



Walden University
ScholarWorks

Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies


Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies
Collection

2019

Instructional Practices of Career and Technical Teachers toward English Language Learners

Alan Kendall Crouch
Walden University

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.waldenu.edu/dissertations>

 Part of the [Bilingual, Multilingual, and Multicultural Education Commons](#), and the [Other Education Commons](#)

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies Collection at ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact ScholarWorks@waldenu.edu.

Walden University

College of Education

This is to certify that the doctoral study by

Alan K. Crouch

has been found to be complete and satisfactory in all respects,
and that any and all revisions required by
the review committee have been made.

Review Committee

Dr. Steven Wells, Committee Chairperson, Education Faculty

Dr. Christopher Cale, Committee Member, Education Faculty

Dr. Amy White, University Reviewer, Education Faculty

Chief Academic Officer

Eric Riedel, Ph.D.

Walden University

2019

Abstract

Instructional Practices of Career and Technical Teachers toward English Language

Learners

by

Alan K. Crouch

MS, Florida Institute of Technology, 1999

BS, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, 1981

Doctoral Study Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Education

Walden University

June 2019

Abstract

In Midwestern high schools, English language learners (ELLs) who are enrolled in Career and Technical Education (CTE) classes transition from school to the workforce at unacceptably low levels. This loss of opportunity has been linked to CTE instructional practices. The purpose of this study was to explore the instructional practices used by CTE teachers to support ELL instruction and how the teachers perceive those practices to improve ELL transition from school to the workforce. The conceptual framework included Freire's critical consciousness theory, which holds that it is important to include learners in the learning process. The framework grounded the study by linking student-centered teaching research to improved ELL outcomes. This basic qualitative study was conducted in secondary school settings in the urban Midwest. Data were collected from 8 CTE education teachers through semistructured interviews and data analyzed by using open and a priori codes. The codes were placed into categories from which themes emerged. Primary themes indicated that CTE teachers apply certain instructional practices with ELLs and perceive that they help ELLs transition to the workforce. These practices include classroom management techniques, adapting curriculum, instructional consistency, questioning techniques, developing community partnerships, and teaching culturally relevant subject matter. A project, in the form of a policy recommendation paper, was created and may translate to an increased number of high school ELL graduates who are prepared to enter the workforce with the skills necessary to be successful. The findings contribute to positive social change through increased understanding of CTE instructional practices toward ELLs.

Instructional Practices of Career and Technical Teachers toward English Language
Learners

by

Alan K. Crouch

MS, Florida Institute of Technology 1999

BS, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, 1981

Doctoral Study Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree of
Doctor of Education

Walden University

June 2019

Acknowledgments

I want to acknowledge those who helped me along the way, my mother, wife, family, and friends. My loving wife, Paula Walker Crouch, has been my guiding spirit behind this journey. She allowed me the time and support needed to complete this long journey. Were it not for her love and understanding, this goal would not be possible. I want to acknowledge the support of my two daughters, Stephanie and Samantha, who gave me the freedom and support to spend time on my personal journey. I also want to acknowledge my efforts were inspired by my father, Dr. Bob Crouch, and my mentors, Dr. Gary Rhodes, Dr. Genene LeRosen, and Dr. Bob Heinz.

Table of Contents

Section 1: The Problem.....	1
The Local Problem.....	1
Rationale	3
Definition of Terms.....	6
Significance.....	8
Research Questions.....	9
Review of the Literature	10
Implications.....	34
Summary.....	34
Section 2: The Methodology.....	36
Qualitative Research Design and Approach	36
Participants.....	41
Data Collection	45
Data Analysis	57
Data Analysis Results	62
Conclusion	81
Section 3: The Project.....	83
Introduction.....	83
Rationale	87
Review of the Literature	88
Project Description.....	97

Project Evaluation Plan.....	98
Project Implications	99
Conclusion	100
Section 4: Reflections and Conclusions.....	101
Project Strengths and Limitations.....	101
Recommendations for Alternative Approaches	103
Scholarship, Project Development, and Leadership and Change	104
Reflection on the Importance of the Work	105
Implications, Applications, and Directions for Future Research.....	107
Conclusion	109
References.....	110
Appendix A: A Policy Recommendation with Detail Report.....	146
Appendix B: Interview Protocol	161
Appendix C: Coding Process	164

Section 1: The Problem

English language learners (ELLs) in American high schools are faced with many obstacles to graduation (Vafai, 2016). Because ELLs face challenges when assimilating into mainstream communities, it is important that all stakeholders in the community, including Career and Technical Education (CTE) teachers, help students succeed (Vocke, Westine, Applegate, & VanDonkelaar, 2016). CTE programs prepare students to enter the workforce by providing training in subjects such as culinary arts, computer literacy, carpentry, etc. CTE programs are popular with students who do not see college as a viable or desirable option (J. W. Rojewski & Hill, 2017). Increasing the number of ELL graduates with employable skills will benefit individuals and communities (De La Garza & Kuri, 2016). However, researchers have been uncertain whether CTE instructors employ research-based pedagogy with ELLs (Andryukhina et al., 2016; Boersma, ten Dam, Wardekker, & Volman, 2016; Kuhn, Alonzo, & Zlatkin-Troitschanskaia, 2016). Identifying what research-based pedagogical practices are used with ELLs in CTE programs may provide evidence on how to improve outcomes in CTE programs.

The Local Problem

The problem I addressed in this study was the need to explore the instructional practices of CTE teachers with ELLs and the perceived linkage of those practices to successful transition to the workforce. The research sites were urban public school settings in the Midwest United States. In one district, there are over 2,000 students, 59% of whom have limited English proficiency. According to the district, students take four classes a day where CTE programs are an option to count towards one of the required

classes for graduation. The districts improvement plans are aimed at improving reading and math scores. To improve reading scores, the district has set a goal that 80% of classroom visits will concentrate on key indicators of the Readers Workshop Elements of instructional practices. The district has found that math scores are low because of human and organizational causes found at the school level. CTE programs can play a vital role in student success by connecting students to their community (De La Garza & Kuri, 2016). Students can learn skills to gain employment and feel productive. To address a gap of low student test scores, CTE teachers need to use research-based instructional practices to position ELLs to be competitive in the workforce.

In this study, I explored the instructional practices of CTE teachers with ELLs and the perceived linkage of those practices to a successful transition to the workforce. Researchers have indicated a gap between desired and actual ELL pedagogy and further research is needed to explore instructional practices and their perceived influence on ELLs' school-to-work transition (Gomez & Diarrassouba, 2014; Kim & Cha, 2015). Virtanen, Tynjälä, and Eteläpelto (2014) found the closer school learning activities were related to workplace skills, the more positive students felt about learning work-related skills. Researchers have also shown that many teachers who teach academic ELL instruction do not know the specific vocabulary used in jobs that require vocational training (Ali, Firissa, & Legesse, 2017; Parkinson & Mackay, 2016). When teachers of ELLs are asked to teach CTE subjects, they must learn the CTE vocabulary (Arnold, 2013). The relation of how much time ELLs spend between academic courses and CTE coursework is critical to their success in CTE programs (Salerno & Kibler, 2015). When

students participate in academic and CTE programs, the demands of their academic courses limit the time they can spend on CTE classes, and this can hinder success in CTE programs.

ELL academic performance also lags behind the academic achievement of their English-speaking peers (Baecher, Knoll, & Patti, 2016). Although skills learned in high school can help individuals join the workforce, many ELLs find graduating from high school to be challenging. For example, it has been noted that only about half of Latinos in the United States graduate high school within 4 years with a diploma (Hansen-Thomas & Sourdot, 2015). School persistence and graduation from high school for Latinos are lower than other racial and ethnic groups (Vega, Hines, Mayes, & Harris, 2016). McWhirter, Valdez, and Caban (2013) found that schools are challenged with differences in “educational and CTE aspirations and outcomes” (p. 36). An exploration of instructional practices in CTE coursework will inform efforts to improve CTE programs (Salerno & Kibler, 2015). Improving CTE program outcomes can lead to higher high school graduation rates by improving students’ confidence and persistence.

Rationale

In this study, I addressed the need to explore the instructional practices of CTE teachers with ELLs and the perceived linkage of those practices to a successful ELL transition to the workforce. It was unclear if CTE teachers use research-based instructional practices with ELLs or if they primarily rely on traditional content pedagogy. It is generally accepted that CTE has different instructional practices than academic instruction (Ali et al., 2017; Parkinson & Mackay, 2016; J. Rojewski, 2002).

CTE teaches specific job-related skills that are used in the workplace (Fejes & Köpsén, 2014). A more hands-on, apprentice-like instructional model is sometimes used by CTE teachers (Köpsén, 2014). Evidence has shown that research-based instructional practices are more effective than traditional instruction when teaching ELLs (Master, Loeb, Whitney, & Wyckoff, 2016). Gulikers, Biemans, Wesselink, and van der Wel (2013) stressed the importance of research-based instruction when assessing outcomes in CTE, and Hämäläinen and De Wever (2013) indicated that there is a need for additional research about the instructional practices of CTE teachers. Therefore, the results of a study like this one will be beneficial to ELL instruction in secondary CTE programs.

Justification of the Problem Choice

There are high stakes involved with the research problem because ELLs often become discouraged and disengage themselves from learning when teachers do not use research-based pedagogy (see Choi, 2013). The results of inadequate instructional practices are not neutral; according to Choi (2013), ineffective ELL pedagogy often results in resentment toward the teacher. Additionally, Elfers and Stritikus (2013) found that inadequate teaching actually creates some of the challenges that ELLs currently experience in school. Therefore, an exploration of instructional strategies toward ELLs was necessary to determine current practice and to inform improvement strategies.

Who Believes This is a Problem

The research problem is meaningful in the educational profession due to the growing immigrant population in the United States. As immigrants seek employment opportunities, higher incomes, and an improved standard of living, their proportionate

population in U.S. schools has skyrocketed (Eu et al., 2015). The National Center for Educational Statistics (2015) estimated that the 4.4 million ELLs, who currently comprise 9% of the U.S. school population, will expand to more than 40% of the population by 2030. This annual growth of approximately 3.4% will continue to prompt educators to seek ways to improve the instruction of ELLs. This growth suggests a need to investigate current instructional practices, especially in view of ELL academic performance.

An exploration of ELL instructional practices in the CTE classroom will clarify the differences between CTE and academic classroom pedagogy. Because CTE classroom instruction is different than in the academic classroom (Andryukhina et al., 2016; Manuel, van der Linden, & Popov, 2017), techniques that apply to academic classrooms may not be as effective in CTE classrooms (Köpsén, 2014). CTE classrooms can have diverse student populations, and research-based pedagogical practices are important to prepare CTE teachers for this diversity (van Beek, de Jong, Minnaert, & Wubbels, 2014). This is because CTE teachers typically provide a tactile demonstration of skills, then guide students in practicing those skills with their own hands with the goal of students achieving the independent practice of the work-related skill (Andryukhina et al., 2016). ELLs in a CTE classroom require more interactive time to ensure student mastery of work-related skills (Fejes & Köpsén, 2014).

A deeper understanding of the social dynamics in CTE classrooms could inform efforts to improve CTE pedagogy. For example, N. Luna and Revilla (2013) stated that some families fail to support education or socialize their children, which undermines academic achievement. Students from these family situations may seek social acceptance

at school to replace a nonsupportive home environment (Roche et al., 2017). Many youths do not have a caring relationship at home and look to their school environment for support (Slaten, Irby, Tate, & Rivera, 2015). Teachers may find it difficult to connect with ELL populations on a social or cultural level (Hattingh, Kettle, & Brownlee, 2017). Improved understanding of CTE instructional practices for ELLs may contribute to improved social engagement for these students. Researching instructional pedagogy models that emphasize social awareness is appropriate for CTE teachers (Castellano, Sundell, & Richardson, 2017).

CTE prepares ELLs to enter the workforce with the skills and knowledge necessary to be successful. Students learn job skills and practice those skills in CTE classes (van Uden, Ritzen, & Pieters, 2014). CTE has a goal to provide employable skills to students in a dynamic classroom setting (Arnold, 2014; Boersma et al., 2016). In school, students become better prepared for the workplace through practice (Stringfield & Stone, 2017). Practicing skills is important to gain confidence and reinforce the proper techniques necessary to perform tasks successfully (Moyer, Snodgrass, Klein, & Tebben, 2017). Workers who finish structured CTE training programs are more likely to be in a career (Polidano & Tabasso, 2014). Therefore, a study of current ELL instructional practices in CTE classrooms may support improved transitioning from school to work. The purpose of this study was to explore ELL instructional practices in CTE programs and the perceptions of how those practices improve ELL transition to the workforce.

Definition of Terms

Terms used in this study are defined as follows:

Academic instruction: A national standard of core academic curriculum that is measured by standardized tests such as ACT (Lynch, 2000).

Career and technical education (CTE): Education programs that range from health sciences, information technology, manufacturing, and transportation (Nicholas et al., 2015).

Critical consciousness (CC): A theory proposed by Freire (1970) where the oppressed realize their situation and commit to transforming themselves and the oppressors realize they restrict the process of learning.

English language learners (ELLs): Individuals whose native language is something other than English (González, 2016).

Direct instruction: A teacher-centered, six-step procedure that guides students toward achieving defined outcomes (“Direct Instruction,” 2017).

I-BEST Integrated Basic Education and Skills Training: A program with two instructors in the same class where one teacher is responsible for academic skills and one teacher concentrates on CTE skill attainment (Price, 2015).

Sheltered instruction observation protocol (SIOP): A researched-based pedagogy that follows eight specific steps from lesson preparation to assessment (Center for Applied Linguistics, 2017).

CTE English as a Second Language (VESL): VESL emphasizes three elements: learning job-specific vocabulary and grammar, learning specific job-related activities, and being embedded in current CTE programs (Buchanan, 1990).

Significance

This study is important to ELLs in their transition to the workforce. There is a shortage of workers prepared for entry-level positions in many occupational fields (Cappelli, 2014). Federal programs, such as Title 1, were designed to improve the academic achievement of the disadvantaged (U. S. Department of Education, 2018). As an example, in California, the foreign-born population represents 30% of the workforce; yet, only 3.7% of ELLs participated in Title 1 programs (California Workforce Development Board and Employment Development Department, 2017). An aging baby boomer generation necessitates a need to replace these retiring workers with workers who have improved technical skills, work experience, and education (Texas Workforce Commission, 2016). Entry-level workers must be skilled in CTE subjects such as carpentry, building trades, automotive repair, and the health industry. Rodríguez, Smith Canter, Voytecki, and Floyd (2013) found an increased understanding of how instruction that is linked to occupational goals may bolster employment possibilities. A strong connection between vocational English used in CTE programs and job performance can help empower students by increasing their confidence. According to a report by the National Science Foundation's Advanced Technological Education program, students need CTE language skills to help them communicate effectively during job interviews and in the work setting (Sommers, 2000). Greene (2014) found that successful job placement is dependent on a student's aspirations. Therefore, through improved ELL instructional practices in the CTE classroom, students may experience CTE as an opportunity and motivation for them to improve their workplace knowledge and skills.

The results of this study may contribute to positive social change by increasing the understanding of CTE instructional practices of ELLS, thereby, potentially increasing the number of graduates who are prepared to enter the workforce with the skills necessary for success. Students who learn CTE skills have an improved chance of employment in the community (van Beek et al., 2014). Limited employment opportunities can create citizenship documentation issues (Trainor, Murray, & Kim, 2016). Effective ELL CTE instruction will help reinforce the feeling that ELLs can be productive in their community (Rodríguez et al., 2013). They will see opportunities where they can be productive and help the community dynamics (Adelson-Goldstein, 2015; Arnold, 2013).

Ultimately, important social change is possible through the improvement of instructional practices in CTE programs. CTE programs can connect students to their community by providing training for skilled jobs. The findings of this study have the potential to increase ELL learning, contribute to filling the labor shortage in a community, reduce citizenship documentation issues, and increase the empowerment of ELLs' experiences being productive in their community.

Research Questions

In this basic qualitative study, I explored the instructional practices of CTE teachers with ELLs and the perceived linkage of those practices to a successful ELL transition to the workforce.

Research Question 1: From the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices are used to support ELLs

Research Question 2: From the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices are perceived to improve successful ELL transition to the workforce?

Review of the Literature

The literature review begins with an overview of the conceptual framework, the theory of CC (see Freire, 1970). Three elements of Freire's (1970) theory are (a) the oppressor-oppressed relationship, (b) the banking concept of education, and (c) how the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment. The literature review continues with an in-depth analysis of the broader problem of how ELL language and instructional practices in CTE classrooms can affect the transition from high school to the workforce. In the broader problem subsection, I identify three themes from the professional literature, including (a) instructional practices of CTE instructors, (b) how CTE instruction differs from academic instruction, and (c) how ELLs transition from high school to the workforce.

Conceptual Framework

In the field of CTE, there have been a limited number of conceptual frameworks applied to understand this discipline. There are secondary, postsecondary, and adult or technical education programs, each with a unique set of processes, and because of the variety of CTE programs offered, it is difficult to know which conceptual frameworks are best suited (Lynch, 1996). Therefore, I have chosen the conceptual framework of Freire's (1970) CC for this study. CC elements can be applied to ELLs' CTE instruction because previous studies have shown that CC is an appropriate educational philosophy with which to analyze instructional practices for ELL in a CTE classroom (Diemer et al., 2017; El-

Amin et al., 2017; McWhirter & McWhirter, 2016). The framework grounded this study by allowing me to research how CTE teachers connect with ELLs and how the unique social situations of ELLs respond to those interactions. The phenomenon of interest was the instructional practices of CTE teachers and their perceived linkage of those practices to a successful ELL transition to the workforce in a Midwestern urban school district.

Description of the conceptual framework. The conceptual framework for this study was Freire's (1970) theory of CC. The central concepts of this theory are based on the beginnings of education where an oppressor (i.e., experts) would teach the oppressed (i.e., learners; Jemal, 2017). The oppressed only bank knowledge through rote memory (Freire & Faundez, 1989). Freire stated that educational practice should change from an expert providing information to a recipient to a more inclusive learning environment. CTE practices are based on a subject matter expert (SME) teaching students how to perform tasks (Ketelaar, Brok, Beijaard, & Boshuizen, 2018). Freire determined that when the oppressed become aware of themselves as a valuable member of humanity, they develop critical consciousness and become active players in their education. The goal of CC is to humanize the learning experience by informing the learner on how to be a complete human being (Manuel et al., 2017). The theory can be useful in understanding the importance of how CTE education is currently taught (Godfrey & Grayman, 2014; Manuel et al., 2017). Treating learners as important individuals change the oppressor-oppressed relationship.

CTE programs are geared toward skill attainment. Researchers have shown that several instructional theories are used to teach CTE topics (Köpsén, 2014; Kuhn et al.,

2016). One theory is content-based instruction (CBI), which emphasizes the concurrent learning of related language skills to relevant content (Baecher, Farnsworth, & Ediger, 2014). Herrera et al. (2016) found there were seven key obstacles to proper implementation of CBI, including that CBI takes too much preparation time to implement effectively. Another teaching method is culturally responsive teaching (CRT). CRT uses the cultural diversity of a student's perspectives and experiences to enhance classroom instruction (Garcia & Chun, 2016). This theory may have applications in academic classrooms, but there have been few empirical studies applying CRT to CTE. Teachers need the training to get exposure to teaching techniques that can reinforce their instructional procedures. CTE teachers' connections with students are more interactive because of the nature of teaching skill attainment (Bathmaker, 2013). The theory of CC has the potential to improve CTE classroom outcomes because connections between teachers and students are more social in nature.

Appropriateness of the conceptual framework. Freire's (1970) theory was appropriate to frame this basic qualitative study because of its emphasis on a student-centered, relational approach. The problem that was addressed in this study was the need to explore the instructional practices of CTE teachers with ELLs and the perceived linkage of those practices to a successful ELL transition to the workforce. Mitra (2003) found that increasing student voices in schools helps students feel more motivated to participate through a stronger sense of ownership of their future. In a 30-month long study, Mitra conducted over 100 semistructured interviews and over 100 observations at Walt Whitman High School in California, where over half of the students were ELLs.

Mitra began the study by creating student-teacher focus groups that allowed each group to see how the other group operated. From these groups, students gained an understanding of the confines of how teachers must operate in the school setting and teachers gained awareness of students' views and needs. Student peer groups relate to the roles of identities, which is a component of Freire's theory of oppressor/oppressed dynamics. Student peer group dynamics, as well as student-teacher relationships, can hinder inclusivity (Campbell & MacPhail, 2002). Mitra found that increasing awareness of both groups lowered student-teacher tensions and increased informality leading to a more humanistic reception by both groups. Students worked on activities that changed school policies rather than trying to change individual classroom environments (Mitra, 2003). Mitra also found that changing the personal interaction between students and teachers had a positive impact on relationships and acceptance. Mitra did not concentrate on classroom instruction but on the human components of connecting with students, which is the main idea behind Freire's CC theory.

Key elements of the framework. There are three key elements of Freire's (1970) theory: (a) the oppressor-oppressed relationship, (b) the banking concept of education, and (c) how the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment. I used Freire's theory to analyze the instructional practices currently used by CTE teachers and how the connections that CTE teachers make to their students helps them in understanding the expectations of a work environment. The CC theory may be applied to the transformation of the CTE classroom to improve desired outcomes.

The oppressor-oppressed relationship. In the relationship between the oppressor and the oppressed, the oppressors are the people who own both material things and knowledge (Freire, 1970). The oppressors' role is to control the oppressed. "Any situation in which 'A' objectively exploits 'B' or hinders his and her pursuit of self-affirmation as a responsible person is one of oppression" (Freire, 1970, p. 55). The oppressors begin to believe that they are supreme beings and the oppressed are just objects to impart their will upon (Freire, 1970). The oppressed do not realize they have the knowledge and they can provide input to their learning (Freire, 1970). Through oppression, the oppressed distrust themselves and believe the oppressors are their only hope for survival (Freire, 1970). The oppressed can gain confidence when they challenge to the oppressors. "It is only when the oppressed find the oppressor out and become involved in the organized struggle for their liberation that they begin to believe in themselves" (Freire, 1970, p. 65). Freire believed that when the oppressor authentically commits to helping others, they must reexamine themselves constantly. The process of constant reflection by teachers changes the education process.

The banking concept of education. Some scholars have considered education as a narrative where the teacher is an expert and students are willing subjects. Teachers have been seen as dispensers of knowledge with students being the receivers of knowledge (Sias, Nadelson, Juth, & Seifert, 2017). In this model, teachers talk about a subject and students are rewarded for memorizing information (Freire, 1970). However, one-way dialogue from teacher to a student does not support active learning or involve students as participants in learning (Bonwel & Eison, 1991; Chickering & Zelda, 1987; Deci &

Ryan, 1980; Settles, 2010). Rote learning characterized students as “containers” or “receptacles” to be filled with information (Freire, 1970). Freire felt that teachers should connect with learners on a humanistic level. The relationship between teachers and students changes as teachers rethink their education practices (Darder, Baltodano, & Torres, 2003). According to CC, when teachers begin to see education as collaboration, learning in both the student and teacher improves (Diemer & Blustein, 2006). Teachers begin to create a dialogue with students where both are responsible for learning (Slaten et al., 2015). Those dedicated to liberation will adopt the concept that people are conscious beings and work on *problem-posing* education (Freire, 1970). People begin to see the world as a dynamic place where they have input to the process and can help with the transformation of their environment (Avis, 1999)(Matthew A. Diemer & Blustein, 2006). Teachers should embrace student curiosity. “The curiosity of students can sometimes shake the certainty of their teachers” (Freire, 1970, p. 33). CTE has elements of this concept where the SME (i.e., teacher) tells students how to do tasks. When CTE teachers involve students in the learning process, outcomes may be improved.

Transformation of the learning environment. The transformation of the learner’s environment takes place when CC questioning techniques are applied in the classroom. Everyone has a role in the transformation of the learning process. Educators who view education as the practice of domination and not as the practice of freedom deny that learners are independent people with their own thoughts (Freire, 1970). Significant education relies on critical thinking where an open dialogue exists between people (Blaak, Openjuru, & Zeelen, 2013). Critical thinking is asking questions where there

could be multiple answers and is the process of linking questions and answers to actions that are performed in the future (Frieire & Faundez, 1989). Questions that are framed to cause a reflective response are extremely important to learning (Reed, Swanson, Petscher, & Vaughn, 2014). Students who are constantly asking questions are engaged in the learning process where their thoughts are constantly reinforced or changed.

Review of the Broader Problem

In this section, I provide a review of the scholarly research related to the use of instructional practices of CTE teachers with ELLs and CTE teachers' perception of the linkage of those practices to a successful ELL transition to the workforce. I searched the electronic databases of ERIC, SAGE Premier, and EBSCO for this study. To ensure saturation of the literature, I also searched additional resources, such as Google Scholar, traditional books, and web sites. The search terms I used included *CTE education*, *critical consciousness*, *ELL/ESLs transition to the workforce*, *labor force*, and *CTE instructional practices*.

The CC theory addresses far-reaching aspects of social awareness and how people connect to each other (Diemer & Rapa, 2016). In this literature review, I touch on areas of research of the CC theory, such as social awareness and open dialogue, social and emotional integration, authentic relationships, school environments, and community collaboration. Although the social aspects of CC are important, three themes in this study are aligned with CTE. In my research of the broader problem, I identified three themes from the professional literature: (a) instructional practices of CTE instructors, (b) how

CTE instruction differs from academic instruction, and (c) how ELLs transition from high school to the workforce.

The main component of CC theory is associated with developing a critical consciousness in students (El-Amin et al., 2017). El-Amin et al. found that using CC concepts creates profound social changes and academic benefits. These social changes have a direct impact on community awareness (Gullan, Power, & Leff, 2013). CTE instruction provides community benefits by educating a workforce; therefore, CTE instruction is vital to support community projects. CC is important in fostering community change through transformative activism and community engagement (Diemer, Rapa, Park, & Perry, 2017). This activism and engagement are how communities grow and become prosperous.

