thermally anomalous pixels in daytime imagery are identified where the MIR brightness temperature exceeds 360 K, as compared with just 320 K in night-time imagery (Giglio et al. 2003; Justice et al. 2002; Schroeder et al. 2014).

95

The MODIS fire products are made available in the Hierarchical Data Format (HDF), with its Scientific Data Sets (SDS) listing, amongst other characteristics, the longitude and latitude of anomalous pixels, and the associated fire radiative power (FRP) (Giglio, 2010). The performance of the MODIS algorithm for observing thermal anomalies has regularly been validated by comparison with corresponding Advanced Space-borne Thermal Emission and Reflection Radiometer (ASTER) fire observations both in terms of anomaly detection (Giglio et al. 2003; Morisette et al. 2005; Csiszar et al. 2006) and emission quantification (Giglio et al. 2008).

103

104 The VIIRS was developed for cloud and Earth surface observations and initial calibration and 105 validation steps have shown it as performing very well, producing high-quality data comparable with 106 that of MODIS (Cao et al. 2013; Cao et al. 2014). It consists of a panchromatic day-night band and two 107 collections of other bands: five high resolution imagery (I) bands (of 375 m at nadir) and sixteen 108 moderate (M) resolution bands (of 750 m at nadir); the VIIRS bands are compared with each other, 109 and with those of MODIS, in Table 1. Each collection of bands has a 3040 km swath width, providing 110 twice daily global coverage. The I-bands cover the visible spectrum and also include medium and 111 longwave infrared bands. The M-bands cover approximately the same portion of the spectrum (with 112 some shorter wavelength bands) but also possess higher spectral resolution i.e. narrower bandwidths 113 and, with a better signal to noise ratio, are more appropriate for quantitative applications.

114

Table 1. The bands of MODIS and VIIRS, compared in terms of their spectral characteristics (\*dual gain
band; † low gain band). The bands outlined are those of relevance to this research.

MODIS			VIIRS							
		Spatial	Spatial resolution: 750 m Spatial resolution: 375 m Spatial resolution:							
Band	Spectral range (µm)	resolution (m)	Band	Spectral range (μm)	Band	Spectral range (μm)	Band	Spectral range (µm)		
8	0.405-0.420	1000	M1	0.402 - 0.422						
9	0.438 - 0.448	1000	M2	0.436 - 0.454						
3	0.459 - 0.479	500								
10	0.483 - 0.493	1000	МЗ	0.478 - 0.488						
11	0.526 - 0.536	1000			,					
12	0.546 - 0.556	1000	ма	0.545 - 0.565						
4	0.545 - 0.565	500								
1	0.620 - 0.670	250								
13	0.662 - 0.672	1000	M5	0.662 - 0.682	11	0.600 - 0.680	DNB	0.500 - 0.900		
14	0.673 - 0.683	1000	1015							
15	0.743 - 0.753	1000	M6	0.739 - 0.754						
2	0.841 - 0.876	250	M7	0.846 - 0.885	12	0.850 - 0.880				
16	0.862 - 0.877	1000								
17	0.890 - 0.920	1000								
19	0.915 - 0.965	1000								
18	0.931 - 0.941	1000			1					
5	1230 - 1250	500	M8	1.230 - 1.250						
26	1.360 - 1.390	1000	М9	1.371 - 1.386			1			
6	1628 - 1652	500	M10	1.580 - 1.640	I3	1.580 - 1.640				
7	2105 - 2155	500			1					
			M11	2.230 - 2.280						
20	3.660 - 3.840	1000	M12	3.610 - 3.790	14	3.550 - 3.930				
21†	3.929 - 3.989	1000								
22	3.929 - 3.989	1000	M13*	3.970 - 4.130						
23	4.020 - 4.080	1000								
24	4.433 - 4.498	1000			-					
25	4.482 - 4.549	1000								
27	6.535 - 6.895	1000								
28	7.175 - 7.475	1000			1					
29	8.400 - 8.700	1000	M14	8.400 - 8.700						
30	9.580 - 9.880	1000					1			
31	10.780 - 11.280	1000	M15	10.26 - 11.260	15	10.500 - 12.400				
32	11.770 - 12.270	1000	M16	11.540 - 12.490						
33	13.185 - 13.485	1000								
34	13.485 - 13.785	1000								
35	13.785 - 14.085	1000								
36	14.085 - 14.385	1000								

