

Marquette University
e-Publications@Marquette

English Faculty Research and Publications

English, Department of

1-1-2014

“Lifted Moments”: Emily Dickinson, Hymn Revision, and the Revival Music Meme-Plex

Sarah Wadsworth

Marquette University, sarah.wadsworth@marquette.edu

Published version. *Emily Dickinson Journal*, Vol. 23, No. 1 (2014): 46-74. DOI. © 2014 Johns
Hopkins University Press. Used with permission.



SARAH WADSWORTH

“Lifted Moments”: Emily Dickinson, Hymn Revision,
and the Revival Music Meme-Plex

transtextuality: “all that sets the text in a relationship, whether obvious or
concealed, with other texts.”

—Gérard Genette, *Palimpsests* (1)

In *Two Modern Women* (1890), a novel by Kate Gannett Wells (1838-1911), these words rise joyfully from a remote Unitarian congregation somewhere in the Dakotas:

The soul hath lifted moments
Above the drift of days,
When life’s great meaning breaketh
In sunrise on our ways. (281)

The occasion is the ordination of a new, female minister, and, fittingly, the ceremony takes place on Easter. As she steps into her new role, Ruth—one of the “two modern women” of the book’s title—greet the gathered crowd with “her desire that they should all grow in truth and happiness, and show by their daily lives that the sunsets of the old organizations built on theology had melted into the sunrise of living religious deeds, whose deepening rays would reach into the power of individual belief” (271). To the novel’s early readers, the hymn the congregation sings in response might have been recognized as “The Crowning Day” (also known as “The Morning Hangs Its Signal” and “Wings of the Morning”), which had recently appeared in a popular Unitarian hymnal and would soon pass into common use. For readers today, however, the hymn’s first line—“the soul hath lifted moments”—may more readily recall Emily Dickinson’s haunting poem

"The Soul has Bandaged moments - " (Fr 360), and for good reason: a side-by-side comparison of these texts reveals echoes and inversions that appear to be more than coincidental. And yet, curiously, their textual histories confound efforts to make sense of their relationship in a straightforward linear fashion. Instead, the links between them hint at a complex web of textual codes spinning out through the sprawling culture of nineteenth-century hymns—oral and written, popular and liturgical, ephemeral and durable, shaped by institutionalized "structures of belief" and yet highly volatile and susceptible to change (Watson 8). As one hymnologist puts it, hymns have an "intrinsic textual instability . . . result[ing] from the dissemination of words and tunes not only through the international circulation of printed books, but also through multiple manuscript copies, lining out, plagiarism, and adaptation" (Deconinck-Brossard 1).¹

The parallels between "The soul hath lifted moments" and "The Soul has Bandaged moments - " raise a number of questions that this paper takes up. Most obviously, in what ways are these texts in dialogue with one another, and what other "voices" enter into the conversation? What does their juxtaposition reveal about the spirituality expressed in Dickinson's verse, and, by extension, her poetic response to religious expressions voiced collectively through the medium of hymns? In pursuit of these questions, this essay turns on an inescapable conundrum concerning the dating and provenance of these texts. Dickinson's poem is thought to have been composed in, or about, the summer of 1862, although it remained unpublished until 1945; "The Crowning Day" ("The Morning Hangs Its Signal") first appeared in print in 1886, although it probably circulated orally prior to that date. Given this chronological divergence, how can we make sense of their eidetic convergence? To explore the relationship between them, I approach these texts through triangulation. Proceeding through a linked sequence of paired readings, this essay elucidates how connections between two loosely related texts sharpen and become meaningful when they are brought into dialogue with a third. Juxtaposing three overlapping pairs of lyrics—first by Daniel Webster Whittle and William Channing Gannett, then by Philip Doddridge and Emily Dickinson, and, finally, by Gannett and Dickinson—this essay illustrates how texts that probably did not bear on one another directly may have related to one another indirectly as they worked within and responded to a shared hymnic culture that underwent constant adaptation and recombination throughout the nineteenth century.

In *Palimpsests: Literature in the Second Degree*, Gérard Genette notes that music operates in a "double register" (390) of words and melodies that lends it a "mind-boggling transformational capacity" involving "different words on the same tune,

a different tune for the same words, etc.” (387). The case of hymns is particularly intricate because such imitative transformations occur both within and between texts. In *The English Hymn: A Critical and Historical Study*, J. R. Watson explains that within a single hymn “words and music form a kind of theme and variations” that develop from verse to verse (27). At the same time, hymns are constructed on a transtextual substrate of “shared codes”:

Each hymn is a new and unique way of putting things, but it is often the old way slightly altered: hymns exist in hymn-books as separate works, though often having a family resemblance to one another—sharing the same metre, borrowing phrases from one another, paraphrasing the same psalm or biblical chapter, sharing tunes. The discourse of a hymn is a shared speech, and a conversation with other hymns: going through a section in a hymn-book . . . is a little like eavesdropping on a seminar, in which each voice has something to contribute, and in which each hymn is conscious of the others and relates to them. (19)

Watson’s analogy provides a valuable frame of reference for the intertwined sequence of lyrics I discuss. Rather than conceiving of the relationship among these texts in a strictly linear fashion—a vertical continuum of discrete “sources” and modular “influences” descending through time—we should think of them as operating within a multidimensional, multidirectional, transtemporal network that is both synchronous and diachronous.

In order to understand the complex ways in which such cultural networks operate, a number of contemporary critics have embraced a biological paradigm, arguing that genetic structures and processes provide not just a convenient metaphor but a viable theoretical model for the way cultural texts actually function. Building on the work of Richard Dawkins, Daniel Dennett, Susan Blackmore, and others, for example, Michael D. C. Drout analyzes discrete components of Anglo-Saxon tradition as “memes” that “combine, recombine, mutate, and remain stable” as they circulate through human culture (“A Meme-Based Approach” 289). “A meme,” Drout explains, “is the simplest unit of cultural replication, analogous to the biological gene; it is whatever is transmitted when one person *imitates*, consciously or unconsciously, another”; in other words, “memes are the atoms and meme-plexes the molecules of culture” (*How Tradition Works* 4, 43).² This essay extends Drout’s approach to a cluster of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century hymns that share the motif and teleological doctrine of the “crowning day.” In doing so, it traces a path through a network of memes connecting the

“lifted moments” of popular hymn to the “Bandaged moments” of Dickinson’s verse.³

