

Rowan University

Rowan Digital Works

---

Theses and Dissertations

---

5-10-2007

## Life after Harry: creating a reader's advisory model based on the literary archetypes of J.K. Rowling's Harry Potter series

Patricia C. Hatton  
*Rowan University*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://rdw.rowan.edu/etd>



Part of the [Library and Information Science Commons](#)

Let us know how access to this document benefits you -  
share your thoughts on our feedback form.

---

### Recommended Citation

Hatton, Patricia C., "Life after Harry: creating a reader's advisory model based on the literary archetypes of J.K. Rowling's Harry Potter series" (2007). *Theses and Dissertations*. 775.  
<https://rdw.rowan.edu/etd/775>

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by Rowan Digital Works. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Rowan Digital Works. For more information, please contact [LibraryTheses@rowan.edu](mailto:LibraryTheses@rowan.edu).

LIFE AFTER HARRY:  
CREATING A READER'S ADVISORY MODEL BASED ON THE  
LITERARY ARCHETYPES OF J. K. ROWLING'S *HARRY POTTER* SERIES

by  
Patricia C. Hatton

A Thesis

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the  
Master of Arts Degree  
of  
The Graduate School  
at  
Rowan University  
May 10, 2007

Approved by \_\_\_\_\_  
Advisor

Date Approved May 10, 2007

©2007 Patricia C. Hatton

## ABSTRACT

Patricia C. Hatton  
LIFE AFTER HARRY:  
CREATING A READER'S ADVISORY MODEL BASED ON THE  
LITERARY ARCHETYPES OF J. K. ROWLING'S *HARRY POTTER* SERIES  
2006/07  
Dr. Marilyn L. Shontz  
Master of Arts in School and Public Librarianship

The purpose of this study was to develop and test a method of Reader's Advisory based on archetypal character analysis in place of genre, author, or mood advisory. The study used J. K. Rowling's popular *Harry Potter* fiction series as a base for developing this strategy. After identifying four character archetypes in the *Harry Potter* series, the researcher consulted Bowker's *Fiction Connection* database to find other award winning young adult fiction that contained at least two of the archetypes identified in the *Harry Potter* series. Upon identifying ten novels that fit the criteria, the researcher read and analyzed each of the novels to see if they did, indeed, contain archetypes similar to ones found in the Rowling series. Of the ten young adult novels, eight were found to meet the established criteria.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author wishes her sincere thanks and gratitude to Dr. Marilyn Shontz for her attention, guidance, and insight during the preparation of this thesis and for her patience and encouragement in finding “the perfect topic.”

In addition, the author thanks her husband, Jeremiah, whose unending love and tolerance has allowed her to skip the dishes, the laundry, and the cooking to curl up in a warm chair to read books meant for teens, and her parents, Jane & Mike, who never took away the flashlight before midnight. The author also cites the passion of two students, Ian and Jessica, whose own love of Harry makes July 2007 both exciting and bittersweet.

And finally, the author acknowledges the impact of CRR, whose influence prompted her to get to know Harry so well.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER		PAGE
	LIST OF TABLES.....	vi
I	INTRODUCTION.....	1
	Research Problem.....	1
	Purpose of the Study.....	2
	Definition of Terms.....	3
	References.....	5
II	LITERATURE REVIEW.....	6
	The Changing Face of Reader’s Advisory Services.....	6
	Current Trends in Reader’s Advisory.....	9
	Conclusions.....	18
	References.....	19
III	METHODOLOGY AND OBJECTIVES.....	21
	Archetypal Selection.....	21
	<i>The Innocent Embarking on a Journey and Orphan</i> .....	21
	<i>The Sage or Guardian</i> .....	25
	<i>The Friend</i> .....	25
	<i>The Sorcerer</i> .....	27
	<i>The Villain</i> .....	29
	Model Selection.....	30
	References.....	31

IV	ANALYSIS OF DATA.....	32
	<i>Inkheart</i> .....	36
	<i>The Naming</i> .....	37
	<i>The Witch's Boy</i> .....	37
	<i>The Golden Compass</i> .....	38
	<i>The Lion, the Witch, and the Wardrobe</i> .....	39
	<i>The Folk Keeper</i> .....	40
	<i>The Hollow Kingdom</i> .....	40
	<i>The Thief Lord</i> .....	41
	<i>The Ropemaker</i> .....	42
	<i>The Hobbit</i> .....	42
	References.....	44
V	ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION.....	45
	Summary.....	45
	Conclusions.....	45
	Recommendations.....	46
	REFERENCE LIST.....	49
	APPENDIX	
	READER'S ADVISORY LIST .....	52

LIST OF TABLES

	PAGE
Table 1      Acceptable Synonyms for Character Archetypes .....	33
Table 2      List of Titles .....	35

CHAPTER I  
INTRODUCTION  
Research Problem

Literary archetypes are considered by many scholars to be the staple of characterization in young adult novels. Drawing from Carl Jung's view that archetypes are images and motifs that are drawn from our collective unconsciousness, literary archetypes are often the original model after which others are patterned. Young adults are drawn to certain archetypal characters as they read, and can identify the patterns of behavior unconsciously—even sometimes without realizing it.

Today's young adult librarians are sometimes disheartened with the lackluster approach young adults take to choosing literature. Closing their eyes and blindly reaching for the novel with the brightest colors, fewest pages, or nearest location often leads to a disinterest in reading. However, many librarians have also experienced the exhilaration that young adults feel when lost in a series of books that engage and interest them.

Since 1997, millions of young adults have been caught in the momentum of the *Harry Potter* series by J. K. Rowling. Book stores and libraries alike have reported increased sales and circulation. Mainstream media has climbed on board with the release of the motion pictures and commercialization campaigns as well. But July 2007 will mark the end of Harry Potter. With the seventh and final book's release fast approaching, it is imperative that young adult librarians prepare for the wave of readers who have spent the



last nine years “filling time” between installments and who will be searching for new characters to love and with which to make friends.

But how can librarians accurately recommend works that students will respond to and enjoy? The process of creating a Reader’s Advisory program among young adults has long perplexed librarians. However, the sensational popularity of the *Harry Potter* series is due in part to the lifelike and round characters that Rowling has created. Likewise, a recommended reading program based on *Harry Potter* could be created by recognizing the archetypal characters within the novels that readers identify with and then recommending books that utilize similar archetypal characters.

#### Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to develop a reader’s advisory model based on character archetypes rather than plot elements or author identification. Assuming that many readers enjoyed a work because they identified with a character in which they recognize a part of themselves, it was reasonable to assume that young adults would enjoy works with similar characters. For example, if a student identified with the character playing *the orphan* archetypal role in a novel, librarians could recommend other books with an orphan archetypal character.

To test the feasibility of such a reading advisory strategy, the researcher wanted to use a popular novel or novel series as the basis for the model list. Recently, the *Harry Potter* series had developed a huge youth following. Therefore, the researcher identified archetypal characters that J. K. Rowling used in the *Harry Potter* series and then located similar archetypal characters in other young adult novels. Once identified, these novels were grouped together to help create a list of novels that librarians could use as

recommendations for readers who enjoyed the popular series and who are looking for additional works to devour.

There were, however, limitations to such a study. The immediate question that comes to mind is “*How do you find other archetypal characters?*” This question is valid as it is unlikely that any librarian has time to search through an infinite number of novels. To this end, the following procedures were used.

After identifying four selected archetypal characters in the selected series, *Harry Potter*, the researcher searched Bowker’s *Fiction Connection* database for novels with similar archetypes. Next, the summaries of novels appearing on the list were subjected to a search for key word synonyms. Finally, the novels were read and archetypal characters were identified. Those with archetypal characters meeting the criteria made the final recommendation list.

#### Definition of Terms

For the purposes of this study, the following definitions were used:

- *Archetypal characters* were defined broadly as stock characters that embody images related to the “deepest and most permanent aspects of people’s lives.” Popular literary archetypes include the innocent embarking on a journey, the seeker, the orphan, the caregiver, the sage, the friend, the lover, the villain, the ruler, the fool, or the magician (Donelson & Nielson, 2005). Harmon & Holman (1996) defined archetypal characters as “a character type that occurs frequently in literature, myth, religion, or folklore and is, therefore, believed to evoke profound emotions because it touches the unconscious memory and thus calls into play illogical but strong responses” (p. 39).