Social awareness and open dialogue. The CC concepts of social awareness and open dialogue are important for ELL success in the workforce. To support marginalized youth, Slaten et al. (2015) said to (a) incorporate social-emotional learning in culturally relevant methods, (b) nurture authentic relationships that support positive school environments, and (c) build a school environment that emphasizes community collaboration. CTE classrooms are appropriate learning environments for integrating these elements into content instruction. Recognizing that students have distinctive social and cultural roots that impact social dynamics in the classroom is important (Baumeler, 2017). Teachers need to be equipped with the skills to acknowledge and address the unique social needs of ELLs (Vega et al., 2016). Integrating social awareness concepts to a diverse population of CTE students is important for student engagement.

Social and emotional integration. Social and emotional integration is important for students to feel engaged and important in their community. Social and emotional awareness can educate and liberate students where the education system can be thought of as a place of social control (Freire, 1976). Social awareness is important for ELLs to feel included (N. Luna & Revilla, 2013). Social awareness leads to an understanding of “freedom, autonomy, social justice and construction of self” (Tur Porres, Wildemeersch, & Simons, 2014, p. 277). Instructional practices using CC concepts can have profound implications for social change and academic success (El-Amin et al., 2017). Social awareness in a classroom helps students feel connected, and instructional practices that allow students to connect to each other and community partners are important for student success in a classroom (Gullan et al., 2013).

Authentic relationships. Authentic relationships are where teachers demonstrate respect and value student’s opinions thus improving learning outcomes. In a quantitative study of 1,027 ninth graders, Godfrey and Grayman (2014) found that classrooms where open discussions and respect for diverse opinions create a climate of critical consciousness which has been shown to improve student academic outcomes. Open discussions can be defined as two-way communication where teachers value students input and opinions. Teachers can create authentic relationships by using instructional techniques that include self-sustaining engagement, conversations that generate mutual satisfaction and promoting motivation through inclusive engagement (Furrer, Skinner, & Pitzer, 2013). Students tend to acquire their own perceptions of teachers of teacher behavior which can influence their expectations (van Beek et al., 2014). In traditional

learning situations, teachers often dictate information to students. But in CTE classrooms, Köpsén (2014) said that emotional negotiations about the time necessary to complete a task occur between students and teachers. Fostering authentic relationships in CTE classrooms can increase students intrinsic motivations (Misbah, Gulikers, Maulana, & Mulder, 2015). As students connect with teachers, they may see an important connection between schools and their community.

Instructional practices used with ELLs and how they relate to student

achievement. Lucas, Villegas, and Martin (2015) reviewed 30 studies of teachers' beliefs about ELLs and found that the majority of teachers who responded were ill-equipped to teach ELLs. In 9 of the 11 studies that centered on teacher preparedness, they found teachers having a negative attitude towards ELL academic abilities and preferred not to have them in their class. Lucas et al. also concluded that teachers preferred not to attend professional development related to ELL instruction. Kelly (2018) found that teachers taught their classes the way they think is best and not necessarily changing their pedagogy because they have ELLs in their classes. Teachers believed that good teaching is applicable to all students. Fletcher Jr., Djajalaksana, and Eison (2012) found that CTE teachers choose interactive lecture (48%), questioning (23%), and whole group discussion (17%) as their preferred method of instruction. Improving student motivation is associated with improved engagement. CTE teachers should learn to increase student engagement instructional practices. ELLs may not have basic reading skills as other students. This slower pace of reading comprehension can impact a teacher's lesson strategy. ELLs with poor reading skills may need more time to read or re-read material to improve

comprehension (Lambert, Velez, & Elliott, 2014). CTE teachers need to be prepared to modify their teaching styles so ELLs can interact with other students.

School environment and community collaboration. CTE programs are a conduit between school and community. CTE programs support community involvement through volunteer, co-operative learning, service learning, or apprenticeship programs (De La Garza & Kuri, 2016). When students support their communities through these activities they begin to share values (Mitchell, 2015). Student participation in community events that utilize their CTE skills are important for students to feel connected and important (Slaten et al., 2015). CTE instruction makes a connection between school and work. Connecting CC concepts of social awareness help students become more engaged in their awareness of learning a vocation and its relevance to the working world (Diemer, 2009). ELLs are faced with many challenges to succeed in their local community with social situations, language, and obtaining wage sustaining work. To address these challenges, teachers need to utilize research-based instructional practices to position ELLs to be competitive in the workforce. When entering the workforce, ELLs may need additional preparation in language and social skills to compete for jobs.

A study that evidenced the need for additional preparation to enter the workforce is Ciarocco (2018). This study found that career preparation is very important to students. It is vital for CTE educators to develop programs that are current and relevant to the teaching skills that are relevant in the workforce (J. W. Rojewski & Hill, 2017). CTE instruction includes workforce-ready skills. Instructor-led pedagogy limits students understanding of how school and work interact. In a two and a half yearlong study with

34 middle school teachers in two schools, Lesseig, Nelson, Slavit, and Seidel (2016), found student learning improved with open-ended questions and project-based tasks. Teachers commented that student-centered learning was a better way to teach students who are in CTE and STEM courses. Educators need to listen and connect with students so they become more engaged in the learning process. The concept using the students' voice to improve student engagement may require a change in pedagogy (Kirk et al., 2017; Mercer & Dawes, 2014; Pehmer, Gröschner, & Seidel, 2015). Students in the 21st century bring with them knowledge and experiences that adults, who have lived longer and know more, think they understand (Sias et al., 2017). Students have knowledge that is essential to the development of the learning processes. CC theory aligns with the current research that teachers should create a collaborative classroom environment where students are encouraged to provide an open and honest dialogue about their education process.

CTE classrooms are comprised of a diverse student population that reflects an ever-changing community profile (Reegård, 2016). This diversity suggests different instructional techniques are necessary. CTE teachers who utilize student engagement concepts can improve student's educational experiences, thus allowing them to be more successful in the work environment. Teachers agree that proficiency in content knowledge and applied pedagogical theories make for effective classroom instruction (Vincent & Kirby, 2015). But often, CTE teachers tend to rely on teaching a task for employment and not necessarily classroom dynamics of diverse populations (Boersma et al., 2016). In contrast to this, the use of CC techniques in the CTE classroom suggests

stronger engagement, meaningful open dialogue, and improved inclusion and learning. Therefore, CC may contribute in a positive fashion as a framework for this exploration of instructional practices (Tur Porres et al., 2014). CTE teachers work with a diverse group of students that have individual needs.

The literature review continues with an in-depth analysis of the broader problem of how ELL language and instructional practices in CTE classrooms can be linked to the transition from high school to the workforce. Three themes from the professional literature are then reviewed. These include (a) instructional practices of CTE instructors, (b) how CTE instruction differs from academic instruction, and (c) how ELLs transition from high school to the workforce.

Instructional practices of CTE teachers. It is unclear which research-based pedagogy if any, CTE teachers' use. Often times CTE teachers are not required to have formal teaching qualifications but are hired for their technical competence (Köpsén, 2014). It is felt they should be subject experts and knowledge of instructional pedagogy is a plus, not a requirement. Kuhn et al. (2016) found that the diversity of CTE content teachings relies heavily on keeping current with the subject matter and leaves little time for learning how to incorporate research-based instructional strategies. Kuhn et al. also found that the complex nature of CTE subjects prevents CTE teachers from agreeing on a common teaching method. When CTE teachers participate in professional development programs they are participating in topics such as collaboration, tutoring and virtual learning environments (Jääskelä & Nissilä, 2015). They seldom participate in

opportunities to learn skills that concentrate on social dynamics which would help them with ELL instructional techniques.

CTE programs are moving from traditional input-based curricula to outcome-based curricula. Teaching task completion is not enough for potential employees to be successful in the workplace. Dynamic work environments demand workers demonstrate problem-solving techniques. A result-oriented approach will necessitate a change in curriculum design that is based on the result of instruction (Bansal, Gaffar, & Dalrymple, 2015). Bansal, Bansal, and Dalrymple (2015) found outcome-based curricula employ pedagogical activities such as problem-solving, active reading, and partially guided exercises. Freire's concept of moving from an oppressor/oppressed teaching style to a student-centered approach reflects the shift in pedagogy to outcome-based instruction.

Teacher roles are changing from a subject matter expert dictating to students what to do towards an outcome based student-oriented program (Cort, 2014). Gulikers et al. (2013) investigated the move from input-based curricula to outcome-based curricula in CTE education. Gulikers et al. found that outcome-based curricula more closely align with industry needs for workers who can complete job-related tasks. Despite this, teachers examined in the study tended to follow a traditional input-based program. The strength of the study was found in its large and varied data collection sources. Gulikers et al. analyzed data from (a) nine institutions that offered CTE programs, (b) 11 examination secretaries (secretaries who interact with all CTE instructors), (c) CTE instructors, (d) three educational researchers, and, (e) 10 educational consultants. The researchers investigated the teachers' perceptions of aligning their formative assessments

to coincide with classroom instruction. The formative assessments might need to change to align with outcome-based summative assessments that are used in the national ranking of schools. CTE teachers could benefit from making the learning experience meaningful which can develop the student as a whole person (Minaabad, 2017). Teachers perception of their instructional practices may identify if they are currently using CC concepts.

CTE student engagement. CTE teachers usually follow a predetermined curriculum to deliver content. Student engagement practices are recommended, especially with ELLs (Braden, Wassell, Scantlebury, & Grover, 2016). Often the ELLs voice is not considered in instructional pedagogies. Braden et al. (2016) published a mixed method study that illustrates this point. They studied a group of 147 sixth and seven grade students in which there was a subgroup comprised of 12 ELLs. In addition, 12 teachers from different disciplines participated in the study. Over a 2 year period, the researchers used student interviews, cogenerate dialogues, and field notes as well as observations and recordings to collect data. Findings supported the need for teachers to provide individualized instruction based on the students' knowledge level. Class assignments need to be tailored to allow for individual differences in learning styles. Popular instructional methods for ELLs such as the SIOP and CBI do not consider student voices to engage them in learning. Polat and Cepik (2016) found that misinterpretation of the SIOP model may rely heavily on teacher's actions instead of student's ideas. Cenoz (2015) found that CBI is usually aimed at a dominant language and may fail to include ELL populations in teaching complex concepts. ELLs may not get the attention they need to overcome any language differences in learning complex CTE skills. Braden et al. in

alignment with CC concepts, advocated for personalizing instruction. Communicating to learners on an individual basis is important to ELLs (Adelson-Goldstein, 2015). Teachers and students should have genuine conversations on how they want to learn. Braden et al. suggested that teachers be exposed to classroom-based collaborative research where they can learn to meet the needs of ELLs. The researchers suggested that teacher education programs should be aimed at cogenerate dialogue between teachers and students where instructional practices can be improved.

How CTE instruction differs from academic instruction. CTE instruction is approached differently than the approached used in an academic educational setting. CTE teachers use their background and experience in the subject to teach skill attainment. In the academic educational setting, teachers rely on the knowledge they acquired at a university (Fejes & Köpsén, 2014). Both academic and CTE teachers teach content knowledge, but CTE teachers also focus on teaching skill attainment. Based on 20 semistructured interviews of CTE teachers, Fejes and Köpsén (2014) found those who participate in teacher education pedagogy had a significantly positive impact on student outcomes. Through participation in training helped them transfer occupational knowledge to classroom instruction. Participation also allowed them to connect to the teaching community. CTE teachers divide their time between participating in teacher education training and occupational training to stay relevant to an ever-changing work environment. Those teachers who balance both instructional and occupational training are more successful in the classroom. This necessitates CTE teachers acquire pedagogical knowledge of learning techniques in addition to their content knowledge (Kuhn et al.,

2016). CTE teachers benefit from learning academic instructional pedagogy in addition to staying current in their occupation field.

CTE teachers are responsible for teaching industry content which differs from academic objectives. In a mixed method study of 2,004 students conducted over 4 years, Castellano, Sundell, and Richardson (2017) found blending academic instruction with CTE programs improved GPA scores, improves attendance rates, lowers attrition rates and results in a higher likelihood of graduating high school. Providing students with academic instruction that aligns with career readiness goals helps a student succeed. Firth (2009) studied ELL instruction as it related to a work setting, not a classroom setting. His evidence supports the position that ELL studies grammatical English in a school setting but outside the classroom, English is much more social and business-oriented or nonstandard. Outside the classroom, ELL interactions can be labeled lingua franca encounters that do not necessarily follow accepted language structure. Language skills are necessary to complete a resume or participate in an interview, but without the CTE skill attainment, students are not likely to stay employed. Additionally, ELLs who assimilate into U.S. school systems adopt a coping mechanism of memorization (DeCapua & Marshall, 2011). Student outcomes can be improved when specialized CTE language acquisition is presented in the proper work context (Parkinson & Mackay, 2016). This can be stressful for programs that are required to cover a certain amount of content in a relatively short time. CTE content and academic content can overlap but it is difficult for academic content to be in-depth enough for CTE programs (Parkinson & Mackay, 2016; Zhang, 2017). School systems are geared towards teaching English so

students are able to pass standardized test scores for accreditation compliance. In-depth learning of CTE topics takes away from necessary academic instruction time which can have a negative effect on student performance on standardized tests (Diemer et al., 2010). Recognizing that CTE teachers are tasked with various levels of language proficiency, especially with ELLs, puts additional stress on teaching CTE skills. A philosophical debate could be made on whether to teach language skills or CTE skills first (Arnold, 2013). Additional research is necessary to determine what relevant English language skills are necessary for the workplace.

Using CC concepts changes the classroom dynamic from chasing an outcome to thinking of students as users. A student should be involved in learning by including them in two-way open dialogue. For example, in a 2017 meta-analysis, Cervantes-Soon et al. study found that two-way interaction (TWI) of ELLs between students and teachers was invaluable. Cervantes-Soon et al. (2017) identified 86 empirical studies and conceptual papers that reviewed TWI interactions that may have gone unrecognized when reviewing other measures of success. The researchers used thematic codes such as student access and experiences, classroom pedagogy, teacher's background, community engagement, and district and state policies. Cervantes-Soon et al. reported TWI programs often become a routine program that can marginalize bilingual acquisition. TWI interactions may actually support a dominant behavior by groups such as parents. This dominant behavior of certain groups can marginalize the complacent students who resort to going along with the group instead of advocating for their rights. Teacher's attitudes can create inequalities in TWI programs through various backgrounds, training, ideologies, etc.

Cervantes-Soon et al. also noted found that curriculum, pedagogy and instruction practices may lean towards English dominate students which further creates inequalities in the classroom. This can be especially true in CTE classrooms. CTE teachers demonstrate a procedure and follow it up with questions. It is essential for teachers to learn proper questioning techniques that encourage deeper learning. Those techniques should transfer what students know to the new learning situation (Ahmed, Nordin, Ali, Md, & Latip, 2017). This approach transforms the classroom from students answering questions to explaining what they know and how to use that knowledge in performing a task. Questioning techniques could include asking students to explain to perform the task. CC questioning techniques could be used to better assess student understanding of the task. Cervantes-Soon et al. summarized that CC concepts can be used to draw attention to power dimensions and humanizing the classroom which can create inclusivity.

A CTE curriculum can be improved and enhanced by using student-centered learning pedagogy. Placklé et al. (2017) noted that an integrated curriculum that includes domain-specific learning along with cognitive and emotional self-regulation skills helps students learn. Placklé et al. used the term *Powerful Learning Environment* to describe four components that are interrelated. The first principle is learning tasks which can include problem-solving or assignments designed to connect learning to work skills. The second principle is key competencies where self-regulation, collaboration and problem-solving are emphasized. The third component is adaptive learning support that includes evaluation for learning, coaching, and differentiation. The last principle is a positive and safe learning environment. The researchers used nine schools where 532 students

participated in the research. Placklé et al. found that designing CTE curricula that include more learning support and guidance improves student engagement. A key component of CC is connecting to students on an individual level. This is further supported by van Uden et al., (2014), who found that teachers should improve their interpersonal behavior to connect with students on a personal level. The researchers call for an additional investigation on how teachers interact with students to promote student engagement through a student-centered approach.

As evidence shows it is necessary to understand how CTE teachers use research-based pedagogy when instructing ELLs. The challenges that ELLs bring to the classroom can put significant stress on how teachers are supposed to meet educational requirements. An added dimension to the instructional pedagogy of CTE teachers is the realization that they need to prepare their students for employment with demonstrable skills. The next section will review the literature on how it relates to the research question 2, from the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices are perceived to improve successful ELL transition to the workforce?

Transition from school to the workforce. The primary goal for CTE is to facilitate instruction of employable skills that are relevant to the workplace, but language skills are essential to success at work. Parkinson and Mackay (2016) found students need to relate both to peers and related trade professionals. Parkinson and Mackay used semistructured interviews of 11 CTE program tutors. The recorded and transcribed interviews lasted between 30-60 minutes and were listened to by both researchers. Parkinson and Mackay also collected 30 examples of student's writings. Tutors were

used for their expertise of the curriculum and their knowledge of problems the students were having with the course content. Parkinson and Mackay determined that students acquire values and language skills simultaneous in CTE programs. In the trades, workplace workers are expected to understand the language used in building codes, manufacturer specifications, and written procedures. These types of writings can be highly condensed which can take a high degree of experience to interpret. Since ELLs face challenges when trying to assimilate into mainstream communities, it is important that all stakeholders in the community help students achieve success in gaining relevant employment (Vocke et al., 2016). It is important for ELLs to become productive citizens by participating in the workforce (Vafai, 2016). Relevant employment should link academic instruction with relevant work environments. Academic performance can be improved when students are engaged in service learning projects that are community oriented (Acevedo-Polakovich et al., 2014). Service learning is academic work where the goal is to develop civic skills and the disposition of the student that are reinforced by participating in the program (De La Garza & Kuri, 2016). CTE teachers should be aware of the challenges that ELLs face when entering the workforce.

CTE programs use terms and sentence structures that are different from conversational English. How to perform tasks, step by step procedures, and industry specifications layer on a different language called *Vocational English as a Second Language* to conversational English. CTE teachers that introduce program specific and industry relevant terminology can help prepare ELLs when finding employment in the work sector. ELLs who lack CTE language struggle in the work environment. English

courses that provide relevant CTE language help ELLs in on-the-job training (Ali et al., 2017). Ali et al. (2017) mixed method study that had over 5500 CTE professionals. The researchers used questionnaires, interviews, and focus groups to ask if English for specific purposes (ESP) was relevant in CTE programs. Ali et al. found that ESP had been removed from their CTE programs without any research to support the change. Ali et al. determined that the removal of English courses in CTE programs negatively affected effective interaction between teachers and students. Learners need to acquire relevant English language skills to be successful in the work environment. The use of relevant curriculum support materials can be compromised by learners lacking proper English language skills. It is important to utilize textbooks that are written using VESL (Vafai, 2016). VESL textbooks can help work-specific language integration during instruction. Learning VESL to be successful in the work situation is important. Research-based instructional practices that shorten the VESL learning process will help with the transition from school to work faster (Kaz, 2014). Appropriate language skills help ELLs succeed in the workplace (Wu, 2017). All stakeholders benefit when VESL is incorporated into instructional practices. A quicker transition from school to work helps all stakeholders.

ELLs who are unprepared for the workforce can lead to an erosion of community support which can result in affecting student confidence. Renn, Steinbauer, Taylor, and Detwiler (2014) found when students are confident in their knowledge and their ability to communicate; they have higher self-efficacy. The Renn, Steinbauer, Taylor, and Detwiler study collected data from 95 students and mentors over eight months to support five

hypotheses. The goal of the study was to analyze career planning, job searches, and limited job searching techniques. A conclusion of the study was that mentors were invaluable to prevent self-defeating job searches where individuals cannot find a job. Mentors also prevented participants from selecting an unsatisfying job. The study also found self-defeating behaviors limit an individual's ability to reach their goals. Students needed mentors to guide and motivate them through what might be their first self-motivated job-related search. Using mentors as a support mechanism helped create self-efficacy which improved student confidence to enter the workforce. Self-efficacy allows students to have confidence in the work world. They are more confident in the work environment where situations are more fluid and dynamic. Schools are ill-equipped to teach all of the problems that one is likely to experience in a work situation (Cappelli, 2014). ELLs who have higher confidence through an understanding of the working language are more productive workers.

CTE programs can be structured as a school-based program or as a community-based program, but they need to prepare students for the workforce. School-based programs teach CTE curriculum in specific courses designed to teach occupational skills. Community-based programs can be known as workplace-based learning, co-op, internships, job shadowing, or apprenticeship programs that are designed to complement school-based instruction (Köpsén, 2014). In either situation, the goal is to concentrate on learning outcomes. Köpsén found CTE teachers feel their most important role is to teach employable skills. Köpsén conducted semistructured interviews with 22 CTE teachers of which eight were women. Each interview lasted for approximately one hour and was

recorded and transcribed verbatim. The study was organized into four sections. The first sections stated that CTE teachers have a different relationship with their students than other teachers. CTE teachers meet their students more often and for longer periods. Thus, close relationships with students were created. The remaining three sections of the study center on students being participants in their learning, helping CTE students grow and guiding students into their working life. Köpsén results suggest that CTE teachers are utilizing the concepts of CC where they are connecting with students.

Service learning is often integrated into a course instead of being a standalone component. Service learning can improve the CTE classroom experience by providing relevant context to the learners (Acevedo-Polakovich et al., 2014; Mitchell, 2015). Effective service-learning projects include input from stakeholders such as schools, teachers, employers, and organizations that are discussed and agreed upon (De La Garza & Kuri, 2016). All partners should have a stake in the project. Each stakeholder should commit the necessary resources to provide a beneficial outcome for all (Elfers & Stritikus, 2013). The relationship of the stakeholders is important to the success of these projects. CTE programs are a solution to research long term outcomes in partnerships with local communities in school to work models (Nicholas et al., 2015). A community will benefit from a strong alliance of partners who believe in supporting education. An important aspect of CTE education programs is that they are preparing a student population for employment by teaching work relevant skill sets. As CTE student populations become more diverse, CTE teachers will be tasked with how to handle this

diversity. One growing segment in CTE is ELL. How ELL needs are specifically met in the CTE classroom is important for student success in the workplace.

Implications

The results/findings of the basic qualitative study may provide a deeper understanding of ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers and how their instructional practices are perceived to improve students to enter the workforce. The findings supported a policy paper that will provide direction to stakeholders regarding current instructional practices towards ELLs in secondary CTE programs. The findings may lead to a change in instructional pedagogy in CTE classrooms, identification of relevant Professional Development Opportunities (PDO) for CTE teachers, and possibly, a stronger community connection between employers and schools.

Summary

In Section 1 I presented the problem and purpose of the study, provided evidence that it is current and meaningful in the discipline and defined key terms. I also identified research questions and aligned the research with Freire's conceptual framework of critical consciousness. The conceptual framework of CC is used to link three key elements of Freire's theory, (a) the oppressor-oppressed relationship, (b) the banking concept of education, and (c) how the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment to secondary CTE classrooms instruction. In Section 2 of this study, I will review the methodology used to gather and analyze data. I will describe the participant population, data collection and data analysis methods used. CTE classrooms are a complex structure of social dynamics where it is easy to have an

oppressor-oppressed relationship due to the nature of teaching CTE skills. The relationships between teachers and students are important to understand how each views the other's role in education.

Section 2: The Methodology

This section is a detailed overview of the methodology used for this study. The purpose of this study was to explore the ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers and how those practices are perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. In the study, I developed the research questions to address CTE teachers' perspectives of what instructional practices were used to support ELLs and what instructional practices were perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. This section includes a discussion of the research design and approach, qualitative tradition, justification for why a basic qualitative study was chosen and a description of the participants, sampling procedures, data collection, and analysis of this study. This section will conclude with the results of the data analysis.

Qualitative Research Design and Approach

The qualitative research design derived logically from the problem that I addressed in this study: The need to explore the instructional practices of CTE teachers with ELLs and the perceived linkage of those practices to a successful ELL transition to the workforce. Qualitative methods have grown popular in many research circles (Twining, Heller, Nussbaum, & Tsai, 2017). Qualitative research is used when researchers want to know where, when, how, and what circumstances lead up to a behavior or action (Bogdan & Bilken, 1992). To gain the perspectives of CTE teachers, I used a qualitative approach in this study. CTE teachers who voluntarily participated in the study provided data through semistructured interviews. Qualitative studies may be chosen instead of quantitative methods because of the associated hypothetical-deductive

method that is associated with true science (Watts & Stenner, 2005). A qualitative theory is critical to understanding human behavior (Jonsen, Fendt, & Point, 2018). A qualitative research design was appropriate for this study because my goal was to analyze how CTE teachers felt about their impact on teaching ELLs.

Problem and Research Design

Qualitative methodology fit my intent to explore the ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers and how those practices are perceived to improve ELLs' transition to the workforce. In this study, I used the basic qualitative methodology to research the instructional practices CTE teachers used in their classrooms. Merriam (2009) and Merriam and Tisdell (2015) said a basic interpretive study is the most common type of qualitative method for beginner researchers. Participant interviews were the data source for this study and were used to understand their experiences. A basic qualitative methodology using interviews allows the researcher to relate to the participants' shared experiences (Merriam, 2009; Seidman, 2006). A basic qualitative study was most appropriate for the intention to explore the instructional practices used by CTE teachers. Interviews are not designed to get answers to questions, test hypotheses, or evaluate a situation (Seidman, 2006). Instead, the participants' responses to my interview questions provided in-depth insights into their perspectives about teaching ELL in CTE programs.

Description of the Basic Qualitative Study

The qualitative research method I employed was a basic qualitative study. The study required an inquiry into secondary school CTE classes. Basic qualitative studies

investigate participant opinions and experiences (Percy, Kostere, & Kostere, 2015).

Interviews are well suited for understanding individual experiences and integrating participant perspectives (D. E. Smith, 2006; Windsong, 2018). I used a basic qualitative study for this study because it allowed me to illuminate the readers' understanding of the CTE teachers' role in ELL instructional practices.

Justification of the Research Design

I chose a basic qualitative study as the research design. The study participants were CTE education teachers from an urban, public school district in the Midwest United States. A basic qualitative study is appropriate when following an interview protocol (see Castillo-Montoya, 2016). The interview protocol in this study included interview questions aligned with the research questions, creating conversations from which to generate data (see Castillo-Montoya, 2016). I developed the protocol to concentrate the interview responses on the instructional practices of CTE teachers. The use of semistructured interview questions explored participants' understanding of the instructional pedagogy they used. Interviews allowed the participants to discuss real events and issues that they had in each class they taught (Percy et al., 2015). Phone interviews were the most appropriate type of interviews for this study. Phone interviews are used to gather data quickly and provide some personal contact with each participant (Valenzuela & Shrivastava, 2002).

