

Evaluation of *Penicillium bilaji* Inoculation and Copper and Zinc Fertilization in Relation to Crop Yield and Nutrient Uptake.

P.J. Doyle, C. van Kessel, R.B. McKercher, and
R.E. Karamanos

Abstract

Growth chamber and field experiments were conducted on three low micronutrient alkaline soils from Northeastern Saskatchewan to test the efficacy of PB-50 inoculation and phosphorus (P), copper (Cu) and zinc (Zn) fertilization in relation to plant yield and nutrient uptake responses. Field experiments involving wheat (*Triticum aestivum* 'Katepwa') and peas (*Pisum sativum* 'Titan') showed no yield or P uptake as a result of PB-50 seed inoculation or P₂O₅ fertilization for three locations. Fertilization of wheat with CuSO₄ and peas with ZnSO₄ produced increases in seed and total plant uptake of Cu and Zn. A yield increase from 2722 kg/ha to 3682 kg/ha (40 to 54 bu/ac) as a result of Cu fertilization was observed for Katepwa wheat on Nipawin Soil (DTPA Cu = 0.1 µg/g). No other yield increases were observed for Cu or Zn fertilization on the other soils. Growth chamber experiments involving wheat (*Triticum aestivum* 'Park') and navy beans (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.) produced results similar to field experimentation. Increased Cu uptake in wheat for CuSO₄ fertilized treatments was observed for all three soils. Cu fertilization in the Nipawin soil showed a yield increase in wheat relative to control. Wheat seed inoculation with PB-50 produced no yield increases and minor nutrient uptake differences. Increased yields and Zn uptake in beans for ZnSO₄ fertilized treatments was observed in all three soils. Seed inoculation of navy bean with PB-50 produced variable yield increases and nutrient uptake differences in two of three soils.

Introduction

Extensive research has been conducted to examine the nature and occurrence of micronutrient deficiencies in cropping systems. Early assessment of the micronutrient status of Saskatchewan soils found that most of the province's soils were adequately supplied with copper (Cu) and zinc (Zn) (Stewart, 1969). Recent findings suggest the opposite. For example, Kruger et al. (1985) suggest that Cu deficiencies in Saskatchewan are likely concentrated in the soils of the light transition of grey and brownish grey podzolic soils. Karamanos et al. (1983) found significant yield increases with Zn fertilization of some Saskatchewan soils.

Soluble Cu and Zn fertilizers are the usual method of correcting Cu and Zn deficiencies. These sources are expensive and inefficient because the majority of the applied element is immobilized in insoluble fractions of the soil (Kabata-Pendias and Pendias, 1984; Tisdale et al., 1984). Plant uptake of Cu and Zn is dependant on soluble levels in the rhizosphere.

Microbial metabolism and the release of root exudates enhance the solubility and availability of metals in the rhizosphere by mediating pH and complexation reactions (Barber and Lee, 1974; Kucey, 1988; Mench et al., 1988). For example, Linehan et al. (1989) observed seasonally-increased micronutrient concentrations in the rhizosphere of barley (*Hordeum vulgare* L.). They attributed this observation to the biological production of ligands which mobilized insoluble forms of micronutrients in the rhizosphere.

Root exudates produced by higher plants are soluble organic compounds ranging from simple sugars to complex vitamins and complex and mucilages (Rovira et al., 1979). These compounds may promote the dissolution of rhizosphere metals by forming soluble metal complexes (Bromfied, 1958; Godo and Reisenaur, 1980; Olsen and Brown, 1980; Uren, 1984; Curl and Truelove, 1986; Merckx et al., 1986; Mench et al., 1988). Low molecular weight root exudates have acidic functional groups which dissociate and react with metals to form strong metal complexes. For example, metal chelation/complexation by root exudates may be induced by dissociation of the functional groups of organic acids (eg., citrate, malate), amino acids (eg., glutamate, lysine) and HO- hydroxyl and phenolic groups associated with each exudate (Mench et al., 1988).

Phosphate-solubilizing rhizosphere microbes solubilize inorganic phosphorus and micronutrient compounds in soil by excreting organic acids into their environment (Kucey, 1988). Analyses of culture filters of these microbes have revealed the production of the following acids: lactate, glycolate, citrate, 2-ketogluconate, malate, oxalate, malonate, tartarate and succinate (Fig. 1) (Sperber, 1958; Louw and Webley, 1959; Duff et al., 1963; Taha et al., 1969; Banik and Dey, 1982). The quantities of acid produced by such microbes may equal > 5 % of the total carbohydrate consumed by the organism (Banik and Dey, 1982).

