

1945

A topical method of teaching United States history.

James Albert Sibson

University of Massachusetts Amherst

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.umass.edu/theses>

Sibson, James Albert, "A topical method of teaching United States history." (1945). *Masters Theses 1911 - February 2014*. 2680.
Retrieved from <https://scholarworks.umass.edu/theses/2680>

This thesis is brought to you for free and open access by ScholarWorks@UMass Amherst. It has been accepted for inclusion in Masters Theses 1911 - February 2014 by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks@UMass Amherst. For more information, please contact scholarworks@library.umass.edu.

UMASS/AMHERST



312066012037084

A TOPICAL METHOD OF TEACHING
UNITED STATES HISTORY

SIBSON

1946

LD
3234
M268
1946
S564
COP.2

A T O P I C A L M E T H O D
O F T E A C H I N G
U N I T E D S T A T E S H I S T O R Y

by

James Albert Sibson

A Problem in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Master of Science Degree

MASSACHUSETTS STATE COLLEGE

Amherst, Massachusetts

June 1945

OUTLINE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER	Page
I	INTRODUCTION.....1
	Definition of History.....1
	1. Function of History.....1
	2. Field of History.....2
	Objectives of History Teaching.....2
	1. Realization of Change in History.....3
	2. Appreciation of Heritage.....4
	3. Social Evaluation of Change.....4
	Achievement of Objectives.....5
II	GROWTH OF HISTORY IN COLLEGE AND SCHOOL CURRICULA IN UNITED STATES
	Origin of Study of History.....8
	Later Developments in the Study of History.....10
	1. Massachusetts Law of 1827.....10
	2. History as a College Entrance Requirement...11
	3. Improvements in Content.....12
	Development of Methods.....14
	1. Chronological-Textbook Method.....14
	2. Unit Method.....15
	3. A Topical Method.....16

NOV 8 1946 G:ft

III	A DESCRIPTIVE COMPARISON OF A TOPICAL METHOD OF TEACHING UNITED STATES HISTORY WITH A CHRONOLOGICAL-TEXTBOOK METHOD.....	18
	A Topical Method of Teaching.....	18
	1. Definition.....	18
	2. A List of Topics.....	20
	A Contrast in Tabular Form Between a Topical Method of Teaching and a Chronological-Textbook Method...	21
	An Explanation of the Use of the Material.....	33
IV	AN ATTEMPT AT EVALUATION.....	38
	Explanation.....	38
	The Pairing of Students.....	42
	General Procedure in Measurement.....	42
	1. Cooperative Test Results.....	43
	2. Relations Test Results.....	44
	3. General Test on Background of American Institutions Results.....	45
	Summary.....	46
V	SUMMARY.....	48
	Objectives of History Teaching.....	48
	Methods of Securing Objectives.....	48
	1. A Chronological-Textbook Method.....	48
	2. A Unit Method.....	48
	A Third Method Suggested.....	49
	A Comparison of the Two Methods.....	49
	Attempt at Evaluation.....	49
	Discussion.....	50
	Bibliography.....	53
	Acknowledgments.....	55

LIST OF TABLES

Page

TABLE I The Scores Made by the Two Groups on the
Cooperative History Test, Together with
the Means.....43

TABLE II The Scores Made by the Two Groups on the
Relations Test, Together with the Means.....44

TABLE III The Scores Made by the Two Groups on the
General Test on the Background of American
Institutions, Together with the Means.....45

I N T R O D U C T I O N

CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

Definition of History-Much of the fundamental knowledge by which we relate ourselves to our environment is cast into the molds of history, geography, mathematics, science, and religion. In this relationship, history has an important place. It asks the questions--When and Why? It clears up the chronological relations in our collective experiences. These relations may not be understood, however, except as they are understood in the perspective of history. Uncovering these causal relations, history serves as a basis for sound judgment when similar circumstances arise in the social world.

1. Function of History-These causal relationships are spoken of as the continuity of history, and it is the function of history to conserve and vitalize this continuity.

Charles Beard says somewhat the same thing when he states,

"Written History seeks to organize world affairs in their chronological chain according to their inner connections. It attempts to explain, within limits, how things come to be what they are by throwing them in to perspective, and sequential, if not causal relation".¹

Hendrik Wilhelm Van Loon also follows this explanation of history, when, in discussing the importance of history,

1 Beard, Charles A Charter For the Social Sciences, P. 19

he says,

"The entrance of America upon the scene of international politics as the most important actor, destined to play "The Lead" for the next 500 years, convinced me that a proper and reasonable understanding of cause and effect was the most important factor in the lives of the rising generation".²

2. Field of History-From these sources we develop the concept of history as being a development of events which are brought into being by certain definite preceding factors. However, the assumption that this continuity of history is concerned only with the political or military activities of man is questionable. History is concerned with the past life of man considered as a member of society. It comprises the whole period of the development of human society from the earliest ages for which evidence has been preserved. It includes the various manifestations of the human spirit in art, literature, and religion, as well as the vicissitudes of states and their leaders, and the course of economic and social evolution. Based on this broad conception of history, the attempt to limit it to past politics is losing ground.

Objectives of History Teaching-Realizing what history is brings one to the point of determining what it should be doing to belong properly in the curriculum. In order to do this, a teacher should adhere to the educational formula of determining objectives and methods. The primary step in teaching is the determination of aims or objectives, after which the methods will be determined in order that the

necessary desired aims or objectives be realized. It is necessary then to establish some objectives for United States History.

1. Realization of Change in History-Finney states what he considers to be one objective of history:

1. "Realization of the fact that society is continually changing".³

It has been stated before--history asks the question When and Why? This study of cause and effect is in itself an assumption that society is changing. The causes for this change, together with the change itself, developing over a period of time are spoken of as trends in history. Since there is this change, we must try to realize the trend or direction of social change, as, for example, the apparent trend towards a social democracy in the United States. A study of these trends leads to a better informed public opinion and cannot be overlooked if we heed Charles Beard's admonitions. He stated in this research toward better curriculum planning,

"At the peril of making wrong guesses in some directions and raising undesirable controversies in others, we may venture to make a distillation of American History--to summarize in tabular form some of the goals which the American Nation seems to have set for itself--goals which must of necessity shape instruction in the social studies.

- a. National Planning in industry, business and agriculture.
- b. Expansion of insurance systems to cover protection against sickness, etc.

- c. Universal education from the earliest years of youth to the last years of old age.
- d. Perfection of systems of transportation.
- e. Development of city, community, regional and state planning coordinated with national designs.
- f. Development of national, state, and local parks--for wholesome recreation.
- g. Expansion of present facilities to include a national program of preventative medicine.
- h. The conscious and deliberate encouragement of science, letters and the arts.
- i. The preservation and expansion of a reasoned equality of opportunity for all men.
- j. Cooperation with other nations of the earth in promoting travel, intercourse and commerce--so that the solution of conflicts is always to be sought for on a basis of peace."⁴

2. Appreciation of Social Heritage-Another objective of history teaching according to Finney is:

2. "An appreciation of our social heritage".⁵

A student by observing the origin, development, and function of these institutions that go to make up our society comes to understand what they have cost and so his use and appreciation of them is increased. This is what is meant when it is said, "History Teaches Patriotism and Citizenship".

3. Social Evaluation of Change-A third and final

4. Ibidem Beard, Charles, P. 79

5. Ibidem Finney, Ross L., P. 261

objective is,

3. "An evaluation of social change".⁶

This implies a critical attitude. By a study of social change, with references to that change as it existed in other phases of history, criteria are established which determine the present value of change.

