

## Firms' Performance, Employment and Poverty during the Economic Slowdown Period in Vietnam

Chau Le and Cuong Nguyen Viet and Thao Nguyen and Thuy Nguyen and Tung Phung

15. October 2013

Online at http://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/54140/ MPRA Paper No. 54140, posted 6. March 2014 14:48 UTC

### Firms' Performance, Employment and Poverty during the Economic Slowdown Period in Vietnam

Chau Hai Le Cuong Viet Nguyen Thao Hoang Nguyen Thuy Hong Nguyen Tung Duc Phung\*

#### Abstract

Vietnam has achieved high economic growth and poverty reduction over the last two decades. However the country has experienced economic slowdown in recent years. GDP growth rate within the period of 2009-2012 was about 5 percent, which is considerably lower than the previous periods' growth rate at 7 percent. This study shows that the economic slowdown does not have serious impacts on firms, laborers and households in the short-term. Although firms' revenue, profit and size have declined, the number of firms still increases. Unemployment slightly decreased in the economic slowdown period. Average real wage per hour increased. Laborers are more likely to shift between different sectors and tend to move to the agricultural sector. Household average real income increased at the rate of 3.5 percent during 2010-2012, which is substantially lower than the rate of increase during the period 2006-2008 (at 17 percent). Poverty rate decreased from 14 percent in 2010 to 11.8 percent in 2012.

Key words: Economic slowdown, poverty, livelihood, enterprises, labor, labor shift, sector shift.

JEL classification: O10, E17, E24

\_\_\_\_\_

<sup>\*</sup> Authors are from Mekong Development Research Institute, Hanoi. Contact email: <u>cuongnguyen@mdri.org.vn</u>.

We would like to express special thanks to UNDP Office in Vietnam and MDG Project Management Unit for their continual support of this study. We would like to thank Ms. Nguyen Bui Linh (UNDP) and Mr. Nguyen Tien Phong, Mr. Tran Quoc Phuong, Ms. Phan Thu Huong, Mr. Nguyen Thang (Center for Analysis and Forecasting) and Ms. Nguyen Thi Lan Huong (Institute of Labor Science and Social Affairs) for their helpful comments on this study.

#### **1. Introduction**

Vietnam has garnered great achievements in economic growth and poverty reduction for the last two decades. Annual growth rate reached 7 percent within the last 20 years. Poverty rate decreased from 57.4 percent in 1993 to 14.2 percent in 2010. However, the global economic crisis has depressed Vietnam growth rate. Annual GDP growth rate in 2009-2012 was about 5 percent, which is considerably lower than the previous period's growth rate at 7 percent. Even though the poverty rate provided by Ministry of Labor, Invalids and Social Affairs (MOLISA) has declined over the last two years, many reports indicate that other indicators of the economy is getting worse, such as increased unemployment rate and a large number of bankrupt SMEs since 2009 till now.

There are many reasons led to economic slowdown including both internal and external factors. Internal factors include the inefficient operation of State Enterprises, banking sectors and inappropriate investment structures of the economy. The global economic crisis also has negative impact to Vietnam economy as the result of deeper economic integration into the world's economy. Even though economic integration and trade liberalization are considered as an important component to sustain high economic growth and poverty reduction but they could also create short-term negative impact. A shock from the world economy could have negative effect on the poverty reduction progress of a small and open economy like Vietnam.

Economic slowdown brings about different impacts on enterprises and households. For example, labor and firms in construction and financial sectors are likely to suffer more from the negative impact of economic slowdown in the recent years. The identification of the most vulnerable groups to economic downturn plays an important role in socio-economic policy formulation in order to minimize the negative impact.

There are many researches in economic crisis and slowdown. In Vietnam, even though there are a limited number of researches in the impact of economic slowdown to poverty reduction progress, a great number of researches have been conducted on economic slowdown's impact on employment and firms' operation. With regards to poverty and households welfare in the context of economic slowdown, Nguyen (2011) found that low economic growth could depress the poverty reduction progress, which might led to Vietnam inability to achieve its Millennium Development Goals (MDG) on reduction of overall poverty, especially food poverty reduction goal. Riedel (2009) used IMF forecast about Vietnam GDP growth rate to determine the impact of economic slowdown to average income per capita in Vietnam. The analytical results show that economic downturn have long-term negative impact on the average income per capita.

With regard to the effect of economic slowdown to employment, Warren-Rodíguez (2009) used macroeconomic data on GDP and employment to estimate elasticity of employment to growth. The analytical results show that economic slowdown has negative impact on the economy's employment generation resulting in increasing unemployment rate. Nguyen *et al.* (2009) also applied similar method using more updated data in combination with regression-based method using enterprise data collected from the Enterprise Census

within 2004-2006 to study the impact of economic slowdown on employment. The research findings are similar to Warren-Rodíguez (2009)'s finding, the projected unemployment rate will increase (to about 6 to 6.5 percent in 2010) attributed to the shortfall of employment caused by economic slowdown.

Some other researches conducted using case-study approach (VASS, 2009; Dinh, 2009; Anh, 2009; Nguyen, 2009) focusing on employment at craft village, labor market and industrial zone also shows that job opportunities and income decrease while job loss possibility increases.

Despite pessimistic forecast about employment situation, the unemployment rate in Vietnam provided by GSO is still at a low level and has tendency to decrease in the recent years. Unemployment rate was about 2.9 percent in 2009 and decreased to 2 percent in 2012. However, according to Cling *et al.* (2010), unemployment rate might not be the main indicator for the impact of economic slowdown on labor market because informal sector plays an important role in regulating labor supply and demand in Vietnam. The research forecasted that despite of decreased income in informal sector as the result of economic shocks, its labor force will increase by 27.2 percent in 2015. ILO (2012) mentioned that although the unemployment rate in Viet Nam was not high despite the economic slowdown, many workers had little choice but accepting jobs in the informal sector with low income and instability to support themselves and their families.

According to Pham (2009), despite lower employment generation, firms are likely to cut labor working hours rather than have their labor force laid off. Razafindrakoto *et al.* (2011) used data obtained from Labor Force Survey 2007 and 2009 also found that the adjustment mechanism of labor market under economic slowdown is to cut labor working hours and increase of the use of part-time or underemployment workers (labor works less than 35 hours/week despite demand for higher number of working hours).

Assessing the level of impact of economic slowdown on different sectors, Nguyen et al. (2009) found that manufacturing was the most affected sector. Employment in service sectors was also significantly affected, especially in Wholesale/ Retail trade and Hotels/ Restaurants. According to Pham (2009), the most influenced sectors are import-export dependent sectors such as textile, leather and footwear, wood production, seafood processing, power accessories and tourism. Small and medium enterprises also suffered from the negative impact of economic slowdown. A survey of 2,500 enterprises conducted by CIEM (2012) shows that 60 percent of survey enterprises believed that their business environment is still under the negative impact of global economic crisis.

To obtain a more updated picture of economic slowdown's impact, this research uses data from recent surveys to analyze the current situation of firm operations, labor and employment and poverty situation in the context of economic slowdown. In particular, the research uses three databases including VHLSS, LFS and EC in order to answer following research questions:

With regard to firms' operation:

- How do the economy and firms perform in the economic slowdown context? Which sectors are the best performers and which sectors experience the lowest growth?
- Do employment and labor salary decrease?
- Facing difficulties in economic slowdown, do firms change their main business? Which sectors attract firms from other sectors and which sectors are the most profitable?

With regard to labor and employment:

- Have underemployment and unemployment rate increased? Labor from which sectors lost their job for the last period?
- Does the number of decent work decrease?
- How is the short-run labor shift? Which sectors are the most attractive and which sector is the least attractive?

Regarding households:

- Do household average income decrease and whether poverty increases in the context of economic slowdown?
- Which type of households could escape from poverty and which type of households possibly fall back to poverty in this period?
- How does the family change its livelihood in response to economic slowdown impact? Which type of livelihood would bring higher income for the households?

This research includes six parts. Part two describes the data sources using in the research. Part three presents analysis on firm operation based on data obtained from EC. Part four analyzes the current situation of labor and employment using LFS database. Part 5 analyze poverty reduction progress and household livelihood in the recent years using VHLSS. The final chapter presents conclusion and some recommendations.

#### 2. Data Sources

Three main data sources were used in this research including Vietnam Household Living Standard Survey (VHLSS), Labor Force Survey (LFS) and Enterprise Census (EC). These are large-scale survey, conducted by GSO. Database used in this research is the most updated data.

#### Vietnam Household Living Standard Survey

The first data source is VHLSS 2010 and 2012. This survey is conducted by GSO once every two years. The total number of households for each year is 9,399 households, chosen from all provinces/cities in Vietnam and represent for the national and regional levels. VHLSS collect detailed data on many household aspects such as demographic characteristics, education, health care, properties, household income and expenditure. Besides, the survey also collect information related to remittance. This piece of information is important to analyze the impact of economic slowdown on rural and poor households' income because remittance is a large part in households' total income. VHLSS is often used to analyze poverty, households' welfare and characteristics in Vietnam.

#### Labor Force Survey

Data using in this research are drawn from LFS 2008, 2010, 2011 and 2012. The survey is conducted by GSO. Survey object are household's member above 15 years old. LFS 2012 also includes survey for child labor from people from 5 to 17 years old. However, in this research, we would not use data from child survey.

The number of observations in 2008, 2010, 2011 and 2012 are respectively 1,469,033, 916,894, 1,110,467 and 746,768. In 2011, sample size was 76,320 households each quarter and 25,440 each month. In 2012, sample size was 50,640 households each quarter and 16,880 households each month in 2012. Especially, there are panel data in 2011 and 2012 between different months, but there is no panel data between each year. All money-related variables are adjusted to fixed price of January 2008 to mitigate inflation effect.

The surveys collect detailed information about the employment of each household member including household information, employment (unemployment, paid job, and non-economic activities), occupation, economic sector and other characteristics such as Health insurance, social insurance, contract labor, working hour, salary and income. In 2011 and 2012, there is additional information about job before quitting job.

#### **Enterprise Census**

The research uses updated data from Enterprise Census (EC) 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012. These surveys are conducted on all number of operating firms in Vietnam. The number of observations for EC 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012 are respectively 155,771, 205689, 233235, 287896, 339287 and 352206 firms, forming panel data. When calculate data related to revenue, income and wage, price is adjusted to fixed price of December 2007 to mitigate inflation effect.

EC survey provides complete information about the firm's operation including enterprise type, sector, main business, number of staffs, and number of female staffs, salary expenditure and properties. It also collects data about revenue, profit and tax payment.

#### 3. Production and business activities

#### 3.1. Number of enterprises according to economic sectors, ownership and labor scale

Despite many concerns that the economic slowdown will affect the number of newly established business, this number has increased in the recent years. In 2011, there were 340 thousand enterprises in total, which increased about 126 percent as compared to this number in 2007. However, the growth rate has been unstable. In 2008, total number of enterprises rose sharply, at 32.0 percent whereas in 2009, the rate was only 13.1 percent. It can partly be explained that Vietnamese economy started to be affected by the global economic

slowdown. In 2010, the number of enterprises doubled that of 2009. However, the number in 2012 only grew 2.8% as compared to 2011.

| Economic sectors                                   | 200    | )8          | 200    | )9          | 201    | 10          | 201    | 11          | 201    | 2           |
|--|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|
|  | Number | %<br>growth |
| Agriculture  | 8513   | 248.5       | 8703   | 2.2         | 9121   | 4.8         | 10246  | 12.3        | 10313  | 0.7         |
| Manufacturing                                      | 39890  | 25.0        | 44051  | 10.4        | 48689  | 10.5        | 56904  | 16.9        | 59226  | 4.1         |
| Electricity, water supply and mining and quarrying | 4179   | 10.7        | 3017   | -27.8       | 2865   | -5.0        | 3098   | 8.1         | 3200   | 3.3         |
| Construction                                       | 28234  | 34.5        | 32801  | 16.2        | 42654  | 30.0        | 44612  | 4.6         | 47630  | 6.8         |
| Retail and wholesale                               | 80430  | 32.1        | 90598  | 12.6        | 111954 | 23.6        | 130012 | 16.1        | 131363 | 1.0         |
| Transportation                                     | 7735   | -7.1        | 9854   | 27.4        | 15105  | 53.3        | 18872  | 24.9        | 19753  | 4.7         |
| Hospitality and catering                           | 7082   | 16.6        | 8597   | 21.4        | 10176  | 18.4        | 12910  | 26.9        | 12950  | 0.3         |
| Financial, banking, insurance<br>and real estate   | 2067   | 9.1         | 2037   | -1.5        | 2665   | 30.8        | 2673   | 0.3         | 2788   | 4.3         |
| technology, education and<br>health                | 15220  | 50.1        | 17286  | 13.6        | 23428  | 35.5        | 31685  | 35.2        | 32489  | 2.5         |
| Services   | 1040   | 26.4        | 1581   | 52.0        | 2057   | 30.1        | 2600   | 26.4        | 2665   | 2.5         |
| Other sectors                                      | 11281  | 33.0        | 14100  | 25.0        | 19072  | 35.3        | 25591  | 34.2        | 26202  | 2.4         |
| Total  | 205671 | 32.0        | 232625 | 13.1        | 287786 | 23.7        | 339203 | 17.9        | 348579 | 2.8         |

Table 3.1: Total number of enterprises and growth rate according to economic sectors

Source: Enterprises Census 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012

In 2011, the number of firms working in "financial intermediary, banking, insurance and real estate" increased at the lowest pace (0.3 percent) among other sectors, which contrasted to the figure in 2010 (30 percent). Construction sector had the second lowest growth rate of the number of enterprises, with the number being at 4.6 percent as compared to 30 percent in 2010. In 2012, this rate was at the lowest for enterprises operating in agricultural sector, "hospitality and catering" sector.

Retail and wholesale enterprises accounted for the largest proportion of enterprises regarding economic sectors – about 38 percent over the period (Table 3.2). Contrasting to this, firms operating in service sectors constitute the lowest proportion, at about 0.8 percent in 2012.

| Economic costors  |      | (%)  | Total numb | er of enterp | rises |      |
|---|------|------|------------|--------------|-------|------|
| Economic sectors  | 2007 | 2008 | 2009       | 2010         | 2011  | 2012 |
| Agriculture   | 1.6  | 4.1  | 3.7        | 3.2          | 3.0   | 3.0  |
| Manufacturing   | 20.5 | 19.4 | 18.9       | 16.9         | 16.8  | 17.0 |
| Electricity, water supply and mining                      | 2.4  | 2.0  | 1.3        | 1.0          | 0.9   | 0.9  |
| Construction  | 13.5 | 13.7 | 14.1       | 14.8         | 13.2  | 13.7 |
| Retail and wholesale                                      | 39.1 | 39.1 | 38.9       | 38.9         | 38.3  | 37.7 |
| Transportation  | 5.3  | 3.8  | 4.2        | 5.2          | 5.6   | 5.7  |
| Hospitality and catering                                  | 3.9  | 3.4  | 3.7        | 3.5          | 3.8   | 3.7  |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate             | 1.2  | 1.0  | 0.9        | 0.9          | 0.8   | 0.8  |
| Information, science and technology, education and health | 6.5  | 7.4  | 7.4        | 8.1          | 9.3   | 9.3  |
| Services  | 0.5  | 0.5  | 0.7        | 0.7          | 0.8   | 0.8  |
| Other sectors   | 5.4  | 5.5  | 6.1        | 6.6          | 7.5   | 7.5  |
| Total   | 100  | 100  | 100        | 100          | 100   | 100  |

 Table 3.2: Proportion of enterprises according to business sectors

With regard to different types of ownership, private enterprises have made up of 50 percent of total enterprises in Vietnam over the years. The number of private enterprises increased from 77.647 in 2007 to 205.467 in 2012. Private limited liability, joint stock and foreign companies have had the largest growth rate of the number of enterprises, especially in 2012 (Table 3.3). However, the number of state-owned and foreign enterprises decreased in 2012; only private and joint stock companies witnessed an increase in the number of enterprises in 2012.

|                                 | 20     | 2008        |        | 09          | 20     | 10          | 202    | 11          | 2012   |             |
|---------------------------------|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|
| Ownership                       | Number | %<br>growth |
| State                           | 3287   | -5.9        | 3338   | 1.6         | 3238   | -3.0        | 3294   | 1.7         | 3217   | -2.3        |
| Cooperative                     | 13597  | 101.9       | 12257  | -9.9        | 11954  | -2.5        | 13517  | 13.1        | 13214  | -2.2        |
| Private                         | 46527  | 15.0        | 46677  | 0.2         | 47822  | 2.5         | 48928  | 2.3         | 47939  | -2.0        |
| Private<br>limited<br>liability | 103079 | 32.8        | 123422 | 19.7        | 162484 | 31.7        | 193272 | 19.0        | 205467 | 6.3         |
| Joint stock                     | 33556  | 49.4        | 40389  | 20.4        | 55274  | 36.9        | 70004  | 26.7        | 70208  | 0.3         |
| Foreign                         | 5625   | 13.4        | 6539   | 16.3        | 7014   | 7.3         | 10188  | 45.3        | 8527   | -16.3       |
| Total                           | 205671 | 32.0        | 232622 | 13.1        | 287786 | 23.7        | 339203 | 17.9        | 348572 | 2.8         |

Table 3.3: Total number of enterprises and growth rate according to ownership

Source: Enterprises Census 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012

Table 3.4 shows that the number of micro enterprises with less than 10 employees has increased at a faster pace than that of enterprises with larger labor scale. In 2012, the number of firms with 1 to 5 employees went up 12.3 percent, while the number of enterprises with 10 to 300 employees decreased. Firms with more than 300 employees witnessed a slight increase, at around 2 percent in 2012 as compared to 2011.

| Labor scale   | 200    | )8          | 20     | 09          | 20     | 10          | 201    | 11          | 20     | 12          |
|---------------|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|--------|-------------|
| Labor scale   | Number | %<br>growth |
| 1 to 5        | 64121  | 29.6        | 72684  | 13.4        | 107005 | 47.2        | 139978 | 30.8        | 157261 | 12.3        |
| 6 to 10       | 63029  | 37.5        | 75345  | 19.5        | 83464  | 10.8        | 84305  | 1.0         | 79742  | -5.4        |
| 11 to 20      | 34532  | 49.3        | 36281  | 5.1         | 41534  | 14.5        | 48406  | 16.5        | 47784  | -1.3        |
| 21 to 199     | 37714  | 20.2        | 41748  | 10.7        | 48405  | 15.9        | 57409  | 18.6        | 55728  | -2.9        |
| 200 to 300    | 2214   | 9.7         | 2362   | 6.7         | 2625   | 11.1        | 2974   | 13.3        | 2925   | -1.6        |
| 300 and above | 4040   | 2.7         | 4184   | 3.6         | 4690   | 12.1        | 4963   | 5.8         | 5062   | 2.0         |
| Total         | 205650 | 32.0        | 232604 | 13.1        | 287723 | 23.7        | 338035 | 17.5        | 348502 | 3.1         |

 Table 3.4: Number of enterprises and growth rate according to labor scale

An important question is that whether the number of bankrupt firms increases during the economic slowdown period. In Table 3.5, we used repeated data to estimate the number of enterprise which went bankrupt. In particular, we examine enterprises which were operating in 2007 but having no data in 2008 (Column 2007-2008 in Table 3.5). Even though this figure cannot accurately reflect the actual number of bankrupt enterprises (because an enterprise might suspend their operation or refuse to answer), this can be used as a proxy to exhibit bankruptcy/non-operating situation among Vietnamese firms.

According to Table 3.5, during 2010-2012, the number of enterprise shutting down per year was about 45 thousand. This was the highest number during the period of 2007 to 2012. "Retail and wholesale", construction and manufacturing sector experienced the largest number of closed enterprises in 2011 and 2012. In 2012, the number of closed enterprises was the highest during 2007-2012. The number of closed down SMEs (less than 200 labors) was relatively high, especially enterprises with less than 10 employees (about 36 thousand closed ones). Moreover, almost closed companies were private limited liability and joint stock ones (accounting for 90 percent of closed companies).

|   | 2007-2008 | 2008-2009 | 2009-2010 | 2010-2011 | 2011-2012 |
|---|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| Total   | 27470     | 40760     | 29614     | 45438     | 45312     |
| Economic sectors  |           |           |           |           |           |
| Agriculture   | 480       | 639       | 626       | 872       | 840       |
| Manufacturing   | 4732      | 6265      | 4807      | 5884      | 6253      |
| Electricity, water supply and mining                      | 344       | 1549      | 519       | 410       | 359       |
| Construction  | 3295      | 5483      | 4169      | 6921      | 5610      |
| Retail and wholesale                                      | 10556     | 17024     | 12328     | 19430     | 18037     |
| Transportation  | 2263      | 1079      | 816       | 2182      | 2333      |
| Hospitality and catering                                  | 1113      | 1159      | 1247      | 1378      | 1906      |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate             | 329       | 313       | 170       | 445       | 363       |
| Information, science and technology, education and health | 2109      | 3742      | 2186      | 4020      | 4652      |
| Services  | 207       | 267       | 254       | 476       | 408       |
| Other sectors   | 2042      | 3240      | 2492      | 3420      | 4551      |
| According to ownership                                    |           |           |           |           |           |
| State   | 235       | 283       | 148       | 252       | 238       |

Table 3.5: Number of enterprises no longer in panel data

|                           | 2007-2008 | 2008-2009 | 2009-2010 | 2010-2011 | 2011-2012 |
|---------------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| Cooperative               | 793       | 2245      | 1192      | 870       | 1050      |
| Private                   | 6224      | 8622      | 6673      | 8284      | 6057      |
| Private limited liability | 15234     | 22148     | 15399     | 27252     | 24861     |
| Joint stock               | 4630      | 7132      | 5683      | 8474      | 10988     |
| Foreign                   | 354       | 330       | 516       | 306       | 2118      |
| In size                   |           |           |           |           |           |
| 1 to 5                    | 11431     | 17431     | 12590     | 21911     | 24679     |
| 6 to 10                   | 9256      | 14398     | 11147     | 14543     | 10728     |
| 11 to 20                  | 2896      | 5336      | 3335      | 5270      | 4727      |
| 21 to 199                 | 3481      | 3223      | 2320      | 3398      | 3692      |
| 200 to 300                | 161       | 106       | 89        | 102       | 144       |
| 300 and above             | 245       | 253       | 128       | 180       | 179       |

#### 3.2. Enterprises' business activity situation

#### **Revenue** and profit

The period of 2007-2012 witnessed a decreased trend in average real revenue of enterprises. On average, an enterprise's revenue was 12.5 billion, reducing around 18.3 percent compared with data in 2008. This figure continuously declined through 2008, 2009 and 2010, with the figures being at -7.3, -8.8 and -8.5 percent respectively. Although revenue growth rate in 2011 slightly increased 0.9 percent, this figure dropped around 3 percent in 2012.

