A COMPREHENSIVE REVIEW OF DEFINITIONS OF ADULT EDUCATION

DISSERTATION

Presented to the Graduate Council of the

University of North Texas in Partial

Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

By

Margaret M. Anderson, B.S., M.Ed., M.A.

Denton, Texas

August 1992

Anderson, Margaret M., A Comprehensive Review of
Definitions of Adult Education. Doctor of Philosophy,
(Adult and Continuing Education) Aug., 1992, 174 pp. 2
tables, references, 202 titles.

This study identified definitions of adult education
appearing in three major adult education journals (Journal
of Adult Education, Adult Education Journal, Adult
Education) and three handbooks of adult education (1948,
1960, and 1970) over a period of 40 years, 1939 to 1979, and
concluded there is no one universally accepted definition of
adult education.

More than 12,700 pages were read and scanned.
Definitions were categorized according to a modified
Scheffler classification which included five categories:
negative, nebulous or broad, stipulative, descriptive, and
programmatic. A total of 283 different definitions were
identified. Based on these data, more definitions appeared
in handbooks than in journals, or one definition for every
22 pages in handbooks and one definition for every 55 pages
in journal readings. More definitions were found in the
stipulative category than in any other category. Writers
tended to use the term adult education to fit their own
needs in specific situations.

This study should be reassuring to persons who are

confused as to what adult education is because it points out the fact that authorities in the field have failed to arrive at one acceptable definition. The study challenges all people working in adult education to band together and make a decided effort to answer the question "Can one universally accepted definition of adult education be formulated or are varying definitions necessary?"

A categorization of definitions is provided in tabular form. In addition, two appendices are included. One appendix provides a list of authors and definitions and a listing of where each definition was found in the journals or handbooks. The second appendix provides a chronological list of all journals and handbooks, dates, authors of definitions, and titles of articles in which definitions were found.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Adult educators have long been aware of the fact that there is no universally accepted definition of adult education. Some argue that this is due to the fact that the status of adult education as a profession is subject to debate (Griffith, 1980).

Historically, many educators have felt education and learning should be focused on children. William James, as quoted by Bryson (1936) stated that during the 19th century many psychologists believed men learned very little after attaining physical maturity. In fact, James claimed few men got new ideas after the age of 25 years.

There are those who maintain that it is not necessary to understand the field of adult education or to set limits by explaining what adult education is and is not. These individuals believe that description and provision of structure to the field will also narrow the field and make it more specialized. These advocates claim that the field is so young, one cannot know what should be included in it or excluded from it (Apps, 1979).

Cartwright (1936) stated that one of the wisest decisions reached by the founders of the American Association for Adult Education (AAAE) in 1926 was "to

permit American adult education to define itself" (p. 84), thereby leaving the association unfettered by an inclusive or exclusive definition of adult education. Many people feel that if a definition of adult education had been adopted at that time, the association and the field would not have been able to maintain the pace needed for the rapid advancement of adult education throughout the country. Although multiple definitions have developed since that time, a number of persons in the field are in agreement as to the ambiguity of a definition of adult education.

Kaplan (1953) in an article appearing in Adult Education pointed out the fact that "there are sharp differences of opinion and interpretation as to the definition and scope of adult education" (p. 177). According to Verner (1964), "adult education is difficult to describe and almost impossible to define" (p. 1) because of the many institutions and agencies sponsoring different forms of adult education. In such a complex situation, Verner believed a specific definition tends to be either too inclusive or too exclusive.

In a similar manner, Peers (1958) noted that the Adult Education Association of the USA (AEA) made no attempt to circumscribe the term adult education. Instead, the AEA sought to bring about coordination and integration in the adult education movement and to release energy in the field, rather than to control it.

Grattan (1959) described the growth of adult education in the United States as beginning as early as the 1700s, when Cotton Mather's book, <u>Essays To Do Good</u>, was published. Grattan describes Mather's work as probably the first work concerned with adult education to be published in America. However, the term adult education was not actually in use in the United States until June 1924. That year, the first American conference on adult education was convened by the Carnegie Corporation of New York. Rumors had been coming from England about activities for the education of adults and this conference was assembled to see if there was enough interest in such activities to form a central organization whose purpose would be to draw various agencies together to help correlate and strengthen their efforts. Deliberations and decisions of the conference resulted in extensive studies of American activity in adult education (Ely, 1936).

Although many writers have felt, over the years, that adult education is difficult if not impossible to define, some writers have attempted to define the term. Blakely (1958) stated that a pivotal point of the formal adult education movement in the United States was the birth of the Adult Education Association. He described adult education as the "test" of all other levels (elementary, secondary and higher education), "the test of whether the process of growth has really begun" (p. 13). Another viewpoint presented by Blakely is that adult education is the

preparation for the responsible exercise of authority, which implies it is the means for successful self-government.

Some researchers have attempted curtail the nebulous nature of adult education; thus, many varying definitions of adult education can be found in books regarding the subject. Verner (1964) believed that different forms of adult education were developed to meet specific needs at given times and under certain conditions. As perceptions of needs change, so too, do the forms of adult education. This can be illustrated by noting that the lyceum of the 19th century and the chautauqua of the early 20th century all but vanished, while today the expansion of night schools and the concept of continuing education have become popular (Hart, 1927; Verner, 1964).

Verner (1964) stated that, "adult education is both a means and an end in itself" (p. 2). For example, when an agency sets out to achieve a specific learning objective deemed essential to the successful accomplishment of the agency's purposes, adult education is seen as a means. Activities such as in-service education fall under the means category. When adult education is provided under the auspices of recognized educational institutions, it is then seen as an example of adult education as an end in itself. However, others have disagreed with this position. For example, Abraham Flexner (1932) believed there was a vast

distinction between education and training, He stated:
"Training is means; education is end" (pp. 442-443).

Elias and Merriam (1980) relied on research done by
British analytic philosophers (Peters, Paterson and Lawson)
to define adult education. First, one must analyze the
concepts of two terms: adult and adult education. To most
persons, being an adult is a normative concept based on both
chronological age and status in society. The second
concept, adult education, involves the following
requirements: (a) something valuable and worthwhile is
transmitted, (b) people must care about what is learned, (c)
there must be an awareness about what is learned, (d) what
is learned must be is a voluntary process, (e) a cognitive
element must be present, (f) that which is learned is
cognitively associated with other areas of learning, and
lastly (g) what is learned must be usable. According to
Elias and Merriam, the term adult education has a broader
usage in this country than in other countries. They
stressed that to differentiate between adult education and
the education of adults only brings out a sense of elitism
and rational bias in the adult education field.

Gnagey (1964), in an article in Adult Education,
explained that "education is a continuing process from
cradle to grave" (p. 9) but that for many, "adult education
has long been regarded as a way to provide learning for

people who did not complete their schooling" (p. 9). Gnagey
declared that,

> modern adult education should now recognize that
> practically all persons above 25 years of age need
> continuing learning experiences in general education,
> including the humanities, arts and sciences, rather
> than just belated schooling to patch the gaps in their
> earlier training. (p. 9)

The literature reflects diverse opinions by various
writers and adult education agencies regarding the
definition of adult education. Some persons limit adult
education to specific kinds of learning activities for
adults while others believe the term should encompass many
learning activities for adults.

In a working paper on direction finding, the AEA
Consultative Committee even questioned whether adult
education is really a field ("An Overview and History of the
Field," 1957). "Until 1924 the term adult education was
practically unknown in this country. Agencies engaged in
educating adults were so unrelated they did not even have a
common name for what they were doing" (p. 219). After
discussing the nature and various forms of adult education,
the committee continued: "The heterogeneous and amorphous
nature of the activities just described as constituting the
'field' of adult education suggests the question: Is there
really a field?" (p. 224). Because elements of commonality,
producing to an extent a degree of cohesion, identification,
and preciseness of definition are associated with the
concept of "field," the question is raised, does adult

education contain these elements? The committee believed
that studies have proven that some elements are present (p.
224). Kaplan (1958) also questioned whether adult education
should be regarded as a discipline in itself. Houle and
Buskey (1966) believed that even though a body of theory is
being built for adult education, it cannot yet be called a
science and noted that it is still "guided merely by a dim
instinct as well as puzzled curiosity" (p. 131).

The Problem

Because educators seem unable to determine a single
acceptable definition of adult education, it seemed
worthwhile to search major adult education journals and
handbooks of adult education over a period of 40 years to
examine how adult education has been defined.

Purpose

The purpose of this study was to determine the varying
definitions of adult education found in major adult
education journals and handbooks of adult education
published over a period of 40 years, from 1939 through 1979.
No attempt is made to define adult education. After a
thorough review of journals and handbooks from 1939 through
1979, definitions of adult education were catalogued.

Research Questions

This dissertation represents an effort to answer questions rather than test hypotheses. Griffith (1966) in presenting guidelines for writers, stated:

> A prevalent misconception is that hypotheses should be stated in all research. In fact, a series of questions is more appropriate than a series of hypotheses when the investigator is dealing with normative or census-type data. Hypotheses, strictly speaking, are appropriate only when a theory is to be tested. (p. 88)

Answers to the following questions, applicable to major adult education journals and handbooks of adult education, were sought in this study:

1. How prevalent (how frequent) are definitions of adult education?

2. How extensive (scope, range) are the definitions?

3. Is any one specific definition accepted by a majority of writers?

4. Can the definitions be organized or classified into specific categories?

5. How have definitions of adult education changed over the period of time studied?

Significance

As Best (1977) pointed out, "man uses history to understand the past, and to try to understand the present in light of past events and developments" (p. 340). Historical

research of adult education definitions found in major adult education journals and handbooks is useful in a number of ways:

1. Historical research in this area assists in the development of an understanding of why things are as they are and helps in ascertaining the current issues and problems in adult education (Merriam and Simpson, 1984; Wiersma, 1980).

2. It helps provide an understanding of why no one definition for adult education has been unanimously accepted by workers in the adult education field.

3. Once the issue of why there is no widely accepted definition of adult education is understood, a better chance of dealing with the issue more effectively exists.

4. This research project provides a perspective for interpreting a part of the contemporary educational context. This information is useful in mapping or designing courses of action to deal with specific problems in the field and in developing education policies and processes (Cook, 1965; Wiersma, 1980).

5. The cataloging and studying of various definitions of adult education found in journals and handbooks makes it possible to determine guidelines for future practice in adult education and it helps in the prediction of future trends (Wiersma, 1980). However, it should be remembered that prediction, per se, is not a goal of historical

research (Merriam and Simpson, 1984). Since 1926, when AAAE was founded, the field of adult education has expanded and changed. How adult education will continue to change and what needs should it try to meet in the future are important questions which call for careful consideration (Cook, 1965; Wiersma, 1980).

6. The old adage that those who are unfamiliar with mistakes of history are doomed to repeat them may be avoided if workers in the field are aware of what has already been done and of what has worked in the past (Cook, 1965; Wiersma, 1980).

Differences in definitions appearing in journals and handbooks during the time period covered are easily noted. The critical appraisal of definitions from the literature has the potential to initiate new research which may, eventually, result in a comprehensive definition of adult education or lead to a universal realization that adult education should not have one definition. Griffith (1966) pointed out that an important aspect when doing research is "knowing what has not produced the desired results" (p. 90). Insights gained from undesired results often become of great importance. This study may also benefit the field of adult education as workers in this area attempt to substantiate its existence and its contributions.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

Literature in the adult education field reflects the
difficulty encountered over the years by authorities and
experts to arrive at a definition of adult education that is
acceptable to all. Liberal adult education workers do not
see education in the same light as do educators in the
progressive adult education field.

According to Elias and Merriam (1980), the Adult
Education Association (AEA), known as the American
Association for Adult Education (AAAE) from 1926 to 1951,
originally reflected a preference for adult liberal
education. Later they broadened its base to include a
variety of educational activities that are in line with the
goals of progressive adult education.

Peers (1958) noted multiple factors have influenced
the character and development of adult education in this
country. As a result, a variety and an unevenness of types
of adult education are seen in the United States.

Two examples of the unevenness and variety of
definitions of adult education can be seen in the following
discussion of Bryson's (1936) and Bergevin, Morris and
Smith's (1963) notions about adult education. Bryson (1936)
stated that "Lifelong learning is an ancient ideal in the

11

history of civilization, but adult education as an organized

social movement is comparatively new in American life" (p.

3). He claimed that adult education can be defined "as

including all the activities with an educational purpose

that are carried on by people engaged in the ordinary

business of life" (p. 3). He stated that age alone is not

an adequate criterion. For example, a 30-year old man may

pursue a doctorate degree. Although an adult in age, he is

only continuing in a school system and, therefore, is not in

a real sense a seeker of adult education. Thus, Bryson

limited his definition to strictly voluntary participation.

Bergevin, Morris and Smith (1963), in the glossary of

Adult Education Procedures, provides the following four

definitions for adult education:

> The process through which adults have and use
> opportunities to learn systematically under the
> guidance of an agency, teacher, or leader; experiences
> in day to day living which cause adult behavioral
> change; the study of the professional field of adult
> education.
> In a free society a kind of education which
> promotes a mature rationality in our adult lives and
> institutions. (p. 240)

Definitions

As Elias and Merriam (1980) pointed out, definitions

related to adult education are critical philosophical issues

which may be difficult to resolve. They believed that the

definition of adult education was a major philosophical

issue.

Problems are inherent when working with such a term as definition. Ambiguity and vagueness may make a concept such as definition difficult to understand. Ambiguity refers to the fact that a word or statement may be interpreted in more than one way. For example, the word, trunk may mean a storage container or a part of an elephant; or a statement such as "his teaching is terrible" may refer to method or content. Both words and concepts can also be vague, or refer to qualities that things have in different degrees, such as large, how large, or adulthood, by what criteria? Analysts have attempted to remove ambiguity and make vague statements more precise. They have recognized for a long time that the concept, definition, needs clarification (Elias and Merriam, 1980).

In his book, The Language of Education, Scheffler (1960) first noted that there are two kinds of definitions: scientific and general. He explained that general definitions are most often used in education, and discussed the following three meanings for the term, general definition:

1. A definition may be stipulative; that is, the writer may give a meaning to a term according to the way it will be used. Often a stipulative definition is different from the common usage or is an attempt at choosing one out of numerous possible meanings. According to Scheffler (1960), stipulative definitions "can neither be fairly

justified nor rejected by consideration of the accuracy with which they mirror predefinitional usage . . . stipulative definitions may be said to be matters of arbitrary choice" (p. 15).

2. A definition may be descriptive if it proposes to describe what is being defined, and is usually the definition in common usage. Usually, an explanatory rule or description of a term's prior functioning is given. Descriptive definitions mirror predefinitional usage which helps bring about understanding of a defined term's meaning. As Scheffler pointed out, "descriptive definitions are not simply abbreviatory devices adopted for convenience and theoretically eliminable. They purport not to economize utterance, but to provide explanatory accounts of meaning" (p. 16). According to Scheffler descriptive definitions are used (a) to help in applying the term with proficiency, (b) to acquaint someone with the reference of the defined term, and (c) to "distill the guiding principle of such application and to show its interconnection with others" (p. 17). "The demands of accuracy allow considerable leeway to descriptive definition" (p. 18). Only descriptive definitions can be criticized for failure to agree with predefinitional forms of usage.

3. A third type of definition is the programmatic definition. Like stipulative and descriptive definitions, classifications of programmatic definitions are not based on

linguistic form only--context in which the term is used must
be considered. Whether a definition is programmatic is
dependent on the term's practical purport on a particular
occasion. A definition may be programmatic in some specific
situations and not in others. As Scheffler (1960) pointed
out, programmatic definitions are often used in stating
serious moral choices and tell implicitly what should be
done rather than what is done. For example, "Education is
the process for developing critical abilities in
individuals" (Elias and Merriam, 1980, pp. 186-187).

Scheffler (1960) summed up a comparison of the three
kinds of definitions by identifying the underlying interest
for each:

> The interest of stipulative definitions is
> communicatory, that is to say, they are offered in the
> hope of facilitating discourse; the interest of
> descriptive definitions is explanatory, that is, they
> purport to clarify the normal application of terms; the
> interest of programmatic definitions is moral, that is,
> they are intended to embody programs of action. (p. 22)

No overlapping is found between stipulative and descriptive
definitions. As stated earlier, descriptive definitions
describe predefinition usage whereas stipulative definitions
do not. Sometimes, definitions may be judged as
programmatic and stipulative at the same time. More often,
however, definitions are identified as simultaneously
descriptive and programmatic (Scheffler, 1960). Elias and
Merriam (1980) concurred that most definitions in education,
because it is a value-laden concept include both descriptive

and programmatic elements. Scheffler (1960) cautioned, however: "that alternative accurate definitions are possible, and that it must therefore not be supposed that to each term there corresponds one and only one correct definition" (p. 28).

Wise, Nordberg and Reitz (1967) maintained that the term definition implies that the explanation (or definition) is clearer than the thing or word being defined. Certain characteristics must be present: a word or thing should not be defined in terms of itself; it should not be stated in a negative sense; it should be equal in scope to the thing defined, that is, it should include only that which is necessary but it should be complete as well.

In this research, only definitions referring specifically to adult education are documented. Many writers use the terms, adult education and continuing education, synonymously. However, Schroeder (1970) pointed out that some people claim there are definite distinctions between the two. He stated that, at the philosophical level, many refer to continuing education as the ideal while adult education identifies a deliberate means (similar to elementary, secondary, and higher education).

If the term adult education was cited along with the term continuing education the definition was noted. However, the term continuing education without the author's

notation that adult education and continuing education were considered synonymous were not included.

Another problem with defining adult education arises because of the way adult education is perceived. Some see it as a body of knowledge or field of study while others think of adult education as a field of educational practice (Smith, Akin & Kidd, 1970). Both types of definitions are included in this study.

If the noun <u>definition</u> or the verbs <u>is</u>, <u>describes</u> or <u>defines</u>, were used or implied, the statement was considered a definition and was accepted for cataloging. It should be noted that many writers who do not define adult education per se go into great detail discussing purposes, characteristics, criteria and goals of adult education (Ely, 1936; Smith, Akin & Kidd, 1970).

Delimitations

Based on searches for adult education journals at university and public libraries, citations found in adult education books and journal articles, and conversations with authorities in the adult education field, the following adult education journals published in the United States were chosen as major journals in the field of adult education: the <u>Journal of Adult Education</u> from 1929 to 1941, the <u>Adult Education Journal</u> from 1942 to 1950, <u>Adult Education</u> from 1950 to 1983, the <u>Adult Education Bulletin</u> from 1936 to

1950, Adult Leadership from 1952 to 1977, and Lifelong Learning from 1977 to 1989.

Because of the volume of data gathered, the review of journals was limited to the major research journals in adult education. These journals appeared under three names during the time period covered. The Journal of Adult Education which was phased out in 1941, was replaced by the Adult Education Journal. In 1950 the Adult Education Bulletin and the Adult Education Journal were merged to form Adult Education. It should be noted that in the winter of 1983, the Adult Education Quarterly became the major research journal in adult education. These journals have served for many years as the official organ of the major professional organization of adult education, originally the American Association for Adult Education, but later designated the American Association for Adult and Continuing Education.

As noted in Volume 1 of Adult Education, the Adult Education Association of the United States of America was established at Columbus, Ohio, with the dissolution of the American Association of Adult Education (originally established in 1926) and the Department of Adult Education of the National Education Association (first established in 1921). At that time, 1951, Adult Education was designated the official organ of the Adult Education Association (AEA). (News From the AEA, 1951).

A span of 40 years of publications was chosen in order to provide a broad perspective of the various kinds of definitions used. Because the first 10 years of the Journal of Adult Education were by-passed and the study began with the year 1939, 1979 was the line of demarcation for researching journals. Decisions regarding the period included in this study were based on findings made by scanning earlier and later years which revealed that:

1. During the first 10 years of the publication of Journal of Adult Education, the field was still in the process of finding and establishing its identity, change was rapidly occurring, and writers dealt mainly with goals, purposes, and characteristics of adult education rather than definitions of adult education.

2. During the years from 1980 to 1990, many of the definitions, ideas and thoughts were reiterated and writers continued to struggle with earlier definitions of adult education, tried to evaluate them, and, in some cases, attempted to expand and refine them.

Although Adult Leadership, Lifelong Learning and Adult Education Bulletin are journals in adult education and contain definitions of adult education, they are not presented because of the large amount of data collected from the research journals and handbooks.

Five handbooks of adult education were published, in 1934, 1936, 1948, 1960, and 1970. These handbooks trace the

evolution of adult education during the first half century of its existence and are considered valid sources of data for answering the question: "How was the field of adult education defined in its successive stages of development by contributors . . . ?" (Knowles & DuBois, 1970, p. xviii).

Only the 1948, 1960, and 1970 handbooks were researched for definitions of adult education, because a perusal of the table of contents and a scanning of writings of earlier editions (1934 and 1936) did not reveal articles which were considered pertinent.

CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH DESIGN

Historical research was chosen as the method and design for this project. In the field of education, historical research has helped man to understand the how and the why of educational happenings and has helped evaluate educational contributions to determine if they were long-lasting or merely current fads (Best, 1977; Wise, Nordberg, & Reitz, 1967). With this method (historical research) the number of definitions of adult education used in articles over the years was determined and the variety of definitions which appeared was noted.

Borg (1963) described historical research as one of the most difficult types of educational research to do well. He pointed out, however, that this type of research is very important and necessary because it provides insight into educational problems that cannot otherwise be gained. Cook (1965) and Best (1977) agreed, noting that the conduct of historical research is inherently difficult and time consuming. One difficulty in historical research noted by Best is in delimiting the problem so that a satisfactory and penetrating analysis can be made. Historical research consists of steps essentially the same as those found in other types of research: defining the problem, collecting

data, and synthesizing and evaluating the data collected
(Borg, 1963; Wiersma, 1980).

Data Collection and Organization

Each issue of the adult education research journals
and the three handbooks of adult education listed was
carefully read and scrutinized to identify definitions of
adult education. The plan for presenting the findings was
determined by the data found and how they could best be
organized and presented. Data are reported in the following
way:

1. Definitions are presented in narrative form in the
dissertation. Concise definitions are quoted and
definitions not succinctly stated are discussed briefly.
Definitions by the same author sometimes appeared more than
once, and some changed over the years; however, each
definition was noted. Minor changes in definition by the
same author (e.g. addition or deletion of a, an, the, or
changes from singular to plural) were not considered
significant unless they appeared to change the meaning of
the term adult education.

2. Definitions are presented in chronological order
as they appeared in the journals and handbooks.

3. The chronologically ordered definitions of adult
education are classified using a modification of Scheffler's
classification of definitions. There are a number of ways
in which definitions of adult education can be classified or

categorized. Schroeder (1970) in his article, mentions one way. His categorization scheme is rather complex and includes many subsets. There are three major categories: classification, structure analysis, and operation analysis. Knowles (1955) presents another way. He says: "'Adult education' is used in three ways: to describe a process, an activity, and a movement" (p. 67). Knowles maintains the most common usage is that activity of people learning together in groups. However, it can be a process where individuals learn from daily experiences. Movement is described as combining all activities and processes to give a third meaning to the term adult education. The three ways include a variety of ways mature individuals learn and make their lives richer. However, in this study, definitions will be classified according to a modified Scheffler classification.

Scheffler's classification was expanded to include (a) negative, (b) amorphous, (c) stipulative, (d) descriptive, and (e) programmatic definitions. Although Wise, Nordberg and Reitz (1967) suggested that the term definition should not be stated in a negative sense, several authors were quite specific in defining what adult education is not. For this reason a negative category was deemed relevant. Amorphous and very broad definitions include comments which indicate that adult education cannot be defined (for various reasons) or which provide a definition so broad as to not be

very meaningful (difficult to understand or visualize).

Stipulative definitions include those considered specialized

such as health care adult education and labor (or workers)

adult education. Descriptive definitions are those which

describe what is being defined and usually are the

definitions in common usage. Programmatic definitions

include those that state serious moral choices and which

tell what should be done rather than what is being done

(Scheffler, 1960).

4. An alphabetical list of the authors of definitions

of adult education is provided in Appendix A. Each listing

is followed by the name, date, and page numbers of the

journal or handbook where each definition was found.