Muzzey, in discussing the aims of history, seems to include all of these objectives when he says,

"This is your America; but only the study of history will furnish you with the story of the precious inheritance you receive from the builders of the American Nation and will provide the background of knowledge necessary for the wise preservation and improvement of your heritage".

From these sources there would appear to be agreement that the three objectives in history which are of paramount importance are:

1. To know that people and events are in a continual period of change.
2. An evaluation of this change by comparison with similar periods of change as they existed in the past.
3. An appreciation of our people and their development.

Achievement of These Objectives-With these objectives in mind, a teacher should use a method which would show promise of achieving these aims in his students. Dissatisfied

6. Ibidem Finney, Ross L., P. 262

7. Muzzey, David Saville A History of Our Country P. XI

with a chronological textbook treatment of history, since it did not seem to present a clear picture of change and a proper evaluation of it, the writer determined to try another method. Studying at summer school brought convictions that a Topical Method of teaching history held much more promise. Experience with this Topical Method over a period of years and with various classes has led the writer to believe that it is good and that teachers should become more familiar with it. Such is the purpose of this paper, viz; To evaluate the topical plan in presentation and analysis of data the writer has accumulated, together with study of various other used plans.

GROWTH OF HISTORY IN
COLLEGE AND SCHOOL
CURRICULA
IN THE UNITED STATES

CHAPTER II

GROWTH OF HISTORY IN COLLEGE AND SCHOOL CURRICULA IN THE UNITED STATES

Origin of the Study of History-Although today the subject of social studies, including history, is found in all secondary schools and colleges, it was not always so. History had a hard struggle to gain sufficient recognition to be included at all; and, for a long time, it occupied a very minor place. Both Wesley and Kepner indicate that there was almost no study of history in the United States before 1800.

"In the academies history was sometimes offered, but the subject had a very limited place in the secondary school curriculum before 1825 and almost no place in the elementary school".¹

"Perhaps the appearance of textbooks reflects with reasonable fidelity the growth of history in the curriculum. The first textbook in American History, written by John McCulloch, was published in 1787 in Philadelphia".²

Earlier, from the time of the Greeks up through the Middle Ages, the people learned the traditions of their race and the heroic deeds of their ancestors through the songs of the minstrels and the wandering bards. Judd testifies to this when he writes,

"History in its first form, that which was given to it by Herodotus, was scarcely more than a collection of narrative accounts of the customs and doings of the people".³

1. Wesley, Edgar Bruce Teaching the Social Studies, P. 178

2. Kepner, Tyler Influence of Textbooks on Methods
"Fifth Yearbook National Council for
Social Studies P. 158 (1935)

3. Judd, Charles Hubbard Psychology of Secondary Education
P. 364-5

Following this narrative type of history came a period until well on in the eighteenth century when history became a type of literature to be read in leisure moments. Doubtless some history may have crept, incidental to the study of the classics, into the Latin Grammar Schools of early New England, but it is to the American Academy that we are mostly indebted for the real beginning of the subject. Bent and Kronenberg are in evident agreement with this statement when they write,

"In the Latin Grammar School history was taught incidentally through the medium of the Latin, but it was a separate subject in the Academies".⁴

Kandel discusses the scope of probably one of the first history courses when, in discussing the first American Academy, founded by Benjamin Franklin in Philadelphia in 1753, he quotes from Franklin's course of study,

"In Franklin's Academy the curriculum stated that 'history, universal and national, with chronology, ancient customs and morality, religion and politics' was studied".⁵

Previous to this period, the support for the study of history had been based on such grounds as religious zeal, when Luther believed that a knowledge of history would be of value in promoting an understanding of his teachings.

4. Bent, Rudyard K. and Kronenberg, Henry H. Principles of Secondary Education, P. 238

5. Kandel, I. L. History of Secondary Education, P.P. 398-9

Support had also been given by Rousseau, who wished history to teach everyday facts about everyday people. Napoleon's appearance on the European continent gave further support to the study of history but not for a very laudable purpose, according to Wesley, when he writes,

"Shortly after 1800 history teaching was supported as a means of promoting nationalism. Nearly every country built up programs which involved the study of national achievements, culture, and the peculiar merits of the country. Republican France, independent Belgium and united Italy wanted their former historical accounts all revised and brought into account with the new situation. The later World War had a similar effect. Revised programs appeared in all the countries and they reflected an accentuated nationalism." ⁶

In the United States, academic freedom made possible a correction and prevention of such perversion of the curriculum as this, as evidenced by the success of the attempts to improve the curriculum, sponsored by such educational associations as the American Historical Association. The world might well have been saved from the terrific havoc of the later world wars had such freedom been possible in European countries.

Later Developments in the Study of History-1. Massachusetts Law of 1827-In 1827, a Massachusetts law which marked the real beginning of the public high school prescribed the study of United States History in all high schools. The development of the academies and the passage of this law caused the development

6. Ibidem Wesley, P. 177

of this subject so that more courses in history were taught than there were high schools. In 1842, Horace Mann reported that 10,177 pupils were engaged in a study of United States History.

2. History as a College Entrance Requirement-By 1850 history had found a permanent place in the program of the public high school, and colleges had begun to require it for admission. Michigan was the first to prescribe United States History to The Revolution as an entrance requirement, and gains were noted from that time on. Harvard also, at this time, made history an entrance requirement by requiring Worcester's Elements of Ancient History for admission.

In 1895, out of a total of 475 universities and colleges investigated by the Bureau of Education, 306 required United States History for admission. This was a beginning, but only a beginning for, according to Henry Bourne, Ph. D., Professor of History at Western Reserve,

"The knowledge expected must have been the merest outline for, as late as 1890, some institutions were still using, textbooks like Barne's United States".

Not only was the knowledge expected small, but the diversity of subject matter was probably greater than in any other branch of instruction according to Herbert Espy.

7. Monroe, Paul Principles of Secondary Education, P. 553.

"Before the turn of the century, the vigorous growth of the social studies had produced considerable variety in courses and curricula offered in the schools, and attempts were made to make critical surveys of social studies courses and curricula and to formulate college entrance requirements in history".⁸

3. Improvements in Content-Attempts were made to improve this situation. In 1895, The New England Association of Colleges and Preparatory Schools appointed a Committee of Ten to deal with the special question of entrance requirements in history. The recommendations, later adopted by the Association and endorsed by the Schoolmaster's Association of New York and vicinity, were:

*1. A list of seven topics, each representing a year's work of three periods each a week, was drawn up consisting of:

- a. Greek
- b. Roman
- c. French
- d. German
- e. Modern European
- f. English
- g. American

2. Two of these seven topics were to be required for admission to colleges.

3. Additional topics might be accepted as additional preparation.

4. Entrance examinations should be so framed as to require comparison and judgement rather than memory work."⁹

In 1899, a committee of seven appointed by the American Historical Association made a report which remains as the

8. Espy, Herbert G. Public Secondary Schools, P. 257

9. Ibidem Monroe, P. 555

standard document on the question of history in American Secondary Schools. The Committee urged that the schools recognize the need for college preparation and yet allow themselves to adapt their needs to local environment.

