# Research Panel: Wage Discrimination at Universities and Professional Schools 

Ken Thornicroft<br>University of Victoria

Follow this and additional works at: https://thekeep.eiu.edu/jcba
Part of the Collective Bargaining Commons, and the Higher Education Commons

## Recommended Citation

Thornicroft, Ken (2018) "Research Panel: Wage Discrimination at Universities and Professional Schools," Journal of Collective Bargaining in the Academy: Vol. 0 , Article 12.
Available at: https://thekeep.eiu.edu/jcba/vol0/iss13/12

# Wage Discrimination in University <br> Professional Schools: Evidence from British Columbia's Business \& Law Faculties 

Kenneth Wm. Thornicroft, LLB/Jd, PhD, Barister \& Solicitor
Professor of Law \& Employment Relations
Presentation to the National Center for the Study of
Collective Bargaining in Higher Education and the Professions
45th Annual Conference: April 15-17, 2018
New York, NY, USA

## The BC Professional School Salary Study

- Six British Columbia universities included in the study: University of British Columbia (UBC - 55,000 students), Simon Fraser University (SFU 30,000 students), University of Victoria (UVic - 31,000 students), University of British Columbia-Okanagan (UBC-O - 9,000 students), University of Northern British Columbia (UNBC - 3,500 students) and Thompson Rivers University (TRU - 8,300 students)
- All six universities have business schools; UBC, UVic and TRU have law schools
- Times Higher Education World Rankings (2017; N = 981 universities): UBC - 36; SFU - 201-250; UVic - 301-350); UBC-O (not ranked); UNBC (not ranked); TRU (not ranked)
- Salary data: B.C.'s "Sunshine Law" - Financial Information Act, ss. 2(3)(a) and Financial Information Regulation, s. 6 - total annual remuneration for university employees (earning above $\$ 75 \mathrm{~K}$ ) must be reported
- Individual employee data obtained from university websites and other internet sources such as Linkedln and Research Gate


## The BC Professional School Salary Study - Variables

- Dependent variables:
i) Salary ("includes any form of salary, wages, bonuses, gratuities, taxable benefits" as per the Financial Information Act); ii) Natural log of Salary Note: Salary data reported in 2016 calendar year (2014-15 fiscal year) most recent data available
- Independent variables (dummy variables):
i) Institution (UBC, SFU, UVic, UBC-O, UNBC and TRU)
ii) Academic Administrator (Dean, Associate Dean, Assistant Dean and Director/Chair)
iii) Academic Rank (Full Professor, Associate Professor, Assistant Professor and Instructor) Note: sessional instructors excluded from the study iv) Business or Law School (Business: $\mathrm{N}=351$; Law: $\mathrm{N}=99$ )
v) Female faculty member ( $35.1 \%$ of the total faculty complement) vi) Member of visible minority ( $21.8 \%$ of the total faculty complement) vii) Interaction term (female x visible minority)
viii) Highest degree (Doctorate, Master and Bachelor)


## Mean Salary: Descriptive Statistics ( $\mathrm{N}=450$ )

|  | Overall | $\begin{gathered} \text { Male } \\ (\mathrm{N}=292) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Female } \\ & (\mathrm{N}=158) \end{aligned}$ | Male/Female Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean Salary | \$162,306 | \$170,720 | \$146,757 | 1.16 |
| Mean Salary Business | $\begin{gathered} \$ 165,045 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=351) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 172,769 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=243) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 147,667 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=108) \end{gathered}$ | 1.17 |
| Mean Salary Law | $\begin{gathered} \$ 152,596 \\ (N=99) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 160,562 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=49) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 144,789 \\ (N=50) \end{gathered}$ | 1.11 |
| Mean Salary Professor | $\begin{gathered} \$ 205,539 \\ (N=138) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 206,029 \\ (N=106) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 203,914 \\ (N=32) \end{gathered}$ | 1.01 |
| Mean Salary Assoc. Professor | $\begin{gathered} \$ 166,975 \\ (N=108) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 175,031 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=66) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 154,315 \\ (N=42) \end{gathered}$ | 1.13 |
| Mean Salary Asst. Professor | $\begin{gathered} \$ 133,669 \\ (N=91) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 134,399 \\ (N=53) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 132,652 \\ (N=38) \end{gathered}$ | 1.01 |
| Mean Salary Instructor | $\begin{gathered} \$ 128,478 \\ (N=113) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 139,967 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=67) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 111,744 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=46) \end{gathered}$ | 1.25 |

