



AUTHOR(S):

TITLE:

YEAR:

Publisher citation:

OpenAIR citation:

Publisher copyright statement:

This is the _____ version of proceedings originally published by _____
and presented at _____
(ISBN _____; eISBN _____; ISSN _____).

OpenAIR takedown statement:

Section 6 of the "Repository policy for OpenAIR @ RGU" (available from <http://www.rgu.ac.uk/staff-and-current-students/library/library-policies/repository-policies>) provides guidance on the criteria under which RGU will consider withdrawing material from OpenAIR. If you believe that this item is subject to any of these criteria, or for any other reason should not be held on OpenAIR, then please contact openair-help@rgu.ac.uk with the details of the item and the nature of your complaint.

This publication is distributed under a CC _____ license.

Theorizing Social Fear and Contested Urbanism of Displacement, Alienation and Contemporary processes of Political, Economic and Religious-induced Mobility: A Cross Cultural Study

Quazi Mahtab Zaman (PhD)¹, Igea Troiani (PhD)², Iris Altenberger³ and Rosa Cervera⁴

Abstract

Fear is an intrinsic human response to social insecurity and epitomises the perceived disparity in anticipation and engagement with the 'other'. Fear of other ethnic minority groups and their involvement or not in the city's social and labour markets can manifest spatial insecurity through territoriality, boundary definition, ghettoization and access to communal public space. The cost of land and property, the incoming wealth and the ability of a migrant or refugee to generate income (or not)– to buy or rent or live illegally– are major contributing factors in social inclusion. Many metropolitan cities are challenged and pressured by economic, political, religious, and racial class divisions. Here we argue that contested urban settlements of migrant and low-paid workers need to be studied through the matrix of social fear using new methodologies of communication that map fear and displacement within the city and public space.

Keywords: social fear, urban fear, neoliberalism, affordable housing, public space, unfinished urban developments

Introduction

Fear is an intrinsic human response to social insecurity and epitomises the perceived disparity in anticipation and engagement with the 'other'. Strangeness emerges as a widespread issue in the realm of: conflicts in contested places within and at the borders of cities; politics in divided cities and regions, and social displacement and occupation – temporary and permanent – as a result of forced economic or political migration. Fear of other ethnic minority groups and their involvement or not in the city's social and labour markets can manifest spatial insecurity through territoriality, boundary definition, ghettoization and access to communal public space. The cost of land and property, the incoming wealth and the ability of a migrant or refugee to generate income (or not)– to buy or rent or live illegally– are major contributing factors in social inclusion. Many metropolitan cities are challenged and pressured by economic, political, religious, and racial class divisions. In this paper, we argue that contested urban settlements of migrant and low-paid workers need to be studied through the matrix of social fear read here through Raymond William's concept of 'structures of feeling' using new methodologies of communication that map fear and displacement within the city and public space.⁵

The urban research presented here stems from a range of pilot studies in three different displaced social groups in different cities: Syrians in Scotland; Rohingya (Burmese minorities) in Bangladesh; and migrants in Spain. It asks: How is social fear portrayed in various newcomer social groups, ranging from children to adults in the case study cities? How do non-citizens privately and publicly occupy the cities in which they relocate? How can sites of 'Contested Urbanisms' in urban city edges create richer and more inclusive and equitable social environments and public space?

Social Fear as a discourse

Researchers working in urban planning, architecture, geography and the social sciences have articulated several paradoxical definitions of fear depending on the depth of scholarship in each discipline. While 'the issue of fear is still highly marginal to the main stages of theoretical development in planning theory'⁶ it is sometimes studied through Yosef Jabereen's concept of 'space of risk'⁷ as 'a lived space that has low levels of trust among different urban groups'. Simone Tulumello refers to 'social fear' in urban settings as a social construct'.⁸ Social fear is based on three points of view in urban planning: first, the spatialisation of fear; second (modernist) spatialities; and third, the encounter and political economies of urban fear. These three views have helped shape many planning narratives in the history of cities prone to urban conflicts, social displacements and the way fear shapes planning and occupation practice.⁹ Recurrent fear in displaced urban society in contested urbanism is not always a function of the contemporary organisation of cities, but a combination of global (hegemonic) and local (discursive/contingent) perspectives in the theorization of urban fear. Geopolitics of suspicion and security, whether at local, regional or inter-border countries, is found to have generated social conditions whereby social exclusion is predominantly experienced by the marginalised minorities who because of class, ethnicity, race and gender are displaced by economic, politics or social engineering.¹⁰

