1	
2	
3	<b>Radiocarbon Evidence for a Possible Abyssal Front</b>
4	Near 3.1 km in the Glacial Equatorial Pacific Ocean
5	
6	L. D. Keigwin <sup>a</sup> *
7	a t t h
8	S. J. Lehman <sup>°</sup>
9	awas de Usie Ossere errentris Institution
10	260 Woods Hole Rd
11	200 woods Hole Rd. Woods Hole MA 02542
12	woods hole, IVIA 02545
13	<sup>b</sup> University of Colorado
15	INSTAAR Campus Box 450
16	Boulder CO 80309
17	
18	*corresponding author
19	telephone 508 289 2784
20	email: lkeigwin@whoi.edu
21	
22	ABSTRACT
23	We investigate the radiocarbon ventilation age in deep equatorial Pacific
24	sediment cores using the difference in conventional <sup>14</sup> C age between coexisting
25	benthic and planktonic foraminifera, and integrate those results with similar
26	data from around the North Pacific Ocean in a reconstruction for the last
27	glaciation (15 to 25 conventional <sup>14</sup> C ka). Most new data from both the
28	Equatorial Pacific and the Emperor Seamounts in the northwestern Pacific
29	come from maxima in abundance of benthic taxa because this strategy reduces
30	the effect of bioturbation. Although there remains considerable scatter in the
31	ventilation age estimates, on average, ventilation ages in the Equatorial Pacific users significantly greater below 2.2 km ( $-2080 + 1125$ km s $-15$ ) then in the
32 22	were significantly greater below 5.2 km ( $\sim$ 5080 ±1125 yrs, n=15) than in the doubt interval 1.0 to 3.0 km ( $\sim$ 1610 ± 250 yrs, n=12). When compared to the
33 24	depth interval 1.9 to 5.0 km (~1010 $\pm$ 250 yrs, n=12). When compared to the
34 25	average model is seawater $\Delta$ C prome for the North Fachic, the Equatorial Desific glassial data suggest an abussal front located somewhere between 3.0
35 36	and 3.2 km modern water depth. Above that depth, the data may indicate
30	slightly better ventilation than today and below that depth, dacial Equatorial
38	Pacific data appear to be as old as last glacial maximum (I GM) deen water
39	ages reported for the deep southern Atlantic. This suggests that a glacial
40	reservoir of aged waters extended throughout the circumpolar Southern Ocean
	or aged waters entended anoughout the encomposal Southern Occum

41 and into the Equatorial Pacific. Renewed ventilation of such a large volume of

42 aged (and, by corollary, carbon-rich) water would help to account for the rise in

43 atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> and the fall in  $\Delta^{14}$ C as the glaciation drew to a close.

44 45

Key Words: radiocarbon; foraminifera; ocean ventilation; Pacific Ocean

46

# 47 1.0 INTRODUCTION

The ocean is the largest reservoir of readily exchangeable carbon on 48 Earth. With ~39,000 gigatonnes of carbon (GTC =  $10^{15}$  g C) in the ocean, and 49 ~580 GTC in the recent pre-industrial atmosphere, it is clear that small changes 50 51 in oceanic carbon storage could cause large changes in the atmospheric  $CO_2$ inventory. For this reason, beginning ~25 years ago with ice core observations 52 that the glacial atmosphere had lower  $CO_2$  levels than today (Barnola et al., 53 1987; Petit et al., 1999), climatologists have looked to the ocean for evidence 54 that its carbon storage was different in the past. Although the surface ocean 55 56 readily exchanges with the atmosphere if it is not ice covered, the deep ocean exchanges with the atmosphere only at high latitude locations in the North 57 Atlantic and Southern Oceans. Multiple lines of geochemical evidence indicate 58 this exchange was interrupted during cold episodes of the last glacial cycle, 59 either through the stabilizing effects of low salinity at sites of deep-water 60 formation, sea ice cover at those sites, or both (Boyle, 1988; Duplessy et al., 61 1988; Sigman et al., 2010). 62

Unlike other proxies of deep ocean ventilation, radiocarbon comes with a 63 timescale. Deep ocean  ${}^{14}C$  content is set by the atmospheric  ${}^{14}C$  activity and the 64 extent of surface ocean equilibration with the atmosphere in the formation 65 region, and decreases quantitatively due to radioactive decay in the ocean 66 interior and may be further influenced by mixing. Available data from solitary 67 corals and foraminifera indicate greater ventilation ages during the last ice age 68 in the North Atlantic (Robinson et al. 2005), the South Atlantic (Skinner et al., 69 70 2010), and in the southwest Pacific (Skinner et al. 2015), but the most recent compilations from the Equatorial and North Pacific have failed to identify deep 71 water old enough to account for elevated atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C activity during the 72 last glaciation and the subsequent decline that began about 16.5 ka, at least 73 74 according to simple mass balance calculations (Broecker, 2004; Broecker and 75 Barker, 2007). For example, Broecker et al. (2004) and Broecker et al. (2008) found no signal of poor ventilation at 2 km - 2. 8 km water depth in with west 76 77 equatorial Pacific (WEP), nor did Broecker and Clark (2010) at 4.4 km in the east equatorial Pacific (EEP). Finally, Broecker and Clark (2011) concluded 78 79 that the interplay between selective dissolution and bioturbation of planktonic foraminifera (Barker et al., 2007) is too significant to extract meaningful 80

ventilation ages from benthic-planktic age pairs in the deep Pacific. Evidence of 81 significantly older bottom waters than recorded by Broecker and colleagues has 82 been found in cores from intermediate water depths off Baja California 83 (Marchitto et al., 2007), in the Panama Basin (Stott et al., 2009), off the Arabian 84 peninsula (Bryan et al., 2010), in the southwest Pacific (Sikes et al., 2000; 85 Skinner et al., 2015), and in the Southern Ocean (Burke and Robinson, 2012). 86 87 It has been hypothesized that the deep reservoir mixed with near surface waters in the Southern Ocean and was introduced to Antarctic Intermediate Water 88 (AAIW), yet the signal has not been detected along present-day AAIW 89 pathways located along the western margins of S. America (dePol-Holz et al., 90 2009) and Africa (Cleroux et al. 2011). 91 There are several metrics for <sup>14</sup>C-based ocean ventilation (e.g. Cook and 92 Keigwin, 2015), and of these we focus here on the difference in conventional 93 <sup>14</sup>C ages between coexisting benthic and planktonic foraminifera (BF and PF, 94 resepectively) which represents the extent of <sup>14</sup>C aging or disequilibrium 95 between the surface and deep ocean. Our new <sup>14</sup>C results from several cores in 96 the Equatorial Pacific indicate that below ~3.2 km, BF-PF<sup>14</sup>C ventilation ages 97 were  $3080 \pm 1125$  years during the glacial interval. The contrast of those old 98 deep waters with younger waters above  $\sim 3.2$  km, when compared to the modern 99  $\Delta^{14}$ C distribution, likely reflects an abyssal front extending from the Southern 100 Ocean into the tropical North Pacific Ocean, although its northern extra-tropical 101 extent remains unclear. In addition to helping explain elevated atmospheric 102  $\Delta^{14}$ C during the glaciation, subsequent ventilation of these old deep waters 103 likely also influenced the postglacial decline of atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C and the 104 coincident rise in pCO<sub>2</sub> (Marchitto et al., 2007; Anderson et al. 2009; Burke and 105 Robinson, 2012). 106

