

1 Influences of forested and grassland vegetation on Late Quaternary 2 ecosystem development as recorded in lacustrine sediments

3
4 Kendra K. McLauchlan ^{a*}

5 Ioan Lascu ^{b,c*}

6 Emily Mellicant ^a

7 Robert J. Scharping ^{a^}

8 Joseph J. Williams ^d

9

10 ^a Department of Geography, Kansas State University, Manhattan KS 66506 U.S.A.

11 ^b Department of Mineral Sciences, National Museum of Natural History, Smithsonian
12 Institution, Washington, DC 20560, U.S.A.

13 ^c Department of Earth Sciences, University of Cambridge, Downing Street,
14 Cambridge, CB2 3EQ, U.K.

15 ^d Department of Geography, Oxford Brookes University, Oxford, U.K.

16 *corresponding author

17 [^] current address: Department of Cell Biology, Microbiology and Molecular Biology,
18 University of South Florida, Tampa, FL U.S.A.

19

20 **keywords:** Holocene; Paleolimnology; North America; Sedimentology; Lakes;
21 Inorganic geochemistry; Vegetation dynamics; Weathering

22

23 Abstract

24 Geosphere-biosphere interactions are ubiquitous features of the Earth surface, yet
25 the development of interactions between newly-exposed lithologic surfaces and
26 colonizing plants during primary succession after glaciation are lacking temporal
27 detail. To assess the nature, rate, and magnitude of vegetation influence on parent
28 material and sediment delivery, we analyzed ecosystem and geochemical proxies
29 from lacustrine sediment cores at a grassland site and a forested site in the northern
30 U.S. Over time, terrigenous inputs declined at both sites, with increasing amounts of
31 organic inputs toward present. The similarities between sites were striking given
32 that the grassland sequence began in the Early Holocene, and the forested sequence
33 began after the Last Glacial Maximum. Multiple mechanisms of chemical weathering,
34 hydrologic transport, and changes in source material potentially contribute to this
35 pattern. Although there were strong links between vegetation composition and
36 nitrogen cycling at each site, it appears that changes in forest type, or from oak
37 woodland to grassland did not exert a large influence on elemental (K, Ti, Si, Ca, Fe,
38 Mn, S) abundance in the sedimentary sequences. Rather, other factors in the
39 catchment-lake system determined the temporal sequence of elemental abundance.

40

41 1. Introduction

42 One of the fundamental relationships within Earth systems is the interaction
43 between the geosphere and the biosphere. The role of terrestrial plants in shaping
44 newly formed landscapes (*i.e.* primary succession) has been studied after glacial
45 retreat (Buma et al. 2017), volcanic eruptions (Cutler et al. 2008), and mass

46 movement (Colombaroli and Gavin 2010). Most Earth surfaces are considered to
47 undergo relatively slow rock weathering processes. These processes are dominated
48 by climatic factors, but vegetation also influences weathering (Pawlik et al., 2016)
49 and vice versa (Hahm et al., 2014). The nature of the geosphere-biosphere
50 relationship, and its regulators in space and time, vary across various climatic,
51 geomorphic, tectonic, and biotic settings (Porder, 2014). Here, we focus on the biotic
52 setting, comparing the pace and nature of ecosystem development between two
53 major vegetation types—forest and grassland— to improve our understanding of
54 the relative effect of biota on the geochemical composition of sediments over
55 millennial timescales (Jenny, 1941).

56
57 To understand landscape development over time, we are often limited to comparing
58 Earth-surface features to source rock material. While this can give some indication
59 of how plants may have interacted with rock on timescales of 10^5 or 10^6 years, the
60 intermediate steps, rates, and controls of geosphere-biosphere processes are
61 unknown using this approach. Nonetheless, chronosequence studies of primary
62 succession have demonstrated, broadly, how ecosystems change over time. As
63 primary successional stages develop, there is generally a temporal sequence of
64 biogeochemical changes such as base cation mineral weathering, organic matter
65 accumulation from the terrestrial biosphere, increases in plant-available nitrogen,
66 and decreases in phosphorus (Laliberte et al., 2012; Wardle et al., 2004). However,
67 characterizations of these early stages lack high temporal detail. In particular, we
68 may be missing important system behavior such as tipping points and pedogenic
69 thresholds (Vitousek and Chadwick, 2013).

70
71 Early postglacial successional processes can be reconstructed by studying
72 geochemical records of rock-plant interactions in continuously-deposited lacustrine
73 sedimentary records (Mackereth 1966, Pennington et al. 1972, Engstrom and
74 Hansen 1985). These records provide information on a finer scale ($<17,000$ yBP)
75 than is possible in temperate chronosequences. Measuring elemental concentrations
76 in sedimentary sequences has a long history (Likens, 1985; Willis et al., 1997), but
77 because of the proxy nature of these records, interpretation is aided by a multitude
78 of other parameters describing the properties of these systems (Kylander et al.,
79 2011). Of particular importance are proxies of transport processes from the
80 catchment to the sediment. These dynamic processes are a function of climatic
81 changes, lithological variability, and differences in vegetation cover between
82 grassland and forested catchments. Through multi-proxy investigation, sedimentary
83 sequences have begun to yield unique information about early ecosystem processes.
84 For example, important information about P cycling can be obtained from studying
85 the chemical weathering of the phosphate mineral apatite early in catchment
86 development (Boyle 2007, Norton et al. 2011).

87
88 There are several potential mechanisms for how terrestrial vegetation could
89 determine trajectories of biogeochemical change on centennial to millennial
90 timescales, as seen in Holocene sedimentary records. First, vegetation composition
91 can influence chemical weathering rates. There are examples of organic acids

92 produced by coniferous vegetation speeding ecosystem acidification (Ford 1990)
93 and even leading to podsolization during the Holocene (Davis et al., 2006).
94 Conversely, removal of trees has been demonstrated to cause an increase in soil pH
95 (Bradshaw et al., 2005). Second, the degree of vegetation cover (primary
96 productivity) can affect hydrologic pathways and physical weathering. Large-scale
97 changes from grassland to forests between stadials and interstadials during the Last
98 Glacial, with different rates of productivity, led to differences in weathering product
99 delivery to a depositional basin (Kylander et al., 2011). Finally, there are also
100 potential feedbacks between fire regimes and geochemistry. In lodgepole pine
101 forests of the western U.S., loss of nitrogen and base cations has occurred over the
102 past 4,000 years with repeated fire (Dunnette et al., 2014; Leys, 2016). While fire
103 events and plant cover were significantly related at Thyl Lake in the French Alps,
104 soil processes were primarily linked to vegetation composition, and secondarily to
105 changes in fire regime (Mourier et al., 2010).

106

107 To assess rates, patterns, and mechanisms of ecosystem development after glacial
108 retreat, we compared two sedimentary sequences in the upper Midwestern U.S.
109 from a grassland site and a forested site. Our three main questions were:

- 110 1) How did source material change over the sedimentary sequences?
- 111 2) What were the patterns of nutrients, especially limiting nutrients such as
112 nitrogen, potassium, calcium, and magnesium, during Holocene ecosystem
113 development?
- 114 3) Did the terrestrial biosphere determine the trajectory of elemental change at
115 each site?

116

117

118 **2. Methods**

119 *2.1. Study sites*

120 Fox Lake is located in southern Minnesota, U.S.A., has a surface area of 3.85 km², and
121 a maximum water depth of 6 m. The lake was formed during the retreat of the Des
122 Moines Lobe of the Laurentide Ice Sheet at the end of the last glaciation about
123 12,000 years ago (Maher, 1982 (Lusardi et al. 2011)). Fox Lake is approximately 10
124 km from the southernmost extent of the Des Moines Lobe, but the timing and path of
125 deglaciation are not entirely clear in this region. The catchment parent material is
126 calcareous glacial till, and lake water geochemistry is dominated by catchment input
127 rather than precipitation-evaporation dynamics (Gorham et al. 1983). There is one
128 small inlet stream on the west side of the lake. Soils surrounding Fox Lake are a mix
129 of Udols and Aquolls—poor to well-drained clay loams formed from calcareous
130 tills— and are often deep (>2m) (USDA NRCS).

