

### **Manuscript Studies**

Volume 2
Issue 2 Fall 2017
Article 7

1-8-2019

# The Western Manuscript Collection of Alfred Chester Beatty (ca. 1915–1930)

Laura Cleaver Trinity College Dublin, cleaverl@tcd.ie

## The Western Manuscript Collection of Alfred Chester Beatty (ca. 1915–1930)

#### **Abstract**

Alfred Chester Beatty and his wife Edith were amongst the last figures of a generation of London-based collectors who created major collections of medieval manuscripts between c. 1915 and c. 1930. In shaping his collection, Beatty benefitted from the advice and example offered by older collectors, in particular Sydney Cockerell and Henry Yates Thompson, and from the skills of those who worked in museums, notably Eric Millar. This period saw major developments in the study of medieval manuscripts. Much of this work was rooted in connoisseurship and concentrated on grouping books by region, artist and date. Trained by Cockerell and others, Beatty worked to develop connoisseurial skills in order to build a collection that could rival those in museums. The publication of catalogues of a selection of his books, and the sale of part of his collection in 1932-1933, helped to draw attention to the manuscripts that he considered to be of the finest quality. At the same time, the rejection of volumes from the collection, which were often never publicly linked to his name, helped to establish the collection's reputation for excellence and to consolidate contemporary ideas about a canon of illuminated manuscripts that were to have an important influence on both twentieth-century collecting and scholarship.

#### **Keywords**

Alfred Chester Beatty; Sydney Cockerell; Henry Yates Thompson; manuscript trade; connoisseurship; medieval

## MANUSCRIPT STUDIES

A Journal of the Schoenberg Institute for Manuscript Studies

VOLUME 2, NUMBER 2
(Fall 2017)

Manuscript Studies (ISSN 2381-5329) is published semiannually by the University of Pennsylvania Press



#### MANUSCRIPT STUDIES

#### VOLUME 2, NUMBER 2 (Fall 2017)

#### ISSN 2381-5329

Copyright © 2017 University of Pennsylvania Libraries and University of Pennsylvania Press. All rights reserved.

Published by the University of Pennsylvania Press, 3905 Spruce Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104.

Printed in the U.S.A. on acid-free paper.

Manuscript Studies brings together scholarship from around the world and across disciplines related to the study of premodern manuscript books and documents, with a special emphasis on the role of digital technologies in advancing manuscript research. Articles for submission should be prepared according to the Chicago Manual of Style, 16th edition, and follow the style guidelines found at http://mss.pennpress.org.

None of the contents of this journal may be reproduced without prior written consent of the University of Pennsylvania Press. Authorization to photocopy is granted by the University of Pennsylvania Press for libraries or other users registered with Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that all required fees are verified with CCC and paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. This consent does not extend to other kinds of copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, for database retrieval, or for resale.

2018 SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION:

Single issues: \$30

Print and online subscriptions: Individuals: \$40; Institutions: \$90; Full-time Students: \$30 International subscribers, please add \$18 per year for shipping.

Online-only subscriptions: Individuals: \$32; Institutions: \$78

Please direct all subscription orders, inquiries, requests for single issues, address changes, and other business communications to Penn Press Journals, 3905 Spruce Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104. Phone: 215-573-1295. Fax: 215-746-3636. Email: journals@pobox.upenn.edu. Prepayment is required. Orders may be charged to MasterCard, Visa, and American Express credit cards. Checks and money orders should be made payable to "University of Pennsylvania Press" and sent to the address printed directly above.

One-year subscriptions are valid January 1 through December 31. Subscriptions received after October 31 in any year become effective the following January 1. Subscribers joining midyear receive immediately copies of all issues of Manuscript Studies already in print for that year.

Postmaster: send address changes to Penn Press Journals, 3905 Spruce Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104.

Visit Manuscript Studies on the web at mss.pennpress.org.

### Manuscript Studies

#### A Journal of the Schoenberg Institute for Manuscript Studies

#### $VOLUME\ 2\,,\ NUMBER\ 2$

			- 1	1
$\boldsymbol{A}$	v	<b>†</b> 1	rl	00
4 <b>1</b>	. 1	u	u	co

Statim Prosequi: An Index as a Product, Instrument, and	
Medium of the Medieval Franciscan Inquisition in Tuscany	
Geoffrey W. Clement	267
A Tool for Exemplary Pastoral Care: Three Booklets of the	
Edwardes Manuscript in Context	
Hannah Weaver	296
Conversational Lollardy: Reading the Margins of MS Bodley 978	
ELIZABETH SCHIRMER	328
"My Written Books of Surgery in the Englishe Tonge": The London Company of Barber-Surgeons and the <i>Lylye</i> of Medicynes	
Erin Connelly	369
The Two Yoḥannəses of Santo Stefano degli Abissini, Rome: Reconstructing Biography and Cross-Cultural Encounter through Manuscript Evidence	
Samantha Kelly and Denis Nosnitsin	392
Textual Contents of Pāli Samut Khois: In Connection with the Buddha's Abhidhamma Teaching in Tāvatiṃsa Heaven	
Toshiya Unebe	427
The Western Manuscript Collection of Alfred Chester Beatty (ca. 1915–1930)	
Laura Cleaver	445

#### iv | Journal for Manuscript Studies

The St. Chad Gospels: Diachronic Manuscript Registration and Visualization	
Stephen Parsons, C. Seth Parker, and W. Brent Seales	483
Annotations	
An Investigation of the Relationship between Prince Shōtoku's <i>Shōmangyō-gisho</i> and Two Dunhuang Buddhist Manuscripts: A Debate over Originality and Canonical Value	
Mark Dennis	449
The Glossa Ordinaria Manuscripts of the Biblioteca Capitolare of Monza	
E. Ann Matter	508
The Summula de Summa Raymundi in Gordan MS 95, Bryn Mawr College	
Thomas Izbicki	524
A Newly Discovered Manuscript of the <i>Historia de los Reyes</i> <i>Moros de Granada</i> by Hernando de Baeza	
María Mercedes Delgado Pérez	540
Reviews	
Albert Derolez. The Making and Meaning of the Liber Floridus: A Study of the Original Manuscript, Ghent,	
University Library MS 92	
Mary Franklin-Brown	569
Bent Lerbæk Pedersen. Catalogue of Yao Manuscripts	
Adam Smith	573
T. L. Andrews and C. Macé, eds. Analysis of Ancient and	
Medieval Texts and Manuscripts: Digital Approaches	
Alexandra Gillespie	577

	Contents   v
Elizabeth Solopova. Manuscripts of the Wycliffite Bible in the Bodleian and Oxford College Libraries	
KATHLEEN KENNEDY	581
Colour: The Art and Science of Illuminated Manuscripts NICHOLAS HERMAN	584
List of Manuscripts Cited	589

## The Western Manuscript Collection of Alfred Chester Beatty (ca. 1915–1930)

Laura Cleaver Trinity College Dublin

N HIS DIARY ENTRY for 11 December 1915, Sydney Cockerell, director of the Fitzwilliam Museum in Cambridge, recorded his first meeting with "Mr Beatty, an American collector of manuscripts," when Alfred Chester Beatty visited the Fitzwilliam.¹ Later that day, Cockerell, who was also a

The research for this paper was facilitated by an Irish Research Council New Foundations Grant, for which I am very grateful. In the course of this research, I have benefited from the expertise and generosity of many scholars, including Hyder Abbas, Toby Burrows, Mara Hoffmann, Peter Kidd, Danielle Magnusson, Stella Panayotova, William P. Stoneman, Jill Unkel, Karen Winslow, and Catherine Yvard. I am extremely grateful to Alice Ford-Smith for letting me see material in the archives at Bernard Quaritch Ltd. and to the staff of the Bodleian Library, the British Library, and the Morgan Library. I am particularly grateful to the staff of the Chester Beatty Library for allowing me to access material in their archives while they are in the process of cataloguing.

<sup>1</sup> S. C. Cockerell, Diary for 1915: London, British Library Add. MS 53652, fol. 59; on Cockerell, see C. de Hamel, *Hidden Friends: A Loan Exhibition of the Comites Latentes Collection of Illuminated Manuscripts from the Bibliothèque Publique et Universitaire, Geneva* (London: Sotheby & Co., 1985); C. de Hamel, "Medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts from the Library of Sir Sydney Cockerell," *British Library Journal* 13 (1987): 186–210; C. de Hamel, "Cockerell as Entrepreneur," *Book Collector* 55 (2006): 49–72; C. de Hamel, "Cockerell as Museum Director," *Book Collector* 55 (2006): 201–23; C. de Hamel, "Cockerell as Collector," *Book Collector* 55 (2006): 339–66; S. Panayotova, *I Turned It into a Palace: Sydney Cockerell and the Fitzwilliam Museum* (Cambridge: Fitzwilliam Museum, 2008).

collector of medieval books, had tea with Beatty and his wife, Edith, before taking Beatty back to his rooms to look at manuscripts. It is unclear exactly when Beatty bought his first Western medieval manuscript, but the earliest records of his interest in such books suggest that he began collecting circa 1914, when he appears to have acquired two Books of Hours and placed an unsuccessful bid for a third.<sup>2</sup> In December 1915, shortly after his visit to Cambridge, Beatty purchased another Book of Hours and a second manuscript through a Sotheby's sale.3 Beatty had made his fortune as a mining engineer in America.4 After the death of his first wife in 1911, Beatty and his two children moved to London, where he married Edith (née Dunn) in 1913.5 On 5 January 1916, Cockerell visited the Beattys at their London home, 24 Kensington Palace Gardens, to inspect Beatty's nascent collection of manuscripts. Cockerell concluded that the manuscripts, of which there were about fifteen, were "not exciting," though he noted that Beatty had "some beautiful Chinese books." Evidently keen to encourage Beatty's collecting, Cockerell immediately "took him to tea with the Yates Thompsons, where he saw some MSS that raised his standard." The following morning, Cockerell "went carefully through Mr Beatty's MSS and told him which of them (about half) I should not advise him to keep." Later, when annotating

<sup>2</sup> Dublin, Chester Beatty Library Archives, Western MSS Old General Catalogue VIII–XVIII Century (note that entries in this source are not always reliable); London, Quaritch Archives, Commission Book for 1914–1917, p. 915; C. Horton, "No Duds! The Manuscript Trading of Alfred Chester Beatty," *Book Collector* 65 (2016): 207–34 at 211. On Beatty as a collector, see C. Horton, *Alfred Chester Beatty: From Miner to Bibliophile* (Dublin: Townhouse, 2003); R. J. Hayes, "Contemporary Collectors XVIII: The Chester Beatty Library," *Book Collector* 7 (1958): 253–64; R. J. Hayes, foreword to *The Chester Beatty Western Manuscripts: Part I*, Sotheby's sale, 3 December 1968 (London: Sotheby & Co., 1968), 9–10; B. P. Kennedy, "The Collecting Technique of Sir Alfred Chester Beatty," in B. P. Kennedy, ed., *Art Is My Life: A Tribute to James White* (Dublin: National Gallery of Ireland, 1996), 107–19.

<sup>3</sup> The bids were placed through Quaritch: London, Quaritch Archives, Commission Book for 1914–1917, p. 1011; see also *Catalogue of Valuable and Rare Old and Modern Books and Important Ancient Illuminated and Other Manuscripts*, Sotheby's sale, 21 December 1915 (London: Sotheby & Co., 1915), lots 29 and 37.

<sup>4</sup> For Beatty's biography and career in mining, see A. J. Wilson, *The Life & Times of Sir Alfred Chester Beatty* (London: Cadogan Publications, 1985).

<sup>5</sup> Wilson, Life & Times, 136.

<sup>6</sup> S. C. Cockerell, Diary for 1916: British Library Add. MS 52653, fol. 9v.

his diary, Cockerell described his intervention in Beatty's collection as "a memorable event, which gave him a new start."7

Cockerell's diaries provide valuable, if one-sided, insights into his relationship with Beatty and the relatively small community of people interested in medieval books. Beatty's introduction into a group of collectors including Cockerell and Henry Yates Thompson was to prove extremely important in shaping his collection of medieval manuscripts over almost two decades. Beatty's wife Edith also played a significant role in the development of the collection, purchasing some of the most lavishly illuminated manuscripts as gifts for her husband. The Beatty collection proved particularly influential because Beatty, following in the footsteps of Yates Thompson, organized the publication of a selection of his manuscripts. The catalogue was written by Eric Millar, and it appeared in two volumes in 1927 and 1930.8 A proposed third volume was never completed, as Beatty decided to sell his collection of Western manuscripts, and two major sales were held in 1932 and 1933.9 The sales were financially disastrous, with many manuscripts failing to sell ("bought in"), and Beatty opted to keep the remainder of the collection, much of which was sold at two sales held after his death (which occurred on 19 January 1968). 10 As a result of these sales, and other sales, gifts, and exchanges, Beatty's manuscripts are now to be found in collections in Europe, America, Australasia, and Japan, as well as in the library in Dublin that bears his name. Although Beatty only actively acquired medieval manuscripts from circa 1914 to circa 1930, the choices that he made in acquiring and publishing material had a significant impact

Cockerell, Diary for 1916, fol. 9v.

See F. Wormald, "Eric George Millar," in The Eric George Millar Bequest of Manuscripts and Drawings, 1967 (London: British Museum, 1968), 3-6; E. G. Millar, The Library of A. Chester Beatty: A Descriptive Catalogue of the Western Manuscripts, 2 vols. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1927-30).

<sup>9</sup> Catalogue of the Renowned Collection of Western Manuscripts, The Property of A. Chester Beatty, Esq.: The First Portion, Sotheby's sale, 7 June 1932 (London: Sotheby & Co., 1932), hereafter referred to as First Portion; Catalogue of the Renowned Collection of Western Manuscripts, The Property of A. Chester Beatty, Esq.: The Second Portion, Sotheby's sale, 9 May 1933 (London: Sotheby & Co., 1933), hereafter referred to as Second Portion.