- 107
- 108 2.0 METHODS

109 This paper presents new data on cores from four locations: the northern 110 Emperor Seamounts in the NWP; the Gulf of California; and the west and the east equatorial Pacific (Table 1). Three of the EEP cores were collected in 1978 111 on R/V Knorr (KNR) cruise 73 by R.P. von Herzen for heat flow studies and 112 were dried out by the time of our sampling. KNR73 piston cores (PCs) 3, 4, 113 and 6 straddle the Equator in a depth transect on the west flank of the East 114 Pacific Rise, from 3.6, 3.7, and 3.8 km water depth, respectively (Figure 1). 115 Core 3PC was studied previously (Boyle and Keigwin 1985) and heavily 116 sampled, so for the present study we sampled the archive half. Samples of three 117 other EEP cores were provided by the curators at Scripps Inst. of Oceanography 118 (PLDS 7G) and Oregon State University (VNTR01-10GC and ME0005 24JC). 119

Samples from WEP free fall core S67 (FFC) 15, were provided by the HawaiiInstitute of Geophysics (HIG).

Sampling and analytical methods are similar to those reported earlier 122 (Keigwin 2004). At each location we relied on  $\delta^{18}$ O stratigraphy and  ${}^{14}$ C dating 123 of near-surface dwelling planktonic foraminifera (PF) to identify the glacial 124 interval. As discussed previously, we sought to identify peaks in abundance of 125 benthic foraminifera (BF) for <sup>14</sup>C measurement, since the burrowing action of 126 animals on the seafloor tends to reduce the amplitude of abundance maxima but 127 it does not usually create peaks (Broecker et al., 1984). For core ME0005 128 129 24JC, our sampling of the glacial interval was guided by the chronology of 130 Kienast et al. (2006).

131

Because the KNR73 cores were dry and brittle, and not easily sampled 132 without disturbance, we scribed the split surface at 1-cm intervals, removed 133 134 large sections from the liner, and cut them along the scribe lies. Although this breaks up the sample, large pieces were collected and bagged. Small samples 135 (1-2 g) were removed from the bags for preliminary counting. Intervals of 136 abundant BF were re-sampled at 1-cm spacing to identify the level of peak 137 138 abundance, and again if necessary until enough BF were recovered for <sup>14</sup>C measurement (generally >2 mg  $CaCO_3$ ). For a minifera were picked from the 139 fraction >150  $\mu$ m for both stable isotope and <sup>14</sup>C analysis. Where abundance of 140 PF was determined (PCs 3, 4, PLDS 7G, and VNTR01-10GC), samples were 141 142 microsplit to about 300 individuals and counted (>150 um fraction). The other 143 EEP cores were still moist and sliced and bagged as above at SIO and OSU, and the WEP free fall core (FFC) was sampled using paleomagnetic cubes by the 144 145 curator at HIG.

146

BF samples were cleaned ultrasonically if necessary, and planktonic samples were cleaned this way only if they were abundant. Smaller samples were put in 1 dram screw cap vials filled completely with distilled water. The vials were shaken to suspend the foraminifera and then quickly hit against the lab bench. This "infrasound" treatment successfully shakes free loosely adhering sediment without too much damage to the shells and is easier to control than ultrasound.

Emperor Seamount results and previously published data from shallow locations in the nearby Okhotsk Sea are based on the benthic foram *Uvigerina* and the planktonic *Neogloboquadrina pachyderma* s. because these are the only species present in the glacial interval that were sufficiently abundant for <sup>14</sup>C measurement. During warm episodes of deglaciation, <sup>14</sup>C dates were on *Globigerina bulloides* and *Uvigerina*. *Uvigerina* was also analyzed from the LGM of DSDP Site 480 samples in the Gulf of California (Keigwin and Jones, 161 1990). In the Equatorial Pacific we dated the PF *Globigerinoides ruber* and 162 *Globigerinoides sacculifer*, and the BF *Nuttalides umbonifera*, *Uvigerina*, and 163 *Cibicidoides*. Low BF abundance and lack of obvious abundance maxima led 164 us to date mixed BF in ME005 24JC, but *Uvigerina* was the most abundant 165 taxon.

Accelerator mass spectrometry (AMS) <sup>14</sup>C dating was done using routine 166 methods at the National Ocean Sciences AMS (NOSAMS) facility at Woods 167 Hole Oceanographic Institution and at the Univ. of California, Irvine, for 168 samples graphitized at the Univ. of Colorado. All <sup>14</sup>C ages are given as the 169 conventional laboratory reported age, without correction for ocean reservior 170 effects (Stuiver and Polach, 1977). Most stable isotope measurements were 171 made at NOSAMS on a VG Prism mass spectrometer and some were made on a 172 Finigan 252. Where possible, we made analyses on individual specimens of 173 Uvigerina, Cibicidoides, or N. umbonifera. 174

175

## 176 3.0 RESULTS

177

178 <u>3.1 Equatorial Pacific.</u>

New stable isotope, abundance, and <sup>14</sup>C results for Equatorial Pacific 179 cores are summarized in Figure 2 and arranged according to water depth. 180 181 Stable isotope data are archived at the National Climate Data Center 182 (http://search.usa.gov/search?affiliate=NCDC&query=paleo). Where multiple 183 benthic measurements were made at the same level (within 1.0 cm), we report the apparent ventilation age as determined from each benthic species as the 184 difference between the  ${}^{14}C$  age for that species and the average of the PF  ${}^{14}C$ 185 ages for that level. All new <sup>14</sup>C results and ventilation ages are listed in Table 2. 186 Uncertainty in average PF age is given as the standard error (SE) of the mean of 187 the measurement values or the individual measurement uncertainties summed in 188 quadrature, whichever is larger. Uncertainty of BF-PF ventilation age estimates 189 190 was calculated as the quadrature sum of the  $1\sigma$  BF measurement uncertainty and the PF age uncertainty (where only a single PF age is available, the average 191 SE for all PF measurement pairs was used). Where we have AMS dates on 192 193 multiple BFs from the same stratigraphic level, we calculated ventilation ages 194 for each BF sample separately. Thus, one core depth may provide multiple 195 ventilation age estimates.

- 196
- 197

For purposes of the present study, we define the glacial interval as
 between 25 and 15 <sup>14</sup>C ka measured in PF. Data are considered to be glacial if

one of a pair of PF dates falls within  $1\sigma$  of the 15-25 <sup>14</sup>C ka window. Above ~3.7 km water depth, the glacial interval (shaded interval in Figures 2-4) is found between about 40 and 80 cm, but at greater water depths it appears closer to the core top. As expected, where  $\delta^{18}$ O is maximum  $\delta^{13}$ C is at or near minimum, and the glacial  $\delta^{13}$ C of individual *Cibicidoides* is within the range of previous studies.