- *Young adults* are defined as anyone between the ages of approximately 12 to 18 and *young adult literature* is defined as anything that readers between those ages choose to read (Donelson & Nielson, 2005).
- *Reader's Advisory (RA)* is a public service initiative where the librarian guides a patron in selecting new reading material. In this study, *reader's guidance* is used interchangeably with *reader's advisory*.

## References

- Cohen, S. M. (2006, March/April). The next big “library thing”. *Public Libraries*, 45(2), 33-35.
- Donelson, K. L., & Nilsen, A. P. (2005). *Literature for today's young adults*. New York: Pearson.
- Harmon, W., & Holman, C.H. (1996). *A handbook to literature (7<sup>th</sup> ed.)*. New York: Prentice Hall.
- Kuzyk, R. (2006, February). A reader at every shelf: New tech tools and library innovations take patrons well beyond the bestsellers. *Library Journal*, 131(3), 32-35.
- May, A. K., Olesh, E., Miltenberg, A. W., & Lackner, C. P. (2000, September). A look at reader's advisory services. *Library Journal*, 125(15), 40-43.
- Ross, C. S., & Chelton, M. K. (2001, February). Reader's advisory: Matching mood and material. *Library Journal*, 126(2), 52-55.
- Sturm, B. W. (2003, December). Reader's advisory and bibliotherapy: Helping or healing? *Journal of Educational Media & Library Services*, 41(2), 171-179.
- Tenopir, C. (2006, September). Readers who like this book. *Library Journal*, 131(14), 29.

## CHAPTER II

### LITERATURE REVIEW

#### The Changing Face of Reader's Advisory Services

The importance placed on Reader's Advisory (RA) has changed as the service has spanned and developed during the past three centuries. And although most library professionals would agree with Sturm (2003) that RA is defined as the art of "helping library patrons find books to read based on their prior reading preferences," few professionals agree on how it should be done. Crowley (2005) reviewed the history of RA beginning in 1834 when a public library came into existence in Peterborough, New Hampshire. While no one can quite pinpoint when RA services became more formalized, Crowley credited the practitioners working during 1876-1920 as being the originators of the movement.

However, the emphasis placed and motivations for RA since that time period have changed time and time again. From 1920 to 1940, librarians often recommended only non-fiction books in an effort to promote their educational merit in a post World War I era (Crowley, 2005). During this time period, Crowley related, full time RA positions became available in many public libraries and the ALA, in conjunction with the Carnegie Corporation, promoted the Reading with a Purpose program which publicized "sixty-seven bibliographic essays on subjects as diverse as the sciences, the life of Christ, contemporary Europe, and African-Americans in the United States" (p. 39). These essays were used by patrons to gather recommendations for further reading until

professionals discovered that these non-personal and overwhelming topical lists did not attract individual patrons.

Crowley (2005) categorized RA services from 1940 to 1984 as lost or non-existent. As the philosophy of the country changed, libraries found themselves trying to maintain an image of professionalism that aided educational goals and community edification. Recreational reading was considered a waste of time; therefore, programs that encouraged recreation were dismissed. Chelton & Smith (2000) came to the same conclusion when they argued that “every generation of librarians defines for itself and its users what needs the profession views as important and what needs it will address. For the last few decades, librarianship has focused on meeting the information needs of its users” (p. 136). Chelton & Smith went on to cite rapidly developing technology as “accelerat[ing] and empahsiz[ing] this focus” (p. 136). With this focus so clearly defined before library professionals, it is no wonder that many fiction readers felt embarrassed to *bother* the reference desk with a question as *simple* as “Could you help me find a beach book?”

It was not until 1984 that today’s fervor for RA services reemerged. With the introduction of reading clubs and research proving the benefits of recreational reading, libraries began embracing the idea of discovering the perfect RA system to benefit their patrons. Chelton & Smith, however, argued that even today fiction was not given the proper level of appreciation in libraries. One example used to support this claim was the lack of any national fiction circulation statistics. Instead, researchers like Chelton must depend on state findings to represent national statistics. Shearer’s (1998) study in North Carolina found that “fiction constitutes 67% of all circulation in North Carolina libraries”

(p. 114) and was being used as a baseline representation for the United States. In addition, every article written about RA services resoundingly stated the same point—because of the disconnect with fiction-reading patrons for so long, there were not nearly enough resources, references, or information available to help the patron. Bookstores like Barnes & Noble, Borders, and even Amazon.com were farther along with their RA programs than the average school or public library. Shearer (1998) even contended that Blockbuster did a better job with advising.

My video rental store staff spends more time and energy on advisory service than any public library I have worked in or used on a regular basis. They also provide guides to films in a book format and a computerized guide to films. They always carefully classify films in appropriate, popular genres... The successful strategies of these stores should be adapted for libraries' print and nonprint based services.

(p. 115)

It is blatantly obvious that the profession is feeling the need to “catch up” in this area. Recent trends to redesign public libraries to look more welcoming and trendy so as to compete with local bookstores have a direct link to the need to develop keener RA strategies. Chelton & Smith, however, held great hope for the future role of RA in the public library arena.

As more and more library users turn to the Internet instead of the library to meet their informational needs, library administrators and staff are seeking areas in which the library can excel. They are looking for niche areas in which the public library can retain and expand its presence. Service to

fiction readers is one area in which many libraries feel they have the potential to excel. The question that keeps haunting many of these institutions is “how?” (p. 136)

The question of how to best offer patrons RA services continues to develop as different models are introduced, studied, dismissed, reinvented, reintroduced, restudied, and re-dismissed. By reviewing the current trends in today’s RA services, a better model from which to begin may be created.

#### Current Trends in Reader’s Advisory

The best way to summarize RA services today is to say that there are no rules or standards set in stone. Because the service is still being developed, there are numerous ideas all being put into practice. Still, three model types stand out as the norm in today’s libraries.

#### *Interview Models*

Based on the strategies universally accepted as the techniques to manage a reference interview, many libraries utilize a tweaked form of the reference interview as the mainstay of their RA services. And while the reference interview does serve as a starting point, there are many differences between the two. For example, in reader’s advisory transactions, the librarian is serving as an advisor, not an expert. There is no one right answer and therefore librarians must identify several different title possibilities for the reader. Shearer commended Duncan Smith for identifying the following steps to a reader’s advisory transaction in *Librarians Abilities to Recognize Reading Taste* (1996):

1. The advisor must elicit information about the reader’s interests.



2. The advisor must look for the similarities and links between titles and not just their uniqueness.
3. The advisor must be able to establish links between titles based on both the reader's interests and on the advisor's knowledge of titles and reader's advisory resources.
4. The advisor must be able to present identified titles and communicate how each title relates to the reader's interests. (p. 114)

In this model, librarian-advisors practice active listening as they probe into the reader's likes and dislikes by asking questions such as, "What was the last title that you read and liked?" and "What did you like about it?" Shearer (1998) quoted Joyce Saricks categorization of RA interviews as "conversations about books that may lead to suggestions for further reading" (p. 115). Shearer went on to note that, oftentimes, these interviews were "opportunit[ies] for the reader to express feelings about current reading" and the strategy "acknowledges the importance of talking with a sympathetic listener about books that have been read" (p. 115).

Unfortunately, most field research showed that library professionals were *not* administering successful RA interviews. The results of May, Olesh, Miltenberg, and Lackner's research (2000) found that most professionals could not adequately conduct a reader's guidance interview.

Staff members were often reluctant or ill-prepared to take on the responsibility of reading guidance. Formal RA interviews were not conducted—rather, selected questions were posed to elicit the reading tastes of advisees. The RA interchange

was not an in-depth process. Follow up was rarely offered, and patrons were seldom invited back to discuss the titles suggested. (p. 43)

Chelton's 2003 article *Reader's Advisory 101* also commented on the common mistakes found in RA interviews. Like May, et al. (2000), Chelton found that most librarians did not practice active listening skills like asking open ended questions and keeping eye contact, and instead, they used "the OPAC as a crutch to keep the hands busy and the eyes away from the user when the brain stops" (p. 38). Another common mistake made by librarians was that they only suggested material that he or she had read and liked. Chelton uses the analogy of a reference librarian to show how ludicrous this was.