119 The AFP, which has been developed for the VIIRS, is categorised as an Application Related Product 120 (ARP). An ARP is produced by the S-NPP Ground System's Interface Data Processing Segment (IDPS) 121 which converts the Raw Data Records into geolocated calibrated measurements, or Sensor Data 122 Records (SDRs), and then into Environmental Data Records (EDRs) of geophysical parameters, of 123 which ARPs are a subcategory (Csiszar et al. 2014; Justice et al. 2013). Using the same algorithm as its 124 MODIS forerunner (although Collection 4, as opposed to the Collection 5 currently used in MODIS 125 data), it utilises the suite's mid-infrared and thermal infrared bands (M13: 3.970–4.130 µm and M15: 126 10.260–11.260 µm), to identify pixels representing thermal anomalies on the surface. Details of the 127 full algorithm, and its similarities and differences to the equivalent MODIS algorithm, are summarised 128 in the product's Operational Algorithm Description (JPSS, 2013). Data from M13 are particularly useful 129 for such studies given its high saturation temperature (634 K) when set in low-gain mode, whereas 130 those of M15 are suitable for characterising the background thermal conditions (although these have 131 the potential to saturate for moderate/large thermal anomalies). Similarly to the MODIS fire 132 algorithm, and with the aim of reducing false alarms, the precise algorithm applied in the daytime is 133 more stringent than the corresponding night-time product. At the current time, only the longitude 134 and latitude of those pixels identified as potential fires are listed within the associated HDF file of the 135 VIIRS AFP, thereby preventing complete comparison with the MODIS data products. However, by the 136 time the first JPSS satellite is launched in 2017, the product will be upgraded to a full Environmental 137 Data Record, with the requirement of a fire mask and FRP data; plans are also in place for updating 138 the algorithm used to the most up to date MODIS Collection 6 version (Csiszar et al. 2014; Schroeder 139 et al. 2014). To date, only one attempt at quantifying thermal emission data retrieved from VIIRS has 140 been made: the Nightfire algorithm (Elvidge et al. 2013). This examines VIIRS Sensor Data Records for 141 anomalies and quantifies the associated thermal emissions, in terms of megawatts, for comparison 142 with MODIS-derived FRP and, using it, a high correlation between MODIS derived FRP data, and VIIRS 143 thermal emissions, has been shown (Elvidge et al. 2013).

144

Despite the similarity in bands, one important difference in the processing steps between MODIS and
 VIIRS data is that, prior to being incorporated into a data product, different approaches are taken to

147 handle the 'bow-tie' effect. This effect is the pixel footprint enlargement and distortion that occurs 148 towards the ends of an image obtained by scanning radiometers such as MODIS and VIIRS. Not only 149 does the 'bow-tie' effect reduce the reliability of pixel comparisons (both within and between scenes) 150 but, by resulting in pixel enlargement towards the end of scan widths, the sensitivity of pixels, for 151 example to fires and thermal anomalies, also degrades towards the scan edge (Wolfe et al. 1998; Cao 152 et al. 2013). To reduce this effect in VIIRS data, a novel approach has been taken which incorporates 153 both the deletion of overlapping pixels, and aggregation of those remaining, based on their distance 154 from the nadir. This approach results in spatial resolutions that are more comparable (to within a factor of two, as opposed nearly five for MODIS), and pixels that approximate a square, across the 155 156 whole scan (Wolfe et al. 2013; Cao et al. 2014).

157

## 158 Methods

159 Using the Smithsonian Institution's Global Volcanism Program (GVP) database (available at: 160 http://www.volcano.si.edu/), all Indonesian volcanoes reported to have displayed activity since the 161 availability of the VIIRS AFP (3 April 2012) were identified. These volcanoes, 21 in total, are shown in 162 Figure 1 and all data encompassing elements of this region, for the period 3 April 2012 – 14 July 2014 163 (835 days and 6754 files), were downloaded from NOAA's Comprehensive Large Array-data 164 Stewardship System (CLASS, www.class.noaa.gov/). For comparison, MYD14 data for the same region 165 and period (6885 files) were downloaded from NASA's Earth Observing System Data and Information 166 System (Reverb, reverb.echo.nasa.gov/). Only MODIS Aqua data were used as its local overpass times 167 (~1.30am and ~1.30pm) are similar to those of S-NPP, thereby facilitating comparison (Csiszar et al. 168 2014). However, to assist in comparing the performance of the MODIS and VIIRS products, two other 169 datasets were also obtained: 1. MODIS Terra Thermal Anomaly/Fire Product data (MOD14) for the 170 same period and 2. Data from the MODVOLC volcanic detection system (Wright et al., 2004). With 171 regard to MOD14, the differing acquisition times (~10.30am and ~10.30pm), and the rapidly varying 172 nature of volcanic activity and atmospheric conditions, mean its data cannot be directly compared 173 with MYD14 or VIIRS data, but it is included to assist in identifying the causes of any MODIS-VIIRS 174 discrepancies. Data from the MODVOLC system, which uses both Aqua and Terra data, are similarly 175 included to assist in identifying the causes of any such discrepancies.



177

Figure 1. All Indonesian volcanoes recorded as displaying activity according to the GVP database, in
the period: April 2012 – 14 July 2014. Asterisks refer to volcanoes which displayed thermal anomalies
that were detected in either, or both, the MYD14 and VIIRS fire product files.