These were the recommendations:

- *1. A unit of history is one year of work given 5 times a week or two years of work given 3 times a week.
2. One to four units in history should be a requirement for college entrance depending on the requirements of the colleges involved.
3. The studies for secondary schools were:
 - a. Ancient History
 - b. Medieval and Modern History
 - c. English History
 - d. American History and Civil Government". ¹⁰

There has been some dissent with this report due to a desire to lay greater stress on the modern periods, so a committee of five, appointed by The American Historical Association, recommended European History to 1760 and Modern History from that time on.

The result of these studies is shown in a report by T. H. Briggs in "Report of United States Commissioner of Education"---1915.

"7,179 schools were studied and these were the results:

There were 2.5 required courses of study in history in each school.
There were 2 plus elective courses in history in each school,
making an average total of 4 courses of study of history in 7,179 schools in the United States. Only in ten of these schools was no history offered". ¹¹

10. Ibidem Monroe P. 556

11. Inglis, Alexander Principles of Secondary Education P. 541

Such was the development of history in the school curriculum.

Development of Methods-During all this time various methods of teaching had been developed and tried to secure to the students the greatest benefits from the study of history.

1. Chronological-Textbook Method-Probably the first method in use was that of the Chronological-Textbook Method of presenting United States History to the students. Chronology tries to show how an institution, custom, or movement started and grew to its present status. Until recent times, this was the dominating element in the organization of school history. Thus, the chronology of the textbook served as a guide for the author and the teacher. It was expected that the pupil also appreciated such a logical treatment of history.

By 1900 there were numerous criticisms of this type of teaching. Among them were:

- *1. The cause and effect relationship was obscured by intervention of problems other than the initial one.
2. Problems or topics were broken up in trying to follow the time element in history.
3. Finally, this arrangement soon made history a dry and unpopular subject to the students.¹²

In order to correct these conditions, teachers began to deviate from the chronological arrangement of the textbook to follow the more important phases of a topic or problem. It would be wrong, however, to state that the principle of chronology is outmoded or wrong. Causal relations and explanation of our existing culture are dependent upon an appreciation and

knowledge of chronology. Thus, the conclusion is that the principle of chronology must continue to be used, but in a more flexible manner than formerly.

2. Unit Method - Another of these methods of teaching is the Unit Method. Edgar Bruce Wesley says,

"The unit is an organized body of information and experiences designed to effect significant outcomes for the learner." ¹³

In other words, the materials and exercises pertaining to a given subject are used to develop attitudes that will determine behavior. There is a unity or cohesion about a central theme upon which a reasoning attitude is being developed. This is a highly desirable method of teaching, but in Muzzey's American People the units are not of a type which seem to be capable of achieving one of the more important objectives of history teaching - that is, evaluation of trends in our present life. As an example, let us take Unit III - How The Sections Of Our Country Began to Contend For Their Special Interests. This unit, while giving to a student some understanding of our attempts to harmonize conflicting interests of the North, South and West of the period 1824-1840, does not provide a clear picture of the present day problems or conflicts which are arising in labor, business and government, such as the demand for a more adequate social security program, which may have had their origin in events of this period. In other words, there

13. Ibidem Wesley, Edgar Bruce, P. 469

is no sustained effort in that unit to relate events of this period to any present day problem or trend.

3. A Topical Method - As a result of this situation, a Topical Method by which some continuity is provided for by an understanding of the problems confronting the people of the United States seems to be deserving of a place in teaching procedure, if we are to give to the community a well informed student. A description of this method is given in chapter three of this work in an attempt to explain how it might better secure objectives already discussed.

Since there is no definite book on the market which provides for a satisfactory arrangement of topical material, and since Muzzey's Unit and Chronological Textbooks do not seem to provide for an adequate treatment of history in accordance with the objectives established, the present study is designed to acquaint teachers more fully with the arrangement of subject matter, the methods used, and the means of evaluating the Topical Method.

A D E S C R I P T I V E C O M P A R I S O N
O F
A T O P I C A L M E T H O D O F T E A C H I N G
U N I T E D S T A T E S H I S T O R Y
W I T H A
C H R O N O L O G I C A L - T E X T B O O K M E T H O D

CHAPTER III

A DESCRIPTIVE COMPARISON OF A TOPICAL METHOD OF TEACHING UNITED STATES HISTORY WITH A CHRONOLOGICAL-TEXTBOOK METHOD.

A Topical Method of Teaching 1.-Definition-In history the topic involves the systematic consideration of some theme or problem throughout its development. All material bearing upon the particular theme or topic is brought together for treatment. Rugg appears to be suggesting a teaching procedure of this sort when he writes of curriculum revision,

"A sane method by which the useless subject matter can be discarded from the school curriculum, and, instead, major problems, institutions, and modes of living that are of social importance are utilized and taught in the lowest grades commensurate with mental abilities and experiences of the children. The actual technique involves the analysis of books by persons who have an extraordinary insight concerning contemporary social trends."¹

This analysis spoken of by Rugg to discern trends and goals of society has been made by Charles Beard, and a reference has been made to it on page three of this work. Beard has developed trends and goals in this analysis of objectives which might well serve as a guide to the teacher of American History. Topics can then be developed based on the ten goals listed on page three. Since they were designed to shape instruction in the social studies, it seems only logical that they be objectives of classroom work in United States History.

This method of teaching is in keeping with the expressed

1. Rugg, Harold "Curriculum Making: Points of Emphasis" Ch. XI

objectives of history teaching mentioned before. They are:

1. "Realization of the fact that society is continually changing".
2. "An evaluation of this change by comparison with similar periods of change as they existed in the past".²

One strong criticism of this method is that, "History is more inclusive and complicated than a series of topics implies".³ In order to meet this criticism and make corrections to eliminate it, we can develop our history chronologically until we come to the logical starting point for the development of a topic. For example, the study of our foreign policy would logically start with Washington's Farewell Address. The development of labor, and a study of it and its relations with management might well start with the period of Jacksonian Democracy.

In such a topic as that of Labor and Management, which will be the subject of a detailed explanation later on, the teacher should deviate from the chronological arrangement of the textbook and concentrate on the development of this topic until a discussion and study had been made which would include, as a minimum the following; the origin of labor during Jackson's time, its developing conflict with management, the formation of the Knights of Labor, plus the final development of the American Federation of Labor with its bitter rival, the Congress for Industrial Organization. Also included would be the part our government plays in its present control of labor and management.

2. Ibidem Finney, Ross L. P. P. 261-262

3. Ibidem Wesley, E. B. P. 143

Engelhardt and Overn's interpretation of history as being dynamic in content would seem to support this study of the problems of society, even though they are at the same time giving a warning to teachers about dogmatic teaching procedure. In one chapter, entitled The Dynamic Concept of Social Studies Curriculum, they write,

"Modern thinking conceives of the social studies as a series of dynamic relationships between teacher and pupil in which the former tries to keep the secondary school abreast with developments in civilization. It is the function of the secondary school to study data pertaining to the problems of society rather than to set up answers and indoctrinate pupils".⁴

By developing a chronological background of present day problems similar to the problem of Labor and Management, students are realizing the change going on during their lifetime and are in a position to attempt a more logical evaluation of that change than would be possible under other methods.