Chronological lists of the journals and handbooks and

the dates, volume numbers, and pages where the definitions

are found are provided in Appendix B. With each journal or

handbook is listed the author of the definitions and the

name of the article in which the definitions appeared.

The cataloging of the findings in one place allows

adult educators and those interested in adult education to

see both the quantity and the variety of adult education

definitions which have appeared in journal and handbook

articles over a period of 40 years. By examining specific

references, individuals can see how the definitions have

varied. This information should also facilitate future

researchers' efforts to determine why definitions have been

so varied, whether the definitions reflect changes occurring to meet the purposes of adult educators and the needs of the participants, and the possibility or feasibility of adopting just one definition of adult education.

CHAPTER 4

FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS OF DATA

In the major research journals--comprised of the
Journal of Adult Education, the Adult Education Journal, and
Adult Education from the years 1939 to 1979--more than
11,000 pages were scanned for definitions of adult education
and more than 122 references to adult education were noted.
A few of the references noted indicate the direction in
which adult education is going rather than defining adult
education.

Three Handbooks of Adult Education published in the
United States during the period from 1939 to 1979 were
included: one in 1948, one in 1960, and one in 1970. A
total of 39 references that were considered relevant to the
definition of adult education was found in the more than
1,773 pages of the three handbooks.

Journal Findings

Journal of Adult Education

The Journal of Adult Education was the first major
adult education journal in the United States. Its first
volume was published in February 1929, and its last issue
was published in October 1941.

In the journal's first 10 years of existence, the editors and authors were mainly concerned with establishing an identity--answering questions such as: What is considered adult education? What institutions and agencies provide adult education? and What are various geographic areas doing in the field of adult education?

By 1939, persons working in the field of adult education began to have vague ideas of what constituted adult education, and articles in the journal began to reflect some of their feelings and ideas. For this reason, the first 10 years of the Journal of Adult Education were omitted from this study. Scanning issues of the Journal of Adult Education beginning with the year 1939 was more productive as far as finding definitions of adult education. An additional 1,500 pages were scanned from the years 1939 through 1941, and 13 references were noted.

Volume 11, in 1939, had four allusions to or definitions of adult education. The fillers used to complete the last pages of articles sometimes consisted of definitions of adult education. It was in one of these fillers that Adam stated:

> Adult education is something more than an intellectual opiate for the governed masses. It represents a definite method of social control, an essential framework for political democracy. (p. 71)

In a column entitled "The Clearing House" (1939), a discussion of the library's function in adult education

reveals that many were still in doubt as to what exactly

that function was:

> This slump was due . . . in part to a feeling among
> many libraries that what was being said about adult
> education, both orally and in print, was too "nebulous"
> to be easily interpreted in terms of everyday library
> work. Now the needed clarification is being given
> through many reports of experiments and achievements in
> adult education service, especially in small and
> medium-sized libraries. (p. 96)

In another filler at the end of an article in Volume 11

of the journal Robbins (1939) stated:

> The content of adult education may range from reading
> and writing to the deepest problems of science and
> philosophy. It may be as practical as learning how to
> raise chickens or as theoretical as pure mathematics.
> It may demand manual skill as does typing or it may
> call for intellectual development as does a course in
> calculus. Alphabetically it may range from A for
> agriculture to Z for zoology. Whatever adults learn is
> the content of adult education. (p. 139)

Mauer (cited in "Minorities and Democracy," 1939)is

quoted in a discussion on minorities and democracy in Volume

11 as to how to differentiate between adult education and

workers' education:

> The basic purpose of workers' education is the role of
> an intelligent guide to a new social order. It is
> distinctly not to be confused with numerous existing
> forms of adult education. They are designed for the
> most part either to give a bit of culture to the
> student or else to lift him out of his present job into
> a higher one. Workers' education will stimulate the
> student to serve the labor movement in particular and
> society in general. It is not education to be used for
> personal advancement. (p. 305)

In an article entitled "What is Adult Education?"

Thomas (1939) explained that:

> adult education means more than schooling . . . adult
> education is as different from ordinary schooling as

> adult life, with its individual and social
> responsibilities, is different from the protected life
> of the child . . . . Adult education . . . makes
> special allowance for individual contributions from the
> students, and seeks to organize these contributions
> into some form of social purpose (pp. 365-366).

Thomas claimed that there is a type of adult education that
"makes room for individuality but is lacking in social
purpose" (p. 367) and discussed the "type of adult education
that stresses individuality and social purpose together . .
. . This is adult education in its highest or normal form"
(p. 367). Thomas' conclusion was that, "we may say that
normal adult education and genuine democracy are identical"
(p. 368).

Volume 12 revealed six definitions of adult education.
Although Boyle (1940) wrote of adult education in Nova
Scotia, he began his article with a statement voiced by many
American adult educators: "Adult education is an abstract
term, and as such it has become so extraordinarily elastic
as to be meaningless" (p. 158).

In discussing democracy and self-reliance, which must
go along with it, Wriston (1940) used his own version of
adult education when he qualified it by stating: "In
dealing with adult education, I shall exclude training for
the activities by which an adult seeks to improve his
vocational efficiency, though I would not even by inference,
appear to deprecate such activity" (p. 238). A filler at
the end of Wriston's article included the following relevant
observation by Overstreet (1940):

Whatever direction adult education is to take in America, this would seem to be primary, that it is not to be chiefly education in the sense of adding new knowledge; it is rather to be education in the sense of enabling the individual to gain a point of view, to achieve a philosophy, and to use the materials of life for the effective expression of such wisdom as he may acquire. (p. 243)

In discussing the problems faced by the American Association of Adult Education, Cartwright (1940) suggested that:

Pressure was brought upon the young organization to define adult education, both inclusively and exclusively. Those who pressed for a definition were insistent enough to raise the question to the status of a public issue. . . . The Association withstood the temptation to define and thus summarily to end the issue. It continued to assert that adult education was so broad a field as to defeat any attempt to say specifically what it did or should include, much less to say what it did or should exclude. (p. 264)

Cartwright added that "a successful attempt was made to preserve a delicate balance between the many and different forms which adult education assumed" (p. 264). Members of the association would not commit themselves on the issue of courses given for credit versus non-credit bearing courses, but suggested that both types had places of usefulness in the field.

McAfee (1940) made the following interesting observation: "There is a sense in which all education is adult education. It is all directed toward the production of genuine adults" (p. 350). In comments about specialized programs in adult education Wile (cited in "Specialized Programs of Adult Education," 1940) stated: "Adult

education . . . is an instrument for public health" (p.
522).

Volume 13 was the last volume published as the Journal
of Adult Education. Only two references to adult education
were noted in this volume. Otis (1941) described how adults
should be able to choose and enjoy subject areas and stated:
"Adult education is widely inclusive and prides itself upon
that fact. Its subject matter is diversity itself" (p. 53).

In discussing the privilege of leadership Overstreet
(1941) explained that,

> Adult education represents a many-sided effort to
> create situations in which the twentieth-century
> American can prove himself an independent and
> courageous freeman worthy to raise issues that concern
> the everyday welfare and happiness of himself; his
> neighbors; his countrymen; and, beyond these, the
> living millions of the world. (p. 250)

Overstreet described adult education as "a movement that
cuts across the rigid lines of modern specialization" (p.
251).

In issue Number 3 of Volume 13 a note indicated that
the Journal of Adult Education was ceasing publication in
October 1941 and that another journal, probably a quarterly,
would take its place. The new publication was to be known
as The Adult Education Journal ("The Clearing House," 1941).

Adult Education Journal

The Adult Education Journal was published quarterly
from April 1942 until July 1950 by the American Association
for Adult Education following "the regrettable death of the

Journal of Adult Education" ("Editorials, Phoenix," 1942, p. 24). Approximately 1,700 pages of the Adult Education Journal were scanned for definitions of adult education. Sixteen references to adult education definitions were found. The years 1942 and 1943 (8 issues) yielded no specific definitions; however tasks of adult education were enumerated in one article. In 1944, Volume 3 yielded one definition. Kandel (1944) in his article "Adult Education and the Future of Democracy," offered an American definition: "adult education includes 'all activities with an educational purpose that are carried on by people engaged in the ordinary business of life'" (p. 25). Like a number of authors found in the journals, Kandel mentioned that education is a lifelong process.

During the next several years an increased interest in exactly how adult education was changing and developing was evident. Bryson (1946), in an article on the historical perspective of the adult education movement, noted that with the experiment of the Work Projects Administration "adult education got to be associated in the public mind with the emergency, with the urgent problem of salvage that the depression had brought on us" (p. 110).

Even before the depression, Bryson (1946) noted the large number of immigrants coming into the United States caused "the term adult education . . . to be firmly fixed in the mind of nearly everybody as a name for training

foreigners to speak English and become citizens" (p. 110).
Bryson maintained that while this is a noble cause, it is
only a "very limited part of adult education" (p. 110) and
in considering all aspects of adult education, it is not the
most important part. According to Bryson, many adult
educators preferred the term "life-long learning," which
emphasized the importance and normality of continuing to
learn as adults rather than suggesting that it was something
special or remedial. Some gain was made in the way adult
education was viewed until the depression--during that
period adult education became special--"done for the
underprivileged by the unfortunately displaced teacher" (p.
111).

In 1946, Bryson explained that, "We mean by the term
adult education the movement to provide that men and women
shall be given every chance to use their powers and to
strengthen them as they go." (p. 111). Bryson disagreed
with Adler's (cited in Bryson, 1946) thesis that there was
little adult education in programs of some agencies. He
agreed, however, with Adler's statement that "adult
education is for making men better citizens" (p. 112). Both
Adler and Bryson believed that "adult education has to do
with the most fundamental judgments that men can make" (p.
112).

In the third issue of Volume 6 of the Adult Education
Journal, Locke (1947) pointed out the fact that writers were

discovering that adult education was undergoing a

revolution. He quoted Mark Starr: "Once upon a time adult

education was largely confined to naturalization for

citizenship, and to removing illiteracy" (p. 107). The

definition, he explained, had become broader and was no

longer confined to citizenship and illiteracy. In an

article in the same issue, "Panel on Community Education"

(1947), it was pointed out that "adult education must be a

learning process for life" (p. 116).

The third article in this issue dealing with what adult

education is was written by Brigham (1947). In it, Brigham

presented the following statement of goals for adult

education which the Indiana Association for Adult Education

had adopted:

> Adult education, in the broad acceptance of the term,
> comprehends all educational activities engaged in by persons
> who have terminated their basic formal schooling and assumed
> the responsibilities of adulthood. Adult education is
> therefore not limited to any age level, nor to any
> restricted form of educational activity. Its essence is the
> impact of educational processes on adult life. Its
> significance lies in the assumption that educational
> processes which are initiated and cultivated in the brief
> years of formal schooling can be, and in a democracy must
> be, maintained and developed throughout adult life. Its
> ultimate end is that individual growth may become synonymous
> with community, national, and world programs. (p. 154)

Volume 7 of the Adult Education Journal contained two

definitions of adult education. Hallenbeck (1948a)

contended that "adult education is a function and a process,

not an end, and consequently it becomes valid with reference

to definite objectives" (p. 6). In issue Number 2,

Dickerman (1948) suggested that "adult education is voluntary" (p. 55).

An increase in the number of definitions of adult education was evident in Volume 8. A wide variety of activities were discussed in articles concerning adult education.

In issue Number 2 Fisher (1949) pointed out the now well-recognized fact that "'adult education' was not the same thing as night schools to teach grown-up illiterates how to read and write" (p. 151). This misconception persisted among many otherwise intelligent individuals for many years.

Adult education was considered in a preliminary report of the Committee on Constitutional Revision which was mentioned in an article found in issue Number 3. Among the six points that the committee felt were in need of revision was the need for the interpretation of adult education to be broadened ("AAAE News," 1949, p. 164).

Powell (1949), in issue Number 3, mentioned that a theme running throughout many journals was that "The picture of adult education in the United States is one of apparent confusion . . . with no established institutional pattern, no accepted curriculum, and no professional body of leaders" (p. 169).

This belief was reiterated by Starr (1949), who stated that,

Adult education in the United States, and more so in a world survey, is a veritable mosaic. . . . Even the term "adult education" is subject to varying interpretations. In the Anglo-Saxon countries the term is used to mean education carried on for adults, normally thought of as 18 years of age and up. In France the phrase "education of adults" is challenged by the conception of "popular culture" which includes youth groups and a wide variety of recreational and spectator activities. In many countries "adult education" is very far from the conception of "education of, by and for adults." (pp. 217-218)

In a discussion of the subjects taught to adults in California schools, Getsinger (1949) stated that a study of subject offerings and the distribution of classes allows one to draw the inference that "adult education is a separate thing, distinct and apart from elementary, secondary, or higher education just as each of these major divisions is different from each other" (p. 232).

Volume 9 included two definitions of adult education. Issue Number 4 of Volume 9 (October 1950) was combined with the <u>Adult Education Bulletin</u> and published as <u>Adult Education</u>. In issue Number 1, Taylor (cited in "Report on Virginia Conference," 1950) who presented a speech at the second post-war conference on adult education in Virginia, stressed "adult education as a movement rather than an institution" (p. 29). Taylor also explained that, "In the adult education movement the issues are to make intelligent progressive adaptations to an increasing need for understanding of complex conditions under which all adults today live" (p. 30).

Issue Number 3 was the last issue of this journal under the name <u>Adult Education Journal</u>. In that issue the summary of the Annual Business Meeting of the American Association for Adult Education included a description of the reorganization of adult education and enumerated ten purposes, including one which stated; "Continuing definition of the adult education movement and profession" ("AAAE News," 1950, p. 103).

Horn (1950) reiterated the premise that "education is a life-long and continuous process" (p. 110) and that,

> an adult education program must provide opportunities that assist an individual to achieve greater success in his chosen occupation, to live a richer, fuller, and more satisfying personal life, and to measure up more effectively to the duties and responsibilities of citizenship in our contemporary democratic society. (p. 110)

In a discussion of Dean Horn's article, Rogers (1950) stressed "that adult education is a process that must be related to <u>the informal organization</u> of society, hence academic principles drawn from experience with other types of education cannot be regarded as 'sound' for adult education" (p. 117).

<u>Adult Education</u>

<u>Adult Education</u> replaced the <u>Adult Education Journal</u> in 1950. The first four volumes included six issues per year. In the autumn of 1954 the journal became quarterly and was published quarterly during the remaining years of its publication. Approximately 8,000 pages were read or scanned

for definitions or allusions to adult education. Ninety-four references of separate and distinct articles were deemed pertinent. Only 83 of the articles specifically addressed the definition of adult education. While some articles contained only one definition, other articles included multiple definitions.

Volume 1, October 1950 through August 1951, yielded five references to the definition of adult education. The first issue of Volume I included a book review of Knowles's Informal Adult Education, which defined informal adult education as programs which are not offered for credit--courses which are "functional" and are more concerned with the solving of real-life problems than with abstract knowledge (Shangold, 1950). Overstreet, who wrote a foreword to Knowles's book, defined informal adult education as creating its own methods and formal education as using the traditional methods of educational institutions (Shangold, 1950). Shangold , however, emphasized that because compulsion, ritualism, and blind formality are contrary to adult education, the qualifier, informal, is redundant.

As stated earlier, many articles that do not include definitions of adult education per se, do include definition and discussion of terms closely associated with adult education, such as definitions of adult educators and the characteristics of adequate adult education programs

(Deming, 1950, pp. 25-26). In another article in Volume 1, Number 1, Deane (1950) provided a broad definition of adult education: "It has been construed to mean any situation within which a mature individual is stimulated to learn material" (p. 22).

It should be noted that in Volume 1, Number 3, in the discussion of a "UNESCO's Austrian Seminar on Adult Educational Methods" (1951), the recommendation was made "that UNESCO prepare a glossary of adult education for future use" (p. 103).

In Volume 1, Number 4, Kidd (1951) repeatedly expressed the opinion that the concept of adult education is frustrating. Kidd quoted J. T. Adams, who was bewildered by the confusion and complexity of the field of adult education in the United States and who described it as "a field as easy for the unwary to enter and almost as difficult to find one's way about in and exit from, as the celebrated Maze at Hampton Court" (p. 138).

In Volume 1, Number 5, McHugh (1951) presented a major proposition that "adult education is a phase in the continuous current of adult life and should be approached in terms of the major social attitudes rather than the specialized attitudes of the pedagogic tradition" (p. 172). McHugh conceived of "adult education as an adult social experience which differs in phase but not in kind from other group experiences and is continuous with them" (p.

173). McHugh pointed out adult education's similarities with other group experiences which are fruitful: (a) developed and controlled by participants, (b) produces specific objective results, (c) proceeds by the interactions of personalities, and (d) brings about changes or modifications in each personality involved (p. 174). In addition, McHugh pointed out that "education for adults is a normal and continuous phase of the student's and teacher's experience" (p. 174).

A newsbrief concerning a Ford Foundation Fund for Adult Education which had been allocated to start a new magazine was also included in Volume 1, Number 5. An intention for the fund, it was stated, was not to embark on a program of indoctrination which asserts that "The phrase, 'adult education,' is sometimes used as an excuse for 'educating' adults to think in uncertain channels, to adapt certain points of view at the expense of other points of view" ("News From the AEA," 1951, p. 202).

Stacy (1951) commented on education in general, but the comment certainly applies to adult education as well: "Education without action is futile, and action without education is fatal" (p. 223).

A perusal of Volume 2 of <u>Adult Education</u> revealed only three references. In an article in Volume 2, Number 3, Stensland and Stensland (1952) stated that "Adult education

in many of its most vital forms is a group undertaking" (p. 90).

In the same volume, Pell (1952), discussing the work of the AEA's Committee on Social Philosophy, offered a definition written by a group of individuals who were active in the adult education field, based on the following aims:

Adult education should become
A continuing experience,
And available to all adults,
Helping them to grow
As individuals
And as group members in a democratic society.
Adult education means participation in activities
Adapted to interests, needs and capacities
In a program
Alive to the pulse of the community--
A program which extends itself
Into the lives of people
Wherever they are
And by whatever means are effective (p. 129).

Pell (1952) added that, "Adult education refers to that educational process and program which deals with the needs and aspirations of adult people as individuals and as members of the community" (p. 132).

In Volume 2, Number 6, Kessel (cited in "Some Trends in Adult Education," 1952) discussed significant trends in the recreation phase of adult education and stated that "Adult education is a series of voluntary, meaningful experiences leading toward the realization of a person's potentialities for effective participation in a democratic society" (p. 206).

Two references were noted in Volume 3 of <u>Adult Education</u>. Blakely (1952) in "Adult Education Needs a

Philosophy and a Goal," maintained that change forces the
acceptance of adult education--an education which uses the
experiences of life as its curriculum and an education which
is "both an end in itself and a means to a better personal
and public life" (p. 5). Indirectly, Blakely identified
adult education as the "fourth level" of education in the
statement that,

> If the American people clearly see the need to turn
> their energies and talents to the "fourth level" of
> education, one for which primary, secondary and higher
> education exist to prepare us, they will do so with
> characteristic zeal and creativity. (p. 8)

A summary of a former statement changed, and refined as
a result of suggestions made by a number of discussion
groups of AEA regarding building working philosophies in
adult education, defined adult education as "an instrument
for facilitating the growth of human personality and the
development of a better world" (Hallenbeck, 1953, p. 151).

In volume 4, seven references to adult education were
found. In issue Number 1, Henry (1953) stated, "Adult
education is still education for citizenship, education for
self-improvement, personal efficiency and personal
enrichment; but it is also a means for developing
consciousness of the overwhelming urgency of accelerating
international understanding" (p. 5). Henly (1953) noted
that, "In one sense adult education is the newest division
of the general field of education, and in another it is as
old as civilization, itself" (p. 48).

In some articles, adult education was not defined as to what it is but rather as to what it is not. Crabtree (1953) quoted Mark McCloskey, who "deplored the viewpoint held by some that adult education is a business by which teachers eke out a meager existence" (p. 54).

In an article in issue Number 2, Volume 4, McGhee (1954) stated that, "Adult education has its own separate identity, arising not from its possession of a discrete subject matter, like that of Law or Medicine, but perhaps from the special concern for a unity of life and knowledge which characterizes adult students" (p. 68).

Royall (1954) began his article with what many others have noted: "It is almost impossible to define the expression 'adult education'" (p. 94). Royall added, however, that the term "adult education" implies that the activity must be educational, and that "adult" implies a special type of education.

Royall continued:

> It is my belief that adult education can be best defined generally as a type of communication within the open society whose proximate objective is the creation of sub-communities within that society, these sub-communities being created for the continuous solution of the essentially unpredictable problems which arise in the open society. The ultimate objective of adult education is the transformation of the entire open society itself into the pattern of a great university. Adult education, thus conceived, is a very recent and highly refined aspect of the "time-binding" process. But it is time-binding, not in preparation for life conceived statically as something that can be prepared for; rather it is time-binding for intelligent living in processes conceived dynamically as something unpredictable and in some sense "free." (p. 95)

In issue Number 5, Luke (1954) noted that "The purposes of the community council go beyond most traditional definitions of 'adult education' and may include civic projects, cooperative child care activities, school reorganization, and generally increased citizen participation in welfare, education, and public health programs" (p. 159). Luke asked: "Is there so little definition of the field of adult education that a specific brand of community organization is impossible?" (p. 160).

Luke continued:

> Purposes, program and clientele are, in turn, further premised on the implicit definition which those who promote the cause of adult education gives to the field they serve. If "adult education" means discussion groups, film forums, night schools, group listening to cultural or public affairs, telecasts, organized field visits and concerts, museum lectures, and other voluntary, part-time study pursuits (irrespective of auspices or subject matter), then the organizational concept of an adult education council will take one form. If it means some, or only one of the above activities, the organizational plan will be different. However, if "adult education" means, in addition to the activities identified above, such programs as personnel supervision, inservice training, counseling, staff and committee work, and any other activity where adults work, play, confer and consult together, then the organizational plan is much different. (p. 163)

In the same issue, Longmore and Loomis (1954) discussed rural social systems and their relationships with adult education:

> Adult education, as viewed by the Fund for Adult Education, consists of all activities and programs that promise significant contributions to world peace and international understanding; that secure allegiance to the principle of freedom and democracy in the solution of problems of society; and that advance the economic well-being of people everywhere, and improve economic

institutions for the realization of democratic goals. (p. 200)

Volume 5 of Adult Education introduced the change from six to four issues yearly. Eight references to adult education were noted in Volume 5, including a comprehensive article entitled "What Is Adult Education? Nine 'Working Definitions.'"

In issue Number 2, Knowles (1955) noted that "adult education is such a pervasive phenomenon that it eludes precise definition" (p. 67). Knowles added, "In its broadest meaning, it includes all experiences that help mature men and women to acquire new knowledge, understanding, skills, attitudes, interests, or values . . . it encompasses practically all life-experiences, individual or group, that result in learning" (p. 67).

In the same issue, Schwertman (1955) writing about the significance of an AEA conference in 1954, stated that "adult education is like quicksilver--that is if touched one way it becomes labor education; if touched another, it becomes religion; and if touched another, it can become something else, possibly psychology or sociology" (p. 77). He maintained that adult education does not have a subject matter of its own. Fuller (1955), in another article commented that adult education is of two kinds: informal and formal. He stated that, "the experiences of social living are adult education" (p. 96)

In a keynote speech to NAPSAE, S. M. Jackson (cited in Crabtree, 1955) explained that, "adult education is a mission and not a career" (p.99).

Issue Number 3 of Adult Education contained one of the most comprehensive articles on definitions of adult education found in any of the major adult education journals examined. The article, "What Is Adult Education? Nine 'Working Definitions'" (1955), was a result of contributions (as to their respective definitions of adult education) by well-recognized authorities in the field of adult education. The article points out that each definition is not only a conception of how each writer visualized the field of adult education but it also encompassed his vision of what it should be and what he was working to make it. These definitions, then, indicate adult education as "an only partially formed enterprise, one not yet fully embodied in existing institutions and programs" (p. 131). The following nine definitions are found in this article:

Hallenbeck's essay on the definition of adult education was presented first. He explained that the word definition helps to sort things into categories, including the purpose for which the classification is made. Such purposes are of two kinds: scientific and administrative. Both kinds of purposes must be considered in defining adult education. He believed the basic definition by Lyman Bryson is still useful: "Adult education includes all the activities with

an educational purpose that are carried on by people outside the ordinary business of life" ("What Is Adult Education?" 1955, p. 132).

