DR. SILVIA DEL VECCHIO (Orcid ID : 0000-0001-8458-0433)

DR. EDY FANTINATO (Orcid ID : 0000-0003-0114-4738)

DR. CORRADO MARCENÒ (Orcid ID : 0000-0003-4361-5200)

Article type : Research Article

Co-ordinating Editor : Jörg Ewald

Biogeographic variability of coastal perennial grasslands at the European scale

Del Vecchio S¹, Fantinato E¹, Janssen JAM², Bioret F³, Acosta A⁴, Prisco I⁴, Tzonev R⁵, Marcenò C⁶, Rodwell J⁷, Buffa G¹

Del Vecchio, S. (Corresponding author, silvia.delvecchio@unive.it)¹, Fantinato, E. (edy.fantinato@unive.it)¹, Janssen, J.A.M. (john.janssen@wur.nl)², Bioret, F. (frederic.bioret@univ-brest.fr)³, Acosta, A. (aliciateresarosario.acosta@uniroma3.it)⁴, Prisco, I. (irene.prisco@uniroma3.it)⁴, Tzonev, R. (rossentzonev@abv.bg)⁵, Marcenò, C. (marcenocorrado@libero.it)⁶, Rodwell, J. (johnrodwell@tiscali.co.u)⁷, Buffa, G. (gabriella.buffa@unive.it)¹

1 Ca' Foscari University of Venice, Via Torino 155, 30172 Venice, Italy

2 Wageningen University and Research, P.O. Box 47, 6700 AA Wageningen, The Netherland

3 Université de Bretagne Occidentale, F-29238 Brest, France

4 Roma Tre University, viale Marconi 446, 00146 Roma

5 Sofia University, 8 Dragan Tzankov Blvd., Sofia 1421, Bulgaria

6 Masaryk University, CZ-61137 Brno, Czech Republic

7 Derwent Rd, Lancaster LA1 3ES, England

Running head: Biogeographic variability of coastal grasslands

This article has been accepted for publication and undergone full peer review but has not been through the copyediting, typesetting, pagination and proofreading process, which may lead to differences between this version and the Version of Record. Please cite this article as doi: 10.1111/avsc.12356

Key words

Azonal habitats; Climatic gradient; Dune habitats; Endemism; Habitat classification; Meta-analysis; Phytosociological data; Vegetation gradient; Vegetation structure.

Nomenclature: Euro+Med (http://ww2.bgbm.org/EuroPlusMed/ (accessed Jan. 2017) and The Plant List database http://www.theplantlist.org/ (accessed Jan. 2017) for plant species not present in Euro+Med; Mucina *et al.* (2016) for alliances.

ABSTRACT

Question: Coastal environments have often been described as azonal. While this characteristic is clear for the foredune system, it seems less evident for more inland fixed dunes, which host habitats of major conservation concerns, whose features seem to be more related to local climatic conditions. We hypothesized that, differently from other coastal habitats, dune perennial grasslands differ floristically and structurally across their European range and that patterns of variation are linked to the corresponding climate.

Location: European coasts (Atlantic Ocean, Baltic, Mediterranean, and Black Sea)

Methods: We used a large dataset of phytosociological relevés, representative of coastal grasslands all along their European range. The role of climatic variables (temperature, precipitation and continentality) in determining the variability in species composition and vegetation structure (by means of life forms) was investigated through CCA, DCA and GLM. The degree of concentration of species occurrences within groups was calculated through the Phi coefficient.

Results: Through multivariate analyses we identified seven major types of coastal grassland, corresponding to different geographical areas. The groups significantly differed in their climatic envelope, as well as in their species composition and community structure.

Conclusion: Our results confirm the hypothesis that coastal dune perennial grasslands are subjected to local climate which exerts significant effects on both floristic composition and community structure. As a consequence, coastal grasslands are particularly prone to the effect of possible climate change which may alter species composition and distribution, and lead to shifts in the distribution of native plant communities.

INTRODUCTION

Coastal dune systems are distributed in almost all latitudes, and are characterized by a high ecological diversity in terms of geomorphological dimensions, environmental heterogeneity, and compositional variation (van der Maarel, 2003; Martínez *et al.*, 2004). Coastal dune habitats have often been described as azonal (Noirfalise, 1987; Acosta *et al.*, 2003; Wiedemann & Pickart, 2004), i.e. as linked to non-climatic environmental stress-factors or extreme soil conditions (Walter, 1985).

Indeed, the vegetation of beaches and foredunes is usually characterized by habitat specialists (Maun, 1994) with a broad to global distribution (e.g. *Cakile maritima, Ammophila arenaria, Elytrigia juncea*) (Wiedemann & Pickart, 2004; Davy *et al.*, 2006; Carboni *et al.*, 2016), resulting in low compositional variation at a continental scale (Doing, 1985), although examples of biogeographic vicariance have been described (Géhu, 1986). In contrast, communities of fixed dune systems have been described as subjected to local climate, geomorphology, lithology and site history (Provoost *et al.*, 2004; Houston, 2008; Sburlino *et al.*, 2008), suggesting a stronger influence of environmental factors and past climatic events that drove floristic migrations (Martínez *et al.*, 2004; Buffa *et al.*, 2007).

Species-rich perennial dune grasslands, where a matrix of perennial species is colonized by ephemeral species in spring and early summer, represent one of the most valuable and diversified habitat of the semi-fixed or fixed dune sector (Doing, 1985). They mainly occupy the transition zone along the sea-inland vegetation zonation, developing between the herbaceous vegetation of the foredune and the scrubs of the fixed dune. Being less exposed to the severe coastal environmental conditions, they normally present a higher vegetation cover and higher species richness compared to other early-successional dune habitats (Houston, 2008; Sburlino *et al.*, 2013; Del Vecchio *et al.*, 2015a). Moreover, they often grow in an undulating landscape with variable expositions and slopes, resulting in a high variability of micro-climates. Thanks to these features, they host a great variety of species, often rare, endemic or endangered, and a very high number of different plant communities (Martínez *et al.*, 2004; Bioret *et al.*, 2011; Del Vecchio *et al.*, 2012b; Del Vecchio *et al.*, 2012a), which, alongside serious anthropogenic threats, makes them habitats of major conservation concern (Bakker *et al.*, 2016; Janssen *et al.*, 2016).