I considered other qualitative study designs but determined that a basic qualitative study to be the best choice for this study. The purpose of this study was to explore the ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE education teachers and how those practices

are perceived to improve ELLs' transition to the workforce. I considered a case study method but rejected it because a case study is appropriate for answering *how* and *why* questions (Yin, 2017). A case study is best used when the researcher has little control over the events or if it is impossible to identify the variables of the situation ahead of time (Harrison et al., 2017). A multisite or collective case study was considered because CTE teachers work at different schools and will have similar experiences but was rejected (see Bogdan & Bilken, 1992; Creswell & Creswell, 2017). Bogdan and Bilken (1992) stated that a case study is used to understand a specific event. A case study can discover processes and gain insight into a group of individuals (Lodico, Spaulding, & Voegtle, 2010). Merriam (2009) defined a case study as both a unit of study and the product produced from the research. A case study is a bounded system with a case or unit to study (Merriam, 2009). A bounded system means that the research has boundaries such as secondary school settings. A particularistic case study emphasizes an exact situation or phenomenon (Harrison, Birks, Franklin, & Mills, 2017). I rejected this method because the problem addressed was instructional practices and not a specific situation. A descriptive case study captures rich, thick descriptions of phenomena (Lodico et al., 2010; Merriam, 2009). Exploratory case studies research a contemporary phenomenon that addresses the *what*, *how*, and *why* questions (Blackburn, 2017). Exploratory case studies are used when the outcomes are not clearly defined and researchers are seeking to understand (Yazan, 2015; Yin, 2017). Descriptive case studies use quantitative data to support qualitative data so that method was rejected (Cranmore & Wilhelm, 2017). An

explanatory case study design was considered but rejected because I was not testing a theory in this study (Baškarada, 2014).

A case study may have perceived drawbacks, but the benefits outweigh the criticism. Cronin (2014) found that case study research may lack validity and may be held to low regard in some circles. Case study research could also be criticized for its failure to support generalizability and validity concerns question its research value (Harrison, Birks, Franklin, & Mills, 2017). A case study is beneficial when researching educational advancements, evaluating programs, or enlightening policy though (Merriam, 2009; Tight, 2010). Case studies are used to capture participants' perceptions and understandings of complex situations (Baxter & Jack, 2008).

I considered an ethnographic study but rejected it because an ethnographic study focuses on the culture of groups (Merriam, 2009). Like case studies, ethnographic studies research a phenomenon from multiple perspectives; however, ethnographic research requires the researcher to gain the perspective of the participants by becoming part of the group investigated, which was not an option as I am not a secondary education CTE teacher (see Lodico et al., 2010). My study alignment did not fit with how ethnographic studies are conducted.

I also considered the grounded theory, but this theory relies on theory development, which was not the intent of this study (Wiesche, Jurisch, Yetton, & Krcmar, 2017). Phenomenological studies are qualitative research studies that examine the meaning of an event in an individual's life (Creswell, 2014). This was not applicable

to the study of instructional practices of CTE teachers because there is not a specific event that is being studied (Ary, Jacobs, Irvine, & Walker, 2018).

Participants

Participants are necessary for any research study because they provide the data from which the study results are derived. It is vital to select the correct participants who can provide relevant data to the study; participants must represent the population the study is based on. Participants must volunteer for the study, and the data collected cannot be coerced (Bogdan & Bilken, 1992).

Criteria for Selecting Participants

I selected the target population from CTE teachers at the Midwest school district partner. Teachers from a mix of CTE subjects taught at the secondary education level possess unique experiences depending on their course content. The participants taught CTE topics such as culinary arts, cosmetology, masonry, carpentry, Information Technology, etc. The selection of the target population is vital to obtaining relevant research. A particular group of CTE teachers may not represent all of the various types of CTE programs available (Herreid, Prud'homme-Généreux, Schiller, Herreid, & Wright, 2016). All of the participants in this study taught CTE programs in a secondary education setting. Walden University partnered with an urban, public school district in the Midwest United States that was willing to participate in research.

Justification for the Number of Participants

I intended to select and interview eight to 10 CTE teachers who taught a variety of CTE subjects in a public school district in an urban city in the Midwest. The best

nonprobability sampling method for qualitative research is purposeful sampling, which also limits the number of participants to a manageable number (Palinkas et al., 2015). Unique, purposeful sampling was used because the participants were CTE teachers in a unique situation (Merriam, 2009). Purposeful sampling can gain a deeper understanding because participants have information that others do not (Creswell & Creswell, 2017). CTE education teachers were asked to voluntarily participate in the study. Creswell and Creswell (2017) stated that a few cases can be used if the data are exhaustively mined for information. Fusch and Ness (2015) found as few as six interviews are enough to provide data saturation and gain in-depth information. The small sample size allowed me to perform a deeper analysis of the data. CTE is taught in many settings, and the experiences of CTE teachers may be applied to other situations.

Procedures for Gaining Access to Participants

The partner school district administration provided me with a letter of cooperation and data use agreement, which granted permission for voluntary data collection. The principal provided consent to contact potential participants. I obtained written permission from the school district before obtaining Walden Institutional Review Board (IRB) approval. I sent e-mail communications to potential participants using my Walden University e-mail address. Potential participants were CTE teachers in secondary education programs. In my initial e-mail, I asked the participants for their preferred method of communication. Participants returned an e-mail expressing interest in participating. I then called the participants to answer any questions about the study and schedule their interviews. All participants sent an e-mail giving consent before the data

were collected. The consent form outlined potential risks, such as psychological, relationship, and legal risks. These risks were minimized in the study because of the voluntary nature of data collection and my limited contact with the participants. If participants were uncomfortable providing any information, they were informed they could stop at any point in the process. Before data collection began, I asked each participant if they were still willing to voluntarily provide data for this study. I also reiterated the nature of the study and asked if there were any questions or concerns about participating in this study. As a benefit, all participants will have access to the study results by asking to have a copy e-mailed to them.

Researcher-Participant Working Relationship

During this study, I was a doctoral student at Walden University in the Curriculum, Instruction, and Assessment Ed.D. program. I was not affiliated with the study schools. I am currently an assistant dean in the School of Business at a community college in a southern state. I am a former automotive education teacher with 25 years of experience who taught at postsecondary public education institutions and automotive manufacturer training programs. I have not taught at the secondary education level, but my current position affords me extensive interactions with secondary teachers in CTE programs. I contacted each participant via phone to introduce myself and begin to build an open relationship. Through conversation, I began to understand each individual's position and willingness to provide information.

Protecting Participant Rights

The participants of this study have rights and expectations that are critical to the research procedure. The risk to the privacy of participants in small case studies may be more difficult to protect than in large “big data” studies (Henderson, 2016). Consent from the school administration and each participant was authorized before data collection began (Merriam, 2009). Participant consent was provided by e-mail before participants completed the interview. I reviewed with each participant that this was a voluntary study and they were not required to participate. Individual rights must be protected by ensuring there is informed voluntary consent of the participants (Ross, Iguchi, & Panicker, 2018). Lodico et al. (2010) stated that researchers should weigh all possible risks when collecting data. At any time during the process, the participant could withdraw from providing data. Participants could provide written notification to me that they no longer wanted to participate in the data collection process.

To maintain confidentiality, I used the Microsoft Excel product and assigned an ID to each participant. The core requirement for ethically responsible research is voluntary, informed consent from participants (Ross et al., 2018). The use of the ID provided confidentiality for participants. This confidential ID is only known to me and will be used in all communications about the study. Changing the names of the participants is not enough protection to ensure their privacy (J. M. Morse & Coulehan, 2015). The ID and participants names are stored in two different electronic sources to provide additional security as to their identities. Access to participants own data will be provided if they ask for it (Henderson, 2016). Participant contact information was limited

to name, e-mail address, and a contact phone number only. I limited the available demographic information about the participants to include a school district in the Midwest.

Data Collection

The instruments used to collect data were semistructured interviews. Qualitative research engages participants through interviews to gain personal knowledge of a situation (Cleary, Horsfall, & Hayter, 2014). The qualitative data from teacher interviews clarified ELL pedagogical practices that CTE teachers use. A goal of qualitative data collection is to discover what is happening and how the implications of what is occurring are linked (Merriam, 2009). I used semistructured phone interviews for this basic qualitative study.

Data Collection Process

The target population of high school CTE teachers came from recommendations by a Midwestern school district and a search of CTE teachers on high school web sites. It was important to have a mix of CTE subjects for this study to provide unique experiences each subject offers (Lynch, 1996). CTE topics in my study included family and consumer education, culinary, engineering, agriculture, and medical careers. This group of CTE teachers did not represent all CTE programs available but is a representation of the types of subjects taught in CTE programs (Herreid et al., 2016). CTE programs are taught in many school districts and the experiences of these CTE teachers may be applied to other high school settings.

Semistructured phone interviews were the source for gathering data. Data were collected after being granted permission to do so by the Walden IRB (IRB Approval No. 06-08-18-0338811). Qualitative studies use interviews for data collection (Kallio, Pietilä, Johnson, & Kangasniemi, 2016; Oates, 2015). Redlich-Amirav and Higginbottom (2014) confirm that qualitative research uses interviews to collect information. Interviews are the best source of data collection when researchers cannot observe behavior, feelings, or how people react to a situation (Merriam, 2009). The data collection was limited to the interview data. The participants found phone calls more convenient for interviews than using Skype. Interviews were conducted over the phone, recorded, and transcribed. The data were analyzed using a constant comparative model and batched into categories based on similar themes. Color coding and theme identification methods were used to analyze the participant data.

Walden University partnered with an urban public school in the Midwest. The intent of this study was to have eight-10 CTE teachers participate. In September 2018, I began contacting participants. I found 13 possible participants e-mail addresses by searching Midwestern high school web sites. Using my Walden University e-mail address, I contacted the 13 possible participants to ask for their voluntary participation in my study. Of the 13 possible participants, four agreed to participate, three said to not contact them again, and six did not respond to multiple e-mail requests. After receiving an e-mail confirmation of consent to participate, I set up interviews with the four who agreed to participate. The four interviews were completed at the end of October 2018.

Four interviews are not enough for data saturation. Fusch and Ness (2015) stated that six interviews were sufficient to provide data to reach saturation. With a participant population of fewer than eight, methods such as snowball, chain, or network sampling may be used to select additional participants (Merriam, 2009). Because the initial response was insufficient for data saturation, networking was utilized to identify other potential participants who can provide relevant data. With permission from Walden University, I searched other Midwestern high school web sites for CTE teachers. I found seven high schools that teach CTE programs in a Midwestern public school system. I contacted 13 additional CTE teachers in November 2018. By the end of December 2018, four of the 13 responded that they wanted to participate, one declined, and eight did not respond. After receiving an e-mail confirmation of consent to participate, I set up interviews with the four who agreed to participate. The four interviews were completed by the end in January 2019. For this study I contacted 26 participants, eight participants were interviewed, four said they did not want to participate, and 14 did not respond to multiple e-mail requests. All of the participants are high school CTE teachers.

The sample size of eight participants facilitated the saturation of data. It has been found that small sample sizes can provide data saturation (Ertefaie, Small, & Rosenbaum, 2018; Morse, Lowery, & Steury, 2014). Creswell and Creswell (2017) said a few cases can be used if the data is exhaustively mined for information. Data saturation is necessary to ensure all of the participants' information as it relates to the study is collected. The saturation of data can occur when no new data is generated (Kolb, 2012; Saunders et al.,

2018). A sample size of eight participants allowed me to perform a deeper analysis of the data.

Data Collection Instruments

Semistructured phone interviews were the source for data. The purpose of this study was to explore the ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers and how those practices are perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. Interviews are the most used data collection method in qualitative studies (Kallio et al., 2016; Oates, 2015). Interviews are the best source of data collection when researchers cannot observe behavior, feelings, or how people react to a situation (Merriam, 2009). The design and time frame of this study did not allow me to conduct classroom observations.

Interviews. Interviews are the preferred method for collecting data because they can get better or more data and the cost is less than other methods of data acquisition. An interview protocol was followed (Appendix B). Qualitative research uses interviews to collect information (Redlich-Amirav & Higginbottom, 2014). Interviews can gain insight into descriptions and interpretations of others (Stake, 1995). Interviews can be structured, semistructured, or unstructured in nature (Merriam, 2009). For this study, semistructured one-on-one phone interviews were deemed most appropriate. A semistructured interview is used when the researcher uses a mix of structured and informal questions. The semistructured interviews are flexible in nature but are used to gain specific data from the participants. Structured and informal questions can be used in any order, as the flow of the interview will determine which questions get asked next. Semistructured interviews allow for spontaneous answers that can add depth and thickness to the data (Kvale, 2008).

The answers should provide a description of the situation or create a story the participant can recount. Merriam (2009) found that a researcher should not ask *Why* questions as they can lead to a dead end response. Open-ended questions allowed the participant to describe their experiences, opinions, or values, how they feel, and background or demographic information. I followed up with probing questions based on the participant's responses. Probing questions seek to clarify information or elicit an additional response. As such, probing questions were impulsive and were not planned. Probing or follow up questions included how the participant felt about a particular situation or what their opinions were.

Qualitative questions are open-ended to allow the respondents to define the situation in their own words where they may formulate new ideas on a topic. Merriam (2009) found that additional questions may take the form of a hypothetical situation, devil's advocate, ideal position or interpretive questions and help provide additional in-depth data from the participant. An interview guide was used to guide the researcher in asking the questions (Merriam, 2009). Jacob and Furgerson (2012) developed interview protocol guidelines, such as building rapport and specific questioning techniques, which were used with the teachers (see Appendix B). I piloted the interview questions with my peers to flush out confusing questions or questions that need rewording. It is imperative to make the questions clear in nature to the participants.

Sufficiency of data collection instruments. Data collection was obtained from phone interviews. The saturation of data happens when no new data is generated (Kolb, 2012). Data saturation is necessary to ensure all of the participants' information as it

relates to the study is collected. Fusch and Ness (2015) stated that six interviews could provide data to reach saturation. Interviews provided the data necessary to generate results for this study.

Process for how and when data are generated and recorded. I intended to have the interviews recorded using Skype software. Skype is an appropriate method to conduct the interviews (Iacono, Symonds, & Brown, 2016; Oates, 2015; Quartiroli, Knight, Etzel, & Monaghan, 2018). Skype is accessible from any computer with an internet connection and Skype software. If using Skype, the researcher must be aware of some limitations. To ensure security Skype interviews would have been conducted with only the researcher and participant present. Using the phone or the Internet to connect with participants limits personal interactions. Skype can be used with voice only or with a camera feed is available on both parties' systems. A concern may be how to validate the interviewee's identity (Iacono et al., 2016). The researcher can use several methods to validate the interviewee's identification such as holding up picture identification or discussion with the supervisor before the interview to gather information about the participant. Another method is to use social media to cross check ones identity if available (Iacono et al., 2016). Using Skype without a camera eliminates nonverbal cues (Mealer & Jones, 2014) and, as with any technology, there can be technical difficulties. The necessary software and hardware must be available to both parties. Connection speed may make it difficult to conduct an interview (Iacono et al., 2016; Oates, 2015). The participants did not choose to use Skype. Interviews were conducted via phone calls and digitally recorded.

The participants found phone calls easier to complete the interviews. The interviews were conducted outside participant school work hours so as not to interfere with their jobs. By scheduling the interviews outside normal working hours, the burden on the part of the participants was minimized. The total participant time for this study was estimated at 60 minutes. Irvine, Drew, and Sainsbury (2013) found that participants should tolerate 30 minutes for a phone interview where most face-to-face interviews last longer. The initial interviews lasted about 45-50 minutes. It is important to build rapport with the interviewee to get quality data (Mealer & Jones, 2014; Oates, 2015). A lack of face-to-face interactions can hinder rapport. An informal introductory conversation can set the tone for the entire interview and build trust (Irvine et al., 2013; Weller, 2017). Quality data generation is built on trust between the interviewer and interviewee. I used a phone application to record the interviews. These recorded interviews were used to create a transcript. Member checks were performed to ensure the accuracy of participant responses.

Process for tracking data from instruments and emerging themes. There are several ways to record the interview data. The best method is to electronically record the interview so it can be played back verbatim. Other methods include taking notes during the interview or recording data after the interview. Both of those methods cause the researcher to lose concentration in the interview process. Each interview was electronically recorded. A systematic approach is important to interpret transcripts (Cleary et al., 2014). Beginning researchers should transcribe at least one interview to see what opportunities they missed to follow up with probing questions (Oates, 2015). I

transcribed my first participant's interview into a word document. This technique can also be used to validate the questions to ensure they are soliciting the desired depth of response. Accurate data recording and transcription is essential for reliability in qualitative research (Lewis, 2015). The remaining interviews were transcribed verbatim by the phone application. When reviewing the transcriptions, I read through the interview responses while listening to the recording in case corrections or data is missing from the interview. I analyzed each transcription to thoroughly explore and look for alternative understandings which may lead to additional or recoding of the data (Cleary et al., 2014). The transcription document used single-spaced lines which I numbered. When the interview speaker changed, the lines were double spaced to identify a change in who was talking. The interview questions were bolded and highlighted so they were easily identified.

Data security. The privacy of the participants is vital. The data is stored on the researcher's personal computer when the research was completed. The personal computer is password protected and only I know the password. Recorded phone interviews and documents are stored in the home of the researcher for at least 5 years. My home is locked when not occupied. All data will be viewed by me only in the privacy of my home. Steps will be taken to ensure others will not be present when viewing the data. School documents were requested sent via Walden University e-mail. There is always a concern about the security of information on the Internet (Miller, Latulipe, Melius, Quandt, & Arcury, 2016). Password protection is one way to protect data. Data were filed

using the randomly assigned ID numbers to protect the source. All recorded data stored in my personal computer will be deleted after 5 years from the date of the final study.

Systems to develop themes. The interview data were analyzed using the constant comparative method to discover themes. Interview data were transcribed and analyzed as the interviews were completed. Anticipated themes from the data included more instructional practices, state policies, professional development, too much paperwork, and students are not prepared to learn. Codes derived from the data were placed into critical consciousness categories to determine the level of participation CTE teachers feel they are conveying to their ELLs. The interview protocol aligns with Freire's critical consciousness theory (Appendix B). The three elements of Freire's (1970) theory are (a) the oppressor-oppressed relationship, (b) the banking concept of education, and (c) how the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment. CC elements can be measured and validated.

Several researchers have developed scales to measure different populations of critical consciousness of the participants (Diemer, McWhirter, Ozer, & Rappa, 2015). Thomas et al. (2014) found that additional research using to measure critical consciousness was necessary. Diemer et al. (2017) created a 46-item scale with two subcomponents of Freire's concepts. Critical reflection allows a researcher to analyze societal inequalities. The other subcomponent is a critical action that encompasses collective action to change the perceptions of society's inequalities. Thomas et al. developed the Critical Consciousness Inventory (CCI), which is a nine-item scale used to measure CC development and civic engagement. Thomas et al. found that CC has the

potential to better understand the development of youths, but the concept needs further analysis. The CCI can be used to promote student development and evaluate the curricula for CC components (Thomas et al., 2014). The CCI report validated data by using, Rasch-type analysis and the CCI scale was created using the Guttman scale. Themes derived from interview data were analyzed against the CCI scale for CC components. Student interaction and activity are a core component of CTE. Student CC is more prevalent during high interaction times with other students. Through student interactions, students are aware of their differences with other students. Abilities and comprehension differences may be highlighted through instructor interactions. Diemer et al. found that factors of CC can be identified in three underlying conceptually meaningful factors were, (a) perceived inequality, (b) perceived fairness, and (c) sociopolitical involvement. These factors can be experienced in CTE classrooms where student interactions are high.

The factor for critical reflection is the perceived inequality of how participants feel about their status and how others around them are treated. This factor can be observed in the instructional practices of CTE instructors. Areas of concern concentrate on how people are treated differently or do racial or ethnic groups have advantages over me. Students may perceive that they are being treated differently than others because of their social status or ELL status.

The factor for critical reflection is that egalitarianism examines societal equity. This factor can be observed in a CTE classroom with regards to how CTE instruction differs from academic instruction. ELLs may be treated one way in academic classes and

another in CTE classes. The instructional practices of CTE teachers may not allow for ELL differences in teaching concepts so ELLs feel they are being left out.

The third factor of critical action is the sociopolitical participation is how individuals participate in the social-political process to affect change perceived inequalities. This factor relates to how ELLs transition from high school to the workforce. ELLs would demonstrate competence and confidence through subject knowledge. Employers would be the best source of data to gauge student behaviors and actions in the workplace. Employers could monitor student progress over time to indicate student sociopolitical participation.

Role of the Researcher

My educational background is rooted in CTE and as such, I have beliefs of what CTE teachers current teaching practices should entail. I believe that to be an effective teacher, your background should have some understanding of current research-based teaching practices. I also believe that teachers should be self-reflective and understand their shortcomings when teaching occupational skills. By understanding their shortcomings, they would seek information to improve their teachings. I reviewed my data analysis for any biases that I may have towards CTE teachers. I took the necessary steps to avoid any conflict of interest by constantly reflecting on my actions and comments. I understood there was a potential for bias as I collected the interview data because I have a background in CTE instruction. As a former automotive teacher, I have taught in postsecondary and business settings. I have never worked as a secondary CTE education teacher; therefore, I do not possess the same educational experiences as

secondary teachers. I am not familiar with the duties and requirements required to meet local, state and federal policies. I have worked with secondary education CTE teachers, but I have not taught in a secondary education setting. Therefore, my experiences are similar but not exact.

I understand that I, and the participants, brought biases, predispositions, and attitudes which may affect the interactions we had (Merriam, 2009). In all interactions with the participants, I reminded myself to be nonjudgmental, respectful, and nonthreatening. My experiences have allowed me to interact with a diverse population and I constantly reminded myself of the background of CTE teachers and how their culture and experiences might impact their reactions to education. Those reactions may be different from mine in any situation. I have worked with many cultures and I am cognizant of the differences they have over my cultural upbringings. I need to understand how my personality and skill as an interviewer affected the answers the participants provided. I practiced the interview questions with my peers and used their feedback to analyze how my interview techniques were perceived. I also needed to be aware of the attitudes and both myself and the participants when interacting with the participants. I constantly reflected on the moment and determined if an adverse situation was developing which may have restricted the data collection process. And I must understand the motivation that both the participant and I had to work on this study. Participants may have ulterior motives for providing data (Merriam, 2009). I worked to develop a researcher-participant relationship that was comfortable, open and inviting so each participant would feel comfortable when they shared their experiences with me.

Data Analysis

The purpose of this study was to explore the ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers and how those practices are perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. Qualitative data analysis methods were used to analyze the data. Data analysis began after I conducted and transcribed the interview data. The data collection process was limited by the time frame of this study and the participants teaching schedules. Analyzing the data resulted in codes, categories, and themes from which the results may be summarized.

Analysis Including Coding Procedures

The interview data were collected between October 2018 and January 2019. Interview transcriptions were downloaded and stored on my password-protected computer. Data generated from interviews were coded and analyzed.

All data were analyzed using the constant comparative method to discover themes. Constant comparative method has been most associated with grounded theory but has gained popularity in other research models (Cho & Lee, 2014; Fram, 2013). The constant comparative method allows the researcher to analyze data inductively so the data can be connected between codes and categories (Boeijs, 2002; Hewitt-Taylor, 2001). The constant comparative analysis conceptualizes the data and places it into general concept categories (Merriam, 2009). The constant comparative method was used continuously throughout the study. Data were collected until the point of saturation. Saturation is when no new themes are evident. The data were coded and interpreted. The researcher is responsible for analyzing the data and determining themes. It is the self-awareness of the

researcher to ensure data accuracy and saturation (Houghton, Casey, Shaw, & Murphy, 2013; J. M. Morse, 2015; Spiers, Morse, Olson, Mayan, & Barrett, 2002). The researcher has the responsibility of ensuring the data analyzed thoroughly. Regularly collecting data and coding to ensure the researcher has exhausted the possibilities is an essential process for any study.

Recorded interview data were transcribed to word documents. I read through the transcripts to gain an understanding of what the participants said. During the first analysis of the transcripts, I searched for a priori codes based on Freire's concepts of (a) the oppressor-oppressed relationship, (b) the banking concept of education, and (c) how the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment from the conceptual framework. I identified those codes in sentences, paragraphs, and sections of data (Hewitt-Taylor, 2001). I used color coding to code the concepts found in the transcribed interviews (Karahan, Canbazoglu Bilici, & Unal, 2015). A different color was used to highlight each a priori code. When I reviewed the transcripts again, I made notes in the margin of each page about data meaning. The notes consisted of phrases such as does this apply to all students, need administrative support, stronger community connection, etc. Merriam (2009) said notes should reflect relevant statements to a study. I began to reflect on the notes and how they aligned with a priori codes. I reviewed the highlighted data again and identified and underlined common concepts from which I created inductive codes.

These inductive codes were placed into categories that became themes (Appendix C). In my third review of the transcripts, I reflected on the a priori codes and notes.

Inductive codes began to emerge from my interpretations of the data. I wrote the induced codes in the margin of the transcript where I highlighted and circled each code. I compared and contrasted the a priori codes with the inductive codes formulated from the data. I counted each different highlighted color and totaled the number of times each code was used. I initially listed 12 inductive codes that I felt represented the participants' feelings. After a careful reflection of the 12 inductive codes, I collapsed similar data into five inductive codes. Inductive codes included student preparation, flexible content delivery, different ELL language levels, lack of community connections, and informing ELLs of the expectations of CTE programs. The inductive codes derived from the data did not match a priori codes based on Freire's constructs. For example, one a priori code was the banking concept of education which contrasted with the inductive code of flexible content delivery. Together, these codes were assigned to three broader categories.