There are three basic elements in adult education: it must be purposeful and orderly education, not accidental; it must be voluntary; and third, it is in addition to what the individual's main responsibilities in life are. Hallenbeck stated that many people disagree with this definition because it is so general and they wish for one that is more specific and clear-cut. Hallenbeck believed definitions of adult education can also be handled by classifying in a number of other ways: by institutions where adult education is offered (e.g., evening high school, library services, agricultural extension), in terms of the kind of group for whom the education is given (e.g., parent education, worker education, etc.), in terms of subject matter (e.g., public speaking, history, mathematics), by type of method used in its operation (e.g., forums, workshops, lectures), as well as by the skills around which the course is based (e.g., sewing, painting, auto mechanics). Another consideration is the definition needed when adult education is part of community service and is an endeavor to meet the needs of adults.

The next contributor, Sheats, answered the question, What is adult education? by stating that, while all experience is educative, all experience cannot be defined as

adult education. He warned that specific definitions can be misleading as well, and cites the specific definition given by the State Legislature of California in 1953. This body, in determining apportionments from the State School Fund, defined an adult as "any person who has attained his twenty-first birthday on or before September first or February first of the semester for which he has enrolled, and who has enrolled in less than ten class hours as defined in Section 6961 for junior college districts or ten periods of not less than forty minutes each week for high school districts" ("What Is Adult Education?" 1955, p. 134).

Sheats proposed that coverage be built into the definition of adult education "for those organized and planned activities in which man engages for the purpose of learning something" (p. 135). Three elements are present in this view: purpose, planned study, and organization. While purpose has to do with why the student or group wishes to participate, planning refers to the structuring or committee planning of the course. Organization is then handled by the agency or institution providing the activity or course. He also pointed out that it is important that self-education not be excluded. In summary, he explained:

> Thus, although adult education may be conceived of as a fourth level of educational opportunity, it, more than elementary, secondary, or higher education, uses the educational process, without external or arbitrary limitations as to content or method, for groups whose members are voluntary participants. . . . The key word, of course, is education, and if by this we mean opportunity for growth, for increased maturity and

wisdom, for self-realization as well as improved social competency, it should be possible to differentiate those programs and activities which serve these ends from entertainment, recreation, hobby, riding, and time-wasting. (p. 135)

The next contributor, Sworder, in an essay on a working definition of adult education, viewed adult education "as an educational program that is planned and organized to assist adults in meeting their responsibilities as individuals and as members of society" (p. 135). He believed that if an educational program can be determined to be beneficial to an adult, as a citizen and as a member of society, then it can be included within a working definition of adult education. Differences between adult education and other levels of education help to make a working definition. These differences have to do with the responsibilities adults have--in carrying on the functions of government, in maintaining economic stability, in being good parents and maintaining a well-adjusted family life, and last, having the responsibility of providing the social, cultural, and spiritual environment for present and future generations ("What Is Adult Education?" 1955).

Other differences can be noted from the viewpoint of differences between adults and children in their daily lives:

1. For adults, education is usually a part-time affair while their full-time occupation is that of a wage-earner

and a parent. For children, education is usually a full-time occupation.

2. Adult education attempts to meet immediate and continuing educational needs of adults in solving problems while the education of children is planned for the indeterminate future.

3. Education for adults is voluntary; for children, education is mandatory.

4. Adults usually engage in adult education for a reason and are, therefore, eager to learn; children have little choice in choosing curriculum and must participate in a rigidly set format of courses and credits ("What Is Adult Education?" 1955).

According to Sworder, there is a definite relationship of adult education to other levels of education--elementary, secondary, and higher education. All four stages are of equal importance and all help people to develop full capabilities. In order to meet the needs of the people, adult education must (a) be planned in cooperation with the individuals involved, (b) have educational objectives for both formal and informal courses and activities, (c) include continuity of planning, (d) provide leadership for the assessment and fulfillment of needs, and (e) be open to all persons without regard to race, creed, or economic circumstance. Sworder finished with the question: "What is adult education? Through a

planned and organized process of education, it is a way in which we . . . can think better, work better, and live better" ("What Is Adult Education?" 1955, p. 136).

Stensland began his essay as follows: "Adult education is proclaimed the fourth level of education in a mature society which takes for granted that learning is lifelong" ("What Is Adult Education?" 1955, pp. 136-137). However, he believed this is an incomplete definition and that motivation and character are important differences between adult education and other levels. These differences include (a) the learner's selection and direction of own learning, and (b) alignment of learning with action, relating thoughts to deeds, persons to persons, communities to communities. Stensland explained, "It may well be that the purposing phase is the most potent part of adult education, making it the very conscience of democracy" (pp. 137-138).

In MacKaye's essay, he discussed the differences between adult education and pedagogy but did not provide a succinct, specific definition of adult education. In ending his essay, he commented that adult education is often too broadly defined and that "it should be narrowed down to the function of preparing for adult life on a level of social and civic inspiration" (p. 139).

Contributor Minich began his essay by stating: "I conceive adult education to be a continuing educational experience which should contribute to the growth of people

as long as they live" ("What Is Adult Education?" 1955, p.
139). He emphasized that there is very little difference
between adult education and other levels of education, and
that those differences are in application and degree rather
than in principles of learning or methodology. He
explained, that adult education should (a) be available to
all persons, (b) help persons as individuals and as group
members to become more responsible citizens, (c) be diverse
and broad ranged, (d) represent a partnership among groups
and agencies concerned with the education of adults, and (e)
be voluntary. Minich concluded with the statement: "if
adult education is to attain the above-stated goals, and
reach all the people, it must not only adapt itself to their
interests, needs, and capacities, but must also extend
itself into the lives of people" (p. 140).

For Schwertman, the key to a working definition for
adult education was the word, _experience_. He explained that
this is not only a word, but a concept with three notions:
"Adults have more experience. Adults have different kinds
of experiences. Adult experiences are organized
differently" ("What Is Adult Education?" 1955, pp. 140-141).
His working definition was concise: "adult education is the
constant expansion of experience in desirable directions"
(p. 141). He explained that his definition does not differ
drastically from his definition of education but that it

does place more emphasis on experiential factors which compose the total aspects of a learning experience.

The next essay, by Blakely, tied the definition of adult education in with purpose. He preferred that the term adult education have the adjective adult removed to "preserve the unqualified noun _education_ for the process of deliberately educed growth" ("What Is Adult Education?" 1955, p. 142). Unless growth was involved, Blakely did not consider the activity education.

In defining functions of adult education, Frank believed that the following assumptions must be considered: (a) Many traditional ideas, beliefs and assumptions are today incongruous, (b) the social order is undergoing changes, (c) current living habits may no longer be appropriate or compatible with the lives we are expected to live, and (d) patterns of human relations have changed ("What Is Adult Education?" 1955). According to Frank, "Adult education may be regarded as a social invention peculiarly appropriate to our times" (p. 144), helping adults to recognize social changes and to accept the responsibility for integrating these into the culture. He continued, "adult education may be regarded as the unique resource of a free social order to carry on the functions of self-criticism, self-regulation, and self repair" (p. 144). Frank emphasized that,

> adult education has the great office of helping people
> to gain confidence in themselves, to renew their

courage and their faith in human potentialities, in order that as a people we can overcome our many resistances to change and replace our anxieties with hopefulness toward the future. (p. 145)

In summary, no clearly drawn issues emerged. Although some writers stressed growth in awareness, sensitivity, and intelligence, others stressed the belief that an ability to fill the social roles of parent, worker, and citizen is more important in adult education. The various definitions provided depict adult education differently and project different purposes, reminding adult educators of the variety of problems present. At the same time, the prescription of adult education as the remedy points out a real basis for the unity of the adult education movement. ("What Is Adult Education?" 1955).

In issue Number 4, Jayne and Gibb (1955), wrote about "the Mountain-Plains project." They found that consultants changed from seeing adult education as largely a matter of curriculum program to more of a community action program or a set of broad forces of social change. Still other consultants changed from seeing it as a program to bring education to the community to seeing it as a way of satisfying community needs and helping to find their own solutions to perceived problems. Some participants of the study began by seeing adult education as an organized effort to manipulate people, but changed to see it as an intrinsic community force. Attitude changes were the most significant.

Another article in the same issue described the
university's role in adult education: "Thus to the
university, <u>adult education</u> has become simply the gamut of
policies and functions associated with the 'extension' of
the university to the adult publics beyond the campus"
(Adolfson, 1955, p. 231). Adolfson provided a broad
definition which implied that the university adapts and
changes its role in adult education as educational needs
change or as the university's resources develop. He added:

> Where once the university was bounded by campus walls,
> today the university seeks to make itself as integral
> and dynamic a part of the life of the community and
> region as possible within the limits of available
> resources. This is <u>adult education</u> university style.
> (p. 232)

In his article in the same issue, Luke (1955) pointed
out what many others have reiterated: "'adult education,'
as usually considered in the United States, has no one
institutional pattern, adheres to no single educational
philosophy, and is without a standardized subject matter or
method" (pp. 236-237). According to Luke, this accounted
for the rapid and broad spread of adult education.

Four references or definitions were noted in Volume 6
of <u>Adult Education</u>. Many articles of this volume contained
discussions of the roles, aims, tasks, and goals of adult
education. Others included discussion of professionalism as
applied to adult education.

In a discussion of adult education in community
development in issue Number 1, it was noted that:

> adult education no longer is concerned merely with providing constructive leisure time activities for individuals, preparing the foreign-born for American citizenship, and helping industrial employees to acquire new mechanical skills. Adult education has finally "come of age" and is now recognized as a full partner in the significant affairs of community life. ("Adult Education in Community Development," 1955, p. 16)

In issue Number 3, White (1956), after reading many books on adult education, came to the conclusion that adult education is "as broad as human life itself, and life, most assuredly, is 'a mosaic made out of discrete (if not always discreet) contributions'" (p. 156).

In a book review of Grattan's _In Quest of Knowledge_, Verner (1956) explained that the book explored several theses, one being "that adult education is the only important form of education continuous with man's progress" (p. 187). As Grattan pointed out, "the education of adults is not synonymous with adult education; . . . adult education is not the creation of adult educators but of social forces" (p. 187).

In issue Number 4, Verner (1956) stated that Louis Lowy, in _Adult Education and Group Work_, professed to show that "adult education is nothing more than social group work and that the methodology developed in social group work is appropriate to adult education" (p. 230). According to Verner, "adult education is concerned with educational processes leading to social action" (p. 231).

Volume 7 revealed five references pertinent to the definition of adult education. In "A Community Program of Adult Education: Michigan's Recommendations to the White House Conference on Education" (1956), adult education is defined in an indirect manner when it is called a fourth level:

> A strong, so-called 'fourth level' of education, education for adults, in our public school system would and should make as much of an impact on our society as did the first three: primary, secondary, and higher. . . . Adult education is a link in community integration and solving of community programs. (pp. 41, 44)

In an article by Harden (1956) the terms adult education and university extension are used interchangeably.

Blakely (1957), in "The Path and the Goal," did not describe adult education as a fourth level above elementary, secondary, and higher education. He believed that it is much more than that. He stated, "adult education is the test of all other levels--the test of whether the process of growth has really been begun. Looked at in this way, it is the end of life" (p. 95). According to Blakely, adults control the world and therefore, "adult education is the foundation of the responsible exercise of authority--in the home, in schools, in churches, in organizations, in communities, in the nation, in the world" (p. 95). When viewed in this way, adult education is also the means for successful self-government in a political and social sense. However, "if the word 'adult' is to mean something other than 'of age,' and if 'education' is to have a meaning that

excludes indoctrination, adult education is possible only in a free society" (p. 95).

In an article in issue Number 3, "A Sociologist Looks at Adult Education," Hallenbeck (1957) explained that the term education must be discussed before adult education can be considered: "First, education is something which happens inside an individual. . . . Second . . . all will imply growth, development or change. This is to say education is a dynamic thing" (p. 135).

In a working paper in issue Number 4, the observation was made that "In terms of institutions and enrollments the scope of adult education is so broad as to defy precise definition. . . . For statistical purposes, the definition of adult education is limited to continuous (as against sporadic) experiences, organized specifically for the purpose of adult learning" ("An Overview and History of the Field," 1957, p. 227). According to Knowles (1957), also in issue Number 4, "By definition, adult education is a process of individual growth" (p. 238).

In Volume 8 of Adult Education, four references were found that pertain to the definition of adult education. In issue Number 1, Houle (1957), in what may have been the first major address on adult education made at the inauguration of a university president, quoted Warner and Abegglen as stating: "All categories (of big business leaders) . . . equip themselves through adult education with

the special knowledge for their further advancement" (p. 9)

Houle quoted their conclusion that,

>   Adult education in America is a necessary process not
>   only for equipping the mature with knowledge but for
>   providing millions of Americans with more flexibility
>   in their lives and greater freedom of choice, and so
>   reducing the number of men and women confined to a
>   fixed status. (p. 9)

Kaufman (1957) in another article in the same issue,
stated: "Adult education has been defined as education 'to
help adults live more successfully'" (p. 18). Later in the
article, he pointed out that the Adult Education Association
of the U.S.A. believes "the fundamental goal of adult
education is to enable adults to deal intelligently,
democratically, and peacefully with the problems posed for
individuals and communities by the perversive facts of
change" (p. 19).

In issue Number 2, Holden (1958) described adult
education as having "a marginal existence when compared to
elementary, secondary, or community college programs" (p.
89). He claimed that it has a "night school" connotation
and is often a means to learn something elementary, remedial
or necessary for citizenship. In addition, adult education
implies a "second chance" at education and is often not
considered as "for everyone" (p. 89). The manner in which
adult education is held can be due to three things: the low
priority of adult education, due to indefinite sequence of
grades or levels; the nature of being a large and all-
inclusive area of non-compulsory education; and the fact

that adult education has different meanings for different individuals.

In an article, "An English View of Workers' Education in the U.S.," Millgate (1958) noted that:

> Jack Barbash defines workers' education as "any planned educational activity which a union undertakes; or an educational activity undertaken by any agency other than a union, where a major objective is to build more effective union citizenship. . . . The difference between adult education generally and workers' education is that adult education seeks to improve the individual as an individual. (p. 162)

Millgate also noted that there is a definite distinction between "education" and "training" of which many persons seem unaware.

In an article in issue Number 4, "The Nature of Adult Participation," Verner and Newberry (1958) explained that, "Since adult education is a voluntary activity, the decision to participate or not rests with the individual adult and is influenced by factors that are components of both the personality and the social group life of the individual involved" (p. 208). Further, "adult education is primarily a product of an urban culture, therefore, more participants are found in urban areas" (p. 219). They continued,

> Where adult education is an extension into adult life of an institution's responsibility on a preadult level, the pattern of organization is oriented toward that preadult level with the result that those who are further removed from their formal school experiences are least attracted to it. (p. 219)

Volume 9 revealed only one reference to definition of adult education. Stern (1959) in a discussion of the

problems faced by adult educators, stated, "Adult education
is a natural field for really free and exciting enterprise,
but it requires a certain mentality" (p. 79).

Bell (1959) in writing about education in Baltimore in
issue Number 3, described the fabric of adult education as
being "composed of many activities, classes, courses,
programs and meetings conducted by distinct institutions and
organizations for diverse and occasionally contradictory
purposes" (p. 159). He cited a report of the Board of
School Commissioners on June 20, 1952, as follows:

> Public adult education is a public injunction because
> after all the other agencies, institutions, and media
> have played their educational roles in their own ways
> and for their own purposes, the governmental unit must
> be prepared to augment, supplement, or modify the
> education available for its citizens. (p. 161)

The first of six references in Volume 10 of Adult
Education was in "Boston University's Adult Education
Program" (1959), a press release of February 15, 1959. This
article included the following statement:

> At a time when the concept of adult education is in
> danger of being defined and applied too narrowly, it is
> important that a philosophy of continuing education be
> presented that will help to encourage, extend and
> enrich the learning of all adults. (p. 43)

According to a summary on the faculty administrative
committee deliberations at Boston University, "'Adult
education' is no absolutely abstract term" (p. 44);
clientele, methods, objectives and connotations arising out
of the needs and temper of changing society all influence
education, including adult education. The press release

emphasized the need for a re-thinking of adult education so that it is identified in our minds with a "life-long process." As pointed out, the President's Committee on Education Beyond the High School talked of "adult education" as a afterthought despite the efforts of adult educators to remind the committee that "adult education" as well as "higher education" comprises education beyond high school.

This Boston University report, however, takes a bold viewpoint about adult education and goes on to state that: "adult education embraces many and all legitimate goals of people with respect to continuing growth . . . ; a bold program in adult education cannot be completely defined a priori" (p. 46) because even though precise definition may circumscribe properly, the conditions of contemporary life being both dynamic and explosive call for a theoretical and pragmatic operational blend.

In another article in the same issue, Dickerman (1959) described "Adult education [as] a comparatively new field of study" (p. 50), one that is indefinite as to what information and skills ought to be included in the training of adult educators.

In his article, "Adult Education and Freedom" in issue Number 2, Jarrett (1960) wrote: "Adult Education can, then, be a force in promoting the spirit of freedom in individuals and in groups" (p. 70). Jarrett believed that a major reason for adult education is that it offers an escape from

boredom. Jarrett also quoted Robert Redfield, who described "education [as a] conversation about the meaning of life, as each sees some part of it, on behalf of everyone" (p. 72). Jarrett maintained that this can be applied to the liberal education of adults.

Essert (1960), in issue Number 3, believed that

"Adult education" has been difficult to define, because the knowledges about it are drawn from all the social inferences, and because the word "education" has traditionally subsumed it under the rubric of childhood and youth instruction. . . . The field of adult education is the totality of occasions actually planned and used for and by persons of adult years; it includes both the practices and the practitioners operating in their variety at any given time across the country. The discipline called "adult education" is a distinct area of scientific and philosophical study, dealing with a body of content, of theory, and of methodology peculiar to itself. (p. 133)

In "Democracy Three Ways," Fleece (1960) stated, "We all agree that adult education is a democratic movement, growing out of democratic societies and supporting democratic ideals" (p. 182). The big problem is, however, that democracy has many aspects and educators in adult education disagree on which attributes should be emphasized.

Fleece examined the way we view people "every man is as good as every other man, . . . " and stated, "People who see mankind in this beneficent light tend to think of adult education as a supermarket where each can choose for himself from among varying products and varying brands of the same product" (p. 183).

In the "Professional Literature" section of issue Number 4, Verner (1960b) reviewed a book which contained in its title a definition relating to adult education: Continuing Education, An Evolving Form of Adult Education.

Four references were found in Volume 11 of Adult Education. In issue Number 2, Kreitlow (1961) voiced the concern of many educators: "Unless a body of knowledge in adult education is soon developed by vigorous research in the field, it may be concluded that there is no such field!" (p. 67). In the same issue, Bigger (1961) expressed his agreement in the following statement: "The phrase 'adult education' is in itself a catch-all and difficult to define in formal terms" (p. 83).

Westervelt (1961), in "Stretching Adult Educators," maintained that "education is different from training" (p. 99), that education involves the acquisition, organization and application of symbols and is a function of learning distinct from training (p. 100). As Westervelt pointed out, "Edmund Brunner has noted that adult education 'encompasses most of the areas of knowledge'" (p. 100).

In a book review of The Emerging Evening College, Liveright (1961) pointed out that McMahon

> highlights the apparent dichotomy between what he calls "traditional education" and "adult education." According to McMahon, traditional education means formal, credit, similar-to-daytime-education, while adult education means informal, non-credit education which is different from the daytime program and which is based more on community and "felt needs" than upon traditional university curriculum. (p. 188)

According to McMahon, evening colleges should be involved only with "traditional education," and another branch of the college (extension or community services) should carry on some kind of "adult education" activity.

In his article, "Stating a Position on Adult Education" in issue Number 4, Luke (1961) concluded that "adult education has made its greatest contribution in the areas of academic, vocational, avocational, and cultural education" (p. 251). He emphasized that adult education can provide Americans with many different kinds of educational opportunities which can help them make wise public and community decisions determining the direction in which American society should forge ahead in future years.

Volume 12 revealed only one reference to a definition of adult education. In a review of Lindeman's book, The Meaning of Adult Education, Kolben (1962) brought out that "Lindeman criticizes the common idea that education is preparation for life and substitutes instead the suggestion that education is life" (p. 128). By rejecting static forms of education--that is education forms which are alike from year to year--Lindeman opens up the way for adult education.

Lowe (1962) believed that in the United States, the term adult education has a greater complexity which can, in part, be explained by historical basis. However, the unregulated growth of adult education in this country has caused a failure to find a rationale so as to give the field

a strength of purpose and a characteristic public image.
Lowe suggested that it has also failed to consider the non-
vocational aspects. Lowe (1962) explained that aside from
the problem of definition of adult education, people from
England notice that adult education in the United States is
aimed at vocational training in the main and that the
average person sees further education in terms of acquiring
higher vocational qualifications for possible advancement on
the job.

Volume 13 yielded only two references to definitions of
adult education. In issue Number 4, Whipple (1963) provided
a review of London and Wenkert's essay Some Reflections on
Defining Adult Education: stated,

> Essential components include its function, purpose,
> definition of an adult, and a distinction between
> formal and adult education. Functionally, there must
> be an organized content. Its purpose must be to
> educate, and it is adult education if the organizer
> says so--in other words, it depends upon the major
> purpose of the programmer rather than the students who
> take the course. A student is an adult if he is
> independent and if he has accepted social
> responsibility. Age is irrelevant. A considerable
> portion of the essay attempts to distinguish between
> formal education and adult education. (p. 243)

In a book review of Adult Education Theory and Method
by Verner, Knox (1963) quoted Verner's definition:

> Adult education is the action of an external
> educational agent in purposefully ordering behavior
> into planned systematic experiences that can result in
> learning for those for whom such activity is
> supplemental to their primary role in society, and
> which involves some continuity in an exchange
> relationship between the agent and the learner so that
> the educational process is under constant supervision
> and direction. (p. 253)

Volume 14 had three references to definitions of adult education. In issue Number 2, Knowles (1964) asked "What Do We Know About the Field of Adult Education?" and wrote, "Adult Education became publicly defined as a discrete field of social practice with the founding of the American Association for Adult Education on March 26, 1926" (p. 67). Knowles stated that the feeling of the Adult Education Association in its early days was that "the field is still in the process of definition and maturation" (p. 71). Later he stated "the adult educational field was not one that could be described in immediately discernible categories, but each succeeding attempt brought new parts into focus and made their relationship to a whole increasingly clear" (p. 74). Knowles believed some generalizations can be made about the field of adult education including the fact that it is highly expansive and flexible; it is a multidimensional social system, which is highly interactive; and it is becoming a more delineated field of study and practice.

In an article appearing in the same issue, Cotton (1964) noted that as early as 1919, the view was recognized "that adult education is a permanent national necessity and therefore should be both universal and lifelong" (p. 80). Cotton cited Harold Laski, who 40 years ago wrote,

> If it is our purpose to make adult education a normal and necessary part of the general educational process, we need to make it less a matter about which people, and especially its advocates, have knowledge. We need

to make it much more a scientific study, and much less
one in which general impressions, or the limited
personal experience of a few workers, set both the
direction and the rate of our effort. (p. 83)

Cotton described earlier educators who saw adult

education as essentially "an educational enterprise

concerned with the life of the mind, with ideas and the uses

of intelligence, not propaganda and practical politics" (p.

85).

Also, in issue Number 2, Phinney (1964) reviewed

Monroe's book on library adult education. Phinney, the

reviewer, pointed out that Monroe elected to analyze through

"an historical review of the meaning which 'adult education'

has had for librarians between 1920 and 1955 . . . the

variety of conceptions of library adult education" (p. 117).