There's a joke that says that the best reference librarian is supposed to be someone who knows nothing but can find anything. The same is true of reader's advisors. It is unacceptable to tell a user that one has not personally had breast cancer or started a business and therefore cannot or may not be able to help find information on these topics. However, such responses seem to be the norm when the same librarians are asked about books. One of the biggest myths is that a librarian must have read a book to suggest it, without resorting to any reference sources. Excusing one's own ignorance is not the same as answering a question, nor is it professional. (p. 38-39)

May, et al. (2000) addressed this mistake by re-emphasizing the need for librarians to consult reader's advisory reference sources just as they would to answer a reference question. In their study, however, they found that only 46% of approached librarians utilized any tool at all to assist patrons (p. 41). Unfortunately, many of those

advisors looked no further than their OPAC for suggestions. Because the number of sub-headings for fiction novels tends to be absurdly lower than non-fiction, this fails to be the only tool a librarian-advisor needed to help guide patrons. Sadly, only 6% of librarians checked references such as NoveList, *NY Times Book Review*, *Genreflecting*, or *What do I Read Next?* (p. 41). Also, 72% of librarians spent less than 10 minutes with a patron. The researchers concluded that “library staff dread patron requests for assistance in finding fiction to read” (p. 42).

However universal the RA interview may be becoming, it is apparent that there is still work to be done. Still, there is no end to the suggestions for what to do once the information is obtained. Assuming that the interview went well, and assuming that the reader *knew* why he or she liked certain titles, several choices still lay ahead for a librarian advisor. Ross & Chelton (2001) gathered information for fifteen years from avid readers to develop their list of five ways that avid readers choose a book for pleasure. They argued that any RA program should be designed to help readers with questions develop these same five traits within their own browsing behavior.

1. Responding to the reading experience wanted
2. Responding to the need for sources about new books
3. Responding to the elements of a book
4. Responding to the clues on the book itself
5. Responding to the cost in time or money

Ross & Chelton contended that while the statement suggested by Saricks and Brown (1997), “Tell me about a book that you’ve read and enjoyed,” was important, it was also misleading. Instead, they suggested in their first trait to discover what type of

mood the reader was in and what type of experience they were looking for. Simply put, they warned against putting readers into boxes by only suggesting to them books with so many similarities they were hard to tell apart. Instead, they suggested that “an appeal to emotion and mood... allows for groupings across genres for readers when mood trumps genre” (p. 54).

Appeal factors other than mood, however, were suggested by different scholars. Chelton (2003) listed appeal factors such as a “book’s pacing, characterization, story line, and time frame” as different ways for analyzing new titles for patrons (p. 38). Other factors mentioned in research included setting, language and genre. In Chelton & Smith’s (2000) study, participants felt that “advisors need to realize that a book’s appeal characteristics may or may not include those characteristics that are frequently referred to as literary” and that advisors should “engage in a constant process of identifying characteristics shared among readers” (p. 139). Thus, even within the interview model, there are improvements to be made and different points of view over which elements and characteristics are to be attended to.

#### *Passive Advisory Models*

Passive advisory, defined by May, et al. (2000), as “the tools by which libraries assist users in selecting fiction without direct interaction between patron and librarian” (p. 42) was definitely the most utilized model for Reader’s Advisory. Perhaps because most libraries do not have the budget to staff a full time RA specialist, or because the majority of approachable people on the library staff are paraprofessionals, both school and public libraries often utilize a variety of methods to assist readers in their choice.

#### *Genre Shelving*

Although its very suggestion can offend a classification specialist, shelving by genre is quickly becoming one of the top suggestions by RA specialists. Moyer (2005) clearly indicated that Harrell's argument in *Use of Fiction Categories* that "arranging fiction by categories is one of the easiest ways to guide patrons, especially in times of tight budget when there is not enough time to conduct a reader's advisory interview with every patron" was valid (p. 221). The idea of reorganizing an entire collection seemed a little harsh however, until results like a 36% increase in fiction circulation were reported. Then, "genrefication," as it is known, seemed a little more interesting. Moyer argued that until "OPACs, electronic reader's advisory tools, and fiction classification schemes have been developed to the point that readers are able to 'browse' genres electronically," genrefication might be the answer (p. 221). In 2006, the idea of electronic genre browsing was brought to fruition when The Reader's Advisory Online (RAO) database became available as a "Genreflecting" tool (Tenopir, 2006, p. 131). The May, et al., study (2000) showed that 89% of the libraries they visited utilized genre shelving. Allowing patrons to browse by genre, whether on the shelf or electronically, seems to be making its way to the forefront as a passive RA technique.

### *Lists*

May, et al.'s, study (2000) showed that 57% of the visited libraries displayed some type of list to help patrons select books. Lists were as simple to compile as the *New York Times Best Seller List* to a more localized version such as which books were recommended by local staff members (Nottingham, 2002). Other libraries compiled lists based on well-known readers in their community's preferences or famous actors top

picks. Finally, Ross & Chelton (2001) contended that lists should be developed that reflect emotional content such as “Bloodless Mysteries” or “Bittersweet Romances.”

### *Displays*

An alternate type of RA strategy includes the age-old practice of creating good displays. Kuzyk (2006) reminded readers that “studies show that lit displays are looked at twice as many times and twice as long as unlit ones” (p. 34). Normally considered a merchandising strategy, purposeful displays can also serve as a passive way to encourage readers to choose their own fiction books. Nottingham’s article (2002) pointed out that Recommended Title displays “equate to the bakery aroma at the grocery store” (p. 337). Similarly, many chain bookstores such as Barnes & Noble and Borders have also implemented this strategy.

### *Social Networks & Blogs*

Another type of passive RA strategy is Internet based. Steven Cohen (2006) reported that Library Thing, a new type of user-based cataloging, “incorporates social interactions, book recommendations, self-classification, and monitoring of new books” (p. 33). The power to the people cataloging that it allows makes Library Thing “the ultimate social tool for readers. For those that like to receive book suggestions from others, LT is the place to not only get those recommendations, but to meet others with similar reading tastes as well” (p. 34).

In addition to social networking, blogs are another up and coming device used by libraries to help patrons find new reading material. Kuzyk (2006) claimed that these free blogs can be used to “alert patrons to new materials, post lists of upcoming titles, and call

attention to undiscovered classics” (p. 33). In short, the maximum number of patrons is affected by a single entry.

### *Book Groups*

Finally, book groups can serve as an excellent way to passively guide patrons. May, et al., (2000) found that only 20% of the libraries that they visited provided some sort of book discussion group, but many libraries implemented this tool with much success. Kuzyk (2006) reported on the success of a library that instituted a “Gab Bag” program where “multiple copies of literary titles were prepackaged into totes that can be checked out by group members for up to twice the standard three-week circulation period” (p. 34). Regularly, members met to discuss books from the gab bags.

### *Form Based Models*

Because many libraries are striving to do more than passively guide and yet cannot dedicate the staff needed to run an interview RA model, many libraries have settled somewhere in the middle with a form based model. Hollands (2006) took the lead in this method of inquiry by first debunking some of the assumptions made when working solely with an interview system. He considered the following assumptions faulty:

1. Readers will approach librarians with RA questions.
2. The person approached with an RA question will be the right person for the job.
3. Enough information is obtained in an interview to provide good RA service.
4. Quality RA service is possible, given the time constraints of library encounters.

5. Resources needed by reader's advisors are easy to use in face-to-face discussion.
6. Face-to-face RA encounters are documented sufficiently to support follow up. (p. 206-208)

Following this debunking, Hollands argued that the initial contact with readers should be form based. His form based Reader's Advisory plan had six steps.

1. Assembling and training an RA team
2. Designing a form
3. Delivering the form to readers
4. Receiving completed forms and routing them to the advisors
5. Responding to the forms
6. Documenting the transaction and following up (p. 208-211)

Hollands' (2006) argument that "a form is a noninvasive way to use shared terminology to obtain a profile of new readers" (p. 211) is not without substantiation. Readers involved with this program at his library reported a 4.79 overall satisfaction out of 5. In addition, readers reported a 4.39 rated satisfaction level with the recommended books. Holland's library was not the only one that experimented with a form based approach. Nottingham's Ohio branch library also reported success with the strategy. The library "offers customers a personalized reading list with annotations" for every patron who fills out an inquiry sheet (p. 338). Forms were available at the fiction area and circulation desk and patrons received their personalized recommendations within a week.



## Conclusions

Despite the different options for Reader's Advisory services, libraries have realized that they need to be focusing on how to increase patron satisfaction with fiction titles. While no one model has become the subscribed to method, librarians are anxious to identify a model that can be used both quickly and realistically. Whether a model utilizes mood, genre, author, plot, or some other device as a base for recommendations, the field is still open for ideas on how to find books that patrons identify with.