<sup>10</sup> See Horton, "No Duds!," 227-29.

on the academic study of illuminated manuscripts. The influence of the circle of collectors of which he became a part, including Cockerell and Yates Thompson, played a major role in shaping both Beatty's taste and the form of his publications. The Beattys can be seen as among the last of the collectors who were able to amass major private collections to rival those in museums. The collection, publication, and dispersal of the books at a time when art history was beginning to appear as an academic discipline in the English-speaking world also helped to ensure that Beatty's favored manuscripts became part of a canon of illuminated books that were well known to both scholars and the market.

The English ritual of afternoon tea on 5 January 1916 laid the foundations for Beatty's collection of medieval manuscripts and his entry into a select group of connoisseur-collectors of which Yates Thompson and Cockerell were both important members. By the time Beatty and Yates Thompson met, the latter's collection of manuscripts was well known, not least because he had published catalogues in 1898, 1902, 1907, and 1912.<sup>11</sup> These publications were followed by seven further volumes of illustrations, published between 1907 and 1918.<sup>12</sup> Yates Thompson sent a copy of the final volume of illustrations to Beatty, inscribed to "Chester Beatty with great regard from H Y Thompson." The catalogues made clear Yates Thompson's ambition to be known for owning the highest quality material available, as he aimed to create a collection of one hundred "first[-]rate" manuscripts.<sup>14</sup> He famously stated: "My plan has been never to buy any

<sup>11</sup> M. R. James, A Descriptive Catalogue of Fifty Manuscripts from the Collection of Henry Yates Thompson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1898); A Descriptive Catalogue of the Second Series of Fifty Manuscripts . . . in the Collection of Henry Yates Thompson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1902); S. C. Cockerell, A Descriptive Catalogue of Twenty Illuminated Manuscripts Nos. LXXV to XCIV (Replacing Twenty Discarded from the Original Hundred) in the Collection of Henry Yates Thompson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1907); A Descriptive Catalogue of Fourteen Illuminated Manuscripts Nos XCV to CVII and 79A Completing the Hundred in the Library of Henry Yates Thompson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1912).

<sup>12</sup> Illustrations from One Hundred Manuscripts in the Library of Henry Yates Thompson, 7 vols. (London: Chiswick Press, 1907–18).

<sup>13</sup> This volume is now in the library of the Courtauld Institute.

<sup>14</sup> Descriptive Catalogue of Fourteen Illuminated Manuscripts, xiv.

additional volume unless it was decidedly superior in value and interest to one at least of my original hundred, and upon its acquisition pitilessly to discard the least fascinating of the said hundred."15 Because his collection developed as he was publishing his catalogues, they actually contain 134 of the manuscripts that passed through his hands, and the collection probably never numbered exactly one hundred. Nevertheless, Yates Thompson developed a reputation as a collector of only the finest books, and his collection was to prove extremely influential on Beatty's collecting practices.

In May 1916, Beatty returned to Cambridge and spent at least three days in the Fitzwilliam Museum studying manuscripts. 16 In September of that year, Cockerell ran into Beatty in Oxford, and the two men, together with Yates Thompson, examined manuscripts in the Bodleian Library.<sup>17</sup> These hours spent in the close scrutiny of books were fundamental training for anyone wishing to be considered a connoisseur. At the same time, Beatty continued to add to his collection of Western manuscripts, and began to spend very large sums on some volumes, paying £2,000 for the De Levis Hours (an early fifteenth-century French manuscript, with sixteen miniatures and a gilded border on every text page, now Yale Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library MS 400) in 1916, and £1,000 for another Book of Hours in the same year, as well as making much more modest purchases.<sup>18</sup> Beatty continued to develop the collection slowly over the remaining years of the decade, but in 1920 he began to buy medieval manuscripts in significant numbers. In March of that year Beatty bought five manuscripts (the thirteenth-century Salvin Hours, a fourteenth-century copy of Augustine's City of God in French, Vincent of Beauvais's Speculum Historiale, and the

<sup>15</sup> A Descriptive Catalogue of Twenty Illuminated Manuscripts Nos. LXXV to XCIV (Replacing Twenty Discarded from the Original Hundred) in the Collection of Henry Yates Thompson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1907), i.

<sup>16</sup> Cockerell, Diary for 1916, fols. 29v-30.

<sup>17</sup> Cockerell, Diary for 1916, fol. 49.

<sup>18</sup> Dublin, Chester Beatty Library Archives, Western MSS Old General Catalogue VIII-XVIII Century; The Chester Beatty Western Manuscripts: Part II, Sotheby's sale, 24 June 1969 (London: Sotheby and Co., 1969), 103; Horton, "No Duds!," 211; a digital facsimile of Yale University, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, MS 400, is available at http://brbl-dl .library.yale.edu/vufind/Record/3519437, accessed 4 January 2017. Appendix: nos. xxxix, lxi.

Gospel Book of Pius II, together with a second Book of Hours, which he returned) from the sale of Yates Thompson's own collection, and he lodged unsuccessful bids on a further two volumes. In the report of the sale in *The Times*, Beatty was described as "a well-known collector of MSS," and the growth of interest in manuscripts was reflected in the suggestion that the volumes sold for somewhere "between five and 10 times the original cost." In July, Beatty successfully bid on six items at the sale of Lord Mostyn's collection (including the twelfth-century Mostyn Gospels, a late-fifteenth-century copy of Herodian's *Historia de Imperio*, The Mostyn Hours, a fifteenth-century copy of Sallust's *De Bello Catilinae*, and a Vitruvius), though he again returned a manuscript. Most significantly, however, at the end of that year Beatty made his first purchase from the collection of manuscripts that had been amassed in the nineteenth century by Thomas Phillipps.

Beatty visited the Phillipps collection in Cheltenham on 6 October 1920.<sup>22</sup> Following the visit, he wrote to the manuscripts' owner, Thomas Fitzroy Fenwick, grandson of Thomas Phillipps, to arrange a further visit, adding that Edith was also keen to see the manuscripts.<sup>23</sup> Beatty returned to Cheltenham in December, when he arranged the purchase of twenty-four manuscripts and two fragments from Fenwick, for a total of £11,954.<sup>24</sup>

<sup>19</sup> London, Quaritch Archives, Commission Book for 1917–1920, p. 1446; *Catalogue of Twenty-Six Illuminated Manuscripts and Eight Fifteenth-Century Books Printed on Vellum, the Property of Henry Yates Thompson*, Sotheby's sale, 23 March 1920 (Sotheby & Co., 1920). Beatty purchased lots 35 (£2,000), 54 (£850), 55 (£6,700), 61 (£520), and 64 (£2,700). He returned lot 64 (now British Library, Yates Thompson MS 7) and was unsuccessful on lots 60 and 63. Appendix: W MSS 60, 73, 75, xxxi.

<sup>20 &</sup>quot;Yates Thompson Sale: £77,965 for the Second Portion," *The Times,* 24 March 1920, p. 14. 21 London, Quaritch Archives, Commission Book for 1917–1920, p. 1500; *Catalogue of Very Important Illuminated and Other Manuscripts, the Property of the Lord Mostyn,* Sotheby's sale, 13 July 1920 (Sotheby & Co., 1920). Beatty won lots 7 (£390), 40 (£2550), 50 (£250), 63 (£355), 104 (£48), and 125 (£82) (lot 7 was returned). Appendix: W MS 19, xxxiv, lxviii, ciii, cix.

<sup>22</sup> Letter dated 8 October 1920, Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Phillipps-Robinson C 719; A. N. L. Munby, *The Dispersal of the Phillipps Library*, Phillipps Studies 5 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1960), 71–75.

<sup>23</sup> Letters dated 8 October 1920 and 4 December 1920, Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Phillipps-Robinson C 719.

<sup>24</sup> Letter dated 17 December 1920, Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Phillipps-Robinson C 719. Appendix: W MSS 9–10, 16–18, 22–24, 29, 31–33, 54, 57, 66–68, xv, xx, xxii–xxiii, lxxi, lxxv, lxxx, xcii, xcix.

Edith also arranged to buy a fragment of a lavishly illuminated tenthcentury Gospel Book (Phillipps MS 14122, now Walters Art Museum W 751) for £500.25 On 31 December, Fenwick wrote to Beatty: "Alas! The books have just gone, and one more chapter in their history is closed—a long chapter indeed—for many of them have been for close on a hundred years in the family possession. The New Year will find them in a new home, where I am convinced they will be appreciated to the fullest extent by two such devotees to medieval art as your charming wife and yourself."26 The illumination was clearly part of the appeal of the chosen volumes, but Beatty's notes made on this visit to Cheltenham, now preserved at Sotheby's in London, demonstrate an awareness of other features of manuscripts.<sup>27</sup> The notes are extremely brief, but often offer a judgment on the condition of a volume and the quality of the writing as well as that of the illumination. For example, of Phillipps MS 3010 (a copy of Livy's De Secundo Bello Punico made in the second half of the fifteenth century for King Mathias Corvinus of Hungary), he wrote:

3010 Italian 15th Century Corvinus. Writing poor. Illumination fine.

The entries also often include prices, presumably those named by Fenwick.<sup>28</sup> Despite its "poor" writing, Beatty bought MS 3010 for £500.29 It was sold in 1933 and is now in the New York Public Library (Spencer MS 27).<sup>30</sup> However,

<sup>25</sup> Letter dated 30 December 1920, Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Phillipps-Robinson C 719; images of the manuscript are available at www.thedigitalwalters.org/Data/WaltersManuscripts/ html/W751/description.html, accessed 4 January 2017.

<sup>26</sup> Letter dated 31 December 1920, Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Phillipps-Robinson C 719; printed in Munby, Dispersal of the Phillipps Library, 72.

<sup>27</sup> C. de Hamel, "Chester Beatty and the Phillipps Manuscripts," Book Collector 40 (1991): 358-70. I am extremely grateful to Toby Burrows, Mara Hoffmann, and Peter Kidd for their help in accessing this notebook.

<sup>28</sup> De Hamel, "Beatty and the Phillipps Manuscripts," 360.

<sup>29</sup> Letter dated 17 December 1920, Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Phillipps-Robinson C 719.

<sup>30</sup> Images are available at https://digitalcollections.nypl.org/items/510d47da-eb74-a3d9e040-e00a18064a99, accessed 1 February 2017.

in other cases, Beatty concluded that a volume was "not fine or important enough" for his collection (Phillipps MS 1347) or that the price being asked was "far too high," as in the case of Phillipps MS 3633, for which Fenwick wanted £3,000. When Cockerell saw the purchases, he was impressed, describing them as "very fine." Beatty bought a further eight manuscripts from Fenwick in 1923 for a total of £3,320 and nine more in 1924 at a cost of £5,105. $^{32}$ 

On 15 May 1923, Beatty was elected a member of the Roxburghe club, an exclusive group of manuscript collectors and experts that included both Yates Thompson and Cockerell.<sup>33</sup> Cockerell was probably influential in supporting Beatty's election, and his diary records that after the meeting he went to tea with the Beattys to break the news.34 A history of the club published in 1928 claimed that Beatty "has been interested for many years in collecting Oriental and Western manuscripts, specializing particularly in manuscripts of artistic merit from the point of view of miniatures and calligraphy."35 Beatty seems to have written very little about his aims in creating the collection.<sup>36</sup> After Beatty's death, his librarian, R. J. Hayes, claimed that "few private collections have ever been assembled where such rigorous tests of quality and condition have been applied," adding "his collecting was never indiscriminate and it was by no means unusual for him to dispose of a manuscript when a finer example of calligraphy or painting turned up of a rather similar kind."37 This is supported by a note in the unpublished catalogue of the collection worked on in the 1920s, where in an

<sup>31</sup> S. C. Cockerell, Diary for 1921: British Library Add. MS 52658, fol. 8v.

<sup>32</sup> See Munby, *Dispersal of the Phillipps Library*, 73; de Hamel, "Beatty and the Phillipps Manuscripts," 364–65. Appendix: W MSS 1–7, 11–15, 46, 58–59, 65, 70, xxvi.

<sup>33</sup> S. C. Cockerell, Diary for 1923: British Library, Add MS 52660, fol. 23v; C. Bigham, *The Roxburghe Club: Its History and Its Members, 1812–1927* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1928), 116.

<sup>34</sup> Cockerell, Diary for 1923, fol. 23v.

<sup>35</sup> Bigham, Roxburghe Club, 116.

<sup>36</sup> See also de Hamel, "Beatty and the Phillipps Manuscripts," 366; Horton, "No Duds!," 213–14.

<sup>37</sup> *The Chester Beatty Western Manuscripts: Part I,* Sotheby's sale, 3 December 1968 (London: Sotheby & Co., 1968), 9.

entry with Beatty's initials, dated 24 February 1924, the collection is described as containing "116 W. MSS. A few of the western MSS will be rejected as finer ones are obtained," a phrase that echoes Yates Thompson's collecting practice.<sup>38</sup> In all of this, however, Beatty's definition of quality remains frustratingly vague, probably because his views were shared and reinforced by his circle of friends and collectors and thus were not felt to need explanation.

The rhetoric about quality in Beatty's collecting resonates with some of Yates Thompson's practices, though Beatty did not share all Yates Thompson's interests. Although he often described material using terms such as "firstrate" or "exquisite," Yates Thompson's catalogues did not itemize the criteria that qualified these manuscripts for inclusion in his select hundred. Nevertheless, some recurring themes are evident in the descriptions of his collection. He was particularly interested in books that contained evidence of elite patronage or authorship. He wrote, "I cannot deny myself the pleasure of pointing out for the encouragement of collectors what a variety of interesting personages and institutions is encountered in connexion with the picture-books of the Middle Ages. It seems as though the greatest potentates had vied with one another for the possession of these treasures."<sup>39</sup> Yates Thompson seems to have thought that books made for great men were both intrinsically interesting and likely to have been the best of their era, although he observed that "at the present day no one taste at once so refined and so artistic is so universal among the great ones of the earth."40 At the same time, Yates Thompson wanted manuscripts that were in perfect or nearperfect condition. In addition, he appreciated the decoration of books, and particularly those that he judged to be "refined" and "delicate," such as the Coetivy Hours, a fifteenth-century Book of Hours measuring approximately 14 × 10 centimeters, with 148 miniatures and in which every page has richly decorated borders, often featuring subsidiary scenes or drolleries (figure 1).41

<sup>38</sup> Dublin, Chester Beatty Library Archives, Western MSS Old General Catalogue VIII-XVIII Century.