Organic acids produced by rhizosphere microbes may dissociate insoluble Cu and Zn compounds in soil (Kucey, 1988). This process is believed to occur through a three step process: i) lower rhizosphere pH, ii) chelate/complex metals and iii) initiate exchange reactions in the growth environment (Sperber, 1958; Molla and Chowdhury, 1984; Asea et al., 1988). Such micronutrient - organic chelates may be of great importance in the release of metal nutrients in the rhizosphere (Stevenson and Ardakani, 1972; Linehan et al., 1989).

Berrow et al. (1982) concluded that 2-ketogluconate isolated from a culture of *Erwinium* species was able to extract the some amount of Cu, Mn, Mo, Ni, and Zn from soil as concentrated EDTA and DTPA solutions. Kucey (1988) showed that the addition of 0.05 M EDTA to solutions containing insoluble Cu and Zn had the same effects on solubilization effect as inoculation with *Penicillium bialji*. In addition, *P. bialji* inoculation of wheat (*Triticum aestivum* Chester) increased plant uptake of Cu and Zn from soil in greenhouse and field experiments. A plant growth promoting isolate of *Pseudomonas putida* inoculated onto clover was shown to increase plant uptake of Fe, Cu, Al, Zn, Co, and Ni (Meyer and Linderman, 1986).

Penicillium bialji is a naturally occurring soil fungus which is the 'active ingredient' in a seed inoculant termed PB-50™. This organism can mobilize insoluble micronutrient and phosphate soil fractions by secreting various organic acid metabolites in the rhizosphere (Kucey, 1988). Inoculation with *P. bialji* and fertilization with inexpensive insoluble Cu and Zn sources may represent an alternative to more expensive Cu and Zn fertilizer methods. Field and growth chamber experiments were conducted on three low micronutrient alkaline soils to meet three test objectives, evaluation of: PB-50 seed inoculation, Cu and Zn fertilization, and P fertilization in the field.

Materials and Methods

Growth Chamber

Growth chamber experiments were established in 10 x 15 cm columns to determine the efficacy of PB-50 seed inoculation and Cu and Zn fertilization in relation to plant yield and nutrient uptake. Wheat (*Triticum aestivum* 'Park') and navy beans (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.) were grown on three low micronutrient alkaline soils (Table 1) from Northeastern Saskatchewan to serve this purpose. Soil was collected from the Ah

horizon (0 - 15 cm) of each soil and was dried, ground, and sieved through a 2 mm polypropylene screen before use in the columns.

Table 1 Basic properties of the soils used in experimentation.

Site	Texture	pH	Cond. (dS/m)	Concentration ($\mu\text{g/g}$)							
				NO ₃	P	K	SO ₄	Cu*	Zn*	Fe*	Mn*
Snowden	Loam	8.0	0.3	5.6	15	134	11	0.4	0.4	22	3.0
Nipawin	Sand	8.0	0.3	2.2	14	70	7	0.1	0.6	17	3.0
Aylsham	Loam	8.1	0.4	8.3	19	82	10	0.3	0.9	26	6.7

* DTPA extractable levels

The Snowden, Nipawin, and Aylsham soils are mapped under the Smeaton-comp, Whitefox, and Weirdale soil associations respectively. Each soil is relatively low in Cu and Zn and would receive recommendation for Cu and Zn application for sensitive crops (SSTL, 1989).

Four treatments were established for the copper experiment involving park wheat: control, *P. bilaji* inoculation, CuSO₄, and *P. bilaji* + CuSO₄. Similar treatments were imposed in the zinc experiment involving navy beans: control, *P. bilaji* inoculation, ZnSO₄, and *P. bilaji* + ZnSO₄. Each source of Cu or Zn was added so that an equivalent of 10.00 g of Cu or Zn per 1.5 kg soil was added for each Cu or Zn treatment. The experiment was established on a complete randomized block design and each treatment was replicated four times.

Approximately 1.5 kg of soil was used in each column. An application of plant nutrients was applied to each column to ensure that only the test element would limit fertility (Table 2).

Table 2 Nutrient sources added to growth chamber soils.