Racialized and gendered bodies of minority groups challenge the construction of the ideal urban citizen and disrupt social norms.¹¹ In terms of the 'spatiality of identity', the relationship between citizenry, otherness and urban geographies of fear has been the subject of feminist and urban geographers for decades.¹² In Doreen Massey's research on power and space, she contends that 'There are places within our own local areas which we might find it difficult to enter because they are alienating (we do not conform to the characteristics required of those who normally gain admission).'¹³ Urban geographies of fear are experienced by visitors to enclave areas of non-citizens and conversely by non-citizens forced to

migrate from their homelands. Identity politics, home and material culture of belongings are intertwined for both citizen and migrant groups alike. The research of the relationship between possessions, disadvantaged peoples or refugees and cities require new approaches and methodologies that map not only the corporeal urban occupation of non-citizens but also emotional recordings and readings for which Raymond Williams 'structure of feelings' is expanded upon.

Williams coined the 'structure of feelings' as a phrase to show the relationship between dramatic conventions and written texts. Williams was particularly concerned with the acceptance or not within particular societies of behaviours, conventions or practices that related to citizenry or not. Williams used the concept to examine the phenomena of dominant hegemony, in order to propose it a dynamic means of forming new lines of social thought and convention. The space between stereotypical and official policy or regulatory discourse differed to popular urban and cultural experience. Feelings, rather than thought, are highlighted by Williams to reveal emotional aspects not typically prioritised but which should be.

The authors of this chapter have undertaken research in the different respective cities, understanding their geographical distinctiveness but always endeavouring to register within their research and through their respective methodologies – using audio recordings, photography, and video – the relationship between fear of otherness, displacement and contested urbanism. In the case of the first case study of Syrian refugees in Scotland, the research focused on forced migration and material possessions.

CASE STUDY 1 - Forced migration, inherent material objects and social mobility: Syrian Refugees in Aberdeen

Migrants that are forced to leave their country leave behind many of their personal effects. Most of the time their houses are destroyed as a result of war. The migratory families' only belongings are some or all of their family members and select personal items that are easy to carry. These

possessions are signs of their affinity to keep a trace of memories regardless of their value, where the perceived importance is strongest at the time of social displacement. Also, this perceived value is compromised by the condition where the displaced social groups weigh their selection of belongings against their mode of mobility, namely walking or by boat (Figure 1) while triggering the 'oscillation of fear' by confronting uncertainty at every unknown location.



Figure 1: Displaced migrants usually take the route from Turkey onto the island of Lesbos, and then taken different routes by humanitarian support groups. (Source: Evening Express, <https://www.eveningexpress.co.uk/fp/news/local/fleeing-the-horrors-of-war-torn-syria1/> (accessed on 4 April 2018, 4:45pm))

Forced migration changes the relationship with material culture because it requires migrants and refugees to make choices about the material objects they will take on their journey, to a sometimes but often unknown destination. These objects are intrinsic to the memory of an identity that in the context of a new culture and place is changing and developing. If not always physically present, the select possessions can be considered as transitional objects that become part of the experience of displacement.¹⁴ Depending on the duration of their stay in a new city, the homeland

belongings of migrants and refugees form a key role in constructing domestic attachment. If migrants and refugees choose to stay, new belongings are acquired in an endeavour to improve status and living standards. This path made possible by neoliberal, work opportunities to accrue economic, social and cultural capital is how class and citizenry status is improved through neoliberalism.

Neoliberalism is presented by governments as a way in which poverty – often understood as ‘social disadvantage’¹⁵– can be transformed into social power. It is the vehicle through which welfare state dependency is moved to the individual. By definition, neoliberalism is generally understood to be a *laissez-faire* economic liberalism that is founded on the drive for economic independence and growth although it is defined differently, positively or negatively depending on what aspect of the neoliberal system is focused upon.¹⁶ Janet Newman writes that unlike other scholars such as Jessop and Peck who emphasise "the role of the state in securing political and ideological reform in order to enable the expansion of the scope and reach of corporate capital"¹⁷ David Harvey "(2005) views neoliberalism as a class-based political project of creating new means of capital accumulation". For Michel Foucault neoliberal governments have enforced a belief in "installing 'economic' logics of calculation (constituted through discourses of markets, efficiency, consumer choice and individual autonomy) and strategies for promoting 'self-governing' subjects".¹⁸ Entrepreneurism, both in work by migrant and refugee groups can facilitate class and social mobility. Typically, it involves capital accumulation built upon the scant possessions brought from their homeland.

According to the Aberdeen Community Planning Partnership¹⁹ and the UK Home Office’s Vulnerable Persons Relocation Scheme, Aberdeen has started to take a 5% share of the estimated 2,000 refugees coming to Scotland over the next five years. This first body of research was by a multi-disciplinary team consisting of artists and social scientists and explores the chosen transitional objects Syrian refugees take with them to Aberdeen using art-based methods of research.

