University of New Hampshire
University of New Hampshire Scholars' Repository

Doctoral Dissertations   Student Scholarship

Spring 2018

The Activity of Becoming a Second-Career Teacher

Michael Hildebrandt
University of New Hampshire, Durham

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholars.unh.edu/dissertation

THE ACTIVITY OF BECOMING A SECOND-CAREER TEACHER

BY

MICHAEL HILDEBRANDT

Bachelor of Arts, Colby College, 2004

Master of Science in Education, Simmons College, 2008

DISSERTATION

Submitted to the University of New Hampshire

in Partial Fulfillment of

the Requirements of the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in Education

May 2018

THE ACTIVITY OF BECOMING A SECOND-CAREER TEACHER

BY

MICHAEL HILDEBRANDT

This dissertation has been examined and approved in partial fulfillment of the requirements for

the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

Paula M. Salvio, Ph.D. Dissertation Chair
Professor of Education

Joseph Onosko, Ph.D.
Associate Professor of Education

Andrew D. Coppens, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor of Education

Hadley Solomon, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor of Education

John Hornstein, Ed.D.
Affiliate Assistant Professor of Education

March 28, 2018

Original signatures are on file with the Graduate School, University of New Hampshire.

DEDICATION

For the memory of Tom Mitchell; a man I would have very much liked to include in this study

and who passed too young into his second-career as a caring teacher.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I suppose when you take the better part of a decade to complete your doctoral studies, you should expect to see a varied cast of characters. I want to sincerely thank everyone who has walked alongside me through the process, and particularly those who coaxed me across the finish line. Thank you Mike Middleton, Bill Wansart, and Bryan Ness for serving as my doctoral committee, for introducing me to educational research, and for your encouragement. Thank you, Bill, for the education that you inspired by serving as a mentor and co-teacher. Additional thanks to Bruce Mallory, Barbara Houston, and Suzanne Graham for equipping me with skills and ways of thinking that serve me daily in my expanded sociological imagination. Among my decades of education, I am happy to proclaim that the best education I have received is in your capable hands.

Thank you to my dissertation committee members: Joe Onosko, Andrew Coppens, Hadley Solomon, and John Hornstein. Thank you for the encouragement you provided to me and the perspective you all bring from the various stages of your career. And, especially, thank you for your patience. I have appreciated each of you for the ways that you serve as a more capable other drawing me into the practice of educational research (which sounds a lot less fun that I think any of us has found it to be). Thank you, most heartily, to my dissertation committee chair Paula Salvio. Paula, you have been a sage and a saint. You picked me up after mentors departed and helped me shape a study that is a more authentic reflection of my mind's work than I ever thought possible. You asked a lot of questions and offered a lot of suggestions, and though I know you wished I would just take one and run, I am happy that you were patient with me as I found my own way to completing my dissertation.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT

THE ACTIVITY OF BECOMING A SECOND-CAREER TEACHER

By

Michael Hildebrandt

University of New Hampshire, May 2018

This is a study of three second-career teachers' experiences of self transformation and the processes of socialization and identity formation each undergoes during his or her first three to five years as a full-time teacher. Each narrative offers a means through which to explore how liminal identity is at play during the transition to a new career—an experience that reshapes the experiences and self-understandings of individuals in the process of becoming teachers. The narratives that emerge from in-depth interviews showcase individuals with multi-faceted lives who have engaged in a multitude of personal and professional activities throughout their life course and find themselves between worlds occupying a liminal identity during the transition to a new culture. Exploring personal and professional histories provides an appreciation of the motivations, the transitional experiences, and the transformations of self that individuals experience as they seek to situate themselves within the new culture in and out of the classroom and formulate a life that includes teaching. The multiple cultural activities, and the selves constituted therein, allow second-career teachers to bring rich learning experiences to students not merely as experts in their professional field but as experienced and caring adults with complex lives to share. The presentation of co-constructed case histories and analysis of the narratives seeks to add to the literature stories that engender an appreciation of the complex transformations involved in becoming a second-career teacher. Implications for teacher education programs serving and retention of second-career teachers are discussed.

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Personal Significance

I started teaching right out of college, and I taught at the same school from the moment I began teaching until the time I went to graduate school. But I was not exclusively a teacher. I tried my hand at student life, and athletics, academic administration, and fundraising. Working as a campus coordinator in the student life office, I drew on my earliest employment experiences as a camp counselor as I planned weekend trips and activities for 180 high school residents. I founded the first swim team at the school, meeting a need expressed by students and responding to their demand that my experience as a high school swimmer made me a great candidate for a coach. I found a voice with the faculty as I taught first aid and CPR classes, drawing on my experiences in Emergency medicine—a "pre-career" I engaged in before heading to college—and expanded those workshops as I took the lead in designing a more comprehensive professional development program for the high school faculty. For four years, I even tried working as a fundraiser for the school by writing grants and working with foundations and corporations to secure resources for various projects. These experiences are a part of me now and, even at the time, were drawing on parts of my self that were more and less easily re-activated. I became a teacher not just to teach, but to bring myself to the school community and to the lives of my students. I did not consider how my prior experiences would impact my teaching practice as I started teaching—I was a teacher of students, not of content.

I was 29 years old when I began my doctoral program and first taught in higher education. Teaching courses in special education and educational psychology to pre-service teachers was rewarding, more so because many of my students were "non-traditional" learners.

Some were coming back to school after years of working menial labor, to "get a career" or "make something of themselves". Others were furthering their education to change fields altogether and wondered if they were "overqualified" teachers. They held professional or terminal degrees in business, law, design, fine arts, and engineering, and they had decades of experience that they could not see translating into the classroom.

During the fall of 2011 I taught a graduate level class in special education. Having been a special educator for nearly a decade at that point, and having completed a master's degree in special education, I felt nearly equipped to give students an overview of special education law and classroom practice. The class was a weekend format, catering to the busy schedules of those working full time in and out of the field of education. The fist Friday evening was an introduction to the course, an overview of expectations, and an introduction of a new group of classmates. Saturday would bring workshops to explore and engage with the elements of special education law: landmark cases and legislation, IEPs and 504 plans, rights and responsibilities. I had my materials prepared and I was excited to engage in sharing my experience with a group of would be teachers.

As I set out on teaching, I told the class, "I see laws as protections for our students." A student chortled: "I'm sorry," she apologized frankly, "I have been practicing law for the past 20 years and I have never heard anyone refer to laws as protections." She may be a newcomer to the field of education, I thought, but she is certainly no novice. I do not remember how I responded: my training in improvisational theatre had kicked in and I was speaking while scanning the audience for their response and refreshing my approach. I too was no novice teacher, but a newcomer to a different educational culture; teaching in a post-secondary classroom with a different balance of power than the secondary classroom I was accustomed to, requiring

heightened adaptability and responsiveness. I was again excited to learn how to engage in my craft. I was learning about myself and my classroom of peers as I continued becoming a teacher.

Over the past six years, I have taught at four institutions of higher education preparing future teachers in associate, bachelors and masters programs. Many of my students are non-traditional, and one subset of these non-traditional students has caught my interest: career-changers entering into teaching. Since the first term teaching in higher education in which I memorably shared my rosy view of special education law to a practicing lawyer changing fields to become a teacher, I have taught many more career changers: engineers and accountants, carpenters and caretakers, visual artists and child psychologists, musicians, marketing executives, journalists…and next term I am sure I will meet more. Each of them comes to my classroom with a story to share and a vision for how she will pursue her own second-career as a teacher. I am curious, having followed "traditional" path into my first career as a teacher, how is the experience of these teachers different?

Second Career Teachers

National recruitment efforts have long sought individuals with professional experience to enter the field of teaching. William Marinell and Susan Johnson (2014) present findings from the analysis of two-decades of data on second-career teachers which suggest that, among other things the percentage of second-career teachers nearly doubled from 1988-2008 and make up one-third of the incoming public school workforce, yet the literature base on second-career teachers is quite small. Gary Crow, Linda Levine, and Nancy Nager (1990) were among the first to note an increasing trend in enrollment of career-switchers in alternative teacher education programs—like Bank Street College, Harvard, and Columbia, from which the authors hailed—and subsequent studies largely track trends in enrollment of career-changers into teacher

education programs, the reactionary emergence of alternative certification programs which are simultaneously lauded and panned, and the "unique" teaching methods employed in such programs. Spanning just under three decades and encompassing less than 150 articles, the literature base is skewed toward a market analysis for teacher education programs and lacks information about second-career teachers as a population of individuals who have unique expertise, experiences, and perspectives to bring into our nation's classrooms.

The literature on second-career teachers provides adequate information on recruitment, enrollments by program type (traditional and accelerated teacher preparation programs) as well as recommendations for providing tailored programs for the unique needs of a population of career-changers. Most studies draw from participant pools of teacher candidates, often from the researchers' own programs in teacher education. Previous research has found that in age, professional preparation and experience, and disposition toward the profession, these newcomers enter the profession differently than their colleagues coming directly from undergraduate teacher preparation programs. My own aims are to understand how individual teachers situate themselves within the culture of a school, a discipline, and the culture of teaching and make sense of themselves through narrative. This work will involve stories of individuals who are becoming second-career teachers.

The focus of this study—on the socialization and identity formation of second-career teachers—is situated within a further limited subset of the already small literature base. In reviewing this literature, two problems emerge: 1) the literature explores second-career teachers in training rather than second-career teachers in action and 2) second-career teacher socialization and identity formation are seen as constrained by singular self-identification rather than afforded greater opportunity for the career-changers' cultural multi-membership. While much of the

research seems unaware of or undaunted by these limitations, a few studies have pointed out the need to expand the population under investigation and the theoretical tools employed.

To the issue of studying teachers in preparation Diane Novak and Gary Knowles (1992) suggest that research is needed on the "subsequent impact on teaching" of the "interplay of previous life and career experiences" (p.34), as they suggest the study of practicing second-career teachers rather than those in preparatory programs. The focus of this study on second-career teachers with at least two years of teaching experience follows from a gap in the literature, the recommendation from Novak and Knowles, and also a finding from Morettini (2014): the reasons to engage in (stay in) teaching become more specific over time pointing to a need to break from the pre-service and first-year populations that have dominated the literature and explore populations of teachers further into their second-career transformation. There is a need to study second-career teachers in process, not in sequestered cultures of training programs but as they are engaged in the activity of teaching in order to understand their transitions and self-transformations.

To the issue concerning theoretical tools, a more dramatic shift must be made. The research on second-career teachers' socialization and identity formation generally focuses on identity construction utilizing a Cartesian model of the unified self, demanding singular self-identification. A belief in a unified self leads to narrow investigation or "inspection" of how one is "making" or "taking" an identity as a teacher, and subordinating all other identities (James, 1890). This will not allow a view of the individual as a reflection of her myriad cultural engagements but rather answer the question "who is she as a teacher?" or "who has she now become?". Instead of documenting how one teaches or who one is as a teacher (a description of *being*), this study examines the main research question: how do career-changers engage in the

activity of *becoming* second-career teachers and make meaning of their experience through narrative? We must look at second-career teachers holistically by taking view of the "totality of their societal interactions" (Roth, 2015), to understand their self-transformations within their multiple group memberships—historical and concurrent—not merely the way they engage in the practice of teaching. Said another way, we must not investigate merely the teaching life of career-changers but rather share stories of lives that include teaching (Sumara and Luce-Kapler, 1996).

The Population Under Study

In this study I conducted in-depth interviews with three participants. Each had his or her own experiences within multiple cultures both prior to teaching and within the teaching profession. Though similarities are to be found among the group, by no means will the reader find in tucking-in to the participant narratives presented in the fourth chapter that these second-career teachers are a monolithic group. The participants were all teachers at secondary schools in or beyond their third year of teaching and each with more than a decade of experience in a first career. All were parents and children, spouses and siblings. All were fairly certain that they would be teaching for the rest of their working life—though none of them recollected knowing that they might leave their first career either. Participants ranged in age from mid-thirties to late forties and had taken somewhat straight to wildly wandering paths into their second careers in teaching.

Raphel was raised as a "faculty kid" living on campus of a private prep school in New England. His father had been, as an important matter of fact, a second-career teacher himself and Raphel had envisioned that he too would teach from early on in his high school career. This future career path was not because Raphel had been a stellar student—in fact, he disliked school

and struggled due to his Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD)—but because he had been inspired by music and by music teachers and wanted to be one such teacher for his own students. But at college he found the curriculum in the teacher education program stifling. More specifically he found the future vision of teaching that it presented to him stifling. He took a meandering path that lasted a decade and wove through various roles in the entertainment industry only to "come home" to a career in teaching when he found out he was going to be a father. He followed the path his father had taken and took a job as a music teacher and chair of the music department at a small private high school nestled in a New England suburb. The school serves students with learning disabilities including ADHD and Raphel felt he could relate to his students owing to his own earlier academic struggles. More importantly, he felt he could become the teacher he wanted to be by employing a learning plan that led from how students want to learn rather than a prescribed curriculum or set of standards.

Josh grew up enjoying school and engaged in many activities with multiple groups throughout his childhood. He, too, envisioned himself as a future teacher after being inspired in his high school history classes and wanting to be that inspiration for his own students. But the "insistent guidance" of his father led him into engineering, the field that both his father and his older brother had entered before Josh. Engineering school was difficult and took Josh five years to complete and working as a mechanical engineer for two decades did not always provide the "balance" of technical skill and social engagement that Josh enjoys. Josh's path back to teaching was a major change and was not precipitated by life events but by a calculation of right timing and a desire to find greater fulfillment in balancing family and professional life. Josh teaches classes in woodshop, engineering, and mathematics—under the banner of STEAM—at a medium-sized public high school in a seaside New England town. Josh brings his engineering

mindset and his wide array of extra-curricular experience into his hands-on classrooms as tools to engage students in their own learning and to help each student draw in his or her own experience in school and beyond. While Josh notes there are tradeoffs—like salary—in becoming a teacher, his own children have noted that he is happier, and he enjoys telling them about the progress his students are making as they build a "tiny house".

Terry was the first in her family to receive a bachelor's degree, and her two decades of work as a dental hygienist required a professional license gained through specific and rigorous coursework and multiple practicum experiences. While working as a hygienist she thought someday she might teach dental hygiene, and it wasn't until she had children of her own that she saw a pathway to teaching opening up for her. She formed a pre-school co-op with other "smart, educated women" and then followed her children into the public school system as a parent volunteer, a teacher's aide, a student teacher, a long-term sub, and a full-time teacher of life science. Terry teaches at a large, regional secondary school along the route 95 corridor in New England. She cares deeply for her students and enjoys organizing lesson plans and implementing the best practices in teaching that she learned in her teacher preparation program.

Research Questions

Spending over three hours with each participant allowed them time to share more about their multi-faceted lives than could be presented and provided us, together, time to construe meanings from their lived experiences of becoming second-career teachers. This meaning-making work was the goal of this study which sought to answer a broad research question: "how does an individual become a second-career teacher?" I must admit, the question is a bit misleading. An individual does not simply "become a teacher" because an individual is not simply a member of one culture with a singular "self" or role to be played. Individuals are

professionals and parents, siblings and spouses, husbands and homeboys. The question then becomes a bit more complex—*how does an individual become a teacher having once been engaged in a different career?* But new questions emerge about who the individual is becoming when we acknowledge that an individual has not a unified self ("I am now though I once was") but rather a multiplicity of selves that comprise a dynamic sociocultural identity ("I am able to now having once participated in").

- *How does prior and concurrent experience impact second-career teachers' motivations for becoming teachers, their activity as teachers, and their understanding of themselves within multi-group memberships as they become second-career teachers?*
  - *What factors influence the decision to become second career teachers?*
  - *How does their prior and concurrent experience shape the way they teach—how they present themselves as teachers during the activity of teaching?*
  - *How does becoming a teacher shape how they make sense of their lives—their identity—both at the present moment "as teachers" and across their life story?*

These questions do adequately capture the taxonomy of an investigation and presentation of the lives of career-changers becoming second-career teachers encapsulating motivations, qualitative and quantitative changes in activity and the subsequent impacts of these activities on the activity of teaching (Roth, 2009), and the self-understandings made of the experience (Bruner, 1990). The stories themselves, however, are not reduced to answering questions and instead speak of particular ways in which real people lead multi-faceted lives that include meaningful work as teachers (Sumara and Luce-Kapler, 1996).

Conceptual Framework

Much of the literature on second-career teachers seeks to understand the socialization of career-changers *into* the profession of teaching. Seeking to view an individual as socialized *into* a culture requires singular identification of teachers as one who has an *in-group* affiliation. The consequence of being *out* is an identity crisis. This understanding of *in* or *out* of the teaching culture or of "teacherly" conduct, at the very least, has an adverse impact on the findings of the research on second-career teachers. Second-career teachers often struggle in their transition to teaching and are viewed in the literature as encountering an identity role conflicts (Newman, 2010; Williams, 2010; Synder, Olivera, and Paska, 2013), subordinating parts of themselves in order to have a cohesive identity (Trent and Gao, 2009; Snyder, 2010) or being "caught between worlds" with a maladaptive, liminal identity (Pierce, 2007). More jarringly, these findings reflect a cultural pattern that does not seek to understand the complexities of lived experience but merely seeks to singular identifications of individuals based on group affiliations. Parker Palmer (1998) contends that not allowing individuals to consider the complexity of their lives and how it is brought to bear on the activity of teaching results in the loss of the teacher's soul. But there is no need for singular resolution of identity crisis as one is in *transition* from one culture to another as one need not choose from among his multiple selves but rather work to comprehend continuity as he undergoes *transformation*.

Such a transformation of the individual should be expected when being immersed in a new culture. The sociocultural tradition views the individual and the culture as dialectical wherein the individual interacts with the environment around him in turn transforming both himself the environment through the employment of cultural tools (such as language) and activity (such as communication). An understanding of the individual as an organism that is

transformed by its engagement with cultural environments is essential for understanding self-transformations that result in mutually constitutive processes of socialization and identity formation. Having been a part of other cultures previously, the individual is being introduced to new cultural tools and expectations that may be in conflict with previous or concurrent roles and tools, to be sure. Cultures create *horizons* or limits upon that which we can do or conceive of doing, and moving into a new culture expands that horizon affording new opportunities for activity as well as constraints upon activity (Wertsch, 1991; Berger and Luckman, 1966, p.102, Engeström, 1987).

Methodological Framework

Vygotsky's (1978) search for method resulted in three essential characteristics of the investigation of higher psychological functions: an analysis of process, not objects; a focus on explanation, not description; and an investigation of development-in-action rather than fossilized behavior (Chapter 4). On the first principle, Vygotsky stresses the importance of observing the process both looking backward and forward, noting that the analysis of processes "requires a dynamic display of the main points making up the processes' history" and "any psychological process, whether the development of thought or voluntary behavior, is a process undergoing changes right before one's eyes" (p.61). On the second principle, Vygotsky references Lewin (1935) who makes a distinction between a focus on phenomenological analysis—which focuses on phenotypes or visible manifestation—and *genotypic analysis,* which seeks to explain a phenomenon based on its origins rather than outward appearance. On the third principle, Vygotsky notes "…we need to concentrate not on the *product* of development but on the very *process* by which higher forms are established" (Vygotsky, 1978, p.64). I will elaborate on these three demands presently.

Process, not object or product. Vygotsky (1978) notes that to focus on process over object is to forgo experimental analysis in favor of dynamic analysis— *"To study something historically means to study it in the process of change*; that is the dialectical method's basic demand" (Vygotsky, 1978, p.65 emphasis in original). Such dynamic analysis requires a turning back to and reconstructing each stage in the developmental process in order to understand the origins of the activity: "We need to concentrate not on the *product* of development but on the very *process"* by which it was developed (Vygotsky, 1978, p.64). Through the employment of a "dynamic analysis" this study has adhered to this first demand of Vygotsky's method. The process that is referenced is the dialectical process—the "historical" development of the self and the society—the historical contexts is essential in understanding individuals through Vygotsky's dynamic analysis (Wertsch, 1991). The investigation of process over product is particularly salient when endeavoring to study adult behavior and why beginning teachers are more valuable for these purposes than those with decades of experience.

Explanation, not description. Vygotsky (1978), drawing from Kurt Lewin (1935) demands a focus not on the outward appearance of activities as phenotypes (descriptive) but on the origins that give rise to the outward appearances of activity through genotypic analysis (explanatory): "though two types of activity can have the same external manifestation, whether in origin or essence, their nature may differ most profoundly" (Vygotsky, 1978, p.63). A second-career teacher is an interesting example of how phenotypical analysis leads to inaccurate conclusions:

> **Terry:** When you come is as a new teacher you think everyone else has been there for a while you know… I felt like that. I felt like there's nobody else new, right? But then there was another. She was the history teacher. But like the English teacher I didn't find out till later and like he's only been teaching seven years. So, he changed jobs too. He was in a communications job, now he's an English teacher, right? And the math teacher had changed jobs, but she's retiring, and she's been

there for like twenty years…People, you think because they're so confident in themselves of the way they're presenting themselves, you think they've been in the school for a long time…or, because they're older…when it could be their first year (laughing).

A second-career teacher in *appearance* is more like an experienced teacher owing to an advancement of years, and we would like to believe that the skills developed in industry can transfer to the classroom. However, second-career teachers are often, in *relevant experience*, more similar to inexperienced peers—those who are coming fresh from undergraduate programs and are, in appearance, nearly as youthful as their (secondary) students and with little more professional or life experience.

Development in action, not fossilized behavior. Vygotsky (1978) discusses the plight of seeking to understand fossilized behaviors, or developmental processes that have "died away" leaving competency in their place. This progression to mechanized behavior is, of course, intended and natural, but Vygotsky is interested in studying individual development, not personal achievement. The automatic character of routinized behavior—that which is born out of continued practice—make psychological analysis of the behavior quite difficult. Vygotsky's work, therefore, sought to understand the process by which development occurs by observing the development in real time. "Any psychological process, whether the development of thought or voluntary behavior, is a process undergoing change right before one's eyes" (p.61). This may be a fleeting "aha!" moment as an individual grasps a concept, realizing development of a problem-solving method or it may be a process that takes days or weeks. Such an experimental-developmental process was employed by Vygotsky to observe behavior in development during problem-solving tasks with young children so that he could observe the process in action before children had the change to develop "automatic or mechanized psychological processes…being repeated for the millionth time" (Vygotsky, 1978, p.63-64).

Contribution to the Literature

The three co-constructed narrative case-histories herein provide a view of individuals becoming second-career teachers, at once engaging in socialization into the new cultural activity and discerning the ways in which tools from former cultural activity can be authentically deployed in the activity of teaching. The individuals are not viewed as products of socialization into the field of teaching—a characteristic of other studies that have sought to understand the adaptive and maladaptive experience of second-career teacher candidates. The case-histories reveal complex positioning of individuals seeking to make meaning of their experience, complex narratives presented by individuals seeking to gain an understanding of themselves through reconciling multiple group memberships, and stories of classroom practice that reveal complex incorporations and subordinations of multiple identities born of multi-faceted experience.

The current literature on second-career teachers contains several studies that employ the work of sociocultural theorists Jean Lave and Etienne Wenger. Lave and Wenger (1991) and Wenger (1998) provide descriptions of individuals working to situate themselves within the particular "community of practice" and note that identity formation for individuals transitioning between groups is a project of resolution of conflicts that emerge from multiple group memberships. Studies that employ Lave and Wenger's sociocultural frameworks rely—inappropriately—on resolution of conflict through subordination of multiple identities in pursuit of singular self-identification. In keeping with Vygotsky's demands, this study understands the process (not product) of identity formation and socialization of second-career teachers not as the resolution of identity conflicts born of competing priorities (Anderson, Fry, and Hourcade, 2014; Gifford, Synder, and Cuddapah, 2013; Haggard, Slostad, and Winterton, 2006; Morton, Williams, and Brindley, 2006; Pierce, 2007; Snyder, 2010; Synder, Olivera, and Paska, 2013) but

as the unending process of "becoming" a member of a community with a role to play and a story to tell. This process of situating the self, of acquiring the "tools of the trade" by engaging as an active participant in the activity of a culture, must be viewed in light of the interaction between the individual and the culture. Such engagement not only provides for one's acquisition of the cultural tools but also of an appreciation of oneself as an active participant, gaining "identity" as one who can lay claim to the milieu and engage in appropriate roles as a member of a community of practice.

This study seeks not merely to describe (what) but to explain (how) career changers have come to and are becoming in their second-career as teachers, making use of the cultural tools born of his prior and concurrent cultural activities. A thread of the current literature on second-career teachers studies the transfer of professional competencies into the classroom (Tigchelaar, Brouwer, and Korthagen, 2008; Etherington, 2009; Grier & Johnson, 2012, Antink-Meyer & Brown, 2017). Some studies have found that encouraging second-career teachers to draw on prior professional competencies can help them develop professional self-efficacy as newcomers to teaching (Freidus, 1994; Mayotte, 2003), yet questions have been raised about how relevant these professional competencies are to classroom teaching (Glenn, 2003; Diezmann and Watters, 2015). Some studies have expanded the view beyond the classroom to describe the ways in which dispositions born of prior professional engagements prepare teachers for recent turns toward "professionalized" standards for teaching (Storey, 2007; Tan, 2012). While career educators will not appreciate the partisan message Storey and Tan both present—that prior careers in business gave these second-career teachers an advantage in the modern era in which we find out educational system engaged—the more holistic view of the person has merit. While the literature has focused on how prior professional competencies can be utilized to aid in the

development of second-career teachers in teacher preparation programs, this limited view of

transfer of competencies does not take view of the transformations of the individual who is

drawing with them their prior cultural experience as "the totality of societal interactions" (Roth,

2015). Merely viewing the professional competencies and how they are transferred into teaching

and non-teaching activity provides a limited view of the individual as she is seen only as a

professional, not as a person. Criticism of my own conceptualization of the current study during

a roundtable presentation (Hildebrandt, 2016) guided me in reconceptualizing the study to look

beyond the individual-as-professional and to the "totality of societal relations" that Roth (2015)

demands we take into view.

This study tracks 1) the life histories of individuals marked by qualitative and

quantitative transformations (Roth 2015) as he or she engages in the activity of becoming a

second-career teacher and 2) the transformation of self as the individual tells his or her story

(Wortham, 2000). The study of three individual case-histories reveals the complex experience of

career-changers becoming second-career teachers, leaving careers and exploring new family

dynamics; engaging with new situations and different colleagues, different learning activities and

new students each year; and building a "tool kit" upon which to draw as they become more

capable in their craft. Beyond socialization and identity formation as appropriations of cultural

activity and the construction of a singular "teacher self", within each participant's story of

becoming a second-career teacher emerges an understanding of the unique cultural engagements

of each individual and the resolutions of multi-membership that they each pursue.

Presenting the data as co-constructed narrative case histories provides two benefits to

understanding the experience of second-career teachers. First, the "stor[ies] from the field"

(Schram, 2006) begin to illuminate the diversity of experience second-career teachers bring into

the classroom and allow professionals who are considering a career change to teaching to gain perspective from the experience of others, as stories have a hermeneutic quality and allow others to interpret and learn from them (Bruner, 1990). The co-constructed narrative case-histories also take into consideration the representational and interactional selves that participants constructed during open-ended interviews. The foregrounding of these situated performances highlights the ways in which individuals make sense of themselves through interactions with others, even during the process of sharing stories about themselves.

What Lies Ahead

This dissertation is organized into five chapters. Chapter One provides background of the focus and locus of the study. Chapter Two contains a review of the literature on second-career teachers. Chapter Three on "Methodology" provides a rationale for the use of case history design and narrative methodology, the details of specific recruiting, selection, and interviewing of participants, and details of the data analysis procedures. Chapters Four includes three parts, each containing one co-constructed narrative case-histories of the three participants. These narratives include both the material account—the participant's story—as well as reflections on the representational and interactional selves constructed during open-ended interviews. Presenting "long-story" narrative case-histories provide both a lens into the experiences of three second-career teachers. Chapter Five provides discussion of the results revisiting the research questions and themes from the literature on second career teachers to suggest implications for teacher-education programs and directions for future research.

CHAPTER 2

REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

In this chapter I provide a review of the literature that informs this study, both empirical and conceptual. I have organized this chapter to first present the historical context of the study of second-career teachers and then to analyze the literature that has explored the socialization and identity formation of second-career teachers. In the second part of the chapter I provide an analysis of the literature on second-career teacher socialization and identity formation, deploying various traditions to contextualize and critique the findings of previous research and to argue for the need to look at the complex lives of career-changers teachers holistically through the construction and analysis of narratives of becoming second-career teachers.

Historical view of the literature on second-career teachers

An emerging market. Crow, Levine, and Nager (1990) first reported on a trend of "career changers" entering teacher certification programs at Bank Street College (as well as other teacher preparation programs at Harvard and Columbia). Situated within a literature base on socialization and career change, Crow, et al. present an ethnographic study of those leaving other careers to join "the noble profession". 1990 was surely not the first instance of an individual leaving a career and entering the profession of teaching; yet, Crow et al. reveal that the necessity of this article was marked by a noted increase in the number of career-changers entering teacher certification programs. The literature (and field of teacher education) quickly turned toward a reactionary (and reductionist) approach, lauding "alternative" routes to certification (Shannon, 1990; The National Educational Service Corps, 1990; Madfes, 1991; Ryan and Spangler, 1991), some of which were instituted by corporations (e.g. Chevron, as reported in Madfes, 1991), to respond to shortages in the teacher workforce, specifically in mathematics and science.

Margaret McKenna (2001) delivers a call to arms in *Connection: New England's Journal of Higher Education and Economic Development*, citing for-profit companies, industry-sponsored fast-track programs, and packaged online courses as threatening entrants into the teacher preparation field and specifically targeting second-career teachers. A number of articles published shortly thereafter tout the merits of these various alternative routes reaching out to a growing sector of second-career teachers including new models of University teacher education programs (Resta, Huling, Rainwater, 2001; MacDonald & Manning, 2002; Konecki, Pottorff, King, Lin, Armstrong, Pryor, Reinken, Collins, Melin, Shroyer, Eikenberry, 2002; Morton, Williams, and Brindley, 2004; Gnadinger, 2006), fast track programs and alternative routes, including Teach for America (Tell, 2001; Ruenzel, 2002; deBettencourt & Howard, 2004; Weiner & Newtie, 2006; Donaldson, 2012), and technology enhanced programs, employing online tools and web-conferencing solutions, (Chapman & Knapczyk, 2003; Harrell and Harris, 2006). This agitprop is of little use to the literature base in terms of describing the population of second career teachers but does show sustained interest in grabbing part of the emerging market share. Kate Walsh and Sandi Jacobs (2007) add their own response and agitation to this research base in a report that outlines the gross variability in alternative certification programs and concludes that such routes to teacher certification are alternative only in name, often reflecting the undergraduate programs to which they are meant to be alternatives.

In 2008, The Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship Foundation published a monograph anticipating acute shortages in the teaching workforce within the decade. The report provides a retrospective look at alternative-routes for second-career teachers and offers brief recommendations for such programs: using recruiting techniques that target the strongest candidates, designing programs for the unique needs of adult learners, providing rich clinical

experiences and induction programs, and assisting with job placement. The report also offers recommendations for researchers, suggesting that data be collected on the number of second-career teachers entering the workforce each year, characteristics of the most effective programs be identified, the motivations of career-changers be analyzed, and the prior experiences of second-career teachers be explored to gain greater understanding of this unique population of teachers (Haselkorn & Hammerness, 2008). The report, published a decade ago, seemed to present these as new directions for research, highlighting the paucity of research on second-career teaches. The research base that had been developing since 1990, however, often focused on answering precisely the questions proposed in the foundation's study, seeking to improve educational programs for and understanding of second-career teachers.

That decade since the Woodrow Wilson Foundation report is now up, and the shortages are upon us. The present historical moment is as eager to see second-career teachers enter the ranks of classroom teachers as at any point in the last three decades. When National Public Radio (2018) interviewed Stanford University Professor Emeritus Linda Darling-Hammond about our nation's current teacher shortage she stated that we are providing credentials to individuals who pass "the breath test: if [you] can fog the mirror, you're qualified to teach". Alternative certification programs and emergency credentials will continue for the foreseeable future, and we ought to continue digging for understanding of who second-career teachers are as people with rich experiences born of storied personal and professional lives.

Second-career teacher identity and socialization

An interest in understanding the motivations for becoming a second-career teacher and the life experiences of those becoming second-career teachers is a quest for understanding individual development. As I have noted earlier, my sociocultural understanding of individual

development explores the social and historical contexts that give rise to individual development through processes of socialization and identity formation. Situated in the literature on second-career teachers is a small literature subset that explores second-career teachers' socialization and identity formation.

The questions posed by the Woodrow Wilson Foundation report are *why* and *how* questions—the type of questions that are not easily answered and perhaps are never answered definitively. The literature on *why* individuals change careers to become teachers provides several motivations that lead second-career teachers into the field. These motivations are important as they create qualitative changes in the life course of individuals, expanding (and constraining) the activities that can be pursued thereafter (Stetsenko, 2013; Roth, 2015). Glenda Anthony and Kate Ord (2009) find that second-career teachers switch careers when the time is right, when the opportunity to teach looks good, and when they feel called to pursue a burgeoning passion to teach. The first reason has been echoed by others who find that second-career teachers are often seeking to re-balance value propositions in their lives—namely family and work priorities (Crow, Levin, & Nager, 1990; Freidus, 1989; Young, 1995; Lee, 2011; Morettini, 2014). At times, researchers have found that the opportunity to teach may look like a reasonably stable vocational choice (Olsen, 2008; Richardson & Watt, 2005). Pursuing a passion for teaching, a love for subject matter, or responding to a sense of calling is the most romantic of the reasons to pursue a second-career in teaching, and several studies found this to be the chief motivation for second-career teachers making the change though all found other values were taking into consideration (Backes & Burns, 2008; Castro & Bauml, 2009; Williams & Forgasz, 2009).

The literature on how individuals become second career teachers looks at both identity and socialization, and much of the literature focuses on the struggles of second-career teachers in both regards. The literature reveals that second-career teachers experience challenges in the classroom in the same ways that first career teachers do—disengaged students, behavioral issues, a struggle to cover content (Gifford, Synder, and Cuddapah, 2013). They also find overly bureaucratic administrative structures and a set of social mores that take time to understand and internalize (Anderson, Frey, and Hourcade, 2014). Yet second-career teachers struggle in unique ways as well often needing to balance families and other responsibilities, not to mention a number of personal and social identities and take new role identities (e.g. as yet-again students and newcomers to their work) while in teacher preparation programs and beyond (Morton, Williams, and Brindley, 2006; Haggard, Slostad, and Winterton, 2006; Pierce, 2007). Others have found that second-career teachers experience a "loss of identity" (Freidus, 1994) or a conflict of identity statuses as they go from an experienced professional in their first-career to a newcomer in the second (Grier and Johnston, 2009; Williams, 2010). Further, as second-career teachers engage in the day-to-day work, they must be transformed *into* teachers, being trained in and internalizing the cultural activity through socialization (Griffiths, 2011) and developing a new self-concept (Synder, Oliveira, and Paska, 2013).

Socialization and Identity Formation. Much of the literature on second-career teacher identity focuses on a framework of self-perception. This "inner sense" of being a teacher is important as there is evidence to suggest that individuals who see themselves as part of the group—who subscribe to the collective identity—are more likely to persist in the field. The literature on second-career teachers, again, focuses on ways to mitigate attrition from the field— second-career teachers are being recruited due to acute shortages in the teaching workforce and

graduates of alternative certification programs such as those serving second-career teachers have higher attrition rates than teachers prepared in traditional undergraduate programs (Darling-Hammond, 2003). Several early studies investigating teacher identity and socialization include case studies chronicling the experiences of second-career teachers in teacher preparation programs (Novak and Knowles, 1992; Powell, 1994; Neapolitan, 1996; Heuser and Owens, 1999; Gomez, Walker, and Page, 2000). These studies explore second-career teachers' reasons for going into teaching and the ways they draw on personal and professional experiences when navigating in the classroom and through school bureaucracy. Conducted in alternative teacher preparation programs seeking to serve non-traditional students such as second-career teachers, these cases provide information for faculty members who work with this population. Both the focus and the locus of these studies are problematic for understanding how individuals become second career teachers negotiating multi-membership **of** various cultural activity systems as they engage in the new activity of teaching.