Gnagey (1964a) in "Adult Goals For Adult Education" in

issue Number 3, defined adult education in one area as

follows:

If adult education is to live up to its true meaning,
which it defines as lifelong learning it had better get
about the business in a more serious way of reaching
adults at the level of their higher human needs and
interests. (p. 177)

Five references to adult education were found in Volume

15. Dickerman (1964) in "What Is This 'Continuing

Education'?" maintained "The vineyard in which I labor is no

longer adult education but is, or seems in a fair way to

becoming, continuing education" (p. 3). He noted that

Verner had already announced that, in North America,

"continuing education is now synonymous with adult

education" (p. 3). Dickerman believed "`continuing education' seems preferable to `adult education,' since it implies that education is a necessary and proper activity for adults" (p. 3). Dickerman (1964) believed that defining the term adult education should also help in distinguishing between it and other categories of education. This is often confusing because adult education may involve further study in the fields of elementary, secondary, or higher education. To add to the confusion, it should be remembered that the term adult education does not mean the same thing in different countries--in England and India the term does not mean the same as in the United States. Dickerman strongly favored the term continuing education to the term adult education because "`continuing education' has an impressive advantage in its implication that in today's world everyone must keep on learning, though `lifelong learning' does this quite as well while `further education' and `adult education' do it almost as well" (p. 5). Zahn (1964) described "University adult education [as] the offering of university instruction to those who no longer have the full time occupation of student" (p. 44).

Nadler (1965), in "A Need in Adult Education," stated that the conclusion has been reached "that training is realistically one of the many specialties under the broad umbrella of adult education" (p. 107). Haggstrom (1965) discussed education and adult education and explained what

is meant by both terms: "Education, therefore, is not the transmission of knowledge and skill, but rather the development of assumptions of knowledge and skill which enable those educated to define their situations clearly enough to allow action to proceed" (p. 153). He continued as follows:

> Obviously adult education consists rather in the enhancement of the self-realization of adults through communication of assumptions which are learned. . . .adult education can be defined as enhancement of the self-realization of adults by their learning assumptions of knowledge and skills. (p. 153)

Adams (1965), in issue Number 3, was quite implicit in his definition of adult education: "By definition, adult education is higher education, education after high school" (p. 173). Later in the article, Adams added that "adult education can be a catalyst that helps men come to grips, with elements that are essential to moral thinking" (p. 177).

Only one reference to adult education was found in Volume 16. In "A Model for the Analysis of Continuing Education for Adults," Wientge (1966) maintained that specific, more exact definitions of adult and continuing education are needed. He then proceeded to define adult and continuing education, but failed to define adult education per se, although the implication in the article is that adult education is synonymous with continuing education. Wientge's definitions are as follows:

Adult--An adult for purposes of the model is defined as
one who is employed or employable in a full-time
occupation or retired because of age from a full-time
occupation. Housewives, under this definition are
considered to be fully employed. Conversely, an adult
is not a full-time student enrolled in a formal
educational curriculum. . . . In general, continuing
education is defined to include all educational
offerings available for adults on a part-time basis and
includes degree and non-degree courses, conferences,
short courses, residential experiences and
correspondence and extension offerings. (p. 247)

Volume 17 of Adult Education revealed no references to

a definition of adult education. Volume 18 of Adult

Education, yielded only one reference.

McMahon, Coates, and Knox (1968) maintained that

"Education is a lifelong process" (p. 197), and that "adult

education has no common thread, no single set of goals" (p.

197). In the United States, "the field is as broad as the

range of human interests and human needs, but one central

characteristic is a sense of growth and satisfaction in the

adult who engages in the learning process" (p. 198).

In the United States, because adult education is

usually identified with specific segments or forms of

education in which adults are involved, adult education has

become stereotyped as formal night school, vocational

training, hobby instruction, Americanization classes, or

other specific learning activities. Most individuals

associate education with formal structure; for this reason,

adult education is often not recognized as true education

(McMahon, 1968).

Volume 19 provided three references. Ingham (1968) in an article in Volume 19, defined adult education as

> a process designed to effect change in the participant's behavior. In organized forms of adult education, it is the organization's intent to influence this change; that is, to provide an experience designed to influence the participants. Thus, organizations engaged in the adult education process, like any organization, must exercise power if they are to achieve their organizational goals. Here again, the organizational goal may be "to help students learn what they want to learn" within rather broad limits. (p. 55)

Ingham also pointed out that adult education is voluntary and, therefore, subordination is the choice of the participant.

Boyd (1969) made the following statement in "New Designs For Adult Education Doctoral Programs": "It is not a novel approach to define adult education by first defining adult and education, but it has tradition and merit" (p. 188). However, this does not lead to a closure. Boyd, who attempted to define adult education in a psychological context in an earlier article (see Adult Leadership, Nov. 1966), offered again his definition of both adult and education in the context of adult education:

> The adult having his own standards, aspirations and expectations based upon his own recognized identity establishes that which he wishes to learn and is able to go directly to the subject matter. The social context is significant to his actions but they do not serve as psychological bridges to his engagement in learning. . . . Education involves learning and experiences are integral segments of education. Education is the purposive structuring and organizing of experiences. Experiences provide growth to the extent that they have continuity and expression of subject matter. (pp. 189-190)

Both of these definitions must be taken into consideration when defining adult education. Boyd pointed out that in using the term, adult education, to mean a field of study in the doctoral program, the term connotes an area of study.

In a book review of <u>Farm, Mill and Classroom: A History of Tax-Supported Adult Education in South Carolina to 1960</u> in issue Number 4, Page (1969) provided Hardy's description of adult education: "Adult Education is an agent for change, and the absence of it has retarded the growth and development of States" (p. 285).

The only reference to adult education in Volume 20 was Portal-Foster's (1970) definition of adult education as "a process of learning by doing, a process that requires the teacher to become a group leader capable of changing his students not only through subject matter competency but also by his ability to promote participation and motivation" (p. 68).

Volume 21 revealed no references to adult education. However, there were four references found in Volume 22.

In a discussion of the concept of education Dickinson (1971) stated, "The concept of education as a lifelong integrated process suggests a new emphasis in participation research in that adult education becomes one aspect of a continuous process instead of a discrete phenomenon to be studied in isolation" (p. 37).

Brady and Long (1972) stated their definition of adult
education before talking about the differences in
perceptions of program planning procedures:

> Adult education--a process by which adults attempt to
> bring about desired changes in their knowledge,
> understanding, skills, abilities or attitudes, and
> ultimately in their behavior; or any process by which
> agents or agencies attempt to change people in these
> ways. (p. 126)

In another article, Bass (1972) noted that the terms
adult education and continuing education are used
interchangeably: "The term continuing education was
substituted for the term adult education in the
questionnaire" (p. 210). The implication is that adult
education is continuing education.

Carlson (1972) discussed the common belief that adult
education should serve as an "educational service station"
or be pictured "as a cafeteria where the adult picks and
chooses what he wants" (p. 291). As noted by Carlson, this
view was held for almost a quarter of a century but has been
discouraged in recent years. Carlson also noted that Frances
Kellor, in advocating Americanization concepts "wanted adult
education to be a science with 'final indestructible
definitions and principles . . . and . . . finally approved
methods'" (p. 296).

In the first of four references found in Volume 23,
Lloyd (1972) wrote of Freire and noted that three uses of
the term adult education can be suggested: first, social
change, referring to self-improvement in individuals;

second, improvement within institutions that enables them to function more effectively; and last, radical restructuring of society necessary to bring about basic changes desired. Lloyd pointed out the fact that Freire used the term in the latter sense while American adult educators tend to use the term in the first two ways cited.

Lloyd (1972) repeated Verner's definition of adult education: "Adult education is a relationship between an <u>educational agent and a learner</u> in which the agent selects, arranges, and continuously directs a sequence of progressive tasks that provide systematic experience to achieve learning for the learners" (p. 16). The question is then asked, "Is there not a danger that such definitions reduce learners to passive objects?" (p. 16).

In an article in issue Number 2, Long (1973) discussed a variety of opinions as to what is "educational" for adults and stated that modern adult education literature shows many efforts at an attempt to define "adult" as part of the term adult education. Long stated, "According to Pasquale's definition, all college education and all apprenticeship (except that of involuntary bound apprentices) was adult education" (p. 133).

In a summary of his article, "Adult Education Forever: Toward a More Humanistic View of Development: Adult Education's Role," DeVries (1973) stated that a definition of development in strictly economic terms is inadequate; it

is, instead, a multidimensional process. Because it is a

multidimensional process, the role of adult education is to

assist in this process. Thus, if adult education is viewed

in this way, dependency relationships between teachers and

learners are avoided, enabling each to contribute to the

development of the other. "This" DeVries concluded, "is

adult education" (p. 241).

In issue Number 4, Dowling)1977) reviewed Houle's

book, The Design of Education. According to Dowling, "The

book describes Professor Houle's system for understanding

and planning programs in adult education, a field which he

[Houle] defines as a 'cooperative (not an operative) art

designed to increase skill (or ability), knowledge (or

information), or sensitiveness'" (p. 306).

Volume 24 and Volume 25 of Adult Education had no

references to definitions of adult education. However,

Volume 26 included two quite comprehensive references.

In "The Past as Prologue: Toward An Expanded View of

Adult Education," Rockhill (1976) emphasized

> that adult education consists of all "systematic adult
> learning experiences," as defined either by the learner
> or the provider. Adult education is not synonymous
> with an institution or set of institutions, nor is it
> coterminous with a level or fourth tier of learning.
> Thus, its conceptualization and history are necessarily
> complex and difficult to integrate. (p. 197)

Rockhill added,

> The term "adult education" was first used extensively
> in the post World War I period to bring attention to
> the need for formal educational programs for adults, a
> need created because of: (a) the void left by the

breakdown of informal educational processes, (b) the
equation of education with degrees and vocational
skills, and (c) the consequent narrowing of education
to mean a series of age-graded, credentials-oriented
institutions which almost always excluded adults. (p.
199)

In her discussion of an expanded view of adult

education, Rockhill (1976) noted,

Throughout the literature, perhaps nothing has inspired
a more lively debate than the question "what is adult
education?" Implicit in all writing about adult
education is an assumption as to what it is. . . .
Essentially, it is my view that adult education is a
"Systematic Adult Learning Experience." A very simple
and straightforward definition, it can easily be
remembered by its acronym, SALE. . . . To be systematic
an experience must be of some duration, with a learning
objective and some criterion of fulfillment implied,
whether defined by the learner or the provider. . .
Random learning is eliminated but all occasions of "I
want to know . . . " or "you will learn . . . " are
included. (p. 200)

As Rockhill pointed out, Stubblefield defined adult

education as "that which promotes an intelligent response to

public problems, as contrasted with the 'education of

adults' which can be liberal, remedial, etc." (p. 202).

In the abstract for an article, Stubblefield (1976)

noted that "Adult education advocates and theorists began in

the mid-1920's to distinguish between 'adult education' and

other forms of 'education for adults.' In this conception,

adult education was a 'study' and 'learn' approach to life"

(p. 253).

Stubblefield (1976), in the body of the article stated

that,

From the mid-twenties to the mid-thirties adult
education advocates and theorists began to distinguish

"adult education" from other forms of "education for adults" such as liberal education, remedial education, university extension, and vocational education. Education should do more, they claimed, than disseminate knowledge and information; it should cultivate an intelligent response to public problems. (p. 254)

As Stubblefield (1976) pointed out, Lindeman, a leading American theorist of adult education, claimed that not all learning by adults can be considered adult education.

Lindeman set forth "the generalized criteria for defining adult education" as "individual growth through continuing educational means in a group context." Specifically, "adult education is conceived to be individual growth in and through a social medium and for a social end." (cited in Stubblefield, 1976, p. 254)

In the same article, Stubblefield (1976) quoted Kilpatrick as saying "that adult education becomes practically co-extensive with all shared effort to face life's problems" (p. 254). . . . "Adult education was really a 'study' and 'learn' approach to personal and social problems; any difficulty which arises is an opportunity for 'adult education'" (p. 254). Kilpatrick believed that "adult education took its aims and character from the view that education was continuous with life, i.e., the process by which the human organism constantly builds and refines itself through more adequate behavior" (p. 254).

Later in the article, in a discussion of Lindeman's definition of adult education, Stubblefield (1976) asserted, "Adult education then had a broader purpose than releasing knowledge and power for individual use; it sought to help

persons improve their collective enterprises as well" (p.

257).

In a discussion of experiments in adult education,

Stubblefield (1976) noted that

the 1920's and 1930's were seminal years in the history
of adult education in the United States. . . . Perhaps
the most significant legacy of this period lay in the
conception of adult education that emerged: the idea
of adult education as a process of helping adults to
use their experience and knowledge in understanding and
handling situations in their lives. (p. 266)

Volume 27 included two references to adult education.

In an article in issue Number 4, Merriam (1977) questioned

whether education can be categorized as andragogy and

pedagogy as suggested by Knowles, or whether adult education

is just a fourth level in addition to primary, secondary and

higher education, as suggested by Blakely (cited in Merriam,

1977).

In the same issue, Dowling (1977) reviewed Hiemstra's

book, <u>Lifelong Learning</u>. He noted the following:

A reluctance to use the words "adult" and "education"
when writing about adult education [as in the name of
the book] may stem from the discomfort professional
educators of adults feel concerning the public's
associations with either or both words. Being adult in
a youth-oriented society is not necessarily something
to flaunt and the word "education" conjures up less
than pleasant memories for far too many adults. (p.
231)

Dowling pointed out that a subtitle, using words such as

adult, continuing, and education are on the front cover and,

hopefully, clue perspective readers as to what is contained

in the book.

Two references to adult education were found in Volume
28. In issue Number 1 of Volume 28, Carlson (1977)
discussed the professionalization of adult education as
follows: "Leaders of the field had long been aware . . . of
the concern of those responsible for granting public and
foundation funds that adult education was `a vast,
amorphous, undefined field without any unified or consistent
aim'" (p. 53).

Later in the article, he explained that, "What was an
`amorphous' activity, not easily understood by public
officials and prestigious civic leaders, may be on the way
to achieving sufficient identity for the consideration of
increased public funding" (p. 54).

Dickinson (1978) discussed the contributions of Coolie
Verner to adult education. One major contribution listed
was that of "defining and differentiating adult education as
an academic discipline and field of practice" (p. 223). In
an expansion of the definition and differentiation,
Dickinson (1978) added,

> An early task in the emergence of an academic
> discipline is the development of a precise terminology
> which can be applied consistently. . . . As adult
> education is an applied discipline, theory and research
> are expected to have an impact on a field of practice
> as well as a body of knowledge. The potential exists
> for theory, research, and practice to advance
> interdependently. (p. 224)

Dickinson (1978) continued, "Verner's attempts to
define adult education originated with a distinction between
learning and education" (p. 225). He [Dickinson] believed

that such a distinction is necessary if everyday activities
in which an adult acquires learning or behavioral changes
are to be differentiated from activities which involve
specific effort to help bring about behavioral change in the
adult. He pointed out how Verner's concept of adult
education evolved, and gave four definitions of adult
education proposed by Verner, starting with the term defined
in 1959:

> Adult education is concerned with the organization and
> conduct of educational activities for adults in which
> systematic learning is provided through the
> establishment and maintenance of a direct exchange
> relationship between the learner or participant and the
> education agent so that the learning process is under
> constant direction. (p. 225)

A modification in 1962 included the definition of an
adult and emphasizes the role of the educational agent:

> Adult education is the action of an external
> educational agent in purposefully ordering behavior
> into planned systematic experiences that can result in
> learning for those for whom such activity is
> supplemental to their primary role in society, and
> which involves some continuity in an exchange
> relationship between the agent and the learner so that
> the educational process is under constant supervision
> and direction. (p. 225)

The definition Verner used in 1964 plays up the role of
the agent:

> Adult education is a relationship between an
> educational agent and a learner in which the agent
> selects, arranges, and continuously directs a sequence
> of progressive tasks that provide systematic
> experiences to achieve learning for those whose
> participation in such activities is subsidiary and
> supplemental to a primary productive role in society.
> (p. 225)

In 1974, Verner (cited in Dickinson, 1978) incorporated the range of providers of adult education into the definition:

> Adult education is any planned and organized activity provided by an individual, an institution, or any other social instrumentality that is intended specifically to assist an adult to learn and which is under the immediate and continuing supervision of an instructional agent who manages the conditions for learning in such a way as to facilitate the successful achievement of the learning objectives. (p. 225)

Dickinson (1978) then pointed out that

> Verner's evolving definition of adult education has been described by Schroeder as definition by operation analysis in that it includes the purpose of the operation and the function of the parts to achieve that purpose, while Houle aligned Verner with change theory. (p. 226)

The limited acceptance of any of Verner's definitions of adult education has been due to that fact that self-directed learning was excluded. Dickinson (1978) believed that

> the findings of Verner's adoption studies provided support for the theses that adult education is distinct from formal schooling and that the role of the adult educator should be incorporated in differentiating adult education from self-education and other learning in the natural societal setting. (p. 230)

No references to definitions of adult education were found in Volume 29. However, in issue Number 3, Bell and Courtney (1979) described the need for adult education and noted that UNESCO, in a series of publications, started a new era involving a basis for a new adult education. As pointed out in Bell and Courtney's article,

> a wider and deeper meaning of education is being rediscovered with a view to revamping the whole field and thus making it more functional and effective. The

new meaning is symbolized by the term lifelong education which includes formal, informal and non-formal patterns of learning throughout the life-cycle of the individual for the conscious and continuous enhancement of the quality of life, his own and that of society. (p. 196)

In issue Number 4, Knudson (1979) began a critique of andragogy with this statement: "According to Carlson . . . adult education used to be an informal educational system, devoid of jargon and technicality, where 'friends educated friends'" (p. 261). With time, a variety of terms have been introduced into the discussion of the field of adult education, and have resulted in the increased use of jargon and technicality.

Adult Education, Volume 30, was the last volume published under that name and contained only one issue, Number 1. In this issue, Main (1979) gave a definition of adult education taken from Grabowski and Mason's Learning For Aging and noted that it was a consensus definition by the contributing authors:

Adult Education. A relationship between an educational agent and a learner in which the agent selects, arranges and continuously directs a sequence of progressive tasks that provide systematic experiences to achieve learning for those whose participation in such activity is subsidiary and supplemental to a primary productive role in society. (p. 32)

Boshier and Pickard (1979), in their introduction wrote the following statement: "Adult education is a social science discipline and a field of practice" (p. 34). They further explained that different interpretations as to the meaning of discipline result in questioning whether adult

education can be called a discipline: "Other interpretations lead to a argument which maintains that education is not itself a discipline; thus it is not possible for a subset such as adult education to call itself a discipline" (p. 35).

Handbook Findings

Only three Handbooks of Adult Education were examined for definitions. Two earlier handbooks, from 1934 and 1936, revealed no definitions of adult education. The 1934 handbook consisted of a directory of national organizations engaged in adult education, a listing of local adult education efforts deemed of national importance, and a type of reference form set-up for relating adult education activities.

The 1936 handbook contained articles covering types of activities provided by adult educators and some historical information concerning the early development of adult education (e.g. lyceum, Chautauqua).

Handbook, 1948

By the time the 1948 handbook was published, adult education was beginning to achieve a visible, though often vague, identity. This handbook contained 555 pages, but only six references that were considered pertinent to definitions of adult education.

Bryson (1948) pointed out that adult education was defined in earlier times in a narrow sense; later, the American Association for Adult Education had looked for a new name to connote broader parameters such as "lifelong learning" (p. 3). Many proponents looked on adult education as a "normal part of normal life" (p. 4) and felt that adult education encompassed "whatever help can be got from recorded or communicated experiences of others" (p. 4).

In an article in the 1948 handbook, Hazard noted that the use of the particular term adult education was a fairly recent development in the United States, although in one form or other, adult education has been present in this country since its colonization. Brown (1948) added that education for families is a branch of adult education and that "it differs from general adult education in the specificity of its focus, objectives, and content" (p. 83).

In "Intercultural Education," Kotinsky (1948) explained that the definition of <u>adult education</u> is dependent upon exactly what activities are included under that term. According to Kotinsky, some individuals limit the meaning of adult education to "schooling at the adult level" (p. 103). Other activities such as law enforcement, civil rights, employment, housing, recreation, health and welfare are considered outside the delimited area. Others, however, describe adult education as adults learning how to deal best

with crucial problems in their lives, whether in a classroom or elsewhere.

Adult education has been present for many centuries as part of religious practice. The lifelong learning tradition has been present in Jewish history for 20 centuries (Goldman, 1948). In Protestant Christian churches, adult education is as old as the Christian movement itself having begun with Jesus, the Master Teacher (Swearingen, 1948). VanSant (1948) pointed out that adult education councils "are concerned with adult education--the education of all adults--because intelligent, public-spirited men and women see today that it is the adults who set the pace and stamp the pattern of life in every community" (p. 197).

Hewitt (1948) noted that adult education is sometimes seen as "little more than a repair service" (p. 240), or is viewed as a poor relation in the education family. However, Hewitt maintained that, even though it is the youngest member of the education family, adult education is by far the most important for two reasons: adults must be well prepared to teach future generations, and experience is essential for full understanding. Hallenbeck's article, previously reported in the Adult Education Journal, (1948a), appeared in the handbook (1948b) as well. Hallenbeck explained that "adult education is a function and a process, not an end" (p. 245) and, as such "becomes valid with reference to definite objectives" (p. 245).

Burch (1948) wrote of a company that attempted to do a documentary picture on adult education but was unable to find a "typical" American community program for adult education that provided all the varied activities specified. As a result of the experience, the company concluded that adult education, unlike formal education, "had never developed an institutional pattern" (p. 281) and that what occurred was a diffusion of responsibility for providing adult education opportunities. This seems to have been an important factor in the growth of adult education because it promoted flexibility and variety in total adult education offerings (Burch, 1948). The Library Association of Portland, Oregon, in describing their work noted that, "It is a basic assumption that all adult work is adult education, and that no part of it is more important than the day-to-day assistance to the general borrower in whatever field his needs or interests lie" (Notes on Representative Organizational Programs, 1948, p. 410).

Handbook, 1960

In the Editor's Preface of the Handbook of Adult Education in the United States, Knowles (1960a) pointed out that "As the format of the [handbook] series matured it came to be regarded as the basic reference work in the adult education field" (p. xi). It should be noted that the 1960 handbook has 624 pages, compared to the 555 pages in the

1948 handbook and that 16 references relating to definitions of adult education were noted.

In the first chapter, entitled "What is Adult Education?" Blakely (1960) noted that "Definitions of adult education in the United States are as multitudinous as the autumn leaves, yet none satisfies many persons engaged in it" (p. 3). Blakely pointed out that a complexity exists in adult education which traverses all degrees, from the most simple to the most advanced. He believed that adult education covers everything from education as an end in itself to education as a means to other ends.

Blakely (1960) explained that "Some activities are called adult education which should not be, and some of the best examples of adult education are not so regarded by those engaged in them" (p. 4). He believed that "adult education cannot be satisfactorily defined" (p. 4), but that adult education can be both formal and informal. He pointed out that adult education is the largest and the fastest growing segment of American education. "More important, much of adult education is becoming, not a 'making up,' but a 'keeping up' and a 'going ahead.'" (p. 5). At the end of his article, Blakely used the term continuing education and chose to ignore the term adult education until the last paragraph, where he stated: "in the pluralism of adult education we can find our common ground" (p. 6). In the article, "Historical Development of the Adult Education

Movement in the United States," Knowles (1960b) noted that "Until 1924 the term 'adult education' was practically unknown in this country; agencies engaged in educating adults were so unrelated they did not even have a common name for what they were doing" (p. 23).

According to Powell and Benne (1960) the phrase adult education was first used in the early 19th century in England and even today is deplored by some as being vague, meager, or repetitious. Kreitlow (1960) concluded his article by pointing out that since there is such a diversity in the field of adult education, much research comes from other disciplines or fields, and that this may continue to be so until "there is more clarity as to what adult education actually is" (p. 115).

Cotton (1960) studied the importance of "Public Understanding of Adult Education" using a two-page schedule with five main questions which were answered by 183 respondents. One question revealed that one of the main obstacles to the creation of a public image of adult education was the fact that no common image was accepted for definition. However, some respondents felt that progress was being made in the creation of a more accurate concept in the public mind "as to what adult education really is" (p. 132). Other respondents had difficulty understanding what the term adult education meant. Cotton concluded with the following statement: "today there is much more power behind

this thing called adult education because of the process
which does more than educate--it makes for a more abundant
life" (p. 136).