Source	Soil Level (g/kg)		
NH ₄ NO ₃	N	= 13.3	
Ca(H ₂ PO ₄) ₂	P	= 5.3	Ca = 3.5
KCl	K	= 26.7	
CaCl ₂ •6H ₂ O	Ca	= 8.0	
MgSO ₄ •7H ₂ O	Mg	= 0.7	S = 0.9
FeSO ₄ •7H ₂ O	Fe	= 0.67	S = 0.4
MnSO ₄ •4H ₂ O	Mn	= 0.53	S = 0.1
Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇ •10H ₂ O	B	= 0.07	
Na ₂ MoO ₄ •2H ₂ O	Mo	= 0.08	
ZnSO ₄ •7H ₂ O (wheat only)	Zn	= 0.66	S = 0.3
CuSO ₄ •5H ₂ O (beans only)	Cu	= 0.66	S = 0.3

Seeds inoculated with *P. bilaji* were plated on potato dextrose agar (0.5 % v/v rosebengal and tetrachlorocycline and 0.5 % and 1.0 % w/v K₂HPO₄ and CaCl₂ respectively) to assay the population of *P. bilaji* on the seed surface. Plates were counted based on a dilution series from 10² to 10⁴ colony forming units (CFU's) per seed.

Each column was watered daily with distilled deionized water according to weight so that the soil was always between 60 and 90 % field capacity. Eight wheat seeds and four bean seeds were seeded at 3 and 4 cm depths respectively into moist soil. The wheat and pea seedlings were thinned to 4 and 2 plants per column respectively two weeks after seeding. A 16 hour photoperiod was used at diurnal temperatures of 22 ± 1 °C and 16 ± 1 °C respectively. The growth chamber light intensity was $175 \mu\text{E}\cdot\text{s}^{-1}\cdot\text{m}^{-2}$ at the soil surface for the duration of the experiment.

The plants were harvested by cutting 2 cm above the soil surface 84 and 95 days after seeding for beans and wheat respectively. Each sample was dried at 60 °C for 1 week and the total plant mass values were determined. The plant samples were then thrashed by hand and the seed and straw masses were measured. Seed and straw samples were ground in a cyclone mill with a nickel impeller and digested according to Thomas et al. (1967). Analysis of plant uptake of P, Cu, and Zn was conducted using an ICP plasma spectrometer.

All statistical mass and nutrient uptake values were generated from analysis of variance with a protected least significant difference at 95% significance according to Steel and Torrie (1980).

Field

Field trials were established during the summer of 1990 on the sites where the growth chamber soil was sampled in Northeastern Saskatchewan. A completely randomized block design was employed for experimentation. The plot dimensions were 1.05 meters in width and 12 meters in length (12.50 m² area) All Cu and Zn fertilizer calculations were based on these dimensions and a 0.15 m depth.

The Cu and Zn treatments imposed were identical to those in growth chamber experimentation. The Cu and Zn fertilizers were applied at a 15 kg/ha rate by broadcasting on the soil surface and incorporating with a light harrowing. Additional phosphorus treatments were established at each site to determine the efficacy of phosphorus fertilization and PB-50 seed inoculation. The P source used was triple super phosphate (0-46-0). These treatments were: no P₂O₅, no P₂O₅ + PB-50, 1/2 P₂O₅, 1/2 P₂O₅ + PB-50, full P₂O₅, and full P₂O₅ + PB-50. The P₂O₅ rates on all sites were as follows: 1/2 = 10 kg/ha and full = 20 kg/ha. In each case, the P was seed placed. Each treatment was replicated five times.

Wheat (*Triticum aestivum* 'Katepwa') and peas (*Pisum sativum* 'Titan') were seeded at 4 and 5 cm depths respectively with a small plot seed drill. The seeding rates for wheat and peas were 108.5 and 156.8 g/plot (86.8 and 125.4 kg/ha) respectively. Both wheat and peas were inoculated with commercial PB-50 according to label recommendations. The *P. bilaji* inoculated seeds were assayed for viable colonies using the same method as in growth chamber experimentation. All of the pea seeds were inoculated with a commercial strain of *Rhizobium leguminosarum* to ensure N₂ fixation. Blanket applications of plant nutrients were applied to each plot to meet fertilizer recommendations. The pea plots did not receive nitrogen fertilizer.

During the course of the field experiment, the plots at all three sites were maintained for weed and insect control and visual yield and vigor ratings were taken. Each plot was harvested by cutting 4 m² samples from each plot. The Snowden, Nipawin, and Aylsham sites were harvested 105, 103, and 103 days after seeding respectively. The plant yield for each plot was determined after 14 days of drying. The samples were then

thrashed and the seed yield was measured from each plot. Seed and straw samples were ground, digested, and analyzed for P, Cu, and Zn uptake according to the procedures used in growth chamber experimentation.