Work on second-career teachers' self-concept is important for understanding the ways that we can encourage professionals to leverage their professional experience to find success as classroom teachers. A context-specific construct, self-efficacy is defined as "beliefs in one's capacity to organize and execute the courses of action required to produce given attainments" (Bandura, 1997, p.3). For a teacher, self-efficacy is the individual's belief the he or she can successfully accomplish the tasks demanded of her as a teacher (Tschannen-Moran, Woolfolk, Hoy & Hoy, 1998; Tan, 2012). Studies in this realm focus on self-efficacy, seek to leverage first-career competencies in order to promote a sense of self-confidence in the classroom (Freidus, 1994; Mayotte, 2003; Tigchelaar, Brouwer, and Korthagen, 2008; Etherington, 2009; Grier & Johnson, 2012) as well develop positive perceptions of the new

professional self (Wiehe, 2009; Wilcox & Samaras, 2009). While second-career teachers have

been found to have higher self-efficacy and job satisfaction than first-career teachers, self-

efficacy has a higher impact on job stress in second-career teachers than first year teachers

(Troesch and Bauer, 2017). This may lead to quicker attrition of second-career teachers as these

once-capable professionals now find themselves struggling with the work at hand.

Consistent with the sociocultural perspective that views knowledge as situated and

culturally constituted by ever-evolving action, even the content knowledge needed for teaching is

distinct from that required in the professional field (Mayotte, 2003; Glenn, 2003; Diezmann and

Watters, 2015). This finding runs contrary to the belief that capable professionals will make

capable teachers and poses an important challenge to the conclusion from previous research that

second-career teachers will bring their industry experience directly into the classroom. A focus

on technical skill in "pedagogy" will not make a teacher into an individual who is able to engage

in the art of teaching. In order to be effective as a teacher, one must be effective at making prior

cultural engagements relevant to the current practice of teaching. Studies in this realm note the

difficulties of second-career teachers in appropriating the cultural norms, suggesting that stronger

mentorship programs are needed (Griffiths, 2011; Glenn, 2003). Sociocultural theory

understands the newcomer's (Lave & Wenger, 1991) need for guided practice (Rogoff, 1990)

from mentors serving as more capable others (Vygotsky, 1978). Additionally, systemic supports

in both teacher intern and first-year induction programs prove instrumental in helping second-

career teachers develop the self-efficacy needed to thrive in their new profession (Haselkorn &

Hammerness, 2008; Griffiths, 2011)

Beyond findings that teachers need training to translate skills and knowledge used in the

professional arena into the classroom (Mayotte, 2003; Diezmann and Watters, 2015), a strand of

inquiry has looked at professional dispositions and how they impact the newcomer to teaching (Storey, 2007; Tan, 2012; Nielson, 2016). This work provides information to support teacher efficacy as well as transformations in the identities of second-career teachers. The investigation of prior competencies moves beyond discussions of self-efficacy and into the way prior experiences are brought into teaching. The view of the self expands from one that seeks competence as a teacher to a self-concept born of appreciating the role one is playing in a particular context. Gail Mayotte (2003) argued that new second-career teachers must consider their attitudes about teaching, arguing that these are often born out of prior work experience.

Yet noting even the interplay of prior career competencies and pedagogical knowledge that are important in the transition to a new career, the view remains limited to technical skills and dispositions rather than an ability to engage in a dynamic transformation through dialectical processes of situating an emergent life history within evolving cultural engagements. The individuals in these studies are describing their experiences through self-report measures in surveys and interviews. They are asked to describe themselves—the sense of themselves— through reporting on self-perceptions. The focus created a false dichotomy and explores an "in/out" self-understanding—one of being, not becoming. In their work with first career teachers, Kenneth Zeichner and Jennifer Gore (1990) found that prior educational experience, teacher-education programs and the teaching practicum, and workplace culture each played a role in the shaping of teacher identity. Further, understanding life history and sociohistorical context is beneficial in exploring socialization and identity development of first-career teachers (Diniz-Pereira, 2003; Vuorikoski, 2001). This is particularly true among second-career teachers who have more life experience and have engaged in socialization into a work culture previously as adults. The exploration of an individual's development into a new community of practice ought

to present the full arc of the self-transformation rather than take focus on the early stages of developing a new social identity.

Identity conflicts and teacher self-identification. Studies on second-career teacher identity formation often look to psycho-social processes of transition to investigate adaptive and maladaptive experience, following psychological views of identity crisis as a way of understanding individuals in transition. These views have roots in Erikson's theories of identity. While Erikson's focus was on adolescents, the confusion that arises in transition between two life courses can be seen as psychosocial moratorium. Erikson explored commitments to identity domains of relationships, ideologies, and occupation as ways to rectify identity crises. Yet, in the case of second-career teachers, satisfying the commitment to work means coming to identify oneself as a teacher. This is less an exploration of identity formation than another way for an individual to identify as a teacher (or not) in order to formulate a new identity. Studies of second-career teachers' socialization and identity have identified a struggle that emerges from the identity conflict when engaging in a new culture or taking on a new role (Newman, 2010; Williams, 2010; Synder, Olivera, and Paska, 2013) leaving newcomers with a sense of being caught between worlds with a liminal identity (Pierce, 2007) needing to subordinate some part of themselves in order to experience a cohesive sense of self (Trent and Gao, 2009; Snyder, 2010). Wenger (1998) believes: ''multi-membership and the work of reconciliation are intrinsic to the very concept of identity'' (p. 160).

Erik Erikson's work on identity crisis, particularly among adolescents, follows a psychological tradition of seeking to maintain a singular self-identification or identity. As Erikson discusses adolescence, he purports that individuals find themselves through role experimentation—through taking on different forms to see where they find a "fit"—and "gains

an assured sense of inner continuity and social sameness which will bridge what he was…and what he is about to become, and will reconcile his conception of himself and his community's recognition of him" (Erikson, 1956, p.45). The "fit" is evidenced by "feelings of being at home in one's body, a sense of 'knowing where one is going' and an inner assuredness of anticipated recognition from those who count" (Erikson, 1956, p.51). Erikson finds those in transition are "primarily concerned with what they appear to be in the eyes of others" as they search for continuity and sameness and that the threat to identity at this stage in development is role confusion (Erikson, 1950, p.327).

The "fit" that Erikson describes may be understood as a reconciliation between the social, empirical self and the reflective, subjective self. The social self, for William James (1890), is the view of an individual that is constructed by others. "A man's social self is the recognition which he gets from his mates…he has as many social selves as there are individuals who recognize him and carry an image of him in their mind" (James 1890, p.159). The "me", as James calls this social self may be as multiple as the number of social interactions. The "I", the self-concept or self-perception—otherwise called identity—is constructed through a reflective process. George Herbert Mead (1929) describes the inner conflict that occurs as one reflects and seeks to gain self-understanding. The "me" or social actor is, in Mead's rendering, subject to the "I" or social critic. The "I" observes the various roles and social actions of the "me" and determines whether or not they line up with the core values.

Sociocultural theorists William Penuel and James Wertsch (1995) proclaim that "Identity research must examine contexts in which identity is contested or under transforming shifts." (p.90), but this does not mean that the reconciliation of multiple identities need not be through subordination. Elaine Wilson and Rosemary Deaney (2010) investigate how one scientist-turned-

teacher exercises agency as she transitions to teaching. The authors investigate the teachers personal and social identities and self-concept, analyzing self-verification and self-efficacy to explain the process of identity formation. While the theoretical framework for the study is strong, the findings are discouraging. Most notably, the authors find that a mismatch between the "ideal teacher" image held by the second-career teacher and the realities of teaching, leading the participant to leave her part-time teaching post after just one term. The struggle of not being the type of teacher that she had wanted to be—with little support and guidance—proved a significant challenge in constructing a realistic identity during the participant's induction year. Instead of focusing on the maladaptive characteristics of the individual would-be teacher or the sudden alienation found in moving from one cultural context to another, Wilson and Deaney provide a more narrative interpretation—the once-but-not-again teacher could not see a coherent fit to the story of her life. This study shows promise for future directions in narrative research as Wilson and Deaney all but proclaim that the new teacher has not *yet* become that which she hoped she would be as a teacher owing to the fact that they followed her through an induction year rather than when she had become situated within her new profession.

   Role Identity. Individuals who have or are engaged in multiple cultures are dynamically drawn to the cultural resources of their multiple cultural activities in order to become active participants within each culture. This departs from both the analysis of purely psychological identity formation and purely social identity in an effort to view the individual as an active agent in the cultural activity which gives rise to a situated identity. The former departure moves from an analysis of individual's choice and response in different cultures to a view of how the cultural activities or life events call upon an internalized repertoire of potential responses. The later

28

departure moves from an understanding of the individual as one who is more-or-less able to engage in adaptive behaviors within a culture by using the tools appropriated therein.

While the literature on second-career teachers has taken role-confusion to constitute a psychological crisis and being caught between worlds with a liminal identity, role-confusion may merely be indicative of being in the early phases of socialization. Erving Goffman (1961) uses the term role-conflict to describe the phenomenon of an individual presenting an improper self (role-identity) for a particular audience. For second-career teachers, such "conflict" has been shown to arise from competing priorities in social and familial (Gifford, Synder, and Cuddapah, 2013) or personal and professional roles (Haggard, Slostad, and Winterton, 2006; Morton, Williams, and Brindley, 2006). The employment of "conflict" language indicates adherence to a belief in a singular, unified self that is common to psycho-social frameworks which seek coherence and suggest maladaptive engagement in social life if resolutions cannot be found (Erikson, 1968).

Individuals must appropriate roles by internalizing social scripts, cultural norms and expected behaviors. This is the internalization process through which an individual comes to reflect the cultural activity. Social Constructivists, symbolic interactionists and sociocultural theorists agree that individuals will take on many roles which will be developed in highly contextualized settings and will be played out in similar settings. Further, it is argued, these roles will create horizons, confining the activity of the individual, who will privilege the social script as appropriated. Goffman (1959) states that this may occur because the individual lacks appropriate role-segregation which would allow him or her to present each role in an appropriate social setting (p.36).

This, however, would seem to construct a dire situation for an individual changing

careers and becoming a teacher. The individual would have to begin anew appropriating the

repertoires of the [teaching] culture in order to successfully perform his or her role in the

classroom and beyond. Individuals would be tabula rasa, clean slates to be filled with the context

specific knowledge required to be teachers. Worse yet, all teachers would teach precisely as their

teacher preparation courses had instructed—which is not to say [definitively] poorly, but

certainly the idea of rehearsed, mechanical teaching activity is uninspiring at best. Further, the

interest in recruiting second-career teachers is that individuals from will bring their experience

into the classroom and inspire students to see knowledge as something that can be used in "the

real world" not merely a set of facts and figures to memorize and regurgitate at exam time.

Certainly some of the professional role is desired in the classroom, if only elements that have

been translated for operationalization in the activity of teaching.

Cultural tools provide affordances and constraints, setting limits on possible forms of

socially relevant interaction (Wertsch, 1991; Berger and Luckman, 1966, p.102). The constraints

are often highlighted by symbolic interactionists (e.g. Meade, 1934; Goffman, 1959; Blumer,

1969) but that does not mean that there are not intersections between cultures with their own sets

of meaning for interaction. Social Constructionists Berger and Luckman add that people's

"relevance structures intersect with the relevance structures of others at many points, as a result

of which we have 'interesting' things to say to each other" (p.45). While the literature on second-

career teachers focuses on the maladaptive behaviors of individuals transitioning from industry

to the classroom, it would follow from Berger and Luckman that the affordance of multiple

"relevance structures" would also play into teachers' transitions not merely the constraints.

James Wertsch (1991) points to what Mikhail Bakhtin (1981) termed privileging—the means by

which the individual actor selects the cultural tool that is "more appropriate or efficacious than others in a particular social setting" (Wertsch, 1990, p.124). A privileging –not a relinquishing or subordinating—of particular cultural tools is a process of the individual agent selecting from among the "tool kit" to which she has access (Bakhtin, 1981; Wertsch, 1991). The individual is not merely appropriating "tools for teaching" but also working to situate herself within the context of the cultural activity of teaching and working to situate teaching within the constellation of the cultures in which she is engages.

Sociocultural theorists contend that not only language but all cultural activity provides affordances and constraints upon an individual's activity. The cultural tools, including language, that one uses have been developed over time in the specific cultural context. As with symbolic interactionism, the ways individuals can use the tools and the roles that they can play are limited by the historical development of the culture. Culture provides us with role images (Erikson, 1968) or social scripts (Tomkins, 1978) for how we can and should act and react in certain circumstances. These are not trained responses that are directly instructed but rather socialized, or interiorized, behaviors. Conceiving of socialization as the internalization (Vygotsky, 1978) or appropriation (Rogoff, 1990) of cultural practices allows for the formation of a new identity through which the individual can become a more central participant (Wenger, 1998) and engage more competently and confidently in cultural activity. In this way socialization is not the *taking* of cultural tools nor the *making* of oneself but instead the *situating* of the self whereby the individual holds an identity within the context of the present cultural activity. As Wenger (1998) clarifies: "identity in this sense is an experience and a display of competence that requires neither an explicit self-image nor self-identification with an ostensible community" (p. 152).

Talking about processes of socialization and identity separately perhaps serves only to disentangle two mutually constitutive processes. Exploring individual self-transformations as processes of becoming, we must concede that one is always being socialized and always forming and expressing an identity. Jennifer Vadeboncoeur, Renira Vellos, and Kristen Goessling (2011) see identity construction as central to the project of learning *not* because one must know herself in order to interact with those around her but because interacting with the individuals, social context, and social systems around one self is the only way to situate the self and "complete" an identity (see also Vygotsky, 1997; Bakhtin, 1993). Vadeboncoeur et al. join Penuel and Wertsch (1995) in noting that identity changes from context to context based on the cultural tools employed and unique contexts and actors engaged.

Narratives of Second-Career Teachers. A specific recommendation for future research from one of the early case-histories of second-career teachers, Novak and Knowles (1992) suggest in-depth studies of personal and professional life-histories:

> There is a need to more clearly understand the impact of certain first careers and specific life events on individuals' later development as teachers. Research efforts are needed which identify the common traits of second-career teachers, particularly focusing on those elements which provide insights into the interplay of previous life and career experiences and their subsequent impact on teaching. In-depth studies of individuals may illuminate those elements. (p. 34)

In his research on work and identity, sociocultural theorist Stephen Billet (2006, 2008) discusses an approach that seeks to investigate the situated identity presented in a particular culture that is informed by prior experience and life history. An individual comes to any setting with a history and a past of complex relationships, interactions, and cultural activities from previous cultural engagements. In order to understand who an individual *is* we must understand not simply *who* they are or *where* they are (what culture they are engaged in) but where they have been, where they are, and where they are going. An individual is not a unique *who* but

rather a rendering of her myriad cultural engagements. We can take view of the individual making sense of the constellation of cultural activity rather than as one in transition between fixed inner identities or understandings of the self. This allows a view of situated experience vis a vis Lave and Wenger (1991) without the assumption that all things in the present situation are born of the interactions therein but may also be drawn in from prior experience and even imagined futures (such as imagining oneself as the "ideal type" teacher). Billet (2006) emphasizes the individual-as-actor in a social world, in which the individual is transformed through intentional actions across the life-course. Who we are is emergent as we are, at any given point, all that we have been and all that we will become. As such, we are in process—in a perpetual state making sense of what we have done and positioning ourselves for what we will do in the future.

In two studies exploring the development of second-career teachers, Jóhannsdóttir and Roth (2014) and Roth (2015) explore the "becomings" of second-career teachers by looking at single cases of how teachers are making *qualitative* changes in their development as they depart from prior professions to become teachers and *quantitative* changes in their development as they engage with and in the cultural activity of teaching. Roth (2009) has called qualitative changes *development* as they present dramatic shifts in the life-course possibilities presented to the individual. She has called quantitative changes *learning* as these are incremental and continuous growth within a singular culture of activity. Taking a case-history approach, both explorations of second-career teachers look at dramatic changes in the life course (qualitative), such as changing careers, and incremental changes in lived-experience (quantitative) as they engage more fully in the cultural activity of teaching. As Roth seeks to understand the becomings of teachers, he employs the term "knotwork" (see Engeström, 1987) to describe the complex

interaction of cultural engagements that constitute the individual expression of the "totality of societal relations". This term comes from Yrjö Engeström (1987), a Cultural Historical Activity Theorist who ascribes, like Roth, to a materialist understanding of human development. Engeström's work discusses the ways in which our multiple realms of activity allow for *Learning by Expanding* (the title of his seminal work)—developing larger networks of experience through qualitative changes in cultural activity. As such, Roth (2015) take to analyzing the material story, observing the "becomings" present in second-career teachers' account of the transition to teaching and the inherent transformations that occur when one's cultural activity changes or expands. He notes his own "un/becoming" as a science teacher was a "dropping in and dropping out" as he engaged in other activities throughout his work and personal life. Such a material story or narrative account of one's development and provides an understanding of how cultural engagements over time provide the individual with transformational opportunities through engagement with the activity of various cultures.

Roth (2015) also notes a second becoming— "becoming as" a teacher. Roth views these as quantitative changes or instances in which an individual is learning within the context of a new culture, what I have previously discussed as internalizations or, more simply, a process of socialization. Thurídur Jóhannsdóttir & Wolff-Michael Roth (2014) take up discussion of non-professional cultural activities more centrally in presenting the story of a fisherman-turned-teacher in a small village in Finland. Sam, a former fisherman and teacher-in-training serving as a student teacher in a language instruction program, draws upon his experiences as a village entertainer to tell stories in the classroom as a part of his teaching. This was not Sam's occupation but rather one of his many cultural engagements that had a significant impact on his development as a teacher— "He made the students laugh and enjoy themselves" (Jóhannsdóttir

& Roth, 2014, p. 7). This forwards the idea that a variety of cultural tools provide the affordance of "relevance structures" that teachers can draw upon when becoming as teachers in the classroom (Berger and Luckman, 1966).

> Activity-based sociocultural theories assume that learning is a process of mutually constitutive individual, social, and cultural *transformations*, which takes place through peoples' participation in activities. Activity is the unit of analysis, and the goal is to describe and interpret these processes and transformations by observing them, describing them, and comparing them across multiple natural settings. (Weldon, 2001, p.86, italics added)

Through a narrative that encompasses the personal and professional life history as it comes to bear on the current practice of teaching, Roth draws out the story of how the individual has engaged as an active agent by being drawn into practices of the new culture, drawing upon practices of prior or concurrent cultures in the new culture, and dynamically "privileging" the multiplicity of cultural tools born of multi-faceted lived experience in order to affect situationally appropriate activity. Individuals are engaged in a world of myriad cultural interactions and cannot live out every possible life course. Qualitative changes arise from dramatic shifts in cultural activity. Viewing the "totality of social interactions" through their life-history— particularly one that is *about* a career change—will inevitably bring about movements in the activities in which the individual engages. While taking view of this life-history seems to satisfy the call by Novak and Knowles and the framework provided by Billet, the view of the individual remains materialist, objectifying experience that has an inherently subjective, human character. Further development of narrative methodology has sought to move beyond the material story and into an exploration of the narrative construction of self.

Interpersonal narrative expressions of identity. Over the last four decades, narrative methodologies have taken root as a mode of understanding psychological constructs such as identity (Bruner, 1990; Polkinghorne, 1991). While narrative inquiry leads to the production of a

story, it is not sufficient to take the material story as a construction of identity. The sociocultural approach demands, presented earlier, include an examination of the individual 1) in process of change 2) in the context of her social and historical (cultural) engagements, and 3) through using mediational means as the unit of analysis (Wertsch, 1991). In exploring identity narratively, we can look for sociohistorical context in the material story that is presented, and we can observe the individual in the process of change through the historical actions presented as she stories her lived-experience as Roth and Jóhannsdóttir have done. We can also explore the meaning-making undertaken by the narrator in the activity of re-storying the narrative, analyzing her intentions as she speaks to a particular audience. Finally, as interviewer and interviewee engage in dialogue that gives rise to the narrative, we can come to understand the "type of self" she is becoming as an individual engaged in a particular social interaction. The analysis of the representational and interactional features of narrative has not been undertaken in the literature on second-career teachers.

In looking at the representational and interactional aspects of the narrative account it is possible to hear individuals "trying on" different selves as they engage in the interviews. As noted earlier, individuals are confined to specific roles by the cultural activities they have engaged in, but these roles can be played in a variety of contexts. When an individual is telling he life story, she will enact particular roles through the telling in order to represent herself in particular ways. These representational aspects of narrative are often analyzed for investigations of "narrative identity" or "narrative self-making/taking" (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990). Wortham (2000) argues that much of the literature on narrative construction of self relies on an understanding of the participant's description of their self and takes to analyzing the *representational account* in which the narrator describes or presents herself as a particular type

of person. This is certainly a key function of narrative and an important aspect of the narrative to be explored. Particular presentations of self serve particular purposes of intentions of the speaker (Goffman, 1959), the first component of Bakhtin's Trio. But Wortham argues that looking solely at the representational account provides an incomplete understanding of the presentation and transformation of self.

Wortham's work allows for a consideration of the full trio: the intention, addressivity, and voice(s) present in the co-construction of narrative case histories. In analyzing narrative case-histories we can go beyond the representational function and view the interactional function. Through the telling of their story individuals represent and enact themselves as particular types of self may transform themselves by "becoming" the "type of self" that they present during the interview. "Sometimes narrators can change who they are, in part, by telling stories about themselves (e.g., Freeman, 1993; Gergen, 1994; Grumet, 1987)" (Wortham, 2000, p.157). Wortham concludes that by representing and enacting a type of self, narrators can, through their performance, become the type of self presented. Following this tradition adds another layer for understanding the development-in-action of second-career teachers as they are becoming through their participation in this study.

Conclusion

The problem of the literature base on second-career teachers is not on the type findings that describe second-career teachers but in the fact that the findings themselves are descriptions of the population and, often, aim to improve the teacher education programs serving these students rather than seeking to understand and support the second-career teachers themselves. Vygotsky demands that we move beyond description of phenotypic presentation to a focus on genotypic analysis—an explanation of the conditions that gave rise to the outward expression.

There is little work done to explain why second-career teachers sometimes struggle to situate themselves within the activity of the school. There is not merely a need to ask different questions but a need to ask questions in a different way.

Explanation of phenomena can be pursued by studying the history that gives rise to the circumstances. This is component to what Vygotsky demands—that the individual be studied historically. The individual is a product of her sociohistorical situation. Thinking narratively, this begs for the arc of the story—an understanding of the origins of the activity of the moment that can be cast toward a future visioning. This is the past, present, future linking that is demanded of narrative methods and a way to focus on the explanation of development-in-action through an investigation of the processes that give rise to the development.

The literature on second-career teachers is lacking in the application of broad questions about the experience of second-career teachers. Additionally, the literature on the identity formation and socialization of second-career teachers is missing a dynamic consideration of identity formation, privileging a Western preference of unified theories of identity and self-concept and taking view of the individual in transition rather than of an individual undergoing transformation. This study adds to the literature by sharing and analyzing the stories of second-career teachers to explore the multi-faceted lived experience born of participation in prior professional and mature personal settings. Specific additions to the literature will be the form of co-constructed narrative case-histories of experience and a dynamic approach to identity formation that aim to add depth to the data on *how* second-career teachers' experience the transformation of becoming a second-career teacher.

My aim in this study is not to determine the objective characteristics of how one engages in the profession of teaching but rather to explore the subjective phenomenon of how one

engages in the *activity of becoming* a second-career teacher, drawing with them the handiwork of their prior cultural experience. The story itself is imbued with meaning, and this study will attempt to analyze the constructed and constituted meanings (Bruner, 1990). The foregrounding of co-constructed narrative case histories and their analysis will provide an understanding of how second-career teachers are engaging in the current activity of teaching and drawing on prior and concurrent experience in their day-to-day lives as they are becoming second-career teachers. These stories will serve to enrich the lives of those who tell them and those who hear them and will allow those working with second-career teachers or those who are considering a second-career as a teacher to learn from those who have previously walked this path (Coles, 1989; Bruner, 1990).

CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

On becoming as a researcher

My own journey to becoming a researcher track the theory employed in this study. Opportunities arise through conversation and provide new cultural tools that allow me to move beyond constraints in my research activity. My path to this research methodology began with a call from Vygotsky (1978) to embrace the search for method as "one of the most important problems of the entire enterprise of understanding the uniquely human forms of psychological activity. In this case, the method is simultaneously pre-requisite and product, the tool and the result of the study" (p.65). It is nice to know that the search ends, even if what you were looking for ends up in the last place you look.

When I first conceived of a narrative study, I heard the romantic "call of stories" (Coles, 1990) as a way of allowing participants to engage in a meaning-making enterprise (Bruner, 1990). My desire was to draw out the stories of my participants and position myself in an advocacy stance giving voice to the experience of second-career teachers who, the literature seemed to indicate to me, were recruited and trained for their expertise without regard for their rich experience. With narrative I wanted to give the rich and thick description of a second-career in teaching.

Interviews with participants revealed interesting stories. I wanted to share them as first-person autobiographical accounts, feeling that my participants sprung off the page as the most interesting people in the world. I had explored notions of emplotment from Lakoff and Ricoeur and Polkinghorne. I was happy with the way I had presented the voice of the individuals. But I had lost sight of the fact that they were not just telling their story, they were directing their story

for my ends—for my study of second-career teachers. There nowhere to go with the study of second-career teachers because I had written myself out of the narrative.

I read that co-constructing narratives was similar to covering findings and discussion. I looked back at an article by Wolff-Michael Roth (2015) that I thought had approached the subject well. Roth presented the story of an individual becoming a second-career teacher and then analyzed what had occurred through the story. I tried but it felt disjointed—like I was narrating over the dialogue in a film.

Dialogue may have been an aha moment. The co-construction is not presenting findings and then discussion but rather presenting findings and discussion at once. My own voice can enter the conversation from the interviews a second time, now as an observer of the interaction that took place. The transcripts and structured stories helped and moving back to audio and video tapes helped reveal that which I had missed. And I had missed a lot. I had missed anything but the material story. In his articles on becoming a second career teacher Roth takes the narrative account, the story, as the element to be analyzed.

New voices enter into my journey. The voices of committee members who remind me that I not only want to share case studies but I want to analyze the sociocultural activity. I want to inquire into the ways in which participants are engaging with me in the interview. I want to understand their development in action even as we sit and talk. But the idea of trying to understand who one is becoming through the telling their story was interesting. I looked back to well-known educational researchers in the narrative tradition and found Connelly and Clandinin (1990) had looked at the ways in which individuals represent themselves through telling their story. This allowed me to read transcripts through old lenses, looking for "the presentation of self" (Goffman, 1959). But this was not enough. A good deal of narrative research does take

view of the material story and the representational or propositional self and misses the richness of the meaning made in the interpersonal interaction of the interview (Wortham, 2000). I needed to engage the transcripts and recordings again to investigate the ways in which the individual was interacting with me and with the others in his or her own story—an aspect of the study that provided for a much deeper analysis than I had originally conceived.

Bakhtin and Wertsch lay out what, for me, was merely a theoretical framework. Reading work by Stanton Wortham and Madeline Grumet, I was able to understand how in looking at the text and seeking to understand the presentation of self, I was only uncovering the narrator's intention—the first part of Bakhtin's Trio. In analyzing the data for the interactional positioning throughout the narrative account, I could hear the addressivity and voice(s) that complete Bakhtin's trio. Participants were not telling their story, they were sharing with me how their story fit the contours I had laid before them. I was the audience—the co-author of the narrative template I had established for them. More importantly, they were sharing incredibly important information about the meaning they made of their experiences through the voices of others in their story, drawing in quotes from people long since passed from their lives and even from me as I sat with them dialoguing about their experience of becoming second-career teachers.

Introduction

"The search for method becomes one of the most important problems of the entire enterprise of understanding the uniquely human forms of psychological activity. In this case, the method is simultaneously pre-requisite and product, the tool and the result of the study." (Vygotsky, 1978, p.65)

My main research question "how do individuals become second-career teachers?" demands a broad view. It is not enough to look simply at the acquisition of the tools of the trade through teacher preparation programs as much of the literature has done. This is suitable to answer the question "how do individuals learn to teach" and misses the opportunity to gain a deeper understanding of second-career teachers and how their "totality of societal interactions" is brought to bear on the activity of teaching. An effort to understand the dynamic development of individuals becoming second career teachers requires a methodology that seeks to situate the individual within his or her sociocultural and sociohistorical context and explain the cultural activity that gives rise to the present activity. My research sub questions ask about how other aspects of the individuals past cultural activities play into and play out in the activity of teaching and in becoming a teacher. Answering these questions requires taking view of an extended timescape in order to situate the individual within a prior sociocultural context as they carry the story forward to the ways that second-career teachers come to and become confident in teaching.

More importantly, the methodology for this study must ensure that the unit of analysis in this study is what Roth (2015) calls "fullness of life"—but has at other times been more simply termed "activity" and more recently "experience"—in order to understand the complex and dynamic process individuals are experiencing as they are transformed by their changing cultural

activities. Through the co-construction and analysis of narrative case-histories, the fullness of life and the dynamic process of transforming the self through changing cultural activity is explored.

Employing a dynamic analysis of second-career teacher development

Vygotsky's (1978) search for method results in three essential characteristics of the investigation of higher psychological functions: an analysis of process, not objects; a focus on explanation, not description; and an investigation of development-in-action rather than fossilized behavior. Vygotsky stresses the importance of socio-historical *analysis of process* both looking backward and forward, noting that the analysis of processes "requires a dynamic display of the main points making up the processes' history" (p.61). Pursuing a *focus on explanation*, Vygotsky references Lewin (1935) who makes a distinction between phenotypic analysis—which focuses on phenotypes or visible manifestation—and genotypic analysis, which seeks to explain a phenomenon based on its origins rather than outward appearance. Rejecting the experimental designs and elementary stimulus-response investigations popular in psychology in his day, Vygotsky demanded an investigation of *development-in-action* noting "any psychological process, whether the development of thought or voluntary behavior, is a process undergoing changes right before one's eyes" (p.61).

The employment of narrative methods in this study provides a way to look at both the material narrative account (co-constructed narrative case-histories) and the interaction the gave rise to the narrative account (in-depth interview data). An analysis of process, not objects is evident as I seek to understand the *qualitative changes*, the ways in which teachers *learn (quantitative changes)* through cultural activity and interiorize the cultural tools of prior and concurrent cultural activity, even for employment in the practice of teaching (Stetsenko, 2013; Roth, 2015). A focus on explanation, not description is pursued as I do not seek to describe the

present "teacher self" but rather to understand how the current engagement in teaching activity is influenced by the prior and concurrent cultural engagements in which the individual has taken part. An investigation of *development-in-action* rather than fossilized behavior is evident in two respects. First, the situation of each individual as a current teacher is essential to their own appreciation of how they are developing as teachers, engaging in the activity of teaching at the same time as they are sharing their story of becoming a second career teacher. Analysis of the narrative account—the interaction that gave rise to the story—provides a more granular appreciation of the individual's *interpersonal development*: the ways she is being transformed even through the sharing of her own story (Wortham, 2000).

Case-History Design

A case study design should be used when a) the study asks "how" and "why" questions, b) the behavior of participants cannot be manipulated, c) the context may play a role in shaping the study, d) or the phenomenon and context have unclear boundaries (Yin, 2003). Each of these criteria is satisfied, making case study a suitable methodology. This study sought to understand *how* individuals become second career teachers and employed open-ended interviews to provide the space for individuals to tell their own story. Pamela Baxter and Susan Jack (2008) note that working to develop case studies of individuals demands close collaboration with participants while allowing them to tell their own story as the data to be analyzed in the study. In sharing their stories, participants describe their own reality, guided by the mediational means of the open-ended questions and the audience of the interviewer (Wertsch, 1991). Through hearing the individual tell her story, the researcher gains a better understanding of participants' actions (Baxter and Jack, 1998; Lather, 1992; Robottom & Hart, 1993) and the sociocultural contexts that gave rise to those actions (Polkinghorne, 1991). John Creswell (2007) argues that the

binding of a case can be done through story and suggests that individual case studies are case histories. I will use the term narrative case history instead of case study in this paper.

Using narrative case-histories to view the "totality of societal relations". Narrative is a method in qualitative research (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990) as well as a frame of reference for the research process (McAdams, 1985; Heikkinen, 2002). Narrative methods may be used as a way to present qualitative research data from a case study, a biographical study, a phenomenological study, or an ethnographic study (Creswell, 2007). Over the last four decades, narrative methodologies have taken root as a mode of understanding psychological constructs such as identity (Bruner, 1990; Polkinghorne, 1991). Narrative case-histories satisfy the demands listed above and provide a view of the "totality of societal interactions" as a narrative told across a sequential time presents a "human in process" (Schram, 2006). The lived experience of individuals as they engage in a new cultural context is one of navigating and negotiating social relationships, expressing individualities and appropriating social practices, and coming to terms with the way one is operating within the setting as both a capable outside and a newcomer becoming more capable in and identified with the new cultural activity. Through a narrative that encompasses the personal and professional life history as it comes to bear on the current practice of teaching, my aims were to draw out the story of how the individual has engaged as an active agent by being drawn into practices of the new culture, has drawn upon practices of prior or concurrent cultures in the new culture, and is dynamically "becoming" a second career teacher. This study analyzes the material narrative account for the qualitative and quantitative transformations in activity in which the individual engages and also analyzes the narrative account for representational and interactional characteristics presented by the individual narrator

as he or she is telling the story, representing and enacting particular selves in the process (Wortham, 2000).

  The material narrative account. Torril Moen (2006) contends "Narratives are not broken into elements; they are neither reductionistic nor static. Narratives, rather, enable us to study teachers and their teaching in movement, in a process of development, and within the teachers' social, cultural, and institutional settings." (p.59) This quote echoes the methodological demands put forth by Vygotsky, that we must view development not as a product of experience but rather as a process. Jóhannsdóttir and Roth (2014) and Roth (2015) take to analyzing the material story itself, observing the "becomings" present in second-career teachers' own account of their transition to teaching and the inherent transformations that occur when one's cultural activity changes or expands qualitatively as well as the quantitative changes that occur as an individual becomes a more central participant in the cultural activity. While this is of interest, my own study is interested not just in how one engages in the cultural activity as a more central participant but how the second-career teacher offers unique cultural tools appropriated from other contexts. Within each participant's story of becoming emerges an understanding of the unique cultural engagements of each individual. Roth employs the term "knotwork" (see Engeström, 1987) to describe the complex interaction of cultural engagements that constitute the individual expression of the "totality of societal relations". In this study, I am not interested in investigating how individuals are creating a "teacher self" but rather in understanding how individuals are engaged in the sociocultural processes of becoming second-career teachers, engaging in new cultural activities in ways that reflect the multiple cultural engagements both prior and concurrent and how they are coming to terms with the various roles and identities that constitute their multiple selves.

The representational and interactional features of the narrative account. Narrative is a way of creating meaning by "ordering" our experiences toward a particular ending (Gergen and Gergen, 1990; Polkinghorne; 1991; Bruner, 1990). Wertsch (2000) cites British literary critic Sir John Frank Kermode (1968) noting that the "sense of an ending" toward which a narrator speaks is a way for individuals to organize their story and shape the affordances and constraints of their narrative. In this way, looking solely at the material information presented in an interview excludes key data that can provide deeper understanding of the meaning being made through the narrative. In this study, the "ending" was the current status of each of the participants as second-career teachers, and the way that the ending was pursued was through co-constructing a narrative account of how participants became second-career teachers.