"Electricity and water supply, mining and quarrying" enterprises have had the largest revenue growth rate of profit. Average revenue in 2008 of these enterprises rose 51.6 percent; moreover, in 2009, revenue growth rate was 176.3 percent. The reason for this might be the increase of electricity and water prices during the economic crisis.

Additionally, enterprises operating in financial sector also have had positive revenue growth rate from 2007 to 2011. Average revenue of a company in financial sector in 2011 was 32.5 billion, increasing 40% in comparison with that of 2007. Nevertheless, in 2012 the growth rate of this figure declined 24.1 percent.

| Table 3.6: A | verage revenue of | f an enterprise | according to | economic sectors | (million) |
|--------------|-------------------|-----------------|--------------|------------------|-----------|
|              |                   |                 |              |                  | (         |

| Economic sector  | 200                  | 2008        |                      | 2009        |                      | 0           | 201                  | 1           | 2012                 |             |
|--|----------------------|-------------|----------------------|-------------|----------------------|-------------|----------------------|-------------|----------------------|-------------|
|  | Revenue<br>(million) | %<br>growth |
| Agriculture  | 3974                 | -68.9       | 3917                 | -1.4        | 4392                 | 12.1        | 4696                 | 6.9         | 4393                 | -6.5        |
| Manufacturing  | 25783                | -15.5       | 25769                | -0.1        | 25969                | 0.8         | 26118                | 0.6         | 25959                | -0.6        |
| Electricity, water supply<br>and mining and<br>quarrying | 4707                 | 51.6        | 13004                | 176.3       | 16608                | 27.7        | 18679                | 12.5        | 19667                | 5.3         |
| Construction   | 7850                 | -16.3       | 8435                 | 7.4         | 7494                 | -11.2       | 7380                 | -1.5        | 6936                 | -6.0        |
| Retail and wholesale                                     | 17564                | 6.6         | 13758                | -21.7       | 12705                | -7.7        | 13826                | 8.8         | 12969                | -6.2        |
| Transportation   | 13683                | 22.9        | 11254                | -17.7       | 9337                 | -17.0       | 8350                 | -10.6       | 8576                 | 2.7         |
| Hospitality and catering                                 | 3847                 | -12.6       | 3400                 | -11.6       | 3261                 | -4.1        | 3111                 | -4.6        | 3039                 | -2.3        |

| Financial, banking,<br>insurance and real estate | 28672 | 23.3  | 33074 | 15.4  | 28429 | -14.0 | 32544 | 14.5  | 24686 | -24.1 |
|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| technology, education<br>and health              | 3121  | -0.1  | 3272  | 4.8   | 2916  | -10.9 | 2241  | -23.1 | 2518  | 12.3  |
| Services   | 999   | -15.2 | 2553  | 155.6 | 1460  | -42.8 | 976   | -33.2 | 834   | -14.5 |
| Other sectors                                    | 8561  | -7.8  | 10021 | 17.0  | 7941  | -20.8 | 6548  | -17.5 | 6878  | 5.0   |
| Total  | 14852 | -7.3  | 13548 | -8.8  | 12392 | -8.5  | 12507 | 0.9   | 12132 | -3.0  |

Note: inflation adjusted price in 2007

Source: Enterprises Census 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012

To study the change in productivity from 2008 to 2012, we calculate average revenue per employee in Table 3.7. The result shows that average revenue per employee in 2012 decreased around 2.7 percent. Firms in financial intermediary and banking, agricultural sector, service sector and "retail and wholesale" sectors experienced a downward trend in average revenue per employee.

| Table 3.7: Average | profit per ( | employee of an | enterprise | according to | economic sectors |
|--------------------|--------------|----------------|------------|--------------|------------------|
|--------------------|--------------|----------------|------------|--------------|------------------|

|   | 200                 | 8           | 200                 | 19          | 201                 | 10          | 201                 | 1           | 20                  | 12          |
|---|---------------------|-------------|---------------------|-------------|---------------------|-------------|---------------------|-------------|---------------------|-------------|
| Economic sector   | Profit<br>(million) | %<br>growth |
| Agriculture   | 89.3                | -26.9       | 96.8                | 8.5         | 110.4               | 14.1        | 135.2               | 22.4        | 122.4               | -9.5        |
| Manufacturing   | 266.8               | 1.9         | 282.5               | 5.9         | 298.8               | 5.8         | 311.0               | 4.1         | 316.5               | 1.8         |
| Electricity, water supply<br>and mining and<br>quarrying        | 205.7               | 47.8        | 304.2               | 47.8        | 338.7               | 11.3        | 384.6               | 13.6        | 401.1               | 4.3         |
| Construction  | 182.7               | -0.5        | 208.9               | 14.3        | 206.2               | -1.3        | 185.0               | -10.3       | 185.7               | 0.4         |
| Retail and wholesale  | 1525.1              | 16.0        | 1211.1              | -20.6       | 1045.4              | -13.7       | 1237.9              | 18.4        | 1151.9              | -6.9        |
| Transportation  | 312.8               | 6.9         | 294.5               | -5.9        | 330.7               | 12.3        | 317.8               | -3.9        | 327.1               | 2.9         |
| Hospitality and catering  | 176.7               | -6.9        | 169.3               | -4.2        | 168.5               | -0.5        | 168.5               | 0.0         | 159.0               | -5.6        |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate                   | 1215.2              | 18.4        | 935.5               | -23.0       | 1082.9              | 15.8        | 1208.0              | 11.5        | 963.8               | -20.2       |
| Information, science and<br>technology, education<br>and health | 213.7               | 15.4        | 219.0               | 2.4         | 210.6               | -3.8        | 167.4               | -20.5       | 182.6               | 9.1         |
| Services  | 73.4                | -16.4       | 230.1               | 213.6       | 153.8               | -33.2       | 106.6               | -30.7       | 97.2                | -8.8        |
| Other sectors   | 369.2               | 1.0         | 426.5               | 15.5        | 369.8               | -13.3       | 326.4               | -11.7       | 331.4               | 1.5         |
| Total   | 407.2               | 10.9        | 387.2               | -4.9        | 392.7               | 1.4         | 414.2               | 5.5         | 403.1               | -2.7        |

Note: inflation adjusted price in 2007

Source: Enterprises Census 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012

Similar to average profit of enterprises, average profit also showed a sharp and decreasing trend over the years (Table 3.8). Average profit in 2012 declined about 48% as compared to 2007. Although average profit had a decreased trend, it slightly increased in 2012, with the growth rate of this number being at 4.3 percent. One of the reasons for this was that in 2012 inflation was low, contrasting with other years during the period.

|   | 20                  | 08       | 20                  | 11       | 20                  | 12       |
|---|---------------------|----------|---------------------|----------|---------------------|----------|
| Economic sectors  | Profit<br>(million) | % growth | Profit<br>(million) | % growth | Profit<br>(million) | % growth |
| Agriculture   | 592.0               | -70.2    | 441.1               | -21.4    | 409.8               | -7.1     |
| Manufacturing   | 1234.5              | -31.0    | 1057.3              | -27.2    | 1052.5              | -0.5     |
| Electricity, water supply and mining and quarrying        | 420.4               | 22.9     | 985.3               | -36.0    | 1452.7              | 47.4     |
| Construction  | 319.6               | -24.6    | 221.0               | -28.7    | 158.0               | -28.5    |
| Retail and wholesale                                      | 223.6               | -19.6    | 181.2               | -21.5    | 221.6               | 22.3     |
| Transportation  | 1024.9              | 11.5     | 312.3               | -39.3    | 297.1               | -4.9     |
| Hospitality and catering                                  | 512.8               | -15.7    | 262.2               | -26.2    | 256.4               | -2.2     |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate             | 5211.3              | -20.5    | 3656.1              | -27.4    | 3409.6              | -6.7     |
| Information, science and technology, education and health | 219.9               | 20.3     | 157.7               | -47.8    | 160.4               | 1.7      |
| Services  | 31.9                | -60.5    | 46.9                | -2.7     | 43.4                | -7.5     |
| Other sectors   | 1284.3              | -15.6    | 635.5               | -39.7    | 749.4               | 17.9     |
| Total   | 598.0               | -26.9    | 415.8               | -30.1    | 433.8               | 4.3      |

#### Table 3.8: Average profit of an enterprise according to economic sectors

Note: inflation adjusted price in 2007

#### Source: Enterprises Census 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012

To study characteristics of enterprises which have operated through years and bankrupt ones, Table 3.9 shows average profit and profit per employee of an enterprise which have operated over 3 years and bankrupt ones in 2012 (could go bankrupt or merge with another enterprise). The result shows that enterprises (except for financial and banking enterprises) which stopped operating normally have less than 3 years of experiences. Consequently, firms having less operating experiences were more likely to be affected by the economic slowdown.

|   |   | Enterprise  | s have opera                            | Enterprises closed in 2012                                |   |   |   |   |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Economic sectors  | Total<br>profit in<br>2010<br>(million) | Average<br>profit per<br>employee<br>in 2010<br>(million) | Total<br>profit in<br>2011<br>(million) | Average<br>profit per<br>employee<br>in 2011<br>(million) | Total<br>profit in<br>2012<br>(million) | Average<br>profit per<br>employee<br>in 2012<br>(million) | Total<br>profit in<br>2011<br>(million) | Average<br>profit per<br>employee<br>in 2011<br>(million) |
| Agriculture   | 4828.6                                  | 108.4   | 5694.2                                  | 138.0   | 5255.8                                  | 119.7   | 1699.8                                  | 145.4   |
| Manufacturing   | 36145.2                                 | 310.7   | 39838.3                                 | 330.9   | 40115.8                                 | 333.4   | 7773.3                                  | 259.6   |
| Electricity, water supply and mining and quarrying              | 16126.7                                 | 299.8   | 22273.2                                 | 359.3   | 23695.4                                 | 356.4   | 9598.8                                  | 363.5   |
| Construction  | 11135.6                                 | 206.8   | 11005.6                                 | 195.5   | 10982.3                                 | 200.2   | 4863.8                                  | 215.6   |
| Retail and wholesale  | 18664.1                                 | 1158.6  | 20644.3                                 | 1384.2  | 19530.4                                 | 1320.5  | 8708.4                                  | 1147.1  |
| Transportation  | 13206.4                                 | 338.9   | 12879.6                                 | 323.3   | 13520.1                                 | 340.6   | 4539.3                                  | 300.6   |
| Hospitality and catering  | 4801.8                                  | 194.6   | 5062.2                                  | 199.3   | 4663.6                                  | 187.2   | 822.5                                   | 89.0  |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate                   | 32563.5                                 | 1129.8  | 36104.5                                 | 1222.3  | 30572.4                                 | 936.4   | 35979.6                                 | 1194.8  |
| Information, science and<br>technology, education and<br>health | 4511.8                                  | 239.7   | 4030.7                                  | 203.2   | 4559.9                                  | 218.1   | 1050.6                                  | 136.5   |

#### Table 3.9: Total profit and average profit per employee

|                  |   | Enterprise  | Enterprise<br>20                        | es closed in<br>12  |   |   |   |   |
|------------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Economic sectors | Total<br>profit in<br>2010<br>(million) | Average<br>profit per<br>employee<br>in 2010<br>(million) | Total<br>profit in<br>2011<br>(million) | Average<br>profit per<br>employee<br>in 2011<br>(million) | Total<br>profit in<br>2012<br>(million) | Average<br>profit per<br>employee<br>in 2012<br>(million) | Total<br>profit in<br>2011<br>(million) | Average<br>profit per<br>employee<br>in 2011<br>(million) |
| Services         | 1047.4                                  | 73.7  | 1812.6                                  | 140.7   | 1323.4                                  | 102.9   | 480.2                                   | 76.7  |
| Other sectors    | 13840.3                                 | 412.8   | 12727.6                                 | 371.1   | 12687.9                                 | 367.3   | 3275.3                                  | 332.2   |
| Total            | 18365.1                                 | 404.1   | 19865.0                                 | 430.9   | 19503.0                                 | 422.4   | 6235.8                                  | 463.5   |

Note: inflation adjusted price in 2007

Source: Enterprises Census 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012

#### **Employment** structure

Table 3.10 shows that the firm labor size was 47.4 in 2007, which considerably declined to 44.4 in 2008 and continued to decline to 32.6 employees per enterprise in 2012 (decreased more than 30 percent as compared to 2007).

Generally, firms having positive growth rate of profit and revenue (i.e. electricity and water supply and mining sectors) witnessed an increase in labor scale. On the other hand, enterprises in agricultural, manufacturing sectors experienced a sharp decrease in labor size. In 2011, agricultural enterprises laid off about 70 percent of their total workers while this figure for the manufacturing industry was 27.5 percent as compared to 2007.

| E   |       |       | Number of | employees |       |       |
|---|-------|-------|-----------|-----------|-------|-------|
| Economic sectors  | 2007  | 2008  | 2009      | 2010      | 2011  | 2012  |
| Agriculture   | 103.5 | 44.4  | 40.4      | 39.5      | 34.5  | 35.7  |
| Manufacturing   | 123.8 | 103.8 | 97.0      | 95.5      | 89.8  | 88.3  |
| Electricity, water supply and mining and quarrying        | 44.2  | 43.2  | 66.6      | 76.7      | 76.5  | 101.2 |
| Construction  | 50.9  | 42.9  | 39.5      | 36.6      | 38.9  | 36.3  |
| Retail and wholesale                                      | 13.2  | 12.2  | 11.9      | 13.1      | 11.8  | 11.6  |
| Transportation  | 41.8  | 47.9  | 38.2      | 35.8      | 29.2  | 30.1  |
| Hospitality and catering                                  | 23.3  | 22.3  | 20.4      | 19.8      | 18.3  | 18.9  |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate             | 76.6  | 86.8  | 96.6      | 83.5      | 116.3 | 107.0 |
| Information, science and technology, education and health | 16.8  | 14.6  | 14.5      | 13.8      | 13.5  | 13.5  |
| Services  | 13.4  | 13.6  | 10.8      | 9.5       | 9.1   | 8.5   |
| Other sectors   | 37.5  | 28.2  | 29.8      | 21.8      | 20.9  | 23.2  |
| Total   | 47.4  | 39.7  | 37.1      | 34.7      | 32.6  | 32.6  |

Table 3.10: Average number of employees according to economic sectors

Source: Enterprises Census 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012

Table 3.11 shows that the proportion of female employee experienced a stable trend over the years. This figure decreased in agricultural sector and increased in some sectors such as construction and transportation. In agricultural sector, female employees accounted for about 38.2 percent in 2007 and this ratio was much lower at 30.2 percent in 2012. On the other hand, the ratio of female employees increased around 4 percent in 2012 (compared with 2007) for construction and transportation sectors. The proportion of female employee during the period from 2007 to 2012 fluctuated from 42 percent to 43 percent, reflecting that women played an important role in the workforce of the whole economy.

| Economia sostars  |      | The pro | portion of fe | emale worke | ers (%) |      |
|---|------|---------|---------------|-------------|---------|------|
| Economic sectors  | 2007 | 2008    | 2009          | 2010        | 2011    | 2012 |
| Agriculture   | 38.2 | 30.4    | 29.5          | 30.0        | 29.7    | 30.2 |
| Manufacturing   | 57.0 | 56.5    | 55.8          | 56.2        | 57.1    | 57.1 |
| Electricity, water supply and mining and quarrying        | 23.5 | 24.1    | 25.7          | 26.7        | 27.0    | 25.9 |
| Construction  | 13.8 | 13.8    | 15.0          | 16.5        | 17.9    | 18.5 |
| Retail and wholesale                                      | 38.8 | 37.9    | 37.8          | 37.2        | 37.2    | 38.8 |
| Transportation  | 18.4 | 18.4    | 18.5          | 25.3        | 22.7    | 24.6 |
| Hospitality and catering                                  | 54.2 | 54.0    | 53.9          | 53.9        | 53.9    | 53.7 |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate             | 54.8 | 55.7    | 55.1          | 55.9        | 51.9    | 56.2 |
| Information, science and technology, education and health | 34.7 | 34.5    | 36.4          | 37.7        | 37.5    | 38.2 |
| Services  | 54.3 | 51.9    | 51.6          | 51.0        | 48.1    | 47.8 |
| Other sectors   | 36.6 | 33.8    | 36.2          | 37.0        | 36.6    | 36.1 |
| Total   | 44.0 | 42.7    | 42.5          | 42.4        | 43.0    | 43.3 |

Table 3.11: The proportion of female employees according to economic sectors

The proportion of employees with social insurance remained stable during the period of 2007 to 2012 (about 57 percent). However this ratio in agricultural enterprises decreased sharply from 67 percent in 2007 to 55 percent in 2012. Economic slowdown also caused this ratio to decline in some sectors like construction and service. On the contrary, the proportion of employees having social insurance in manufacturing, "electricity and water supply, mining and quarrying" sectors increased significantly, at 5.4 percent and 10 percent respectively. This reflects that enterprises affected by the economic slowdown tended to reduce labor with long-term contracts or owed money spent for employees' social insurance.

| Economic sectors  | The pro | portion of e | mployees wi | th social insu | rance (%) |
|---|---------|--------------|-------------|----------------|-----------|
|   | 2007    | 2008         | 2009        | 2010           | 2011      |
| Agriculture   | 67.1    | 49.6         | 52.5        | 50.2           | 53.0      |
| Manufacturing   | 68.2    | 69.8         | 71.1        | 73.0           | 73.6      |
| Electricity, water supply and mining and quarrying        | 77.5    | 78.8         | 86.9        | 87.4           | 87.5      |
| Construction  | 26.5    | 24.8         | 25.9        | 24.8           | 22.6      |
| Retail and wholesale                                      | 39.5    | 41.8         | 40.3        | 43.4           | 42.3      |
| Transportation  | 46.5    | 49.4         | 45.4        | 57.0           | 51.2      |
| Hospitality and catering                                  | 52.3    | 50.8         | 50.1        | 50.4           | 49.2      |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate             | 92.3    | 94.9         | 92.2        | 94.1           | 94.5      |
| Information, science and technology, education and health | 45.6    | 48.2         | 47.9        | 50.8           | 43.8      |
| Services  | 43.9    | 41.0         | 36.8        | 36.0           | 34.8      |
| Other sectors   | 64.5    | 64.0         | 63.4        | 59.4           | 51.7      |
| Total   | 57.6    | 57.4         | 57.9        | 58.4           | 57.5      |

Table 3.12: The proportion of employees with social insurance

Source: Enterprises Census 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, and 2011

Average real wage of an employee per year had an increased trend from 2007 (Table 3.2). In 2012, this figure was 37.2 million, which rose about 37 percent as compared to 2007. However workers' average wage in most sectors in 2011 was less than that of 2010, especially enterprises operating in agriculture, transportation, "financial intermediary, banking, insurance and real estate" sectors. In 2012 average real wage rose 10 percent as compared to 2011. One of the reasons for this was that inflation in 2011 was at a very high level (18.6 percent) while inflation in 2012 was only 6.8 percent.

#### Table 3.13: Average wage

|   | Average wage per year (million/person/year) |      |      |       |      |       |  |  |  |  |
|---|---|------|------|-------|------|-------|--|--|--|--|
|   | 2007  | 2008 | 2009 | 2010  | 2011 | 2012  |  |  |  |  |
| Agriculture   | 30.7  | 21.2 | 22.1 | 35.3  | 29.2 | 26.9  |  |  |  |  |
| Manufacturing   | 23.1  | 23.9 | 26.1 | 27.8  | 28.1 | 33.4  |  |  |  |  |
| Electricity, water supply and mining and quarrying        | 35.5  | 32.2 | 49.5 | 51.4  | 45.8 | 45.6  |  |  |  |  |
| Construction  | 24.4  | 22.0 | 25.7 | 27.6  | 26.4 | 29.0  |  |  |  |  |
| Retail and wholesale                                      | 24.8  | 26.8 | 30.2 | 32.1  | 28.6 | 40.2  |  |  |  |  |
| Transportation  | 34.1  | 36.7 | 37.8 | 51.0  | 41.3 | 32.2  |  |  |  |  |
| Hospitality and catering                                  | 23.4  | 23.4 | 24.4 | 27.6  | 24.2 | 25.7  |  |  |  |  |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate             | 79.0  | 93.1 | 94.5 | 101.3 | 95.9 | 112.7 |  |  |  |  |
| Information, science and technology, education and health | 41.8  | 44.6 | 47.7 | 49.6  | 40.9 | 57.5  |  |  |  |  |
| Services  | 17.6  | 16.7 | 20.0 | 16.2  | 19.9 | 24.4  |  |  |  |  |
| Other sectors   | 41.9  | 39.9 | 43.9 | 41.5  | 73.7 | 46.4  |  |  |  |  |
| Total   | 26.8  | 27.3 | 30.4 | 33.3  | 33.4 | 37.2  |  |  |  |  |

Note: inflation adjusted price in 2007

Source: Enterprises Census 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012

#### 3.3. Change in business industries

A major concern arisen was how enterprises could draw up strategies during the economic slowdown. Have they changed their main business activity or changed their labor scale? Did this bring about increase in their profit?

Table 3.14 presents change of firm's main business activity in short-term (1 year) in the period 2007-2008 before the economic slowdown. The result shows that enterprises in service sector had highest proportion of firms changing their main businesses. Besides, there were about 80 percent of enterprises remained in the business; of which financial and banking sectors were the most stable.