## Mean Salary: Descriptive Statistics continued ( $\mathrm{N}=450$ )

|  | Overall | $\begin{gathered} \text { Male } \\ (\mathrm{N}=292) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Female } \\ & (\mathrm{N}=158) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Male/Female } \\ \text { Ratio } \end{gathered}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean Salary UBC | $\begin{gathered} \$ 193,154 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=195) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 207,372 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=126) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 167,190 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=69) \end{gathered}$ | 1.24 |
| Mean Salary SFU | $\begin{gathered} \$ 149,040 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=92) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 152,578 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=63) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 141,356 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=29) \end{gathered}$ | 1.08 |
| Mean Salary UVic | $\begin{gathered} \$ 139,083 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=78) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 145,075 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=43) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 131,712 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=35) \end{gathered}$ | 1.10 |
| Mean Salary -UBC-O | $\begin{gathered} \$ 147,566 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=16) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 152,940 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=10) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 138,611 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=6) \end{gathered}$ | 1.10 |
| Mean Salary UNBC | $\begin{gathered} \$ 132,656 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=11) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 138,562 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=8) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 116,906 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=3) \end{gathered}$ | 1.19 |
| Mean Salary TRU" | $\begin{gathered} \$ 120,560 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=58) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 124,595 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=42) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 109,969 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=16) \end{gathered}$ | 1.13 |

## Mean Salary: Descriptive Statistics continued

|  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Overall } \\ & (\mathrm{N}=98) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Male } \\ (\mathrm{N}=62) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Female } \\ & (\mathrm{N}=36) \end{aligned}$ | Male/ Female Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Member of a Visible Minority | \$158,226 | \$166,650 | \$143,716 | 1.16 |
| Visible Minority Professor | $\begin{gathered} \$ 200,845 \\ (N=18) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 196,763 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=12) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 209,009 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=6) \end{gathered}$ | 0.94 |
| Visible Minority Associate Professor | $\begin{gathered} \$ 163,674 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=33) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 178,500 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=21) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 137,727 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=12) \end{gathered}$ | 1.30 |
| Visible Minority Asst. Professor | $\begin{gathered} \$ 135,798 \\ (N=28) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 137,154 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=15) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 134,234 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=13) \end{gathered}$ | 1.02 |
| Visible Minority Instructor | $\begin{gathered} \$ 141,137 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=19) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 154,667 \\ (N=14) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 104,393 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=5) \end{gathered}$ | 1.48 |
| Visible Minority Business School | $\begin{gathered} \$ 162,149 \\ (N=87) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 167,910 \\ (N=58) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 150,626 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=29) \end{gathered}$ | 1.11 |
| Visible Minority - <br> Law Schoo | $\begin{gathered} \$ 127,194 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=11) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 148,378 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=4) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \$ 115,090 \\ (\mathrm{~N}=7) \end{gathered}$ | 1.29 |

## OLS Regression Results ( $\mathrm{N}=450$ )

Independent
Variable

Dependent
Variable =

## Salary (p-value)

Dependent Variable
= InSalary (p-value)

64,855.71 (0.00000)
0.38075 (0.00000)

Institution - UBC 8,247.61 (0.30661) 0.09959 (0.02474)

Institution - SFU
Institution - UVic
Institution - UBC-Okanagan
Institution - UNBC
Admin - Dean
Admin - Associate Dean
Admin - Assistant Dean
Rank - Full Professor
Rank - Assoc. Professor
43,525.02 (0.00000)
Rank
0.29375 (0.00000)
0.07944 (0.07061)
0.11277 (0.11143)
0.09185 (0.26136)
0.31833 (0.00001)
0.24830 (0.00003)
0.05259 (0.52254)
0.45303 (0.00000)
0.14767 (0.00204)