A List of Topics-A list of topics and the logical starting point for these topics would vary with the individual drawing up the list. However, some topics for use in United States History that are concerned with serious problems confronting our present and future citizens, with a logical starting point for each, would surely include the following:

<u>Topic</u>	<u>Starting Point</u>
Foreign Policy	Washington's Farewell Address
Political Parties	Hamilton-Jefferson conflict over Federalist Party
Hemispheric Cooperation	Monroe Doctrine
Liberal vs Strict Interpretation of Constitution	Jefferson and his Political Philosophy of Government

4. Engelhardt, Fred and Overn, A.V. Secondary Education-Principles and Practices P. 376

<u>Topic</u>	<u>Starting Point</u>
States Right Theory of Government	Calhoun's Exposition and Protest over Tariff of Abominations
Labor and Management	Jacksonian Democracy
Government Regulation of Business	Theodore Roosevelt
Spoils System and Civil Service	James Garfield and his Presidency
Tariff Problem	Cleveland's Presidency
Imperialism	McKinley and Spanish-American War
Social Security	Presidency of F. D. Roosevelt
Self-Sufficiency	Mercantile Theory of Trade
Economics of Money and Inflation	Bryan-McKinley Election
International Peace	Woodrow Wilson and Treaty of Versailles

These topics may not be what every teacher would use as a list, but, if a reference is made to the events of the last ten years, it will be readily seen that a great deal of discussion over various aspect of these problems has been carried on in Congress, in the newspapers, over the radio, and in the every day conversations of our citizens.

A Contrast in Tabular Form of a Topical Method of Teaching With a Chronological-Textbook Method- In order to present a clearer picture and to try to show how a Topical Method would work, a tabular comparison will be made, using as a subject the unit of work in United States that deal with the period of sectionalism in the years from 1824-1840. In parallel columns there will be listed:

1. Objective of work
2. Overview or introductory explanation of the unit of work
3. Outline of work to be covered
4. References
5. Pupil activities
6. Tests

This explanation will be made for each method so that a comparison will be made as the two methods are developed. Finally, a discussion of the material will be included in order to show how the method might be handled.

A Descriptive Comparison of A Topical Method
of Teaching United States History With a Chronological-
Textbook Method

The Development of Sectionalism in the
United States

Chronological-Textbook Method

Objectives- 1. To understand how the various sections of our country began to contend for special privileges and how this policy of sectionalism became involved in all the questions of this period.

2. To understand how this period was productive of a great change in democracy

Topical Method

Objectives: 1. To understand how the development of sectionalism in the United States led to problems which today appear difficult of solution. Some of these problems having their origin at this time are:

a. Origin of the labor movement in the United

Chronological-Textbook Method

which was spoken of as a democratic revolution.

3. To understand Jackson's political philosophy.

Topical Method

States with its accompanying conflict with management.

b. Development of manufacturing in the United States leading eventually to a demand for government regulation of business to prevent abuses to the consuming public.

c. Development of a conflict between proponents of a confederated government who demanded a strong states rights' policy and proponents of a federal form of government who believed that the power of government came from the people and not the states.

d. Spread of democracy leading to reform movements which have as their resultant aims a program of economic reforms which are criticized as being socialistic.

Chronological-Textbook Method

Overview:

In 1820 there were only 22 states in the union, and none of these were west of the Mississippi River. There was no car, railroad or plane transportation as we know it today. Mail and telephone facilities were lacking to bind the country together.

Economically, these states were divided into three groups-the northern manufacturing states, the agricultural west, and the southern states, in which cotton was the principal crop. Each of these sections began to demand that their representatives in Congress protect their interests. Henry Clay proposed an American System as a means of eliminating these sectional differences, but the various sections refused to accept this plan for American self-sufficiency.

Topical Method

Overview:

During this period there developed conflicting interests in the United States in the form of an industrial East, an Agricultural West and a cotton growing South. Each section had certain interests and desires. From these desires and interests have developed certain events which have resulted in unsolved problems. For example, the origin of the labor movement at this time brings us today a point where labor is organized along different lines in different industries and is not only engaged in a conflict with management at times, but is also quarreling within itself.

In addition, the constant pressure of the East for more tariff protection and more aid from government has resulted in a dominating place for business in our political economy. As a result a demand for more government regulation has been

Chronological-Textbook Method

The South, to protect itself, began to demand a states right theory of a confederated union, while the North insisted on a federal form of government, in which the activities of the government would be based on the consent of the people and not the states.

Topical Method

made to replace a laissez-faire policy of the period 1860-1900.

The development of democratic activities at this time has resulted in a more definite demand for a better standard of living which finds itself including certain reforms which are occasioning great political rivalry because they are tinged with socialism. This is what some call the real democratic way of life as distinct from the fascistic way in which the government of a few make all the decisions.

Finally, the states' rights movement getting a stimulus from the Exposition and Protest of Calhoun was enabled to keep alive until it was thought destroyed at the time of the Civil War. However, the conflict between Congress and the States over the poll tax issue, and the conflict over regional planning similar to the Tennessee Valley Authority show that there still exist groups who believe that the power of

Chronological-Textbook Method

Topical Method

Congress is greater than it was intended by the Constitution.

Outline of Material

	<u>Background of Period</u>	
	<u>Presidents</u>	<u>Problems</u>
1. Political Development		
a. Era of Good Feeling		
b. Favorite Sons		
2. Election of 1825	Adams,	Tariff of Abominations
a. Adams vs Jackson	John Quincy	
b. Corrupt Bargain Charges	1825-29 Republican	Corrupt Bargain Charges "Exposition and Protest"
3. Administration of Adams		
a. Problems		
1. Effect of Corrupt Bargain Charges	Jackson, Andrew	Westward Expansion
2. Effect of Sectionalism on Policies	1829-37	1. Hayne-Webster Debate
3. Tariff Legislation	Democrat	
a. Tariff of Abominations		Tariff
b. "Exposition and Protest" of Calhoun		1. Nullification
b. The American System of Henry Clay		2. Force Bill
		National Bank
		1. Dislike by Jackson
		2. Veto of Charter
		3. Removal of Deposits
		Speculation in Lands
		1. Specie Circular
		2. Panic of 1837
4. Jacksonian Democracy		
a. Democratic Revolution		
1. Theory of Democracy		
2. Reform Movements		
3. Spoils System		
5. Problems of Jackson's Administration	Van Buren, Martin	Texas Problem
a. Political Philosophy	Democrat	
b. Westward Expansion	1837-41	Independent Treasury System
1. Senator Foote		
2. Hayne-Webster Debate		
c. Tariff		
1. Nullification		
2. Force Bill		
d. Second National Bank		
1. Financial Condition		
2. Jackson's Concept of Bank		
3. Veto of Bank Bill		
e. Sale of Western Lands		
1. Wildcat Banks		
2. Specie Circular		
3. Panic of 1837		

Topical Outline

Labor and Management

1. Development of Labor in the United States
 - a. Convention of 1833
 - b. 1. Demands
 2. Success
 - b. Relationship of labor to politics
 1. Fertile ground for development of Spoils System

Chronological-Textbook Method

6. Jackson's Manipulation of Election of 1837
 - a. Martin Van Buren
 - b. Formation of Whigs
7. Policies of Van Buren
 - a. Independent Treasury System
 - b. Texas Question
8. Formation of "Ballyhoo political elections"
 - a. Campaign of 1840

Topical Method

- c. Labor during the industrial revolution
 1. Consolidation of business met by consolidation of labor
 - a. Knights of Labor
 1. Objectives and success
 - b. American Federation of Labor
 1. Comparison with Knights of Labor
 2. Success
 - c. Congress for Industrial Organization
 1. Reason for origin
 2. Success
 3. Relationship to American Federation of Labor
 - d. Types of labor unions
 1. Craft Union
 2. Industrial
 - e. Objectives of union organization
 1. Better working conditions
 2. Economic security

- II The government steps in
 - a. Wagner-Connery Labor Act
 1. Collective bargaining
 2. National Labor Relations Board

- III How the conflict between labor and management might be handled
 - a. Hormel's plan of salaried workers
 - b. Henry Ford and part time self-sufficiency of workers

Pupil Assignments and Activities

Terms to Master:

- a. American System
- b. Protective Tariff
- c. "Exposition and Protest"
- d. Specie Payment
- e. Nationalism
- f. Trade Union
- g. States' Rights
- h. Force Bill
- i. Gag Rule
- j. Jacksonian Democracy
- k. Spoils System
- l. Whigs
- m. Removal of Deposits

1. Be prepared to give a three minute talk on the following subjects:
 - a. Was the term "Corrupt Bargain" justified by what actually happened in the election of 1825?
 - b. The Tariff of Abominations was purely sectional in character and did not provide for protection to American manufactured goods.