131

132 Devils Lake is located in southern Wisconsin, has a surface area of 1.53 km², and a
133 maximum depth of 14 m. Catchment parent material is primarily hematite-rich
134 quartzite, as well as glacial till deposited in moraines from the Green Bay Lobe at the
135 end of the last glacial period, ca. 18,500 cal yBP (Attig et al. 2011). Soils in this area
136 are thin (0.5-1 m) Udalfs—moderately well-drained stony and cobbly silt loams
137 formed from a mixture of loess and quartzite bedrock (USDA NCRS). Devils Lake is

138 located just to the south of the maximum extent of the Laurentide Ice Sheet. The
139 catchment of Devils Lake has areas of quartzite cliffs and the geology is considerably
140 different than Fox Lake and therefore these two sites capture a wide range of
141 weathering products to lakes.

142
143 The two study sites are ~480 km apart (Fig. 1). The sites were chosen due to their
144 positions relative to the furthest advance of the Laurentide Ice Sheet and dominant
145 vegetation cover during the Holocene. At the time of Euro-American settlement
146 (mid-1800s), Fox Lake was tallgrass prairie characterized by warm-season grass
147 species such as *Andropogon gerardii*, *Sorghastrum nutans*, and *Schizachyrium*
148 *scoparium* (Küchler 1964). Today, the Fox Lake catchment is dominated by
149 agriculture. In contrast, Devils Lake is surrounded by mixed deciduous-coniferous
150 forest including the conifer *Pinus strobus* and deciduous components of *Quercus*
151 *rubra*, *Quercus alba*, and *Acer rubrum*, and herbaceous savanna understory
152 vegetation. Modern vegetation between the two sites likely varies due to differences
153 in precipitation. Devils Lake on average receives 914-940 mm of annual
154 precipitation, while Fox Lake receives 762-812 mm of annual precipitation (NOAA
155 NWS).

156
157 In February 2012, we obtained sediment cores from both Devils Lake and Fox Lake
158 using piston corers. The Fox Lake sediment core was 9.3 meters long and the Devils
159 Lake sediment core was 10.4 m long.

160
161 A previous study of Fox Lake established a radiocarbon-based chronology as well as
162 the vegetation and fire history (Commerford et al. 2016). The same sediment cores
163 were used to measure the proxies described in the current manuscript. Previously,
164 vegetation history reconstructed by pollen analysis from 9,300 cal yBP indicates
165 that Fox Lake has been a grassland site since near the beginning of the record, with
166 only one slight change from oak forest to grassland at 8,200 cal yBP (Commerford et
167 al. 2016). The oak forest vegetation is characterized by high amounts of *Quercus*
168 pollen (an arboreal pollen type), and the grassland vegetation is characterized by
169 high amounts of non-arboreal pollen types such as Poaceae, *Ambrosia*, and
170 *Artemisia*. Thus, for this study we used the % arboreal pollen to capture this
171 vegetation transition at Fox Lake. The lithostratigraphy for Fox Lake is consistently
172 characterized by dark brown, high organic matter sediment throughout the core.
173 Five zones (F1-F5) were determined with constrained hierarchical cluster analysis
174 using changes in magnetic susceptibility (Commerford et al. 2016).

175
176 Details of the lithology, radiocarbon chronology, fire history, and geochemical proxy
177 records of Devils Lake are also described previously (Williams et al. 2015). The
178 same sediment cores were used to measure the proxies described in the current
179 manuscript. Devils Lake has a much longer record than Fox Lake, beginning at
180 17,000 cal yBP (Williams et al. 2015), and captures three types of forest: spruce,
181 pine, and hardwood (Maher 1982). The detailed pollen stratigraphy with three
182 forest types was established by Maher (1982) and a robust chronology was
183 established by Williams et al. (2015) with input from Grimm et al. (2009). The

184 changes in vegetation from coniferous to hardwood forest types are characterized
185 by changes in spruce pollen (*Picea*), pollen from hardwood trees (*Quercus* and
186 *Ulmus*) and grass pollen (Poaceae). The lithostratigraphy of Devils Lake varies
187 throughout the core, with five main units. Five zones (D1-D5) were delineated based
188 on sediment appearance, composition, and mineralogy (Williams et al., 2015).

189
190 The two study sites differ in multiple ways—they cover different time periods (one
191 starting in the Late-glacial and the other in the early Holocene), are situated in
192 different geologic terrains, and were analyzed for a different suite of sedimentary
193 proxies— but chiefly provide an important contrast in dominant vegetation type
194 and the degree of vegetation change during their respective records. To put the
195 lithologic, pollen, and sedimentological changes for each lake in context, we use the
196 stratigraphic zones previously delineated and published for each lake [Fox Lake in
197 Commerford et al. 2016 and Devils Lake in Williams et al. 2015]. The same sediment
198 cores were used to establish the stratigraphic zones and also for the new analyses
199 presented in this manuscript for both Fox Lake and Devils Lake.

200
201

202 *2.2. Micro X-ray fluorescence (μ -XRF) core scanning*

203 All sections of the Devils Lake and Fox Lake sediment cores were scanned using an
204 Itrax XRF core scanner (Cox Analytical Systems, Gothenburg, Sweden) at the
205 LacCore X-ray Fluorescence Laboratory housed at the University of Minnesota
206 Duluth Large Lakes Observatory. This instrument produces an optical RGB digital
207 image, a microradiographic digital image, and count data for most elements from
208 aluminum (atomic number 13) to uranium (92). XRF scans were performed using a
209 molybdenum tube set at 30 kV and 25 mA with a dwell time of 60 s and a step size of
210 10 μ m. The Fox Lake data were reduced by averaging to 1 cm, while the Devils Lake
211 data were averaged to 0.1 cm and then smoothed using a 10-point running mean.
212 The raw count data is expressed as counts second⁻¹ (cps).

213

214 For elements with sufficient counts, we divided the elemental counts by
215 molybdenum coherence (MoCoh) values for each measured interval to account for
216 variation among analytical time periods in the characteristics of the Mo tube. A
217 centered log ratio (clr) transformation was then performed on the MoCoh-corrected
218 μ -XRF intensities, such that $I_{clr} = \ln(I/G)$, where I is the intensity of the element
219 transformed, and G is geometric mean of all the elements analyzed at the same
220 measuring point. We analyzed a set of selected elements that had sufficient counts,
221 and that are important in ecosystem and weathering processes. Although the
222 investigated elements are found in various compounds in the sediment, they can
223 indicate three types of processes: allochthonous, biogenic, and authigenic (Lopez et
224 al. 2006). We used Ti_{clr} and K_{clr} as indicative of detrital input, Si_{clr} and Ca_{clr} as
225 indicative of detrital input, as well as biogenic silica and calcite formation
226 respectively, and Fe_{clr} , Mn_{clr} , and S_{clr} as indicative in part of detrital input, as well as
227 redox processes.

228

229 To better trace these additional processes, MoCoh standardized values were then
230 divided by Ti counts to obtain a measure of silicate weathering (K/Ti), biogenic
231 silica (Si/Ti), and authigenic mineral precipitation (Ca/Ti, Fe/Ti, Mn/Ti, and S/Ti).
232 While none of these elements should be interpreted as uniformly indicating a single
233 process, their variability as assemblages may lead to an improved understanding of
234 lake sedimentation (Martin-Puertas et al., 2017). In conjunction with other proxies,
235 elemental assemblages can be used to assess catchment inputs (both lithological
236 and organic), redox conditions, and potentially aquatic primary productivity.
237 Elemental concentrations are sometimes non-linearly correlated with XRF
238 intensities throughout sediment cores, due to matrix effects, physical properties,
239 and geometry of the sample in different sections. To avoid such effects, we resort to
240 using log-ratios of μ -XRF intensities, which are linear functions of log ratios of
241 element concentrations (Weltje and Tjallingii 2008). The log-ratio transformation
242 also helps with issues related to closed-sum data encountered in multivariate
243 statistical analyses (Martin-Puertas et al., 2017).