Within the period of 2010-2011, under the impact of the economic slowdown, a number of enterprises changed their major business to the others. There was a stronger tendency for firms to change their main business as compared to the previous period 2007-2008 (Table 3.15). While only service sector had more than 10 percent firms shifted their businesses to other sectors in 2007, seven out of ten sectors having less than 90 percent of workers remained in the same sector in 2011. This change was especially high in scientific activities and technology (20 percent) and services sectors (40 percent) in 2011. Firms have high tendency to shift their business to wholesale and retail trade, probably because this sector has easy entry and requires low fixed investment.

|  | Year 2008   |  |  |              |                      |                |                             |   |  |          |               |       |
|--|-------------|--|--|--------------|----------------------|----------------|-----------------------------|---|--|----------|---------------|-------|
| Year 2007  | Agriculture | Mining and quarrying,<br>Manufacturing | Electricity, water<br>supply and mining and<br>quarrying | Construction | Retail and wholesale | Transportation | Hospitality and<br>catering | Financial, banking,<br>insurance and real<br>estate | Science and<br>technology, education<br>and health | Services | Other sectors | Total |
| Agriculture  | 93.5        | 2.0                                    | 0.0  | 0.5          | 3.0                  | 0.2            | 0.3                         | 0.0   | 0.3  | 0.0      | 0.3           | 100   |
| Manufacturing  | 0.1         | 95.5                                   | 0.1  | 0.8          | 2.8                  | 0.1            | 0.1                         | 0.0   | 0.3  | 0.0      | 0.2           | 100   |
| Electricity, water<br>supply and mining<br>and quarrying | 2.4         | 1.5                                    | 95.0   | 0.4          | 0.3                  | 0.1            | 0.0                         | 0.0   | 0.1  | 0.0      | 0.2           | 100   |
| Construction   | 0.1         | 1.1                                    | 0.1  | 94.5         | 2.1                  | 0.4            | 0.1                         | 0.0   | 1.1  | 0.0      | 0.6           | 100   |
| Retail and wholesale                                     | 0.1         | 1.6                                    | 0.1  | 0.8          | 96.1                 | 0.4            | 0.2                         | 0.1   | 0.3  | 0.1      | 0.4           | 100   |
| Transportation   | 0.1         | 1.0                                    | 0.0  | 1.5          | 5.4                  | 89.5           | 0.3                         | 0.0   | 0.3  | 0.1      | 1.8           | 100   |
| Hospitality and catering                                 | 0.0         | 0.3                                    | 0.0  | 0.2          | 1.3                  | 0.2            | 96.7                        | 0.0   | 0.1  | 0.1      | 0.9           | 100   |
| Financial, banking,<br>insurance and real<br>estate      | 0.1         | 0.0                                    | 0.0  | 0.1          | 1.1                  | 0.3            | 0.1                         | 96.6  | 0.6  | 0.0      | 1.2           | 100   |
| Science and<br>technology,<br>education and health       | 0.0         | 0.8                                    | 0.0  | 2.0          | 1.6                  | 0.2            | 0.1                         | 0.0   | 93.4   | 0.2      | 1.8           | 100   |
| Services   | 0.0         | 2.3                                    | 0.7  | 1.0          | 8.9                  | 0.8            | 0.8                         | 0.3   | 2.4  | 80.5     | 2.3           | 100   |
| Other sectors  | 0.1         | 0.6                                    | 0.3  | 1.2          | 3.5                  | 1.4            | 0.7                         | 0.1   | 2.7  | 0.3      | 89.2          | 100   |

### Table 3.14 The proportion of shifting firms in 2007 to other economic sector in 2008

Source: Enterprises Census 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012

|   |             |   |  |              |                         | Year 2         | 2011                        |   |   |          |               |       |
|---|-------------|---|--|--------------|-------------------------|----------------|-----------------------------|---|---|----------|---------------|-------|
| Year 2010   | Agriculture | Mining and<br>quarrying,<br>Manufacturing | Electricity,<br>water supply<br>and mining and | Construction | Retail and<br>wholesale | Transportation | Hospitality and<br>catering | Financial,<br>banking,<br>insurance and | Science and<br>technology,<br>education and | Services | Other sectors | Total |
| Agriculture   | 95.3        | 0.8                                       | 0.4  | 0.3          | 2.2                     | 0.1            | 0.1                         | 0.0                                     | 0.2   | 0.0      | 0.5           | 100   |
| Manufacturing   | 0.1         | 87.7                                      | 0.2  | 1.4          | 8.1                     | 0.4            | 0.2                         | 0.0                                     | 1.1   | 0.1      | 0.7           | 100   |
| Electricity, water supply<br>and mining and quarrying | 2.3         | 2.5                                       | 86.1   | 2.1          | 3.9                     | 0.4            | 0.0                         | 0.0                                     | 1.4   | 0.2      | 1.2           | 100   |
| Construction  | 0.1         | 2.7                                       | 0.1  | 78.1         | 9.2                     | 1.1            | 0.3                         | 0.0                                     | 5.9   | 0.2      | 2.4           | 100   |
| Retail and wholesale                                  | 0.2         | 3.9                                       | 0.1  | 1.8          | 89.1                    | 1.2            | 0.4                         | 0.1                                     | 1.1   | 0.4      | 1.9           | 100   |
| Transportation  | 0.0         | 0.9                                       | 0.1  | 1.7          | 6.5                     | 87.0           | 0.4                         | 0.0                                     | 0.5   | 0.2      | 2.7           | 100   |
| Hospitality and catering                              | 0.0         | 0.4                                       | 0.0  | 0.4          | 1.8                     | 0.4            | 95.0                        | 0.1                                     | 0.4   | 0.2      | 1.4           | 100   |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate         | 0.1         | 0.2                                       | 0.0  | 0.6          | 3.0                     | 0.5            | 0.5                         | 84.9                                    | 6.8   | 0.2      | 3.4           | 100   |
| Science and technology, education and health          | 0.0         | 2.7                                       | 0.1  | 5.4          | 5.2                     | 0.6            | 0.2                         | 0.1                                     | 80.4  | 0.5      | 4.9           | 100   |
| Services  | 0.1         | 4.0                                       | 0.4  | 1.9          | 18.4                    | 1.6            | 1.3                         | 0.3                                     | 5.9   | 59.0     | 7.2           | 100   |
| Other sectors   | 0.1         | 1.5                                       | 0.2  | 2.3          | 6.8                     | 3.0            | 1.4                         | 0.3                                     | 6.5   | 0.8      | 77.1          | 100   |

 Table 3.15: The proportion of shifting enterprises in 2010 to other economic sector in

 2011

Table 3.16 analyzes revenue growth rate of enterprises after changing its main business activity. Enterprises, which did not change their main business experienced growth in revenue. Especially, "electricity and water supply" enterprises experienced revenue growth rate of 41.1 percent. Although construction and "scientific information, education and health" sectors did not achieve revenue growth, the decreases in revenue were minor, accounting for 3.6 percent and 2.4 percent.

Firms having their business shifted to manufacturing, construction, "electricity, water and mining" and "retail and wholesale" sectors witnessed an impressive revenue growth rate. Revenue growth rate for transportation enterprises shifting to manufacturing business from 2007 to 2008 was 100.8 percent; this number for firms shifting from construction to "electricity and water supply" business, from transportation to construction and from service sector to "scientific information, education and health" sectors in 2008 was 46.0 percent; 41.6 percent and 154.4 percent respectively.

|  |             |   |  |              | 3                       | Year 201       | 1                           |   |   |          |               |
|--|-------------|---|--|--------------|-------------------------|----------------|-----------------------------|---|---|----------|---------------|
| Year 2010  | Agriculture | Mining and<br>quarrying,<br>Manufacturing | Electricity,<br>water supply<br>and mining and | Construction | Retail and<br>wholesale | Transportation | Hospitality and<br>catering | Financial,<br>banking,<br>insurance and | Science and<br>technology,<br>education and | Services | Other sectors |
| Agriculture  | 17.2        | 14.4                                      | 25.9   |              | 61.0                    |                |                             |   |   |          | -43.5         |
| Manufacturing  | 30.4        | 12.0                                      | 10.8   | 15.0         | 29.9                    | 23.3           | 3.3                         |   | -9.9  | -24.5    | -1.4          |
| Electricity, water supply<br>and mining and<br>quarrying | 28.8        | 19.0                                      | 41.1   | 20.4         | 49.5                    |                |                             | ·                                       | 3.9   |          | -1.2          |
| Construction   |             | 18.0                                      | 46.6   | -3.6         | 29.3                    | 8.3            | 5.7                         |   | -17.2                                       | -8.7     | -17.7         |
| Retail and wholesale                                     | 14.9        | 25.2                                      | -19.5  | -1.9         | 13.4                    | 8.4            | -11.2                       | 308.4                                   | -4.8  | -34.9    | 14.8          |
| Transportation   |             | 100.8                                     |  | 41.6         | 68.2                    | 2.6            | 16.2                        |   | 7.5   |          | 12.2          |
| Hospitality and catering                                 | •           | -7.4                                      |  |              | 81.9                    | 1.2            | 13.4                        |   | -8.6  |          | 152.5         |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate            | •           |   | ·  |              | 160.7                   |                |                             | 10.1                                    | -16.8                                       | ·        | -14.7         |
| Science and technology, education and health             |             | 40.4                                      |  | 37.0         | 53.6                    | -4.8           | 10.4                        |   | -2.4  | 444.6    | 27.0          |
| Services   |             | 6.6                                       |  | -35.5        | 448.5                   |                |                             |   | 154.3                                       | 5.5      | 69.4          |
| Other sectors  |             | 45.1                                      | -0.0   | -8.5         | 26.4                    | 28.5           | 31.5                        | 167.4                                   | 10.2  | 31.9     | -1.6          |

#### Table 3.16: Average growth rate of revenue of shifting enterprises in 2010-2011

*Note: cells with "." contain the total number of shifting enterprises less than 30 Source: Enterprises Census 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010 and 2011* 

Table 3.17 shows enterprises' main business activity in short-term during the period 2011-2012. The result shows that firms have lower tendency to change their main business within 2011-2012 as compared to the previous year. This change was similar as the period between 2007 and 2008. It can be partly explained by the argument that after the economic slowdown, firms tended to shift their businesses and therefore achieved some level of stability.

|   |             |   |  |              |                         | Year 2         | 2012                        |   |   |          |               |       |
|---|-------------|---|--|--------------|-------------------------|----------------|-----------------------------|---|---|----------|---------------|-------|
| Year 2011   | Agriculture | Mining and<br>quarrying,<br>Manufacturing | Electricity,<br>water supply<br>and mining and | Construction | Retail and<br>wholesale | Transportation | Hospitality and<br>catering | Financial,<br>banking,<br>insurance and | Science and<br>technology,<br>education and | Services | Other sectors | Total |
| Agriculture   | 97.4        | 0.6                                       | 0.3  | 0.2          | 1.2                     | 0.0            | 0.0                         | 0.0                                     | 0.1   | 0.0      | 0.2           | 100   |
| Manufacturing   | 0.1         | 94.7                                      | 0.1  | 0.9          | 3.1                     | 0.2            | 0.1                         | 0.0                                     | 0.5   | 0.1      | 0.3           | 100   |
| Electricity, water supply<br>and mining and quarrying | 0.4         | 1.2                                       | 95.6   | 1.0          | 1.0                     | 0.3            | 0.0                         | 0.0                                     | 0.2   | 0.0      | 0.3           | 100   |
| Construction  | 0.1         | 1.1                                       | 0.1  | 93.2         | 2.3                     | 0.4            | 0.1                         | 0.0                                     | 2.0   | 0.0      | 0.8           | 100   |
| Retail and wholesale                                  | 0.1         | 1.9                                       | 0.1  | 1.3          | 94.9                    | 0.5            | 0.2                         | 0.0                                     | 0.4   | 0.1      | 0.6           | 100   |
| Transportation  | 0.1         | 0.5                                       | 0.0  | 1.1          | 2.6                     | 93.8           | 0.1                         | 0.0                                     | 0.3   | 0.0      | 1.4           | 100   |
| Hospitality and catering                              | 0.1         | 0.3                                       | 0.0  | 0.2          | 1.2                     | 0.2            | 96.0                        | 0.0                                     | 0.2   | 0.2      | 1.7           | 100   |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate         | 0.0         | 0.1                                       | 0.0  | 0.1          | 0.8                     | 0.2            | 0.0                         | 96.5                                    | 1.2   | 0.0      | 1.0           | 100   |
| Science and technology, education and health          | 0.0         | 1.6                                       | 0.1  | 3.1          | 1.5                     | 0.2            | 0.1                         | 0.3                                     | 91.3  | 0.1      | 1.8           | 100   |
| Services  | 0.1         | 2.3                                       | 0.1  | 2.1          | 5.8                     | 0.5            | 0.5                         | 0.1                                     | 2.8   | 81.6     | 4.1           | 100   |
| Other sectors   | 0.1         | 0.8                                       | 0.1  | 1.6          | 3.1                     | 1.1            | 0.5                         | 0.2                                     | 2.8   | 0.2      | 89.6          | 100   |

Table 3.17: The proportion of shifting enterprises in 2011 to other economic sector in2012

#### 4. Employment

#### 4.1. Employment

There have been rising concerns with regard to the effect of economic slowdown on worsening unemployment (Phan, 2012). However, GSO statistics suggest that unemployment and underemployment rate experienced a declining tendency during 2008-2012 (Figure 4.1). The unemployment rates in urban and rural areas were estimated at 3.1 percent and 1.3 percent respectively, which reflects a situation whereby Vietnamese workers cannot allow themselves to become unemployed due to inadequate social security policies. The underemployment rate in rural area was lower than that in the urban area (3.3 percent as compared to 1.6 percent).

To gain a deeper insight into employment changes in recent years, other characteristics of employment are investigated. While VHLSS covered data on employment, the number of observations was relatively low, especially on waged workers. Therefore, Labor Force and Employment Survey were used to analyze the employment, especially the employment fluctuation since the Survey covered a significantly bigger sample (See Section 2 for data description).



Figure 4.1: Unemployment and underemployment rate (%)

*Note: Underemployment is defined as working less than 35 hours per week Source: GSO* 

Table 4.1 displays the characteristics of the employment structure, rate of waged workers and the average working hours per week. Generally, there was no notable change in the employment structure by economic sectors. The employment shares of economic sectors slightly changed by 1.0 percent. However, Table 4.1 also shows some effect of the economic slowdown on the labor market. Specifically, the share of workers in agricultural sector increased by 2.5 percent from 44.4 percent in 2008 to 46.9 percent in 2012 (an increase by 1 million workers). This situation implies that economic slowdown raised the risk of losing

jobs in high productivity sector as well as decent jobs (i.e. industry and service) and created negative impacts on the movement of workers from agricultural sector. The proportions of waged workers and average weekly working hours declined but at low rate. The low average working hours per week of agricultural sector even further decreased (42.1 hours in 2008 to 37.6 hours in 2012).

Such industries as retailing, catering and hospitality, and service draw a big share of informal workers and therefore, record a low percentage of wage workers, only from 19.0 percent to 31.0 percent total workers these respective sectors. Other sectors as electricity production, water, mining; finance and banking, insurance and real estate account for a small percentage of workers (less than 1 percent). Nevertheless, these sectors along with information and technology, education and health sectors record high proportions of waged workers of more than 90 percent. The average weekly working hours of all industries were reported to fall among which some sectors recorded sharp decline compared to the average of 48 hours per week. Most notably, there was a decrease to only 37.6 hours per week in the agricultural sector.

|  | Employn<br>econor | ment struct<br>nic sectors | ture by<br>s (%) | Waged workers (%) Average working hours<br>(hours/week) |       |       | Average working hour (hours/week) |       |       |
|--|-------------------|----------------------------|------------------|---|-------|-------|-----------------------------------|-------|-------|
|  | 2008              | 2010                       | 2012             | 2008  | 2010  | 2012  | 2008                              | 2010  | 2012  |
| Agriculture  | 44,43             | 43,53                      | 46,90            | 6,89  | 7,63  | 7,21  | 42,64                             | 42,12 | 37,59 |
| Manufacturing  | 12,96             | 12,98                      | 12,22            | 61,04   | 66,57 | 67,87 | 50,43                             | 48,91 | 47,50 |
| Electricity, water supply and mining                                 | 0,75              | 0,74                       | 0,65             | 87,19   | 88,69 | 89,15 | 46,28                             | 45,16 | 44,09 |
| Construction   | 5,21              | 6,11                       | 5,61             | 79,55   | 85,81 | 85,81 | 51,61                             | 49,01 | 47,49 |
| Wholesale and retail trade;  | 13,59             | 13,43                      | 12,64            | 14,88   | 17,50 | 18,80 | 50,91                             | 48,96 | 48,31 |
| Transportation   | 3,76              | 3,34                       | 2,92             | 41,32   | 44,19 | 45,46 | 50,76                             | 48,58 | 48,09 |
| Accommodation and food service activities                            | 4,61              | 4,71                       | 4,45             | 15,88   | 20,12 | 19,80 | 48,77                             | 48,03 | 47,16 |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate activities             | 0,66              | 0,67                       | 0,71             | 92,16   | 90,26 | 90,15 | 44,95                             | 44,34 | 43,66 |
| Information, Science and<br>Technology, Education and<br>Health care | 6,08              | 6,40                       | 6,00             | 94,03   | 94,33 | 94,88 | 44,34                             | 43,59 | 41,31 |
| Services   | 2,09              | 2,04                       | 1,85             | 30,07   | 29,71 | 31,79 | 48,52                             | 47,17 | 46,22 |
| Other activities   | 5,87              | 6,06                       | 6,05             | 88,30   | 86,88 | 87,65 | 44,99                             | 43,93 | 41,32 |
| Total  | 100               | 100                        | 100              | 32,2  | 35,14 | 33,89 | 46,24                             | 45,18 | 42,14 |

 Table 4.1: Characteristics and employment structure by industry

Source: Labor Force and Employment Survey

Table 4.2 shows a substantial decline in the percentage of workers working for individual while this number of workers in household businesses recorded a reverse trend. Nevertheless, the average working hours of both groups fell over time reflecting the rising underemployment situation.

|                             | Labor structure by sectors (%) |       |       | % wag | ed worker | s (%) | Weekly working hours |       |       |  |
|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-----------|-------|----------------------|-------|-------|--|
|                             | 2008                           | 2010  | 2012  | 2008  | 2010      | 2012  | 2008                 | 2010  | 2012  |  |
| Working for individual      | 67,31                          | 49,82 | 58,45 | 10,62 | 6,47      | 9,39  | 44,78                | 42,6  | 39,09 |  |
| Household business          | 9,97                           | 26,33 | 17,87 | 30,11 | 33,49     | 31,22 | 52,73                | 48,85 | 48,39 |  |
| Private enterprise          | 5,82                           | 8,32  | 7,62  | 90,46 | 92,32     | 91,75 | 52,21                | 48,83 | 48,82 |  |
| Foreign invested enterprise | 1,84                           | 2,3   | 2,37  | 99,98 | 99,86     | 99,73 | 52,41                | 51,56 | 50,65 |  |
| State                       | 14,69                          | 13,2  | 13,43 | 99,99 | 99,54     | 99,52 | 45,24                | 44,2  | 41,78 |  |
| Total                       | 100                            | 100   | 100   | 32,06 | 35,14     | 33,89 | 46,22                | 45,18 | 42,14 |  |

 Table 4.2: Characteristics and employment structure by economic sector

Source: Labor Force and Employment Survey

Table 4.3 provides information on the average monthly and hourly wage and the proportion of workers with signed labor contracts during 2010 and 2012 (LFS 2008 does not have statistics on these categories). The average hourly wage (adjusted price in 2008) increased from 25% from 9.2 thousand VND to 11.7 thousand VND. Agricultural and service sectors were the only two industries where the average wage fell during that period. Since agricultural jobs are more vulnerable than jobs in other sectors, the total income of agricultural workers remarkably decreased due to the double effects of reduced working hours and lower average hourly wage.

The average wages witnessed a rising trend in all the remaining industries. Most notably, the average wage in finance, banking, insurance and real estate almost doubled in 2 years (9.8 thousand VND to 18.6 thousand VND) which was among the industries with the highest average wage. However, this number cannot fully reflect the total actual income. Even though fixed monthly wage seems to be more accurately recorded through this number, workers' income can comprise bonus and other sources of income which cannot be easily recorded.

Since the average monthly working hours decreased, the average monthly wage rose at a lower rate than the average hourly wage. The average monthly wage increased by approximately 18 percent during 2010-2012. In general, change in average monthly wage showed a similar pattern as that in hourly wage.