The three categories consisted of (a) student-centered vs. instructor-led pedagogy, (b) curriculum, and (c) community connections. I reviewed the three categories and analyzed how they aligned with the two research questions. The two research questions were from the perspectives of CTE teachers: what instructional practices are used to support ELLs and what instructional practices are perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. The reflection of the alignment between categories and research questions led me to create six themes. The themes were classroom management techniques, adapting curriculum, instructional consistency, questioning techniques, connection with community partners, and teaching relevant content. As themes began to emerge from the categories, I repeatedly reviewed the transcripts, notes, and codes to further refine and

support these themes (Cho & Lee, 2014; Holton, 2010). I incorporated the category of student-centered vs. instructor-led pedagogy into the two themes of classroom management techniques and questioning techniques. This aligns with Freire's (1970) CC theory of the oppressor-oppressed relationship. The category of the curriculum is reflected in the themes of curriculum changes to support ELL instruction and consistent instructional delivery. This aligns with the CC theory of the banking concept of education. The category of community connections is reflected in the themes of connection with community partners and teaching relevant content. This aligns with the CC concept of how the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment.

Themes are formed based on similar ideas or concepts in qualitative data analysis that combine to form major ideas (Creswell, 2012). The themes that developed from research question 1 were the classroom management techniques, adapting curriculum, instructional consistency, and questioning techniques. The themes that developed from research question 2 were the connection with community partners and teaching relevant content. These six themes reflected the feelings the participants had about instructional practices and their understanding of how they are preparing ELLs for the workforce.

Evidence of Quality of Procedures

Walden University IRB approval process ensured quality research methods were followed. The credibility of data was reviewed through member checking. Member checking, or respondent validation, was a process where I solicited feedback from the participants as I was uncovering themes (Merriam, 2009). As I conducted the interviews I

performed member checking to ensure I had identified participants' ideas correctly. That process ensured the data was accurately depicted by the participants.

Creditability and validity refer to the trustworthiness of data collected.

Creditability of the study was addressed by following an interview protocol during the data collection process. Following an interview protocol increases the reliability of a study (Castillo-Montoya, 2016). The same questions and order were asked of each participant. By following an interview protocol each participant was able to answer all of the questions. Providing each participant with the same opportunity was important.

Validity occurs when the data gathered reaches saturation. Saunders et al. (2018) describe validity as ensuring the content of the data is valid. To support validity and creditability member checks and peer reviews that confirm categories and interpretations are used (Lodico et al., 2010; Poduthase, 2015). At the same time, questions arise as to the validity of those checks. Member checks may invalidate the interpretation the researcher has performed (Harrison et al., 2017; Mjøsund et al., 2017). Smith and McGannon (2018) found member checking does not verify the research. When member checking is performed, the participant may contradict their original statements. They may have a different impression of the questions because of the time factor between interviews. Twining et al., (2017) state terms such as truthfulness and trustworthiness should replace validity in qualitative studies. The researcher must be truthful in presenting the data and trustworthy that they followed IRB procedures in reporting the results.

Procedures for Dealing with Discrepant Cases

Discrepant cases may arise because of a misunderstanding of the question or a participant providing information that was not asked. During the data analysis, it may be noted that a data sample does not agree with other data samples from the same question (Bråten, Braasch, & McCrudden, 2018). The member check process should verify if the data analysis reveals a data sample that does not agree with other samples. It may be difficult for the reader to understand the analysis if it is not known who is right or who is wrong (Braasch & Bråten, 2017). If discrepant cases are noted, the interviewee would be contacted to review the data (Birt, Scott, Cavers, Campbell, & Walter, 2016). There were no discrepant cases in this study.

Data Analysis Results

The purpose of this study was to explore the ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers and how those practices are perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. The two research questions were used to explore the perspectives of CTE teachers: what instructional practices are used to support ELLs and what instructional practices are perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. The eight participants were CTE secondary education teachers who took participated in phone interviews that did not exceed 1 hour. CTE teachers teach different content; therefore, their individual concerns will differ from each other.

The framework of my study is based on Freire's (1970) theory of CC. Three elements of Freire's theory are (a) the oppressor-oppressed relationship, (b) the banking concept of education, and (c) how the transformation of the learning environment

changes the learning environment. A basic qualitative methodology fits the intent to explore the ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers. My study explores the instructional practices of CTE teachers and how they prepare ELLs to enter the workforce.

Process for When Data Were Generated, Gathered, and Recorded

I intended to use Skype to record the interviews; however, it became evident that participants felt more comfortable with phone calls. Phone calls offered them more flexibility for when the interviews were conducted. I recorded the phone interviews using an application on my phone. I transcribed the first interview to gain an understanding of the participants' responses and the complexity of the interview. The interviews were transcribed into Word documents. I printed the transcribed interviews and read each transcript two times to get an understanding of the data. I made several corrections to the transcriptions to reflect the accuracy of the recorded calls. I then listened to each interview call again and verified the accuracy of the transcription. I reviewed the printed transcription and highlighted codes and emerging themes while making notes in the margins. Data collection and analysis of the transcriptions took nine weeks. I coded for themes that addressed the research questions as well as Freire's (1970) framework of CC. I also analyzed the data for any evidence of research-based instructional pedagogy. The data were organized and aligned with each of the research questions.

Findings From the Problem and Research Questions

The purpose of my doctoral study was to research what instructional practices are used to support ELLs and are perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. I

analyzed the interview responses to Freire's (1970) CC theory elements of (a) the oppressor-oppressed relationship, (b) the banking concept of education, and (c) how the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment. The themes derived from the data were aligned with the research questions. The themes that developed from research question 1 were the classroom management techniques, adapting curriculum, instructional consistency, and questioning techniques. The themes that developed from research question 2 were the connection with community partners and teaching relevant content.

Participant Responses that Address Instructional Practices

The interview questions addressed research question 1. From the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices are used to support ELLs? All eight of the participants responded that they needed to modify the curriculum to meet ELL needs. The modifications included moving from teacher centered to student centered, adding more picture and vocabulary and using a consistent format for content delivery. Students responded positively to the instructors' delivery methods.

Research question 1 Theme 1: Classroom management techniques. Classroom management techniques vary depending on the students' progress in the school year. All eight participants said they changed their teaching style from teacher-led to student-centered as the school year progressed. The participant's answers varied from instructor-led to student-centered depending on which students were in their classes. Participants 4 and 8 said it is a combination of both teacher-led and student-centered. The participants felt that students needed more instructor-led guidance at the beginning of the year but as

students learned what the teacher expectations were, they moved to a more student-centered approach. Participant 7 said, “More teacher-led at the beginning versus at the end.” The teachers found that at the beginning of a school year, students needed more guidance to understand the content being presented. The teacher was setting the tone for the remainder of the year on how the teacher wanted the class to be managed. As the school year progressed, the students were able to work more independently because they understood what the teacher expected from them. The instructional methodology changed from teacher-centered to student-centered but the student-centered approach was dependent on which students were in each class. Participant 2 said, “Here’s how to do this thing. Here’s a little bit of how it works, now adjust it, figure it out. Make it change. Make it work for you. And then, it’s almost all project based.” Participant 6 said, “I have some kind of teacher instruction that kind of thing but then there’s usually like a breakout group when they are working with tier peers and doing their own activities.” The classroom management style that teachers use in their classes is dependent on what class they are teaching and who the students are in that class.

Classroom management techniques vary depending on the grade level of the students in a class. CTE classes tend to be heterogeneous. In other words, the students who are in the class are a result of their interests and their choice of elective. CTE teachers may have classes with only ninth and 10th grade students or classes with only 11th and 12th grade students. CTE teachers may also have a mix of ninth grade to 12th grade students in the same class. It depends on which students choose their classes. Students choose the class they want based on their interests’ because CTE subjects count

as electives. Participant 6 said, “They have a limited amount of electives that they can take and they usually need to get their required classes done first so I don’t have too many freshmen in my class.” Participant 8 said, “I have nine through 12 and I also have six through eight so I have some middle school six through eight. I might have a ninth-grade ELL 1 and 12th-grade ELL 1 in the same class.” Teachers used different teaching techniques depending on the grade level of students. Lower grade levels required more instructional guidance from the teacher and therefore were a more teacher-centered style was used. In classes that contained higher grade students, the instructors were able to use student-centered learning techniques. Students were more mature and were able to perform the assignments with some help. They adapted their classroom management techniques as their student population changed.

Finally, classroom management techniques vary depending on the ELL level of students in a class. Participant 4 said, “There are over 35 different languages spoken in the school, you have to address each class differently.” Four of the participants stated that they had many different languages spoken in their classes and that 50% to 60% of the school population in the district was ELL. During the school year, teachers may have newly arrived students, who just moved into the area, placed into their classes. Participant 1, 3, and 8 said that a lot of our ELLs are refugees that don’t have any formal schooling. When a class was mostly Level 1 ELLs, the instructors were teacher-centered and fixated on students understanding vocabulary. Level 1 ELLs needed more guidance and instruction to understand the content. CTE teachers can have Level 1 to Level 6 ELLs in the same class. The nature of CTE programs as electives accounts for the ELL level

variation in classes. Participant 8 stated, “I have ELL 1 through ELL 3 in the same class just because of our elective numbers.” The differences in ELL levels in classes can be challenging. Participant 6 “it’s like you have having problems you got a Level 1 and a Level 6 together like hey, you are all over the place.” Combining the different level ELLs in the same class can put additional pressure on teachers.

Each class was comprised of various levels of ELLs who brought with them their culture and educational experiences in the classroom. Participant 8 said, “I have nine through 12 and I also have six through eight so I have some middle school six through eight. I might have a ninth grade ELL level 1 and 12th grade ELL Level 1 in the same class.” When a class was mostly Level 1 ELLs, the instructors were teacher-centered and fixated on students understanding vocabulary. Participant 2 said, “Some of my EL students are strong, they’re strong speakers, they practice, they work hard. And some of my other students are struggling more. They aren’t able to work as hard because they’re more frustrated.” The experiences that ELLs bring to their CTE classes can be rewarding and challenging at the same time. Participant 1 said,

Because you want to challenge them and you’re going to get to that point but at the same time, like, sometimes you are aiming a little too high and the students go, they don’t get there and they get frustrated and it’s just kind of like beats them down more and already difficult.

Teachers may see ELLs move from one level to another during the school year. As they learn English through learning vocabulary and writing skills, the CTE class dynamics can change. Participant 4 stated, “Getting into the higher level they know how

to write better.” When a class had mostly ELL Level 3 students, the instructor could use other instructional techniques because the students had a better grasp of the concepts and vocabulary. Because the student population can vary in each class, teachers had to be flexible in their instructional delivery techniques. The teaching techniques varied amongst the classes they taught depending on where they were in the semester, the mix of grade levels, and the various levels of ELLs in a class.

Changing classroom management techniques aligns with Freire’s theory of the oppressor-oppressed relationship where the relationship is counter to an instructor-led methodology. CTE teachers consider the dynamics of the class makeup and modify their teaching style to accommodate the student differences. Teachers are not being the oppressors and dictating information that the students are expected to learn. The diverse student population was not a surprise but it does challenge the teachers to be creative in their teaching styles so that every student can take advantage of the opportunity to learn (Baumeler, 2017). Participant 7 stated,

It’s challenging because our school district will put English Learners in with native speakers, so I may have an EL level one or two, three or four level in with students that are native English speakers and it’s very challenging for me because EL students especially level ones need to be taught at a slower pace than native speakers or even higher level EL students, they can handle a faster pace.

Teachers need the skills to recognize the diversity in their classes and a process to take advantage of the uniqueness (Miles & Knipe, 2018; Vega et al., 2016). Kuhn et al. (2016) remind us that CTE teachers need help in understanding research-based

instructional techniques because they lack sufficient time to research such methods on their own.

Research question 1 Theme 2: Curriculum changes to support ELL

instruction. All eight of the participants were excited to have ELLs in their classes but they understood that changes were necessary to the curriculum to meet the challenges of ELLs face in their classes. The participants desire to provide the best instruction for their students has them reviewing their curriculums. All eight of the participants followed state guidelines that are applicable to their topic in teaching employable skills. Participant 1 said he follows a standard curriculum “but I’m free to change any stuff.” The teachers felt a need to modify content to fit their particular classroom. The participants said they added content to fill needs students had based on their prior learning. They added more videos or vocabulary where they felt students could use additional guidance. Participants 1, 2, and 4 said they made some modifications to the standard curriculum to make it less reading intensive. Participant 6 addressed the issue by saying,

Pre-structured stuff is meant for a suburban school where everybody is at the same reading level. You definitely have to create your own stuff and modify it and make many different kinds of variations that hopefully meet everybody’s needs and that are the struggle for sure, trying to catch everybody especially with that one class right after I have a level one in it here and then I got a level six.

The participants tried to use the standard curriculum because it takes a lot of time to instructional material to be relevant to ELL instruction. Participant 5 said, “I do preplanned mostly because it just takes a lot of time and stress off on my plate but I find

myself modifying it for different groups but its' mostly preplanned thing that I find." The participants found that the standard curriculum used in lab work did not require as many changes as the content curriculum.

The diversity of CTE curriculum and instructor preferences on teaching styles will always be a source of concern for teachers. Participants 2 and 4 also modified their curriculum to meet their class goals. They concentrated more on vocational vocabulary and used additional pictures to increase the understanding of core concepts. Participants used available resources to reinforce class concepts. Participant 6 stated,

Anytime we come across a word of like phrase or something that very foreign to them, it's so convenient to have Google right there and just pull up Google images, this is what I'm talking about, now do you guys get it? They are like oh yeah.

The participants also found that the native speaking students benefited from instructional techniques that worked for ELLs. Participant 8 found that "I find that anything modification wise that I've done is acceptable for how level ELL as well as a mainstreamed regular education student." Curriculum changes are part of the self-reflection that teachers use when they understand what the students need to learn.

Changing the curriculum to fit students' needs is represented in Freire's (1970) CC theory of the banking concept of education. This concept is demonstrated in how teachers determine students' and change the standard curriculum to meet those needs. The participants created an authentic relationship between teacher and student through understanding what students need for success. Participant 8 said, "Anything I'm getting

that's coming from a curriculum, its' obviously got to be modified for ELLs." Placklé et al. (2017) also found that the curriculum should address the needs of the learners. If ELLs need additional material to understand concepts, they need to be incorporated into the curriculum.

Research question 1 Theme 3: Consistent instructional delivery. Consistent instructional delivery methods were important for each instructor so students would know what was expected of them each class. The participant felt following a pattern creates a desirable classroom behavior. All eight participants have a consistent classroom process. They feel that ELLs are more successful in class when they have a consistent plan to follow. Students can concentrate on new material when they know what is expected of them each class. Participant 4 said,

I think what's really the key point in all education is how you start your class and what we do is when you go into any class here if they have the same pattern. So we have guided questions and a learning goal and an agenda and a word for the day here.

The participants felt consistency in classroom management was important for student success. The participants used techniques such as starting each class with 10-15 minutes of lecture to set the tone for the class. Some participants used learning goals, vocabulary words or questions to begin their classes. Participant 2 said,

I try to keep it as similar as possible, especially with the language and with the ways in which we ask them because that just adds another language tax if we switch things up too much between like class and assessments.

The participants felt this structure was important for learning. When students were exposed to a consistent format of instruction, they were able to grasp complicated concepts better.

Consistent instructional delivery is applicable in the framework of Freire's CC theory is how the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment. Although there was consistency in the instructional delivery, the level of difficulty would change from the beginning of the school year to the end. At the beginning of the school year, students were introduced to concepts and provided most of the information about the topic. Student assessments were more aligned with an understanding of simple concepts. As the year progressed, more difficult lessons relied on knowledge gained earlier in the school year (Parkinson & Mackay, 2016; W. Zhang, 2017). Participant 4 said,

At the beginning you know like I said everybody sold you know ELO the question of the day the learning goals the da the agenda of the word of the day, so that pattern helps ELO because it's the same thing in every class. So that pattern following the pattern, creates a behavior that when they come into classroom they're kind of set.

The content delivered should be delivered with enough repetition for students to develop a behavior of understanding ("Engineering a classroom that works for all", 2018). This will reduce the stress that students can experience when they are unsure of what is coming next.

Research question 1 Theme 4: Questioning techniques. All eight participants varied their questioning techniques to fit the desired outcomes of each class. Participants 3 and 6 said, “Memorizing is useless in our information age.” The participants used questions to stimulate conversation. Through conversations, the ELLs would generate their own questions. Participant 2 said, “I get more questions from my ELL students. They are more habituated to needed to ask questions or they realize they are at a disadvantage.” They felt the questions they asked meant they were interested in learning. Participant 5 said, “They ask more of like what does this mean. They ask for more clarification.” As the school year progressed, the participants moved from general questions about comprehension to more in-depth questions that were aligned with critical thinking skills. Participant 4 said, “I tried not to answer their questions directly but through a series of related questions, I tried to lead the students to come up with the answers.” The participants would guide the students in the process of acquiring knowledge. Participant 6 said, “Right I teach them the process of how to answer a question whether it’s a simple transfer skill or how do we solve it.” CTE subjects utilize critical thinking skills to move from memorization to problem-solving. Participant 3 said,

But they don’t learn it. You could get up there and tell them the answers but you’re not developing critical thinkers and you’re also not teaching them how to do the work of a scientist. And the retention level is much shorter. You can tell them all the facts but they’re not going to retain it.

Each of the participants used questioning techniques that elicited student participation in the learning process.

Questioning techniques are part of the conceptual framework that is directly aligned with Freire's CC theory, which is the banking concept of education. This questioning technique is what Freire (1970) would recognize as participant participation. The teachers were not dominating and dictating the information. Students were allowed to come up with answers through interaction with the teacher and each other. Participant 3 summed it up by stating, "You can tell them all the facts but they're not going to retain it." Ahmed et al. (2017) found that when students explained what they know, they are better equipped to perform a task.

Participant Responses That Address ELL Transition to the Workforce

The interview questions addressed research question 2. From the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices are perceived to improve successful ELL transition to the workforce? All eight of the participants responded that they did not have a formal process for tracking graduates. They did not have advisory groups comprised of area businesses that could give feedback on their programs. Six of the teachers stated they had conversations with former students and they asked the graduate if they were using the skills they learned in class, at their jobs. Students responded positively about the instruction they received.

Research question 2 Theme 5: Connection with community partners. The eight participants did not exhibit a strong relationship with community members. Participants 2, 4, 7, and 8 expressed similar a sentiment. They did not have direct connections with community partners but other departments at the school were responsible for fostering those industry connections. Participant 2 said, "I have limited

contact with graduates and it's actually a huge problem because we'd like to make all these grand statements about how successful we are at getting in the college and we have no idea." Two of the participants said that the lack of community connections with their programs was a problem. They wanted the feedback from the community about how their ELLs were connecting with the workforce.

Freire's CC theory of how the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment is evident in connections with the community. This is demonstrated by how the students succeed in the workplace. Vocke et al. (2016) also found that students who are connected to the community are better learners because they see a connection between school programs and life skills. Participant 1 said,

I don't really have any follow-up with the students in the workplace unless they come back to the school in which case I always, like, I'll ask them, like, what part of the class is useful, did this stuff help you, and trying to nail down specifics and I am always trying to get feedback from them.

CTE teachers wanted feedback from business partners on how their graduates are doing in the workplace. Learning CTE content does not only happen in the classroom. Parkinson and Mackay (2016) found that students learned in school as well as in the workplace. These connections ELLs have to their community makes them feel valued.

Research question 2 Theme 6: Teaching relevant content. All eight participants felt the nature of the classes with different level grades and ELL levels made it difficult to teach all of the content they wanted. The different levels of students both in grades and ELL understanding caused each class to move at a slower pace than the

teachers wanted. They felt they had to go slow to keep the class learning at the same level. Participant 5 stated, “I don’t think that I’m able to cover the breadth of content and the depth of content that I need to for somebody to really be successful fresh out of this program.” The pace of instruction was slower than the participants wanted which restricted the ability to cover the content they felt they could cover. The participants wanted to cover topics outside the standard curriculum because they felt they were relevant for their students. Participant 4 said,

Well, you have standards every standard you have to follow your and that you’re doing. So based on that, you know that’s what you’re changing the course I’m going to change it again because they’re leaning towards more food service industry. So I’m going to do so the kids get a certification in food handling and have that.

Teachers felt it was appropriate to teach skills that students would use in the workplace. The participants felt that they had difficulty teaching “soft skills” that are related to employment opportunities. They thought to create a résumé and communicating effectively were skills they should teach but did not have the time to in their classes. Participant 2 said, “We send an e-mail of like 10 lines and to them (students) it seems like a book:” They felt they were covering basic concepts to some students while others were prepared to learn more advanced material. The class diversity makes it difficult for the teachers to cover everything they want to cover. Participants realize the limitations of the public school system. Participant 8 said it would be beneficial if you could have just ELL CTE classes. He also said, “It would be more

focused on vocabulary through CTE if you had just ELL classes. You could pace down a little bit more to ensure that all students are getting the material presented.” The participants felt it was their job to have a defined goal for each class and do what they could to help students achieve that goal through repetition of performing the skill.

Freire’s (1970) CC theory of the “banking concept of education” is evident in the discussion of teaching relevant content. Teachers used their experiences and limited graduate feedback to ensure they were teaching relevant content. Participant 1 said he is “Trying to expose them to real world, the practical stuff.” CTE teachers asked their former students if they used what they learned in their classes. Cappelli (2014) found that schools are not aware of all the problems that students will have at their workplace. They must learn problem-solving and critical thinking to adapt to an ever-changing work environment. Köpsén (2014) and Vafai (2016) support the goal of workplace learning and apprenticeship programs that can strengthen the curriculum by aligning tasks taught at school with tasks performed on the work site.

The salient patterns in the data were related to how the participants like having ELLs in their classes and how through self-reflection, they modify their teaching strategies to ensure ELLs have a positive educational experience. All eight of the participants felt it important to modify teaching strategies and curriculum so ELLs can benefit from their instruction. The participants added more images or vocabulary to their lessons to clarify difficult concepts.

Discrepant Cases

Reporting discrepant cases establish credibility and reliability in a study (Creswell, 2014). During my data collection and analysis, I did not find any discrepant cases. All of the participants had similar experiences with ELL instruction.

Procedures Followed to Address the Accuracy of the Data

What follows is a discussion of how I followed the procedures explained earlier to ensure accuracy and trustworthiness of the findings. First, being aware of the biases of a researcher is important to ensure credibility. Twining et al. (2017) stated that researchers should indicate their biases to the audience to instill trustworthiness in the data. Conclusions in a study should be based on confidence that the results are unbiased. To minimize my biases I used interview protocols (Appendix B) to stay focused on objectivity (Creswell, 2014; Lodico et al., 2010). Understanding my biases was a part of the critical self-reflection that I performed throughout the collection and analysis of data. To ensure credibility it is important that researchers are aware of and make claims to personal biases (Creswell & Creswell, 2017). Critical reflection was one of the procedures I followed to ensure objectivity in the analysis and findings.

Also to ensure the accuracy and trustworthiness of the findings, I conducted member checks to clarify inconsistencies found during data collection. A member check interview would confirm, modify or verify the participant's original interview (Birt et al., 2016; Lodico et al., 2010). The participants had the opportunity to review the initial codes and categories I created from the original interview. All eight of the participants agreed with the codes and categories discussed. The member check process allowed me

to clarify with the participant what they meant when they answered the question. Member checking was used to verify the accuracy and trustworthiness of the data.

Summary of Outcomes

An observation I noted while I conducted the interviews was that CTE teachers had more administrative support than they indicated. The participants seemed to work as independent programs within the school. The nature of CTE programs, and sometimes the location of the classroom, cause limited interaction with other teachers and administrators. The participants would benefit from being included in the intake of the students into their programs. The mix of students caused the participants concern over student success. The participants struggled to keep all students at the same progression because of the language differences. Participant 4 said, "I used to run just an ELO class for the lower levels and that's one of my biggest problems where they put that Level 2s in my classroom and this was just a problem." The results of the study point out how different each CTE program is. The CTE content and student populations put additional strain on CTE teachers' ability to meet their personal high standards and the needs of the business community.

Discussion of Themes that Address Research Question 1

Research Question 1 was from the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices are used to support ELLs? The themes that developed from research question 1 were the classroom management techniques, adapting curriculum, instructional consistency, and questioning techniques. My research-based recommendations that address research question 1 contribute to improving ELL instructional practices of CTE

teachers. My recommendations address onboarding ELLs into CTE programs, identifying different ELL levels in the same class, and providing professional development opportunities specifically for CTE teachers to implement research-based instruction techniques. Participant 8 said it best when he stated, “I have ELL 1 through ELL 3 in the same class just because of our elective numbers. You could pace down a little bit more to ensure that all students are getting the material presented.” There was the overwhelming feeling of the eight participants was that every student was able to benefit from their programs. They felt that similar ELL levels and more time could provide the necessary classroom changes that would improve ELL student outcomes. I recommend additional research be performed to address the diversity in CTE classrooms to seek solutions that benefit the students.

My research-based recommendations also include professional development for CTE teachers. CTE teachers have a unique teaching environment that includes a more diverse student population. CTE teachers have different grades and ELL levels where there is a difference in maturity and comprehension levels of students. To help reinforce the participants’ desire to provide quality instruction for all of their students, they should participate in learning what research-based instructional models fit best with CTE programs

Discussion of Themes that Address Research Question 2

Research question 2 was from the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices are perceived to improve successful ELL transition to the workforce? The themes that developed from research question 2 were the connection with community

partners and teaching relevant content. My research-based recommendation to address research question 2 is to formalize the community connection with area business and the CTE programs. This can be done through student-centered work-based programs and advisory committee input. Both of these options would provide CTE teachers with the desired feedback on the quality of their programs. The advisory committee model is proven successful in Virginia's Henrico County school system ("Henrico County Public Schools," 2018). The participants said that someone else in the school performed outreach activities. CTE teachers should be included in connecting with business partners. This business connection would lead to a stronger CTE program where businesses would have input to the curriculum.