Questions on Test

1. What social reforms did Fanny Wright advocate?
2. How did Jackson's idea of Democracy differ from Jefferson's?
3. How did the factory system affect the lives of the workers?
4. What was Jackson's concept of the Presidency?
5. What started the Hayne-Webster debate?
6. Why did South Carolina claim to be the winner of the nullification controversy?
7. How did the new democratic West influence the older states?
8. Why was Jackson opposed to the National Bank?
9. What caused the Panic of 1837?
10. What was Calhoun's theory of the relationship of the National Government to the states?

2. Complete the following chart:
States Rights

<u>Event</u>	<u>Explanation Purpose</u>
Kentucky and Virginia Resolutions	
Hartford Convention	
Exposition and Protest	
Hayne-Webster Debate	

3. Fill in the following chart and discuss in relationship to self-sufficiency:

<u>American System</u>	
<u>Needs of West</u>	<u>Needs of North</u>
1	1
2	2
3	3
	4
<u>Needs of South</u>	<u>England</u>
1	
2	

4. Debate: Resolved that, Andrew Jackson was upsetting the American system of checks and balances by his conduct of office.

Chronological-Textbook Method

Debate: Resolved that, in Presidential Elections the person receiving the greatest number of votes be President.

Oral Reports:

1. Personal life of Andrew Jackson
2. Election of 1828

Fill in the following chart:

Date-Party Candidate-Platform

1824

1828

1832

1836

Identify:

- a. Robert Hayne
- b. John Calhoun
- c. Henry Clay
- d. Nicholas Biddle
- e. Thomas Benton
- f. Daniel Webster

Topical Method

5. Page 292-Text-Explain why each of the items in the picture on this page has been included and tell the significance.

6. Prepare a list of changes that happened at this time which will explain the term, Democratic Revolution.

7. Write a paper dealing with the life of Henry Clay.

8. Complete the following worksheet:

Jackson's Administration

Select the proper answer by circling the number of it.

- a. Senator Hayne stated that
 1. The U.S. had a federal form of government.
 2. A state could nullify an act of Congress.
- b. The West felt that Senator Foote's arguments for cessation of land sales were based on
 1. Fear of loss of labor by East.
 2. Sale of lands was causing inflation.
- c. The Ordinance of Nullification emphasized
 1. States' right concept of government.
 2. Government by the people.
- d. Jackson felt that a National Bank was
 1. Corrupt
 2. A stable influence on American finances.
- e. The veto of the National Bank Bill by Jackson
 1. Could be removed by a 2/3 vote of Congress.
 2. Meant that the bill could not become a law.
- f. Sale of Western lands in 1836 was
 1. Approved of by Jackson.

Chronological-Textbook Method Topical Method

- 2. Filling the Treasury with paper money that was not backed by gold.
- g. The Gag Resolution in Congress in 1836 was an attempt to
 - 1. Prevent the discussion of slavery.
 - 2. Limit debate.

Match:

- 1. Henry Clay-----Removed funds from National Bank
- 2. John Calhoun----President of Bank
- 3. William Marcy---Union Supporter
- 4. Robert Hayne----Southern leader of states' rights
- 5. Daniel Webster--Great compromiser
- 6. Nicholas Biddle-Spoils system
- 7. Roger Taney-----Webster's debate opponent

Topics for Reports

1. The Old Northwest
Ogg, F.A.
The Old Northwest
Chronicles of America-Vol.xix

II. Women's Rights
Porter, K.
History of Suffrage in U.S.
P.135-45
Beard, Mary
America Through Women's Eyes

III. Labor Conditions in
Jacksonian Era
Beard, Mary
Short History of Labor
Movement
Orth, S.P.
Armies of Labor Chap. II

IV. Crigin of Whig Party
Carroll, E.M.
Origin of Whig Party

Topical Assignments

Prepare a paper dealing with the history of labor in the United States.

Defend the need for the introduction of the Congress for Industrial Organization at this time.

Prepare an argument defending the Craft or Industrial form of Union, and imagine that you are to give the talk before an unorganized group of workers.

Library research; List as many aims of labor organization as you can.

Explain how the National Labor Relations Board functions.

Terms to Master:

- | | |
|--------------------------|------------------------------|
| a. Collective Bargaining | f. Maintenance of Membership |
| b. Closed Shop | g. Open Shop |
| c. Picketing | h. Lockout |
| d. Sit Down Strike | i. Blacklist |
| e. Company Union | |

Chronological-Textbook Method Topical Method

Prepare a paper, affirmative or negative, on:

1. Labor problems can best be handled by a method similar to the Hormel's plan of salaried worker.
2. The Ford Plan of part time self-sufficiency is the only way to handle the problem of economic security for labor.

Books to Read

Lodge, H.C. Daniel Webster
 Rodgers, J. The True Henry Clay
 James, Maquis Andrew Jackson, the Border Captain
 Johnson, G.W. An Epic in Homespun

Books to Read

Howland, H. Theodore Roosevelt and his Times
 Chase, Stuart Men and Machines
 Johnson, G.W. An Epic in Homespun
 James, Maquis Andrew Jackson, Border Captain

References

Bassett, Short History of American People
 Muzzey History of American People
 Harlowe History of the United States
 Elson History of the United States

References

Muzzey, D.S. A History of the American People PP. 280-312, 452, 460, 463, 464, 465
 Peck America in Our Day PP. 159-179
 Canfield and Wilder The United States in the Making PP. 533-544, 546, 547, 551, 555
 Faulkner, H. American Economic System PP. 737, 744, 775, 778

Test

1. Nineteenth Century New England demanded a high tariff because of its
 1. Manufacturing.
 2. Opposition to inflation.
 3. Shipping and shipbuilding.
 4. Desire to be self-sufficient.
2. The election of Andrew Jackson was an indication of the
 1. Power of the Financial East.
 2. Rise of West in national affairs.
 3. Decline of Democratic Party.
 4. Growth of anti-slavery sentiment.