Narrative research is a collaboration between researcher and participant, not a search for information serving the purposes of the researcher (Altork, 1998). The heart of narrative is the meaning-making enterprise undertaken by those invested in constructing and hearing the narrative. As such, both the interviewee and interviewer's activity within the interview should be explored in order to fully understand the "narrative account" that is produced through the interaction of the interview. Wortham (2000) argues that much of the literature on narrative construction of self takes to analyzing the *representational text* in which the narrator describes herself as a particular type of person and must seek to address the interactional characteristics through which the individual "becomes" a "type of self" through the telling of her story. Both the representational and the interactional text can be analyzed through the lens of Bakhtin's Trio: intentionality, addressivity, and voice. Investigating a speaker's *intentionality* raises the question what is the speaker trying to communicate? A speaker sharing a story is able to present a particular version of his or her self in so doing. The speaker, thus, takes an agentic position in

crafting a personal narrative. Considering the *addressivity* requires that we ask who is being spoken to? In an interview setting, the addressee is the interviewer. The relationship shared between any participants in a conversation creates a power dynamic. The power dynamic between interviewer and interviewee is generally found to be imbalanced. Thus, while the participant is sharing his or her story in the way that he or she wants, agency is hindered by the power imbalance and by the questions posed by the interviewer. In short, while it is the participants story it is the researcher's study. Finally, listening to the *voice* presented affords an opportunity to ask the question who is doing the speaking? In this study, the answer to who is doing the speaking is approached from listening to the various roles, both enacted and envisioned, that participants have engaged. The participants in this study live multi-faceted lives with many roles that have been developed through cultural participation. While they have transitioned to second-careers in teaching, as they have done so they have incorporated tools they appropriated from other cultures into their current practice. When recounting stories, they may reveal voices developed in other cultures, exposing the multiple roles they engage while becoming second-career teachers. Their stories may include cultural scripts or authoritative voices of others that shape the discourse of the individual (Bakhtin, 1981). The trio becomes a framework for interpretation of the narratives employed by the researcher.

Co-constructing Narratives. The representational and interactional constructions of self are constrained by the structure of an interview. From a representational standpoint, the narrator is both "telling their story" and "answering the questions" posed by the interviewer. From an interactional standpoint, the interviewer encourages types of self to be presented by the ways he or she interacts with the interviewee. Wortham (2000) discusses how one interviewee represents and enacts a victimized self, demonstrating a "plea for the interviewer to take a more emotionally

involved position" (p. 161), but the interviewer continues with a more "scientific interview" approach, continuing with a line of questions rather than responding to the plea. Wortham suggests that the interviewer could have taken a more sympathetic position (and intimates that this should have been done), but we do not hear from the interviewer about their charge in the interview. The interviewer was a graduate student serving as a research assistant and may have been told to be as objective as possible, to do more listening than talking, or to remember that an interview is about the interviewee, not the interviewer (Seidman, 2006). While these are helpful pointers for conducting a scientific interview, an interview that is intended to provide for the co-construction of a narrative case-history, for instance, would not be served well by following these guidelines.

Methods

Relevant Contexts and Settings

This study was conducted in Eastern Massachusetts. Massachusetts boasts excellent public and private schools and a storied past of debate on the merits of each (see, e.g. Glenn, 1998). Massachusetts also requires that all public school teachers gain a teaching credential and, within 5 years of beginning teaching, complete a master's degree. This provides a highly qualified teaching workforce, a focus on professional development of teachers, and a clear path for second-career teachers entering the teaching workforce.

Data Collection

Data collection in the form of in-depth interviews took place between March and August of 2017. Data collection consisted of conducting three in-depth interviews with each participant in the study. Irving Seidman (2006) recommends a "three-interview structure" to provide sufficient contextualization that "one-shot" interviews fail to generate (p. 17). Further, in-depth

interviews enhanced "trustworthiness" of the study by providing intensive (though non-extensive) repeated exposure (Baxter, 2008) as I collected data about the lived experience of participants (Creswell, 2007). Seidman's (2006) interviewing protocol elicited information from which the case-histories were composed and provided a narrative account that could be analyzed for material, representational, and interactional aspects.

Data Source. The data source in this study consisted of in-depth interviews with participants. Three open ended in-depth interviews were conducted to capture the participant's relevant life history, experience becoming a teacher, and view of themselves as a teacher (attachment D). Each interview lasted between one and two hours. The interviews drew out the aspects of the cultures that the individual has engaged with and appropriated through their life experience as well as in the process of becoming a teacher. Participants shared stories of their lived experience through descriptive interviews (1 and 2). Transcripts of the first two interviews were reviewed during the third interview as the interviewer drew in excerpts to ask for clarity, interpretation, and even revision of earlier misrepresentations of meaning thus serving as a sort of "hermeneutic interview" (Van Manen, 2014) that asked participants to interpret or "make sense of" what they had previously shared.

- The first interview sought to gather the "focused life history" to put participants' experience in context (Seidman, 2006) and the understand how participants had engaged with prior cultural activities including family, school, community, and work.
- The second interview sought to gather the experiences of the teacher in the current culture—the experience of becoming a teacher.
- The third interview asked participants to reflect on the meaning being made in each culture and how the cultures interact—how do the prior cultures impact the teaching

culture and how does the current teaching culture impact perception of and engagement in (including retroactive meaning making) prior cultures.

Audio and video recordings were made of each interview to facilitate the construction of personal narratives (Seidman, 2006). Participants were allowed to access the audio recordings of their interviews upon request. These recordings were transcribed by the researcher. All recordings, transcripts, and pseudonym keys were stored on an encrypted cloud storage account authenticated with the researcher's credentials. All recordings, transcripts and pseudonym keys will be kept on an encrypted cloud storage account at the conclusion of this study.

Purposeful Sampling. A purposeful sample is appropriate for a study of individual experiences whether in a phenomenological framework or through life-history (Creswell, 2007). Patton (1990) notes a variety of different strategies for purposeful sampling. For my study, I chose a typical-case sampling with particular criteria for the sample: participants were selected from individuals who had engaged in a prior career for no fewer than three years and who have been teaching for at least two (2) years. These criteria were employed instead of an earlier desire to interview "successful" and "effective" teachers. Notions of using teacher "success" as selection criteria have been deemed imprudent, but it should be noted that my selection criteria may have accounted for ineffective teachers as certainly those who are unsuccessful (at least rhetorically) in that I drew from a pool of teachers in their 3rd year in the profession or beyond. Studies have indicated that less effective teachers have higher attrition rates (Goldhaber, Gross, Player, 2007), particularly after the 2nd year (Murname, 1984; Hanushek, Kain, O'Brien, Rivkin, 2005).

The aim of this purposeful sampling and limited demographic is to assist in presenting cases that are similar enough to be cohesive when taken together and allow the richness of

diversity to emerge in spite of these narrow criteria. The necessity of selecting participants with significant (3 years or more) of previous career experience and who are beyond the teacher prep or induction year stage of beginning teaching was to explore individuals undergoing complex processes of change—in keeping with the demand for genetic method—an essential of sociocultural research whether focusing on the individual (sociocultural) or group (cultural-historical activity theory) plane. These criteria also provide a population of individuals who are less likely to leave the profession, as previous research has indicated the teachers are most likely to leave during the first three years (Ingersol, 2001). In an effort to ensure teachers are studied "in process", the selection criteria allowed teachers to reflect upon their first years of teaching, which research would indicate include struggle, as well as an appreciation of how they are "catching their stride", which Pamela Grossman (2009) reports typically occurs around the third year which coincides with a reduction in attrition risk according to Linda Darling Hammond (2003).

Finally, in order to present narratives from similar individuals, participants in this study were all secondary teachers as the work secondary educator is quite different from that of an elementary teacher in pedagogy, classroom management, and potential for the use of cultural resources—in the form of disciplinary skills, knowledge, or dispositions—from a previous career.

Participant Selection. Participants were recruited through local schools and school districts. A recruiting email (Appendix B) was sent to principals and assistant principals at 10 high schools in Eastern Massachusetts. These gatekeepers were asked to circulate a recruiting email (Appendix B) among their faculty to recruit potential participants. Through the recruiting email, participants who were interested in taking-part in the study followed a link to an eligibility

questionnaire (Appendix C) in which participants were asked to confirm that they meet the

criteria for participation before giving their name and contact information, through the form,

directly to the researcher. The recruitment data of all who responded, including those who did

not participate in the study, will be destroyed at the conclusion of the study.

Participants who met the eligibility requirements were contacted by the researcher

through their preferred mode of contact (email) and were asked to schedule a brief informational

meeting about the requirements of the study. Once the informational meeting time was set, the

participant was emailed the informed consent document so that it could be reviewed during the

informational meeting. During the informational meeting, which was conducted over the phone

for all participants, the three-interview structure was reviewed and an overview of the short

timeframe for data collection—within a two- of three-week period for each participant, optimally

(Seidman, 2006)—was reiterated. Participants were informed over the phone that they would not

receive compensation for their participation in this study and were asked if they had questions

regarding the informed consent document. At the end of the informational meeting, a time and

location for in-depth interviews was established. Locations for in-depth interviews satisfied the

criteria suggested on the informed consent document:

- The interview location should provide a comfortable, safe and private space that is
  convenient for participants (minimal travel), free from distractions, and quiet enough to
  allow for recording of interviews.

- In order to protect participants' privacy, it was suggested that interview locations be
  outside of the workplace, but teachers retained the option to conduct the interview at their
  school if they wished. I offered all participants a "neutral space" in a study room at a

local library. Three of the participants chose to be interviewed in the space I provided.

The fourth opted to have conduct the interview in his office at his school.

Filling the participant pool of 3 participants took far longer than anticipated. Teachers and

administrators are busy, and without offering compensation for this study participants "gave" me

a large portion of their time. I am thankful that all participants persisted through the study and

were often eager to set up interviews in order to fit the established timelines.

Research Integrity

By listening to and recording the stories told by participants, I collected important

information about individuals in transition, transforming and being transformed by the cultures

in which they are engaged. The researcher is a key instrument in a qualitative research study

from the presence in the interview to the selective attentions and interpretive decisions made in

data analysis. In a qualitative study, subjectivity is always a consideration.

Tom Schram (2006) and Seidman (2006) both discuss the need to pursue

"trustworthiness" when engaging in qualitative research. Seidman looking at the validity of the

empirical data collected from the participant and Schram demanding that researchers account for

their own subjectivity and influence over the project. Seidman (2006) discusses

"trustworthiness" in relation to the in-depth interview, using the word trustworthiness in place of

the more familiar "validity" in referring to the veracity of the data. Taking recommendations

from Seidman (2006), "trustworthiness" of the interview data was pursued by engaging in all

three rounds of interviews with each participant over a short period of time (2 weeks) with short

intervals between interviews (2-3 days). I did not use multiple methods to "validate" or

"triangulate" the stories that participants shared, but participants were encouraged to use their

own professional records (CV, resume, teaching evaluations) or other sources to refresh their

recollection of particular points in time—not as triangulations of evidence but rather as aids to the participant in sharing from their experience.

While Seidman's recommendations provide some accounting for the "trustworthiness" of the participant's stories, they do not yet account for the subjectivity of the researcher. Schram (2006) notes a tension that the researcher must hold when pursuing qualitative research—to strive for objectivity while recognizing one's own subjectivity. Subjectivity will never be removed or "accounted for", and indeed the values, experiences, and views we, as researchers, hold give us the passion to pursue projects in which others may find no merit. The researcher must make efforts to present his motivations and assumptions clearly both in interactions with the participant during data collection and when discussing methodologies employed for data analysis.

Accounting for Subjectivity. When I made contact with participants my *presentation of self* (Schram, 2006) was as an educator and teacher education faculty member interested in hearing the stories of individuals who, like many of my graduate school students, are second-career teachers. I shared the key aim of the project was to hear about "the experience of career changers as they are becoming second-career teachers." While this is an oversimplification, I did not want to lead participants to try and answer my questions but rather to focus on sharing of their experience. Aware of the unequal power distribution between researcher and participant, I made further efforts to break any tension and let participants know that their story would guide our interviews. I shared my own brief narrative to initiate our interviews and engaged in a "reflexive dyadic" style of interviewing (Ellis and Berger, 2003) in order to engross the other, engage in a more natural conversation (Davidson, 2003), and not make my participants feel they were being interrogated or psychoanalyzed.

In qualitative research, the researcher himself is a research instrument. Engaged subjectivity (Schram, 2006) asks that we consider ourselves as the instrument, accounting for sensitivities, emotions, and personal qualities that inevitably influence the process and the project (Schram, 2006, p.135). The reason a researcher pursues a study is personal and subjective and must be laid bare. I employed a reflexive dyadic interviewing method described by Carolyn Ellis and Leigh Berger (2003) as a type of collaborative interview:

> Reflexive dyadic interviews follow the typical protocol of the interviewer asking questions and the interviewee answering them, but the interviewer typically shares personal experience with the topic at hand or reflects on the communicative process of the interview. In this case, the researcher's disclosures are more than tactics to encourage the respondent to open up; rather, the researcher often feels a reciprocal desire to disclose, given the intimacy of the details being shared by the interviewee. The interview is conducted more as a conversation between two equals than as a distinctly hierarchical, question-and-answer exchange, and the interviewer tries to tune in to the interactively produced meanings and emotional dynamics within the interview itself (Gubrium and Holstein, 1997). (p. 162)

While an interview method provides a collaborative approach, the power imbalance between researcher and participants is clear and largely assumed as a component truism within qualitative research (Schram, 2006). The selection of this interview style was an intentional step toward developing rapport and also meant that I was continuously making myself familiar to the participants in the study. I made an intentional decision to "start" the conversation by sharing a framework of my own "multi-faceted" life history. At the beginning of each interview I shared the following:

> I am interested in hearing your story of how you're becoming a second career teacher. I don't assume to know what a traditional trajectory looks like, I don't value career teachers in quotes over second career teachers, I don't hold dear any notion of what it means to teach, what it means to be a teacher, I don't pretend all teachers have a single set of values, beliefs, norms, morays. For what it's worth I worked as an emergency medical technician and as a teacher I engage in stonework and carpentry as professionalized hobbies. I'm excited by science and literature and I find new depths of my character both good and bad each day as I strive to be a better husband and a better father. Your story is likely as multi-faceted as mine and that's why I'm here. I pressed record and I'm ready to

listen to you tell your story as only you can tell it. I'll listen, I'll ask questions in an effort to draw out aspects of the experience, not to ask you to tell me what you think I want to hear. Are you ready to share your story?

Truthfully, I felt silly sharing this. I felt vulnerable, but that was the point. I did not want the participants to feel like I was going to "take" their story, so I started off by sharing a bit of my own "becomings". I am not fully arrived as a researcher, but I do feel that I am, as Seidman (2006) says, "finding a way to do 'empirical' work that is emotionally and intellectually satisfying" (p.5). It is work that I can do with others.

Pursuing engaged intersubjectivity. Accounting for my own subjectivity and recognizing myself as an instrument in the research process exposes my awareness of myself, but the interview is not about me. Phenomenology asks researchers to begin with an epoch, an emptying of one's preconceived notions so that he can be open to that which the participant has to share. While this seems noble, I suggest going further and becoming a researcher who listens to the story that the participant is telling embodying the position of story-taker yet also provides the mediational means by which the individual can be transformed through the telling of her story. As I have noted earlier, social interaction provides a situation in which we can become ourselves or be completed through others (Vygotsky, 1997; Bakhtin, 1993). I the researcher—the other—am positioned to co-construct the situation in which the story teller becomes a version of herself through the telling of her story (Wortham, 2000). The participants in this study found that, though they had told their story numerous times to various people before (Raphel) the interview process enabled them to make connections they had never thought of before (Terry). It is not just the intentionality of the story-teller that is important but the intentionality of the story-taker. I presented myself throughout our interviews not as a researcher but as a listener and a learner. One of my participants even noted during our third interview that I was "learning from

my elders" as I conducted the interviews which made me feel like I had found the right tone—elevating her and my desire to learn from her and downplaying my role as a researcher, at least in our conversations.

This interaction with Terry, the first participant that I interviewed, helped me to further become as a researcher, identifying a characteristic about myself—as one who is always trying to learn from others—that would help me further mitigate the power imbalance inherent in interviews. Jerome Bruner (1966) notes that learning is a particularly human quality, one that is "so deeply ingrained in man that it is almost involuntary" (p.113). I will carry this as a reminder to leverage my interest in learning as I continue in my process of becoming a researcher—it is becoming a different kind of learner not a wholly new enterprise.

Through conducting interviews, I was learning about a different path to teaching. My *own subjective* past experiences in transitioning from one culture to another or holding multiple selves provided me with an interest in sharing my own story. But, my own path to teaching was rather traditional. I became a teacher at age 22 having engaged in practicum experiences during my undergraduate experience and being immersed in an intensive teacher-residency like program during my first years of teaching. While my own experience and knowledge of "becoming" a teacher could surely have proven to be an obstacle to learning about my participants (Schram, 2006), my desire to understand their stories kept me eager to hear more. I approached my participants and their stories with this wonder and laughed at myself when transcribing the numerous occasions on which I heard myself, on tape, utter, "Oh, wow!" The process of this work has helped me discover new ways to understand human experience, but I still feel that I am a student. In many ways, I hope I always feel this way as it allows a "distance" from a position of knowing and an authentic engagement of one wondering at the world around him.

Ethical & Safety Considerations. Participants for this study had numerous opportunities to "opt out" of participating. While my intention was not to make the participant recruitment and selection process so challenging that only individuals very interested in sharing their story would end up participating in my study, it seems based on the quality of the stories shared and the interest of participants that this may have been the case. The multi-step process of recruiting participants 1) sending a recruiting email through gatekeepers (which could be ignored) and 2) having participants complete a brief eligibility survey (which allowed participants to answer "not interested in sharing my story") and 3) then contacting participants to set up a screening interview (for which they could ignore my attempts to make contact) and 4) then having participants schedule three separate interviews certainly was not for the faint of heart. More interesting is that only one of the final participants received the initial recruiting email from the primary gatekeeper but rather through a "friend in another district" who thought they might be interested in participating.

When presenting narrative case-histories participant information is shared with the depth and complexity of a story. It is important to make intentional decisions to provide for the confidentiality of participants. As this study intended to share stories of individuals who have left jobs in industry to pursue a career in teaching, it was possible that they would reveal sensitive information about the school or their interaction with the school that could be perceived negatively. Identities of participants might be easy to discern owing to the small number of participants in the study, the unique characteristics that comprise any individual second-career teacher, and the fact that many second-career teachers seek to remain in close proximity to their previous job when changing careers so as not to upset the lives of their families and deconstruct social networks. A particular threat to maintaining confidentiality and anonymity was the

utilization of participants' life histories and a particular focus on the interaction of the previous self—that born of the industry-based work—which in certain cases made it nearly impossible to protect a participant's identity. Because I was not seeking to draw conclusions about particular contexts but rather to exhibit the stories of individuals moving from professional contexts to teaching, I felt confident that masking the participant's identity was sufficient. Participants were informed of the risks through the informed consent document provided to them before our initial meeting and signed by each participant before data collection began. Each participant seemed satisfied with the masking techniques outlined in the document and was aware of the risks involved with a study of this nature. Pseudonyms have been substituted for all names of persons, schools, school districts, employers, cities, towns, and counties.

Data Analysis

Vygotsky (1962/2000) warns against deconstruction of the whole into component elements noting that in so doing, "Nothing is left for the investigator but to search out the mechanical interaction of the [two] elements in hope of reconstructing, in a purely speculative way, the vanished properties of the whole" (p.3). It is therefore important to find a method that seeks to present a story, complete with "rich and thick" descriptions of personal experience that are "meaning-filled" in a way that presents the voices of the speaker. John Polkinghorne (1991) echoes this sentiment: "To experience life as a meaningful whole, one must maintain and preserve the self against internal dissolution into its component parts" (p.145).

Two processes drove the data analysis during this study: the creation of participant narratives and engaging in analysis of the representational and interactional features of the narratives. While this process might be seen as a type of "double coding" but I would prefer to consider it a means of "living with" the data and "engrossing" the participant in a collaborative

process. As one in the early stages of becoming a researcher I found this process both overwhelming and enlivening, and there are changes I would make to my process in future studies. In the following section I outline the data analysis processes completed in this study.

Narrative Analysis to Analysis of Narrative. Data analysis was a two-part process. The first process served a need to create participant narratives. This was important in constructing the "text" to be worked with and analyzed through a conceptual discussion (the second process), but necessitated its own framework in order to make clear how the text was derived from the data sources: "In most cases, we don't see a procedural account of the analysis, explaining just how the researcher got from 500 pages of field notes to the main conclusions drawn" (Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña, 2014, p.257). The second process was to analyze the narratives through the lens of the conceptual framework of the transformative self in action, seeking to understand the processes of individual development through dynamic analysis (Vygotsky, 1978). It has been noted that these two elements can look like "findings" and "discussion"—or I might more readily frame them as the emic perspective of those becoming teachers (the study participants), and the etic-perspective of the one becoming a researcher (the researcher—me). In this study, the narrative case-histories are not merely presentations of autobiographical narrative but rather co-constructed narratives that explore the material account as well as the representational and interactional selves enacted during interviews.

Working with the data. Looking at nearly 5 hours of transcribed conversation for each participant, I realized what one of my doctoral faculty members meant when he described his own post-field experiences as "swimming in data". I had nearly 80 pages of transcription (30,000 words) for each participant. Now, of course, as Catherine Kohler Riessman (2001) notes, not all of what happens during the relational context of the interview is narrative. Interviews include

answers to pointed questions about demographics, listings, chronicles, and other non-narrative forms of discourse (p. 7). "Stories in research interviews are rarely clearly bounded…Deciding which segments to analyze and putting boundaries around them is an interpretive decision, shaped in major ways by theoretical interests. Deciding beginnings and endings of narratives is often a complex interpretive task." (Riessman, 2001, p.9) But I found Riessman's question helpful: "how does an investigator identify narrative segments for analysis?" (p.8).

From the outset of our interviews, I had asked participants to respond to questions built around a chronological presentation of the story. Educational researchers Michael Connelly & Jean Clandinin (1990) note that teachers are natural storytellers who lead individually and socially storied lives. Jerome Bruner (1996) notes that storytelling is an act of meaning making—of construing reality—but that it is not merely idiosyncratic and particular to the individual: narratives do present some universals, most notably the desire of the "teller" to "impose coherence on the past, turn[ing] it into a story" (p. 144). But, in interviews "narration" on one train of thought continues to a different ending point than the beginning of the next question, and the meandering path of a narrative is authentic to the process of an individual making sense of his or her own experience, as Josh notes during one of our interviews:

> **Josh:** Well, and it's funny when I'm talking about something that I don't think so much about I tend to take a much more meandering path. So, it's fun. For me it's fun but I get lost sometimes.

I had asked participants to share their story and was asking questions that were largely based on a chronology, but the transcripts reflected the intended cordiality of a conversation, the again intentional digressions into my own story as component to my reflexive dyadic interviewing

technique, and the emergent "messiness" that befalls both qualitative data and the dialogic meaning making process.

Constructing the narratives. Polkinghorne (1991), drawing on the work of Paul Ricoeur, discusses the process of "emplotment" in which the narrator weaves complex events into a single story often with the creation of a chronological presentation of episodes and events, or a "past-present-future linking" (Grbich, 2013; Polkinghorne, 1991). While it is true that stories are often told chronologically, creating a structural form would not have served the purposes of this study. The current research study is not simply one of presenting narratives but rather to answer specific questions posed by the researcher through use of the data collected from participants and had to depart from straightforward chronological narratives in order to reflect the themes that emerged during interviews. This study does not pursue structural emplotment but rather seeks to co-construct and co-present cohesive narratives of lived experience. Early life experiences, major life events, first careers, marital relationships and adventures in parenting all provide context for the transition to teaching and the presentations and transformations of self therein. The aim is to share the "multiple threads…woven together into a complex and layered whole" (Polkinghorne, 1991, p.141) that the participants presented.

Jean Clandinin and Janice Huber (2010) provide a framework for moving from data collection in the field to the final research text. The authors note that it is an iterative process as the researcher moves 1) from field to field text, 2) from field text to interim research text, 3) and from interim research text to final research text. Moving from the field to the field text, I benefited greatly from constructing transcripts from audio recordings. The transcripts served as a first draft of a field text which was broken down into three main parts following a taxonomy presented in recent studies of second-career teachers by Jóhannsdóttir and Roth (2014) or Roth

(2015). While this taxonomy was a helpful framework for telling each story, it also reveals the limits of descriptive narrative and case-study approaches that present phenotypes of teachers rather than engaging in explanation of the origins of activity that Vygotsky demands.

Narrative case taxonomy. The taxonomy for presenting narrative case-histories was adapted from Jóhannsdóttir and Roth (2014) and Roth (2015) who explore the "un/becoming" of second-career teachers in two single case studies that seek to describe and explain how cultural activity transforms the individual throughout the life course, particularly as he or she experiences a qualitative change in activity—becoming a second-career teacher. The taxonomy provides a way to look not merely at the phenotypic presentation of second-career teachers as a unique subset of newcomers but rather to explain why new teachers engage in the activity of teaching in the way that they do. The three parts of the taxonomy include 1) coming to teaching, 2) becoming a teacher, 3) becoming as a teacher

The first section, coming to teaching, presents relevant life history to give readers an understanding of who the individual was before becoming a teacher. This part of the taxonomy was not explicitly present in Jóhannsdóttir and Roth (2014) or Roth (2015), but it allows for a much clearer presentation of cases as the reader is not required to trust the reporting of the researcher but can instead confirm the connections made through the empirical data presented. The second section, becoming a teacher, shares the co-constructed account of how the individual moved from the professional role and activities in industry to the role and activities as a second-career teacher. Dynamic development is apparent in this section owing to individual participants ability to re-live conversations and experiences from that time period through active remembering (Weldon, 2001). Finally, the third section, becoming as a teacher, provides a thematic exploration of who the individuals are becoming as they become more comfortable in

their teaching. The context from the first two sections of the taxonomy is in great service to this section as the reader is able to hear how earlier professional and personal experiences influence the work of second-career teachers. Each "episode" compliments the picture of the whole, as providing narrative coherence is characteristic of individuals (Bruner, 1996) Each episode adds depth to the understanding of the "totality of societal interactions" of the individual participants becoming second-career teachers.

Sociocultural aspects of narrative. After developing an overarching structure for the narratives which weaves together various experiences and cultural activities across time, I went back to the field text to explore the representational and interactional aspects that were present in the interview listening closely to Bakhtin's trio: intentionality, addressivity, and voice. This was a highly interpretive step as I was making sense of what I saw in the field-text transcripts and providing my own interpretation in the interim research text. This work drew me back to the audio recordings at times to listen to the way certain interactions occurred and even to the video tape as I sought to include information about non-verbal communication, which would not be captured in the audio recording. Working through the "episodes" of coming to teaching and becoming a teacher first, I found that much of the representation and interactional self became clearer when I looked at the shorter episodes in the final section on second-career teachers becoming as teachers, presenting day-to-day experiences. By working through the data in this way, I tried to engross the participant (Noddings, 1990) and through my interpretations share the presentation of self they valued through the way they carried themselves in our interview.

The three individual narrative case-histories reveal unique stories. All of what was shared during interviews could not possibly be shared in a single case-history, nor should it. Through working with the data and listening to the participants words, the priorities that participants had

highlighted in their interviews became organizing themes for the final research text. As the research text was constructed, I made efforts to share these themes as representational and interactional aspects of the selves being presented during the interview as well as textual accounts in the stories that are told. The aim is to bring life not only to the individual participant on the page but to give life to the relational experience shared during interviews.

In the future, I intend to add a procedural step—sharing themes and the interim text with participants to move from an interviewer-participant relationship to one that embraces participants as collaborators (Paula Salvio, personal communication, 2018). Such a process did not fit with Seidman's (2006) phenomenological interview structure that I had used as a framework for this study. I instead offered that participants could read transcripts or review recordings, but all felt that they had accurately shared their story and declined my offer. Providing a formal procedure for reviewing the emerging narrative reflects the type of collaborative work I want to do and the type of researcher I am becoming.

Cross-Case Comparisons. A case history involves both a description of the case(s) as well as explanation of the phenomenon under study (Creswell, 2007; Stake, 1995; Yin, 2009). Single cases of career-changers becoming teachers have been presented in the literature, and this study sought to provide more depth by exploring the cases of three individuals becoming second-career teachers. This collective or multiple case history approach takes into view all three cases and seeks to understand the similarities and differences between them (Stake 1995; Yin, 2003). Robert Yin (2003) describes how analysis of multiple cases may look for literal (similar) or theoretical (contrasting but predictable) replications between the cases. Matthew Miles and Michael Huberman (1994) note that cases can be bound by propositions (see, also, Yin, 2003) and the application of a theoretical framework. The propositions for comparison between cases

in this study were uncovered in the emergent coding process as it became clear that the second-career teachers in this study experienced some of the same phenomena as those described in the literature. Some of the cross-case themes appear in the narrative case-histories, though not all. This is because of the focus on personally relevant narratives which highlight specific aspects of the individual participants' identity. Cross-case comparisons are shared in Chapter Five (Discussion) as a way of speaking back to the literature and making suggestions for the improvement of preparation programs for second-career teachers.

The framework for comparison of cases focuses most specifically on a discussion of the teaching metaphors employed by second-career teachers. Metaphors emerge through and are ways for individuals to make sense of their experience. Metaphors have been explored in research on teacher identity (Lakoff and Johnson, 1980; Bullough, Knowles, and Crow, 1992) and common teaching metaphors provide a framework for discussing the ways in which second-career teachers employ similar and divergent metaphors in describing themselves as teachers. The discussion of metaphors serves not only to compare the three case-histories pursued through this study but to engage in a broader discussion of what it means to be a teacher.

Conclusion

Exploring three narrative case-histories allows for an examination of the dynamic development of second-career teachers as they are transformed in and by their current, prior, and concurrent cultural engagements. The exploration of case-histories avoids reductions that Vygotsky warn against and employs the individual and cultural activity as the unit of analysis. Examining the material case histories for the qualitative and quantitative transformations provides ample description of the experiences of second-career teachers as well as explanation of how cultural activity shapes the life course and lived experience of individuals. Examining the

sociocultural aspects of the narrative account born of in-depth interviews provides further

explanation of the individual development-in-action and transformations of self occurring during

the telling of their story.

CHAPTER 4

STORIES OF BECOMING A SECOND-CAREER TEACHER

Second-career teachers are not a monolithic group and come to teaching at various points is life for a number of reasons with different personal and professional life experiences (Haselkorn and Hammerness, 2008). They come into the classroom with preconceived notions of what it means to teach and draw on their prior educational, personal and professional experience as well as their training in teacher education programs to become teachers. Their lives continue, letting go of old activities and identities or absorbing the new activity in to create new understandings of themselves. In sharing their story participants in this study share what they do not yet know that they are becoming (Paula Salvio, personal communication, 2012) and through the process of the interview become a temporal rendering of themselves.

This chapter provides three co-constructed case-histories of second-career teachers. Cases employ the voice of the narrator to share his or her story of becoming a second-career teacher. Each case follows a broad timescape exploring life-history that led to the decision to teach, the events of the transition to *becoming* a teacher, and the teaching activities that have helped the teacher to *become as* a second career teacher (Roth, 2015). This focus on the narrated event is not sufficient in exploring the complex histories and dynamic individual development of second-career teachers. The voice of the researcher enters the case-histories to provide analysis of the narrated event and the event of speaking (Jakobson, 1957, cited in Wortham et. al, 2011) and at times to connect the situated voice of the participant narrative to the broader social context considering not only whence the voice emerges but what it says about teachers and teaching. The case-histories themselves have a hermeneutic quality (Bruner, 1990) and hopefully are enjoyable to read.

RAPHEL

Profile

      Raphel is in his mid-thirties. He is a father of a little girl and he and his wife are expecting their second child. He is clean cut and muscular and shows up to each of our interviews in a white T-shirt with tattoos slipping out from the sleeves. He has bravado, a baritone voice, an infectious enthusiasm for good company and conversation.

      While I might have labeled him a musician, a DJ, or a band member, Raphel gives himself the title "entertainer" as he describes his first career. This title provides a more apt description of who he remains even during our interview. He is one of the most gifted storytellers I have encountered, and in the first few minutes of speaking with him I realized I was not going to need to ask many questions—Raphel was going to tell the story he had been writing since he was a young child.

      Raphel is in his third year of teaching at Mather High School after spending a little over a decade in the music and entertainment industry. He coaches wrestling at Mather in addition to his role as the head of the music department. In the spring, when rehearsals for the school musical do not conflict, he helps out with track practice. He shares both these bits of information as matters of fact, as though, of course he would help out with athletics. It is not all that interesting to him. Athletics and music have always been a part of his life. Or, athleticism is part of his life—music is his passion.

Coming to Teaching

      Overture. Raphel jumps right to the point, or my point—the second-career teacher—as if he has something to get off of his chest. He is eager to share that the story is only part his own. When asked to share about his upbringing and schooling, Raphel begins with a story about

seeing his father leave a job in sales to pursue his passion for the arts and become a second-career teacher. Raphel continually revisits this "social script" or "myth" as he presents his own story of becoming a second-career teacher, even acknowledging that he heard his father's voice encouraging him to pursue his passion.

> So, I grew up as a faculty child. We lived on the campus. It was a boarding school, private school. My father was the, he was the chair of the theater department. So, theater and the arts have been in my family ever since I was in fifth grade.

> My father was a pharmaceutical sales rep and he was a district manager. I was very little. Like three, four, five years old and just kind of growing up and not really knowing who my father was. Like he was just this guy that was gone. And he would come home and spend some time with us and then he would leave again. And my father just decided that that's not what he wanted to do with his life, that he wanted to—he was an actor he grew up doing theater himself—so he wanted to find a career that would allow him to still do theater but also allow him to be a family man. So, he made the switch and we moved [away] for four years while he worked on his MFA in directing. All of a sudden, we had a complete role reversal in the household. All of a sudden, my dad was the one that was home all the time and my mom actually ironically started working for the same [pharmaceutical] company. So I grew up kind of with that, watching that mentality that education is in a way a nice way to do the things you love to do but also be grounded and stay at home and be a part of that family life which is so important to my father. Then when he got the [teaching] job we moved [onto campus] when I was in the fifth grade. So, I got to kind of watch the transformation of my father at a very young age. Where he went from doing something that he was incredibly successful in but wasn't happy because he wasn't doing the thing that he loved to do. So, for me growing up watching that and observing that it was a huge life lesson for me and I knew that I wanted to do the thing that made me happy. And I didn't know what that was at the time, but I knew that I wanted to make sure that whatever I was doing it was something that I really enjoyed doing.

Pursuing Multiple Interests, Balancing Multiple Passions. In high school, Raphel pursues the arts and athletics. He runs track and completes in field events. He wrestles. He helps with some plays and continues with music in an acapella group, a garage band, and music classes at school. When Raphel is looking at colleges, he desires to continue both his athletic and his music interests. He and his father go on a college tour. The way Raphel tells this part of the story

is different from other episodes. He is focused on what he wants—to run track and to continue

with music—and will not be told that he cannot do both.

> When I went [away to my own boarding school for] high school I brought my passion for the theater and my passion for the music and that kind of performing arts thing just kind of created, you know, its own little persona. I was also doing sports and things like that too. I tried to find, you know, tried to find that balance you know it's really hard (laughing) to do both those things. So, when I was looking at colleges I started looking at schools that had both a good music program and a good track team, because I was really into track and field. In high school I was a hurdler, long jumper, mid distance guy. And then I threw the jav, I was really interested in the eight hundred. I kind of did a little everything. I was pretty good at a lot of events, not super good one.