<sup>39</sup> Descriptive Catalogue of the Second Series, vii.

<sup>40</sup> Descriptive Catalogue of the Second Series, ix.

<sup>41</sup> Descriptive Catalogue of the Second Series, ix; the Coetivy Hours is now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library W 082.



FIGURE 1. Dublin, Chester Beatty Library W 082, fol. 209r. © The Trustees of the Chester Beatty Library.

In addition, Yates Thompson aimed to obtain manuscripts from throughout the Middle Ages and across Europe. He declared, "It is very much to be regretted that my hundred [manuscripts] includes no specimen of early Irish art, and no worthy representative of the Winchester school of illumination of the 10th and 11th centuries." However, in 1912 he noted that fifty-one of

<sup>42</sup> Descriptive Catalogue of Fourteen Illuminated Manuscripts, xiv.



FIGURE 2. Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, formerly WMS 103 fol. 160r, leaf repurchased by the Chester Beatty Library. © The Trustees of the Chester Beatty Library.

his manuscripts had been made in France, suggesting a tension between his plan and his personal taste, as well as the limitations of the material available for purchase.43

Beatty's notes on the Phillipps collection provide some insights into his taste and his ambitions for the collection. Only very occasionally does Beatty

<sup>43</sup> Descriptive Catalogue of Fourteen Illuminated Manuscripts, xiv.

make reference to former owners of the manuscripts. However, like Yates Thompson, Beatty wanted books that were in perfect condition, though he did occasionally purchase damaged manuscripts, including a richly decorated, but water-stained, early fifteenth-century Book of Hours (his W MS 103) from which he removed some leaves (figure 2).44 His notes offer judgments on both the illustration and the writing of manuscripts. The latter appears to have been a largely aesthetic judgement on the script, as there is no obvious correlation between his comments and either the accuracy of the copying or the consistency of execution. There are some hints that Beatty, like Yates Thompson, was interested in obtaining a range of material: of Phillipps MS 4790 he wrote, "do not need it in view of my purchase from Ellis." Similarly, although he judged the writing of Phillipps MS 3948 to be poor, he added, "may be worth getting as have no example of a bestiary." (Edith purchased the latter in 1925, and it became W MS 80.) Intriguingly, the seven earliest items included in Beatty's published catalogues were all purchased from the Phillipps collection in 1923 and 1924, suggesting that he may have been deliberately seeking to expand the scope of the collection. In contrast to his negative judgments of many volumes in the Phillipps collection, Beatty described Phillipps MS 1798 as "a first class book in every respect and in perfect condition" (figure 3). This was one of Fenwick's treasures (a copy of Statius of Naples's Thebaid), and Beatty set down a longer description than usual:

This is a beautiful book of the late XIV [century]. The writing is Italian. The miniatures however are French. The sky is blue and the figures are in a very brown grisaille type. A fine book, 12 miniatures. Miniatures are of a uniformly high grade. The book is not for sale except at a high price £3000–£5000.

In a second entry in the Phillipps notebook, he added that he "would be glad to add such a book to my collection."

<sup>44</sup> *The Chester Beatty Western Manuscripts: Part II,* 67–69. I am very grateful to Karen Winslow, who is working on an MPhil thesis on this manuscript, for insights into its history. Appendix: liv.



FIGURE 3. Dublin, Chester Beatty Library W 076, fol. 129v. © The Trustees of the Chester Beatty Library.

Hayes claimed that "Beatty became known to every rare book dealer in London, Paris and New York as a generous buyer who insisted on fine quality and was prepared to pay high prices to obtain it."45 Yet the notes made on the Phillipps manuscripts suggest that Beatty was cautious with his money. He often valued the Phillipps volumes at less than Fenwick wanted,

<sup>45</sup> The Chester Beatty Western Manuscripts: Part I, 9; see also Kennedy, "Collecting Technique," 110.

and thus did not buy. For example, of Phillipps MS 2164 Beatty noted, "will take £5000—too high."46 In his letters to Fenwick, Beatty also made reference to the demands of his business interests rendering him "not very flush" (1921) and blamed "high taxes" (1923) for limiting his ability to spend money on books, though this may have been, in part, an attempt to bargain with Fenwick.<sup>47</sup> In the unpublished catalogue of his manuscripts, Beatty sometimes used a code to record prices, a practice he may also have derived from Yates Thompson, who used a similar code.<sup>48</sup> Although it seems extremely unlikely that Beatty's decision to sell his collection in 1932, in the wake of the Wall Street crash, was prompted purely by a need to convert manuscripts into cash, and was instead, as Charles Horton has argued, probably informed by a desire to focus on other parts of the collection, Cockerell later claimed that in this period Beatty "was in difficulties owing to the slump."49 This view was echoed by Morgan's librarian Belle da Costa Greene, but she also suggested that Beatty had "rather lost interest in his European manuscripts."50

In contrast to Beatty's cautious attitude toward the prices of manuscripts, his wife Edith was willing to pay much higher prices for items she knew Beatty wanted. In advance of Yates Thompson's first major sale of manuscripts in 1919, Edith managed to persuade him to sell her the Coetivy Hours (now Chester Beatty Library W MS 82) for £4,000, making it significantly more expensive than any recorded price Beatty had paid for a Western manuscript up to that point (figure 1). The manuscript was a present for her husband.<sup>51</sup> As is well known, Edith visited the Phillipps collection

<sup>46</sup> See also de Hamel, "Beatty and the Phillipps Manuscripts," 368-69.

<sup>47</sup> Letters dated 23 March 1921 and 8 February 1923, Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Phillipps-Robinson C 719.

<sup>48</sup> De Hamel, *Hidden Friends*; Horton, *Alfred Chester Beatty*, 14. Beatty's code was based on the name of his country estate, Calehill Park. Yates Thompson's was Bryanstole, perhaps based on his address in Bryanston Square. I am grateful to Peter Kidd for discussion of price codes.

<sup>49</sup> S. Cockerell, Diary for 1920, British Library, Add. MS 52657, fol. 45v; see also "News and Comment," *Book Collector* 15 (1966): 65; Horton, "No Duds!," 229–30.

<sup>50</sup> Letter from Belle da Costa Greene to F. S. Ferguson, 23 March 1932, New York, Morgan Library, ARC 1310.

<sup>51</sup> S. Cockerell, Diary for 1919, British Library, Add. MS 52656, fol. 23.

in November 1925 to buy further gifts for Beatty.<sup>52</sup> On this occasion, she bought eight manuscripts for a total of £21,800, paying £7,000 each for two manuscripts (Phillipps MSS 1798 and 3502, now Chester Beatty Library W 076 and 122) that were intended to be Christmas and birthday presents.<sup>53</sup> These volumes (the Statius of Naples, Thebaid, that Beatty had previously admired [figure 3], and Dictys Cretensis, De Bello Troiano) were among Fenwick's treasures, but in his notes on the Phillipps collection, Beatty had previously valued MS 3502 as "probably worth £3000-4000." Edith's extravagant enthusiasm at this moment is recorded in a letter to Fenwick. She wrote, "You won't forget that I am going to buy the 'Book of the Chase' for £10,000—only I cannot afford it until next year—and also that if you decide to sell any other treasures . . . you will give me the refusal first—I shall always buy them, even if I have to sell some of my jewels," a promise that was never followed through.<sup>54</sup> The books were shown to Cockerell on 2 December, who declared them "splendid."55

By the early 1920s, both Beatty and Edith seem to have been confident in their judgment of what constituted the finest medieval manuscripts available for purchase. However, the growing collection required management. From 1919 Beatty employed Francis Kelly as his librarian, and Kelly was later followed by Joan Kingsford Wood (whose sister Kate was married to Cockerell).56 In addition, in 1923 Beatty employed Eric Millar, who was working in the manuscripts department at the British Museum, and a friend and protégé of Cockerell, on a salary of £100 a year to "assist me in a general way in my library at odd times and drop in at Sotheby's when convenient to you and generally follow the question of manuscripts for me."57 Beatty's

<sup>52</sup> Munby, Dispersal of the Phillipps Library, 74; de Hamel, "Beatty and the Phillipps Manuscripts," 369-70; Horton, "No Duds!," 221.

<sup>53</sup> Letter dated 13 November 1925, Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Phillipps-Robinson C 719; de Hamel, "Beatty and the Phillipps Manuscripts," 369-70.

<sup>54</sup> Letter dated 13 November 1925, Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Phillipps-Robinson C 719.

<sup>55</sup> S. C. Cockerell, Diary for 1925: British Library Add. MS 52662, fol. 58.

<sup>56</sup> See Horton, "No Duds!," 216.

<sup>57</sup> Chester Beatty Library Archives, Millar Correspondence, letter dated 6 November 1923; see also "News and Comment," 65; de Hamel, "Cockerell as Museum Director," 216; de Hamel, "Cockerell as Collector," 358; Horton, "No Duds!," 222.

#### 460 | Journal for Manuscript Studies

arrangement with Millar lasted for almost a decade, and by 1924 Millar had formally begun work on a catalogue of the Western manuscripts. The publication was designed to form three volumes, and Beatty did not include all the manuscripts he owned in the catalogue, instead selecting what he believed to be the best of his manuscripts and organizing them chronologically. Two volumes of the catalogue, produced in large format and including some color images, complete with an additional two volumes of plates, appeared in 1927 and 1930, and these detailed eighty-one manuscripts. Work had begun on a third volume when, to both Millar's and Cockerell's horror, Beatty announced his decision to sell his manuscripts. Beatty did not see why the project could not be completed, but Millar objected to cataloguing books he would no longer have access to, and the publication was eventually abandoned. 59

Millar's dismay and indignation at the sale of the collection seems to have been as much personal as professional.<sup>60</sup> He had invested a huge amount of time and effort in the work, and moreover had encouraged Beatty to buy books specifically for inclusion in the catalogue. In July 1925, Millar visited Sotheby's to see the manuscripts coming up for sale. He wrote enthusiastically to Beatty about lot 201, describing it as "a splendid book, and I shall be very disappointed if you don't get it."<sup>61</sup> He went on, "Cockerell (whom I met there) said there were several people about, American book-sellers and the like, who might go for it even though they knew very little about it, so that it would be as well to put as high a bid on it as you feel justified in doing." At the end of the letter he reiterated, "I needn't say I wish you the best of luck over lot 201, which must come into Vol. 1 of the catalogue." Beatty was evidently convinced, as he bought the manuscript (a

<sup>58</sup> S. C. Cockerell, Diary for 1932: British Library Add. MS 52670, fols. 15v, 19; see also de Hamel, "Cockerell as Museum Director," 217.

<sup>59</sup> See Horton, "No Duds!," 225-27.

<sup>60 &</sup>quot;News and Comment," 65; Horton, "No Duds!," 225.

<sup>61</sup> Dublin, Chester Beatty Library Archives, Millar Correspondence, letter dated 24 July 1925; see also *Catalogue of Highly Important Manuscripts, Valuable Printed Books, Fine Bindings, Autograph Letters*..., Sotheby's sale, 27 July 1925 (London: Sotheby & Co., 1925).

twelfth-century copy of Zacharias Chrysopolitanus's In Unum ex Quatuor with unusual grisaille decoration) for £700.62 A note in the Quaritch archives states that the manuscript was "sent to Eric Millar Esq."63 Beatty sold the volume in 1933, and it is now in the Wormsley Library.64

The relationship between Millar, Cockerell, and Beatty also sheds some light on attitudes towards private collectors and museum acquisitions in this period. Although he was employed at the British Museum, Millar was happy to moonlight for Beatty (and certainly enjoyed the additional income, repeatedly asking for advances). He seems to have accepted that the museum was simply not in a position to compete with rich collectors at auctions. However, in 1923 Millar wrote to Beatty at the request of the keeper of manuscripts at the British Museum, Julius Gilson, about "an important Spanish MS 14th cent. coming up at Hodgson's next Thursday. . . . Gilson asked me to tell you that he hopes to be allowed to go up to £210 on it, and he would be very grateful if you would let us have a try up to that amount."65 The Americans to whom Millar had referred in his letter about the 1925 sale included people like Belle da Costa Greene, who was buying for the Morgan collection, and Abraham Rosenbach, and these bidders were helping to drive up prices.66 Greene was in England in June 1925, and Cockerell introduced her to Millar on a visit to the British Museum.<sup>67</sup> Although Cockerell looked in at Sotheby's on the day of the sale on 27 July, his diary indicates that during this period he was preoccupied with trying to convince members of the Courtauld family to make donations to the Fitzwilliam Museum. Nevertheless, his willingness to try to manipulate the market is suggested by the diary entry for 28 July, which reads: "spent most of the morning at Quaritch's and Maggs' trying to arrange for J. R. Holliday or

<sup>62</sup> London, Quaritch Archives, Commission Book for 1921-1926, p. 1852. Appendix: W MS 28.

<sup>63</sup> London, Quaritch Archives, Commission Book for 1921-1926, p. 1852.

<sup>64</sup> Second Portion, 80-81, lot 43.

<sup>65</sup> Dublin, Chester Beatty Library Archives, Millar Correspondence, letter dated 12 August 1923.

<sup>66</sup> See "Yates Thompson Sale: £77,965"; "The Sale Room," The Times, July 28, 1925, p. 11.

<sup>67</sup> Cockerell, Diary for 1925, fol. 34.

Charrington to buy the Caldecotts at Sotheby's tomorrow without competing against each other." Cockerell sought to use the fact that private collectors were in a position to spend large sums on manuscripts as a means of enriching museum collections in the longer term. In 1923 he approached Beatty about an English Book of Hours that he had found at Maggs Bros. and which I gave him the opportunity of buying on condition of its coming to the Fitzwilliam after the death of himself and his wife. He is to show it to her and to let me know." Beatty did buy the manuscript for £450 and subsequently gave it to the Fitzwilliam, where it is now MS 375.