The rate of workers with signed labor contracts decreased from 43.4 percent to 41.1 percent. Most industries witnessed a declining trend for the rate of workers with signed labor contracts. The lowest rate was recorded for agriculture while those of electricity-mining, banking finance-insurance-real estate; information-science and technology-education-health care were notably high (above 90 percent) and relatively stable.

| Table 4.5: wage and labor contract | <b>Table 4.3:</b> | Wage | and labor | contracts |
|------------------------------------|-------------------|------|-----------|-----------|
|------------------------------------|-------------------|------|-----------|-----------|

|  | Average hourly wage (thousand VND/hour) |       | Average mont<br>(thousand VN | hly wage<br>ID/hour) | % workers with signed<br>labor contracts (%) |       |  |
|--|---|-------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|-------|--|
|  | 2010                                    | 2012  | 2010                         | 2012                 | 2011   | 2012  |  |
| Agriculture  | 10,14                                   | 9,00  | 1708,9                       | 1353,2               | 3,55   | 4,12  |  |
| Manufacturing  | 7,92                                    | 9,76  | 1548,7                       | 1854,4               | 66,23  | 64,65 |  |
| Electricity, water supply and mining                                 | 9,80                                    | 14,03 | 1770,0                       | 2474,3               | 92,08  | 90,74 |  |
| Construction   | 9,11                                    | 10,38 | 1785,8                       | 1971,8               | 18,03  | 15,80 |  |
| Wholesale and retail trade;  | 9,25                                    | 10,41 | 1811,9                       | 2011,6               | 29,05  | 27,62 |  |
| Transportation   | 9,83                                    | 12,56 | 1910,5                       | 2416,0               | 55,21  | 53,24 |  |
| Accommodation and food service activities                            | 6,67                                    | 8,35  | 1281,9                       | 1575,1               | 21,69  | 19,34 |  |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate activities             | 9,76                                    | 18,57 | 1731,9                       | 3243,1               | 95,10  | 96,84 |  |
| Information, Science and<br>Technology, Education and<br>Health care | 10,03                                   | 15,08 | 1748,0                       | 2491,8               | 96,19  | 95,43 |  |
| Services   | 8,23                                    | 7,49  | 1552,2                       | 1384,8               | 16,05  | 12,13 |  |
| Other activities   | 9,91                                    | 14,09 | 1741,0                       | 2328,8               | 92,08  | 91,60 |  |
| Total  | 9,18                                    | 11,66 | 1658,4                       | 1965,4               | 43,43  | 41,07 |  |

Note: Wage was adjusted with price in 2008

Source: Labor Force and Employment Survey

Table 4.4 indicates the rate of workers with fringe benefits including social and health insurance. During 2 years, the rates rose with regard to both social and heal insurance. Finance, Banking-Insurance-Real estate was the industry with the highest fringe benefits with increasing rates of workers having social and health insurance while those in other industries showed a reverse trend. Electricity-Water-Mining and Information-Science & Technology-Education-Health care were also among industries with good workers' fringe benefits (approximately 90 percent having social insurance and 80 percent having health insurance). The lowest rate of workers with fringe benefits was reported for agriculture where only 17.5 percent and 2.5 percent workers having social and health insurance respectively in 2012. Likewise, the rates of workers having fringe benefits in industries with high proportions of informal workers such as retailing, hospitality and catering and service were notably low, at only 2 percent to 7 percent.

| <b>Table 4.4:</b> | Workers' | fringe | benefits |
|-------------------|----------|--------|----------|
|-------------------|----------|--------|----------|

|  | % workers wit<br>insurance | h social<br>(%) | % workers with health insurance (%) |       |  |
|--|----------------------------|-----------------|-------------------------------------|-------|--|
|  | 2011                       | 2012            | 2011                                | 2012  |  |
| Agriculture  | 14,92                      | 17,52           | 3,22                                | 2,48  |  |
| Manufacturing  | 60,06                      | 59,87           | 41,53                               | 41,38 |  |
| Electricity, water supply and mining                     | 90,08                      | 88,75           | 83,89                               | 78,56 |  |
| Construction   | 15,33                      | 13,89           | 12,54                               | 11,44 |  |
| Wholesale and retail trade;                              | 47,09                      | 41,90           | 7,88                                | 7,34  |  |
| Transportation   | 46,55                      | 42,08           | 20,91                               | 20,51 |  |
| Accommodation and food service activities                | 30,37                      | 25,54           | 4,69                                | 5,12  |  |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate activities | 91,56                      | 93,97           | 80,13                               | 84,94 |  |

|  | % workers wit<br>insurance | th social<br>(%) | % workers with health<br>insurance (%) |       |  |
|--|----------------------------|------------------|--|-------|--|
| Information, Science and Technology, Education and Health care | 96,64                      | 95,91            | 90,02                                  | 89,55 |  |
| Services   | 16,35                      | 19,00            | 2,51                                   | 3,45  |  |
| Other activities   | 92,56                      | 90,46            | 78,33                                  | 75,83 |  |
| Total  | 59,4                       | 57,69            | 21,99                                  | 20,09 |  |

Source: Labor Force and Employment Survey

#### 4.2. Skilled and unskilled workers

Economic slowdown affects different groups of workers to different extents. Skills and expertise are two determinants of workers' compatibility in the labor market as well as of their coping capacity to negative impacts of economic slowdown. In Vietnam, the proportion of skilled workers accounted for approximately 17.2 percent in 2010 and slightly decreased to 16.8 percent in 2012. The skill levels vary among industries. While such industries as agriculture, service, construction, wholesale and retailing attract a large percentage of workers, the proportions of skilled workers in these industries were relatively low (Table 4.5). The highest rate of skilled workers was recorded for the industry of Information-Science & Technology-Education-Health care and Finance, Banking-Insurance-Real estate.

|  | 2010  | 2012  |
|--|-------|-------|
| Agriculture  | 2,62  | 2,6   |
| Manufacturing  | 13,56 | 14,35 |
| Electricity, water supply and mining                           | 56,87 | 58,56 |
| Construction   | 11,86 | 12,12 |
| Wholesale and retail trade;                                    | 12,38 | 13,6  |
| Transportation   | 16,88 | 16,92 |
| Accommodation and food service activities                      | 8,22  | 9,08  |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate activities       | 78,35 | 78,89 |
| Information, Science and Technology, Education and Health care | 88,58 | 88,63 |
| Services   | 9,06  | 9,55  |
| Other activities   | 67,9  | 67,75 |
| Total  | 17,15 | 16,82 |

#### Table 4.5: Proportions of skilled workers by industries

Note: skilled workers are defined as workers with elementary and advanced vocational training, and higher education.

Source: Labor Force and Employment Survey

The unemployment rate fell in general. Table 4.2 shows the unemployment rate of skilled and unskilled workers. Accordingly, there was a moderate decline in the unemployment rate of unskilled workers while this corresponding rate among skilled workers almost remained constant.



Figure 4.2: Unemployment rate of skilled and unskilled labor

Source: Labor Force and Employment Survey

Table 4.6 and 4.7 compares the average working hours and wages of skilled and unskilled workers. The average weekly working hours slightly fell for both groups, by around 2 hours during 2010 and 2012. The average hourly wage of skilled workers exceeded that of unskilled workers by a margin of approximately 25 percent. However, the actual hourly wage of skilled workers notably rose during this period by nearly 50 percent. Meanwhile, that of unskilled workers only showed a moderate increase and even fell given a decline in their average hourly working hours. The biggest decreases in the average monthly wage were shown in the industries of agriculture and service.

That the increase in the average wage of skilled workers was higher than that of unskilled workers widened the wage difference between these two groups during 2010-2012.

|   | Average weekly working hours |      | Hourly wage<br>(thousand VND) |      | Monthly wage<br>(thousand VND |        |
|---|------------------------------|------|-------------------------------|------|-------------------------------|--------|
|   | 2010                         | 2012 | 2010                          | 2012 | 2010                          | 2012   |
| Agriculture                                   | 40,6                         | 34,5 | 9,5                           | 14,1 | 1549,2                        | 1946,7 |
| Manufacturing                                 | 48,0                         | 47,1 | 8,6                           | 14,5 | 1659,5                        | 2733,1 |
| Electricity, water supply and mining          | 44,1                         | 43,5 | 10,7                          | 16,0 | 1888,7                        | 2773,4 |
| Construction                                  | 47,6                         | 46,3 | 9,8                           | 14,8 | 1872,0                        | 2749,6 |
| Wholesale and retail trade;                   | 49,2                         | 48,4 | 11,6                          | 13,4 | 2288,2                        | 2589,8 |
| Transportation                                | 47,6                         | 47,4 | 12,6                          | 15,3 | 2401,6                        | 2909,1 |
| Accommodation and food service activities     | 47,8                         | 47,3 | 8,8                           | 12,9 | 1685,8                        | 2443,4 |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate |                              |      |                               |      |                               |        |
| activities                                    | 43,5                         | 43,4 | 9,8                           | 19,9 | 1702,4                        | 3446,3 |
| Information, Science and Technology,          |                              |      |                               |      |                               |        |
| Education and Health care                     | 43,3                         | 40,9 | 10,3                          | 15,7 | 1784,6                        | 2574,3 |
| Services                                      | 46,1                         | 46,2 | 4,7                           | 10,4 | 870,9                         | 1928,9 |
| Other activities                              | 43,0                         | 40,8 | 10,9                          | 16,0 | 1865,3                        | 2602,4 |
| Total   | 44,6                         | 42,6 | 10,3                          | 15,6 | 1843,4                        | 2651,3 |

 Table 4.6: Working hours and wage of skilled workers

*Note: skilled workers are defined as workers with elementary, advanced vocational training, and higher education.* 

|   | Average weekly working hours |      | Hourl <u>y</u><br>(thousar | y wage<br>1d VND) | Monthly wage<br>(thousand VND) |        |
|---|------------------------------|------|----------------------------|-------------------|--------------------------------|--------|
|   | 2010                         | 2012 | 2010                       | 2012              | 2010                           | 2012   |
| Agriculture                                   | 42,2                         | 37,7 | 10,2                       | 8,7               | 1718,0                         | 1317,3 |
| Manufacturing                                 | 49,1                         | 47,6 | 7,8                        | 8,7               | 1523,4                         | 1659,2 |
| Electricity, water supply and mining          | 46,6                         | 45,0 | 8,3                        | 10,6              | 1541,0                         | 1903,1 |
| Construction                                  | 49,2                         | 47,7 | 9,0                        | 9,8               | 1774,9                         | 1864,1 |
| Wholesale and retail trade;                   | 48,9                         | 48,3 | 8,3                        | 9,0               | 1617,1                         | 1740,7 |
| Transportation                                | 48,8                         | 48,2 | 8,8                        | 11,5              | 1708,5                         | 2214,7 |
| Accommodation and food service activities     | 48,1                         | 47,2 | 6,3                        | 7,4               | 1204,9                         | 1399,4 |
| Financial, banking, insurance and real estate |                              |      |                            |                   | 1833 5                         | 1080.6 |
| activities                                    | 47,4                         | 44,8 | 9,7                        | 11,1              | 1855,5                         | 1980,0 |
| Information, Science and Technology,          |                              |      |                            |                   | 1318 1                         | 1573 1 |
| Education and Health care                     | 46,1                         | 44,1 | 7,2                        | 8,9               | 1316,1                         | 1575,1 |
| Services                                      | 47,3                         | 46,2 | 8,6                        | 7,2               | 1622,6                         | 1325,9 |
| Other activities                              | 46,0                         | 42,4 | 6,9                        | 8,5               | 1273,8                         | 1444,7 |
| Total   | 45,3                         | 42,1 | 8,4                        | 9,0               | 1521,5                         | 1518,8 |

#### Table 4.7: Working hours and wage of unskilled workers

*Note: skilled workers are defined as workers with elementary, advanced vocational training, and higher education.* 

Source: Labor Force and Employment Survey

#### 4.3. Short-term labor shirt

As mentioned above, in the long run most workers can find jobs after they lose their previous jobs. The unemployment rate in Vietnam is relatively low and tends to decrease even during economic slowdown. A question is brought forward as to whether workers lose or switch their jobs in the short run. Table 4.8 and Table 4.9 show the labor shift in terms of the share of workers in the short run (the first 6 months compared to the last 6 months of 2012) by industries. To estimate these tables, we use the panel data from the Labor Force and Employment Survey which was repeated on a quarterly or 6 month basis. For instance, the first line of Table 4.8 presents the rate of workers in agriculture during the first 6 months of 2012 (which was surveyed in either Quarter 1 or Quarter 2). During the last 6 months (which was surveyed in either Quarter 3 or Quarter 4), 88.8 percent workers stayed in agriculture while 2.03 percent switched to manufacturing and 3.95 percent did not go to work by the year-end.

Table 4.8 showed that the percentage of workers who did not switch to other industries was 80 percent on average. Agriculture was the industry whereby the switching trend was not apparent (88.8 percent workers still stayed in agriculture). Workers in industries with low rates of workers having signed labor contracts and low average wages tend to switch to other industries in a hope that they can find better job opportunities. However, these workers do not have high chances of finding jobs in such industries as Finance, Banking-Insurance-Real Estate or Information, Science and Technology, Education and Health care. 6.2 percent workers in service industry switched to agriculture, 5.6 percent switched to retailing and 5.5 percent became unemployed. Only 7.2 percent workers could find new jobs in 2012, mostly in agriculture (3.5 percent). The rate of workers in construction industry who switched to other industries was also high whereby 12 percent of construction workers in the first 6 months of 2012 switched to agriculture during the last 6 months.

Service industry also witnessed an obvious trend of labor shift whereby only 66.2 percent workers in the first 6 months stayed in this industry in the last 6 months. The job loss rate was 4 percent. The highest job loss rate was recorded for the industry of service (5.5 percent) while the lowest was in Information, Science and Technology, Education and Health care (2.8 percent).

The rate of workers switching to agriculture was quite high, which reflects that in a context when other industries face difficulties, workers tend to return to agriculture. The highest rates of workers switching to agriculture were recorded for retailing and manufacturing.

Table 4.9 analyzes the labor shift in 2011. Switching trend in 2011 tended to be consistent with that in 2012. However, the rates of workers switching to other industries in 2011 were generally lower than those in 2012. The situation implies that employment tends to be less stable during economic slowdown.

|   |             |               |                              |              | T                           | The last 6 m   | onths of 201  | 2                      |  |          |                  |             |       |
|---|-------------|---------------|------------------------------|--------------|-----------------------------|----------------|---|------------------------|--|----------|------------------|-------------|-------|
| The first 6<br>months of 2012                               | Agriculture | Manufacturing | Electricity,<br>water supply | Construction | Wholesale and retail trade; | Transportation | Accommodatio<br>n and food<br>service<br>activities | Financial,<br>banking, | Information,<br>Science and<br>Technology. | Services | Other activities | Not working | Total |
| Agriculture   | 88,75       | 2,03          | 0,04                         | 1,74         | 1,83                        | 0,29           | 0,44  | 0,02                   | 0,29                                       | 0,21     | 0,42             | 3,95        | 100   |
| Manufacturing   | 6,47        | 80,66         | 0,23                         | 1,67         | 3,03                        | 0,78           | 0,93  | 0,08                   | 0,61                                       | 0,65     | 0,64             | 4,25        | 100   |
| Electricity,<br>water supply<br>and mining                  | 4,97        | 3,22          | 73,98                        | 2,78         | 4,39                        | 0,88           | 0,73  | 0,15                   | 0,73                                       | 1,17     | 4,24             | 2,78        | 100   |
| Construction  | 12,00       | 3,29          | 0,11                         | 74,76        | 2,15                        | 1,07           | 0,77  | 0,02                   | 0,99                                       | 0,59     | 0,97             | 3,27        | 100   |
| Wholesale and retail trade;                                 | 5,67        | 3,42          | 0,16                         | 0,81         | 79,21                       | 1,28           | 2,65  | 0,09                   | 0,50                                       | 0,82     | 1,00             | 4,40        | 100   |
| Transportation  | 4,73        | 3,24          | 0,23                         | 2,02         | 5,29                        | 76,12          | 1,22  | 0,17                   | 0,73                                       | 0,63     | 2,12             | 3,51        | 100   |
| Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities             | 3,41        | 2,02          | 0,05                         | 0,80         | 6,76                        | 0,69           | 78,01   | 0,18                   | 0,64                                       | 0,92     | 1,35             | 5,18        | 100   |
| Financial,<br>banking,<br>insurance and<br>real estate      | 0,43        | 1,28          | 0,14                         | 0,43         | 1,71                        | 0,71           | 1,56  | 83,64                  | 1,71                                       | 0,28     | 5,12             | 2,99        | 100   |
| Information,<br>Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education and | 2,84        | 1,16          | 0,07                         | 0,67         | 1,27                        | 0,23           | 0,55  | 0,15                   | 87,09                                      | 0,46     | 2,74             | 2,79        | 100   |
| Services  | 6,17        | 4,73          | 0,37                         | 1,76         | 5,64                        | 1,22           | 2,07  | 0,37                   | 2,98                                       | 66,17    | 2,98             | 5,53        | 100   |
| Other activities  | 3,27        | 1,57          | 0,32                         | 0,64         | 1,97                        | 1,03           | 1,05  | 0,57                   | 2,97                                       | 1,14     | 82,23            | 3,24        | 100   |
| Not working   | 3,51        | 0,94          | 0,03                         | 0,28         | 0,86                        | 0,18           | 0,44  | 0,05                   | 0,31                                       | 0,19     | 0,36             | 92,84       | 100   |
| Total   | 29,97       | 7,92          | 0,41                         | 3,61         | 8,19                        | 1,94           | 2,94  | 0,46                   | 3,99                                       | 1,19     | 4,05             | 35,33       | 100   |

### Table 4.8: Rate of switching workers in 2012 by industries

|   | The last 6 months of 2012 |               |   |              |                             |                |   |  |  |           |                  |             |       |
|---|---------------------------|---------------|---|--------------|-----------------------------|----------------|---|--|--|-----------|------------------|-------------|-------|
| The first 6<br>months of 2012                               | Agriculture               | Manufacturing | Electricity, water<br>supply and mining | Construction | Wholesale and retail trade; | Transportation | Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities | Financial, banking,<br>insurance and real<br>estate activities | Information,<br>Science and<br>Technology, | Services  | Other activities | Not working | Total |
| Agriculture   | 85,2<br>8                 | 2,26          | 0,06                                    | 2,00         | 2,06                        | 0,34           | 0,44  | 0,02   | 0,25                                       | 0,24      | 0,47             | 6,58        | 100   |
| Manufacturing   | 6,54                      | 76,7<br>1     | 0,16                                    | 1,70         | 3,70                        | 0,82           | 0,94  | 0,07   | 0,63                                       | 0,81      | 0,78             | 7,13        | 100   |
| Electricity,<br>water supply<br>and mining                  | 4,86                      | 2,19          | 73,9<br>8                               | 3,15         | 3,81                        | 0,67           | 0,48  | 0,19   | 1,43                                       | 0,19      | 4,58             | 4,48        | 100   |
| Construction  | 10,9<br>8                 | 3,83          | 0,38                                    | 72,8<br>6    | 2,30                        | 1,43           | 0,74  | 0,07   | 0,68                                       | 0,70      | 0,94             | 5,10        | 100   |
| Wholesale and retail trade;                                 | 5,94                      | 3,74          | 0,26                                    | 0,96         | 75,7<br>4                   | 1,21           | 2,71  | 0,13   | 0,59                                       | 1,14      | 0,99             | 6,61        | 100   |
| Transportation  | 5,12                      | 3,15          | 0,14                                    | 2,27         | 5,88                        | 73,7<br>4      | 1,29  | 0,25   | 0,59                                       | 0,74      | 1,82             | 5,02        | 100   |
| Accommodatio<br>n and food<br>service<br>activities         | 3,29                      | 2,50          | 0,09                                    | 0,95         | 7,38                        | 0,78           | 73,3<br>5                                       | 0,21   | 0,44                                       | 0,89      | 1,52             | 8,60        | 100   |
| Financial,<br>banking,<br>insurance and<br>real estate      | 1,58                      | 1,58          | 0,25                                    | 0,50         | 1,75                        | 0,83           | 0,42  | 79,2<br>0  | 1,41                                       | 0,67      | 5,74             | 6,07        | 100   |
| Information,<br>Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education and | 2,57                      | 1,00          | 0,10                                    | 0,69         | 1,47                        | 0,32           | 0,60  | 0,16   | 84,6<br>8                                  | 0,70      | 2,70             | 5,02        | 100   |
| Services  | 4,35                      | 5,75          | 0,38                                    | 2,00         | 7,24                        | 1,78           | 1,87  | 0,22   | 1,75                                       | 62,2<br>5 | 3,11             | 9,28        | 100   |
| Other activities  | 3,24                      | 1,55          | 0,55                                    | 0,97         | 1,98                        | 1,44           | 1,06  | 0,77   | 2,63                                       | 0,98      | 79,8<br>9        | 4,95        | 100   |
| Not working   | 4,75                      | 1,45          | 0,05                                    | 0,59         | 1,37                        | 0,32           | 0,64  | 0,07   | 0,40                                       | 0,31      | 0,46             | 89,5<br>9   | 100   |
| Total   | 24,4<br>6                 | 7,58          | 0,42                                    | 3,56         | 7,94                        | 1,93           | 2,80  | 0,47   | 3,69                                       | 1,22      | 3,64             | 42,3<br>0   | 100   |

### Table 4.9: Rate of switching workers in 2012 by industries

| The first 6 months of 2012  | Working<br>for<br>individual | Household<br>business | Private<br>enterprise | Foreign<br>invested<br>enterprise | State-<br>owned<br>enterprises | State sector | Not<br>working | Total |
|-----------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------|----------------|-------|
| Working for<br>individual   | 85,88                        | 7,92                  | 0,98                  | 0,15                              | 0,26                           | 0,56         | 4,25           | 100   |
| Household business          | 16,81                        | 74,49                 | 3,08                  | 0,24                              | 0,33                           | 0,71         | 4,35           | 100   |
| Private enterprise          | 6,70                         | 6,98                  | 74,13                 | 2,79                              | 3,32                           | 1,75         | 4,33           | 100   |
| Foreign invested enterprise | 3,69                         | 2,06                  | 10,19                 | 78,83                             | 0,89                           | 0,65         | 3,69           | 100   |
| State-owned<br>enterprises  | 3,75                         | 1,89                  | 9,10                  | 0,93                              | 73,51                          | 6,88         | 3,94           | 100   |
| State sector                | 3,59                         | 1,45                  | 1,25                  | 0,14                              | 2,03                           | 88,67        | 2,87           | 100   |
| Not working                 | 4,62                         | 1,45                  | 0,58                  | 0,15                              | 0,21                           | 0,56         | 92,42          | 100   |
| Total                       | 37,06                        | 12,35                 | 4,84                  | 1,39                              | 2,10                           | 6,79         | 35,45          | 100   |

The last 6 months of 2012

#### Table 4.10: Rate of switching workers in 2012 by economic sectors

Source: Labor Force and Employment Survey

Table 4.10 reflects the rates of labor shift in short run (the first 6 months compared to the last 6 months of 2012) to other economic sectors. On average, the rate of workers who did not switch to other sectors was around 80 percent. The sector with most stable structure was state and working for individual with respective rates of workers who stay in the sectors of 88.7 percent and 85.8 percent. Meanwhile, the highest rates of workers switching to other sectors were in state-owned enterprises, private enterprises and household businesses. There were a considerate percentage of 9.1 percent of workers in state-owned enterprises switching to private enterprises. Among switching workers of household businesses, the majority changed to self-employed making up 16.8 percent the total workers of the sector.