Previous research on coastal fixed dune perennial grasslands mainly concentrated on the description of vegetation composition and on the syntaxonomical classification at local to national levels (e.g. Brullo *et al.*, 2001; Gamper *et al.*, 2008; Colasse & Delassus, 2014), using the Braun-Blanquet approach (Westhoff & van der Maarel, 1973; Dengler *et al.*, 2008), or on ecology, management and conservation strategies (e.g. Provoost *et al.*, 2004; Isermann *et al.*, 2010; Del Vecchio *et al.*, 2016). However, despite their evident diversity, no comparative studies, analyzing the variability of coastal perennial grasslands across their European range, have been carried out yet.

Two comprehensive, pan-European hierarchical habitat classification schemes are widely used in Europe: the EUNIS habitat classification (Davies *et al.*, 2004) and the Annex I of the EU Habitats Directive (92/43/EEC) (European Commission, 1992, 2013). EUNIS splits dune perennial grasslands into four geographical types: "Northern fixed grey dunes", "Biscay fixed grey dunes", "Mediterraneo-Atlantic fixed grey dunes" and "East Mediterranean fixed grey dunes". Annex I of the Habitats Directive recognizes only two types of dune perennial grassland: the habitat "2130* - Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous vegetation - grey dunes" along the coasts of the Baltic and North Sea, Atlantic Ocean and Black Sea, and " 2210 - *Crucianellion maritimae* fixed beach dunes", in the

Mediterranean. The dune perennial grassland types of both classifications encompass a wide geographical distribution, from the Baltic to the Mediterranean Sea. Recently, Schaminée et al. (2016) reviewed the EUNIS grassland types based on vegetation plots and proposed to reorganize dune perennial grasslands into three types: "B1.4a - Atlantic and Baltic coastal stable dune grassland (grey dunes)", "B1.4b - Mediterranean and Macaronesian coastal stable dune grassland (grey dunes)" and "B1.4c - Black Sea coastal dune grassland (grey dunes)".

From this starting point, this study aimed to analyze the variability of dune perennial grasslands relating it to climate gradients throughout their European distribution range. We hypothesized that, differently from other coastal habitats, perennial dune grasslands are subjected to the local climate which exerts significant effects on both floristic composition and community structure.

METHODS

Data collection

We collected phytosociological relevés of dune perennial grasslands from the entire European distribution range from published literature and from unpublished data, available from the European Vegetation Archive database (EVA; Chytrý *et al.*, 2016) and provided by some authors of this article. We considered as "dune perennial grasslands" the vegetation that grows between the foredune and the scrubs of the fixed dune, with a cover of perennial species higher than 25% of the total vascular species cover. The origin, number of relevés and syntaxa of each data source are provided in Appendix S1. For alliances delimitation and nomenclature we followed Mucina *et al.* (2016).

From an initial database of 4,500 relevés, we removed relevés with anomalous size (surface < 1 or > 25 m²) (e.g. Haveman & Janssen, 2008; Gigante *et al.*, 2016a) and uncertain information on geographic position or on the year in which they were performed. Furthermore, we removed all non-vascular species from relevés, because they had not been consistently sampled throughout the dataset. We performed geographic resampling in order to avoid spatial autocorrelation by randomly selecting one relevé per cell from a 1 x 1 km grid. After this procedure, we obtained a database of 605 relevés x 586 species (see Fig. 1 for the geographic distribution of relevés). Preliminary analysis of the dataset showed that neither remaining variation in plot size nor the year of surveying influenced the floristic composition (Pearson correlation; data not shown).

We associated to each relevé a) latitude and longitude; b) the value of mean annual temperature and precipitation using Worldclim (Fick & Hijmans, 2017), in 1 km² resolution grid (ArcGis 9.2); c) a continentality index, defined as the annual range of the extreme temperature values divided by the sine of the latitude (Kc index; Conrad, 1946); d) the syntaxon at the alliance level as indicated by authors who made the relevé, conforming the nomenclature to Mucina *et al.* (2016). We

chose the alliance rank because it has been proved to be the most appropriate to describe the variability of vegetation across wide geographical ranges, such as the European scale of investigation (Jennings *et al.*, 2009; Faber-Langendoen, 2015). Finally, we associated to each species a) the life form (Raunkiær, 1934), as a synthetic indication of adaptation to environmental conditions, especially climate (Kent & Coker, 1992); b) the distribution type, according to Tutin *et al.* (2001) and Euro+Med

Data analysis

To test our hypothesis we performed a Canonical Correspondence Analysis (CCA, on presence-absence data; Pc-ord 5.1 software; McCune & Mefford, 2006, 999 randomization), using the mean annual temperature, the mean annual precipitation and the Kc index as climatic data. To define the groups in the CCA diagram we performed a cluster analysis on the relevés x climatic data matrix (using Ward's clustering method, Euclidean distance, on square root transformed data; Pc-ord 5.1). Furthermore, we performed unconstrained ordination (DCA, on presence-absence data; Pc-ord 5.1), to compare constrained (CCA) with an unconstrained approach (DCA).

For each species in each group obtained by the CCA analysis we calculated the Phi coefficient (JUICE 7.0 Software; Tichý, 2002; Tichý & Chytrý, 2006). Being based on the degree of concentration of species occurrences, the Phi coefficient can be considered as a fidelity measure of a species in a given group of relevés (Tichý, 2002). The phi value of 40 was used as the lower threshold to identify the diagnostic species in each group. The value of the Fisher exact test was set at 0.001.

In order to detect differences in the structure of sand perennial grasslands, we performed a PERMANOVA (Past 3.0 Software) among the groups, followed by post hoc Tukey test, using the frequency of life forms (in particular chamaephytes, hemicryptophytes and therophytes) as dependent variables, and the groups identified by the CCA as grouping variable. To analyze the contribution of climate variables in determining the distribution of life forms, we performed General Linear Models (on square root transformed data; R package MASS; Venables & Ripley, 2002) using the frequency of life forms as dependent variables and the climatic variables (mean annual temperature and mean annual precipitation) as independent variables.