Conclusion

The purpose of this study was to explore the ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers and how those practices are perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. In Section 2, I reviewed the methodology and how the project was completed. I conducted eight CTE teacher interviews and analyzed the interview data. Six major themes were identified. Data analysis found the themes related to research question 1 were the classroom management techniques, changing the curriculum to support ELL instruction, instructional consistency, and questioning techniques. The themes that related to research question 2 were the connection with the community and teaching relevant content. The three key elements of Freire's theory are, (a) the oppressor-oppressed relationship, (b) the banking concept of education, and (c) how the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment. The data

shows a connection between the instructional pedagogy of CTE teachers and Freire's theory of CC. Although six of the eight CTE teachers did not identify research-based instructional pedagogy, it was evident that the self-reflective nature of the teachers in this study is connecting with their students and preparing them for the workforce. In Section 3, I describe the purpose of the project and its goals.

Section 3: The Project

Introduction

In this basic qualitative study, I explored the ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers and how those practices are perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. The conceptual framework for the study was based on Freire's (1970) CC theory, which states that learners must be given respect and included in the learning process. This framework grounded the study by linking student-centered teaching practices to improved student outcomes. CC concepts that are applied in the classroom allow for open dialogue and stronger student-teacher connections that improve student outcomes (Pehmer, Gröschner, & Seidel, 2015b). The current study was conducted in a secondary school setting in an urban Midwestern state. Data were collected from eight CTE education teachers through semistructured interviews. CTE teachers teach relevant skills and vocational language that is necessary for success in the workplace.

The study was guided by the following research questions:

Research Question 1: From the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices are used to support ELLs?

Research Question 2: From the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices improve successful ELL transition to the workforce?

The project (see Appendix A) is a policy recommendation with detail that will be shared with stakeholders in the research school districts. In this section, I will discuss the project goals, rationale, and provide a literature review to support the genre of the project. I will also detail how the project was implemented and the plan to evaluate it. I will

conclude with project implications for positive social change and the importance of the project to the local stakeholders as well as the profession.

Description of the Project

In this policy recommendation with detail, I provide recommendations for ELL decision makers based upon a deeper understanding of existing instructional practices and CTE teachers' perspectives about which techniques improve ELL transition to the workforce. Using this form of project, through their own data collection methods, researchers collect data from participants, summarize their findings, and make policy recommendations to stakeholders (Carayannis, Meissner, & Edelkina, 2017; Delia & Krasny, 2018; Stetler et al., 2006). Recommendations can vary and be changing everyday experiences to improve student engagement, specific changes in assessment or curriculum, or organizational changes (Lowenhaupt & Reeves, 2017; Milner, 2013; Wang & Degol, 2017). Lowenhaupt and Reeves (2017) recommended sweeping systemic changes to improve ELL instruction. Policy recommendations papers offer solutions that may or may not be implemented by the stakeholders. In this policy recommendation with detail, I demonstrate a research-based pedagogy that shows successful techniques to improve ELL outcomes in CTE programs.

Goals of a Policy Recommendation With Detail

The goal of a policy recommendation with detail is to provide information and policy recommendations to stakeholders (Milner, 2013). In this study, I explored the instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers with ELL and how those practices are perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. Areas of policy recommendations

include instructional practices of teachers, an effective transition of students to the workforce, and professional development opportunities. Stakeholders make decisions on whether to adopt the recommendations.

Findings

The data I gathered in this study did not demonstrate that the participants were following research-based instructional pedagogy. Instead of following a prescribed pedagogy, all participants but one teacher were teaching skills using instructional techniques they found to work based on their experiences. The one exception, Participant 7, did her doctoral study on ELL instruction using SIOP and said she followed the basic constructs of SIOP in her classroom. Participant 2 had been introduced to instructional pedagogy through professional development classes but did not recall the specifics. He indicated that he taught using the concepts he remembered in his training, saying,

I don't like remember the acronym but to me, it's a lot of obvious stuff, right? But it's like, hey, make sure you access prior knowledge, Make sure you assess where they are and make sure that you try to bring in new knowledge, be purposeful. And then make sure to generalize near the end of class, so that you can try to develop that knowledge into a wider base, right?

The majority of participants' responses were not a surprise to me. As Kuhn et al. (2016) found, CTE teachers concentrate on the subject matter which leaves little time to adopt a research-based instructional pedagogy. Although a common research-based instructional strategy was not identified, the participants did use sound instructional practices in their teachings.

The teachers did not identify an instructional model but identified some areas they wanted to change. Other than Participant 7, who is an advocate for sheltered instruction, there was little awareness of research-based instructional models. One participant said she “wanted to try a game show technique to keep her class engaged similar to the Food Network show.” She wanted to make the instruction relatable to what students perceive as success, becoming a TV star. The two major themes the participants expressed were to have similar level students, both grade and ELL levels, in the same class and more time for teaching. They feel that keeping the entire class on the same learning level would make it easier to address student’s needs. Participant 5 said,

I do wish that I could have smaller classes and spend more time with them than I can go slower so that we can work on both the language and like the conceptual content things instead of trying to shove both down their throat in one 40-minute session.

Participants also asked for more professional development aimed at ELL instruction. They felt if they were aware of techniques that worked, they would be more inclined to try them in their CTE classrooms.

Several participants wanted more apprenticeships, which would strengthen the connection to the community. Preparing ELLs for the workforce was a goal each participant felt deserved more attention. Participant 2 said, “But especially if English is very difficult for them, then you have them have that option to fall back on just to work within the community is some task.” He was thinking of what options are available to ELLs so they can be successful members of a community.

Rationale

The results of this basic qualitative study provided a deeper understanding of how ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers prepare students for successful employment. I chose a policy recommendation with a detail paper because it is an appropriate response given the scope of the project. When a problem is identified, researchers analyze the available data and produce knowledge that is shared with stakeholders (Makofane, 2018). Stakeholders have access to an abundant amount of information at any given moment, so they cannot be expected to analyze all of the information to make informed decisions. As Cairney and Kwiatkowski (2017) said,

People use short cuts to gather enough information to make decisions quickly: the “rational,” by pursuing clear goals and prioritizing certain kinds of information, and the “irrational,” by drawing on emotions, gut feelings, values, beliefs, habits, and the familiar, to make decisions quickly.

In a policy recommendation with detail paper, educational researchers summarize the vast amount of information available to produce a detailed report that makes recommendations to stakeholders. These recommendations are the framework for discussions stakeholders should have about how to address a perceived problem (Fagerberg, 2018). Stakeholders review the recommendations of the researcher and decide whether to take action.

In the data analysis subsection in Section 2 of this study, I revealed CTE teachers’ perceptions of how ELL instruction is currently addressed in their programs. The teachers are realistic in what can and cannot be changed given the limitations of public education.

They know that best practices would be smaller classes, having the same level of ELLs, and more time to teach content. They are aware of the constraints that public education has to address these issues. They did discuss issues that they felt could be addressed that are within the scope of system restrictions. The teachers could benefit from sharing information about which of the students are entering their programs and building stronger business connections to support their programs. In this policy with a recommendation detail report, I make recommendations that address sharing information and building stronger business connections.

Review of the Literature

In this review of the literature, I examine how policy recommendations are appropriate, how the recommendations are supported by the literature, and the limitations of a policy paper. Stakeholders may use policy papers to inform decisions in their organizations. Policy recommendations are derived from research findings with the analysis and summation of the data being used to make recommendations. Policy papers are used to communicate information to a group and to educate and inform the readers (Mattern, 2013). Policy papers provide an authoritative point of view where a solution to a problem may be outlined (Herman, 2013; Kemp, 2005; Sakamuro, Stolley, & Hyde, 2015). Herman (2013) recommended that papers provide the pros and cons as well as what is feasible for the organization to consider. Participant suggestions may not be reasonable given the working environment of the organization. I developed this policy recommendation with detail project based on my research of the instructional practices of CTE teachers as they relate to ELL instruction.

How a Policy Paper is Appropriate

A policy recommendation with a detail paper was an appropriate project for this study because they are used to summarize data into relevant, concise recommendations that address the problems of the organization. Stakeholders prefer policy papers because they predigest results of an abundance of research and summarize the results into a concise document (Boswell & Smith, 2017; Dagenais & Ridde, 2018). It is time-consuming and exhaustive to read the results of many research projects and review the outcomes. The ambiguity and complexity of research papers can exhaust readers time and energy (Cairney & Oliver, 2017). The sheer amount of information available can cause stakeholders to be overwhelmed in trying to make a decision. Stakeholders do not have the time to read through the vast amount of research and summarize the results, so they prefer a short concise report where they can discuss the recommendations and determine appropriate actions (Rose et al., 2018). Policy papers recommendations save stakeholders time.

Recommendations in policy papers are based on one researcher's evidenced-based research. Policies are not derived from research or theories that researchers recommend; instead, the recommendations are based on evidence that informs and supports the findings (Edler & Fagerberg, 2017; Leuz, 2018). For policymakers to consider adopting the recommendations, the recommendations must align with the organizations' mission, and the top management must consider the recommendations valuable and determine what changes will make improvements (Owen, 2014). Administrators then build a vision of what the new model looks like and the

implementation of the new plan (Boon & Edler, 2018; Short, 2013). The stakeholders must provide expectations and oversee the change process, and the recommended policy changes must be viewed by constituency groups as a fundamental change in the direction of the organization and less about a fiscal reaction to a problem (Mazzucato, 2017). Educating the organization about the benefits of change shows that stakeholders are committed to improvements. The necessary resources must be allocated to support a change in policy (Carayannis et al., 2017). The policy changes directed by any recommendations must be realistic and attainable to be successfully implemented.

How Theory and Research Support the Content of the Policy Paper

A policy recommendation with a detail paper foundational model is comprised of a problem identified by an organization, a researcher's interpretation of a theoretical model, and a comprehensive analysis of relevant research that links the theory to the problem (Fagerberg, 2018). Detailed analysis allows a researcher to make recommendations to stakeholders. Mueller-Langer, Fecher, Harhoff, and Wagner (2019) found that when different studies reinforce similar recommendations, it help stakeholders have confidence in the study. The recommendations are not the same because researchers tend to interpret the data differently (Fagerberg, 2017; Upton, Vallance, & Goddard, 2014). Researchers interpret the validity of recommendations results based on the findings of a study; this interpretation of findings and the researcher's life experiences will dictate the recommendations to stakeholders (Upton et al., 2014).

If the stakeholders follow those recommendations is dependent on many factors. It has been shown that policy papers are an effective communication tool that

stakeholders use to make decisions (Cairney, Oliver, & Wellstead, 2016a; Dagenais & Ridde, 2018). Stakeholders review the recommendations and determine their value as a solution to a problem. Boswell and Smith (2017) found that policy recommendations were a reassuring narrative that the researcher recommendations would reinforce what stakeholders already considered the solution to the problem. This detailed policy paper with recommendations derived two major themes as they relate to ELL instruction in CTE classes. One theme was how CTE teachers managed their classrooms with ELLs and the other was how ELLs were prepared to enter the workforce. My three research-based recommendations are based on my analysis of the findings. The three recommendations are improving ELL transition into CTE programs, professional development for CTE teachers specifically aimed at ELL instruction and improving community connections between businesses, CTE programs, teachers, and students.

Improving ELL transition into CTE programs. Data analysis revealed two issues to address regarding the ELL transition into CTE programs. What perceptions ELLs have about CTE programs and how CTE teachers are made aware of the students entering their programs. In addressing student perceptions of CTE programs, program materials should be made available to parents and students explaining program expectations and desired outcomes (Plotner, Mazzotti, Rose, & Teasley, 2018; Zacarian, 2011). Students need to understand the unique classroom/lab experiences of CTE programs. As one teacher said, “A lot of our students may qualify for some services, but there are plenty, especially by the time there are 11th and 12th graders that can function fairly easily in a classroom without support.” To better prepare students for success, they

should be explained the unique expectations of CTE programs (Jocson, 2018). The other issue is for CTE teachers to meet the students that are entering their programs before they enter the classroom. CTE teachers differentiate their instruction based on the makeup of their classes in both grade and ELL levels (Watulak et al., 2018). The unique classroom situations of CTE programs requires an understanding of the maturity and comprehension levels of each student to maximize student participation and address safety concerns in their classes.

Students' effective transition from school to the workforce is one recommendation based on the data. For example, Moyer, Snodgrass, Klein, and Tebben (2017) and Wright et al., (2018) recommended immersive simulations be used to provide a strong connection between classroom learning and the work world. Fletcher Jr, Warren, and Hernández-Gantes (2018) recommended that work-based learning, which connects students to employers through internships, be used to improve the employability of students. Mentorships between students and employers may be part of policy recommendations (Regan et al., 2017; Thomas, Bloomfield, Gordon, & Aggar, 2018). Making connections between students and work brings relevance to classroom instruction.

Professional development. The second recommendation stakeholders should consider is PD for CTE teachers. Teachers asked for PD opportunities specifically designed for CTE teachers so that they could implement the use of effective ELL instruction techniques. As a teacher said, "Yeah, it's great having them in class, I love having EL students. They are some of my favorite students to work with so I love to have

them in my classroom.” It is clear the inclusion of ELLs in CTE programs is rewarding. What is unclear is if teachers know what instructional strategies will benefit the ELL population. To help reinforce the participants’ desire to provide quality instruction for all of their students, they should participate in learning which research-based instructional model fits best with CTE programs. Understanding how to provide the best instruction with the diversity in CTE classrooms is challenging. CTE teachers may not have the educational background to understand how challenging ELL instruction can be in their classes.

Assessment and PD improvements are common recommendations of educational policy papers. Such recommendations include changes in either student or teacher assessments (Lindvall, Helenius, & Wiberg, 2018; Milner, 2013). PD is recommended to improve teacher collaboration (Fischer et al., 2018; Zagona, Kurth, & MacFarland, 2017). Teacher collaboration is recommended to draw upon the strengths of others to improve student outcomes. Wang and Degol (2017) recommended that collaboration occurs among researchers, teachers, and policymakers. The goal of the project is to provide information to stakeholders about the instructional practices of CTE teachers and how ELLs are prepared to enter the workplace.

I am recommending PD geared towards how teachers learn and present new ideas into their classrooms (Kennedy, 2016; Stacey, Harvey, & Richards, 2013). Dolan et al., (2018) found that PD programs are an effective way to introduce teachers to research-based programs. Teachers who choose to teach as a career path learn instructional techniques that prepare them for the classroom. CTE teachers are usually hired for their

content expertise and may not have been exposed to research-based instructional practices (Miles & Knipe, 2018). There are many PD programs that focus on instructional strategies such as Boost for Mathematics and Count on Vasterås (Lindvall et al., 2018). PD programs usually include the main idea the teacher should learn, how to design a lesson and a reflection of how well the lesson achieved the desired results. The type of PD chosen by administrators is based on what they feel are the most important item teachers needed to learn. Lowenhaupt and Reeves (2017) found that PD should be a “holistic, collaborative approach to integrating ELLs into schools and classrooms” instead of teaching a strategy (p. 50). This holistic and collaborative approach aligns with the concepts of CC where the learners, in this case, the teachers, are an active member of the learning process. Students are included in the learning process and not just told what to do. Asking teachers what type of professional development they need would generate ideas about the type of PD needed.

Improve community connections. The third recommendation stakeholders should consider is to formalize community connections with area business and CTE programs. This can be done through student-centered work-based programs and advisory committee input. Both of these options would provide CTE teachers with the desired feedback on the quality of their programs. Student-centered work-based programs allow students to transfer the knowledge of the classroom to real-world work experience. Job shadowing or internships where the students work for an employer are recommended. Students would benefit from being exposed to working conditions where they would see the value of soft skills as well as the skills they learned in their coursework. These

opportunities can be paid or non-paid experiences.

Creation of program advisory committees would lead to a stronger CTE program where the business would have input to the curriculum and equipment needs. Advisory committees provide valuable input for students who are trying to learn the skills they need to be successful in the workplace (Lowe & Iskander, 2016). The advisory committee model has been successful in Virginia's Henrico County school system Passarella (2018) found that a strong connection to advisory groups and CTE programs strengthen community connections. Although the CTE teachers in this study said that other departments in their schools performed outreach activities, they wanted to be involved in building stronger community business partnerships.

CTE programs in the United States are a culmination of how educators blend work experience with knowledge. In a comprehensive report, Passarella (2018) found that including stakeholders in the implementation of CTE programs ensures "quality control for industry standards are met, determining when new occupational programs need to be developed to take account of projected changes in the economy, and existing programs need to be closed or radically revised" (p. 23). A systemic review of CTE programs and reviewing best practices from other countries may bring about necessary changes in how CTE programs are taught in the United States. This policy recommendation with a detail report should be considered with an open mind.

Limitations of a Policy Paper

A policy recommendation with a detail report has limitations as to its effectiveness. Stakeholders must be motivated to review the report and consider the

recommendations (Boswell & Smith, 2017). Although the researcher is motivated to dedicate years studying the problem, the policy paper recommendations take time to read and understand the problem with suggestions for improvements. Recommendations suggested by a policy paper will usually include changes that impact resources. These resources are often employee workloads, financial investments and organizational changes (Makofane, 2018). The desire to change must be directed from the top and have sufficient commitment to time and resources for any changes to take effect. If stakeholders do not believe the policy recommendations will impact the problem, they are not likely to adopt the changes. Without support from top administrators, lasting change will not happen (Lumsden & Goode, 2018). As Weible and Cairney (2018) said: “The policy process is inherently messy and marked by a sticky resistance to change” (p. 194). Simple solutions to difficult problems are few and far between.

How the Search was Conducted

To write the policy recommendation with detail, I searched electronic databases such as ERIC, SAGE Premier, and EBSCO at the Walden University library. I searched for additional resources such as Google Scholar, books, and web sites for my research. The search terms I used included *policy recommendations*, *theory to application*, *white papers*, *policy effectiveness*, and *policy procedures*. The two major themes presented in this policy recommendation with detail are critical consciousness and how ELL transition to the workforce from CTE programs.

Project Description

The finding from this study is summarized in a policy recommendation with detail. The policy recommendation with detail will be presented to the stakeholders. The stakeholders would review and discuss the findings. The findings would generate conversation within the community on how CTE programs could bridge a gap between school and work. The findings could be used to develop PD programs that concentrate on CTE instructional practices.

Proposal Implementation

With Walden University approval I will forward my policy recommendation with detail to the proper stakeholders by July 2019. My vision is for the stakeholders to discuss the results and develop a researched based solution that could be implemented for the 2019-2020 school year. Possible outcomes might be an onboarding process for ELLs, PD programs specifically designed for CTE teachers and the creation of advisory boards to support CTE programs. The discussions would move away from task accomplishment to how students can use the skills they learned in school to help build community relations.

Roles and Responsibilities of Stakeholders

Key stakeholders include CTE teachers, school administrators, industry connections and those who are responsible for PD. Teachers are the most important part of the learning process. They need to be engaging and understanding of their roles as educators. School administrators must support and guide teachers to seek ways that improve student outcomes. An advisory committee that is comprised of local business

leaders can assess the program and make recommendations that fit their needs. Based on input from this policy recommendation with detail and advisory members, PD programs may be necessary to provide the training that teachers need to meet industry concerns.

My role is to present my findings to the stakeholders. The stakeholders will review the validity of the results and either continues to provide CTE instruction as they currently do or develop a plan to address the needs identified. Stakeholders are responsible for determining if the recommendations are of value. They should solicit input from all parties involved and determine the best course of action for their particular situation (Dagenais & Ridde, 2018). There is no one solution to any problem and any recommendations provided by a researcher should be discussed openly with the organization. Weible and Cairney (2018) found that rarely can anyone study fit the needs of a complex organization. Stakeholders must rely on the recommendations from many sources before a policy change can be expected to be effective (Cairney et al., 2016). Stakeholders must decide the direction the organization will move based on the recommendations they receive from researchers and internal groups.

Project Evaluation Plan

The study has resulted in a policy recommendation with detail where a formative evaluation has been recommended to the stakeholders. Formative evaluations are a rigorous process that identifies a systematic approach to identify concerns and make recommendations (Kowalski, Veaser, & Heisler, 2018). Formative evaluations derive recommendations from the data. They are designed to provide enough detail where recommendations can be made based on data (Patton, 1987; Stetler et al., 2006).

Although the results provided may indicate a change in school processes or procedures, the school district is responsible for acting if they find the results worthy.

To gauge the effectiveness of the project, an evaluation will be performed. The evaluation will go through several steps. The first evaluation is provided by the Walden University IRB board and associated committee chairs. These members have reviewed the process throughout the creation and final edition of the project. They have reviewed and approved the methods and processes used to generate results and conclusions. This evaluation has ensured the project is measured by valid and trustworthy criteria (Granit-Dgani, Kaplan, & Flum, 2016). The most important evaluation will be performed by the stakeholders in the education community.

I chose a formative evaluation summarized in a policy recommendation with detail to present my findings. My policy recommendation with detail includes a summary of the local problem, the results of the project, conclusions I draw from the research and recommendations to the stakeholders. Formative evaluations can guide the stakeholder's decisions about future changes to programs.

Project Implications

Many instructional pedagogy models are designed to improve ELL instruction in academic classrooms. The results of this policy recommendation with detail may suggest an effective method to improve student outcomes in CTE programs. The connection between learning in the classroom and connections made at a work site can build stronger community relations and empower students to feel they can make a difference.

The study findings will contribute to a growing body of studies on ELL instruction in CTE programs. Although CC is one theory that may improve CTE instructional practices, the results of this study may inspire educators to review other instructional pedagogies as they align with CTE programs. Existing models such as SIOP and CALLA may be tailored to concentrate on the unique demands of CTE programs. The success of students helping improve community relations may expand beyond the local school district.

Conclusion

Section 3 described the policy recommendation with a detail project that is to be shared with key stakeholders. This section summarized the project and how the project is relevant to the problem. The project was outlined, the rationale presented, and a brief literature review on the benefits of creating a policy recommendation with detail and how the project will be evaluated. The best way to share the results is with a policy recommendation with detail. Section 4 provides my reflections and conclusions of my project.

Section 4: Reflections and Conclusions

In this policy recommendation with a detail project, I make a connection between ELL instruction in CTE programs and empowering students to make a difference in their community. The purpose of this policy recommendation with a detail report was to inform stakeholders about ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers and how those practices are perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. The analysis of the data collected gave me a deeper understanding of the challenges and successes that CTE teachers have in the classroom.

Project Strengths and Limitations

This policy recommendation with a detail project provides insight for stakeholders to appreciate the challenges that ELL teachers face in CTE programs. In the project, I highlight the strengths of how ELL instruction is currently being conducted. I also point out the limitations of this study. Additional research should be performed to further understand the complexities of CTE instruction in public schools.

Strengths of the Project

The strength of this policy recommendation with a detail project is that it reinforces the position that CTE instructors are hired as content masters and not for their pedagogical knowledge. CTE teachers must also learn how to convey their subject mastery to students. Dorozhkin, Tarasyuk, Lyzhin, Krotova, and Sherstneva (2016) found that relevant professional training for teachers is vital to the success of an organization. Knowing about a subject and being able to transfer that content in an understandable manner are two different skill sets (Bathmaker, 2013). Six of the eight participants had

not had exposure to instructional pedagogy and only one teacher had knowledge of instructional pedagogy designed for ELL instruction. CTE teachers would benefit from learning about research-based instructional pedagogies designed for ELLs. This policy recommendation with a detail project supports Kuhn et al.'s (2016) findings that CTE teachers need help in understanding research-based instructional pedagogies. Placklé et al. (2017) found that CTE teachers spend time modifying the curriculum to meet the perceived needs of the student. CTE teachers need support to understand how ELLs learn so they can modify their teaching style to fit the needs of the students in the same manner that they modify curriculum.

Limitations of the Project

The limitations of this policy recommendation with detail stem from the common limitations of most qualitative studies. Those limitations include researcher biases and the sample population. I was aware that my role and educational background could have affected the data collection procedures or analysis. I designed my procedures to mitigate these unintentional biases. During the qualitative data analysis, I also continually reviewed my interpretations at every step of the research process to guard against bias and noted these instances on the transcripts (see Creswell & Creswell, 2017; Merriam, 2009). It is vital to report participant responses to stakeholders and not personal biases.

Another limitation was the small sample size that was only located in one part of the United States, which may not be sufficient to understand the depth of the problem. CTE encompasses many topics, and as a result, many methods of teaching. The diverse nature of CTE programs may have produced different findings if a larger, more diverse

sample was used (J. M. Morse, 2015a). The educational backgrounds of the CTE teachers were not part of the inclusion requirements in this study. CTE teachers having ELL backgrounds may have had different views on how instruction should be delivered to ELLs (Garcia & Chun, 2016). In this study, I only interviewed CTE teachers who taught in a high school. CTE programs are delivered in several models such as regional centers or specialized high school programs (Passarella, 2018). Various delivery models may have different CTE teacher requirements. The participants in this study may have participated in statewide ELL initiatives taught through PDO programs that other CTE programs do not follow. This policy recommendation with a detail project should be considered important but not all-encompassing.

Recommendations for Alternative Approaches

I chose a policy recommendation with a detail project to provide stakeholders with one solution to a perceived problem. An alternative approach to this project could be reviewing the delivery models of CTE programs to determine if ELLs benefited from a particular model. The CTE teachers interviewed in this study worked at a high school setting, and other CTE models include specialty high schools or regional CTE centers. These models draw CTE students from a larger geographic area that potentially impacts the number of ELLs in a class. With a larger ELL population in classes, research-based instructional pedagogy would have a greater impact on student success (Jocson, 2018). If looking at CTE models in specialty high schools or regional CTE centers, the stakeholders for a report at this level would change from local representatives to state

officials. Changing the CTE program delivery structure is a larger initiative than this project was designed for.

Scholarship, Project Development, and Leadership and Change

In researching this policy recommendation with a detail project, I have learned about scholarship, the importance of detailed research, and how to present that information to stakeholders. My scholarship took place in several areas such as discovery research, integration of concepts, and practical applications (Blais, 1993). The practical application of my research is important to inform stakeholders of a possible change in policy. My policy recommendation with a detail project caused me to question the source of the information and how the conclusion was determined (Schmitt, 2016). Creating the policy recommendation with a detail project transformed my personal growth from that of a reader of information to an informed presenter of research-based information (Patanapu et al., 2018). My doctoral journey was similar to McDonough (2015) where we both made an intentional choice to expand our knowledge and inform others of our findings. I learned that the process of conveying research to stakeholders is difficult.

