Accepted Manuscript

Evolution of Koch's postulates: towards a twenty-first century understanding of microbial infection

Guido Antonelli, Sally Cutler

PII: S1198-743X(16)30048-9

DOI: 10.1016/j.cmi.2016.03.030

Reference: CMI 563

To appear in: Clinical Microbiology and Infection

Received Date: 25 March 2016

Accepted Date: 29 March 2016

Please cite this article as: Antonelli G, Cutler S, Evolution of Koch's postulates: towards a twenty-first century understanding of microbial infection, *Clinical Microbiology and Infection* (2016), doi: 10.1016/j.cmi.2016.03.030.

This is a PDF file of an unedited manuscript that has been accepted for publication. As a service to our customers we are providing this early version of the manuscript. The manuscript will undergo copyediting, typesetting, and review of the resulting proof before it is published in its final form. Please note that during the production process errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.



- 1 Evolution of Koch's postulates: towards a twenty-first century understanding
- 2 of microbial infection.

3

4 Guido Antonelli ¹ and Sally Cutler^{2*}

5

- 6 1 Department of Molecular Medicine and ^Pasteur Institute Cenci Bolognetti
- 7 Foundation, "Sapienza" University of Rome, Italy
- 8 2 School of Health, Sport & Bioscience, University of East London, London,
- 9 E15 4LZ, UK
- 10 *Corresponding author: email: s.cutler@uel.ac.uk

12	From the conception of what became known as Koch's postulates (or Henle-
13	Koch's postulates in recognition of Henle's prior conceptualisation of infection
14	theory) through to our current era, microbiologists have wrestled with the
15	problem of infectious agent attribution. Robert Koch himself appreciated that
16	their might be exceptions, or even flaws, in his proposed guide for
17	establishing causality for microbial infections, in particular when dealing with
18	the requirement for the infectious agent to grow and to "produce the disease
19	anew" in experimental vertebrates [1]. Indeed, some researchers of the time
20	struggled to fulfil these postulates resulting in delay in the publication of their
21	findings such as, for instance, the causal relationship of Borrelia recurrentis
22	for louse-borne relapsing fever. Here laboratory animals proved refractory to
23	this human-adapted infection, which coupled with the inability to cultivate this
24	spirochaete, challenged fulfilment of the above postulates [2].
25	
26	Birth of the field of virology confirmed the inadequacy of a stringent adherence
27	to the criteria postulated by Koch. Determination of causality had to be
28	relaxed to accommodate asymptomatic carriage, but also the complexity of
29	recovering these infectious agents and successfully demonstrating infection in
30	animal models. Further evidence of causality was gleaned from use of
31	serological criteria whereby appearance of antibodies against the proposed
32	pathogenic virus could corroborate its role in disease aetiology and was
33	indeed instrumental, for instance, in elucidating the role of Epstein-Barr virus
34	in causing infectious mononucleosis [1].

36	Attempts to update Koch's postulates were introduced using a molecular
37	variant of these [3]. These pragmatic guidelines were essential to prevent
38	falsely incriminated microbes being correlated with pathological causality
39	through "guilt by association" (see table 1).
40	
41	The paradigm was further challenged by our increasing understanding of
42	microbial infection including, for examples: modulation between latency and
43	overt infective episodes; appreciation of mixed polymicrobial biofilm infections;
44	the certainty that one organism might have a causative role in various
45	clinically distinct infections whilst others show a more narrow clinical
46	presentation; the ability of some pathogens to cause differing clinical
47	pathologies and similarly, unrelated infectious agents to produce
48	indistinguishable disease consequences. Host factors must not be
49	overlooked, with different immunological predispositions, efficacies resulting in
50	a gradient of clinical consequences following infection. Furthermore, existing
51	prior infections might have provoked an immune response that is poorly
52	aligned to tackle the current pathogen, thus such immunological dissonance
53	might facilitate heightened spread or indeed provoke pathological destructive
54	consequences.
55	
56	Intertwined with these host factors, we must also consider the composition of
57	our normal flora and its ability to deter the ingress of pathogens either directly
58	or indirectly through colonisation resistance [4]. Our appreciation of complex
59	microbial communities and their influence over development of disease is still
60	in its infancy.

61	Currently disease attribution demands that complex interactions whereby
62	location, host factors and possession of virulence genes combine contributory
63	influences regarding pathological consequences. Others suggest that
64	successful intervention should also be included, however given the increasing
65	levels of antimicrobial resistance, this may now be a less informative criteria.
66	
67	Singh et al. eloquently review these challenging dilemmas within this issue [5].
68	They detail the microbial dysbiosis observed in patients with inflammatory
69	bowel disease and explore our current knowledge of the underpinning factors
70	that facilitate this condition. They argue the need for expansion of Koch's
71	postulates to accommodate the multitude of microbial triggers and highlight
72	that a common profile for this dysbiosis is probably unrealistic, however, with
73	such modifications, Koch's postulates still offer value in demonstrating
74	causality. Importantly, they note that though experimental models can
75	reproduce inflammatory bowel responses, these are rarely followed for
76	sufficient duration to demonstrate the chronic and relapsing picture typified by
77	Crohn's disease or ulcerative colitis.
78	Additional issue with which we have to deal with when the evolution of Koch's
79	postulates is addressed come from virology. It is now clear that, together with
80	the major known pathogenic viruses, many other viruses are present in
81	clinical samples and that the totality of these agents, defined as human
82	virome, is an integral part of the microbiotic universe that makes us healthy
83	[6]. In this framework, we know that human Torquetenovirus TTV), the most
84	abundant virus within the virome, has a remarkable ability to produce chronic
85	infections with no clearly associated clinical manifestations, gaining the status

of orphan virus. Focosi et al. in this issue summarize recent findings about TTV and review its characteristics [7].