> So, my dad and I took a trip and we looked at a couple DI [Division One] track schools and you know they said "yeah, you can run here but you gotta give up this music thing." And then I looked at a couple conservatories and they said the exact opposite thing. So I started looking at Division Three liberal arts schools. Small schools that are designed to be, you know, eclectic schools. They look for that eclectic student. The good balance student-athlete. And [one school said] "We'll make both of these work. It may take you five years, but we'll make it work for you." So that's where I ended up going. So, when I got to college I was a decathlete so I kinda did a little bit of everything.

Raphel begins his post-secondary career at a college where he will be able to pursue both

the arts (music) and athletics (track), though he does not mention track again pointing to this

being a secondary passion at best. I cannot help wondering whether there is a voice missing,

whether it was Raphel's father who wanted him to be able to do both, or whether Raphel himself

knew that he really wanted to continue with his athletic pursuits while continuing on with music.

The arts are for the sensitive types and athletics for the brutes—yet Raphel presents both

empirical selves (a la James, 1890). A paradox. A multi-faceted self. The two identities do not

seem to be in conflict for Raphel, however. Maybe, again, it was his father who modeled the

melding of arts and athletics—Raphel's father had been both the head of the theatre department

and the wrestling coach. As Raphel has noted many times, his father provided a strong role

identity for him to emulate and a strong social script for him to appropriate.

Raphel studies music education but is turned off by the constraints put upon music educators working in the public education system. He switches to a Bachelor of Arts in music degree. Here again Raphel seems to make a conscientious choice. By making this change, he is walking away from a career path he had seen very clearly at the end of high school. In fact, he had taken a school-sanctioned opportunity to "drop out" of high school in order to pursue an internship in music education.

> Even as a high schooler, I actually, when I was in high school, I knew that I wanted to be a teacher. I always looked up to my teachers as a high schooler even though I hated high school and hated the school aspect, I loved and respected the work that teachers put into what they were doing. And my mentor, the person who, I mean I wouldn't be who I am today, [my mentor] was my music teacher in high school. So, my senior year, [we could] actually drop all our classes after [getting] into college. You can drop all your classes and pursue an independent study. So, I got in touch with the local public middle school and talked to their music teacher and said, "Hey I've got this opportunity. Would it be OK if I came and helped you out in any way you need me?" And he said, "Yeah." So, I got the offer, so I dropped all my classes and I went to the local public middle school and I taught there.

> Every kid at that school had a required music class that they had to take. So, I was there every day of the week and I would just go through the rotation with the kids. On chorus days I would play the piano when [the teacher] needed an accompanist, or I would sit with the boys in the boys' section and sing with the boys. And that was really funny because I was this high school senior at the time, and, you know, the boys were in middle school and they were too cool to do anything, you know? But as soon as I came in I started singing, I was this older boy that was singing, and all the girls were going crazy, so the boys started singing. They wanted to, you know, so there was this huge transformation…it really got the quality of their performance up. Then on the [non-chorus] day, I, I was learning how to play guitar and teaching it at the same time. Because [the teacher was] like, "I teach guitar on this day." I'm like, "Well, I don't know how to play the guitar, but I'll watch you and I'll figure it out and I'll help out." So that's how I learned how to play. That's how I first started learning how to play guitar was learning through osmosis, kind of (laughing). Music has always been something that comes very easy and naturally to me just like, you know, sports comes naturally to other people or things like that. It's just something that I've always had a connection to. And I've never really shied away from doing things like that.

> I was already going into [college] for music education so this was kind of like [letting] me just get my feet wet and see if I really, if this is something I really want to do. I'm so glad I did that because I came into [college] guns blazing. I was ready to go.

As Raphel headed to college his vision was clear—he wanted to become a music teacher. He had selected a college that would allow him to pursue music and athletics. He had experience in the classroom and it had only made him more excited for the future career he envisioned. And still, his path diverged from the one he envisioned. After just a few years of music education teacher training, Raphel was sufficiently turned off from the field he had been so sure was his calling. He pursues a "purer" music degree, and ultimately leaves school with two more courses to take—this time, though, the school has not sanctioned his early exit and though he walks in the graduation ceremony, his diploma folder is empty.

Pursuing a single passion—free spirit or trusting explorer? While an intentional pursuit of balance among activities and interests seemed to guide Raphel in high school and into college, his first career seems to have cast him into the role of the "yes man". He tells this part of the story as one in which "everything kind of falls into place". It began, as Raphel notes with dramatic storytelling panache, "When I first got to college…"

> When I first got to college—my story is kind of weird because everything kind of falls into place in a really weird way (laughing)—I'd learned how to break dance back in high school, you know there were some kids that did it so I kind of got interested in it. And so, we're at the freshman orientation dance and there's this kid break dancing on the dance floor so I'm like, "All right!" So I jump out and I start doing it and we start battling and then we finish and the D.J. comes up to me from the, from that party and she says, "Hey, the guy you were just battling is one of my employees. I hire dancers to come to these parties and kind of get the party started. So, I'm looking for more break dancers. Would you be interested in doing it?" And, you know I took this card and it was my freshman year and I was like "I really need to focus on school and I don't have a car." I was like, "Let me let me keep this card and when I get a car I'll give you a call and see if you're still interested." So she's like "All right." So, a year passes, and nothing really changes from that. And then sophomore year I get a car, so I call the D.J. and I say, "Hey I don't know if you remember me," and she was like, "Oh I remember exactly who you are, and we've got a show this weekend. Do you want to come down?" So as a college student it was like the perfect job because it was only weekend work, it was only a couple hours for the party, and it was good money for a college kid (laughing) you know. I ended up developing a really cool relationship with that D.J. company. The owner and his wife, I still talk to today and they're like my second family away from home.

After leaving college, Raphel works as an entertainer—DJing and getting the party going. He takes a break to play in two different bands, both on short-term "contracts" that take him into the life of reality television contestant and cruise ship entertainer. At first Raphel seems to construct for himself a lifestyle of a free spirit, taking opportunities as they arise. But the way he positions the various voices in his telling of the story, another construction of self emerges—of one who is willing to take recommendations for opportunities that will allow him to more fully engage his passion for music.

> So, while I'm doing the D.J. thing I have this girlfriend who was like, "Let's go out to this bar. I know this this guy does an acoustic show that you'll really enjoy" because she knew I was really into music. So, we went. And this guy starts playing and I bumped into him in a bathroom on one of his breaks and I said, "Hey I used to be a musician or I still kind of am. I do it on the side." and he's like, "Hey, well get up and sing something." So I'm like, "OK!" So, I jumped up and started singing and he instantly just comes up to me and says, "What do you play? I've got this band that I'm trying to get started and do you play any instruments?" And I'm like, "Well my main is the keyboards." And he goes, "Well that's great. I don't have a keyboard player in this band so you're in if you want in." … So, I joined the band and then like two weeks later I got a call from him saying, "Hey, we've got a call from a producer…to do this T.V. show. And it's kind of like American Idol but with bands. Would you be willing to do this T.V. show?" I'm like, "Well what could go wrong?"

Nothing went wrong, but the band did get cut shortly after the filmed audition process began. He notes being shocked, but that he had made friends with members of the other groups auditioning and was offered a gig to work on a cruise ship for three months as a member of an acapella group.

> And I'm like "Yeah I'll do that! I'll definitely do that!" So, I, you know, went back [and] told my DJ "sorry, I need another three months off" and he's like, "OK." … But you know so it's like I say, when things kind of fall into place they really did just. I wasn't ever expecting any of these things that happen they just kind of fell into place.

Raphel uses this as a refrain. In his story he sees things as falling into place. But when he got back from the gig on the cruise ship, he decided that he wanted to make an intentional change in his life and pursue performing and making music rather than working as an entertainer. He found

something had changed in him and he said: "I've got to do this music thing. This is what I really want to do."

> So I got involved with this band—I signed a year-long contract with these guys. And six years later I was still in the band. (laughing) And we went from doing like, I guess a show every Friday, Saturday, so about a hundred shows a [year] to about a hundred and fifty shows. And we were touring all over the country. We ended up buying a tour bus and we were on the road constantly. And I was still DJing on Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday nights. Friday, Saturday I was with my band…Staying really busy…staying able to create a pretty nice little…and this was the career that I thought I was going to do.

> But I was starting to get to the other side of the coin saying, "I love this. I love the performing part. I love the people I'm working with, but it's not what I want to do." And that voice in my head from my father kept popping in my head you know, "Be careful because you could get stuck doing something that you may not want to do the rest of your life." You know I, and as I got older and twenty-nine, thirty hit and I started looking at my drummer who was forty years old and was like, "I love my drummer, but I don't want to be doing this. I don't want to be traveling all over the world." …I loved the performing part and I loved the camaraderie of the guys. But what's the next step? You know, what's the next step? And if you're saying what's the next step, that's a problem.

> So, and it was during this time that I met my now wife. I met her at one of the clubs I was DJing at. But we started living together. We started talking about family. And that started becoming more interesting, I start becoming more interested in that than I was as a musician, traveling musician. And then we, uh, we ended up getting pregnant (laughing). And that like, it sounds cliché, but that was a huge changing moment for me. And I said, "All right. That's it. I've really done everything I wanted to do." And I was looking for the next part of my life and here was. And so, I said "Yes!"

Interlude: Becoming not a teacher

Making a [wrong] career change. Raphel quickly returns to school to finish his music degree, and, while finishing out his time with the band and working some nights as a DJ, he takes a job at a bank. But after he stops playing with the band and DJing, the bank job causes concern for Raphel's wife and mother…Raphel seems different. He is no longer pursuing his passion for music and again realizes that he needs to make a change. Remembering that his father was able to pursue his passion for the arts and be a family man, Raphel decides to become a teacher.

Raphel got right to work. He knew he needed to settle down and become a family man. Raphel speaks as though from a cultural script about what it means to become a father.

> When you have a family, you become a part of something bigger than yourself and it's the first time in my life I think I really cared more about the bigger picture than what was important to me at the time. I still had these feelings of what I loved to do, but at that time in that moment, I was concerned about, how do I set up my child for the best success.

He went back to school to finish his degree, re-enrolling at the college he had not quite graduated from ten years earlier. He told his band mates that he would play with them for four more months, through the New Year's Eve show, but that he needed to move on. And he needed another—a steady—source of income. "So, I needed to get the first steady job that I could find. And I thought to myself, well, what's that? A bank! It's gotta be a bank, right? A banker's job." He applied for a job with a retail bank during a career fair at the college. He got the job and, despite still working part time as a DJ and finishing out his contract with the band and finishing up his college degree, he started working part time at the bank.

> (laughing). So, it was, it was pretty rough. But then at the end of two thousand and fourteen, everything changed. You know, I got out of the band, I got out of DJing and I went right into full time working at a retail bank. And that was hell on earth (laughing). That was…I mean I knew I needed to get something that was financially stable...because I wanted to be, you know, a good father and a good, you know, take care of my family. I thought it was going to be in like a regular bank, but it was one of those banks that was inside of a grocery store. And they're open seven days a week and they're open twelve-hour days, and they were short staffed. So I was working twelve-hour days, and I was working Sundays. And I was like, "This isn't what I signed up for. "And I always make the joke that when I was a kid I said I would never have a job that said, "Do you want fries with that?" As a kid, I, you know, that's just a stupid thing you say to yourself. But I found myself saying, "Do you want fives with that?" And I'm like, that's close enough (laughing)!

Raphel needed to get out and reflecting on it he knew he wasn't happy. But he was committed to this phase of life. He was committed to being a family man, prioritizing the needs of his family above his own. This decision was coming out of the cultural script of the male as the provider. He had to abandon the earlier version of himself where he was able to say, "What

could go wrong?" when presented with an opportunity to do something that would take him

across the country to be on a television show or around the world to perform with a band. This

cultural script is found in the literature that we are presented during our education. The gray

flannel suit. The Willie Loman's of the world. And, more importantly, the pharmaceutical

salesman that Raphel knew quite well as a man without passion from his youth.

Becoming a Teacher

Following the myth. Raphel's wife and mother saw something different. Within six

months of starting at the bank they asked him what was wrong, and it forced him to take a look

at himself. His reaction to becoming a father had led him away from music, and he missed it.

> The only way to [understand yourself] is to stop doing what you're doing and observe
> what happens to your personality. Observe what happens to your characteristics. It wasn't
> until my wife and my mom said we see this change in you. And you don't know it, you're
> just going day to day, you're doing the day to day thing and it wasn't until they said that,
> that I was like yeah. I did take this break, and this isn't working, so I need to fix it.

> So, I started thinking about everything. Everything started clicking. You know what do I
> really want to do and I instantly thought back to my childhood. I think for me growing up
> seeing that [boarding school] environment, especially when [my wife and I] found out we
> were having a baby, I wanted to use what experience I had ... I mean, use the tools that
> you know, right?

The "tools" that Raphel is referring to is the social script he was given by his parents. He saw,

through his own experience as a child, that one way to resolve the conflict between the multiple

roles he had to play—as a father who needed to provide for his family and as a musician—was to

become a teacher. As he says, his parents "used their environment to raise their three boys."

> [As kids] when we moved [onto campus] and it was mom home all the time and dad
> home all the time. While dad was working, we were still living at his work. So even
> though he was at work, I was able to be a part his life. They were able to find a way to
> work and parent at the same time. They used their environment to raise their three
> boys…I think I wanted to get back into that world so I could do the same thing. Do what
> I love to do, but also raise a child and be a part of her life as much as possible. So, I
> thought, "Well education is what I originally started in." It's, again, it allows me to do the

thing that I love to do. And it allows me to stay at home and be grounded and have that family life.

And again, Raphel notes that things just fell into place.

So I started applying for schools and after a few failed attempts I got in touch with Mather, and the rest just happened the way it happened, you know. And I got the offer and we took a huge gamble because it was, you know, a [teacher's] salary (laughing). And [my wife] was working at the time. We had a brand new baby...I said, "Look if we're going [to do this] you're going to be a stay at home mom. That's what you want to do, and I'll work as many weekends as I have to make it work but we will do what we can to make it work." And so it was a huge gamble, but she put a lot of faith in me and, you know, it's amazing...We came out here and it's been the best decision I've ever made. It really has.

Becoming as a Teacher

A Once and Future Teacher. Raphel is a homecomer (Crow et al, 1990)—a second-career teacher who had once entertained becoming a teacher earlier in life. Raphel had interned as a student teacher for music classes before he went to college—an experience that confirmed his interest in music education and allowed him to go off to college for a music education degree with "guns blazing". But soon after beginning his degree, Raphel decided to leave the program.

I started as a music [education major] …and about two years into the program I started learning the rules of the state's public school system and what it actually meant to be certified to teach in the public schools and I didn't like it. I didn't like the rigidness of the program. They had very specific what kind of music you're allowed to teach in a public school. If you want to teach, you're certified K-12. So, if you start at the high school and you're loving it and they say, "We have a hole in elementary school we're going to move you to the elementary school," and that's a big difference. So, I started really thinking that maybe finishing the education part wasn't really something that I was interested in. So I switched from a Bachelor of Music degree in education to a Bachelor of Arts in music. Just a much more generalized degree because I think I knew that I wanted to kind of explore my musical interests, you know.

Raphel is, in this moment, unapologetic as he describes changing majors. What he saw in the music education program was a vision of his future that was not about music but rather the bureaucracy of schools and perhaps a realization that to be a music teacher is not to have classes of eager students, as Raphel had been, but to bounce around as needed within a public education

80

system that regularly underfunds the arts. Raphel did not want to follow the direction of someone who would tell him where to teach, and certainly not how to teach.

> I dropped out of my college program because I didn't like the rigidity of a public school program, so I knew going in that I wanted a lot of autonomy in the program because I know I was going to take a more of a, a less traditional approach to teaching music. You know, I wanted kids to be self-driven and Mather School (pseudonym) just happens to be a school that allows kids to develop their own unique way. And the music program was such in a kind of state of disrepair that they said, "We don't really have a program right now, so you can do whatever you want." And I'm like "What do you mean whatever you want?" As soon as I got there they said, "Here's the music class that we have scheduled for you, you can do whatever you want." And it's been a dream to work in a place like that. I've got a lot of friends…[teaching] at other places and I tell about what I get to do they're super jealous (laughing). I have this complete autonomy and I can do, you know, I'm taking music and I'm arranging contemporary pop tunes for chorus. We're doing acapella chorus stuff and, and I can teach the kids guitar in a way that it's not teaching them scales and I'm not following a Coda Line method, or Suzuki for violin or something. I'm [asking], "How do you want to learn? OK, you're a singer you want to learn how to play the guitar? All right, let me teach you a couple chords so you can accompany yourself." You know, let them drive the reason that they need to learn the instrument.

As Raphel describes what he was looking for in a music program, it becomes clear that his desire for autonomy was not a desire to do what *he wanted* but rather to teach students in the way that *they needed*. He had said this earlier, but even in listening to our recorded conversation and reading the transcript, I had missed it. He had used the term autonomy and I had focused on that and the ways it is discussed as a psychological need (e.g. Self-Determination Theory). What Raphel discusses clearly is that he wanted autonomy because he wanted to be able to take the lead from his students and discover where that path would take them together. This is part of the self he presents throughout his story, one who is not just willing to go along but who finds excitement in doing so. What this meant, in terms of him leaving music education was not that he was going to take a less traditional approach to teaching music—an important turn of phrase from what I had interpreted as his meaning; that he wanted to be a different kind of music teacher.

81

What Raphel describes is a highly individualized approach to music instruction. His

desire to follow the lead of his students and provide for them what they need is admirable, but

taxing. Yet, for Raphel, it is what he expects of himself as a teacher.

In creating his own teaching persona, Raphel draws on a "role images" presented by

teachers from his past. Two teachers he admired were his father and his high school music

teacher.

> This is my third year. So, I'm learning more and more about the kids every year and I'm also learning, since I'm a new teacher, I'm learning about my teaching style…Learning how to wait for the thing that I'm looking to click, click. You know? And learning how to deal with that, that's been a challenge. I know that I have a unique way of looking at music, and so when I get kids in here who I think are similar to me, I'm expecting that same kind of drive and when it doesn't happen, I have to take a step back and say "Is this me or is this, this kid?" and I've got to figure out a different way of approaching. Every year it's a learning curve.

Raphel further discusses his desire to be responsive to the needs of those around them

as he discusses his understanding of teaching as constantly modifying and finding what

works. In this he makes note that he does not like "monotony"—an interesting rejection of

the "stability" that so many people pursue and psychological theories of identity privilege.

> But that's I kind of think the beauty of teaching is that there's never a moment where you just go, "I've done it and I can just coast forever." You know you're always trying to work out the problems of the year. Well, I'm also the kind of guy, I hate monotony. I think that's why I hated retail banking so much. But I hate the idea of doing the same thing day after day after day. And you know I think teaching is one of those professions that you really do get to come in and do different things and you know there's a lot more, especially at Mather, you're improvising so much. You know I have an idea of what I want to do but the general, like the process changes. The general goal kind of stays the same, you know, you want to improve their musicianship. But there's so many different facets and ways to approach that that it's, it makes it interesting. I get to do that on a daily basis, come and go "Oop. Nope. That didn't work with that kid on this day at this hour." Maybe I'll try it a different day or with a different kid. Yeah, I love that. I know that that can probably frustrating to some people (laughing).

Raphel works to meet the needs of his students on a closely personal level and has the

flexibility within the structure of his program to adapt to the different types of students that enter

his classroom. He has come to realize this in just a short period of time and, more than accepting it, he celebrates it:

> Next year it'll be completely different. I'll have a different set of kids that will come in and they may be more instrument driven and so I'll have to do different things. Or they may just be at a higher level in terms of their musicianship. And that's what's really neat about, again, about the [student profile here] is that some of these kids come in then they've never even touched an instrument before. Most of them honestly have come in they've played like the saxophone when they were in the fourth grade but their math scores started falling so they were pulled out of the music class so they could work harder on their math stuff. And, you know, now that I know the profile it's like, why would you ever do this to these kids? These kids that need something to grab onto and be successful in. You know, why just force them to do stuff that one they don't like doing, and two they're not good at it. I don't know if it was brought up in [a graduate school] class or if it's something that I've noticed in my own observations, but kids wouldn't be here unless they hadn't had repetitive failure almost through their entire existence, at some point in their academic career. Public school has this par attitude. If you're at par or you're above par, good for you, do what you can while you're here. If you're below par, that's when we have to start figuring out what to do. Those are the kids that we usually get. We usually get the kids who are below par. Not that they're incapable of achieving amazing things. We talk about objectives and what's important to us and music has always been, like I said, a big driving force, but I think Mather has awoken something in me that I didn't even expect in myself, which was general care of these kids. I want my program to succeed, obviously, but I want the kids in it to succeed more. You got to give them that opportunity to grow and be successful in something.

Raphel continues to listen to the voices of those around him and to take direction from them. He departed from a career in education early on because it was lock step, teaching to standards with too much accountability to an authoritative script. At Mather, Raphel is able to listen to the needs of his kids and to follow their direction in what they need.

Relating to social-emotional needs. The music classes the Raphel teaches are ungraded. Like all other electives at Mather, student evaluations are simply pass or fail: "And we do that because we want them to find that level of satisfaction. You know we want them to do it because they want to be there not because it's somewhere they have to be like the rest of their day." Students are given the opportunity to spend fifty minutes a day to let their brains "process something a little differently—a little more right brained…something that they enjoy doing and

that they find success in." Raphel thinks that many teachers, or even people without learning

disabilities, take that for granted.

> Being neurotypical, right? We find, we find success in a lot of things that we do. And for
> our kids who aren't so typical that's, it's very important that we give them that time...I
> was diagnosed at the exact same age as I started playing piano with ADHD. And that's,
> you know, something that I've, you know, dealt with my entire life. I'm still dealing with
> it, you know, you never grow out of it you just learn how to cope and manage it. So,
> academics was a struggle for me… especially things that I didn't find interesting. If I was
> studying history, for example, in high school, if it didn't have music, it really didn't
> interest me. But as soon as I could add musical elements to it, it became fascinating. Even
> in [graduate school] right now, if I had a project I have to write about, I try to add as
> much music as I can to it. We did this structure of language class and we were supposed
> to take a text and analyze it for language. So I took a song and I analyzed song lyrics, just
> so I could stay in the vein of music.

> And that maybe another reason why I like teaching [here] so much because I can relate.
> "Look, I get that you don't like math. I was there. I've been there with you. And you do
> crazy things to avoid things you don't like doing." I struggled with my academic teachers.
> With my art teachers and you know performing arts teachers and my coaches I was like
> the best student in the world, but the things I didn't like doing I was not a good student
> (laughing)...

Raphel not only brings his prior socialized group identities into his teaching, but his own

experience, telling his students that he is not so different from them. He lets them know that he

has struggled, and he can empathize with them:

> I think to truly empathize with your students you need to, you need to share with them
> and let them know that they're a human first and a student second. Right? And as soon as
> they can understand that you were, you have done the things that they're doing, and if
> they can truly get that you can break that barrier of student teacher weirdness and really
> start to make some connections.

It is through his ability to relate to his students, to truly empathize and feel with them that Raphel

is able to build a music education program that allows students to thrive and allows he himself to

thrive in becoming a music educator. He relates a part of his own educational history that

illuminates why he is so passionate about following the lead of his students—because their

interest and passion is going to drive them, and sometimes you have to wait for them to find it.

I think with ADHD, yeah, you have elements of attention deficit, but the things that drive you have incredible focus. I think a lot of our kids just hadn't found that thing that drives them, but they do still have incredible focus. They could not pay attention in class, but whatever they're thinking about, they are thinking about it hard! So, for me, I found I was very lucky that I found that thing that I can think about hard. I would be in eighth grade class, I remember this like it was yesterday, I would be thinking about music. I'd be thinking about the way the lines move if the melody moves, I'd be thinking about notes, I'd be thinking about texture of music, anything that had to do with it. I'd be thinking about a song, it'd just be going around in my head and I would not ... I'd be looking right at the teacher and the teacher is talking right to me and she would say my name five times before I finally snapped out of it and said, "What?" I know that for some people, that's kind of hard to understand, but I understand it when I see that in my kids too. When I have kids I go, "Oh, they're gone, they're gone right now. I wonder what they're thinking about." 'cause if we could tap into that, then they would not stop learning.

Music as experiential education. Raphel wants to develop in his students a love of music—a passion that will drive their academic pursuits. As he discusses how he is developing his program, he makes it clear that he is positioning interest and passion before academic learning. This reflects his own process of learning music at a young age. He heard music in church and became interested. His parents brought a piano into the house and said, "let's see what happens", and when he showed enough interest they got him lessons. Again, Raphel is "using the tools that he has" as he indicated previously, following the models others present for him and, in turn, presenting those models for others to learn from.

That kind of experiential learning is more prevalent, and they'll remember it. It'll be stored in their long-term memory and that kind of experiential learning is something you can't teach in a classroom. If they figure out that two plus two equals four, they'll remember it forever. If you try to shove it down their throat, they'll push away. That's my goal. I've experienced that. I want to create an environment that is as inviting as possible where kids can come in here and I always tell them all the time, this is the place to make mistakes, I want you to make mistakes in here. I'm not looking for a perfection even on the stage, we're not going to worry about that right now. The other thing is this program has no goal, I'm not going to give them, "at the end of this term, you're going to put on a show," I'm not going to give them that. I want them to just be in here experiencing what it's like to play music. If they want to put on something, that's totally up to them, but I'm not going to push it on them. It's going to be "Come in here, jam with your friends, have a good time."

I think right now I'm spending a lot of time in the after-school program, growing the program, again to create initial interest. My goal is to slowly start to pull away from that, especially in the evening time, and grow the program academically where the kids could take the classes as electives. Through that, also have advanced classes and stuff so the kids can grow on their own and they can understand the content. At this point, this is the first year I have seniors who want to go off and study music in college. So, I want to be able to prepare them properly. When you start with just introductory classes, it's great to get the kids in the door but we want to keep them in the door, too. There's always I think ... I'm just always trying to think about what's the next step and just to keep that growing process. But you've got to keep that initial interest too. Now that I'm building my program and I have kids at various levels, having them in the same class is counter-productive almost because you try to teach one kid how to read music and the other kid working on higher level things with theory and history and musicology kind of things. So music is a very academic subject in itself. There's a lot of vocabulary and a lot of processes there. There's the math involved and so just like a math class, a kid couldn't take algebra all four years. So, creating those opportunities to grow and then have different levels of theory appreciation, history, all those steps.

This was the first time I had heard Raphel talk about music academically, and he presented the information somewhat dryly. I realized that he saw me as a non-musician and so the audience before him would not be interested in the great depths of knowledge he has from undergraduate training as a voice major and years working in the music industry. But, he did know me as an educator, so I asked him to tell me more in a way that I might understand.

I was a voice major in college, so we had to learn how to speak other languages, but also learn how to speak our language and learn how to sing our language. Some of the [remedial language arts] stuff that they do here, kind of crosses over into my world. The vocabulary is different: for example [at school] we have what are called short vowels and long vowels, but [in music] we say open vowels or closed vowels by how much our mouth opens and closes on certain vowels for singing. So, I had to kind of re-learn the jargon a little bit and re-learn the vocabulary, but the processes are similar. So it's been fun to use what I know in the music world and use it in my Language Arts tutorial classes, for example. I had a kid last year who was kind of a music kid, she was a senior, but she read at a sixth-grade reading level and by the time she left, she was testing at her grade level, she was testing at 12th grade. What I just noticed is when she was reading, her fluency was ... There was no rhythm to it. There was just ... It was just words sporadically. So, I took the metronome out and I made her read one word at every click. Just adding that little bit of music, she understood. She's a violin player so she understood how to follow basic rhythm. We did that, and she was able to really start to find the pace and stuff like that. We should be using the tools that we have in our tool box, and if you're a soccer coach, you should be using soccer jargon. Whatever you know, you

should try to pass on to your [students]. You've got to use the stuff that you've got in your tool box.

Raphel was able to use the cultural tools available to him to teach. That had not been presented to him in a textbook or through training he had engaged in as an undergraduate music education student nor as a graduate student when he completed his master's degree. He had followed the interest of his student and found a way to engage his own relevance structures to speak to her—to teach her—in a unique way that might only work for her. This is what Raphel wanted to do as a teacher. This is why he had left his undergraduate degree in music education when it seemed so rigid. He had not realized that teaching could be so much fun.

Reprise: On becoming a teacher

The myth and the reality. When I ask Raphel about his relationships with administrators, he laughs. I think he is going to laugh off the question and am concerned that he thinks, because of my work in some of the local schools, that I know the administrators. I am relieved when he opens up, seeing me as an audience for his story (my own role in the interview as a researcher) rather than an education faculty member who works at different schools in the area.

> I think I'm probably having to put the most effort into is understanding how other schools operate. I have a tendency to come and go, "Well, this is how it was done here." And so, you come in with this level of expectation that it's going to be the same everywhere. And it's not. Every school is so different. Especially, I went to a school that is one of the oldest boarding schools in America, to a school that's [like, not that] old and they're still trying to figure out their identity, and still trying to figure out the best ways to do things. And my first year was very difficult. To bite my tongue. To keep quiet and…You know, you come in as a first year and you've got all these ideas and you just want to…you know especially when you're running your own program your first year and you want to just come in guns blazing. And you've got to be careful that you don't offend the people who have been there for forty years. And they say, "This is how we've been doing for, you know, forever and this is how we're going to continue doing it." And, so you got to, got to tread lightly. You know, and I think I've gotten to a point now where I know the right things to say. I know the right people to talk to. But that's, that's always something that I try to pay attention to...I mean those are two very different sides of the coin: faculty and

administration. I mean, those, those can be, they can be very nasty at some schools. Very nasty. Especially when we start mixing in like housing or, you know, even stupid things like parking (laughing). All of those things can get really nasty.

This window into the life of a boarding school teacher was not an element I had anticipated in discussing Raphel's story, or the story with any of my participants. But for Raphel, I realize that coming to work at a boarding school was part of following his father's social script. Ultimately, what Raphel reveals is that the social script he took from his father—to become a teacher in order to pursue a passion for the arts and a need to be both a provider and an involved father—did not work out perfectly. He had noted that he lived on campus as a young child. His family currently rents an apartment in the next town over from Mather.

> When you have all these different things you're trying to juggle with, with the music piece, the athletic piece, just the overall trying to grow a program from scratch, you've got to spend a lot of time on campus. You have to be here, you have to make a presence. I don't think you can do it any other way. If there was, I might look into it, but I haven't found it yet. I think because of the way Mather is set up, it's so different just in terms of faculty housing and things like that, that we're not there yet and I think I spend too much time away from home. I wish I could be home more. If we lived on campus, I would be home right now or using my time to ... I still have prep periods and things I have to do for my job but having just the closer proximity to home would be a much more accustomed to what I'm used to growing up. That's not to say that won't happen, someday that could happen.

INTERLUDE

"I'VE BEEN THERE WITH YOU."

As Raphel reveals early on, his story of becoming a teacher is only part his own. Taken from the social script provided by his father, Raphel uses a second-career as a teacher to provide him a lifestyle that balances his passion for music and his desire to be an involved parent. The use of this script becomes the strongest theme throughout the narrative and provides a look beyond merely seeing his father as a role image to seeing a complete way of life as one that he can re-enact. The social script becomes a cultural tool or a complete cultural activity that Raphel can appropriate and draw into his own life story. As is shared in closing Raphel's narrative, he is unable to perfectly replicate this script provided by his father as is to be expected—Raphel is engaged with different actors, at a different time, in a different culture (Penuel and Wertsch, 1995; Vadeboncoeur et al, 2011). In this way the social script becomes a different type of cultural tool—a tool known as "myth"—that can otherwise be understood as an "ideal type". Sumara and Luce-Kapler (1996) have explored this construct in seeking to understand the complexities involved in becoming a teacher—a process that involves coming to understand that the imagines life as a teacher is an idealized vision and does not meet with reality. This ideal-real disconnect requires a reimagining of future selfhood and, as has been realized in the literature on second-career teachers, may result in a departure from the profession of teaching altogether (Pierce, 2007). Raphel is hopeful that circumstances will change at Mather and provide him the teaching life of which he has dreamed. In the meantime, Raphel is focused on developing himself as the type of teacher that he seeks to be, even if he cannot be raising his children as the "faculty kid" that he was.

In addition to following the myth provided by his father, Raphel describes himself as someone eager to follow the lead that others present to him. He regularly positions others as agents in his "next move" and repeatedly states that "everything just sort of fell into place". He follows the recommendation of one girlfriend or another, jumps on stage and gets offered a gig after an impromptu performance, and even follows a group of new found band mates onto a cruise to Hawaii. In presenting his story as a set of happy accidents, Raphel distances himself from the responsibility for his own story. But it is clear that at times Raphel selects the path for himself and takes an active role within his own socialization process—in going to college, in leaving his major, even in teaching students through intentionally non-traditional methods. In this he is the "active agent" that Penuel and Wertsch (1995) anticipate in dynamic self-transformation.

What Raphel demonstrates well through drawing in these other voices is perhaps unconscious dialogical development—the ability to deploy others in his own becomings (Vygotsky, 1997), allowing them to lead him down paths that he would not have pursued without their direction and encouragement. As a teacher, Raphel himself plays out this same interaction, taking the lead from his students in where they need to go and serving as an expert in getting them there. He listens to their desires and provides for them opportunities for learning in a way that will develop in them the skills that they need at that time, like Vygotsky's (1978) proverbial more capable other serving as the trusted associate who can listen and provide tools to which the student does not yet have access. In this way we see the Raphel's students' learning as a process of cultural apprenticeship as Rogoff (1990) describes and the socialization that is an apt description of much of education.

Raphel's strength as a teacher is less about his ability to draw on the knowledge and skills developed in his previous profession—an oft cited strength of second-career teachers (Tigchelaar, Brouwer, and Korthagen, 2008; Etherington, 2009; Grier & Johnson, 2012, Antink-Meyer & Brown, 2017)—and more about his ability to draw on, consciously or unconsciously, the way that others have helped him develop into the person that he is today. When discussing who he is in the classroom, Raphel does not cite specific role images appropriated from mentors (Erikson, 1968) the he incorporates into his emergent teacher self. Instead of drawing on images of *teaching*, he seems to reflect on his own processes of *learning* as he engages with his students, using the "other" from his past as the one who helped him to learn deeply both the material at hand as well as the ways in which he was to interact with it. More than a transfer of skills into the classroom, the rendering of himself as a teacher brings forward a residual self-transformation born of a struggle to situate himself within the activity of learning so many years ago. Raphel's greatest strength as a teacher is not in his knowledge of music and what it means to be a musician or entertainer—though surely those skills are essential for a music teacher—but in his ability to remember what it is like to too struggled to learn, and to understand that the most effective role for him as a teacher is to provide space and support for his students to grow.

As a teacher, Raphel is a mentor and a guide (Rogoff, 1990) who finds that the most compelling parts of his job are discovering the needs of his students and his ability to share with them his passion for music. As a story-teller, Raphel is both a teacher and an entertainer (Jóhannsdóttir & Roth, 2014). He holds his intention—the story or the curriculum—alongside a deep consideration of his audience—his students or, well, me as the story-taker—and knows how to bring in the various voices or instruments that will make his composition come to life. Raphel's story was not only so well told because of the interesting qualitative and quantitative

developments—though there were many of those—but because Raphel was able to present a multi-voiced narrative. The positioning of various voices (Wortham, 2000) of individuals who have guided Raphel along the way revealed much about Raphel as an individual and helps us to understand him as a teacher, a father, a husband, a son, a brother, a bandmate—a person with a complex life that, thankfully, includes teaching (Sumara and Luce-Kapler, 1996).

Whether directly by following their lead onto the stage or the cruise ship or appropriating the social script they presented, Raphel gives power to others throughout his narrative. Conversely, Josh regularly positions himself as the deciding agent throughout his life. In his narrative Josh identifies decisions to move away from groups and activities from an early age. When he allows "insistent guidance" of his father to lead him into a career path, he finds that it is "not a good fit". His agency also allows him to adeptly move between groups as an authentic participant. This, he finds, gives him the ability and the authority to make connections between and among the various activities and cultures in which he engages, even though to others the connections may "seem like a leap".