I feel that in completing my research and learning about how CTE instruction happens in a classroom, I am better equipped to help stakeholders understand how to support a growing ELL population. Stakeholders include school administrators and area business leaders who may participate in program advisory committees (DeMatthews & Izquierdo, 2018). Stakeholders have an interest in the success of programs. Recommendations are made to stakeholders who are able to help in the decision process to make changes to instructional practices (Harris & Sullivan, 2017). Stakeholders make

judgments about the connection between what is happening in the classroom and how it impacts the schools' mission; therefore, they value the teachers' expertise in the classroom and want to help improve student achievement (Heineke et al., 2018). Teachers benefit from the support that stakeholders provide, both parties find this collaboration to be invaluable to student success (DeMatthews & Izquierdo, 2018). CTE teachers have a responsibility to ensure they address the needs of community partners so students are able to be productive citizens (Stacey et al., 2013). The results of this study can help educate stakeholders on how teachers can improve ELL student outcomes in CTE programs. All students should have the same opportunity to be a productive community member, and as an administrator who has oversight of instructor content, I have learned how to analyze their pedagogy and guide their instruction to support the underserved populations, especially ELLs.

Reflection on the Importance of the Work

My research has helped me understand the challenges and opportunities that CTE secondary education teachers face in their classrooms. Secondary CTE classes have a mixture of ninth to 12th grade students as well as different levels of ELL students in the same class. ELLs at different levels in the same class may not be prepared for the readings and assignments (Hall & Graziano, 2017). CTE teachers are challenged with presenting information so all students can understand it. If similar level students were in the same classroom, teachers could teach at one level, and if necessary, provide the necessary accommodations for student success (Klassen, 2017). With various ELL levels in the same class, students grasp the material at different rates. Level 1 students can

struggle to keep up in class because they lack a basic understanding of English (Fendrick, 2018). The various level of ELLs in the same class challenges CTE teachers to keep all students progressing at the same pace. My belief that stakeholders should be more informed about the challenges of CTE instruction was the impetus for conducting this study.

I enjoyed learning content matter to support my passion in the automotive industry. When I began teaching, I found myself wanting to understand the art of teaching and how the various instructional pedagogies could be applied to CTE instruction. Carrying out this study gave me an opportunity to combine my passion for learning with a desire to help CTE instructional practices. While summarizing the data I challenged myself to consider the teachers' position and how they felt about teaching. Teachers grow up in a different generation than their students. High school students today are considered Generation iGen/Gen Z, they were born between 1995 and 2012 and have had access to the Internet their whole lives ("Career Planner," 2018). One of the core concepts of Freire (1970) is to be able to relate to learners. CTE teachers have a diverse classroom and need to engage students with adaptive learning techniques (Shatto & Erwin, 2017). CTE teachers are challenged with teaching content that is both relatable to students and applicable to the work environment (Burrow, 2018). CTE teachers also deal with a combination of social and emotional pressures that high school students have and the emotional stresses that ELLs bring to their classroom (Akello & Timmerman, 2018; Robinson, 2016). Social media has caused Generation iGen/Gen Z students to be exposed to different social pressures than their teachers grew up with ("Career Planner," 2018).

I believe one of the most important lesson learned from my study is that good teaching is good teaching (Candal, 2015). CTE teachers may not be aware of instructional pedagogy concepts, but they understand what students need to learn to be successful in the workplace. CTE teachers come from diverse backgrounds; they may be career switchers or retired working professionals wishing to share their experiences with learners. Their approach to teaching may not be based on instructional pedagogy as much as their desire to teach what they found to be successful in the workplace (M. J. Luna, Selmer, & Rye, 2018). CTE teachers' life experiences influence their teaching styles because they bring their experiences in the workplace to the classroom (Antink-Meyer & Brown, 2017). This can be a different approach than teachers of academic programs. Academic program teachers usually have several years of college learning experiences to draw from, while CTE teachers feel they have greater flexibility when teaching because they are not teaching students to pass standardized tests (Bowen, Marx, Williams, & Napoleon Jr., 2017). CTE teachers feel they have a stronger school influence and classroom control with their classes compared to academic teachers, and this lets them be more flexible and able to vary instructional approaches to fit their individual classes (Burrow, 2018). It does not matter about what teachers have to work with; good teachers connect with their students beyond being viewed as a content expert.

Implications, Applications, and Directions for Future Research

In this study, I researched ELL instruction in CTE secondary classrooms. A growing ELL population and the No Child Left Behind Act has highlighted the need for the research of ELL instruction at the secondary education level (Capps et al., 2005;

Lowenhaupt & Reeves, 2017; Passarella, 2018) The importance of ELL instruction in CTE classrooms cannot be overstated. Successful communities are built on a population that can provide and create a safe, desirable living environment. Communities are built by workers who are competent, educated, and informed.

Implications for Social Change

CTE subjects encompass a large group of skill sets that are seemingly unrelated (Salerno & Kibler, 2015). To get CTE teachers to work together on common goals requires a leader with the insight to inspire good instruction and not subject matter content. Leaders possess the power to change organizations and people (Passarella, 2018; Turan & Bektas, 2013). Leaders should work with community members to understand how students are transitioned from school to the workforce. Collaboration among groups is important to creating a culture of change through a common language (Young, Hill, Morris, & Woods, 2016). CTE teachers who understand that instructional pedagogy does not replace subject content but rather improves the instructional delivery of that content will be leaders in their community. Teachers who can reflect on target skills and abilities will improve instructional management and assessments (Kawinkamolroj, Triwaranyu, & Thongthew, 2015). When CTE teachers understand that content is only part of what they are teaching, the students will be better prepared to enter the workforce and become productive members of a community.

Recommendations for Future Research

In this study, I concentrated on the CTE teachers' perceptions of ELLs in secondary classrooms. Future researchers could expand on that subset and include CTE

student outcomes as well as business partners' experiences and higher education's experiences with student learning. Student outcomes are the focal point of how well CTE instruction is working (Passarella, 2018). To determine if student outcomes are meeting business expectations, research should be done on how relevant the CTE curriculum is to addressing businesses' needs.

Conclusion

The findings of my study highlighted the importance of teachers' experiences with ELLs in CTE classrooms. In Section 4, I highlighted how my policy recommendation with detail was relevant to today's CTE classrooms as well as its social change implications. The study results demonstrate that CTE instruction has moved from the concept of authority figure telling subordinates how to perform skills to an elaborate, student-centered approach where caring about students is the key to success. CC theory represents the core ideas that make teachers become good teachers. Good teachers do more than present content; they meet student needs and work with stakeholders to create a learning environment that is exciting and relevant to today's ELLs.

References

- Acevedo-Polakovich, D. I., Cousineau, J. R., Quirk, K. M., Gerhart, J. I., Bell, K. M., & Adomako, M. S. (2014). Toward an asset orientation in the study of US Latina/o youth: Biculturalism, ethnic identity, and positive youth development. *Counseling Psychologist, 42*(2), 201–229. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000013477904>
- Adelson-Goldstein, J. (2015). *Preparing English learners for work and career pathways: Companion learning resource*. Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Education.
- Ahmed, A., Nordin, M. K., Ali, D. F., Md, A. N., & Latip, N. A. (2017). Practices in vocational teaching method to improve the quality of teaching. *The Social Sciences, 12*(3), 413–418. <https://doi.org/10.3923/sscience.2017.413.418>
- Akello, L. D., & Timmerman, M. C. G. (2018). Local language a medium of instruction: Challenges and way forward. *Educational Action Research, 26*(2), 314–332. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09650792.2017.1319287>
- Ali, A., Firissa, B., & Legesse, A. (2017). Investigating the relevance of ESP (English for Specific Purpose) for TVET (Technical and Vocational Education and Training) Colleges in Ethiopia. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary and Current Research, 5*(Jan/Feb), 79–87.
- Andryukhina, L. M., Dneprov, S. A., Sumina, T. G., Zimina, E. Y., Utkina, S. N., & Mantulenko, V. V. (2016). The model of monitoring of vocational pedagogical competences of professors in secondary vocational education. *International Journal of Environmental and Science Education, 11*(14), 7016–7034.
- Antink-Meyer, A., & Brown, R. A. (2017). Second-career science teachers' classroom

- conceptions of science and engineering practices examined through the lens of their professional histories. *International Journal of Science Education*, 39(11), 1511–1528. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09500693.2017.1338787>
- Arnold, L. (2013). English for new citizens: Contributions of a learner-centered vocational ESL framework. *CATESOL Journal*, 25(1), 129–142.
- Ary, D., Jacobs, L. C., Irvine, C. K. S., & Walker, D. (2018). *Introduction to research in education* Boston MA., Cengage Learning.
- Avis, J. (1999). Shifting identity: New conditions and the transformation of practice – teaching within post-compulsory education. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 51(2), 245–264. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13636829900200081>
- Baecher, L., Farnsworth, T., & Ediger, A. (2014). The challenges of planning language objectives in content-based ESL instruction. *Language Teaching Research*, 18(1), 118–136. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1362168813505381>
- Baecher, L., Knoll, M., & Patti, J. (2016). Targeted observation of ELL instruction as a tool in the preparation of school leaders. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, 10(3), 201–216. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19313152.2016.1185910>
- Bansal, S., Bansal, A., & Dalrymple, O. (2015). Outcome-based education model for computer science education. *Journal of Engineering*, 28(2), 113–121.
- Bansal, S., Gaffar, A., & Dalrymple, O. (2015). Building faculty expertise in outcome-based education curriculum design. In *2015 IEEE Frontiers in Education Conference (FIE:Vol. 2014)*, pp. 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.1109/FIE.2015.7344100>
- Baškarada, S. (2014). Qualitative case study guidelines. *Qualitative Report*, 19(40), 1–25.

<https://doi.org/10.7748/nr2013.05.20.5.28.e327>

Bathmaker, A.-M. (2013). Defining 'knowledge' in vocational education qualifications in England: An analysis of key stakeholders and their constructions of knowledge, purposes and content. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 65(1), 87–107.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2012.755210>

Baumeler, C. (2017). Competence-based vocational education and training and its cultural context sensitivity. *European Education*, 51(1), 1–15.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/10564934.2017.1344503>

Baxter, P., & Jack, S. (2008). Qualitative case study methodology: Study design and implementation for novice researchers. *The Qualitative Report*, 13(4), 544–559.

Retrieved from <http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR13-4/baxter.pdf>

Birt, L., Scott, S., Cavers, D., Campbell, C., & Walter, F. (2016). Member checking: A tool to enhance trustworthiness or merely a nod to validation? *Qualitative Health Research*, 26(13), 1802–1811. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732316654870>

Blaak, M., Openjuru, G. L., & Zeelen, J. (2013). Non-formal vocational education in Uganda: Practical empowerment through a workable alternative. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 33(1), 88–97.

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2012.02.002>

Blackburn, G. (2017). A university's strategic adoption process of an PBL-aligned eLearning environment: an exploratory case study. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 65(1), 147–176. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11423-016-9472-3>

- Blais, R. (1993). Variations in surgical rates in Quebec: Does access to teaching hospitals make a difference? *Higher Education Research & Development*, *14*(10), 1729–1736. <https://doi.org/10.1080/072943600445637>
- Boeije, H. (2002). A purposeful approach to the constant comparative method in the analysis of qualitative interviews. *Quality & Quantity*, *36*, 391–409. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1020909529486>
- Boersma, A., ten Dam, G., Wardekker, W., & Volman, M. (2016). Designing innovative learning environments to foster communities of learners for students in initial vocational education. *Learning Environments Research*, *19*(1), 107–131. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10984-015-9203-4>
- Bogdan, R. C., & Bilken, S. K. (1992). Qualitative research for education. *Sociolog: The Journal Of The British Sociological Association*, 1–8.
- Bonwel, C. C., & Eison, J. A. (1991). *Creating excitement in the classroom*. ASHE-ERIC Higher Education Report. <https://doi.org/ED340272>
- Boon, W., & Edler, J. (2018). Demand, challenges, and innovation. Making sense of new trends in innovation policy. *Science and Public Policy*, *45*(February), 435–447. <https://doi.org/10.1093/scipol/scy014>
- Boswell, C., & Smith, K. (2017). Rethinking policy ‘impact’: Four models of research-policy relations. *Palgrave Communications*, *13*(44), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-017-0042-z>
- Bowen, B., Marx, A., Williams, T., & Napoleon Jr., L. (2017). School influence and classroom control: A comparison of career and technical education, science, and

- mathematics Teachers. *Career and Technical Education Research*, 42(3), 183–192.
<https://doi.org/10.5328/cter42.3.183>
- Braasch, J. L. G., & Bråten, I. (2017). The discrepancy-induced source comprehension (D-ISC) model: Basic assumptions and preliminary evidence. *Educational Psychologist*, 52(3), 167–181. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00461520.2017.1323219>
- Braden, S., Wassell, B. A., Scantlebury, K., & Grover, A. (2016). Supporting language learners in science classrooms: Insights from middle-school English language learner students. *Language and Education*, 30(5), 438–458.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/09500782.2015.1134566>
- Bråten, I., Braasch, J. L., & McCrudden, M. T. (2018). The role of conflict in multiple source use. *Handbook of Multiple Source Use* (p. 160). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Buchanan, K. (1990). Vocational english-as-a-second-language programs. Retrieved from <https://www.ericdigests.org/pre-9216/vocational.htm>
- Burrow, A. K. (2018). Teaching introductory ecology with problem-based learning. *The Bulletin of the Ecological Society of America*, 99(1), 137–150.
<https://doi.org/10.1002/bes2.1364>
- Cairney, P., & Kwiatkowski, R. (2017). How to communicate effectively with policymakers: Combine insights from psychology and policy studies. *Palgrave Communications*, 3(1), 37. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-017-0046-8>
- Cairney, P., & Oliver, K. (2017). Evidence-based policymaking is not like evidence-based medicine, so how far should you go to bridge the divide between evidence and policy? *Health Research Policy and Systems*, 15(35), 1–11.

<https://doi.org/10.1186/s12961-017-0192-x>

- Cairney, P., Oliver, K., & Wellstead, A. (2016). To bridge the divide between evidence and policy: Reduce ambiguity as much as uncertainty. *Public Administration Review*, 76(3), 399–402. <https://doi.org/10.1111/puar.12555>.
- Campbell, C., & MacPhail, C. (2002). Peer education, gender and the development of critical consciousness: Participatory HIV prevention by South African youth. *Social Science & Medicine*, 55(2), 331–345. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-9536\(01\)00289-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-9536(01)00289-1)
- Candal, C. S. (2015). *Massachusetts charter public schools: Best practices serving English Language Learners*. Pioneer Institute for Public Policy Research.
- Cappelli, P. (2014). *Skill gaps, skill shortages and skill mismatches: Evidence for the US*. Cambridge. Retrieved from <http://www.nber.org/papers/w20382>
- Capps, R., Fix, M., Murray, J., Ost, J., Passel, J., & Herwantoro, S. (2005). *The new demography of America's schools: Immigration and the No Child Left Behind Act*. English. <https://doi.org/10.1037/e723122011-001>
- Carayannis, E. G., Meissner, D., & Edelkina, A. (2017). Targeted innovation policy and practice intelligence (TIP2E): Concepts and implications for theory, policy and practice. *Journal of Technology Transfer*, 42(3), 460–484. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10961-015-9433-8>
- Career Planner. (2018). Retrieved from <https://www.careerplanner.com/Career-Articles/Generations.cfm>
- Castellano, M., Sundell, K. E., & Richardson, G. B. (2017). Achievement outcomes

among high school graduates in college and career readiness programs of study.

Peabody Journal of Education, 92(2), 254–274.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/0161956X.2017.1302220>

Castillo-Montoya, M. (2016). Preparing for interview research: The interview protocol refinement framework. *The Qualitative Report*, 21(5), 811–831.

Cenoz, J. (2015). Content-based instruction and content and language integrated learning: The same or different? *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 28(1), 8–24.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/07908318.2014.1000922>

Cervantes-Soon, C. G., Dorner, L., Palmer, D., Heiman, D., Schwerdtfeger, R., & Choi, J. (2017). Combating inequalities in two-way language immersion programs: Toward critical consciousness in bilingual education spaces. *Review of Research in Education* (Vol. 41, pp. 403–427). <https://doi.org/10.3102/0091732X17690120>

Cho, J. Y., & Lee, E.-H. (2014). Reducing confusion about grounded theory and qualitative content analysis: Similarities and differences. *The Qualitative Report*, 19(64), 1–20. <http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR19/cho64.pdf>

Choi, Y. (2013). Teaching social studies for newcomer English language learners: Toward culturally relevant pedagogy. *Multicultural Perspectives*, 15(1), 12–18.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/15210960.2013.754640>

Ciarocco, N. J. (2018). Traditional and new approaches to career preparation through coursework. *Teaching of Psychology*, 45(1), 32–40.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/0098628317744963>

Cleary, M., Horsfall, J., & Hayter, M. (2014). Qualitative research: quality results?

- Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 70(4), 711–713. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jan.12172>
- Cort, P. (2014). Europeanisation of curricula in Europe: Policy and practice, curriculum reform in Europe: The impact of learning outcomes. *European Educational Research Journal*, 13(5), 595–600. <https://doi.org/10.2304/eej.2014.13.5.595>
- Cranmore, J., & Wilhelm, R. (2017). Assessment and feedback practices of secondary music teachers : A descriptive case study. *Visions of Research in Music Education*, 29.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research*. (5th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson Education.
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2017). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Cronin, C. (2014). Using case study research as a rigorous form of inquiry. *Nurse Researcher*, 21(5), 19–27. <https://doi.org/10.7748/nr.21.5.19.e1240>
- Dagenais, C., & Ridde, V. (2018). Policy brief as a knowledge transfer tool: To “make a splash”, your policy brief must first be read. *Gaceta sanitaria*, 32(3), 203–205. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gaceta.2018.02.003>
- Darder, A., Baltodano, M., & Torres, R. D. (2003). *The critical pedagogy reader*. New York, NY: RoutledgeFalmer.
- De La Garza, T., & Kuri, M. (2016). Building strong community partnerships: Equal voice and mutual benefits. *Journal of Latinos and Education*, 13(2), 120–133. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15348431.2013.821064>
- DeCapua, A., & Marshall, H. W. (2011). Reaching ELLs at risk: Instruction for students

with limited or interrupted formal education. *Preventing School Failure: Alternative Education for Children and Youth*, 55(1), 35–41.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/10459880903291680>

Delia, J., & Krasny, M. E. (2018). Cultivating positive youth development, critical consciousness, and authentic care in urban environmental education. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 8(JAN), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2017.02340>

DeMatthews, D., & Izquierdo, E. (2018). The importance of principals supporting dual language education: A social justice leadership framework. *Journal of Latinos and Education*, 17(1), 53–70. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15348431.2017.1282365>

Diemer, M. A. (2009). Pathways to occupational attainment among poor youth of color: The role of sociopolitical development. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 37(1), 6–35. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000007309858>

Diemer, M. A., & Blustein, D. L. (2006). Critical consciousness and career development among urban youth. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 68(2), 220–232. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2005.07.001>

Diemer, M. A., McWhirter, E. H., Ozer, E. J., & Rapa, L. J. (2015). Advances in the conceptualization and measurement of critical consciousness. *Urban Review*, 47(5), 809–823. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11256-015-0336-7>

Diemer, M. A., & Rapa, L. J. (2016). Unraveling the complexity of critical consciousness, political efficacy, and political action among marginalized adolescents. *Child Development*, 87(1), 221–238. <https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.12446>

- Diemer, M. A., Rapa, L. J., Park, C. J., & Perry, J. C. (2017). Development and validation of the critical consciousness scale. *Youth & Society, 49*(4), 461–483. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0044118X14538289>
- Diemer, M. A., Wang, Q., Moore, T., Gregory, S. R., Hatcher, K. M., & Voight, A. M. (2010). Sociopolitical development, work salience, and vocational expectations among low socioeconomic status African American, Latin American, and Asian American youth. *Developmental Psychology, 46*(3), 619–635. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/a0017049>
- Direct Instruction. (2017). Retrieved 1/1/2017, from <http://www.worksheetlibrary.com/teachingtips/directinstruction.html>
- Dolan, E. L., Elliott, S. L., Henderson, C., Curran-everett, D., John, K. S., & Ortiz, P. A. (2018). Evaluating discipline - based education research for promotion and tenure. *Innovative Higher Education, 43*, 31–39. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10755-017-9406-y>
- Dorozhkin, E. M., Tarasyuk, O. V, Lyzhin, A. I., Krotova, O. P., & Sherstneva, N. L. (2016). Structural and functional model of training future masters of vocational training for the organization of teaching and the production process in terms of networking. *International Journal of Environmental & Science Education, 11*(15), 8323–8334.
- Edler, J., & Fagerberg, J. (2017). Innovation policy: What, why, and how. *Oxford Review of Economic Policy, 33*(1), 2–23. <https://doi.org/10.1093/oxrep/grx001>
- El-Amin, A., Seider, S., Graves, D., Tamerat, J., Clark, S., Soutter, M., ... Malhotra, S. (2017). Critical consciousness: A key to student achievement. *Phi Delta Kappan,*

98(5), 18–25. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732306287525>

Elfers, A. M., & Stritikus, T. (2013). How school and district leaders support classroom teachers' work with english language learners. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 50(2), 305–344. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0013161X13492797>

Engineering a classroom that works for all. (2018). *Science Scope*, 42(1), 16–20.

Ertefaie, A., Small, D. S., & Rosenbaum, P. R. (2018). Quantitative evaluation of the trade-off of strengthened instruments and sample size in observational studies. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 113(523), 1122–1134. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01621459.2017.1305275>

Eu, K., Cross, G., Moore, C. L., Ward, E., Manyibe, O., Aref, F., Cyprian, D. (2015). New immigrating racial and ethnic populations and "trends impacts" on state vocational rehabilitation agencies. *Journal of Applied Rehabilitation Counseling*, 46(2), 20–34.

Fagerberg, J. (2017). Innovation policy: Rationales, lessons and challenges. *Journal of Economic Surveys*, 31(2), 497–512. <https://doi.org/10.1111/joes.12164>

Fagerberg, J. (2018). Mobilizing innovation for sustainability transitions: A comment on transformative innovation policy. *Research Policy*, 47(9), 1568–1576. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.respol.2018.08.012>

Fejes, A., & Köpsén, S. (2014). Vocational teachers' identity formation through boundary crossing. *Journal of Education and Work*, 27(3), 265–283. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13639080.2012.742181>

Fendrick, A. M. (2018). Supporting English language learners inside the mathematics

- classroom: One teacher's unique perspective working with students during their first years in America. *Research and Evaluation in Literacy and Technology*, 41.
- Firth, A. (2009). Doing not being a foreign language learner: English as a lingua franca in the workplace and (some) implications for SLA. *IRAL-International Review of Applied Linguistics in Language Teaching*, 47(1), 127–156.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1515/iral.2009.006>
- Fischer, C., Fishman, B., Dede, C., Eisenkraft, A., Frumin, K., Foster, B., McCoy, A. (2018). Investigating relationships between school context, teacher professional development, teaching practices, and student achievement in response to a nationwide science reform. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 72, 107–121.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2018.02.011>
- Fletcher, E. C., Jr., Djajalaksana, Y., & Eison, J. (2012). Instructional strategy use of Faculty in career and technical education. *Journal of Career and Technical Education*, 27(2), 69–83. <https://doi.org/10.21061/jcte.v27i2.561>
- Fletcher, E. C., Jr., Warren, N. Q., & Hernández-Gantes, V. M. (2018). Preparing high school students for a changing world: College, career, and future ready learners. *Career and Technical Education Research*, 43(1), 77–97.
<https://doi.org/10.5328/cter43.1.77>
- Fram, S. M. (2013). The constant comparative analysis method outside of grounded theory. *The Qualitative Report*, 18(Article 1), 1–25.
- Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York, NY: Continuum.
- Freire, P. (1976). Literacy and the possible dream. *Prospects* (Vol. 6, pp. 68–71).

Dordrecht, Netherlands. Kluwer Academic Publishers.

<https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02220134>

Friere, P., & Faundez, A. (1989). *Learning to question*. New York, NY: Continuum.

Furrer, C. J., Skinner, E. a., & Pitzer, J. R. (2013). The influence of teacher and peer relationships on students' classroom engagement and everyday motivational resilience. *National Society for the Study of Education*, 113(1), 101–123.

Fusch, P. I., & Ness, L. R. (2015). Are we there yet? Data saturation in qualitative research. *The Qualitative Report*, 20(9), 1408–1416. <https://doi.org/1, 1408-1416>

Garcia, C., & Chun, H. (2016). Culturally responsive teaching and teacher expectations for Latino middle school students. *Journal of Latino Psychology*, 4(3), 173–187. <https://doi.org/10.1037/lat0000061>

Godfrey, E. B., & Grayman, J. K. (2014). Teaching citizens: The role of open classroom climate in fostering critical consciousness among youth. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, 43(11), 1801–1817. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10964-013-0084-5>

Gomez, M. N., & Diarrassouba, N. (2014). What do teachers need to support english learners? *English Language Teaching*, 7(5), 89–101. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v7n5p89>

González, M. M. (2016). An on-line journal for preparing teacher candidates for the instruction of english language learners. *Networks*, 18(2), 1–9.