The species distribution area and the alliances were used as general descriptors of the variability within each group.

This article

RESULTS

Variability of perennial grasslands across the European distribution range

According to the floristic and climatic variability, and to the groups evidenced by the cluster analysis (percent chaining = 0.47; clustering level = 90%) we could identify seven major groups in the CCA ordination space (Fig. 1; see Appendix S2 for the scatter plot of relevés and technical results). The first axis was predominantly determined by the mean annual temperature and the Kc index, while the second axis was determined by the mean annual precipitation (Appendix S2).

The correlation of the climatic variables with the unconstrained ordination (DCA ordination axes, Appendix S2) confirmed the result obtained using the constrained method (CCA).

The groups corresponded to different geographical areas arranged along a latitudinal and longitudinal gradient (Fig. 1): i) the first one (1 Baltic) corresponded to the relevés distributed along the coasts of Baltic Sea; ii) the second one (2 North Sea) included the relevés form the North Sea and the east coast of Great Britain; iii) the third one (3 Atlantic) included the West Atlantic coast, from the Channel and the west coast of Great Britain downward to the Bay of Biscay and down to approximately Porto district; vi) the fourth group (4 N Adriatic) corresponded to the North Adriatic region (Italy), which represents the north-eastern part of the Mediterranean Basin; v) the fifth group (5 Black Sea) corresponded to the Black Sea coast; vi) the sixth group (6 S Atlantic) included the relevés of the South Atlantic coast, in Portugal; vii) the seventh group (7 Medit-Atl) mainly assorted the relevés from the Mediterranean coast, but it also included the southernmost part of the Atlantic coast of Spain and Portugal.

The groups showed differences in their climatic envelope, summarized in Tab. 1. The groups arranged from north to south along an increasing gradient of mean annual temperature and continentality, with group 1 showing the minimum and group 7 the maximum values. Mean precipitation values displayed a maximum at intermediate latitudes, and decreased eastwards, along the longitudinal gradient, with the western coasts of Europe, bordering the Atlantic ocean, and the N Adriatic coastline showing the highest values of precipitation.

Diagnostic species

The diagnostic species of each group, their Fidelity index values and their distribution area are summarized in Tab. 2. Each group was characterized by diagnostic species with a narrow distribution area, in some cases endemic. The values of the fidelity index were high, especially for the groups 1 Baltic, 4 N Adriatic, 5 Black Sea and 6 S Atlantic, with the Black Sea group having the highest number of diagnostic species. A similar pattern was observed at the syntaxon level of alliance, since

each group showed a dominance of one alliance. A synoptic table showing the frequency of species in each group is provided in Appendix S3.

Climatic variables and vegetation structure

We found differences in the frequency of life forms among groups (PERMANOVA test; F= 53.32; p=0.0001). In particular, chamaephytes increased in frequency southwards, while hemicryptophytes and therophytes evidenced an opposite trend (Fig. 2).

Linear models showed that temperature was the most important driver of life forms frequency, with significant influence on all of them (see Appendix S4 for technical results). Chamaephytes increased at higher temperatures, while hemicryptophytes and therophytes decreased. Precipitation mainly affected therophyte frequency, that increased with increasing precipitation. Hemicryptophytes showed the same trend, although the effect was less strong.

DISCUSSION

Our results confirm the hypothesis that coastal dune perennial grasslands are subjected to the local climate which exerts significant effects on both floristic composition and community structure. Although some species are widely distributed (e.g. *Artemisia campestris, Carex arenaria, Cerastium semidecandrum*), most of them show narrower geographical ranges and are related to specific climatic conditions or local biogeographical or geological histories (Piñeiro *et al.*, 2007). Our results are in line with those of Jiménez-Alfaro *et al.* (2015) who found a greater effect of climatic variables on fixed dune communities with respect to shifting dunes.

The analysis of the relationships between vegetation and climatic variables allowed to identify seven groups of perennial grasslands, which depict a clear geographical gradient, mainly determined by latitude and continental position, running from the coasts of Baltic and North Sea, through those of West Atlantic Ocean, North Adriatic and Black Sea, downward to the Mediterranean coast and the southern coast of Atlantic Ocean.

Although detailed comparisons are difficult as classifications may not use the same variables or the same spatial resolution, our results are consistent with the thermotypes of Europe proposed by Rivas-Martínez *et al.* (2010), in particular as far as boundaries are concerned. Especially, our data support the existence of a large intermediate zone, extending from the English Channel down to approximately the Porto district, which corresponds to the "Thermotemperate" zone proposed by Rivas-Martínez *et al.* (2010). The transition zone extends eastward to the North Adriatic region and the Black Sea area.

Each climatic zone proved to be rather homogeneous when considering the floristic composition. Diagnostic species showed a geographically well delimited distribution, for most part coincident with that of the group, with a remarkable richness in endemic species. The high values of

the fidelity index confirm that identified diagnostic species were present in almost all relevés of the group, and allowed to characterize each geographical area from the floristic point of view. Moreover, the analysis of diagnostic species distribution area supported the distinctiveness of the Black Sea region, recognized by almost all climatic, environmental and biogeographical stratifications of Europe (EEA, 2005; Metzger *et al.*, 2005; Rivas-Martínez *et al.*, 2010) as well as the climatic and floristic peculiarities of the western coast of Europe, bordering the Atlantic ocean (Beatty & Provan, 2013; Minckley *et al.*, 2015). Either paleogeographic events (such as the ice age of the Quaternary period) and the current climatic conditions (in particular the North Atlantic Oscillation -NAO) associated to high precipitation rates (Webb & Bartlein, 1992; Batten *et al.*, 2014; Minckley *et al.*, 2015) are probably related to the floristic identity of this area.