244

245 *2.3. Stable isotope analysis*

246 Organic carbon (C) and nitrogen (N) concentrations and standard isotopic ratios
247 ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$, $\delta^{15}\text{N}$) were measured on dried bulk sediment samples every 10 cm for the Fox
248 Lake sediment core and every 5 cm for the Devils Lake sediment cores. Analyses
249 were conducted at the Stable Isotope Mass Spectrometry Laboratory at Kansas State
250 University and the Central Appalachian Stable Isotope Facility at the University of
251 Maryland following standard procedures for sediment samples. To maximize
252 precision, in-house standards calibrated to PeeDee Belemnite ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$) and
253 atmospheric N_2 gas ($\delta^{15}\text{N}$) were used. Analytical error was better than 0.1 ‰ for
254 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and better than 0.2 ‰ for $\delta^{15}\text{N}$. C:N ratio of the bulk sediment was calculated
255 by dividing %C by %N.

256

257 *2.4. Particle size analysis*

258 Bulk sedimentary particle size was measured for Fox Lake sediments because of an
259 expectation that particle size would change during the Holocene as aridity and
260 eolian inputs changed. We did not measure particle size with this method at Devils
261 Lake because of the nature of the sedimentary material and difficulty in interpreting
262 bulk particle size in this depositional environment. Throughout the 9.3-m Fox Lake
263 sediment core, 1 mL samples were removed from every third centimeter. Each
264 sample was pretreated with 30 mL of 25% H_2O_2 at 80 °C to remove organic matter.
265 After settling overnight, excess liquid was decanted. Samples were measured using a
266 laser particle size analyzer through a wet dispersion unit (Mastersizer 3000 and
267 Hydro EV accessory; Malvern Instruments Ltd., Worcestershire, UK). The analyzer
268 outputted volume percentages for 100 size classes from 0.01 to 3500 μm . Volume
269 percentages from these size classes were summed according to USDA grain size
270 categories: clay <2 μm , silt 2-50 μm , sand 50-2000 μm , and gravel >2000 μm . While
271 most sediments are finer-grained than soils, we used the USDA classification to
272 match interpretations of particle size transport.

273

274 *2.5. Magnetic parameters and unmixing model*

275 To gain insight into sediment dynamics at Devils Lake we calculated the fluxes of
276 lithogenic (LITH), pedogenic (PED), and biogenic (BIO) magnetic minerals using the
277 method developed by Lascu et al. (2010). For this we measured anhysteretic
278 remanent magnetization (ARM), saturation magnetization (M_s), and saturation
279 remanent magnetization (M_{rs}) at the Institute for Rock Magnetism, University of
280 Minnesota. A D-Tech 2000 demagnetizer was used for the acquisition of ARM in a
281 0.1 mT direct field superimposed on an alternating frequency field decaying at a
282 rate of 5 μ T per half cycle from a peak value of 200 mT. ARM susceptibility (χ_{ARM})
283 was calculated by dividing the ARM to the direct field. Remanence measurements
284 were performed using a 2G superconducting rock magnetometer. M_s and M_{rs} were
285 obtained from slope-corrected hysteresis loops measured on a Princeton
286 Measurements vibrating sample magnetometer using a maximum applied field of 1
287 T and a step size of 5 mT.

288

289 Using the unmixing model of Lascu et al. (2010), we derived relative abundances
290 and fluxes of three magnetic components in the sediments from the magnetic
291 measurements. The BIO, PED, and LITH components were determined to be the end
292 members in the unmixing model, based on their distinct values for the ratios of
293 M_{rs}/M_s and χ_{ARM}/M_{rs} . (respectively 0.5 and 1.5 mm/A for BIO; 0.2 and 0.01 mm/A
294 for PED; 0.05 and 0.01 mm/A for LITH). The BIO end member represents a
295 population of grains with narrow size range (30-80 nm) produced in the lake by
296 magnetotactic bacteria, via controlled biomineralization of magnetite, a process that
297 entails alignment of the nanocrystals in chains. After the death of the bacteria, these
298 particles are preserved in the sediment as magnetofossils (either as linear or
299 partially collapsed chains), and provide information about the physical and
300 geochemical conditions in the lake. The PED end member originates in the
301 catchment soils, as the result of magnetic enhancement either through abiotic
302 precipitation, or induced biomineralization by dissimilatory iron-reducing bacteria.
303 The pedogenic ensemble comprises clustered grains of magnetite ranging in size
304 from a few nm to 1-2 μ m, and are transported to the lake by surface runoff. The
305 LITH end member is representative of magnetic particles in the silt grain size range.
306 The source of these larger particles is in the bedrock, and transport to the lake is
307 accomplished by streams and/or overland flow. Fluxes of each end member were
308 calculated as magnetite ($M_s = 92 \text{ Am}^2/\text{kg}$) by multiplying the relative abundance by
309 the fraction of dry sediment, gamma density from core logging, and sediment
310 accumulation rate from the age model (Lascu et al. 2010). We did not measure
311 magnetic properties of Fox Lake sediments with this method because of differences
312 in parent material and associated uncertainties in interpretation of magnetic data.

313

314 *2.6. Multivariate statistics*

315 To investigate if the terrestrial biosphere determined the trajectory of elemental
316 change, principal component analyses were performed on the eight elemental
317 counts derived from XRF, as well as additional variables capturing different aspects
318 of ecosystem history for Fox Lake and for Devils Lake. There were a total of 21 input

319 variables for Devils Lake (Table 1) and 17 variables for Fox Lake (Table 2). The
320 number of variables differed between the sites due to: (1) differences between
321 magnetic and particle size parameters measured on the sediments of each lake, and
322 (2) differences in the number of pollen variables required to summarize vegetation
323 change between the grassland and forested sites. All variables for Fox Lake were
324 measured on the 2012 core, and all variables for Devils Lake except for pollen were
325 measured on the 2012 core. Pollen data were correlated to the 2012 core using the
326 age model of Grimm et al. (2009) and the age model of Williams et al. (2015). The
327 analyses were performed on the correlations because the units differed among the
328 input variables, and data were statistically resampled to the lowest resolution by
329 depth for all variables (every 5 cm for Devils Lake and every 10 cm for Fox Lake).
330 Principal components were rotated to strengthen contrasts.

331

332 **3. Results**

333 *3.1. Sediment sources*

334 The source material analysis at the forested site (Devils Lake) is based on the
335 magnetic end member fluxes from the unmixing model, and the C:N ratio (Fig. 2).
336 The non-biogenic magnetic material input changed over time, with gradual declines
337 in fluxes of both LITH and PED toward present, except for an increase in both
338 components between ~5,000 and 3,000 cal yBP. PED fluxes also increased between
339 ~9,000 and ~7,000 cal yBP. Magnetofossil flux (BIO) was relatively constant for
340 most of the record, except in the sediments deposited during the past several
341 centuries, when the flux increased by an order of magnitude. The source of the
342 organic matter seems to be aquatic, as evidenced by C:N values that rarely exceeded
343 10, the ratio found in aquatic microbes and algae.

344

345 Source material variability during the course of system development at the
346 grassland site (Fox Lake) was evaluated via sediment grain size analyses and the
347 C:N ratio (Fig. 3). Throughout the record, the flux of silt was dominant, with sand
348 being secondary in importance. Comparatively, only very small amounts of clay
349 were delivered to the sediments for most of the record. Two important shifts should
350 be highlighted: (1) a striking increase in influx of sand-sized particles during the
351 mid-Holocene around 5500 cal yBP (zone F3), and (2) an increase in clay and silt
352 influx starting at 1,500 cal yBP (zone F1). The C:N ratio in Fox Lake was almost
353 exclusively >10, indicating that the organic matter was mainly sourced within the
354 catchment. The steady decline of C:N values throughout the Holocene suggests
355 either decreasing terrestrial plant inputs, or an increase in relative abundance of
356 algae and aquatic bacteria (Fig. 3).