Test

1. List in proper chronological order
 - a. A.F. of L. _____
 - b. C.I.O. _____
 - c. Knights of Labor _____
 - d. Convention of 1833 _____
 - e. Consolidation of business _____
2. Associate

a. J.L. Lewis	_____	A.F. of L.
b. S. Gompers	_____	C.I.O.
c. W. Green	_____	N.L.R.B.
d. Hormel	_____	part time self-sufficiency of workers
e. Ford	_____	salaried workers

Chronological-Textbook Method

Topical Method

- 3. The main duty of the National Bank was to
 - 1. Plan the federal budget.
 - 2. Provide for a sound currency.
 - 3. Care for land business of West.
 - 4. Regulate international trade.
- 4. The low wages of factory workers does not mean they were bad off because
 - 1. Those who worked hard could become rich.
 - 2. A dollar would buy more then.
 - 3. Health, education and lunches were provided for by the owners.
 - 4. Many workers had small farms for food.
- 5. Frontier camp meetings were for
 - 1. Holding religious services.
 - 2. Building houses for new settlers.
 - 3. Holding elections.
 - 4. Organizing wagon trains for migration to West.
- 6. In the early days of our government, most states limited rights of white people to vote on basis of
 - 1. Education.
 - 2. Property
 - 3. Ancestry.
 - 4. Religion.
- 7. The interests of the South were represented in Congress by
 - 1. Daniel Webster.
 - 2. Andrew Jackson.
 - 3. Henry Clay.
 - 4. John Calhoun.
- 8. Andrew Jackson was responsible for
 - 1. The spoils system.
 - 2. Acquisition of Louisiana Territory.
 - 3. Power of Supreme Court.
 - 4. Power of the National Bank.
- 9. The Whig Party was united in its opposition to
 - 1. Slavery.
 - 2. Jacksonian democracy.
 - 3. Republican Party.
 - 4. Immigration.

- 3. Selection
 - a. A craft union is composed of
 - 1. All workers in an industry.
 - 2. Skilled labor, as a Carpenter's Union.
 - b. Collective bargaining is constitutional by
 - 1. Wagner-Connery Labor Act.
 - 2. Nat. Labor Relations Board.
 - c. Strikes are more successful and frequent in times of
 - 1. Prosperity.
 - 2. Depression
 - d. Business, to gain its aims in labor disputes, uses
 - 1. Boycott.
 - 2. Closed shop.
 - 3. Blacklist.
 - e. Labor, to gain its aims in labor disputes, uses
 - 1. Blacklist.
 - 2. Injunction.
 - 3. Sitdown strikes.
- 4. Discussion
 - 1. State what you think is the best method of handling labor disputes.
 - 2. What justification is there for striking?
 - 3. What are the causes of strikes?

5. Tell as much as you can about the following chart:

Needs of West	Needs of East
1. Free Roads	1. Labor
2. Free Land	2. Tariff
3. Manufactured Goods	3. Money
	4. Trans-
	portation
	5. Markets
Needs of South	
1. Manufactured Goods	
2. Foodstuffs	

6. How was the above chart related to England?

Chronological-Textbook Method

Topical Method

10. American factory workers did not leave the factory for free western lands because
- 1.They belonged to the party that was out of office.
 - 2.They were signed to work by long term contracts.
 - 3.The factory made their health poor.
 - 4.They had no money for financing the migration to the West.

An Explanation of the Use of the Material

According to Tryon, a textbook method of teaching could be described in the following way,

"If utilized in its original form, it means following the book page by page and chapter by chapter. The teacher is a hearer of lessons, and the pupil who most nearly reproduces the words of the book is a star pupil".⁵

Although Tryon and other educators consider this an outmoded method of teaching, the writer knows of a method exactly like this which was used to teach United States History as recently as 1930.

There are definite benefits from the use of the text, according to Tryon.

"1.A textbook gives the teacher an outline of the work.

5. Tryon, R.M. The Teaching of History in the Junior and Senior High School PP. 55-56

The material to be used in this method has been listed as it would be used. As noted then, the first few days would be spent in an explanation of the work as listed under the headings:

- 1.Overview
- 2.Objectives
- 3.Outline

This explanation would begin by

giving the pupils a mimeographed copy of the material for the following reasons:

- 1.It is necessary for them to have a copy in order to follow the discussion.
- 2.It is a waste of time for the pupils to be copying from the blackboard.

A discussion of this material would take the following form:

- 1.An informal lecture in which the pupils and teacher would discuss the material, relate it to other topics, planned or already studied, and show how it applied to recent happenings of people and their government.

Chronological-Textbook Method

Topical Method

- 2. It furnishes the basis for a unified discussion.
- 3. Each member of the class can be given systematic assignments."⁶

2. Question, or ask for contributions from the class about the material. That is, permit those who have some background of this material to volunteer their service as an aid to the teacher and the procedure.

In other words, there is a definiteness to the work that is being done, and, if followed faithfully, the objectives of the assignment can be achieved.

The next step would deal with the pupil activities. These allow for special interests on the part of the students along

By using the materials listed in the previous pages of this column, the students will gain a knowledge of the historical facts of this period. The questions on the textcover the pages of the assignment adequately and will furnish material to understand the outline. The terms to be mastered will give an understanding of certain points which will be stressed in testing, since they are necessary to an understanding of this period. The various topics assigned for study and report will increase the knowledge of this period and aid in an understanding of it.

certain lines. For example, students interested in mechanical drawing or taking an art course would allow their natural talents free rein on charts such as Clay's American System.

Other students who enjoy debates would have an opportunity to participate in an activity of their choosing. Still other students who excell in written work have their opportunity to do work that is pleasing to them. Finally, the work sheet can be used as a deviation from routine work in a class which can easily become boring.

Finally, having covered this period of United States History, a

For students who enjoy reading, a report on assigned books will increase the

6. Ibidem Tryon R.M. P. 52

Chronological-Textbook Method Topical Method

test will be given that will be indicative of whether or not the pupils have achieved the objectives of this assignment, which were:

1. To understand how the sections of our country began to contend for special interests.
2. To understand how this period was productive of a great change in democracy, which change was spoken of as a democratic revolution.
3. To understand Jackson's political philosophy.

If so, the work has been completed. If not, then additional time is needed on the assignment.

knowledge of this period. Students might also be permitted to investigate the possibilities of historical novels covering this period. Such explanations often aid the understandings desired. The last step in the handling of this problem would deal with the tests. These would be given to determine if the students have developed attitudes, based on knowledge, regarding the problems studied. If this fact is so, then no further time need be spent on the topic.

By having brought the attention of the students to this topic, a foundation has been laid upon which additional knowledge may be placed. It is not expected that students will rush to the library and search for additional knowledge. Rather, it is meant that their reading will now take on a directed course. Information in the newspapers, over the radio, and in their classes will have new meanings to them. This additional information, set against the attitudes they possess, will alter or strengthen these

Chronological-Textbook Method

Topical Method

understandings. In any event, this information will not be entirely unrelated to anything that the student has read or discussed previously.

Each of these methods have been established to obtain certain objectives. The Topical Method is considered a better one by the writer because it tries to use the history as a means of interpreting present day problems, which objective is one of the major aims of history teaching.

AN ATTEMPT
AT
EVALUATION

Chapter IV

An Attempt At Evaluation

Explanation-This chapter was originally intended to be a statistical evaluation of the results obtained from a comparison of the two methods of teaching which were used in this problem. However, because of a scheduling change which affected the makeup of the classes which the writer had intended to use in this experiment, the course of this work was changed. Whatever results were obtained would not be adequate because of the small number of pairs which was finally established when this experiment was started. A worthwhile result could not be obtained unless the comparison between students or classes could be based upon at least twenty-five pairs of students. The final result of attempts to pair students showed only ten pairs of students. This number would not be adequate to show any significant gain for either method of teaching.