Cockerell described the news that the Beattys were to sell their Western manuscripts as "startling and depressing."<sup>72</sup> It seems very likely that he had hoped that the entire collection would come to the Fitzwilliam, and he later claimed that Edith had promised her collections of French paintings and furniture to the museum.<sup>73</sup> Cockerell immediately set about raising £3,500 to buy the William de Brailes leaves for the Fitzwilliam. Cockerell had persuaded Beatty to buy the leaves for \$6,000 on a visit to New York in 1920 and had published on the thirteenth-century English illuminator in 1930.<sup>74</sup> He managed to raise the sum, which he described as a "great relief and satisfaction," and the leaves are now in the Fitzwilliam Museum.<sup>75</sup>

Millar's published catalogues and his work for the unpublished third volume provided the basis for the sales catalogues created in 1932 and 1933.<sup>76</sup> Beatty's initial plan had been to sell the bulk of his Western collection at a series of annual sales, each of which would "contain a selection so far as

<sup>68</sup> Cockerell, Diary for 1925, fol. 38v; see also "The Sale Room."

<sup>69</sup> See Panayotova, I Turned It into a Palace.

<sup>70</sup> Cockerell, Diary for 1923, fol. 45v; see also Panayotova, I Turned It into a Palace, 156.

<sup>71</sup> Panayotova, I Turned It into a Palace, 158-59, 176; Appendix: lxix.

<sup>72</sup> Cockerell, Diary for 1932, fol. 15v; see also Panayotova, I Turned It into a Palace, 157.

<sup>73</sup> S. C. Cockerell, Diary for 1952: British Library, Add. MS 52692 fol. 98v.

<sup>74</sup> S. C. Cockerell, *The Work of W. de Brailes: An English Illuminator of the Thirteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1930); see also de Hamel, "Cockerell as Museum Director," 215, 217.

<sup>75</sup> Cockerell, Diary for 1932, fol. 22v.

<sup>76</sup> First Portion, vii-viii.

possible representative of the whole."77 However, after the not inconsiderable losses made on the manuscripts offered at the first two sales, and an improvement in Beatty's financial situation, the idea for further sales was dropped.<sup>78</sup> Beatty's sale catalogues bore little resemblance to those available when he first started collecting. In addition to detailed descriptions, the lots were illustrated with large plates, including some color images. In the preface to the 1932 catalogue, Beatty was described as one of the "great collectors of modern times."79 His collection was compared to that of Yates Thompson, although it was said to be "more carefully representative of various dates, classes and schools." The documentation provided in Millar's catalogues and the sales catalogues subsequently made those manuscripts relatively easy to trace, and the publicity around the sales helped to draw attention to them. Indeed, some manuscripts continue to be associated with Beatty's name when they appear at auction, including his W MS 104, sometimes called the Chester Beatty Hours, and W MS 173 (Phillipps MS 2506), sometimes described as the Chester Beatty Bible, both of which have been dismembered with leaves now divided among collections around the globe. In the preface to the 1968 sale catalogue, Hayes claimed, "It is no exaggeration to say that throughout the world the words 'Chester Beatty' placed before the number of a manuscript convey immediately to the scholar and the connoisseur the idea of something of special importance and distinction."80 The book dealer Alan Thomas quoted these words in his catalogue as he attempted to resell the manuscripts he had bought at the Beatty sale, suggesting that he recognized and was keen to trade on the value of the Beatty name.81

The reputation of Beatty's collection was partly built on foundations laid by earlier collectors, including Lord Mostyn and Yates Thompson. The 1932

<sup>77</sup> First Portion, vii.

<sup>78</sup> See Horton, "No Duds!," 227; letter from F. S. Ferguson to Belle da Costa Greene, 12 May 1933, New York, Morgan Library ARC 1310.

<sup>79</sup> First Portion, v.

<sup>80</sup> Hayes, foreword, 9; see also Hayes, "Contemporary Collectors," 253.

<sup>81</sup> A. G. Thomas, Fine Books Cat. 23 (London, 1969), 1.

catalogue observed that the period of Beatty's collecting coincided with the Mostyn and Yates Thompson sales, "which contained numerous manuscripts of an importance rarely seen in the market."82 Earlier still, the exhibition and publication of the catalogue of the exhibition of illuminated manuscripts organized by the Burlington Fine Arts Club in 1908 had raised interest in illuminated books and helped to lay the foundations for a "canon" of Western, and more particularly English, manuscripts; a selection of volumes that were widely accepted as pinnacles of a series of styles, and which were to prove attractive to both scholars and collectors. The exhibition attracted 5,053 visitors, not including the Club's members, through whom admission to the exhibition was obtained.<sup>83</sup> Cockerell and Yates Thompson were both members of the exhibition's organizing committee, and were among the private owners who lent a combined total of 197 manuscripts to the exhibition. Cockerell also wrote the introduction to the catalogue. This introduction sought to group manuscripts into regional and chronological schools, with "France, Italy, and the Netherlands [being] well and typically represented," providing a typical connoisseurial framework for the period that resonates with the collections put together by both Yates Thompson and Beatty.<sup>84</sup> Moreover, the exhibition, it was claimed, presented "the finest examples" of illuminated manuscripts from England, together with volumes made across Europe, between the ninth and sixteenth centuries. 85 Although Beatty did not move to London until 1911, it is noteworthy that at least eleven manuscripts shown in the 1908 exhibition, including the Salvin Hours (then in Yates Thompson's collection, now in the British Library) and the Ruskin Hours (then owned by Cockerell, now in the J. Paul Getty Museum) subsequently came into his collection (figure 4).86

<sup>82</sup> First Portion, v.

<sup>83</sup> Burlington Fine Arts Club: History, Rules, Regulations, and Bye-laws (London: Burlington Fine Arts Club, 1925), 30.

<sup>84</sup> S. C. Cockerell, introduction to *Burlington Fine Arts Club: Exhibition of Illuminated Manuscripts* (London: Burlington Fine Arts Club, 1908), xxi–xxviii at xxii.

<sup>85</sup> Cockerell, introduction, xxii; de Hamel, "Cockerell as Entrepreneur," 70.

<sup>86</sup> Burlington Fine Arts Club: Exhibition of Illuminated Manuscripts (London: Burlington Fine Arts Club, 1908), catalogue numbers 46 (The Salvin Hours, W MS 60), 61–62 (The Beaupré Antiphoner, W MS 63), 114 (Bible, W MS 52), 141 (The Ruskin Hours, W MS 64),

#### Cleaver, The Western Manuscript Collection of Alfred Chester Beatty | 465



FIGURE 4. Case M at the Burlington Fine Arts Club exhibition of 1908. Beatty subsequently owned two of the manuscripts in this case (the Holford Hours is in the second row, second from the left, and Statutes of the Order of St. Michael is in the third row, far right).

The Burlington Fine Arts Club had been founded in 1856, and aimed to "bring together Amateurs, Collectors, and others interested in Art; to afford ready means for consultation between persons of special knowledge and experience in matters relating to the Fine Arts; and to provide accommodation for sharing and comparing rare works in the possession of the Members and their friends."87 The 1925 edition of the Club's rules observed

<sup>165 (</sup>The Holford Hours), 171 (Statutes of the Order of St. Michael), 180 (Bible of Cardinal Nicholas Albergati, W MS 79), 196 (Gospel Book/Evangeliarium of Santa Justina), 204 (The Hamilton Field Hours), and 249 (Private Devotions, W MS 77) were all subsequently owned by Beatty; these are marked by an asterisk in the appendix to this article. See also de Hamel, "Cockerell as Entrepreneur," 70.

<sup>87</sup> Burlington Fine Arts Club: Rules, Regulations, and Bye-laws, with List of Members (London: Burlington Fine Arts Club, 1912), 43.

#### 466 | Journal for Manuscript Studies

that "connoisseurship and taste have become qualifications for membership as well as the collection or possession of works of art," and it remained a society of gentlemen (and later ladies), who paid an annual subscription, with dealers and those seeking to make profit from trade in art explicitly excluded from membership.<sup>88</sup> Nevertheless, the Club developed a library with the aim of making it "a means of obtaining knowledge of all sales or other opportunities for the acquisition of Works of Art; and to make it a general medium of information on points relating to the history and condition of the Fine Arts both at home and abroad." Similarly, the Roxburghe Club encouraged its members to sponsor publications (Beatty presented a *Chronicle of Akbar the Great* in 1937), underlining the connections between scholars and private collectors.

Beatty's collection was formed at a time in which there was a growing interest in manuscripts as a subject for scholarship. In 1923 Cockerell introduced Beatty to his neighbor (at 18 Kensington Palace Gardens) Lord Lee of Fareham.<sup>90</sup> Later that year, Cockerell recorded a dinner at the Beattys' where the company included "the Witts," probably Sir Robert Witt (a member of the Burlington Fine Arts Club) and his wife Mary.<sup>91</sup> At this time, the Witts lived in Portman Square, where their neighbors included the Yates Thompsons. In the 1920s, Lee and Witt collaborated with Samuel Courtauld to found the Courtauld Institute of Art, which was intended to provide an academic training that would equip students to serve the needs of collectors like themselves. The Courtauld opened in Portman Square in 1932, just at the moment of the Beatty sales, and in this context, it is striking that the preface to the 1932 sale catalogue observes that Western manuscripts offer "satisfaction . . . to the instincts of the artist, the scholar, and the man of letters alike."92 Some of Beatty's books on manuscripts are now to be found in the library of the Courtauld Institute, although it is unclear how and when they were acquired.93

<sup>88</sup> History, Rules, Regulations, and Bye-laws, 5, 19.

<sup>89</sup> Rules, Regulations, and Bye-laws, with List of Members, 43.

<sup>90</sup> Cockerell, Diary for 1923, fol. 12v.

<sup>91</sup> Cockerell, Diary for 1923, fol. 55v.

<sup>92</sup> First Portion, v.

<sup>93</sup> Items with inscriptions addressed to Beatty in the Courtauld Institute Library include Illustrations from One Hundred Manuscripts in the Library of Henry Yates Thompson, vol. 7

#### Cleaver, The Western Manuscript Collection of Alfred Chester Beatty | 467

The impact of Beatty's decisions in selecting material to be publicly acknowledged as part of his collection, and the subsequent inclusion of these volumes in major museums, private collections, and publications is thrown into relief by the challenge of hunting for the material in his collection that was not included in his catalogues or in the sales that bore his name. In the 1920s Beatty disposed of manuscripts anonymously, as well as exchanging manuscripts, notably with Abraham Yahuda, and giving some as gifts, to recipients including Millar.94 These volumes have received almost no attention in subsequent scholarship. One of the early purchases, a Psalter, found its way to Senshu University in Japan, where it is now MS 7. As a consequence of the digitization of the manuscript, including the detailed inscriptions on the flyleaves, it can be identified as a manuscript purchased by Beatty from Quaritch in 1916, which was subsequently resold by Quaritch in 1931.95 Similarly, thanks to digitization, a group of manuscripts that were exchanged with Yahuda between 1927 and 1931 can be identified in the National Library of Israel.<sup>96</sup> As each manuscript is a unique survival, these volumes are not necessarily less valuable or important than those Beatty favored, but his taste, together with that of his circle, played a very significant part in shaping twentieth-century attitudes to and the study of medieval manuscripts. Ironically, the Western manuscripts that remain in the Chester Beatty collection, which were transferred to Dublin in 1950, have

<sup>(</sup>London: Chiswick Press, 1918), and an offprint of S. de Ricci, "Les Manuscrits de la Collection Henry Yates Thompson," Extrait du Bulletin de la Société Française de Reproductions de Manuscrits à Peintures (Paris, 1926). I came across these entirely by chance, so there may be

<sup>94</sup> Dublin, Chester Beatty Archive, Manuscripts Exchanged or Given Away; D. H. Turner, "List of the Medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts Owned by Eric Millar," British Museum Quarterly 33 (1968): 7-16; D. C. Skemer, Medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts in the Princeton University Library, 2 vols. (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2013), 2:71-72, 75-77, 98-99, 109-11.

<sup>95</sup> Available at http://www.senshu-u.ac.jp/socio/ms\_anglo/KmView/MS\_07/kmview.html, accessed 7 October 2016. Appendix: xcviii.

<sup>96</sup> Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, Yah MSS Var 4, 8, 9, 11-16. See also Dublin, Chester Beatty Archive, Manuscripts Exchanged or Given Away. I am very grateful to Roy Flechner for his help in locating these manuscripts. Digital facsimiles of some of these volumes are available via the National Library of Israel's website.

also received very little attention in scholarship, probably because Dublin has been perceived as relatively inaccessible by those working on manuscripts in the major English centers for manuscript scholarship of Cambridge, London, and Oxford.

Chester Beatty and his wife Edith can be seen as part of the culmination of a generation of major, London-based collectors who were active between circa 1915 and circa 1930. As such, Beatty benefited from the advice and example offered by older collectors, in particular Cockerell and Yates Thompson. Beatty happened to be collecting during a period in which some major collections were put up for sale, but he also sought out material from dealers around the world and managed to extract treasures from the Phillipps collection. This period saw major developments in the study of medieval manuscripts. Much of this work was rooted in connoisseurship, and concentrated on grouping books by region, artist, and date. Beatty worked hard to develop connoisseurial skills in order to build a collection that could rival those in museums. The publication of his catalogues helped to make the manuscripts that he judged to be the finest and most important of his collection available to a wide audience of collectors, curators, and scholars. The sales of his collection in 1932-33 (and later in 1968-69) made some of the manuscripts available to collectors, and helped to further publicize the collection. At the same time, Beatty's rejection and quiet disposal of books that did not meet his idea of the finest quality helped to consolidate contemporary notions of a canon of important and desirable illuminated manuscripts. In this, Beatty and his circle came to have a significant influence on both the trade and study of medieval books in the twentieth century.

#### Appendix: Manuscripts in the Beatty Collection

This list has been compiled using the information recorded in the following sources:

- D1 Dublin, Chester Beatty Library Archives: Western MSS Old General Catalogue VIII-XVIII Century.
- D2Dublin, Chester Beatty Library Archives: Archive Book 8, Manuscripts Given Away or Exchanged.
- Ν London, The National Archives, T218/409.
- O London, Quaritch Archives, Commission Books.
- $\circ$ Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Phillipps-Robinson C 719.
- M E. G. Millar, The Library of A. Chester Beatty: A Descriptive Catalogue of the Western Manuscripts, 2 vols. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1927-30).
- S. de Ricci, "Les manuscrits de la collection Henry Yates Thompson," Bulletin de la R Société française de reproductions de manuscrits à peintures (1926).