The benthic fauna changes as a function of water depth, and of the three 206 genera we counted, only *Cibicidoides* are found at all water depths. At all but 207 the deepest site, in the WEP, and the easternmost site (24JC), Cibicidoides 208 reach peak abundance during the glacial interval. Above ~3.7 km there are 209 short maxima (a few cm) of Cibicidoides within or just above this interval, and 210 211 these are usually associated with maxima in *Uvigerina* and sometimes with N. *umbonifera* maxima. However, there are no *Uvigerina* in the WEP at 4.25 km. 212 213 and there are no N. umbonifera above about 3.4 km water depth in the EEP. At 214 the two KNR 73 cores between 3.6 and 3.7 km in the EEP, N. umbonifera is most abundant before 25<sup>14</sup>C ka and in the Holocene. 215

The abundance of *G. ruber*, *G. sacculifer*, and total planktonic foraminifera also show substantial variability (Figure 3). The two *Globigerinoides* spp. represent about 10% of the planktonic fauna, on average, and they reach a broad maximum in abundance during deglaciation.

Abundances are lower during the glacial and the Holocene (~upper 20 cm), and (oddly) in the two cores with the thickest Holocene sections, the more solutionsusceptible *G. ruber* (Berger, 1970) is consistently least abundant.

223

# 224 <u>3.2 Northwest Pacific</u>.

Of the many <sup>14</sup>C dated sites in the NWP, results from two examples are 225 presented in Figure 4 (see also Cook and Keigwin, 2015). All cores from this 226 region contain abundant Uvigerina during deglaciation [Keigwin, 1998], but 227 abundance of this genus during the LGM is usually lower, and we have not 228 229 found clear glacial peaks in BF abundance deeper than 3.3 km on the northern Emperor Seamounts. In both RNDB 11PC and Vinogadov 37 GGC (3225 and 230 3300 m, respectively, on Detroit Seamount) it was necessary to sample both the 231 working and the archived halves of the cores in order to obtain a datable 232 number of Uvigerina. Figure 4 shows only the 11 PC data, as an example. The 233 shape of the small LGM Uvigerina peak at ~110 cm is identical in each half of 234 the core, and  $\delta^{18}$ O measurement of individual *Uvigerina*, the  $\delta^{18}$ O on *N*. 235 pachyderma s., and the dates on N. pachyderma s. all indicate that the small 236 LGM peak did not result from down core reworking of specimens from the 237 much larger deglacial peaks. The three deglacial peaks yield PF<sup>14</sup>C ages that 238 are all between 13.08 and 13.14  $^{14}$ C ka. 239

In contrast to the results at Detroit Seamount (50°N), Tenji Seamount 240 core RNDB 13PC (49°N) has two LGM BF peaks, based on  $\delta^{18}$ O and PF  $^{14}$ C 241 ages (Figure 4). This core also has three deglacial maxima in Uvigerina 242 abundance, with 4 PF ages of between 13.00 and 13.66 <sup>14</sup>C ka. Late in 243 deglaciation, 13PC has two additional BF abundance maxima, but the  $\delta^{18}$ O data 244 do not reach the expected Holocene minimum of <3.5 %. The accompanying 245 trigger core (13PG) has only one late deglacial BF maximum and we consider 246 that core to be more reliable than the piston core because it captures the 247 expected Holocene  $\delta^{18}$ O minimum. 248

249

## 250 4.0 DISCUSSION

251

Our observations of millennial scale changes in BF abundance in the EEP 252 253 are evidently new. The abundance patterns in Figure 2 have not been noted 254 previously, presumably because earlier sampling of EEP cores was done too coarsely to resolve the millennial-scale events described here. (Most of the BF 255 peaks in the NWP and the EEP occur within a 5 cm interval of core.) 256 257 Furthermore, most previous authors have not measured the dry mass of their sediment samples so it is impossible to know if there have been changes in 258 absolute BF abundance. 259

260 Despite the generally low sedimentation rates in our cores (all <7 cm/kyr except for ME0005 24JC, >20 cm/kyr), where present, benthic foram 261 abundance maxima are several times larger than background values (Figure 2). 262 This suggests that they result from some process significant enough to survive 263 the effects of bioturbation. As bioturbation has often compromised detection of 264 possible millennial scale climate signals in the Equatorial Pacific, the strong BF 265 abundance signal documented here may hold promise for regional (and beyond) 266 correlation of events. 267

Below, we first consider possible contributions of surface ocean fertility and sediment transport to observed BF abundance maxima, followed by a discussion of the possible influences of dissolution and bioturbation on our <sup>14</sup>C results. We then present a basin-wide compilation of glacial BF-PF ventilation ages by depth that appears to indicate a widespread abyssal front in the glacial Pacific.

274

275 <u>4.1 Significance of BF abundance changes</u>.

276

4.1.a. *BF abundance maxima and export production of organic carbon.* 

A long history of studies concluded there must have been higher surface ocean fertility in the EEP during glacial maxima (Arrhenius, 1952; Rea et al.,

1991; Herguera and Berger, 1991). At the eastern end of our study area, in the 280 Panama Basin, Uvigerina is thought to respond to increased export production 281 of carbon in terms of both increased size and abundance (Pedersen et al., 1988). 282 283 Loubere (1991) made a statistical regression of BF species percentages and 284 surface productivity in EEP core tops and found the fauna highly responsive to productivity. In particular he noted that Uvigerina, Cibicidoides and Melonis 285 286 barleeanum are associated with highest organic export fluxes close to the Equator. Conversely, *N. umbonifera* was found to be typical of a lower 287 productivity assemblage that is more prominent south of 5°S. Based on 288 Loubere's (1991) work, our EEP results indicate highest productivity occurred 289 generally in the late glacial/early deglacial interval, a conclusion supported by 290 291 geochemical evidence for changing redox conditions (Berger et al., 1983).

In the Panama Basin, a broad deglacial maximum in the mass 292 accumulation rate of organic carbon and cooling of the sea surface has been 293 documented by Kienast et al. (2006), with a mid-point PF conventional <sup>14</sup>C age 294 295 of ~13.9 ka. Far to the northwest on the Emperor Seamount chain, mass accumulation rates of opal, calcium carbonate, organic carbon, and benthic 296 297 foraminiferal abundance, indicate higher fertility during the last deglaciation compared to the LGM and the Holocene (Keigwin et al., 1992; Keigwin 1998). 298 High export production was confirmed by accumulation rates determined by Th 299 300 normalization in nearby cores (Crusius et al. 2004; Kohfeld and Chase, 2011), and in the Gulf of Alaska by increased diatom export, Ba/Al, and CaCO<sub>3</sub> 301 (Galbraith et al. 2007). Galbraith et al. (2007) argued that these changes 302 303 occurred abruptly in the Gulf of Alaska at the onset of the Bolling/Allerod interval in the North Atlantic region (~14.5 cal. ka), with <sup>14</sup>C age constraints 304 from loosely bracketing conventional PF ages of 13.0 and 15.1 <sup>14</sup>C ka. 305

Among our EEP cores, PLDS 7G, VNTR01 10GC and KNR73-3PC 306 contain BF abundance maxima with PF<sup>14</sup>C ages of ~14.15, 14.18 and 14.73 307  $^{14}$ C ka, respectively (Fig. 2) that indicate that they may be broadly synchronous 308 with the previously documented productivity increase in the Panama Basin 309 310 (Kienast et al., 2006), after allowing for possible regional gradients of deglacial reservoir age of several hundreds of years (Lindsay et al. 2015.; Rae et al. 311 2014). Similarly, the multiple BF abundance peaks with PF<sup>14</sup>C ages of 13.0 to 312 13.6<sup>14</sup>C ka in our NWP cores (Fig. 4) may be related to the sudden increase in 313 314 productivity in the northern Pacific (Keigwin et al. 1992; Galbraith et al. 2007; 315 Kohfeld and Chase, 2011).