Furthermore, this study also provided new evidence of the biogeographic originality of the Italian sector of the Northern Adriatic Sea, already recognized for other north-eastern Italian ecosystems (Buffa & Villani, 2012). These peculiarities, which contribute to define coastal ecosystems strongly atypical within the Mediterranean context (Buffa *et al.*, 2005; Buffa *et al.*, 2007; Gamper *et al.*, 2008: Sburlino *et al.*, 2008; Sburlino *et al.*, 2013), were previously highlighted by Béguinot (1913, 1941), and later by Marcello (1960). Based on floristic studies, both authors described the 'Venetian biogeographic lacuna'. In fact, many typical Mediterranean plant species found on both sides of the Adriatic Sea (such as *Crucianella maritima, Helichrysum stoechas, Maresia nana, Matthiola tricuspidata*) were not present in the Venetian coasts which are exposed to cold north-easterly winds, but sheltered from the influence of warm, south-westerly ones. These climatic features promote sub-Atlantic climatic conditions, rather than Mediterranean ones. Paleogeographic events during the Tertiary period, such as opening and closure of marine corridors as well as the appearance and disappearance of water bodies between Europe and West Asia (up the Caspian Sea), may also have contributed to the floristic difference found along the longitudinal gradient considered in this study (Müller *et al.*, 1999; Ivanov *et al.*, 2011).

Although mosses and lichens were not included in this research, it is worth to highlight their potential role in a further differentiation of sand dune perennial grasslands within the European range. According to literature considered in this study, mosses and lichens were a typical component in sand dune perennial grasslands of northern and West Europe. They were still present in the Northern Adriatic area, while they completely disappeared in the Mediterranean one.

Major features of each group were also confirmed by the relevant number of autonomous syntaxa at alliance level, often endemic or confined to geographical regions. It is the case e.g. of *Koelerion glaucae*, mainly distributed in the north-eastern Europe, *Euphorbio portlandicae-Helichrysion stoechadis*, endemic to the Atlantic coast (Géhu, 2000), or *Syntrichio-Lomelosion argenteae*, limited to the north Adriatic coast (Sburlino *et al.*, 2013). Note also that the groups of relevés identified by the analysis of the relationships between vegetation and climatic variables, in most cases correspond to specific alliances. This result confirms the usefulness of the alliance rank

which is usually floristically better separated compared with higher vegetation ranks (Jennings *et al.*, 2009; Gigante *et al.*, 2016b) and contributes to highlight environmental gradients and biogeographic regions (Willner *et al.*, 2017).

Besides the taxonomical or syntaxonomical differentiation, the analysis of the vegetation structure revealed functional information through life forms (Duckworth *et al.*, 2010; Del Vecchio *et al.*, 2015b; Fantinato *et al.*, 2016; Slaviero *et al.*, 2016; Pierce *et al.*, 2017). Although chamaephytes, hemicryptophytes and therophytes always represented the main life forms, they were differentially distributed among the groups, with chamaephytes prevailing in the southernmost zones (Mediterranean and S Atlantic), while hemicryptophytes and therophytes dominate in the northern, western and easternmost zones and this pattern is strongly related to temperature values. In fact, these results are consistent with previous studies (Swenson & Enquist, 2007; van Ommen Kloeke *et al.*, 2012; Moles *et al.*, 2014) demonstrating that temperature is more related to plant traits than precipitations.

Our study evidenced that the use of large phytosociological databases may represent a valuable tool to detect vegetation variation at continental scale and provide fine-scale information for exploring large-scale ecological patterns and processes and for increasing the accuracy of land categorization.

Our results rather conform to the recent revision of EUNIS grassland habitats classification provided by Schaminée *et al.* (2016). Conversely, the Annex I habitat types seem too broad to account for the variability we found. Considering that Annex I habitat types represent a selected list of habitats of conservation interest, a more detailed classification becomes crucial to provide an effective system for the description and monitoring of habitat types at European, national and regional context. Our study can thus contribute to improve the classification of perennial dune grasslands, providing information on indicator species, structural characteristics and their geographical range across Europe.

Overall, our study demonstrated that climate parameters such as temperature and precipitation have a significant effect on perennial dune grasslands, influencing the species pool, the presence of floristic and coenological peculiarities, and defining the vegetation structure. Although further research is needed to take into account other possible drivers of variation, our results might support the zonality of dune perennial grasslands envisaged by previous authors (Provoost *et al.*, 2004; Houston, 2008; Sburlino *et al.*, 2008). From a biodiversity conservation point of view, this would rise concern with respect to global warming. Due to the important role of climatic parameters in determining the vegetation pattern, coastal grasslands may suffer the influence of climate change more than other coastal habitats (Bakker *et al.*, 2016; Prisco *et al.*, 2016). Rising temperatures and changes in precipitation can substantially alter the composition, distribution, and abundance of species, which can eventually lead to shifts in the distribution of native plant communities (Nordstrom, 2014) and make dune perennial grasslands a key habitat for assessing the long term impact of global warming on coastal biodiversity.