An asterisk at the end of an entry marks volumes included in the 1908 Burlington Fine Arts Club exhibition.

Other information has been taken from the relevant Sotheby's catalogues. This list does not include cuttings from manuscripts. I would be delighted to receive additions and corrections to this list.

#### PART A: MANUSCRIPTS INCLUDED IN MILLAR'S CATALOGUES

These manuscripts are included in E. G. Millar, The Library of A. Chester Beatty: A Descriptive Catalogue of the Western Manuscripts, 2 vols. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1927-30).

- W MS 22 Bede, Historia Ecclesiastica (fragment). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 36275), 4 August 1924, £20 (O), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 1, £48, to Quaritch, now New York, Morgan Library, MS M 826.
- W MS 2 Homilary (The Ottobeuren Homilary). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 8400), 23 February 1923, £880 (O), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 34, £680, to Maggs Bros., now Rome, Biblioteca Nazionale, VE 1190.
- W MS 3 Augustine and Jerome, Theological Works, Commodianus, Carmen Apologeticum. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 12261), 4 August 1924, £850 (O), sold to Wilfred Merton, who "immediately offered to transfer it to the [British] Museum at cost price," 1933, now London, British Library, Add. MS 43460.97

<sup>97</sup> E. G. Millar, "Three Manuscripts from the Chester Beatty Collection," British Museum Quarterly 8 (1933): 17-18 at 18.

- W MS 4 Datiani, *Epistola*; Fulgentius, *De Veritate Praedestinationis*, etc. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 12260), 4 August 1924, £750 (O), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 2, £760, to Negrati, now Rome, Biblioteca Nazionale, VE 1006.
- W MS 5 Augustine, *Sermons*. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 12264), 4 August 1924, £800 (O), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 38, £48,000, to Leo S. Olschki, now Rome, Biblioteca Nazionale, VE 1357.
- W MS 6 Eugippius, Excerpts from St. Augustine. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 12263), 4 August 1924, £850 (O), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 36, £390, to Maggs Bros., now Rome, Biblioteca Nazionale, VE Sessor 590.
- W MS 7 Bede, Commentary on the Canonical Epistles and Apocalypse. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 12262), 23 February 1923, £280 (O), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 1, £1,700, to L. S. Olschki, now Rome, Biblioteca Nazionale, VE 1347.
- W MS 8 Gospel Book (The Tours Gospels). Acquired through Quaritch, 1919, £1,775 (R), sold by Edith Beatty through Maggs Bros., 1952, £15,750, to the Morgan Library (N), now New York, Morgan Library, MS M 860.
- W MS 9 Gospel Book. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 2165/21787), 17

  December 1920, £1,500 (O), sold by Edith Beatty through Maggs Bros., 1952,
  £7,875, to the Morgan Library (N), now New York, Morgan Library, MS M 862.
- W MS 10 Gospel Book. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 14122) by Edith Beatty, 17 December 1920, £500 (O), sold by Edith Beatty through Maggs Bros., 1952, now Baltimore, Walters Art Museum, W 751.98
- W MS 11 Capitularies of Charlemagne, Louis the Pious and Charles the Bald (Ansegisi Capitula). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 10190), 23 February 1923, £500 (O), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 40, £24,000, to H. P. Kraus Inc., now Yale, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, MS 413.
- W MS 12 Canons of the Council of Aix-la-Chapelle. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 6546), 23 February 1923, £250 (O), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 3, £14,000, to L. S. Olschki, now Rome, Biblioteca Nazionale, VE 1348.
- W MS 13 Canons of the Council of Aix-la-Chapelle. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 389), May 1923, £400 (O), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 39, £19,000, to Martin Breslauer, now Cologny, Fondation Martin Bodmer, Cod. Bodmer 68.
- W MS 14 Councils and Decretals (Canones Conciliorum et Decreta Romanorum Pontificum [Collectio Dionysio-Hadriana]). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 390), May 1923, £450 (O), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 41, £12,000, to Bernard M. Rosenthal Inc., now Princeton, Scheide Library.
- W MS 15 Eutropius, *Breviarum ab Urbe Condita* (The Maffei Eutropius). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 3075), 4 August 1924, £275 (O), sold Sotheby's, 9 May

<sup>98</sup> Available at http://www.thedigitalwalters.org/Data/WaltersManuscripts/html/W751, accessed 19 November 2015.

#### Cleaver, The Western Manuscript Collection of Alfred Chester Beatty | 471

- 1933, lot 38, £220, last known collection: Oslo, Schøyen Collection, MS 50 (deaccessioned).
- W MS 16 Gregory the Great, Dialogues. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 3674), 17 December 1920, £230 (O), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 39, £250, to Quaritch, now London, British Library, Egerton MS 3089.
- Gospel Book (The Stavelot Gospels). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. W MS 17 12348), 17 December 1920, £800 (O), now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 017.
- W MS 18 Gregory the Great, Homilies on Ezechiel. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 934/2708), 17 December 1920, £270 (O), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 4, £10,000, to Maggs Bros., resold at Sotheby's, 20 June 1978 (Abbey Sale), lot 2976.
- Gospel Book (The Mostyn Gospels). Acquired Sotheby's, 13 July 1920 (Mostyn W MS 19 Sale), lot 40, £2,500 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 4, £1,500, now New York, Morgan Library, MS M 777.
- W MS 20 Gospels of Matthew and Mark. Acquired from Leon Gruel, February 1920 (M), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 43, £7,500, to H. P. Kraus, now Yale, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, MS 402.
- W MS 21 Missal (Le Mans Missal). Acquired in Paris 1924 (M), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 40, to Rosenthal, now New York, Morgan Library, MS G 17.
- W MS 22 Bible, Genesis-Ruth (The Walsingham Bible). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 4769), 17 December 1920, £2000 (O), now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 022.
- W MS 23 Lectionary (The Trond Lectionary). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 3535), 17 December 1920, £360 (O), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 41, to Quaritch, now New York, Morgan Library, MS M 883.
- Minor Prophets, glossed. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 21948), 17 W MS 24 December 1920, £285 (O), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 42, £560, to Quaritch, now New York, Morgan Library, MS M 962.
- Augustine, Collected works. Acquired Quaritch, 1920 (M), sold Sotheby's, W MS 25 7 June 1932, lot 6, to Maggs Bros., now Harvard, Houghton Library, MS Richardson 26.
- W MS 26 Augustine, Treatises Against Heresy. Acquired Quaritch, 1920 (M), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 6, £5,000, to Maggs Bros., now San Marino, Huntington Library, HM 31151.
- Luke's Gospel, glossed. Acquired Quaritch, 1920 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 3 Decem-W MS 27 ber 1968, lot 7, £3,200, to Charles W. Traylen, resold at Sotheby's, 7 July 2009, lot 19.
- W MS 28 Zacharias Chrysopolitanus, In Unum ex Quatuor. Acquired Sotheby's, 27 July 1925, lot 201, £700 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 43, to Quaritch, now in The Wormsley Library.
- Job, glossed. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 3344), 17 December W MS 29 1920, £285 (O), now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 029.

- W MS 30 Bible, Isaiah to 1 Corinthians. Acquired from Leon Gruel, 1920 (M), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 44, £12,000, to H. P. Kraus Inc., now Yale, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, MS 414.
- W MS 31 Bede, *Expositio in Lucam* (Commentary on Luke). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 1092), 17 December 1920, £250 (O), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 7, £150, to Quaritch, now **Harvard**, **Houghton Library**, **MS Typ 202**.
- W MS 32 Peter Lombard, *Commentary on the Psalms*. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 4597), 17 December 1920, £250 (O), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 8, £260, to Rosenthal, now **Stuttgart**, **Landesbibliothek**, **Theol. & Phil. Fol. 341**.
- W MS 33 Caius Suentonius Tranquillus, *De vita Caesarum* (Lives of the Caesars). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 385), 17 December 1920, £155 (O), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 9, £150, to Quaritch, now **London, British Library, Egerton MS 3055.**
- W MS 34 Bible. Acquired Sotheby's, 21 June 1922, lot 572, £140 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 12, £5,500, to Weinreb & Douwma Ltd.
- W MS 35 Rabanus Maurus, *Expositio Iheremie prophete (Commentary on Jeremiah*). Acquired from Quaritch (M), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 44, to Young, now **Harvard, Houghton Library, MS Typ 200.**
- W MS 36 Haymo, Commentary on the Pauline Epistles, part II. Acquired from Quaritch, 1920 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 47, £3,500, to Maggs Bros.
- W MS 37 Henrici de Knarresburc, *Collectanea*. Acquired from Maggs Bros., 1922 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1933, lot 10, now Yale, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, MS Osborn fa42.
- W MS 38 The de Brailes Leaves. Acquired from Dr Rosenbach, New York, November 1920, \$6,000 (M), sold to the Fitzwilliam Museum with the aid of the National Art Collections Fund, 1932, £3,500, now Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, MS 330.99
- W MS 39 Psalter (fragment). Acquired in Holland, 1922 (M), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 46, £18,000, to Quaritch.
- W MS 40 Psalter. Acquired from Quaritch, 1923 (D1), now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 040.
- W MS 41 Bible, Psalms–Revelation. Acquired from Francis Edwards (M), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 45.
- W MS 42 Gospel Lectionary (*Evangeliarium*). Acquired Sotheby's, 4 May 1926, lot 29, £2,050 (Q), now Los Angeles, The J. Paul Getty Museum, MS 16.
- W MS 43 Augustine, *De Civitate Dei*. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 12269), November 1925, £1,500 by Edith Beatty (O), now **Dublin**, **Chester Beatty Library**, **W 043**.
- W MS 44 Peter Lombard, *Commentary on the Pauline Epistles*. Acquired "from a Spanish collector through the late S. Babra, Barcelona, 1927" (M), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 9, £17,000, to E. P. Goldsmith & Co. Ltd., now New York, Morgan Library, MS M 939.

<sup>99</sup> See also Cockerell, Diary for 1920, fol. 54.

#### Cleaver, The Western Manuscript Collection of Alfred Chester Beatty | 473

- W MS 45 Cassiodorus, Historia Ecclesiastica Tripartita. Acquired Sotheby's, 12 December 1927, lot 56, £280 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 10, £3,400, to Charles W. Traylen, resold Sotheby's, 7 July 2009, lot 20.
- Gratian, Decretum (Decretals). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 1036), W MS 46 23 February 1923, £395 (O), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 11, £4,000, to Maggs Bros., now Baltimore, Walters Art Museum, MS W. 777.
- Gospel Book (The Seitenstetten Gospels). Acquired from Jacques Rosenthal, 1927 W MS 47 (M), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 47, £1,150, now New York, Morgan Library, MS M 808.
- Gradual (The Seitenstetten Gradual). Acquired from Jacques Rosenthal, 1927 (M), W MS 48 sold by Edith Beatty, 1951, to Morgan Library, now New York, Morgan Library, MS M 855.100
- W MS 49 Bible. Acquired from P. M. Barnard, Tunbridge Wells, 1917 (M), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1969, lot 48, £800, to Quaritch, listed in Sam Fogg Rare Books Catalogue 16 (1995).
- Bible. Acquired from Mrs. Wallace Watts, 1926 (M), sold Sotheby's, 3 December W MS 50 1968, lot 13, £2,200, to N. Israel, offered for sale through Les Enluminures, 2005.
- W MS 51 Bible (The Bible of Jean Bude). Acquired privately, through S. C. Cockerell (M), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 48, to Perimayne, now New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1997.320.
- Bible. Acquired from Arthur Severn Esq., 1926 (M), sold Sotheby's, 3 December W MS 52 1968, lot 16, £1,700, to Martin Breslauer.\*
- W MS 53 Bible. Acquired from Arthur Severn Esq., 1926 (M), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 50, £3,000, to Rainer.
- W MS 54 Bible in 4 vols. (The Duprat Bible). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 4259), 17 December 1920, £2,000 (O), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 13, £600, now Boston Public Library, MS 1532.
- W MS 55 Bible. Acquired from Quaritch, 1918 (M), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 14, to Quaritch.
- Bible. Acquired from Myers and Co. New Bond St., 1927 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 3 W MS 56 December 1968, lot 17, £2,000, to Dr. Radaeli, now Milan, Biblioteca Nazionale Braidense, AC IX 36.
- W MS 57 Bible. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 447), 17 December 1920, £135 (O), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 51, £6,000, to Bernard de Gabrielli.
- Missal (fragment). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 4448), 4 August W MS 58 1924, £285 (O), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 52, £3,500, to Maggs Bros., now Oxford, Lincoln College, MS Lat. 150 (E).
- W MS 59 Bede, De Temporum Ratione; Chronicle of Dore Abbey. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 12200), 4 August 1924, £675 (O), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 49, £270, to Quaritch, now London, British Library Egerton, MS 3088.

<sup>100</sup> http://corsair.themorgan.org/cgi-bin/Pwebrecon.cgi?BBID=158991, accessed 14 November 2015.