In the four EEP cores in which we have counted planktonic foram
abundance, highest abundances generally occur during deglaciation, but the
broad deglacial rise in planktonic species does not usually contain abundant
benthic taxa (Fig. 3). Although planktonic foraminifera are most abundant

during the deglacial interval, we cannot be sure to what extent this reflects
preservation rather than productivity (Berger, 1992, for example), or sediment
focusing (Marcantonio et al., 2001; Kienast et al., 2006).

323

324 4.1.b. *Sediment transport*. Although there is strong evidence for high productivity in the NWP during deglaciation and in the EEP during glaciation, 325 it remains possible that peaks in BF abundance could be an artifact of extensive 326 winnowing of clay and silt. In the case of extreme and persistent winnowing, 327 BF peaks could be created. However, in order to explain increases in benthic 328 abundance by factors of 5 or 10, such as during the Holocene or the events at 329 ~14.7 and 15.5 <sup>14</sup>C ka in cores 3PC and 4PC, respectively (Figure 2), 330 enrichment by winnowing would have necessarily produced substantially 331 condensed intervals. Our dating of these cores was not designed to test this 332 possibility, but the depth distribution of PF<sup>14</sup>C ages in 3PC and 4PC is 333 inconsistent with the presence of large discontinuities. At the Emperor 334 Seamounts, each site has multiple deglacial peaks in Uvigerina associated with 335 similar PF  $^{14}$ C ages of ~13.1  $^{14}$ C ka, but the maximum abundances at core 11PC 336 are  $\sim 50/g$  whereas at core 13PC it is  $\sim 28/g$ . If these events resulted from 337 winnowing, then one would expect more winnowing at 11PC, yet based on the 338 *Uvigerina*  $\delta^{18}$ O, the two cores have similar rates of sedimentation. 339

- 340
- 341

4.2. Planktonic age bias due to selective dissolution and bioturbation.

342

343 Barker et al. (2007) noted that the effects of selective dissolution of surface dwelling planktonic species such as G. sacculifer and G. ruber 344 345 compared to deeper-dwelling planktonics, variable residence time of shells in the sediment surface mixed layer, and low rates of sedimentation can combine 346 to create <sup>14</sup>C age offsets between different PF species from the same sediment 347 sample. The conceptual model predicts that relatively dissolution prone species 348 will show a young <sup>14</sup>C age bias with respect to dissolution resistant species, as a 349 result of selective removal of older tests from the mixed layer population. 350 Broecker and Clark (2011) proposed that this effect could lead to artificially 351 large ventilation ages that are based on the difference between BF <sup>14</sup>C dates and 352 PF<sup>14</sup>C dates from co-deposited dissolution prone surface dwelling species. For 353 example, they noted that in four of seven deep water core tops from the 354 equatorial Pacific that are today bathed by calcite undersaturated water, G. 355 sacculifer has a <sup>14</sup>C age about 1000 years younger than solution-resistant 356 planktonic species. Comparison of PF ages from paired measurements of G. 357 ruber and G. sacculifer in cores 3PC and 4PC provide some insight into the 358 359 importance of this process in the deep EEP as, even though both species are

360 surface-dwellers, *G. ruber* is known to be less resistant to dissolution than *G.*361 *sacculifer* (Berger, 1970).

We find no statistically meaningful inter-species age difference across all 362 available G. ruber and G. sacculifer measurement pairs (n = 17, Table 3). If we 363 break the pairs out according to time intervals (based on average PF <sup>14</sup>C ages) 364 corresponding broadly to the Holocene  $(0-10^{14} \text{C ka})$ , deglaciation  $(10-15^{14} \text{C})$ 365 ka), and the glacial period  $(15-25^{14}C \text{ ka})$ , we find that only for the deglacial 366 period is G. ruber measurably younger than G. sacculifer (-233  $\pm$  112 <sup>14</sup>C yr, n 367 = 6). For the glacial interval, the relationship is marked by large variation in 368 both magnitude and sign (+59  $\pm$  745 <sup>14</sup>C yr, n = 7). These results, along with an 369 analysis of the absolute deviation of the inter-species differences (Table 3), 370 suggest that the observed age differences are largely randomized by 371 bioturbation and generally do not preserve systematic offsets that might arise 372 373 from differential dissolution in the mixed layer or from ecological habitat 374 preferences (which are expected to be similar in the EEP for these two species, 375 for example, Watkins et al. 1996). The results are, furthermore, largely insensitive to the placement of age boundaries in the analysis. 376

377

378 We also note that the effect described by Barker et al. (2007) is based on modern ocean observations and late Holocene sediment that reflect especially 379 380 corrosive conditions on the sea floor. However, glacial and deglacial sediment 381 is generally thought to be better preserved than Holocene sediment in the 382 Equatorial Pacific. All other things being equal, the impacts of selective 383 dissolution and young PF age biases should then be greater in the Holocene than during the glaciation and deglaciation, reducing rather than enhancing 384 observed differences in ventilation age that might otherwise arise due to relative 385 aging of Pacific deep water during glacial times. Our Holocene observations 386 are limited to only two cores (3, 4PC), but with BF-PF ventilation ages of 1000 387 to 2000 years, they are close to the expected values based on modern 388 observations (~ 1600 yrs; Broecker et al., 1984). As we describe below, BF-PF 389 390 ventilation ages in the glacial and early deglacial deep Equatorial Pacific are 391 much higher and more variable. In our view, the largest contribution to 392 uncertainty is from bioturbation which, for PFs, we estimate conservatively to be on the order of  $\pm$  500 yr based on absolute deviations of PF age pairs for the 393 glacial period (Table 3). Since we have sampled BFs at local peaks of absolute 394 395 abundance, uncertainties in BF ages from sediment mixing should be minimized, and are likely more than adequately captured by differences in 396 ventilation age for different BF species sampled at or near the same 397 stratigraphic level (Fig. 2, Fig. 5). 398