357

358 *3.2. Sediment geochemistry*

359 To study the sequence of ecosystem processes at each site, we examined temporal
360 patterns of XRF-derived relative elemental abundance. At the forested site Ti_{clr} , K_{clr} ,
361 Si_{clr} , and Ca_{clr} were highest in zone D5, then declined during the Late Glacial,
362 followed by relatively constant values throughout the Holocene, until ~500 cal yBP
363 (Fig. 4a). Fe_{clr} , and Mn_{clr} reached maxima in zone D4, before decreasing throughout
364 the record starting with the Younger Dryas (ca. 12, 750 cal yBP) (Hughen et al.

365 2000). Ti_{clr} , K_{clr} , Si_{clr} , Ca_{clr} , and Fe_{clr} reached their Holocene maxima during the first
366 part of the Holocene hypsithermal, between ca. 9,500 and 7,000 cal yBP (Dean et al.
367 1997). S_{clr} experienced a steady increase throughout the record. Element
368 abundances increased in the last few centuries of the record (zone D1). Log ratios of
369 Ti-normalized elemental counts are shown in Fig. 4b. $\ln(K/Ti)$ and $\ln(Si/Ti)$
370 demonstrated a pattern of decline toward present, with $\ln(K/Ti)$ exhibiting a
371 stronger gradient across the Pleistocene-Holocene transition. $\ln(Ca/Ti)$ values were
372 variable but high in zones D5 and D4, then underwent a sharp transition at ~12,750
373 cal yBP, followed by a decrease until 8,000 cal yBP. A local maximum between 8,000
374 and 7,000 cal yBP is followed by relatively constant values for the rest of the record.
375 $\ln(Fe/Ti)$ and $\ln(Mn/Ti)$ displayed increasing values until ~9,000 cal yBP, with
376 local maxima in zones D5 (for Mn) and D4 (for Fe and Mn). Both $\ln(Fe/Ti)$ and
377 $\ln(Mn/Ti)$ displayed pronounced maxima occurred during the Early Holocene
378 (~11,500-9,000 cal yBP). $\ln(S/Ti)$ showed an oscillatory pattern but increased over
379 time toward present

380

381 Relative elemental abundances in sediments from the grassland site demonstrated a
382 similar pattern to those from the forested site during the Holocene. All seven
383 selected elements demonstrated a long-term decline in abundance from the
384 beginning of the record to present (Fig. 5). This was not a monotonic decline,
385 however. During the early portion of the record (from 9,200 to ~8,500 cal yBP, zone
386 F5), when Fox Lake was surrounded by oak woodland, abundances initially
387 increased, with all elements, except for S_{clr} , exhibiting the highest values in the
388 record at the transition to grassland (ca. 8,500 cal yBP). Other notable peaks
389 occurred in zone F4 (Ca_{clr} , S_{clr}) and around 4,000 cal yBP (Ti_{clr} , K_{clr} , Si_{clr} , Ca_{clr} , Fe_{clr} ,
390 S_{clr}). Log ratios of Ti-normalized counts again revealed different patterns from the
391 absolute counts, with $\ln(K/Ti)$ and $\ln(Si/Ti)$ declining, $\ln(Mn/Ti)$ and $\ln(Fe/Ti)$
392 increasing, and $\ln(S/Ti)$ and $\ln(Ca/Ti)$ exhibiting variable behavior, with mid-
393 Holocene maxima.

394

395 Temporal changes in source material and geochemical structure of sediments can be
396 analyzed with relationships among selected elements. At the forested site, there
397 were positive correlations between Si_{clr} and K_{clr} ($r=0.91$), K_{clr} and Fe_{clr} ($r=0.66$),
398 Mn_{clr} and Fe_{clr} ($r=0.77$), and Ca_{clr} and Sr_{clr} ($r=0.76$), although the correlation strength
399 varied with time (Fig. 6). Slope changes, such as the ones observed in the K_{clr} - Fe_{clr} or
400 Ca_{clr} - Sr_{clr} biplots, indicate temporal variability in geochemical processes.

401 Relationships among elemental counts at the grassland site showed similar positive
402 correlations (Fig. 7), which were very strong throughout the entire record for Si_{clr}
403 and K_{clr} ($r=0.97$), and K_{clr} and Fe_{clr} ($r=0.96$). These two relationships were linear
404 with very little scatter, suggesting similar source material or processes throughout
405 the history of sediment deposition. For Mn_{clr} and Fe_{clr} , and for Ca_{clr} and Sr_{clr} the
406 correlation was still strong ($r=0.85$, and 0.81 respectively), but exhibiting more
407 scatter.

408

409 *3.3. Principal component analyses*

410 At the forested site (Fig. 8), the first principal component, explaining 47.7% of the
411 variability in the dataset, followed the stratigraphic trend that showed a major
412 transition from minerogenic to organic-rich sediments after 13,000 cal yBP (D4-D3
413 transition). Samples with high values of elemental counts, LITH and PED fluxes, and
414 *Picea* pollen loaded positively on the first principal component, while samples with
415 high values of $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, C and N concentrations, and *Quercus* pollen loaded negatively on
416 the first principal component. The second principal component, explaining 16.1% of
417 the variability, separated samples high in *Ulmus* pollen, charcoal and $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ from
418 samples high in Poaceae pollen and S concentration.

419
420 At the grassland site (Fig. 9), the first principal component, explaining 34.8% of the
421 variability in the dataset, displayed periods of little change (e.g., in zone F4),
422 continual decrease (e.g., in zone F3) and continual increase (e.g., in zone F2).
423 Samples with high values of elemental counts loaded positively on the first principal
424 component, and samples with high values of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ and sand loaded negatively on the
425 first principal component. The second principal component, explaining 24.3% of the
426 variability, separated samples high in arboreal pollen types and C and N
427 concentrations from samples with high magnetic susceptibility, Mn concentrations,
428 and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values.

430 **4. Discussion**

431 *4.1. How did source material change over time?*

432 Source materials at both sites changed as evidenced in the sedimentary sequences.
433 At Fox Lake, progressively lower values of C:N reflect gradually declining
434 terrigenous organic inputs and a shift to a predominance of aquatic algal and
435 bacterial organic matter. A similar pattern was observed at Deming Lake, 425 km to
436 the north of Fox Lake (Fig. 1), with reduced fluxes of both terrestrial organic
437 material and total sediment deposition over the entire 9,500 year sequence
438 (McLauchlan et al. 2013). The mineral matter flux at Fox Lake increased over time,
439 with the proportion of sand gradually decreasing (except for a transient increase
440 between 5,500 and 4,000 cal yBP) in favor of silt and clay, especially for the last
441 1,500 years.

442
443 At Devils Lake, mineral sediment sources shifted from inputs from bedrock sources,
444 as indicated by the pre-Holocene predominance of lithogenic magnetic particles, to
445 catchment soils- and lake-derived material, reflected by increasing amounts of
446 pedogenic and biogenic magnetic particles toward present. A noted exception was
447 the increase of both PED and LITH fluxes during the mid Holocene, a warm and dry
448 interval. Several sedimentary records in the region indicate increased eolian influx
449 during this time, such as increased quartz inputs at Elk Lake, Minnesota (Dean
450 1997). Small inputs of calcareous loess have been noted at Devils Lake during the
451 mid-Holocene from sources to the west (Grimm et al. 2009). While this would be
452 barely detectable in XRF data as elevated Ca levels, magnetic parameters provide
453 more detail about eolian inputs depending on the size of the wind-blown particles. If
454 they are in the very fine silt size range (2-4 μm), they contribute to the PED

455 component, whereas if they are larger they contribute to LITH fluxes. Abrupt
456 increases in sand influx beginning at 5500 cal yBP at Fox Lake reflected the
457 proximity to dune fields to the south that mobilized around the same time during
458 increased aridity (Miao et al. 2006).