Verner (1960) confirmed what many have written earlier:
"The bulk of the material written about adult education is
difficult to classify into neat categories. For the most
part it is unimaginative and repetitive" (p. 169). He
added: "Much valuable literature relating to adult
education is not recognized as such because it appears under
the auspices of other disciplines" (p. 170).

Essert (1960) in "Foundations and Adult Education"
noted that, "In 1951 the Ford Foundation established the
Fund for Adult Education and assigned it a concern with
'that part of the total education which begins when
schooling was finished'" (p. 231). Later, he stated that

> In pursuing its objective of advancing the education of
> adults for responsible citizenship, the Fund for Adult
> Education has sought to conceptualize and implement a
> particular kind of education which it holds is
> peculiarly appropriate for the task,--what it has
> called "liberal adult education." (p. 234)

Caliver (1960), in the article "Adult Educational
Activities of Government Agencies," began with the following
assumptions:

> adult education is assumed to include all those
> government-sponsored organized learning activities, of
> all types and levels, including elementary, secondary,
> vocational-technical, collegiate, graduate, and
> professional, which are designed to assist adults to
> improve themselves and their occupational competencies,
> after their formal education has either been completed
> or interrupted. (p. 238)

Caliver maintained that much of the education, including training for military service personnel, may be classified as adult education.

Rogers (1960) noted, as Blakely did earlier in the handbook, that: "many people doing adult education work are not conscious of the fact and would not recognize their work by the label 'adult education'" (p. 275). Later, he stated that, "Taking the broadest possible definition of adult education--the education of adults!--the United Nations works as an educational institution" (p. 275).

In discussing the general adult education field, Mire (1960) asserted that: "Workers' education is an integral-- though separate--branch of adult education" (p. 298). This then makes labor education a valid part of adult education while at the same time setting it apart from it.

Luke (1960) pointed out, as some other writers of journal articles have done, that

> the concept of the adult education role of the public schools was primarily thought of as offering opportunities for immigrants from abroad to learn English or to enable boys and girls who had to leave school to go to work an opportunity to complete their formal education in night school. (p. 345)

With time, the adult education program in public schools was broadened from a remedial program to one presenting varying opportunities for employed adults to improve skills and study new trades. Because adult education in public schools was originally premised on the concept of meeting individual needs, early programs were aimed at remedial education or

increased vocational or civic competence. With time, Luke predicted, it should evolve into an increasing emphasis on meeting needs of the community.

In concluding an article, Hoffer (1960) described a questionnaire study which showed "that all the types of activities specified by the Adult Education Association as comprising adult education are carried on in social welfare agencies" (p. 376).

Birnbaum (1960) contended that some definitions of adult education "would rule out of the field any institutional setting other than those which are classroom-centered or those informal institutions which operate their programs after the classroom-centered model" (p. 379). Recently, some have "challenged the traditional definition of individual-centered education and have argued that community-centered adult education will ultimately be recognized as the field's unique function" (pp. 379-380).

Chapters in the 1960 handbook dealt with a variety of kinds of adult education and a number of specialized definitions, such as the following, were offered: (a) "academic education for adults shall be defined as that kind of education which <u>involves attainment of credit in a number of courses, is systematic and cumulative, and which leads to a certificate or a degree</u>" (Siegle, 1960, p. 393); (b) "health education is adult education in the most fundamental sense" (Roberts & Griffiths, 1960, p. 467); and (c) "'home

and family life education' is the term adopted by the section of the Adult Education Association as an all-inclusive term for any adult education that deals with the home or the family" (Lyle, 1960, p. 480).

Prendergast (1960) proposed that "Perhaps the distinction between adult education and adult recreation now lies not in the activity but in the sponsorship by school or recreation agency" (p. 528). He noted "the fact that adult recreation education has been allotted seven pages in this book is in itself an indication that the lines between adult recreation and adult education have become increasingly tenuous and flexible" (p. 528).

In "Present Trends and Future Strategies in Adult Education," Sheats (1960) explained that

> the marginality of adult education in the established
> institutional structure of our society has been
> ascribed in part to its "aimlessness," to its open-
> ended and opportunistic "service" approach, to its
> "cafeteria" offerings of whatever the public demands,
> to its policy of drift and absence of goal-
> directedness. (p. 554)

Sheats pointed out that "The concept of adult education as an instrument of planned social change is heralded as the sign of a new era" (p. 554), but he also pointed out that "...adult education can be used as an instrument of national control and enforced uniformity" (p. 555). Sheats emphasized the importance of adult education in our lives with the following conclusion to his article:

> A distinguished anthropologist has recently called for
> a whole new approach to education in which the vertical

approach to the transmission of knowledge will give way
to the lateral sharing of information and skills
between and among individuals at all age levels and at
various stages in their attainment of a formal
education: "We are now at the point where we must
educate people in what nobody knew yesterday, and
prepare people in our schools for what no one knows
yet, but what some people must know tomorrow" (pp. 560-
561).

Handbook, 1970

The 1970 handbook had three editors: Robert M. Smith,
George F. Akin, and J. R. Kidd. It was the fifth of a
series, earlier ones were published in 1934, 1936, 1948, and
1960. Sixteen references to adult education were found in
the 594 pages of this handbook. A number of articles that
contained discussions of goals of adult education,
approaches to a definition, and definitions of adult
education were included Although many of the articles did
not define adult education, they appear to play an important
role in how adult education is defined.

Although the preface to the handbook contained the
prediction of an imminent change in format because of the
rapidity with which the field was changing, the
organizational plan of the 1970 handbook was the same as
that of the one published in 1960. The editors noted, "the
field has become so broad and so complex as to require a
great deal of selectivity even in an encyclopedic work"
(Smith et al., 1970, p. x).

In the prologue, Knowles and DuBois (1970) noted that
the handbooks of adult education are considered valid

sources of data for answering the question of how the field

of adult education has been defined in its successive stages

of development. They also noted that the 1934 and 1936

handbooks had no real definitions of the field of adult

education, although a companion book edited by Mary L. Ely

in 1936 did present a conceptualization of the field. Their

brief analysis of content of the previous four handbooks

demonstrated the evolution of adult education as a field of

study and practice and of institutional arrangements in the

process of formation of identity. The editors of the

Handbook of Adult Education (1970) attempted to show shifts

in how the field of adult education was being defined, as

compared to earlier years (Knowles & DuBois, 1970).

The most comprehensive article on the definition of

adult education in any of the handbooks was Chapter 2 of the

1970 handbook. In this article, Schroeder (1970) pointed

out that "The early history of this country is fraught with

educational episodes which in retrospect may be labeled

adult education" (p. 25). Schroeder traced the development

of adult education through the centuries and noted that,

> Adult education, even prior to World War I, was on the
> way to broadening its clientele and its substantive and
> institutional bases. But the emphasis had been
> primarily remedial to make up those education
> deficiencies brought on by a lack of schooling. (p. 26)

Schroeder, who stressed that there had been a greater

emphasis on precision in defining adult education since

1930, believed that,

> If a profession is to emerge, a field of practice must develop clear career patterns, attain general recognition and acceptance by those who will be served, and identify a body of knowledge to profess--all three of which depend, in turn, on precision of definition. (p. 27)

Schroeder pointed out what other writers have said

concerning adult education:

> Some definitions have been broad and inclusive while others have been narrow and exclusive; some have been descriptive while others have been analytical. This diversity has undoubtedly been due in part to the inherent diversity of what is being defined. (p. 28)

He quotes Ziegler as saying:

> one cannot speak of "adult education" as one can speak of the public elementary and high school programs, and expect a common understanding of what is meant by the term. For in addition to the range of activities which comprise adult education, this branch of education has been and continues to be conducted by a multitude of contrasting institutions and agencies each providing according to its own plan (or) method. (p. 28)

In discussing the semantics of adult education versus

continuing education, Schroeder (1970) noted that some

people feel the terms to be synonymous while others feel

there are sharp lines of distinction between them. Those

who seem unable to decide can be found in a third group. He

believed that,

> at the operational level, it has become common for adult educators who function within the context of colleges and universities to refer to their activity as continuing education while referring to all other educative activities designed for adults as adult education. At the philosophical level another distinction has appeared--that continuing education identifies an ideal; whereas, adult education identifies a deliberate means (along with elementary, secondary and higher education) to facilitate the realization of that ideal. . . . continuing education is that idealistic and timeless conceptual thread that

connects all deliberate efforts to help the human
organism learn throughout life. (p. 28)

Schroeder (1970) discussed some of the issues which
have continued to confront educators throughout the years--
the issue of whether self-education or self-managed learning
should be included or excluded from the umbrella of adult
education. Confusion also arises because adult education
can be considered as a field of study or body of knowledge
and adult education can also be thought of as a field of
educational practice. As Schroeder pointed out, "There is
still no single definition universally accepted by adult
educators nor is there a universally held public image of
adult education" (p. 29). Each individual, whether layman
or educator, tends to define adult education within the
boundaries of his or her own experience. Schroeder proposed
a way of classifying definitions based on a framework
adapted from the work of Upton and Samson which uses three
major categories: Definition by classification, by
structure analysis and by operational analysis.

Schroeder's (1970) first group of definitions fall
under those called definition by classification. "A
classification definition includes genus and species terms
as well as statements that tend to differentiate the species
from its genus" (p. 29). Jensen (cited in Schroeder, 1970)
saw adult learning as the genus while he identified two
species of adult learning as that which occurs in a "natural
societal setting" and that which occurs in the context of

"learning organizations." While the first is not consciously directed, the second is, and results in a consciously controlled affair having less of the stimuli and complexities seen in daily life.

Bryson (cited in Schroeder, 1970) also used a definition based on classification when he described "adult education as 'all the activities with an educational purpose that are carried on by people, engaged in the ordinary business of life'" (p. 29).

Schroeder (1970) explained how Blakely, like a number of others, used education as the genus in his definition: "I would take the adjective off adult education and preserve the unqualified noun education for the process of deliberately educed growth regardless of the person" (p. 30). He named adult education as the species. In furnishing a differentiation for the species, he stated: "the mature person more consciously holds the objective and more consciously experiences and more deliberately directs the process" (p. 30).

Schroeder (1970) pointed out Reeves, Fansler and Houle suggested "that adult education is 'any purposeful effort toward self-development carried on by an individual without direct legal compulsion and without such efforts becoming his major field of activity'" (p. 30).

The last example of a definition by classification is one given by Sworder (cited in Schroeder, 1970). Sworder

added some additional aspects in his definition stating

that:

> the substance of the activity is related to the social
> roles of adults; the activity is variable in terms of
> the time span covered, the format used and the
> environment in which it is found; and the activity is
> "dynamic" in nature. (p. 30)

A second method for categorizing definitions of adult

education is definition by structure analysis. As Schroeder

(1970) explained:

> Through this type of definition, the functional parts
> of a structure are identified, described and related to
> form a Gestalt or functional unit. The parts commonly
> isolated--by such authors as Houle . . . Knowles . . .
> Verner and Booth . . . are leadership, goals, content,
> processes, agencies, program areas, and clientele. (p.
> 30)

He believed that this kind of category describes fairly well

the efforts put forth to devise typologies for adult

education.

"To identify and order adult education has been no

small task" (Schroeder, 1970, p. 30). In order to show how

the complexity of the agency and the program dimensions are

overwhelming, Schroeder cited a statement by Ziegler who

believed that adult education today includes:

> The credit and non-credit or "informal" courses at all
> institutions of higher education open to adults;
> programs of public schools, evening high schools and
> junior colleges; the secretarial and vocational work
> offered at commercial schools; the technical and
> management courses given by technical institutions and
> professional graduate schools as well as by business,
> religious, fraternal, professional and public affairs
> organizations, associations and clubs; the religious
> education, public affairs forums, and creative arts
> courses to be found in many churches and synagogues;
> the lectures, films, discussion groups, art fairs and

music festivals offered by public libraries, museums,
and other civic institutions; the home demonstration
and technical-agricultural work provided by the
Cooperative Extension Service; the courses offered by
government agencies and the armed forces to government
employees (and others); the field of community
development; education by television, the Commercial
Correspondence schools and home-study departments of
many universities; and finally, the enormous and
increasing amount of independent self-study or self-
education. (p. 31)

Taking each subsection under structure analysis,

Schroeder (1970) explained each one. Under leadership,

there are three main kinds of organizations which provide

means of giving direction and leadership to adult education.

These three are: "graduate programs of adult education . .

. governmental and philanthropic organizations and

professional associations" (p. 31).

Because the development of adult education was based,

to a large extent, on the special interests and needs of

individuals, adult education can be defined or described by

goals. Liveright (cited in Schroeder, 1970) identified four

major goals: "occupational, vocational and/or professional

competence; personal and family living competence; social

and civic responsibility; and self-fulfillment" (p. 33).

One of the problems in identifying adult education according

to goals has been that goals are derived from two sources:

individual needs or societal needs. Some educators define

adult education according to individual goals. Blakely

(cited in Schroeder, 1970) belongs to this class:

I accept as the purpose of adult education the
fostering of the growth of what is individual in each

human being and the harmonizing of individuality with social unity, which unity should be based on a respect for individuality. (p. 33)

Kallen (cited in Schroeder, 1970) suggested that "basic to a philosophy of adult education is the premise that education of the adult is the recognition of his individuality, and that education should be the enabling, creating, and maturing of an on-going process of self-differentiation" (p. 33). In trying to identify an all inclusive goal for adult education Hallenbeck (cited in Schroeder, 1970) suggested that "the goal of adult education should be the 'mature personality'. . . a person who is able to live creatively with the 'persistent paradoxes of human existence; stability and flexibility, balance and activity, conviction and uncertainty, steadfastness and tolerance'" (p. 34). This goal, by specifying the final objective would serve as a basis for bringing all parts of adult education together.

Schroeder (1970) identified another subset of structure analysis--content--which has neither horizontal nor vertical limits. In studying content of various adult education activities, Johnstone and Rivera (cited in Schroeder, 1970) found the "vocational area to be the most prominent, representing approximately one-third" (p. 34). Another aspect of structure analysis can be considered under processes or methodology, sometimes treated as synonymous. However, Booth (cited in Schroeder, 1970) who identified

three separate parts of process, listed method as first,
technique as second, and device as third. Other factors
considered in structure analysis of adult education,
according to Schroeder, are "individual leadership, agency
bases, program areas and the adult clientele" (pp. 36-37).

A third type of definition of adult education is found
under operation analysis and consists of those definitions
in which "words to be defined are the names of operations"
(p. 39). "Operation analysis seems to describe most closely
the efforts of those who have referred to adult education as
a process with a purpose and a system of elements or
suboperations" (Schroeder, 1970, p. 39).

Verner, (cited in Schroeder, 1970) in defining adult
education in this way, stated that

> Adult education is a relationship between an
> educational agent and a learner in which the agent
> selects, arranges, and continuously directs a sequence
> of progressive tasks that provide systematic experience
> to achieve learning for those whose participation in
> such activities is subsidiary and supplemental to a
> primary productive role in society. (pp. 39-40)

Essert (cited in Schroeder, 1970) also defined adult
education in an operation analysis manner:

> Adult education is an experience of maturing,
> voluntarily selected by people whose major occupation
> is no longer that of going to school or college, in
> which these individuals or groups plan meaningful tasks
> and apply sustained inquiry to them. . . . the major
> portion of adult education in the nation is engaged in
> helping people meet their individual needs as they are
> interpreted by individuals themselves. (p. 40)

Houle (cited in Schroeder, 1970) also offered a
definition which falls under operation analysis:

> adult education is the process by which men and women
> (alone or in groups) attempt to improve themselves by
> increasing their skills or knowledge, developing their
> insights or appreciations or changing their attitudes;
> or the process by which individuals or agencies attempt
> to change men and women in these ways. (p. 40)

An extensive bibliography is provided at the end of
Schroeder's article, many titles of which imply sources of
definitions of adult education (Schroeder, 1970, pp. 40-41).

In the third chapter of the 1970 handbook, Liveright
and Ohliger repeat Jessup and Coles' announcement in 1967
that "there is no internationally accepted definition of
adult education " (pp. 46-47). However, they report that
educators meeting in New Hampshire to compare information
regarding adult education agreed on the following
"potentially acceptable international definition of adult
education" (p. 47):

> Adult education is a process whereby persons who no
> longer attend school on a regular and full-time basis
> (unless full-time programs are especially designed for
> adults) undertake sequential and organized activities
> with the conscious intention of bringing about changes
> in information, knowledge, understanding, or skills,
> appreciation and attitudes; or for the purpose of
> identifying and solving personal or community problems.
> (p. 47)

Liveright and Ohliger (1970) pointed out that, "At
UNESCO and in many countries 'adult education' is used as a
generic term meaning 'the education of men and women' and
includes any form of education" (p. 47). They reported that
UNESCO's efforts to emphasize a concept that adult education
is closely allied to "lifelong integrated education" was
gaining popularity.

In "Philosophical Considerations," White (1970)
admitted that "adult education is a practical art--an art
dedicated to changing the behavior of humans" (p. 121).
White discussed Kallen's four essays in which he looked at
adult education from the eyes of a social philosopher.
Kallen (cited in White, 1970) viewed "adult education as a
means of freeing the adult mind" (p. 131). He emphasized
the role of the teacher as a facilitator and quoted Lao-tzo,
substituting for "leader" the word "teacher":

> A leader is best
> When people barely know he exists.
> Not so good when people obey and acclaim him,
> Worst when they despise him
> 'Fail to honor the people,,
> They fail to honor you';
> But of a good leader, who talks little,
> When his work is done, his aim fulfilled
> They will say, "We did it ourselves." (p. 131)

Kreitlow (1970) described adult education as "a
'following field of study,'" (p. 146) which has, for a long
time, been sitting at the margin of schools and
universities. Only recently, has adult education developed
its own structure and identity.

In a discussion of adult education, Miller (1970) noted
that "Growing and maturing as it [adult education] is, the
field strikes one as amorphous" (p. 154).

The second part of the 1970 handbook contains
information related to the institutions and agencies which
provide adult education in one form or another. It consists
of chapters covering the various specialized kinds of adult

education. The definitions in this part of the handbook are
most often aimed at specific subject area that are
discussed.

Griffith (1970) quoted Frank Jessup's statement that,
"the field of adult education could be described either as a
rich profusion, or as a muddle" (p. 173). He also pointed
out that "legislators view adult education as a means of
accomplishing social purposes" (p. 180), and that "adult
education has been more a movement than a profession" (p.
186).

Haygood (1970) disagreed with some educators:

One cannot equate the terms <u>adult education</u> with
<u>extension</u> or <u>evening college</u> programs. . . . the term
<u>continuing education</u>, which implies the concept of
lifelong learning, is often used to designate
administrative units which contain evening college and
extension functions but which only incidentally stress
continuous learning. (p. 194)

In discussing the number of adults who regularly
participate in public library adult education services,
Monroe (1970) noted "that the 'adult education' aspect of
these services varies in intensity so that a form of service
(e.g., the exhibit) might be considered adult education on a
particular occasion and be almost void of any educational
element on another occasion" (p. 252).

Brodsky (1970) in his article claimed that "the
Department of Defense . . . conducts the world's largest
adult education programs" (p. 283). He pointed out that the

scope of adult education offered in the service is so broad
that:

> If one accepts the definition of Verner that [adult
> education is] ". . . a relationship . . . in which the
> agent selects, arranges, and continuously directs a
> sequence of progressive tasks that provide systematic
> experience to achieve learning for whose participation
> in such activities is subsidiary and supplemental to a
> primary productive role in society," . . . most of the
> training and education provided by DOD may be
> considered adult education. (p. 285)

Rogin (1970) described a branch of adult education known as
labor education which he considered synonymous with workers'
education in this country (p. 301).

Nadler (1970) suggested that "any definition of the
word training would be very close to some of the accepted
definitions of adult education" (p. 315). In addition, he
repeated the following definition by Liveright:

> Adult education is a process through which persons no
> longer attending school on a regular, full-time basis
> undertake activities with the conscious intention of
> bringing about changes in information, knowledge,
> understanding, skills, appreciation, and attitudes.
> (p. 315)

Nadler also perceived some difficulties in defining terms
relating to education and training in that "not all those
engaged in training activities even agree they are
functioning in the field of adult education" (p. 316).

In an article on religious institutions and their
involvement in adult education, Stokes (1970) quoted Father
Villas:

> The term "adult education" is a relatively new phrase,
> new concept and new concern for the educational program
> of the contemporary Orthodox Church. In Orthodox

circles the term "education" is usually equated with
the younger generation. . . . Rarely is education
conceived as an ongoing process that begins in the
early years and continues on into later life. (pp. 358-
359)

Cortwright and Brice (1970) included a discussion of

adult basic education which has been defined in the Standard

Terminology for Instruction in Local and State School

Systems as:

Instruction in communicative, computational and social
skills for adults whose inability to effectively use
these skills substantially impairs their getting or
retaining employment commensurate with their real
ability, in order to lessen or eliminate such
inability, raise their level of education, and enable
them to become more productive and responsible
citizens. This usually is considered to include
instruction for adults whose educational attainment is
below the eighth grade level. (pp. 407-408)

The emphasis in this definition is not in the basic reading

skill or basic computational skill, but in a knowledge of

these skills (p. 408). Whereas before the 1960s, adult

basic education was considered a "struggling infant of adult

education" (p. 409), after 1960, more people recognized the

great need for educating adults in the basic skills. It was

at this time that adult education became a direct concern of

the federal government (p. 409).

Another area of adult education was defined by

Hendrickson and Hendrickson (1970) as follows:

Education for family living is that branch of adult
education which deals specifically with the values,
principles and practices of family life. It has for
its general objectives the enrichment of family
experience through the more skillful participation of
all family members in the life of the family group.

Its offerings include learning opportunities for both sexes and all ages. (p. 442)

Hendrickson and Hendrickson (1970) provided the National Commission of Family Relations of the National Council of Family Relations' more recent and comprehensive definition:

Family life education is a fairly new educational specialty but one for which there is a steadily increasing demand. It is a multi-professional area of study which is developing its philosophy, content, and methodology from direct experience with families and the collaboration of such disciplines as home economics, social work, law, psychology, sociology, economics, biology, physiology, religion, anthropology, philosophy and medicine. (p. 443)

Hendrickson and Hendrickson (1970) concluded their article by pointing out that

family life education, like the adult education field of which it is a part, is extremely diverse in both its theoretical and its practical aspects. This diversity has prevented any clear definition of the field. This, in turn, has created problems in financial support and in coordination of programs. (p. 452)

An article by Charters (1970) confirmed what many adult educators believe: "One concept adult educators have held in common is that education should be viewed as a process extending over the life span" (p. 488). Many have regarded adult education as a luxury or a remedial activity; a view which is slowly changing in an effort to take full advantage of the concept of adult education (p. 488).

Jensen (1970) acknowledged that progress in adult or continuing education has been made and that adult education today is often thought to have as its purpose self-

fulfillment of students; that is, "the chief task of adult education is to help the individual become all that he or she is capable of becoming" (p. 515).

Analysis of Findings

The analysis of findings provided in this section follows the research questions as they were presented in Chapter 1. The research questions developed for this study are the following:

1. How prevalent (how frequent) are definitions in adult education?

2. How extensive (scope, range) are the definitions?

3. Is any one specific definition accepted by a majority of writers?

4. Can these definitions be organized or classified into specific categories?

5. How have definitions of adult education changed over a period of time?

Considering each question separately, the following analyses were completed:

Question 1: How prevalent are the definitions of adult education?

More definitions (201) were found in the journals than in the handbooks (82); however, more than 11,000 pages were read for definitions in the journals whereas only 1,773 pages were covered in the handbooks. In actuality, more definitions were found in the handbooks, based on pages

read: one definition for every 22 pages as compared to one definition for every 55 pages of journal readings. Definitions found in the handbooks were more than twice as prevalent as those found in journals. Knowles' comment (1960) that handbooks have come "to be regarded as the basic reference work in the adult education field" (p. xi) may explain why handbooks contain more definitions of adult education.

Question 2: How extensive are the definitions?