Table 4.11 displays the labor shift in the short run (the first 6 months compared with the last 6 months) by economic sectors in 2011. The switching trend in 2011 was quite consistent with that in 2012. However, the rate of switching workers in 2011 was in general lower than that in 2012.

|                             |                              | The last 6 months of 2012 |                       |                                   |                                |              |                |       |  |  |  |  |  |
|-----------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------|----------------|-------|--|--|--|--|--|
| The first 6 months of 2012  | Working<br>for<br>individual | Household<br>business     | Private<br>enterprise | Foreign<br>invested<br>enterprise | State-<br>owned<br>enterprises | State sector | Not<br>working | Total |  |  |  |  |  |
| Working for individual      | 82,90                        | 8,02                      | 1,09                  | 0,17                              | 0,25                           | 0,53         | 7,04           | 100   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Household business          | 13,35                        | 75,49                     | 3,25                  | 0,39                              | 0,32                           | 0,62         | 6,57           | 100   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Private enterprise          | 6,59                         | 9,76                      | 67,09                 | 2,85                              | 3,48                           | 2,05         | 8,18           | 100   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Foreign invested enterprise | 2,97                         | 2,61                      | 10,53                 | 74,13                             | 1,34                           | 0,79         | 7,63           | 100   |  |  |  |  |  |
| State-owned<br>enterprises  | 3,01                         | 2,24                      | 9,66                  | 0,94                              | 70,86                          | 7,69         | 5,60           | 100   |  |  |  |  |  |
| State sector                | 3,41                         | 1,67                      | 1,41                  | 0,20                              | 3,25                           | 85,08        | 4,99           | 100   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Not working                 | 5,81                         | 2,66                      | 0,96                  | 0,37                              | 0,27                           | 0,70         | 89,22          | 100   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total                       | 28,80                        | 14,35                     | 4,63                  | 1,51                              | 2,020                          | 6,18         | 42,51          | 100   |  |  |  |  |  |

Table 4.11: Rate of switching workers in 2011 by economic sectors

#### 5. Poverty and welfare of households

#### 5.1. Poverty reduction in recent years

Table 5.1 presents the estimates of average income and poverty rate based on the income poverty line. The income poverty line for the period of 2011-2015 is 400,000 VND/person/month (equivalence to 4.8 million VND/person/year) for the rural areas and 500,000 VND/person/month (6 million VND/person/year) for the urban areas. Based on this poverty line and according to the General Survey on Poor and Near-poor Households by Molise, the poverty rate was 14.2 percent by 2010 (MOLISA, 2011). If this poverty line was applied to VHLSS 2010, the poverty rate was estimated to be 7.9 percent, much lower than the poverty rate announced by MOLISA. The reason of this difference is that VHLSS 2010 collected comprehensive data on the household income, while the General Survey on Poor and Near-poor Households employed a much simpler questionnaire, which could result in the omission of a number of sources of household income. The General Survey on Poor and Near-poor Households collected information of a large number of poor and near-poor households, which made it impossible to use the comprehensive questionnaire of the sampling survey.

In this research, we use norms on households in danger of falling into poverty instead of poverty line. The norms on households in danger of falling into poverty for the period of 2011-2015 are 520,000 VND/person/month for the rural areas and 650,000 VND/person/month for the urban areas. When these norms on households in danger of falling into poverty for the period of 2011-2015 was applied to VHLSS 2010, the proportion of households having income below these norms was 14 percent, closer to the poverty rate announced by MOLISA. Therefore, poor households in this research are defined as households with each member earning an average income of up to VND 520,000 per month in rural areas and up to 650,000 VND per month in urban areas. To calculate the poverty line for VHLSS 2012, we adjusted this norm on households in danger of falling into poverty for inflation in the 2010-2012 period.

Results from the annual review of poor households by MOLISA showed that the poverty rate reduced by 2 percentage points. However, there were still opinions pointing out that the actual poverty rate could increase in the context of economic slowdown (Vneconomy, 2013). Estimates from VHLSS 2010 and 2012 indicated that the poverty rate decreased from 14 percent in 2010 to 11.8 percent in 2012 (Figure 5.1). Poverty reduction was achieved in both rural and urban areas, as well as all geographical regions including such poverty regions as the Northern midlands and mountains and Central Highlands. The Central Coast achieved the most notable poverty reduction from 20.6 percent in 2010 to 15.5 percent in 2012 (Table 5.1).



Figure 5.1: Poverty rate within 2010-2012

Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

The real average income of households has increased by 3.5 percent over the two years. This growth rate is much slower than that of the 2006-2008 period, which was recorded at 17 percent (this estimate was based on VHLSS 2006 and 2008). On the contrary, the average income in urban areas was reduced slightly. In terms of geographical regions, the household income in the Southeast reduced by 9.2 percent. The average household income in the Red River Delta went up but the increase is quite small in comparison with other regions. In summary, the household income in high-income regions increased at a slower rate or even decreased compared to other regions. This difference reflected the effects of economic slowdown on households whose income depends on the performance of service or industrial activities.

| Areas                           | Average Income<br>(Thousand<br>VND/person/month) |        | Income rate of | Poverty rate (%) |      | Change in<br>poverty<br>rate |
|---------------------------------|--|--------|----------------|------------------|------|------------------------------|
|                                 | 2010   | 2012   | change (%)     | 2010             | 2012 | (Percentage point)           |
| The whole country               | 1574.6   | 1629.7 | 3.5            | 14.0             | 11.8 | -2.2                         |
| Rural/Urban areas               |  |        |                |                  |      |                              |
| Rural areas                     | 1219.3   | 1311.5 | 7.6            | 17.9             | 15.1 | -2.8                         |
| Urban areas                     | 2383.9   | 2372.2 | -0.5           | 5.1              | 4.0  | -1.1                         |
| Geographical regions            |  |        |                |                  |      |                              |
| Red River Delta                 | 1735.1   | 1807.6 | 4.2            | 7.2              | 6.0  | -1.2                         |
| Northern Midlands and Mountains | 991.0  | 1128.7 | 13.9           | 33.1             | 29.0 | -4.1                         |
| Central Coast                   | 1119.4   | 1274.4 | 13.8           | 20.6             | 15.5 | -5.1                         |
| Central Highlands               | 1267.6   | 1555.3 | 22.7           | 18.3             | 15.9 | -2.4                         |
| Southeast                       | 2715.9   | 2465.7 | -9.2           | 1.9              | 1.8  | -0.1                         |
| Mekong River Delta              | 1348.3   | 1435.4 | 6.5            | 12.1             | 10.6 | -1.5                         |

Table 5.1: The household income and poverty rate by geographical regions

Average income was measured by the price level in January 2010.

Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

One of the weaknesses of poverty rate measurement is its inability to indicate how far off households are from the poverty line or reflect the "depth of poverty". To measure the depth of poverty, we use two indices, including the poverty gap index and the squared poverty gap index (which are described in detail in Annex 1). The higher these indices are, the larger the gap between the poverty line and the income of poor households. The squared poverty gap index puts higher weight for poor households. Therefore, it is also called poverty severity. Table 5.2 shows the reduction of the depth of poverty in both rural and urban areas. In terms of geographical regions, with the exception of the Southeast, the depth of poverty reduced in all regions, especially in the North Mountains and Central Coast. This means that the living standards of the poor and the inequality in living standards among the poor were improved in the 2010-2012 period.

|                                    | Po     | overty gap ind | ex      | Squared poverty gap index |        |         |  |
|------------------------------------|--------|----------------|---------|---------------------------|--------|---------|--|
|                                    | 2010   | 2012           | Change  | 2010                      | 2012   | Change  |  |
| The whole country                  | 0.0397 | 0.0300         | -0.0097 | 0.0162                    | 0.0109 | -0.0053 |  |
| Rural/Urban areas                  |        |                |         |                           |        |         |  |
| Rural areas                        | 0.0519 | 0.0388         | -0.0131 | 0.0215                    | 0.0142 | -0.0073 |  |
| Urban areas                        | 0.0119 | 0.0096         | -0.0023 | 0.0043                    | 0.0034 | -0.0009 |  |
| Geographical regions               |        |                |         |                           |        |         |  |
| Red River Delta                    | 0.0175 | 0.0156         | -0.0019 | 0.0063                    | 0.0056 | -0.0007 |  |
| Northern Midlands and<br>Mountains | 0.1054 | 0.0792         | -0.0262 | 0.0460                    | 0.0297 | -0.0163 |  |
| Central Coast                      | 0.0586 | 0.0382         | -0.0204 | 0.0246                    | 0.0140 | -0.0106 |  |
| Central Highlands                  | 0.0527 | 0.0408         | -0.0119 | 0.0208                    | 0.0138 | -0.0070 |  |
| Southeast                          | 0.0046 | 0.0049         | 0.0003  | 0.0020                    | 0.0017 | -0.0003 |  |
| Mekong River Delta                 | 0.0308 | 0.0246         | -0.0062 | 0.0113                    | 0.0087 | -0.0026 |  |

Table 5.2: Poverty gap index and squared poverty gap index by geographical regions

Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

Although poverty is often measured by general living standard measures such as income and expenditure, the multi-dimension of poverty is also needed to be considered in poverty analyses. Table 5.3 analyzed the expenditure of households in two important areas of education and health. The real expenditure in education of households, which was adjusted for inflation, witnessed a slight increase over the two years of 2010 and 2012. The proportion of education expenditure in the total expenditure of households also increased from 9.6 percent in 2010 to 9.9 percent in 2012. However, the poor households suffered a reduction of about 23 percent in average education expenditure per person from 247 thousand VND to 190 thousand VND. Regarding geographical regions, the Southeast had the highest average education expenditure but this expenditure also decreased in the 2010-2012 period.

Household expenditure in health saw a minor decrease of about 2.5 percent in the period of 2010-2012. The proportion of health expenditure in the total household expenditure also went down from 11.4 percent to 10.8 percent in the same period. The poor households had a relatively large reduction in health expenditure, which decreased by 22 percent. Concerning geographical regions, the Southeast was also the region with the greatest decrease in average health expenditure in the period of 2010-2012.

|                                    | House   | Household expenditure in education                   |   |   |   | Household expenditure in health                   |   |  |  |  |
|------------------------------------|---|--|---|---|---|---|---|--|--|--|
|                                    | 201   | 0  | 20  | 12  | 2010  | )   | 2012  | 2  |  |  |
|                                    | Average<br>expenditu<br>re per<br>person<br>(thousand<br>VND/mon<br>th) | Percent<br>age in<br>the<br>total<br>expend<br>iture | Average<br>expenditur<br>e per<br>person<br>(thousand<br>VND/mon<br>th) | Percenta<br>ge in the<br>total<br>expendit<br>ure | Average<br>expenditure<br>per person<br>(thousand<br>VND/mont<br>h) | Percent<br>age in<br>the total<br>expendi<br>ture | Average<br>expenditur<br>e per<br>person<br>(thousand<br>VND/mon<br>th) | Percen<br>tage in<br>the<br>total<br>expen<br>diture |  |  |
| The whole country                  | 747.8   | 9.6  | 760.5   | 9.9   | 804.0   | 11.4  | 780.9   | 10.8   |  |  |
| Poverty                            |   |  |   |   |   |   |   |  |  |  |
| Non-poor                           | 829.3   | 9.7  | 836.4   | 10.2  | 874.7   | 11.3  | 846.6   | 10.9   |  |  |
| Poor                               | 247.3   | 8.8  | 190.9   | 7.8   | 369.8   | 12.2  | 288.3   | 10.3   |  |  |
| Ethnics                            |   |  |   |   |   |   |   |  |  |  |
| Kinh                               | 826.7   | 10.1   | 838.7   | 10.4  | 880.5   | 11.8  | 853.0   | 11.3   |  |  |
| Minorities                         | 206.0   | 5.9  | 230.4   | 6.4   | 278.8   | 8.5   | 291.9   | 7.2  |  |  |
| Rural/Urban areas                  |   |  |   |   |   |   |   |  |  |  |
| Rural areas                        | 494.4   | 8.9  | 534.7   | 9.1   | 715.6   | 12.0  | 689.1   | 11.2   |  |  |
| Urban areas                        | 1325.0  | 11.2   | 1287.5  | 11.7  | 1005.5  | 10.0  | 995.3   | 9.8  |  |  |
| Geographical regions               |   |  |   |   |   |   |   |  |  |  |
| Red River Delta                    | 864.2   | 10.7   | 897.5   | 11.0  | 962.8   | 11.6  | 942.6   | 11.4   |  |  |
| Northern Midlands<br>and Mountains | 419.8   | 7.9  | 428.1   | 7.7   | 522.2   | 8.8   | 619.8   | 8.9  |  |  |
| Central Coast                      | 674.4   | 11.4   | 719.5   | 11.8  | 694.6   | 11.6  | 674.1   | 10.5   |  |  |
| Central Highlands                  | 668.1   | 10.4   | 700.9   | 9.7   | 734.4   | 12.2  | 759.0   | 10.3   |  |  |
| Southeast                          | 1336.9  | 10.4   | 1178.1  | 11.1  | 964.1   | 10.7  | 789.8   | 9.3  |  |  |
| Mekong River Delta                 | 395.2   | 6.2  | 505.4   | 6.9   | 786.5   | 13.0  | 807.9   | 13.2   |  |  |

#### Table 5.3: Average household expenditure in education and health

Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

#### 5.2. Poverty reduction, growth and inequality

The above results show that household income in rural areas grew at a faster rate than that in urban areas in the 2010-2012 period. This finding suggests that the degree of income inequality could reduce in this period. Figure 5.2 shows that Gini ratio of income declined from 0.44 to 0.41 in the period of 2010-2012. This result is different from that of the growing period before 2010, when Gini ratio of both income and expenditure witnessed an increase (World Bank, 2012). The reason behind this reduction could be the effect of economic slowdown, making households in rural areas, rich and better-off groups suffer a greater decrease in the growth rate of income.



Figure 5.2: Gini ratio in 2010-2012

#### Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

The question is whether the rate of poverty reduction was affected by the decrease of the economic growth rate in recent years. Another question is whether a more equal income distribution contributed to the poverty reduction. To answer these questions, we need to figure out how income increase and changes in income distribution affected poverty reduction in the recent period. Table 5.4 analyzes the changes in situation of poverty in the 2010-2012 period under the effects of three factors: the growth of average income, income distribution and other factors in the decomposition of poverty changes by Datt and Ravallion (1991). The results show that household poverty reduction in the 2010-2012 period was attributed to both income increase and income inequality decrease. The poverty reduction effect of income distribution was even higher than that of income growth. Increase in income and decrease in income inequality reduced the poverty rate by 0.94 percentage point and 1.34 percentage point respectively. In urban areas, the average income increased the poverty rate. However, income redistribution helped reduce the poverty rate in urban areas by 1.22 percentage point.

|                   |       | Poverty rate |        | Contribution of growth and income<br>distribution to poverty reduction in the 2010-<br>2012 period |                     |               |  |
|-------------------|-------|--------------|--------|--|---------------------|---------------|--|
|                   | 2010  | 2012         | Change | Growth   | Income distribution | Other factors |  |
| The whole country | 13.99 | 11.76        | -2.24  | -0.94  | -1.34               | 0.04          |  |
| In which          |       |              |        |  |                     |               |  |
| Urban             | 5.13  | 3.97         | -1.16  | 0.05   | -1.22               | 0.02          |  |
| Rural             | 17.88 | 15.09        | -2.79  | -2.44  | -0.69               | 0.34          |  |

Table 5.4: Growth, income distribution and poverty reduction in the 2010-2012 period

#### Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

Table 5.5 estimates the elasticity of poverty rate to average income and inequality (which was measured by Gini index). Table 5.5 shows that the elasticity of poverty rate to Gini index was much higher than the elasticity of poverty rate to average income. In 2012, if average income grew by 1 percent, the poverty rate decreased by 2.1 percent. It is found that if Gini index increases by 1 percent, poverty rate goes up by 5.5 percent. This finding points out the more important role of income distribution in poverty reduction in comparison with average income growth. In other words, to reduce poverty, it is necessary to issue more

policies helping the poor increase their income. The elasticity of poverty rate to average income and Gini index tends to increase with time, confirming the increasingly vital role of income growth and equal income distribution guarantee in poverty reduction.

|                   | The elasticity of | The elasticity of poverty rate to Gini index of average income |        |      |      |        |
|-------------------|-------------------|--|--------|------|------|--------|
|                   | 2010              | 2012   | Change | 2010 | 2012 | Change |
| The whole country | -1.88             | -2.09  | -0.21  | 4.96 | 5.46 | 0.50   |
| In which          |                   |  |        |      |      |        |
| Urban             | -2.96             | -2.53  | 0.43   | 7.33 | 6.86 | -0.47  |
| Rural             | -1.74             | -2.04  | -0.30  | 3.19 | 4.12 | 0.93   |

 Table 5.5. The elasticity of poverty rate to income and Gini index

Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

#### **5.3.** Moving out of poverty and falling into poverty

Poor households include both chronically poor households and temporarily poor households. Identifying different poor household groups plays a crucial role in introducing suitable propoor policies (Baulch and Hoddinott, 2000). Chronically poor households are defined as households who are continuously poor over a long period while temporarily poor households are households who are poor at a period of time but are not poor at another period of time over a specific time span (Hulme and Shepherd, 2003). In this research, we used the panel data of VHLSS 2010 and 2012 to analyze the move of poverty in different household groups. Figure 5.3 presents the rate of moving out of poverty and falling into poverty in the 2010-2012 period. A large number of households moved out of poverty in 2012, but there were also many households who were not poor in 2010 and fell into poverty in 2012.

Figure 5.3 also shows the degree of chronic poverty by geographical regions. Chronically poor households could be considered as poor households in both 2010 and 2012. The percentage of chronically poor households witnessed a significant change in geographical regions, recording the highest score in the Northern Mountains, followed by the Central Highlands and Central Coast.



Figure 5.3. Proportion of people fall into poverty and lifted out of poverty in 2010-2012

Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

Table 5.6 presents in detail the rate of moving out of poverty and falling into poverty in the period of 2010-2012. The rate of falling into poverty in 2012 was 4.2 percent, accounting for 30 percent of poor households. The proportion of households falling into poverty in the total number of poor households was higher in the urban areas, the Southeast, Mekong Delta River and River Delta River, where the poverty rate was lower than other areas and suffered much more from the effect of economic slowdown. These areas are the most developed regions but have been affected the most by the economic slowdown. The last two columns of table 5.6 estimate the proportion of households moving out of poverty and falling into poverty to the total number of poor households. The region succeeded in poverty reduction if the rate of moving out of poverty was high and the rate of falling into poverty was low. However, the regions which had high rate of moving out of poverty also had high rate of falling into poverty.

| Table 5.6: | The rate   | of moving | out of and | falling into | poverty : | for the | 2010-2012 | period |
|------------|------------|-----------|------------|--------------|-----------|---------|-----------|--------|
| by geogra  | phical are | as (%)    |            |              |           |         |           |        |

|                                 | Household dis                    | tribution based on<br>(%   | the 2010 and 201   | 2 poverty line                       | The proportion of   | The proportion of households  |
|---------------------------------|----------------------------------|--|--|--------------------------------------|---|---|
| Areas                           | Poor in both<br>2010 and<br>2012 | Falling into<br>poverty: non-<br>poor in 2010<br>but poor in<br>2012 | Moving out<br>of poverty:<br>poor in 2010<br>but non-poor<br>in 2012 | Non-poor in<br>both 2010<br>and 2012 | households<br>falling into<br>poverty in<br>2012 to the<br>total number<br>of poor<br>households in<br>2010 (%) | moving out of<br>poverty in 2012<br>to the total<br>number of poor<br>households in<br>2010 (%) |
| The whole country               | 7.3                              | 4.2  | 7.2  | 81.3                                 | 36.5  | 49.7  |
| Rural/Urban areas               |                                  |  |  |                                      |   |   |
| Rural areas                     | 9.3                              | 5.2  | 8.7  | 76.8                                 | 35.9  | 48.3  |
| Urban areas                     | 1.9                              | 1.5  | 3.1  | 93.5                                 | 44.1  | 62.0  |
| Geographical regions            |                                  |  |  |                                      |   |   |
| Red River Delta                 | 3.0                              | 2.3  | 4.0  | 90.7                                 | 43.4  | 57.1  |
| Northern Midlands and Mountains | 21.2                             | 6.7  | 11.1   | 61.0                                 | 24.0  | 34.4  |
| Central Coast                   | 9.7                              | 5.3  | 10.9   | 74.0                                 | 35.3  | 52.9  |
| Central Highlands               | 9.0                              | 4.3  | 9.3  | 77.4                                 | 32.3  | 50.8  |
| Southeast                       | 0.7                              | 1.6  | 1.6  | 96.1                                 | 69.6  | 69.6  |
| Mekong River Delta              | 4.4                              | 5.6  | 7.9  | 82.1                                 | 56.0  | 64.2  |

Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

Table 5.7 shows that Kinh households had a higher rate of falling into poverty than ethnic minority households. Households which had high level of education also had a higher rate of falling into poverty than those which had lower level of education. This relationship is evident when the jobs of householders were examined. Householders who worked in agriculture were less likely to fall into poverty than householders working in other sectors. This finding reflects the fact that economic slowdown affected industry and service more than agriculture; and better-off households more than poor households.

|   | Household distrib             | oution based on the              | e 2010 and 2012 p                | overty line (%)                  | Household   | Household   |
|---|-------------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|---|---|
| Household groups                          | Poor in both<br>2010 and 2012 | Poor in both<br>2010 and<br>2012 | Poor in both<br>2010 and<br>2012 | Poor in both<br>2010 and<br>2012 | distribution<br>based on the<br>2010 and<br>2012<br>poverty line<br>(%) | distribution<br>based on<br>the 2010<br>and 2012<br>poverty line<br>(%) |
| Ethnic groups                             |                               |                                  |                                  |                                  |   |   |
| Kinh                                      | 3.2                           | 3.2                              | 5.8                              | 87.8                             | 50.0  | 64.4  |
| Ethnic minorities                         | 33.2                          | 10.9                             | 16.1                             | 39.8                             | 24.7  | 32.7  |
| Level of education of householde          | er                            |                                  |                                  |                                  |   |   |
| Not finish primary school                 | 16.6                          | 6.7                              | 11.8                             | 64.9                             | 28.8  | 41.5  |
| Primary school                            | 7.6                           | 4.9                              | 7.8                              | 79.7                             | 39.2  | 50.6  |
| Lower secondary school                    | 4.3                           | 3.9                              | 7.2                              | 84.6                             | 47.6  | 62.6  |
| Upper secondary school                    | 3.1                           | 2.6                              | 5.0                              | 89.3                             | 45.6  | 61.7  |
| Vocational school                         | 0.8                           | 1.7                              | 1.7                              | 95.8                             | 68.0  | 68.0  |
| College, university and post-<br>graduate | 0.0                           | 0.0                              | 0.5                              | 99.5                             | n.a.  | 100.0   |
| Householder employment                    |                               |                                  |                                  |                                  |   |   |
| Not working                               | 3.8                           | 2.1                              | 5.1                              | 89.0                             | 35.6  | 57.3  |
| Official area                             | 2.7                           | 1.8                              | 2.9                              | 92.6                             | 40.0  | 51.8  |
| Unofficial area                           | 9.0                           | 5.2                              | 8.5                              | 77.2                             | 36.6  | 48.6  |
| Jobs of householders                      |                               |                                  |                                  |                                  |   |   |
| Manager                                   | 3.5                           | 5.5                              | 4.0                              | 87.1                             | 61.1  | 53.3  |
| Specialist, technician                    | 0.4                           | 1.6                              | 2.2                              | 95.8                             | 80.0  | 84.6  |
| Secretary, office worker                  | 2.1                           | 1.2                              | 3.1                              | 93.6                             | 36.4  | 59.6  |
| Agriculture                               | 13.4                          | 6.5                              | 11.2                             | 68.9                             | 32.7  | 45.5  |
| Skilled Laborer                           | 2.7                           | 2.3                              | 4.4                              | 90.6                             | 46.0  | 62.0  |
| Unskilled Laborer                         | 3.7                           | 4.9                              | 4.4                              | 87.0                             | 57.0  | 54.3  |
| Not working                               | 4.2                           | 2.7                              | 6.3                              | 86.8                             | 39.1  | 60.0  |

## Table 5.7: The rate of moving out of poverty and falling into poverty for the 2010-2012period by household characteristics (%)

#### Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

Table 5.8 and 5.9 analyzes the ratio of households having a decrease in real income in the period of 2010-2012. Vietnam had about 38.8 percent of household having a decrease in real income, and the rate of decrease in average income of this household groups was quite high, scoring at about 32.5 percent. On the contrary, there were about 61.2 percent of households having an increase in real income at the rate of 54.1 percent in the 2010-2012 period.