When this work was started, a preliminary pairing of students was made by the writer which resulted in a well-balanced plan. In classes of approximately thirty-seven students each, twenty-seven pairs of students were established. This result not only gave a satisfactory number of pairs for the experiment, but it also meant that the classes were similar in comparative ability according to the pairing procedure which will be explained later in this chapter. This pairing was done at Christmas time in 1944. The experiment was to be carried on from February to June, 1945. However, scheduling difficulties, plus a shortage of teachers at Portland High School, where this work was being done, resulted in a shifting

of classes in February, which was the beginning of the second semester of the school year. When these changes had been accomplished and a more complete pairing attempted, it was found that only ten pairs of students could be established in the two classes. As stated before, this number was not adequate for statistical evaluation. Since the experiment had been started, however, it was carried through, and the results were tabulated. They will be used later, not as significant evidence, but merely to show that classes taught by a Topical Method do not appear to suffer in comparison with classes taught by the ordinary methods of teaching. It was necessary to change the form of this problem because of this unlooked for consequence.

The original intent of this work had been to do the following. The writer was to attempt to determine if the students of United States History gained a more significant knowledge of it when taught by a Topical Method. This work was to be done at Portland High School at Portland, Maine. The subjects of the experiment were to be two classes in United States History in grade XI. There were about seventy-four students in these classes, equally divided in numbers. A student in the first class was to be paired with a student in the second class, which classes were to be designated as follows:

1. The first class was to be called The Controlled Group.
2. The second class was to be called The Experimental Group.

These two classes were to be paired on the basis of the following materials:

1. Chronological Age-Each student must be within four months of the age of his pair.
2. Average grades for the preceding two years of high school-The students' ranks must be within 1 1/2 points of each other's.
3. United States History rank for the first semester-The students' ranks must be within 1 1/2 points of each other's.
4. Cooperative American History Test-Form S-Finally, results were to be taken for use in pairing from tests which were secured from the Cooperative Test Service of New York. To be paired, students had to have ranks within 1 1/4 points of each other.
5. These students were also to be paired on the basis of sex.

Students were paired on the basis of the above materials, and the experiment was begun. The Controlled Group was taught by a Chronological-Textbook Method. The chronology of the textbook was followed quite faithfully, questions on the material were studied and answered in class, outlines were given to be studied, and special reports were read. In the other class-The Experimental Group-A Topical Method was followed as previously explained. Emphasis was placed on attempts to relate all assignments to present day problems. After a background was established, a deviation from the textbook was the next step. At this point, a topic, pertinent to the period being studied, was introduced, and all activities were centered on it in order to develop reasoning attitudes toward this problem by the students.

Previous to this experimental procedure, tests were given to establish a point from which comparisons could be made. These tests were as follows:

1. Cooperative American History Test-Form S
2. General Test On Background of American Institutions
3. Relationship Test which was based on the cause and effect

relationship between events of the past and present day problems.

Ranks were taken from these tests in February and noted opposite the names of the paired students. After this was done, the procedure, as explained, was followed through, and the final testing period began. At this time, another set of tests were given. They were:

1. Cooperative American History Test-Form T
2. General Test on Background of American Institutions
3. Relationship Test

From these two sets of figures, the following statistical evaluation was to be made: ^I

1. The mean of each group was to be determined by the formula,
$$\left(M = M_i + \frac{\sum F.D.i^2}{N} \right)$$
2. The standard deviation- - was to be determined by the following formula,
$$\left(\sigma = i \sqrt{\frac{\sum F.D.2}{N}} \right)$$
3. The standard error of the means was to be determined by the following formula,
$$\left(\sigma_m = \frac{\sigma}{\sqrt{N}} \right)$$
4. The standard error of the difference of the means was to be determined by the following formula,
$$\left(\sigma_d = \sqrt{\frac{\sigma_m^2}{N} + \frac{\sigma_m^2}{N}} \right)$$
5. Finally, the critical ratio was to be determined to prove whether or not this evidence was significant by the following formula,
$$\left(C.R. = \frac{D}{\sigma_d} \right)$$

Because of the change which was caused by scheduling difficulties, it was decided to secure only the means of each group and make a change in the problem. This was decided on because the smallness of the sample-that is, the securing of only ten pairs of students-would mean that the results would not be significant nor admit of generalizations.

Because it was necessary to make this change, the procedure differed from that of the original plan. Although these figures were obtained and will be used later, it was decided to make of this problem an explanation of A Topical Method of Teaching, and a tabular comparison of it with a Chronological-Textbook Method of Teaching which was discussed on page 19 of this paper.

The plan was followed, but it did not mean that the original plan was to be entirely discarded. The results obtained from this experiment, while not sufficiently adequate for statistical purposes, do give an indication that A Topical Method of Teaching at least does not suffer in comparison with the ordinary methods of teaching. The results of the experiment will be included in the next few pages.

The Pairing of Students-The pairing, as previously explained, was to be done on the basis of certain materials such as chronological age, sex and grades. The original planned number of pairs was not secured, but for the purpose of this experiment as carried out, ten pairs were established in the following way. One example will be given to show how the students were paired. A will be a student in The Controlled Group and B a student in The Experimental Group.

Student	Sex	Chronological Age	Cooperative Test In Percentiles	Average Ranks for First Two Years	First Semester History Rank
A	Male	16 years 9 months	14	86	85
B	Male	16 years 5 months	11	84	87

General Procedure in Measurement-When these pairs were established, the procedure as explained was carried out, and the results obtained are listed in the following tables.

The Cooperative Test Results-Table I shows the gains obtained by the two groups on the general achievement test in history.

Table I

The Gains Made by the Two Groups on the Cooperative History Test, Together With the Means.

<u>Controlled Gains</u>	<u>Experimental Gains</u>
37	66
27	13
11	9
10	7
3	7
-2	7
-8	7
-10	3
<u>-21</u>	<u>-6</u>
$\Sigma = 47$	$\Sigma = 113$
$M = 5.2$	$M = 12.5$

The mean gain for the experimental pairs is clearly in favor of the Topical Method, but, as pointed out before, the few pairs does not admit of statistical treatment to determine the probability of like results if the experiment were to be repeated.

Relations Test-This test was one constructed by the writer and designed to measure the ability of the students to see the relationships, causal and otherwise, between historical events of various eras. The results are shown in Table II.

Table II

The Gains Made by the Groups on the Relations Test, Together With the Means

<u>Controlled Gains</u>	<u>Experimental Gains</u>
29	33
20	29
18	29
15	27
12	25
9	25
9	23
7	16
4	1
<hr/>	<hr/>
$\Sigma = 123$	$\Sigma = 208$
$M = 13.7$	$M = 23.1$

Again the mean gain for the experimental pairs is clearly in favor of the Topical Method, but, since the sample was small and not adequate enough to be sure of similar success, in case the experiment was repeated, the writer does not feel that the evidence is significant enough to be used as such.

General Test on Background of American Institutions-This test was also constructed by the writer to determine whether or not the students would gain a significant knowledge of our country's history. It would be used to achieve the objective mentioned before as "An Appreciation of Our Social Heritage".² The results are shown in Table III

Table III

The Gains Made by the Two Groups on the General Test on Background of American Institutions, Together With the Means.