This question is closely related to question 4. Because in categorizing or classifying definitions, one can see the scope or range of the definitions, question 2 will be answered after question 4.

Question 3: Is any one specific definition accepted by a majority of writers?

No one specific definition is accepted by a majority of writers; however, several writers (Brodsky, 1970; Dickinson, 1978; Lloyd, 1972; Schroeder, 1970) cite one or more of the evolving definitions by Verner.

Question 4: Can these definitions be organized or classified into specific categories?

Although a number of methods for classifying definitions of adult education exist, a modification of Scheffler's classification was considered to be best suited for this study. As explained in Chapter 3, Scheffler's

Classification was expanded and includes the following five different categories:

1. Negative definitions--what adult education is not.

2. Amorphous, nebulous and broad, general definitions--those comments which state that adult education cannot be defined or a definition so broad as to be meaningless.

3. Stipulative definitions--also thought of as specialized definitions, ones pertaining to a specific situation.

4. Descriptive definitions--those which propose to describe what is being defined, usually the definitions in common usage.

5. Programmatic definitions--those used in stating serious moral choices that tell what should be done rather than what is actually being done, the ideal (Scheffler, 1960).

Because of the amount of data collected, the answer to this question has been divided into two separate parts--one consists of a categorization of journal findings and the other a categorization of handbook findings. The categorization of journal findings is shown in Table 1.

Table 1

Classification of Journal Data

Definition Category	Journal of Adult Education	Adult Education Journal	Adult Education
1. Negative	3	0	10
2. Amorphous or very broad	4	4	38
3. Stipulative	3	4	45
4. Descriptive	2	5	36
5. Programmatic	3	6	38

Sixteen citations in the journals did not actually define adult education, but were considered pertinent to the topic under discussion. For example, Mauer (cited in "Minorities--and Democracy," 1939) attempted to show the differences between adult education and worker's education. (p. 305).

While some sources included only one definition per reference, others provided multiple definitions which often fell into different categories. For instance, Stubblefield's article (1976) had multiple definitions which could be categorized in a number of ways: one definition was classified as negative; several were considered stipulative, two were descriptive and some were also considered programmatic. However, all four of Verner's definitions were either descriptive or programmatic. For example, Verner's (cited in Dickinson, 1978) definition:

> Adult education is any planned and organized
> activity provided by an individual, an
> institution, or any other social instrumentality
> that is intended specifically to assist an adult
> to learn and which is under the immediate and
> continuing supervision of an instructional agent
> who manages the conditions for learning in such a
> way as to facilitate the successful achievement of
> the learning objectives. (p. 225)

This definition was categorized as descriptive because it

attempts to describe what is being defined and as

programmatic because it states the desired outcome, which is

the management of "conditions of learning in such a way as

to facilitate the successful achievement of the learning

objectives" (p. 225). It is important to note that many

definitions either state or imply self-directed learning as

part of adult education. However, Verner's four evolving

definitions all exclude self-directed learning which implies

that one aspect (adult education is not self-directed

learning) could be called a negative definition (Dickinson,

1978).

Category 1--Negative definitions include definitions

such as Wriston's (1940) which specifies what will be

excluded in the definition of adult education, or what adult

education in this specific case is not: "In dealing with

adult education, I shall exclude training for the activities

by which an adult seeks to improve his vocational

efficiency, though I would not even by inference, appear to

deprecate such activity" (p. 238).

Rockhill's (1976) definition is very explicit about what adult education is not: "Adult education is not synonymous with an institution or a set of institutions nor is it coterminous with a level or fourth tier of learning" (p. 197).

Category 2--Abstract or broad definitions appeared in all three journals--from 1940 to 1979. This leads to the belief that even time has not clarified the definitions of adult education for many people.

In 1940, Boyle observed: "Adult education is an abstract term, and as such it has become so extraordinarily elastic as to be meaningless" (p. 158). In that same year, Cartwright (1940) noted that, "It [AAAE] continued to assert that adult education was so broad a field as to defeat any attempt to say specifically what it did or should include, much less to say what it did or should exclude" (p. 264). In 1949, Starr stated that "adult education in the United States, and more so in a world survey, is a veritable mosaic" (p. 217). Royall (1954) confirmed the observations of others about the abstractness of the definition of adult education: "It is almost impossible to define the expression, 'adult education'" (p. 94).

Later definitions tended less toward nebulous and amorphous and became broad, extremely general terms (e.g., fourth level, lifelong learning). In 1956, adult education was defined in an indirect manner when it was called a

fourth level ("A Community Program of Adult Education").

Earlier, Blakely (1952) had indirectly described adult

education as a fourth level when he stated:

> If the American people clearly see the need to turn
> their energies and talents to the "fourth level" of
> education, one for which primary, secondary, and higher
> education exist to prepare us, they will do so with
> characteristic zeal and creativity. (p. 8)

In 1957, Blakely modified this definition with the

statement that adult education is more than a fourth level

above elementary, secondary, and higher education. Blakely

described adult education as "the test of all other levels--

the test of whether the process of growth has really been

begun. Looked at in this way, it is the end of life" (p.

95).

Sheats (cited in "What Is Adult Education," 1955) also

noted that adult education "may be conceived of as a fourth

level of education opportunity, it, more than elementary,

secondary, or higher education, uses the educational

process, without external or arbitrary limitations as to

content or method for groups whose members are voluntary

participants" (p. 135). Stensland (cited in "What Is Adult

Education," 1955) began an essay on adult education as

follows: "Adult education is proclaimed the fourth level of

education in a mature society which takes for granted that

learning is lifelong" (pp. 136-137).

Gnagey (1964a) also defined adult education as lifelong

learning with the following: "If adult education is to live

up to its true meaning, which it defines as lifelong learning" (p. 177).

Fleece (1960) gave a broad definition of adult education when he pointed out: "People who see mankind in this beneficent light tend to think of adult education as a supermarket where each can choose for himself from among varying products and varying brands of the same product" (p. 183). Along these same lines, Carlson (1972) noted that adult education has often been thought of as "an educational service station. . . . as a cafeteria where the adult picks and chooses what he wants" (p. 291). In 1977, however, Carlson reverted to a type of definition seen during the early years of adult education: "Leaders of the field had long been aware . . . of the concern of those responsible for granting public and foundation funds that adult education was a 'vast, amorphous, undefined field without any unified or consistent aim'" (p. 53).

Category 3--Stipulative definitions were most often found in the articles; that is, writers tend to use the term adult education to fit their own needs in specific situations. The majority of definitions tended to be given and used in a social context (social purpose, social control, social work, social change, etc.).

Early stipulative definitions included Adam's (1939) assertion that "adult education is something more than an intellectual opiate for the governed masses. It represents

a definite method of social control, an essential framework

for political democracy" (p. 71). Locke (1947) pointed out

that, at one time (quoting Starr), "adult education was

largely confined to naturalization for citizenship, and to

removing illiteracy" (p. 107). Later, adult education was

seen as an agent for change.

Royall (1954) stated:

> It is my belief that adult education can be best
> defined generally as a type of communication within the
> open society whose proximate objective is the creation
> of sub-communities within that society, these sub-
> communities being created for the continuous solution
> of the essentially unpredictable problems which arise
> in an open society. The ultimate objective of adult
> education is the transformation of the entire open
> society itself into the pattern of a great university.
> (p. 95)

Lloyd (1972) noted that the term adult education can be

used in at least three ways: (a) social change, referring

to self-improvement in individuals; (b) improvement within

institutions enabling them to function more effectively; and

(c) the radical restructuring of society necessary to bring

about basic changes desired.

Some authors used adult education and continuing

education as synonyms (Bass, 1972; Verner, 1960b; Wientge,

1966). A number of definitions given concerned specific

areas--public health, business, vocational aspects (Houle,

1957; Lowe, 1962; "Specialized Programs," 1940).

Schwertman (1955) demonstrated how stipulative

definitions can vary when he described adult education as

being "like quicksilver--that is if touched one way it

becomes labor education; if touched another, it becomes religion; and if touched another, it can become something else, possibly psychology or sociology" (p. 78).

Jayne and Gibb (1955) pointed out that consultants often view adult education in a number of ways: some view it as a matter of curriculum program, others as a community action program, still others as broad forces of social change. Some individuals see it as a way of satisfying community needs and helping find their own solutions to perceived problems. Others may originally see adult education as an organized effort to manipulate persons and later perceive it as an intrinsic community force.

In the review of London's and Wenkert's essay, "Some Reflections on Defining Adult Education," Whipple (1963) best expresses what comprises a stipulative definition with the statement: The purpose of adult education "must be to educate, and it is adult education if the organizer says so--in other words, it depends upon the major purpose of the programmer rather than the students who take the course" (Whipple, 1963, p. 243).

McMahon, Coates, and Knox (1968) viewed such stipulative definitions as a hindrance to the full development of adult education and pointed out the fact that adult education is usually identified with specific segments or forms of education in which adults are involved. Adult education has become stereotyped as formal night school,

vocational training, hobby instruction, Americanization classes, or other specific learning activities. Long's article (1973) illustrates Pasquale's use of adult education in a stipulative manner with the statement that "all college education and all apprenticeship (except that of involuntary bound apprentices) [is] adult education" (p. 133).

A few of the stipulative definitions also had programmatic components. An example, by Stubblefield (1976), stated that adult educators first recognized education as the dissemination of knowledge and information, then proposed that it should cultivate an intelligent response to public problems.

Category 4--Descriptive definitions are usually the ones found in common usage that actually describe what a term is or means. Definitions of this category were found in the <u>Journal of Adult Education</u>, the <u>Adult Education Journal</u>, and <u>Adult Education</u>.

Several definitions found in "What Is Adult Education? Nine Working Definitions" (1955), were categorized as descriptive. Sworder considered adult education "as an educational program that is planned and organized to assist adults in meeting their responsibilities as individuals and as members of society" (p. 135). According to Hallenbeck, the descriptive definition used by Lyman Bryson is still a useful one: "Adult education includes all the activities

with an educational purpose that are carried on by people outside the ordinary business of life" (p. 132).

Another example of a descriptive definition was that of Rockhill (1976), who stated: "Essentially, it is my view that adult education is a `Systematic Adult Learning Experience.' . . . A very simple and straight forward definition, it can easily be remembered by the acronym, SALE" (p. 200). She then explained,

> To be systematic an experience must be of some duration, with a learning objective and some criterion of fulfillment implied, whether defined by the learner or the provider. . . . Random learning is eliminated but all occasions of "I want to know . . ." or "you will learn . . ." are included. (p. 200)

Category 5--A few definitions in the journal readings fell only under the programmatic category. Kaufman's (1957) definition is such an example: "Adult education has been defined as education to `help adults live more successfully'" (p. 18). Later, in 1972, Carlson talked of Kellor, who "wanted adult education to be a science with final indestructible definitions and principles . . . and . . . finally approved methods'" (p. 296).

Mixed definitions--Quite a few definitions were found to be both descriptive and programmatic. This confirms Elias and Merriam's (1980) observation, mentioned earlier, that because education is a value-laden concept, definitions often include both descriptive and programmatic elements.

An example of a descriptive-programmatic definition is found in the article, "What Is Adult Education? Nine

Working Definitions" (1955) when Sworder asked the question?
"What is adult education?" (p. 136). He then proceeded to
answer the question: "Through a planned and organized
process of education, it is a way in which we . . . can
think better, work better, and live better" (p. 136). While
this is a descriptive definition, at the same time one can
see that it may be an ideal rather than an actual
description of what occurs.

An analysis of data collected from the handbooks of
adult education, 1948, 1960, and 1970 is provided in Table
2.

Table 2

Classification of Handbook Data

Definition Category	1948	1960	1970
1. Negative	1	1	4
2. Amorphous or very broad	4	7	12
3. Stipulative	2	10	12
4. Descriptive	2	3	12
5. Programmatic	2	3	7

Fourteen references concerning data found in handbooks
did not actually give definitions of adult education but
were cited because of their relevancy to the subject. While

some references in the handbooks had only one definition, others provided multiple definitions (e.g., Schroeder's article in 1970 discussed more than 20 different definitions, classified in all five categories, including one which was categorized as both descriptive and programmatic). Sheats' article in the 1960 handbook grouped definitions into four different categories. Several definitions found in the handbooks, including those of Blakely (1960), Hallenbeck (1948b), and Verner (1960) had appeared also in journal articles.

Categorization using a modified version of Scheffler's system revealed the following examples of all categories in the handbooks:

Category 1--Haygood (1970) gave a definition which fell under the negative category when he stated: "One cannot equate the term <u>adult education</u> with <u>extension</u> or <u>evening college programs</u>" (p. 194).

In the 1948 <u>handbook</u>, Hallenbeck stated both a broad general definition and a negative one when he stated: "adult education is a function and a process, not an end" (p. 245).

Category 2--As stated earlier, a great number of definitions fell in the amorphous and/or broad, general category. An example was that of VanSant (1948), who referred to adult education as "the education of all adults" (p. 197).

Sheats (1960) referred to adult education as being marginal and aimless, "to its open-ended and opportunistic 'service' approach, to its 'cafeteria' offerings of whatever the public demands, to its policy of drift and absence of goal-directedness" (p. 554).

The Preface of the handbook in 1970 described adult education as being "so broad and so complex as to require a great deal of selectivity even in an encyclopedic work" (Smith, et al., p. x).

Category 3--Brown (1948) used adult education in a stipulative manner in his discussion of education for family as a branch of adult education. Hewitt (1948) and several others (Charters, 1970; Luke, 1960; Schroeder, 1970) pointed out that adult education has been viewed as "little more than a repair service" (p. 240). A "repair service" implies remedial education of some sort; therefore, this definition could be classified as stipulative.

Category 4--An example of a descriptive definition was found in an article by Liveright and Ohliger (1970) who gave a definition first proposed at a New Hampshire meeting of educators:

> Adult education is a process whereby persons who no longer attend school on a regular and full-time basis (unless full-time programs are especially designed for adults) undertake sequential and organized activities with the conscious intention to bring about changes in information, knowledge, understanding, or skills, appreciation and attitudes; or for the purpose of identifying and solving personal or community problems. (p. 47)

Category 5--A strictly programmatic definition was given by Jensen (1970), who explained that adult education today is often thought to have as its purpose self-fulfillment of students (p. 513); that is, "the chief task of adult education is to help the individual become all that he or she is capable of becoming" (p. 515).

Mixed--Many of the programmatic definitions found in the handbooks must be classified as "mixed definitions." They contain elements of the programmatic as well as elements of another category--usually descriptive or stipulative. An example of this was found in the discussion on adult education versus continuing education in Schroeder's article (1970):

> At the philosophical level another distinction has appeared--that continuing education identifies an ideal; whereas, adult education identifies a deliberate means (along with elementary, secondary and higher education) to facilitate the realization of that ideal . . . continuing education is that idealistic and timeless conceptual thread that connects all deliberate efforts to help the human organism learn throughout life. (p. 28)

This definition can be categorized as both stipulative and programmatic.

Question 2: How extensive (scope, range) are the definitions?

Overall, based on an analysis of data collected, there was a predominance of definitions in the journals that fell under the stipulative or specialized category. This is also true of handbook findings; that is, stipulative definitions

were found most often although amorphous or broad definitions ran a close second (24 versus 23 references). One stipulative definition per 74 pages was found in the handbooks and one stipulative definition per 212 pages was found in the journals. This is the definition most often given to fit the needs of participants or adult educators in specific situations.

The second most frequently encountered definition fell into two different categories when comparing journal and handbook findings: the handbooks contained more amorphous or general definitions, and the journals contained more programmatic definitions. However, a difference of only one definition was found between the numbers of programmatic and amorphous definitions found in journals (47 programmatic and 46 amorphous).

In both handbooks and journals, definitions falling under negative definitions, comprised the smallest number noted: 6 in handbooks and 13 in journals.

In the most comprehensive article found in any of the three handbooks, Schroeder (1970) provided definitions which fell into all five categories. A negative definition was identified when he pointed out that the question had been brought up as to whether self-education or self-managed learning should fall under adult education (e.g., adult education in some definitions may include or exclude self-education and/or self-managed learning). He also noted that

some proponents have, in the past, considered adult education as synonymous with continuing education while others have felt strongly that there are sharp lines of distinction between them. Schroeder (1970) also noted that "Some definitions have been broad and inclusive while others have been narrow and exclusive" (p. 28).

Schroeder (1970) quoted Ziegler in showing how adult education is often used in a stipulative manner: "this branch has been and continues to be conducted by a multitude of contrasting institutions and agencies each providing according to its own plan (or) method" (p. 28).

An example of a definition of adult education being descriptive was that of Reeves, Fansler and Houle (cited in Schroeder, 1970), who suggested "that adult education is 'any purposeful effort toward well-development carried on by an individual without direct legal compulsion and without such efforts becoming his major field of activity'" (p. 30).

One of the best examples given by Schroeder (1970) of a programmatic definition of adult education was one by Blakely: "I would take the adjective off adult education and preserve the unqualified noun education for the process of deliberately educed growth regardless of the person " (p. 30). Adult education is the species and in furnishing a differentiation for the species, "the mature person more consciously holds the objective and more consciously

experiences and more deliberately directs the process" (p. 30).

Schroeder (1970) provided a definition of adult education, which could be considered both descriptive and programmatic when he stated,

> According to Houle adult education is the process by which men and women . . . attempt to improve themselves by increasing their skills or knowledge, developing their insights or appreciations or changing their attitudes; or the process by which individuals or agencies attempt to change men and women in these ways" (p. 40).

In reviewing the categorization of definitions, I believe the first three categories, negative definitions, amorphous and very broad, and stipulative (specialized), are of no value in attempting to arrive at one universally accepted definition of adult education. It seems more appropriate, apposite, and germane that a combination of descriptive and programmatic elements be utilized in formulating a definition that not only describes what adult education is, but also what it should be, while at the same time allowing for future growth.

Question 5: How have definitions of adult education changed over a period of time?

As stated earlier, Schroeder in the Handbook of Adult Education (1970) tried to point out how the field of adult education has changed over the years. Schroeder (1970) noted that early adult education was primarily remedial and that over the years the field expanded to such an extent

that no "universally held public image of adult education"
(p. 29) existed. Schroeder explained that each individual,
(layman or educator) tended to define education within the
boundaries of his or her own experience.

Dickinson (1978) illustrated how the definition of
adult education has changed in some aspects, with Verner's
four definitions of adult education: in 1959, 1962, 1964,
and 1974. Verner's definition in 1959 stated that
"systematic learning is provided through the establishment
and maintenance of a direct exchange relationship between
the learner . . . and the education agent" (p. 225). By
1974, Verner's emphasis appeared to be on the type of
organized activity and the role of the provider or
educational agent.

In some definitions of adult education, the focus has
been on the participant, the educator and their
relationship; in others, emphasis has been on the fact that
adult education is a field of study.

In comparing definitions of adult education over the 40
years chronicled in this study, it appears that early
definitions often referred only to the literacy of
immigrants and subsequent naturalization for citizenship.
As time passed, it appears that a fear of confining or
restricting the definition resulted in the use of broad,
general, often frustrating and confusing definitions. Later
many writers used the definitions of adult education in

stipulative or specialized manners to better fit their needs in specific situations at particular times. Still later, descriptive and programmatic definitions appeared, although many writers continue to use adult education in a stipulative manner.

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSIONS, IMPLICATIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS

The overwhelming conclusion of the study of data collected and analyzed in the journals and handbooks is that adult education does not have one universally accepted definition.

This study may be somewhat reassuring to students entering the field for the first time because they are able to conclude:

1. There is no one clear-cut definition of adult education.

2. There are many different definitions of adult education.

3. It appears extremely unlikely that there will emerge a universally accepted definition for adult education in the near future.

4. A challenge remains for all people working or interested in adult education to band together and attempt to reach a conclusion as to a definition of adult education, either one universally accepted definition or the recognition that no one definition can be formulated.

As was pointed out in Chapter 1, historical research of adult education definitions can be useful in several ways. This study enables one to see that the wide diversity of

definitions may stem from the fact that although adult
education in one form or another has been around for
hundreds of years, it was not labeled adult education until
the early part of the 20th century. Even today the term
adult education quite often is defined in a stipulative or
specialized manner to suit specific situations.

As stated earlier, both Elias and Merriam (1980) and
Peers (1958) noted the unevenness of types of education based
on philosophical values (liberal, progressive). This may
explain in part why it is so difficult for adult educators
to reach a consensus on definitions of adult education.

By being aware of the diverse opinions and lack of
agreement on one universally accepted definition for adult
education, it is hoped that adult educators may have a
better chance of reaching partial if not complete agreement
on what that definition should be. Studying the diversity
of definitions should aid adult educators in determining
guidelines for future practices in adult education and help
in identifying potential trends.

Adult education was developed, and has evolved, to meet
the needs of adults. This has been repeatedly pointed out
by writers over the years. Sharer (1953) reiterated what is
found throughout many of the journals when he stated: "Many
attempts have been made to define adult education. Since
adult education in the United States is still characterized

by marked flexibility and changing objectives, it is futile
to attempt a definitive statement" (p. 59).

Hallenbeck (1953) maintained that when adult education
is defined, it results in a circle being drawn which shuts
persons out, but that the objective should be to draw a
circle that lets everyone in. According to Smith (1955),
"Adult education has diverse meanings to librarians. No one
meaning [seems] to be acceptable" (p. 166). Smith added
that the definition is usually framed in terms of what a
library does when it provides adult education.

One reason for the difficulty in achieving a definition
that is accepted by all was mentioned by Douglah and Moss
(1969), who pointed out: "Adult education has been
described as a young and emerging field of study, as a
marginal educational enterprise, as an occupation moving
towards a profession" (p. 127). This definition is
concerned with adult education as a field of study rather
than from the viewpoint of the participant.

Merriam (1977) maintained that the article "What Is
Adult Education? Nine Working Definitions," first published
in 1955, is still relevant today. Those who desire one
generally accepted definition would disagree.

Dickinson (1978) described the difficulty in defining
adult education:

> Confusion and a lack of agreement about terminology is
> nowhere more apparent than in the denotation of the
> concept of adult education itself. Most authors are
> inclined to generate their own unique definition of

adult education, and there is little consistency among them. (p. 224)

Life is dynamic. Adult educators should continue to define education according to the needs of adults in meeting the changing structure of the world today. If individuals working in the field believe the true purpose of adult education is to meet the needs of adults in a changing world, the flexibility and sensitivity needed to ensure the development of new programs will be reflected in definitions of adult education. One might contend that this (adult education exists to meet the needs of adults in a changing world) could be a definition of adult education but it has, to date, not been universally accepted as the one definition of adult education. In addition, many of the words used such as adults, needs, changing world require specific definitions of their own.

The literature surveyed appears to support the fact that there have not been adequate forces in the field of adult education to focus or limit definitions to descriptive or programmatic categories, which would seem to be the most logical categories for a single definition.

This research represents a partial study and progress toward the identification of adult education definitions in adult education journals and adult education handbooks. The information gathered herein may serve as a baseline against which other definitions of adult education can be compared.

Recommendations made as a result of this study are as follow:

1. A study of other journals (primarily <u>Adult Leadership</u>, <u>Lifelong Learning</u>, and <u>Adult Education Bulletin</u>) should be made to see if findings in these journals agree with or refute the findings of this study.

2. Adult educators should continue to define adult education according to the needs of adults attempting to survive in a rapidly changing world but should remain cognizant that a universally accepted definition of adult education might do much to identify and clarify the field of study.