REFERENCES

- Acosta, A., Stanisci, A., Ercole, S. & Blasi, C. 2003. Sandy coastal landscape of the Lazio region (Central Italy). *Phytocoenologia*, 33: 715-726.
- Bakker, J.P., Baas, A.C.W., Bartholdy, J., Jones, L., Ruessink, G., Temmerman, S. & van de Pol, M. 2016. Environmental Impacts-Coastal Ecosystems. In: Quante, M. & Colijn, F. (eds.) North Sea Region Climate Change Assessment, pp. 275-314. Springer International Publishing, Cham.
- Batten, D.J., Zhou, Z.Y. & Li, W.B. 2014. Plant remains from Early Cretaceous deposits on the Goban Spur, Bay of Biscay, North Atlantic Ocean, and their palaeoenvironmental significance. *Palaeoworld*, 23: 162-186.
- Beatty, G.E. & Provan, J. 2013. Post-glacial dispersal, rather than in situ glacial survival, best explains the disjunct distribution of the Lusitanian plant species Daboecia cantabrica (Ericaceae). *Journal of Biogeography*, 40: 335-344.
- Bioret, F., Lazare, J.J. & Géhu, J.M. 2011. Évaluation patrimoniale et vulnérabilité des associations végétales du littoral atlantique français. *Journal de Botanique*, 56: 39-67.
- Brullo, S., Giusso del Caldo, G., Siracusa, G. & Spampinato, G. 2001. Considerazioni fitogeografiche sulla vegetazione psammophila dei litorali italiani. *Biogeographia*, 22: 93-137.
- Buffa, G., Mion, D., Gamper, U., Ghirelli, L. & Sburlino, G. 2005. Valutazione della qualità e dello stato di conservazione delgi ambienti litoranei: l'esempio del SIC "Penisola del Cavallino:biotopi litoranei" (Venezia, NE-Italia). *Fitosociologia*, 42: 3-13.
- Buffa, G., Filesi, L., Gamper, U. & Sburlino, G. 2007. Qualità e grado di conservazione del paesaggio vegetale del litorale sabbioso del Veneto (Italia settentrionale). *Fitosociologia*, 44: 49-58.
- Buffa, G. & Villani, M. 2012. Are the ancient forests of the Eastern Po Plain large enough for a long term conservation of herbaceous nemoral species? *Plant Biosystems*, 146: 970-984.
- Béguinot, A. 1913. La vita delle piante superiori della Laguna di Venezia e nei territori ad essa circostanti. UIL Idr.d. R. Magistr. alle Acque, Venezia, 54
- Béguinot, A. 1941. La vita delle piante vascolari. La laguna di Venezia. Ferrari, Venezia.
- Carboni, M., Zelený, D. & Acosta, A. 2016. Measuring ecological specialization along a natural stress gradient using a set of complementary niche breadth indices. *Journal of Vegetation Science*, 27(5): 892-903.
- Chytrý, M., Hennekens, S.M., Jiménez-Alfaro, B., Knollová, I., Dengler, J., Jansen, F., Landucci, F., Schaminée, J.H.J., Aćić, S., (...) & Yamalov, S. 2016. European Vegetation Archive (EVA): an integrated database of European vegetation plots. *Applied Vegetation Science*, 19, 173-180.
- Colasse, V. & Delassus, L. 2014. Contribution à la connaissance phytosociologique des pelouses arrière-dunaires de la côte ouest du département de la Manche. *Documents Phytosociologiques*, 1: 181-201.

- Conrad, V. 1946. Usual formulas of continentality and their limits of validity. *Transaction, American Geophysical Union*, 27: 663-664.
- Davies, C., Moss, D. & Hill, M. 2004. Eunis Habitat Classification. European Environmental Angency, Copenhagen.
- Davy, A.J., Scott, R. & Cordazzo, C.V. 2006. Biological flora of the British Isles: Cakile maritima Scop. *Journal of Ecology*, 94: 695-711.
- Del Vecchio, S., Giovi, E., Izzi, C.F., Abbate, G. & Acosta, A. 2012b. Malcolmia littorea: The isolated Italian population in the European context. *Journal for Nature Conservation*, 20: 357-363.
- Del Vecchio, S., Mattana, E., Acosta, A. & Bacchetta, G. 2012a. Seed germination responses to varying environmental conditions and provenances in Crucianella maritima L., a threatened coastal species. *Comptes Rendus Biologies*, 335: 26-31.
- Del Vecchio, S., Pizzo, L. & Buffa, G. 2015a. The response of plant community diversity to alien invasion: evidence from a sand dune time series. *Biodiversity and Conservation*, 24: 371-392.
- Del Vecchio, S., Prisco, I., Acosta, A. & Stanisci, A. 2015b. Trends in plant species composition and cover along Adriatic coastal dune habitats in the last 20 years. *AOB PLANTS*, 7: plv018.
- Del Vecchio, S., Slaviero, A., Fantinato, E. & Buffa, G. 2016. The use of plant community attributes to detect habitat quality in coastal environments. *AoB PLANTS*, 8: plw040.
- Dengler, J., Chytrý, M. & Ewald, J. 2008. Phytosociology. In: Jørgensen, S.E. & Fath B.D. (eds.) *Encyclopedia of Ecology*, pp. 2767–2779. Elsevier, Oxford.
- Doing, H. 1985. Coastal foredune zonation and succession in various parts of the world. *Vegetatio*, 61: 65-75.
- Duckworth, J.C., Kent, M. & Ramsay, P.M. 2010. Plant functional types: an alternative to taxonomic plant community description in biogeography? *Progress in Physical Geography*, 24 (4): 515– 542.
- EEA, 2005. *Biogeographical regions, Europe 2005*. Available at: http://www.eea.europa.eu. (accessed 2017).
- European Commission, 1992. Council Directive 92/43/EEC of 21 May 1992 on the conservation of natural habitats and of wild fauna and flora. In. Official Journal L 206, 22/07/1992. P. 0007-0050.
- European Commission, 2013. Interpretation Manual of European Union Habitats EUR28, European Commission DG Environment.
- Faber-Langendoen, D. 2015. EcoVeg: a new approach to vegetation description and classification. *Ecological Monographs*, 85: 473-473.
- Fantinato, E., Del Vecchio, S., Slaviero, A.S., Conti, L., Acosta, A.T.R. & Buffa, G. 2016. Does flowering synchrony contribute to the sustainment of dry grassland biodiversity? *Flora: Morphology, Distribution, Functional Ecology of Plants* 222: 96–103.