All statistical mass and nutrient uptake values were generated from analysis of variance with a protected least significant difference at 95% significance according to Steel and Torrie (1980).

Results and Discussion

The results of the plate counts for the growth chamber and field experiments (Table 3) indicate that in each experiment the seeds had viable *P. bilaji* on the seed surface. The navy bean seeds from the Snowden and Nipawin growth chamber studies were not assayed properly, so CFU numbers could not be obtained, but *P. bilaji* colonies were observed on the respective plates.

Table 3 Plate count results of *P. bilaji* inoculated seeds from growth chamber and field experiments.

Soil	Crop	Count (CFUs/seed)	
		Growth Chamber	Field
Snowden	Beans/Peas	nd	3270
	Wheat	5100	nd
Nipawin	Beans/Peas	nd	500
	Wheat	5100	1823
Aylsham	Beans/Peas	2400	350
	Wheat	5100	3316

Growth Chamber

Park wheat yields from growth chamber experimentation (Table 4) show variable responses to *P. bilaji* inoculation and CuSO₄ fertilization. The Nipawin soil showed yield (Table 4) and Cu uptake (Table 5) responses to CuSO₄ additions because it was deficient in

Table 4. Mean plant mass (g/column) values of Park wheat grown on Nipawin, Snowden, and Aylsham Soils*.

Treatment	Plant Mass (g/column)		
	Nipawin	Snowden	Aylsham
Control	5.277 _b	8.704 _a	7.012 _a
<i>P. bilaji</i>	5.899 _b	7.222 _b	6.613 _a
CuSO ₄	6.158 _b	7.567 _b	6.427 _a
<i>P. bilaji</i> + CuSO ₄	7.449 _a	8.224 _{ab}	6.817 _a

* Values with different letters are significantly different (95%)

Cu (DTPA Cu = 0.1 µg/g) (Table 1). Snowden and Aylsham soils had higher Cu levels (DTPA Cu = 0.4 and 0.3 µg/g respectively) (Table 1) and therefore less of a response to applied Cu. *P. bilaji* inoculation without Cu fertilization for the three soils produced no yield or Cu uptake increases relative to control (Tables 4 and 5). *P. bilaji* inoculation with Cu addition increased yield and Cu uptake values for Park wheat grown on the Nipawin

soil. Park wheat yield responses appear to be related to increases in Cu uptake. Yield responses are variable and dependant on the Cu status of the soil.

Table 5. Mean plant copper uptake ($\mu\text{g}/\text{column}$) values of Park wheat grown on Nipawin, Snowden, and Aylsham Soils*.

Treatment	Copper Uptake ($\mu\text{g}/\text{column}$)		
	Nipawin	Snowden	Aylsham
Control	34.02 _c	57.75 _a	37.83 _a
<i>P. bilaji</i>	38.76 _{bc}	48.34 _a	38.81 _a
CuSO ₄	36.88 _{bc}	52.65 _a	35.03 _a
<i>P. bilaji</i> + CuSO ₄	52.02 _a	54.90 _a	43.21 _a

* Values with different letters are significantly different (95%)

Navy beans showed yield responses to ZnSO₄ additions in the Nipawin and Snowden soils and no response in the Aylsham soil. This may be the result of low Zn levels in Nipawin and Snowden soils (DTPA Zn = 0.6 and 0.4 $\mu\text{g}/\text{g}$ respectively) relative to higher levels in the Aylsham soil (DTPA Zn = 0.9 $\mu\text{g}/\text{g}$) (Table 1). *P. bilaji* inoculation produced yield increases in the three test soils. Inoculation without ZnSO₄ addition produced yield increases in Nipawin and Aylsham soils. Inoculation with ZnSO₄ addition gave yield increases in Nipawin and Snowden soils (Table 6).

Table 6. Mean plant mass (g/column) values of Navy beans grown on Nipawin, Snowden, and Aylsham Soils*.