APPENDIX A

ALPHABETICAL LIST OF AUTHORS OF DEFINITIONS

FOUND IN JOURNALS AND HANDBOOKS

Author	Journal or Handbook	Year	Page Number in Journal or Handbook
Adam, T. R.	JAE	1939	71
Adams, J. T.	AE	1951	138
Adams, H. B.	AE	1965	173,177
Adolfson, L. H.	AE	1955	231,232
Adult education in community development	AE	1955	16
Barbash, J.	AE	1958	162
Bass, F. L.	AE	1972	210
Bell, W. V.	AE	1959	159,161
Bigger, J. H.	AE	1961	83
Birnbaum, M.	HB	1960	379,380
Blakely, R. J.	AE	1952	5
Blakely, R. J.	AE	1955	142
Blakely, R. J.	AE	1957	95
Blakely, R. J.	HB	1960	3,4,5,6
Blakely, R. J.	HB	1970	30,33
Booth, A.	HB	1970	34,35
Boshier, R. & Pickard, L.	AE	1979	35
Boston University's adult education program	AE	1959	43,44,46
Boyd, R. D.	AE	1969	189,190
Boyle, G.	JAE	1940	158
Brady, H. C. & Long, H. B.	AE	1972	126
Brigham, N.F.	AEJ	1947	154
Brodsky, N.	HB	1970	283
Brown, M. W..	HB	1948	83
Bryson, L.	AEJ	1946	110,112

Author	Journal or Handbook	Year	Page Number in Journal or Handbook
Bryson, L.	AE	1955	132
Bryson, L.	HB	1948	3,4
Bryson, L.	HB	1970	29
Caliver, A.	HB	1960	238,248
Carlson, R. A.	AE	1972	291
Carlson, R. A.	AE	1977	53,54
Cartwright, M. A.	JAE	1940	264
Charters, A. N.	HB	1970	488
The clearing house. New York's regents' inquiry	JAE	1939	96
A community program of adult education. Michigan's recommendation to the White House conference on education	AE	1956	41,44
Cortwright, R. & Brice, E. W.	HB	1970	407,408
Cotton, T. L.	HB	1960	129,131,132, 133,136
Cotton, W. E.	AE	1964	80
Deane, S. R.	AE	1950	22
DeVries, J.	AE	1973	241
Dickerman, R. V.	AE	1964	3,5
Dickerman, W.	AEJ	1948	55
Dickerman, W.	AE	1959	50
Dickinson, G.	AE	1971	37
Dickinson, G.	AE	1978	224,225,230
Dowling, W. D.	AE	1977	231
Essert, P. L.	AE	1960	133

Author	Journal or Handbook	Year	Page Number in Journal or Handbook
Essert, P. L.	HB	1960	234
Essert, P. L.	HB	1970	40
Fisher, D. C.	AEJ	1949	151
Fleece, J.	AE	1960	182,183
Frank, L. K.	AE	1955	144,145
Freire, P.	AE	1972	13
Fuller, E.	AE	1955	96
Getsinger, J. W.	AEJ	1949	232
Gnagey, T. P.	AE	1964	177
Grabowski, S. & Mason, W. D. (editors)	AE	1979	32
Grattan, C. H.	AE	1956	187
Griffith, W. S.	HB	1970	180,186
Haggstrom, W. C.	AE	1965	153
Hallenbeck, W. C.	AEJ	1948	6
Hallenbeck, W. C.	AE	1953	151
Hallenbeck, W. C.	AE	1955	131
Hallenbeck, W. C.	HB	1948	245
Hallenbeck, W.	HB	1970	34
Harden, E. L.	AE	1956	49
Hardy, N.	AE	1969	285
Haygood, K.	HB	1970	194
Hendrickson, N. & Hendrickson, A.	HB	1970	452
Henly, W. B.	AE	1953	48
Henry, D. D.	AE	1953	5
Hewitt, D.	HB	1948	240
Hoffer, J. R.	HB	1960	376
Horn, F. H.	AEJ	1950	110

Author	Journal or Handbook	Year	Page Number in Journal or Handbook
Houle, C. O.	AE	1957	9
Houle, C. O.	AE	1973	306
Houle, C. O.	HB	1970	40
Ingham, R. J.	AE	1968	55
Jackson, S. M.	AE	1955	99
Jarrett, J. L.	AE	1960	70
Jayne, C. D. & Gibb, J. R.	AE	1955	206,207
Jensen, G.	HB	1970	29
Jensen, G.	HB	1970	513,515
Jessup, F.	HB	1970	173
Johnstone, J. W. C. & Rivera, R. J.	HB	1970	34
Kallen, H. M.	HB	1970	33
Kallen, H. M.	HB	1970	131
Kandel, I. L.	AEJ	1944	25
Kaufman, H. F.	AE	1957	18,19
Kellor, F.	AE	1972	296
Kessell, J. B.	AE	1952	206
Kilpatrick, W.	AE	1976	254
Knowles, M. S.	AE	1950	37
Knowles, M. S.	AE	1955	67
Knowles, M. S.	AE	1957	238
Knowles, M. S.	AE	1964	67,71,74
Knowles, M. S.	HB	1960	528
Knowles, M. S. & DuBois	HB	1970	xvii,xviii, xx,xxii, xxiii
Kotinsky, R.	HB	1948	103
Kreitlow, B. W.	AE	1961	67

Author	Journal or Handbook	Year	Page Number in Journal or Handbook
Kreitlow, B. W.	HB	1960	115
Laski, H.	AE	1964	83,85
Lindemann, E. C.	AE	1976	254
Liveright, A. A.	HB	1970	33
Liveright, A. A.	HB	1970	315
Liveright, A. A. & Ohliger, J.	HB	1970	47
Lloyd, A. S.	AE	1972	12
Longmore, T. W. & Loomis, C. P.	AE	1954	200
Lowe, J.	AE	1962	186
Lowy, L.	AE	1956	230
Luke, R. A.	AE	1954	159,160,163
Luke, R. A.	AE	1955	236,237
Luke, R. A.	HB	1960	345,352
Lyle, M. S.	HB	1960	480
MacKaye, D. L.	AE	1955	139
McAfee, M. H.	JAE	1940	350
McHugh, V.	AE	1951	172,173,174
McCloskey, M.	AE	1953	54
McGhee, P. A.	AE	1954	68
McMahon, E. E.	AE	1961	188
McMahon, E. E. et al	AE	1968	197,198
Merriam, S.	AE	1977	206,207
Miller, P. A.	HB	1970	154
Minich, C. E.	AE	1955	139
Mire, J.	HB	1960	298,299
Monroe, M. E.	HB	1970	252
Nadler, L.	AE	1965	107
Nadler, L.	HB	1970	315,316

Author	Journal or Handbook	Year	Page Number in Journal or Handbook
News from AEA	AE	1951	202
Notes on representative organization programs	HB	1948	410
Otis, D. S.	JAE	1941	53
Overstreet, B. W.	JAE	1941	250
Overstreet, H. A.	JAE	1940	243
Overstreet, H.	AE	1950	37
An overview and history of the field	AE	1957	227
Panel on community education	AEJ	1947	116
Pasquale, A.	AE	1973	133
Pell, O. A.	AE	1952	129-132
Portal-Foster, C. W.	AE	1970	68
Powell, J. W.	AEJ	1949	169
Powell, J. W. & Benne, K. D.	HB	1960	43
Prendergast, J.	HB	1960	528
Redfield, R.	AE	1960	72
Reeves, Fansler & Houle	HB	1970	30
Robbins, C. L.	JAE	1939	139
Roberts, B. J. & Griffiths, W.	HB	1960	467
Rockhill, K.	AE	1976	197,199,200
Rogers, W. C.	HB	1960	275
Rogin, L.	HB	1970	301
Royall, N. N., Jr.	AE	1954	94,95
Schroeder, W. L.	HB	1970	26-31,39

Author	Journal or Handbook	Year	Page Number in Journal or Handbook
Schwertman, J. B.	AE	1955	77,78
Schwertman, J. B.	AE	1955	140,141
Sheats, P. H.	AE	1955	134,135
Sheats, P. H.	HB	1960	554,555,560, 561
Siegle, P. E.	HB	1960	393
Smith, et al	HB	1970	x
Starr, M.	AEJ	19447	107
Starr, M.	AEJ	1949	217,218
Stensland, P. & Stensland, C.	AE	1952	90
Stensland, P. G.	AE	1955	136,137,138
Stern, M. R.	AE	1959	79
Stubblefield, H. W.	AE	1976	202
Stubblefield, H. W.	AE	1976	253,254,257, 266
Sworder, S.	AE	1955	135.136
Sworder, S.	HB	1970	30
Taylor	AEJ	1950	29,30
Thomas, W.	JAE	1939	365,366,367
VanSant, T. A.	HB	1948	197
Verner, C.	AE	1956	187
Verner, C.	AE	1956	230,231
Verner, C.	AE	1963	253
Verner, C.	AE	1964	3
Verner, C.	AE	1972	16
Verner, C.	AE	1978	225,226
Verner, C.	HB	1970	39,40
Verner, C.	HB	1970	285

Author	Journal or Handbook	Year	Page Number in Journal or Handbook
Verner, C. & Newberry, J. S., Jr.	AE	1958	208,219
W.K. Kellogg Foundation	AE	1960	249
Westervelt, A.	AE	1961	99,100
Whipple, J. B.	AE	1963	243
White, T.	AE	1956	156
White, T. J.	HB	1970	121
Wientge, K. M.	AE	1966	247
Wile, I. S.	JAE	1940	522
Wriston, H. N.	JAE	1940	238
Zahn, J.	AE	1964	44
Ziegler, J.	HB	1970	28,31

APPENDIX B

JOURNALS AND HANDBOOKS CONTAINING DEFINITIONS

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
JAE	11/1939	71	Adam, T. R.	Quote (Filler)
JAE	11/19939	90-109	----	The clearing house. New York regents' inquiry
JAE	11/1939	139	Robbins, C. L.	Quote (Filler)
JAE	11/1939	365-368	Thomas, W.	What is adult education?
JAE	12/1940	158-161	Boyle, G.	Out of the drain, into the study club
JAE	12/1940	237-243	Wriston, H. N.	Democracy and a self-reliant culture
JAE	12/1940	243	Overstreet, H. A.	Quote (Filler)
JAE	12/1940	259-268	Cartwright, M. A.	Issues in adult education
JAE	12/1940	350-353	McAfee, M. H.	Hope for the future
JAE	12/1940	496-528	Wile, I. S.	Specialized programs of adult education
JAE	13/1941	53-58	Otis, D. S.	When adult interests and academic requirements meet
JAE	13/1941	249-253	Overstreet, B. W.	The privilege of leadership
AEJ	3/1944	23-26	Kandel, I. L.	Adult education and the future of democracy
AEJ	5/1946	109-115	Bryson, L.	Urgent? Important?
AEJ	6/1947	104-111	Starr, M.	Education for adulthood (by A. Locke)
AEJ	6/1947	115-116	----	Panel on community education
AEJ	6/1947	154	Brigham, N. F.	Indiana sets goals

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
AEJ	7/1948	4-10	Hallenbeck, W. C.	Training adult educators
AEJ	7/1948	53-57	Dickerman, W.	A partnership in learning. A report on the San Jose (California) adult center
AEJ	8/1949	150-152	Fisher, D. C.	Morse A. Cartwright
AEJ	8/1949	169-175	Powell, J. W.	Adult education: American plan
AEJ	8/1949	214-218	Starr, M.	UNESCO conference on adult education
AEJ	8/1949	231-236	Getsinger, J. W.	What do the California adult schools teach?
AEJ	9/1950	29-30	Taylor	Report on Virginia conference
AEJ	9/1950	109-115	Horn, F. H.	International understanding: The lament of a discouraged adult educator
AE	1/1950	36-40	Knowles, M. S.	Professional literature (by B. Shangold) [Review of Informal adult education]
AE	1/1950	36-40	Overstreet, H.	Professional literature (by B. Shangold) [Review of Informal adult education]
AE	1/1950	18-25	Deane, S. R.	Who seeks adult education and why
AE	1/1950	138-148	Adams, J. T.	The Canadian association for adult education (by J. R. Kidd)
AE	1/1951	171-176	McHugh, V.	Toward a theory of approach in adult education
AE	1/1951	202	----	News from AEA

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
AE	2/1952	89-97	Stensland, P. & Stensland, C.	Community education for international understanding. Part II--Training for world citizenship
AE	2/1952	123-134	Pell, O. A.	Social philosophy at the grass roots: The work of the AEA's Committee on Social Philosophy
AE	2/1952	186-211	Kessell, J. B.	Some trends in adult education. A symposium: Education for creative and recreative leisure
AE	3/1952	2-10	Blakely, R. J.	Adult education needs a philosophy and a goal
AE	3/1953	148-152	Hallenbeck, W. C.	Building working philosophies in adult education
AE	4/1953	3-9	Henry, D. D.	Freedom is not enough
AE	4/1953	48-53	Henly, W. B.	The promise of adult education
AE	4/1953	53-57	McCloskey, M.	Review of the NAPSAE conference (by A. P. Crabtree)
AE	4/1954	67-75	McGhee, P. A.	Higher education and adult education
AE	4/1954	94-100	Royall, N. N., Jr.	Adult education's major premise
AE	4/1954	158-167	Luke, R. A.	The community organization of adult education
AE	4/1954	200-207	Longmore, T. W. & Loomis, C. P.	Rural social systems and adult education
AE	5/1955	67-76	Knowles, M. S.	Adult education in the United States

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
AE	5/1955	77-81	Schwertman, J. B.	Significance of the 1954 AEA Conference
AE	5/1955	95-98	Fuller, E.	Adult education in 1954
AE	5/1955	98-102	Jackson, S. M.	Review of the NAPSAE Conference (by A. P. Crabtree)
AE	5/1955	131-145	Hallenbeck. W. C.	What is adult education? Nine working definitions
AE	5/1955	131-145	Bryson, L.	What is adult education? Nine working definitions
AE	5/1955	131-145	Sheats. P. H.	What is adult education? Nine working definitions
AE	5/1955	131-145	Sworder, S.	What is adult education? Nine working definitions
AE	5/1955	131-145	Stensland, P. G.	What is adult education? Nine working definitions
AE	5/1955	131-145	MacKaye, D. L.	What is adult education? Nine working definitions
AE	5/1955	131-145	Minich, C. E.	What is adult education? Nine working definitions
AE	5/1955	131-145	Schwertman, J. B.	What is adult education? Nine working definitions
AE	5/1955	131-145	Blakely, R. J.	What is adult education? Nine working definitions
AE	5/1955	131-145	Frank, L. K.	What is adult education? Nine working definitions

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
AE	5/1955	195-209	Jayne, C. D. & Gibb, J. R.	The Mountain Plains project
AE	5/1955	231-232	Adolfson, L. H.	The university's role in adult education
AE	5/1955	236-240	Luke, R. A.	The Inter-Association Conference for National Organizations
AE	6/1955	3-25	----	Adult education in community development
AE	6/1956	155-162	White, T.	Some common interest of adult education leaders
AE	6/1956	185-191	Verner, C.	Professional literature [Review of In quest of knowledge]
AE	6/1956	185-191	Grattan, C. H.	Professional literature by C. Verner [Review of In quest of knowledge]
AE	6/1956	226-233	Lowy, L.	Research-based publications, 1955 (by C. Verner)
AE	6/1956	226-233	Verner, C.	Research-based publications, 1955
AE	7/1956	40-44	----	A community program of adult education. Michigan's recommendations to the White House conference on education
AE	7/1956	49-53	Harden, E. L.	Adult education's untended garden
AE	7/1957	93-98	Blakely, R. J.	The path and the goal

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
AE	7/1957	219-230	----	An overview and history of the field. A working paper prepared by AEA Consultative Committee on direction-finding
AE	7/1957	234-240	Knowles, M. S.	Philosophical issues that confront adult education
AE	8/1957	3-17	Houle, C. O.	Education for adult leadership
AE	8/1957	18-25	Kaufman, H. F.	Concerns of adult education in Mississippi
AE	8/1958	162-174	Barbash, J.	An English view of workers' education in the U.S. (by M. Millgate)
AE	8/1958	208-222	Verner, C. & Newberry, J. S., Jr.	The nature of adult participation
AE	9/1959	75-79	Stern, M. R.	New ideas in promotion and the recruitment of adult students
AE	9/1959	157-163	Bell, W. V.	Baltimore's adult education tapestry
AE	10/1959	42-50	----	Boston University's adult education program: A report by a faculty administrative committee at Boston University
AE	10/1959	50-52	Dickerman, W.	A study of introductory courses in adult education
AE	10/1960	67-72	Jarrett, J. L.	Adult education and freedom
AE	10/1960	67-72	Redfield, R.	Adult education and freedom (by J. L. Jarrett)

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
AE	10/1960	131-140	Essert, P. L.	A proposed new program in adult education
AE	10/1960	182-184	Fleece, J.	Democracy three ways
AE	10/1960	249-250	W. K. Kellogg Foundation	Professional literature (by C. Verner) [Review of continuing education, An evolving form of adult education]
AE	11/1961	67	Kreitlow, B. W.	Research reports: Their significance in building and communicating a body of knowledge
AE	11/1961	83-91	Bigger, J. H.	The single presentation as an approach to teaching
AE	11/1961	99-105	Westervelt, A.	Stretching adult educators
AE	11/1961	181-192	McMahon, E. E.	Professional literature (by A. A. Liveright) [Review of The emerging evening college]
AE	12/1962	183-189	Lowe, J.	Impressions of adult education in the United States
AE	13/1963	243-256	Whipple, J. B.	Professional literature [Review of Some reflections on defining adult education]
AE	13/1963	243-256	Verner, C.	Professional literature (by A. B. Knox) [Review of Adult education theory and method]
AE	14/1964	67-79	Knowles, M. S.	What do we know about the field of adult education?

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
AE	14/1964	80-88	Cotton, W. E.	The challenge confronting adult education
AE	14/1964	80-88	Laske, H.	The challenge confronting adult education (by W. E. Cotton)
AE	14/1964	177-179	Gnagey, T. P.	Adult goals for adult education
AE	15/1964	3-8	Dickerman, R. V.	What is this continuing education?
AE	15/1964	3-8	Verner, C.	What is this continuing education? (by R. V. Dickerman)
AE	15/1964	35-46	Zahn, J.	Dropout and academic ability in university extension courses
AE	15/1965	105-108	Nadler, L.	A need in adult education
AE	15/1965	145-160	Haggstrom, W. C.	Poverty and adult education
AE	15/1965	172-179	Adams, H. B.	Learning to think morally
AE	16/1966	246-251	Wientge, K. M.	A model for the analysis of continuing education for adults
AE	18/1968	197-213	McMahon, E. E. et al	Common concerns: The position of the Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.
AE	19/1968	52-68	Ingham, R. J.	A comparative study of administrative principles and practices in adult education units
AE	19/1969	186-196	Boyd, R. D.	New designs for adult education doctoral programs

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
AE	19/1969	285-286	Hardy, N.	Professional literature (by R. Page) [Review of <u>Farm, mill and classroom</u>: <u>A history of tax supported adult</u> <u>education in South Carolina to 1960</u>]
AE	20/1970	67-87	Portal-Foster, C. W.	An application of work-emotionality theory to adult education
AE	22/1971	36-47	Dickinson, G.	Education variables and participation in adult education: An exploratory study
AE	22/1972	122-135	Brady, H. C. & Long, H. B.	Differences in perceptions of program planning procedures
AE	22/1972	207-217	Bass, F. L.	Impact of the black experience on attitudes toward continuing education
AE	22/1972	291-299	Carlson, R. A.	Professional leadership vs the educational service station approach: An historical appraisal
AE	22/1972	291-299	Kellor, F.	Professional leadership vs the educational service station approach: An historical appraisal (by R. A. Carlson)
AE	23/1972	3-20	Lloyd, A. S.	Freire, conscientization and adult education
AE	23/1972	3-20	Freire, P.	Freire, conscientization and adult education (by A. S. Lloyd)
AE	23/1972	3-20	Verner, C.	Freire, conscientization and adult education (by A. S. Lloyd)

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
AE	23/1973	132-143	Pasquale, A.	Adult education in Savannah (by H. B. Long)
AE	23/1973	234-242	DeVries, J.	Toward a more humanistic view of development: Adult education's role
AE	23/1973	304-316	Houle, C. O.	Book reviews [Review of The design of education]
AE	26/1976	193-207	Rockhill, K.	The past as prologue: Toward an expanded view of adult education
AE	26/1976	196-207	Stubblefield, H. W.	The past as prologue: Toward an expanded view of adult education (by K. Rockhill)
AE	26/1976	253-269	Stubblefield, H. W.	Adult education for civic intelligence in the post World War I period
AE	26/1976	253-269	Lindemann, E. C.	Adult education for civic intelligence in the post World War I period (by H. W. Stubblefield)
AE	26/1976	253-269	Kilpatrick, W.	Adult education for civic intelligence in the post World War I period (by H. W. Stubblefield)
AE	27/1977	195-208	Merriam, S.	Philosophical perspectives on adult education: A critical review of the literature
AE	27/1977	230-238	Dowling, W. D.	Book reviews [Review of Lifelong learning]

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
AE	28/1977	53-63	Carlson, R. A.	Adult education forum. Professionalization of adult education: An historical-philosophical analysis
AE	28/1978	223-234	Dickinson, G.	Principal contributions of Coolie Verner to a discipline of adult education
AE	28/1978	223-234	Verner, C.	Principal contributions of Coolie Verner to a discipline of adult education (by G. Dickinson)
AE	30/1979	19-33	Grabowski, S. & Mason, W. D. (editors)	The power-load margin formula of Howard V. McCluskey as the basis for a model of teaching (by K. Main)
AE	30/1979	34-51	Boshier, R. & Pickard, L.	Citation patterns of articles published in adult education 1968-1977
HB	1948	3-6	Bryson, L.	What we mean by adult education
HB	1948	83-95	Brown, M. W.	Better human relations and community improvement for family living
HB	1948	101-106	Kotinsky, R.	Intercultural education
HB	1948	196-200	VanSant, T. A.	Public school adult education programs
HB	1948	240-242	Hewitt, D.	Adult education on its own
HB	19948	243-249	Hallenbeck, W.	Training adult educators
HB	1948	304-528	-----	Notes on representative organizational programs

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
HB	1960	3-6	Blakely, R. J.	What is adult education
HB	1960	41-53	Powell, J. W. & Benne, K. D.	Philosophies of adult education
HB	1960	106-116	Kreitlow, B. W.	Research in adult education
HB	1960	129-137	Cotton, T. L.	Public understanding of adult education
HB	1960	230-237	Essert, P. L.	Foundations and adult education
HB	1960	238-254	Caliver, A.	Adult education activities in government agencies
HB	1960	274-285	Rogers, W. C.	International organizations in adult education
HB	1960	286-301	Mire, J.	Adult education in labor unions
HB	1960	345-355	Luke, R. A.	Public school adult education
HB	1960	366-377	Hoffer, J. R.	Adult education in voluntary social welfare organizations
HB	1960	378-392	Birnbaum, M.	Adult education in general voluntary organizations
HB	1960	393-403	Siegle, P. E.	Academic education for adults
HB	1960	467-478	Roberts, B. J. & Griffiths, W.	Health education of the public
HB	1960	479-490	Lyle, M. S.	Home and family life education
HB	1960	527-533	Prendergast, J.	Adult recreation education
HB	1960	527-533	Knowles, M. S.	Adult recreation education (by J. Prendergast)

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
HB	1960	553-564	Sheats, P. H.	Present trends and future strategies in adult education
HB	1970	ix-xi	Smith et al.	Preface, _Handbook of adult education_
HB	1970	xvii-xxiii	Knowles, M. S. & DuBois	Prologue: The handbooks in perspective
HB	1970	25-43	Schroeder, W. L.	Adult education defined and described
HB	1970	25-43	Ziegler, J.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	1970	25-43	Jensen, G.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	1970	25-43	Bryson, L.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	1970	25-43	Blakely, R. J.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	1970	25-43	Reeves, Fansler & Houle	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	1970	25-43	Sworder, S.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	1970	25-43	Liveright, A. A.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	1970	25-43	Kallen, H. M.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	1970	25-43	Hallenbeck, W.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
HB	1970	25-43	Johnstone, J. W. C. & Rivera, R. J.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	1970	25-43	Booth, A.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	1970	25-43	Verner, C.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	1970	25-43	Essert, P.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	19970	25-43	Houle, C. O.	Adult education defined and described (by W. L. Schroeder)
HB	1970	45-57	Liveright, A. A. & Ohliger, J.	The international dimension
HB	1970	121-135	White, T. J.	Philosophical considerations
HB	1970	121-135	Kallen, H. M.	Philosophical considerations (by T. J. White)
HB	1970	151-167	Miller, P. A.	A glance at the future
HB	1970	171-189	Jessup, F.	Adult education institutions (by W. S. Griffith)
HB	1970	171-189	Griffith, W. S.	Adult education institutions
HB	1970	191-212	Haygood, K.	Colleges and universities
HB	1970	245-263	Monroe, M. E.	Public libraries and museums
HB	1970	283-300	Brodsky, N.	The armed forces
HB	1970	283-300	Verner, C.	The armed forces (by N. Brodsky)

Journal or Handbook	Volume and Date	Page Numbers	Author of Definition(s)	Article Title (author if other than author of definition)
HB	1970	301-313	Rogin, L.	Labor unions
HB	1970	315-333	Nadler, L.	Business and industry
HB	1970	315-333	Liveright, A. A.	Business and industry (by L. Nadler)
HB	1970	407-424	Cortwright, R. & Brice, E. W.	Adult basic education
HB	1970	439-455	Hendrickson, N. & Hendrickson, A.	Education for family life
HB	1970	487-498	Charters, A. N.	Continuing education for the professions
HB	1970	513-526	Jensen, G.	Education for self-fulfillment

REFERENCE LIST

AAEE News. The annual business meeting. (1949, May 11).
    Adult Education Journal, 8, 162-167.