## References

- Booth, H. (2005, January/February). RA for YA: Tailoring the readers' advisory interview to the needs of the young adult patrons. *Public Libraries*, 44(1), 33-36.
- Chelton, M. K. (1999, January/February). What we know and what we don't know about reading, readers, and readers advisory services. *Public Libraries*, 38(1), 42-47.
- Chelton, M. K. (2003, November). Readers' advisory 101. *Library Journal*, 128(18), 38-39.
- Chelton, M. K., & Smith, D. (2000, Winter). Talking with readers: A competency based approach to readers' advisory service. *Reference & User Services Quarterly*, 40(2), 135-142.
- Cohen, S. M. (2006, March/April). The next big "library thing". *Public Libraries*, 45(2), 33-35.
- Committees of RUSA. (2004, Summer). Recommended readers' advisory tools. *Reference & Users Quarterly*, 43(4), 294-305.
- Crowley, B. (2005, January/February). Rediscovering the history of readers' advisory service. *Public Libraries*, 44(1), 37-41.
- Donelson, K. L., & Nilsen, A. P. (2005). *Literature for today's young adults*. New York: Pearson.
- Hollands, N. (2006, Spring). Improving the model for interactive readers' advisory service. *Reference & User Services Quarterly*, 45(3), 205-212.
- Kuzyk, R. (2006, February). A reader at every shelf: New tech tools and library innovations take patrons well beyond the bestsellers. *Library Journal*, 131(3), 32-35.
- May, A. K., Olesh, E., Miltenberg, A. W., & Lackner, C. P. (2000, September). A look at reader's advisory services. *Library Journal*, 125(15), 40-43.
- Moyer, J. E. (2005, Spring). Adult fiction reading: A literature review of readers' advisory services, adult fiction librarianship, and fiction readers. *Reference & User Services Quarterly*, 44(3), 220-231.
- Nottingham, J. (2002, Summer). Doing it right: A readers' advisory program. *Reference & User Services Quarterly*, 41(4), 335-339.

- Ross, C. S., & Chelton, M. K. (2001, February). Reader's advisory: Matching mood and material. *Library Journal*, 126(2), 52-55.
- Shearer, K. (1998, Fall). Readers' advisory services: New attention to a core business of the public library. *North Carolina Libraries*, 56(3), 114-116.
- Sturm, B. W. (2003, December). Reader's advisory and bibliotherapy: Helping or healing? *Journal of Educational Media & Library Services*, 41(2), 171-179.
- Tenopir, C. (2006, September). Readers who like this book. *Library Journal*, 131(14), 29.

CHAPTER III  
METHODOLOGY AND OBJECTIVES

Archetypal Selection

This study employed content analysis as its standard methodology. After identifying several archetypal character types that appeared in a popular young adult fiction title, a methodology was designed to choose additional young adult materials to analyze for similar archetypal characters. The popular fiction series, *Harry Potter*, by J. K. Rowling, was analyzed for character archetypes. The following five archetypes were identified using Donelson and Nilsen's *Literature for Today's Young Adults*— the innocent embarking on a journey, the sage, the friend, the sorcerer, and the villain. Each of the archetypes was foundational to the plot of the series and could be used to help identify other similar works of literature that patrons may want to read.

*The Innocent Embarking on a Journey and Orphan*

According to Donelson and Nilsen, the most archetypal of all story characters was the innocent embarking on a journey. J. K Rowling's series about a young boy named Harry Potter was based on this, the most common of archetypes. Harry could also be classified as fitting the archetypal role of orphan, and the direction of the series showed Harry's orphan status as a major contributing factor to his innocence and journey. Specifically, researchers Donelson and Nilsen said this about the innocent archetypal story,

It begins with a young person setting out either willingly or unwillingly... on a journey or quest and meeting frightening and terrible challenges. After proving his or her worth, the young person receives help from divine or unexpected sources. (p. 99)

It is important to note that this archetypal analysis held strong when the researcher looked at individual plots within books in the series, as well as the series overall. For example, in the first novel, *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone*, Harry willingly took on the task of protecting the stone from Voldemort. Likewise, in the second novel, he willingly risked his life to face the horrors within the Chamber of Secrets so as to rescue his best friend's sister. It was not until the fourth novel, *Harry Potter and the Goblet of Fire* that Harry took on a challenge against his will. Entered into the Tri-Wizard tournament without his knowledge, Voldemort manipulated conditions so as to try and end Harry's life. The fifth novel also showed Voldemort's manipulation when Harry unknowingly but willingly flew into a trap to rescue his godfather. Finally, in the sixth novel, Harry was once again in control of his own destiny. Upon coming to a full understanding of where Voldemort was drawing his power, Harry asked to accompany Dumbledore to destroy the Horcrux—despite the danger. These six independent stories, however, were just individual scenes in the larger picture. It is during the fifth and sixth books that it became clear how archetypal the character of Harry really was.

The revelation of the prophecy in book five, *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix* showed how clearly Harry was playing the role of the innocent embarking on a journey:

THE ONE WITH THE POWER TO VANQUISH THE DARK LORD  
APPROACHES... BORN TO THOSE WHO HAVE THRICE DEFIED HIM,  
BORN AS THE SEVENTH MONTH DIES...AND THE DARK LORD WILL  
MARK HIM AS HIS EQUAL, BUT HE WILL HAVE POWER THE DARK  
LORD KNOWS NOT... AND EITHER MUST DIE AT THE HANDS OF THE  
OTHER FOR NEITHER CAN LIVE WHILE THE OTHER SURVIVES... (p.  
841).

With this prophecy came the knowledge that Harry's life had been predestined since before he was born. The idea of playing a predestined role plainly showed the activities of the first four books in a different light. The prophecy lent credence to the idea that those activities were clearly designed to prepare him for his eventual role. Still, Dumbledore, in book six, *Harry Potter and the Half-Blood Prince*, tried to convince Harry that he was still in charge of his own destiny. When Harry questioned whether he really had any choice in whether to try and eliminate Voldemort, Dumbledore replied, "Of course you've got to! But not because of the prophecy! Because, you, yourself, will never rest a moment until you've tried!"

It is the realization that Harry *wanted* to kill Voldemort that sets him free from the prophecy. Rowling wrapped the issue up with Harry's thoughts:

But he understood at last what Dumbledore had been trying to tell him. It was, he thought, the difference between being dragged into the arena to face a battle to the death and walking into the arena with your head held high. Some people, perhaps, would say that there was little to choose between the two ways, but Dumbledore

knew—and so do I, thought Harry, with a rush of fierce pride, *and so did my parents*— that there was all the difference in the world. (p. 512)

Regardless, however, of how willingly Harry took on the journey, it is clear that his entire life, including the death of his parents, had been preparing him for this final task of destroying Voldemort.

There are additional requirements of ‘the innocent’ archetype that Harry met.

Donelson and Nilsen note this:

“A distinguishing feature of such romances is the happy ending achieved only after the hero’s worth is proven through a crisis or an ordeal. Usually as part of the ordeal the hero must make a sacrifice, be wounded, or leave some part of his or her body, even if it is only sweat or tears. The real loss is that of innocence, but is it usually symbolized by a physical loss...” (p. 102)

Harry’s life journey had been marked with loss and sacrifice. Orphaned as an infant, Harry’s first experience of loss was perhaps his most painful—the loss of his parents. In the first book of the series, Harry left behind his friends, Ron and Hermione, to travel into the last chamber alone. In the second book he was impaled by the serpent’s tooth and was only saved by the phoenix’s tears. Later, in the third book, he lost his godfather to society. In book four, however, the losses became more significant. Captured by Voldemort, Harry lost his blood to Wormtail which, in effect, helped Voldemort regain power. In the fifth and sixth books he suffered a crushing loss with the loss of Sirius and Dumbledore, his mentors and pseudo-parents. Finally, in the sixth book, Harry suffered an emotional loss when he ended his relationship with Ginny Wesley to protect her from being used by Voldemort and had to pay a “tribute of blood” to the archway protecting a

Horcrux (p. 578). Though substantial, these losses were only symbols of the innocence Harry had lost between the ages of eleven and sixteen.

### *The Sage or Guardian*

Sages, Donelson and Nilsen noted, are known for giving spiritual, emotional, and intellectual care. Sages often question and lead the innocent archetypal figure. More importantly, they must be “wise enough to realize that people cannot search for just one truth, but instead must understand a multiplicity of truths” (p. 104). Psychological researchers, like Carl Jung and Joseph Campbell, referred to this archetype as the mentor. Without doubt, J. K. Rowling set up the character of Dumbledore as a mentor to young Harry throughout the series.