## OLS Regression Results continued ( $\mathrm{N}=450$ )

| Independent <br> Variable | Dependent <br> Variable = Salary <br> (p-value) | Dependent <br> Variable = InSalary <br> (p-value) |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Business School | $\mathbf{2 6 , 2 5 3 . 2 0} \mathbf{( 0 . 0 0 0 0 9 )}$ | $\mathbf{0 . 1 3 0 4 7}(\mathbf{0 . 0 0 0 3 7 )}$ |
| Female Faculty Member | $\mathbf{- 1 0 , 4 2 6 . 0 7 ( 0 . 0 4 6 7 7 )}$ | $\mathbf{- 0 . 0 6 4 4 1}(\mathbf{0 . 0 2 5 2 2 )}$ |
| Professor - Visible Minority | $2,538.22(0.69755)$ | $0.01704(0.63438)$ |
| Female x Visible Minority | $-8,757.44(0.41242)$ | $-0.05792(0.32313)$ |
| Highest Degree - Doctorate | $5,464.55(0.60966)$ | $0.07917(0.17788)$ |
| Highest Degree - Masters | $-969.49(0.91426)$ | $0.05465(0.26963)$ |
| R$^{2} /$ Adjusted R2 | $0.52744 / 0.50885$ | $0.55003 / 0.53232$ |
| F value | $28.36330(0.00000)$ | $31.06271(0.00000)$ |
| Re |  |  |

Reference categories: TRU (Institution); Chair/Director (Administrative position); Instructor (Rank); Law School (versus Business School); Bachelor Degree (Highest Degree)

## Wage Discrimination in B.C. University Business \& Law Schools: Conclusion \& Discussion Points

- According to Statistics Canada, in 2017, 40.2\% of all full-time academic teaching staff were women; in this study, $35.1 \%$ of the faculty members were women
- In this study, and across all of the universities, faculties, administrative positions and ranks included in the study, the mean male/female wage gap is approximately $16 \%$
- There is a comparatively modest male/female mean salary differential when comparing full professors and assistant professors (about $1 \%$ in favour of male faculty members)
- The female wage gap falls to approximately $6.5 \%$ when there are controls for university, faculty, administrative position, rank, race and degree (the gap is approximately $7.7 \%$ in an equation that excludes controls for race and degree)

Wage Discrimination in B.C. University Business \& Law Schools: Conclusion \& Discussion Points continued

- The largest mean salary gap - $24 \%$ - was at UBC. What might account for this comparatively larger gap?
- When an interaction term (Female x UBC) was included in the equation, this variable indicated a significant 14\% adverse gender effect and the "Female" variable, although still negative (albeit very small $-2 / 10$ ths of $1 \%$ ), was no longer significant.
- The results of this study are largely consistent with those reported in the AUUP 2016-17 salary study, "Visualizing Change" (overall, a $6 \%$ to $9 \%$ male salary wage gap depending on rank)
- The results suggest that there is no discrimination by race https://thekeep.eiu.edu/jcba/volo/iss13/12


## Wage Discrimination in B.C. University Business \&

## Law Schools: Conclusion \& Discussion Points continued

- However, although not statistically significant ( $p=.32$; Quaere: Is that even relevant when reporting population data?), the coefficient for the "Female x Visible Minority" interaction variable is negative and suggests there is a 6\% wage gap for visible minority women ( $\mathrm{N}=36$ ); Note also the mean salary differences as between minority men and women at the associate professor/instructor ranks (30\% and $48 \%$ gaps, respectively) and for mean business and law faculty salaries (12\% and 29\%, respectively)
- Business school faculty salaries are approximately $13 \%$ higher than law school salaries (women constituted slightly more than 50\% of all law school faculty members but only $30.8 \%$ of business school faculty members)
- There is an $11 \%$ mean salary gap as between male and female law faculty members and a 17\% mean salary gap as between male and fermale biusiness school faculty members