<u>Controlled Gains</u>	<u>Experimental Gains</u>
31	33
30	33
28	27
27	26
27	25
25	23
20	22
20	19
<u>18</u>	<u>11</u>
$\Sigma = 226$	$\Sigma = 219$
$M = 25.1$	$M = 24.4$

² Ibidem Finney Ross L. P. 261

The results of this test show a very minor gain which favors the Controlled Group. Even were the samples of sufficient numbers, however, this gain could not be considered significant because the means of each group were so close that, to all intents and purposes, there is no difference. The difference between these two means is .7 where the mean for each group is approximately 25. Thus, since the two groups were paired as being equal in ability, their gains are just what one would expect from two classes of equal ability.

Summary-In the tests used the indications are that some superiority exists for the Topical Method. Certainly it can be said that the students did not lose so far as the objectives measured are concerned. Much more experimentation must be done, however, before a definite claim of superiority can be made.

S U M M A R Y

Chapter V

Summary

Objectives of History Teaching-Students of teaching methods in United States History seem to be in agreement that the course of study should aim at certain objectives which have been established in common as being of paramount importance. There is little disagreement over objectives in United States History. Any disagreement arising does so from the methods being used to attain these objectives. Common objectives, then, of history teaching are as follows:

1. Realization of change in Society.
2. Evaluation of that change.
3. Appreciation of our social heritage".¹

Methods of Securing Objectives-To secure these objectives to the students, two methods of teaching have been in common use. They are:

1. Chronological-Textbook Method
2. Unit Method

An explanation of these methods was made in Chapter II. The first method follows the course of the textbook quite faithfully, while the second method divides the book into sections and stresses one central theme upon which all pupil activities are based. Only material relevant to the theme is discussed. Both of these methods

1. Ibidem Finney, Ross L. P. 258, 261, 262

have been used extensively, but there is still criticism of history teaching. Since this fact is true, experimentation must continue in order to correct this undesirable situation and eliminate the criticism.

A Third Method Suggested-The writer felt, as did others, that teaching methods in use were not achieving their objectives. As a result, a third method is suggested and was tried out by the writer. This method-A Topical Method- concentrates on one theme and develops it chronologically to its present position of interest in the discussions of our present citizens. The consideration of problems of this sort seems to be the latest recommendation for teachers as cited in page three of this work from Charles Beard.

A Comparison of Two Methods- The Topical Method was discussed, explained, and compared with the usual Chronological Method in the previous pages of this problem. The comparison was made by establishing the following items for each method of teaching:

1. Objectives
2. Overview
3. Outline of material to be studied
4. Pupil activities
5. Tests
6. Explanation of methods

Attempt at Evaluation - When this study was originally started, a statistical comparison was to be made between the Chronological-Textbook Method of Teaching and a Topical Method. There was to be two classes used in this experiment, a Controlled Group and An Experimental Group. The Controlled Group was to be taught United

States History by a Chronological-Textbook Method, and the Experimental Group was to be taught the same subject by a Topical Method. Students from the first class were to be paired with students in the second class on the basis of:

1. Chronological Age
2. Average ranks for first two years
3. History rank for first semester of school year
4. Cooperative American History Test Rank
5. Sex

From this pairing material, students who were equal in ability and maturity were to be paired and used to test the success of the two methods being compared. Because of scheduling difficulties, however, where twenty-seven pairs had originally been planned, the number of pairs actually established dropped to ten. For this reason, no definite conclusions could be arrived at. As far as the results of the groups tested were concerned, there was a clear case of superiority for the Topical Method. Whether this superiority would hold in another experiment of the same sort is questionable because of the smallness of the samples.

Discussion-The writer's opinion and his experience of the past several years, plus the results of the experiment conducted this year, tend to favor a Topical Method of Teaching. The method used in this problem is recommended by all educational texts dealing with the measurement of results in teaching, including the ones used in this work by Truman L. Kelley, Edgar B. Wesley, and J. G. Umstattd. Further information about these references will be found in the Bibliography.

In conclusion then, the following results seem to favor a Topical Method of Teaching United States History:

1. The students definitely did not lose in achieving the desired objectives.
2. Class interest was more sustained in the Experimental Group than in the Controlled Group.

Since the results seem to favor a Topical Method, the writer feels that a continuation of a Topical Method of Teaching United States History is the logical step to take until further experimentation and educational literature proves otherwise.

B I B L I O G R A P H Y

Bibliography

- Beard, Charles A. "A Charter For The Social Sciences" Scribner and Sons Boston (1934) x 236 p.
- Bent, Rudyard K. and Kronenberg, Henry H. "Principles of Secondary Education" McGraw Hill Company, Inc. New York and London (1941) xlll 594 p.
- Dexter, Edwin G. "A History of Education in The United States" The MacMillan and Company, Ltd. New York (1904) xxi 656 p.
- Espey, Herbert G. "Public Secondary Schools" Houghton Mifflin Co. Boston and New York (1939) xli 596 p. 21 cm.
- Engelhardt, Fred and Overn, A.V. "Secondary Education Principles and Practices" D. Appleton Century Company, Inc. New York (1937) xvi 622 p.
- Finney, Ross L. "A Socialized Philosophy of Education" The MacMillan Company New York (1940) x 563 p.
- Inglis, Alexander "Principles of Secondary Education" Houghton Mifflin Company Boston (1918) xvi 741 p.
- Judd, Charles H. "Psychology of Secondary Education" Ginn and Company Boston (1927) 365 p.
- Kandel I. L. "History of Secondary Education" Houghton Mifflin Company Boston (1930) xvii 577 p. 21 cm.
- Kelley, Truman L. "Statistical Method" The MacMillan Company New York (1924) xl 391 p.
- Kepner, Tyler "Influence of Textbooks on Methods" Fifth Yearbook (1935) National Council for Social Studies
- Monroe, Paul "Principles of Secondary Education" The MacMillan Company New York (1905) xxlii 772 p.
- Muzzey, David Saville "A History of Our Country" Ginn and Company Boston (1936) xli 851 p.
- Rugg, Harold "Curriculum Making: Points of Emphasis" Foundation of Curriculum Making, Part II Twenty-Sixth Yearbook of The National Society for The Study of Education
- Smith, Donnal V. "Social Learning for Youth in Secondary Schools" Scribner and Sons Boston 9 19410 x 292 p.

Superintendence, Department of "Social Studies Curriculum"
Fourteenth Yearbook of The National Education
Association of The United States Washington D.C.
(1936) 380 p.

Superintendence, Department of "The Improvement of Education"
Fifteenth Yearbook of The National Education Association
of The United States Washington D.C. (1936) 380 p.

"Tentative Social Studies Course of Study in the XI Year
United States History" Evansville Public High School,
Evansville, Indiana (1936) 44 p.

Umstatted, J.G. "Secondary School Teaching" Ginn and Company
Boston xli 467 p.

Van Loon, Hendrik Wilhelm "The Story of Mankind" Garden City
Publishing Company New York (1934) xxvii 505 p.

Wirth, Freemont P. "The Development of America" American Book
Company Boston (1936) x 772 p.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The writer wishes to acknowledge the aid received from the following sources:

To Dr. Albert W. Purvis, advisor during this study, for his many valuable suggestions and for his encouragement, without which, it would have been difficult to complete this problem.

To Professor Welles for his early formation of a teaching policy, which has brought satisfaction to the writer; and to Professor Sievers, whose suggestions persuaded the writer to try to secure his degree.

Approved by:

Albert W. Purvis

T. J. Welles

Date Aug. 24, 1945