Treatment	Plant Mass (g/column)		
	Nipawin	Snowden	Aylsham
Control	3.932 _c	9.303 _b	6.538 _b
<i>P. bilaji</i>	4.882 _a	10.379 _{ab}	8.419 _a
ZnSO ₄	4.075 _{bc}	10.434 _{ab}	6.973 _b
<i>P. bilaji</i> + ZnSO ₄	5.282 _a	12.192 _a	7.295 _b

* Values with different letters are significantly different (95%)

Navy bean yield increases (Table 6) are related to increased plant uptake of Zn in the Nipawin and Snowden soils but not in the Aylsham soil (Table 7). In all cases, ZnSO₄ fertilization produced greater plant uptake of Zn relative to control treatments (Table 7). *P. bilaji* seed inoculation without ZnSO₄ addition led to Zn uptake increases in the Nipawin and Aylsham soils relative to control (Table 7). *P. bilaji* inoculation with ZnSO₄ produced the highest Zn uptake in Navy bean relative to all other treatments (Table 7).

In general, Navy beans showed more consistent yield and Zn uptake responses to ZnSO₄ addition and *P. bilaji* inoculation compared to Park wheat responses to CuSO₄ addition and *P. bilaji*. The Navy beans may have been more sensitive to soluble Zn levels than Park wheat was to soluble Cu levels.

In these experiments, soil fertility for both wheat and beans was in the following order: Snowden > Aylsham > Nipawin. These experiments also showed that *P. bilaji* inoculation and CuSO₄ / ZnSO₄ additions did not ensure yield increases because responses were variable. Yield responses to Cu were observed in low Cu Nipawin soil and Zn

responses were observed in low Zn Nipawin and Snowden soils. Aylsham soil was not responsive to Cu or Zn additions because it was not deficient in Cu or Zn.

Table 7. Mean plant zinc uptake ($\mu\text{g}/\text{column}$) values of Navy beans grown on Nipawin, Snowden, and Aylsham Soils*.

Treatment	Zinc Uptake ($\mu\text{g}/\text{column}$)		
	Nipawin	Snowden	Aylsham
Control	69.01 _b	145.50 _b	102.51 _c
<i>P. bilaji</i>	109.61 _a	172.16 _b	135.75 _b
ZnSO ₄	112.33 _a	268.19 _a	149.68 _a
<i>P. bilaji</i> + ZnSO ₄	142.40 _a	303.60 _a	163.61 _a

* Values with different letters are significantly different (95%)

The majority of the native and fertilizer Cu and Zn in the high pH test soils should exist in insoluble alkaline fractions. If *P. bilaji* solubilization is occurring in the rhizosphere of treated plants, it is likely occurring through an acidification mechanism.

Field

Katepwa wheat yields from field experimentation show variable response to CuSO₄ addition and no response to *P. bilaji* seed inoculation. The Nipawin site showed a yield increase to CuSO₄ fertilization, but no response to *P. bilaji* (Table 8). Yield increases in the Nipawin site correspond to increased Cu uptake in CuSO₄ amended plots (Table 9). The Snowden site showed no yield or Cu uptake response to CuSO₄ or *P. bilaji* treatments (Tables 8 and 9). The Aylsham site showed no significant yield responses to CuSO₄ or *P. bilaji* (Table 8), but showed increases in Cu seed uptake from both amendments (Table 9). This indicates that some external factor, not the Cu and *P. bilaji* treatments, affected Aylsham wheat yields.

Table 8. Mean seed mass ($\text{kg}\cdot\text{ha}^{-1}$) values of Katepwa wheat grown on Nipawin, Snowden, and Aylsham Soils*.

Treatment	Seed Mass (kg/ha)		
	Nipawin	Snowden	Aylsham
Control	2722 _b	4616 _a	3470 _a
<i>P. bilaji</i>	2661 _b	3887 _a	2620 _b
CuSO ₄	3682 _a	4213 _a	2682 _b
<i>P. bilaji</i> + CuSO ₄	3536 _a	4349 _a	2795 _{ab}

* Values with different letters are significantly different (95%)

As with the growth chamber wheat experiments, a positive yield response to Cu was only observed on the Nipawin soil with low Cu levels.

Table 9. Mean values of seed copper uptake (mg/4m²) of Katepwa wheat grown on Nipawin, Snowden, and Aylsham soils *.