399

400

401

4.3. Equatorial and North Pacific BF-PF ventilation age.

There is general agreement that there were significant changes in the 402 deep circulation of the North Pacific during the past ~25 ka, as evident in 403 various proxy data (Boyle and Keigwin, 1985; Zahn et al., 2001; Keigwin, 404 1998; Ohkushi et al., 2003; Galbraith et al., 2007; Okazaki et al. 2010; Lund et 405 al. 2011). Of the many proxies brought to bear on the subject, <sup>14</sup>C has been of 406 recent interest because of the suggestion that the deep ocean may have driven 407 the deglacial atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> increase and  $\Delta^{14}$ C decrease if long-sequestered 408 CO<sub>2</sub> was released to the atmosphere as deep ocean ventilation increased after 409 the glacial period (Hughen et al., 2004; Broecker et al. 2004; Marchitto et al. 410 2007; Skinner et al. 2010). Okazaki et al. (2010) compiled available BF -PF <sup>14</sup>C 411 age pairs from North Pacific locations and concluded that BF-PF ventilation 412 ages began to decrease beginning 20-19 calendar ka and remained ~500-1000 413 <sup>14</sup>C yr lower than during the early LGM until the end of Heinrich Event 1 (H-1, 414 415 17.5 to 15 cal. ka), suggesting that deep water may have been produced somewhere in the region to depths as great as 3 km during the interval. More 416 recently, Rae et al. (2014) showed that ventilation of the deep NEP (3640 m) 417 improved suddenly during "the middle of H-1" based on a brief but seemingly 418 robust collapse of the age difference in two BF-PF pairs. <sup>14</sup>C results from 419 another NEP core indicate that ventilation at 2.7 km was the same during the 420 last glaciation as today (Lund et al. 2011). On the other hand, Jaccard and 421 Galbraith (2013) suggest that bottom waters at 2400 m (and deeper) were 422 poorly ventilated until ~ 15 calendar ka based on measurements of authigenic 423 uranium in NWP core 13PC. Aside from four BF-PF pairs of Shackleton et al. 424 (1988) and the previous work of and Broecker et al. (2004, 2008) and Broecker 425 and Clark (2010), ours are the only other deep water ventilation estimates from 426 the Equatorial Pacific. 427

Whereas Okazaki et al. (2010) compiled ventilation data from the North 428 Pacific in a time series, here we compile the data they used along with more 429 430 recently published data and our new results into a single depth reconstruction, but with distinct labels for results from the NWP, NEP, EEP and WEP (Figure 431 432 5). In our analysis we consider primarily the BF-PF ventilation age, since this metric does not involve assumptions regarding reservoir age effects or 433 calibration to calendrical age, as may be needed to estimate physical ventilation 434 age using decay trajectories (c.f. Adkins and Boyle, 1997). Thus, plotted results 435 436 are not subject to potentially significant uncertainties regarding the magnitude and spatial distribution of past surface reservoir ages, but ventilation ages with 437 respect to the coeval atmosphere may be more variable than indicated by the 438 439 reconstruction based on BF-PF age.

We also lump together all results for which any one of the associated 440 conventional PF <sup>14</sup>C ages lies within  $1\sigma$  of 15 to 25 <sup>14</sup>C ka, a relatively broad 441 interval that includes both the LGM and H-1. The approach is deliberately 442 inclusive so as to maximize the number of (still relatively sparse) observations 443 under consideration and because climatically and oceanographically significant 444 events documented elsewhere are not always well resolved in the Pacific 445 Ocean. For example H-1 is not directly evident in the Pacific as an armada of 446 447 icebergs and is otherwise difficult to identify with certainty. Furthermore, as has been noted previously (Keigwin et al., 1992; Skinner and Shackleton, 2005), 448 Pacific BF  $\delta^{18}$ O data lag Atlantic data because of the long interbasin transit 449 time, so from that perspective the end of the LGM in the deep Pacific is 450 451 younger than in the Atlantic. Glaciological evidence from Hawaii indicates the LGM persisted in the North Pacific until about 15 ka (Blard et al., 2007). 452

The glacial BF-PF ventilation age results are given in Figure 5 along with 453 an estimate of the basin-wide average  $\Delta^{14}$ C in modern seawater (solid red line, 454 upper X axis scale) by depth from the World Ocean Circulation Experiment 455 (http://cdiac.ornl.gov/oceans/glodap/), and were averaged over the North 456 Pacific between the Equator and 55°N by R. M. Key (pers. comm.). Data used 457 in making Figure 5 are listed as SOM Table 1. Equivalent sea water <sup>14</sup>C ages 458 (open red symbols) are effectively relative to that of the pre-nuclear, pre-459 460 industrial atmosphere and have been corrected by 400 yrs for presentation on the BF-PF age scale (lower X axis). Formal uncertainties for the apparent 461 ventilation ages were desribed earlier and are listed in Table 2; a more realistic 462 assessment may be provided by the observed spread in BF-PF age differences 463 for different cores from similar depths in the same ocean region or, (for the new 464 results) for different BF species sampled at or near the same stratigraphic level. 465 Since the glacial data span a relatively large age interval, some of the observed 466 spread may reflect authentic time dependent variability of BF-PF ventilation 467 age. As we will show below, however, plausible time-dependent variations (i.e., 468 Okazaki et al. 2010) do not appear to have influenced the overall structure of 469 470 the BF-PF depth profile.

Despite the observed scatter, the glacial age sediment data are roughly 471 consistent with the modern sea water  ${}^{14}C$  profile at depths above ~3.2 km 472 (Figure 5). A distinctive break relative to the modern profile occurs about 3.1 473 km in the sediment results from the Equatorial Pacific; data between 1.9 and 3 474 km average 1610±250 yrs, whereas deeper data fall consistently on the "old" 475 side of the modern profile, with an average BF-PF ventilation age of 476 477 3080±1125 yrs. Taken at face value, these results record a pronounced abyssal front between shallower, well ventilated waters and deeper, poorly ventilated 478 waters in the Equatorial Pacific at a modern water depth of 3.0 to 3.2 km. The 479

impression of a front is reinforced by consistency of equatorial Pacific and 480 North Pacific results above 3.0 km. Four BF-PF pairs from 3.2 km in the EEP 481 (Shackleton et al. 1988) are consistent with a front at or just above this depth 482 (SOM Fig. 2), but are excluded from Fig. 5 since, unlike the other EEP data, 483 they are based on PF measurements in N. dutertrei which may be biased old 484 (potentially reducing BF-PF with respect to other data shown) (Barker et al., 485 2007). Inclusion of these data would yield a deep Equatorial Pacific BF-PF 486 average of  $2890 \pm 1100$  yr. 487

In order to evaluate the possible influence of time-dependent variation in 488 our reconstruction, we separate glacial results into two age classes, greater or 489 less than ~19.6  $\pm$  0.4 calendar ka, corresponding to the transition to younger 490 BF-PF ventilation age documented above ~ 3km in the North Pacific (Okazaki 491 et al. 2010). This age break corresponds to conventional PF <sup>14</sup>C ages greater or 492 less than 17.0 <sup>14</sup>C ka in our results (Table 2), with an age spread after 493 calibration that incorporates large uncertainty in the surface reservoir age ( $\Delta R$ 494 of 0-600 in CALIB 7.1, after Stuiver and Reimer 1993) but which nevertheless 495 securely identifies samples older than the transition indicated by Okazaki et al. 496 (2010). For the deep Equatorial Pacific, there is no statistically significant 497 difference of BF-PF age for pre- and post transition samples; "pre-transition" 498 samples are  $2850 \pm 870$  yr (n=9) and "post-transition" samples are  $3440 \pm 1440$ 499 yr (n=6) and  $2920 \pm 750$  yr (n=5) when the oldest (6050 yr) sample is excluded. 500 Most importantly, the large contrast with results above and below 3.1 km is 501 maintained both within and across the two age classes, as can be seen in 502 separately annotated symbols in Figure 5. We also note that some of the time-503 dependent variation reconstructed by Okazaki et al. (2010) may relate to 504 505 changes in the range of depths represented by their core selection, since the largest BF-PF ages in the North Pacific appear to be in "pre-transition" samples 506 from 2.4 to 2.9 km. 507