From the first chapter of the first book to the last chapter of the sixth, Dumbledore guided Harry through the trials of growing up parentless. Throughout the novels, Dumbledore gave fatherly advice like, “It does not do well to dwell on dreams and forget to live” (p. 214). In *Chamber of Secrets* Harry called on Fawkes for help when showing great loyalty to Dumbledore (p. 332). Then, in *Harry Potter and the Half Blood Prince*, Dumbledore’s death shook Harry to the core. Harry came to realize that the “people who cared about him had stood in front of him one by one, his mother, his father, his godfather, and finally Dumbledore, all determined to protect him” (p. 645). The death of Harry’s sage, Dumbledore, served as the final loss of innocence that Harry must endure before facing Voldemort in book seven.

### *The Friend*

Donelson and Nilsen noted that the archetypal image of friendship spans the generations starting with the story of friendship between Jonathon and David in the Old



Testament. Today, popular television shows like *Friends* show that the archetypal image is still ingrained in society. Perhaps prevalent because of the adolescents' intense need to be part of something bigger than themselves, J. K. Rowling also uses this archetypal image for two of the most central characters in the story.

Ron Weasley and Hermione Granger fulfilled the friend archetype in the *Harry Potter* series. After fighting off the giant ogre in book one, the trio worked as a team to overcome evil time and time again. Whether it was facing the Ministry of Magic, school bullies, evil teachers, or Voldemort himself, the three teens were inseparable throughout the series. Of most interest, however, was the ending of book six in the series. As Harry was dealing with the loss of his mentor, Dumbledore, and his decision to leave behind his first love, Ginny, he decided to also abandon Ron and Hermione.

“We’ll be there Harry,” said Ron.

“What?”

“At your aunt and uncle’s house,” said Ron. “And then we’ll go with you wherever you are going.”

“No—” said Harry quickly; he had not counted on this, he had meant for them to understand that he was undertaking this most dangerous journey alone.

“You said to us once before,” said Hermione quietly, “that there was time to turn back if we wanted to. We’ve had time, haven’t we?”

“We’re with you whatever happens,” said Ron. (p. 651)

Despite Harry’s protests, he cannot help but to have appreciated the deep rooted friendship that was evident in his friends’ decisions. The sixth novel closed with the thoughts of Harry about this archetypal friendship—

In spite of everything, in spite of the dark and twisting path he saw stretching ahead for himself, in spite of the final meeting with Voldemort he knew must come, whether in a month, in a year, or in ten, he felt his heart lift at the thought that there was still one more golden day of peace left to enjoy with Ron and Hermione. (p. 652)

### *The Sorcerer*

Donelson and Nilsen also made reference to the archetype of magician, or sorcerer. Sorcerers, as identified by Donelson and Nielsen, “appear in stories of fantasy where authors create a make-believe world with no explanation of how the magic works” (p. 108). Often characters that lead, sorcerers can be found in single doses, or all over a work of fiction. In J. K. Rowling’s series, *Harry Potter*, sorcery was found everywhere. In fact, only five main characters did not possess some sort of ability to work magic. Although there are sorcerers throughout the works, the roles of archetypal sorcerers that lead were played by the staff of Hogwarts School.

The staff at Hogwarts, under the guardianship of Albus Dumbledore, practiced the noble art of teaching, and of passing their magical knowledge on to students. Professors like McGonagall, Snape, Flitwick, and Sprout taught lessons in transfiguration, potions, charms, and herbology, respectively. Each of these professors regarded their subject as an art, and held the students to high standards. On the first day of class in *The Sorcerer’s Stone*, Professor McGonagall delivered a warning to the class, “Transfiguration is some of the most complex and dangerous magic you will learn at Hogwarts... Anyone messing around in my class will leave and not come back. You have been warned” (p. 134).

In addition to setting high standards, most of the teachers possessed an intense passion for the magical subject that they taught. Professor Snape's introduction to the class in *The Sorcerer's Stone* included the following speech,

You are here to learn the subtle science and exact art of potion making... As there is little foolish wand-waving here, many of you will hardly believe this is magic. I don't expect you will really understand the beauty of the softly simmering cauldron with its shimmering fumes, the delicate power of liquids that creep through human veins, bewitching the mind, ensnaring the senses... I can teach you how to bottle fame, brew glory, even stopper death... (p. 136-137)

Snape's speech demonstrated his intense love for his subject and his desire to pass on the information to willing and able pupils. As the students got older and continued to increase in their abilities, Snape continued to challenge them with complicated material. In their fifth year, students prepared to take O.W.L. exams, or Ordinary Wizarding Level exams. Snape reminded them that he "take[s] only the very best into" his N.E.W.T. Potions class for their sixth and seventh years.

Finally, the staff at Hogwarts School of Witchcraft and Wizardry protected the students with their magic until the students were old enough to protect themselves. In *The Sorcerer's Stone*, the staff of Hogwarts defended their students from a wayward troll. In *The Chamber of Secrets* and *The Prisoner of Azkaban*, the staff performed security sweeps and kept watch for uninvited intruders that wished the students harm. Finally, in *The Order of the Phoenix* and *The Half-Blood Prince*, staff members rushed off to the Ministry of Magic or to the Hogwarts castle hallways to battle the Death Eaters bent on killing students and staff alike. Because of these three elements—the staff's love of their

magical subject, the staff's ability to pass this magical subject on, and the staff's desire to protect their students—the staff of Hogwarts School of Witchcraft and Wizardry lead in a way that defined them as archetypal sorcerers.

### *The Villain*

While the other mentioned archetypes are considered either protagonists or supporters of the protagonist, there was also an antagonistic archetypal character to be identified. Villains, as identified by Donelson and Nilsen, are strong characters “who will stand up and fight” (p. 106). Interestingly enough, the archetypal villain is only considered such because they choose to side with evil. The same character, siding with good, is considered to be an archetypal superhero or warrior. In J. K. Rowling's *Harry Potter* series, Voldemort was the archetypal villain. Known as “He-Who-Must-Not-Be-Named” by frightened wizards everywhere, Voldemort was feared for merciless murders as well as encouraging unbelievable torture. Even his appearance made him seem villainous. He was described as being “whiter than a skull, with wide, livid scarlet eyes and a nose that was flat as a snake's with slits for nostrils” in *Goblet of Fire* (p. 643). His intelligence and skill were not questioned, however. In the very first book, Ollivander, the famous wand maker, said of Voldemort, “He-Who-Must-Not-Be-Named did great things—terrible, yes, but great” (p. 85) and Professor Dumbledore acknowledged that “Voldemort [has] powers that [he] will never have” (p. 11). Still, with the knowledge that Voldemort had the opportunity to be a hero or warrior, it was his intention to remain alone and his desire for more power that corrupted him.

## Model Selection

It was the purpose of this study to create a reader's advisory model based on character archetypes. Of the five identified archetypes previously discussed four were selected to be used as a basis for recommending other fiction stories to students who name *Harry Potter* as their favorite series and who are looking for a new reading challenge. The fifth term, friend, was not used because it was too broad to find helpful synonyms that could help to narrow the choices.

In order to identify other novels with similar archetypes, Bowker's *Fiction Connection* database was consulted. Beginning with the *Harry Potter* series, the researcher searched Bowker's for the archetypal words used by the database. Then, the researcher performed searches to identify other young adult novels that might have similar archetypal structure. After choosing ten novels, they were read and analyzed. Those findings are discussed in Chapter IV.

## References

- Donelson, K. L., & Nilsen, A. P. (2005). *Literature for today's young adults*. New York: Pearson.
- Rowling, J. K. (1997). *Harry Potter and the sorcerer's stone*. New York: Scholastic.
- Rowling, J. K. (1999). *Harry Potter and the chamber of secrets*. New York: Scholastic.
- Rowling, J. K. (1999). *Harry Potter and the prisoner of Azkaban*. New York: Scholastic.
- Rowling, J. K. (2000). *Harry Potter and the goblet of fire*. New York: Scholastic.
- Rowling, J. K. (2003). *Harry Potter and the order of the phoenix*. New York: Scholastic.
- Rowling, J. K. (2005). *Harry Potter and the half blood prince*. New York: Scholastic.

## CHAPTER IV

### ANALYSIS OF DATA

Librarians rarely have the time or desire to read every book in the library. Therefore, if character archetypes are to be used as the basis for a reading guidance program, it becomes imperative to develop a quick system for identifying the archetypal characters found within a novel. One valuable time saving tool could be *Fiction Connection*, an online fiction advisory tool provided by Bowker. For the purposes of this study, it was desirable to utilize *Fiction Connection* to view the summaries, awards won, main characters, and character traits associated with young adult novels published in the United States.