By utilising art-based research, wide ranging methodological possibilities arise, such as the use of sound, video recording and drawing. These mixed methods allow the exploration of the phenomenological experience of refugees and their chosen material objects. Therefore, art-based research allows for the addition of textures and layers to the research data as it explores in depth the objects the refugees chose to bring with them. As the researchers have no Arabic language skills this methodology allows for the building of rapport with the participants that goes beyond a verbal interaction bridged by a translator. Though the methodology was innovative, there is a triangulation with traditional research methods in the form of interviews.²⁰ Additionally, the art created permits a wider audience to discover the experiences expressed by the Syrian refugees. The art-based method research therefore brings new advantages.

Art as a method falls under the category of 'interpretive phenomenological analysis methods'.²¹ This method tries to illustrate participants' needs and aspirations include: sustainability of the body; nourishment of the heart; fostering of the mind and soul; social justice and activism; dreams and desires; and self-empowerment and identity. The participants generate meaning using photographs that engage with the self, performance, bodies, emotions, imagination, intellect, humour and story-telling. Arts-based study offers richness and complexity of alternative forms of data that exposes new methods of engagement – most of these are cognitive or emotional. Moreover, art-based research is a creative route to identify the experiences of refugees.

Arts-based research is a visual method and is a qualitative inquiry that emphasises constructivism, critical interpretation, and contextualism.²² According to Finley, it is one of the diverse ways of experiencing the real-world scenario.²³ Arts-based research helps in engaging vulnerable cohort by ways of (1) giving voice to those with less power in society²⁴; (2) helping a rapport between research and lived experience²⁵; and (3) making meaning through multiple senses and medium.²⁶ Art-based research is a creative way of capturing multiple experiences using various representational forms

of media of expression that enhances our understanding of the human condition that confronts harsh life conditions. To reach a completeness of lived experience, art helps in the 'knowledge construction'.²⁷

The result of art-based research is a vivid articulation of the long-journey of the Syrian refugee and the way they have adjusted to, been confronted by, and settled in an alienated spatial domain that helped reconstruct their fragmented 'knowledge construction'. A further study is taking place at the time of writing this paper.

CASE STUDY 2 – Recording fear, displacement and space through FOCAL (Fear Oscillation Calculator): Rohingya Refugees in Chittagong, Bangladesh

The ethnographic information of the second case study city of Chittagong is captured through pilot social surveys using a modified version of 'The Social Phobia Inventory (SPIN) – a questionnaire originally developed by Jonathan Davidson at Duke University for screening and measuring generalised social anxiety disorder. The various contours of social phobia – fear, avoidance and temporal behavioural changes – are scaled with intensity, from 'Low to High' with a corresponding number value. A score higher than 10 indicates likelihood of a social anxiety disorder.

A new measuring tool has been tested by the authors of this research, called FOCAL (Fear Oscillation Calculator), which takes into account linear capturing of variance in fear at various point of contacts by people within a displaced society. The oscillation refers to the 'mood swing' but in this case the fear is subject to change by circumstances in variables, such as age, gender, and family structural integrity (broken family) who lose 'social capital' at the origin and are prone to uncertainty in forming new 'social capital'.

Only one case was conducted as part of longitudinal assessment in Rohingya refugees aiming to construct the modality and contours of fear amongst displaced children and adults, mostly women, sometimes with

(Figure 2) or without men who have either been abducted or killed during the displacement process. This was done through one representative working in an international NGO at the make-shift accommodation of displaced settlers using a FOCAL Pilot Survey (Table 1).



Figure 2: A father carries his son across water from Myanmar to Bangladesh (Photo credit: Aurélie Marrier d'Unienville, source: Oxfam International, <https://www.oxfam.org/en/emergencies/bangladesh-rohingya-refugee-crisis> (Accessed on 4 April 2018, 4:57pm)

The pilot outcome demonstrates a mixed anxiety contours manifested in 'oscillation' (FOCAL). Children are prone to defining anxiety as the outcome of 'temporal and unknown' dislocation and display hopefulness and the expectation for 'return to the original social order'. Adults define 'social fear' as a recurrent phenomenon, and search for a permanent solution by assessing the future vulnerability of their children. However, a new secured social domain is blurred by the new arrival of fear and uncertainty as the product of alienation, exploitation and weak adherence to the new social order.