- Fick, S.E. & Hijmans, R.J. 2017. Worldclim 2: New 1-km spatial resolution climate surfaces for global land areas. *International Journal of Climatology* 37: 4302–4315.
- Gamper, U., Filesi, L., Buffa, G. & Sburlino, G. 2008. Phytocaenotic diversity of the N-Adriatic coastal sand dunes. 1 - The phanerophytic communities. *Plant Sociology*, 45: 3-21.
- Géhu, J.M. 1986. La végétation côtière. Faits de géosynvicariance atlantico- méditerranéenne. Bulletin d'Écologie, 17 (3): 179-187.
- Géhu, J.M. 2000. Observations phytosociologiques préliminaires sur le littoral occidental de la Île de Jersey (Anglo-Normande). *Colloques Phytosociologiques* 27: 169-196
- Gigante, D., Attorre, F, Venanzoni, R., Acosta, A., Agrillo, E., Aleffi, M., Alessi, N., Allegrezza, M., Angelini, P, (...) & Zitti, S. 2016a. A methodological protocol for Annex I Habitats monitoring: the contribution of Vegetation science. *Plant Sociology*, 53: 77-78.
- Gigante, D., Foggi, B., Venanzoni, R., Viciani, D. & Buffa, G. 2016b. Habitats on the grid: The spatial dimension does matter for red-listing. *Journal for Nature Conservation*, 32: 1-9.
- Haveman, R. & Janssen, J.A.M. 2008. The analysis of long-term changes in plant communities using large databases: The effect of stratified resampling. *Journal of Vegetation Science*, 19: 355-U97.
- Houston, J. 2008. Management of Natura 2000 habitats. 2130 *Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous vegetation ('grey dunes'). European Commission.
- Isermann, M., Koehler, H. & Mühl, M. 2010. Interactive effects of rabbit grazing and environmental factors on plant species-richness on dunes of Norderney. *Journal of Coastal Conservation*, 14: 103–114.
- Ivanov, D., Utescher, T., Mosbrugger, V., Syabryaj, S., Djordjević-Milutinović, D. & Molchanoff, S. 2011. Miocene vegetation and climate dynamics in Eastern and Central Paratethys (Southeastern Europe). *Palaeogeography Palaeoclimatology Palaeoecology*, 304: 262-275.
- Janssen, J., Rodwell, J., García Criado, M., Gubbay, S., Haynes, T., Nieto, A., Sanders, N., Landucci,F., Loidi, J., (...) & Valachovič, M. 2016. European Red List of Habitats. European Union.
- Jennings, M.D., Faber-Langendoen, D., Loucks, O.L., Peet, R.K. & Roberts, D. 2009. Standards for associations and alliances of the US National Vegetation Classification. *Ecological Monographs*, 79: 173-199.
- Kent, M. & Coker, P. 1992. Vegetation description and analysis. Wiley, Chichester.
- Jiménez-Alfaro, B., Marcenò, C., Guarino, R., Chytrý, M. 2015. Regional metacommunities in two coastal systems: spatial structure and drivers of plant assemblages. *Journal of Biogeography*, 42 (3): 452-462.
- Marcello, A. 1960. Lacuna floristica del Veneziano e sue condizioni bioclimatiche. *Mem. Biogeogr. Adr*, 5: 51-118.
- Martínez, M.L., Psuty, N.P. & Lubke, R.A. 2004. A perspective on coastal dunes. *Coastal Dunes: Ecology and Conservation*, 171: 3-10.

- Maun, M.A. 1994. Adaptations enhancing survival and establishment of seedlings on coastal dune systems. *Vegetatio*, 111: 59-70.
- McCune, B. & Mefford, M. J. 2006. PC-ORD Multivariate Analysis of Ecological Data. Version 5. MjM Software. Gleneden Beach: Oregon.
- Metzger, M.J., Bunce, R.G.H., Jongman, R.H.G., Mücher, C.A. & Watkins, J.W. 2005. A climatic stratification of the environment of Europe. *Global Ecology and Biogeography*, 14: 549-563.
- Minckley, T.A., Haws, J.A., Benedetti, M.M., Brewer, S.C. & Forman, S.L. 2015. Last interglacial vegetation and climate history from the Portuguese coast. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 30: 59-69.
- Moles, A.T., Perkins, S.E., Laffan, S.W., Flores-Moreno, H., Awasthy, M., Tindall, M.L., Sack, L., Pitman, A., Kattge, J., (...) & Bonser, S.P. 2014. Which is a better predictor of plant traits: temperature or precipitation? *Journal of Vegetation Science*, 25: 1167-1180.
- Mucina, L., Bültmann, H., Dierßen, K., Theurillat, J.P., Raus, T., Čarni, A., Šumberová, K., Willner, W., Dengler, J., (...). & Tichý, L. 2016. Vegetation of Europe: hierarchical floristic classification system of vascular plant, bryophyte, lichen, and algal communities. *Applied Vegetation Science*, 19: 3-264.
- Müller, P., Geary, D.H. & Magyar, I. 1999. The endemic molluscs of the Late Miocene Lake Pannon: their origin, evolution, and family-level taxonomy. *Lethaia*, 32: 47-60.
- Noirfalise, A. 1987. *Map of the Natural Vegetation of the member countries of the European Community and of the Council of Europe*. Office for official publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg.
- Nordstrom, K. 2014. Coastal Dunes. In: Masselink, G. & Gehrels, R. (eds) *Coastal Environments and Global Change*, pp. 178-193. Wiley-Blackwell.
- Pierce, S., Negreiros, D., Cerabolini, B.E.L., Kattge, J., Díaz, S., Kleyer, M., Shipley, B., Wright, S.J.,
 Soudzilovskaia, N.A., (...) & Tampucci, D. 2017. A global method for calculating plant CSR
 ecological strategies applied across biomes world-wide. *Functional Ecology*, 31: 444-457.
- Piñeiro, R., Fuertes Aguilar, J., Draper Munt D. & Nieto Feliner, G. 2007. Ecology matters: Atlantic– Mediterranean disjunction in the sand-dune shrub Armeria pungens (Plumbaginaceae). *Molecular Ecology*, 16: 2155–2171.
- Prisco, I., Carboni, M., Jucker, T. & Acosta, A. 2016. Temporal changes in the vegetation of Italian coastal dunes: identifying winners and losers through the lens of functional traits. *Journal of Applied Ecology*, 53: 1533–1542.
- Provoost, S., Ampe, C., Bonte, D., Cosyns, E. & Hoffmann, M. 2004. Ecology, management and monitoring of grey dunes in Flanders. *Journal of Coastal Conservation*, 10: 33-42.
- Raunkiær, C. 1934. The Life Forms of Plants and Statistical Plant Geography.Oxford University Press.