181

182 The geolocation accuracy of MODIS has been confirmed as around 50 m (Wolfe et al. 2002), and for 183 VIIRS it is comparable, at around 70 m nadir (Wolfe et al. 2013; Cao et al. 2014). Given these small 184 values, extracting data from the respective thermal anomaly product using the longitude and latitude 185 of each volcano will provide the corresponding pixel-level data. However, as thermally anomalous 186 volcanic phenomena may extend far from the crater of a specific volcano (e.g. via lava flow or 187 pyroclastic density current), all thermal anomalies recorded within ±0.02° longitude and latitude of 188 each volcano were identified and extracted to ensure no loss of volcanic signal, while also minimising 189 the possibility of including nearby non-volcanic thermal sources. The signals were organised into daily 190 observations and where there was more than one scene observing the surface on the same day, only 191 data from the scene with the highest summed per-pixel thermal anomaly emission (in the case of 192 MODIS data) or the greatest number of identified anomalous pixels (in the case of the VIIRS AFP and 193 MODVOLC) were considered, so as to avoid compounding the instantaneous daily sum value. To

determine the type of volcanic activity potentially responsible for the thermal signals noted, the GVPdatabase was queried for each detected anomaly.

196

197 Results

#### 198 Thermal anomaly detection

199 An initial comparison of the volcanic-observational capabilities of both the MODIS and VIIRS fire 200detection algorithms must consist of an examination of their thermal anomaly detection capabilities. 201 Of the 21 volcanoes reported within the GVP database as displaying volcanic activity during the period 202 in question, 15 exhibited thermal anomalies that were detected by either, or both, the MYD14 and 203 VIIRS fire product files (see Figure 1). In many cases, detected anomalies related directly to activity 204 reported in the GVP database, whereas in others, no activity was reported (see Figure 2 for this 205 comparison). Where thermal activity was detected but with no corresponding activity reports, it is 206 likely that either the activity had gone unobserved on the ground or that the thermal activity had a 207 source other than volcanism; conversely, where no thermal anomaly detections were made during 208periods of reported activity, it is likely that cloud, or volcanic emissions, obscured the surface from 209 view. These discrepancies between observations and recorded activity highlight the relative 210 sparseness of reported volcanic observations in the region which is largely a function of the 211 remoteness and inaccessibility of many of Indonesia's volcanoes.

212

213 In the absence of other truly quantitative data from the VIIRS product, comparison between the 214 MYD14 and VIIRS algorithms can only be extended by examining the presence or absence of 215 anomalies, and by counting the numbers of anomalous pixels identified. Throughout the period, the 216 VIIRS AFP detected 923 anomalous pixels, 62% more than MYD14, which detected 569. The VIIRS AFP 217 also detected anomalies on more days than MYD14 (519 versus 308) and of these days, 26% were 218 also identified as displaying anomalies by MYD14 while in reverse, of the daily MYD14 detections, 45% 219 were also identified by the VIIRS AFP. These data (displayed in Figure 2) suggest a superior detection 220 capability i.e. higher sensitivity to thermal anomalies, for the VIIRS AFP. The discrepancy in detections 221 between these products could be attributed to a number of factors discussed in due course, ranging

- from activity type and time of day of observation, to the characteristics of the sensors themselves and
- 223 how their shared algorithm functions.



Figure 2. Temporal comparison of GVP reported activity at the volcanoes detailed in Figure 1, with thermal anomalies at them, as detected by MYD14 and the VIIRS AFP, for a period of 835 days (1 April 2012 – 14 July 2014). The interval between minor tick marks on the x-axis is 28 days.

229

225

230 The detection capability of both sensors appears, to some extent, to be dependent on the volcano 231 being observed. At Sengeang for example, of 29 days of VIIRS AFP detections, 86% had corresponding 232 MYD14 detections and, of 30 days of MYD14 detections, 83% had corresponding VIIRS AFP 233 detections; at Paluweh, of 130 days of VIIRS AFP detections, 43% had corresponding MYD14 234 detections and of 81 days of MYD14 detections, 69% had corresponding VIIRS AFP detections. In 235 other cases however, the VIIRS AFP was shown as much more sensitive for example, at Sirung volcano 236 over the entire period, no MYD14 detections were made, as compared with 6 days of anomaly 237 detection for the VIIRS AFP. Extending this analysis to examine volcanic activity type, Table 2 compares the number of days on which GVP reports of specific types of volcanic activity were made, 238 239 with the number of days on which thermal anomalies were detected, by product. Confirming a common theme, the VIIRS AFP more regularly detected thermal anomalies than MYD14, for all activity types. Overall, those types of activity associated with intense heat (i.e. pyroclastic flows, lava flows or explosions) are more comprehensively detected than other activity types, although detections remain low, with only 10.3-16.9% of GVP reports detected by the VIIRS AFP, as compared with 0.0-11.9% for MYD14.