Refrain: Daniel Webster Whittle and William Channing Gannett

In the introduction to the popular Unitarian hymnal *Unity Hymns and Chorals for the Congregation and the Home* (1880), editors William Channing Gannett, James Vila Blake, and Frederick L. Hosmer explain that “many of the hymns will be found altered from the originals; in most cases slightly, in but a word or line; yet not a few are largely altered” (3).⁴ As Watson notes, the practice of reappropriation, or “the writing of new words to old tunes or old themes,” was deeply engrained in the American hymn tradition. From Timothy Dwight’s Revolutionary-era rewriting of psalmic hymns to eradicate references to the monarchy, to the abolitionist hymns of Julia Ward Howe, Harriet Beecher Stowe, and John Greenleaf Whittier, who all “knew the traditional hymns” but whose own lyrics “seem to have an inner compulsion to be different,” reappropriation was “a necessary part of the American hymn-writing experience” (Watson 477-79). Dickinson, who shared this “inner compulsion to be different,” knew the work of Howe, Stowe, and Whittier as well as the traditional hymns, could recognize their reappropriations, and participated in this shared cultural practice. Moreover, as Daniel L. Manheim has argued, “revival hymns were a source of invention” for Dickinson; revivalist discourse “was central to her development as a writer” (378).⁵ As a composer and reviser of hymns, as well as co-editor of *Unity Hymns and Chorals*, William Channing Gannett (1843-1923) also had extensive first-hand experience of the widespread practice of reappropriation in traditional and revival hymns. The brother of novelist Kate Gannett Wells, he composed the lines “the soul hath lifted moments . . .” in the revisionist hymn that Wells’s fictional congregation sings. Gannett thus occupies a central position in the meme-plex of hymns that surround Dickinson’s “The Soul has Bandaged moments - .” By establishing links between Gannett’s lyrics, earlier hymns he drew upon, and later hymns that borrow from his, we may begin to trace the outlines of the hymnic network in which both Gannett’s and Dickinson’s texts are embedded.

Gannett, a prominent Unitarian minister, was the son of Ezra Stiles Gannett and god-son of the renowned William Ellery Channing, who Ezra succeeded as pastor of Boston’s Federal Street Church. Gannett had an impeccable pedigree within the Unitarian establishment, but he was also a towering figure in his own right. After completing his training for the ministry at Harvard Divinity School

during a period in which “the Harvard school of hymnody” was in full flower, he went on to serve as pastor at several locations in New England and the Midwest before stepping into a long-term position in Rochester, NY (pastor 1889-1908; pastor emeritus 1908-23), where he actively promoted the women’s suffrage and temperance movements, among other progressive endeavors. Perhaps Gannett is best remembered, however, as the “major spokesman for liberal Unitarians” during the creedal conflict known as the “East-West Controversy” (Pease 213). Through a manifesto titled “Things Commonly Believed Among Us” (1887), he sought to bridge the widening gap between the more conservative Eastern Unitarian Christians and theists who traced their ideological lineage back to William Ellery Channing and the more radical Western branch inspired by the humanistic theology of Theodore Parker. A cofounder of the liberal Unitarian periodical *Unity*, Gannett authored many articles and books, including volumes of theology, biography, devotional literature, writings on social issues, and poetry. Alfred P. Putnam’s *Singers and Songs of the Liberal Faith* (1875) included a modest selection of Gannett’s poems among those by Theodore Parker, Jones Very, Henry Wadsworth Longfellow, Oliver Wendell Holmes, and other luminaries. His chief contribution to hymnody came, however, when he co-edited *Unity Hymns and Chorals* (1880; rev. 1889, 1911) and edited *The Thought of God in Hymns and Poems* (first series 1885; second series 1894; third series 1918). An accomplished lyricist, Gannett contributed several hymns of his own to these collections, including the particular version of “The Crowning Day” (“The Morning Hangs Its Signal”) that Wells incorporates in *Two Modern Women*.⁶

As far as I have been able to determine, Gannett’s version of “The Crowning Day,” a variation on a popular hymnic theme, initially appeared in print in 1886, when it was included in a five-cent hymnal titled *Love to God and Love to Man: Songs for Revival Tunes* issued by the Publishing Committee of the Western Unitarian Conference. It is likely, however, that the hymn was already in use and had circulated orally before it was anthologized.⁷ When the original 84-page *Unity Hymns and Chorals* was greatly expanded in 1889 and again in 1911, the new omnibus editions incorporated the 15-page *Love to God and Love to Man* in its entirety. Gannett’s “The Crowning Day” also appeared in *The Thought of God in Hymns and Poems* (second series 1894) and in Pluma M. Brown’s *Song-Hymnal of Praise and Joy: A Selection of Spiritual Songs, Old and New* (1897). One of ten hymns Gannett composed that had passed into common use by the mid-twentieth century (Julian 2:1639), it seems to have been continuously in print ever since. It appears in a slightly different arrangement in *Singing the Living Tradition* (1993), a hymnal

currently used in Unitarian churches (James 14), where it joins a musical rendering of Dickinson's "If I can stop one heart from breaking" (Unitarian Universalist Association 40, 292).⁸

Revisionist compositional practices, clearly evident in Gannett's "The Crowning Day," particularly appealed to Unitarian hymnists, who often borrowed existing melodies and refashioned extant lyrics, eliminating references to the Trinity and de-emphasizing Christocentric theology. The preface of Gannett's hymnal tract *Love to God and Love to Man* proclaims the Unitarians' rationale as well as their method: "With the help of friends to select the tunes and write new words, we print a few songs in which well-known music is set to singing our Liberal Faith" (150). More expansively, an 1886 report of the Unitarians' Western Conference described this collection of forty-seven songs set to revival tunes as "a rather daring attempt to wed our rational religious feeling and thought to music which has heretofore been the accompaniment of a more sensational and dramatic form of religion than ours can claim to be" (Effinger 28).⁹ In his foundational study of the English hymn, Louis FitzGerald Benson remarks that in Gannett, Blake, and Hosmer's *Unity Hymns and Chorals* "both theology and liturgies were frankly uprooted from a Christian basis and replanted under freer skies" (472). Less enthusiastically, Foote describes "[t]his little hymn book" (which he characterizes as "left-wing" and "radical") as "a markedly individualistic production with many of the older hymns altered to conform to the beliefs of the editors" (108). In the context of a revival music memeplex, this kind of borrowing, adapting, and recombining of ideas, affect, words, and musical scores exemplifies the processes of perseverance and change through which hymnic memes endured and proliferated.¹⁰

Gannett's "The Crowning Day" is a case in point. Not only does its title duplicate that of an earlier hymn by Gannett's contemporary, (Major) Daniel Webster Whittle (1840-1901; pen name "El Nathan"), but the melody (indicated in *Unity Hymns and Chorals* [1889] by "Tune, 'The Crowning Day,' in G. H. [*Gospel Hymns*]," 416), the first two lines of the refrain—"Oh, the crowning day is coming! / Is coming by and by!"—are identical to those of Whittle's revival hymn. In other respects, the two sets of lyrics part company. Their contrasting refrains epitomize their authors' diverging treatments. Here is Whittle:

Oh, the crowning day is coming!
Is coming by and by!
When our Lord shall come in "power"
And "glory" from on high!
Oh, the glorious sight will gladden

Each waiting, watchful eye,
In the crowning day that's coming by and by.
(*Sacred Songs and Solos* 345)

And now Gannett:

Oh, the crowning day is coming,
Is coming by and by!
We can see the rose of morning,
A glory in the sky.
And that splendor on the hill-tops
O'er all the land shall lie
In the crowning day that's coming by and by!
(*Unity Hymns* [1889] 172)

While Whittle's lyrics herald the supernatural "power" and "glory" of Christ's earthly return ("the hour is drawing nigh" when "He'll come in glory"), Gannett celebrates the natural "glory" and "splendor" of daybreak, substituting the metaphorical "rose of morning" for the literal sight of Jesus. Even as Whittle's hymn rests on orthodox Christian doctrine, Gannett's revision naturalizes and secularizes the central motif of the "crowning day."

Whittle's version of "The Crowning Day" appeared in Ira D. Sankey's landmark collection of traditional and gospel hymns *Sacred Songs and Solos, Nos. 1 and 2 Complete* (1880); resurfaced in *Gospel Hymns No. 4* (1884, hymn #92), compiled by Sankey, James McGranahan (who composed the tune for Whittle's "The Crowning Day"), and George C. Stebbins; and was eventually absorbed into the influential *Gospel Hymns, Nos. 1 to 6 Complete* (1895, hymn #611). A close friend of the evangelist Dwight L. Moody, Whittle had joined a team of popular musicians specially enlisted, as Samuel J. Rogal explains, to "sing and lead singing at [Moody's] evangelistic services, to write the texts and the music for new gospel songs, to adapt new music to older texts and new texts to older music, and publish a wide variety of song books through which all of the editors sought, essentially, to reconcile the deep chasm that had grown between the traditional congregational hymn and the popular gospel song" (x). Unlike the Unitarians' hymn revisions, founded on fundamental theological differences, the evangelicals distinguished their hymns from their traditional counterparts by embracing a "new kind of rhetoric," "incantatory and repetitive," derived from African-American slave songs, and couching it

in a heightened emotional register characterized by sentimentality, intimacy, and passion (Watson 501).¹¹

Introduced in *Sacred Songs and Solos* by a line from the Gospel of Matthew — “They shall see the Son of Man coming in the clouds of heaven with power and great glory” (Matt. 24.30)—Whittle’s “The Crowning Day” centers on the Second Coming of Christ. The lyrics modulate from the descriptive:

Our Lord is now rejected,
And by the world disowned;
By the *many* still neglected,
And by the *few* enthroned;

to the prophetic:

The heavens shall glow with splendour;
But brighter far than they,
The saints shall shine in glory,
As Christ shall them array;

At the same time, the mood modulates from despondency (signaled by “rejected,” “disowned,” “neglected”) to exultation, represented visually through images of light (“glow,” “brighter,” “shine”) and opulence (“splendor,” “glory”). Anticipating this transformation, the hymn concludes with an exhortation to the faithful:

Let all that look for, hasten
The coming joyful day,
By earnest consecration,
To walk the narrow way;
By gath’ring in the lost ones,
For whom our Lord did die,
For the crowning day that’s coming by and by.

In these final lines, Whittle’s “The Crowning Day” enjoins its collective performers and auditors to “hasten” Christ’s return by evangelizing those whose souls are yet to be redeemed.

In *Gospel Hymns and Social Religion: The Rhetoric of Nineteenth-Century Revivalism*, Sandra S. Sizer identifies significant themes and motifs of late nineteenth-century revival lyrics in an effort “to discover . . . the distinctive features which gospel hymns possessed, as contrasted with other kinds of hymns” (20). According

to Sizer, gospel-hymn rhetoric employs several strategic moves, which, for the purposes of my analysis, map onto the textual components comprising the revival music meme-plex. Most conspicuously, “gospel hymns are largely constructed around series of metaphors in poetic form—Jesus as ‘shepherd’; life as a ‘stormy sea’; the individual as ‘child’ of God.” As Sizer’s structural analysis demonstrates, “such metaphors consistently appear as elements in a group of contrasting sets. The hymns are sharply dualistic in this respect, describing the world and its woes in opposition to the bliss of heaven and the beauty of Jesus” (24). This duality, building on a tendency “to portray the human condition as that of a passive victim” (30), comes into focus in the third verse of Whittle’s “The Crowning Day”:

Our pain shall then be over:
We'll sin and sigh no more;
Behind us all of sorrow,
And nought but joy before—
A joy in our Redeemer,
As we to Him are nigh,
In the crowning day that's coming by and by.

Whittle contrasts past with future (“behind” and “before”), juxtaposes former desolation (“sin and sigh”) with long-awaited intimacy with the Savior (“we to Him are nigh”), and starkly opposes positive and negative emotions: “pain” and “sorrow” versus the twice-mentioned “joy.”

Gannett’s Unitarian hymn develops quite differently, as nature replaces Christ, laughter replaces sorrow, and the personified image of daybreak cheerily foreshadows the inevitable progress of collective human enlightenment:

The morning hangs its signal
Upon the mountain’s crest,
While all the sleeping valleys
In silent darkness rest;
From peak to peak it flashes,
It laughs along the sky
That the crowning day is coming by and by!

In Gannett’s hymn, the “lonely prophets” seem standoffish and marginal in comparison to the shining saints and prophetic immediacy of Whittle’s lyrics. Here, agency lies not with the Savior but with “truth” itself:

Above the generations,
The lonely prophets rise—
The truth flings dawn and day-star
Within their glowing eyes;

And, while Gannett uses “heart” as a synecdoche, it is rational thought, rather than emotion, that provides access to truth: Gannett’s subjects engage in an active process of “thinking” that contrasts with Whittle’s passively expectant and obediently proselytizing subjects:

From heart to heart it brightens,
It draweth ever nigh,
Till it crowneth all men thinking, by and by!

Finally, Gannett’s hymn celebrates the individual moments of spiritual illumination that accrue to humanity’s collective enlightenment, as opposed to the sudden post-apocalyptic finality of Christ’s Second Coming.

From hour to hour it haunts us,
The vision draweth nigh,
Till it crowneth living, *dying*, by and by!

In contrast to Whittle’s text, in which “lost ones” draw “nigh” to Jesus, who “did die,” for Gannett it is the vision of “life’s great meaning” that “draweth nigh,” ultimately to die, just as dawn will “die” only to return on the morrow.