- W MS 60 Hours (The Salvin Hours). Acquired Sotheby's sale, 23 March 1920 (Yates Thompson Sale), lot 35, £2,000 (Q), presented to the British Museum, 1955, now London, British Library, Add. MS 48985.\*
- W MS 61 Psalter. Acquired from R. G. L. Barrett, Esq. 1924 (M), now **Dublin, Chester** Beatty Library, W 061.
- W MS 62 Conrad of Saxony, *Speculum Beate Marie Virginis*. Acquired Sotheby's, 5 May 1926 (Brollemann-Mallet sale), lot 155 (M), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 50, to Quaritch.
- W MS 63 Antiphoner (Beaupré Antiphoner), 4 vols. Acquired Sotheby's, 22 June 1921 (Yates Thompson Sale), lot 67, £1,510 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 15, £1,850, to Spanish Art Gallery, now Baltimore, Walters Art Museum, W 759–762.\*
- W MS 64 Hours (The Ruskin Hours). Acquired from Dr. S. C. Cockerell, 1924 (M), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 16, £2,900, to Quaritch, now Los Angeles, The J. Paul Getty Museum, MS Ludwig IX 3.\*
- W MS 65 Aristotle, *De Caelo et Mundo, Meteora, Metaphysica*. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 3383), 23 February 1923, £165 (O), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 15, £5,800, resold Sotheby's, 7 July 2009, lot 35.
- W MS 66 Gratian, *Decretum (Decretals*). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 125), 17 December 1920, £480 (O), now **Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 066.**
- W MS 67 Justinian, *The Codex of Justinian*, books I–IX. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 3339), 17 December 1920, £330 (O), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 17, £600, to St. John Hornby.
- W MS 68 Augustine, *De Civitate Dei*, books I–XXII. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 4600), 17 December 1920, £190 (O), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 51, £120, to Goodyer, now **Harvard**, **Houghton Library**, **MS Typ 228**.
- W MS 69 Peter of Poitiers, Compendium in Genealogia Christi (Roll Chronicle). Acquired Maggs Bros., 1923, £1,260 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 54, £3,200, to Martin Breslauer, now Cologny, Fondation Martin Bodmer, Cod. Bodmer 183.
- W MS 70 Flores Historiarum. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 3897), 4 August 1924, £600 (O), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 18, £6,000, to Weinreb & Douwma Ltd.
- W MS 71 Psalter. Acquired from Quaritch, after 1924 (M), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 19, £23,000, to Charles W. Traylen, now Geneva, Bibliothèque de Genève, Comites Latentes MS 15.<sup>101</sup>
- W MS 72 Augustine, *La Cité de Dieu*, books I–X (in French). Acquired from Francis Edwards (M), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 18, to T. H. Riches.
- W MS 73 Augustine, *La Cité de Dieu*, books XI–XXII (in French). Acquired Sotheby's, 23 March 1920 (Yates Thompson Sale), lot LIV, £850 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 19, to Quaritch, now **Harvard, Houghton Library, MS Typ 201.**

<sup>101</sup> See also Catalogue of Highly Important Manuscripts, Valuable Printed Books, Fine Bindings, Autograph Letters, Sotheby's sale, 27 July 1925, lot 222.

- W MS 74 Histoire Ancienne. Acquired from Quaritch, 1923 (M), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 20, £1,200, to Spanish Art Gallery, now Houston, James E. and Elizabeth J. Ferrell Collection. 102
- Vincent of Beauvais, Speculum Historiale. Acquired Sotheby's, 3 March 1920 (Yates W MS 75 Thompson Sale), lot 55, £6,700 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 20, £88,000, to "de Gourlay" (pseudonym for anonymous buyer), now Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MSS n.a.f. 15939-15944.
- W MS 76 Statius of Naples, *Thebaid*. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 1798), November 1925, by Edith Beatty, £7,000 (O), now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 076.
- W MS 77 Private Devotions, written at Bruges by Iohannes de Ecclesia. Acquired Sotheby's, 29 July 1929, lot 8 (M), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 21, £14,000, to Quar-
- W MS 78 Statutes and Matricola of the Guild of Innkeepers, Perugia. Acquired from Sabin, 1921 (M), now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 078.
- Bible (Bible of Cardinal Nicholas Albergati). Acquired from the executors of Sir W MS 79 George Holford, 1928 [probably December 1927] (M), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 61, £85,000, to H. P. Kraus, now Yale, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, MS 407.\*
- W MS 80 Liber de Naturis Rerum. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 134/3948), November 1925, by Edith Beatty, £450 (O), now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 080.
- Missal. Acquired from Paul Gruppe, Berlin, 1920 (M), sold Sotheby's, 7 June W MS 81 1932, lot 22, to Rosenthal, now Los Angeles, The J. Paul Getty Museum, MS Ludwig V 6.

#### PART B: MANUSCRIPTS NOT INCLUDED IN MILLAR'S CATALOGUES

Because manuscripts were unusually given multiple numbers during their time in Beatty's collection, the entries here are listed alphabetically by author/title, following descriptions given in the documentation, and have been assigned new Roman numerals. Numbers associated with Beatty's collection are given in the brackets at the end of each entry.

- i Adversos hereticos. Acquisition unknown, exchanged with Yahuda, January 1929 (D2), now Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, Yah MS Var 13 (W MS XIX\*/48/53).
- ii Alphonsus Bovosius, Liber Apologeticus Adversus Graecos. Acquired from Leighton (D1), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 37, £750, to Dr. A. Martegani (W MS 70/116/131/168).

<sup>102</sup> E. Morrison and A. D. Hedeman, eds., Imagining the Past in France: History in Manuscript Painting, 1250-1500 (Los Angeles: J. Paul Getty Museum, 2010), 169.

iii	Antiphonary. Acquisition unknown, now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 127.
iv	Antiphonary. Acquisition unknown, exchanged with Yahuda, 26 May 1930 (D2),
	now Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, Yah MS Var 15 (W MS VII*).
v	Augustine, De Civitate Dei. Probably acquired from Quaritch, probably exchanged
	with Yahuda, 26 May 1930 (D2), now Harvard, Houghton Library, MS Typ 141
	(W MS XII).
vi	Augustine, Ennarationes in Psalmos. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 24 June
	1969, lot 45, £2,500, to Alan G. Thomas, now Harvard, Houghton Library, MS
	Тур 703.
vii	Azo, Summa in Codicem et Institutiones cum Extraordinariis. Acquisition unknown,
	sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 55, £9,500, to Martin Breslauer, now Cologny,
	Fondation Martin Bodmer, Cod. Bodmer 14 (W MS 112).
viii	Bible. Acquisition unknown, exchanged with Yahuda, 26 May 1931 (D2), now
	Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, Yah MS Var 14 (W MS IX*).
ix	Bible (end of Genesis). Acquired from Gruel, Paris, or Leighton, exchanged with
	Yahuda, 1931 (D2) (W MS 49).
X	Bible. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 14, £3,200, to
	Alan G. Thomas (W MS 116).
xi	Bible. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 49, £1,000, to
	Quaritch (W MS 128).
xii	Bible. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 56, £3,500, to
	Alan G. Thomas (W MS 117).
xiii	Bible. Acquisition unknown, given to Eric Millar. 103
xiv	Bible. Acquired Sotheby's, 30 January 1920, lot 127, presented to W. G. Beatty,
	18 June 1928 (D2).
XV	Bible (Isaiah to Apocalypse). Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 2506),
	17 December 1920, £490, sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 57, £2,000, to Alan G.

xvi Bible. Acquired from Messers Young, Liverpool, 17 May 1921, presented to Eric Millar, 6 January 1928 (D2). 104

Thomas, subsequently dismembered (W MS 173).

xvii Breviary (The Armagnac Breviary). Acquired from Sabin, 1923, £1,600 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 24, £30,000, resold Sotheby's, 4 December 2007 (W MS 63/75/82/93).

xviii Cicero, *De Oratore*. Acquired Sotheby's, 30 January 1920 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 28 June 1921, lot 163, to Quaritch, now **Princeton, University Library, Kane MS 31**. 105

xix Cicero, *Orationes Novem*. Acquired from Sydney Cockerell, September 1920, by Edith Beatty, sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 27, £180, to Quaritch, reacquired for Edith Beatty by Sydney Cockerell, 28 July 1947, now **Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 124** (W MS 96/97/103/144). 106

<sup>103</sup> Turner, "Manuscripts Owned by Eric Millar," 14.

<sup>104</sup> See also Turner, "Manuscripts Owned by Eric Millar," 14.

<sup>105</sup> Skemer, Medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts, 2:71-72.

<sup>106</sup> Cockerell, Diary for 1920, fol. 45v.

- Cicero, Orationes Novem. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 240), 17 XXDecember 1920, £125 (O), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 28, £4,800, to Rainer (W MS 90/95/102/104/125).
- Cicero, De Senectute, De Amicitia, Paradoxa. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, xxi 24 June 1969, lot 65, £600, to T. Silverstein Esq. (W MS 164).
- Columella, De Rustica. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 2251), 17 xxii December 1920, £225 (O), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 28, £550 (W MS 98/102/109).
- De miseriae humanae conditionis. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 437), xxiii 17 December 1920, £4 (O), given to Yahuda, 17 December 1931, now Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, Yah MS Var 11 (W MS III/105).
- Dictys Cretensis, De Bello Troiano. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. xxiv 3502), November 1925, by Edith Beatty, £7,000 (O), now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 122 (W MS 100/107/110B).
- Diurnal. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 33, £1,400, to XXV Meier Elte, now The Hague, Koninklijke Bibliotheek, MS 135 J 8 (W MS 101).
- Flores Historiarum. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 3897), 4 August xxvi 1924, £600 (O), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 18, £6,000, to Weinreb & Douwma Ltd. (W MS 51A/65).
- Flores Senecae. Acquired from Maggs Bros., 30 November 1921 (D1), sold xxvii Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 73, £2,200, to Tulkens Antiquariat (W MS 113/ 123/130/148).
- Franciscus Barbarus and others, Miscellany. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection xxviii (no. 6640), November 1925, by Edith Beatty, £3,000 (O), now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 113 (W MS 101/108/108A).
- Giovanni Gioviano, Opera. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 7084), xxix November 1925, by Edith Beatty, £2,000 (O), now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 108 (W MS 99/106/110C).
- Gospel Book (The Evangeliarum of Santa Justina). Acquired from the executors of XXX the Holford estate, December 1927/January 1928, now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 107 (W MS 115B/127).\*
- xxxi Gospel Book/Lectionary (Gospel Book of Pope Pius II). Acquired Sotheby's, 24 March 1920 (Yates Thompson Sale), lot 61, £520 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 63, £460, to Quaritch for New York Public Library, now New York, New York Public Library, Spencer MS 29 (W MS 50/95/110/118).
- Gradual. Acquired Sotheby's, 11 June 1923, lot 180, £100 (Q). xxxii
- xxxiii Gregory the Great, Moralia. Acquisition unknown, exchanged with Yahuda, 17 December 1927 (D2).
- Herodian, Historia de Imperio. Acquired Sotheby's (Mostyn sale), 13/14 July 1920, xxxiv lot 50, £250 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 29 (W MS 58/105/107/113).
- Hours (with autograph of George Edmund Street). Acquisition unknown, exchanged XXXV with Yahuda, December 1927 (D2), now Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, Yah MS Var 8 (W MS 74A).
- Hours (in Dutch). Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 30 (W MS xxxvi 16/94/117/125).

- xxxvii Hours. Acquired 1914, £450 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 25, £5,000, to Altdorfer.
- xxxviii Hours. Acquired from Tregaskis, 1914, £200 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 35, £2,200, to N. Israel (W MS 31/90/96/98).
- xxxix Hours. Acquired from Quaritch, 1916, £1,000 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 72, £16,000, to Maggs Bros., now private collection (W MS 76/91/116/125).
- xl Hours. Acquired at the Red Cross Sale, 26 April 1916, lot 2081, £95 (Q), exchanged with Yahuda (W MS 84/119).
- xli Hours. Acquired from Francis Edwards, 1918, exchanged with Yahuda, 26 May 1930 (D2), now Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, Yah MS Var 4 (W MS XVIII/88/148).
- xlii Hours. Acquired from the Fairfax Murray estate, 1918, £1,200 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 31, £17,000, to Charles W. Traylen (W MS 70/82/89/102/147).
- xliii Hours. Acquired Sotheby's sale, 30 January 1920, lot 131 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 23 (W MS 68B/76/83).
- xliv Hours. Acquired Sotheby's, 30 January 1920, lot 134, £1,950 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 25, £710, to Quaritch, now Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, n. a. lat. 3115 (W MS 75B/85/92/85–92.III).
- xlv Hours. Acquired from Gilhofer and Ranschburg, Vienna, February 1920 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 64, to Quaritch, now **Harvard, Houghton Library, MS**Typ 213 (W MS 34/86/112/120/120.III).
- xlvi Hours. Acquired from Dr. I. Schwartz, Vienna, February 1920, £500 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 55 (W MS 42/89/92/97).
- xlvii Hours. Acquired from Belin, Paris, 1920, exchanged with Yahuda, January 1930 (D2), now **Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, Yah MS Var 9** (W MS XIV/75/118).
- xlviii Hours. Acquired from Ellis, 1920, £400 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 36, £4,500, to Maggs Bros., now **Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS IV 542** (W MS 15/81/98/121/128).
- xlix Hours. Acquired from Maggs Bros., November or December 1923, £450 (D1), given to the Fitzwilliam Museum, 1936, now Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, MS 375 (W MS 77/94).
- Hours. Acquired Paris, February 1924 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 63, £5,500, to Quaritch (W MS 86/88/91/96).
- li Hours. Acquired Sotheby's, 14/15 April 1924, lot 166, £420 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 71, £90,000, to M. Brymer Esq., now Los Angeles, The J. Paul Getty Museum, MS 48 (W MS 85/87/94).
- lii Hours. Acquired privately, 1928 (D1), now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 089 (W MS 85\*/95).
- liii Hours. Acquired Sotheby's, 19 December 1928, lot 579, £71 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 32, £2,400, to Meier Elte, now **The Hague, Koninklijke Bibliotheek, MS 135 E 23** (W MS 87).