Table 1: FOCAL Pilot Survey

Date:	Participant profile:	Gender: M/F;	Age:.....	Origin:
.....Current	Place:	Method	of	transfer:

walking/vehicle/boat/others:Date of leaving the origin:Date reaching the new place:.....; Number of family members:(please indicate any missing member after relocation:); Triggering factors of fear: war/natural disaster/genocide/gentrification by land price & job loses/other political threats/religious conflict (tick as many as applicable)

FOCAL originators and scores: 0: No fear; 1: start of fear; 2: fluctuating fear; 3: sustaining fear; 4: fear turn into intense chronic health condition; 5: fear created long-term mental disorder

FEAR ORIGINATOR							Scoring	Oscillation profile
Fear occurred at the origin							2	
Fear during displacement (unsafe transport)							4	
Fear due to losing family members							4	
Fear due to losing native place/home							3	
Fear due to life threatening condition (*)							5	
Fear due to unsafe transient place							4	
Fear in dealing with relocation							3	
Fear at new place							3	
Fear due to exploitation at origin							3	
Fear due to exploitation at new place							4	
Total Scoring							35	
Intensity of Fear	None	Mild	Severe	Austere	Deepening (leading to long-term disorder)	(*) Peak of fear occurs during life threatening condition, interpreted or demonstrated by killing, harming or abducting		
Rating	< 20	21 to 30	31 to 40	41 to 50	51 to higher			
Interpretation/observation			x					

Table 1: Pilot FOCAL study on Rohingya refugee, age 35, male, having relocated from Rakhine state of Myanmar (Zaman, Toriani, Rosa, 2018)

The pilot study helps to portray the oscillation of fear that began at the origin (Rakhine state) and lasted with higher intensity during the Rohingya refugees pathway to a new make-shift place. The frequency of fear from the 'Oscillation Profile' column demonstrate the fluctuation of fear, but the median fear is found to be 'severe' (a total of 35). A more in-depth and longitudinal study are currently being carried out in the make-shift camp with the help of volunteers taking a larger cohort of refugees.

The journey of refugees into large cities can be recorded and analysed through the study and communication of their material possessions brought from their homeland, as seen in Case Study 1, or through the surveying of the oscillation of fear of arrival and anticipation as in Case Study 2. In Case Study 3, methods of research are used to document the emotional qualities of spaces which migrant and low to middle-income people are able to occupy. This research employs photography of a large-scale failed housing development on the outskirts of Madrid to show the spatial, emotional and social signs of disenfranchised and isolated citizens and non-citizens who live at the margins of the city and society. The photographs show how absence and emptiness visualise fearful and unwelcoming spaces and highlight how an absence of communal public space, that can be occupied by residents, disempowers settlement.

CASE STUDY 3 – Capitalism and cheap unfinished housing developments: Migrants in Seseña, Spain

Unfinished urban housing developments in Europe and beyond are emerging as a strand of contemporary architectural research because “both the practice and the discipline of architecture face an economic, social, and political landscape vastly different from the one that greeted them in the early years of the 21st century.”²⁸ Completed or incomplete housing that is partly occupied or empty “tell stories, if they’re allowed” and architects, architectural educators and students, and artists have become more involved in relaying those stories to culture at large.²⁹ Case Study 3 is research undertaken on the housing development of El Quiñón in Seseña

(Figure 3) which is today occupied by low to middle income Spaniards and migrants and is located 30 minutes south of Madrid on the A4 highway.³⁰ Located near a tyre dumping ground which caught fire in May 2016, it is a monument that symbolises 20 years of frantic property speculation that failed to be fully realised.

The research team consisted of academics and postgraduate design researchers based in the School of Architecture at Oxford Brookes University in the United Kingdom.³¹ It was led by Igea Troiani (PhD) and Andrew Dawson and ran from September 2015 to May 2016. “Unfinished Madrid” is part of a larger design research project to examine the relationship between unfinished building capital, neoliberalism, inclusivity and social design activism. The research project which has photographed, videoed and researched modern ruin fragments of unfinished buildings in Athens, Greece (2014-15) and Cuba (2016-17) examines the way in which empty unfinished building debris from the economic downturns or halted by political change and upheaval might be co-opted and regenerated to form stronger socially inclusive communities; and how the architect might reflect on the rise of big global development driven by economic rather than social motives and their alternative participation in design labour for social betterment. Key theories by Rem Koolhaas on global capitalism informed the research.



Figure 3: El Quiñón, Seseña: apartment blocks lie empty and the foundations for others have been abruptly abandoned (Photograph: Joshua Aylett, 22 October 2015)

Koolhaas identified “how global capitalism created dynamic, highly speculative urban conditions that were transforming the contemporary city.”³² Building and land development, the by-product of neoliberalism has enabled the rise of the entrepreneurial developer, with or without an architect. The easy access to money (or capital) has allowed developers to design the form of our cities and its social demographic divisions. From North America to South America, Asia to Europe, a frenzy of speculative investment has allowed many metropolitan city edges to become border sites of expansive successful or turbulent development.