The first step, after identifying four character archetypes in the *Harry Potter* series, was to log into *Fiction Connection* and search for the *Harry Potter* novels. Upon finding one, the entry was analyzed for the keywords the database was using to describe the four archetypes previously identified in Chapter III of this study. The following keywords were identified: orphan, evil, sorcerer, and guardian. Because these four words have many synonyms, a chart was created to list acceptable synonyms (see Table 1).

<b>Table 1: Acceptable Synonyms for Character Archetypes</b>			
<b>Orphan</b>	<b>Evil</b>	<b>Sorcerer</b>	<b>Guardian</b>
Abandoned	Villain	Wizard	Friend
Motherless	Enemy	Magician	Protector
Innocent	Dark	Witch	Guard
Alone	Nemesis	Magic	Guide

Using these keyword synonyms, the *Fiction Connection* database was then searched using a number of combinations. For example, when the word *orphan* was put into the database, more than 2,000 hits were recorded. Narrowing these results to those that also included the word *magic* brought the results down to 294. Adding a filter to exclude all but young adult novels resulted in a list of 20 novels. Finally, only novels that had received a distinguished award or recognition were considered. The list of 20 fell to four (and two of these were from the *Harry Potter* series). By systematically continuing to combine the identified synonyms from Table 1, i.e. *orphan* and *evil*, *orphan* and *guardian*, *wizard* and *nemesis*, a list of 32 novels was compiled. By highlighting the targeted words within each novel summary, reviews, and details sections, the list was narrowed to only those novels containing two or more of the keywords or synonyms from Table 1. From there, the summaries of the novels were used to determine the ten novels that were deemed by the researcher to be likely to include the four character archetypes.

The ten novels that were analyzed for this study are listed in Table 2 along with the archetype that the *Fiction Connection* pre-search identified. After reading the novels and reviewing the results, each novel was analyzed to see if the archetypes actually



existed in patterns similar to the *Harry Potter* series. Each of the novels is discussed in the following section.

<b>Table 2: List of Titles</b>			
<i>Title</i>	<i>Author</i>	<i>Awards or Recognition</i>	<i>Archetype Keywords</i>
<i>Inkheart</i>	Cornelia Funke	<i>Publisher's Weekly</i> Best Books of the Year, <i>School Library Journal</i> Review, <i>Booklist</i> Review, ALA Notable Books for Children	orphan, evil, sorcerer
<i>The Naming</i>	Alison Croggon	<i>School Library Journal</i> Starred Review, <i>Booklist</i> Review	orphan, evil, sorcerer, guardian
<i>The Witch's Boy</i>	Michael Gruber	<i>School Library Journal</i> Starred Review, ALA Notable Books for Children	orphan, sorcerer
<i>The Golden Compass</i>	Phillip Pullman	Carnegie Medal, <i>Publisher's Weekly</i> Best Books of the Year	orphan, evil
<i>The Lion, the Witch, and the Wardrobe</i>	C.S. Lewis	<i>School Library Journal</i> Review <i>Horn Book</i> Review	orphan, evil, sorcerer, guardian
<i>The Folk Keeper</i>	Franny Billingsley	<i>Publisher's Weekly</i> Best Books of the Year	orphan, sorcerer
<i>The Hollow Kingdom</i>	Clare B. Dunkle	Mythopoeic Fantasy Award for Children's Literature	orphan, sorcerer, evil
<i>The Thief Lord</i>	Cornelia Funke	Mythopoeic Fantasy Award for Children's Literature	orphan, evil, sorcerer, guardian
<i>The Ropemaker</i>	Peter Dickinson	Carnegie Medal, Michael L. Printz Award	orphan, evil, sorcerer, guardian
<i>The Hobbit</i>	J.R.R. Tolkien	<i>Publisher's Weekly</i> Review, <i>Horn Book</i> Review	evil, sorcerer, guardian

## *Inkheart*

Information provided by Bowker's *Fiction Connection* indicated that Cornelia Funke's 2003 novel, *Inkheart*, would be a likely place to begin looking for archetypes similar to those found in Rowling's famous series. *Fiction Connection* suggested that it would include an orphan (like Harry), a villain (like Voldemort), and a sorcerer (like Dumbledore) (see Table 2). The researcher found that these suggestions were valid and accurate. Within a few chapters, Meggie, the twelve year old protagonist, was without both her father and mother. Although eventually reunited, many of the most interesting parts of the book took place when Meggie was responsible for herself and her own actions. Perhaps not a "technical" orphan, the absence of her mother and the kidnapping of her father leave her alone often enough to wear the honorary title of orphan. Next, the novel revealed several villains worthy of the word evil. Capricorn, the lead scoundrel, was surrounded by a band of henchmen and rogues almost as corrupt as himself. Murder, torture, arson, and thievery were merely the tools Capricorn uses to control people by instilling terror. Finally, *Inkheart* was analyzed for the sorcerer archetype. That role was filled by the character of Mo, Meggie's father who found he could read characters out of books and into the real world. Different than Dumbledore, Mo's power was limited to this one "trick," and thereby limits his effectiveness as a sorcerer archetype. Still, the very basics of the archetype were there as other characters name him Silvertongue and respond to him as a man full of magic. Overall, Funke's *Inkheart* did contain three characters that filled the archetypal roles of orphan, villain, and sorcerer, and thereby qualified as one with many archetypal similarities to Rowling's *Harry Potter* series.

### *The Naming*

Alison Croggon's 2002 novel, *The Naming*, included all four of the archetypes identified in the *Harry Potter* series (see Table 2). Maerad, orphaned at age seven, was raised as a slave in the land of Gilman's Cot and lead a life threatened by not only drudgery, but by drunken men and beatings. Her existence was akin to Harry's life with the Dursley's until a mysterious guardian, Cadvan, rescued her and began to train her in the ways of the Light. Cadvan was reminiscent of Albus Dumbledore in his ability to both praise Maerad for good work and admonish the teen for her sometimes self-indulgent behavior. As Maerad and Cadvan travel, she was able to see more of the sorcery and magic that she aspired to in characters such as Malgorn, Silvia, Saliman, and Nelac. Finally, Maerad was introduced to the evil doings of the Black Bards, or Hulls, who seek to destroy Maerad and serve the Nameless One. Croggon's *The Naming* was only the first in a quartet, and the storyline follows the epic pattern of Tolkien and Rowling. Overall, Croggon's *The Naming* did contain the four archetypal roles of orphan, villain, sorcerer, and guardian and thereby qualified as one with many archetypal similarities to Rowling's *Harry Potter* series.

### *The Witch's Boy*

The search of *Fiction Connection* database listed Michael Gruber's *The Witch's Boy* as one of the novels with similar archetypal roles as *Harry Potter*. The search records showed that the roles of orphan and sorcerer were portrayed in the novel (see Table 2). While this was technically accurate, the archetypal roles were noticeably different than those found in Rowling's series. Lump, the orphaned child with freakish features was raised by the woman, a witch with no name, and a talking bear named Ysul. The story

wove together characters from famous fairy tales, but the magic involved was more fantastical than realistic. Lump, unlike Harry, never had access to the magic his step mother possessed, and instead, lived only in her shadow trying to figure out who he was and wanted to be. Because the story was Lump's, the magic was always a tertiary issue, not a primary focus. Overall, Gruber's *The Witch's Boy* did contain an archetypal orphan and sorcerer, but there were not enough similarities between the roles found in Rowling's *Harry Potter* series to qualify it as a successful match.

#### *The Golden Compass*

Phillip Pullman's 1995 novel *The Golden Compass* matched the character archetypes of orphan and evil from the *Harry Potter* series (see Table 2). *Fiction Connection* indicated that the novel would have a villain, like Voldemort, and an orphan, like Harry, to drive the plot forward. These indications were correct. The novel sets forth both Lord Asriel and Mrs. Coulter as evil villains who put their own interests above others' well being. Kidnapping children to slice away their daemons, or souls, and leaving the children for dead showed action worthy of Rowling's evil Lord Voldemort. The protagonist, Lyra Belacqua, an orphan since birth, used her adventurous and independent spirit to fight back against these evils. Quite like Harry in many ways, Lyra explored the areas around her with as much ferocity as Harry explored the halls of Hogwarts. Although there were major differences between the two stories, the characters had very similar dispositions. Overall, Pullman's *The Golden Compass* did contain two characters that filled the archetypal roles of orphan and villain and thereby qualified as a novel with archetypal similarities to Rowling's *Harry Potter* series.