Treatment	Copper Uptake (mg/4m ²)		
	Nipawin	Snowden	Aylsham
Control	0.492 _b	4.969 _a	0.734 _b
<i>P. bilaji</i>	1.118 _{ab}	4.278 _a	1.369 _a
CuSO ₄	2.067 _a	5.007 _a	1.555 _a
<i>P. bilaji</i> + CuSO ₄	1.280 _{ab}	5.008 _a	1.509 _a

* Values with different letters are significantly different (95%)

Katepwa wheat from the Nipawin and Aylsham sites showed no yield responses to the various P rates (Table 10). The Snowden site showed a yield increase for the 1/2 rate P₂O₅ treatments, but no response to the full P₂O₅ rate. The yield results for this site suggest that the full P₂O₅ rate had the same effect on yield as the control (no P₂O₅) treatment. The wheat at this site produced a relatively flat response to *P. bilaji* seed inoculation (Table 10).

Table 10. Mean seed mass (kg•ha⁻¹) values of Katepwa wheat grown on Nipawin, Snowden, and Aylsham soils*.

Treatment	Seed Mass (kg/ha)		
	Nipawin	Snowden	Aylsham
No P ₂ O ₅	3128 _a	3972 _b	2903 _a
No P ₂ O ₅ + <i>P. bilaji</i>	3272 _a	4218 _b	2860 _a
1/2 P ₂ O ₅	3214 _a	5198 _a	3088 _a
1/2 P ₂ O ₅ + <i>P. bilaji</i>	2996 _a	4462 _{ab}	2644 _a
Full P ₂ O ₅	3682 _a	4213 _b	2682 _a
Full P ₂ O ₅ + <i>P. bilaji</i>	3536 _a	4349 _{ab}	2795 _a

* Values with different letters are significantly different (95%)

No differences in wheat seed P uptake were observed for the Nipawin site (Table 11). Differences in P uptake were observed in the Snowden and Aylsham sites. The 1/2 P₂O₅ treatment yielded the highest seed P uptake for both Snowden and Aylsham wheat. In both sites, the full P₂O₅ treatments had the same effect on seed P uptake as the control (no P₂O₅) treatment (Table 11).

Table 11. Mean values of seed phosphorus uptake (g/4m²) of Katepwa wheat grown on Nipawin, Snowden, and Aylsham soils *.

Treatment	Phosphorus Uptake (g/4m ²)		
	Nipawin	Snowden	Aylsham
No P ₂ O ₅	4.999 _a	5.258 _b	4.448 _{ab}
<i>P. bilaji</i> + No P ₂ O ₅	5.197 _a	5.897 _b	4.608 _a
1/2 P ₂ O ₅	5.249 _a	7.442 _a	4.662 _a
<i>P. bilaji</i> + 1/2 P ₂ O ₅	4.767 _a	5.902 _b	3.196 _b
Full P ₂ O ₅	5.842 _a	5.822 _b	4.125 _{ab}
<i>P. bilaji</i> + Full P ₂ O ₅	5.160 _a	6.197 _{ab}	4.265 _{ab}

* Values with different letters are significantly different (95%)

An explanation for the lack of a trend in yield or seed P uptake for the various treatments may relate to the high P levels of these soils (Table 1) and inherent spatial variability of soil P.

Titan peas grown at the Snowden and Aylsham sites showed no yield response to ZnSO₄ additions or *P.bilaji* seed inoculation. The application of ZnSO₄ produced higher seed Zn uptake values at both sites. *P.bilaji* inoculation had no significant effect on seed uptake at either site (Table 12).

Table 12. Mean seed mass (kg•ha⁻¹) and seed zinc uptake (g/4m²) values of Titan peas grown on Nipawin, Snowden, and Aylsham soils*.

Treatment	Seed Mass (kg/ha)		Zinc uptake (g/4m ²)	
	Snowden	Aylsham	Snowden	Aylsham
Control	3246 _a	3354 _a	23.507 _b	24.654 _b
<i>P. bilaji</i>	3345 _a	3264 _a	20.173 _b	27.404 _{ab}
ZnSO ₄	3090 _a	2951 _a	43.095 _a	33.400 _a
<i>P. bilaji</i> + ZnSO ₄	2884 _a	3229 _a	37.511 _a	26.791 _{ab}

* Values with different letters are significantly different (95%)

The P₂O₅ and *P.bilaji* treatments had no significant effect on seed yield or P uptake at the Snowden and Aylsham sites (Table 13). This non-response could be attributed to the relatively high P levels of the Snowden and Aylsham soils (P = 15 and 19 µg/g respectively) (Table 1).

Table 13. Mean seed mass (kg•ha⁻¹) values of Titan peas grown on Nipawin, Snowden, and Aylsham soils*.