Like Whittle’s hymn, which largely conforms to the gospel conventions Sizer identifies, Gannett’s lyrics are structured by dualistic contrasts, most conspicuously darkness versus light. Rather than juxtaposing contrasting emotional states concretized by metaphors that dramatize the inward struggles of individual souls (e.g., battle versus victory, storm versus rest), however, Gannett’s polarity of “good thing” versus “evil thing” generalizes and abstracts the dualism, with the added implication that “good” and “evil” are external factors rather than spiritual states.

And in the sunrise standing,
Our kindling hearts confess
That no good thing is failure,
No evil thing success!
From age to age it groweth,

That radiant Faith so high,
And its crowning day is coming, by and by!

Unlike Whittle's lyrics, which follow a progression from sin and suffering to the joy and salvation that culminate in the crowning day of the Resurrection, Gannett's lyrics strip the "crowning day" motif of its messianic, eschatological import in order to realign this recurring hymnic meme with a humanistic Unitarian orientation.¹²

Sizer's remarks on nineteenth-century revivalist lyrics support the conception of hymn culture as a meme-plex constructed of recurring, competing, adaptable memes. She explains, "it is not that people had a worldview or set of rules 'in their heads' and then wrote hymns to conform to it, but rather that they possessed and used as models earlier hymns which presented a persuasive picture of the world—one which was congruent with other similar cultural productions of their time and place" (127). Evangelicals like Whittle and Unitarians like Gannett alike availed themselves of earlier hymnic models—written and oral, traditional and revisionist—borrowing, mixing, revising, and riffing on the vast supply of images, motifs, refrains, themes, catch-phrases, and melodies that made up the common stock, or meme-plex, of hymns. According to Sizer, "[t]he important point is the selection of elements from previous tradition which, while at one level being mere imitation, has new meaning in the context of emerging nineteenth-century language and forms" (128). Constructed of common textual building blocks, these two versions of "The Crowning Day" helped constitute radically different "structures of belief" through the living networks of individuals and congregations who voiced them.

Theme: Philip Doddridge and Emily Dickinson

As critics have long observed, Dickinson, too, frequently revised the structures and diction of traditional hymns to create radically different, often subversive, texts. Most recently, in *Emily Dickinson and Hymn Culture*, Victoria Morgan describes Dickinson's poems "as 'alternative hymns' in so far as they display a sophisticated manipulation of hymnic space which serves to incorporate the poet's own experience" (5). As Morgan observes, earlier "criticism on Dickinson and the area of hymnody . . . focused exclusively upon Watts" (119); but "Dickinson's relation to hymnody is more wide-reaching, complex and subtle than criticism in this area has allowed. Far from being without a context, the radical re-visioning of the divine to be found in Dickinson's 'alternative hymns' can be situated within an engagement with a community of hymn writers" (vii).

Morgan expands the field substantially by investigating Dickinson's relationship to women hymn writers of the nineteenth century, but the sheer magnitude of the contemporaneous hymn culture leaves vast territory still to be explored. Among the more promising of these unexplored regions are the abundant contributions of English clergyman Philip Doddridge (1702-51), whose hymns and other devotional works contain vital threads (i.e. memes) that seem to connect Gannett's "lifted moments" to Dickinson's "Bandaged" moments. By examining the way discrete compositions of Doddridge's mesh, in differing ways, with Gannett's "lifted moments" and Dickinson's "Bandaged moments," we can discern more clearly the texture, dimensions, and some of the coordinates of the revival music meme-plex.¹³

Doddridge, an independent divine and associate of Watts, composed several hundred hymns that circulated widely in manuscript, orally, and in print. Nearly three hundred appeared in various posthumous editions of his hymns, but he also disseminated them in manuscript form, including some that he enclosed—like Dickinson—in his abundant letters. Doddridge, whose optimistic lyrics would have appealed to Gannett and perhaps to Dickinson too, frequently referenced discrete "moments" in his work.¹⁴ Although he does not appear to have used the phrase "lifted moments" (let alone anything resembling "bandaged"), he does write of "exalted moments." Doddridge's hymns appeared in Unitarian anthologies along with those of Watts, Steele, Cowper, and others, often in altered form (Watson 462); as one nineteenth-century critic remarked, Doddridge's hymns "suffered much" from "hymn-tinkers" and "in many . . . cases . . . whole hymns have been mangled barbarously" (Hitchcock 339, 340).¹⁵

Even as Gannett appropriated the title, refrain, and tune of an earlier hymn called "The Crowning Day," he may have found inspiration for the remainder of his hymn in the work of Doddridge, whose *Rise and Progress of Religion in the Soul* (1745) was dedicated to Watts. A likely influence, whether direct or indirect, this devotional text features an exhortation in a prayer, titled "The Young Convert's Prayer for Divine Protection Against the Danger of These Snares," that shares with Gannett's hymn a consistent pattern of imagery as well as a narrative progression that grows from spark to fire and spreads from person to person as it describes a process of divine illumination:

Quicken me, O Lord . . . that by me thou mayest also quicken others! Make me the happy instrument of *enkindling* and animating the flame of divine love in their breasts; and may it catch *from heart to heart*, and *grow every moment* in its progress. (221; emphasis added)

In this passage, Doddridge's language closely resembles Gannett's images of truth igniting ("kindling") "from heart to heart" as "lifted moments" gather "hour to hour" and "age to age" in a gradual but unflagging increase of faith. Regardless of whether this diction originated with Doddridge (probably not) and regardless of whether Gannett read Doddridge (he probably did), the similarities between these texts further support the usefulness of memetics as a supplement to traditional source studies.¹⁶

Just as Gannett's version of "The Crowning Day" rejects Whittle's orthodox text while appropriating, or "lifting," the germinal lines of its refrain, Dickinson's "The Soul has Bandaged moments -" intersects with a hymn by Doddridge, sharing its diction and imagery but not its structure and theme. The hymn, a doctrinal reflection based on Hosea 11.4 (beginning "I drew them with cords of a man, with bands of love: and I was to them as they that take off the yoke"), originally appeared as "Gratitude the Spring of true Religion" (#152) in Doddridge's *Hymns Founded on Various Texts in the Holy Scriptures* (1755; new edition 1835) (Julian 1:781) and in J. D. Humphreys's 1839 *Scriptural Hymns by the Rev. Philip Doddridge, D. D.* (#171). It also issued forth as #170 in Jeremy Belknap's *Sacred Poetry* (1795, with several subsequent editions) and in a number of lesser known hymnals.¹⁷

In New England, an altered version of Doddridge's hymn reached a wide audience through *The Springfield Collection of Hymns for Sacred Worship* (1835), a popular Unitarian hymnal, where it bore the title "The Bands of Love." As Foote records, *The Springfield Collection* was compiled by the Reverend William Oliver Bourne Peabody (1799-1847) of Springfield:

[Peabody's] collection contains 509 hymns, admirably chosen from the accepted classics of the period, Watts and Doddridge predominant, but with an increasing number of the recent compositions by Unitarian hymn-writers of the first third of the 19th century. . . . On its merits the *Springfield Collection* rightly shared with *Greenwood's Collection* and *The Cheshire Collection* the largest measure of popularity and use among Unitarians in the middle of the 19th century. (23)

There are several indications that Dickinson knew *The Springfield Collection*. First, as Foote indicates, it was widely used among Unitarians in New England; and Dickinson had relatives, friends, and associates who formed Unitarian affiliations or manifested Unitarian leanings, including Thomas Wentworth Higginson, with whom she initiated a correspondence in the period to which "The Soul has Bandaged moments -" dates.¹⁸ In addition, as Martha Winburn England explains, "American hymnody reacted to the revival of Unitarian interest in church song,

and names that were dear to [Dickinson] were signed to hymns that contributed to that revival: Thomas W. Higginson, J. G. Holland, Emerson, Hale, Lowell, Pierpoint, Bryant, Longfellow, Parker" (128). Then, too, since Dickinson's poetry contains allusions to other texts by Doddridge (England 127), it is likely that she knew "The Bands of Love" (though possibly under a different title), whether through *The Springfield Collection* or another source. Finally, as Morgan remarks, "[t]he fact that Unitarians were interested in 'revising' Watts's work to fit with their own theological beliefs might have furthered Dickinson's interest [in Watts]" (91); Morgan's point is equally relevant to a consideration of Doddridge's work.

In "The Bands of Love," Doddridge employs images of war, bondage, captivity, and chains to dramatize the spiritual battle between sin and salvation. Like the gospel hymns that came later (including Whittle's "The Crowning Day"), "The Bands of Love" presents humanity as passive. Beginning with an invocation, it offers a prayer of praise:

<i>Hymns, etc.</i>	<i>Springfield Collection</i>
My God, what silken Cords are thine! How soft, and yet how strong! While Pow'r, and Truth, and Love combine To draw our Souls along.	My God, what silken cords are thine! How soft, and yet how strong! Thy power, and truth, and love, combine To lead our souls along.
Thou saw'st us crush'd beneath the Yoke Of <i>Satan</i> and of Sin: Thy Hand the Iron-Bondage broke Our worthless Hearts to win.	[stanza omitted]

In this opening passage, Doddridge stresses the individual's utter helplessness in relation to God and Satan alike: souls led or drawn along on tethers are yoked together like beasts of burden, bound by the shared encumbrance of sin.

The succeeding portion of the hymn introduces images that resonate with both Gannett's "The Crowning Day" and Dickinson's "The Soul has Bandaged moments - ." Particularly suggestive are the reference to "the crowning day," connecting the hymn to Gannett, and the diction of warfare, linking it to Dickinson, whose imagery of bandages, bombs, and horror resonates with its wartime composition. The most significant point of intersection, however, occurs in the *Hymns, etc.* text with the juxtaposition of "one moment" and "unnumbered years, / Eternity" and the resulting emphasis on the discrete transformative moment. In the meme-plex of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century hymns, the "moment" freighted with ontological significance seems to splinter

and multiply, surfacing variously in Gannett's hymn, where such moments are "lifted," and in Dickinson's, where they are "bandaged."

Hymns, etc.

The Guilt of twice ten thousand Sins
One Moment takes away;
And Grace, when first the War begins,
Secures the crowning Day.

Springfield Collection

The guilt of twice ten thousand sins
Thy mercy takes away;
Thy grace, when first the war begins,
Secures the crowning day.

Comfort thro' all this Vale of Tears
In rich Profusion flows,
And Glory of unnumber'd Years,
Eternity bestows.

Comfort through all this vale of tears
In rich profusion flows,
And glory, through unnumbered years,
Thy sacred word bestows.

The final stanza returns to the soul's passivity but replaces the references to Satan and sin with affirmations of the overwhelming power of God's love:

Hymns, etc.

Drawn by such Cords we onward move,
Till round thy Throne we meet;
And, Captives in the Chains of Love,
Embrace our Conqu'ror's Feet.

Springfield Collection

Drawn by such cords, our hearts shall move,
Till round thy throne we meet;
And, captive in the willing chain,
We fall before thy feet.

Similar in its movement to both Gannett's version of "The Crowning Day" and Dickinson's "The Soul has Bandaged moments - ," the narrative structure of Doddridge's hymn is both circular and progressive: beginning with bondage and ending with captivity, it describes a journey from sin to salvation. At the same time, Doddridge's "silken cords," or "bands of love," contrast with the less benignant bandages evoked in Dickinson's poem, even as "bandaged" echoes "bands."

Dickinson, like Doddridge, conveys the soul's powerlessness through images of bondage and captivity. Dickinson's verse is also rife with the kind of war imagery, allusions to captivity, and emphasis on specific moments laden with meaning that Doddridge deploys. In "The Soul has Bandaged moments - " Dickinson juxtaposes moments of extreme bleakness and ecstatic release even as she rejects conventional dualistic tropes. This uneasy coupling simultaneously undercuts and resonates with Doddridge's admonition in *The Rise and Progress of Religion in the Soul* that "[you] learn to number the times of your sharpest trials among the sweetest and most exalted moments of your life" (381). Providing

the driving force behind "The Soul has Bandaged moments - ," this climactic juxtaposition of high and low moments further adumbrates Doddridge's proximity to Dickinson in the sprawling meme-plex of revival-era hymns.

Variations: Emily Dickinson and William Channing Gannett

In light of the varied uses of the "crowning day" by Doddridge, Whittle, and Gannett (as image, motif, title, and refrain), consider Gannett's "lifted moments" alongside Dickinson's "Bandaged" ones. A close side-by-side examination of the two helps flesh out in greater detail the attributes of the "crowning day" meme and the larger meme-plex in which it circulated. At the same time, Dickinson's poem opens itself up to fresh readings when situated in relation to Gannett's lyrics.

Like Gannett's revision of "The Crowning Day," "The Soul has Bandaged moments - " largely takes the form of description (as opposed to invocation or exhortation); Dickinson's poem is, however, a "negative" affirmation, that is, it bears testimony to and validates something negative rather than (or in addition to) something positive. The contrast between "lifted" and "Bandaged" is, of course, key, with Dickinson's "Bandaged" suggesting a reconfiguration of the "bands" in the *Springfield* title of Doddridge's "Gratitude the Spring of true Religion."