For instance, in *Turbulent and Mighty Continent: What Future for Europe?* economist Anthony Giddens argues that Europe no longer seems so mighty, nowadays unable to impact upon world affairs because it is struck by turbulent and unstable conflicts.³³ With divisions arising all over Europe, issues of social inequality, increased unemployment, inescapable debt and unmanageable immigration many Southern European countries are shifting from sites of historical power to becoming powerlessness. In Italy, Portugal, Greece and Spain, the architectural and urban landscapes are showing

signs of deterioration and stagnation due to economic crises inside and beyond Europe and are experiencing problems associated with anxiousness in relation to modernity.³⁴

In Europe, the downturn in the market from the crisis has had varying social and urban effects for countries, although arguably the hardest hit were the economies of the EU member countries – Portugal, Ireland, Italy, Greece and Spain (PIIGS). Many projects were halted in these countries leaving small and large speculative developments as unoccupied, unsellable or incomplete or unfinished. A fall in employment prospects in these countries, a consequent of uncertainty in the markets, meant that for countries like Spain, a class of low income or unemployed workers grew. In addition to the bursting of the neoliberal prosperity bubble in 2008, Italy, Greece and Spain have also had to cope with a migrant crisis, the influx of war refugees migrating from Asia, mainly Syria (Figure 4) adding to the already steady number of migrants moving after the mid 1990s from Ecuador, Romania, Morocco, and elsewhere to satisfy ‘the economic demand for new workers’ and in search of a better life.³⁵ The impact of the migration on urbanism has contributed to issues pertaining to social fear.



Figure 4: Syrian Refugee is approaching Aberdeen (Aberdeen Solidarity with Refugees, source: Aberdeen Trades Union Council, 5 September 2015, <https://aberdeentuc.blogspot.co.uk/2015/09/atuc-pledges-support-for-refugees.html> (accessed on 4 April 2018, 4:37pm)

In Spain, urban residential complexes built by entrepreneurial developers during the boom were targeted at second homebuyers that favour private ownership to be rented by others (low income Spanish nationals and refugees). Public space was often minimised and controlled by speculative market economies and the fact that some developments failed to be completed due to a loss of capital left residents in housing estates whose public services and amenities were planned but not built.

The residential Francisco Hernando development at El Quiñón was the brainchild of Francisco Hernando, better known as “Paco el Pocero”. It was initiated in the early 2000s and was to be one of the housing developments in Spain, with an original plan of 13,500 apartments costing over 9 billion Euros to build. Approved quickly through means of bribery, the project fell into trouble, after fewer than 3000 of the completed apartments had been sold, and fewer than a third of the sold apartments were occupied. At its peak in 2007, buyers who bought in Phase 1 of the development for 3,600 people, paid up to €250,000 for a 100m², three-bedroom, 100-square-meter apartment. The average price of an apartment in Phase 2 of the

development for 2,300 people was, in March 2016, less than €100,000, up from €50,000 in 2011.³⁶ Both the failure to complete the project, the peripheral location of the housing estate, its unconnected to railway transit lines to Madrid and the radical drop in purchase and rental prices has meant that El Quiñón is now marketed at low-income Spaniards or migrants who have relatively limited areas within the labour market to contribute to because of their 'sex, age, status, education, qualifications, ethnic origin, and so on'.³⁷

The 'Unfinished Madrid' research studio focused on the mapping and interrogative study of the consequences of the shift from luxury to austerity in Spain exemplified by its unfinished buildings, and fringe ghost town urbanizations. Using urban exploration and ethnographic fieldwork methods the research team visited the almost deserted 'ghost urbanizations' researching its inhabitation and emptiness recorded through visual research traces of occupation, desertion and graffiti (Figure 5). Of the migrants who had chosen to rent low cost accommodation in El Quiñón, most were optimistic about their potential future prospects even though as sites of contested urbanism, El Quiñón exemplified social isolation and separation. The research findings visually argued for an increase in public space as a mode of community building, with the vacant shops and unoccupied street seen as sites for changing everyday community life, interaction and exchange.