460 *4.2. What were the nutrient patterns during Holocene ecosystem development?*

461 While different lengths of time are represented in the records presented here—
462 9200 years for Fox Lake and 17,000 years for Devils Lake— the similarity in
463 geochemical patterns indicates that the sequence of processes may be the same
464 across sites although the rate of these processes may vary. Temporal patterns of
465 accumulation of nutrients in the sediments, especially nitrogen and base cations,
466 during Holocene ecosystem development indicate striking secular trends. One of the
467 strongest patterns in these records is the slow decline in elemental abundances
468 toward present, reflecting some kind of ontogenetic process or combination of
469 processes. This is especially interesting given the different lithologic settings of
470 these two sites, and the relatively heterogeneous nature of glacial till present on
471 both sites. Lakes in pure bedrock settings, especially basalt and granite with well-
472 established weathering pathways, may demonstrate even clearer signals of
473 geochemical change over time (Sperber et al. 2017, Burghilea et al. 2018)

474
475 Similar patterns—declines in concentrations of easily-weathered elements such as
476 Ca and Sr—have been documented in late-Pleistocene and Holocene sedimentary
477 records in the Alps (Koinig et al. 2003, Schmidt et al. 2006) and the southern Urals
478 (Maslennikova et al. 2016). Clear signals of N accumulation as seen in
479 chronosequences (Engstrom et al. 2000, Wardle et al. 2004) and some lake
480 sedimentary sequences (Hu et al. 2001, McLauchlan et al. 2013) are also seen at Fox
481 Lake in sedimentary $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ (Fig. 3). An increase in $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ values at the beginning of the
482 sedimentary record was not as clear at Devils Lake, possibly due to climatic control
483 of N fluxes to the basin during ice sheet retreat and very early landscape evolution
484 (Williams et al., 2015). It is possible that additional factors confound interpretation
485 of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ values as indicating early successional processes, however.

486
487 The relationships between elements show dominantly, but not entirely, abiotic
488 control of elemental ratios. At Fox Lake, K_{clr} and Ca_{clr} both decline from 8,000 years
489 ago toward present, a time period when grassland vegetation stayed relatively
490 constant (Fig. 5). Si, K, Ti, and Ca abundances in Devils Lake show similar decreasing
491 trends over the first 7,000 years of the record. In the bedrock present at this site, K
492 and Ca are found in extremely low concentrations as the Baraboo quartzite is both
493 chemically and physically mature (Medaris et al., 2003). The quartzite and the
494 claystone and siltstone layers interspersed within the quartzite are composed of Si,
495 Ti, Al, and Fe (Medaris et al., 2003). Early inputs of K and Ca to Devils Lake may have
496 been either from unstable, sparsely vegetated local catchment sources deposited by
497 the retreating glacier, which have subsequently been eroded or chemically
498 weathered, or increased eolian deposition due to drier conditions. Maximum K and
499 Ca abundances in Devils Lake between 9,500 and 7,000 cal yBP are more difficult to

500 interpret, as they occur in the middle of zone D3 when vegetation composition is
501 fairly stable. Subsequent stabilization of the catchment has reduced clastic input in
502 the lake and abundances of Ca and K have leveled off after 7,000 cal yBP.
503

504 In Devils Lake zone D4, $\ln(\text{Ca}/\text{Ti})$ increased, in contrast to $\ln(\text{K}/\text{Ti})$ and $\ln(\text{Si}/\text{Ti})$,
505 which coincided with peaks in $\ln(\text{Mn}/\text{Ti})$, $\ln(\text{Fe}/\text{Ti})$, and $\ln(\text{S}/\text{Ti})$. These patterns in
506 ratios could be related to a shift to endogenic mineral precipitation, likely due to a
507 change in the redox state of the lake waters in response to climate change during the
508 Late Glacial interstadial. During this time period dark, banded microbial sediments
509 were accumulating in deep, stratified lake waters characterized by bottom anoxia
510 (Williams et al., 2015). $\ln(\text{Ca}/\text{Ti})$ decreased suddenly with abrupt cooling at the
511 onset of the Younger Dryas. Throughout the record, the decline in $\ln(\text{Si}/\text{Ti})$ lagged
512 behind $\ln(\text{K}/\text{Ti})$, which in turn lagged behind the decline in $\ln(\text{Ca}/\text{Ti})$, as Ca is more
513 easily mobilized than K during chemical weathering, and Si is the least prone to be
514 dissolved (Nesbitt et al. 1996). $\ln(\text{Si}/\text{Ti})$ was high at the beginning of the record and
515 decreased afterward, suggesting that initial inputs of lithogenic silica from the
516 catchment during glacial retreat were extremely high. As the catchment stabilized,
517 physical weathering decreased and detrital input decreased. Peaks in $\ln(\text{Si}/\text{Ti})$ at
518 $\sim 9,500$ cal yBP and to a lesser extent at $\sim 6,500$ cal yBP, may suggest increased
519 contributions from biogenic silica at those times. Despite the appearance of diatoms
520 and corresponding in-lake productivity around 7,500 cal yBP, biogenic silica inputs
521 were not as large as the previous high input of detrital silica.
522

523 Fe is correlated to both K and Ti throughout the record at both sites, suggesting that
524 Fe in the lake sediments is mainly detrital. However, there are time periods
525 characterized by weaker correlation between Fe and K, and Fe and Ti, especially at
526 the forested site. This points to a more important contribution from authigenic iron-
527 bearing minerals, meaning Fe entered the lake in dissolved form through
528 groundwater and precipitated as iron oxides and/or hydroxides. High $\ln(\text{Fe}/\text{Ti})$ and
529 $\ln(\text{Mn}/\text{Ti})$, along with abundant vivianite and pyrite in zone D4 (visually identified
530 using petrography), suggest reducing conditions during the Late Glacial interstadial
531 (Williams et al., 2015). At the grassland site, the S trend correlates with those of the
532 other elements, suggesting an origin from sulfates in the calcareous tills from the
533 catchment (Gorham et al., 1983). At the forested site, S has an opposite trend to the
534 other elements, suggesting it is associated with organic matter, which increases
535 steadily throughout the record (Williams et al., 2015).
536

537 The Ca-Sr relationship provides additional information about the source material.
538 Concentrations of Ca and Sr in the Baraboo quartzite are extremely low (Medaris et
539 al., 2003), while the till around Fox Lake is calcareous (Commerford et al., 2016). Sr
540 often substitutes for Ca in calcium-bearing minerals and is equally mobile during
541 chemical weathering. At Fox Lake, $\ln(\text{Ca}/\text{Sr})$ is higher during the oak woodland
542 phase prior to 8,200 cal yBP and lower during the grassland phase after 8,200 cal
543 yBP. At Devils Lake, $\ln(\text{Ca}/\text{Sr})$ is high prior to 12,800 cal yBP and low and relatively
544 constant from 12,800 cal yBP to present (Fig. 6). Strong correlation between Ca and
545 Sr indicates a single source for both elements, while a weaker correlation suggests

546 separate provenance, e.g., Ca from an endogenic source and Sr from a lithogenic
547 source.

548

549 Climate conditions—hydrologic changes in the catchment, lake level, and
550 evaporation— were considered in other studies to strongly influence elemental
551 concentrations of same seven elements that we studied here (Martin-Puertas et al.
552 2011, Heymann et al. 2013). Lithological composition and mineralogy (quartz
553 silicates, clay silicates, calcite, coarse particles) have also been considered the
554 dominant factor in determining sedimentary elemental concentrations (Koinig et al.
555 2003). Declines in elemental concentration could be simply reflecting depletion of
556 mobile elements such as Ca and K from source material in the catchment (Minyuk et
557 al. 2014). In addition to simple first order hydrologic dissolution, there could be a
558 change in the pace of chemical or physical weathering, or changes in transport
559 pathways similar to those observed in Glacier Bay, Alaska during ecosystem
560 development (Milner et al. 2007). Recently, a unified “erosion signal” has been
561 identified in alpine lake sediments characterized by changes in elemental
562 concentrations (Arnaud et al. 2016). In lacustrine settings, Ti is considered a metric
563 of detrital input, so a decline in Ti concentration as observed at both sites in this
564 study likely indicates a gradual decline in detrital input. Finally, there could be
565 further influences through the mechanism by which elements are precipitated in
566 sediments and diagenetic alteration.