245

Table 2. The number of days that the VIIRS and MYD14 fire products detected thermal anomalies at

247 Indonesia's volcanoes, as compared with volcanic activity type derived from the GVP database.

	Plume	Seismicity	Incandescence	Lava dome	PF	Fumarole	Lava	Explosion	Ashfall
Days of recorded activity	1276	418	350	297	118	35	29	19	13
VIIRS AFP detected days	135	22	36	37	20	1	3	2	0
Proportion detected (%)	10.6	5.3	10.3	12.5	16.9	2.9	10.3	10.5	0.0
MYD14 detected days	69	19	17	14	14	1	1	0	0
Proportion detected (%)	5.4	4.5	4.9	4.7	11.9	2.9	3.4	0.0	0.0

248

The difference in VIIRS and MODIS thermal detections between day and night (between which the algorithm used changes) can also be examined. It was found that 64% (n = 364) of all pixels identified by MYD14 as anomalous and 65% (n=601) of all pixels identified as anomalous by the VIIRS AFP, were detected in imagery obtained at night. The significance of this is that there is a comparable, reduced sensitivity of both algorithms during the day-time. This is a function of the higher (and identical) MIR temperature threshold applied within the daytime algorithm.

255

# 256 Thermal anomaly quantification

The detection of volcanic activity, as is possible with both the MODIS and VIIRS fire detection algorithms, is important. Of often greater utility however, is the quantification of such activity so as to provide an indication of the activity type and intensity. For both MODIS and VIIRS products, such quantification is possible by virtue of the number of anomalous pixels identified, as this effectively quantifies the spatial extent of an anomaly; in the case of MYD14 however, quantification is more usefully also is additionally provided by the associated total FRP data. For MYD14, the relationship here between the number of anomalous pixels and total FRP per scene however, is not particularly

264 strong ( $r^2 = 0.57$ ). This is because there is a range of FRP values that a pixel identified as anomalous 265 might display. For example, the smallest pixel FRP identified within the dataset was 7.5 MW (for Ibu, 266 14 June 2012, with no GVP-reported activity) and the largest was 992.3 MW (for Soputan, 18 267 September 2012, with eruptive activity, including volcanic plumes, reported). The daily sum FRP for all 268 volcanic activity detected is plotted in Figure 3, along with the corresponding daily numbers of 269 anomalous pixels as identified by both MYD14 and the VIIRS AFP. Although in many cases peaks and 270 troughs do coincide, there is only a small positive relationship between both the numbers of pixels 271 identified as anomalous by both sensors ( $r^2 = 0.28$ ) and between the number of pixels identified as 272 anomalous by the VIIRS AFP and the corresponding MYD14 FRP retrievals ( $r^2 = 0.15$ ). It is unfortunate 273 therefore, that until upgraded to an EDR, accurately quantifying the emissions detected from the 274more sensitive VIIRS sensor will remain troublesome.

275

276To assist in determining the cause of the discrepancy in detections between the VIIRS and MODIS fire 277 products, corresponding daily numbers of anomalous pixels, as identified by the MODIS Terra product 278 (MOD14), are also displayed in Figure 3. Although there are similar trends, given the difference in 279 image acquisition time, little relationship exists between either of the variables derived from the Aqua 280 and Terra products (anomalous pixels:  $r^2 = 0.06$ , FRP retrievals:  $r^2 = 0.03$ ) or between the Terraderived anomalous pixel numbers and those from VIIRS ( $r^2 = 0.26$ ). MODVOLC detections for the same 281 282 volcanoes and time period are fewer than those from the MODIS fire products (these data are also in 283 Figure 3). Summed, the number of days that both the MYD14 (308) and MOD14 (386) products made 284 detections is 694 as compared with 520 for MODVOLC (which utilises both MODIS sensors). This 285 difference reflects an acknowledged reduced sensitivity of the MODVOLC algorithm (e.g. Vaughan and 286 Hook, 2006; Blackett, 2013). However for one volcano, Batu Tara, the reverse was found to be true, 287 with MODVOLC making thermal anomaly detections on 145 days, as compared with just 10 for MYD14, 16 for MOD14 and 24 for VIIRS. 288



Figure 3. MODIS-derived FRP, and corresponding numbers of pixels identified as anomalous by the
 MODIS (both MYD14 and MOD14) and VIIRS fire detection products, and also the MODVOLC system.