Granit-Dgani, D., Kaplan, A., & Flum, H. (2016). Theory-based assessment in environmental education: a tool for formative evaluation. *Environmental Education Research*, 4622(March), 1–31. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13504622.2016.1144172>

- Greene, A. D. (2014). Tracking work: Race-ethnic variation in vocational course placement and consequences for academic and career outcomes. *International Journal of Educational Studies*, 1(1), 9–18.
- Gulikers, J. T. M., Biemans, H. J. A., Wesselink, R., & van der Wel, M. (2013). Aligning formative and summative assessments: A collaborative action research challenging teacher conceptions. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 39(2), 116–124.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stueduc.2013.03.001>
- Gullan, R. L., Power, T. J., & Leff, S. S. (2013). The role of empowerment in a school-based community service program with inner-city, minority youth. *Journal of Adolescent Research*, 28(6), 664–689. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0743558413477200>
- Hall, J. D., & Graziano, K. H. (2017). Flipping math in a secondary classroom. *Journal of Computers in Mathematics and Science Teaching*, 36(1), 5–16.
- Hämäläinen, R., & De Wever, B. (2013). Vocational education approach: New TEL settings—new prospects for teachers’ instructional activities? *International Journal of Computer-Supported Collaborative Learning*, 8(3), 271–291.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11412-013-9176-1>
- Harris, B., & Sullivan, A. L. (2017). A framework for bilingual school consultation to facilitate multitier systems of support for English language learners. *Journal of Educational and Psychological Consultation*, 27(3), 367–392.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/10474412.2017.1307758>
- Harrison, H., Birks, M., Franklin, R., & Mills, J. (2017). Case study research: Foundations and methodological orientations. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*,

- 18(1). <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.17169/fqs-18.1.2655>
- Harrison, H., Birks, M., Franklin, R., & Mills, J. (2017). Case study research: Foundations and methodological orientations. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 18(1). <https://doi.org/10.17169/FQS-18.1.2655>
- Hattingh, S., Kettle, M., & Brownlee, J. (2017). Internationalising a school: Teachers perspectives on pedagogy, curriculum, and inclusion. *TESOL in Context*, 26(1), 45–62.
- Heineke, A. J., Papola-Ellis, A., Davin, K. J., Cohen, S., Roudebush, A., Wright-Costello, B., & Fendt, C. (2018). Language matters: Developing educators' expertise for English learners in linguistically diverse communities. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 8318, 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07908318.2018.1493493>
- Henderson, G. E. (2016). With great (participant) rights comes great (researcher) responsibility. *Genetics in Medicine*, 18(2), 124–125. <https://doi.org/10.1038/gim.2015.67>
- Henrico County Public Schools. (2018). Retrieved from <https://henricocoe.com/>
- Herman, L. (2013). Tips for writing policy papers. Retrieved from <https://www-cdn.law.stanford.edu/wp-content/uploads/2015/04/White-Papers-Guidelines.pdf>
- Herreid, C. F., Prud'homme-Généreux, A., Schiller, N. A., Herreid, K. F., & Wright, C. (2016). What makes a good case, revisited: The survey monkey tells all. *Journal of College Science Teaching*, 45(1), 60–65.
- Herrera, R. L., Richter, Kenneth, G., Colunga, Luis, O. R., & Espejel, L. D. G. (2016). Mexican Teachers' perceptions of teaching english through content based

- instruction in the state of Guanajuato Mexico: A dual perspective. *Entreciencias*, 4(97–108).
- Hewitt-Taylor, J. (2001). Use of constant comparative analysis in qualitative research. *Nursing Standard*, 15(42), 39–42. <https://doi.org/10.7748/ns2001.07.15.42.39.c3052>
- Holton, J. A. (2010). The coding process and its challenges. *The Grounded Theory Review*, 9(1), 21–40. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781848607941.n13>
- Houghton, C., Casey, D., Shaw, D., & Murphy, K. (2013). Rigour in qualitative case-study research. *Nurse Researcher*, 20(4), 12–17. <https://doi.org/10.7748/nr2013.03.20.4.12.e326>
- Iacono, V. Lo, Symonds, P., & Brown, D. H. K. (2016). Skype as a tool for qualitative research interviews. *Sociological Research Online*, 21(2). <https://doi.org/10.5153/sro.3952>
- Irvine, A., Drew, P., & Sainsbury, R. (2013). Am I not answering your questions properly?: Clarification, adequacy and responsive in semi-structured telephone and face-to-face interviews. *Qualitative Research*, 13(1), 87–106. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1468794112439086>
- Jääskelä, P., & Nissilä, P. (2015). Identifying themes for research-based development of pedagogy and guidance in higher education. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research*, 59(1), 24–41. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00313831.2013.838696>
- Jacob, S. A., & Furgerson, S. P. (2012). The qualitative report writing interview protocols and conducting interviews: Tips for students new to the field of qualitative research. *The Qualitative Report*, 17(42), 1–10.

- Jemal, A. (2017). Critical consciousness: A critique and critical analysis of the literature. *The Urban Review*, 49(4), 602–626. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11256-017-0411-3>
- Jocson, K. M. (2018). “I want to do more and change things”: Reframing CTE toward possibilities in urban education. *Urban Education*, 53(5), 640–667. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0042085915618714>
- Jonsen, K., Fendt, J., & Point, S. (2018). Convincing qualitative research: What constitutes persuasive writing? *Organizational Research Methods*, 21(1), 30–67. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1094428117706533>
- Kallio, H., Pietilä, A. M., Johnson, M., & Kangasniemi, M. (2016). Systematic methodological review: Developing a framework for a qualitative semi-structured interview guide. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 72(12), 2954–2965. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jan.13031>
- Karahan, E., Canbazoglu Bilici, S., & Unal, A. (2015). Integration of media design processes in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) education. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, (60), 221–240. <https://doi.org/10.14689/ejer.2015.60.15>
- Kawinkamolroj, M., Triwaranyu, C., & Thongthaw, S. (2015). Coaching process based on transformative learning theory for changing the instructional mindset of Elementary school teachers. *Bulgarian Comparative Education Society*, 153–160. <https://doi.org/10.4161/sgtp.1.1.12178>
- Kaz, D. (2014). *Investing in Effective Employment & Training Strategies for English Language Learners*. Seattle, WA. Seattle Jobs Institute.

- Kelly, L. B. (2018). Preservice teachers' developing conceptions of teaching English learners. *TESOL Quarterly*, 52(1), 110–136. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.375>
- Kemp, A. (2005). White paper writing guide. Arvada, CO: Impact Technical Publications. Retrieved from <http://www.impactonthenet.com/wp-guide.pdf>
- Kennedy, M. M. (2016). How does professional development improve teaching? *Review of Educational Research*, 86(4), 945–980. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0034654315626800>
- Ketelaar, E., Brok, P. Den, Beijgaard, D., & Boshuizen, H. P. A. (2018). Teachers' perceptions of the coaching role in secondary vocational education. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 64(3), 295–315. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2012.691534>
- Kirk, C. M., Lewis, R. K., Brown, K., Karibo, B., Scott, A., & Park, E. (2017). The empowering schools project. *Youth & Society*, 49(6), 827–847. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0044118X14566118>
- Klassen, M. (2017). ELLS in the midwest: Effects of assessments on writing discourse in a rural classroom. *INTESOL*, 14(1), 51–76.
- Kolb, S. M. (2012). Grounded theory and the constant comparative method: Valid research strategies for educators. *Journal of Emerging Trends in Educational Research and Policy Studies*, 3(1), 83–86. Retrieved from <http://jeteraps.scholarlinkresearch.com/articles/Grounded Theory and the Constant Comparative Method.pdf>
- Köpsén, S. (2014). How vocational teachers describe their vocational teacher identity.

Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 66(2), 194–211.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2014.894554>

Kowalski, C. P., Veesser, M., & Heisler, M. (2018). Formative evaluation and adaptation of pre-and early implementation of diabetes shared medical appointments to maximize sustainability and adoption. *BMC Family Practice*, 19(109), 1–24.

<https://doi.org/10.1186/s12875-018-0797-3>

Kuhn, C., Alonzo, A. C., & Zlatkin-Troitschanskaia, O. (2016). Evaluating the pedagogical content knowledge of pre- and in-service teachers of business and economics to ensure quality of classroom practice in vocational education and training. *Empirical Research in Vocational Education and Training*, 8(1), 5.

<https://doi.org/10.1186/s40461-016-0031-2>

Kvale, S. (2008). Doing interviews: Conducting an interview. *Doing interviews* (pp. 52–67). Thousand Oaks, CA. Sage publications. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781849208963>

Lambert, M. D., Velez, J. J., & Elliott, K. M. (2014). What are the teachers' experiences when implementing the curriculum for agricultural science education? *Journal of Agricultural Education*, 55(4), 100–115. <https://doi.org/10.5032/jae.2014.04100>

Lesseig, K., Nelson, T. H., Slavitt, D., & Seidel, R. A. (2016). Supporting middle school teachers' implementation of STEM design challenges. *School Science and Mathematics*, 116(4), 177–188. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ssm.12172>

Leuz, C. (2018). Evidence-based policymaking: Promise, challenges and opportunities for accounting and financial markets research. *Accounting and Business Research*, 48(5), 582–602. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00014788.2018.1470151>

- Lewis, S. (2015). Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches. *Health Promotion Practice, 16*(4), 473–475.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1524839915580941>
- Lindvall, J., Helenius, O., & Wiberg, M. (2018). Critical features of professional development programs: Comparing content focus and impact of two large-scale programs. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 70*, 121–131.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2017.11.013>
- Lodico, M. G., Spaulding, D. T., & Voegtle, K. H. (2010). *Methods in educational research: From theory to practice*. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Lowe, N., & Iskander, N. (2016). Power through problem solving: Latino immigrants and the inconsistencies of economic restructuring. *Population, Space and Place*, (May).
<https://doi.org/10.1002/psp.2023>
- Lowenhaupt, R., & Reeves, T. D. (2017). Changing demographics, changing practices: Teacher learning in new immigrant destinations. *Journal of Professional Capital and Community, 2*(1), 50–71. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JPC-09-2016-0023>
- Lucas, T., Villegas, A. M., & Martin, A. D. (2015). Teachers' beliefs about English language learners. In *Teachers' beliefs about English language learners*. (pp. 453–474). International handbook of research on teachers' beliefs.
- Lumsden, K., & Goode, J. (2018). Policing research and the rise of the 'evidence-base': Police Officer and staff understandings of research, its implementation and 'What Works.' *Sociology, 52*(4), 813–829. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038516664684>
- Luna, M. J., Selmer, S. J., & Rye, J. A. (2018). Teachers' noticing of students' thinking

in science through classroom artifacts: In what ways are science and engineering practices evident? *Journal of Science Teacher Education*, 29(2), 148–172.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/1046560X.2018.1427418>

Luna, N., & Revilla, A. T. (2013). Understanding Latina/o school pushout: Experiences of students who left school before graduating. *Journal of Latinos and Education*, 12(1), 22–37. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15348431.2012.734247>

Lynch, R. L. (1996). In search of vocational and technical teacher education. *Journal of Career and Technical Education*, 13(1).

Lynch, R. L. (2000). New directions for high school career and technical education in the 21st century. Retrieved from <http://www.eric.ed.gov/PDFS/ED444037.pdf>

Makofane, M. (2018). “Sharing of findings and recommendations remains a fallacy”: Reinvigoration of the dissemination and implementation of social work doctoral research findings. *Social Work*, 54(2), 146–162.

Manuel, A., van der Linden, J., & Popov, O. (2017). Educators in non-formal vocational education and training in Mozambique: A plea for recognition and professionalisation. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 36(3), 324–338. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02601370.2016.1241311>

Master, B., Loeb, S., Whitney, C., & Wyckoff, J. (2016). Different skills? Identifying differentially effective teachers of English language learners. *The Elementary School Journal*, 117(2), 261–284. <https://doi.org/10.1086/688871>

Mattern, J. (2013). How to write a white paper. Retrieved from <https://www.dirjournal.com/blogs/how-to-write-a-white-paper/>

- Mazzucato, M. (2017). *Mission-oriented innovation policy*. London England..
- McDonough, K. A. (2015). *Performing critical consciousness in teaching: Entanglements of knowing, feeling and relating*.
- McWhirter, E. H., & McWhirter, B. T. (2016). Critical consciousness and vocational development among Latina/o high school youth: Initial development and testing of a measure. *Journal of Career Assessment, 24*(3), 543–558.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1069072715599535>
- Mealer, M., & Jones, J. (2014). Methodological and ethical issues related to qualitative telephone interview. *Nurse Researcher, 21*(4), 32–37.
- Mercer, N., & Dawes, L. (2014). The study of talk between teachers and students, from the 1970s until the 2010s. *Oxford Review of Education, 40*(4), 430–445.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/03054985.2014.934087>
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2015). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. (4th). San Francisco, CA: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Miles, R., & Knipe, S. (2018). “ I sorta felt like I was out in the middle of the ocean”:
Novice Teachers ’ transition to the classroom. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education, 43*(6). Retrieved from <http://ro.ecu.edu.au/ajte/vol43/iss6/7>
- Miller, D. P., Latulipe, C., Melius, K. A., Quandt, S. A., & Arcury, T. A. (2016). Primary care providers’ views of patient portals: Interview study of perceived benefits and consequences. *Journal of Medical Internet Research, 18*(1), e8.

<https://doi.org/10.2196/jmir.4953>

Milner, H. R. (2013). *Policy reforms and de-professionalization of teaching*. Boulder, CO: Retrieved from <http://nepc.colorado.edu/publication/policy-reforms-deprofessionalization>

Minaabad, M. S. (2017). Study of the effect of dynamic assessment and graphic organizers on EFL learners' reading comprehension. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 8(3), 548–555. <https://doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0803.13>

Misbah, Z., Gulikers, J., Maulana, R., & Mulder, M. (2015). Teacher interpersonal behaviour and student motivation in competence-based vocational education: Evidence from Indonesia. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 50, 79–89. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2015.04.007>

Mitchell, T. D. (2015). Using a critical service-learning approach to facilitate civic identity development. *Theory Into Practice*, 54(1), 20–28. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00405841.2015.977657>

Mitra, D. (2003). Student voice in school reform: Reframing student-teacher relationships. *McGill Journal of Education*, 38(2), 289–304.

Mjøsumund, N. H., Eriksson, M., Espnes, G. A., Haaland-Øverby, M., Jensen, S. L., Norheim, I., Vinje, H. F. (2017). Service user involvement enhanced the research quality in a study using interpretative phenomenological analysis – the power of multiple perspectives. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 73(1), 265–278. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jan.13093>

Morse, J. M. (2015a). Analytic strategies and sample size. *Qualitative Health Research*,

25(10), 1317–1318. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732315602867>

Morse, J. M. (2015b). Critical analysis of strategies for determining rigor in qualitative inquiry. *Qualitative Health Research*, 25(9), 1212–1222.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732315588501>

Morse, J. M., & Coulehan, J. (2015). Maintaining confidentiality in qualitative publications. *Qualitative Health Research*, 25(2), 151–152.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732314563489>

Morse, W. C., Lowery, D. R., & Steury, T. (2014). Exploring saturation of themes and spatial locations in qualitative public participation geographic information systems research. *Society and Natural Resources*, 27(5), 557–571.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/08941920.2014.888791>

Moyer, R., Snodgrass, J., Klein, S., & Tebben, C. (2017). *Simulated work-based learning instructional approaches and noteworthy practices*. Washington, DC: National Center for Innovation in Career and Technical Education.

Mueller-langer, F., Fecher, B., Harhoff, D., & Wagner, G. G. (2019). Replication studies in economics — How many and which papers are chosen for replication, and why?

Research Policy, 48(1), 62–83. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.respol.2018.07.019>

Nicholas, J., Chae, C., Azlan, M., Hussain, M., Zulkifli, R. M., & Passmore, D. (2015).

School-to-work revisited: Did work-based learning experiences improve prospects for students in career and technical education? <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2703854>

Oates, J. (2015). Use of Skype in interviews: The impact of the medium in a study of mental health nurses. *Nurse Researcher*, 22(4), 13–17.

<https://doi.org/10.7748/nr.22.4.13.e1318>

- Owen, G. T. (2014). Qualitative methods in higher education policy analysis : Using interviews and document analysis. *The Qualitative Report, 19*, 1–19.
<https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781107415324.004>
- Palinkas, L. A., Horwitz, S. M., Green, C. A., Wisdom, J. P., Duan, N., & Hoagwood, K. (2015). Purposeful sampling for qualitative data collection and analysis in mixed method implementation research. *Administration and Policy in Mental Health and Mental Health Services Research, 42*, 533–544. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10488-013-0528-y>
- Pappamihel, N. E., & Lynn, C. A. (2016). Adaptations for English language learners: differentiating between linguistic and instructional accommodations. *The Electronic Journal for English as a Second Language, 20*(3), 1–13.
- Parkinson, J., & Mackay, J. (2016). The literacy practices of vocational training in carpentry and automotive technology. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 68*(1), 33–50. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2015.1104714>
- Passarella, A. (2018). *The necessary components of an effective Career and Technical Education (CTE) program*. Baltimore, MD: Institute for Educational Policy.
- Patanapu, S. K., Doshi, D., Kulkarni, S., Reddy, P., Adep, S., & Reddy, S. (2018). Does academic performance influence personal growth initiative? An institutional-based study among undergraduate dental students. *Journal of Education and Health Promotion, 7*(January), 1–5. <https://doi.org/10.4103/jehp.jehp>
- Patton, M. Q. (1987). *How to use qualitative methods in evaluation*. Los Angeles, CA:

SAGE Publications.

- Pehmer, A.-K., Gröschner, A., & Seidel, T. (2015a). Fostering and scaffolding student engagement in productive classroom discourse: Teachers' practice changes and reflections in light of teacher professional development. *Learning, Culture and Social Interaction*, 7, 12–27. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lcsi.2015.05.001>
- Pehmer, A.-K., Gröschner, A., & Seidel, T. (2015b). How teacher professional development regarding classroom dialogue affects students' higher-order learning. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 47, 108–119. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2014.12.007>
- Percy, W. H., Kostere, K., & Kostere, S. (2015). Generic qualitative research in psychology. *The Qualitative Report*, 20(2), 76–85.
- Placklé, I., Könings, K. D., Jacquet, W., Libotton, A., van Merriënboer, J. J. G., & Engels, N. (2017). Students embracing change towards more powerful learning environments in vocational education. *Educational Studies*, 44(1), 26–44. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03055698.2017.1331840>
- Plotner, A. J., Mazzotti, V. L., Rose, C. A., & Teasley, K. (2018). Perceptions of interagency collaboration: Relationships between secondary transition roles, communication, and collaboration. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0741932518778029>
- Poduthase, H. (2015). Rigor in qualitative research: Promoting quality in social science research. *Research Journal of Recent Sciences*, 4(October), 25–28.
- Polat, N., & Cepik, S. (2016). An exploratory factor analysis of the sheltered instruction observation protocol as an evaluation tool to measure teaching effectiveness. *TESOL*

- Quarterly*, 50(4), 817–843. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.248>
- Polidano, C., & Tabasso, D. (2014). Making it real: The benefits of workplace learning in upper-secondary vocational education and training courses. *Economics of Education Review*, 42, 130–146. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econedurev.2014.06.003>
- Price, D. (2015). Classroom activities to support WIOA* and address workforce preparation. *2015 TALAE Conference* (pp. 1–73). Houston, TX.
- Quartiroli, A., Knight, S. M., Etzel, E. F., & Monaghan, M. (2018). Using Skype to facilitate team-based qualitative research, including the process of data analysis. *Remedial and Special Education*, 20(6), 659–666. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13645579.2016.1275371>
- Redlich-Amirav, D., & Higginbottom, G. (2014). New emerging technologies in qualitative research. *The Qualitative Report* (19).
- Reed, D. K., Swanson, E., Petscher, Y., & Vaughn, S. (2014). The effects of teacher read-alouds and student silent reading on predominantly bilingual high school seniors' learning and retention of social studies content. *Reading and Writing*, 27(7), 1119–1140. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11145-013-9478-8>
- Reegård, K. (2016). Diversity of occupational orientations in sales vocational education and training. *Journal of Education and Work*, 29(6), 688–706. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13639080.2015.1024642>
- Regan, S., Wong, C., Laschinger, H. K., Cummings, G., Leiter, M., MacPhee, M., ...
Read, E. (2017). Starting out: Qualitative perspectives of new graduate nurses and nurse leaders on transition to practice. *Journal of Nursing Management*, 25(4), 246–

255. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jonm.12456>

- Renn, R. W., Steinbauer, R., Taylor, R., & Detwiler, D. (2014). School-to-work transition: Mentor career support and student career planning, job search intentions, and self-defeating job search behavior. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 85(3), 422–432. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2014.09.004>
- Robinson, L. (2016). Age difference and face-saving in an inter-generational problem-based learning group. *Journal of Further and Higher Education*, 40(4), 466–485. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0309877X.2014.984598>
- Roche, K. M., Calzada, E. J., Ghazarian, S. R., Little, T. D., Lambert, S. F., & Schulenberg, J. (2017). Longitudinal pathways to educational attainment for youth in Mexican and Central American immigrant families. *Journal of Latina/o Psychology*, 5(1), 12–26. <https://doi.org/10.1037/lat0000059>
- Rodríguez, D., Smith Canter, L. L., Voytecki, K., & Floyd, K. (2013). Educators taking the lead to transition high school emergent bilingual learners with disabilities. *Journal of Multilingual Education Research*, 4(Fall), 89–107.
- Rojewski, J. (2002). Preparing the workforce of tomorrow: A conceptual framework for career and technical education. *Journal of Vocational Education Research*, 27(1), 7–35. <https://doi.org/ED419696>
- Rojewski, J. W., & Hill, R. B. (2017). A framework for 21st-century career-technical and workforce education curricula. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 92(2), 180–191. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0161956X.2017.1302211>
- Rose, D. C., Sutherland, W. J., Simmons, B. I., Ivory, S., Steiner, N., Wu, W., Norris, L.

- (2018). The major barriers to evidence informed conservation policy and possible solutions. *Conservation Letters*, *11*(April), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1111/conl.12564>
- Ross, M. W., Iguchi, M. Y., & Panicker, S. (2018). Ethical aspects of data sharing and research participant protections. *American Psychologist*, *73*(2), 138–145. <https://doi.org/10.1037/amp0000240>
- Sakamuro, S., Stolley, K., & Hyde, C. (2015). White paper: Purpose and audience. Retrieved from <https://owl.english.purdue.edu/owl/resource/546/1/>
- Salerno, A. S., & Kibler, A. K. (2015). Vocational training for adolescent English language learners in newcomer programs: Opportunities or isolation? *TESOL Journal*, *6*(2), 201–224. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesj.140>
- Saunders, B., Sim, J., Kingstone, T., Baker, S., Waterfield, J., Bartlam, B., Jinks, C. (2018). Saturation in qualitative research: Exploring its conceptualization and operationalization. *Quality and Quantity*, *52*(4), 1893–1907. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-017-0574-8>
- Schmitt, U. (2016). Personal knowledge management for development (PKM4D) framework and its application for people empowerment. *Procedia Computer Science*, *99*, 64–78. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2016.09.101>
- Seidman, I. (2006). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences*. (3rd). New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Shatto, B., & Erwin, K. (2017). Teaching millennials and generation Z: Bridging the generational divide. *Creative Nursing*, *23*(1).
- Short, D. (2013). Training and sustaining effective Teachers of sheltered instruction.

Theory Into Practice, 5(2) (October), 118–127.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/00405841.2013.770329>

Sias, C. M., Nadelson, L. S., Juth, S. M., & Seifert, A. L. (2017). The best laid plans: Educational innovation in elementary teacher generated integrated STEM lesson plans. *Journal of Educational Research*, 110(3), 227–238.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/00220671.2016.1253539>

Sheltered Instruction Observation Protocol. (2017). *Center for Applied Linguistics*.

Retrieved from <http://www.cal.org/siop/about/>

Slaten, C. D., Irby, D. J., Tate, K., & Rivera, R. (2015). Towards a critically conscious approach to social and emotional learning in urban alternative education: School staff members' perspectives. *Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology*, 7(1), 41–62.

Smith, B., & McGannon, K. R. (2018). Developing rigor in qualitative research: Problems and opportunities within sport and exercise psychology. *International Review of Sport and Exercise Psychology*, 11(1), 101–121.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/1750984X.2017.1317357>

Smith, D. E. (2006). *Institutional ethnography as practice*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.

Sommers, S. (2000). *VESL – Vocational English as a Second Language: Courses A & B Curriculum Guide*. Chicago, IL.

Spiers, J., Morse, J. M., Olson, K., Mayan, M., & Barrett, M. (2002). Verification strategies for establishing reliability and validity in qualitative research.

International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 1(2).

<https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406918788237>

- Stacey, K., Harvey, S., & Richards, H. (2013). Teachers working with ESOL paraprofessionals in a secondary context: Examining supervision. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 36, 55–67. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2013.07.002>
- Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousand Oaks, CA. Sage publications.
- Stetler, C. B., Legro, M. W., Wallace, C. M., Bowman, C., Guihan, M., Hagedorn, H., ... Smith, J. L. (2006). The role of formative evaluation in implementation research and the QUERI experience. *Journal of General Internal Medicine*, 21(SUPPL. 2), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1525-1497.2006.00355.x>
- Stringfield, S., & Stone, J. R. (2017). The labor market imperative for CTE: Changes and challenges for the 21st century. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 92(2), 166–179. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0161956X.2017.1302209>
- Texas growth occupations. Texas Workforce Commission (2016). Austin, TX.
- Thomas, A. J., Barrie, R., Brunner, J., Clawson, A., Hewitt, A., Jeremie-Brink, G., & Rowe-Johnson, M. (2014). Assessing critical consciousness in youth and young adults. *Journal of Research on Adolescence*, 24(3), 485–496. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jora.12132>
- Thomas, T. H. T., Bloomfield, J. G., Gordon, C. J., & Aggar, C. (2018). Australia’s first transition to professional practice in primary care program: Qualitative findings from a mixed-method evaluation. *Collegian*, 25, 201–208.

<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.colegn.2017.03.009>

Tight, M. (2010). The curious case of case study: A viewpoint. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 13(4), 329–339.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/13645570903187181>

Trainor, A., Murray, A., & Kim, H.-J. (2016). English learners with disabilities in high school: Population characteristics, transition programs, and postschool outcomes. *Remedial and Special Education*, 37(3), 146–158.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/0741932515626797>

Tur Porres, G., Wildemeersch, D., & Simons, M. (2014). Reflections on the emancipatory potential of vocational education and training practices: Freire and Rancière in dialogue. *Studies in Continuing Education*, 36(3), 275–289.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/0158037X.2014.904783>

Turan, S., & Bektas, F. (2013). The relationship between school culture and leadership practices. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, (52), 155–168.

Twining, P., Heller, R. S., Nussbaum, M., & Tsai, C. C. (2017). Some guidance on conducting and reporting qualitative studies. *Computer Science Education*, 106(1–9). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2016.12.002>

U. S. Department of Education. (2018). Improving basic programs operated by local educational agencies (Title I, Part A). Retrieved from <https://www.ed.gov/>.