567

568 *4.3. Biosphere-lithosphere interactions: Did vegetation determine the trajectory of*
569 *elemental change at each site?*

570 After initial establishment of vegetation at each site, comparisons of vegetation and
571 geochemical change between sites indicate a limited role of vegetation change in
572 influencing geochemical parameters at each site. This generally agrees with other
573 studies that attribute changes in element concentrations in sediment cores to
574 climate-driven changes in weathering and transport processes. An alternative
575 possibility is sediment geochemical change should be attributed to climate-driven
576 vegetation change and subsequent changes in biogeochemical cycling (Martin-
577 Puertas et al., 2017). In our study, at both the grassland site and the forested site,
578 the first principal component separated samples with high elemental abundances
579 from those with high organic matter concentration. At the forested site, high *Picea*
580 pollen loaded positively on the first axis with the elemental counts, and *Quercus*
581 pollen loaded with organic matter, but this is difficult to interpret purely as a
582 vegetation signal due to a simultaneously warming climate. Thus, there was some
583 correlation of elemental change and forest composition (either hardwood or
584 coniferous forest), but there was also concurrent climate change occurring over the
585 intervals with changes in forest composition.

586

587 The other vegetation transitions later in the Holocene at the forested site (involving
588 *Ulmus*) are only correlated with $\delta^{15}\text{N}$, which indicates strong links between
589 vegetation and N cycling throughout the record. Arboreal pollen at Fox Lake and
590 Poaceae (non-arboreal pollen) at Devils Lake loaded in the opposite direction from
591 the N cycling proxy $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ at both sites. Early Holocene vegetation reorganization and

592 development of the lake catchment played dominant roles in sediment deposition at
593 Lake Meerfelder Maar, Germany (Martin-Puertas et al., 2017). Interactions among
594 vegetation types were important during the transition from glacial to interglacial
595 conditions at the Gerzensee site in Switzerland (Ammann et al. 2013), but this may
596 be a due to the relatively large magnitude of vegetation change as indicated in pollen
597 assemblages.

598
599 The degree of vegetation change in this study, while notable at each site, is not as
600 large as those demonstrated to causes geochemical changes in other sequences
601 between glacial and interglacial conditions. In particular, differences in primary
602 productivity during stadial-interstadial cycles caused changes in weathering rates at
603 Les Échets, France (Kylander et al. 2011) and Lake El'gygytgyn, Russia (Minyuk et al.
604 2014). The onset of aquatic productivity and organic matter deposition was
605 certainly important at Devils Lake, resulting in anoxic conditions and notable black
606 bands dominated by amorphous aquatic organic material in the sediments
607 (Williams et al., 2015). However, while the rate of declining elemental
608 concentrations was altered significantly by this one transition from glacial to
609 interglacial conditions, the direction of the trajectory was the same across the
610 transition, indicating a more complex set of processes in addition to plant
611 colonization of a bare landscape. In early succession on recently deglaciated terrain,
612 the timing of establishment of certain plant functional types such as N₂ fixers and
613 coniferous trees can have significant effects on accretion of soil C and N, and erosion
614 rates (Crocker and Major 1955, Fastie 1995). At Devils Lake, the transition from
615 coniferous to deciduous forest in Zone D3 certainly affected fire regime, but not the
616 geochemistry based on the Ti-normalized element concentrations. Finally,
617 geochemical sedimentary records may be able to add detail to the classic view that
618 the relative importance of autogenic and allogenic processes changes over
619 successional time (Matthews, 1992).

620
621 Another way to assess the role of the terrestrial biosphere is to compare the
622 trajectories between the two sites. The similarities in the sequence of geochemical
623 changes between the forest and the grassland site provide further support for a
624 limited role of vegetation type. Comparisons of absolute rates of change are
625 complicated by different elemental counts between sites, but, for example, declines
626 in $\ln(K/Ti)$ and $\ln(Ca/Ti)$ seem to be faster at the forested site than at the grassland
627 site. However, differences in lithology, topography, and basin size could be more
628 important than vegetation differences between grassland and forest. In particular,
629 Fox Lake is larger and shallower, with calcareous glacial till as parent material and
630 significant agricultural land use in the watershed. Devils Lake is deeper, with non-
631 calcareous glacial till and Precambrian quartzite as parent material and a protected
632 watershed within a state park. As an alternative hypothesis, it is possible that
633 climate change was directly influencing geochemistry through catchment
634 weathering and hydrologic transport of material into the lake basin. Further
635 estimates of weathering rates, catchment destabilization due to aridity, or
636 hydrologic fluxes over Holocene timescales would help test these hypotheses.
637

638 **Conclusions**

639 To assess rates, patterns, and mechanisms of ecosystem development after glacial
640 retreat, we compared two sedimentary sequences in the upper Midwestern U.S., one
641 from a grassland site and a forested site. We found that source material changed
642 over the Holocene sedimentary sequences. We also found that the patterns of
643 nutrients, especially limiting nutrients such as nitrogen, potassium, calcium, and
644 magnesium, changed over the Holocene sedimentary sequences. It seems that once
645 vegetation was established, there was minimal influence of vegetation composition
646 on inorganic sediment properties thereafter. At the forested site, transitions among
647 vegetation from *Picea* to *Pinus* to deciduous hardwood led to changes in fire regime
648 and nutrient cycling but not inorganic element abundances. At the grassland site,
649 the transition from oak forest to grassland affected primarily delivery of organic
650 material to the catchment. There is future potential to interpret sedimentary
651 elemental concentrations in light of ecological processes. Two aspects are likely to
652 make these successful: (1) comparing several sites with different vegetation
653 histories, and (2) measuring many proxies to help provide independent estimates of
654 multiple processes influencing sediment records.

655

656 **Acknowledgments**

657 We thank J. Mueller, S. McConaghy, J. Commerford, A. Myrbo, K. Brady, A. Lingwall, T.
658 Ocheltree, R. Paulman, and R. Keen for field and laboratory assistance. J. L. Morris
659 provided helpful discussion about the Fox Lake XRF data. We thank Catherine Yansa
660 and an anonymous reviewer for comments that greatly improved the manuscript.
661 Financial support was provided by National Science Foundation BCS-0955225 to
662 K.M. and a Kansas State University College of Arts and Sciences Undergraduate
663 Scholarship to R.S. Support for I.L. was provided through ERC grant 320750 under
664 the European Union's Seventh Framework Programme (FP/2007-2013)

665

666 **Author contributions**

667 KM managed the project and led manuscript preparation. IL led data analysis and
668 figure conception. IL, EM, and KM led data interpretation. All authors generated
669 primary data from Fox Lake and/or Devils Lake sediment cores, and all authors
670 discussed results and contributed to manuscript preparation.

671

672

673 **Table 1.** Proxy variables for various ecosystem processes, measured on sediment
 674 cores from the grassland and forested lakes and presented in this manuscript.
 675 Original sources for some of the proxy variables shown in this manuscript are also
 676 reported here.
 677

	Fox Lake (grassland site)	Devils Lake (forested site)
charcoal concentrations	Commerford et al. 2015	Williams et al. 2015
pollen concentrations	Commerford et al. 2015	Maher 1982
elemental concentrations (XRF)	this manuscript	this manuscript
% C, % N, $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, $\delta^{15}\text{N}$	this manuscript	Williams et al. 2015
magnetic parameters to estimate particle size		this manuscript
laser-based particle size analysis	this manuscript	

678
 679
 680

681
682
683
684
685
686

Table 2. The 21 input variables for the principal component analysis of the Devils Lake sediment core, and eigenvectors for each variable on the first two principal components.