## 294 Discussion

295 A number of comparable MYD14 and VIIRS fire product detections of volcanic activity have been 296 highlighted however, equally, a number of occasions have been shown with little similarity. Overall, 297 the data suggest an enhanced sensitivity of the VIIRS AFP to smaller and/or more subtle thermal 298 anomalies, as compared with the MYD14 Product. Given that the algorithm used for both products is 299 the same, differences in thermal anomaly detection capabilities must be, primarily, due to variations 300 in pixel size – both physically (i.e. 1000 m compared with 750 m) and by virtue of the data processing 301 (i.e. VIIRS pixel aggregation and sampling scheme). This suggestion is confirmed by the fact that both 302 MODIS Fire Products (MYD14 and [MOD14]), which use the same algorithm and share the same 303 spatial resolution, show a significant anomalous pixel under-detection (i.e. 569 [570]) as compared 304 with the VIIRS AFP (923). Csiszar et al. (2014) showed how the observed differences between the 305 MODIS and VIIRS fire products, in relation to counts of fire pixels, are consistent with those expected 306 due to the differences in spatial sampling *i.e.* given that any terrestrial thermal anomaly will 307 constitute a greater proportion of the footprint of a smaller pixel, the smaller VIIRS pixels would be

expected to detect more, and smaller, thermal anomalies than MODIS, when using a comparable detection algorithm. In relation to the pixel aggregation and sampling scheme that is used in the VIIRS data, it also results in smaller pixel footprints towards the scan edge, further improving spatial resolution here as compared with MODIS (Cao et al. 2013; Justice et al. 2013; Schroeder et al. 2014).

312

313 To represent the influence of spatial resolution, Figure 4 shows a range of possible volcanic surface 314 configuration simulations and, based on the infrared emissions that each would produce, the 315 corresponding limits of unsaturated detection (both maxima and minima) for the MODIS and VIIRS 316 sensors (detection will be possible above the maxima but saturation will mean the associated data 317 cannot be reliably quantified). The range of volcanic scenarios that the VIIRS can detect is greater in 318 all respects (up to its pixel size) than for MODIS. The implications of this are that: for a given 319 temperature, the thermal anomaly must be larger to be detected by MODIS; VIIRS can detect cooler 320 anomalies of the same size; and, for anomalies smaller than the pixel size, VIIRS will be able to 321 quantify them up to a greater temperature before saturation (634 K as compared with 500 K for 322 MODIS). Csiszar et al. (2014) confirms that work is on-going to customise the algorithm used in the 323 VIIRS AFP for the specific characteristics of this sensor. An enhanced VIIRS fire detection algorithm 324 has, in fact, already been developed which uses the sensor's 375 m I-bands (bands I4 and I5). This 325 new product shows improved detection performance over the 750 m product (with, for example, a 326 25× factor increase in absolute numbers of night-time fire pixels detected) (Schroeder et al. 2014). 327 The challenge posed by these smaller pixels however, is that saturation will be more regular 328 (occurring at only 367 K), meaning that it will be quantitatively useful only for smaller and/or cooler 329 thermal anomalies (Schroeder et al. 2014).

330

The requirement of a VIIRS-specific thermal detection algorithm is confirmed when the MODIS Fire Product data are compared with MODVOLC data. For all volcanoes except Batu Tara, the MODVOLC algorithm predictably underestimated the number of anomalous pixels. For Batu Tara however, the MODVOLC algorithm identified thermal anomalies on 135, 129 and 121 more days than MYD14, MOD14 and VIIRS, respectively. Throughout this period, Batu Tara was persistently active, regularly erupting ash plumes into the atmosphere and displaying Strombolian and effusive activity (BGVN,

337 2014). The reason for this large difference relates to the water-masking procedure used, and how it is 338 applied in the thermal detection algorithm of the MODIS and VIIRS products. The algorithm requires, 339 in most cases, at least six-valid pixels neighbouring a candidate thermal anomaly; pixels masked as 340 water are invalid (Justice et al. 2006). Given that Batu Tara forms an island (Pulau Komba) of only 4.7 341 km<sup>2</sup>, even when particularly radiant, the MODIS Fire Product algorithm rarely detects a thermal 342 anomaly there as only rarely are there adequate valid pixels; those detected by VIIRS number slightly 343 more as the smaller pixel size means a smaller area of land is required to fulfil the valid pixel requirement. The MODVOLC algorithm in contrast, does not apply this requirement, hence retrieving 344 345 a larger number of detections. There is clearly therefore, room for improvement in the application of 346 the MODIS and VIIRS fire detection algorithms.

347

348 Added to the spatial resolution explanation, one other factor needs to be considered to more fully 349 understand the differing sensitivities of the MODIS and VIIRS fire products: the view scan angle. For 350 the VIIRS sensor, this provides for a swath width of 3040 km, as compared with 2330 km for MODIS. 351 The significance of this difference is two-fold. Firstly, being 30% larger than the MODIS swath, it 352 would be expected that 30% more detections would be made by the VIIRS sensor, thereby explaining 353 a good deal of the 62% increase in VIIRS AFP detections, as compared with MYD14. Secondly, the 354 larger swath means there are no gaps between orbits (i.e. complete global coverage twice daily), as 355 compared with MODIS which experiences gaps in coverage around the equator (Cao et al. 2014). 356 Given that the Indonesian islands are within 10° of the equator, such gaps will have reduced the 357 capability of the MODIS products to view and detect all Indonesian volcanic activity and, as such, will 358 also be partly responsible for the smaller numbers of anomalous pixels detected.