Profile

Josh began teaching in his mid-forties after a twenty-year career as an applications engineer. He is a loving husband and father of twins, age eleven, a fifth-don black belt and Taekwondo instructor, a load organizer at the local skydiving drop zone, an avid gardener, bread baker, and restorer of hiking and mountain biking trails. While he began teaching in his mid-forties, Josh had dreamt of being an educator when in high school. "You know, probably the reason I wanted to be a history teacher, my absolute best, most inspirational teacher in high school was a history teacher. He was my AP European history teacher and just fantastic. You know, really inspiring. If I could be like him…" Josh, in some ways, is what Crow et al (1990) would call a homecomer, a second-career teacher coming back to an earlier envisioned career in education. Yet, Josh is not coming back to his vision of being a history teacher, he is becoming a second-career teacher in the woodshop.

Josh is a third-year teacher of STEAM at Green Public High School. In asking Josh about his experience becoming a teacher, I referred to Josh as the woodshop teacher, but he corrects me. "So, I am woodshop. I am also robotics. And I'm starting an engineering with a colleague. So technically, the all-encompassing term would be STEAM. So add the A for arts. So, right now, many people call me Applied Arts or Industrial Arts. But there is more to it than that." Woodshop. Robotics. Engineering. Our interactions from the very first minutes of the interview are a sharing of power—Josh wants to direct his story toward my aims—learning about the experiences of second-career teachers—but he is quick to make corrections and interrupt the structure to provide detail, clarification, and even self-exploration. At times he is emotional and makes both pairs of eyes in the room well as he recounts family struggles or challenges and

successes with students. The precision and emotion which Josh employs while sharing his story reflect the personality fit he found in his work as an applications engineer: "the good combination of the technical and the social":

Coming to Teaching

Intentional self-transformation is not new for Josh. Josh demonstrates from the start his calculating personality and appreciation of the long-lasting ramifications of his social engagements. When asked to discuss his upbringing and schooling, Josh shares a story about how as a middle schooler he departed one a group of friends who are traveling down a negative path that he does not see for his future.

> I'll go back to a big decision point in junior high in middle school now when I realized my grades were going down and I was always a smart kid, did well, and then my grades were going down and then my friends that I was hanging out with, with whom I would hang out at that time, suddenly a few of them started smoking and then [it was] "hey maybe we can raid the parents' liquor cabinet" and I said, "oh hold on this isn't me." So, I made a very abrupt, a very thoughtful decision. I consciously cut them out of my life, changed the way I dressed, just I made a big change of it just make a clean break. So, I changed my hair, changed my wardrobe almost entirely and from that point, for years, got straight A's. I really just said that's not what I want to be.

This recounting of an intentional change in future life course is profound and shapes a theme throughout Josh's story. When he is engaged in something that doesn't seem like a good fit, Josh is willing to make a calculated change. Here, at a young age, he opens up new opportunities for his future by departing from a group of friends who are beginning down a deviant path. Josh makes a "clean break" from these friends and changes his appearance—an aspect of his empirical self (James, 1890)—in order to pursue another path. Maybe his "analytical and linear" mindset makes it necessary for him to engage this qualitative change so that he knows all development thereafter will add to the man he wants to become.

But this is not to say that Josh travels one straight path. He tries many things and calculates, rhetorically, their odds of success in his future. The decision to leave his group of friends and to leave a potential career path reveal (rhetorically) a calculating personality as well as an individual who works to make decisions that set him up for the future he desires. His straight A's continue through high school. He was interested in math and science…

> you know, I think I found that easier than history. Enjoyed French. [I played] football all the way through and basketball for half of high school and then I was also a certified student athletic trainer. I would tape ankles, be on hand for minor injuries. In Massachusetts it's very professionalized; schools hire professional trainers to do that but where I grew up they wanted students to get the experience. So we trained under certified athletic trainers and doctors. I went to camps offered by companies that make much of the equipment. It's really a nice lead in for people so that was that was one thing I toyed with going into [for work] at one point and then said, "hmm, no"…In retrospect [it was] probably not intellectual enough for me.

As Josh is able to engage in his own calculations of what will be a good fit for him in his future, his social supports do the same. Josh notes that he liked many subjects in school, but he enjoyed studying History and was enamored of his History teacher. Josh dreamed of being a History teacher.

> When I was applying to colleges I was thinking history and teacher maybe. My dad is a mechanical engineer. He grew up poor and put himself through college and vowed to himself that "my kids would have easier". There were four of us: two boys, two girls. I was the youngest. Everyone went [to college]. My sister immediately before me, number three child said, "I don't want to go" and [dad] said in no uncertain terms you know "You are going, and you will find something to do." My brother, three and a half years older than me is a chemical engineer and was in college at the time. And my dad said [to me] "What are you going to do with a history degree? Manage a Pizza Hut?" It just so happened that my brother's best friend had graduated with a history degree. And he had a goal of becoming a college professor, so he was taking masters courses at that time and was managing a Pizza Hut. So, this was real. [Dad's] like, "you should be an engineer." And I had the test scores to go along with it, so I applied to two colleges only: the state university and the state tech. Not many people have heard of Tech, but it's where my father went and it's where my brother was. [I was] accepted to both. Offered a scholarship at Tech but said no. I wanted to go to the state university; it's more prestigious and I can do my own thing. I was accepted to the college of

engineering based on my dad's guidance, insistent guidance. I let him guide me and that's, that's fine. But that was where I went.

During College, Josh struggled academically. He pursued engineering, a vocational path that was established for him by his father and notes that the academic struggle may have been because engineering was not a good fit for him. His grades slipped. He was a shade above the cutoff for academic probation. He had to repeat a few classes so they would count toward his major. This was different for Josh, who had been a straight A student and had taken all of the AP classes his school offered at the time. "But, I made it work and boy I learned a lot about perseverance and struggling through something." He finished his engineering degree in 5-years and reports that he even enjoyed himself along the way, joining a fraternity that allowed him opportunities to develop leadership skills through various roles.

> So, I got to be treasurer, to manage some serious books; social chairman, which was fun to arrange, and I loved to develop the skill of putting events together. And then president, so you need to do all of these and try to get to herd all the cats and manage everybody. So those were some of the most valuable learning experiences I had. Probably detracted from my formal education a little bit but, tradeoffs. You know, tradeoffs for everything, and I think that's what I like about engineering: nothing is all good, nothing is all bad. It's almost that Eastern Philosophy: everything's in balance and it's a trade-off, so what's your choice? You know it's, "Ok here's the good and bad in this and do the pros outweigh the cons of any decision." And that's a very subjective, in a lot of cases.

I interject here, noting a larger connection Josh is making and not wanting to miss the cue signaled by a sudden change in Josh's story.

Michael:	So, mechanical engineering as Eastern philosophy?
Josh:	Yeah. Interesting.
Michael:	I like it.
Josh:	I mean, it's a stretch. I can make that stretch because I had studied some martial arts in high school, but I didn't do it really formally through college. As soon as I graduated I joined a school, a Dojong as we say in Korean, for Taekwondo and I've gone continuously since [nineteen] ninety-three. So now if I'm a fifth-

don black belt and volunteer instructor. So, I, I can make that philosophical leap.

Michael: I think that it's…you're making this connection that seems like I don't get it. But you do. So, I think that's important to your story to understand these connections.

Josh pushed back at my question, like I was questioning his authority to make that connection. While I had hoped he might describe the connection further, I understood that he felt challenged and was asserting his authority over his story, so I took the opportunity to affirm him and made a note to follow up on this connection later. I needed to remember that while the research questions are mine, the story belongs to my participants. I should not have interrupted.

Thankfully, without missing a beat, Josh gets back into telling his story, and back into the rhythm of sharing his story as a balance of the technical work of his calculating mind to make [the right] choices for himself and the voices of his social support network influencing him. Yet while Josh seemed to make decisions in middle and high school that set him up for future success, during college Josh pursued tangential interests that harmed his future prospects as an engineer.

So, I graduated from college. I looked for engineering jobs nearby. It was nineteen-ninety- three it was just coming out of recession for the [manufacturing] industry. They were not hiring. They were not hiring a lot—most of my friends had fathers, uncles, friends who worked [in the plants] so they had an in. They'd interned for them. I very purposely chose to work landscaping for my summer job. And landscaping meant mowing lawns once maybe twice a week but doing full new yard installations from sod to trees to brick patios. So these are some of the skills that I can look back at that job— you know driving large trucks, driving trailers—and the skills I picked up on the job I get to use for the rest of my life and I enjoy it. I love planting trees I love gardening—that's something from my father and my grandparents from Northern Italy. But because I had that I had no practical office work experience, and I had no "in" [at local companies].

Josh had intentionally rejected summer work in his vocational path. After reading about his academic struggles in the engineering classes we might assume this was to take a break from the rigors of work that he found intellectually challenging, but Josh proposes two different

explanations. One is that he did not want to gain an internship through a family connection as his friends had done, whether out of a need to make his own success or as a rejection of his father's authoritative pressure that led Josh to the engineering program in the first place. The second is that he wanted to develop skills other than those that were intellectual skills. Ones that he could carry with him into the future—and even that connect to his ancestral past. Josh does pick up on this theme and describes how it satisfies a need to be a bit divergent from social norms, but not before concluding that he found a job, eventually, by relying on his social network.

> So, I was looking for a job actively and it just so happens that a friend's father down in [Florida] knew of jobs there and it was in the military-industrial complex. It was Naval contracting, naval engineering contracting. So, I interviewed and received a job offer. I never envisioned leaving [the Midwest]. I thought I would be there forever. All my friends nearby. All of my U.S. family was there. I said, "I can always come back" and in my mind I always thought I'd come back you know two, three years later.

Josh met his current wife during his first year in [Florida] and has lived on the East Coast ever since.

Becoming a teacher

Through his first career, Josh continues to engage in activities and watches his family grow from he and his wife to a family of four as Josh and Beth have twins. Work causes strain for Josh. He finds himself committed to the life he has built in Massachusetts and turns down a promotion that would take him back to the Midwest. He also turns away from large corporations, favoring small family owned companies. Fidelity to one company sees him leave a job of 9 years to work for the German manufacturing company he had been a sales rep for. Then, he had had enough…and decides to become a teacher.

During the transition to teaching, Josh discusses with his wife. She reminds him that he has been "miserable for years" in his current career—overworked and overstressed—never quite finding the right fit. She reflects that he has been teaching in many of his activities throughout

the years, taking leadership roles and instructing and mentoring those around him. The two have calculated what their family needs and though they don't have a "cushion", they decide the timing is right for Josh to move into a public school teaching job.

For Josh, the transition to teaching was a calculated technical maneuver, in keeping with his "analytical and linear" mindset, which he jokes drives his wife crazy. "[It] drives [Beth] just up a wall sometimes because I'm just so analytical and linear in a lot of ways. It's like this has to follow that this has to follow that. But I'm grateful to have that, to be able to analyze certain things and [it's] very helpful for my own life." He made sure that he stayed on with his company so that he would get the severance that his German-owned company offered. He considered how becoming a teacher at age forty-five would allow him to take a nice public pension in twenty years, at age sixty-five. His social support, his wife, his—and he says this with eyes that ask I hear how genuinely he uses this otherwise trite-sounding term— "life-partner" encouraged him that the time was right, that he had been teaching in many of his activities across the years, and that they, together, would make it work. The time was precisely right and perfectly wrong as Beth got sick with cancer during Josh's first year of teaching and the two of them went through a really rough winter. But the new social support of the school was more accommodating than his eighty-hour a week job would have been at that time. And she is in remission. And Josh is happier as a teacher. Even the twins have noticed the change.

Alienation or Agency? Kathleen Pierce (2007) finds that second-career teachers occupy a space "in between selves" as they transition to teaching. This liminal identity is understandable for individuals transitioning from one social context to another. One might find herself in between social worlds unsure of what is expected and thus experiencing alienation, but this is to be expected as one learns the ways of the new culture.

From his days growing up to his current engagements in professional and personal activities, Josh has always had multiple interests and a number of peer groups. Though, he notes, he has never really fit in, and never really wanted to fit into just one.

> I've been able to draw this theme all the way back to [high school]. I was an athlete in high school, but I never really fit in with the athletes. I never really fit in with the smart kids because I was an athlete. You know I played dungeons and dragons all the way through high school which was definitely not cool for anyone, and I loved to read my fantasy books. So many different interests along the way. So, it was fun to kind of cross over groups, and this has been kind of [been an] ongoing theme in my life: friends with many people but you're not really tied to one.

Josh says this with pride, not with a longing for a closer connection with a specific group in his past. He sees this as a theme in his life, a conscious decision to be engaged with multiple groups and a variety of activities. As with taking jobs in landscaping over the summer instead of internships in the field of engineering, Josh opts for a multiplicity of personal engagements.

> So, since [college] I think my biggest skill or hobby—and this is where I met my wife—is skydiving. So I have about sixteen hundred jumps. I am not a certified instructor by choice because there's too much liability involved but I am a volunteer staff member at our drop zone. I'm called the load organizer there, so I choreograph, I put together jumps for experienced formation skydivers. I do that a few times a month. My wife hasn't jumped since we had kids. She hung it up with 800 jumps. We met many of our best friends that way.

> And [my wife and I] both continue to do Taekwondo. And we like to hike, and we've met people who that's all they do. So, I like to run hiking groups. I'm a member of the Friends of King's Common Trails and we like to build boardwalks and do trail work. And there are people that, that's all they do, and that's great. These people have that passion and dedication. And we have many friends at skydiving who are all into skydiving—we call it the subculture. And Taekwondo they're all into Taekwondo. We feel passionate about all these things but not so much that we are willing to forego everything else. And so, we kind of skip between the groups.

In discussing the activities it is clear that Josh is intentionally commits to many activities and many groups of people rather than just one. As he notes, he can track this back to his youth. His lack of social "fit" is not something that happened when he departed from a group of friends in high school leaving him socially adrift—this is an intentional decision.

And what's interesting, just to take that to where I am now, is it lets me relate to so many of the kids. You know so I can speak to the athletes. I can speak to, you know, the kids who want to start the *Dungeons and Dragons* club and they want me to be the advisor. I can speak to, you know, plenty of other people along the way. And they can't figure me out and that's kind of a good thing as far as I'm concerned, but uh, no it's nice to not be pigeonholed and judged. I mean, you're going to be judged regardless but, make it harder for them to judge.

Work-Life Balance. There may be a misconception that teaching is a low-stress job—an easy job—a conception that surely is not aided by the snipe: "Those who can't do, teach." Josh reports that friends are envious of his new job and wish that they too could have less stress—even availing themselves of some of their income in trade for more life satisfaction. Josh does not disagree with them:

I have a bunch of my friends from engineering and from sales who when I explain I teach woodshop we build a tiny house every year. And they say, "Oh my God that's the perfect job." I say, "Well yeah it's great but, you make a lot less money." And they're like, I heard someone just say it recently, "I would gladly make half what I make now for half the stress." I was like "Well, I have about half the stress probably, sometimes more, and I make less than half of what I used to (laughing)." And that's OK. It's an adjustment.

This point is important to Josh, possibly as a way of affirming a decision to take a job that pays much less than his previous job. He offers unsolicited triangulation of the fact that he is less stressed than in his previous work. Josh's children see a difference in him at home as well, noting that he is less stressed:

[And now], so early in the transition [my] kids actually said, one time, "Wow, you know, Papa was never this nice was he was at [the German company]" You know, I'm just more grounded. I'm less concerned about... less stressed about everything else that's going on. I guess when I get stressed, like my father, I'm snappy. Much more. So, that's gotten a lot better. And not that there aren't some negatives now, like 'I couldn't keep the kids...I just couldn't get their attention today' or 'They were totally out of control'. You know, there is that. But a lot of times its 'You should see these. Here are pictures of what they made'. So yeah, it's fun. And more importantly [my] kids are curious. Especially about the tiny house.

Josh is not trying to downplay the amount of stress he has in his new role as a teacher but rather is sharing how he is finding it a good fit for him as a person. He reports that he liked the job but

not the hours, especially when he moved from government contracting work with a strictly regulated (short) work week to a job in the private sector: "I really, really enjoyed it, but the problem was I was good at it and the company was growing so I got more and more and more work. So, forty-five, fifty, once I hit fifty-five to sixty hours I was pulling my hair out…"

The long work weeks and frustrating corporate culture drove him to change jobs and go to work for a small family owned company. The job changed after nine years and he was able to work from home full time, but the balance was tipped toward the work side rather than home:

> It was always with me. So even if I, you know, we eat dinner, we sit and eat together all the time. That is very special to us. We go to the farms together on the weekend to pick up our food. We do things and we have these rituals that are important to us. The phone would ring, but not during dinner, we have certain sacrosanct times, but you know, if it is after dinner when we're playing a game or whatever. "I've got to take this." Vacation never felt like vacation because I could never really let go. So, it [was] a German company [and I'd] get six weeks of vacation and I would take every single day. But half of those days, after the kids went to sleep I would be on email. I mean, so [work] was much more intrusive before. And frankly I would say I was more negative then. It was more, 'You wouldn't believe'. And you take that out mostly on the people you are closest with at that point. You know, the frustration.

Josh was burnt out not on the work but on the opportunity cost of the work. The work was good throughout, and Josh seemed to have found a way to do the type of work that satisfied his intellectual and emotional needs—the technical and the social—but he was giving up too much of his family life. So, again, Josh makes a conscious decision to prioritize one of his social roles—that of a father—and make a bold decision to teach. About half the stress and a little less than half the pay: "But, you know, does Bhutan have something on us? You know is the national happiness index more important than the gross domestic product? And I'll say, 'Oh yeah! (laughing) Absolutely!'"

Becoming as a Teacher

      Josh is a newcomer to Green Public High School, but he has been teaching for years. As a load organizer at the local drop zone, Josh instructs other skydivers in intricate formations and ensures they maintain appropriate safety protocols reminding them to "plan the jump and jump the plan." In his career as a technical sales engineer Josh had to teach customers about the products and found that was his greatest high and a key motivator—not the nice commission he got for each sale. He further found that he liked "teaching" his customers by providing them hands-on customer support and found abstract or removed customer support over the phone frustrating. And Josh works to include all students in his classroom, giving them a low-stress environment in which they can pursue their personal best. A tall, gaunt middle-aged white male, Josh cuts an unlikely picture of an Eastern philosopher, but for his students he definitely makes it work.

      Classroom Management--"the technical and the social". Josh begins class reviewing the agenda for the day written on the board at the front of the room and with the safety briefing. It may be assumed that these classroom management techniques may have come from the graduate courses in classroom management the Josh took in his teacher education preparation program, but Josh says it comes from experiences as an engineer:

> So [in the woodshop] I put the general plan for the project on the board. 'Here's what we are working on. Here is what's next up. Here's a reminder for your time.' So, it's semi scripted, but it's more just trying to lay out the plan and then explain certain things that 'The gotchas' if you will. [And then a safety briefing], always, and that's something I brought from industry. Every time you enter a plant or mine. You know, power plant, chemical plant, any plant. They're big on safety. And as I explained to the kids, some of them I was able to breeze through a little sheet. It's five minutes. Others it's a video, others it's a one-day class. For one it's a week-long class. That just gets you in. You're not allowed to touch anything. We take safety very seriously. My grandfather had two half fingers. I say, "We are much too young to hurt ourselves permanently. We are always going to wear safety [equipment]. Safety glasses and four-inch rule are the

biggest." Never, ever anywhere within four inches of any blade. So, we say this across the board.

The two-part structure—general plan and safety plan—has a very technical feel to it and it is clear while Josh is talking about it that he takes this very seriously. And he looks for efficiencies even in presenting his plan, successfully lobbying the parent teacher organization this past year to get him a SmartBoard for the shop so that he can save plans or parts of daily plans that he has written up on the board for use in other classes and in future years. And in the quote above we hear Josh's understanding of himself as a member of the classroom community. The use of "they" in reference to his old industry and "we" in reference to his classroom of students, Josh is expressing an important sense of self-verification within his new role as a teacher.

When recollecting a recent afternoon at the drop zone, Josh makes a connection to and expresses self-verification as a current member of the group. As the load organizer for his skydiving group, Josh establishes the routine for the jump, instructing his fellow jumpers the formations they will engage in:

> [With skydiving] I'm a load organizer. I was out there yesterday…I have the jumpers practice what we're going to do. We go step by step. Here are the moves. Then we plan when we're going to separate and how high we're opening and then which way we're landing so we go through the entire plan just like how we do in class. It's different. I don't have a board or smart board or a white board even to write it but at that point [we are all experienced jumpers]. We have a saying of plan the dive, dive the plan—so you don't do something unexpected that makes an unsafe situation. It's the same idea. Use your plan, make what's on the plan. I don't say it [in the woodshop]. It doesn't have the ring but it's the same idea.

He makes reference to how he teaches when in his skydiving group rather than answering my question about how skydiving influences his teaching. While his use of "we" affirms his continued group membership, his response to my question seems to elevate his understanding of himself as one who teaches in many of the activities he pursues. Though, it is impossible to say

that becoming a teacher professionally impacted this role as Josh had noted previously that he felt he was a teacher in many of his activities. Causal relationship aside, Josh seems to be affirming that teaching is a good fit for him.

Whether in the woodshop, the plant, the martial arts studio, or the back of an airplane Josh is keenly aware that there are risks that must be mitigated but cannot be completely controlled. These are the trade-offs that he notes are inherent in mechanical engineering and have philosophical underpinnings in Eastern Philosophy he has studied through his time in Taekwondo: "Nothing is all good; nothing is all bad." As he relates a story about the woodshop, he comes to realize that his calculating personality and experience in uncontrollable situations has given him a framework for safety that he can share with his students.

> "Everyone is going to make mistakes, but…" I try to not say "be careful." I try to say "Think." And "Be smart." I just try to counsel a little bit. OK, if you are gonna do something, and you think it is going to be really fun and really cool in the woodshop. Don't do it. Just stop yourself. Think about everything that could go wrong. OK, and then if there is nothing that could really go wrong, Go ahead! [And that], actually probably, more than anything, [it comes from] skydiving. I'd say that's the tangible thing that I can point to. Having seen some pretty horrific things and read about it on a regular basis. When there's a skydiving accident, they always say there's never one thing that went wrong. It's a chain of events. Break the chain anywhere and it doesn't happen, right? As far as the "stop, think about consequences," that's just trying to break the chain so they can process for a second. I'm trying to get the kids to do it themselves where they've got this chain of events which starts with a bad idea and then it goes with them doing whatever they were doing... Again, the whole idea is just stop break the chain.

Josh again illustrates his variety of experience and how he brings that into the classroom not because of pre-service teacher training but because of the multi-faceted life. He says his multi-membership helps him relate to more of his students. The students have the opportunity to find the aspects of Josh's experience that they find the most relatable and relevant to their own lives and are even led to share how one of their own life experiences influences their understanding of the concept he is trying to teach:

I think the industry aspect gets through to some kids who think that's cool. I think skydiving would get through to other kids. I mix it up. Other kids, you get one who's like, "Oh yeah, scuba. We do the same thing." That's kind of what I'm trying to do. In the shop setting, that's the kind of thing I want to draw out with, that's like, "Yeah, me too." That's great. Tell us how.

Josh sounds very much like a natural teacher, positing himself as someone who falls more on the "art" than the "craft" side of teaching. He reflects that he did not find his teacher preparation coursework very helpful. But, while Josh may have learned much of his instructional style from experiences before becoming a teacher, he makes a connection to how this ability is able to help him reach more students in his classroom, specifically those with special needs.

But, I'm breaking down steps all the time. I mean everyday life is every project I take on. You know I break it down into steps, whether it's making bread every week for the family or whether it's explaining what we're doing in the woodshop or the tiny house… I'm grateful to have that, to be able to analyze certain things and [it's] very helpful for my own life. I'm grateful that I was then able to take that back into [teaching]. I find that this, this is really great for all my kids [students] and especially the kids on [IEP] plans. So, you know, break it down. Most IEPs talk about how you need to break down tasks into simpler, complex tasks into simpler ones. And I try to not have any complex tasks in the shop. As they get more experience, in Wood II, or Advanced Wood I'll let them do more of that. But I break down everything whether it's just, just by myself just in my head just breaking down a, as far as ok step, step, step, and putting it up on the board.

Hands on Teaching. American pragmatist John Dewey was surely not the first to advocate for experiential and hands on learning, and today all levels of education try to incorporate hands on learning in and out of the classroom. As Josh talks about hands on learning, he does not speak about it as something that he tries to do in his classroom. He does not even discuss it as something that he finds particularly important for his students. Hands on learning is something that is important for Josh himself—he wants to be a hands-on teacher.

When I became a teacher I got my professional licensure for math and for technology and engineering, they call it. That technology and engineering piece is the only licensure they offer for shop anymore. So, they got rid of industrial arts, except for in vocational school setting, which is a little bit more intense. So with that I actually looked for math jobs first. And the thing about the woodshop that interested me most was being able to take

something from drawing to a reality. And then, making something tangible with my hands.

As an engineer, Josh's education involved taking things from drawings and making them into reality. It wasn't all "problem sets and computations" but also involved "countless hours in the lab". Yet, instead of describing how he liked learning in a hands-on way through his training as an engineer, he describes the frustration of trying to provide technical support over the phone when he was in his technical sales job. "I did like the [customer] service end [of my technical sales jobs]—which I did a lot of—when I was there and I could be hands on and I could see people and do it. But someone calling [for technical support] and saying, 'This piece of [equipment] is doing this one thing.' And then it's almost impossible to duplicate unless you have the exact same thing. So that was the frustration on that end."

While Josh does not share this example explicitly as a metaphor, it does provide an interesting metaphor for teaching. Trying to teach a student devoid of the appropriate context is like trying to give technical support for a complex piece of machinery over the phone. And, to learn "hands on" that he prefers to teach the tangible rather than the abstract, Josh takes an opportunity to teach a math class. The experience affirms his desire to teach through "hands on" methods and that the woodshop is the place for him.

I was point eight last year, and [my school] offered me a point two teaching position to round me out to full-time for math. And it was a math class that they created. It was more or less pre-algebra, remedial, with kids who just couldn't handle algebra one…but I just I found that not being hands on, not having stuff I could point to and just all on the board all theoretical, no matter how good the problems were written, how much they tried to bring in real world things it just was too abstract. And when the semester was closing and the head of the department said, "I think we're going to have an opening are you interested in applying?" I was like, "No" I really like the woodshop. I like being hands on."

Josh is quite remarkable in his self-understanding. Turning down a job that would bring his position up to full-time because the style of teaching is not he desires should give more of us

courage to say "No" quickly and with surety. In reality, Josh was not turning down a job offer

but expressing his agency in becoming the type of teacher he wants to be. The ability to turn

down this job comes from an understanding of his preferred teaching method born out of years of

quasi-teaching experience, like that of providing customer service when in his technical sales

jobs. It is not simply that Josh had a bad experience with "a very difficult disciplinary class" but

that he desired to teach in a way that he had found success in an approximation of the teaching

activity in a different context. Further exercising his agency over becoming the type of teacher

that he wants to be, Josh gets to work creating something for himself that will allow him to teach

in the way that he wants and to bring his position to full-time. "I'm now putting together an

engineering class for next year with a colleague and we're planning to be largely hands-on, lab-

based. So more of a, a little less hands-on than the woodshop obviously, probably more like half

and half. But, yeah, so some lecture some flipped classroom and then lots of hands on just to

reinforce it."

  Meeting students at their level of need. Josh is not just looking out for his own desired

mode of teaching as he revives the woodshop and works to expand hands on learning

opportunities. He is considering the students who he sees on a daily basis.

> We're pushing all these kids into college with way too much student debt and jobs that
> they're really not good fits for if they find a job. Going into a trade is probably the right
> move. Yet, the vocational schools, even they really hyper specialize. Top achieving
> students go there. It's no longer the lower achievers. Top achieving students go there with
> an eye to having a career or going to college. So, where do [low achieving] kids belong?
> What are we doing to them? From what I've seen, kids, they don't say, "Where do I
> belong?" They just say, "I don't belong in school. I don't belong in school at all." That's
> why one thing I like about our new principal. He recognizes the shop. He recognizes the
> marine tech program. He recognizes we need to give something else for these kids. The
> school committee made a four-year requirement for science, so we need to give some
> hands-on science stuff that some of these kids will be able to take into [the workforce].
> Not that they're going on to trade school but we're going to give some kids some
> experience, some skills that they would translate into life. And it's lucky that I fell into
> this job and it's funny that not many schools have wood shops anymore. That's a luxury in

a lot of ways but it's one that we fully intend to take full advantage of because there are plenty of kids, no matter what's published and what's pushed that shouldn't go to college. And I'm not saying that they don't deserve an education. But I think, you know, we've stigmatized very good jobs that maybe you get your hands dirty where they can make a really good living. So I had, again, the great experience of those two companies I worked for as technical sales engineer. You know, there's a shop attached. It was an office and a [machine] shop. And machinists, in many cases, they're on their feet all day. They get a little dirty with the cutting oil. But these are highly skilled, almost all men—there was one woman, who could make six figures with overtime. But they did great. They were bad students, but they had an aptitude for math in most cases. They became machinists and they did great. Do we make machinists anymore?

Josh is agitated as he says this. He is passionate about this idea and it is clear that he cares deeply for his students. He wants them all to succeed and get the best out of life. Some of this passion may come from his care for the machinists he worked with or even the people he grew up alongside in the rust belt of the industrial Midwest, but Josh points back to his students who he feels are being given bad guidance or left without a good option. He makes a connection to the transition plans and IEP meetings for students with special needs and expresses his desire for these kids to find success in his classroom that they can translate into success in the real world. He takes pride in knowing that his class is a sort of experiential education that gives students a taste of what their lives might be like and to build confidence through their achievements during school.

As Josh said, in the woodshop, students are able to take things from a drawing to reality, to make something that can be seen and appreciated. He reports with great pride that his students on IEPs have made amazing progress in their skill and pursuit of projects, and that they not only have something to show for their learning but that the students and their parents use that as a showcase.

That's fun to see them feel mostly good about finishing, even after struggling. Maybe my most rewarding are some of the kids with more special needs, on plans, and really seeing what they can do and how they can do it. Some have required more assistance than other. When you build a, when I help them build an Adirondack chair, they never thought they

could build anything so big. And their parents and teachers and everyone just feel so proud of these kids. It's fantastic.

Josh is beaming as he says this, and my eyes have welled up. He can sense that I am emotional and generously keeps talking, knowing that I need a moment to compose myself.

It's funny to go to the family level and have these discussions. My son is all of eleven and wants to be a special ed teacher. Through some of the groups we are involved with and then he has met a few of my students along the way. And then just how we talk about it and how rewarding it is. How rewarding it has been. He's had interest...he's always been good... [his school] does a good job of keeping the integrated classrooms with special needs. So he has always been exposed to it and for him it is no big deal. But then when he hears me talk about how rewarding it has been working with some of my favorite students, he just made the connection. Like "Oh, I could do this as a job. I could be a special education teacher and get that much reward."

This remark about his son is heartwarming and provocative. In an earlier conversation Josh had said that he is not much of a nurturer and that he marvels as his wife's ability to respond well to and care for their children. He suggests that perhaps his "harder" nature comes from his father and that his wife knows so much about children because of her experience babysitting as a young woman and in her work as a legal consultant dealing with cases of child protection and child development. I am struck that Josh's ability to see potential in all of his students has made him a model for his son to emulate, but it has also given Josh a new way to look at and relate to his kids and appreciate them "for their differences…It's important for me to understand where their differences come from. It's a joy."

Rituals and Mindfulness. As a practitioner of Taekwondo and a volunteer instructor, Josh has spent the last twenty-five years learning a martial art form and Eastern philosophy. Early in our conversation Josh relates that he sees a connection between mechanical engineering and Eastern philosophy and defends his position as one that he has the authority to make. In becoming a teacher, Josh has brought in a few aspects of his Taekwondo practice to the classroom—notably a set of rituals that help students develop presence.

I have a ritual to start [class]. Everyone focuses in. Here is the plan. Here is the safety briefing. Let's go. Give the reminders. Focused in, ready to start, not on the phone. And not that there is not chatting. And I think that is the difference with the woodshop. And, as I say, this is not a core class. You can be social. Do your work. Don't stop and just talk. But be social with people next to you. Take this chance to decompress and unwind from your otherwise quiet, stressful work day. And I think that is where some of the kids thrive.

This ritual helps students focus on the work at hand, developing presence for the work of the moment. Josh shares that by doing this he gets the students into a place where they are more receptive to other principles of Eastern philosophy.

As far as what I like about Eastern philosophy, again, the idea of being able to be aware and present. There is a mindfulness movement at Marblehead. We have an expert practitioner whose come on as a teacher. I bring it as far as the ritual aspect up front and I'll pause and kind of take a few-minute pause and be quiet and we're going to do this. But I just try to calm people down; the expectation is to get people thinking clearly before we move on. So very much like starting class and I think that's the same Eastern philosophy. It's building on the same concepts of mindfulness that they do. It's just a little bit sneakier. We get to talk about discriminating mind and the need to be able to see what you're doing and make adjustments but not judge yourself for it. You need to be aware of everything but distracted by nothing, so it's all these concepts. It's fun to get that kind of philosophical underpinning and have that be part of me and what I do. It feels good. And I think that's where Taekwondo is really helping me [as a teacher]. I think it is because the thing about Eastern philosophy is balance, all right? There's a balance and you're trying to be a good person knowing that you got this part to you so everything you do, there's a balance and that informs me in a lot of ways that I think makes me a more accepting and forgiving teacher.

For Josh part of being a teacher is helping the students to become more forgiving of themselves as well. He shares that he encourages his students to pursue their *personal best*, another concept from Taekwondo that drives Josh to differentiate assignments for students with special needs and to act as a supportive "guide on the side" as he goes around the room checking on student projects.

What one person can make versus what someone can make…what people of different abilities and needs, disabilities, that looks different in my opinion. And that's, getting the same grade for something that looks different is a reasonable accommodation for woodshop. A different product. Because a lot of people who are fine motor skill challenged, they're not going to be able to do all the same stuff and that's fine. I look at it

as level setting for what that product needs to be. That's fun to see them feel mostly good about finishing, even after struggling.

And it seems to be working. Josh reports that he does not see the same level of behavioral difficulties from students with special needs have in other classes. He reports that on several occasions each year he gets an email from a counselor or special education case manager asking for teacher input on behaviors.

> There are many now who I have gotten the email from the counselor or from the special ed case manager like "Change medication. This seems to be a problem". I don't see it. Across the board, when I have gotten that request, it has never been an issue. I've had kids who struggle in traditional academic sense who do fantastic in there…So to teach I think also means to understand different personalities in different people and appreciate, you know, where they're coming from.

INTERLUDE

NOTHING IS ALL GOOD…NOTHING IS ALL BAD.

Josh is not the first career-changer seeking work-life balance as a second-career teacher. The management of social, economic, moral and family values has been discussed in the literature on second-career teachers, and many teachers report that such balance is a top motivation for moving into teaching (Crow, Levin, & Nager, 1990; Freidus, 1989; Young, 1995; Lee, 2011; Morettini, 2014). But Josh's pursuit of balance is deeper than the work life balance discussed previously in the literature. Josh's understanding of balance is informed both by his training as an engineer and his practice of Taekwondo and studies of Eastern philosophy—two intersecting relevance structures (Berger and Luckman, 1966) that emerge often in Josh's narrative.

As Josh presents his story, he focuses on aspects of balance, specifically highlighting a balance he has had affirmed by his wife that he attributes to both his training and experience in the professional field of [mechanical] engineering and his engagement with the Eastern philosophies underpinning his practice of Taekwondo— "the good balance of the technical and the social". Josh's representational self mirrors this balance of the technical and the social as Josh shares recollections of numerous activities in which he performs technical duties and engages with the people in those activities which he liked much better than "just sitting and crunching numbers or looking at designs" that were demanded of him in his very first "straight engineering" job. He continues this line of explanation of balance as he discusses his work in the classroom: establishing a routine to support a precise, step-by-step learning methodology and to maintain a "safety culture" before moving around the room to check in with students and take joy in their growing abilities or encourage them to achieve their "personal best".