	Principal component 1	Principal component 2
charcoal count	0.17	0.63
Ca	0.92	-0.24
Sr	0.62	-0.50
K	0.91	-0.22
Fe	0.67	0.12
Mn	0.85	0.16
Si	0.87	0.07
S	-0.15	-0.56
Ti	0.76	-0.35
$\delta^{15}\text{N}$	0.13	0.86
N (%)	-0.89	-0.23
$\delta^{13}\text{C}$	-0.73	-0.31
C (%)	-0.90	-0.07
Flux LITH ($\mu\text{g cm}^{-2} \text{yr}^{-1}$)	0.77	-0.24
Flux PED ($\mu\text{g cm}^{-2} \text{yr}^{-1}$)	0.69	-0.23
Flux BIO ($\mu\text{g cm}^{-2} \text{yr}^{-1}$)	0.11	-0.18
Flux total ferrimagnetic ($\mu\text{g cm}^{-2} \text{yr}^{-1}$)	0.78	-0.25
<i>Picea</i>	0.87	-0.18
<i>Quercus</i>	-0.83	-0.32
<i>Ulmus</i>	-0.13	0.78
Poaceae	0.33	-0.54

687
688

689 **Table 3.** The 17 input variables for the principal component analysis of the Fox Lake
 690 sediment core, and eigenvectors for each variable on the first two principal
 691 components.
 692

	Principal Component 1	Principal Component 2
Magnetic susceptibility (SI)	0.06	0.83
Arboreal pollen (%)	0.17	-0.57
flux clay (mg cm ⁻² yr ⁻¹)	0.37	-0.34
flux sand (mg cm ⁻² yr ⁻¹)	-0.15	-0.17
δ ¹⁵ N	-0.40	-0.05
N (%)	0.40	-0.78
δ ¹³ C	-0.40	0.82
C (%)	0.30	-0.76
Ca	0.85	-0.13
Sr	0.88	-0.16
K	0.93	-0.20
Fe	0.78	-0.30
Mn	0.49	0.70
Si	0.88	-0.24
S	0.65	-0.50
Ti	0.85	-0.24
charcoal count	0.15	-0.29

693
 694
 695
 696

697 **Figure captions**

698

699 Figure 1. a) Regional map with locations of Fox Lake, Devils Lake, and the other sites
700 referred to in text (Deming Lake, Elk Lake). b) Detail of Fox Lake basin morphology
701 and vegetation. c) Detail of Devils Lake basin morphology and vegetation. Red dots
702 represent coring sites.

703

704 Figure 2. Source material of sediments at the forested site (Devils Lake, Wisconsin):
705 fluxes of biogenic (BIO), pedogenic (PED), and lithogenic (LITH) ferrimagnetic
706 material calculated from measured magnetic parameters, N and C isotopic
707 composition, and C:N ratio of organic material, and relative abundances of main
708 pollen types. Zones (D1-D5) were based on lithologic transitions in the sediment
709 core identified by Williams et al. (2015)

710

711 Figure 3. Source material of sediments at the grassland site (Fox Lake, Minnesota):
712 fluxes of clay, silt, and sand, N and C isotopic composition, and the C:N ratio of
713 organic material, and relative abundance of arboreal pollen. Zones (F1-F5) were
714 based on magnetic susceptibility transitions in the sediment core identified by
715 Commerford et al. (2016).

716

717 Figure 4. Centered-log ratios of selected elements (a) and log ratios of element
718 intensities with respect to the intensity of Ti (b) for sediments from the forested site
719 (Devils Lake, Wisconsin).

720

721 Figure 5. Centered-log ratios of selected elements (a) and log ratios of element
722 intensities with respect to the intensity of Ti (b) for sediments from the grassland
723 site (Fox Lake, Minnesota).

724

725 Figure 6. Cross plots of selected element abundances from the sedimentary
726 sequence at the forested site (Devils Lake, Wisconsin) color coded by time.

727

728 Figure 7. Cross plots of selected element abundances from the sedimentary
729 sequence at the grassland site (Fox Lake, Minnesota) color coded by time.

730

731 Figure 8. Principal components analysis of 21 variables measured on a sediment
732 core spanning the entire sequence of ecosystem development following deglaciation
733 ~17,000 years ago from Devils Lake, Wisconsin. a) Time series of principal
734 components 1 and 2; b) Score plot of principal components 1 and 2: circles
735 represent data points and diamonds represent eigenvectors for each of the
736 variables.

737

738 Figure 9. Principal components analysis of 17 variables measured on a sediment
739 core spanning 9200 years of ecosystem development following deglaciation from
740 Fox Lake, Minnesota. a) Time series of principal components 1 and 2; b) Score plot
741 of principal components 1 and 2: circles represent data points and diamonds
742 represent eigenvectors for each of the variables.

743 **References**

- 744 Ammann, B., U. J. van Raden, J. Schwander, U. Eicher, A. Gilli, S. M. Bernasconi, J. F. N.
745 van Leeuwen, H. Lischke, S. J. Brooks, O. Heiri, K. Novakova, M. van
746 Hardenbroek, U. von Grafenstein, S. Belmecheri, W. O. van der Knaap, M.
747 Magny, W. Eugster, D. Colombaroli, E. Nielsen, W. Tinner, and H. E. Wright.
748 2013. Responses to rapid warming at Termination 1 a at Gerzensee (Central
749 Europe): Primary succession, albedo, soils, lake development, and ecological
750 interactions. *Palaeogeography Palaeoclimatology Palaeoecology* **391**:111-
751 131.
- 752 Arnaud, F., J. Poulencard, C. Giguët-Covex, B. Wilhelm, S. Revillon, J. P. Jenny, M. Revel,
753 D. Enters, M. Bajard, L. Fouinat, E. Doyen, A. Simonneau, C. Pignol, E. Chapron,
754 B. Vanniere, and P. Sabatier. 2016. Erosion under climate and human
755 pressures: An alpine lake sediment perspective. *Quaternary Science Reviews*
756 **152**:1-18.
- 757 Attig, J. W., P. R. Hanson, J. E. Rawling, A. R. Young, and E. C. Carson. 2011. Optical
758 ages indicate the southwestern margin of the Green Bay Lobe in Wisconsin,
759 USA, was at its maximum extent until about 18,500 years ago.
760 *Geomorphology* **130**:384-390.
- 761 Boyle, J. F. 2007. Loss of apatite caused irreversible early-Holocene lake
762 acidification. *Holocene* **17**:543-547.
- 763 Buma, B., S. Bisbing, J. Krapek, and G. Wright. 2017. A foundation of ecology
764 rediscovered: 100years of succession on the William S. Cooper plots in
765 Glacier Bay, Alaska. *Ecology* **98**:1513-1523.
- 766 Burghilea, C. I., K. Dontsova, D. G. Zaharescu, R. M. Maier, T. Huxman, M. K. Amistadi,
767 E. Hunt, and J. Chorover. 2018. Trace element mobilization during incipient
768 bioweathering of four rock types. *Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta* **234**:98-
769 114.
- 770 Colombaroli, D., and D. G. Gavin. 2010. Highly episodic fire and erosion regime over
771 the past 2,000 y in the Siskiyou Mountains, Oregon. *Proceedings of the*
772 *National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* **107**:18909-
773 18914.
- 774 Commerford, J. L., B. Leys, J. R. Mueller, and K. K. McLauchlan. 2016. Great Plains
775 vegetation dynamics in response to fire and climatic fluctuations during the
776 Holocene at Fox Lake, Minnesota (U.S.A.). *Holocene* **26**:302-313.
- 777 Crocker, R. L., and J. Major. 1955. Soil development in relation to vegetation and
778 surface age at Glacier Bay, Alaska. *Journal of Ecology* **43**:427-448.
- 779 Cutler, N. A., L. R. Belyea, and A. J. Dugmore. 2008. The spatiotemporal dynamics of a
780 primary succession. *Journal of Ecology* **96**:231-246.
- 781 Dean, W. E. 1997. Rates, timing, and cyclicity of Holocene eolian activity in north-
782 central United States: Evidence from varved lake sediments. *Geology* **25**:331-
783 334.
- 784 Engstrom, D. R., S. C. Fritz, J. E. Almendinger, and S. Juggins. 2000. Chemical and
785 biological trends during lake evolution in recently deglaciated terrain. *Nature*
786 **408**:161-166.