359



361 Figure 4. Here, a range of two-component volcanic surfaces are modelled: a hot volcanic component 362 and a cooler, non-volcanic component (this simulated surface is depicted in the inset). The hot 363 component is simulated with a range of temperatures (up to 1500 K, x-axis) and sizes (up to the pixel 364 footprint size, y-axis). Based on the minimum thresholds as prescribed by the fixed threshold fire-365 detection algorithms, and the maximum unsaturated detection limits of the sensors, points within the 366 envelopes delineated relate to scenarios that, based on the corresponding thermal emissions, the 367 respective sensors and algorithms would be capable of detecting. Above the upper limits represented 368 by these envelopes, thermal activity will still be detected, but saturation will prevent accurate 369 emission quantification. The temperature maxima used here relate to the maximum FRP levels of 370 detection for VIIRS (5100 MW), as compared with MODIS (3500 MW).

360

# 372 Conclusion and the future

373 It has been shown that comparing the volcanic observational capabilities of two remote sensors is no 374 simple task. The characteristics of the sensors themselves render precise comparison as impossible, 375 and as volcanic activity is sporadic, it is easily missed if the short period of activity is not captured, or 376 if observing conditions are sub-optimal (Csiszar et al. 2014). Equally, the sparseness of reported 377 volcanic observations in Indonesia against which, remote observations might be compared, is 378 unfortunate and a function of the remoteness and inaccessibility of many of the country's volcanoes.
379 Fortunately, the fact that remote detections have, in some cases, confirmed recorded activity and,
380 indeed in others, have isolated activity not recorded elsewhere, evidences the utility of remotely
381 sensed data, either from VIIRS or MODIS, in filling in the gaps in our knowledge of volcanic behaviour
382 globally and, given its optimal performance, the VIIRS AFP appears most capable in this task.

383

384 The data presented have shown that the VIIRS AFP constitutes an improvement over the comparable 385 MODIS product(s) in terms of its sensitivity to, and detection frequency of, volcanic thermal 386 anomalies. This corroborates the findings of a number of other fire-observation studies and should be 387 seen by the thermal remote sensing community as confirming VIIRS as a satisfactory follow-on to the 388 MODIS-era dataset. We are, in fact, lucky to have an extended period of MODIS and VIIRS 389 observations which coincide and against which such comparisons can be made, and from which the 390 influences of the different characteristics of both can be analysed. Users need only wait until 2017 for 391 quantitative VIIRS AFP data to be available against which more thorough comparisons may be made 392 with MODIS. And the future does indeed look promising based on the findings presented here, with 393 VIIRS appearing more sensitive than MODIS and, with a much higher saturation temperature, able to 394 detect and observe a greater range of volcanic scenarios. Researchers additionally have the prospect 395 of an increasingly rich set of new thermally-sensitive satellite sensors to look forward to, with two Sea 396 and Land Surface Temperature Radiometers (on board the European Space Agency's Sentinel-3 397 satellites) also planned to be operational by 2017. As such, 2017 is likely to be a significant year for 398 the thermal remote sensing community who should, in turn, be optimistic about what it is set to bring 399 in terms of terrestrial thermal anomaly observation.

400

## 401 References

402BGVN (2014). Report on Batu Tara (Indonesia). In: Wunderman, R (ed.), Bulletin of the Global403VolcanismNetwork, 39:1.SmithsonianInstitution.404http://dx.doi.org/10.5479/si.GVP.BGVN201401-264260.

405 BLACKETT, M. (2013). Review of the utility of infrared remote sensing for detecting and monitoring 406 volcanic activity with the case study of shortwave infrared data for Lascar Volcano from