This balance is ritualized. Josh is appropriating this framework from his "linear sequential" way of thinking—one that he attributes to his training as an engineer. In this way Josh is drawing on a prior competency or appropriating former cultural practices. In another way, Josh is expressing himself as one who is confident in the activities in which he engages and able to select the cultural tools that are appropriate for the context (Bakhtin, 1981; Wertsch, 1991). In fact, it is possible the Josh is able to select into activities that are similar enough to previous activities that they provide the space for his way of thinking and doing—the cultural tools he is ready to employ (Vadeboncoeur et al., 2011). Rather than a bold step forward into self-transformation, Josh's transition to teaching may be conceived of as a calculated move into a context into which his personal and professional competencies transfer. This is dissimilar to the transfer of competencies found in the literature on second-career teachers in as much as the literature discusses the transfer of skills and knowledge and it does provide a view of how a transfer of dispositions may suit particular types of teachers or contexts of teaching (Tigchelaar, Brouwer, and Korthagen, 2008; Etherington, 2009; Grier & Johnson, 2012, Antink-Meyer & Brown, 2017). Josh, after all, is not teaching history as he had imagined he might when he was first considering a career as a teacher. If he was trying to teach history I imagine he would have reacted in similar ways to his experience teaching a "straight mathematics" class—it just would not fit his style.

Josh's interactional self throughout our interviews is also a balance of technical and social. He is not shy in interrupting me to ensure we gain precision in telling his story, and he gives me great detail in sharing a story that shares both the technical (financial) and social (work life balance) considerations he weighed when making his decision. He is highly emotional and forgoes his calculating personality as he discusses his wife's illness or when sharing about

successes of some of his students—he tears up and his voice cracks as he shares confidently held parts of his personality. He also reads my own emotional reaction to some of these stories well, providing me time to compose myself during our final meeting when I was brought to tears by one of the stories that he shares.

Throughout his story, Josh shares that he is comfortable moving between cultural activities and playing a variety of roles. This serves him well in both the technical and the social aspects of his teaching. He is able to draw on experience from industry and from skydiving, from hiking and mountain biking and from Taekwondo as he works to instruct his students. These various roles are of interest to his students, and the multiple groups that Josh has engaged with over the years give him the adaptability to try out different ways of explaining information or relating to students, all of which make him a successful teacher able "to inspire and instruct" his students as his favorite history teacher had done for him years ago, planting the seed for a long-off transition in which Josh would become a second-career teacher.

Terry, though, offers a less dynamic image in her narrative. She engages in fewer activities than Josh and Raphel and her first-career was pursued out of a part-time job she began in high school. She admits that she "settles in" to a rhythm of life and work early on in her adult life and even bemoans that she might have liked to make the decision to become a teacher earlier. A signature development in her life was having children and becoming a mother. This qualitative change establishes the foundation for her slow progression to becoming a teacher and the incorporations she makes between the two activities and social role images and in her classroom she draws heavily on one role identity in seeing herself as caring, kind, competent, and engaging as a teacher: "If you are a mother, you are a teacher, you know?"

TERRY

Profile

Terry, the youngest of four children, was the first in her family to complete a bachelor's degree. She began working at a dentist's office at age sixteen, worked her way through college attaining a license in dental hygiene and continuing on to complete a bachelor's in her fourth year of college as a full-time student and full-time hygienist. She pursued independence through work and education—money meant independence for her at a younger age—and got married at age twenty-one, right after her college graduation. Terry is a working mother. She has one daughter off at the state college and a son who is about to graduate from the local high school. She comes to our interviews right after school and jokes, after one interview that went just over an hour, that she is going to make macaroni and cheese for dinner. The interviews are fun, and we both laugh a lot.

While some people are comfortable reflecting on their lives, Terry is less so. She says at several points as we are talking that she does not often reflect on her own life or even talk about her work noting that her husband does most of the taking, processing his day and talking about the small business he runs. This seems an interesting gender role reversal and it provides me insight into why I might have needed to ask more questions of Terry to get her to share certain parts of her experience. Not only is she unpracticed, but she is used to listening to a man talk and here I, a man, opened by telling her that I wanted to hear her tell her story.

Coming to Teaching

During childhood & high school, Terry was close with her family and was involved at church and at school. Terry notes that she loved school, "which, not all students do" and that she had "great, loving teachers" in elementary school who made her enjoy learning. This is a theme

she draws on throughout her story, noting that teachers must be caring and representing and positioning herself as a caring teacher, particularly in comparison to some of the teachers she observed when completing her student teaching. When Terry's sisters graduated from high school, she had to "transform" herself and engaged in some new activities—none of which seemed to stick.

> I had two older sisters. We were all in high school together. I had friends through all the grades. High school was just a lot of fun for me. Fairly small. It was like 360 kids in my graduating class. I knew a good handful of them...literally [a handful] ...didn't have a lot of friends. Well, I had a lot of friends but not a lot of them were in my grade. So, when I became a senior I had to, like, transform myself and make new friends because everyone else had graduated pretty much. So that's when I became yearbook editor and I joined the play. And I played powderpuff football. I actually tried track but going as a senior to start a new sport I didn't feel, I wasn't ever welcomed into it. And to not have support from your peers or the coach? I mean the coach never knew my name. But those are the things, I was just trying different things. And as a teenager kids do that all the time I think they try to figure out who they are. So, yeah, I made new friends and I tried new things. And I could have just, I could have just studied or whatever but yeah, I tried to do some different things.

Terry discusses early attempts to transform herself and notes that she did not every feel that she fit. The lack of fit was not that the activities themselves were not to her liking but rather that she did not feel accepted into the group. Her sisters and friends had departed from high school and in the new activities that she tried she did not feel supported by the coach or by her peers. This positioning of others as welcoming and supportive is important in Terry's story. She represents herself as a "people person" who finds success in her first and second careers because of the relationships she is able to build. She also positions others as key to her development stating that an extra "push" from trusted peers to try something new—or better yet to have someone pull her into a new direction.

The one thing that did stick with Terry from high school was her after school job at the dentist's office. She had not selected this job because she was interested in the medical field,

dentistry, or her eventual occupation as a dental hygienist. She had gotten the job out of an interest to have some spending money. "We grew up in a family that my dad worked two jobs my mom didn't work. We didn't have extra money. So I always had to work." Her high school guidance counselor was helping her get an after-school job that was in walking distance of the school. She loved the work but was drawn to it because of the people she worked with.

> The man that I worked for was amazing in so many ways. He was patient teaching me things. He told jokes all the time to the patients, but he was also kind. …I don't know if it was the job itself or the people there you know they just drew me in and I just really enjoyed working there. All the people. The patients as well as the employees there. So I like people. I guess I am a people person.

Being welcomed into this environment, Terry decided she would continue to work in the field. She did not say that she intended to come back and work for the same man, but she did, even using the present tense though she has not worked as a hygienist for a few years:

> So, it was a big part of my life because then I became a dental hygienist after that. So, I went to school, became a dental hygienist and ended up working for the same man for twenty years. So, it was a lot for a high school kid, you know. I started that when I was sixteen and [really] it was based on an interest that I wanted money. Growing up in a household where your parents didn't give you money for anything that you wanted. So if you wanted a car or you wanted to go with your friends, you needed money. You know you want to be able to pay for that. So, I had to find someplace to work where I could walk from school. It was that I got paid much either. But it was its independence too, you know; it was that feeling of independence. And again, I had two older sisters who were already in college, you know, so, they had some money because they were working. It makes you motivated when you are the baby of the family. Both [of my sisters went to college] locally though, neither one of them went away. They both stayed at home. I was the only one that went away. That's another story. (laughs)

During college Terry studied for her dental hygienist's license and worked on and off campus to help support herself through school. She went to school full time and had a rigorous schedule taking dental hygiene classes almost all day every day. During her senior year she worked as a hygienist two days a week and went to school 3 days a week, effectively starting her career while completing a bachelor's degree to compliment her professional/associates degree in

dental hygiene. Terry took some classes in education thinking that one day she might want to teach hygiene.

> I went right to college for dental hygiene because I was working in the dentist's office, so I knew that's what I wanted to do. Hygiene school is really intense. You go to school from 8-5 everyday so, because clinical is four hours every afternoon, so there wasn't really like a lot of, like, extra time in there to do other things because you were in school all day and then had to do your homework. So, in my family you know my sisters went to college too, but we were the first generation to go to college. No one had even gotten their bachelor's…my sister got an associate's…so like we had gone far, you know? So, I was very studious in college.

> And in the back of my mind, even back then, I knew that I wanted maybe to teach. Maybe teach hygiene, that was my thought process. I mean I took a lot of education classes, I probably took eight education classes in undergrad. You can get a degree in two years but all of the extra, I mean those liberal art classes it really takes three years to get your degree. I was going to go four years, so I got my bachelor's degree. So, during that time (laughing) after my junior year I actually did graduate with my dental hygiene license. So, my senior year I worked two days a week at a dentist office in the town of Olson (pseudonym) and then went to school three days.

Terry was incredibly organized as she pursued her undergraduate studies. She pursues her dental hygiene license while balancing work and then, thinking that she might want to teach someday, decides to take some education classes and complete a bachelor's degree. She mentions that she is a first-generation college student, but she did have "role images" provided by her two older sisters. Each of them went on to complete associate's degrees, working their way through school in the technical fields they would eventually get full time jobs in as well. The foresight to complete her bachelors certainly opened up her future path to becoming a second-career teacher.

Terry gets married two months after she graduates with her bachelor's degree. She settles in close to her hometown, works as a dental hygienist, and enjoys building her life with her husband. But she does share a regret that she did not continue on with her studies to get a master's degree right away.

> I got married at twenty-one. How crazy is that right? We we're living in [town] first. Right by the college. And if I was smart I would have taken my grad classes then for

education, but I wasn't that smart. Because we were working full time…I started to get involved with life and not school. I mean, when you start earning money, you just don't think about going back to school…I mean school is different from life. When you're in school that's all you think about like especially undergrad. It's all about you just doing your work, your school work, and you don't have any other worries. But then you know when I had, like I had told you I graduated and two months later got married and we were both working, and you know you have to pay your bills, so, going back to school we didn't have that extra money probably too like I hadn't really thought of that.

Within five years of graduating from college, Terry and her husband build a home, become involved at church, and have children. Terry continues working three long days each week as a dental hygienist she but also forms a preschool co-op with friends to provider nursery and preschool for their children. She finds she loves teaching.

One of my good friends was from the office, from the dentist's office, we both had kids that same age. They were little kids right and, so, when you have little kids, if you stay at home, like during the week just like your brain is just turning to mush, right? So, we got four other, we got four or five families together so four others besides myself, um, and we set up like playdates. And then we did that for probably a year and then the kids were old enough to start going to preschool and we said, "why are we going to send our kids to preschool if we're here, and we're all intelligent women, right? Why can't we just have a little preschool here?" So, between the five of us we just said that two days a week a week we'd have this preschool thing and two of us would teach a week, two of us would watch the little kids and one of us would have four hours a week off, you know to go do what we wanted. So that's what we did. So for years we had preschool with the kids. I had so (SOOOO) much fun. We grew baby chicks and butterflies and, you know, did all the letters and shapes and, days of the week and months. You know, did all that stuff and it was so fun. I knew I wouldn't want to be a preschool teacher but that was like my first…well if you're a mother you're a teacher, you know.

Terry found empowerment in teaching her own children. But she did it with friends. Throughout this part of her story she positions herself as an equal to the others, referring to "we". Teaching was an empowering project for Terry, and perhaps her final sentence expresses this empowerment best: teaching was a way that she made her role as a mother significant. She is an intelligent and educated woman. She was not a stay at home mom, even on the days when she was not at work—she was a teacher.

So, then when [my kids] did go to school, like my baby went to kindergarten, I totally missed [teaching] because we had been teaching already for seven years. And, so, they always need help in elementary school with little kids, right? Kindergarten class is a lot of kids, a lot of energy. So I just asked if they wanted help, and I would just go in, and to be able to just go in there and help keep things organized, you know, like, so they have activities going on, if you can just be at a table to help this group of kids, and the teacher's doing her thing but you're in charge of just this little area…So I volunteered to read and then… I would set up some kind of science experiment and then we'd do it and then we'd clean up. So that's what I did.

Becoming a Teacher

As her kids got older, Terry continued volunteering at the school on her days off from working as a dental hygienist. "I would volunteer in the library and I would volunteer in the classroom reading and I would help with science experiments and, my husband, I was in there volunteering so much that my husband was like, 'why don't you get a job and get paid?' So, I ended up becoming a teacher's assistant…I really liked it a lot." Terry's husband provides the voice of a supportive other and gives Terry the push to become a teacher's assistant. As she continues working as a teacher's assistant she gets another "push" from a friend:

So the college [nearby] sent one that they were having a master's degree cohort. So I was thinking about it and thinking about it and I had another friend who wasn't really happy in her job, so she was like let's do it together. So, I probably never would have done it if she didn't like, pull me and say, "let's do it!" She gave me the push I guess not pull, but she pushed me. I needed it…

Terry had noted earlier that she sought independence. That is what drove her to get a job at age sixteen and to pursue education to get a higher paying job in the field. Now, as a mother, she positions the voices of others as elemental in her development. While this might suggest that she is taking a different role as a married woman, Terry describes it in a more pragmatic way, describing how she was satisfied making money and needed the "incentive" of having a friend to go with in order to give her the push to go back to school:

I was comfortable working and making money and doing, you know, the day to day. I needed an incentive I guess. I guess just having a friend to go with (laughing). You know

fear of the unknown. Going back to school. I hadn't gone to school for twenty years, so, you know, she she's my age and if she could do it I could do it. I always have had people supporting…always.

Terry took four years to complete her graduate work and get her teaching license "It was a slow, slow progression (laughing)." She had little kids and "a very helpful husband" in what she calls a "crazy time". She was working five days a week as a teaching assistant and on Saturdays as a hygienist.

I couldn't let go of the hygiene until I had a full-time teaching position. I don't know if it's an identity thing, like, for so long you thought of yourself as, I was a dental hygienist. And when people are, when people ask you about yourself like you often say who you are based on your profession. And, even when I was working Saturdays, I was still more dental hygienist that I was teacher. Because you know, because I was still just the helper (as a teacher). Um, I'd probably tell them both, but you know. So then, I guess eventually…

So, it took, it takes a while to get a job, right? So there was about a year and a half transition time before I actually had a full-time teaching position that I was secure in. And then I taught two more years before I gave up the hygiene. So, I held on, you know, it was hard to let go of the old job, the old me. The stability of having a [full-time teaching] position that I knew was secure [helped]. I had been there two years, knew I had the third year coming. You know you get your professional status after that. And it's a lot, you know, [my] husband didn't want me to give [dental hygiene] up, because, it was a higher paying job. It was a hard decision. And not only the money, it was the people. So, most of my patients were friends and family at that point, right? So, to say to them…it was hard to tell all of them. And it was, slowly I told all of them that I was not going to work anymore. So, so that's why. (laughing) [The money] wasn't that much honestly because. I worked on Saturdays so yeah. I mean you know. I mean, it helped, but money wasn't really a consideration, it was the people. I mean you want to be independent, you know. You know, and my husband has always been like, you know, if anything ever happens to me I want to be able to take care of yourself. So, we are practical in that sense.

And, well, I left [hygiene] because I wanted to be a teacher but I also left, I thought about changing careers because of physical reasons. I have a bone spur in my neck that numbs one of my hands, so, you can't hold an instrument safely, you know. But I had, way before I even had that, you know, I had started going to school, um, to get my masters. So, I already knew I was going to change careers, so, again, God thing, he knew I was going to need to be somewhere else, so, I was prepared when it was time.

Teachers are Caring, Competent, and Organized. Terry noted earlier in our conversations that she was inspired by caring elementary teachers and that she found she could be helpful by organizing when volunteering in her kids' school. While secondary teaching is different from elementary teaching and elementary teachers are different than secondary teachers (Fuller and Brown, 1975) these two role images of teachers drove her reactions to teachers she observed while completing her master's degree and student teaching. She completed over two-hundred hours of observations of teachers from several different schools.

Terry: So, so learning who you will feel comfortable with I think observing others is definitely the way you learn that.

Michael: And, and, so are there any of those observations that stick out, you know those two hundred hours, that stick out as particularly good or particularly awful that you say I will never teach like that?

Terry: Uh-huh (laughing).

Michael: Or I will always strive to teach like that?

Terry: Uh-huh. So let's start with the awful, because it was really awful. I observed…a week of a teacher who didn't do anything. He gave [the kids] packets and he sat at a desk and there were packets of papers all stacked up like around the room that the kids had turned in like he never corrected any of them. I'm so…so to me I'm like "Why? Why are you even doing it [teaching]?

Michael: (shifting in seat) Yeah. I'm shifting in my seat that story makes me so uncomfortable, right?

Terry: Un-huh. It was very uncomfortable to someone to observe that classroom and not be able to do anything to, you know, whatever, help the kids or…Obviously, whoever knows that's the way he is, but…so that was the worst, but there is a lot of good. I mean, way more good!

In this interaction, I had been able to affirm Terry in her reaction to a poor role image of a teacher who did not demonstrate care for his students. My question had suggested that she share negative and positive reactions, but we both realized that it would be more fruitful to discuss the

positive images she had seen in the classrooms she observed. She spends more time discussing

positive role images that focus on hands on teaching methods, command of subject matter, and

organization:

> I observed a math teacher who did a lot of kinesthetic, a lot of, like demonstrations, had the kids talking and moving. I observed a microbiology teacher who was super organized—like he had nothing on his desk. I wish I could be like him. He would put everything in drawers, everything was nice and neat. [And] he knew his stuff so well he wouldn't even need to think about what he was going to say. I also had a professor in college, the reason human anatomy is one of my favorite subjects is because of this Professor in college who, he just stood up and lectured but…he was so excited about it. Never looked at a note for anything he talked about, just had slides that went through. You know, those kinds of teachers that just know their stuff. You know, know their content. Those are my favorite ones I guess. So, you finish the hundreds of hours of observations and you try to find a place where you think you'll fit in. Because I observed probably five different school districts, you know. (laughing).

Terry draws on more role images here, thinking back to her college teachers for those that had

command of her subject and reaffirming that organization was important for her instruction.

These role images are affirmed once again as Terry engages in her student teaching with a

student teacher who was both caring and organized:

> The woman that I student taught with was amazing: kind, very organized, like, we both kind of were overachievers in making sure everything's prepared ahead of time. She taught me how to be ready a week in advance, you know, for all of your materials, make sure you were comfortable when you went into a classroom, things like that. And she supported me like as we were teaching…When I started student teaching after the first week I was pretty much teaching full-time myself. She was there, supportive, and we planned together. We planned with the other science teachers too which was a good thing. So it was all good. She felt comfortable with me there. And she also happened to be pregnant. So, when she went on her maternity leave they just had me stay for the rest of the year. So that all worked out really well.

Terry was able to take over the class as a long-term sub when her cooperating teacher went on

maternity leave. She finished her degree and was a licensed teacher, but finding a job was

difficult. For all of the talk about teacher shortages—particularly in math and science—and

wanting to hire second-career teachers, Terry did not find it easy to get a full-time position

teaching life-sciences. She did get a long-term sub position the next year and credits that to her

ability to express care and organization.

> I ended up getting another position in another local school district [the next year]. And
> it's funny, the reason I got the position in this next place was because when I was
> interviewing, the principal who was one of the interviewers, her grandchild came in and I
> goo'd-and gaa'd over the grandchild. You know the fact that I was a mother and like I
> like kids just that hit her…and the fact that I was very organized. I had a binder with all
> my lessons and ideas in it and stuff so that impressed her too.

But when that four-month position was over, it was the middle of the school year and she was

not able to find anything else. She needed something, both to keep her busy and bring in some

money, but also to keep learning and "put it on [her] resume".

> so, I just did day-to-day [substitute teaching]. Which is terrible. It's, it's, it's a very
> difficult thing to do I think. The kids disrespect [you], you know? They don't expect you
> to actually teach anything. As a substitute you're in there—you're a babysitter basically
> trying to manage the classroom…A lot of times it was read the book and, you know,
> answer these questions so. That kind of thing…the kids weren't disrespectful to me, but,
> they weren't engaged. There was nothing really exciting for them to do. Um, but, again
> with all of that it's a learning experience.

The next fall she got another long-term sub position. This time it was not a maternity leave but

was filling in for someone who was in an interim administrative role at the school. He was trying

out the role for two years, and Terry came in to take over his class for the second year:

> but he didn't want to let go of his teaching either. He wasn't sure he really wanted to
> transition, so, um…it was still his classroom. Right? Because I was just the sub. He was in
> the building. So I planned all the lessons, it's not like he was doing that, but the room was
> his. So, the decoration, the way the room looked, the way it was set up, that was all his. So,
> when he left [teaching]…it took me probably, it took me another year after that to actually
> change the room. So I kept it the second year the same way and then the third year I'm like
> OK. You know it's time to make this my own.

Becoming as a Teacher

      Teachers are caring. As Terry has noted, being a mother is what brought her to

teaching. The moment when her children were set to go to preschool she made the decision to

team up with the moms (yes, not parents) of other children and start a preschool co-op. When her

children went to elementary school she volunteered in their classroom, then became a full-time teacher's assistant, then went back to graduate school to complete her masters and teaching certificate. So, for Terry, being a mother and being a teacher have a clear connection. "Well if you're a mother you're a teacher, you know?"

Terry brings her role as a parent into the classroom as she cares for her students. She reflects on how her son was the same age as her students when she began teaching and that gave her a greater understanding of the needs of the students in her classroom:

> I started teaching when my son was probably thirteen. I mean full time as a teacher not a teacher's assistant. So, he was thirteen my daughter must have been fifteen. Thirteen was about the age I was teaching, which was kind of cool. And my daughter was a little bit older. So I like had a bit of, you know I think that's valuable experience, you know, having children the age you are teaching. I think you have more compassion, you know, for the fact that they're not…we expect so much from them at that age, like already to be grown up and know all of the skills of studying and writing and, you know, behaving (laughing). Um, and you, I mean, I've read a lot of books on psychology and development and all that so, you know that it's a huge growing time, emotionally, physically, at that age, but I think, I mean knowing that my son could go to sleep and grow an inch, you know, and wake up the next day kind of thing and be in pain from it and tired and things like that helped me understand maybe where some of the kids were coming from that came into school.

While it was easy for Terry to connect being a mother with being a teacher, she did not discuss how her prior career as a dental hygienist influenced her as a teacher nearly as much. She noted that the skills and knowledge are different—her training was so much more specific, having taken two classes specifically focused on head and neck anatomy that would not translate well into her day-to-day teaching. She did note, however, that she was educating her patients.

> The skills obviously are very different and the knowledge of you know anatomy versus a broad knowledge of science. [But] as a dental hygienist you are educating your patient. You know you're trying to get them to realize that if they do certain things their life will be better (laughing) No, their teeth or hygiene or how they feel, orally, will be better. So, I guess, in that respect like you try to teach the kids that if they do certain things their life will be easier, you know?

126

But more than that, Terry was able to draw in her experience from working as a dental hygienist to demonstrate care for her students. She would notice when kids got their braces off and congratulate them or talk with them about the experience reminding them to keep up with routines of good hygiene and maintenance of their expensive smiles.

> So, it's something I notice, I notice teeth obviously. I lived it for a long time. (laughing). I think there are similar characteristics for both for me for hygiene and teaching. So, you have to be caring, right, you have to care about your patient and your students. You have to be prepared to do your work, right, you're trained to be a hygienist and to be a teacher. You have to understand the psychology of you know people's emotions that are there in both situations.

In sharing this Terry was revealing her ability to care for students and make connections with them based on what she knows much more than how her previous career as a dental hygienist makes her a valuable science teacher. Her skills and knowledge are too technical and do not translate to the classroom. As she mentions her work as a hygienist and how it relates to the classroom it seems forced, and she continues on to discuss how the students gain emotional support from guidance counselors at the school.

The guidance counselors are leading a teacher professional development series right now helping teachers to understand the heightened anxiety that impacts students' lives and learning. They are reading books and helping one another develop deeper understandings of what home life is like for some students. The variety of situations presented in the readings and workshops are giving Terry a new perspective. "You don't realize how many kids are traumatized at their home, just things that they go through that you just couldn't imagine. Anxiety [is] very huge."

Terry has always been a very involved mother. Though she always worked, even when her kids were little, she was involved in their education and eventually became a teacher owing to those experiences. Her own experience as a parent—playing a specific role within a particular family culture—constrained her understanding of other cultures. As she comes to terms with this

she reflects on the experience of her students and the way she was brought up, contrasting the

over-involved parents of today with her own uninvolved parents.

> I still think about you know what's happening in [my students] lives and, you know, at home and…and they're so smart. Some of them are so smart and so talented and, and so busy. And we're kind of this society where they're over-scheduled. [Parents now are] too good. Too involved. I mean I just I just got an email from a mom that has emailed me several times because any time there's a grade that she doesn't like she emails me, and I just want to be like, it doesn't matter. It's like five points. (laughing) Leave them alone. You know. But you can't do that, you know? When I grew up my parents didn't, I mean there wasn't any computer that gave you the grade immediately or on your phone or whatever. Um, seriously, they couldn't be involved, and I think we were better off, you know? To a degree.

Teachers are organized and caring. Terry draws on her role as a mother as she

represents herself as a caring teacher. But, throughout our interactions together Terry has

presented herself as very organized. She is on time for each of our appointments and responds to

my questions in an organized way—not taking a meandering path through telling her story that

others might present. She has highlighted her belief that good teachers are organized through

giving privileged positions to "neat" and "organized" teachers she had observed during student

teaching, and she aligns herself with such teachers as she describes her practicum experience:

"The woman that I student taught with was amazing: kind, very organized, like, we both kind of

were overachievers in making sure everything's prepared ahead of time."

When Terry talks about her own teaching style, she again elevates the idea that teachers

ought to be organized, giving herself a historic voice in making this argument.

> I always said that if you are organized as a teacher, management is fairly easy. So, as long as you keep them, keep your lesson moving…usually as long as you don't have somebody who's completely disruptive. But so, so that's tough so. Classroom management is organization I think, but then it's relationships. So if they like you they're going to behave for you, I think. Right? So, every child needs something different maybe,

but, yeah. That's why I try to have fun in class. You know, I try to remember, when I want to get through that curriculum, you know, that if I can get through it in a different way that they are more engaged then it's gonna be more fun for all of us.

The balance of organization and having fun is challenging for Terry at times. When she experiences challenges in the classroom management she notes that she has to be patient and caring and not lose control. Ultimately, being patient and caring in these instances is a way to regain control of the organized classroom.

> There are times when, like last year we had about thirty, forty kids who were ADD, totally, like off the wall ADD. It seems like every other year we have like different classes. And they're sometimes just the group of kids feed off of each other. You want to have fun with them, but you can't because then you can't get them to learn. So that's, that's frustrating. And then you have to be the most patient, caring, you know you can never lose it, you know, because that's not cool. So, you really have to always be in control of who you are, and they can't see that they're getting to you or whatever, so…that's difficult.

This tension is evident in the way Terry represents herself as a teacher. She wants students to like her so that they behave because if they behave they can get through the curriculum. But this is not a fair presentation of Terry. This is Terry talking about herself and presenting how she sees herself as a teacher. When Terry shares about an interaction she has with a student it becomes much clearer that Terry wants her classroom to be organized places of learning. She cares deeply for her students, she just has not yet found a way to find a way to balance organization and care in real time.

> I have this one student who…so, last week, two weeks ago, she got kind of snippy at me because I was using whiteboards and she wasn't writing something down and I was just watching to see if she would do it and she's like "I don't, like, I don't know." And in science there's a lot of vocab so it's kind of like a foreign language. And she doesn't have self confidence in her ability to do science and she just was like "It's not my fault! I can't do science!" And she yelled this out in class, right? She's in my homeroom, so the next day I said, "I know that you're good, you can do science because this is the third trimester and you've been doing just fine." Today she [got a] ninety-six on the test and it was, and it was the best grades she's gotten all year. And she's like, she had to come up to me and tell me that she got the ninety-six, and she told me like after all the other kids left she came up to me she's like, I got a ninety-six it's the best grade I ever got. And I'm like, see

you can do science, you know. So that's why you like, that's why I like teaching. The relationship.

Terry had expressed her inability to balance organization and care in real time in one sentence: "Classroom management is organization I think, but then it's relationships?" Terry is working on this, with the help of a student teacher, as they work together to get through the curriculum in an engaging way.

Teachers are organized and caring and engaging. Terry finds teaching science exciting. She learns about and tries new methods on a regular basis and notes that she changes her teaching style each year.

> Methodology changes daily though, right? ... My goal is to always mix it up. Science I think is the best subject to teach because you can give a little lecture, show a little YouTube video, do a little activity, all in the same class period. I try to get them up and moving. I try to get them talking every single day. Thinking, you know. I guess I learned it, you know, at [graduate] school. And then like the little things, Laura Rutherford's books. You know, like, instructions and different methods of instruction. She has a lot of fun ways to teach.

She is energized as she says this, sharing with me about her teaching. At that point we are two educators in the room. I ask how she is able to share her passion for teaching science with colleagues, and she tells me about how she just had her first student teacher in the classroom.

> It was fabulous (laughing). I mean it probably isn't always a great experience, but it was such a great experience having her in my class. She was funny. She made the classroom light. She was young, like, so she's a first-career teacher, so she was, she actually went to the school that I teach at. Teachers would come to visit her in my classroom more than they came to visit me (laughing). I've actually built stronger relationships with those people because she was there. But she had such a fun-loving attitude. And the kids absolutely loved her and related to her because she was basically like basically like a little older than them, you know, and she joked around a lot, and I know she's going to have classroom management problems because (laughing) this class that I have is the best behaved hundred and five students I've ever had. And I told her that I said, "You know not every bunch of kids are going to be able to fool around with you and then come back and be able to have you teach them." So she's actually long-term teaching at the school, and she's like "The kids aren't always nice to me." So, she's learning though. She's learning.

The interactional positioning of the student teacher is helpful for understanding Terry as a teacher. If confirms the way Terry prioritized organization in her classroom. She calls it out very specifically in reflecting on what she realized from teaching alongside this student teacher "She just made me just remember that these are kids…. [they] have to go to school. They are a captive audience, so you might as well try to have a little fun with them. To just try to have fun every day."

And during the time the student teacher was working in her classroom, Terry tried out a new teaching method. It was called Whole Brain Teaching and engages in the type of kinesthetic learning that she had observed years ago and that had been outlined in the books she mentioned, by Laura Rutherford.

> Right from the beginning of the year I have [the students] doing actions and singing songs and, you know, making acronyms for things and rhymes or whatever. So, when [the student teacher] came in these are the ways I was teaching so she's learning like getting the kids up and whole body teaching you know was good. So, she had a lot of energy so that worked out really well. The way that we bounced off of each other I guess, and I kept her a little lower and she helped bring me up.

It seemed as though Terry thought this teaching methodology might be a really good fit for the student teacher, but I wondered if Terry had been able to teach her something about organization as well. This seemed like it would have been such a loss and seemed like a way Terry might have showed care for the student teacher who had been working alongside her.

Michael:	So one thing one thing she would take from that experience is the whole brain or is something else?
Terry:	No, she said that the thing she learned or will carry through her teaching is my, I call it my "do now" but it's, uh, my daily PowerPoint. So, my daily PowerPoint starts off with the "do now". So, homework and a question that they need to contemplate, so they come right in and talk to your neighbor, you know, and see if you can answer this question. Sometimes you write it down in your science notebook or whatever. Um, and then the next slide was the forecast of the day what you're going to do, hopefully get through that day. But on the forecast, I

would attach any Power Point and YouTube videos, any papers that kids needed, like so, it all becomes kind of like your daily plan. So you can look next, next year, you know, how did I do, you know, my genetics unit and you have your all of your PowerPoints with all of your papers and Power Points and everything attached to it, so everything is there. This is my organization right, so she said that's the best thing for her, you know.

Michael: That's sort of what I was hoping you were going to say. As someone who…like you said, you got that from your cooperating teacher and just said 'organization is great classroom management'. So that's the bell that went off for me was, did you make sure you passed on to her that organization is the backbone of classroom management?

Terry is trying to find a balance in her teaching, working to become a teacher who is competent and caring, organized and engaging. Her experience of having another teacher in the room was certainly a growing experience for her as she was able to reflect on who she is as a teacher regularly. She realized the value of another teacher in the room to help her become herself: "It would be great to have a co-teacher, you know?" Indeed. As Vygotsky says, "Through others we become ourselves".

Science and Faith

There is a part of Terry that is intentionally subordinated in her role as a teacher: her faith. Terry is a Christian woman. She talks about being involved in her church during our first interview. She brings it up again during our third interview, and I encourage her to talk about it.

Terry: I told you I was in a bible study with a group of teachers, right? ... We're all teachers. Because we support each other and pray for each other's kids and things like that, so.

Michael: Has that, do you feel like that's been helpful to you as a teacher? In what ways has it been helpful to you?

Terry: Yeah. Well, because like they tell me different things that they do, like to try to pray for their…like when they pray for the kids like they either walk among the desks or pray on the way to work in the car, you know. To hear how it really does affect their attitude which affects the kids' response to

them. You know, I do some of the things that they do, and when you don't pray that morning you know you have, you seem to have more turmoil, you know?

Michael: So, how does it affect your attitude, praying before school or whenever it is that you are in the habit of doing that? How does it affect your attitude and how does it affect what goes on in the classroom?

Terry: Yeah. I guess if you're praying for someone then you care about them and you just, you know, you're always trying to do your best for them and help them and, you know, you're not looking at the bad as much. You're trying to lift them up.

But, Terry says she does not feel she is able to outwardly express her faith at school "because I'm in a public school, I guess". She notes that she has a "bible verse a day" calendar on her desk, but kids would need to come behind her desk to see it. She also says she will engage in conversations about faith with her students if they mentioned that they went to Christian camp, and that at least one of her students has gone to church with her: "…so that's cool. They know that I'm there. They see me at church too, you know."

While she does not feel that she can outwardly express her faith at school, her faith provides a lens through which she sees science, the subject she teaches in school.

Um, I just think all of science is amazing (laughing) you know and how can it be, you know, all of it, from a radio wave to a satellite being out I mean it's stuff I don't understand. It's gotta be from someone higher intellect, (laughing) of a higher intellect than myself, you know. Because we keep learning more and more too, about the world. …Where'd the first cell come from? And people are trying to figure it out. I think it proves [the existence of God] (laughing).

She also remarks that her faith does impact her teaching and how she teaches certain topics. And as I listened to her I became uncomfortable realizing that she had another tension to work through in her life—balancing the values of two cultures where she held important identities. As she spoke I wondered how she made sense of the tension. I realized that it might have been the

best decision to subordinate her Christian identity as sometimes this is the most reasonable resolution of identity conflict in the public sphere.

> I just took a class on evolution which was very interesting, and it was completely anti, you know, religion at all. Which is fine, um, but [my faith] does affect how I teach certain things I guess. I wouldn't say we, you know, evolved from monkey's maybe but if a kid brought it up I'd say our DNA has been shown that it has about 98%, something like that, but same with a mouse I guess (laughing). Like a lot of mammals share like, genome, you know? I believe in evolution that we've changed over time and the earth has changed over time and all that I mean so, I still think God is involved day to day with it all. So one of the [other] things I teach is cell theory. They still haven't proven where the first cell came from and the kids bring that up sometimes and I'm like, well, we'll have to keep thinking about that and, you know? It's not like it just happened. It doesn't, I mean, it doesn't affect my faith as much as just trying to walk the path of…I don't want to, um, I don't want to degrade my faith or belittle it. Like I don't want to ever have to say anything against my faith at school.