- 787 Engstrom, D. R., and B. C. S. Hansen. 1985. Postglacial vegetational change and soil
788 development in southeastern Labrador as inferred from pollen and chemical
789 stratigraphy. *Canadian Journal of Botany* **63**:543-561.
- 790 Fastie, C. L. 1995. Causes and ecosystem consequences of multiple pathways of
791 primary succession at Glacier Bay, Alaska. *Ecology* **76**:1899-1916.
- 792 Ford, M. S. 1990. A 10,000 year history of natural ecosystem acidification. *Ecological*
793 *Monographs* **60**:57- 89.
- 794 Gorham, E., W. E. Dean, and J. E. Sanger. 1983. The chemical composition of lakes in
795 the North-Central United-States. *Limnology and Oceanography* **28**:287-301.
- 796 Grimm, E. C., L. J. Maher, and D. M. Nelson. 2009. The magnitude of error in
797 conventional bulk-sediment radiocarbon dates from central North America.
798 *Quaternary Research* **72**:301-308.
- 799 Heymann, C., O. Nelle, W. Dorfler, H. Zagana, N. Nowaczyk, J. B. Xue, and I. Unkel.
800 2013. Late Glacial to mid-Holocene palaeoclimate development of Southern
801 Greece inferred from the sediment sequence of Lake Stymphalia (NE-
802 Peloponnese). *Quaternary International* **302**:42-60.
- 803 Hu, F. S., B. P. Finney, and L. B. Brubaker. 2001. Effects of Holocene *Alnus* expansion
804 on aquatic productivity, nitrogen cycling, and soil development in
805 southwestern Alaska. *Ecosystems* **4**:358-368.
- 806 Koinig, K. A., W. Shotyk, A. F. Lotter, C. Ohlendorf, and M. Sturm. 2003. 9000 years of
807 geochemical evolution of lithogenic major and trace elements in the sediment
808 of an alpine lake - the role of climate, vegetation, and land-use history.
809 *Journal of Paleolimnology* **30**:307-320.
- 810 Kuchler, A. W. 1964. Potential natural vegetation of the conterminous United States.
811 Pages 89-92 *The national atlas of the United States of America*. U.S.
812 Geological Survey, Washington, DC.
- 813 Kylander, M. E., L. Ampel, B. Wohlfarth, and D. Veres. 2011. High-resolution X-ray
814 fluorescence core scanning analysis of Les Echets (France) sedimentary
815 sequence: new insights from chemical proxies. *Journal of Quaternary Science*
816 **26**:109-117.
- 817 Lascu, I., S. K. Banerjee, and T. S. Berquo. 2010. Quantifying the concentration of
818 ferrimagnetic particles in sediments using rock magnetic methods.
819 *Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems* **11**:22.
- 820 Lopez, P., E. Navarro, R. Marce, J. Ordoñez, L. Caputo, and J. Armengol. 2006.
821 Elemental ratios in sediments as indicators of ecological processes in Spanish
822 reservoirs. *Limnologia* **25**:499-512.
- 823 Lusardi, B. A., C. E. Jennings, and K. L. Harris. 2011. Provenance of Des Moines lobe
824 till records ice-stream catchment evolution during Laurentide deglaciation.
825 *Boreas* **40**:585-597.
- 826 Mackereth, F. J. H. 1966. Some chemical observations on post-glacial lake sediments.
827 *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B-Biological Sciences*
828 **250**:165-213.
- 829 Maher, L. J. 1982. The palynology of Devils Lake, Sauk County, WI. . *Quaternary*
830 *History of the Driftless Area*. University of Wisconsin Extension, Geological
831 and Natural History Survey, Madison, Wisconsin.

- 832 Martin-Puertas, C., B. L. Valero-Garces, M. P. Mata, A. Moreno, S. Giralt, F. Martinez-
833 Ruiz, and F. J. Jimenez-Espejo. 2011. Geochemical processes in a
834 Mediterranean Lake: a high-resolution study of the last 4,000 years in Zoar
835 Lake, southern Spain. *Journal of Paleolimnology* **46**:405-421.
- 836 Maslennikova, A. V., V. N. Udachin, and P. G. Aminov. 2016. Lateglacial and Holocene
837 environmental changes in the Southern Urals reflected in palynological,
838 geochemical and diatom records from the Lake Syrytkul sediments.
839 *Quaternary International* **420**:65-75.
- 840 McLauchlan, K. K., I. Lascu, A. Myrbo, and P. R. Leavitt. 2013. Variable ecosystem
841 response to climate change during the Holocene in northern Minnesota, USA.
842 *Geological Society of America Bulletin* **125**:445-452.
- 843 Miao, X., J. A. Mason, J. B. Swinehart, D. B. Loope, P. R. Hanson, R. J. Goble, and X. Liu.
844 2006. A 10,000 year record of dune activity, dust storms, and severe drought
845 in the central Great Plains. *Geology* **35**:119-122.
- 846 Milner, A. M., C. L. Fastie, I. Chapin F S, D. R. Engstrom, and L. C. Sharman. 2007.
847 Interactions and linkages among ecosystems during landscape evolution.
848 *Bioscience* **57**:237-247.
- 849 Minyuk, P. S., V. Y. Borkhodoev, and V. Wennrich. 2014. Inorganic geochemistry data
850 from Lake El'gygytgyn sediments: marine isotope stages 6-11. *Climate of the*
851 *Past* **10**:467-485.
- 852 Nesbitt, H. W., G. M. Young, S. M. McLennan, and R. R. Keays. 1996. Effects of
853 chemical weathering and sorting on the petrogenesis of siliciclastic
854 sediments, with implications for provenance studies. *Journal of Geology*
855 **104**:525-542.
- 856 Norton, S. A., R. H. Perry, J. E. Saros, G. L. Jacobson, I. J. Fernandez, J. Kopacek, T. A.
857 Wilson, and M. D. SanClements. 2011. The controls on phosphorus
858 availability in a Boreal lake ecosystem since deglaciation. *Journal of*
859 *Paleolimnology* **46**:107-122.
- 860 Pennington, W. M. T., E. Y. Haworth, A. P. Bonny, and J. P. Lishman. 1972. Lake
861 sediments in northern Scotland. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal*
862 *Society B-Biological Sciences* **264**:191-294.
- 863 Schmidt, R., C. Kamenik, R. Tessadri, and K. A. Koinig. 2006. Climatic changes from
864 12,000 to 4,000 years ago in the Austrian Central Alps tracked by
865 sedimentological and biological proxies of a lake sediment core. *Journal of*
866 *Paleolimnology* **35**:491-505.
- 867 Sperber, C., O. A. Chadwick, K. L. Casciotti, K. G. Peay, C. A. Francis, A. E. Kim, and P.
868 M. Vitousek. 2017. Controls of nitrogen cycling evaluated along a well-
869 characterized climate gradient. *Ecology* **98**:1117-1129.
- 870 U.S. Department of Agriculture. Natural Resources Conservation Service. "Soil
871 Survey | NRCS Soils,"
872 www.nrcs.usda.gov/wps/portal/nrcs/main/soils/survey/.
- 873 US Department of Commerce, and NOAA. NWS Forecast Office. NOAA's National
874 Weather Service, www.weather.gov/.
- 875 Wardle, D. A., L. R. Walker, and R. D. Bardgett. 2004. Ecosystem properties and
876 forest decline in contrasting long-term chronosequences. *Science* **305**:509-
877 513.

878 Weltje, G. J., and R. Tjallingii. 2008. Calibration of XRF core scanners for quantitative
879 geochemical logging of sediment cores: Theory and application. *Earth and*
880 *Planetary Science Letters* **274**:423–438.

881 Williams, J. J., K. K. McLauchlan, J. R. Mueller, E. M. Mellicant, A. E. Myrbo, and I.
882 Lasca. 2015. Ecosystem development following deglaciation: a new
883 sedimentary record from Devils Lake, Wisconsin, USA. *Quaternary Science*
884 *Reviews* **125**:131-143.
885