Treatment	Seed Mass (kg/ha)		Phosphorus uptake (g/4m ²)	
	Snowden	Aylsham	Snowden	Aylsham
No P ₂ O ₅	2977 _a	3335 _a	4.104 _a	5.335 _a
No P ₂ O ₅ + <i>P. bilaji</i>	3012 _a	3873 _a	4.156 _a	5.962 _a
1/2 P ₂ O ₅	3222 _a	3447 _a	4.794 _a	5.459 _a
1/2 P ₂ O ₅ + <i>P. bilaji</i>	2951 _a	3243 _a	4.314 _a	5.151 _a
Full P ₂ O ₅	3090 _a	2951 _a	4.288 _a	4.729 _a
Full P ₂ O ₅ + <i>P. bilaji</i>	2884 _a	3229 _a	4.033 _a	5.012 _a

* Values with different letters are significantly different (95%)

Conclusions

Variable responses of wheat and beans to Cu, Zn, and *P.bilaji* treatments were observed in growth chamber experiments. Additions of Cu and Zn increased plant yields only in soils with low levels of each nutrient. The Nipawin soil was low in both nutrients and produced yield increases in park wheat and navy beans as a result of Cu and Zn additions. The Snowden soil had low Zn levels and showed yield increases in Navy beans with the addition of Zn to soil. Seed inoculation with *P.bilaji* produced variable responses. Inoculation without Cu or Zn addition produced only one positive yield result (Aylsham Navy bean). Seed inoculation with Cu and Zn soil fertilization

produced yield and Cu/Zn increases in Nipawin Park wheat and Navy beans and Snowden Navy beans.

Katepwa wheat grown on the Nipawin field site showed yield and Cu uptake increases from Cu fertilization because this site had very low Cu levels and no effect of *P.bilaji* inoculation. The Aylsham site showed a decrease in yield with Cu addition and *P.bilaji* inoculation, but an increase in seed uptake of Cu with both treatments. The Snowden site showed no response to *P.bilaji* or Cu. The Snowden site showed yield and seed P uptake increases for the 1/2 P₂O₅ treatments. The full P₂O₅ treatments had the same effect as the no P₂O₅ treatments. This may be related to a toxic effect of the higher P level on plant growth. The Nipawin and Aylsham sites showed no yield response to the P₂O₅ treatments or PB-50 seed inoculation and no trends in P uptake as a result of the various treatments.

Titan wheat grown on the Snowden and Aylsham field sites showed no yield or P uptake responses to the P₂O₅ treatments or PB-50 seed inoculation. The level of NaHCO₃-extractable P may have been too high in these soils to induce yield responses.

References

- Asea, P.E.A., R.M.N. Kucey, and J.W.B. Stewart. 1988. Inorganic phosphate solubilization by two *Penicillium* species in solution culture and soil. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry*. 20: 459 - 464.
- Banik, S. and B.K. Dey. 1982. Available phosphate content of an alluvial soil as influenced by inoculation of some isolated phosphate solubilizing microorganisms. *Plant Soil*. 69; 353 - 364.
- Barber, D.A. and R.B. Lee. 1974. The effect of microorganisms on the adsorption of manganese by plants. *New Phytologist*. 73; 97 - 106.
- Berrow, M.L., M.S. Davidson, and J.C. Burridge. 1982. Trace elements extractable by 2-ketogluconic acids from soils and their relationship to plant contents. *Plant and Soil*. 66: 161 - 171.
- Bromfield, S.M. 1958. The solution of gamma-MnO₂ by substances released from soil and from the root of oats and vetch in relation to Mn availability. *Plant and Soil*. 10; 147 - 160.
- Cline, G.R., P.E. Powell, P.J. Szanislo and C.P.P. Reid. 1982. Comparison of the Abilities of Hydroxamic, Synthetic, and Other Natural Organic Acids to Chelate Iron and Other Ions in Nutrient Solution. *Soil Science Society of America Journal* 46; 1158 - 1164.
- Curl, E.A., and B. Truelove. 1986. Rhizosphere in Relation to Plant Nutrition and Growth. pp. 167 - 190. In: *The Rhizosphere*. Springer Verlag, Berlin.
- Duff, R.B., D.M. Webley and R.O. Scott. 1963. Solubilization of minerals and related materials by 2-ketogluconic acid producing bacteria. *Soil Science*. 95; 105 - 114.
- Godoy, G.H. and H.H. Reisenauer. 1980. Plant effects of soil manganese availability. *Soil Science Society of America Journal*. 44; 993 - 995.