Figure 5: Left - Graffiti on empty street shop front in El Quiñón (Photograph: Christopher Jones, 22 October 2015); Right – Graffiti on empty sports ground wall “Si Podemos” or “Yes We Can” (Photograph: Isabelle Mollé, 22 October 2015)

Conclusion

The urban research presented in this paper depended on a range of pilot studies to test the methodological model using three case studies in three different cities. The research examined the temporal foundation of ‘Contested Urbanism’ through an economic interpretation of how low-income people are disadvantaged and how the privatization of space and the neoliberal mentalities resist the production of resilient, affordable and harmonised social spaces. The research identified a typological pattern to the minority group urban occupation of cheaper property, mainly in urban outskirts where community public space is underdeveloped, incomplete or unfinished. We argue that inclusive public space could be generated for the local disenfranchised communities as a counterpoint to neoliberal distancing with building occupants.

Building on the research of Raymond Williams on the ‘structure of feelings’ the paper is an upshot and effort to portray the varying nature of social fear, temporal occupation and anti-urbanism reflected in the sites of habitation of displaced refugees and immigrants in three large cities. Anti-urbanism

develops as an origin and likelihood of formation at current transient fringe settlements that depend on the condition and collaboration with the displaced families. The paper reinforces that social fear and anti-urbanism are two symptomatic behavioural changes of non-citizen settlers. It links poverty with emotional and 'social disadvantage'.³⁸ It also reveals how social fear is a condition to be researched by inter-disciplinary teams and proposes the use of interdisciplinary methods to more deeply understand the contested city and the contributors of fear as a multi-faceted phenomenon.

The urban research presented here on the different displaced social groups of Syrians in Scotland; Rohingya (Burmese minorities) in Bangladesh; and migrants in Spain reveals how alternative methods and communication of research expose alternative aspects associated with social fear, inclusion and city public space. The research undertaken in Case Study 1 of the Syrian community in Scotland that used arts-practice is able to map memory and identity relative to displaced communities. Case Study 2 employs a unique FOCAL Survey method to embed emotion into research praxis studying the Rohingya minority in Bangladesh. In Case Study 3 neoliberal *laissez-fair* housing development occupied by low-to-middle income disenfranchised migrants, refugees and Spaniards uses visual research methods to highlight the absence of community public space is interrelated to unoccupied and deserted housing estates.

The research examines the temporal foundation of 'Contested Urbanism' through an economic interpretation of how low-income people are disadvantaged and how the privatization of space and the neoliberal mentalities resist the production of resilient, affordable and harmonised social spaces. The research identifies a typological pattern to the minority group urban occupation of cheaper property, mainly in urban outskirts where community public space is underdeveloped, incomplete or unfinished. We argue that inclusive public space in Aberdeen, Chittagong and Seseña could be generated for the local disenfranchised communities as a counterpoint to neoliberal distancing with building occupants.

References

- Abu-Orf, H. (2013) 'Fear of difference: 'Space of risk' and anxiety in violent settings', *Planning Theory*, 12(2), pp. 158–176.
- Barone, T. (2000) *Aesthetics, Politics, and Educational Inquiry: Essays and Examples*. Washington, D.C.: Peter Lang.
- Brand, S. (1997) *How Buildings Learn: What Happens after They're Built*, London: Phoenix.
- Dean, H. and L. Platt eds. (2016) *Social Advantage and Disadvantage*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Domínguez, I. "Spain's ghost city comes to life", *El País*, 4 March 2016, https://elpais.com/elpais/2016/02/29/inenglish/1456754974_557309.html, Accessed 8 April 2018.
- Dunham-Jones, E. 'Irrational Exuberance: Rem Koolhaas and the 1990s,' in P. Deamer ed. (2014) *Architecture and Capitalism: 1845 to the Present*, London: Routledge, pp. 150-171.
- England, M. R. and S. Simon (2010) 'Scary cities: urban geographies of fear, difference and belonging,' *Social & Cultural Geography*, 11(3), pp. 201-207.
- Finley, S. (2008) 'Arts-based research', In G. Knowles & A. Cole eds. *Handbook of the Arts in Qualitative Research: Perspectives, Methodologies, Examples & Issues*, Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications, pp. 71-82.
- Finley, S. & Finley, M. (1999) 'Sp'ange 1: A Research Story', *Qualitative Inquiry*, 5(3), 313- 337.
- Flowers B. ed. (2014) *Architecture in an Age of Uncertainty*, Farnham, Surrey: Ashgate.
- Garoian, C. (1999) *Performing Pedagogy*, Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Giddens, A. (2014) *Turbulent and Mighty Continent: What Future for Europe?* Cambridge: Polity.
- Harvey, D. (2007) *A Brief History of Neoliberalism*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Jabareen, Y. (2006) 'Space of risk: The contribution of planning policies to conflicts in cities, lessons from *Nazareth*,' *Planning Theory and Practice*, 7(3), pp. 305–323.
- Leavy, P. ed. (2014) *The Oxford Handbook of Qualitative Research*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Massey, D. (1994) *Space, Place and Gender*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Massey, D. (2007) *World City*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Menz, G. and A. Caviedes eds. (2010) *Labour Migration in Europe*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Newman, J. (2012) *Working the Spaces of Power: Activism, Neoliberalism and Gendered Labour*, Bloomsbury Academic, London.
- Norris, J. (2000). Drama as research: Realizing the potential of drama in education as a research methodology. *Youth Theatre Journal*, 14, 40-51.
- Parkin, D. (1 November 1999) 'Mementoes as Transitional Objects in Human Displacement', *Journal of Material Culture*, 4(3), pp. 303-320.
- Pain, R. (2010) 'The New Geopolitics of Fear', *Geography Compass*, 4(3), pp. 226–240.
- Robertson, J. (2015) 'Moray Council lend support to Syrian refugee crisis outreach effort', *The Press and Journal*, October 15 (<https://www.pressandjournal.co.uk/fp/news/moray/722315/moray-council-lend-support-to-syrian-refugee-crisis-outreach-effort/>, accessed on 9 April 2018)
- Smith, J. A., & Osborn, M. (2008). Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis. In J. Smith, *Qualitative Psychology: A Practical Guide to Research Methods* (pp. 53-80). London: Sage.
- Sullivan, G. (2005). *Art practice as Research: Inquiry in the Visual Arts*, Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Tulumello, S. (2015) 'Fear and Urban Planning in Ordinary Cities: From Theory to Practice', *Planning, Practice & Research*, 30 (5): 477–496.
- Watrin, R. (1999) 'Art as Research', *Canadian Review of Art Education*, 26(2), pp. 92-100.
- Williams, R. J. (2004) *The Anxious City*, London: Routledge.