Any possible northern manifestation of poorly ventilated waters within 508 509 the deep N. Pacific remains difficult to evaluate from our compilation of results. Above ~3.1 km, both the northern and Equatorial Pacific measurements indicate 510 similar BF-PF ventilation ages. This is likely a robust finding, since similar 511 methods were employed in both areas (most NWP results used our methods; 512 Cook and Keigwin, 2015). Below ~3.1 km, there is a paucity of glacial BF-PF 513 age pairs from the northern N. Pacific that meet our criteria for co-deposition 514 (within 1 cm). Of these, 2 come from the relatively brief "middle H-1" 515 516 ventilation event documented in the NEP by Rae et. al. (2014) and, they suggest, these were associated with a dramatic increase in the surface ocean 517 reservoir age (leading to under-representation of the actual deep water <sup>14</sup>C age 518 from BF-PF age pairs). We note that many of the deepest northern N. Pacific 519

cores come from areas where today the surface ocean reservoir age appears to 520 be locally elevated (see map of core depths vs. estimated pre-nuclear surface 521 water <sup>14</sup>C age in Supplementary online Figure 1. If the estimated recent, pre-522 nuclear reservoir age distribution (Rubin and Key, 2002) reflects the potential 523 for locally- or regionally- anomalous increases in reservoir age during the 524 glacial and/or deglacial periods, results from deeper N. Pacific cores in Fig. 5 525 may under-represent actual deep water <sup>14</sup>C ages with respect to the larger 526 number of records available from above ~3.1 km. Nonetheless, there is as yet 527 no clear <sup>14</sup>C evidence for excessive glacial aging of deep waters in the northern 528 N. Pacific. The single new BF-PF age pair characterizing the deep NWP, as 529 noted in section 3.2, ultimately required sampling of the archive half of 530 Vinogradov 37GGC in order to obtain enough Uvigerina for dating. Given that 531 this is the only result for the deep NWP, more work in the region is clearly 532 533 needed.

534 Radiocarbon data from the LGM of the subtropical western North Atlantic indicate apparent ventilation ages of only about 1500 years in cores as 535 deep as 4.7 km (Keigwin, 2004). Evidently the very old deep water we find in 536 537 the Equatorial Pacific Ocean did not extend substantially unmixed into the deep western North Atlantic. In the South Atlantic at ~3.8 km Skinner et al. (2010) 538 539 also measured LGM BF-PF ventilation ages of about 1500 years. However, they also identified large changes in the surface reservoir age, suggesting that 540 that deep South Atlantic benthic <sup>14</sup>C ages were 3500 to 4000 yrs older than the 541 coeveal atmosphere during the LGM. Values in this range were maintained for 542 ~6 kyr, with a maximum at ~19 calendar ka BP. In Figure 5 we show prior 543 estimates of  $\Delta^{14}$ C (vs. coeval atmosphere) for these data as a box centered at 3.8 544 km depth to represent a likely end-member value for Lower Circumpolar Deep 545 Water (LCDW) (Burke and Robinson, 2012). Projection of these results from 546 the  $\Delta^{14}$ C (vs. atmosphere) axis onto the BF-PF age axis carries some 547 uncertainties related to possible local deviations from mean ocean surface 548 reservoir age, but the overall impression is that both the deep Equatorial Pacific 549 and deep Southern Ocean were comparably aged during much of the LGM. We 550 thus posit a direct connection between the two locations via mixing with 551 LCDW as in the present day ocean, implying that similarly old waters may have 552 had a circumpolar distribution during part or all of the glacial period. 553

554 Thus, we argue that both the Southern Ocean (Skinner et al. 2015), and 555 much of the world's most voluminous ocean basin harbored a potentially vast 556 reservoir of old carbon. Broecker et al. (2004) estimated that the volume and 557 degree of deep ocean <sup>14</sup>C depletion needed to account for the equilibrium 558 change in  $\Delta^{14}$ C of glacial atmosphere and remaining portions of the ocean was 559 much larger than seemed plausible given existing observational constraints.

- However, Burke and Robinson (2012) suggest that recent observations of 560
- abyssal depletion during the LGM, comparable in degree to those documented 561
- here, would be sufficient to account for subsequent transient depletion of the 562
- atmosphere and surface ocean during deglaciation. The complementary 563
- observations of deglacial atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C and CO<sub>2</sub> change (Machitto et al. 564
- 2007) suggest a common cause relating to improved ventilation of the ocean's 565
- deepest waters (Toggweiller et al., 2006). 566
- 567 568

### 569 CONCLUSIONS

- Our study of deep ocean ventilation ages based on the difference in  $^{14}C$ 570 ages of coexisting benthic and planktonic foraminifera in cores from the deep 571 Equatorial Pacific and Northwest Pacfic reveals the following: 572
- 573

574 1. Maxima in absolute abundance of benthic foraminifera are common in both

- 575 the NWP and most Equatorial Pacific sites during the Holocene, the
- deglaciation, and the glacial period. They appear to be related to higher fertility 576 577 during glaciation in the EEP and during deglaciation in both regions.
- Abundance of planktonic foraminifera is lowest in the late Holocene, 578
- intermediate during the glacial, and highest during deglaciation. 579
- 580

- 2. In the EEP, paired <sup>14</sup>C measurements of G. sacculifera and G. ruber do not 581 reveal systematic differences of age that might arise from ecological 582 preferences or differential dissolution in the sediment mixed layer. Variations 583 584 in the sign and magnitude of inter-species age differences can be attributed 585 largely to bioturbation.
- 586

3. Our few Holocene apparent ventilation ages from the EEP fall in the 1000 to 587 2000 year range, similar to today. However, deglacial and glacial values are 588 589 both larger and more variable (1500 to 6000 years), with a mean of  $\sim$ 3100 yrs 590 that is greater than anything observed previously in the shallower Equatorial and North Pacific. Data above about 2 km indicate slightly younger ventilation 591 ages compared to the modern (GLODAP) mean sea water depth <sup>14</sup>C profile for 592 the same region. A large contrast of apparent ventilation age (~1500 yrs) above 593 and below 3.1 km in the Equatorial Pacific is emphasized by comparison to the 594 modern data, suggesting a front in BF-PF ventilation age near that depth. 595 596

- 597 4. The large BF-PF 14 C differences for >3.1 km in the glacial equatorial
- 598 Pacific indicate bottom waters that may be comparably aged to the Lower
- 599 Circumpolar Deep Water in the South Atlantic. Thus, there may have been a