### *The Lion, the Witch, and the Wardrobe*

C.S. Lewis' *The Lion, the Witch, and the Wardrobe* was also marked by Bowker's *Fiction Connection* as a novel that included all four of the same archetypal characters as the *Harry Potter* series (see Table 2). To begin, the four Pevensie children, Peter, Edmund, Susan, and Lucy, were practically orphaned when they were sent to the country during the WWII air-raids on London. While their parents were still alive and well, Peter remarked that their temporary home was "the sort of house where no one's going to mind what [they] do." This new found independence essentially made them orphans. Next, the Bowker database indicated that there would be a sense of evil in the book. The villain, the White Witch, used trickery, deceit, kidnapping, and murder as a means to her end. Much like Rowling's Voldemort, the White Witch surrounded herself with evil henchman whom she cared little for but who did her bidding. A third archetype, the sorcerer, was found in the novel on a smaller scale. The White Witch had the power to turn enemies to stone, while Lucy possessed the potion to heal. While no one ran around casting spells, the book did contain an underlying theme of magic. Finally, the archetypal role of guardian was played by the lion Aslan. Stepping in when needed and then disappearing for years on end, Aslan sacrificed himself for Edmund and protected the children (as well as the country) from the evil witch much like Dumbledore. Overall, Lewis's *The Lion, the Witch, and the Wardrobe* did contain four characters that filled the archetypal roles of orphan, villain, sorcerer, and guardian and thereby qualified as one with many archetypal similarities to Rowling's *Harry Potter* series.

### *The Folk Keeper*

According to *Fiction Connection*, Franny Billingsley's 1999 novel, *The Folk Keeper*, included the archetypes of orphan and sorcerer (see Table 2). Once again, *Fiction Connection* seemed to be accurate in these descriptions. Corinna Stonewall, parentless, penniless, and pushed from one orphanage to another, showed the independent streak that many archetypal orphans demonstrate. Her determination to carry her own bags, find her own way, and solve her own mysteries resounded with the independent streak of Harry Potter and friends throughout the series. The taming of her power as well as the discovery of her family's magical past also made her an archetypal sorcerer. However, like Mo in *Inkheart*, Corinna's limited power made her less like the sorcerer's in Rowling's series and much more like a one dimensional witch with limited abilities. While *The Folk Keeper* included two of the basic archetypes found in the *Harry Potter* series, the roles were so different that the similarities were barely recognizable. Overall, Billingsley's *The Folk Keeper* did contain an archetypal orphan and sorcerer, but there were not enough similarities between the roles found in Rowling's *Harry Potter* series to qualify it as a successful match.

### *The Hollow Kingdom*

The 2003 novel by Clare B. Dunkle, *The Hollow Kingdom*, contained the three archetypes of orphan, sorcerer, and evil villain (see Table 2). Orphans Kate and Emily came to the Hallow Hill estate to stay with a cousin until they came of age. Like many archetypal orphans, the girls were independent and adventurous, as seen by their exploration of the forest and land around the estate. These adventures led them to Marak, the goblin King who played the role of the powerful sorcerer. He wielded his power over

the girls to force one into marriage, and yet, his character was not the evil villain. Instead, the introduction of the evil sorcerer that threatened the Goblin Kingdom united the girls and the goblins into action. Although the plot was very different, the characters in *The Hollow Kingdom* can certainly be considered to be cut from the same archetypal cloth as those of J. K. Rowling's stories. Overall, Dunkle's *The Hollow Kingdom* did contain three characters that filled the archetypal roles of orphan, villain, and sorcerer and thereby qualified as one with many archetypal similarities to Rowling's *Harry Potter* series.

#### *The Thief Lord*

Cornelia Funke's *The Thief Lord* was another novel identified as having similar archetypal characteristics to Rowling's works because of its inclusion of orphans, evil, sorcery, and a guardian (see Table 2). Prosper and Bo, two orphans running away from their aunt and uncle, wandered into a group of street children who acted like a family and who were cared for by a child guardian known as the Thief Lord. The evil Barbarossa took advantage of the children whenever possible and played the pirate of their innocence. Magic entered the story briefly at the end when a magical merry-go-round reversed the aging process and reduced the man Barbarossa to a young child. *The Thief Lord* included the archetypal characters included in *The Harry Potter* series, but utilized them so differently that the average reader may not make cross-genre connections between the characters. Still, overall, Funke's *The Thief Lord* did contain an archetypal orphan, evil villain, guardian, and sorcerer, and the inclusion of these archetypes qualified it as a successful match to Rowling's *Harry Potter* series.



### *The Ropemaker*

*Fiction Connection* identified Peter Dickinson's 2001 fantasy novel *The Ropemaker* as including the archetypes of orphan, evil, guardian, and sorcerer (see Table 2). First, while Tilja did set forth on a journey without her parents, her parents remained safe in the valley, and she traveled with her grandmother and two others from her village. This technically did not qualify her for orphanhood. However, there were several key times during the story when Tilja's powers marked her as an independent soul and apart from the care of others. Next, the evil Empire's magicians, or watchers, ruled the empire with a cruelty and power similar to Voldemort's, even forcing the people of the empire to pay a fee for permission to die without penalty to their families. As Tilja worked to overthrow this system and save the Valley, Ramdatta, the Ropemaker, served as her guardian, first rescuing her from bandits, then helping her disguise, and finally, assisting her in overthrowing the last of the evil Watchers, Moonfist. Throughout the novel, different characters influenced Tilja as she tried to understand the magic she possessed. Specifically, Faheel played the role of the sorcerer archetype as he helped to right everything in the kingdom that had gone so wrong. Overall, Dickinson's *The Ropemaker* did contain four characters that filled the archetypal roles of orphan, villain, sorcerer, and guardian and thereby qualified as a novel with many archetypal similarities to Rowling's *Harry Potter* series.

### *The Hobbit*

J.R.R. Tolkien's *The Hobbit* was recommended by *Fiction Connection* as having archetypal similarities to the *Harry Potter* series because of the evil, sorcerer, and guardian characters (see Table 2). After reading the novel, Bowker's *Fiction Connection*

database description was correct. The archetypal roles of villain were played by characters such as the Great Goblin, the giant spiders, the dragon Smaug, and Gollum. However, unlike Voldemort, the villain in Rowling's series, these characters were mere obstacles along a journey instead of constant presences. Both the roles of sorcerer and guardian were played by Gandalf, the wizard who accompanies the company on their journey. Gandalf's magic, like the magic of Dumbledore, was often not explained and typically saved the group from certain disaster. However, unlike the *Harry Potter* series, Gandalf was the only representative of the wizarding world within the story. Other characters were helpless to follow suit. Overall, Tolkien's *The Hobbit* did contain three characters that filled the archetypal roles of villain, sorcerer, and guardian and thereby qualified as one with many archetypal similarities to Rowling's *Harry Potter* series.

## References

- Billingsley, F. (1999). *The folk keeper*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Croggon, A. (2002). *The naming*. Pellinor. Cambridge, MA: Candlewick Press.
- Dickinson, P. (2001). *The ropemaker*. New York: Delacorte Press.
- Dunkle, C. B. (2003). *The hollow kingdom*. New York: Henry Holt.
- Funke, C. (2003). *Inkheart*. New York: Scholastic.
- Funke, C. (2005). *The thief lord*. New York: Scholastic.
- Gruber, M. (2005). *The witch's boy*. New York: Harper Collins.
- Lewis, C. (1950). *The lion, the witch, and the wardrobe*. The chronicles of Narnia. New York: Harper Collins.
- Pullman, P. (1995). *The golden compass*. New York: Yearling.
- Tolkien, J. (1937). *The hobbit*. New York: Ballantine Books.

## CHAPTER V

### ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

#### Summary

The purpose of this study was to develop and test a method of Reader's Advisory based on archetypal character analysis in place of genre, author, or mood advisory. The study used J. K. Rowling's popular *Harry Potter* fiction series as a base for developing this strategy. After identifying the character archetypes in the *Harry Potter* series, the researcher consulted Bowker's *Fiction Connection* database to find other award winning young adult fiction that contained at least two of the archetypes identified in the *Harry Potter* series. Upon identifying ten novels that fit the criteria, the researcher read and analyzed each of the novels to see if they did, indeed, contain archetypes similar to ones found in the Rowling series.