Not coincidentally, the word "Bandaged" also appears in Dickinson's "I never hear that one is dead," dating from about 1874, in which "Belief" in immortality ("chance of Life") is associated with annihilation, while the "Daily mind," skeptical or unbelieving by contrast, corresponds to futility and emptiness ("tilling its abyss").¹⁹ The relevance of this poem to "The Soul has Bandaged moments - " justifies quoting it in full:

I never hear that one is dead
Without the chance of Life
A fresh annihilating me
That mightiest Belief,
Too mighty for the Daily mind

That tilling it's abyss,
Had Madness, had it once or, Twice
The yawning Consciousness,

Beliefs are Bandaged, like the Tongue
When Terror were it told

In any Tone commensurate
Would strike us instant Dead -

I do not know the man so bold
He dare in lonely Place
That awful stranger - Consciousness
Deliberately face -

(Fr1325)

With its themes of Resurrection and life-altering faith (“mightiest Belief”), along with its contrast between dull quotidian realities and the sudden “strike” of overpowering belief, “I never hear that one is dead” has significant parallels to “The Soul has Bandaged moments - .” Most pointedly, the use of “Bandaged,” with its multiple implications of injury, constraint, silencing (now to the point of terror-induced speechlessness), helplessness, and incapacitation—a drastic intensification of the kind of passivity we first saw in Whittle’s hymn and then again in Doddridge’s—provides an illuminating gloss on “The Soul has Bandaged moments - .”

In addition to sharing the adjective “Bandaged,” these two poems are linked by a terrifying presence. The vague “Terror” at the heart of “I never hear that one is dead” shadows the fully personified “Fright” that ushers in and closes off “The Soul has Bandaged moments - ”:

The Soul has Bandaged moments -
When too appalled to stir -
She feels some ghastly Fright come up
And stop to look at her -

The second stanza of “The Soul has Bandaged moments - ” modulates from impersonal description to a direct address to “Goblin,” apparently another name for the “ghastly Fright” of the first stanza.

Salute her, with long fingers -
Caress her freezing hair -
Sip, Goblin, from the very lips
The Lover - hovered - o’er -

Here, the relationship between “Lover” and “Goblin” seems close in meaning to the “Belief”-“Consciousness” pairing in “I never hear that one is dead,” where the personification of “that awful stranger Consciousness” in the final stanza

embodies the silent terror of a frightening realization. "I never hear that one is dead" ambiguously conflates the annihilation of "mightiest Belief" with the "Madness" of "yawning Consciousness" and the deathly terror of "that awful stranger Consciousness." "The Soul has Bandaged moments - ," however, is structured by opposing pairs that intensify the contrast between skepticism and belief. In the stanza's concluding lines ("Unworthy, that a thought so mean / Accost a Theme - so - fair - "), "a thought so mean" seems to reinforce the idea of disbelief, while "Theme - so - fair" hints of what the later poem terms "That mightiest Belief" (i.e., everlasting "Life"). This theme—Resurrection—is, of course, the primary referent of the "crowning day" meme.

The opening line of the next stanza ("The Soul has moments of Escape - ") is crucial to the text's overall structure, as it parallels the poem's first line while anticipating the first line of the last stanza ("The Soul's retaken moments - "). According to Morgan, one of the "dominant modes in Dickinson's poetry concerning religion" involves "the ways in which the poems challenge the portrayal of a direct and linear movement towards, and communication between, God and speaker in religious orthodoxy as exemplified in the hymns of Isaac Watts" (11). The comparison of Gannett's and Dickinson's texts reveals a clear illustration of Morgan's point that Dickinson's "alternative hymns" tend to challenge the conventional notion of a linear progression toward the Divinity just as they "destablise oppositional thinking" (9).

Gannett's hymn uses daybreak as a structural device as well as a trope of enlightenment. It begins with a mere "signal" of the approaching morning flashing from the mountaintops while "silent darkness" blankets the "sleeping" valleys. At the conclusion, sunrise is in full glow, and so, too, the hearts of the people are "kindling" as Faith becomes "radiant." The lyrics thus describe a steady, straightforward movement from literal and metaphorical darkness to literal and metaphorical illumination—a progressive linearity reinforced by the gradually unfolding and increasingly expansive stanza-by-stanza sequence "From peak to peak it flashes" . . . "From heart to heart it brightens" . . . "From hour to hour it haunts us" . . . "From age to age it groweth."

Dickinson's poem, in contrast, begins and ends with images of "Fright" and "Horror" and peaks in the middle in the full glare of a summer noontime (with the blooming rose and "delirious" bee).²⁰ This extended seasonal simile corresponds to the Soul's ecstatically boisterous "Escape," rather than with the gentle and homely "kindling" of collective enlightenment Gannett associates with daybreak.

The soul has moments of escape -
When bursting all the doors -
She dances like a Bomb, abroad,
And swings upon the Hours,

As do the Bee - delirious borne -
Long Dungeoned from his Rose -
Touch Liberty - then know no more,
But Noon, and Paradise -

Here, in these “liberated” stanzas, Dickinson’s idiosyncratic slant rhyme contrasts with the perfect rhyme of the first stanza, where its use suggests conformity and constraint. In the next stanza, in which Dickinson explicitly equates poetry (“plumed feet”) and “Song,” the lines resume the convention of perfect rhyme as the soul is “retaken” and its poetic faculties impaired:

The Soul’s retaken moments -
When, Felon led along,
With shackles on the plumed feet,
And staples, in the song,

The Horror welcomes her, again,
These, are not brayed of Tongue -

For Dickinson, the Soul’s initial condition is not one of slumber, as in Gannett’s hymn, but of injury, mummification, bondage (with the “shackles” and “staples” echoing the “iron bondage” of Doddridge’s hymn), paralysis (“too appalled to stir”), and condemnation (“Felon”). At the poem’s conclusion the passivity of the first stanza becomes compulsory and punitive through images of forcible restraint and imprisonment. Gannett’s appropriation and repetition of the traditional refrain, “The crowning day is coming by and by,” as the hymn’s culmination suggests security and continuity even in the context of a radically revisionist system of belief. In contrast, Dickinson’s chillingly speechless close signals not merely a rejection of this dominant meme but a refusal to sound the underlying assurances upon which it rests.

Like Dickinson, Gannett conjures an approaching presence that “haunts” the soul, but for Gannett this specular presence is “life’s great meaning” as opposed to the implied skepticism or denial of Dickinson’s “a thought so mean.”²¹ A later revision of Gannett’s hymn concludes with the banishment of “fear” by faith

("behold the radiant token / of faith above all fear"); but Dickinson's verse ends with the reunion of the "retaken" soul and the "ghastly Fright" poised to embrace the now-"shackled" muse. Thus, the motion Dickinson describes is circular, rather than linear, and recursive rather than teleological, as the poem achieves closure through the completion of a loop (one could almost say "a vicious circle"): "The Horror welcomes her, again."