600	circupolar distribution of old water that extended as far as the equatorial Pacific
601	and that was likely sufficient to have caused the transient decrease in
602	atmospheric radiocarbon activity during deglaciation.
603	
604	ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
605	We thank Mary Carman for helping prepare samples for geochemical
606	analysis, Al Gagnon for providing the stable isotope data, and the staffs at
607	NOSAMS and UC Irvine for radiocarbon measurements. Chad Wolak and
608	Patrick Cappa assisted with sample preparation at the Univ. of Colorado. Bob
609	Key has been especially generous with his time in compiling North Pacific
610	WOCE data for our reconstructions. We also thank Ning Zhao for providing
611	<sup>14</sup> C results from EEP core 24J, and Colin Lindsay for preparing the
612	supplementary figure. We are also grateful to the curators at HIG, OSU, and
613	SIO for for carefully sampling cores in their collections. The manuscript was
614	greatly improved by the thoughtful comments of Luke Skinner and an
615	anonymous reviewer. This work was funded by NSF grants OCE-1031224 and
616	OCE-0424861 to LDK and 0851391 to SIL
617	
618	
619	
620	REFERENCES
621	
622	Adkins, J. F. and E. A. Boyle (1997). "Changing atmospheric $\Delta^{14}$ C and the record of deep
623	water paleoventilation ages." <u>Paleoceanography</u> <b>12</b> : 337-344.
624	Anderson, R., S. Ali, et al. (2009). "Wind-driven upwelling in the Southern Ocean and the
625	deglacial rise in atmospheric CO2." <u>Science</u> <b>323</b> : 1443-1447.
626	Arrhenius, G. (1952). "Sediment cores from the east Pacific." <u>Rep. Swedish Deep Sea</u>
627	Exped. 5: 1-228.
628 620	Barker, S., W. Broecker, et al. (2007). Radiocarbon age offsets of foraminifera resulting
630	hioturbated zone " Paleoceanography <b>22</b> : PA2205
631	Barnola, I. M., D. Ravnaud, et al. (1987). "Vostok ice core provides 160.000-vear record
632	of atmospheric CO2." <u>Nature</u> <b>329</b> : 408414.
633	Berger, W. (1970). "Planktonic foraminifera: selective solution and the lysocline."
634	<u>Marine Geol.</u> <b>8</b> : 111-138.
635	Berger, W. (1992). Pacific carbonate cycles revisited: arguments for and against
636	productivity control. <u>Centenary of Japanese Micropaleontology</u> . K. Ishizaki and
63/	I. Saito. Tokyo, Terra Scientific Publishing Co.: 15-25.
038 639	berger, w. п., к. с. гинкен, et al. (1965). Glacial-Holocene transition in deep sea sediments: Manganese-snike in the east equatorial Pacific "Nature <b>202</b> , 231.
635 636 637 638 639	<ul> <li>Berger, W. (1992). Pacific carbonate cycles revisited: arguments for and against productivity control. <u>Centenary of Japanese Micropaleontology</u>. K. Ishizaki and T. Saito. Tokyo, Terra Scientific Publishing Co.: 15-25.</li> <li>Berger, W. H., R. C. Finkel, et al. (1983). "Glacial-Holocene transition in deep sea sediments: Manganese-spike in the east equatorial Pacific." <u>Nature</u> 303: 231-</li> </ul>

640 233.

641	Blard, PH., J. Lave, et al. (2007). "Persistence of full glacial conditions in the central
642	Pacific until 15,000 years ago." <u>Nature</u> <b>449</b> : 591-595.
643	Boyle, E. A. (1988). "Vertical oceanic nutrient fractionation and glacial/interglacial CO2
644	cycles." <u>Nature</u> <b>331</b> : 55-56.
645	Boyle, E. A. and L. D. Keigwin (1985/86). "Comparison of Atlantic and Pacific
646	paleochemical records for the last 215,000 years: changes in deep ocean
647	circulation and chemical inventories." <u>Earth and Planet. Sci. Lett.</u> 76: 135-150.
648	Broecker, W. and S. Barker (2007). "A 190 ‰ drop in atmosphere's D14C during the
649	"Mystery Interval" (17.5 to 14.5 kyr)." <u>Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.</u> <b>256</b> : 90-99.
650	Broecker, W., S. Barker, et al. (2004). "Ventilation of the glacial deep Pacific Ocean."
651	<u>Science</u> <b>306</b> : 1169-1172.
652	Broecker, W. and E. Clark (2010). "Search for a glacial-age 14C-depleted ocean
653	reservoir." <u>Geophys. Res. Lett.</u> 37.
654	Broecker, W. and E. Clark (2011). "Radiocarbon-age differences among coexisting
655	planktic foraminifera shells: The Barker Effect." <u>Paleoceanography</u> <b>26</b> : PA2222.
656	Broecker, W., E. Clark, et al. (2008). "Near constancey of the Pacific Ocean surface to
657	mid-depth ratdiocarbon-age difference over the last 20 kyr." <u>Earth Planet. Sci.</u>
658	<u>Lett.</u> <b>274</b> : 322-326.
659	Broecker, W. S., A. Mix, et al. (1984). "Radiocarbon measurements on coexisting benthic
660	andplanktic foraminfera shells: potential for reconstructing ocean ventilation
661	times over the past 20,000 years." <u>Nuclear Inst. and Methods in Phys. Res.</u>
662	section B: Beam Interactions with Materials and Atoms 5: 332-339.
663	Bryan, S. P., T. M. Marchitto, et al. (2010). "The release of 14C-depleted carbon from the
664	deep ocean during the last deglaciation: Evidence from the Arabian Sea." <u>Earth</u>
665	<u>Planet. Sci. Lett.</u> <b>298</b> : 244-254.
666	Burke, A. and L. F. Robinson (2012). "The Southern Ocean's role in carbon exchange
667	during the last deglaciation." <u>Science</u> <b>335</b> : 557-561.
668	Cleroux, C., P. deMenocal, et al. (2011). "Deglacial radiocarbon history of tropical
669	Atlantic thermocline waters: absence of CO2 reservoir purging signal." <u>Quat. Sci.</u>
670	<u>Rev.</u> <b>30</b> : 1875-1882.
671	Cook, M. and L. Keigwin (2015). "Radiocarbon profiles of the NW Pacific from the LGM
672	and deglaciation: Evaluating ventilation metrics and the effect of uncertain
673	surface reservoir ages." <u>Paleoceanography</u> <b>30, doi:10.1002/2014PA002649</b> .
674	Crusius, J., T. F. Pedersen, et al. (2004). "Elevated productivity in the NW Pacific during
675	the Bolling warm period as a cause of reduced intermediate-water oxygen
676	concentrations along the California margin." <u>Geology</u> <b>32</b> : 633-636.
677	Davies-Walczak, M., A. C. Mix, et al. (2014). "Late glacial to Holocene radiocarbon
678	constraints on North Pacific Intermediate Water ventilation and deglacial
679	atmsopheric CO2 sources." <u>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</u> <b>397</b> : 57-66.
680	dePol-Holz, R., L. Keigwin, et al. (2010). "No signature of abyssal carbon in intermediate
681	waters off Chile during deglaciation." <u>Nature Geosciences</u> <b>3</b> : 192-195.
682	Duplessy, J. C., N. J. Shackleton, et al. (1988). "Deepwater source variations during the
683	last climatic cycle and their impact on the global deepwater circulation."
684	Paleoceanography <b>3</b> : 343-360.
685	Galbraith, E. D., S. L. Jaccard, et al. (2007). "Carbon dioxide release from the North
686	Pacific abyss during the last deglaciation." <u>Nature</u> <b>449</b> : 890-894.