AAEE news. (1950). Adult Education Journal, 9, 102-108.

Adam, T. R. (1939). Quote (filler). Journal of Adult
Education,11, 71.

Adams, H. B. (1965). Learning to think morally. Adult
    Education, 15, 172-179.

Adolfson, L. H. (1955). The university's role in adult
    education. Adult Education, 5, 231-232.

Adult education in community development (1955). Adult
    Education, 6, 3-25.

Apps, J. W. (1979). Problems in continuing education. New
    York: McGraw-Hill.

Bass, F. L. (1972). Impact of the black experience on
    attitudes toward continuing education. Adult
    Education, 22, 207-217.

Bell, D. L., & Courtney, S. (1979). Adult education forum.
    Justification, need, and ideology in adult education--
    the British context. Adult Education, 29, 194-200.

Bell, W. V. (1959). Baltimore's adult education tapestry.
    Adult Education, 9, 157-163.

Bergevin, P., Morris, D., & Smith, R. M. (1963). Adult
    education procedures. New York: Seabury Press.

Best, J. W. (1977). Research in education (3rd ed.).
    Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.

Bigger, J. H. (1961). The single presentation as an
    approach to teaching. Adult Education, 11, 83-91.

Birnbaum, M. (1960). Adult education in general voluntary
    organizations. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of
    adult education in the United States, (pp. 378-392).
    Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Blakely, R. J. (1952). Adult education needs a philosophy
    and a goal. Adult Education, 3, 2-10.

Blakely, R. J. (1957). The path and the goal. Adult Education, 7, 93-98.

Blakely, R. J. (1958). Adult education in a free society. Toronto, Canada: Guardian Bird.

Blakely, R. J. (1960). What is adult education. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 3-6). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Borg, W. R. (1963). Educational research, an introduction. New York: David McKay.

Boshier, R., & Pickard, L. (1979). Citation patterns of articles published in adult education 1968-1977. Adult Education, 30, 34-51.

Boston University's adult education program. A report by a faculty administrative committee at Boston University. (1959). Adult Education, 10, 42-50.

Boyd, R. D. (1966). A psychological definition of adult education. Adult Leadership, 15, 160-162.

Boyd, R. D. (1969). New designs for adult education on doctoral programs. Adult Education, 19, 186-196.

Boyle, G. (1940). Out of the drain, into the study club. Journal of Adult Education, 12, 158-161.

Brady, H. C. & Long, H. B. (1972). Differences in perceptions of program planning procedures. Adult Education, 22, 122-135.

Brigham, H. F. (1947). Indiana sets goals. Adult Education Journal, 6, 154.

Brodsky, N. (1970). The armed forces. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), Handbook of adult education (pp. 283-300). New York: Macmillan.

Brown, M. W. (1948). Better human relations and community improvement for family living. In M. L. Ely (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 83-95). New York: Institute of Adult Education, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Bryson, L. (1936). Adult education. New York: American Book.

Bryson, L. (1946). Urgent? Important?. <u>Adult Education Journal</u>, <u>5</u>, 109-115.

Bryson, L. (1948). What we mean by adult education. In M. L. Ely (Ed.), <u>Handbook of adult education in the United States</u>, (pp. 3-6). New York: Institute of Adult Education, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Burch, G. (1948). A community organization for adult education. In M. L. Ely (Ed.), <u>Handbook of adult education in the United States</u>, (pp. 281-288). New York: Institute of Adult Education, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Caliver, A. (1960). Adult education activities in government agencies. In M. S. Knowles (ed.), <u>Handbook of adult education in the United States</u>, (pp. 238-254). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Carlson, R. A. (1972). Professional leadership vs the educational service station approach: An historical appraisal. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>22</u>, 291-299.

Carlson, R. A. (1977). Adult education forum. Professionalization of adult education: An historical-philosophical analysis. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>28</u>, 53-63.

Cartwright, M. A. (1936). The American association for adult education. In M. L. Ely (Ed.), <u>Adult education in action</u> (pp. 80-91). New York: American Association for Adult Education.

Cartwright, M. A. (1940). Issues in adult education. <u>Journal of Adult Education</u>, <u>12</u>, 259-268.

Charters, A. N. (1970). Continuing education for the professions. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), <u>Handbook of adult education</u> (pp. 487-498). New York: Macmillan.

The clearing house. New York regents' inquiry. (1939). <u>Journal of Adult Education</u>, <u>11</u>, 90-109.

The clearing house. (1941). <u>Journal of Adult Education</u>, <u>13</u>, 205-324.

A community program of adult education. Michigan's recommendations to the White House conference on education (1956). <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>7</u>, 40-44.

Cook, D. R. (1965). <u>A guide to educational research</u>. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

Cortwright, R., & Brice, E. W. (1970). Adult basic education. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), <u>Handbook of adult education</u> (pp. 407-424). New York: Macmillan.

Cotton, T. L. (1960). Public understanding of adult education. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), <u>Handbook of adult education in the United States</u>, (pp. 129-137). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Cotton, W. E. (1964). The challenge confronting American adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>14</u>, 80-88.

Crabtree, A. P. (1953). Review of the NAPSAE Conference. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>4</u>, 52-57.

Crabtree, A. P. (1955). Review of the NAPSAE Conference. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>5</u>, 98-102.

Deane, S. R. (1950). Who seeks adult education and why. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>1</u>, 18-25.

Deming, R. C. (1950). Characteristics of an adequate adult education program. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>1</u>, 25-26.

DeVries, J. (1973). Toward a more humanistic view of development: Adult education's role. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>23</u>, 234-242.

Dickerman. R. V. (1964). What is this "continuing education?" <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>15</u>, 3-8.

Dickerman, W. (1948). A partnership in learning. A report on the San Jose (California) adult center. <u>Adult Education Journal</u>, <u>7</u>, 53-57.

Dickerman, W. (1959). A study of introductory courses in adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>10</u>, 50-52.

Dickinson, G. (1971). Educational variables and participation in adult education: An exploratory study. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>22</u>, 36-47.

Dickinson, G. (1978). Principal contributions of Coolie Verner to a discipline of adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>28</u>, 223-234.

Douglah, M. A. and Moss, G. M. (1969). Adult education as a field of study and its implications for the preparation of adult educators. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>19</u>, 127-134.

Dowling, W. D. (1977). Book reviews [Review of Lifelong learning]. Adult Education Journal, 27, 230-238.

Editorials, Phoenix. (1942). Adult Education Journal, 1, 24.

Elias, J. L. and Merriam, S. (1980). Philosophical foundations of adult education. Malabar, FL: Robert E. Krieger.

Ely, M. L. (Ed.)(1936). Adult education in action. New York: American Association for Adult Education.

Essert, P. L. (1960). A proposed new program in adult education. Adult Education, 10, 131-140.

Essert, P. L. (1960). Foundations and adult education. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 230-237). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Fisher, D. C. (1949). Morse A. Cartwright. Adult Education Journal, 8, 150-152.

Fleece, J. (1960). Democracy thru ways. Adult Education, 10, 182-184.

Flexner, A. (1932). How much of it is education? In M. L. Ely (Ed.), Adult education in action (pp. 442-444). New York: American Association of Adult Education.

Fuller, E. (1955) Adult education in 1954. Adult Education, 5, 95-98.

Getsinger, J. W. (1949). What do the California adult schools teach? Adult Education Journal, 8, 231-236.

Gnagey, T. P. (1964a). Adult goals for adult education. Adult Education, 14, 177-179.

Gnagey, T. P. (1964b). The coming revolution in education. Adult Education, 15, 9-16.

Goldman, I. M. (1948). Adult Jewish education in America. In M. L. Ely (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 179-186). New York: Institute of Adult Education, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Grattan, C.H. (Ed.)(1959). American ideas about adult education, 1710-1951, classics in education. No. 2. New York: Bureau of Publications, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Griffith, W. S. (1966). Guidelines for writers preparing manuscripts for adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>16</u>, 85-91.

Griffith, W. S. (1970). Adult education institutions. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), <u>Handbook of adult education</u> (pp. 171-189). New York: The Macmillan Co.

Griffith, W. S. (1980). Personnel preparation. In H. J. Alford (Ed.), <u>Power and conflict in continuing education, survival and prosperity for all</u>? (pp. 201-229). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.

Haggstrom, W. C. (1965). Poverty and adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>15</u>, 145-160.

Hallenbeck, W. C. (1948a). Training adult educators. <u>Adult Education Journal</u>, <u>7</u>, 4-10.

Hallenbeck, W. C. (1948b). Training adult educators. In M. L. Ely (Ed.), <u>Handbook of adult education in the United States</u>, (pp. 243-249). New York: Institute of Adult Education, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Hallenbeck, W. C. (1953). Building working philosophies in adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>3</u>, 148-152.

Hallenbeck, W. C. (1957). A sociologist looks at adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>7</u>, 135-136.

Harden, E. L. (1956). Adult education's untended garden. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>7</u>, 49-53.

Hart, J. K. (1927). <u>Adult education</u>. New York: Thomas Y. Crowell.

Haygood, K. (1970). Colleges and universities. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), <u>Handbook of adult education</u> (pp. 191-212). New York: Macmillan.

Hazard, H. B. (1948) Education of the adult foreign born for citizenship. In M. L. Ely (Ed.), <u>Handbook of adult education in the United States</u>, (pp. 51-59). New York: Institute of Adult Education, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Hendrickson, N., & Hendrickson, A. (1970). Education for family life. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), <u>Handbook of adult education</u> (pp. 439-455). New York: Macmillan.

Henly, W. B. (1953). The promise of adult education. Adult Education, 4, 48-53.

Henry, D. D. (1953). Freedom is not enough. Adult Education, 4, 3-9.

Hewitt, D. (1948). Adult education on its own. In M. L. Ely (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 240-242). New York: Institute of Adult Education, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Hoffer, J. R. (1960). Adult education in voluntary social welfare organizations. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 336-377). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Holden, J. B. (1958). Improving the status of public school teachers of adults. Adult Education, 8, 87-92.

Horn, F. H. (1950). International understanding: The lament of a discouraged adult educator. Adult Education Journal, 9, 109-115.

Houle, C. O. (1957). Education for adult leadership. Adult Education, 8, 3-17.

Houle, C. O., & Buskey, J. H. (1966). The doctorate in adult education 1925-1965. Adult Education, 16, 131-168.

Ingham, R. J. (1968). A comparative study of administrative principles and practices in adult education units. Adult Education, 19, 52-68.

Jarrett, J. L. (1960). Adult education and freedom. Adult Education, 10, 67-72.

Jayne, C. D., & Gibb, J. R. (1955). The Mountain-Plains Project. Adult Education, 5, 195-209.

Jensen, G. (1970). Education for self-fulfillment. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), Handbook of adult education (pp. 513-526). New York: Macmillan.

Kandel, I. L. (1944). Adult education and the future of democracy. Adult Education Journal, 3, 23-26.

Kaplan, A. (1953). Views of adult education abroad on a world association. Adult Education, 3, 175-178.

Kaplan, A. (1958). Research review. Adult Education, 8, 195-207.

Kaufman, H. F. (1957). Concerns of adult education in Mississippi. Adult Education, 8, 18-25.

Kidd, J. R. (1951). The Canadian association for adult education. Adult Education, 1, 138-145.

Knowles, M. S. (1955). Adult education in the United States. Adult Education, 5. 67-76.

Knowles, M. S. (1957). Philosophical issues that confront adult education. Adult Education, 7, 234-240.

Knowles, M. S. (1960a). Editor's preface. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. xi-xv). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Knowles, M. S. (1960b). Historical development of the adult education movement. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 7-28). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Knowles, M. S. (1964). What do we know about the field of adult education? Adult Education, 14, 67-79.

Knowles, M. S., & DuBois, E. E. (1970). Prologue: The handbooks in perspective. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd, (Eds.), Handbook of adult education (pp. xvii-xxiii). New York: Macmillan.

Knox, A. B. (1963). Professional literature [Review of Adult education theory and method]. Adult Education, 13, 243-255.

Knudson, R. S. (1979). Critique. Humanagogy anyone? Adult Education, 29, 261-264.

Kolben, K. (1962). Professional literature [Review of The meaning of adult education]. Adult Education, 12, 127-129.

Kotinsky, R. (1948). Intercultural education. In M. L. Ely (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 101-106). New York: Institute of Adult Education, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Kreitlow, B. W. (1960). Research in adult education. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the

<u>United States</u>, (pp. 106-116). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Kreitlow, B. W. (1961). Research reports: Their significance in building and communicating a body of knowledge. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>11</u>, 67.

Kreitlow, B. W. (1970). Research and theory. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd, (Eds.), <u>Handbook of adult education</u> (pp. 137-149). New York: Macmillan.

Liveright, A. A. (1961). Professional literature [Review of <u>The emerging evening college</u>]. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>11</u> 181-192.

Liveright, A. A., & Ohliger, J. (1970). The international dimension. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), <u>Handbook of adult education</u> (pp. 45-57). New York: Macmillan.

Lloyd, A. S. (1972). Freire, conscientization and adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>23</u>, 3-20.

Locke, A. (1947). Education for adulthood. <u>Adult Education Journal</u>, <u>6</u>, 104-111.

Long, H. B. (1973). Adult education in Savannah, Georgia: 1765-1789. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>23</u>, 132-143.

Longmore, T. W., & Loomis, C. P. (1954). Rural social systems and adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>4</u>, 200-207.

Lowe, J. (1962). Impressions of adult education in the United States. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>12</u>, 183-189.

Luke, R. A. (1954). The community organization of adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>4</u>, 158-167.

Luke, R. A. (1955). The Inter-Association Conference for National Organizations. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>5</u>, 236-240.

Luke, R. A. (1960). Public school adult education. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), <u>Handbook of adult education in the United States</u>, (pp. 345-355). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Luke, R. A. (1961). Stating a position on adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>11</u>, 248-251.

Lyle, M. S. (1960). Home and family life education. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), <u>Handbook of adult education in the</u>

United States, (pp. 479-490). Chicago, IL.: Adult
    Education Association of the USA.

Main, K. (1979). The power-load margin formula of Howard
    Y. McClusky as the basis for a model of teaching.
    Adult Education, <u>30</u>, 19-33.

McAfee, M. H. (1940). Hope for the future. *Journal of
    Adult Education*, <u>12</u>, 350-353.

McGhee, P. A. (1954). Higher education and adult education.
    Adult Education, <u>4</u>, 67-75.

McHugh, V. (1951). Toward a theory of approach in adult
    education. *Adult Education*, <u>1</u>, 171-176.

McMahon, E. E., Coates, R. H. & Knox, A. B. (1968). Common
    concerns: The position of the Adult Education
    Association of the U. S. A. *Adult Education*, <u>18</u>, 197-
    213.

Merriam, S. (1977). Philosophical perspectives on adult
    education: A critical review of the literature. *Adult
    Education*, <u>27</u>, 195-208.

Merriam, S. B., & Simpson, E. L. (1984). *A guide to
    research for educators and trainers of adults*.
    Malabar, FL: Robert E. Krieger.

Miller, P. A. (1970). A glance at the future. In R. M.
    Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), *Handbook of
    adult education* (pp. 151-167). New York: Macmillan.

Miller, P. A. (1973). Book reviews [Review of *The design
    of education*]. *Adult Education*, <u>23</u>, 304-316.

Millgate, M. (1958). An English view of workers' education
    in the United States. *Adult Education*, <u>8</u>, 162-174.

Minorities--and democracy. A report on the fourteenth
    annual meeting, May 15, 16, and 17, 1939. (1939).
    Journal of Adult Education, <u>11</u>, 287-325.

Mire, J. (1960). Adult education in labor unions. In M. S.
    Knowles (Ed.), *Handbook of adult education in the
    United States*, (pp. 286-301). Chicago, IL.: Adult
    Education Association of the USA.

Monroe, M. E. (1970). Public libraries and museums. In R.
    M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), *Handbook of
    adult education* (245-263). New York: Macmillan.

Nadler, L. (1965). A need in adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, 15, 105-108.

Nadler, L. (1970). Business and industry. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), <u>Handbook of adult education</u> (pp. 315-333). New York: Macmillan.

News from the AEA (1951), <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>1</u>, 161-167, 202.

Notes on representative organizational programs. (1948). In M. L. Ely (Eds.), <u>Handbook of adult education in the United States</u>, (pp. 304-528). New York: Institute of Adult Education, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Otis, D. S. (1941). When adult interests and academic requirements meet. <u>Journal of Adult Education</u>, <u>13</u>, 53-58.

Overstreet, B. W. (1941). The privilege of leadership. <u>Journal of Adult Education</u>, <u>13</u>, 249-252.

Overstreet, H. A. (1940). [Filler]. <u>Journal of Adult Education</u>, <u>12</u>, 243.

An overview and history of the field. A working paper prepared by AEA Consultative Committee on direction-finding (1957). <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>7</u>, 219-230.

Page, R. (1969). Professional literature [Review of <u>Farm, mill and classroom: A history of tax supported adult education in South Carolina to 1960</u>]. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>19</u>, 285-286.

Panel on community education. (1947). <u>Adult Education Journal</u>, <u>6</u>, 115-116.

Peers, R. (1958). <u>Adult education, a comparative study</u> (2nd ed.). New York: Humanities Press.

Pell, O. A. (1952). Social philosophy at the grass roots: The work of the AEA's Committee on Social Philosophy. <u>Adult Education, 2</u>, 123-134.

Phinney, E. (1964). Professional literature [Review of <u>Library adult education, the biography of an idea</u>]. <u>Adult Education 14</u>, 116-128.

Portal-Foster, C. W. (1970). An application of work-emotionality theory to adult education. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>20</u>, 67-87.

Powell, J. W. (1949). Adult education: American plan. Adult Education Journal, 8, 169-175.

Powell, J. W., & Benne, K. D. (1960). Philosophies of adult education. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 41-53). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Prendergast, J. (1960). Adult recreation education. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 527-533). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Report on Virginia conference. (1950). Adult Education Journal, 9, 29-30.

Robbins, C. L. (1939). [Filler]. Journal of Adult Education, 11, 139.

Roberts, B. J., & Griffiths, W. (1960). Health education of the public. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 467-478). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Rockhill, K. (1976). The past as prologue: Toward an expanded view of adult education. Adult Education, 26, 196-207.

Rogers, M. (1950). III. Discussion of Dean Horn's article. Adult Education Journal, 9, 115-118.

Rogers, W. C. (1960). International organizations in adult education. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 274-285). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Rogin, L. (1970). Labor unions. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), Handbook of adult education (pp. 301-313). New York: Macmillan.

Royall, N. N., Jr. (1954). Adult education's major premise. Adult Education, 4, 94-100.

Scheffler, I. (1960). The language of education. Springfield, IL.: Charles C. Thomas.

Schroeder, W. L. (1970). Adult education defined and described. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), Handbook of adult education (pp. 25-43). New York: Macmillan.

Schwertman, J. B. (1955). Significance of the 1954 AEA Conference. Adult Education, 5, 77-81.

Shangold, B. (1950. Professional literature [Review of Informal adult education]. Adult Education, 1, 36-40.

Sharer, R. (1953). The community's program of continuing education. Adult Education, 3, 59-62.

Sheats, P. H. (1960). Present trends and future strategies in adult education. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 553-564). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Siegle, P. E. (1960). Academic education for adults. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States, (pp. 393-403). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Smith, H. L. (1955). Adult education activities in public libraries. Adult Education, 5, 166-171.

Smith, R. M., Akin, G. F., & Kidd, J. R. (Eds.). (1970). Preface. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), Handbook of adult education (pp.ix-xi). New York: Macmillan.

Some trends in adult education. A symposium: Education for creative and recreative leisure (1952). Adult Education, 2, 186-211.

Specialized programs of adult education. (1940). Journal of Adult Education, 12, 496-528.

Stacy, W. H. (1951). Author swings into action. Adult Education, 1, 216-223.

Starr, M. (1949). UNESCO conference on adult education. Adult Education Journal, 8, 214-218.

Stensland, P., & Stensland, C. (1952). Community education for international understanding. Part II--Training for world citizenship. Adult Education, 2, 89-97.

Stern, M. R. (1959). New ideas in promotion and the recruitment of adult students. Adult Education, 9, 75-79.

Stokes, K. (1970). Religious institutions. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), Handbook of adult education (pp. 353-370). New York: Macmillan.

Stubblefield, H. W. (1976). Adult education for civic intelligence in the post- World War I period. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>26</u>, 253-269.

Swearingen, T. T. (1948). Protestant Christian adult education. In M. L. Ely (Ed.), <u>Handbook of adult education in the United States</u>, (pp. 192-195). New York: Institute of Adult Education, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Thomas, W. (1939). What is adult education? <u>Journal of Adult Education</u>, <u>11</u>, 365-368.

Toward a new association. Some questions and answers, (1950). <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>1</u>, 5-12.

UNESCO'S Australian seminar on adult educational methods. (1951). <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>1</u>, 100-106.

VanSant, T. A. (1948). Public school adult education programs. In M. L. Ely (Ed.), <u>Handbook of adult education in the United States</u>, (pp. 196-200). New York: Institute of Adult Education, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Verner, C. (1956a). Professional literature [Review of <u>In quest of knowledge</u>]. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>6</u>, 185-191.

Verner, C. (1956b). Research-based publications, 1955. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>6</u>, 226-233.

Verner, C. (1960a). The literature of adult education. In M. S. Knowles (Ed.), <u>Handbook of adult education in the United States</u>, (pp. 162-178). Chicago, IL.: Adult Education Association of the USA.

Verner, C. (1960b). Professional literature [Review of <u>Continuing education, An evolving form of adult education</u>]. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>10</u>, 249-250.

Verner, C. (1964). <u>Adult education</u>. Washington, D.C.: Center for Applied Research in Education.

Verner, C., & Newberry, J. S., Jr. (1958). The nature of adult participation. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>8</u>, 208-222.

Westervelt, A. (1961). Stretching adult educators. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>11</u>, 99-105.

What is adult education? Nine "working definitions". (1955). <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>5</u>, 131-145.

Whipple, J. B. (1963). Professional literature [Review of Some reflections on defining adult education]. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>13</u>, 243-255.

White, T. (1956). Some common interests of adult education leaders. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>6</u>, 155-162.

White, T. J. (1970). Philosophical considerations. In R. M. Smith, G. F. Akin, & J. R. Kidd (Eds.), <u>Handbook of adult education</u> (pp. 121-135). New York: Macmillan.

Wientge, K. M. (1966). A model for the analysis of continuing education for adults. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>16</u>, 246-251.

Wiersma, W. (1980). <u>Research methods in education, an introduction</u> (3rd ed.). Itasca, IL: F. E. Peacock

Wise, J. E., Nordberg, R. B., & Reitz, D. J. (1967). <u>Methods of research in education</u>. Boston: D. C. Heath.

Wriston, H. N. (1940). Democracy and a self-reliant culture. <u>Journal of Adult Education</u>, <u>12</u>. 237-243.

Zahn, J. (1964). Dropout and academic ability in university extension courses. <u>Adult Education</u>, <u>15</u>, 35-46.