In terms of geographical regions, the Southeast had the largest number of households having a decrease in real income at a high rate. The Central Highlands had a relatively low rate of households having a decrease in income and simultaneously the highest rate of income increase of developed household group.

|                                 | Househol  | ds having a o                                     | lecrease in rea  | l income              | Households having an increase in real income             |   |  |                             |  |
|---------------------------------|---|---|--|-----------------------|--|---|--|-----------------------------|--|
| Areas                           | % of<br>households<br>having a<br>decrease in<br>income | Average<br>income/<br>person/<br>month in<br>2010 | Average<br>income/<br>person/<br>month in<br>2012 (by<br>2010 price) | % change<br>in income | % of<br>households<br>having an<br>increase in<br>income | Average<br>income/<br>person/<br>month in<br>2010 | Average<br>income/<br>person/<br>month in<br>2012 (by<br>2010 price) | %<br>change<br>in<br>income |  |
| The whole country               | 38.8  | 1879.5  | 1268.4   | -32.5                 | 61.2   | 1136.7  | 1751.1   | 54.1                        |  |
| Rural/Urban areas               |   |   |  |                       |  |   |  |                             |  |
| Rural areas                     | 37.5  | 1507.6  | 984.8  | -34.7                 | 62.5   | 956.6   | 1539.4   | 60.9                        |  |
| Urban areas                     | 42.3  | 2776.0  | 1952.0   | -29.7                 | 57.7   | 1667.9  | 2375.3   | 42.4                        |  |
| Geographical<br>regions         |   |   |  |                       |  |   |  |                             |  |
| Red River Delta                 | 39.3  | 2233.2  | 1521.0   | -31.9                 | 60.7   | 1364.1  | 2021.0   | 48.2                        |  |
| Northern Midlands and Mountains | 38.3  | 1188.3  | 821.6  | -30.9                 | 61.7   | 805.7   | 1268.2   | 57.4                        |  |
| Central Coast                   | 36.1  | 1464.4  | 1040.0   | -29.0                 | 63.9   | 895.1   | 1366.4   | 52.7                        |  |
| Central Highlands               | 34.3  | 1629.0  | 1112.2   | -31.7                 | 65.7   | 1046.8  | 1830.9   | 74.9                        |  |
| Southeast                       | 40.2  | 2862.1  | 1793.4   | -37.3                 | 59.8   | 1604.6  | 2501.8   | 55.9                        |  |
| Mekong River Delta              | 42.2  | 1659.6  | 1137.1   | -31.5                 | 57.8   | 1055.8  | 1632.4   | 54.6                        |  |

Table 5.8: Changes in income of households by region (%)

Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

Table 5.9 also shows that the rate of households having a decrease in average income in households where the householders had a high level of education or worked in nonagricultural sectors was higher than that in households where householders had a lower level of education or worked in agricultural sector. This demonstrates the fact that the effects of economic slowdown hit industries requiring highly-skilled labor (or sustainable jobs, nonagricultural jobs) more seriously.

| Table 5.9: Changes in nousenoid income by nousenoid characteristics ( | (%) | % |
|---|-----|---|
|---|-----|---|

|                                       | Househol                          | ds having a c               | lecrease in rea                   | l income                    | Household                         | ds having an                | increase in rea                   | l income                    |
|---------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Household groups                      | % of households                   | Average income/             | % of households                   | Average income/             | % of<br>households                | Average income/             | % of<br>households                | Average income/             |
| nouscnou groups                       | having a<br>decrease in<br>income | person/<br>month in<br>2010 |
| Ethnic groups                         | meome                             | 2010                        | meonie                            | 2010                        | meome                             | 2010                        | meonie                            | 2010                        |
| Kinh                                  | 38,5                              | 2057,7                      | 1382,8                            | -32,8                       | 61,5                              | 1230,4                      | 1891,6                            | 53,7                        |
| Ethnic minorities                     | 40,8                              | 815,2                       | 584,9                             | -28,3                       | 59,2                              | 520,1                       | 826,8                             | 59,0                        |
| Level of education of ho              | useholder                         |                             |                                   |                             |                                   |                             |                                   |                             |
| Not finish primary school             | 39,5                              | 1199,5                      | 826,5                             | -31,1                       | 60,5                              | 751,5                       | 1191,7                            | 58,6                        |
| Primary school                        | 38,3                              | 1497,1                      | 1043,2                            | -30,3                       | 61,7                              | 980,6                       | 1601,1                            | 63,3                        |
| Lower secondary school                | 37,4                              | 1831,6                      | 1208,4                            | -34,0                       | 62,6                              | 1074,3                      | 1716,5                            | 59,8                        |
| Upper secondary school                | 38,2                              | 2028,0                      | 1421,2                            | -29,9                       | 61,8                              | 1294,3                      | 1949,9                            | 50,7                        |
| Vocational school                     | 40,5                              | 2785,8                      | 1761,3                            | -36,8                       | 59,5                              | 1601,9                      | 2357,6                            | 47,2                        |
| College, university and post-graduate | 42,4                              | 4005,6                      | 2754,4                            | -31,2                       | 57,6                              | 2473,8                      | 3309,8                            | 33,8                        |
| Householder                           |                                   |                             |                                   |                             |                                   |                             |                                   |                             |
| Not working                           | 40,2                              | 2152,1                      | 1484,4                            | -31,0                       | 59,8                              | 1301,6                      | 1937,4                            | 48,8                        |
| Official area                         | 39,0                              | 2834,4                      | 2036,5                            | -28,2                       | 61,0                              | 1637,8                      | 2387,8                            | 45,8                        |
| Unofficial area                       | 38,3                              | 1648,1                      | 1083,3                            | -34,3                       | 61,7                              | 1014,3                      | 1602,5                            | 58,0                        |
| Jobs of householders                  |                                   |                             |                                   |                             |                                   |                             |                                   |                             |
| Manager                               | 36,9                              | 2904,7                      | 1736,0                            | -40,2                       | 63,1                              | 1588,7                      | 2399,0                            | 51,0                        |
| Specialist, technician                | 42,3                              | 3211,1                      | 2358,7                            | -26,5                       | 57,7                              | 1597,4                      | 2366,6                            | 48,2                        |
| Secretary, office                     | 39,5                              | 2243,4                      | 1613,3                            | -28,1                       | 60,5                              | 1476,8                      | 2246,3                            | 52,1                        |

| worker            |      |        |        |       |      |        |        |      |
|-------------------|------|--------|--------|-------|------|--------|--------|------|
| Agriculture       | 38,6 | 1446,3 | 912,6  | -36,9 | 61,4 | 843,0  | 1381,6 | 63,9 |
| Skilled Laborer   | 36,2 | 1832,8 | 1276,9 | -30,3 | 63,8 | 1292,8 | 1891,6 | 46,3 |
| Unskilled Laborer | 38,0 | 1670,8 | 1144,3 | -31,5 | 62,0 | 1106,8 | 1743,4 | 57,5 |
| Not working       | 40,8 | 2229,0 | 1493,1 | -33,0 | 59,2 | 1316,6 | 1951,0 | 48,2 |

Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

#### 5.4. Livelihoods of poor households

The main livelihoods of poor households depend largely on agricultural activities, of which cultivation plays the most important part, followed by aquaculture and livestock. Table 5.10 shows that the proportion of average income by different livelihood activities of poor households as well as non-poor households did not witness many changes over the two years of 2010 and 2012. In 2012, the proportion of income from cultivation of poor households to the total income was 31.9 percent. That from wages and salaries was about 24.4 percent. Next, remittances accounted for 10.4 percent, followed by income from aquaculture, livestock and others. Income from non-agricultural production and business occupied the smallest proportion of only 5.1 percent of the total income of poor households.

| Percentage of income from activities |          | 2010 |       |          | 2012 |       |  |  |  |  |
|--------------------------------------|----------|------|-------|----------|------|-------|--|--|--|--|
|                                      | Non-poor | Poor | Total | Non-poor | Poor | Total |  |  |  |  |
| Cultivation                          | 15.3     | 33.8 | 17.9  | 15.2     | 31.9 | 17.2  |  |  |  |  |
| Livestock                            | 4.2      | 8.1  | 4.8   | 4.3      | 8.1  | 4.7   |  |  |  |  |
| Aquaculture                          | 3.5      | 9.6  | 4.3   | 3.2      | 9.6  | 4.0   |  |  |  |  |
| Income from wages and salaries       | 42.3     | 24.9 | 39.9  | 43.9     | 24.4 | 41.6  |  |  |  |  |
| Non-agricultural activities          | 19.3     | 5.8  | 17.4  | 17.8     | 5.1  | 16.3  |  |  |  |  |
| Remittances                          | 8.8      | 10.0 | 8.9   | 8.8      | 10.4 | 9.0   |  |  |  |  |
| Others                               | 6.5      | 7.7  | 6.7   | 6.9      | 10.4 | 7.3   |  |  |  |  |

#### Table 5.10: Household livelihoods by the structure of income

#### Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

Figure 5.4 estimates the distribution of poor households by major livelihoods in 2012. The difference between this figure and table 5.9 is that it estimates the distribution of households by major livelihoods and does not estimate the structure of average income. Major livelihoods of households are defined as the livelihoods which bring about the source of income with the highest proportion in the total income. Livestock was the major livelihoods of 43.7 percent of poor households while wages and salaries were the major livelihoods of 28 percent of poor households. Only 5.5 percent of poor households relied on non-agricultural activities. The proportion of non-poor households having major livelihoods of wages, salaries and non-agricultural activities were 51.4 percent and 19.1 percent accordingly.



#### Figure 5.4. Household proportion by livelihood 2012

Source: VHLSS 2012

Figure 5.4 shows that there were 7.9 percent of poor households and 6.2 percent of non-poor households relied on remittances as the major livelihoods. In the context of low economic growth, one of the concerns of poor households is that the sources of remittances of relatives and friends will be affected. Table 5.10 shows that the proportion of remittances to the total income was unchanged. However, to analyze in detail, we estimated the proportion of households receiving remittances and the amount of remittances in comparison price of 2010 in table 5.11 and 5.12.

| Areas                              | The proportion remittances f | of househol<br>from foreign | ds receiving<br>countries | The average amount of remittances/per<br>person/year of households receiving<br>remittances |         |            |  |  |  |
|------------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|---|---------|------------|--|--|--|
| -                                  | 2010                         | 2012                        | Change (%)                | 2010  | 2012    | Change (%) |  |  |  |
| The whole country                  | 4.40                         | 4.64                        | 0.24                      | 10534.6   | 7982.7  | -24.2      |  |  |  |
| Rural/Urban areas                  |                              |                             |                           |   |         |            |  |  |  |
| Rural areas                        | 3.37                         | 3.67                        | 0.30                      | 9143.5  | 8781.0  | -4.0       |  |  |  |
| Urban areas                        | 6.74                         | 6.90                        | 0.16                      | 12118.1   | 6991.1  | -42.3      |  |  |  |
| Geographical regions               |                              |                             |                           |   |         |            |  |  |  |
| Red River Delta                    | 3.15                         | 3.34                        | 0.19                      | 14414.8   | 9540.4  | -33.8      |  |  |  |
| Northern Midlands and<br>Mountains | 2.60                         | 1.93                        | -0.67                     | 12781.1   | 16321.3 | 27.7       |  |  |  |
| Central Coast                      | 5.18                         | 5.34                        | 0.16                      | 6448.2  | 6996.3  | 8.5        |  |  |  |
| Central Highlands                  | 1.80                         | 1.90                        | 0.10                      | 1109.0  | 2307.9  | 108.1      |  |  |  |
| Southeast                          | 6.48                         | 7.09                        | 0.61                      | 13125.3   | 6320.4  | -51.8      |  |  |  |
| Mekong River Delta                 | 5.24                         | 5.93                        | 0.69                      | 9446.0  | 8337.0  | -11.7      |  |  |  |

 Table 5.11: Households receiving remittances from foreign countries in the 2010-2012

 period

*The average amount of remittances is measured by the price index in January 2010. Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012* 

Results indicated that the proportion of households receiving remittances increased slightly in the 2010-2012 period, however, the average amount of remittances per person in

comparison price decreased by 24.2 percent. The decline of the amount of remittances in urban areas was much higher than that in rural areas. Regarding geographical regions, the Southeast and Red River Delta had the highest rate of decline. On the other hand, Central Highlands and the Northern Mountains had the lowest proportion of households receiving remittances but the average amount of remittances received increased during this period.

The domestic remittances also had the same tendency as the foreign remittances. The proportion of households receiving remittances witnessed a small increase. However, the amount of remittances received went down at smaller rate than that of foreign remittances. The annual average amount of remittances per person in urban areas decreased by 8.8 percent while that in rural areas saw a growth of 3.6 percent.

| Areas                              | The proportion<br>domes | of household<br>stic remittance | ds receiving<br>ces | The average amount of remittances/per<br>person/year of households receiving<br>remittances |        |            |  |  |
|------------------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------|---|--------|------------|--|--|
|                                    | 2010                    | 2012                            | Change (%)          | 2010  | 2012   | Change (%) |  |  |
| The whole country                  | 82.9                    | 84.8                            | 1.9                 | 1527.2  | 1510.3 | -1.1       |  |  |
| Rural/Urban areas                  |                         |                                 |                     |   |        |            |  |  |
| Rural areas                        | 84.7                    | 85.3                            | 0.6                 | 1300.4  | 1347.0 | 3.6        |  |  |
| Urban areas                        | 78.9                    | 83.6                            | 4.7                 | 2081.4  | 1899.1 | -8.8       |  |  |
| Geographical regions               |                         |                                 |                     |   |        |            |  |  |
| Red River Delta                    | 87.4                    | 90.4                            | 3.0                 | 1621.9  | 1812.9 | 11.8       |  |  |
| Northern Midlands and<br>Mountains | 78.4                    | 82.5                            | 4.0                 | 907.6   | 991.4  | 9.2        |  |  |
| Central Coast                      | 79.6                    | 82.0                            | 2.5                 | 1237.1  | 1186.5 | -4.1       |  |  |
| Central Highlands                  | 92.6                    | 94.1                            | 1.6                 | 535.7   | 718.4  | 34.1       |  |  |
| Southeast                          | 75.0                    | 83.3                            | 8.2                 | 2713.3  | 2176.9 | -19.8      |  |  |
| Mekong River Delta                 | 88.0                    | 81.0                            | -7.0                | 1472.2  | 1477.0 | 0.3        |  |  |

 Table 5.12: Households receiving domestic remittances in the period of 2010-2012

*The average amount of remittances is measured by the price index in January 2010. Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012* 

Although the income structure of households have not changed much, there were a number of households making changes to their major livelihoods in the 2010-2012 period. The question raised is how households changed their major livelihoods and whether this move brought about higher income. To answer this question, we used panel data of VHLSS 2010 and 2012, of which there were 4.157 households surveyed in both 2010 and 2012 to assess the change in major livelihoods of households.

Table 5.13 estimates the percentage of households changing their major livelihoods from 2010 to 2012. For example, the first line shows the major livelihood in 2012 of households who had livestock as their major livelihood in 2010. Specifically, 66.3 percent of households had cultivation as their major livelihood in both 2010 and 2012. On the other hand, there were 17.3 percent of households switching their major livelihood from cultivation to paid-workers and 3 percent moved to other livelihoods.

The diagonal in table 5.13 (in bold type) reflects the percentage of households not changing the major livelihoods in 2010 and 2012. The higher the value of diagonal

estimates, the lower the changes in major livelihoods. The proportion of households changing their major livelihoods was lowest in those living largely on wages and salaries, followed by those self-working in non-agricultural activities. These were also the two livelihoods with the highest income. Households having livestock as the major livelihood changed their livelihoods the most. There were about 70 percent of them moving to other livelihoods. They tended to switch to salaries and wages to earn a livelihood.

|                  |                            |                 |           | М               | lajor livelihoo    | ds in 2012                          |                 |        |       |
|------------------|----------------------------|-----------------|-----------|-----------------|--------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------|--------|-------|
|                  |                            | Cultivatio<br>n | Livestock | Aquacultu<br>re | Wages and salaries | Non-<br>agricultura<br>l activities | Remittanc<br>es | Others | Total |
| Major<br>Livelih | Cultivation                | 66.3            | 3.2       | 3.6             | 17.3               | 3.3                                 | 3.7             | 2.5    | 100   |
| oods             | Livestock                  | 27.1            | 30.4      | 5.4             | 15.3               | 9.8                                 | 6.6             | 5.5    | 100   |
| 2010             | Aquaculture                | 15.5            | 1.5       | 51.3            | 19.9               | 1.9                                 | 5.2             | 4.7    | 100   |
|                  | Wages and<br>salaries      | 4.7             | 1.3       | 0.5             | 81.4               | 7.6                                 | 3.0             | 1.5    | 100   |
|                  | Agricultural<br>activities | 3.1             | 1.0       | 0.7             | 21.4               | 67.1                                | 4.2             | 2.7    | 100   |
|                  | Remittances                | 11.6            | 0.7       | 0.7             | 28.7               | 7.8                                 | 38.8            | 11.7   | 100   |
|                  | Others                     | 8.8             | 4.1       | 1.1             | 26.7               | 8.6                                 | 13.7            | 37.1   | 100   |
|                  | Total                      | 17.6            | 2.3       | 3.0             | 48.8               | 17.6                                | 6.4             | 4.4    | 100   |

Table 5.13: Changes in major livelihoods in the 2010-2012 period

#### Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

In table 5.14, we assess the changes in major livelihoods of poor households (based on the poverty line of 2010). Generally, poor households changed their livelihoods more than non-poor households. However, the difference among two groups is not much. The highest proportion of households changed their livelihood to wages and salaries, followed by cultivation.

| <b>Table 5.14:</b> | Changes in | major live | lihoods of po | or households i | n the 2010-2012 | period |
|--------------------|------------|------------|---------------|-----------------|-----------------|--------|
|                    |            |            |               |                 |                 |        |

|                      |                         |             |           | Maj         | or livelihoo             | ods in 2012                        |             |        |       |
|----------------------|-------------------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|--------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------|--------|-------|
|                      |                         | Cultivation | Livestock | Aquaculture | Wages<br>and<br>salaries | Non-<br>agricultural<br>activities | Remittances | Others | Total |
|                      | Cultivation             | 59.6        | 5.0       | 4.8         | 20.8                     | 3.9                                | 2.8         | 3.1    | 100   |
| M                    | Livestock               | 29.6        | 0.0       | 14.9        | 21.0                     | 12.3                               | 6.6         | 15.7   | 100   |
| Major<br>Livelihoods | Aquaculture             | 18.0        | 0.0       | 37.1        | 30.7                     | 0.0                                | 9.0         | 5.2    | 100   |
| In<br>2010           | Wages and salaries      | 14.1        | 1.0       | 0.9         | 72.1                     | 3.3                                | 5.6         | 3.0    | 100   |
|                      | Agricultural activities | 7.9         | 0.0       | 0.0         | 20.3                     | 64.0                               | 3.7         | 4.1    | 100   |
|                      | Remittances             | 13.4        | 0.0       | 2.6         | 33.0                     | 3.2                                | 35.7        | 12.2   | 100   |
|                      | Others                  | 11.7        | 3.3       | 3.1         | 9.3                      | 0.0                                | 36.9        | 35.8   | 100   |
|                      | Total                   | 34.6        | 2.7       | 5.3         | 36.9                     | 6.2                                | 8.5         | 5.9    | 100   |

#### Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

The next question is whether households received higher income after changing their livelihoods. Changing livelihoods is endogenous, which means households only move to another livelihood if they realize the clear chance of obtaining higher income. Therefore, it

is not easy to answer this question. In this research, we only used the percentage of change in income to see how household income changed after the change in major livelihoods. Table 5.14 presents household income in comparison price of 2010 by each household group before and after the change in major livelihoods. The percentage of change (%) was also estimated. It should be noted that cells highlighted in yellow represent estimates of below 20 observations (households) and the results need to be explained with caution.