- Hours. Acquired in or after 1929. Dismembered while in Beatty's collection. Some liv leaves sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 58. Now dispersed with leaves in collections around the world (W MS 103).
- Hours (Hours of Anne of Austria). Acquired at or after Sotheby's, 3 July 1922, 1v £100, sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 69, £1,800, to Quaritch, now New York, Morgan Library, MS M 1110 (W MS 75C/84/86/93).107
- lvi Hours (Hours of Cardinal della Rovere). Probably acquired at Red Cross Sale, Christie's, 26 April 1916, lot 2082, £236 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 67, £6,500, to Thomas Agnew, now Birmingham, Barber Institute, No. 397 (W MS 18/85/90/113/121).
- lvii Hours (Hours of Charlotte of Savoy). Acquired from Quaritch, 1923, sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 59, £40,000, to A. Haddaway Esq., now New York, Morgan Library, MS M 1004 (W MS 67A/79/86).
- Hours (The Coetivy Hours). Acquired from Henry Yates Thompson by Edith lviii Beattty, 1919, for £4,000 (D1), now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 082 (W MS 33/69/80/87).
- lix Hours (The Comites Latentes Hours). Acquired from Quaritch, 1920 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 68, £2,500, to Alan G. Thomas, now Geneva, Bibliothèque de Genève, Comites Latentes MS 38 (W MS 12/73/83/84/91).
- 1xHours (The De Levis Hours). Acquired from Quaritch, 1916, £2,000 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 53, now Yale, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, MS 400 (W MS 67/78/85.III/115).
- lxi Hours (The Giraldi-Guicciardini Hours). Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 34, £4,000, to Alan G. Thomas, now Stockholm, National Museum, NMB 1960 (W MS 92).
- lxii Hours (The Golf Hours). Acquired from Quaritch, 1918 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 69 (W MS 82/124/131/140).
- lxiii Hours (The Hamilton Field Hours). Acquired in America, 1927, \$2,000, now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 094 (W MS 68A/77/84). 108\*
- lxiv Hours (The Holford Hours). Acquired from the executors of the Holford estate December 1927/January 1928 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 31, £2,800, to Dr. Rosenthal, now Lisbon, Museu Calouste Gulbenkian, MS LA 210 (W MS 122A/123/130).\*
- Hours (Hours of Jean Robertet, a.k.a. The Foucquet Hours). Acquired from the 1xv executors of the Holford estate December 1927/January 1928 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 54, now New York, Morgan Library, MS M 834 (W MS 74/83/90).

<sup>107</sup> See letter from E. G. Millar, 11 April 1924, Chester Beatty Library Archive.

<sup>108</sup> Documentation in Chester Beatty Library Archive.

- lxvi Hours (The Kalmancsehi Hours). Acquisition known, sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 65, £510, to Quaritch for Lucius Wilmerding Esq. (Q), now Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, n. a. lat. 3119 (W MS 111A/114).
- lxvii Hours (Hours of Margriet of Uitenham). Acquired from Sabin, 1924, £200 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 27, £6,200, to Maggs Bros. (W MS 93/97/118).
- lxviii Hours (The Mostyn Hours). Acquired Sotheby's (Mostyn sale), 13 July 1920, lot 63, £355 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 56, now Philadelphia, Philadelphia Museum of Art 1945–65–6 (W MS 79/93/100/143).
- lxix Hours (The Nevill Hours). Acquired Sotheby's, 25 July 1922, lot 584, £100, sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 26, £160, to Quaritch for the Earl of Berkeley, now Berkeley Castle (W MS 78/92/99).
- lxx Hours (The Hours of Nicholas von Firmian). Acquired from Sabin, 1923 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 68, £450, to Rosenthal, now Berlin, Staatsbibliothek, HS 241 (W MS 80/120/127).
- lxxi Hyginus, *De Sideribus*. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 6972), 17

  December 1920, £400 (O), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 60, £580, to Quaritch for New York Public Library, now New York, New York Public Library, Spencer MS 28 (W MS 89/96/106).
- lxxii Isidore of Seville, *Etymologiae*. Acquired from Leighton (D2), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 53, £1,400, to Quaritch (W MS 45A/126).
- lxxiii Jaume Domènech, *Universal History* in Catalan. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 30, £2,200, to Quaritch, subsequently reacquired, now **Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 188** (W MS 180).
- Ixxiv Justinian, Epitoma Historiarum Philippicarum. Now Princeton, University Library, Kane MS 43 (MS 37).
- lxxv Lactantius. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 12283), 17 December 1920, £285 (O), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 57, £160, to Quaritch, now Harvard, Houghton Library, MS Typ 143 (W MS 88/97/103/104/104.III).
- Lactantius, De Divinis Institutionibus/Divinae Institutiones, De Ira Dei, De Opificio, De Ave Phoenice. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 137), November 1925, by Edith Beatty, £550 (O), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 58, £250, now Los Angeles, The J. Paul Getty Museum, MS Ludwig XI, 1 (W MS 103/103A/110/110.III).
- lxxvii Lactantius, *Opera*. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 66, £4,000, to Alan G. Thomas, now Cologny, Fondation Martin Bodmer, Cod. Bodmer 104 (W MS 121).
- Ixxviii Lectionary written for Cardinal Marino Grimani. Probably acquired at Hodgson's sale, 9 November 1922, lot 388, £100 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 32 (W MS 115C/126).
- lxxix *Legenda Aurea.* Acquisition unknown, exchanged with Prof. Yahuda, 18 December 1928 (D2), now Yale, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, MS 111.
- lxxx Livy, *De Secundo Bello Punico*. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 3010), 17 December 1920, £500 (O), Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 59, £440, to Quaritch for

- New York Public Library, now New York, New York Public Library, Spencer MS 27 (W MS 99/104/105/112).
- 1xxxi Livy, De Secundo Bello Punico Libri Decem. Acquired from Paul Gruppe, Berlin, 15 April 1929, lot 4, £1,466, via Quaritch (Q), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 29, £18,000, to Maggs Bros. (W MS 118).
- lxxxii Missae de Virgine. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 70, £900, to Leo S. Olschki (W MS 114).
- lxxxiii Missal. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 22, £4,800, to L. S. Olschki (W MS 115).
- 1xxxiv Missal (Colonna Missal). Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 7 June 1932, lot 33, to Quaritch, now Manchester, John Rylands Library (W MS 128).
- Missal (Lamberti Missale). Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, 1xxxv lot 62, £1,000, to Quaritch, now Munster, Bibliothek Universität Münster, MS NR 1003 (W MS 109).
- 1xxxvi Missal (of San Petrino). Acquired from Ellis, 1924, £1,050 (D1), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 66, to Prof. Pitti, now New York, New York Public Library, Spencer MS 64 (W MS 111/115/123).
- lxxxvii Missal (Utrecht Missal). Acquisition unknown, exchanged with Yahuda, January 1929 (D2), now Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, Yah MS Var 16 (W MS
- lxxxviii Odo of Morimond, Commentary on the Old Testament. Acquisition unknown, given to Eric Millar, 1 July 1926, now Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS IV 191.109
- Origen and Jerome, Commentaries on the Epistles of St Paul. Acquired by Edith lxxxix Beatty, sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 42, £3,000, to Leo S. Olschki (W MS 105).
- Ovid, Metamorphoses. Acquisition unknown, given to Eric Millar. 110 XC
- Paul the Deacon, Homilary. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 6659), xci November 1925, by Edith Beatty, £300 (O), sold Sotheby's, 3 December 1968, lot 2, £14,000, to Martin Breslauer, now Cologny, Fondation Martin Bodmer, Cod. Bodmer 128 (W MS 5A/110/132).
- Petrarach. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no. 250), 17 December 1920, xcii £115 (O).
- xciii Pietro de' Crescenzi, Liber ruralium commodorium. Acquired from Quaritch, 1919, presented to Mr. Marks, 26 May 1930 (D2).
- Pietro de' Crescenzi, Liber ruralium. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 3 Decemxciv ber 1968, lot 26, £5,000, to Rainer.
- Polybius, Historiae. Acquired from Quaritch, after 1919 (R), sold Sotheby's, 9 May XCV 1933, lot 62, £195, to Quaritch, now Cologny, Fondation Martin Bodmer, Cod. Bodmer 139 (W MS 52/110/109/117/117.III).

<sup>109</sup> Turner, "Manuscripts Owned by Eric Millar," 11.

<sup>110</sup> De Ricci, "Les Manuscrits de la Collection Henry Yates Thompson," 19; Turner, "Manuscripts Owned by Eric Millar," 15.

xcvi	Pontifical (The Broadley Pontifical). Acquired from Sabin (D1), sold Sotheby's,
	9 May 1933, lot 67, to Quaritch, now Harvard, Houghton Library, MS Typ 217
	(W MS 112A/116/124).
xcvii	Proprium Missarum de Sanctis. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 3 December
	1968, lot 8, £2,000, to Alan G. Thomas (W MS 111).
xcviii	Psalter. Acquired from Quaritch, May 1916, now Senshu University, MS 7 (MS 10).
xcix	Quintilian, De Institutione Oratoria. Acquired from the Phillipps Collection (no.
	3009), 17 December 1920, £250 (O), sold Sotheby's, 24 June 1969, lot 60, £12000,
	to Maggs Bros. (W MS 86/98/101/105/120).
С	Rosarium. Acquisition unknown, now Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, W 099
	(W MS 122/123/129).
cii	Sallust, Catilinae Coniuratio and Bellum Iugurthinum. Now Princeton, University
	Library, Kane MS 33. <sup>111</sup>
ciii	Sallust, De Bello Catilinae. Acquired Sotheby's, 13 July 1920 (Mostyn Sale), lot 104,
	£48 (Q), sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 61, £115, to Maggs Bros., now Harvard,
	Houghton Library, MS Richardson 17 (W MS 107/109/115/123).
civ	Sermons. Acquired from Leighton 1917, exchanged with Yahuda, 26 May 1930
	(D2), now Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, Yah MS Var 12 (W MS XV*/48).
cv	Sextus Iulius Frontinus, Strategemata. Acquired Sotheby's, 30 January 1920, sold
	Sotheby's, 28 March 1922, now Princeton, University Library, Kane MS 48
	(MS 27). <sup>112</sup>
cvi	Statutes of the Order of the Garter. Acquisition unknown, sold Sotheby's, 24 June
	1969 (W MS 199).
cvii	Statutes of the Order of St. Michael. Acquired from the executors of the Holford
	estate December 1927/January 1928, sold Sotheby's, 9 May 1933, lot 70 (W MS

In addition, there are records of manuscript purchases that may or may not relate to manuscripts

Vitruvius. Acquired Sotheby's, 14 July 1920 (Mostyn Sale), lot 125, £82 (Q).

Terence, Comedies. Acquisition unknown, given to Eric Millar. 113

Hours. Acquired Sotheby's, 21–22 December 1915, lot 29, £20 (Q). Hours. Acquired Sotheby's, 16–17 November 1925, lot 164, £30 (Q). *Introits*. Acquired Sotheby's, 21–22 December 1915, lot 37, £19 (Q).

116A/129).\*

included in the list above:

cviii cix

<sup>111</sup> Index of Christian Art. This manuscript may have been purchased, but returned in 1920, see Skemer, *Medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts*, 2:76.

<sup>112</sup> Skemer, Medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts, 2:111.

<sup>113</sup> Turner, "Manuscripts Owned by Eric Millar," 16.

## LIST OF MANUSCRIPTS CITED

Baltimore, Walters Art Museum

W 751: 451, 470

W 759-62: 474

W 777: 473

Bangkok, Wat Hua Krabu Manuscript: 431, 432 fig. 1

Berlin, Staatsbibliothek

HS 241: 480

Birmingham, Barber Institute No. 397: 479

Boston, Boston Public Library MS 1532: 473

Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale

MS IV 191: 481 MS IV 542: 478

Bryn Mawr, PA, Bryn Mawr College Gordan MS 95: 527–28, 527 fig. 1, 528 nn. 15–16

Cambridge, MA, Harvard University,

Houghton Library

MS Richardson 17: 482 MS Richardson 26: 471

MS Typ 141: 476

MS Typ 143: 480 MS Typ 200: 472

MS Typ 201: 474

MS Typ 202: 472

MS Typ 213: 478

MS Typ 217: 482

MS Typ 228: 474

MS Typ 703: 476

Cambridge, UK, Corpus Christi College

MS 4: 585

MS 32: 338, 338 n. 25, 343 n. 34, 355 n. 61

Cambridge, UK, Fitzwilliam Museum

MS 251, fol. 15r: 585

MS 276: 586

MS 159: 587

MS 330: 472, 585

MS 375: 462, 478

Collegeville, MN, Saint John's University,

Ethiopian Manuscript Microfilm Library

MS no. 4553: 414 n. 69

Cologne, Historisches Archiv

Best. 7010-293: 585

Cologny, Fondation Martin Bodmer

Cod. Bodmer 14: 476

Cod. Bodmer 68: 470

Cod. Bodmer 104: 480

Cod. Bodmer 128: 481

Cod. Bodmer 139: 481

Cod. Bodmer 183: 474

Dublin, Chester Beatty Library

Thai MS 1341: 432

Thai MS 1343: 433

W 017: 471

W 029: 471

W 040: 472

W 043: 472

W 061: 474

W 066: 474

W 076: 457 fig. 3, 475

W 078: 475

W 080: 475 W 082: 453, 454 fig. 1, 458, 479 W 089: 478 W 094: 479 W 099: 482	Yah MS Var 11: 467 n. 96, 477 Yah MS Var 12: 467 n. 96, 482 Yah MS Var 13: 475, 467 n. 96 Yah MS Var 14–15: 476, 467 n. 96 Yah MS Var 16: 467 n. 96, 481	
W 107: 477 W 108: 477 W 113: 477 W 122: 477	Kew, The National Archives PROB 11/49/251: 375 n. 15–16, 378 n. 31 PROB 11/116/532: 377 n. 24	
W 124: 476 W 127: 476 W 188: 480	Lichfield, Cathedral Library MS 1: 483–98	
W MS 103 (formerly; now dismembered): 455 fig. 2, 456	Lisbon, Museu Calouste Gulbenkian MS LA 210: 479	
Dunhuang Nai 93: 499, 502–7, 503 n. 8 Tama 24: 499, 502–7, 503 n. 8	London, British Library Add. 38662: 296–327, 296 n. 1, 299 fig. 1, 306 n. 26	
Florence, Bibl. Medicea Laurenziana MS Or. 148: 423	Add. 38663: 296–327, 296 n. 1, 299 fig. 2, 306 n. 26 Add. 38664: 296 n. 1	
Geneva, Bibliothèque de Genève Comites Latentes MS 15: 474 Comites Latentes MS 38: 479	Add. 40142: 296–327, 296 n. 1, 301 fig. 3, 306 n. 26 Add. 40143: 296 n. 1	
Ghent, Universiteitbibliotheek MS 92: 569	Add. MS 43460: 469 Add. MS 48985: 474 Add MS 52660: 452 n. 33–34, 462 n. 70,	
Göttingen, Niedersächsische Staats- und-Universitätsbibliothek MS Uffenb. 51 cim.: 585	466 n. 90–91 Add. MS 52653: 446 n. 6, 447 n. 7, 449 n. 16–17 Add. MS 52656: 458 n. 51 Add. MS 52657: 458 n. 49, 472 n. 99, 476 n. 106 Add. MS 52658: 452 n. 31 Add. MS 52662: 459 n. 55, 461 n. 67, 462 n. 68 Add. MS 52670: 460 n. 58, 462 n. 72	
The Hague, Koninklijke Bibliotheek MS 135 E 23: 478 MS 135 J 8: 477		
The Hague, Museum Meermanno- Westreenianum MS 10 B 23: 355 n. 61		
Hildesheim, Dombibliothek MS St Godehard 1: 355 n. 61	and 75 Add. MS 52692: 462 n. 73 Add. MS 53652: 445 n. 1	
Jerusalem, National Library of Israel Yah MS Var 4: 467 n. 96, 478 Yah MS Var 8: 467 n. 96, 477 Yah MS Var 9: 467 n. 96, 478	Cotton MS Nero A XI: 311 Egerton MS 3055: 472 Egerton MS 3088: 473 Egerton MS 3089: 471	