The section of Dickinson's poem that corresponds thematically to the epiphanic culmination of Gannett's hymn occurs unexpectedly in the middle stanza ("The soul has moments of Escape - "). The extended imagery here of violence, destruction, lawlessness, and criminal conviction resonates with the poem's wartime composition as well as the idea of spiritual warfare, with its extensive hymnic context. It also links it to other poems Dickinson wrote during this period concerning "the experience of fragmentation" and "extreme states: mental anguish, despair, the self as bomb or volcano, the fear that one may be coming apart" (Habegger 477). Enlarging on the interpretive possibilities, Jonnie G. Guerra has argued persuasively that a relevant definition of "bomb" in this stanza is "the stroke upon a bell," one of the definitions given in Dickinson's copy of Webster's Dictionary. As Guerra explains, "This meaning connects the soul's dance with the movement and ringing of a bell and greatly enhances the figure" (31). In addition, Guerra suggests, the stanza "portray[s] the female soul as she swings on a belfry tower rope, her rhythmical movements producing strokes that mark the passing hours" (31). Guerra's interpretation is particularly compelling when we consider that the stanza ends with a reference to "tongue," a word that occurs not only in "I never hear that one is dead," where "the Tongue / When Terror were it told" harbors a pun suggesting the ringing of a bell ("told" — "toll"), but in another poem from the same fascicle (17), likewise dated by Franklin "About summer 1862," where it indisputably refers to the clapper of a bell:

It was not Death, for I stood up,
And all the Dead, lie down -
It was not Night, for all the Bells
Put out their Tongues, for Noon.
(Fr355)

The final line of "The Soul has Bandaged moments - ," then—"These, are not brayed of Tongue - " — can be parsed as referring simultaneously to words that are not spoken, lyrics that are not sung, and church bells that are not rung.

Read in the context of Gannett's version of "The Crowning Day," Guerra's lexical analysis exposes a pointed contrast between the "lifted moments" of Gannett's hymn, in which the enlightened soul seems to step out of the sweep of time by rising "above the drift of days," and Dickinson's conception of the emancipated soul swinging from the tolling church bell by hanging on the ropes, or cords (silken or otherwise), attached to them. Read in this way, "Bomb" can be seen as an image of exultation and revelry inextricably tied to the noisy, material marking of time as opposed to an ascent (being "lifted") into an abstract eternal plane. In addition, by drawing attention to the physical setting of this middle stanza, Guerra's gloss on "Bomb" suggests that "bursting all the doors" refers to the doors of a church, and that the state of exuberant liberation bodied forth is the soul's reaction to being released, ejected, or otherwise dislocated from the confined space of the sanctuary.²² The frenzied activity associated with the spiritual rebel, fugitive, or escapee takes on added force when contrasted with the characteristic passivity of gospel hymns such as Whittle's. In light of this pattern of imagery, the poem's final line—"These, are not brayed of Tongue - "—reads as an ironic allusion to the church chorals that Dickinson would have heard reverberating through the meeting house and that her poetic form (common meter in this poem) summons. "Brayed," rather than sung, the hymns thus sanctioned are, by implication, dissonant and unintelligible, like a donkey's whinny, as well as inarticulate ("brayed [braid] of tongue" also suggesting "tongue tied" like the "Bandaged" dumbstruck "Tongue" in "I never hear that one is dead").

Beginning with a near echo of "The soul hath lifted moments," Dickinson's "The Soul has Bandaged moments - " thus concludes with an oblique and dubious allusion to the singing of hymns that celebrate moments of faith-filled enlightenment. Taken as a whole, and read against Gannett's "The Crowning Day," Dickinson's poem can be understood as offering a hymn-like observance of those sunken or "unlifted" moments that are the counterpart of the exalted moments hymns traditionally celebrate. To borrow a term Dickinson employs in her poem's pivotal fifth stanza, "The Soul has Bandaged moments" commemorates those moments that are so low and dismal as to be "dungeoned," thereby giving shape and legitimacy to moments of spiritual emptiness and existential horror, while locating the soul's liberation and ecstasy outside the traditional confines of the church.²³ In the "crucible" of the poet's mind, the creative process filters and refines the available memes to produce a poem that is at once utterly original and steeped in the generative medium of existing forms (Drout, *How Tradition Works* 42).

As Watson observes:

the hymn is not expected to sow doubt in the mind of the singer, or produce complex and contradictory emotions, or express frustration, anxiety or confusion. Hymns do not often use irony . . . ; instead they express assurance and banish doubt Apart from the portrayals of the Crucifixion, there does not seem much awareness, in hymnody, of misery and suffering, of the great dilemmas of the human situation, of the most serious problems of tragic art and human life, of the greatness and wretchedness of the human condition. (4)

Poetry, in contrast, is free to express all of these extremities, and Dickinson's hymn revisions do just that. Manheim has argued that "with consummate authority, Dickinson liberated the terms of revivalist rhetoric to construct a personal network of meanings and associations" (391). In its exploration of the depths and heights of spiritual anguish and release, "The Soul has Bandaged moments - " turns Doddridge's and Gannett's lyrics alike inside out. If, as Drout suggests, the literary critic's "job is to try to figure out the regularities by which [memes and meme-plexes] combine and recombine in the infinite chemistry of the cultural world" (*How Tradition Works* 43), Dickinson's "Bandaged moments" represents an unusually volatile concoction. By reading the text through a memetic framework, we can more readily comprehend the poet's embeddedness in a transtextual cultural network, but we can also recognize more fully the poet's creative refashioning of the materials at her disposal. Extending the scope of this kind of non-chronological, multidirectional analysis to a broader swath of the hymnic field promises to facilitate new ways of reading and thinking about Dickinson's verse.²⁴

Coda

In *Iola Leroy; or, Shadows Uplifted* (1892), Frances E. W. Harper ends her narrative with a note in which she declares that the "mission" of her novel is to "awaken in the hearts of our countrymen a stronger sense of justice and a more Christlike humanity in behalf of those whom the fortunes of war threw, homeless, ignorant and poor, upon the threshold of a new era" (282). She expresses hope that her work will "inspire" young readers "to embrace every opportunity, develop every faculty, and use every power God has given them to rise in the scale of character and condition, and to add their quota of good citizenship to the best welfare of the nation." Anticipating that future literary contributions of African Americans may "add to the solution of our unsolved American problem," she concludes with the following lines:

There is light beyond the darkness,
Joy beyond the present pain;
There is hope in God's great justice
And the negro's rising brain.
Though the morning seems to linger
O'er the hill-tops far away,
Yet the shadows bear the promise
Of a brighter coming day. (282-83)