The review by Gentile and Micozzi deals with further emerging concepts regarding viral infections whereby some cause a life-threatening illness whilst in others with similar risks, present with only a limited or benign illness, if indeed any consequences of infection are noted. The authors speculate that some viruses, other than those causing viral diseases, and beyond those existing as chronic commensal long-lived infectious accrued throughout lifetime, may exert a physiological protective effect on the host through "transkingdom interactions" and immunomodulatory effects, also potentially providing anti-tumour protection [5].

Now that we have embarked upon the whole genomic sequencing era, further adaptations of causality guidelines for infectious diseases are warranted. The powerful combination of cultivation approaches assessed against the backdrop of the local microbial consortia in its entirety might collectively provide deeper insights into causality for infectious diseases [4]. We can further embed this approach within the emerging iterative computational field of systems biology whereby a milieu of molecular interactive networks can potentially predict pathological interactions and outcomes between microbes and their host. Though still in its infancy, the technological impacts of this emerging discipline could revolutionise diagnostics and furnish us with new intervention possibilities [6].

1	1	1	
L	Τ	Τ	

In the light of the above considerations, it is tempting to speculate that, finally, we still fail to have consensus by which infectious disease causation can be established without doubt. Largely this dilemma arises from the continuum of interactions demonstrated between microbes and their host, necessitating our understanding of this complex interplay and underpinning factors that influence whether this will manifest as asymptomatic carriage or development of life-threatening pathological consequences.

120 Table: Criteria for causality over the ages

Suggested causality indicators	Year	Reference
Diseases might be caused by microorganisms	1838	Henle cited by [1]
 Parasite occurs in every case of the disease under circumstances that could account for observed pathology Parasite is absent from those without the disease It can be reproducibly grown in pure culture It can induce the disease anew 	1891	Koch cited by [1]
 Specific virus must regularly be found associated with a disease. Virus must be shown to occur in the sick individuals but not as an incidental or accidental finding, instead being the cause of the disease under investigation. 	1937	[7]
 New virus established by laboratory passage (animal/tissue culture) Repeatedly isolated from human specimen and not a contaminant derived from host used to propagate the virus Antibody response increasing as a result of infection Agent compared with other similar viruses Constant association with specific illness Double blind studies with human volunteers should reproduce clinical disease Cross-sectional and longitudinal studies to identify patterns of disease Preventable by use of specific vaccine 	1957	[8]
 Nucleic acid sequence belongs to a putative pathogen and is present in most cases of an infectious disease preferentially associated with pathology Lower copy number or absence of these sequences from those without disease Decrease or absence following treatment/recovery Detection predates disease or sequence copy number correlated with severity Congruence with biological knowledge Correlation with areas of tissue pathology Reproducible findings 	1996	[3]
Sequencing microbial communityComputational models to assess presence and	2016	[4]

proportion for resulting pathology

- Isolation of microbes of interest from diseased host
- Testing of fresh isolates and consortia in relevant disease model

122 123		References:
124	1	Evans AS. Causation and disease: The henle-koch postulates revisited.
125		Yale Journal of Biology and Medicine. 1976; 49: 175-195.
126	2	Birkhaug K. Otto h. F. Obermeier. In: Moulton FR, ed. <i>A symposium on</i>
127		relapsing fever in the americas. Washington: American Association for the
128		Advancement of Science. Section on Medical Sciences 1942; 7-9.
129	3	Fredricks DN, Relman DA. Sequence-based identification of microbial
130		pathogens: A reconsideration of koch's postulates. Clinical Microbiology
131		Reviews. 1996; 9 : 18-33.
132	4	Byrd AL, Segre JA. Adapting koch's postulates: Criteria for disease
133		causation must take microbial interactions into account. Science. 2016;
134		351 : 224-226.
135	5	Gentile G, Micozzi A. Speculations on the clinical significance of
136		asymptomatic viral infections. Clinical Microbiology and Infection. 2016.
137	6	Dix A, Vlaic S, Guthke R, Linde J. Use of systems biology to decipher host
138		microbial interactions and predict pathological consequences. Clinical
139		Microbiology and Infection. 2016.
140	7	Rivers TM. Viruses and koch's postulates. Journal of Bacteriology. 1937;
141		33 : 1-12.
142	8	Huebner RJ. The virologist's dilemma. Annals of the New York Academy of
143		Sciences. 1957; 67 : 430-438.
144		