The results show that almost households changing their major livelihoods experienced an increase in their real income. The highest rate of income increase occurred in households moving from cultivation to livestock and non-agricultural activities and from cultivation to remittances. Households moving from cultivation to other livelihoods had their income go up over two years. Households switching to other livelihoods from salaries and wages also achieved an income increase. However, moving from other livelihoods to livestock often reduced household income. The change from several non-agricultural livelihoods such as remittances and agricultural production and business to wages and salaries also resulted in a decline in real average income.

|            |                  |        |                 |           |                 | Major liveli             | hoods in 2012                          |                 |        |        |
|------------|------------------|--------|-----------------|-----------|-----------------|--------------------------|--|-----------------|--------|--------|
|            |                  |        | Cultivatio<br>n | Livestock | Aquacult<br>ure | Wages<br>and<br>salaries | Non-<br>agricultur<br>al<br>activities | Remittan<br>ces | Others | Total  |
|            |                  | 2010   | 1075.6          | 670.7     | 590.9           | 751.7                    | 833.9                                  | 792.9           | 752.5  | 962.3  |
|            | Cultivatio       | 2012   | 1287.9          | 1082.3    | 851.5           | 972.0                    | 1328.7                                 | 1271.4          | 1154.9 | 1208.1 |
|            | 11               | Change | 19.7            | 61.4      | 44.1            | 29.3                     | 59.3                                   | 60.3            | 53.5   | 25.5   |
|            |                  | 2010   | 1351.4          | 1707.5    | 1108.2          | 1270.0                   | 1565.9                                 | 871.8           | 533.3  | 1378.9 |
|            | Livestock        | 2012   | 1135.9          | 2321.3    | 861.4           | 1281.3                   | 1168.5                                 | 1344.7          | 1193.0 | 1523.8 |
|            |                  | Change | -15.9           | 35.9      | -22.3           | 0.9                      | -25.4                                  | 54.2            | 123.7  | 10.5   |
|            |                  | 2010   | 863.0           | 1751.3    | 1264.0          | 767.5                    | 3539.6                                 | 940.7           | 1784.4 | 1161.6 |
|            | Aquacultu        | 2012   | 710.9           | 1195.5    | 1446.6          | 790.3                    | 770.3                                  | 827.8           | 1814.3 | 1170.4 |
|            | 10               | Change | -17.6           | -31.7     | 14.4            | 3.0                      | -78.2                                  | -12.0           | 1.7    | 0.8    |
| Major      | Wages            | 2010   | 793.0           | 1079.4    | 876.0           | 1551.4                   | 1472.1                                 | 1063.8          | 2056.3 | 1493.5 |
| Livelih    | and              | 2012   | 945.8           | 1415.6    | 1128.1          | 1708.6                   | 1983.3                                 | 1665.3          | 2864.5 | 1703.3 |
| oods       | salaries         | Change | 19.3            | 31.1      | 28.8            | 10.1                     | 34.7                                   | 56.5            | 39.3   | 14.0   |
| In<br>2010 | Non-             | 2010   | 3226.3          | 1136.6    | 779.0           | 2039.7                   | 1732.0                                 | 1237.0          | 1663.1 | 1808.9 |
| 2010       | agricultur<br>al | 2012   | 1421.2          | 1676.3    | 1673.4          | 1707.2                   | 1875.5                                 | 1775.9          | 2649.7 | 1838.6 |
|            | activities       | Change | -55.9           | 47.5      | 114.8           | -16.3                    | 8.3                                    | 43.6            | 59.3   | 1.6    |
|            |                  | 2010   | 952.6           | 1228.8    | 989.9           | 1867.1                   | 1368.6                                 | 1555.1          | 1506.0 | 1548.1 |
|            | Remittanc        | 2012   | 863.1           | 1523.8    | 1801.9          | 1306.4                   | 1625.1                                 | 1631.2          | 1220.8 | 1400.7 |
|            | 05               | Change | -9.4            | 24.0      | 82.0            | -30.0                    | 18.7                                   | 4.9             | -18.9  | -9.5   |
|            |                  | 2010   | 1297.8          | 870.4     | 801.5           | 2456.9                   | 2204.0                                 | 657.3           | 1118.9 | 1507.9 |
|            | Others           | 2012   | 1285.9          | 1330.3    | 3610.9          | 1641.5                   | 1596.7                                 | 1031.9          | 1275.0 | 1394.9 |
|            |                  | Change | -0.9            | 52.8      | 350.5           | -33.2                    | -27.6                                  | 57.0            | 14.0   | -7.5   |
|            |                  | 2010   | 1112.3          | 1164.2    | 1038.9          | 1557.8                   | 1651.6                                 | 1211.2          | 1366.0 | 1440.6 |
|            | Total            | 2012   | 1209.3          | 1606.8    | 1307.7          | 1625.4                   | 1851.0                                 | 1532.5          | 1674.4 | 1577.9 |
|            |                  | Change | 8.7             | 38.0      | 25.9            | 4.3                      | 12.1                                   | 26.5            | 22.6   | 9.5    |

Table 5.15: Changes in major livelihoods of households in the 2010-2012 period

*Note: cells highlighted in yellow are of estimates of below 20 observations. Therefore, results need to be explained with caution.* 

Source: VHLSS 2010 and 2012

#### 6. Conclusions

This research provides a comprehensive picture about the current situation of firm operation, employment, households' income and poverty in the context of economic slowdown. The study uses the most updated data from large-scale surveys including VHLSS 2010 and 2012, LFS and Enterprise Census within the period of 2007-2012.

The analytical results show that the number of enterprises still increases but at a lower rate as compared to previous years. In 2011 and 2012, the number of enterprise in financial intermediary, banking, and real estate's experienced the lowest increase, which differs from the quick pace of the pre-2011 years. Construction sector experiences a low increase in number of enterprises. The newly established firms mainly are micro-enterprises (lower than 10 labors). In the economic slowdown context, there are many bankrupt enterprises, which normally are small-scale firms, and there are many other small enterprises established in this period.

Firms' real average revenue (adjusted for inflation) within 2007-2012 has declined. In 2011, the average revenue was 12.3 billion VND, decreased by 6 percent as compared to that of 2007. The average size of labor per enterprise also decreased from 47.4 workers in 2007 to 44.4 workers in 2008 and continued to decline to 32.6 workers (a decrease of over 30 percent) in 2011.

In comparison to the pre-slowdown period in 2007-2008, firms has higher tendency to change their main business in 2010-2011. In 2008, only one service sector (firms are categorized into 10 main sectors, some relatively small industry was classified into "Others", see in Table 3.1) has more than 10 percent of firms shifting their businesses to other sectors; this corresponding figure in 2011 is seven out of ten sectors. The rate of change is especially the highest in science and technology and services. Firms have high tendency to change their business to wholesale and retail, partly because wholesale and retail has easy entry and requires low fixed investment.

The majority of firms that did not change their business experience growth in revenue. Sectors such as construction, "scientific activities and technology, education and healthcare" did not experience increase in revenue growth; however, the rate of decrease was relatively small at -3.6 percent and -0.4 percent respectively. Meanwhile, firms changed their business to Wholesale and retail trade and manufacturing sectors achieves high growth in revenue.

Even though average size of enterprise decreased, the increase in number of firms has resulted in an increase in total number of employment. Unemployment rate slightly decreased during 2008-2012. In 2012, unemployment rates in rural and urban areas are 3.1 percent and 1.3 percent respectively. However, the average working hours per week in all sectors dropped. This number in many sectors was substantially lower than the average 48 hours/week. Average working hours in agriculture was 37.6 hours, indicating a 21 percent decrease from 2007.

Average real salary still increased, but the quality of work has fallen down. In particular, the percentage of labor having labor contract declined from 43.4 percent in 2011

to 41.1 percent in 2012. This number decreased in most sectors. The proportion of workers that have remuneration benefits such as social insurance and health insurance experienced a slight drop. The wage gap between skilled and unskilled labor tends to increase within 2010-2012.

Workers are more likely to shift their jobs to other sectors in the context of economic slowdown. Service sector experienced the highest labor shift, reflected in only 66.2 percent of labor working in the first six months still remained in service sector in the last six months of 2012. The proportion of workers that remains working in agriculture is the highest at 88.8 percent. Agriculture was found to attract labor from other industries. This fact indicates that when employment situation in other sectors become difficult, workers are more likely to turn to less sustainable, lower-productivity activities in agriculture. For instance, a large proportion of labor in construction sector shift their jobs to other sectors and up to 12 percent of labor working in construction sector at the beginning of the year moved to agriculture at the end of 2012.

Average real household income increased insignificantly at 3.5 percent during 2010-2012, which is much lower than the rate of 17 percent increase during the period 2006-2008. Household income in urban areas slightly decreased. With regard to geographic region, households in the Southwest region have their income dropped by 9.2 percent on average over the last two years.

Increase in average real income has contributed to the decrease in poverty rate from 14 percent in 2010 to 11.8 percent in 2012. Progress in poverty reduction takes place in both rural and urban areas as well as in all regions such as Central Highland and Northern midland and mountain areas. However, households' expenditure for health care and education decreased within 2010-2012, reflecting a decline in the poor's living standard during the economic slowdown.

Achievements in poverty reduction contribute to a decrease in Gini ratio from 0.44 to 0.41 within 2010-2012. The analytical results show that poverty reduction in the period of 2010-2012 is mainly attributed to increase in household income and decrease in inequality. The impact of income distribution is even higher than the impact of income increase.

The global economic crisis has depressed enterprises' revenue, profit and size even though the extent of impact has not been serious. This fact implies that Vietnam economy has not achieved its growth expectation. If the economic slowdown prolongs, negative impacts on enterprises, employment and households' welfare will intensify over time. Poverty reduction is unsustainable without economic growth. Besides, it is noted that the impact of the economic slowdown might be long-term and have certain lag. Meanwhile, this research only focuses on the current situation of enterprises and households.

In order to acquire sustainable poverty reduction, the Government should formulate policies to boost the economic growth and support the vulnerable groups. The vulnerable groups include labor without insurance, underemployed labor in rural areas, poor households and households in danger of falling into poverty.

#### Reference

Baulch, Bob and John Hoddinott (2000), "Economic Mobility and Poverty Dynamics in Developing Countries", *Journal of Development Studies* (Special Issue) (August).

BLĐTBXH (2011), "Phê duyệt kết quả Tổng điều tra hộ nghèo, hộ cận nghèo theo chỉ thị Sô 17SZ/CT-TTg ngày 21 tháng 9 năm 2010 của Thủ tướng Chính phủ", 640/QĐ-LĐTBXH, ngày 30 tháng 05 năm 2011.

CIEM (2012) "Đặc điểm môi trường kinh doanh ở Việt Nam: Kết quả điều tra doanh nghiệp nhỏ và vừa năm 2011", Hanoi: CIEM/DoE/ ILSSA/UNU-WIDER

Cling J.-P., Razafindrakoto M. & Roubaud F. (2010c), "Assessing the Potential Impact of the Global Crisis on the Labor Market and the Informal Sector in Vietnam", Journal of Economics & Development, 18, June, 16-25

Datt, G. and Ravallion, M. (1991), "Growth and Redistribution Components of Changes in Poverty Measures: A Decomposition with Applications to Brazil and India in the 1980s", *Living Standard Measurement Study*, Working Paper No. 83.

Dinh Thi Thu Phuong (2009), Rapid assessment on the social impacts of economic crisis in Viet Nam: Case studies on day Laborers in "mobile Labor markets" in Ha Noi, Hanoi: CAF-VASS/Oxfam/World Bank

Foster, J., J. Greer, E. Thorbecke (1984), "A Class of Decomposable Poverty Measures", Econometrica, 52, 761-765.

Hulme, D., and Shepherd, A. (2003), "Conceptualizing Chronic Poverty", World Development, Vol. 31, No 3.

ILO (2012) "Nearly 1 million out of work, stronger job creation needed", truy cập ngày 2/8/2013 tại

http://www.ilo.org/hanoi/Informationresources/Publicinformation/Pressreleases/WCMS\_195 908/lang--en/index.htm

IRC (2012), "Tác động của chương trình 135 giai đoạn II qua lăng kính hai cuộc điều tra đầu kỳ và cuối kỳ".

Nguyễn Ngoc Anh (2009), Rapid assessment on the social impacts of economic crisis in Viet Nam: Case studies on formal sector: enterprises and workers in industrial parks, Hanoi: CAF-VASS/Oxfam/World Bank.

Nguyễn Tam Giang (2009), A rapid assessment on the social impacts of the economic crisis on two craft villages, processed, Hanoi: CAF-VASS/Oxfam/World Bank.

Nguyen Viet Cuong, 2011. "Can Vietnam Achieve The Millennium Development Goal On Poverty Reduction In High Inflation And Economic Stagnation?," The Developing Economies, Institute of Developing Economies, vol. 49(3), pages 297-320, 09.

Nguyen Viet Cuong, Peter Lanjouw, and Marleen Marra (2012) Vietnam's Poverty Mapping using the 2009 Housing Population Census and 2010 Vietnam Living Standards Survey, background paper prepared for the 2012 Poverty Assessment, May.

Nguyễn Việt Cường, Phạm Thái Hưng & Phùng Đức Tùng (2009), "Đánh giá ảnh hưởng của suy giảm kinh tế hiện nay đối với việc làm (thất nghiệp) ở Việt Nam", Hanoi: UNDP.

Phạm, Q. Ngọc (2009), Impact of the Global Financial and Economic Crisis on Viet Nam, paper prepared for the ILO's rapid Assessment Study on the impact of the financial and economic crisis, February

Phan, A. (2012), "Kinh tế khó khăn, thất nghiệp tăng chóng mặt", Báo Người đưa tin, ngày 28/12/2012, tại <u>http://www.nguoiduatin.vn/kinh-te-kho-khan-that-nghiep-tang-chong-mat-a31065.html</u>

Razafindrakoto M., Roubaud F. & Nguyen Huu Chi (2011) "Vietnam Labor market: an informal sector perspective", Vietnam Annual Economic Report 2011.

Riedel J. & Clayton W. L. (2009) "Cuộc khủng hoảng kinh tế toàn cầu và những tác động dài hạn của nó đối với Việt Nam", Hanoi: UNDP

VASS, WB, OGB, AAV "Quick Survey of Global Financial-Economic Crisis on Enterprises and Employees in Thanh Hoa, Nghe An, Hai Phong, Ho Chi Minh, Binh Duong, Dong Nai, Vietnam." Hanoi, April 2009.

Vneconomy (2013), "Suy giảm không ảnh hưởng nhiều đến người nghèo", Vneconomy ngày 15/5/2013, <u>http://vneconomy.vn/2013051411022313P0C9920/suy-thoai-khong-anh-huong-nhieu-den-nguoi-ngheo.htm</u>

Warren-Rodríguez A. (2009), "The impact of the global crisis downturn on employment levels in Viet Nam: an elasticity approach", UNDP Viet Nam Technical Note, February

World Bank (2012), "Well Begun, Not Yet Done: Vietnam's Remarkable Progress on Poverty Reduction and the Emerging Challenges", The Work Bank.

#### **Annex 1: Poverty and Inequality measurement**

Dataset of the VHLSS were used to analyze the poverty, inequality and livelihood of rural households. The poverty index is measured by the FGT as followed (Foster, Greer and Thorbecke, 1984):

$$P_{\alpha} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{q} \left[ \frac{z - Y_i}{z} \right]^{\alpha}, \qquad (1)$$

While  $Y_i$  is the average expenditure per capita of person  $i^{th}$ , *z* is the poverty line, *n* is the number of people in the sampe, *q* is the numer of poor people, and can be interpreted as the measurement of poverty severity.

When being 0, the formula gives us H index which measures the poverty rate – the rate of people living below the poverty line. When being 1 or 2 we can have the poverty gap (PG) enabling the measurement of poverty depth, and the squared poverty gap indicating the poverty severity.

To measure the inequality, Gini ratio is used which is calculated as below (Deaton, 1997):

$$G = \frac{n+1}{n-1} - \frac{2}{n(n-1)\overline{Y}} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \rho_i Y_i$$
(2)

While  $\rho_i$  is the place of person i<sup>th</sup> in the expenditure distribution Y with the order on which the wealthiest person is 1.  $\overline{Y}$  is the average expenditure per capita of the whole sample; n is the number of observations. Gini value ranges from 0 (absolute equal) to 1 (absolute unequal). The closer the Gini is, the bigger the inequality in expenditure becomes.

### Annex 2: Labor tables

### Table A.4.1: Labor shift by industries including every type of workers in 2011 (by the number of workers)

|  |             |               |   |              |                                   | Yea            | r-end   |   |   |          |                     |                |        |
|--|-------------|---------------|---|--------------|-----------------------------------|----------------|---|---|---|----------|---------------------|----------------|--------|
| Year-<br>start   | Agriculture | Manufacturing | Electricity,<br>water<br>supply and<br>mining | Construction | Wholesale<br>and retail<br>trade; | Transportation | Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities | Financial,<br>banking,<br>insurance<br>and real<br>estate<br>activities | Information,<br>Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education<br>and Health<br>care | Services | Other<br>activities | Not<br>working | Total  |
| Agriculture  | 53343       | 1415          | 40  | 1252         | 1290                              | 213            | 275   | 11  | 156   | 151      | 291                 | 4114           | 62551  |
| Manufacturing  | 1252        | 14683         | 30  | 326          | 709                               | 157            | 180   | 13  | 121   | 156      | 150                 | 1365           | 19142  |
| Electricity,<br>water supply<br>and mining                             | 51          | 23            | 776   | 33           | 40                                | 7              | 5   | 2   | 15  | 2        | 48                  | 47             | 1049   |
| Construction   | 958         | 334           | 33  | 6359         | 201                               | 125            | 65  | 6   | 59  | 61       | 82                  | 445            | 8728   |
| Wholesale and retail trade;  | 1207        | 760           | 52  | 195          | 15394                             | 245            | 551   | 26  | 119   | 232      | 202                 | 1343           | 20326  |
| Transportation   | 250         | 154           | 7   | 111          | 287                               | 3602           | 63  | 12  | 29  | 36       | 89                  | 245            | 4885   |
| Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities<br>Financial,          | 232         | 176           | б   | 67           | 520                               | 55             | 5168  | 15  | 31  | 63       | 107                 | 606            | 7046   |
| banking,<br>insurance and<br>real estate<br>activities<br>Information, | 19          | 19            | 3   | 6            | 21                                | 10             | 5   | 952   | 17  | 8        | 69                  | 73             | 1202   |
| Technology,<br>Education and<br>Health care                            | 250         | 97            | 10  | 67           | 143                               | 31             | 58  | 16  | 8245  | 68       | 263                 | 489            | 9737   |
| Services   | 137         | 181           | 12  | 63           | 228                               | 56             | 59  | 7   | 55  | 1959     | 98                  | 292            | 3147   |
| Other activities   | 305         | 146           | 52  | 91           | 186                               | 135            | 100   | 72  | 247   | 92       | 7512                | 465            | 9403   |
| Not working  | 5305        | 1624          | 54  | 654          | 1528                              | 362            | 720   | 81  | 446   | 342      | 511                 | 100022         | 111649 |
| Total  | 63309       | 19612         | 1075  | 9224         | 20547                             | 4998           | 7249  | 1213  | 9540  | 3170     | 9422                | 109506         | 258865 |

## Table P.4.2: Labor shift by economic industries (only examining workers with more than 40 hours/week) in 2011 (by number of workers)

|  |             | Year-end      |   |              |                                   |                |   |   |   |          |                     |                |        |  |  |
|--|-------------|---------------|---|--------------|-----------------------------------|----------------|---|---|---|----------|---------------------|----------------|--------|--|--|
| Year-<br>start   | Agriculture | Manufacturing | Electricity,<br>water<br>supply and<br>mining | Construction | Wholesale<br>and retail<br>trade; | Transportation | Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities | Financial,<br>banking,<br>insurance<br>and real<br>estate<br>activities | Information,<br>Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education<br>and Health<br>care | Services | Other<br>activities | Not<br>working | Total  |  |  |
| Agriculture  | 29082       | 678           | 29  | 632          | 638                               | 114            | 150   | 7   | 70  | 77       | 158                 | 1609           | 33244  |  |  |
| Manufacturing  | 913         | 12958         | 29  | 270          | 581                               | 135            | 133   | 11  | 109   | 130      | 126                 | 1112           | 16507  |  |  |
| Electricity,<br>water supply<br>and mining                             | 41          | 23            | 705   | 30           | 27                                | 7              | 5   | 2   | 14  | 1        | 43                  | 45             | 943    |  |  |
| Construction   | 821         | 298           | 33  | 5634         | 178                               | 111            | 49  | 6   | 54  | 52       | 76                  | 377            | 7689   |  |  |
| Wholesale and retail trade;  | 902         | 635           | 45  | 154          | 13044                             | 216            | 443   | 23  | 108   | 193      | 180                 | 1020           | 16963  |  |  |
| Transportation   | 184         | 134           | 5   | 95           | 234                               | 3136           | 51  | 12  | 25  | 29       | 80                  | 200            | 4185   |  |  |
| Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities<br>Financial,          | 162         | 133           | 5   | 50           | 399                               | 42             | 4042  | 12  | 22  | 43       | 69                  | 419            | 5398   |  |  |
| banking,<br>insurance and<br>real estate<br>activities<br>Information. | 13          | 16            | 2   | 6            | 19                                | 9              | 4   | 885   | 17  | 7        | 66                  | 68             | 1112   |  |  |
| Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education and<br>Health care             | 209         | 78            | 11  | 58           | 115                               | 30             | 52  | 15  | 7070  | 56       | 239                 | 410            | 8343   |  |  |
| Services   | 108         | 140           | 11  | 35           | 175                               | 40             | 37  | 5   | 47  | 1557     | 80                  | 220            | 2455   |  |  |
| Other activities   | 200         | 123           | 47  | 78           | 159                               | 122            | 80  | 68  | 229   | 71       | 6637                | 377            | 8191   |  |  |
| Total  | 32635       | 15216         | 922   | 7042         | 15569                             | 3962           | 5046  | 1046  | 7765  | 2216     | 7754                | 5857           | 105030 |  |  |

|   |             |               |   |              |                                   | Yea            | r-end   |   |   |          |                     |                |       |
|---|-------------|---------------|---|--------------|-----------------------------------|----------------|---|---|---|----------|---------------------|----------------|-------|
| Year-start  | Agriculture | Manufacturing | Electricity,<br>water<br>supply and<br>mining | Construction | Wholesale<br>and retail<br>trade; | Transportation | Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities | Financial,<br>banking,<br>insurance<br>and real<br>estate<br>activities | Information,<br>Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education<br>and Health<br>care | Services | Other<br>activities | Not<br>working | Total |
| Agriculture   | 87.48       | 2.04          | 0.09  | 1.90         | 1.92                              | 0.34           | 0.45  | 0.02  | 0.21  | 0.23     | 0.48                | 4.84           | 100   |
| Manufacturing   | 5.53        | 78.50         | 0.18  | 1.64         | 3.52                              | 0.82           | 0.81  | 0.07  | 0.66  | 0.79     | 0.76                | 6.74           | 100   |
| Electricity, water<br>supply and mining                             | 4.35        | 2.44          | 74.76   | 3.18         | 2.86                              | 0.74           | 0.53  | 0.21  | 1.48  | 0.11     | 4.56                | 4.77           | 100   |
| Construction  | 10.68       | 3.88          | 0.43  | 73.27        | 2.31                              | 1.44           | 0.64  | 0.08  | 0.70  | 0.68     | 0.99                | 4.90           | 100   |
| Wholesale and<br>retail trade;                                      | 5.32        | 3.74          | 0.27  | 0.91         | 76.90                             | 1.27           | 2.61  | 0.14  | 0.64  | 1.14     | 1.06                | 6.01           | 100   |
| Transportation  | 4.40        | 3.20          | 0.12  | 2.27         | 5.59                              | 74.93          | 1.22  | 0.29  | 0.60  | 0.69     | 1.91                | 4.78           | 100   |
| Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities<br>Financial        | 3.00        | 2.46          | 0.09  | 0.93         | 7.39                              | 0.78           | 74.88   | 0.22  | 0.41  | 0.80     | 1.28                | 7.76           | 100   |
| banking, insurance<br>and real estate<br>activities<br>Information. | 1.17        | 1.44          | 0.18  | 0.54         | 1.71                              | 0.81           | 0.36  | 79.59   | 1.53  | 0.63     | 5.94                | 6.12           | 100   |
| Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education and<br>Health care          | 2.51        | 0.93          | 0.13  | 0.70         | 1.38                              | 0.36           | 0.62  | 0.18  | 84.74   | 0.67     | 2.86                | 4.91           | 100   |
| Services  | 4.40        | 5.70          | 0.45  | 1.43         | 7.13                              | 1.63           | 1.51  | 0.20  | 1.91  | 63.42    | 3.26                | 8.96           | 100   |
| Other activities  | 2.44        | 1.50          | 0.57  | 0.95         | 1.94                              | 1.49           | 0.98  | 0.83  | 2.80  | 0.87     | 81.03               | 4.60           | 100   |
| Total   | 31.07       | 14.49         | 0.88  | 6.70         | 14.82                             | 3.77           | 4.8   | 1.00  | 7.39  | 2.11     | 7.38                | 5.58           | 100   |

# Table A.4.3: Rates of switching workers by economic industries, (only examining workers with more than 40 hours/week) in2011 (by number of workers)

|                             |                                   |                           |                           | Year                                  | r-end                              |              |                |        |
|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------------------------|--------------|----------------|--------|
| Year-start                  | Workin<br>g for<br>individu<br>al | Househ<br>old<br>business | Private<br>enterpri<br>se | Foreign<br>invested<br>enterpri<br>se | State-<br>owned<br>enterpri<br>ses | State sector | Not<br>working | Total  |
| Working for individual      | 61744                             | 5970                      | 813                       | 130                                   | 184                                | 396          | 5241           | 74478  |
| Household business          | 4696                              | 26564                     | 1144                      | 138                                   | 114                                | 219          | 2313           | 35188  |
| Private enterprise          | 769                               | 1138                      | 7825                      | 332                                   | 406                                | 239          | 954            | 11663  |
| Foreign invested enterprise | 113                               | 99                        | 400                       | 2817                                  | 51                                 | 30           | 290            | 3800   |
| State-owned enterprises     | 154                               | 115                       | 495                       | 48                                    | 3630                               | 394          | 287            | 5123   |
| State sector                | 559                               | 273                       | 231                       | 32                                    | 532                                | 13940        | 818            | 16385  |
| Not working                 | 6522                              | 2985                      | 1083                      | 415                                   | 302                                | 789          | 100132         | 112228 |
| Total                       | 74557                             | 37144                     | 11991                     | 3912                                  | 5219                               | 16007        | 110035         | 258865 |

Table A.4.4: Labor shift by economic sectors, all types of workers in 2011 (by number of workers)

Source: Labor Force and Employment Survey

## Table A.4.5: Labor shift by economic sectors, only examining workers with more than 40working hours per week in 2011

|                             |                              | Year-end              |                       |                                   |                                |              |                |        |  |  |  |  |
|-----------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------|----------------|--------|--|--|--|--|
| Year-start                  | Working<br>for<br>individual | Household<br>business | Private<br>enterprise | Foreign<br>invested<br>enterprise | State-<br>owned<br>enterprises | State sector | Not<br>working | Total  |  |  |  |  |
| Working for individual      | 34769                        | 3786                  | 489                   | 73                                | 135                            | 207          | 2314           | 41773  |  |  |  |  |
| Household business          | 3710                         | 22233                 | 988                   | 113                               | 102                            | 184          | 1730           | 29061  |  |  |  |  |
| Private enterprise          | 675                          | 1034                  | 7368                  | 324                               | 395                            | 215          | 869            | 10880  |  |  |  |  |
| Foreign invested enterprise | 98                           | 97                    | 383                   | 2735                              | 51                             | 29           | 277            | 3670   |  |  |  |  |
| State-owned enterprises     | 133                          | 111                   | 475                   | 41                                | 3382                           | 368          | 279            | 4789   |  |  |  |  |
| State sector                | 414                          | 221                   | 200                   | 31                                | 512                            | 12298        | 718            | 14394  |  |  |  |  |
| Total                       | 39799                        | 27482                 | 9903                  | 3317                              | 4577                           | 13301        | 6187           | 104567 |  |  |  |  |

|                             | Year-end                     |                       |                       |                                   |                                |              |                |       |  |  |  |  |
|-----------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------|----------------|-------|--|--|--|--|
| Year-start                  | Working<br>for<br>individual | Household<br>business | Private<br>enterprise | Foreign<br>invested<br>enterprise | State-<br>owned<br>enterprises | State sector | Not<br>working | Total |  |  |  |  |
| Working for individual      | 83.23                        | 9.06                  | 1.17                  | 0.17                              | 0.32                           | 0.50         | 5.54           | 100   |  |  |  |  |
| Household business          | 12.77                        | 76.50                 | 3.40                  | 0.39                              | 0.35                           | 0.63         | 5.95           | 100   |  |  |  |  |
| Private enterprise          | 6.20                         | 9.50                  | 67.72                 | 2.98                              | 3.63                           | 1.98         | 7.99           | 100   |  |  |  |  |
| Foreign invested enterprise | 2.67                         | 2.64                  | 10.44                 | 74.52                             | 1.39                           | 0.79         | 7.55           | 100   |  |  |  |  |
| State-owned enterprises     | 2.78                         | 2.32                  | 9.92                  | 0.86                              | 70.62                          | 7.68         | 5.83           | 100   |  |  |  |  |
| State sector                | 2.88                         | 1.54                  | 1.39                  | 0.22                              | 3.56                           | 85.44        | 4.99           | 100   |  |  |  |  |
| Total                       | 38.06                        | 26.28                 | 9.47                  | 3.17                              | 4.38                           | 12.72        | 5.92           | 100   |  |  |  |  |

 Table A.4.6: Rate of switching workers by economic sectors, only examining workers with

 more than 40 working hours per week in 2011

|  |             | Year-end      |   |              |                                   |                |   |   |   |          |                     |                |        |  |  |
|--|-------------|---------------|---|--------------|-----------------------------------|----------------|---|---|---|----------|---------------------|----------------|--------|--|--|
| Year-<br>start   | Agriculture | Manufacturing | Electricity,<br>water<br>supply and<br>mining | Construction | Wholesale<br>and retail<br>trade; | Transportation | Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities | Financial,<br>banking,<br>insurance<br>and real<br>estate<br>activities | Information,<br>Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education<br>and Health<br>care | Services | Other<br>activities | Not<br>working | Total  |  |  |
| Agriculture  | 41320       | 946           | 17  | 812          | 854                               | 135            | 204   | 10  | 133   | 96       | 194                 | 1839           | 46560  |  |  |
| Manufacturing  | 776         | 9672          | 27  | 200          | 363                               | 93             | 112   | 10  | 73  | 78       | 77                  | 510            | 11991  |  |  |
| Electricity,<br>water supply<br>and mining                             | 34          | 22            | 506   | 19           | 30                                | 6              | 5   | 1   | 5   | 8        | 29                  | 19             | 684    |  |  |
| Construction   | 653         | 179           | 6   | 4067         | 117                               | 58             | 42  | 1   | 54  | 32       | 53                  | 178            | 5440   |  |  |
| Wholesale and<br>retail trade;   | 717         | 433           | 20  | 103          | 10024                             | 162            | 335   | 11  | 63  | 104      | 126                 | 557            | 12655  |  |  |
| Transportation   | 143         | 98            | 7   | 61           | 160                               | 2302           | 37  | 5   | 22  | 19       | 64                  | 106            | 3024   |  |  |
| Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities<br>Financial,          | 149         | 88            | 2   | 35           | 295                               | 30             | 3406  | 8   | 28  | 40       | 59                  | 226            | 4366   |  |  |
| banking,<br>insurance and<br>real estate<br>activities<br>Information, | 3           | 9             | 1   | 3            | 12                                | 5              | 11  | 588   | 12  | 2        | 36                  | 21             | 703    |  |  |
| Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education and<br>Health care             | 174         | 71            | 4   | 41           | 78                                | 14             | 34  | 9   | 5342  | 28       | 168                 | 171            | 6134   |  |  |
| Services   | 116         | 89            | 7   | 33           | 106                               | 23             | 39  | 7   | 56  | 1244     | 56                  | 104            | 1880   |  |  |
| Other activities   | 206         | 99            | 20  | 40           | 124                               | 65             | 66  | 36  | 187   | 72       | 5179                | 204            | 6298   |  |  |
| Not working  | 1913        | 509           | 19  | 150          | 467                               | 98             | 240   | 27  | 171   | 104      | 198                 | 50538          | 54434  |  |  |
| Total  | 46204       | 12215         | 636   | 5564         | 12630                             | 2991           | 4531  | 713   | 6146  | 1827     | 6239                | 54473          | 154169 |  |  |

#### Table A.4.7: Labor shift by industries including every type of workers in 2011 (by the number of workers)

| Table A.4.8: 1 | Labor shift b | y economic indu | stries (only exan | nining workers | with more than 4 | 0 hours/week) in 201 | 1 (by number |
|----------------|---------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|
| of workers)    |               |                 |                   |                |                  |                      |              |

|  | Year-end    |               |   |              |                                   |                |   |   |   |          |                     |                |       |  |
|--|-------------|---------------|---|--------------|-----------------------------------|----------------|---|---|---|----------|---------------------|----------------|-------|--|
| Year-start   | Agriculture | Manufacturing | Electricity,<br>water<br>supply and<br>mining | Construction | Wholesale<br>and retail<br>trade; | Transportation | Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities | Financial,<br>banking,<br>insurance<br>and real<br>estate<br>activities | Information,<br>Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education<br>and Health<br>care | Services | Other<br>activities | Not<br>working | Total |  |
| Agriculture  | 16441       | 366           | 11  | 304          | 330                               | 54             | 74  | 4   | 59  | 39       | 90                  | 587            | 18359 |  |
| Manufacturing<br>Electricity, water                                    | 423         | 7062          | 23  | 146          | 258                               | 72             | 70  | 10  | 67  | 52       | 63                  | 350            | 8596  |  |
| supply and mining  | 24          | 19            | 451   | 17           | 19                                | 5              | 3   | 1   | 4   | 5        | 27                  | 14             | 589   |  |
| Construction   | 405         | 113           | 5   | 2798         | 95                                | 45             | 25  | 1   | 49  | 23       | 43                  | 117            | 3719  |  |
| Wholesale and retail trade;  | 357         | 293           | 13  | 68           | 6853                              | 113            | 205   | 7   | 49  | 65       | 92                  | 365            | 8480  |  |
| Transportation   | 88          | 73            | 6   | 51           | 112                               | 1803           | 28  | 5   | 15  | 11       | 56                  | 78             | 2326  |  |
| Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities<br>Financial,          | 78          | 44            | 1   | 23           | 169                               | 18             | 2057  | 6   | 14  | 20       | 42                  | 107            | 2579  |  |
| banking,<br>insurance and<br>real estate<br>activities<br>Information, | 3           | 9             | 0   | 3            | 8                                 | 4              | 8   | 554   | 12  | 1        | 35                  | 17             | 654   |  |
| Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education and<br>Health care             | 154         | 61            | 2   | 40           | 72                                | 12             | 30  | 8   | 4914  | 20       | 148                 | 149            | 5610  |  |
| Services   | 65          | 58            | 7   | 20           | 64                                | 16             | 24  | 5   | 41  | 807      | 42                  | 54             | 1203  |  |
| Other activities   | 117         | 78            | 17  | 31           | 94                                | 58             | 49  | 36  | 174   | 50       | 4581                | 165            | 5450  |  |
| Total  | 18155       | 8176          | 536   | 3501         | 8074                              | 2200           | 2573  | 637   | 5398  | 1093     | 5219                | 2003           | 57565 |  |

|   |             | Year-end      |   |              |                                   |                |   |   |   |          |                     |                |       |  |  |
|---|-------------|---------------|---|--------------|-----------------------------------|----------------|---|---|---|----------|---------------------|----------------|-------|--|--|
| Year-start  | Agriculture | Manufacturing | Electricity,<br>water<br>supply and<br>mining | Construction | Wholesale<br>and retail<br>trade; | Transportation | Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities | Financial,<br>banking,<br>insurance<br>and real<br>estate<br>activities | Information,<br>Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education<br>and Health<br>care | Services | Other<br>activities | Not<br>working | Total |  |  |
| Agriculture   | 89.55       | 1.99          | 0.06  | 1.66         | 1.80                              | 0.29           | 0.40  | 0.02  | 0.32  | 0.21     | 0.49                | 3.20           | 100   |  |  |
| Manufacturing   | 4.92        | 82.15         | 0.27  | 1.70         | 3.00                              | 0.84           | 0.81  | 0.12  | 0.78  | 0.60     | 0.73                | 4.07           | 100   |  |  |
| Electricity, water<br>supply and mining                             | 4.07        | 3.23          | 76.57   | 2.89         | 3.23                              | 0.85           | 0.51  | 0.17  | 0.68  | 0.85     | 4.58                | 2.38           | 100   |  |  |
| Construction  | 10.89       | 3.04          | 0.13  | 75.24        | 2.55                              | 1.21           | 0.67  | 0.03  | 1.32  | 0.62     | 1.16                | 3.15           | 100   |  |  |
| Wholesale and<br>retail trade;                                      | 4.21        | 3.46          | 0.15  | 0.80         | 80.81                             | 1.33           | 2.42  | 0.08  | 0.58  | 0.77     | 1.08                | 4.30           | 100   |  |  |
| Transportation  | 3.78        | 3.14          | 0.26  | 2.19         | 4.82                              | 77.52          | 1.20  | 0.21  | 0.64  | 0.47     | 2.41                | 3.35           | 100   |  |  |
| Accommodation<br>and food service<br>activities<br>Financial        | 3.02        | 1.71          | 0.04  | 0.89         | 6.55                              | 0.70           | 79.76   | 0.23  | 0.54  | 0.78     | 1.63                | 4.15           | 100   |  |  |
| banking, insurance<br>and real estate<br>activities<br>Information, | 0.46        | 1.38          | 0.00  | 0.46         | 1.22                              | 0.61           | 1.22  | 84.71   | 1.83  | 0.15     | 5.35                | 2.60           | 100   |  |  |
| Science and<br>Technology,<br>Education and<br>Health care          | 2.75        | 1.09          | 0.04  | 0.71         | 1.28                              | 0.21           | 0.53  | 0.14  | 87.59   | 0.36     | 2.64                | 2.66           | 100   |  |  |
| Services  | 5.40        | 4.82          | 0.58  | 1.66         | 5.32                              | 1.33           | 2.00  | 0.42  | 3.41  | 67.08    | 3.49                | 4.49           | 100   |  |  |
| Other activities  | 2.15        | 1.43          | 0.31  | 0.57         | 1.72                              | 1.06           | 0.90  | 0.66  | 3.19  | 0.92     | 84.06               | 3.03           | 100   |  |  |
| Total   | 31.54       | 14.20         | 0.93  | 6.08         | 14.03                             | 3.82           | 4.47  | 1.11  | 9.38  | 1.90     | 9.07                | 3.48           | 100   |  |  |

# Table A.4.9: Rate of switching workers to other industries by economic industries, only examining workers with more than 40working hours per week in 2011

|                             | Year-end                     |                       |                       |                                   |                                |              |                |        |  |  |  |
|-----------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------|----------------|--------|--|--|--|
| Year-start                  | Working<br>for<br>individual | Household<br>business | Private<br>enterprise | Foreign<br>invested<br>enterprise | State-<br>owned<br>enterprises | State sector | Not<br>working | Total  |  |  |  |
| Working for individual      | 50649                        | 4671                  | 580                   | 89                                | 152                            | 330          | 2504           | 58975  |  |  |  |
| Household business          | 2892                         | 12814                 | 529                   | 41                                | 56                             | 123          | 748            | 17203  |  |  |  |
| Private enterprise          | 487                          | 507                   | 5388                  | 203                               | 241                            | 127          | 315            | 7268   |  |  |  |
| Foreign invested enterprise | 79                           | 44                    | 218                   | 1687                              | 19                             | 14           | 79             | 2140   |  |  |  |
| State-owned enterprises     | 125                          | 63                    | 303                   | 31                                | 2447                           | 229          | 131            | 3329   |  |  |  |
| State sector                | 378                          | 153                   | 132                   | 15                                | 214                            | 9341         | 302            | 10535  |  |  |  |
| Not working                 | 2530                         | 793                   | 319                   | 83                                | 116                            | 307          | 50571          | 54719  |  |  |  |
| Total                       | 57140                        | 19045                 | 7469                  | 2149                              | 3245                           | 10471        | 54650          | 154169 |  |  |  |

 Table A.4.10: Labor shift by economic sectors all types of workers in 2011 (by the number of workers)

Source: Labor Force and Employment Survey

## Table A.4.11: Rate of switching workers by economic sectors, only examining workers with more than 40 working hours per week in 2011

|                             | Year-end                     |                       |                       |                                   |                                |              |                |       |  |  |  |  |
|-----------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------|----------------|-------|--|--|--|--|
| Year-start                  | Working<br>for<br>individual | Household<br>business | Private<br>enterprise | Foreign<br>invested<br>enterprise | State-<br>owned<br>enterprises | State sector | Not<br>working | Total |  |  |  |  |
| Working for individual      | 21141                        | 2508                  | 279                   | 40                                | 66                             | 147          | 904            | 25085 |  |  |  |  |
| Household business          | 1779                         | 8903                  | 378                   | 32                                | 42                             | 89           | 492            | 11715 |  |  |  |  |
| Private enterprise          | 338                          | 386                   | 4572                  | 164                               | 226                            | 115          | 253            | 6054  |  |  |  |  |
| Foreign invested enterprise | 60                           | 37                    | 191                   | 1381                              | 17                             | 13           | 63             | 1762  |  |  |  |  |
| State-owned enterprises     | 86                           | 59                    | 281                   | 29                                | 2267                           | 218          | 118            | 3058  |  |  |  |  |
| State sector                | 293                          | 130                   | 117                   | 12                                | 197                            | 8692         | 271            | 9712  |  |  |  |  |
| Total                       | 23697                        | 12023                 | 5818                  | 1658                              | 2815                           | 9274         | 2101           | 57386 |  |  |  |  |

|                             | Year-end                     |                       |                       |                                   |                                |              |                |       |  |  |  |
|-----------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------|----------------|-------|--|--|--|
| Year-start                  | Working<br>for<br>individual | Household<br>business | Private<br>enterprise | Foreign<br>invested<br>enterprise | State-<br>owned<br>enterprises | State sector | Not<br>working | Total |  |  |  |
| Working for individual      | 84.28                        | 10.00                 | 1.11                  | 0.16                              | 0.26                           | 0.59         | 3.60           | 100   |  |  |  |
| Household business          | 15.19                        | 76.00                 | 3.23                  | 0.27                              | 0.36                           | 0.76         | 4.20           | 100   |  |  |  |
| Private enterprise          | 5.58                         | 6.38                  | 75.52                 | 2.71                              | 3.73                           | 1.90         | 4.18           | 100   |  |  |  |
| Foreign invested enterprise | 3.41                         | 2.10                  | 10.84                 | 78.38                             | 0.96                           | 0.74         | 3.58           | 100   |  |  |  |
| State-owned enterprises     | 2.81                         | 1.93                  | 9.19                  | 0.95                              | 74.13                          | 7.13         | 3.86           | 100   |  |  |  |
| State sector                | 3.02                         | 1.34                  | 1.20                  | 0.12                              | 2.03                           | 89.50        | 2.79           | 100   |  |  |  |
| Total                       | 41.29                        | 20.95                 | 10.14                 | 2.89                              | 4.91                           | 16.16        | 3.66           | 100   |  |  |  |

 Table A.4.12: Rate of switching workers to other sectors by economic sectors, only examining workers with more than 40 working hours per week in 2011