Williams, R. (1977) 'Structures of Fear', Chapter 9, in R. Williams, *Marxism and Literature*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 128-134.

Winnicott, A. D. (1991), *The Piggle: An Account of the Psychoanalytic Treatment of a Little Girl*, Penguin.

Wrench, J, A. Rea and N. Ouali. (1999) *Migrants, Ethnic Minorities and the Labour Market: Integration and Exclusion in Europe*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

¹ Scott Sutherland School of Architecture, Robert Gordon University, Aberdeen, UK, g.m.m.zaman@rgu.ac.uk

² School of Architecture, Oxford Brookes University, Oxford, UK, itroiani@brookes.ac.uk

³ School of Applied Social Studies, Faculty of Health and Social Care, Robert Gordon University, UK, i.altenberger1@rgu.ac.uk

⁴ School of architecture, Alcala University, Madrid, Spain, rosa.cervera@uah.es

⁵ Raymond Williams (1977) 'Structures of Fear', Chapter 9, in Raymond Williams, *Marxism and Literature*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 128-134.

⁶ Harem Abu-Orf, 2013. 'Fear of difference: 'Space of risk' and anxiety in violent settings', *Planning Theory*, 12 (2), pp. 158–176 (p. 159)

⁷ Yosef Jabareen (2006) 'Space of risk: The contribution of planning policies to conflicts in cities, lessons from Nazareth', *Planning Theory and Practice*, 7(3), pp. 305–323; p. 319.

⁸ Simone Tulumello, 'Fear and Urban Planning in Ordinary Cities: From Theory to Practice', *Planning, Practice & Research*, 2015 30 (5): 477–496.

⁹ Tulumello, 'Fear and Urban Planning in Ordinary Cities', 477–496.

¹⁰ Rachel Pain (2010) 'The New Geopolitics of Fear', *Geography Compass*, 4(3), pp. 226–240.

¹¹ Marcia R. England and Stephanie Simon (2010) 'Scary cities: urban geographies of fear, difference and belonging', *Social & Cultural Geography*, 11 (3), pp. 201-207, (p. 202)

¹² Doreen Massey, 2007. *World City*, Cambridge: Polity Press, p. 179.

¹³ Doreen Massey, 'Concepts of space and power in theory and in political practice', *Documents d'anàlisi geogràfica* (2009) 55: 15-26.

¹⁴ David Parkin (1 November 1999) 'Mementoes as Transitional Objects in Human

Displacement', *Journal of Material Culture*, 4(3), pp. 303-320; Winnicott, A. D. (1991),

The Piggle: An Account of the Psychoanalytic Treatment of a Little Girl, Penguin.

¹⁵ Hartley Dean, 'Poverty and Social Exclusion', in Hartley Dean and Lucinda Platt eds. 2016 *Social Advantage and Disadvantage*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 3-24, p. 3.