#### Conclusions

The information gathered from a content analysis of the ten novels demonstrated an 80% success rate in the Reader's Advisory methodology. Eight out of the ten novels did contain the archetypal characters that the *Fiction Connection* database indicated would be present in a way that was comparable or similar to the novels of J. K. Rowling's famous series. The two novels that did not qualify, Gruber's *The Witch's Boy*, and Billingsley's *The Folk Keeper*, failed because the archetypes did not exist in a similar way as the favorite characters in the *Harry Potter* series. However, both *The Witch's Boy* and *The Folk Keeper* made the trial list with only two identified archetypes. If the

minimum number of matching archetypes were defined as three instead of two, 100% of the selected novels would have met the criteria.

Even at 80%, however, the method can be hailed a success. Reader's Advisory will never be an exact science because it is based on the desires, moods, and whims of the patron. This study developed a methodology to test the success rate of one method that had not been used before. No evidence of the success rate of other methods (i.e. advising by genre, author, or mood) was found. By providing a list of novels with summaries, a librarian can provide a patron with a place to begin. From this beginning, patrons will be able to peruse the novels themselves and make a choice based on their specific interests.

#### Recommendations

At the conclusion of this study, several questions remained that provided areas for additional research.

##### *Repeating the Study*

One area of potential for additional study at the close of this research was testing the validity of the conclusion. In order to determine if the 80% success rate of this study is repeatable, the study would need to be done again using a different base novel or series. After determining the archetypes in that new novel, a researcher could consult Bowker's *Fiction Connection* again to find novels with similar archetypes. Once the matching novels had been read and analyzed, the corresponding data would reveal whether the 80% success rate was replicated.

##### *Using Bowker's Fiction Connection to Test other Reader's Advisory Strategies*

The 80% success rate of this study seemed impressive, but without corresponding data that revealed the success rates of other Reader's Advisory strategies, the results were

inconclusive. There is room for further study using Bowker's *Fiction Connection* as a tool for finding novels with similar genres, mood or plot elements. If *Fiction Connection* continued to yield a high percentage of success, it seems that it would be a powerful tool in the hands of librarians who are often caught off guard with the question, "Can you recommend a book?"

### *Testing the Resulting List*

The purpose of this study was to test one Reader's Advisory method of recommending books based on character archetype. While *Fiction Connection* proved to be a valuable tool in locating novels with similar archetypal makeup, there was no evidence to support or deny that this method would lead to a list of novels that a reader would enjoy. Because of that, additional study needs to be completed by testing the resulting list of novels (Appendix) with actual readers. After finding a group of willing readers who had read and enjoyed the *Harry Potter* series, the test group would need to read the ten novels that appeared on the list. Once finished, the test group should be surveyed to see which of the books on the resulting list they enjoyed. The success of this researcher's Reader's Advisory method would not be known until those results were analyzed and conclusions made.

### *Surveying the Population*

Finally, research needs to be done with the young adult population to determine which method of Reader's Advisory they would prefer and which methods of communication they would most likely utilize. Living in a technological world, many young adult readers might prefer to receive their Reader's Guidance Recommendations on the Internet, by email, or even text message. Creating a list of advisory material is

pointless unless the target population is actively referring to these lists in their search for new books.

## REFERENCE LIST

- Billingsley, F. (1999). *The folk keeper*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Booth, H. (2005, January/February). RA for YA: Tailoring the readers advisory interview to the needs of the young adult patrons. *Public Libraries, 1*, 33-36. Retrieved December 5, 2006, from Wilson Web database.
- Chelton, M. K. (1999, January/February). What we know and what we don't know about reading, readers, and readers advisory services. *Public Libraries, 38*(1), 42-47.
- Chelton, M. K. (2003, November). Readers' advisory 101. *Library Journal, 128*(18), 38-39.
- Chelton, M. K., & Smith, D. (2000, Winter). Talking with readers: A competency based approach to readers' advisory service. *Reference & User Services Quarterly, 40*(2), 135-142.
- Cohen, S. M. (2006, March/April). The next big "library thing". *Public Libraries, 45*(2), 33-35.
- Committees of RUSA. (2004, Summer). Recommended readers' advisory tools. *Reference & Users Quarterly, 43*(4), 294-305.
- Croggon, A. (2002). *The naming*. Pellinor. Cambridge, MA: Candlewick Press.
- Crowley, B. (2005, January/February). Rediscovering the history of readers advisory service. *Public Libraries, 44*(1), 37-41.
- Dickinson, P. (2001). *The ropemaker*. New York: Delacorte Press.
- Donelson, K. L., & Nilsen, A. P. (2005). *Literature for today's young adults*. New York: Pearson.
- Dunkle, C. B. (2003). *The hollow kingdom*. New York: Henry Holt.
- Funke, C. (2003). *Inkheart*. New York: Scholastic.
- Funke, C. (2005). *The thief lord*. New York: Scholastic.
- Gruber, M. (2005). *The witch's boy*. New York: Harper Collins.
- Harmon, W., & Holman, C. H. (1996). *A handbook to literature* (7th ed.). New York: Prentice Hall.



- Hollands, N. (2006, Spring). Improving the model for interactive readers' advisory service. *Reference & User Services Quarterly*, 45(3), 205-212.
- Kuzyk, R. (2006, February). A reader at every shelf: New tech tools and library innovations take patrons well beyond the bestsellers. *Library Journal*, 131(3), 32-35.
- Lewis, C. (1950). *The lion, the witch, and the wardrobe*. The chronicles of Narnia. New York: Harper Collins.
- May, A. K., Olesh, E., Miltenberg, A. W., & Lackner, C. P. (2000, September). A look at reader's advisory services. *Library Journal*, 125(15), 40-43.
- Moyer, J. E. (2005, Spring). Adult fiction reading: A literature review of readers' advisory services, adult fiction librarianship, and fiction readers. *Reference & User Services Quarterly*, 44(3), 220-231.
- Nottingham, J. (2002, Summer). Doing it right: A readers' advisory program. *Reference & User Services Quarterly*, 41(4), 335-339.
- Pullman, P. (1995). *The golden compass*. New York: Yearling.
- Ross, C. S., & Chelton, M. K. (2001, February). Reader's advisory: Matching mood and material. *Library Journal*, 126(2), 52-55.
- Rowling, J. K. (1997). *Harry Potter and the sorcerer's stone*. New York: Scholastic.
- Rowling, J. K. (1999). *Harry Potter and the chamber of secrets*. New York: Scholastic.
- Rowling, J. K. (1999). *Harry Potter and the prisoner of Azkaban*. New York: Scholastic.
- Rowling, J. K. (2000). *Harry Potter and the goblet of fire*. New York: Scholastic.
- Rowling, J. K. (2003). *Harry Potter and the order of the phoenix*. New York: Scholastic.
- Rowling, J. K. (2005). *Harry Potter and the half blood prince*. New York: Scholastic.
- Shearer, K. (1998, Fall). Readers' advisory services: New attention to a core business of the public library. *North Carolina Libraries*, 56(3), 114-116.
- Sturm, B. W. (2003, December). Reader's advisory and bibliotherapy: Helping or healing? *Journal of Educational Media & Library Services*, 41(2), 171-179.
- Tenopir, C. (2006, September). Readers who like this book. *Library Journal*, 131(14), 29.

Tolkien, J. (1937). *The hobbit*. New York: Ballantine Books.

APPENDIX  
READER'S ADVISORY LIST

# *Life after Harry*

## *A Reader's Advisory*

**Finished with J.K. Rowling's  
*Harry Potter* series?  
Feel like your best friends are gone?**

**Then check out some of the books below for  
more characters like Harry, Dumbledore,  
Voldemort, and the Hogwarts staff!**

### *The Naming*

Croggon, A. (2002). *The naming*. Pellinor. Cambridge, MA: Candlewick Press.

### *The Ropemaker*

Dickinson, P. (2001). *The ropemaker*. New York: Delacorte Press.

### *The Hollow Kingdom*

Dunkle, C. B. (2003). *The hollow kingdom*. New York: Henry Holt.

### *Inkheart*

Funke, C. (2003). *Inkheart*. New York: Scholastic.

### *The Thief Lord*

Funke, C. (2005). *The thief lord*. New York: Scholastic.

### *The Lion, the Witch, and the Wardrobe*

Lewis, C. (1950). *The lion, the witch, and the wardrobe*. The chronicles of Narnia. New York: Harper Collins.

### *The Golden Compass*

Pullman, P. (1995). *The golden compass*. New York: Yearling.

### *The Hobbit*

Tolkien, J. (1937). *The hobbit*. New York: Ballantine Books.