# List of Manuscripts Cited | 591

MS Harley 1862: 335 n. 23	Milan, Biblioteca Nazionale Braidense
MS. Harley 3698: 390 n. 63	AC IX 36: 473
MS Harley 3915: 585	Manga Pihliatan Canitalan
MS Laud Misc. 511: 336 n. 24, 347	Monza, Biblioteca Capitolare
MS Royal 15 D 1: 355 n. 61	Monza a-3/10: 514 n. 24
MS Royal 17: 328 n. 1	Monza a-3: 513 n. 18, 514, 514 n. 21,
MS Royal 17 C.xxxiii (Royal C): 328 n.	515 n. 27
1, 333, 335–36, 336 fig. 1, 346 n. 37, 365	Monza a-4: 513 n. 18
n. 67	Monza a-5: 513 n. 18, 515 n. 29
MS Royal 17 D.viii (Royal D): 333, 335-	Monza a-6: 513 n. 19, 516 n. 30, 518–19
37, 337 fig. 2, 346 n. 37, 348 n. 46, 349	Monza a-7: 513 n. 19
n. 47, 352 n. 50, 365 n. 67	Monza a-8: 513 n. 18
MS. Sloane 334: 390 n. 63	Monza a-9: 513 n. 19
MS. Sloane 512: 390 n. 63	Monza a-10: 513 n. 19, 514 n. 20, 516
OR. 13703: 433, 434 fig. 2	n. 31, 517 fig. 2
Or. 16552: 434	Monza a-11: 513 n. 19, 516 n. 31
Yates Thompson MS 7: 450 n. 19	Monza a-12: 513 n. 18
1	Monza a-13: 513 n. 19, 516 n. 31
London, London Metropolitan Archives,	Monza a-14: 513 n. 18–19, 516 n. 31
Guildhall Library	Monza a-15: 513 n. 17
MS. 5265/1: 376 n. 17, 377 n. 25,	Monza a-16: 513 n. 19, 516 n. 32
380 n. 36	Monza a-17: 513 n. 19, 516 n. 31
MS. 9051/5: 378 n. 30, 385 n. 50	Monza a-18: 513 n. 19, 516 n. 32
MS. 9171/15: 378 n. 28	Monza a-19: 513 n. 19
	Monza a-20: 513 n. 18
London, Quaritch Archives	Monza a-21: 513 n. 18
Commission Book for 1914–1917: 446	Monza a-22: 513 n. 18, 514 n. 24, 515 n
n. 2–3	27, 516 n. 30, 519
Commission Book for 1917–1920: 450	Monza a-23: 513 n. 19, 514 n. 24, 515
n. 19 and 21	n. 27
Commission Book for 1921–1926: 461	Monza a-24: 513 n. 18
n. 62–63	Monza a-25: 513 n. 18, 514 n. 24, 515
T 1 TT: 1 A11 . 3 6	n. 27
London, Victoria and Albert Museum	Monza a-26: 513 n. 19
MS 16: 472	Monza a-27: 513 n. 16
MS Ludwig V 6: 475	Monza b-1: 513 n. 16
MS Ludwig IX 3.: 474	Monza b-2: 513 n. 19, 516 n. 31
P.159–1910: 585	Monza b-3: 513 n. 19, 515, 515 n. 25
Los Appeles The L Deul Cetty Museum	Monza b-4: 513 n. 19, 515, 515 n. 28
Los Angeles, The J. Paul Getty Museum	Monza b-5: 513 n. 19, 514 n. 24, 515
MS 48: 478	n. 27
MS Ludwig XI, 1: 480	Monza b-7: 513 n. 16
Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional	Monza b-9: 514 n. 24, 515 n. 27
MSS/11267/21: 542	Monza e-4: 513 n. 18, 516 n. 31

# 592 | Journal for Manuscript Studies

Monza e-5: 513 n. 18 Monza e-6: 513 n. 17 and 19	Oslo, Schøyen Collection MS 50: 470–71
Monza e-8: 513 n. 19 Monza e-9: 513 n. 16 Monza e-11: 513 n. 18 Monza e-13: 513 n. 19, 516 n. 31, 519 Monza i-11: 513 n. 17	Oxford, Bodleian Library Digby 23: 322, 322–23 n. 87 MS 48: 326 n. 100 MS. Ashmole 1505: 369–91, 371 fig. 1, 272 fig. 2, 373 figs. 3–4, 374 fig. 5 MS Bodley 978: 328–68, 328 n. 1, 341 n. 33, 342 fig. 3, 343 fig. 4, 344 fig. 5, 346 n 37, 347 n. 43, 348 n. 46, 349 fig. 6, 349 n 47–48, 352 n. 50–51, 353 n. 55, 357 fig. 7 358 n. 64, 361 fig. 8, 361 n. 67, 362 n. 68 366 n. 78, 368 n. 80 MS Pali a.27 (R): 428 n. 3, 431, 444 MS Phillipps-Robinson C 719: 450 n. 22–24, 451 n. 25–26 and 29, 458 n. 47, 459 n. 53–54 Oxford, Lincoln College MS Lat. 150: 473
Münster, Bibliothek Universität Münster MS NR 1003: 481  New Haven, Yale University, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library MS 111: 480 MS 400: 449, 449 n. 18, 479 MS 402: 471 MS 407: 475 MS 413: 470	
MS 414: 472 MS Osborn fa42: 472	
New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art 1997.320: 473	Oxford, Trinity College MS 93: 332 n. 14, 583
New York, Morgan Library and Museum ARC 1310: 458 n. 50, 463 n. 78 MS G 17: 471	Oxford, Worcester College MS E. 10. 7: 583
MS M 777: 450 n. 21, 471 MS M 808: 473 MS M 826: 469 MS M 855: 473 MS M 860: 470 MS M 862: 470 MS M 883: 471 MS M 939: 472	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France MS Éth. 35: 415 n. 71 MS fr. 24766: 300, 300–301 n. 7, 302 fig. 4, 304–5, 309 MSS n.a.f. 15939–15944: 475 MS n. a. lat. 3115: 478 MS n. a. lat. 3119: 480
MS M 962: 471  New York, New York Public Library  MS M 924-470	Paris, l'École française d'Extrême-Orient EFEO 39: 434, 435 fig. 3 EFEO 40: 432
MS M 834: 479 MS M 1004: 479 MS M 1110: 479 Spencer MS 27: 451, 480–81 Spencer MS 28: 480 Spencer MS 29: 477 Spencer MS 64: 481	Phillipps, Sir Thomas, collection of MS 125: 474 MS 134/3948: 475 MS 137: 480 MS 240: 477 MS 250: 480

MS 385: 472

Thai MS.6: 432

# List of Manuscripts Cited | 593

MS 389: 4/0	MS 12348: 4/1	
MS 390: 470	MS 14122: 451, 470	
MS 437: 477	MS 21948: 471	
MS 934/2708: 471	Private Archive of the Escalante family	
MS 1036: 473	Historia de los reyes moros de Granada:	
MS 1092: 472	544–67, 548 fig. 1, 550 n. 18 and 22–23,	
MS MS 1347: 452	•	
MS 1798: 456, 459, 475	551 fig. 2, 551 n. 24, 553 fig. 3, 554 fig. 4,	
MS 2164: 458	555 fig. 5	
MS 2165/21787: 470	Petchaburi, Thailand, Wat Lat	
MS 2251: 477	Manuscript: 433	
MS 2506: 463, 476	DI 1 1 1 1 DI 1 1 1 1 A CA	
MS 3009: 482	Philadelphia, Philadelphia Museum of Art	
MS 3010: 451, 480	1945–65–6: 480	
MS 3075: 470	Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania	
MS 3339: 474	Rare Book and Manuscript Library	
MS 3344: 471	MS Codex 730: 528, 530 fig. 3, 531, 531	
MS 3383: 474	nn. 20–22, 532 nn. 23–26 and 30–34,	
MS 3502: 459, 477	533 nn. 37-39, 41, 43-47, 49 and 53,	
MS 3535: 471	534 nn. 56-60, 62-63 and 65-73, 535	
MS 3633: 452	nn. 74–75, 80–82 and 84, 536 n. 85, 87	
MS 3674: 471	and 90–95, 537 nn. 96–99, 101–2 and	
MS 3897: 474, 477	104–113, 538 nn. 119–22, 124–25, 128–	
MS 3948: 456	33 and 135–6, 539 nn. 137–40, 145–50	
MS 4259: 473	and 152	
MS 4448: 473	MS Codex 741: 528, 529 fig. 2, 531, 531	
MS 4597: 472	nn. 20–22, 532 nn. 23–30, 32 and 35, 533	
MS 4600: 474	nn. 36, 40, 42, 46–48 and 50–52, 534 nn.	
MS 4769: 471	54–58, 60–67 and 71, 535 nn. 74–83, 536	
MS 4790: 456	nn. 85–90, 93 and 95, 537 nn. 97 and	
MS 6546: 470	99–115, 538 nn. 116–20, 123, 125–27,	
MS 6640: 477	129–31 and 133–34, 539 nn. 141–43,	
MS 6659: 480	145–46 and 151	
MS 6972: 480	Ms. Coll. 591: 509 n. 4, 510 fig. 1	
MS 7084: 477	1710. Con. 371. 307 II. 1, 310 IIg. 1	
MS 10190: 470	Princeton, Princeton University Library	
MS 12200: 473	Kane MS 31: 476	
MS 12260: 470	Kane MS 33: 482	
MS 12260: 470 MS 12262: 470	Kane MS 43: 480	
MS 12263: 470 MS 12263: 470	Kane MS 48: 482	
	MS Garrett 143: 296 n. 1	
MS 12264: 470	Domo Ribliotoca Casanatanas	
MS 12269: 472	Rome, Biblioteca Casanatense	
MS 12283: 480	MS 969: 269	

### 594 | Journal for Manuscript Studies

MS 1730: 267–95, 267 n. 1, 267–68 n. 3, 268 n. 4, 269 n. 6, 270 fig. 1, 272 figs. 2–3, 273 fig. 4, 277 fig. 5, 277 nn. 17–21, 278 figs. 6–7, 279 n. 22, 280 figs. 8–9, 280 n. 23, 281 figs. 10–11, 281 n. 24, 282 nn. 25–27, 283 figs. 12–14, 284 n. 28, 285 figs. 15–16, 285 n. 29, 286 n. 30, 287 figs. 17–18, 288 fig. 19, 288 n. 31, 289 fig. 20, 290 figs. 21–22, 291 fig. 23, 291 n. 32, 292 fig. 24, 293 fig. 25 MS 2206: 421 n. 75

Rome, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale

VE 1006: 470 VE 1190: 469 VE 1347: 470 VE 1348: 470 VE 1357: 470

VE Sessor 590: 470

San Lorenzo de El Escorial, Real Biblioteca del Monasterio de El Escorial Y/III/6: 542, 558 n. 31

San Marino, Huntington Library HM 31151: 471

Siena, Biblioteca Comunale degli Intronati MS D V 13: 405 n. 37, 418, 420 fig. 2

Stockholm, Nationalmuseum NMB 1960: 479

Stuttgart, Landesbibliothek Theol. & Phil. Fol. 341: 472 Tokyo, Senshu University MS 7: 467, 467 n. 95, 482

Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana Stamp. Barb. A VIII 18,: 403, 408 n. 51, 420

Vat. et. 1: 400, 400 n. 25, 409–10, 410 n. 59, 421 n. 75, 422, 424 fig. 5, 425, 425 n. 81, 426

Vat. et. 2: 400, 400 n. 25, 401, 409, 425-26

Vat. et. 5: 407

Vat. et. 10: 425 n. 82

Vat. et. 15: 406, 406 n. 39, 425

Vat. et. 16-18: 425 n. 82

Vat. et. 25: 406-7 n. 44, 407

Vat. et. 35: 400, 406, 406 nn. 39–40, 409, 409 n. 53, 421, 422 fig. 3, 425 n. 82, 426

Vat. et. 40: 426

Vat. et. 42, 49, 52, and 57: 425 n. 82

Vat. et. 66: 400, 402–6, 406 n. 39, 407 n.

45, 408 n. 51, 409, 411, 418, 419 fig. 1,

423 n. 80, 425 n. 82, 426

Vat. lat. Ms. 2648: 269 Vat. lat. Ms. 3978: 269

Vat. lat. Ms. 5092: 269

Vat. lat. Ms. 6177: 398 n. 15, 401 n. 29

Vat. lat. Ms. 6178: 398 n. 16

Vaticano Rossiano 865 MS Vat. Ross 865: 400, 400 n. 25, 409, 422, 423 fig. 4, 426

Vatican City, Archivio Segreto Vaticano AA., Arm. I–XVIII, no. 2953: 395 nn. 7–8, 396 nn. 9–10, 397 nn. 13–14, 398 nn. 17–18, 404 n. 34, 416 n. 72