¹⁶ "David Harvey (Harvey 2005) views neoliberalism as a class-based

political project of creating new means of capital accumulation, while Jessop (Jessop 2002) and Peck (Peck 2004) place more emphasis on the role of the state in securing political and ideological reform in order to enable the expansion of the scope and reach of corporate capital. In contrast Foucauldian inspired theories of governmentality (Brown 2005; Ong 2007; N. Rose 1999) view neoliberalism in terms of technologies for governing populations by installing 'economic' logics of calculation (constituted through discourses of markers, efficiency, managerialism, consumer choice and individual autonomy) and strategies for promoting 'self-governing' subjects." (Newman 2012: 157)

¹⁷ Janet Newman, 2012. *Working the Spaces of Power: Activism, Neoliberalism and Gendered Labour*, Bloomsbury Academic, London, p. 157.

¹⁸ Newman 2012: 157.

¹⁹ John Robertson (15 October 2015) 'Moray Council lend support to Syrian refugee crisis outreach effort', *The Press and Journal* (<https://www.pressandjournal.co.uk/fp/news/moray/722315/moray-council-lend-support-to-syrian-refugee-crisis-outreach-effort/>, accessed on 9 April 2018)

²⁰ Patricia Leavy ed. (2014) *The Oxford Handbook of Qualitative Research*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

²¹ Smith, J. A., & Osborn, M. (2008). Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis. In J. Smith, *Qualitative Psychology: A Practical Guide to Research Methods* (pp. 53-80). London: Sage.

²² Graeme Sullivan (2005). *Art practice as Research: Inquiry in the Visual Arts*, Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

²³ S. Finley (2008) 'Arts-based research', in G. Knowles & A. Cole eds. *Handbook of the Arts in Qualitative Research: Perspectives, Methodologies, Examples & Issues 328*, Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications, pp. 71-82.

²⁴ Tom Barone (2000) *Aesthetics, Politics, and Educational Inquiry: Essays and Examples*. Washington, D.C.: Peter Lang; Susan Finley and Macklin Finley, (1999) 'Sp'ange 1: A Research Story', *Qualitative Inquiry*, 5(3), 313-337.

²⁵ Charles R. Garoian (1999) *Performing Pedagogy*, Albany: State University of New York Press.

²⁶ Norris, J. (2000). Drama as research: Realizing the potential of drama in education

as a research methodology. *Youth Theatre Journal*, 14, 40-51.

²⁷ Rhonda Watrin (1999) 'Art as Research', *Canadian Review of Art Education*, 26(2), pp. 92-100; Finley, 2008.

²⁸ Benjamin Flowers, "Introduction," in Benjamin Flowers ed. (2014) *Architecture in an Age of Uncertainty*, Farnham, Surrey: Ashgate, p. 2.

²⁹ Brand, S. (1997) *How Buildings Learn: What Happens after They're Built*, London: Phoenix, p. 4.

³⁰ The research also studied Valdeluz, another incomplete housing development on the outskirts of Madrid.

³¹ The postgraduate students included: Alini Ab Halim; Dorata Adamczyk; Ali Argalioglu; Joshua Aylett; Daniel Bianchi; Nazmi Bin Samium; Bryan

Bradbrook; Valeria Fabriano; Dafydd Jones-Davies; Christopher Jones; Isabelle Mollé; Jun Ng; Alicia Sardi Hernandez; and James Sidaway.

³² Dunham-Jones, "Irrational Exuberance," p. 150.

³³ Anthony Giddens (2014) *Turbulent and Mighty Continent: What Future for Europe?* Cambridge: Polity.

³⁴ Richard J. Williams, 2004. *The Anxious City: English Urbanism in the late Twentieth Century*, London and New York: Routledge.

³⁵ Willem Maas, 'Unauthorized Migration and the Politics of Regularization, Legalization, and Amnesty'- The Case of Spain in George Menz and Alexander Caviedes eds. *Labour Migration in Europe*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 232-250. (236, 237).

³⁶ Iñigo Domínguez, "Spain's ghost city comes to life", *El País*, 4 March 2016,

https://elpais.com/elpais/2016/02/29/inenglish/1456754974_557309.html, Accessed 8 April 2018.

³⁷ Lorenzo Cachón, "Immigrants in Spain: From Institutional Discrimination to Labour Market Segregation" in John Wrench, Andrea Rea and Nouria Ouali eds. 1999. *Migrants, Ethnic Minorities and the Labour Market: Integration and Exclusion in Europe*, Basingstoke: Palgrave, pp. 174-194 (p. 177)

³⁸ Harley Dean, "Poverty and Social Exclusion", in Harley Dean and Lucinda Platt eds. 2016, *Social Advantage and Disadvantage*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 1-24.