I was uncomfortable because I am not an authority on science and faith and I do know it is a polarized debate in both Christian and scientific communities. It seemed that Terry was doing her best to find a balance between her faith and her teaching obligations. Terry must have understood my discomfort or the question that I felt I just couldn't push at. She recalled an experience she had had when a friend asked her how she deals with her faith in her teaching.

> [A Christian friend] asked me, like, how I would teach these students to deal with their faith in the science content, you know because she brought up evolution, and I didn't have a very really good answer for her either. So, she said, "Research it." So I did. I read a lot of things but it's not going to change the way that I'm teaching. [I mean, in science it's about] evidence. I know that's what I'm teaching my seventh graders. Like you can't just have a feeling or hear somebody else say something and then take that as your own, you know, where's the evidence. You know, so, scientists need evidence, and then you can form your reasoning afterwards.

Terry had just shared a major conflict between her spiritual and her professional selves, and she had revealed that she held both sets of values in a state of perpetual tension or of a heterarchical [non]ordering (Minsky, 1985; Hodges and Baron, 1992). Bert Hodges and Reuben Baron (1992) note, values operate as sociocultural tools and, as such, offer affordances and constraints. The overlapping of two values held in high-esteem will provide

mutual affordances, or a safe path of travel as Hodges notes in his preferred automotive metaphor (personal communication, 2017), but will also necessitate the acknowledgement of areas that constrain activity. Terry had found the resolution to these highly-esteemed values of science and faith by subordinating one position. An alternate resolution may have been to teach science in a Christian school. Maybe that did not occur to Terry. Maybe it did not appeal to her. Or maybe the Christian schools were not looking for science teachers.

INTERLUDE

MOTHER AND TEACHER AND CHRISTIAN?

Unlike the two male participants in this study, Terry's story follows a more linear progression. She goes into her first career by following a career path she had begun as an after-school job in high school. She positions a male boss as the one who leads her into this profession—one who she found caring and fun to be around—so decided to go to college for dental hygiene. She credits this vocational path to her environment—her father was a working-class laborer and her sisters had gone on to get associates degrees and technical training in specific fields. Terry went to college to get the skills required to move up in her company—to achieve professional status as a hygienist. And she did just that, eventually staying at the same dentist's office for twenty-eight years. She got married straight out of college at age twenty-one, got involved in her church and in building her life with her husband—a cultural narrative not unfamiliar to me as a faculty member at a Christian college. After five years she and her husband welcomed their first child into the world, and two years later a second. These changes in activity set up her transition into a life that included teaching, which she says is bound to her status as a mother stating, "If you are a mother, you are a teacher."

The intersection of roles of mother and teacher has been documented and problematized in explorations of the feminization of teaching (see, e.g. Grumet, 1988). Grumet (1998) discusses the historical position of school teaching as women's work and draws in the voices of women who celebrate this role as an extension of mothering—a selected quote from Catharine Beecher seems to amplify Terry's understanding of this intersection: "The great purpose in a woman's life—the happy superintendence of the family—is accomplished all the better and easier by preliminary teaching in school. All the power she may develop here [at home] will come in use

there [in the school]" (in Grumet, 1988 p. 37). While this position extends beyond the connection Terry was making, it does speak to the cultural understanding of women in teaching—an understanding that surely is not lost on Terry. Terry had chosen to leave her first career—adjusting her hours to part-time work as a dental hygienist—and took up teaching as an extension of her activities as a mother.

Obvious qualitative changes in her life as she became a mother as well as a rebalancing of value propositions she placed on her various activities allowed new opportunities in her life (Wertsch, 1991; Hodges and Baron, 1992). Her work schedule changed because she wanted to be around her kids more and she found empowerment through starting a pre-school co-op with other friends who were all "smart, educated women." Terry followed her kids by volunteering in the schools because she found she liked teaching, but on her own she did not think of it as a potential career path. She continually positions others as those who "push" or "pull" her in new directions. This, too, fits a narrative not merely of women teachers but of females in a patriarchal society. While much has been done in the United States in the past one-hundred and fifty years to move beyond the patriarchy that was present in the time of Catharine Beecher—a 19th century contemporary of Horace Mann—the argument can easily be made that the status of Christian females lags behind. Denominations are the exception to the rule that allow females as lead pastors, and though many churches do support women in leadership roles the roles are often confined to the leading of ministry for other women or for children echoing the Beecher's celebrated status from a bygone era. While it is important to consider the situation of Terry's narrative within her Christian cultural context, it is equally important to note that women's work nationwide is still valued less than men as evidenced by unequal pay in all industries, including teaching.

The feminization of teaching is a lens through which to look at Terry's explanation of her teaching practice as well. Terry desires to be a teacher who is competent and confident—noting that one of her favorite teachers was so "brilliant" that he did not even need to refer to notes. This male teacher was fitting a male type—those who go off script rather than those who, like Terry, are more subservient to the "business of teaching" (Davis, 2015). As Ian Davis (2015) notes, our cultural tropes of female teachers give us images of women who care for their students by imposing order to the classroom and to the curriculum—like the character of Erin Grewell in *Freedom Writers*—often bringing creative methods to engage students in learning. Even examples of "wacky" teachers like Ms. Frizzle from the children's book series *The Magic School Bus* and Jessica Day from the television show *New Girl* are champions for the straight and narrow curriculum. In contrast tropes of male teachers depict subversive agents and anti-modern rebels—like John Keating in *Dead Poets Society (*notes Davis, 2015*)*, Dan Dunne in *Half Nelson* and even Dewey Finn in *School of Rock* and Frank McCourt in his memoir *Teacher Man.* Terry's story positions her as one who is following a straight and narrow path—the gendered curriculum.

Female teachers are expected to be kind, agreeable, open, and courteous (Grumet, 1988; Ebert, Steffens, & Kroth, 2014). Grumet (1988) further problematizes this as a denial of female selfhood endemic to a paternalistic culture—for persistent example, the female teacher is to exercise self-control and order over the classroom, denying her emotions. Terry seems to accept these characterizations and to celebrate them as aspects of her teacher self, modeling herself after role images of teachers who are organized and caring. In her classroom, Terry draws most of her teaching methods from those she has seen modeled by others either through classroom observations she completed in her teacher-preparation program and practicum experience or

books that she reads on science teaching methods. She prides herself on her organization—specifically noting the agenda constructed on her daily PowerPoints—and leads with her care for students. In truth, an organized and safe environment for learning at the hands of a caring adult should not be considered inherently bad. It is the conscription of women into such a socially restrictive role that is under question for female teachers in general and by extension Terry, specifically.

As Terry continues to pursue a career in teaching she incorporates aspects of teaching into her daily practice and takes on an identification as a teacher. Teaching is a new activity for Terry—an activity that early on she balanced with a career as a dental hygienist. She remarks that the professional knowledge was too specific and could not be incorporated into the classroom, and she struggled to articulate ways in which she drew upon the activity from her previous career, echoing the reflections from former participants and from broader sociocultural theory—sometimes cultural tools simply cannot be incorporated into new cultural activity as the activity is not similar enough (Vadeboncoeur et al, 2011). Without being able to rely on professional and their transfer to the classroom, as the literature on second-career teachers suggests, Terry draws on her identity as a mother and maintains her position as a dental hygienist only after two years of full-time teaching—a time at which Terry felt confident that she did not need a fall back plan and that she was, in fact, a good enough teacher (Salvio, 2007).

CHAPTER 5

DISCUSSION

Revisiting the Research Questions

The main research question "How does an individual become a second-career teacher?" was approached not simply in looking at the socialization process in teacher education programs but beyond that crucial point in a teacher's development, both into the teachers' past personal and professional life history and into their first few years of teaching. To situate this study within the broader literature on second-career teachers and to organize the stories around key transformational points, specific points in time or developmental processes have been the focal point of analysis. I drew on questions from the literature on second-career teachers suggesting a need to better understand the motivations for becoming teachers and on the framework provided by Roth (2015) and Jóhannsdóttir and Roth (2014) in their studies of the becomings of second-career teachers. The research questions were phrased within the three timescapes: coming to teaching, becoming a teacher, and becoming as a teacher and discussion of findings will be pursued within that framework presented in sections titled 1) motivations, 2) teaching activity, 3) identity. A fourth section will discuss the ways teachers make meaning of their experience more broadly. *How does prior and concurrent experience impact their motivations for becoming a second-career teacher, their activity as teachers, and their understanding of themselves within multi-group memberships?*

Motivations

What factors influence the decision to become second career teachers?

The literature on second-career teachers has found a variety of factors that influence the decision to become a second-career teacher. A pursuit of work-life balance or value to family life

are the most commonly cited reasons for changing careers (Crow, Levin, & Nager, 1990; Freidus, 1989; Young, 1995; Anthony and Ord, 2009; Lee, 2011; Morettini, 2014) followed by the pursuit of a more stable career (Olsen, 2008; Richardson & Watt, 2005). The literature has also found career-changers who want to "give back" or engage in more meaningful work (Backes & Burns, 2008; Castro & Bauml, 2009; Williams & Forgasz, 2009) though this is less commonly found as the main reason for becoming a second-career teacher than it is among first-career teachers (Lortie, 1975; Olsen, 2008) or within reports that seek to recruit career-changers into the rolls of teacher education programs (e.g. Woodrow Wilson Fellowship Foundation, 2010).

In his study of six young female teacher candidates, Brad Olsen (2008) took view of the "web" of motivations leading to a first-career as a teacher by employing a dynamic and holistic view of teacher identity construction. These first-career teachers had often long envisioned themselves as teachers, "playing teacher" in their youth, having close family members who were teachers, and seeing teaching as a compatible lifestyle for their future desire to be mothers. The participants self-identified as having the requisite (in their estimation) skills for teaching such as giving explanations or advice or being keen storytellers. And, all six of the participants said they had been strong students with strong reading and writing skills, that they had a desire to work with young people, and that they wanted to make a difference in the world. Olsen notes that Dan Lortie (1975) and Francis Fuller and Oliver Brown (1975) had found similar themes among teacher candidates in their studies.

For each of the participants, the constellation of reasons noted previously in the literature drove their career change. The reasons were interwoven and were revealed to participants over time just as participants revealed the web of reasons to me through the course of their interviews.

They each revealed different constellations of reasons for entering teaching that were revealed through the course of interviews. Each of the participants had experience in teaching at earlier points in their lives and had thought they might one day become teachers. Their "homecoming" (Crow et al, 1990) to teaching was, in each case, quite different from their once imagined futures.

Though I am sure it will disappoint admissions officers at teacher education programs across the country, my participants did not note a desire to "give back" as a key motivator in their career change. Life events drove them to seek new careers. Each of the participants had families, and their desire to find work-life balance drove them to teach. Still, the motivation and the transition of each participant was unique. Josh was ready for a change, a move from the hectic 60-hour weeks, the always on lifestyle. He was ready to reduce his stress even if it meant a reduction in pay. Teaching, for Josh, was a way to work at something that used his skills and interests and talents rather than the technical skill that he had been guided into by his insistent father. For Josh teaching was a tradeoff. Nothing is all good; nothing is all bad. It is an Eastern philosophy and a way to pursue happiness.

Terry transitioned to teaching over the course of a decade, gradually moving from volunteer positions in her children's schools to paid work as a teaching assistant to student teaching positions in her teacher preparation program and long-term substitute positions, one of which finally became a full-time teaching position. She finally gave up work in her first career when she entered her "tenure year"—third year—of teaching.

When he and his wife found out they were pregnant, Raphel left his first career as a musician and an entertainer for the wrong career in banking. He became depressed, missing his passion for music, and he took to the social script provided by his father—becoming a second-career teacher to pursue life of passionate work and a good lifestyle for his family.

Teaching Activity

How does their prior and concurrent experience shape the way they teach—how they present themselves as teachers during the activity of teaching?

The literature on second-career teachers has largely focused on the constraints of culture upon individual identity. This is owing to the focus on a singular identification and a difficulty in understanding and acknowledging a phenomenon of multi-membership. Being socialized in multiple cultures, having an identification with them and having interiorized the norms and values of the group causes conflict. We are constrained by the expectations of the culture, but we also have a broader set of norms and values and tools to draw upon.

Though I had expected to find that all second-career teachers in this study would present complex incorporations born of multi-group membership, Terry seemed to present a less dynamic self. Her technical knowledge from the professional field was too technical, as had been found previously in the literature (Glenn, 2003; Denizman and Watters, 2015). Furthermore, the subordination of her outward presentation as a Christian surprised me. Terry explained this well and simply. She felt that her Christian faith was not welcome in the public school and so she did not wear it on her sleeve. There are conflicts between her profession—teaching life science—and her Christian faith. She discusses how her faith impacts her teaching, making decisions about how to teach things giving privilege to her faith and not wanting to make her God look bad, which she may do if she teaches evolution, for example. Her faith, however, was a part of her daily life as a teacher—praying for her students and teaching her curriculum and even being excited about science as evidence of God's existence. It may be that my hopes for overt incorporations of cultural activity into the practice of teaching have clouded my impression and that these actions do serve as evidence of Terry's multi-membership. Terry is finding a way to

make the tools of her Christian culture fit within an environment that is less welcoming to her faith—and, importantly for Terry's story, she is doing it with the support of others who can push her to try new things.

Josh does model himself clearly as one who is able to draw on multiple relevance structures. He has technical knowledge from the field of engineering, from Taekwondo, and from skydiving, none of which translates directly in the field. But Josh articulates how each of these activities becomes part of his teaching. He creates a safety culture in the classroom drawing on experience in industry and in skydiving, creates repertoires for getting "in the zone" that he draws from Taekwondo and his training as a mechanical engineer, and he draws on his various experiences to relate to different types of students he teaches in his classes. Throughout his story he represents himself as the type of person who has been engaged in many groups playing many roles over the course of his life. He positions others in his interactions as those that he is drawing wisdom from in order to build a complex set of multi-cultured knowledge.

Raphel incorporate aspects of his multifaceted self in working with students in the classroom and around campus. He shares with them stories of his own academic struggles and the challenges brought on by his own ADHD, allowing him to relate with his students on a personal level. And, while Terry and Josh's technical knowledge was too technical, Raphel is a music teacher and can draw on his knowledge of music and performance to develop a passion for the arts in his students. What I found most interesting was Raphel's ability to draw on his knowledge of music to help students improve their English language abilities. He goes off script, putting aside what he had learned in his graduate school classes in teacher education and instead brings in a metronome to help his student improve her reading fluency. While I will not present this as a potential direction for future research in a subsequent section of this paper, this type of

non-trained thinking demonstrates a clear benefit of second-career teachers' non-traditional experience.

Again, second-career teachers are not a monolithic group. They have different experiences and are at different life stages, and they also are more and less able to draw those experiences into the classroom. If there is value in the experiences that second-career teachers have—and I think that there is—we should help second-career teachers understand how their experiences may fit in the classroom. Working to co-construct teachers' narratives may be a way to help teachers draw on relevance structures born of prior cultural activity. In turn, this may help more of the students in their classrooms to learn from a broader network of accessible connections.

Identity and reconciliation of multi-membership

How does becoming a teacher shape how career-changers make sense of their lives—their identity—both at the present moment "as teachers" and across their life story?

Seeking to understand who one is becoming as a teacher provides a narrow view of the individual *as* a teacher, a singular identification, rather than as one who leads a life that includes teaching. As such, becoming a second-career teacher is not simply the act of beginning to teach but a qualitative change in the cultures—and cultural activities—in which one engages (Roth, 2009). There is not a singular "shift" in culture or activity entirely. The individual's full life continues, complete with the commitments to cultures that are ever present—both the current cultures of family and friends and social groups, and the cultures of one's prior experience drawn into the present through active rememberings (Weldon, 2001).

As life continues and new understandings of self emerge, career-changers becoming teachers work to incorporate parts of their lives into the practice of teaching and allow teaching

to change their worlds. Balance is found between social groups and family and work by Josh and Raphel, an achievement that they sought in changing careers to become teachers. New lifestyles and ways of seeing themselves emerge, whether giving a new type of purpose and satisfaction to their lives as Terry finds in helping students through their daily lives and Raphel and Josh find in particular through their work with students who struggle academically. Each of the participants in this study saw themselves as teachers of students, not of a specific content, pointing to an appreciation of the complex work that teachers do, or the complex renderings of selfhood that make for the most meaningful and lasting images for our students.

As we seek to understand who these second-career teachers are becoming as teachers, we can look to the metaphors they use to make sense of their experience. Metaphors have been used to explore teacher's conceptions of themselves and their understanding of the activity of teaching. Metaphors can give coherence and meaning to experience (Lakoff and Johnson, 1980; Bullough, Knowles, and Crow, 1992). Robert Bullough, Gary Knowles, and Nedra Crow (1992) find in their study of six student teachers that metaphors change over time, becoming refined as student teachers take on more responsibility in the classroom. In their study, teaching metaphors that emerge are that of a coach, a haven-maker or rescuer, a buddy, a nurturer, a caring adult, a public servant, and a subject matter expert. Additionally, Robert Bullough (1991) reports the metaphors of three other teachers: devil's advocate, husbandman, and chameleon demonstrating the complexity and creativity individuals use in creating metaphors for their teaching. I like to use a museum metaphor to describe the various activities of a teacher—the teacher as a curator of content most often and creator to fill in a collection. The teacher as docent walking museum-goers through the exhibits, providing learned expertise and insights and answering questions.

And, let's face it, the teacher as security guard—keeping the visitors from acting in a way that is not befitting of an institution of high art.

The metaphors employed by my participants are not dissimilar to those employed by the student teachers in Bullough, Knowles, and Crow's study. Not dissimilar and yet entirely different. They described teachers they had observed in their teacher education programs or who had taught them in school as competent, organized, and caring (Terry); as inspiring personalities and expert instructors (Josh); as mentors and learning guides (Raphel). In expressing an understanding of themselves as teachers, my participants often move beyond the understandings they had before they began teaching and express more complex metaphors that relate back to their own lives. Bullough, Knowles, and Crow note the constraints presented by any culture that make it difficult for the individual to resolve conflicts and construct a cohesive self-understanding. They cite Madeline Grumet (1987) in admitting that no metaphor is perfect: "A metaphor for educational experience will illuminate some aspects of educational practice and leave others in the shadows" (p.80, cited in Bullough, Knowles, and Crow, 1991, p.9)

As a teacher, Terry is organized and competent and caring—yet her metaphor is much richer, "If you're a mother you're a teacher, you know?". This way of seeing herself as relevant to the work of teaching because she is a mother demonstrates her love for her work. Teaching and mothering for Terry are not merely jobs, they are passions. She draws heavily on her knowledge of children from having raised two of her own—an activity that any parent knows is a baptism by fire an apt description for which is simply, as my father is fond of saying, "the work will teach us how to do it." Terry notes that she read books about child development, that she and other "smart, educated women" started a preschool co-op for their kids. She was, and is, a very involved mother. Her own daughter is attending a state school studying biology and business—

the fields in which her parents work. Her son finished high school and continued working for a tradesman he had shadowed finding that he liked the work so much he might as well stay on. Sounds familiar.

Through many of his activities Josh has shown himself to be an expert organizer and instructor. He has experience in making complex information clear for his customers as well as his fellow skydivers. He instructs new Taekwondo practitioners in the skills and attitudes they need to achieve their personal best. While he draws this into the classroom organizing his instruction and creating a safety culture for his students, Josh always finds that he likes the balance of the technical and the social and provides an understanding of himself as a teacher as a "ZENgineer". He explores the connection between Eastern Philosophy and engineering in our first interview and brings the theme back again and again noting "Nothing is all good; nothing is all bad." In creating a meditative space for his students and a safety culture in his classroom, he mitigates the threats of the environment so that he can encourage students to achieve their personal best at their own pace. Josh's pursuit of balance in teaching is pervasive: his motivations for becoming a teacher, his practice in the classroom, and his understanding of himself.

Raphel is an accomplished musician and athlete, an entertainer and a coach, a husband and a son. Raphel's metaphor for teaching is as a guide or mentor. He wants to inspire his students and to help them find their own path to musical excellence and passion, and he patiently guides them, finding teaching methods that work for each student. But his desire to find what works for each student goes beyond the classroom and the music lessons. Raphel shares with his students that he struggled academically and socially. He shares with them the way he found an outlet to music—a passion that he found the same year he was diagnosed with ADHD. He

struggled in school but discovered that if he could relate his learning to music he could focus on it and use his passion to drive deeper learning. He still did so in graduate school and still does so in discovering new ways to drive students' learning. This knowledge of himself is what Raphel uses to counsel and encourage his students—and to wonder at how to reach each of them. This is who Raphel wanted to become as a teacher—a more capable other who speaks from a space just beyond the experience of his students to draw them toward greater capabilities of their own and greater understanding of themselves and who they are becoming.

Limitations of the Study

A qualitative methodology is the best suited to generate rich descriptions and nuanced understanding of the lived experiences of individuals (Schram, 2006; Creswell, 2007). The focus on a small number of participants and data collection through in-depth interviews no doubt leads some to question the value of a study that has no "generalizable" results. Stories are not meant to be generalizable data but to engender a sense of understanding of individual experience. These anecdotes are not meant to speak for a population but rather to give voice to those who have experience worth sharing and whose experience may serve as an encouragement to others contemplating their own transition to a second-career in teaching.

The current study presents three cases not in pursuit of generalizable themes but rather to demonstrate that teachers' storied lives impact them as teachers and as persons. The way that they make sense of their experience, subordinating and incorporating previous and concurrent roles and role images, acting as engaged or distant members of the community of learning, and becoming through enacting themselves within the activity of teaching are all unique. As the audience during the data collection process and the other during data analysis, this study is a highly interpretive work. The participants would have told different stories where they speaking

to someone else. As Raphel notes during our conversation, he tells a lot of stories about his experiences but "they are kind of disjointed". He does not tell them all to the same person at the same time. The study that I have conducted is therefore limited by its utter lack of replicability: these stories will not be told again because a different audience will bring out a unique telling with different voices and intentionality.

Implications for Second-Career Teacher Education

As I have tried to position myself as a learner throughout this study, I will consider implications for teacher education and professional development programs by asking what teacher education can learn from these three case studies of second-career teachers. The story told by each of these second-career teachers is different, and again different from the literature on second-career teachers. I make three recommendations for teacher education professionals to consider: 1) that we work with teachers to see themselves as individuals with experience, not merely expertise; 2) that we continue to consider ways of embedding teacher education within the work of teaching following Dewey's demands for education as life itself not preparation for living; and 3) that we make professional development the authentic pursuit of lifelong learning rather than a bureaucratic mandate. To restyle Bruner's (1966) position in the styling of Alexander Pope[1], to *learn* is human.

Experience, not mere expertise. While administrators may desire to have teachers with more experience in the classroom, the department meeting, and the student-parent meetings, students do not share this view. Students tend to like younger teachers more and report finding it easier to develop rapport with youthful teachers (Danziger & Welfel, 2000; Wilson, Beyer, and Monteiro, 2014). Having become a teacher myself at age 22, I understood these benefits

---

[1] Pope's phrase "to err is human…" comes from his work *An Essay on Criticism*.

intimately. The cultural references were not too far off, as my high school students were often only 4 or 5 years younger than I was. They had watched some of the same movies, and, being that I was working at a boarding school, on occasion we would watch television together or go out to movies while I was completing residential life duties on evenings and weekends.

Josh, however, is not 22—he is in his mid-forties. His own tweenaged children are much closer in age to his students than he is by a long shot. The cultural references from his high school years come from before his students were born. And, he is not working at a boarding school. But, Josh does note that his multi-faceted experience throughout his youth affords him the opportunity to relate with a broad spectrum of students. Terry notes that she was able to understand her students better because she her own children were about the same age as her students when she finally landed her full-time teaching job. She seems a champion for making these connections and recounts conversations at the lunch table with other teachers who remind one another that "they are still kids" by sharing stories of their own children coming home to "play with action figures." And, more importantly, Terry realized through mentoring a young teacher that she, too, could have more fun in the classroom—she is developing new understandings of herself as a teacher through the role images presented by her younger peers.

Rather than considering our second-career teachers as those who have value because of their industry experience, we can value their experience and their contributions to the school. Teacher education programs may work to help teacher candidates understand the value of their experiences—as former students and as parents, as siblings and as caregivers, as people not merely professionals—and asking how they might bring their wealth of experience into the classroom. And this need not only be a self-reflection pursued with second-career teachers. All teachers are more than their professional desires and have a variety of experiences that will shape

who they are in the classroom. We must allow them to become themselves through the sharing of their story as they begin their path to teaching and continue sharing their story of growth and learning as they gain experience in the classroom.

Learning is doing. Among first career teachers, pre-service education programs play a large role in the construction of a teacher self, an understanding of what it means to teach, and a framework of activity for teaching such as classroom management, pedagogy, and being part of a union (Zeichner and Gore, 1990). Through much of the second-career teachers literature, pre-service education programs are also thought to play a large role in the construction of teacher efficacy—though we should be suspicious of such findings given that most of the research on second-career teachers is conducted within teacher education programs by the faculty within those programs. For my participants, their teacher education programs played a smaller and at times insignificant role.

As Josh embarked on his transition to teaching, he saw the value of training. His desire was to teach something related to his professional field of engineering, not to go back to his youthful desire to teach history. He took the state examinations to secure a provisional license in mathematics and science. As with anything else, he considered what would be the most valuable classes to take to get him ready for the work of being a teacher.

> What's funny to me is I made sure I took these three classes before I started: Special Education, classroom management, and then I did methods and practice for math. I did one and I'm glad I saw all those, but I have to say, based on all the classes I teach and the flexibility, I've got unit plans but no lesson plan. Printing out daily lesson plans? Totally not useful for me at that point. Classroom management was great to see and get introduced to certain things. I would love to get into some of the alternative discipline methods. I'd love to get into some... You know, they're doing PBIS in my school district and bringing it to the high school and I don't know that I love it. More of a restorative justice model is what I have in mind, knowing that you need a way to do arbitrate it. I find that more inspiring and that's something I could sink my teeth into more. I've got these ideas, having seen that, and I've got the reality of discipline issues and if it's bad enough, they get a Saturday detention. I think that's a little, I don't know. It feels a little

bit limited. Anyway, the administration knows they need to do something different, but they don't know what that is. From a district level of bringing PBIS up and people are joking about it like what is it? Here, have some M&Ms, be good. The way it's typically talked about. Rewards.

Certainly, there are things that cannot be taught in teacher preparation courses but must be learned on the job. What Josh discusses here is not just how his methods and classroom management courses did not prepare him for the work but that they could not. Lesson plans are of little value to his class and, though he may have learned about many different classroom management styles the one that is implemented in his school is poorly implemented—he feels he has little support for managing a classroom in the way he would like to. The rationale for and the value found in teacher residency programs is that they provide on-the-job training that cannot, by definition, be provided in a preparatory program (Schorr, 1993; Kopp, 2001). The experiential model of education provided in residency programs is not owing to the strength of the residency models themselves but rather in the philosophy of educating teachers *in-situ* while practicing their craft rather than preparing them for an imagined future as a teacher. As Dewey (1938) notes, education must be based on experience and is not a preparation for life but an experience of life itself.

Both Josh and Raphel have demonstrated their ability to think critically and creatively about the curriculum in their schools, and Terry noted that she was comfortable with teaching before her practicum even began. While surely more research is needed, what teacher education might learn is that emergency credentials may not deserve the critical looks they are given. What we may need to be critical of is the lack of ongoing professional development that allows teachers to make connections to their lives and to the needs of the students that they learn more about each day.

Ongoing support for continued development. As Grossman (2009) has noted, teachers tend to catch their stride in their third year. All of my participants remarked on this time in their own way. Josh recounts his experience being hired and being given some advice from his principal.

> So it's funny. The principal, when I hired in asked: "Are you sure of what you are getting into?" I said "Of course not! But I think I have an idea." He said "Well, just a little advice. It's a three-year transition. First year is going to be terrible. For most everyone. Second year is a lot better. Third year is usually where everything clicks." So, you know, I was really glad to hear that, and I took it heart. And, that was good.

Raphel notes that his teaching is always evolving. Each year he has different students and he learns new ways of teaching, though he does say that this, his third, year he is learning about and able to reflect on his own teaching style. Terry, likewise, notes the significance of the third-year recollecting how that was the year that she finally gave up moonlighting back in her first career. That was also the year that she redecorated her classroom, finally feeling that the room—and the career—were her own.

But, the first years of teaching are difficult for any teacher. In my own first year of teaching I heard versions of Grossman's finding from my co-workers and mentors, "Wait until the third year…". Beyond teacher education programs, professional development for teachers needs to support the growth and learning of professionals beyond induction year programs. State departments of education have requirements for the collection of "professional development points" or "continuing education credits", but these often feel like checkboxes and requirements rather than professional development opportunities. If there is an industry that is doing this well, perhaps the second-career teachers transitioning from those industries will bring this experience to bear on their work as teachers as well.

One way to look beyond checklists and state mandates might be to engage teachers in understanding their own narratives and how these fit cultural narratives of becoming teachers. Some of the literature on second-career teachers points to career-changers who see themselves as different from their first-career peers and distance themselves from a teacher identity as they begin their second-careers (Trent and Gao, 2009). What I hope this study achieves, minimally, is the amplification of an emerging cultural narrative of becoming a second-career teacher. Situating teachers within a broader cultural narrative may provide a smoother transition to teaching and improve retention rates as those who may otherwise feel dramatically other than their peers. The demographic data bears out that second-career teachers as not an insignificant portion of the incoming teacher pool—they deserve, and we need, to give them the tools they need to thrive for a long and fulfilling career.

Theoretical and Methodological Intersections

Throughout this paper I have found that second-career teachers have more life experience to draw upon as they become teachers. They are able to employ their prior personal and professional experiences in the classroom and draw on relevance structures to create repertoires for teaching and role-identities for themselves as teachers. They incorporate previous experience and cultural tools where possible and subordinate identities that they perceive as "disallowed" from the school environment. Even in subordinating identities, subtle or subversive modes of incorporation are incorporated into daily personal habits and have an impact on engagement with students and curriculum (see Terry's account of Faith and Science). While it may seem that I am suggesting that second-career teachers are better able to incorporate diverse experience, I am left feeling that the question of "why" it is that they are able to do this glares out from beneath these pages.

It is possible that the engagements in multiple cultures of work and advanced stages of life in fact do not lead to a greater ability to draw on various relevance structures or make sense of ones multi membership through incorporation rather than subordination. It is possible that this is merely wisdom. While I cannot attend to the question, "where does wisdom come from?" in the confines of this study, I may propose a few tentative answers.

It is possible that some individuals have a greater capacity for reflection than others (Kegan, 1982, 1994) or can incorporate culture more readily into accessible, interiorized frameworks (Vygotsky, 1978). Robert Kegan's (1982, 1994) work was of interest throughout initial conceptualizations of this study. Kegan has shown an interest in individual's ability to make meaning of their experience and presents a taxonomy of orders of consciousness in which individuals become increasingly able to incorporate various aspects of their experience as they develop or evolve, to use Kegan's term. Yet, through Kegan's work two significant a priori assumption emerges—the individual must have something to incorporate. This is where second-career teachers become a richer set of individuals to study whether trying to understand individual self-concepts, cultural engagements, or both. Kegan's work is on adult development, not child development. The orders of consciousness are a matter of mature personality and psychological ability but also a simpler matter of having had enough experiences to pursue incorporation. As a mentor once shared with me, "I find I am better able to make meaning the older I get" (Hornstein, April 2016, personal communication).

This study did not rely on individuals' capacity to reflect on their activity as a psychological trait or achievement of an order of consciousness but rather pursued understanding of individual development through the meditational means of the interview. Understanding this requires an appreciation of the ways in which we become ourselves through interaction with

others (Vygotsky, 1997; Bakhtin, 1981). This is the essence of dialogism—the intersection of two social actors co-constructing a shared understanding. Contrasted to an autobiography, such as the one Roth (2015) presents of his own becomings, the self that emerges is not a psychological product but an account of an individual being presented in process—through interaction with the other. A monological account is a single voice and expresses a self-understanding or reflective self-concept. A dialogical account presents an individual coming to understand herself in relation to the audience to whom she is telling the story through the meditational means, which, in this study were at the simplest level the questions being posed by the interviewer (Coppens, October 2017, personal communication).

Looking back at the results presented for each participant, we are able to take view of both the psychological abilities of the individual and the effect of dialogical self-construction. At times, I am tempted to disentangle the two, but such an endeavor would both undermine the conceptual underpinnings of this paper and would require a departure from the empirical data itself. But it does raise questions and points to potential approaches for future studies.

I noted that Josh was not new to self-transformation, to making qualitative changes to his life purposefully and to intentionally engaging in multiple cultures as each suited his range of interests. Josh able to incorporate aspects of these various cultures in his teaching which perhaps arises from his practice in multi-membership. But Josh's recounting of his intentional decision to depart from friends at an early age led me to believe that he had a capacity as a pre-teen that he may not have had. He is telling the story today, some thirty years later, with a greater maturity and stronger ability to make sense of his actions in a way that serves his story. A future study might investigate Kegan's orders of consciousness by questioning this developmental logic and seeking empirical evidence to support it. Were Josh to have a journal from that time in his life

his historical response to the situation could be analyzed. With the ubiquity of social media and personal blogs, such a study could be much more easily pursued in the future as the hard copy pre-teen journal is likely an artifact more difficult to locate than a Facebook timeline.

A future study might also question the impact of face-to-face dialogue in identity formation. Rather than a longitudinal study like the one proposed previously, this study could be accomplished over a shorter timeframe. Individuals could create journal entries in which they describe their self-understanding and could then engage in interviews with a similar project and similarly open-ended framework. The investigation would be on the difference between the two self-constructions. A similar study might look at the quality of self-constructions presented to various audiences or with different mediational means (questions). This work seems the type that would result in a research instrument or paradigm for investigating identity construction much like McAdams (2008) *Life Story Interview*.

Directions for Future Empirical Research

There are three distinct directions that this study leads to for future empirical research. The first direction is to continue work on developing the literature base on second-career teachers. The second direction is to employ the narrative methodology developed her the investigate other populations of individuals in transition within P-12 and post-secondary educational institutions and beyond educational institutions altogether.

In looking to add to the literature on second-career teachers the recommendations provided by the Woodrow Wilson National Fellows Foundation report from 2008 provides a good place to start. We recall four areas of inquiry that were deemed prudent to explore: demographics of the population of second-career teachers, characteristics of the most successful programs, motivations of second-career teachers and how prior life experiences lead to a better

understanding of the population. A follow up report prepared by Peter Hart associates on behalf of the Woodrow Wilson foundation (2010) reported extensively on demographics of second career teachers. Further work continues exploring efficacy of various models of preparation in teacher education programs and induction year practices. Finally, motivations of second career teachers have been explored in various studies and continue to find three main motivations: a better family life, a more stable career, and to give back to the community.

This study has sought to address the final recommendation of the 2008 Woodrow Wilson National Fellows Foundation report—to increase the understanding of second career teachers and the way they make sense of their multifaceted lives as they become second career teachers. The stories present a clear direction for future research—having more second-career teachers in their first few years of teaching share their stories. Such a project would have three main impacts. 1) The collection of stories of second-career teachers would grow allowing more would-be teachers to see themselves among the ranks of second-career teachers. In conversation about my dissertation project with a number of high school principals and career changers enrolled in teacher education programs I regularly hear of difficult transitions. Most notably, I have been surprised to hear that teachers struggle to see themselves as a good fit for teaching even several years into working in a school. When speaking of their motivations to teach, the participants in this study do not see themselves as part of the larger narrative about teachers—as good students who wanted to give back. The find teaching to be a way to balance the demands of work and family and co-curricular interests—in this way second-career teachers may be more equipped to pursue a life that includes teaching (Sumara and Luce-Kapler, 1996) as they have a life into which teaching will fit as opposed to building a life around teaching as first career teachers may more readily pursue. Helping career-changers to see themselves as part of a larger trend of

second-career teachers may help them to see themselves as not so unlike others in the field—what impact would reading the stories of other second-career teachers have on those struggling to make the transition? 2) This line of thinking and this question point to the second benefit—retention. This would require picking up on a trend noted in the literature and creating three-year induction and mentoring programs. 3) As teachers tell their story they are able to see the rich life experience they bring to their craft, to gain a greater sense of self, and to come to understand their emergent identity and practice as teachers.