- Rivas-Martínez, S., Penas, A. & Díaz, T.E. 2010. Computerized Bioclimatic Maps of the World: Thermotypes of Europe and Mideast. Available at: http://www.globalbioclimatics.org/cbm/static/conti/Europe_Thermotypes_gb.png
- Sburlino, G., Buffa, G., Filesi, L. & Gamper, U. 2008. Phytocoenotic originality of the N-Adriatic coastal sand dunes (Northern Italy) in the European context: The Stipa veneta-rich communities. *Plant Biosystems*, 142: 533-539.
- Sburlino, G., Buffa, G., Filesi, L., Gamper, U. & Ghirelli, L. 2013. Phytocoenotic diversity of the N-Adriatic coastal sand dunes - The herbaceous communities of the fixed dunes and the vegetation of the interdunal wetlands. *Plant Sociology*, 50: 57-77.
- Schaminée, J., Chytrý, M., Hennekens, S., Janssen, J., Jiménez-Alfaro, B., Knollová, I., Marcenò, C., Mucina, L., Rodwell, J., Tichý, L. & data providers 2016. Review of grassland habitats and development of distribution maps of heathland, scrub and tundra habitats of EUNIS habitats classification. Alterra, Wageningen.
- Slaviero, A., Del Vecchio, S., Pierce, S., Fantinato, E. & Buffa, G. 2016. Plant community attributes affect dry grassland orchid establishment. *Plant Ecology*, 217: 1533–1543.
- Swenson, N.G. & Enquist, B.J. 2007. Ecological and evolutionary determinants of a key plant functional trait: Wood density and its community-wide variation across latitude and elevation. *American Journal of Botany*, 94: 451-459.
- Tichý, L. 2002. JUICE, software for vegetation classification. *Journal of Vegetation Science*, 13: 451-453.
- Tichý, L. & Chytrý, M. 2006. Statistical determination of diagnostic species for site groups of unequal size. *Journal of Vegetation Science*, 17: 809-818.
- Tutin, T., Heywood, V., Burges, N., Valentine, D., Walters, S. & Webb, D. 2001. Flora Europea. Cambridge University Press.
- van der Maarel, E. 2003. Some remarks on the functions of European coastal ecosystems. *Phytocoenologia*, 33: 187-202.
- van Ommen Kloeke, A.E.E., Douma, J.C., Ordoñez, J.C., Reich, P.B. & van Bodegom, P.M. 2012. Global quantification of contrasting leaf life span strategies for deciduous and evergreen species in response to environmental conditions. *Global Ecology and Biogeography*, 21: 224-235.
- Venables, W.N. & Ripley, B.D. 2002. Modern applied statistics with S. 4th edn. Springer, New York.
- Walter, H. 1985. Vegetation of the Earth and ecological systems of the geo-biosphere. 3rd edn. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.
- Webb, T. & Bartlein, P.J. 1992. Global changes during the last 3 million years climatic controls and biotic responses. *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics*, 23: 141-173.
- Westhoff, V. & van der Maarel, E. 1973. The Braun-Blanquet approach. In: Whittaker, R.H. (eds.) Classification of plant communities, pp. 289–399. The Hague, Junk, NL.

Wiedemann, A. & Pickart, A. 2004. Temperate zone coastal dunes. In: Martínez, E. & Psuty, N. (eds.) Coastal dunes: ecology and conservation, pp. 53-63. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.

Willner, W., Jiménez-Alfaro, B., Agrillo, E., Biurrun, I., Campos, J.A., Čarni, A., Casella, L., Csiky, J., Čušterevska, R., (...) & Chytrý, M., 2017. Classification of European beech forests: a Gordian Knot? *Applied Vegetation Science*, 20 (3): 494-512.

Tab.1 Values of temperature, precipitation and continentality index for the seven groups of relevés evidenced by the multivariate analyses.

	ANNUAL TEMPERATURE		ANNU PRECIPIT	CONTINENTALITY INDEX			
	Mean ±SD (°C)	Range	Mean ±SD (mm) Mir	Range	Mean ±SD	Range	
GROUP		Min Max		Min Max		Min	Max
1 Baltic	6.4 ± 0.2	6.1 6.6	54.4 ± 1.6	51.6 57.0	14.1 ±0.1	13.9	14.1
2 North Sea	9.5 ± 0.7	8.1 10.7	60.1 ± 6.5	45.3 70.8	17.0 ± 1.2	14.0	21.3
3 Atlantic	11.8 ± 1.5	7.4 14.8	80.8 ± 13.6	60.9 127.7	20.2 ± 4.2	13.6	30.4
4 N Adriatic	13.4 ± 0.1	13.2 13.5	80.4 ± 12.5	63.3 93.7	25.3 ± 1.1	23.9	26.7
5 Black Sea	12.8 ± 0.5	12.1 13.3	44.3 ±3.3	39.3 47.7	26.5 ± 1.9	22.5	29.1
6 S Atlantic	15.3 ± 0.1	15.1 15.3	61.9 ± 5.0	54.3 69.7	25.2 ± 2.4	21.9	29.0
7 Medit-Atl	16.8 ±0.9	14.5 18.5	46.9 ± 8.3	23.7 71.5	32.1 ± 5.0	20.3	43.0

Tab. 2 Variability of the groups at species and syntaxonomical level. The table shows the diagnostic species, with the relative Phi value (threshold value= 40; Fisher exact test = 0.001), diagnostic species distribution area at European level (Euro+Med; Tutin *et al.*, 2001), and the alliances described in each area, with their percentage of frequency. Nomenclature and syntaxa delimitation follow Mucina *et al.* (2016).