- 2001-2005. In: Pyle, D. M., Mather, T. A. & Biggs, J. (eds) Remote Sensing of Volcanoes and
  Volcanic Processes: Integrating Observation and Modelling. Geological Society, London,
  Special Publications, 380, http://dx.doi.org/10.1144/SP380.10. The Geological Society of
  London, 2013.
- Blackett, M. (2014). Early Analysis of Landsat-8 Thermal Infrared Sensor Imagery of Volcanic
  Activity. Remote Sensing, 6, 2282-2295, doi:10.3390/rs6032282.
- Cao, C., Xiong, X., Wolfe, R., De Luccia, F., Liu, Q., Blonski, S., Lin, G., Nishihama, M., Pogorzala, D.,
  Oudrari, H. and Hillger, D. (2013), Visible Infrared Imaging Radiometer Suite (VIIRS) Sensor
  Data Record (SDR) User's Guide. Version 1.2, 10 September 2013, NOAA Technical Report
  NESDIS 142, Available at <a href="https://cs.star.nesdis.noaa.gov/NCC/UsersGuideVIIRS">https://cs.star.nesdis.noaa.gov/NCC/UsersGuideVIIRS</a>.
- Cao, C., De Luccia, F. J., Xiong, X., Wolfe, R. and Weng, F. (2014). Early On-Orbit Performance of the
  Visible Infrared Imaging Radiometer Suite Onboard the Suomi National Polar-Orbiting
  Partnership (S-NPP) Satellite. IEEE Transactions on Geoscience and Remote Sensing, 52, 2
  1142-1156.
- 421 Csiszar, I., J. Morisette and L. Giglio, (2006). Validation of active fire detection from moderate
   422 resolution satellite sensors: the MODIS example in Northern Eurasia. IEEE Transactions on
   423 Geoscience and Remote Sensing, 44, 7, 1757-1764.
- 424 Csiszar, I., Schroeder, W., Giglio, L., Ellicott, E., Vadrevu, K. P., Justice, C. O. and Wind, B. (2014). Active 425 fires from the Suomi NPP Visible Infrared Imaging Radiometer Suite: Product status and first
- 426 evaluation results. Journal of Geophysical Research Atmospheres, 119, 803-816.
- 427 CVGHM (2012). Center for Volcanology and Geological Hazard Mitigation report in Semeru Weekly
   428 Report, Global Volcanism Program. http://www.volcano.si.edu/volcano.cfm?vn=263300.
- Darwen VAAC, (2012). Darwen Volcanic Ash Advisory Centre report, in Soputan Weekly Report, Global
   Volcanism Program. Online: http://volcano.si.edu/volcano.cfm?vn=266030.
- Elvidge, C., Zhizhin, M., Hsu, F. and Baugh, K. E. (2013). VIIRS Nightfire: Satellite Pyrometry at Night.
  Remote Sensing, 5, 4423-4449.
- 433Giglio, L. (2010). MODIS Collection 5 Active Fire Product User's Guide Version 2.4. Science Systems434andApplications,Inc.Online:
- 435 <u>http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/templates/gfims/docs/MODIS\_Fire\_</u>Users\_Guide\_2.4.pdf.

436	Giglio, L., Descloitres, J., Justice, C. O. and Kaufman, Y. J. (2003). An Enhanced Contextual Fire						
437	Detection Algorithm for MODIS. Remote Sensing of Environment, 87, 273-282.						
438	Giglio, L., Csiszar, I., Restás, A., Morisette, J., Schroeder, W., Morton, D. and Justice, C. (2008). Active						
439	fire detection and characterization with the advanced spaceborne thermal emission and						
440	reflection radiometer (ASTER). Remote Sensing of Environment, 112, 3055-3063.						
441	The Guardian (2014). Volcanic ash cloud from Sangeang Api grounds Australia flights. Online and						
442	available at: <u>http://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/may/31/volcanic-ash-cloud-</u>						
443	sangeang-api-indonesia-grounds-australia-flights.						
444	Harris, A. J. L., Flynn, L. P., Keszthelyi, L., Mouginis-Mark, P. J., Rowland, S. K., and Resing, J. A. (1998).						
445	Calculation of lava effusion rates from Landsat TM data. Bulletin of Volcanology, 60, 52–71.						
446	International Business Times (2013). Mount Sinabung: 17,000 Evacuated and Hundreds 'Threatened						
447	With Starvation' as Volcano Continues to Erupt. Online and available at:						
448	http://www.ibtimes.co.uk/mount-sinabung-indonesia-17000-evacuated-refugees-facing-						
449	<u>525562</u> .						
450	Jakarta Post (2013). Mt. Rokatenda in NTT erupts, reportedly killing five. Online and available at:						
451	http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2013/08/10/mt-rokatenda-ntt-erupts-reportedly-						
452	<u>killing-five.html</u> .						
453	Jakarta Post (2014). Mt. Sinabung eruptions disrupt flights to N. Sumatra, Aceh. Online and available						
454	at: http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2014/10/11/mt-sinabung-eruptions-disrupt-						
455	flights-n-sumatra-aceh.html						
456	JPSS (2013). http://npp.gsfc.nasa.gov/sciencedocuments/2013-529/474-00064_OAD-VIIRS-AF-						
457	ARP_B.pdf						
458	Justice, C.O., Giglio, L., Korontzi, S., Owens, J., Morisette, J.T., Roy, D.P., Descloitres, J., Alleaume, S.,						
459	Petitcolin, F., Kaufman, Y. (2002). The MODIS fire products. Remote Sensing of Environment,						
460	83:244-262.						
461	Justice, C., Giglio, L., Boschetti, L., Roy, D., Csiszar, I., Morisette, J. and Kaufman, Y. (2006). MODIS Fire						
462	Products. Algorithm Technical Background Document. EOS ID# 2741.						
463	Justice, C. O., Román, M. O., Csiszar, I., Vermote, E. F., Wolfe, R. E., Hook, S. J., Friedl, M., Wang, Z.,						
464	Schaaf, C. B., Miura, T., Tschudi, M., Riggs, G., Hall, D. K., Lyapustin, A. I., Devadiga, S.,						