Such replications of this work may easily be found in looking at other populations of second career teachers. Whether comparting the experiences of Elementary vs. Secondary teachers, investigating the differences by discipline or by former career, I am drawn to looking at unique populations of second-career teachers. A mutual interest of alternative teacher preparation and my own investigates the self-transformations of veterans transitioning to civilian life, largely through engagements in education (Ness, Middleton, and Hildebrandt, 2015). This unique population of second-career has been studied previously (McCree, 1993; Jeanne, 1997; Robertson, 2014) and more in-depth study may provide compelling stories of self-transformation—stories of veterans becoming teachers. In the fall of 2017 William and Mary founded the tenth institute in our nation that seeks to turn military service veterans into high quality teachers (Mattingly, 2017). Positioned in an area of our nation with a large network of military services, William and Mary served over 700 veterans who wanted to become teachers in their first year. Even a small-scale study could make an impact in helping veterans to see themselves as future teachers as they might hear part of their own story in that of others.

In addition to working with teacher candidates—many of them second-career teachers—I am also a higher education administrator working to mentor and create professional development

programming for college faculty. I am interested in exploring the narratives of a variety of populations within the academy—adjuncts and lecturers, teaching faculty and tenure track. How do they bring their complex life histories to provide incorporations in their current life? How do adjuncts as bi-vocational teachers make sense of a life that is fragmented-is their activity as a teacher richer for the co-commitment? How do tenure-track faculty live out the multi-faceted existence that is the life of a teacher-scholar?

Or we may look to another point of transition within the halls of higher education studying the lives of faculty members who become administrators. David D. Perlmutter (2018) discusses the steep learning curve that academics-turned-administrators climb, often leaving prior good will among the faculty in their wake. One college faculty member recently shared that he was looked at by his faculty colleagues as having lost 20 IQ points when he took a job as an administrator more than a decade ago, and the administration felt he had lost 20 IQ points when he went back to his full-time faculty role (Shaw, 2017, personal communication). Of our own Bruce Mallory it is said that he warned his education faculty colleagues not to walk too close to him once he took his post as Provost at the University of New Hampshire in 2003—he knew there was a target on his once jovially patted back.

This paper and the research that may emerge in my future is not just about the intersection of work and life of teachers but about adult development. The notion of second career or bi-vocation is not confined to education. A number of recent conversations have led me to listen to lectures by pastors with different ears. How does a financier turned pastor draw on relevance structures to craft his message to the audience before him? How does a pastor who also works as a carpenter draw on his co-occupation when speaking to his predominantly blue-collar congregation? These granular questions seek to employ the narrative analysis tools in this study

to analyze public speech, which would be a challenge for my emerging research skills—but one that I feel would advance my own understanding and the methodological tools themselves.

As Seidman (2003) says, I have found a way of doing empirical research that is life giving. My interest is in pursuing how individuals with more varied experience present complex incorporated identities and become through dynamic development afforded by narrative events and speech events excites me to do more work exploring adult development.

Conclusions

The contributions to the literature on second-career teachers are three-fold. First, this study moves beyond the study of second-career teachers in preparation to tell the stories of second-career teachers in action. Second, the expanded view of prior activity drawn upon provides a complex picture of second-career teachers. Third, the view of the individual moves beyond a unified self-concept achieved through the subordination of conflicting identities to an expanded view of individual experiencing self-transformation in the process of becoming a second career teacher. Employment of co-constructed narratives and the analysis of narratives for representational and interactional selves provides an appreciation of how the individual is becoming a type of self even through the context of the interview. I have noted that even as the researcher it has been difficult to fully comprehend this concept of individual identity and how we become ourselves through interaction with others, transformed by the meeting of far more than two cultures as each individual brings with her a complex understanding of her socialization and identity formation. As such, I feel it necessary to present how my metaphor for myself as a researcher has changed through the course of this project.

Through this study, my own metaphor for the role of a qualitative researcher has been refined. At first, I saw the researcher as an advocate—one who could "give voice to the

voiceless" and "draw out" their stories. As the advocate for their stories, I did not want to include my own voice for fear it would overpower that of my participants.

My committee member Andrew Coppens challenged this metaphor. Had I not been part of the conversation that gave rise to the story? Was not part of my purpose to interpret, understand, and explain and not just to describe? At no point had I described my study as descriptive phenomenology, so I had some work to do with the narratives and with my metaphor. Andrew suggested a metaphor for the narrative analysis as sheets of tin foil which my fingers would poke up from underneath, adding texture.

The metaphor for understanding identity and self is also important and serves to construct my metaphor of myself as a researcher. Cooley discusses the looking glass self—we see ourselves as we think others view us. But this requires the self-reflection and a high order of Kegan's consciousness to take the complexity of self into view. Roth employs Engeström's metaphor of knotwork, seeing the individual as a composite of cultural activity. But extending what Grumet has said about metaphor, the life story will create a version of social interaction and will never reveal the complex knotwork completely.

The propositional and interactional features of narrative led me to think of a turning on of various lights each representing an activity system that travels its own diachronic (linear) trajectory. The lights are turned on and tuned to the audience, intensifying with supportive responses and dimming with those perceived as unsupportive. The descriptions of activity and self-understanding emit from the light sources, drawn out by the questions posed by the researcher. But the researcher does more than elicit a description—he gives texture to the foil.

Together the participant and the researcher—the co-constructors or collaborators in telling the story are a prism refracting out the texture in the light spectrum to reveal complexities

not visible in the unexamined story. This is the demand of Vygotsky's dynamic analysis: to

explain the processes of development in sociohistorical context, realizing that the development is

occurring even in the very moment that we seek explanation.

EPILOGUE

[ir]relevance structures

As a younger man, I worked in emergency medicine. I began as a radio communications technician, worked my way through gopher duties riding on the ambulance while studying to gain Emergency Medical Technician certification. I worked at an EMT for two and a half years, drove the ambulance, acted as a crew chief and officer, and finally served one year as the president of the ambulance service before departing for college. I saw too much. I slept too little. And yet I would not trade that experience for anything. A few years ago, I was having lunch in a park with my family when a young boy was stung by a bee—I calmly excused myself from the picnic blanket and took control without considering this rehearsed reaction to emergency. Last summer I jumped out of a slowing tour tram after seeing a man fall out of a moving vehicle. He was drunk and bruised, but fine. This past summer, after reading a responsorial psalm at my grandmother's funeral, I found myself walking briskly down the aisle of the church not knowing what I would find amid the commotion. I assumed, correctly, that the individuals had not been so moved by the scripture—this was Catholic Mass, not a Pentecostal worship service—but was in distress, and I knew I had the experience and training to help. Sometimes I feel sheepish after such encounters, knowing there are likely others who have current certifications to call upon rather than mine which is now lapsed. But I won't stop reacting this way to emergencies—won't because I can't. Can't because these reactions come from some long past yet not forgotten part of myself.

But in these moments of emergency, it was easy for me to jump to action. There were technical skills that I could draw upon, and somehow my disposition in emergencies is to remain calm knowing that everything is out of control only if I also lose control.

In January of 2018, there was a situation in which I was, thankfully, able to rely upon my training and years of experience as an EMT but for which I was emotionally unprepared. I had worked on the ambulance when I was still a kid. Some of the toughest moments were when we responded to calls that involved children. But now I have my own children. When a toddler had a seizure while I was playing with my kids at the local kids' gym, I again jumped to action. The small boy was unresponsive and visibly in distress. A woman was crying. I looked up. Mascara streamed down her cheeks as she shook and yelped and gasped with fright. "He's going to be ok" I heard myself say. Then I leaned down to check his breathing. He gasped and sputtered for air. "Someone is calling 911?" I asked. We have a toddler in respiratory distress, likely having a seizure. "Does he have a history of seizures?" I asked as I swiped a finger in the toddler's mouth, drawing out a stream of saliva as I turned him onto his side and checked his breathing again. "He is breathing. He is going to be ok. Does anyone know what happened?"

Another active seizure started, and I leaned down to speak some encouragement to this child. I rubbed his back as I cradled his head, keeping him on his side so saliva would drip from his mouth rather than down his throat, "It's okay, little baby boy."

And with those words, I almost lost it. Little baby boy! I looked up into the face of my wife, who had her arms around my own two kids. Their eyes were wide. I calmly asked my wife for a blanket or a towel. Then someone was kneeling at my side wearing dark cargo pants and sturdy black boots. I started giving vitals.

"An active seizure of ninety seconds just ended. Airway is clear. Breathing remains labored and shallow. Color is fine between seizures, cyanotic during. Haven't confirmed what happened." My colleague was not responding. I looked up.

"Oh, you are not an EMT?" I asked.

"No. Cop." He said.

"Ok. Do you have suction?" I asked. Another seizure had started, and the child was sputtering again. Suction might help clear out saliva that my finger swipe had missed or that had gathered in his cheek.

"Suction?" he asked, now addressing another pair of dark pants and dark boots I saw approaching from the corner of my eye.

"Got it" came the words a few seconds later. The officer beside me opened it up and began inserting it into the boy's mouth. I took it from his hands and suctioned the boy's cheek drawing out more saliva.

"Ggggggg" the boy gasped, and his pupils began to constrict again. Color came back into his face and the blue, spider-like veins receded from around his temples. He was again between seizures, but non-responsive.

More dark pants and boots.

"What's going on?" asked a familiarly calm voice.

"Two active seizures in the last five minutes. Airway is clear. I just suctioned. Labored breathing and cyanosis during active seizures. Pupils dilate and constrict evenly and as expected. Haven't heard what onset may have been or if there is a history." I replied.

"Are you a family member?" The EMT asked, seeing me cradling the boy.

"No, I'm an EMT." I say. "Used to be."

"Ok. I'll take him." He says, holding out his arms.

And, as with the handoff to emergency room personnel in the days of old, I watched them go and found a bathroom to wash my hands. Then I went and hugged my kids. My four-year-old daughter had a lot of questions which I answered with a racing, but grateful, heart. She has been

using play to process…small Brio ambulances have been responding to "hurt little boys" all

week.

REFERENCES

Altork, K. (1998). You never know when you want to be a redhead in Belize. In K. DeMarris (Ed.), *Inside stories: Qualitative research reflections* (pp. 111-125). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Anderson, H., Fry, S., & Hourcade, J. J. (2014). Career Changers as First-Year High School Teachers. *Clearing House: A Journal of Educational Strategies, Issues and Ideas*, *87*(4), 149–154. http://doi.org/10.1080/00098655.2013.878302

Anthony, G., & Ord, K. (2008). Change-of-Career Secondary Teachers: Motivations, Expectations and Intentions. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, *36*(4), 359–376.

Antink-Meyer, A. a., & Brown, R. A. (2017). Second-career science teachers' classroom conceptions of science and engineering practices examined through the lens of their professional histories. *International Journal of Science Education*, *39*(11), 1511-1528. doi:10.1080/09500693.2017.1338787

Backes, C., & Burns, J. Z. (2008). New Career-Technical Teachers--What Gets Them, and Why Is It Important to Know? Career Motivations of Trade and Industrial and Healthcare Science Second-Career Teachers. *Journal of Industrial Teacher Education*, *45*(1), 100–112.

Bakhtin, M.M. (1981). The dialogic imagination (M. Holquist, Ed., C. Emerson & M. Holquist, Trans.). Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.

Bakhtin, M.M. (1986). *Speech genres & other late essays* (C. Emerson & M. Holquist (Eds.). Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.

Bakhtin, M. M. (1993). *Toward a philosophy of the act*. V. Liapunov (Trans.). Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.

Berger, P., & Luckman, T. (1966). *The social construction of reality.* New York: Anchor Books.

Blumer, H. (1969). *Symbolic Interactionism: perspective and method.* Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc.

Bruner, J. (1966). *Toward a theory of instruction*. Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.

Bruner, J. (1990). *Acts of Meaning*. Boston: Harvard University Press.

Bullough, R. V. (1991). Exploring personal teaching metaphors in preservice teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *42:*43-51. doi:10.1177/002248719104200107

Bullough, R.V.; Knowles, J.G.; Crow, N.A. (1992). *Emerging as a Teacher.* New York: Routledge.

Castro, A. J., & Bauml, M. (2009). Why Now? Factors Associated with Choosing Teaching as a Second Career and Their Implications for Teacher Education Programs. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, *36*(3), 113–126.

Clandinin, D. J., & Huber, J. (2010). Narrative inquiry. In B. McGaw, E. Baker, & P. P. Peterson (Eds.), International encyclopedia of education (3rd ed.). New York, NY: Elsevier. 436-441

Coles, R. (1989). *The call of stories: Teaching and the moral imagination.* Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Connelly, M. F., & Clandinin, J. D. (1990). Stories of experience and narrative inquiry. *Educational Researcher*, *19*(5), 2-14.

Creswell, J.W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches, third edition*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Crow, G. M., Levine, L. & Nager, N. (1990). No More Business as Usual: Career Changers Who Become Teachers. *American Journal of Education*, *98*(3), 197–223.

Danziger, P. R., & Welfel, E. R. (2000). Age, gender, and health bias in counselors: An empirical analysis. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling, 22,* 135-149.

Darling-Hammond, L. (2003). Keeping good teachers: Why it matters what leaders can do. *Educational Leadership* 60 (8): 6–13.

Davidson, L. (2003). *Living outside mental illness: Qualitative studies of recovery in schizophrenia.* New York: New York University Press.

deBettencourt, L. U., & Howard, L. (2004). Alternatively Licensing Career Changers to Be Teachers in the Field of Special Education: Their First-Year Reflections. *Exceptionality*, *12*(4), 225–238.

Dewey, J. (1916). *Democracy and education*. Champaign, Il.: Project Gutenberg.

Dewey, J. (1938). *Experience and Education*. New York: Colliers.

Diezmann, C. M., & Watters, J. J. (2015). The Knowledge Base of Subject Matter Experts in Teaching: A Case Study of a Professional Scientist as a Beginning Teacher.

International Journal of Science and Mathematics Education, *13*(6), 1517–1537. http://doi.org/10.1007/s10763-014-9561-x

Diniz-Pereira, J. E. (2003). The social construction of teachers' individualism: how to transcend traditional boundaries of teachers' identity? Paper presented at the American Association of Colleges for teacher education annual meeting, New Orleans.

Donaldson, M. L. (2012). The Promise of Older Novices: Teach for America Teachers' Age of Entry and Subsequent Retention in Teaching and Schools. *Teachers College Record, 114*(10).

Ebert, I. D., Steffans, M. C., & Kroth, A. (2014). Warm, but maybe not to competent?– Contemporary implicit stereotypes of women and men in Germany. *Sex Roles, 70(9-10),* 359- 375. doi: 10.1007/s11199-014-0369-5

Ellis and Berger (2003). Their Story/My Story/Our Story. In J.F. Gubrium and J.A. Holstein (Eds.), *Postmodern Interviewing* (pp. 157-183). Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Engeström, Y. (1987/2015). *Learning by Expanding*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Erikson, E.H. (1950). Childhood and Society. New York: Norton.

Erikson, E. H. (1956). The problem of ego identity. *Journal of the American Psychoanalytic Association, 4,* 56-121.

Erikson, E.H. (1968). Identity: Youth and Crisis. New York: Norton.

Etherington, M. (2009). Swapping the Boardroom for the Classroom. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, *34*(4), 39–59.

Freidus, H. (1990). The Call of the Sirens? The Influence of Gender in the Decision to Choose Teaching as a Career Change. Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22second-career+teachers%22&pg=4&id=ED322122

Freidus, H. (1994). Supervision of Second Career Teachers: What's Our Line? Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22second-career+teachers%22&pg=3&id=ED375122

Freidus, H., & Krasnow, M. (1991). Second Career Teachers: Themes and Variations. Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22career+changers%22&pg=8&id=ED336347

Fuller, F., & Brown, O. (1975). Becoming a Teacher. In K. Ryan (Ed.), *Teacher Education: Seventy-Fourth Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Gergen, K. (1994). Realities and relationships. Cambridge: Harvard University.

Gifford, J., Snyder, M. G., & Cuddapah, J. L. (2013). Novice Career Changers Weather the Classroom Weather. *Phi Delta Kappan*, *94*(6), 50–54.

Glenn, C. L. (1998). The History and Future of Private Education in the United States. Journal of Catholic Education, 1 (4). Retrieved from http://digitalcommons.lmu.edu/ce/vol1/iss4/7

Glenn, J. M. L. (2003). Career Switchers: Those Who Can, Do, and Then They Teach. *Business Education Forum*, *57*(3), 8–12.

Gnadinger, C. M. (2006). A New Era of Teacher Preparation: Meeting the Challenge for Alternative Certification. *AILACTE Journal*, *3*, 1–10.

Goffman, E. (1959). *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life.* New York: Doubleday.

Goffman E. (1961). *Asylums: Essays on the Social Situation of Mental Patients and Other Inmates*. Garden City, N.Y. Anchor Books.

Goldhaber, D., Gross, B. and Player, D. (2007). "Are Public Schools Really Losing Their Best? Assessing the Career Transitions of Teachers and Their Implications for the Quality of the Teacher Workforce." CALDER Working Paper No. 12. Washington, D.C.: National Center for Analysis of Longitudinal Data in Education Research.

Gomez, M. L., Walker, A. B., & Page, M. L. (2000). Personal Experience as a Guide to Teaching. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *16*(7), 731–47.

Grbich, C. (2013). *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Introduction*. London, Sage.

Grier, J. M., & Johnston, C. C. (2008). *STEM Career-changers Transition to Teaching: I Have to Become a Student Again?* Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22career+changers%22&id=ED501492

Grier, J. M., & Johnston, C. C. (2009). An Inquiry into the Development of Teacher Identities in STEM Career Changers. *Journal of Science Teacher Education*, *20*(1), 57–75. http://doi.org/10.1007/s10972-008-9119-2

Grier, J. M., & Johnston, C. C. (2012). STEM Professionals Entering Teaching: Navigating Multiple Identities. *Journal of Science Teacher Education*, *23*(1), 19–44. http://doi.org/10.1007/s10972-011-9260-1

Griffiths, V. (2011). Career Changers and Fast-Track Induction: Teacher Perspectives on Their Early Professional Development. *Teacher Development*, *15*(1), 19–35.

Grossman, P. (2009). Teaching: No 'Fallback' Career. *The New York Times*, April 19, 2009.

Grumet, M. (1987). The politics of personal knowledge. Curriculum Inquiry, 17, 320-329.

Grumet, M. (1988). *Bitter Milk: Women and Teaching.* Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press.

Haggard, C., Slostad, F., & Winterton, S. (2006). Transition to the School as Workplace: Challenges of Second Career Teachers. *Teaching Education*, *17*(4), 317–327.

Hanushek, E.A., Kain, J.F., O'Brien, D.M., and Rivkin, S.G. (2005). *The Market for Teacher Quality. NBER Working Paper No. 11154*. Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.

Harrell, P. E., & Harris, M. (2006). Teacher Preparation without Boundaries: A Two-Year Study of an Online Teacher Certification Program. *Journal of Technology and Teacher Education*, *14*(4), 755–774.

Haselkorn, D., & Hammerness, K. (2008). *Encore Performances: Tapping the Potential of Midcareer and Second-Career Teachers*. Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship Foundation. Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22career+changers%22&id=ED536872

Heikkinen, H. L. T. (2002). Whatever is narrative research? In R. Huttunen, H. L. T. Heikkinen, & L. Syrjälä (Eds.), *Narrative research: Voices from teachers and philosophers* (pp. 13-25). Jyväskylä, Finland: SoPhi.

Heuser, D., & Owens, R. F. (1999). Planting Seeds, Preparing Teachers. *Educational Leadership*, *56*(8), 53–56.

Hodges, B.H., Baron, R.M. (1992) Values as constraints and affordances: Perceiving and acting properly. *Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour 22(3), 263-294.*

Ingersol, R. M. (2001). Teacher turnover and teacher shortages: An organizational analysis. American Education Research Journal, 38(3), 499-534.

Jenne, J. T. (1997). Conserving the Status Quo in Social Studies Teaching: The Case of Second Career Military Teachers. *Theory and Research in Social Education*, *25*(4), 446–69.

Jóhannsdóttir, M., & Roth, W.-M. (2014). Experiencing (pereživanie) as developmental category: Learning from a fisherman who is becoming (as) a teacher-in-a-village-school. Outlines. *Critical Practice Studies*, 15.

Kegan, R. (1982). *The evolving self: problem and process in human development.* Cambridge, MA. Harvard University Press.

Kegan, R. (1994). *In over our heads: the mental demands of modern life*. Cambridge, MA. Harvard University Press.

Konecki, L., Pottorff, D., King, C., Lin, E., Armstrong, D., Pryor, S., … Eikenberry, G. (2002). Teacher Education for Career Changers. Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22career+changers%22&pg=5&id=ED463249

Kopp (2001). *One Day, all children…The unlikely triumph of Teach for America, and what I learned along the way.* New York: Public Affairs.

Lee, D. (2011). Changing Course: Reflections of Second-Career Teachers. *Current Issues in Education*, *14*(2).

Lewin, K. (1935). *A dynamic theory of personality*. New York: McGraw Hill.

Löckenhoff, C. E., Chan, W., McCrae, R. R., De Fruyt, F., Jussim, L., De Bolle, M., et al. (2014). Gender stereotypes of personality: Universal and accurate? *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 45(5),* 675-694. doi: 10.1177/0022022113520075

Lortie, D. (1975). *Schoolteacher: A sociological study.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

MacDonald, R. H., & Manning, M. L. (2002). The Career Switcher Program. *Phi Delta Kappan*, *84*(3), 186–88.

Madfes, T. J. (1991). The Chevron ENCORE Midcareer Program and the Mid-life Career Change to Teaching Science and Mathematics Study.

Marinell, W. H., & Johnson, S. M. (2014). Midcareer Entrants to Teaching: Who They Are and How They May, or May Not, Change Teaching. *Educational Policy*, *28*(6), 743–779. http://doi.org/10.1177/0895904813475709

Mattingly, J. (2017). At William and Mary, a hub for turning veterans into K-12 teachers. *Richmond Times-Dispatch*. Retrieved November 14, 2017, from http://www.richmond.com/news/local/education/at-william-and-mary-a-hub-for-turning-veterans-into/article_b871e5b8-e3d7-5bfa-a17b-247f954651de.html

Mayotte, G. A. (2003). Stepping Stones to Success: Previously Developed Career Competencies and Their Benefits to Career Switchers Transitioning to Teaching. *Teaching and Teacher Education: An International Journal of Research and Studies*, *19*(7), 681–695. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2003.03.002

McAdams, D.P. (1985). *Power, intimacy, and the life story: Personological inquiries into identity.* New York, Guilford Press.

McAdams, D. P. (2008). *The life story interview*. Retrieved from https://www.sesp.northwestern.edu/foley/instruments/interview/

McCree, H. (1993). Post-Career Military as an Alternative Pool of Teacher Candidates. Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22second-career+teachers%22&pg=4&id=ED383666

McKenna, M. A. (2001). Who Will Prepare Tomorrow's Quality Teachers? *Connection: New England's Journal of Higher Education and Economic Development*, *16*(2), 18–19.

Meade, G.H. (1934). *Mind, Self, and Society.* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1984). Qualitative data analysis: A sourcebook of new methods. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Miles, M.B.; Huberman, A.M., and Saldaña, J. (2014) Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook 3rd Edition. Washington, DC: Sage.

Moen, T. (2006). Reflections on the Narrative Research Approach. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 5(4).

Morettini, B. W. (2014). Going Back to School: Why STEM Professionals Decide to Teach through Alternative Certification Programs. *Journal of the National Association for Alternative Certification*, *9*(2), 3–23.

Morton, M. L., Williams, N. L., & Brindley, R. (2006). Colliding Cultures: Career Switchers Transition to Elementary School Classrooms. *Action in Teacher Education*, *28*(1), 40–50.

Neapolitan, J. E. (1996). Developing a Conceptual Framework toward Change: A Cross-Case Analysis of Six Career Changers. Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22career+changers%22&pg=6&id=ED395993

Ness, B.M., Middleton, M.J. & Hildebrandt, M.J. (2015) Examining the Effects of Self-reported Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Symptoms and Positive Relations With Others on Self-regulated Learning for Student Service Members/Veterans. *Journal of American College Health*, 63:7, 448-458, DOI: 10.1080/07448481.2014.975719

Newman, E. (2010). ERIC - "I'm Being Measured as an NQT, That Isn't Who I Am": An Exploration of the Experiences of Career Changer Primary Teachers in Their First Year of Teaching. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, *16*(4), 461–475.

Nielsen, A. (2016). Second career teachers and (mis)recognitions of professional identities. *School Leadership & Management*, *36*(2), 221-245. doi:10.1080/13632434.2016.1209180

Novak, D., & Knowles, J. G. (1992). Life Histories and the Transition to Teaching as a Second Career. Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22career+changers%22&pg=7&id=ED349285

Olsen, B. (2008). How reasons for entry into the profession illuminate teacher identity development. *Teacher Education Quarterly,* Summer, 23-40.

Palmer, P. (1998). *The Courage to Teach.* New York: Jossey-Bass.

Penuel, W. R., & Wertsch, J. V. (1995). Vygotsky and identity formation: A sociocultural approach. *Educational Psychologist,* 30(2), 83-92. DOI:10.1207/s15326985ep3002_5

Pierce, K. M. (2007). Betwixt and Between: Liminality in Beginning Teaching. *New Educator*, *3*(1), 31–49.

Polkinghorne, D.E. (1991). Narrative and Self Concept. *Journal of Narrative and Life History* 1(2&3), pp.135-153.

Powell, R. (1994). From Field Science to Classroom Science: A Case Study of Constrained Emergence in a Second-Career Science Teacher. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, *31*(3), 273–91.

Resta, V., Huling, L., & Rainwater, N. (2001). Preparing Second-Career Teachers. *Educational Leadership*, *58*(8), 60–63.

Richardson, P. W., & Watt, H. M. G. (2005). ERIC - "I've Decided to Become a Teacher": Influences on Career Change, Teaching and Teacher Education: An International Journal of Research and Studies, 2005-Ju. *Teaching and Teacher Education: An International Journal of Research and Studies*, *21*(5), 475–489. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2005.03.007

Riessman, C.K (2001) Analysis of Personal Narratives to be published in *Handbook of Interviewing*, Eds Gubrium, J.F. and Holstein, J.A. London, Sage Publications. Pagination taken from a web accessible PDF: http://alumni.media.mit.edu/~brooks/storybiz/riessman.pdf

Robertson, H. (2014). Life Satisfaction of Former-Military, Second-Career Changers. *Journal of the National Association for Alternative Certification*, *9*(1), 3–13.

Roth, W.-M. (2009). Cultural-Historical Activity Theory: Toward a Social Psychology from First Principles. *History and Philosophy of Psychology Bulletin*, 8–22.

Roth, W.-M. (2015). Becoming and belonging: From identity to experiences as developmental category in science teaching. In L. Avraamidou (Ed.), *Identity in science teaching* (pp. 295–320). Rotterdam, The Netherlands: Sense Publishers.

Ruenzel, D. (2002). Tortuous Routes. *Education Next*, *2*(1), 42–48.

Ryan, P. M., & Spangler, S. (1991). Restructuring Teacher Education for Career Switchers. Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22career+switchers%22&pg=2&id=ED334166

Salvio, P.M. (2007). *Anne Sexton: Teacher of Weird Abundance.* Albany: SUNY Press.

Schorr, J. (1993). Class action: What Clinton's national service program could learn from 'Teach for America". *Phi Delta Kappan*, 75(4), 315-318.

Schram, T. (2006). *Conceptualizing and proposing qualitative research.* Columbus, Ohio: Pearson Merrill Prentice Hall.

Seidman, I. (2006). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Shannon, I. L. (1990). ASEP-An Alternative Certification Program for Career Switchers That Works. *Action in Teacher Education*, *12*(2), 38–42.

Snyder, C. (2010). *ERIC - "We Do Not See Things as They Are. We See Things as We Are." Capturing the Transformation of Career Changing Women from STEM Fields to Teaching, ProQuest LLC, 201*. ProQuest LLC.

Stetsenko, A (2013). The Challenge of Individuality in Cultural-Historical Activity Theory: "Collectividual" Dialectics from a Transformative Activist Stance. *Outlines: Critical Practice Studies*, 14(2), 7-28.

Storey, A. (2007). Cultural Shifts in Teaching: New Workforce, New Professionalism? *Curriculum Journal*, *18*(3), 253–270.

Sumara, D.J. and Luce-Kapler, R. (1996). (Un)Becoming a Teacher: Negotiating Identities While Learning to Teach. *Canadian Journal of Education*, 21, 65-83.

Tan, P. I. J. (2012). Second Career Teachers: Perceptions of Self-Efficacy in the First Year of Teaching. *New Horizons in Education*, *60*(2), 21–35.

Teaching as a Second Career. (2008). Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship Foundation. Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22second-career+teachers%22&pg=2&id=ED536867

Tell, C. (2001). Making Room for Alternative Routes. *Educational Leadership*, *58*(8), 38–41.

Tigchelaar, A., Brouwer, N., & Korthagen, F. (2008). Crossing Horizons: Continuity and Change during Second-Career Teachers' Entry into Teaching. *Teaching and Teacher Education: An International Journal of Research and Studies*, *24*(6), 1530–1550. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2008.03.001

Trent, J., & Gao, X. (2009). ERIC - "At Least I'm the Type of Teacher I Want to Be": Second-Career English Language Teachers' Identity Formation in Hong Kong Secondary Schools, Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education, 2009-Au. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, *37*(3), 253–270.

Troesch, L., & Bauer, C. E. (2017). Second career teachers: Job satisfaction, job stress, and the role of self-efficacy. *Teaching & Teacher Education*, *67*389-398. doi: 10.1016/j.tate.2017.07.006

Vuorikoski, M. (2001). *Constructing personal and professional identity during teacher education*. Tampere: University of Finland.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind in society: the development of higher psychological processes*. (M. Cole, Ed.). Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1997). *The collected works of L.S. Vygotsky, Vo. 4: This history of the development of higher mental functions*. (R. W. Rieber, Ed.). New York: Plenum.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1962/2000). *Thought and language*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Walsh, K., & Jacobs, S. (2007). *Alternative Certification Isn't Alternative*. Thomas B. Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22career+changers%22&pg=5&id=ED498382

Weiner, W., & Newtzie, K. C. (2006). They've Dreamed about Becoming Teachers: The Virginia Community College Career Switcher Program. *Community College Journal of Research & Practice*, *30*(2), 155–156.

Wertsch, J. V. (1991). *Voices of the mind: A sociocultural approach to mediated action*. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.

Wertsch, J. V. (1998). *Mind as action*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Wertsch, J.V. (2000). Narratives as Cultural Tools in Sociocultural Analysis. *Ethos*, 28(4): 511-533.

Weldon, M. S. (2001). Remembering as a Social Process. In D. L. Medin (Ed.), *The Psychology of Learning and Motivation* (Vol. 40, pp. 67–120). Boston: Academic Press.

Wiehe, R. L. (2009). *Second Career Teachers' Perceptions of Their Profession*. ProQuest LLC.

Wilcox, D. R., & Samaras, A. P. (2009). Examining Our Career Switching Teachers' First Year of Teaching: Implications for Alternative Teacher Education Program Design. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, *36*(4), 173–191.

Williams, J. (2010). Constructing a New Professional Identity: Career Change into Teaching. *Teaching and Teacher Education: An International Journal of Research and Studies*, *26*(3), 639–647. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2009.09.016

Williams, J., & Forgasz, H. (2009). The Motivations of Career Change Students in Teacher Education. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, *37*(1), 95–108.

Wilson, E., & Deaney, R. (2010). Changing Career and Changing Identity: How Do Teacher Career Changers Exercise Agency in Identity Construction? *Social Psychology of Education: An International Journal*, *13*(2), 169–183. http://doi.org/10.1007/s11218-010-9119-x

Wilson, J. H., Beyer, D., & Monteiro, H. (2014). Professor age affects student ratings: Halo effect for younger teachers. *College Teaching, 62*, 20-24. doi: 10.1080/87567555.2013.825574

Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship Foundation (2010). *Career Changers in the Classroom: A National Portrait*. Retrieved from http://eric.ed.gov/?q=%22career+changers%22&pg=2&id=ED536873

Wortham, S. (2000). Interactional Positioning and Narrative Self-Construction. *Narrative Inquiry*, 10(1), 157-184. DOI 10.1075/ni.10.1.11wor

Wortham, S.; Allard, E.; Lee, K.; Mortimer, K. (2011). Racialization in payday mugging narratives. *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology,* 21, E56-E75.

Young, B. (1995). Career plans and work perceptions of preservice teachers. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 11*(3), 281-292.

Zeichner, K. M., & Gore, J. (1990). Teacher socialisation. In W. R. Houston (Ed.), *Handbook of research on teacher education*. New York: Macmillan Publishing Company.

APPENDIX A: INTERVIEW PROTOCOL

Precursor to first interview

        I am interested in hearing your story of how you are becoming a second-career teacher. I do not assume to know what a traditional trajectory to teaching looks like nor do I value "career teachers" over second-career teachers. I do not hold dear any notion of what it means to teach or what it means to be a teacher, nor do I pretend that all teachers share a single set of values, beliefs, norms, or mores. For what it is worth, I have worked as an emergency medical technician and as a teacher; I engage in stonework and carpentry as professionalized hobbies; I am equally excited by science and literature; and I find new depths of my character (good and bad) each day as I strive to become a better husband and a better father. Your story is likely as multifaceted as mine, and that is why I am here. I have pressed record, and I am ready to listen to you tell your story as only you can tell it. I will listen, and I will ask questions in an effort to draw out aspects of your experiences, not to ask you to tell me what you think I want to hear. Are you ready to share your story with me?

Guiding questions for the first interview:
- Tell me a little bit about yourself as a student in school. (Academic interests/aptitudes? Extra/co-curricular activities? support of family? influence of friends?)
- Tell me about yourself as a young adult after high school. (Did you go on to college right away? What did you study in college? activities during college? Life changes/transforming experiences?)
- Tell me about your experiences in your first career including how you got into your career, what you enjoyed about the work, relationships with colleagues, and any significant experiences or individuals that stand out in your memory.
- Tell me about your life as you were starting out in your career. What activities did you engage in outside of work? What education (if any) did you pursue at that time?

Guiding questions for the second interview:
- Tell me about your decision to leave your career and become a teacher.
- Tell me about your early experiences in teaching. Your interactions with students, with administrators, with staff, with other teachers?
  - Did you ever think about leaving teaching? Why did you stay?
  - What aspect of being a teacher do you find the most rewarding? The most challenging?
- Tell me about your relationship with faculty, administrators, staff, students.
- Tell me about your relationships with friends who have known you as you made this transition. Do you think they see you differently now?
- Tell me about the activities that you engage currently. Have these changed from your first career?

- How is it different now meeting new people? For instance, when you are at a party meeting someone new, what do you tell them that you do? What would you have told them when you were in your previous career?

Guiding questions for the third interview:
- What does it mean to be a teacher? Where do you see yourself fitting that definition in your current teaching? How do you not fit that definition? How do you feel about not fitting that definition in those times?
- What does it mean to be a [name of professional in first career]? Is that something you still hold on to? How do you think that is present in your life today? How is that present in your teaching?
- Let me read you a passage from the transcript from our last meeting in which you recount an experience…what from your varied experiences do you think influenced that?

*

This page is intentionally left blank.