Upton, S., Vallance, P., & Goddard, J. (2014). From outcomes to process: Evidence for a new approach to research impact assessment. *Research Evaluation*, 23(September), 352–365. <https://doi.org/10.1093/reseval/rvu021>

- Vafai, M. M. (2016). Transitions to middle-skill jobs: Pathways into the new socioeconomic structure of the 21st century. *Educational Studies, 52*(2), 139–154.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/00131946.2016.1142995>
- Valenzuela, D., & Shrivastava, P. (2002). Interview as a method for qualitative research. Southern Cross University and the Southern Cross Institute of Action Research (SCIAR).
- van Beek, J. A., de Jong, F. P. C. M., Minnaert, A. E. M. G., & Wubbels, T. (2014). Teacher practice in secondary vocational education: Between teacher-regulated activities of student learning and student self-regulation. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 40*, 1–9. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2014.01.005>
- van Uden, J. M., Ritzen, H., & Pieters, J. M. (2014). Engaging students: The role of teacher beliefs and interpersonal teacher behavior in fostering student engagement in vocational education. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 37*, 21–32.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2013.08.005>
- Vega, D., Hines, E., Mayes, R., & Harris, P. (2016). Preparing Latino students for life after high school: The important role of school counselors and school psychologists. *National Youth-At-Risk Journal, 2*(1), 70–82.
<https://doi.org/10.20429/nyarj.2016.020107>
- Vincent, S. K., & Kirby, A. T. (2015). Words speak louder than action?: A mixed-methods case study. *Journal of Agricultural Education, 56*(1), 32–42.
<https://doi.org/10.5032/jae.2015.01032>
- Virtanen, A., Tynjälä, P., & Eteläpelto, A. (2014). Factors promoting vocational students

- learning at work: Study on student experiences. *Journal of Education and Work*, 27(1), 43–70. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13639080.2012.718748>
- Vocke, K., Westine, C., Applegate, B., & VanDonkelaar, I. S. (2016). Serving latino farmworker students in Michigan summer migrant programs: Directors' perspectives. *Journal of Latinos and Education*, 15(August 2017), 157–169. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15348431.2015.1099528>
- Wang, M.-T., & Degol, J. L. (2017). Gender gap in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM): Current knowledge, implications for practice, policy, and future directions. *Educational Psychology Review*, 29(1), 119–140. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10648-015-9355-x>
- Watts, S., & Stenner, P. (2005). Doing Q methodology: Theory, method and interpretation. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 2, 67–91. <https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088705qp022oa>
- Watulak, S. L., Woodard, R., Smith, A., Johnson, L., Phillips, N., & Wargo, K. (2018). Connected teaching and learning in K-16+ contexts: An annotated bibliography. *Contemporary Issues in Technology and Teacher Education*, 18(2), 289–312.
- Weible, C. M., & Cairney, P. (2018). Practical lessons from policy theories. *Policy & Politics*, 46(2), 183–197. <https://doi.org/10.1332/030557318X15230059147191>
- Weller, S. (2017). Using internet video calls in qualitative (longitudinal) interviews: Some implications for rapport. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 20(6), 613–625. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13645579.2016.1269505>
- Wiesche, M., Jurisch, M. C., Yetton, P. W., & Kremer, H. (2017). Grounded theory

methodology in information systems research. *MIS Quarterly*, 41(3), 685–701.

Windsong, E. A. (2018). Incorporating intersectionality into research design: An example using qualitative interviews using qualitative interviews. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 21(2), 135–147.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/13645579.2016.1268361>

Workforce innovation and opportunity act English language learner workforce navigator pilot program PY 2016/17. (2017). The California Workforce Development Board.

Retrieved from [ining/pubs/ELL-Navigator-RFA-02.20.17.pdf](http://www.cwdb.org/doing/pubs/ELL-Navigator-RFA-02.20.17.pdf)

Wright, A., Moss, P., Dennis, D. M., Harrold, M., Levy, S., Furness, A. L., & Reubenson, A. (2018). The influence of a full-time, immersive simulation-based clinical placement on physiotherapy student confidence during the transition to clinical practice. *Advances in Simulation*, 3(1), 3. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s41077-018-0062-9>

Wu, S.-L. (2017). The planning, implementation, and assessment of an international internship program: An exploratory case study. *Foreign Language Annals*, 50(3), 567–583. <https://doi.org/10.1111/flan.12280>

Yazan, B. (2015). *Three approaches to case study methods in education: Yin, Merriam, and Stake*. (Vol. 20). Retrieved from <http://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/vol20/iss2/12>

Yin, R. K. (2017). *Case study research and applications: Design and methods* (6th ed.). Los Angeles, CA: Sage publications.

Young, C., Hill, R., Morris, G., & Woods, F. (2016). Engaging in collaboration: A team of teams approach. *Kappa Delta Pi Record*, 52(2), 76–78.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/00228958.2016.1156514>

Zacarian, D. (2011). *Transforming schools for English learners: A comprehensive framework for school leaders*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press.

Zagona, A. L., Kurth, J. A., & MacFarland, S. Z. C. (2017). Teachers' views of their preparation for inclusive education and collaboration. *Teacher Education and Special Education, 40*(3), 163–178. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0888406417692969>

Zhang, W. (2017). Quality matters: Content literacy for english language learners. *TESOL Journal, 8*(1), 166–189. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesj.266>

Appendix A: A Policy Recommendation with Detail Report

Instructional Practices of English Language Learner Teachers in Career and Technical
Education

Table of Contents

Appendix A: A Policy Recommendation with Detail Report	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Instructional Practices of English Language Learner Teachers in Career and Technical Education.....	146
Introduction.....	148
Research Design.....	149
Findings.....	150
Conclusion	155
References.....	158

Executive Summary

Graduation rates for Midwestern high schools are increasing, but large gaps remain in graduation rates between various students groups (Collins, 2018; Wastvedt, 2018; *World's best workforce legislative report fiscal year 2016.*, 2016). Graduation rates for English Language Learners (ELLs) are more important than ever because Midwestern ELL population has grown more than 300% in the last 20 years (*Title III, Part A, Subpart I: English Language Acquisition and Language Enhancement*, 2017). To address ELL success in CTE programs, I examined the instructional practices of CTE teachers with ELLs and the perceived linkage of those practices to a successful ELL transition to the workforce.

Key stakeholders such as administrators, teachers, employers, and community organizations should discuss policy recommendation and how it affects ELL instruction in CTE programs. The research study titled *Instructional Practices of Teachers of English Language Learners in Career and Technical Education* (Crouch, 2019) provided the background for the recommendations in this study. This policy paper supports Midwestern CTE action item of “developing strong collaborations between schools, families, and communities” (*College and Career Readiness Resource Guide: Data inquiry.*, 2018; “English Learner Education,” 2018). CTE programs play a vital role in student success by connecting students to their community (De La Garza & Kuri, 2016). Students learn skills to gain employment and feel productive. This paper recommends ELL CTE instructional practices that may translate to an increased number of graduates who are prepared to enter the workforce with the skills necessary for success. Those

recommendations include improving ELL transition into CTE programs, professional development geared towards ELL instruction in CTE classes, and the creation of business advisory committees to help build strong community connections.

Introduction

Studies have shown that effective ELL CTE instruction reinforces the feeling that ELLs can be productive in their community (Adelson-Goldstein, 2015; Arnold, 2013; Rodríguez, Smith Canter, Voytecki, & Floyd, 2013). Research-based instructional practices are more effective than “traditional instruction” when teaching ELLs (Master, Loeb, Whitney, & Wyckoff, 2016). Because CTE classroom instruction is different than in the academic classroom, techniques that apply to academic classrooms may not be as effective in CTE classrooms (Köpsén, 2014). The diversity of CTE programs in both student grade levels and ELL language acquisition levels, suggests different instructional techniques are necessary to improve transition of students from school to work. Lowenhaupt and Reeves (2017) stressed the importance of research-based instruction when assessing outcomes in CTE. Some CTE teachers excel in technical competence but may not have expertise in formal teaching methods. Kuhn et al., (2016) found that the diversity of CTE content teachings relies heavily on keeping current with subject matter and leaves little time for learning how to incorporate research-based instructional strategies. Kuhn et al. also found that the complex nature of CTE subjects prevents CTE teachers from using a common teaching method. CTE teachers divide their time between participating in teacher education training and occupational training to stay relevant with an ever-changing work environment.

Research Design

A basic qualitative study investigated the CTE teacher's role in ELL instruction. The study used the conceptual framework of critical consciousness (CC) theory (Freire, 1970). This theory contests inadvertent application of (a) the oppressor-oppressed relationship and (b) the banking concept of education, and (c) how the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment.

I conducted eight semistructured interviews with Midwestern schools CTE secondary education teachers. Because CTE teachers teach different content, their individual concerns differed. A constant comparative method analyzed the data. I analyzed the interview responses to Freire's (1970) CC theory elements of (a) the oppressor-oppressed relationship, (b) the banking concept of education, and (c) how the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment. The interview questions addressed research question 1. From the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices are used to support ELLs? All eight of the participants responded that they needed to modify the curriculum to meet ELL needs. The modifications included moving from teacher centered to student centered, adding more picture and vocabulary and using a consistent format for content delivery. Students responded positively to the instructors' delivery methods. The interview questions also addressed research question 2. From the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices are perceived to improve successful ELL transition to the workforce? All eight of the participants responded that they did not have a formal process for tracking graduates. They did not have advisory groups comprised of area businesses that could

give feedback on their programs. Six of the teachers stated they had conversations with former students and they asked the graduate if they were using the skills they learned in class, at their jobs. Students responded positively about the instruction they received.

The themes derived from the data were aligned with the research questions. The themes that developed from research question 1 were the classroom management techniques, adapting curriculum, instructional consistency, and questioning techniques. The themes that developed from research question 2 were the connection with community partners and teaching relevant content. Although most of the CTE teachers did not identify a research-based instructional pedagogy, it is evident by their reflective comments that the teachers care about the success of their students.

Findings

Most of the CTE teachers used instructional techniques they believed to be effective based on their experiences. The teachers indicated that they were pleased to have ELLs in their classes. They said that ELLs were engaged and excited to learn in their classrooms! The teachers were aware of the institutional limits of managing CTE programs in a public education setting. Because CTE classes are electives, they are comprised of a diverse student population in both grade and ELL language proficiency levels. CTE teachers may have students in grades 9 – 12 in the same class. There is a difference in maturity and comprehension levels of students from ninth to 12th grade. Classroom management techniques need to change depending on the mix of grade levels of students in a class. Limiting enrollment to certain grade levels could help this disparity. Although the teachers offered suggestions to have only ELL classes or add

more time to each class so they could slow the pace of instruction down, they understood the limits of public education offerings. Classroom management techniques also vary depending on the ELL level of students in a class. Teachers felt that similar ELL levels in a class could improve ELL student outcomes. Teachers would be able to tailor lesson plans to the students' level of understanding. The students would benefit from a pace that they are comfortable with instead of some students who were bored because instruction is too slow, or students left behind because instruction is too fast. Although it may be

As one participant said: "I have ELL 1 through ELL 3 in the same class just because of our elective numbers. You could pace down a little bit more to ensure that all students are getting the

impossible to place the same ELL language proficiencies classes, teachers must adapt to the different levels present course content to all students. CTE teachers also found they had to adapt their curriculum to meet the needs of ELLs. The CTE teachers found that the CTE curriculum is written for mainstream education and it does not cater to the specific needs of

ELLs. One teacher said "I find that anything modification wise that I've done is acceptable for how level ELL as well as a mainstreamed regular Ed student." One of the most important findings from the research is that good teaching is good teaching (Candal, 2015). What benefits ELLs benefits all students. The results of the study did suggest instructional practices, which could improve ELL transition from CTE programs to the workplace.

Recommendation 1: Improving ELLs Transition into CTE Programs

Two issues that to address when ELLs choose a CTE program are what perceptions students have about that program and how CTE teachers are made aware of the students entering their programs. To address student perceptions of CTE programs, administrators should have program materials to present to students about program expectations and desired outcomes. CTE programs have different expectations than academic programs. Student need to understand the unique classroom/lab situations of CTE programs. As one teacher said “A lot of our students may qualify for some services, but there are plenty, especially by the time there are 11th and 12th graders that can function fairly easily in a classroom without support.” To better prepare students for success, they should be explained the unique expectations of CTE programs. CTE Teachers need to know who the students are that are entering their programs. CTE teachers differentiate their instruction based on the makeup of their classes in both grade and ELL levels. The unique classroom situations of CTE programs requires an understanding of the maturity and comprehension levels of each student to maximize student participation and address safety concerns in their classes.

A comprehensive plan to introduce students to a program should include CTE program requirements, program outcomes, and a tour of the shop/facility. The onboarding process should include an introduction to the CTE teacher(s). A transition plan prepares both the student and teacher for success in the CTE program (Plotner, Mazzotti, Rose, & Teasley, 2018). The transition of ELLs to the classroom may only include testing and placement into a ELL program but not necessarily understand the impact of being placed into a CTE program (Zacarian, 2011). When students enter a new situation, they can be

nervous about what the experience will be. Preparing both students and teachers will help ease the transition that both will be experiencing (“Engineering a classroom that works for all.,” 2018; Jocson, 2018). This can be extremely important when students enter the CTE program in the middle of a semester. Teachers need to understand what ELL level the new student is so they can help the student be successful from the beginning.

Recommendation 2: Professional Development

The second recommendation is for professional development (PD) for CTE teachers. Teachers asked for PD opportunities specifically designed for CTE teachers so that they could implement the use of effective ELL instruction techniques. As a teacher said, “Yeah, it’s great having them in class, I love having EL students. They are some of my favorite students to work with so I love to have them in my class room.” It is clear the inclusion of ELLs in CTE programs is rewarding. What is unclear is if teachers know what instructional strategies will benefit the ELL population. It would be easier to try new techniques in the classroom if the teachers knew they were effective. To help reinforce the participants’ desire to provide quality instruction for all of their students, they should participate in learning what research-based instructional models that fit best with CTE programs. The differences in ELL levels in classes can be challenging. One teacher said “it’s like you’re have having problems you got a level one and a level six together like hey, you are all over the place.” Understanding how to provide the best instruction with the diversity in CTE classrooms is challenging. CTE teachers may not have the educational background to understand how challenging ELL instruction can be in their classes.

There are many theories on how students learn. I am recommending PD geared towards how teachers learn and present new ideas into their classrooms (Kennedy, 2016). Teachers who choose teaching as a career path learn instructional techniques that prepare them for the classroom. CTE teachers are usually hired for their content expertise and may not have been exposed research based instructional practices (Miles & Knipe, 2018). There are many PD programs that focus on instructional strategies such as Boost for Mathematics and Count on Vasterås (Lindvall, Helenius, & Wiberg, 2018). PD programs usually include a main idea the teacher should learn, how to design a lesson and a reflection of how well the lesson achieved the desired results. The type of PD chosen by administrators is based on what they feel are the most important item teachers needed to learn. Lowenhaupt & Reeves (2017) found that PD should be a “holistic, collaborative approach to integrating ELLs into schools and classrooms” instead of teaching a strategy. This holistic and collaborative approach aligns with the concepts of CC where the learner, in this case the teachers, are an active member of the learning process. Students are included in the learning process and not just told what to do. Asking teachers what type of professional development they need would generate ideas about the type of PD needed.

Recommendation 3: Improve Community Connections

My third recommendation is to formalize community connections with area business and CTE programs. This can be done through student-centered work based programs and advisory committee input. Both of these options would provide CTE teachers with the desired feedback on the quality of their programs. Student-centered

work based programs allow students to transfer the knowledge of the classroom to a real world work experience. Job shadowing or internships where the students work for an employer are recommended. Students would benefit from being exposed to working conditions where they would see the value of soft skills as well as the skills they learned in their coursework. These opportunities can be paid or non-paid experiences.

Creation of program advisory committees would lead to a stronger CTE program where business would have input to the curriculum and equipment needs. Advisory committees provide valuable input for students who are trying to learn the skills they need to be successful in the workplace (Lowe & Iskander, 2016). The advisory committee model has been successful in Virginia's Henrico County school system ("Henrico County Public Schools," 2018). Although the CTE teachers in this study said that other departments in their schools performed outreach activities, they wanted to be involved building stronger community businesses partnerships.

Conclusion

This project focused on the ELL instructional practices of secondary CTE teachers and how those practices are perceived to improve ELL transition to the workforce. The purpose of the study was to provide recommendations to stakeholders on what is working to improve ELL success in CTE programs. CTE teachers have a diverse classroom and need to engage students with adaptive learning techniques (Shatto & Erwin, 2017). The recommendations focus

Another participant said: "I have limited contact with graduates and it's actually a huge problem, because we'd like to make all these grand statements about how successful we are at getting in them college and we have no

on improving instructional practices of CTE teachers and students transition to the workplace.

A defined onboarding process of ELLs should be more than testing and letting students pick a CTE elective. New students should be provided a comprehensive overview of each CTE program that includes the requirements and expected outcomes. This introduction to the program is to include a tour of the facility and a meet and greet with the teachers. The CTE teachers need to be aware of each student introduced into their program. They need to know what level of instruction students are performing at so they can prepare their lessons appropriately to improve student success.

Professional development opportunities for CTE teachers that are aimed at a holistic, collaborative approach will have a bearing on teachers schedules and possible the schools budget. Teachers may teach the PD programs in the school systems that have the experience and background to lead such programs. If qualified teachers are not available, they the school may have to research industry professionals who may require a fee to conduct the workshops.

Developing business advisory committees is a no cost solution to connect the businesses with CTE programs. The CTE teachers could research area businesses that want to help the teachers. They would provide the human resources necessary to call meetings, review curriculum and program outcomes to make recommendations for improvement. When they provide the work based learning opportunities for students, they would see how CTE instruction provides feedback on student comprehension of how to perform industry skills. This feedback would close the loop on how the education

students receive translates to the workplace. Both CTE programs and business would benefit from such an alliance.

Commitment to change is the key to any recommendations. In 2018, a Midwestern school district ELL graduation rates were 65.6%. Without changes at the student/program level, the goal of 90% student graduation by 2020 seems unlikely. Stakeholders must realize the benefits of helping CTE teachers reach their potential through education of research-based instructional practices and improving industry connections. The teachers in this study made it clear that they care about what they do and how they do it. They want the information that will help them improve teaching techniques that will allow their ELLs the opportunity to excel in the workplace.

References

- Adelson-Goldstein, J. (2015). *Preparing English learners for work and career pathways: Companion learning resource*. Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Education.
- Candal, C. S. (2015). *Massachusetts charter public schools: Best practices serving English Language Learners*. Pioneer Institute for Public Policy Research. *College and Career Readiness Resource Guide: Data inquiry*. (2018).
- Collins, J. (2018). Minnesota's graduation rate hits new high, gaps closing over time.
- De La Garza, T., & Kuri, M. (2016). Building strong community partnerships: Equal voice and mutual benefits. *Journal of Latinos and Education*, 13(2), 120–133.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/15348431.2013.821064>
- Engineering a classroom that works for all. (2018). *Science Scope*, 42(1), 16–20.
- English Learner Education. (2018). Retrieved from
<https://education.mn.gov/MDE/dse/el/>
- Henrico County Public Schools. (2018). Retrieved from <https://henricocte.com/>
- Jocson, K. M. (2018). “I want to do more and change things”: Reframing CTE toward possibilities in urban education. *Urban Education*, 53(5), 640–667.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0042085915618714>
- Kennedy, M. M. (2016). How does professional development improve teaching? *Review of Educational Research*, 86(4), 945–980.
<https://doi.org/10.3102/0034654315626800>
- Köpsén, S. (2014). How vocational teachers describe their vocational teacher identity. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 66(2), 194–211.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2014.894554>

- Kuhn, C., Alonzo, A. C., & Zlatkin-Troitschanskaia, O. (2016). Evaluating the pedagogical content knowledge of pre- and in-service teachers of business and economics to ensure quality of classroom practice in vocational education and training. *Empirical Research in Vocational Education and Training*, 8(1), 5. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40461-016-0031-2>
- Lindvall, J., Helenius, O., & Wiberg, M. (2018). Critical features of professional development programs: Comparing content focus and impact of two large-scale programs. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 70, 121–131. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2017.11.013>
- Lowe, N., & Iskander, N. (2016). Power through problem solving: Latino immigrants and the inconsistencies of economic restructuring. *Population, Space and Place*, (May). <https://doi.org/10.1002/psp.2023>
- Lowenhaupt, R., & Reeves, T. D. (2017). Changing demographics, changing practices: Teacher learning in new immigrant destinations. *Journal of Professional Capital and Community*, 2(1), 50–71. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JPCC-09-2016-0023>
- Master, B., Loeb, S., Whitney, C., & Wyckoff, J. (2016). Different Skills? Identifying Differentially Effective Teachers of English Language Learners. *The Elementary School Journal*, 117(2), 261–284. <https://doi.org/10.1086/688871>
- Miles, R., & Knipe, S. (2018). “ I sorta felt like I was out in the middle of the ocean”: Novice Teachers ’ transition to the classroom. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 43(6). Retrieved from <http://ro.ecu.edu.au/ajte/vol43/iss6/7>

- Plotner, A. J., Mazzotti, V. L., Rose, C. A., & Teasley, K. (2018). Perceptions of interagency collaboration: Relationships between secondary transition roles, communication, and collaboration. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0741932518778029>
- Rodríguez, D., Smith Canter, L. L., Voytecki, K., & Floyd, K. (2013). Educators Taking the Lead to Transition High School Emergent Bilingual Learners with Disabilities. *Journal of Multilingual Education Research*, 4(Fall), 89–107.
- Shatto, B., & Erwin, K. (2017). Teaching millennials and generation Z: Bridging the generational divide. *Creative Nursing*, 23(1).
- Title III, Part A, Subpart 1: English Language Acquisition and Language Enhancement.* (2017). Retrieved from file:///C:/Users/bjs/Downloads/9 Minnesota State ESSA Plan - Title III, Part A, Subpart 1_English Language Acquisition and Language Enhancement.pdf
- Wastvedt, S. (2018). High school grad rates show only slight gains. Retrieved from <https://www.mprnews.org/story/2018/02/27/minn-graduation-rates-up-slightly>
- World's best workforce legislative report fiscal year 2016.* (2016). Retrieved from file:///C:/Users/bjs/Downloads/120B.11 Subd.9c - WBWF Legislative Report.pdf
- Zacarian, D. (2011). *Transforming schools for English learners: A comprehensive framework for school leaders.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press.

Appendix B: Interview Protocol

To maintain alignment with the research questions and sub questions, the following interview questions will guide the study. Each participant will be interviewed and recorded using semistructured interview questions via Skype.

Participant 1 _____

Opening Statement: Hello _____, thank you for voluntarily participating in my research study and answering a few questions. Again, thank you for signing/returning the consent form. To remind you, I will be recording the entire interview to help me capture your thoughts. With your permission, may I start the recording? I would like understand more about you and how you teach, especially the ELL population. To begin the interview (ice breakers):

- 1) Can you provide some information about the CTE program you teach? What level are you teaching, what subject, and number of students/type of schedule, etc.?
- 2) What preparation/background did you have for your first teaching job and were you prepared to teach ELLs?

The remaining questions align with the research questions:

RQ 1 - From the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices are used to support ELLs?

<p>Freire critical consciousness theme: The oppressor-oppressed relationship. The relationship is evident in an instructor-</p>	<p>Study construct: Instructional practices of CTE instructors</p>	<p>3) Give me an example of how you teach your students. What style do you teach with (instructor-led, student-centered, etc.)?</p>
---	--	---

led methodology.		
		4) How do you feel about having ELLs in your classes? How might that affect you're teaching practices or the way you relate to them?
Freire critical consciousness theme: The "banking concept of education". This concept is demonstrated in an authentic relationship between teacher and student. Are conversations open and free flowing? What questioning techniques with students are demonstrated?	Study construct: How CTE instruction differs from academic instruction	5) About how much of your instructional time is spent doing straight lecture and how much doing skill assessment and practice?
		6) What questioning techniques do you use with students? Can you give me examples of the questions you use?

RQ 2 - From the perspective of CTE teachers, what instructional practices are perceived to improve successful ELL transition to the workforce?

Freire critical consciousness theme: How the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment. This is demonstrated by how the students succeed in the workplace.	Study construct: How ELLs transition from high school to the workforce.	7) How do you follow up with your students in the workplace to determine if they are using the skills you taught them? 8) How do you feel your instructional practices prepare students for the workforce? Why?
		9) What additional teaching techniques, if any, do you feel are necessary for ELLs to prepare

		<p>them to enter the workforce?</p> <p>10) Can you describe a CTE instructional model that you feel is successful and you would like to follow that model?</p>
<p>If time permits, additional questions that gain insight into instructor's pedagogical model and align with Freire's framework of authentic relationships.</p>		<p>11) Describe your ideal teaching environment that you feel would prepare students for employment. This may include ideal class size, student preparation, tools or equipment, employer involvement, etc.</p> <p>12) How do you influence the learning culture of your school? Are you involved school committees, school activities, etc.?</p>

Possible Interview Follow up Questions:

- Please give me an example of
- Please tell me more about...
- Please describe your process or procedure for...

Final Question:

11) Is there anything else you would like to add?

Concluding Statement to Participant:

Thank you for participating in this interview. I will have your answers transcribed within one month from today (interview date). I would like to keep a future date open to briefly discuss any additional questions or to clarify any answers I may have questions about.

You will also have access to the completed report if you would like. If you have any questions about the process or results, you may reach out to me at XXXXXXXXX. Again, thank you for your time.

Appendix C: Coding Process

The coding analyses identified common concepts that were coded into categories which became themes.

A priori codes:

- The oppressor-oppressed relationship
- The banking concept of education
- How the transformation of the learning environment changes the learning environment from the conceptual framework.

Inductive codes derived from the data:

- Student preparation
- Flexible content delivery
- Different ELL language levels
- Lack of community connections
- Informing ELLs of the expectations of CTE programs

Categories:

- Student-centered vs. instructor-led
- Curriculum
- Community connections

Identified themes:

- Classroom management techniques
- Curriculum changes to support ELL instruction
- Consistent instructional delivery
- Questioning techniques
- Connection with community partners
- Teaching relevant content