One of several late nineteenth-century reappropriations of the "crowning day" meme, Harper's adaptation is singular for several reasons. Its tentative quality, suggested by the lingering morning, as though victory is a distant prospect, separates it from the unshakeable optimism of "The Morning Hangs Its Signal," while the imagery of shadows is tinged with a sorrow that is absent from Gannett's vision. In addition, the "brighter coming day" is still only a promise in Harper's lines, contrasting with the inevitable sunrise bursting forth, stanza by stanza, as Gannett's hymn unfolds. Finally, Harper's lyrics locate the conflict itself outside the individual: the struggle is external and physical, rather than inward and spiritual; nor is "the present pain" of African Americans merely "a kind of objective correlate to the subjective turmoil and fear recounted in prayer and testimony," as Sizer remarks of the stormy seas and turbulent skies of revivalist rhetoric (123). Meanwhile, elsewhere in the revival music meme-plex, two roughly contemporaneous revisions of "The Crowning Day" roll out their metaphors of battle to produce gospel hymns that are aggressively militaristic in imagery and tone—Thomas Blair's "The Crowning Day" (1889) demands, "Are you marching in the army of our King," "Are you fighting 'neath the banner of the cross?" (140) while the chorus of William Ruebush's "Arise and Shine" (1898) presses us to "fight, fight, fight, in the battle for the right." In contrast to these metaphorical skirmishes over the state of individual souls, Harper implicitly locates the contending forces of good and evil in the socio-political conflicts stemming from racism and oppression. Squarely rejecting the revivalist strategy of "dealing at a cosmic level with what seemed an impossible set of social, political, and economic circumstances" (Sizer 156), Harper's radical intervention in the "crowning day" meme-plex illustrates the durability, adaptability, and transformative potential of this popular hymnic meme.²⁵

In *The English Hymn* Watson writes, "[p]robably the most significant literary scholarship of the present [twentieth] century has been devoted to the discovery of accurate texts, corresponding as closely as possible to the poet's known

intention and original version" (9). Not only is such an approach ill-suited to the historical development of hymns—as Sizer remarks, popular nineteenth-century hymn lyrics often “seem to have come from nowhere in particular” (22)—but this concentrated attention to “the authentic expression of the poet’s mind” is at odds with the perception of hymns as “belonging to the Church, at the service of the editors of a hymn-book, to be altered in whatever way seems to them to be most helpful or expedient” (Watson 9-10). Françoise Deconinck-Brossard adds a valuable insight concerning this communal quality:

Hymns offer a good model of the dynamic interaction between reader and text. The repeated experience of congregational hymn-singing, or of reading devotional poetry for the purpose of private meditation, often leads singers or readers to appropriate hymns as part of their personal culture . . . Occasionally the text (and / or the tune) is altered in the process, and the modified version handed down, sometimes orally, to the next generation of worshippers . . . Hymns are ‘living texts’. The art of hymnody is shaped by reader / singer response to religious poetry, for which no definitive edition can ever be completed. (np)

Tracing the lines that connect Gannett and Dickinson via Doddridge and Whittle, and even Harper, within this intricate web of transtextuality helps reveal how the “lifting” of memes functioned as a means of adapting traditional liturgy and communal texts to radical views and individual expressions. Although it is not always easy or even possible to tell who was “lifting” from whom, the examples of Gannett and Dickinson illustrate how public debates over orthodoxy and progress as well as private (perhaps hidden) reflections on individual experience and belief could crystallize and circulate through the selective replication and redeployment of “lifted moments.”

Notes

I would like to thank Faith Barrett, Angela Sorby, Ron Bieganowski, S.J., Tim Machan, and Eliza Richards for valuable suggestions at various stages in the development of this essay. I am especially indebted to Faith for suggesting the play on “lifted.”

1. In a similar vein J. R. Watson acknowledges the “appalling instability” of hymns but also observes that “the special characteristics of its genre are a stability which comes from its use of consistent codes, especially the great code of the Bible; and a firmness of reader-response which comes from the interpretive community of the Church” (21). See also De Jong.
2. Drout elaborates: “The classic example of a meme is a tune . . . sung by one person and heard and repeated by another,” but “what we call a meme is actually an agglomeration of a whole number of memes . . . [:] a ‘meme-plex,’ a complex of memes” (*How Tradition Works* 4-5). The phrase “the crowning day” is a meme that evokes the larger meme-plex encompassing the entire network of literary and liturgical texts revolving around the Second Coming of the Messiah, the Day of Judgment, and the Resurrection.

3. While some critics see memes as merely metaphorical, Drout regards memetics as essentially and materially descriptive of how tradition works. My approach lies between the two, taking the concept of memes and meme-plexes as components of a useful but not necessarily universal model that functions by way of analogy.
4. In *Emily Dickinson and Hymn Culture*, Victoria Morgan explains that hymns were “a tool for ‘moulding’ theology, [which] meant that hymns were altered frequently to accommodate the different theological leanings of religious groups” (29).
5. According to Manheim, “Dickinson’s verse adaptation of the rhetoric of revivalism is most obvious in her early poetry” (391); and five of the thirteen poems Dickinson sent to Higginson following his 1862 “Young Contributor” piece in the *Atlantic Monthly* “exhibit revivalist language” (397). While Manheim illustrates how Dickinson adapted revivalist tropes “to imagine and articulate an emotional attachment,” my analysis shows Dickinson reappropriating revivalist hymns in very different ways.
6. During the Civil War, Gannett spent three years working with emancipated slaves in South Carolina’s low country. After the Civil War, he studied in Europe and then completed his training for the ministry at Harvard Divinity School (Stephenson 143-45). On “the Harvard school of hymnody,” see Henry Wilder Foote (9-11). On the Creedal Issue and Gannett’s role in the debate, see William H. Pease, “Doctrine and Fellowship: William Channing Gannett and the Unitarian Creedal Issue.” Gannett also wrote several volumes focused on domestic spirituality, including *The House Beautiful* (1895) and *The Little Child at the Breakfast Table* (1915), that reached an audience estimated in the hundreds of thousands (Stephenson 146).
7. According to Foote, Gannett began to compose hymns shortly after completing Divinity School in 1868 (7); and although John Julian records that Gannett’s own manuscript notes date this hymn “Chicago, July 30, 1886” (2:1639), H. W. Stephenson, in his *Unitarian Hymn-Writers*, provides an example of a hymn (“Consider the Lillies, How They Grow”) that Gannett composed and publicly debuted twenty years earlier than its initial date of publication (146). Also supporting the possibility that “The Morning Hangs Its Signal” significantly precedes its date of publication is Stephenson’s assertion that “Gannett’s hymns were mainly written for special occasions.” (See also Julian 2:1639.) