

# Ethnicity and Women's Status: An Exploratory Bibliography

*Patricia E. Sawin  
Indiana University*

What follows is an exploration, the trace of my attempt to find out what kinds of things have been written about women who are members of ethnic groups, and to begin to formulate answers to two questions: (1) How does a woman's membership in an ethnic group influence her status? (2) What are the particular experiences of and pressures upon ethnic women? I soon realized that the compilation of a comprehensive bibliography of the materials regarding "women and ethnicity" would be an enormous task. (See Appendix A for book-length annotated bibliographies on subsections of this topic.) At the same time, however, certain patterns and regularities were emerging. I elected to continue with the original task in order to delineate trends and guiding issues within the field broadly defined, rather than to limit my investigation to a narrower topic for which a truly exhaustive bibliography could be created. My focus in this project has been consistently on change and comparison. What happens to women in particular when the culture of which they are members loses its independent status and becomes identified as an ethnic group within a larger society? How are women affected as compared to men? How is the situation of ethnic women different from that of women who participate in the majority culture?

"Ethnicity" and "status" are both problematic terms. I do not pretend to offer conclusive definitions, but I will identify my foci within these contested fields of meaning. By an "ethnic group" I mean a subgroup within a larger society whose members identify themselves as distinctive because of a culture and history that they share with each other but not with the majority (see Royce 1982\*:24).<sup>1</sup> It is important to realize that "ethnicity" is more a matter of perception than of fact; it depends on members of both the ethnic group and the "mainstream" society recognizing differences and deciding to

acknowledge them as significant (Royce 1982\*:4).<sup>2</sup> I have been particularly interested in the dual consciousness—the awareness of operating in two cultural systems at once—that this perception of difference promotes in members of the ethnic group.

In speaking of women's "status" I include consideration of at least six factors: (1) women's control over resources, (2) their influence in family and group decisions, (3) their control over their reproductive and sexual life, (4) the amount of labor they do and their work conditions, particularly as compared to men within their group, (5) their prestige or the importance accorded to their productive, reproductive, and symbolic activities, and (6) women's satisfaction with their lot.<sup>3</sup> Few of the works surveyed provide information on all of these topics, understandably, given the constraints of discipline-specific interests and sources of data. I have allowed myself the working hypothesis that a positive response (i.e., having control or being valued) in one category is likely to correspond with positive responses in other categories and with general satisfaction, while recognizing that this presupposition is partially conditioned by my own cultural preferences.

By expanding the concept of "status" I have tried to escape what feminist scholars now recognize as an unproductive and rigid conceptual dichotomization of male and female roles in early, structurally-oriented, cross-cultural studies of women (e.g., Rosaldo 1974\*). I have been more interested in women's control over decisions and resources than in whether they hold *formal* political power, more concerned with whether their contributions are acknowledged as valuable than whether they perform the same jobs as men or have equal access to the public sphere. I retain status as the primary dimension of comparison because "power" can be restored to relevance in this debate once its subtler manifestations are recognized and also because it was necessary to place a manageable limit on the discussion. I have also been curious, however, about the personal experience of ethnic women: what are the particular tensions and conflicts that women experience as they try to make their way in two interacting cultures, especially when identification with the cherished traditional culture is likely to bring disadvantages and discrimination? Are women affected differently than men in ways that are consistent cross-culturally? What factors cause women to feel they are "twice a minority," subjugated to men within their own group as well as looked down upon by the dominant society? Do women experience conflict because the two cultures in which they participate have different definitions of women's roles? Although there are several different

ways of "becoming ethnic," are there meaningful similarities or regularities, or do the various kinds of dominant-ethnic relations result in qualitatively different experiences?

I will introduce the discussion with brief reports on the way the project was organized, its limitations, and recent developments in the study of ethnic women that influenced my approach. Then I will outline the regularities in ethnic women's status and experience observable in the body of works surveyed. In conclusion I will offer a few observations on the inherent inclinations, strengths, and blind spots particular to each of the disciplines involved in the study of ethnic women.

### **Organization and Limits of the Project**

I originally conceived the project as a comparison among the effects of different ways of becoming ethnic. The bibliography is organized in categories that roughly reflect this principle both because it reveals certain regularities and because it corresponds to the usual division of labor among scholars in different social scientific disciplines. I identify four basic ways in which a formerly self-governing and independent cultural group can become an ethnic group: (1) by being colonized, (2) by having members removed forcibly from their homeland and transported to another area, usually as slaves, (3) by voluntary immigration in search of improved economic, religious, or political opportunities, and (4) by inclusion within a newly formed nation.<sup>4</sup> Colonized societies have been studied almost exclusively by anthropologists. African-Americans tend to have been studied by sociologists, as have Chicanos, similarly identified as a problem group within American society. Historians have focused mostly on European immigrants. The European peasant societies traditionally studied by folklorists would fall into the fourth category, although contemporary folklorists range across the spectrum, in keeping with current disciplinary emphases on self-identified groups. As a result of this tendency to draw data from specific populations, each discipline has developed a basic outlook on the ethnic experience. As I will discuss below, comparing the analyses produced in different disciplinary traditions reveals the way these presuppositions have circumscribed research.

The works covered in this study and hence my conclusions have been limited both by conscious decisions and by the nature of my search procedure. First, I decided to limit the study to the first three categories (ways of becoming ethnic) on the grounds that most examples of these three types involved contact and conflict between

groups with significantly different cultures, different economic systems (subsistence agriculture or artisanal production in contrast to Western capitalism), and relatively little prior knowledge of each other. (In contrast, neighboring groups included into a nation may have a history of enmity but are likely to share aspects of culture or economy). I also arbitrarily limited the investigation of *immigrants* to the situation in the U.S., although the situation of European immigrants to South America and Australia or former Colonial subjects emigrating to Europe would provide grounds for valuable comparison. My conclusions should be considered to apply only to this restricted population of ethnic women.

In terms of disciplines, I stayed with the four listed above and did not attempt forays into the political science literature or geographers' work on women in development. Within sociology I steered away from highly statistical treatments or psychological approaches, even though the titles of such works suggested concerns like family planning and kinds of stress suffered by ethnic women that are addressed relatively little in the more experientially-oriented literature.

I have restricted this comparison to works that focus on analyzing ethnic women's experience from the standpoint of one or another academic discipline and with an interest in women's "status." I concede, however, that the people with the most to tell us about the negotiation of an ethnic identity are often these women themselves, whether they have left chance documents of their lives in diaries and letters, collaborated with anthropologists or folklorists in the creation of a life history, or found inspiration for writing fiction in a developing feminist perspective. In appendix B I list (with minimal annotation) some of the best-known works of fiction, anthologies, and ethnic women's life histories. I similarly judged literary theory about ethnic women writers and works devoted to developing an ethnically-sensitive feminist practice (rather than to describing women's experience) beyond the scope of this study, although ideally the analytical work should feed the political formulations.<sup>5</sup>

I identified items for possible inclusion through a combination of systematic search in the MLA and Social Science Periodical Indexes,<sup>6</sup> recommendations from fellow scholars, prior familiarity from my research in feminist theory in folklore, anthropology, and literature, and following up references given in articles or books identified by one of the other methods. In folklore and anthropology I could rely on my prior knowledge of the major feminist authors to identify likely sources. In history and sociology, however, the coverage is more subject to the vagaries of the indexing systems. In these disciplines I

may have missed works that address gender issues as part of some other argument if they did not list "women" as a key word or use "women" or "gender" in the title. Similarly, selections in these fields are somewhat skewed toward authors who chose "ethnic" or "ethnicity" as a key word. While helping to identify scholars who conceive of their subjects' experience in terms of living in two cultures, this search technique may have excluded relevant work on Chicanas and African-American women, since some but not all of those scholars choose the "ethnic" designation.

Even within these imposed limits it was not possible to be completely comprehensive, so I have aimed for representative coverage instead. Each category of the bibliography includes several classic works (usually from the 1970s) that set the terms for subsequent debate and an occasional early work that anticipates these results without actually challenging the accepted paradigms of its time. A selection of more recent work (mostly 1980s) demonstrates how those basic issues have been developed, expanded, and redefined.

### Developments in the Field of Ethnicity and Women

I initially undertook this project in 1986 but waited until 1989 to revise and expand it for publication. In that brief interval the study of ethnicity and women has expanded tremendously, and this new literature has both reflected and played a part in reformulating the basic social science paradigms for studying women in culture. In 1986, after surveying the previous six years' worth of issues of several major journals in folklore, anthropology, and ethnic studies (see note 6), I concluded:

I was dismayed, although not entirely surprised, to discover that women and ethnicity seems to be a topic that slips into the cracks between the areas of specialization of current scholarly journals. I found only a few articles even marginally related to the questions in which I am interested. The anthropology journals treat women in non-Western cultures, but not in terms of their incorporation into ethnic minorities. The folklorists treat ethnicity as a phenomenon which is the same regardless of gender, while the ethnic studies scholars seem mostly interested in the political behavior of ethnic groups, although the gender-related problems of Blacks and Chicanos sometimes rate mention.

A statistical review of the sociological literature on ethnic women from 1971-81, published in 1986, reported that of the 24,000 articles listed in *Women's Studies Abstracts* for that period, less than 4 percent were about ethnic women; the review also noted that the *Harvard Encyclopedia of Ethnic Groups* (Thernstrom: 1980\*) did not even list

"ethnic women" as a category for consideration (D'Andrea 1986\*:243, 235).

In the three intervening years, two major journals have brought out special issues devoted to women and ethnicity, the *Journal of American Ethnic History* 8:2 (1989) and *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 14:4 (1989), in addition to the Folklore and Feminism issue of the *Journal of American Folklore* 100:398 (1987), in which five of sixteen articles discuss ethnic women. At least half a dozen other notable articles (reviewed here) have appeared singly. The same period has witnessed the publication of four major monographs (Lamphere [1987], Deutsch [1987], Zavella [1987], Weinberg [1988]), including two (Lamphere and Deutsch) notable for crossing disciplinary boundaries to reveal new insights and revise paradigms. Work on ethnic women by historians has developed sufficiently to suggest the need for a specific theory of history to guide work on immigrant women (Sinke 1989\*). Anthologies of fiction "by and about ethnic women" have proliferated.

New approaches to the study of women were already developing when I first considered this topic, but in the past three years these have moved in from the experimental margins to define the dominant discourse. In anthropology, scholars have at last transcended the dichotomy model that attributed women's universal subordination to their association with nature (as opposed to culture) and with the domestic sphere (Rosaldo 1974\*). Recognizing that arguments about universal subordination can never be resolved—"the asymmetry camp inevitably sees hierarchy, while the egalitarian camp sees complementarity in men's and women's roles" (Lamphere 1988\*:17)—feminist anthropologists now focus on the cultural construction of gender, individual agency within normative roles, and the influence of historical context (see Collier and Yanagisako 1987\*). Historians of immigrant women have moved beyond simply filling in the empty side of the record—documenting that women were there, too—or fighting the old stereotype of passive women victimized by patriarchal pre-migration cultures. Feminist historians are now finding in their work on ethnic women ways of reconceptualizing the study of entire cultures and eras, recognizing that women's domestic activity is not a separate sphere but rather an essential part of the working of an economy and society (Deutsch 1987:11; Mann 1989; Sinke 1989\*:123). Both of these are part of a larger movement in the social sciences generally whereby scholars locate their feminism not in studying women, but rather in defining research issues according to women's experiences and in relation to women's needs for information (Harding 1987\*:6). I

originally designed this study in terms of the then-prevalent dichotomy model. I have retained "status" as the organizing concept because it reflects the mindset of the authors of the classic feminist works reviewed here, but I have had to expand it far beyond the original emphases on prestige and structural position in order to do justice to the later works. Even so, the most innovative works covered here defy this old paradigm utterly; a review of the literature starting with 1985 or 1990 would have to employ a different frame of reference.

### **Regularities**

At one point in the process of this study I was ready to abandon the concept of "ethnicity" altogether, to declare it too broad to encompass the experiences of women whose lives had been conditioned by so many different cultural backgrounds and specific historical developments. A continued survey of this diverse literature convinced me, however, that although there are few universals, it is possible to identify significant patterns and trends. Factors that generate observable regularities include the (real or perceived) extent of difference between the two cultures in which an ethnic group member is involved and the historical era, which in turn influences the economic system and the gender role expectations in the dominant culture.

*Poverty.* The one very nearly universal experience for ethnic women is poverty or at the very least a temporary reduction in standard of living. To some extent this is a matter of societal definition: the group in a society that holds political power and that controls access to valued resources also has the ability to define the social scenario. Dominant groups almost never define themselves as "ethnic"; instead, they posit their culture and traditions as the universal standard and use the cultural variance of other groups as a justification for denying them equal benefits and opportunities (Royce 1982\*:3). Wealthy, well-educated immigrants are less likely to be thought of as ethnic. Their access to resources makes it easier to combine participation in the dominant culture with private retention of valued aspects of the home culture. Most members of ethnic groups, however, whether immigrants, members of assimilated minorities, or, of course, slaves or former slaves, experience poverty as a result of dislocation and discrimination. Even when direct comparison of standards of living is difficult—as in a transition from an agricultural to a wage economy—there is a common experience of feeling less secure and less sure of one's ability to provide for oneself and one's family.

Poverty and lack of security in a wage economy affect everyone, but certain experiences are particular to women. Single women, especially those who took the initiative to emigrate alone, are more likely to experience new freedoms and to enjoy the ability to send money home (Diner 1983). Married women, in contrast, have often had to absorb and compensate for the stresses generated by poverty. Housewives struggle to maintain a nurturing home atmosphere while practicing severe economies, working with unfamiliar foods and supplies, and bearing the blame if too much of the income has to be spent on domestic necessities. Husbands frustrated by their inability to provide adequately for their families may withdraw emotionally or take out their anger on their wives (Bloom 1985\*:615). Contemporary Black, Chicano, and Carib women, like their 19th-century immigrant sisters, frequently have had to compensate for their husbands' relative lack of social power by exhibiting *greater* deference in the home or making it appear that men make family decisions, even when the wife does the real managing (Ladner 1971, Stack 1974, Zinn 1982, Gonzalez 1969, Weinberg 1987:47). In many instances, ethnic families subscribe to a traditional ideal of the wife not working outside the home. In case after case, families find it possible to call upon some higher ideal (e.g., devotion to the patriarchal family) to justify women's employment. Men's participation in "women's work," however, continues to be seen as degrading, so working wives have to bear a double burden (Kim and Hurh 1988:162), often even when the wife is working and the husband unemployed (Bloom 1985\*:616). Even in Black slave families, men's need not to be further "emasculated" by doing women's work resulted in slave women working more hours per day than men (Mann 1989:781).

*Cultural Differences.* Ethnic women participate in and attempt to mediate between two cultures simultaneously. In general, research suggests that pressures on women in situations of culture contact or immigration are greater than those on men because women encounter more extensive differences in gender roles and must make greater accommodations to new distributions of activity in the public and domestic spheres (Rocha Lima 1984:94, Sinke 1989\*:129). However, the precise kind and extent of cultural differences, especially with regard to gender roles and family structures, and the extent of previous familiarity of each group with the other's culture, have regular effects on women's experience.

In early contact situations between groups with little or no previous knowledge of each other—notably European colonizers interacting with aboriginal peoples, the dominant group has tended to



interpret greater differences as evidence that the ethnics effectively have no culture and as justification for treating them accordingly. Greater prior familiarity was no guarantee that immigrants would not be treated as "dirty savages," not only by Anglo-Americans, but by those higher in the ethnic hierarchy (e.g., French-Canadian women who held the best jobs refused to work next to Italians in the Massachusetts textile mills [Bloom 1985\*:614]). Colonizers interacting with native groups, however, have debated whether they had souls (Spanish colonists with natives of the Americas) and even slaughtered them wholesale (Anglo-Australian settlers with Australian Aborigines).

Women are especially impacted when there are marked differences in kinship reckoning (matri- or patri-lineal), ritual involvement of men and women, ideals of female behavior and appearance, and expectations regarding marriage (for romantic love, friendship, or social stability) and control over their own sexual activity, in addition to economic matters to be considered below. In effect, the more sexually egalitarian the original culture, the more women stand to lose, especially when colonizers take that difference as justification for imposing their own standards on a "cultureless" group (see essays in Etienne and Leacock 1980, Mirandé and Enríquez 1979, chapter 2). The institution of private property and patrilineal inheritance deprives women of use rights in lands formerly controlled by matrilineal clans. Women lose political power when men gain control over prestigious trade goods or when outside authorities insist on dealing only with men. Australian Aboriginal women were labeled as prostitutes by white men who did not understand that for these women, having multiple partners was traditionally quite respectable. White Australians' concomitant characterization of Aboriginal women's religious activities as mere "love magic" provided an opportunity for Aboriginal men to devalue women's competing ritual power and to increase men's control within the society (Bell 1983). Montagnais-Naskapi men similarly took advantage of the Catholic marriages encouraged by French missionaries in order to demand deference from their wives (Anderson 1985:56). At best, women's ritual roles go unrecognized (Young 1987). The worst situation was experienced by African-American slave women who, through a combination of cultural and economic justifications, were treated as property, raped at will by their masters, forced to "breed" with other slaves, and repeatedly separated from husbands and children (Marable 1983:3, Mann 1989:791). In a few instances, however, where culture contact was less brutal, a matrilineal family structure proved strong enough to withstand outside pressure and allowed women to keep men from

adopting destructive aspects of the colonizing culture (Anderson 1985:59). For contemporary Native American feminists, the possibility of reviving or strengthening traditional values offers hope of improvement, since they believe that "American Indian women do not need liberation within Indian societies because they have always had a most central and distinct status as life givers, nurturers, and transmitters of cultural knowledge and traditions" (LaFromboise and Parent 1985\*:783; see also Young 1987). Women in native cultures demonstrate their inventiveness and resilience in updating old artistic forms or adapting new materials and techniques to create means of aesthetic expression that both respond adequately to their present situation and allow them to retain their positions as artists and ritual specialists in their societies (Babcock 1986, Hammond 1986, Jahner 1983).

In contrast to native women who lost status as their cultures were overrun, women whose cultural background was closer to that of the dominant culture were more likely to find that existence as an ethnic actually afforded greater opportunities for the individual to develop talents that would have been stifled in the home culture, as was the case, for example, for the Irish immigrant women studied by Diner (1983:46). Small-scale societies are likely to be even more conservative religiously and in the enforcement of patriarchal standards than cosmopolitan European and American society; i.e., the tacitly accepted values are likely to be more consciously and strictly enforced. Thus for immigrants from European peasant cultures, the experience of a life suspended between the old ways and the new options for women could actually be liberating. Alternately, women may decide that they prefer the kinds of influence and prestige offered by their traditional gender roles and may elect to readopt older behaviors and beliefs even though they appear more restrictive from an external perspective (Ginsburg 1987).

In marked contrast to both the early contact and 19th-century immigrant situations, in recent years there may be some advantage to the ethnic group in being seen as different by the majority culture. "Exotic" groups like Hmong refugees may be provided with special programs designed to accommodate cultural differences (Goldstein 1988), whereas public policy tends to be formulated on the assumption that long-term ethnic minorities like African-Americans and Chicanos are or should be striving toward the same cultural and economic standards as the majority culture. In an era when cultural differences are to be respected, distinctive aspects of Mexican-American and African-American culture are nevertheless regarded, respectively, as

atavistic retentions from a "backward" culture or as class-based rather than legitimately culture-based. The effect is to blame the victim rather than the systematic discrimination these people encounter. Chicanas are stereotyped as passive and dominated by their macho husbands, receiving little credit for their use of traditional activities to strengthen extended family ties crucial for survival (Williams 1984:113-114, Zinn 1980:19). Since the 1965 Moynihan Report, African-American culture has been typed as a "culture of poverty" with distinctive values that inhibit achievement, with the "degenerate" female-headed structure of poor Black families singled out as a primary factor. Black women are blamed for being too strong and weakening men instead of being appreciated and encouraged for coming up with innovative ways to provide for their families in the face of poverty and discrimination (Ladner 1971, Stack 1974, Zinn 1989).<sup>7</sup> Gonzalez's recent article warns, conversely, of the problem of assuming that immigrant women will prefer the traditional cultural practices (in this instance, midwife-assisted births) of their home country over American practices with which they are familiar (Gonzalez in Simon and Brettell 1986).

*Variations in the Dominant Culture: Economic.* In almost all of the studies considered for this bibliography, the ethnic group interacts with a dominant society that is characterized by a capitalist mode of production. Several of the authors call upon Marxist theory and in particular Friedrich Engels's *The Origin of the Family, Private Property, and the State* to argue that, in general, women's status should decline in the face of contact with capitalism as women's domestic production for use and reproduction of the work force (through childbearing, feeding workers, etc.) become less valued than men's production of commodities for exchange (Anderson 1985, Etienne and Leacock 1980, Mann 1989, Sinke 1989\*). Comparison of a wide variety of studies makes it possible to identify regularities depending upon the type of capitalism involved.

In the case of early, mercantile capitalism, the possibility exists for men in the contacted society to interact with the capitalists as trading partners or employees while retaining their traditional social arrangements intact, as when Australian Aboriginal men took temporary jobs as stock drovers and the Montagnais-Naskapi and Huron initially expanded their fur-trapping activities to supply the French (Bell 1983, Leacock and Etienne 1980, Anderson 1985). This may, however, upset the balance of power as men accumulate prestige goods or open the way for greater outside interference and the introduction of wage labor if increased exploitation for trade depletes

the resource base and makes the contacted group increasingly dependent. Matrilineal kinship reckoning and matri-local living arrangements are especially endangered because of the tendency of the dominant culture to attribute lack of productiveness to an "irregular" family life. As wage labor supplants traditional occupations, women's traditional control of the family's resources also becomes vulnerable, since men who readily relinquished agricultural products to their wives may classify wages as personal rather than family property (Young 1987:443).

The involvement of an ethnic group in agricultural production for cash rather than local use also correlates with a decline in women's status and influence. Outside brokers tend to work with men and assume that men are the primary agricultural producers and legitimate controllers of wealth whether this reflects traditional power distributions or not. When traditional forms of livelihood are disturbed, replacement projects tend to compensate the men, but not the women, with a concomitant decline in women's relative status (e.g., the Navajo studied by Hamamsy [1957]). Men, similarly, tend to have greater access to new agricultural technologies. Sharecropping and migrant labor are often based on a contract with the male head of household, even though the wife and children must also work to make the crop. The husband receives payment for and usually retains control over wages for the whole family's labor. Women's unpaid domestic labor, because it requires time away from the fields, is devalued as a drain on the family's productive capacity (Deutsch 1987, chapters 6 and 7; Mann 1989:784, 798).

Nineteenth-century industrial capitalism similarly swept men, women, and children into the factories, but with the crucial difference that they were not organized in family work groups. Although the conditions were often appalling and women frequently were relegated to less skilled and less well-paying jobs, this did mean that women were recognized for their own labor and usually paid separately, even if they turned their earnings over to their husbands or fathers. Sexual segregation in the work place provided for the formation of strong female friendships and solidarity at least among women of the same ethnic group. Women workers often got their jobs through the intervention of a female relative who might then help them learn the ropes (Norkunas 1987, Lamphere 1987). In some areas, immigrant women became involved in political and labor movements, usually with the effect of inculcating or strengthening a determination to be more independent of men (Harzig in *Journal of American Ethnic History* 1989). Girls who arrived in the United States in the early 1900s were

more likely to have access to an education than if they had stayed in Europe, while daughters who chose to go out to work and could pay for their own support might be given a room of their own in a crowded tenement apartment or enjoy other privileges (Kessler-Harris 1982\*:126). In general, single immigrant women, as noted earlier, often had greater opportunities for making their own living than in the home country and thus enjoyed increased status, independence, and control over their own lives (Vecchio in *Journal of American Ethnic History* 1989).

When marriage meant leaving wage work, however, as for the Irish women studied by Diner (1983), women's standard of living often declined compared to their single days; and many suffered severe deprivation in order to maintain the husband's honor as provider for his family. When wives did work, this could exert considerable strain on traditional family structures (and still does; see Zavella 1987, chapter 5). Women were usually relegated to middle or low-paying jobs, compared to men of the same ethnic group (Lamphere 1987:33). The practice of paying women less for comparable work enhanced the possibility that the husband would be laid off before his wage-earning wife. Since men rarely took on women's domestic duties, this could result in the wife working two jobs when her husband had none. Even when factory labor was not an option, women in some areas could sew or make paper flowers as "homework" for wages (Kessler-Harris 1982\*:124). Women who supplemented their families' income by taking in boarders had to do additional household labor, but were not necessarily recognized as economic contributors (Lamphere 1987).

Elder children were frequently pressed into wage labor to help support the family. When there was a choice, daughters would be sent to work while sons were allowed to remain in school (Weinberg in *Journal of American Ethnic History* 1989:115, Mirandé and Enríquez 1979:134). Daughters similarly remember having many more duties around the home, while sons were allowed leisure time (Weinberg 1987:40-41).

Specific labor conditions and historical developments could, of course, make a considerable difference in women's ability to reap benefits from going out to work (in terms of enhanced prestige and some relief from the second work day at home). Under certain conditions, companies were eager enough for women's labor to allow nonstandard work hours to accommodate household duties (Vecchio 1989). Alternately, the development of multiple shifts in factories at least made it possible for husbands in dual-earner families to share child care (Lamphere 1987:283). Studies of contemporary situations

suggest, however, that when the values of a family's cultural background define housework as women's work (as for the Columbian and Portuguese immigrants studied by Lamphere and the Chicanos studied by Zavella), husbands may in practice absorb some child care and even some housework, but do not change their ideology (Lamphere 1987:283-7; Zavella 1987:138).

A service economy often exploits women by providing low-paying, insecure jobs and justifying meager remuneration on the grounds that these jobs require only the domestic skills women already have. Still, in the sources surveyed, employment in the service sector appears to have been a relatively productive situation for ethnic women, although there were culture-specific limitations on who went into that work. Jewish families felt that letting their daughters be servants entailed downward mobility, when they had left the old country to be upwardly mobile, and Italians were usually resistant to placing their daughters, unsupervised, in others' homes (Kessler-Harris 1982:127). At the turn of the century, native-born Anglo-American women found work as domestics degrading and overtaxing, but Swedish immigrants thrived in those jobs. For women who would otherwise have worked for wages on a farm in Sweden, housework was relatively easier, and living in the employer's home provided an opportunity to learn American ways while not preventing contact through church and social clubs with other young Swedish workers (Lintelman in *Journal of American Ethnic History* 1989). Black domestic workers "do not see themselves as being the devalued workers that their employers perceive and construct their own interpretation of the meaning of their work" (Collins 1989\*:748; see Rollins 1985\*). First-generation (*Issei*) Japanese-American women working as domestics in California were often ashamed to let status-conscious relatives in Japan know they had such low-status jobs. Yet in their own lives they were satisfied that they were respectably fulfilling their *Meiji* work ethic and suffered no loss of status within the ethnic community where most people held similar jobs (Glenn 1986\*:178-9). Finnish domestics, similarly, sometimes complained about difficult masters but generally saw domestic work as a good option and enjoyed high status among other immigrants. One commentator attributes the character of the Finnish American community to the fact that most of the women had emigrated alone and earned their own living as domestics, although those who returned to Finland were still reluctant to publicize their involvement in the U.S. in a job they would never have stooped to in Finland (Ross in Ross and Wargelin Brown 1986:42; Pentti in Ross and Wargelin Brown 1986:59).

In the contemporary postindustrial economy, a tribal group's attempt to maintain traditional gender-based divisions of physical and ritual labor may give women greater access to outside jobs, resources, and prestige. When men must spend more time than women on ritual duties (as for the Pueblo tribes studied by Young [1987]), women are better able to report regularly to jobs organized according to an Anglo sense of time. For the contemporary Tlingit of Alaska, women are more likely than men to be hired for permanent jobs as teachers and government workers (and consequently are more likely to pursue the necessary education). Men are seen as less reliable because they are more likely to take short-term but very lucrative jobs on fishing boats (Klein in Leacock and Etienne 1980:103-4). For most of this century, the market for tourist souvenirs has provided supplementary income for some Native American groups. Increasing mainstream interest in native arts in the past decade has enabled many more artists (mostly women) to draw upon their cultural background and traditional skills to make a good living, although stylistic innovation for the Anglo market and accompanying role changes may create tensions within the group (see Babcock 1986 on potter Helen Cordero; the work of writers like Louise Erdrich and Leslie Marmon Silko might be considered in the same light).

When members of the ethnic group have so few economic opportunities that they must depend on state welfare, new opportunities arise for external agencies to interfere and impose their model of gender relations, usually to women's detriment. In Australia, government payments to aboriginal people go almost entirely to men, thereby undermining women's traditional independence and enforcing the development of nuclear families (Bell in Leacock and Etienne 1980:264). In a much earlier era, French traders and missionaries provided housing, food, and protection for Native Americans whose sources of support had been overexploited, but only if they would agree to Catholic marriages and the explicit subordination of the wife to her husband (Anderson 1985). In the U.S. currently, Black women are maintained as the heads of households because they receive Aid to Dependent Children and will lose it if they form a permanent alliance with a man, even though he may be unable to find permanent work (Ladner 1971, Stack 1974). It is important to realize, however, that control of resources under these circumstances does not necessarily confer higher status. Black, Chicano, and Black Carib women (in the studies by Ladner 1971, Stack 1974, Zinn 1982, and Gonzalez 1969) are all subject to even greater demands for deference to the men in their cultural group precisely because the men are trying

to find new ways to assert their traditional familial authority when they are unable to provide financially for their families. Additionally, Black women often find that their troubles are minimized in popular representations because they are thought of as superwomen. At the same time, they are castigated by the dominant culture and their own men for being so strong as to "emasculate" the men, although the men's inability to secure jobs or enter into stable relationships actually is the result of institutionalized racism (Ladner 1971).

A pattern is also evident in the effects on women of involvement with a capitalist economy depending upon the prior status of domestic work or production for use. In tribal societies where women's reproduction of the family and the means for their subsistence was valued as different from but equal to men's hunting or trading for prestige objects, coming into contact with capitalism has usually caused a decline in women's status. In situations where women's domestic labor was already devalued compared to wage labor, as for former slaves turned sharecroppers, the opportunity for women to stay at home more and devote energy to the nurturing of their own families was personally satisfying but rarely conferred prestige on women's work (Mann 1989:784-5). When women who previously stayed at home have had to go out to work for the first time, however, as often happens with immigrants up to the present, there is at least a possibility that formerly ignored domestic tasks will be more valued and that women will receive appreciation (though rarely any help) for accomplishing two jobs at once. Indeed, women's satisfaction is often predicated not on how much work they have to do, but on whether they are recognized for doing extra work (Weinberg 1987, Kim and Hurh 1988). Even when mothers did not receive recognition at the time, their daughters could be inspired by retrospective appreciation to strive to better their own lot (Weinberg 1987).

Speaking in the most general terms, the experiences of ethnic women documented in these works support the basic contention that involvement with a capitalist mode of production is likely to be detrimental to women's status. It is essential to refine this view, however, by recognizing that the actual effects in any one case will depend upon the specifics of the historical situation and of differences between the interacting cultures which influence the extent to which capitalist relations interact with and change the extant social structure and individual's options within it.

*Variations in the Dominant Culture: Gender Roles.* While the gender roles for the ethnic group are often at variance with those of the majority culture, it is also important to remember that gender



expectations within the majority culture have not always been the same. Hence the standards imposed upon an ethnic group or seen as a desirable model by ethnic women themselves vary over time. It was the 17th-century French explorers' sense that women should be submissive that brought them to interfere in the egalitarian family structures of the Native American groups with whom they traded for pelts. In the 19th century, in contrast, when the "cult of true womanhood" prevailed among Anglo-American women, recently freed Black share-cropping women sought to emulate that ideal, even when it meant losing status relative to their husbands for not doing as much of the wage-earning field labor. For immigrant families, who shared the ideal of women as benign rulers of the domestic sphere, having to send wives and daughters out to work must have been especially stressful since it marked their class and made them appear more different from "real Americans" than they felt they were.

In the late 20th century, ethnic women face the even more complex situation of a society in which liberated women are admired, although many patriarchal structures are still in place. Women's expectations for their own family roles may change, as for the Portuguese women who see Anglo-American men helping with housework (Lamphere 1987). Alternately, women whose own sense of propriety dictates that they should stop working outside the home as soon as possible may feel conflict over what it means to be a woman when Americans promote the image of career women. Not infrequently, ethnic women subscribe to an ideal of womanhood that they have adopted from the outside culture but which is now being challenged by women in the majority population and passing out of fashion. This cultural lag is particularly sad when the newer (often more feminist) practice in the majority culture is closer to the ethnic group's former traditions. Aboriginal girls, for example, reject traditional arranged marriages after reading modern romance novels, but in so doing separate themselves from a tribal system in which married women interacted mostly with other women and had their own sources of ritual and jural power (Bell 1983). Similarly, the Latinas studied by Gonzalez had been influenced by American models to prefer highly medicalized hospital births over the woman-centered midwife assistance prevalent in their home countries a generation earlier (Gonzalez in Simon and Brettell 1986).

Until very recently, scholars have emphasized the stress that women have encountered when facing conflicting gender roles. Increasingly, however, those analyzing the experience of ethnic women are recognizing a theme that has always been present in the

autobiographical and fictional literature, namely, that negotiating two different sets of gender roles makes these women aware that such expectations are cultural constructions. This creates an opportunity for critical reflection and the reformulation of a gendered identity (Rocha Lima 1984:93, Goldstein 1988:25).

### **Disciplinary Limitations**

In comparing these various literatures on ethnic women, similarities do emerge between the experiences of women in vastly different historical and cultural situations. As readers may have noticed, however, major regularities tend to correspond with circumscribed populations and with the work of scholars in the single discipline that has most focused on that population. While I do not question the validity of any individual study, it is important to realize: (1) that work in the distinct disciplines is not always strictly comparable because of differences in data sources and interests, and (2) that findings within each discipline are influenced by the arguments scholars are called upon to address. This last is particularly important because recently several scholars have found themselves constrained by the presuppositions that had been built up within their own disciplines.

Historians have done almost all the work on 19th-century immigrant women. These works tend, understandably, to focus on the *immigrant* experience rather than on *ethnicity* as a process or issue. In other words, this perspective emphasizes the effects of historical events over the influence of culture. "Ethnicity," when explicitly invoked, is used essentially as a label for the category that includes immigrants of Italian, Jewish, Irish, German, Swedish, Greek, French-Canadian, or other background. There is rarely as much attention to the specific culture of any group as a folklorist or anthropologist would like. The bulk of this literature focuses on women's work experience to the exclusion of social and cultural activities, although attention to women's involvement in political and labor organization reveals a facet of ethnic women's experience relatively little-touched by other disciplines. While the historians' ability to describe women's experiences is sometimes limited by their sources of data (e.g., government statistics), increasing reliance on women's personal documents and oral history often reveals cultural details even when they are not identified as such. Much of the feminist historical work since the mid-1970s has been devoted to dispelling earlier stereotypes of immigrant women as "passive, ignorant, and degraded" (Sinke 1989\*:123). As a result, even though these works document the hardships suffered by immigrant women, they tend to emphasize

strengths and successes and to suggest overall that the immigrant experience was a liberating one for women.

Anthropologists have provided the work on non-Western, usually small-scale societies as they come into contact with Western capitalist cultures. This approach is based on the idea that culture and culture differences are important, so these works supply plenty of detail on the beliefs and practices of the contacted culture, while the Marxist influence on most of the authors assures careful attention to the historical context and specific character of the dominant culture at that historical moment. Because the classic works in this field were designed to combat assertions of women's universal subordination to men, they tend to stress the egalitarian character of gender roles in pre-contact societies and (in contrast to the historians' optimism) to incline toward negative predictions for women in contact situations.

Some sociologists use "ethnic" much as the historians do, simply as a collective label for non-Anglo groups within American society (although the sociologists use the term to include African-Americans and Hispanics as well as immigrants), but for the most part sociologists who specify a focus on "ethnicity" are more interested than scholars in the other disciplines in ethnicity as a problematic experience. It is the sociologists who provide the most direct information about women's experience of negotiating two sets of cultural standards at once. Those working on African-American women, however, especially in the early, classic treatments, were reluctant to employ the term "culture" since they were concerned to demonstrate that these women did not participate in a self-imposed "culture of poverty." Chicana scholars are similarly challenged to discriminate good from bad in their Mexican and Mexican-American background without playing into old stereotypes. In keeping with the standard methods of the discipline, some of the sociological studies made claims to describe ethnic women's *experience* that, given their use of statistical data, are hard to accept from a folkloristic/anthropological point of view. I was encouraged, however, by the increasing use of more ethnographic approaches. The sociologists' attention to the effects of laws and policies on ethnic women highlights other disciplines' silence on those issues. In a feminist twist on the standard use of sociological studies to develop policies implemented *on* minority groups, African-American and Chicana scholars are the most evidently involved in developing political strategies *for* the contemporary populations they study.

Folklorists, not surprisingly, provide most of the data available on ethnic women's experiences outside of work, including religious

activities and foodways as well as involvement in verbal and visual arts. In contrast to the particular subset of anthropologists represented in this study (who focus on culture contact and change), folklorists (like the majority of anthropologists) tend to approach the ethnic group as a bounded entity, a culture in its own right. Hence many folklore studies do not focus on the negotiation of the ethnic boundary or the dual-culture experience, although it is often possible to read between the lines (and see Morgan 1966, Babcock 1986, and Ginsburg 1987 for examples where folklore is involved in interaction with the majority culture). Where these feminist folklorists excel, however, is in challenging received exoteric perceptions of ethnic women's lives. Where historians set out to prove that women did things that were never reported, folklorists reinterpret what ethnic women have been doing all along (see especially Young 1987, Turner and Seriff 1987). The folklore studies reveal repeatedly that a group's own understanding of the value of women's activities need not coincide with the majority culture's standards of worth or status. These insights argue the need for an expanded, flexible, and culturally-sensitive notion of status that challenges the very terms (drawn from the historical and anthropological discourses) in which this comparison was framed.

Within the last few years, scholars within individual disciplines have become increasingly aware of the limits and biases introduced by discipline-specific perspectives. The most exciting works—including Anderson, Deutsch, Lamphere, Yanagisako, and Williams—spring from such a perception and draw upon the theories and approaches of several disciplines to balance cultural detail with historical specificity, representative coverage with personal testimony, and the dual-culture perspective with an appreciation of culture-internal standards.

## Conclusion

This survey of the literature on ethnic women suggests that *ethnicity* has no single face and that ethnicity cannot be pronounced monolithically advantageous or disadvantageous for women, except to the extent that being a member of a dominated group is rarely a positive status. What ethnic women's dual-culture experience gives them in terms of new opportunities and critical insight into the construction of gender is too often counterbalanced by poverty, discrimination, and stress on the individual and the family. Without being able to delineate any universal patterns, I want to emphasize the importance of recognizing culture-based similarities across historical periods, historical similarities across cultures, similarities based on the

economic system across culture and time, and so forth. The attempt to identify and further specify patterns in the functioning of the institutions and scholarly concepts that perpetuate the oppression of certain persons by others is in itself a worthwhile exercise, because in recognizing the common sources of oppression, we destroy the appearance of naturalness and inevitability that supposedly unique situations present. It is in that spirit that this bibliography and introductory essay are offered.

### **Annotated Bibliography**

Within the field of studies on ethnic women, one can identify a number of distinct "discourses," that is, conversations among groups of scholars who are primarily addressing the same issues, usually responding to and building upon each others' work.<sup>8</sup> To assist readers in following these strands of argument, I have divided the bibliographic entries into five groups corresponding to distinguishable discourses. As noted above, scholars within certain disciplines have tended to concentrate on particular ethnic groups, so there is a basic correlation between discipline-specific approaches or interest in particular issues on the one hand and specific ethnic groups or at least the "ways of becoming ethnic" discussed above on the other. Given the increasing and laudable tendency of scholars to apply their scholarly outlook to nontraditional subjects and to seek guidance outside their own discipline, several of the newest and most valuable works do not fit absolutely within one category. Where more than one assignment is possible, I have placed the work within the discourse to which the author is apparently most intent on contributing (which usually corresponds to the writer's disciplinary affiliation). Thus, for example, I have grouped anthropologist Louise Lamphere's study of immigrant mill workers under the anthropological approach and historian Sarah Deutsch's book on New Mexican Hispanics with other historical works.

Within the categories below, I have arranged the entries alphabetically by author's last name for ease of reference. As a result, however, the sequence of entries does not follow the sequence in which authors entered into the discussion. Readers may find it easier to trace the development of particular issues by reading the entries in each section chronologically by date of publication rather than in the order given.

### I. Anthropological Approach (Colonization and the conflict between Euro-American/developed societies and non-Western/tribal societies)

Anderson, Karen. 1985. Commodity Exchange and Subordination: Montagnais-Naskapi and Huron Women, 1600-1650. *Signs* 11(1):48-62.

Anderson offers this comparison of two historical North American tribes in order to refine the argument put forward by Etienne and Leacock in *Women and Colonization* (see below). While Leacock and Etienne (building on Friedrich Engels's argument in *The Origins of the Family, Private Property, and the State*) assert that the introduction of commodity production and exchange leads directly to a deterioration in the status of women, Anderson maintains that specific historical circumstances and the structure of the society have a significant modifying influence. Prior to French colonization, the Montagnais-Naskapi (analyzed by Leacock in *Women and Colonization* and at greater length in her 1981 *Myths of Male Dominance*) and the neighboring Huron (researched by Anderson) were both "egalitarian," that is, they practiced gender-based division of labor but valued women's work, accorded women prestige and autonomy, and guaranteed persons of either gender unmediated access to necessities. Both groups were involved in the French fur trade and were intensively proselytized by French Jesuit missionaries who sought to bring them into Christian marriages in which the wife was required to obey her husband. But whereas the French rapidly undermined women's status among the Montagnais-Naskapi, Huron women managed to maintain their position and privileges. The main differences between the tribes were that the Montagnais-Naskapi were hunter-gatherers and had a loose, flexible social structure while the Huron were semi-sedentary horticulturalists whose society was tightly organized according to matrilineal clans. Anderson argues that the deterioration of women's position was not a necessary result of the fur trade. Rather, historical and structural factors determined a society's vulnerability to the effects of the economic change. The Montagnais-Naskapi found it attractive to move into French-protected villages because their nomadic life style exposed them to Iroquois attacks and because of the depletion of game. In these villages the French intentionally distributed goods solely to men, to whom women were then forced to subordinate themselves. The Huron economic base, by contrast, had not been depleted by the fur trade, so traditional systems of production and distribution could be maintained. Furthermore, matrilocal residence patterns exerted limitations on men who became Christian to secure French trade preference. Anderson confirms the primacy of the economic base, but insists that "the key to understanding the relationship between the subordination of women and commodity production and exchange lies not in the advent of commodity production but in the effect of this change on a society's unit of production and reproduction" (1985:62).

Bell, Diane. 1983. *Daughters of the Dreaming*. Melbourne, Australia: McPhee Gribble Publishers.

Bell's work on Aboriginal women from central Australia is an exemplary ethnography. It is full of very clearly explained detail on the intricate ritual and kinship system, yet it never loses sight of the real human beings under study. Essentially all previous work on Aboriginal culture had argued that women had little involvement with or power in ritual. By actually living in the women's camp (*jilimi*) in an Aboriginal settlement at Warrabri, Bell was able to document that women do have rituals of their own that men must not witness and that they have considerable behind-the-scenes influence even in male-controlled ceremonies like boys' initiations. In fact, men and women share equally in the ritual maintenance of their ancestral lands. Bell demonstrates how the androcentric bias of colonial government agents, cattle station hands, and anthropologists has acted to diminish women's power within their own culture. Ironically, however, her study also suggests that the concentration in settlements of large numbers of Aboriginals who have been driven off their lands is creating the potential for a resurgence of women's power. In these larger settlements there are more potential residents for the *jilimi* (where widows and other women who are not currently associating with men live together with their children). These older women are generally the ones with most time for and interest in ritual matters, and the enlarged *jilimi* are serving as centers of renewed ritual instruction and activity.

Etienne, Mona, and Eleanor Leacock, ed. 1980. *Women and Colonization: Anthropological Perspectives*. New York: Praeger.

This collection was assembled to combat the notion propounded by Rosaldo (1974\*), among others, that a feminist critique of culture must take as its starting point the "fact" that women have been subordinated to men in all known cultures. Leacock argues that there have indeed been egalitarian societies in which men and women's work was different, but equally valued, and in which women consequently held considerable political influence. In most instances, however, contact with European colonizers has destroyed the egalitarian character of these societies, if not the societies themselves, so that synchronic anthropological studies (that assume that "primitive" cultures are now as they have always been) necessarily present distorted evidence. These 12 diachronic studies provide counterexamples from both historic and recent cultures of societies in which women's contributions have been valued and of the changes wrought by colonization. The authors demonstrate that women have lost power and prestige in colonial situations because of a combination of androcentric bias and the imposition of a capitalist economy. Europeans have generally dealt with and accorded responsibility to men only, which gave men preferential access to cash and encouraged women's dependence on men. Simultaneously, the transition to private property often alienated women's rights to use of lands, and the introduction of prestigious trade goods symbolically devalued women's production of articles for use, rather than for trade.

Hamamsy, Laila Shurky. 1957. The Role of Women in a Changing Navaho Society. *American Anthropologist* 59(1):101-111.

This article is notable especially for its early date. While lacking the Marxist framework invoked by Leacock, Hamamsy comes to essentially the same conclusion. In this traditionally matrilineal and matrilocal society, women previously exercised more influence and enjoyed more economic and social security than men. Changes introduced into the economic system, especially the replacement of sheep herding with wage labor, have altered the social organization of the family. Whereas previously "the accumulation of wealth [and concomitant prestige] was possible for both men and women" (1957:110), the advent of new forms of employment available exclusively to men has undermined women's authority. A husband upon whom the wife is economically dependent can dictate neolocal or patrilocal residence. Women separated from their maternal kin and deprived of prestigious labor retain primary responsibility for home and children, but they find little satisfaction since the social significance of both has been reduced. Hamamsy concludes, "the changing economic position and social organization of the Navaho today are adversely affecting the women. They are losing their economic independence, the satisfactions and rewards that accompany their functioning, and their security and power within the family" (1957:11).

Lamphere, Louise. 1987. *From Working Daughters to Working Mothers: Immigrant Women in a New England Industrial Community*. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press.

This book exemplifies what can be achieved by combining the methodologies of anthropological ethnography and social history. What began as a contained study of modern dual-earner immigrant families in a Rhode Island mill town burgeoned into a decade-long project involving half a dozen researchers, including a social historian and students with specialized language skills to interview members of the older (Polish and French-Canadian, as well as English and Irish) and newest (Columbian and Portuguese) ethnic groups. Lamphere is among those scholars noted for leading feminist anthropology away from the earlier structural dichotomy models (see Lamphere 1988\*), so it is hardly surprising that she eschews a direct evaluation of women's status. She employs a Marxist framework to identify the nature and allocation of "productive" (i.e., wage-earning) and "reproductive" labor, with the latter including both work required to sustain the family and that involved in reproducing the social relations of production. Within this framework Lamphere brings together discussions of the types of work available to women, the strategic considerations involved in deciding the allocation of labor, and women's involvement in strikes. Ethnicity has long been an important determinant of the character of this industrial town and has repeatedly proven one of the factory owners' strongest weapons in keeping the workers from uniting in labor unions. Still, Lamphere concludes that the experience of each ethnic group (including the organization of ethnic neighborhoods and family arrangements) was influenced primarily by the combination of the historical state of the labor market and their own



position in the family cycle at their time of entry, with ethnicity one component of a strategic response to the situation. With regard to women, Lamphere demonstrates how changes in the factories and in the nature of household labor have influenced women's participation in wage-labor. Families have always needed more than one paycheck to survive, but whereas in the 19th century the extent of household labor and the possibility of earning money by taking in boarders meant that wives had to be at home, while teenaged daughters could be excused from household duties to go to the mills, today's immigrants can rely on more conveniences and split shifts to juggle care of their small children while sending wives out to work.

Sharp, Lauriston. 1977 [1952]. *Steel Axes for Stone-Age Australians. In Conformity and Conflict: Readings in Cultural Anthropology*, ed. James P. Spradley and David W. McCurdy, pp. 446-460. Boston: Little, Brown and Company.

This early article predates the discourse initiated by Leacock and Etienne, but it is instructive as an example of a standard evaluation of culture change prior to the introduction of feminist perspectives in anthropology. Among the Aboriginal tribe studied by Sharp (Cape York Peninsula, Queensland), only elder men had traditionally been allowed to make and own the stone hand axes which were the most useful tool. Women and younger men were kept in a subordinate relation to the elder men because they had to ask for the use of an axe. Missionaries discovered that the Aborigines were particularly delighted to receive steel hatchets and proceeded to give them out as gifts to everyone, regardless of sex or age, in an attempt to increase attendance at mission functions, with the result that the male elders suddenly lost their traditional authority. Thus, according to Sharp, the contact with European civilization actually increased the relative status of women (and young men) but at the same time has undermined the very foundations of the culture.

Yanagisako, Sylvia Junko. 1985. *Transforming the Past: Tradition and Kinship Among Japanese Americans*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Yanagisako's study of the Japanese American community in Seattle is an example of one of the most exciting recent trends in feminist social science research. Like Lamphere (above) and Deutsch (below), Yanagisako employs a feminist approach to achieve a gender-balanced depiction of the society and issues she studies, in this case Japanese Americans' evolving construction of their kinship system. In her examination of Issei (first-generation) marriages, for example, she is interested in women's status but refuses to treat it as a monolith. Instead she identifies four "patterns of the division of income-producing tasks between Issei spouses" and four "configurations of husbands' and wives' comparative control over four spheres of activity" (1985:48). By juxtaposing these data, she is able to do justice to the range of family work and power arrangements, yet also to conclude that women's participation or lack thereof in the work force made little difference in their status. The significant factor

was the husband's position in his own family: a successor husband (who expected to become the head of his family in Japan) was much more likely to reserve all decisions for himself and treat his wife as a mere worker, while nonsuccessor husbands were much more committed to sharing the creation of a new family unit with their wives (1985:57-9). Similarly, in discussing kinship change between the first and second generations, Yanagisako notes that although women's actual activities and extent of control did not change much, the metaphors in terms of which roles and possibilities were conceived shifted dramatically. While the Issei employed an inherently hierarchical "gender metaphor of sociospatial opposition, which assigned women to an 'inside' domain encompassed by a male 'outside' one," the Nisei (second generation) subscribed to a more flexible "labor-specialization metaphor, which assigned to women the reproductive function of 'family' and 'home,' and to men the productive function of income-producing work" (1985:244).

## II. Sociological Approaches to African-American Women and Chicanas (the legacy of slavery, poverty, and discrimination)

Gonzalez, Nancie L. Solien. 1969. *Black Carib Household Structure: A Study of Migration and Modernization*. Seattle: University of Washington Press.

In this study, Gonzalez delineates the concept of the "consanguineal household," a household consisting of several uterine sisters and their children and mother, who share a living area (among the Caribs, a compound of houses), domestic chores, and financial arrangements. Husbands of the sisters are usually only part-time residents, and uterine brothers are similarly more likely to live in their sisters' compound than with their wife or mistress. This work is remembered for two major theoretical arguments. (1) The consanguineal household should be distinguished from a matrilineal culture because this arrangement is a forced accommodation to adverse circumstances; the nuclear family remains the social ideal, although few can achieve it (1969:13-14). (2) This system occurs in many societies where the traditional social system has been dissolved by industrialization, especially when the only source of cash is recurrent migratory labor that takes men away from home for extended periods (1969:8-11). It is not a remnant of African culture, but a result of the exploitative and dehumanizing practices of capitalist employers in third world countries (1969:107).

Ladner, Joyce A. 1971. *Tomorrow's Tomorrow: The Black Woman*. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday.

Ladner's study provides a sensitive inside portrait of teenage Black women and the difficulties of growing up Black and female. Of particular interest for the consideration of ethnic identity are her observations (1) that Anglo-American society bombards Blacks with images of "what women should be" that they know they can never attain, and (2) that Black women have had to be strong to

survive, yet as a result are simultaneously romanticized as superwomen and denigrated for perpetuating bastardy and emasculating their men. Like Stack and Gonzalez, she argues that Black culture is not inherently "matriarchal," but that women have been forced into positions of responsibility and men deprived of them by the conditions of slavery and continuing social and economic disadvantages. She criticizes white scholars for not recognizing the substantial achievement of Blacks in maintaining a culture this healthy under extremely difficult conditions, yet simultaneously demonstrates that what appears to whites as deviant behavior may be in accord with alternative Black values. The first chapter, although not limited to the situation of women, is extremely valuable for a general study of ethnicity. In it Ladner argues explicitly that whites have labeled Black culture "deviant" as a means of blaming Blacks for their own oppression and that the real problem is not ethnicity or Black culture, but institutionalized racism (1971:4-6).

Mann, Susan A. 1989. Slavery, Sharecropping, and Sexual Inequality. *Signs* 14(4):774-798.

Mann employs a Marxist perspective based on the distinction between production for use and production for exchange to evaluate Black women's changing status in the transition from slavery to sharecropping. She argues that the division of labor increased under sharecropping. While women assumed sole responsibility for domestic work, they were still necessarily involved in field labor, too, so that women worked more hours than men. Women were pleased to have the opportunity to provide for their families better than when they were slaves, but their willingness to take on the less prestigious "production for use" handed increasing control to their husbands.

Marable, Manning. 1983. Groundings With My Sisters: Patriarchy and the Exploitation of Black Women. *The Journal of Ethnic Studies* 11(2):1-40.

Marable deplors the oppression of women in the Black community and traces its development from slavery through the Black Power movement. He documents some of Black women's struggles and achievements as well as the specific forms of oppression to which they have been subjected by Black men as well as white. (One telling example is Black men's opposition to allowing Black women access to birth control on the grounds that it is a white genocidal plot.) Marable argues that Black men's emphasis on their "manhood" and insistence on dominating women is a self-destructive reaction to white patriarchal domination. White masters raped Black women at will in part to demoralize Black men who were unable to protect their families. The productive response, Marable insists, is not to reproduce that structure of domination, but to engage with Black women in a community of equals.

Mirandé, Alfredo and Evangelina Enríquez. 1979. *The Mexican American Woman*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

This was the first major study of Chicanas published by an academic press. The authors, a professor of sociology and graduate student in comparative literature, present a multi-faceted approach to la Chicana, in part because of the paucity of scholarship on contemporary Chicanas, in part to depict the current situation in sociohistorical perspective. Mirandé and Enríquez describe Chicanas as triply oppressed (because they are women, because they are members of a colonized group, and because of internal oppression of Chicanas by Chicanos). The early chapters on "Cultural Heritage" in Mexico and the American Southwest are heterogenous—ranging from a reconstruction of Aztec gender roles to biographies of notable women. The discussion of Aztec women's loss of prestige after the Spanish conquest concurs with anthropologists' analyses of the effects of imposing a male-dominant Christian culture on smaller scale societies. Each biography foreshadows certain aspects of contemporary Chicanas' situation, but the authors do not formulate a comprehensive explanation (historical or theoretical) of the connections between these women of widely different class, race, and historical situation, all of whom are called Chicanas. The central chapters on the contemporary situation (chapter 4, "The Woman in the Family," and chapter 5, "Work, Education, and the Chicana") provide syntheses of current scholarship rather than new ethnographic work. They do, however, convincingly depict typical experiences for Chicanas, for example, the conflict women experience between behaviors that will ensure them success in the Anglo educational system and behaviors that will garner approval from Chicano men. In the chapter on "Images in Literature," Mirandé and Enríquez distinguish images of Chicanas in American Literature, Chicano Literature, and Chicana Literature, and allow the voices in the third category to supply details to enliven the general sociological discussions in the preceding chapters. The final chapter on "Chicana Feminism," while mostly devoted to the historical development of feminism among Chicanas and theoretical formulations, also portrays the difficult experience of Chicanas who are accused of being traitors to their people as a whole if they seek liberation from male dominance within the culture.

Stack, Carol. 1974. *All Our Kin: Strategies for Survival in a Black Community*. New York: Harper and Row.

Stack's study of domestic networking among low-income Blacks in the U.S. provides one of the earliest and most forceful empirically-based arguments against the stereotypical representation of Black families as "matriarchal, deviant, and broken" (1974:23). She disputes the "culture of poverty" theory (see Moynihan 1967\*) arguing that the development of kin and friend ties rather than nuclear families is a positive adaptation to chronic poverty, not a broken family form. Her descriptions of Black family life are detailed and caring, but not romanticized. In Stack's depiction, flexible sexual partnerships, the raising of children by their grandmothers if the mother is too young to take responsibility, the sharing of resources with members of an extended family (even when that leaves the giver short for the next month's rent), and similar

practices unfamiliar to middle-class whites emerge as sensible responses to a difficult situation in which one cannot depend on steady income and must rely on reciprocity between friends to get by. Stack traces the marginal position of Black males in permanent domestic arrangements to the fact that the only dependable income for most low-income Blacks is Aid to Families with Dependent Children, which is distributed to women, but she also collects data to demonstrate that fathers and their families are far more involved with children than statistics based on marriage rates show. Among Stack's most revolutionary insights is the recognition that roles middle-class whites regard as necessarily unified must often be shared by various actors under poverty conditions and that there is thus nothing abnormal about a man living with one group and taking meals with another or with the various component roles of a "mother"—provider, groomer, discipliner, etc.—being spread out among several responsible adults.

Zavella, Patricia. 1987. *Women's Work and Chicano Families: Cannery Workers of the Santa Clara Valley*. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press.

Earlier, programmatic statements on Chicanas (e.g., Zinn 1980, below) suggested that Chicanas' subordination to their husbands is alleviated as women enter the work force. Zavella's detailed ethnographic and historical research on cannery workers allows her to challenge and refine that supposition. In the families she studied, Zavella notes, women do receive somewhat greater respect and a greater say in family decisions when they are working. Overall, however, cultural continuities and structural factors in the job market mitigate against significant change in women's status. Chicanas are encouraged to take seasonal jobs in canneries because they then receive unemployment in off months. Seasonal workers remain dependent upon their husbands, however, and the classification of permanent jobs as men's work makes it very difficult for women to break into those jobs (those who succeed encounter tremendous harassment). Most men believe in a traditional gender-based division of labor, and few families discuss adaptations necessary when wives go to work. Some families cope better than others, but the wife often suffers resentment from her husband and the children (usually daughters) who must take up the slack, and Zavella became increasingly aware of the undercurrent of conflict in most families. As far as the allocation of household work, behaviors may change in response to immediate needs, but "there was no fundamental redefinition of responsibility" (1987:138).

Zinn, Maxine Baca. 1980. Gender and Ethnic Identity Among Chicanos. *Frontiers* 5(2):18-24.

Zinn calls for detailed studies of the interaction between ethnicity and gender in Chicanos' identity formation: "We know a great deal about our ethnic heritage, about our ethnic presence in America, but we know very little either about how our ethnicity contributes to our conceptions of ourselves as women and men or about how our conceptions of women and men contribute to our ethnic identity (1980:18). She notes that traditional gender roles are in a process

of change, especially because of Chicanas' increasing participation in the labor force. Furthermore, current notions of Chicana identity (which emphasize their passivity, childlike nature, and dependence upon and deference to men) are inaccurate both because they are evaluative (tending to compare Chicanos negatively with Anglos) and because they accept cultural norms for truth without reference to actual behavior and individual negotiation of identity in relation to ideal standards. (This article is part of a special issue of *Frontiers* entitled, "Chicanas en el ambiente nacional/Chicanas in the National Landscape," ed. Cordelia Candelaria.)

Zinn, Maxine Baca. 1982. Chicano Men and Masculinity. *Journal of Ethnic Studies* 10:29-44.

Zinn's argument regarding machismo and male dominance in Chicano society are very similar to Ladner and Stack's ideas about the distribution of authority in poor Black families. She maintains that the present system of social inequality, which limits Chicano men's access to valued resources and prevents them from providing for their families according to the middle-class Anglo norm, contribute to sexual stratification within Chicano culture because they push the men to emphasize their masculinity in other ways. At the same time, she warns against describing machismo as a psychological compensation mechanism because that effectively blames Chicanos for their own subordination.

Zinn, Maxine Baca. 1989. Family, Race, and Poverty in the Eighties. *Signs* 14(4):856-874.

Zinn provides a succinct review and persuasive critique of the opposing explanations for the persistence of a Black underclass in the U.S. On the one hand are the "cultural deficiency" models, revived versions of the culture of poverty theories developed in the 1960s. Zinn demarcates three versions of this popularized view: culture as villain, family as villain, and welfare as villain. The alternative explanation, much better supported by research, attributes continuing poverty among Blacks to a decline in the "opportunity structures" of society that has had the greatest impact on Blacks and Hispanics. Since World War II the cities and the well-paying blue-collar jobs located there have been "the main avenue of job security and mobility for Blacks and Hispanics" (1989:865). The shift to a service- and information-based economy and the flight of blue-collar jobs to the suburbs have left these people marooned in the deteriorating and increasingly isolated inner cities. Low marriage rates, according to one explanation, reflect the high percentage of young men who are unemployed or in prison. As Zinn notes, however, current structural explanations "have failed to articulate gender as an analytic category even though the conditions uncovered in contemporary research on the urban underclass are closely intertwined with gender" (1989:873). Zinn calls for research that investigates economic transformations with attention to class, race, and gender.

### III. Sociological Approach to Contemporary Immigrants

Goldstein, Beth L. 1988. In Search of Survival: The Education and Integration of Hmong Refugee Girls. *Journal of Ethnic Studies* 16(2):1-27.

Goldstein studied Hmong students' experiences in American high schools on the assumption that school is a primary site of cultural adaptation for immigrants of school age. She discovered that the young people did see school as "the place where they could seek an American identity" (1988:12) as well as valued job preparation, but also that parents perceived the American values inculcated by the schools—such as individuality and the attainment of competences that the older generation lacked—as a threat to the maintenance of the traditional culture. Girls and boys experienced the resulting tension over school differently, Goldstein argues, because of the strongly patrilineal and patriarchal nature of Hmong society. In remembering life in Laos, boys glorified men's independence and prestige, while girls emphasized hard labor, infant deaths, and unhappy marriages and hoped for better things in America. In school, consequently, boys were more interested in learning concrete skills to use in the hoped-for rebuilding of Laos, while girls wanted to gain social skills to smooth their expected life here. One of the girls' favorite activities was copying phrases from romance novels and constructing imaginary love letters shown only to other Hmong girls. Girls were discouraged from making American friends, however, by their retiring cultural style, by the de facto segregation of students still learning English (factors shared with the boys), and by the patrilineal definition of cultural belonging. Girls who married Americans would no longer have been seen as members of the Hmong community. Furthermore, although schooling was ostensibly valued for young people of both genders, girls often received more reinforcement for maintaining the Hmong community by dropping out of school to marry and have children. While change is slow and Hmong girls receive little recognition from the dominant community, Goldstein concludes that their experience of living between cultures is fostering an awareness of gender as a cultural construction and that the girls are using that as a basis for challenging their position in Hmong society.

Kim, Kwang Chung and Won Moo Hurh. 1988. The burden of double roles: Korean wives in the USA. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 11(2):151-167.

I find this article (like most of those written by sociologists) somewhat frustrating because the authors promise to report on "the adjustment *experiences* of Korean immigrant wives" (1988:151, emphasis added), but actually present statistical data compiled on the basis of formal interviews. The authors achieve breadth (having interviewed 615 adults), but readers learn only how respondents' answers fit into the investigators' categories, not how recent immigrants conceptualize their own experience. Nevertheless, this article helps to answer the question I am most interested in because the authors outline Korean gender role expectations and explain immigrant women's experiences with reference to that standard. They

argue that both men and women among recent Korean immigrants continue to hold the belief that it would be degrading for husbands to do household work. According to this value system, wives should not work outside the home, yet married women's assumption of the double burden of wage work and responsibility for almost all household work can be justified by that "feature of the traditional ideology [that] call[s] for sacrifices on the part of the wives, when such sacrifice is necessary for the collective interests of the [patrilineal] family" (1988:162). Kim and Hurh thus bring forward an aspect of immigrant women's praxis often omitted from the historians' optimistic accounts with their emphasis on opportunity for women. They also compare Korean married women's situation with that of both Black women (whose employment receives community acceptance because of historic discrimination against Black males) and white women (who have more opportunities to negotiate role expectations with their husbands). This comparison emphasizes the importance of ideology-practice disjunctions within an ethnic group as well as conflicts between the value systems of the interacting cultures in influencing women's status.

Simon, Rita James and Caroline B. Brettell. 1986. *International Migration: The Female Experience*. Totowa, NJ: Rowman and Allanheld.

This collection of essays surveys the situation of women who have migrated during the post-World War II period. In the modern period, Simon and Brettell argue, female migrants account for nearly half (in some areas more than half) of the total, yet their particular experiences are still rarely taken into account. The collection includes examples from most of the major migration streams to "Western receiving societies" and so covers immigrants to Canada, Australia, and Europe as well as the U.S. The authors represented employ techniques ranging from the purely statistical to the ethnographic and personal, and the editors have brought together works that stress governmental policy with works that focus on cultural adjustment. The essays and introduction are notable for highlighting complexities of the contemporary migrant experience that either did not occur in earlier generations or are very difficult to reconstruct from historical documents (to cite two fascinating examples that are beyond the strict purview of this bibliography—Turkish women migrating to Germany to earn their own dowries and single Greek women being encouraged to migrate to Australia by the Australian government to offset the large number of unattached Greek male migrant workers). Of particular relevance to the subjects covered in this bibliography are David Haines's discovery that Vietnamese immigrant women's work in the U.S. is a continuation of their active, public, economic role in Vietnam rather than a break with cultural tradition or adaptation to new circumstances, and Nancie Gonzalez's highly personal account of two immigrant Latinas' dilemmas in choosing among the alternatives available for assistance when giving birth in the U.S. Louise Lamphere contributed an article that briefly describes the contemporary portion of the longitudinal study covered in her 1987 *From Working Daughters to Working Mothers* (see above). The more statistical and policy-oriented studies, e.g., Yolanda Prieto's on Cuban women in New Jersey and Rita Simon and Margo DeLey's on undocumented Mexican



women, tend to attribute behavioral patterns to personal preferences, education, or class ideology and hence to de-emphasize cultural influences.

#### IV. Historical Approach (mostly 19th- and early 20th-century European immigrants to the U.S.)

Deutsch, Sarah. 1987. *No Separate Refuge: Culture, Class, and Gender on an Anglo-Hispanic Frontier in the American Southwest. 1880-1940*. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Deutsch's detailed study of Hispanic New Mexican women's experiences of culture contact is exemplary in many ways. She begins with a detailed description of life in the New Mexican mountain villages in the late 19th century, after U.S. annexation but before village culture and economy were disrupted by outside influences. Working from this base, Deutsch proceeds to a chronological discussion of stages in the development of a new economy and social order: (1) men's outmigration for temporary wage labor, during which women sustained the "orderly center" of the village, (2) migration of families to the Southern Colorado coal mines, where enforced living in Anglo-designed company towns prevented women from accessing their traditional sources of power, and (3) migration of families to the Northern Colorado beet fields and the establishment of a permanent migrant lifestyle. She argues that Hispanic women were oppressed not by their husbands, but by the exploitative economic system that Anglo commentators have been unwilling to acknowledge. Deutsch's research experience emphasizes the limiting influence of discipline-specific models and the benefits to be gained by drawing from multiple theoretical perspectives. As a historian, Deutsch had anticipated discovering that "Hispanic women, subordinated at home, found the move north a liberating experience" (1987:10). When her research revealed just the opposite she turned to the anthropological literature on women in similar economies. In the resulting revision she discovered a way to make women's activities and gender issues central organizing principles of a comprehensive cultural study.

Diner, Hasia R. 1983. *Erin's Daughters in America*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Diner's monograph on Irish female immigrants to the U.S. after the Famine is an excellent example of how historical data can be interpreted to reveal the psychological and cultural stresses experienced by women trying to mediate between two cultures. Diner argues that the Irish women who came to America had much more real power and many more opportunities for employment than they would have had at home, that women suffered less from the prevalent negative stereotypes of the Irish than did men, and that late marriages were culturally sanctioned, in part because they had become habitual during the famine years as a means to prevent the further dispersal of family holdings. The basic cultural ideal of male control in the home was not revolutionized, however,

and this created considerable difficulty for those who did marry. Women were still expected to stop working as soon as they got married, which meant not only that they could not continue their support of their natal families back in Ireland, but also that a woman who had provided well for herself often sank into poverty because she and her many children could not live on the husband's earnings alone. Furthermore, women who had enjoyed many years of financial and personal independence before marrying were often far more assertive than Irish men expected their wives to be. Because of cultural discrimination, Irish men were often unable to stay employed, and the inability to provide for their families combined with the greater independence of women led many men to desert their families. Desertion, combined with a high mortality rate for Irish men employed on especially dangerous jobs, produced many female-headed households, most impoverished, if not destitute.

Special Issue: Immigrant Women. 1989. *Journal of American Ethnic History* 8(2).

The appearance of this special issue (composed of articles submitted in response to a call from the [male] editor, not pre-assembled by the authors) suggests the extent to which ethnic and immigrant women's history has gained recognition in the past decade. As the editor notes, these articles emphasize topics prominent in historical treatments of ethnic women, including work, working-class organizations, and education. The articles in this issue are:

Lintelman, Joy K. "American is the woman's promised land": Swedish Immigrant Women and American Domestic Service, pp. 9-23.

Native-born American women who had to work as domestic servants generally complained that the work was degrading, isolating, and too difficult. Lintelman draws on letters from Swedish immigrants preserved in the Folklore Archive in Stockholm as well as statistical sources to document that Swedish women who emigrated to the U.S. had quite a different experience. Most emigrated in the expectation of going into domestic service, did not mind the work (which was easier than the wage farm labor available to them in Sweden), felt it increased their social status, and did not find that the schedule prevented them from having an active social life with other Swedish immigrants.

Borst, Charlotte G. Wisconsin's Midwives As Working Women: Immigrant Midwives and the Limits of a Traditional Occupation, 1870-1920, pp. 24-59.

By surveying records of midwives' activities in four Wisconsin counties, Borst seeks to counter the impression that few married immigrant women entered the work force. She explains why midwifery was a convenient occupation for married women and documents the often considerable extent of their formal training. Although she notes that midwives usually attended women of their own ethnic group, the source of her data prevents her from describing cultural differences in birth customs.

Vecchio, Diane C. Italian Women in Industry: The Shoeworkers of Endicott, New York, 1914-1935, pp. 60-86.

Vecchio documents women's extensive employment in the Endicott Johnson shoe factories in upstate New York to challenge the previously accepted view that "culturally enforced family opposition kept southern Italian women out of the workforce." She suggests that women's employment was promoted by chance variables such as "the

proximity of ethnic neighborhoods to the factories" and also by the company's sensitivity to the cultural situation and women's domestic duties and willingness to accommodate women's particular needs in order to retain them as workers.

Harzig, Christiane. The Role of German Women in the German-American Working-Class Movement in Late Nineteenth-Century New York, pp. 87-107.

Male German-American Socialists promoted a distinctive cultural identity for the group "to delay both acculturation and the evolution of new roles for women." Women formed auxiliary branches and used their experience of organizing solidarity-promoting social events as a step toward political activism and advancing causes of special import to women. Their conviction in the superiority of German-American Socialism over Anglo-American bourgeois culture, however, prevent them from joining into a larger feminist movement.

Weinberg, Sydney Stahl. Longing to Learn: The Education of Jewish Immigrant Women in New York City, 1900-1934, pp. 108-126.

Weinberg reveals that young Jewish immigrant women strove to get an education, even though most had to settle for working to help support their families. Older children often had to work so the younger ones could go to school, and it was usually considered more important for boys to continue their education than girls. Even if first-generation women could not take advantage of increasing educational opportunities themselves, they made sure that their children did. Second-generation Jewish children "went to school in greater numbers and remained there longer than the children of any other contemporary immigrant group."

Norkunas, Martha K. 1987. Women, Work and Ethnic Identity: Personal Narratives and the Ethnic Enclave in the Textile City of Lowell, Massachusetts. *The Journal of Ethnic Studies* 15(3):27-48.

Norkunas interviewed 22 women from seven different ethnic groups in hopes of learning how the unusually extensive involvement of women in the textile mills had affected immigrant families. She discovered, however, that the women were rarely interested in discussing the relation between family and work. Her training as a folklorist is evident in that she proceeded to identify the kinds of narratives the women *were* willing to tell. She was surprised to realize that although these women had remained segregated by ethnic group and knew little of each others' lives, the kinds of experiences they were inclined to talk about—the voyage to America, the feeling of belonging to two nations, impressions of their first days in the mill—were essentially identical. Historians writing about immigrant groups tend to focus on the immigrant experience and hence implicitly to assume that that experience was not influenced by background culture. Norkunas explicitly argues that for this group the immigrant experience *was* more important than the ethnic experience: "They lived in worlds internally different because of language and culture, but all patterned after the demands of factory work and the problems of transition to a foreign land" (1987:40). At the same time she does comment on significant culture-specific differences; for example, most immigrant women did not hesitate to come to Lowell alone if they could join a sister or aunt there, but Greek women (perceived as in need of male protection) only came to a male family

member. Norkunas's oral history both explains and critiques standard historians' practice, suggesting that immigrant women even in the same town did have culture-specific experiences, but the parts of their lives they have been willing to articulate were those constrained to sameness by shared external forces.

Rocha Lima, Valentina da. 1984. Women in Exile: Becoming Feminist. *International Journal of Oral History* 5(2):81-99.

The Brazilian women Rocha Lima studied (like the author herself) defined themselves primarily as *exiles* from their homeland rather than immigrants to the countries in which they resided and most returned to Brazil after a general political amnesty was declared in 1979. Whether or not one wishes to consider them strictly "ethnic," however, they experienced dislocation and the necessity to adapt to a foreign culture much as immigrants do; and Rocha Lima's analysis raises several issues that others might want to consider. Most of the women became feminists during their years of exile. Rocha Lima attributes this to the juxtaposition of cultures. Traditional gender expectations that had been obscured when men and women engaged together in the political struggle were revealed in exile as middle-class women used to the support of extended family and servants suddenly discovered that they were expected to take responsibility for all domestic work without male participation (1984:90). Rocha Lima also argues that women were more susceptible than men to the need to reevaluate their lives and identities when separated from Brazilian culture and from the intense political involvement that had justified their existence (1984:94). The article also evinces the author's respect for those she studied. She talks explicitly about "recognizing the other as a subject—a producer of meanings not our own" (1984:86). She also clearly builds her analysis on what women told her rather than positing categories in advance, and she is able consequently to report on very specific aspects of these women's experience (for example the pressures on relationships and increasing identification with other minorities as well as the development of feminist perspectives) that are almost never reported in the rest of this literature.

Ross, Carl and K. Marianne Wargelin Brown, ed. 1986. *Women Who Dared: The History of Finnish American Women*. St. Paul, MN: Immigration History Research Center, University of Minnesota.

Finnish women are rarely mentioned in the literature on immigrant women, although 100,000 of them came to the U.S. between 1869 and 1914. And although that number represents fully 35 percent of the total Finnish emigration, women have been left out of accounts of Finnish American immigrants, too. Ross and Wargelin Brown created this book to start remedying these omissions. Half the articles provide biographies of prominent Finnish women, notably including outspoken proponents of women's rights, and two others analyze the development of feminism. Of particular relevance to the concerns of this bibliography are Ross's article on "Servant Girls: Community Leaders" and folklorist Marsha Pentti's on "*Piikajutus*: Stories Finnish Maids Tell." Ross argues that "the employment of Finnish American women as domestics had a profound

effect and lasting impact on the fundamental characteristics of the Finnish American community" (1986:42): women who had emigrated alone and gained an independent livelihood (and whose sisters in Finland had the vote after 1906) expected a certain level of respect and shared control with their husbands. Penti identified a distinctive genre of personal experience story told by women who had worked as maids in the U.S., but discovered that those who later returned to Finland told such stories only to each other: maids enjoyed high status in the Finnish immigrant community, but being a maid was considered a very low status job in Finland (1986:57-59).

Seller, Maxine Schwartz. 1981. *Immigrant Women*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Seller's anthology could have been listed with the fiction and life history collections in Appendix B, but I include it here because it was so indicative of (and influential in promoting) the new approach to immigrant women developing among historians in the early 1980s. Seller's premise is that "the immigrant woman's encounter with America, for better or worse, was not the same as the immigrant man's" (1980:5), and she also asserts that women left their native countries to escape not only the economic, political, and religious oppression common to all immigrants, but also "forms of oppression unique to them as women," including "sexual harassment, unequal wages, and working conditions that were more difficult than those endured by their male counterparts" (1980:6). Her goal is "to portray immigrant women as subjects rather than as objects." The collection includes scholarly essays as well as fiction, speeches, and excerpts from autobiographies and oral histories. Seller's thematic organization of the readings into sections with titles like "Why They Came," and "Survival in a New Land" highlights the historian's assumption that historical events exert the most important (and shared) influence on immigrant experience, yet the selections depict the variety of experiences encountered by women whose places of origin include Asia and the Caribbean as well as Europe.

Weatherford, Doris. 1986. *Foreign and Female: Immigrant Women in America, 1840-1930*. New York: Schocken Books.

Weatherford combed social workers' reports and women's own diaries, letters, and autobiographies to compile this thematically-arranged compendium of ethnic women's experiences. She does not advance any theoretical argument but does provide telling glimpses into the lives of immigrant women. Because so much of the recent literature on immigrant women stresses their work, this book is especially valuable for talking about other aspects of women's experience: their health and interactions with the health authorities, their clothing, sexual matters including birth control and the harrowing experiences of unmarried pregnant women turned away by immigration officials as a moral threat while the fathers of their babies were welcomed, and their impressions of the differences between American housekeeping and their customs at home. Weatherford restricts her view to European immigrants but (admirably) includes rural and Western settlers as well as the more-studied urban immigrants. Many of the passages she quotes

from women's own writings provide glimpses of the customs specific to each ethnic group that are too often missing from historical treatments of immigrants.

Weinberg, Sydney Stahl. 1987. Jewish Mothers and Immigrant Daughters: Positive and Negative Role Models. *Journal of American Ethnic History* 6(2):39-55.

Weinberg's article contributes important insights to our understanding of ethnic women's experience because she takes into account not only gender, but also age, birth order, and the interaction of historical and cultural factors. Jewish immigrant sons, she argues, were "coddled guests" in their mothers' kitchens and tend to romanticize their mothers' ability to provide for the family despite hardships. Daughters, in contrast, "knew that it was hard work rather than magic that put food on the table" (1987:41). Older girls were more likely to resent the decision to come to America because they left friends behind, were too old to enter American schools, and often had to work to help support the family in the early days of worst poverty. Younger daughters, in contrast, benefited both from the family's improved economic situation and from parents' gradual shift from the Eastern European view of children as economic assets to the American view of children as independent beings in need of special care. Weinberg also recognizes the importance of appreciation. Making sacrifices for the family and younger siblings could be fulfilling or embittering, depending on whether the daughter's contribution was recognized or taken for granted. Almost all daughters, however, were profoundly impressed by their mothers' self-sacrifice. Whether it spurred them on to pursue opportunities their mothers never had or inspired them to follow the model of fulfillment through others, these immigrant daughters understood the value of women's contribution.

Weinberg, Sydney Stahl. 1988. *The World of Our Mothers: The Lives of Jewish Immigrant Women*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press.

Weinberg bases her depiction of the Jewish immigrant domestic culture on interviews with 46 women who came to New York City before 1925 as well as on first-person accounts from oral history, memoirs, and fiction. This book is notable for devoting four chapters to the European background of the immigrants and exploring changes in East European Jewish society that anticipated and encouraged emigration. Because of her attention to women's own depiction of their experiences, Weinberg is able: (1) to reveal unexpected facts (e.g., the extent to which single Jewish women emigrated first and brought their parents and siblings over later), and (2) to refine our understanding of specific influences (e.g., the difference between older and younger sisters), as well as (3) to trace perceived continuities of experience underneath behavioral changes (e.g., the extent to which women felt they were maintaining a properly religious Jewish home even when they had discarded certain restrictive practices).

### V. Folkloristic Approach (Women's Artistic, Symbolic, and Ritual Roles within Ethnic Communities)

Babcock, Barbara A. 1986. Modeled Selves: Helen Cordero's "Little People." In *The Anthropology of Experience*, ed. Victor W. Turner and Edward M. Bruner, pp. 316-343. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

Helen Cordero of Cochiti Pueblo is the originator of the Storyteller, a pottery image of an adult covered with tiny, listening children. Over 140 potters from numerous Rio Grande pueblos now make related figures, but Cordero created the first one as a likeness of her grandfather, who took very seriously his role in transmitting the cultural traditions to his grandchildren. In this article Babcock traces the personal and cultural sources upon which Cordero draws and argues that even though these pieces are innovative and are made to be sold to Anglo art connoisseurs, Cordero's philosophy, technique, materials, style, and subjects all root her work in Pueblo culture. Cordero has improved her own family's economic situation markedly (her originals now sell for thousands of dollars) and has revitalized the market for Pueblo ceramics from which hundreds of other potters, mostly women, benefit. She periodically gives demonstrations at galleries and museums and has come to see these encounters as an opportunity to share her cultural wisdom with Anglos whose rude questions convince Cordero that they sorely need to be instructed in Cochiti ways (1986:336). In a paper delivered at the 1985 American Folklore Society meeting, entitled "The Shaping of Conflict: Pueblo Ceramics and the Politics of Discourse," Babcock also reports that Cordero's expansion on the traditions has brought her into conflict with tribal gender roles. When giving demonstrations of Storyteller-making, Cordero has been asked to tell the stories that her grandfather told. She feels competent to oblige, but since storytelling is traditionally restricted to men, this has brought opposition from men at Cochiti.

Dégh, Linda. 1985. Dial a Story, Dial an Audience: Two Rural Women Narrators in an Urban Setting. In *Women's Folklore, Women's Culture*, ed. Rosan A. Jordan and Susan J. Kalcik, pp. 3-25. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Dégh surveys the repertoire and storytelling style of two older Hungarian-American women from Gary, Indiana. Each of these women, Dégh argues, embodies a type of traditional village storyteller—one inclined toward the dramatic and epic, the other toward the humorous. Each has retained some very traditional pieces—belief legends and traditional jokes, respectively—and has created a new repertoire in her preferred style out of personal experiences. With advancing age and fewer opportunities to go out, the two women have retained their distinctive styles and repertoires primarily by interacting with each other over the telephone.

Ginsburg, Faye. 1987. When the Subject is Women: Encounters with Syrian Jewish Women. *Journal of American Folklore* 100(398):540-547.

In the Brooklyn Syrian Jewish community in the late 1970s, there was a marked increase in young women's enthusiasm for observing the traditional Jewish laws governing the behavior of menstruating women. A local *mikva* (ritual bath) was even constructed. Rabbis and other male authorities in the community encouraged this renewed adherence, but Ginsburg argues that the women were not simply acquiescing to male demands for greater restrictions on female behavior. Rather, these women had come to the conclusion that the opportunities for education, work, and public activity that American women enjoy are not sufficient recompense for what the Syrian Jewish women saw as a lack of respect and a degraded position. The Syrian Jewish women perceived that strict observance of the "family purity" laws would confer increased control over their households and husbands and would ensure maintenance of cultural standards according to which women's household activities, although conceptually opposed to men's business activities, are granted equal value. (See Zerubavel and Esses 1987, below, for a less optimistic account of women's lives in this community.

Hammond, Joyce D. 1986. Polynesian Women and Tifaifai: Fabrications of Identity. *Journal of American Folklore* 99 (393):259-279.

This article is notable for being the only entry in the *JAF* from 1980 to the publication of the special Folklore and Feminism issue at the end of 1987 that can be construed as having anything to do with women and ethnicity. It is particularly fascinating when read in conjunction with Gailey's article on Tongan women in Leacock and Etienne (1980:294-322). Gailey discusses Tongan women's loss of prestige in the early years of European contact (1830-1900), which was conditioned by the change in values and social structure introduced by missionaries and the implementation of a British legal system, but which also was influenced by the introduction of trade cloth, which replaced the valuable bark cloth made by women and deprived them of their former position of strength in the complex local exchange system. Hammond focuses on the contemporary situation in the Hawaiian, Society, Austral, and Cook Islands (which are geographically close to Tonga and similar in those aspects of culture described by Gailey and Hammond in these articles). She describes how in these societies women have developed a new art form, "tifaifai," a style of appliqué quilting adapted from needlework skills taught by missionaries. She argues that these labor-intensive decorated cloths have taken the place of bark cloth in several societal dimensions. The tifaifai are often made cooperatively, providing a focus for the regeneration of all-female work groups. Women are recognized for their artistry in design and manufacture and also gain power because they have control over the use of the cloths in rituals. Hammond maintains that tifaifai are an expression of women's identity and of ethnic identity, and she demonstrates clearly how the patterns and techniques have



been derived from those involved in the manufacture of bark cloth. Unfortunately, she does not talk about differences in ethnic identification between women who do and do not make tifaifai, nor does she discuss how women's situation differs from men's or whether men have more difficulty maintaining an ethnic identity. Furthermore, since she does not refer to Gailey's article directly, it is difficult to tell if comparisons are valid. This appears to be one of the first publications derived from Hammond's dissertation; some of these questions may be addressed in the dissertation or later works.

Hurston, Zora Neale. 1978 [1935]. *Mules and Men*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Hurston was dedicated to the proposition that Black culture is not just a reaction to white discrimination. Hence her early collection of Southern Black folklore anticipates the tendency of later folklorists to depict the ethnic group culture in itself without reference to its situation vis à vis the dominant culture. Her emphasis on the contextual use of folklore to negotiate gender relations brings race relations back into the picture, however. In the stories women tell to explain or combat their position as "mule of the world," Hurston makes it clear (1) that Black men's need to subordinate their women is conditioned by their own subordination to white men and (2) that Black women are well aware of this situation.

Jahner, Elaine. 1983. Finding the Way Home: The Interpretation of American Indian Folklore. In *Handbook of American Folklore*, Richard M. Dorson, ed., pp. 11-17. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Jahner's brief article is an exciting example of what can be achieved by integrating structural, linguistic, and contextual analyses of narrative. She decries the insultingly simplistic standard renditions of Native American verbal arts and offers as an alternative model her own paraphrase of and running commentary on a traditional Lakota Sioux legend. In the legend, a woman escapes from a jealous husband and travels back to her own people. In the process she overcomes her fears and is befriended by wolves who bestow magic powers upon her that she later uses for the benefit of her tribe. Poetic permutations on the term "taninšni" (roughly translated, "invisibility") emphasize the continuity of her experiences as she moves from being blinded by crying to being able to travel in the dark to emanating light from her eyes as she sees into the future. The article sheds light on the organizing issue of this bibliography because of the contextual information Jahner provides. She heard these stories from Lakota women who took comfort from the legendary example and even used the story as a model for their own actions in times of stress. Of particular relevance are the actions of an "administrator in a major state institution" who reconciled difficulties with her job in the Anglo world and nontraditional lifestyle by following the prescription of the legend and taking what she experienced as a dangerous trip back to see her own people.

Jordan, Rosan A. 1985. The Vaginal Serpent and Other Themes from Mexican-American Women's Lore. In *Women's Folklore, Women's Culture*, ed. Rosan A. Jordan and Susan J. Kalcik, pp. 26-44. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Jordan interprets narratives told by Mexican-American women as symbolic responses to cultural pressure exerted on them to be submissive, obedient, and sexually pure (in contrast to the men's ideal of aggressive sexuality). Legends and memorates about women being invaded and made pregnant by snakes or other creatures reflect women's anxieties about sexual assault, while family stories recall actual dangers encountered by women in their family. In contrast, versions of La Llorona in which the weeping woman lures men to their deaths may bespeak women's desire to avenge themselves against men. Jordan notes that men tell humorous stories on the same themes that reflect women's fears and that Mexican-American women (including those from whom she collected narratives) are starting to object to the restrictions placed on them by their culture. It is not yet clear, however, whether the women's narratives embody a protest or counsel acquiescence to male domination.

Morgan, Kathryn L. 1966. Caddy Buffers: Legends of a Middle-Class Negro Family in Philadelphia. *Keystone Folklore Quarterly* 11:67-88.

In this classic article, Morgan describes stories told by her own family about her ex-slave great-grandmother, Caddy, and her feisty nature, struggles, and eventual success. The stories serve to "buffer" family members against the injustice and racial discrimination they encounter and to bolster their pride and determination to surmount obstacles and command respect just as Caddy did.

Turner, Kay F. 1982. Mexican American Home Altars: Towards Their Interpretation. *Atzlan* 13:309-325.

Mexican-American women in South Texas maintain small personal altars in their homes. Although this tradition is not recognized by the Catholic Church, the altars are important to the women who keep them, their family members, and friends who ask the altar keepers to make petitions for them. The altars include icons of the saints, at least one candle to symbolize the faith of the altar keeper, and often pictures of family members and other personal mementos. The home altar, Turner asserts, is not only a focus for the practice of one's faith and a symbol of personal devotion, but also a site for the "production of productive relationships" (1982:312) where the woman establishes connections with the saints and Virgin and prays for her family. The altar serves as a tangible reminder of the power of woman's cultural role as mediator within the family and between the earthly and heavenly families.

Turner, Kay and Suzanne Seriff. 1987. "Giving an Altar": The Ideology of Reproduction in a St. Joseph's Day Feast. *Journal of American Folklore* 100(398):446-460.

Turner and Seriff analyze Sicilian-American women's practice of "giving an altar" to Saint Joseph, patron of the family, in return for his having answered a special prayer. The elaborate fulfillment of the promise involves building an altar decorated with fancy baked goods, ritually welcoming a group of friends who reenact the holy family's search for lodging, and providing a feast for hundreds of friends. On a practical level, preparations for the celebration involve cooperation between the altar giver and her female friends. On the symbolic level, the ritual elevates women's everyday activities of cooking and nurturing to central importance and allows the altar giver to affirm the value of her maternal role as she welcomes the holy family into her own house when there is no room at the inn. While the ritual is dedicated to a male patron saint, it becomes a "material and symbolic display of women's reproductive power" (1987:457) and an opportunity for the community to recognize the value of women and their traditional activities.

Williams, Brett. 1984. Why Migrant Women Feed Their Husbands Tamales: Foodways as a Basis for a Revisionist View of Tejano Family Life. In *Ethnic and Regional Foodways in the United States: The Performance of Group Identity*, ed. Linda Keller Brown and Kay Mussell, pp. 113-126. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press.

As a symbol of identity for Tejano (Texas-Mexican) migrant farm workers, "the tamale has no serious rival" (1984:113). Wives go to amazing trouble and expense to create huge numbers of these labor-intensive creations for parties and holidays, usually with the justification that their husbands want tamales and must have them. A wife's refusal to make tamales for her husband is regarded even by other women as an outrage and grounds for divorce. While these women may seem like martyrs to their macho husbands, Williams argues that a full understanding of this foodway counters the stereotype of the submissive, exploited Mexican-American woman. When women make tamales, they create a space for female cooperation and conversation. When they give tamales, they forge bonds of reciprocity—with job-brokers, kin who will share living quarters, officials who will help or protect their husbands—that are essential to the family's survival in the marginal place allowed them by the Anglo world.

Young, M. Jane. 1987. Women, Reproduction, and Religion in Western Puebloan Society. *Journal of American Folklore* 100(398):435-445.

Ethnographers studying the Zuni and Hopi have emphasized men's involvement in and women's exclusion from religious ritual. Young draws upon her own field work, contemporary ethnographies, and historical records to reinterpret the situation. Reproduction, she asserts, is "the key metaphor of Western Puebloan

life" (1987:437). When men pray for rain and good crops, they imitate women's natural fertility. Women do not need to participate in ritual because they do their part by bearing children. Since men and women have separate but complementary powers, women's involvement in ritual might even concentrate too much dangerous power in one place. These cultures demonstrate the inaccuracy of assuming that public visibility necessarily equates with greater status.

Zerubavel, Yael and Dianne Esses. 1987. Reconstructions of the Past: Syrian Jewish Women and the Maintenance of Tradition. *Journal of American Folklore* 100(398):528-539.

Zerubavel and Esses analyzed stories told by Syrian Jewish women (from the same Brooklyn community studied by Ginsburg) and were struck by apparent contradictions. One woman said that her mother had worked to support the family after her father's death, yet later characterized her mother as "a housewife, neat woman, very nice and respectable." Another woman admitted how envious she had been of other children who could go to school, yet claimed that education was really only important for boys. The authors offer two interpretations of these differences. First, the women interviewed reacted to the interviewers in various ways, sometimes opening up to a young woman who was Jewish, but not part of the local community, at other times becoming aware that their statements would become part of an official oral history archive. Second, "Syrian Jewish women do not allow their self-image to overlap with male images, even when their own experiences overlap with what the community defines as the male's domain" (1987:537). Zerubavel and Esses's conclusion that these older women are censoring their own experiences to fit with very gender-segregated roles contrasts with Ginsburg's positive interpretation of young women's decision to renew their participation in ritual (see Ginsburg 1987, above).

Appendix A  
**Annotated Bibliographies**

(Editors' Note: Appendix A lists book-length annotated bibliographies that focus on "women and ethnicity.")

Cabello-Argandoña, Roberto, Juan Gómez-Quifones, and Patricia Herrera Duran. 1975. *The Chicana: A Comprehensive Bibliographic Study*. Los Angeles: University of California Chicano Studies Center.

Cantor, Aviva. 1982. *A Bibliography on the Jewish Woman: A Comprehensive and Annotated Listing of Works Published 1900-1978*. Fresh Meadows, NY: Biblio Press.

Cordasco, Francesco. 1985. *The Immigrant Woman in North America: An Annotated Bibliography of Selected References*. Metuchen, N.J.: The Scarecrow Press.

de Caro, F.A. 1983. *Women and Folklore: A Bibliographic Survey*. Westport, CT, and London: Greenwood Press.  
(Follow index entries for ethnicity and individual ethnic groups.)

Green, Rayna. 1983. *Native American Women: A Contextual Bibliography*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.  
(Annotations include a critique of each work's usefulness to scholars and accuracy in portraying Native American women).

## Appendix B

### Ethnic Women Speak for Themselves: Fiction and Life Histories

#### I. ANTHOLOGIES

Allen, Paula Gunn, ed. 1988. *Spider Woman's Granddaughters: Traditional Tales and Contemporary Writing by Native American Women*. Boston: Beacon Press.

Blicksilver, Edith, ed. 1978. *The Ethnic American Woman: Problems, Protests, Lifestyle*. Dubuque, Iowa: Kendall/Hunt Publishing Company.

This source book includes short fiction, poetry, and some speeches and historical letters by American women, organized to emphasize the processes of growing up and developing an identity as an ethnic woman. The collection includes work by Jewish, Slavic, Italian, Greek, Irish Catholic, Norwegian, and other European immigrants as well as Asian-Americans, African-Americans, Chicanas, and Native Americans. To encourage classroom use, Blicksilver provides suggestions for class discussion and student research topics.

Brant, Beth. 1984. *A Gathering of Spirit: Writing and Art by North American Indian Women*. Rockland, ME: Sinister Wisdom Books.

Rayna Green, ed. 1984. *That's What She Said: Contemporary Poetry and Fiction by Native American Women*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

The authors are identified by tribal background in this collection which also includes a sensitive introduction by Green and a glossary of terms.

Moraga, Cherríe, and Gloria Anzaldúa, ed. 1981. *This Bridge Called My Back: Writings By Radical Women of Color*. Watertown, MA: Persephone Press.

This collection of poetry and short fiction includes only writers whose genetic/cultural background is non-European and who are all consciously feminist. In contrast to the conciliatory tone of Blicksilver, these women are openly confrontational, even hostile to the white women who have tried to study them and to assimilate their unique experience of oppression into a middle-class white women's movement. Many of these writers are also lesbian, which adds another complexity to questions regarding identity and the choice of the group to which one owes primary loyalty.

Wong, Diane Yen-Mei. 1988. *Making Waves: An Anthology of Writings By and About Asian American Women*. Boston: Beacon Press.

## II. INDIVIDUAL WORKS OF FICTION

### African-American

Hurston, Zora Neale. 1978 [1937]. *Their Eyes Were Watching God*. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1979. *I Love Myself When I Am Laughing: A Zora Neale Hurston Reader*, ed. Alice Walker. Old Westbury, NY: The Feminist Press. Includes essays, autobiography, and selections from her folklore publications as well as fiction.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1985. *Spunk: The Selected Stories of Zora Neale Hurston*. Berkeley, CA: Turtle Island Foundation.

Morrison, Toni. 1972. *The Bluest Eye*. New York: Washington Square Press.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1974. *Sula*. New York: Knopf.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1977. *Song of Solomon*. New York: Knopf.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1981. *Tar Baby*. New York: Knopf.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1988. *Beloved*. New York: New American Library.

Sanchez, Sonia. 1973. *Love Poems*. New York: Third Press.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1979. *I've Been a Woman: New and Selected Poems*. Sausalito, CA: Black Scholar Press.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1984. *Homegirls and Handgrenades*. New York: Thunder's Mouth Press.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1987. *Under a Soprano Sky*. Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press.

Walker, Alice. 1974. *In Love and Trouble: Stories of Black Women*. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1976. *Meridian*. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1981. *You Can't Keep a Good Woman Down: Stories*. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1982. *The Color Purple*. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1989. *The Temple of My Familiar*. San Diego: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

**Asian-American**

Kingston, Maxine Hong. 1976. *The Woman Warrior: Memoirs of a Girlhood Among Ghosts*. New York: Knopf.

Tan, Amy. 1989. *The Joy Luck Club*. New York: Putnam.

**Jewish**

Yeziarska, Anzia. 1975 [1925]. *Bread Givers: a novel: a struggle between a father of the Old World and a daughter of the New*. New York: Braziller.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1979. *The Open Cage: An Anzia Yeziarska Collection*. New York: Persea Books.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1985. *Hungry Hearts and Other Stories*. New York: Persea Books.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1987. *Red Ribbon on a White Horse: My Story*. London: Virago.

**Mexican-American**

Cisneros, Sandra. 1985. *The House on Mango Street*. Houston: Arte Publico Press.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1987. *My Wicked, Wicked Ways*. Bloomington, IN: Third Woman Press.

**Native American**

Erdrich, Louise. 1984. *Love Medicine*. New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1984. *Jacklight*. New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1986. *The Beet Queen*. New York: Holt.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1988. *Tracks*. New York: Holt.

Silko, Leslie Marmon. 1974. *Laguna Woman*. Greenfield Center, NY: Greenfield Review Press.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1977. *Ceremony*. New York: Viking Press.



\_\_\_\_\_. 1981. *Storyteller*. New York: Seaver Books.

### III. LIFE HISTORIES

The journal *Frontiers* has devoted two special issues to Women's Oral History. See volume 2, number 2 for an article by Sherna Gluck that provides a good introduction to the theoretical issues, with an emphasis on the idea that doing oral history or life history with women is an inherently feminist enterprise. *Frontiers* 2/2 includes reports on the life experiences of Italian, Jewish, Slavic, Black, and Chinese women. *Frontiers* 7/2 has articles on Syrian-Lebanese, Southern Paiute, and Jewish women. Other life-histories and elicited autobiographies of ethnic women (mostly book-length) include:

Bataille, Gretchen M. and Kathleen Mullen Sands. 1984. *American Indian Women: Telling Their Lives*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.

Buss, Fran Leeper. 1980. *La Partera: Story of a Midwife*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Ets, Marie Hall. 1970. *Rosa: The Life of an Italian Immigrant*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Jahner, Elaine. 1985. Woman Remembering: Life History as Exemplary Pattern. In *Women's Folklore, Women's Culture*, ed. Rosan A. Jordan and Susan J. Kalcik, pp. 214-233. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Kelly, Jane Holden. 1978. *Yaqui Women: Contemporary Life Histories*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.

Lurie, Nancy Oestreich, ed. 1966. *Mountain Wolf Woman, Sister of Crashing Thunder: The Autobiography of a Winnebago Indian*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Shiloh, Ailon, ed. 1972. *By Myself, I'm a Book! An Oral History of the Immigrant Jewish Experience in Pittsburgh*. Waltham, MA: American Jewish Historical Society.

Underhill, Ruth. 1985 [1936]. *Papago Woman*. Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press.

Weist, Katherine M., ed. 1977. *The Narrative of a Northern Cheyenne Woman, Belle Hiwalking*. Billings: Montana Council for Indian Education.

## Notes

I am happy to acknowledge the kind assistance of Hanna Griff, Inta Gale Carpenter, and Giovanna del Negro, who suggested items for inclusion, Linda Adams, Kenneth D. Pimple, Martha K. Griesheimer, and George Schoemaker, who commented on earlier drafts, and Anya Royce, who did both.

<sup>1</sup> In this introductory essay I refer to a number of books and articles that are not included in the annotated bibliography to follow. These are listed in the "references cited" section and are marked in the text with an asterisk.

<sup>2</sup> One significant aspect of ethnic identity that I have not been able to address in this study is its rhetorical nature. Because identification with one's ethnic group is, to variable extents, elective, the decision to emphasize, suppress, or otherwise employ one's ethnic identity is influenced (consciously or not) by strategic concerns (Royce 1982\*:5-6). Although the question is interesting, in the current literature on ethnic women little attention is paid to women's manipulation of ethnic identity to enhance their status vis à vis men or to address other issues of particular concern to women.

<sup>3</sup> My concept of how to evaluate women's status owes much to Patricia Mann's formulation (Mann 1989), which she in turn has derived from the work of feminist historian Joan Kelly (see especially Kelly 1984\*:1-15).

<sup>4</sup> I follow the division set out by Royce (1982\*, chapters 3-5), with the exception that she includes slavery as one type of immigration rather than as a separate category. I find the greater severity of slaves' experience of dislocation as well as subsequent differences in opportunities for former slaves compared to voluntary immigrants significant enough to warrant a separate category.

<sup>5</sup> See McDowell (1985\* [1980]), Smith (1985\* [1977]), Gorelick (1989\*), and Collins (1989\*). On the idea that feminist scholarship draws much of its meaning (and its best research problems) from involvement in the political struggle for women's equality see Harding (1987\*:8).

<sup>6</sup> When I first undertook this project in 1986, I manually inspected the issues since 1980 of *American Anthropologist*, *Journal of American Folklore*, *Western Folklore*, *Journal of the Folklore Institute*, *Signs*, *Frontiers*, *Ethnic*, *Journal of Ethnic Studies*, *Ethnic Groups*, *American Ethnic History*, and *Ethnicity*. For the 1989 revision I checked the new volumes of these journals as well as using the computerized indexes.

<sup>7</sup> For Moynihan's original statement see: Daniel P. Moynihan 1967 [1965], *The Negro Family: The Case for National Action*, in *The Moynihan Report and the Politics of Controversy*, ed. L. Rainwater and W. L. Yancy, pp. 39-132. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press. Moynihan has restated the same thesis in his 1986 *Family and Nation*, San Diego: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich. The popular press's enthusiastic reception of this book and a Bill Moyers television documentary promoting the same ideas (*The Vanishing Family: Crisis in Black America*, narrated by Bill Moyers, CBS Special Report, January 1986) reveals the dismaying resilience of the "culture of poverty" theory despite two decades of scholarly work that should have discredited it (Zinn 1989:858-9).

<sup>8</sup> The "discourses" I identify are more circumscribed and concrete than a Foucaultian "discursive formation," which need not be characterized by a unified style nor "the

persistence of a thematic" (1980:63), but partake of the same quality of setting undetected limits for investigation even when scholars are not consciously responding to each other.

### References Cited

(Editors' Note: These references are indicated in the text with asterisks to distinguish them from references listed in the main bibliography itself.)

- Albers, Patricia and Beatrice Medicine. 1983. *The Hidden Half: Studies of Plains Indian Women*. Lanham, Md.: University Press of America.
- Bataille, Gretchen M. and Kathleen Mullen Sands. 1984. *American Indian Women: Telling Their Lives*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.
- Brant, Beth, ed. 1984. *A Gathering of Spirit: Writing and Art by North American Indian Women*. Rockland, Maine: Sinister Wisdom Books.
- Collier, Jane Fishburne and Sylvia Junko Yanagisako. 1987. *Gender and Kinship: Essays Toward a Unified Analysis*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press.
- Collins, Patricia Hill. 1989. The Social Construction of Black Feminist Thought. *Signs* 14(4):745-773.
- D'Andrea, Vaneeta-marie. 1986. Ethnic women: a critique of the literature, 1971-1981. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 9(2):235-246.
- Foucault, Michel. 1980. *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977*, ed. Colin Gordon. New York: Pantheon.
- Glenn, Evelyn Nakano. 1986. *Issei, Nisei, War Bride: Three Generations of Japanese Women in Domestic Service*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Gorelick, Sherry. 1989. Ethnic Feminism: Beyond the Pseudo-Pluralists; review essay. *Feminist Review* 32:11-117.
- Green, Rayna. 1983. *Native American Women: A Contextual Bibliography*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Harding, Sandra. 1987. Introduction: Is there a feminist method? In *Feminism and Methodology: Social Science Issues*, ed. Sandra Harding, pp. 1-14. Bloomington: Indiana University Press and Milton Keynes, England: Open University Press.
- Kessler-Harris, Alice. 1982. *Out to Work: A History of Wage-Earning Women in the United States*. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Kelly, Joan. 1984. *Women, History, and Theory: The Essays of Joan Kelly*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

- LaFromboise, Teresa and Elizabeth Anne Parent. 1985. Review of works on Native American women: Albers and Medicine 1983, Bataille and Sands 1984, Brant 1984, and Green 1983. *Signs* 10(4):782-5.
- Lamphere, Louise. 1988. Beyond Dichotomies (review of Collier and Yanagisako 1987). *The Women's Review of Books* 5(5):17.
- McDowell, Deborah E. 1985 [1980]. New Directions for Black Feminist Criticism. Reprinted in *The New Feminist Criticism: Essays on Women Literature and Theory*, ed., Elaine Showalter, pp. 186-199. New York: Pantheon.
- Moynihan, Daniel Patrick. 1967 [1965]. The Negro Family: The Case for National Action. In *The Moynihan Report and the Politics of Controversy*, ed. L. Rainwater and W.L. Yancy, pp. 39-132. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Rollins, Judith. 1985. *Between Women: Domesticity and Their Employers*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Rosaldo, Michelle Zimbalist. 1974. Women, Culture, and Society: A Theoretical Overview. In *Women, Culture, and Society*, ed. Michelle Zimbalist Rosaldo and Louise Lamphere, pp. 17-42. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Royce, Anya Peterson. 1982. *Ethnic Identity: Strategies of Diversity*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Sinke, Suzanne. 1989. A Historiography of Immigrant Women in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries. *Ethnic Forum* 9(1-2):122-145.
- Smith, Barbara. 1985 [1977]. Toward a Black Feminist Criticism. Reprinted in *The New Feminist Criticism: Essays on Women Literature and Theory*, ed., Elaine Showalter, pp. 168-185. New York: Pantheon.
- Thernstrom, Stephan, ed. 1980. *Harvard Encyclopedia of American Ethnic Groups*. Cambridge, MA, and London: The Bellknap Press of Harvard University Press.