	Group	Diagnostic species	Distribution area	PHI value	Alliances	Frequency (%)
		Festuca polesica	Eurosiberian	96.1		
		Koeleria glauca	Eurasiatic	87.8		
		Hieracium umbellatum	Eurasiatic	62.4		
		Thymus serpyllum s.l.	Eurasiatic	60.3		
	1 Baltic	Pulsatilla pratensis	Eurasiatic	54.8	Koelerion glaucae Volk 1931	100.0
		Arabidopsis arenosa	Eurasiatic	48.7		
		Anthyllis vulneraria ssp. maritima	Eurosiberian	48.7		
		Dianthus arenarius	NE Europe	42.0		
		Tragopogon heterospermus	Baltic endemic	42.0		
		Myosotis ramosissima	Broad distribution	55.2		
		Jacobaea vulgaris	Eurasiatic	53.1		
		Cerastium semidecandrum	Eurasiatic	49.6		
		Festuca rubra	Broad distribution	48.2	Koelerion arenariae Tx. 1937 corr.	
	2 North Coo	Erophila verna	Broad distribution	47.9	Gutermann et Mucma 1995	
	2. North Sea	Carex arenaria	Subatlantic	47.6	Corynephorion canescentis Klika	97.9
		Phleum arenarium	Subatlantic	46.0	1931	
		Erodium cicutarium	Broad distribution	44.7		2.1
		Sedum acre	Eurasiatic	42.3		
		Galium verum	Eurasiatic	42.0		

		Aira praecox	Subatlantic	41.5			
		Veronica arvensis	Broad distribution	41.1			
		Poa pratensis	Eurasiatic	40.3			
		Mibora minima	Western Europe	52.5			
		Euphorbia portlandica	Western Europe	51.0	Euphorbio portlandicae-		
		Thymus praecox	Most of Europe	48.1	1974	64.9	
	3. Atlantic	Ononis spinosa	Mediterranean	45.5			
		Arenaria serpyllifolia	Broad distribution	42.1	Koelerion arenariae Tx. 1937 corr. Gutermann et Mucina 1993	35.1	
		Helichrysum stoechas	Mediterraneo-Atlantic	42.1	Euphorbio portlandicae- Helichrysion stoechadis Sissingh 1974 Koelerion arenariae Tx. 1937 corr. Gutermann et Mucina 1993 Syntrichio ruraliformis-Lomelosion argenteae Biondi, Sburlino & Theurillat in Sburlino, Buffa, Filesi, Gamper & Ghirelli 2013 Sileno thymifoliae-Jurineion kilaeae Géhu et Uslu ex Mucina 2016 Elymion gigantei Morariu 1957		
		Fumana procumbens	South-Eastern Europe	81.2			
		Carex liparocarpos	South-Eastern Europe	67.0		n 100.0	
		Silene vulgaris	Broad distribution	63.7			
		Sanguisorba minor	Broad distribution	61.6			
		Scabiosa triandra	South Europe	56.9	Syntrichio ruraliformis-Lomelosion		
	1 N Advistis	Vulpia fasciculata	Mediterraneo-Atlantic	56.4	argenteae Biondi, Sburlino &		
	4. N Auriauc	Petrorhagia saxifraga	Mediterranean	50.2	Theurillat in Sburlino, Buffa, Filesi, Campar & Chiralli 2013		
		Teucrium chamaedrys	Mediterranean	45.2	Filesi, Gamper & Gimeni 2015		
		Helianthemum nummularium ssp. obscurum	South-Eastern Europe	42.6			
		Silene otites	Most of Europe	40.9			
i 5		Medicago minima	Eurasiatic	40.9			
		Jurinea kilaea	Endemic Black Sea	80.3			
		Silene thymifolia	Endemic Black Sea	75.0			
		Lepidotrichum uechtritzianum	Endemic Black Sea	72.2	Sileno thymifoliae-Jurineion		
		Centaurea arenaria	South-Eastern Europe	66.5	kilaeae Géhu et		
	5 Black Sea	Odontarrhena borzaeana	South-Eastern Europe	60.3	Uslu ex Mucina 2016		
		Peucedanum arenarium	South-Eastern Europe	60.3	Elymion gigantei Morariu 1957		
		Linaria genistifolia	South-Eastern Europe	57.0		72.0	
		Cionura erecta	South-Eastern Europe	57.0			
		Secale sylvestre	South-Eastern Europe	57.0		28.0	

		Silene euxina	Endemic Black Sea	53.6		
		Verbascum purpureum	Endemic Black Sea	50.0		
		Festuca vaginata	South-Eastern Europe	50.0		
		Cynanchum acutum	Broad distribution.	50.0		
		Artemisia campestris	Broad distribution	42.8		
		Erysimum diffusum	South-Eastern Europe	42.0		
		Medicago falcata	Eurasiatic	42.0		
		Armeria welwitschii	Endemic (PT)	88.0		
		Sedum sediforme	Mediterraneo-Atlantic	74.6		
		Herniaria ciliolata ssp. robusta	Western Europe	66.1		
		Iberis procumbens	Western Europe	60.3	Common horizon conception Klilton	70.0
		Corynephorus canescens	Western Europe	53.8	1931	
,	6.S Atlantic	Helichrysum italicum	Mediterraneo-Atlantic	56.1	Haliahrusian nigardii (Diwas Mart	30.0
		Malcolmia littorea	Western Europe	32.3	Corynephorion canescentis Klika 1931 Helichrysion picardii (Rivas-Mart., M. Costa et Izco in Rivas-Mart. et al. 1990) Rivas-Mart. et al. 1999 Crucianellion maritimae Rivas	
		Anagallis monelli	Mediterranean	50.4		
		Calendula suffruticosa	Western Europe.	48.7		
		Seseli tortuosum	Mediterranean	43.5		
		Halimium calycinum	Endemic (PT, ES)	42.8		
	7. Medit-Atl	Lotus cytisoides	Mediterranean	46.1	Crucianellion maritimae Rivas	76.2
		Crucianella maritima	Mediterranean	46.7	Goday & Rivas-Martinez 1958	
		Anthemis maritima	Western Europe	43.9	Corynephorion canescentis Klika	23.8
		Pancratium maritimum	Mediterranean	43.5	1931	

FIGURES

Fig. 1 Geographic distribution of the relevés. Different symbols refer to the grouping emerged by multivariate analyses. White dots = group 1, Baltic Sea; Grey dots = group 2, North Sea; Diamonds = group 3, Atlantic; Asterisks = group 4, N Adriatic; White triangles = group 5, Black Sea; Black triangles = group 6, S Atlantic; Crosses = group 7, Medit-Atl.



Fig. 2 Mean \pm SD of life forms frequency values within each group. Bars with different letters are significantly different to post hoc Tukey test.



SUPPORTING INFORMATION

Appendix S1 - Reference list of published literature used to build the database.

Appendix S2 - Scatter plots of relevés and technical results of multivariate analyses

Appendix S3 - Synoptic table of species frequency in each group.

Appendix S4 - Model results