687 Herguera, J. C. and W. H. Berger (1991). "Paleoproductivity from benthic foraminifera 688 abundance: Glacial to postglacial change in the west-equatorial Pacific." Geology 689 **19**: 1173-1176. Hughen, K., S. Lehman, et al. (2004). "14C Activity and global carbon cycle changes over 690 691 the past 50,000 years." Science 303: 202-207. 692 Jaccard, S. and E. Galbraith (2013), "Direct ventilation of the North Pacific did not reach 693 the deep ocean during the last deglaciation." Geophys. Res. Lett. 40: 694 doi:10.1029/2012GL054118. 695 Keigwin, L. D. (1998). "Glacial-age hydrography of the far northwest Pacific Ocean." 696 Paleoceanography 13: 323-339. Keigwin, L. D. (2004). "Radiocarbon and stable isotope constraints on last glacial 697 698 maximum and Younger Dryas ventilation in the western North Atlantic." 699 Paleoceanography 19: doi: 10.1029/2004PA001029. 700 Keigwin, L. D. and G. A. Jones (1990). "Deglacial climatic oscillations in the Gulf of 701 California." Paleoceanography 5: 1009-1023. 702 Keigwin, L. D., G. A. Jones, et al. (1992). "A 15,000 year paleoenvironmental record from 703 Meiji Seamount, far northwestern Pacific." Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 111: 425-440. 704 Kienast, M., S. S. Kienast, et al. (2006). "Eastern Pacific cooling and Atlantic overturning 705 circulation during the last deglaciation." Nature 443: 846-849. 706 Kohfeld, K. E. and Z. Chase (2011). "Controls on deglacial changes in biofgenic fgluxes in 707 the North Pacific Ocean." Ouat. Sci. Rev. 30: 3350-3363. 708 Lindsay, C., S. Lehman, et al. (2015). "The surface expression of radiocarbon anomalies 709 near Baja California during deglaciation." Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 422:67-74. 710 Loubere, P. (1991). "Deep-sea benthic foraminiferal assemblage response to a surface 711 ocean productivity gradient: A test." Paleoceanography 6: 193-204. 712 Lund, D. C., A. C. Mix, et al. (2011). "Increased ventilation age of the deep northeast 713 Pacific Ocean during the last deglaciation." Nature Geoscience 4: 771-774. 714 Marcantonio, F., R. F. Anderson, et al. (2001). "Sediment focusing in the central 715 Equatorial Pacific Ocean." Paleoceanography 16: 260-267. 716 Marchitto, T. M., S. J. Lehman, et al. (2007). "Marine radiocarbon evidence for the 717 mechanism of deglacial atmospheric CO2 rise." Science **316**: 1456-1459. 718 Ohkushi, K., T. Itaka, et al. (2003). "Last glacial-Holocene change in intermediate water 719 ventilation in the Northwestern Pacific." Ouat. Sci. Rev. 22: 1477-1484. 720 Okazaki, Y., A. Timmermann, et al. (2010). "Deepwater formation in the North Pacific 721 during the last glacial termination." Science 329: 200-204. 722 Pedersen, T. F., M. Pickering, et al. (1988). "The response of benthic foraminifera to 723 productivity cycles in the eastern Equatoral Pacific: Faunal and geochemical 724 constraints on glacial bottom water oxygen levels." Paleoceanography 3: 157-725 168. 726 Petit, J. R., J. Jouzel, et al. (1999). "Climate and atmospheric history of the past 420,000 727 years from the Vostok ice core, Antarctica." Nature 399: 429-436. Rae, J. W. B., M. Sarnthein, et al. (2014). "Deep water formation in the North Pacific and 728 deglacial CO2rise." Paleoceanography 29(6): 645-667. 729 Rea, D. K., N. G. Pisias, et al. (1991). "Late Pleistocene paleoclimatology of the central 730 731 Equatorial Pacific: Flux patterns of biogenic sediments." Paleoceanography 6: 732 227-244.

733	Robinson, L. F., J. F. Adkins, et al. (2005). "Radiocarbon variability in the western North
734	Atlantic during the last deglaciation." <u>Science</u> <b>310</b> : 1469-1473.
735	Rubin, S. and R. Key (2002). "Separating natural and bomb-produced radiocarbon in the
736	ocean: The potential alkalinity method." <u>Global Biogeochemical Cycles</u> 16: 1105,
737	doi:1110.1029/2001GB001432.
738	Shackleton, N. J., J. C. Duplessy, et al. (1988). "Radiocarbon age of last glacial Pacific deep
739	water." <u>Nature</u> <b>335</b> : 708-711.
740	Sigman, D. M., M. P. Hain, et al. (2010). "The polar ocean and glacial cycles in
741	atmospheric CO(2) concentration." <u>Nature</u> <b>466</b> (7302): 47-55.
742	Sikes, E. L., C. R. Samson, et al. (2000). "Old radiocarbon ages in the southwest Pacific
743	Ocean during last glacial period and deglaciation." <u>Nature</u> <b>405</b> .
744	Skinner, L., I. N. McCave, et al. (2015). "Reduced ventilation and enhanced magnitude of
745	the deep Pacific caron pool during the last glacial period." <u>Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.</u>
746	<b>411</b> : 45-52.
747	Skinner, L. C., S. Fallon, et al. (2010). "Ventilation of the deep Southern Ocean and
748	deglacial CO2 rise." <u>Science</u> <b>328</b> (5982): 1147-1151.
749	Skinner, L. C. and N. J. Shackleton (2005). "An Atlantic lead over Pacific deep-water
750	change across Termination 1: implications for the application of the marine
751	isotope stage stratigraphy." <u>Quat. Sci. Rev.</u> <b>24</b> : 571-580.
752	Stott, L., J. Southon, et al. (2009). "Radiocarbon age anomaly at intermediate water
753	depth in the Pacific Ocean during the last deglaciation." <u>Paleoceanography</u> <b>24</b> :
754	PA2223.
755	Stuiver, M. and H. Polach (1977). "Reporting of 14C data." <u>Radiocarbon</u> : 355-363.
756	Stuiver, M. and P. J. Reimer (1993). "Extended <sup>14</sup> C database and revised CALIB
757	radiocarbon calibration program." <u>Radiocarbon</u> <b>35</b> : 215-230.
758	Toggweiler, J. R., J. L. Russell, et al. (2006). "Midlatitude westerlies, atmospheric CO2,
759	and climate change during the ice ages." <u>Paleoceanography</u> <b>21</b> (2).
760	Watkins, J. M., A. C. Mix, et al. (1996). "Living planktic foraminifera: tracers of circulation
761	and productivity regimes in the central equatorial Pacific." <u>Deep-Sea Res.</u> 43:
762	
763	Zahn, R., T. F. Pedersen, et al. (1991). "Water mass conversion in the glacial Subarctic
/64 765	Pacific (54N, 148W): Physical constraints and the benthic-planktonic stable
/65	isotope record." <u>Paleoceanography</u> <b>6</b> : 543-560.
/00 767	
/0/	
/68	











Depth, cm