- Kabata-Pendias, A. and H. Pendias. 1984.** Trace elements in soils and plants. pp. 51 - 108. CRC Press Inc., Cleveland, Ohio.
- Karamanos, R.E., J.J. Germida, D.J. Tomasiewicz and E.H. Halstead. 1983.** Yield response to micronutrient fertilization in Saskatchewan. In: Soils and Crops Workshop. Saskatoon, Sask. Publ. No. 492. Extension Division University of Saskatchewan.
- Kruger, G.A., R.E. Karamanos and J.P. Singh. 1985.** The copper fertility of Saskatchewan soils. *Canadian Journal of Soil Science.* 65: 89 - 99.
- Kucey, R.M.N. 1988.** Effect of *Penicillium bilaji* on the solubility and uptake of phosphorus and micronutrients from soil by wheat. *Canadian Journal of Soil Science.* 68: 261 - 270.
- Linehan, D.J., A.H. Sinclair, and M.C. Mitchell. 1989.** Seasonal changes in Cu, Mn, Zn, and Co concentrations in soil in the root zone of barley (*Hordeum vulgare* L.). *Journal of Soil Science.* 40: 103 - 155.
- Louw, H.A. and D.M. Webley. 1959.** A study of soil bacteria dissolving certain mineral phosphate fertilizers and related compounds. *Journal of Applied Bacteriology.* 22: 227 - 233.
- Mench, M., J.L. Morel, A. Gukert, and B. Guillet. 1988.** Metal binding with root exudates of low molecular weight. *Journal of Soil Science.* 39: 521 - 527.
- Merckx, R., J.H. Vanginkel, J. Sinnaeve, and A. Cremers. 1986.** Plant-induced changes in the rhizosphere of maize and wheat. II. Complexation of cobalt, zinc, and manganese in the rhizosphere of maize and wheat. *Plant and Soil.* 96: 95 - 108.
- Meyer, J.R. and R.G. Linderman. 1986.** Response of Subterranean clover to dual inoculation with vesicular-arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi and a plant growth promoting bacterium *Pseudomonas putida*. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry.* 18: 185 - 190.
- Molla, M.A.Z., A.A. Chowdhury, A. Islam and S. Houge. 1984.** Microbial mineralization of organic phosphate in soil. *Plant and Soil.* 78: 393 - 399.
- Olsen, R.A. and J.C. Brown. 1980.** Factors related to iron uptake by dicotyledonous and monocotyledonous plants. I. pH and reductants. *Journal of Plant Nutrition.* 2: 629 - 645.
- Rovira, A.D., R.C. Foster and J.K. Martin. 1979.** Origin, nature and nomenclature of organic materials in the rhizosphere. pp. 1 - 4. In: *The Soil Root Interface.* (R. Scott-Russell and J.L. Harley, eds.) Academic Press, New York.
- Sperber, J.I. 1958.** Solution of apatite by soil microorganisms producing organic acids. *Australian Journal of Agricultural Research.* 9: 782 - 787.
- SSTL, 1989.** Nutrient Requirement Guidelines for Field Crops in Saskatchewan. Saskatchewan Soil Testing Laboratory. Saskatchewan Institute of Pedology. University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon, Saskatchewan.

- Steel, R.G. and J.H. Torrie. 1980.** Principles and procedures of statistics. A biometrical approach. McGraw-Hill Book Co., New York.
- Stewart, J.W.B. 1969.** Micronutrients in Saskatchewan soils. Report to the meeting of the western section of the national soil fertility committee. Edmonton, Alberta., February 13 - 14.
- Taha, S.M., S.A.Z. Mahmoud, A. Halim El-Damaty and A.M. Abd El-Hafez. 1969.** Activity of phosphate-dissolving bacteria in Egyptian soils. *Plant and Soil.* 31; 149 - 160.
- Thomas, R.L., R.W. Sheard, and J.R. Moir. 1967.** Comparison of conventional and automated procedures for N, P, and K analysis of plant materials using a simple digest. *Agronomy Journal.* 59: 240 - 243.
- Tisdale, S.L., W.L. Nelson and J.D. Beaton. 1984.** Micronutrients in soils and fertilizers. pp. 350 - 413. In: *Soil Fertility and Fertilizers.* Macmillan Pub. Co., New York.
- Uren, N.C. 1984.** Forms, reactions, and availability of iron in soils. *Journal of Plant Nutrition.* 7: 165 - 176.