- Davidson, C., Masuoka, E. J. (2013). Land and cryosphere products from Suomi NPP VIIRS:
  Overview and status. Journal Geophysical Research-Atmospheres, 118(17), 9753-9765.
  doi:10.1002/jgrd.50771.
- Morisette, J. T., Giglio, L., Csiszar, I. and Justice, C. O. (2005). Validation of the MODIS active fire
  product over Southern Africa with ASTER data. Int J Rem Sens, 26, 4239-4264.
- 470 National Geographic (2014). Indonesia's Mount Kelud erupted this week, sending ash into the air,
  471 causing 100,000 people to evacuate and killing three. Online and available at:
  472 <u>http://news.nationalgeographic.com/news/2014/02/140214-mount-kelud-volcano-eruption-</u>
  473 <u>indonesia-ash-science/</u>.
- Schroeder, W., Oliva, P., Giglio, L. and Csiszar, I. B. (2014) The New VIIRS 375 m active fire detection
  data product: Algorithm description and initial assessment. Remote Sensing of Environment,
  143, 85-96.
- 477 Smithsonian Institution (2013). The Indonesian Region. Online and available at:
  478 http://www.volcano.si.edu/region.cfm?rn=6.
- 479 UNISDR (2015). Making Development Sustainable: The Future of Disaster Risk Management. Global
  480 Assessment Report on Disaster Risk Reduction. Geneva, Switzerland: United Nations Office
  481 for Disaster Risk Reduction.
- Webley P. W., Wooster, M. J., Strauch, W., Saballos, J. A., Dill, K., Stephenson, P., Stephenson, J.,
  Escobar Wolf, R. and Matias, O. (2008). Experiences from Real-time Satellite-Based Volcano
  Monitoring in Central America: Case Studies at Fuego, Guatemala. Int J Rem Sens. 29, 6618 –
  6644.
- Wolfe, R. E., Roy, D. P and Vermonte, E. (1998). MODIS Land Data Storage, Gridding, and Compositing
   Methodology: Level 2 Grid. IEEE T Geosci Remote, 36, 1324-1338.
- Wolfe, R., Nishihama, M., Fleig, A., Kuyper, J., Roy, D., Storey, J. and Patt, F. (2002). Achieving sub pixel geolocation accuracy in support of MODIS land science. Remote Sensing of
   Environment, 83, 31 49.
- Wolfe, R., Lin, G., Nishihama, M., Tewari, K., Tilton, J. and Isaacman, A. (2013). Suomi NPP VIIRS
   prelaunch and on-orbit geometric calibration and characterization. Journal of Geophysical
   Research: Atmospheres, 118, 508-511.

- Wright R. and Flynn L. P. (2003). Satellite observations of thermal emission before, during, and after
   the January 2002 eruption of Nyiragongo. Acta Vulcanologica. 15, 67-74.
- Wright, R., Flynn, LP, Garbeil, H, Harris, AJL, and Pilger, E. (2004). MODVOLC: near-real-time thermal
  monitoring of global volcanism. Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research, 135, 29498
  49.
- 499

## 500 List of figure captions

- Figure 1. All Indonesian volcanoes recorded as displaying activity according to the GVP database, in
  the period: April 2012 14 July 2014. Asterisks refer to volcanoes which displayed thermal anomalies
  that were detected in either, or both, the MYD14 and VIIRS fire product files.
- 504
- 505 Figure 2. Temporal comparison of GVP reported activity at the volcanoes detailed in Figure 1, with
- 506 thermal anomalies at them, as detected by MYD14 and the VIIRS AFP, for a period of 835 days (1 April

507 2012 – 14 July 2014). The interval between minor tick marks on the x-axis is 28 days.

508

509 Figure 3. MODIS-derived FRP, and corresponding numbers of pixels identified as anomalous by the 510 MODIS (both MYD14 and MOD14) and VIIRS fire detection products, and also the MODVOLC system.

511

512 Figure 4. Here, a range of two-component volcanic surfaces are modelled: a hot volcanic component 513 and a cooler, non-volcanic component (this simulated surface is depicted in the inset). The hot 514 component is simulated with a range of temperatures (up to 1500 K, x-axis) and sizes (up to the pixel 515 footprint size, y-axis). Based on the minimum thresholds as prescribed by the fixed threshold fire-516 detection algorithms, and the maximum unsaturated detection limits of the sensors, points within the 517 envelopes delineated relate to scenarios that, based on the corresponding thermal emissions, the 518 respective sensors and algorithms would be capable of detecting. Above the upper limits represented 519 by these envelopes, thermal activity will still be detected, but saturation will prevent accurate 520 emission quantification. The temperature maxima used here relate to the maximum FRP levels of 521 detection for VIIRS (5100 MW), as compared with MODIS (3500 MW).

522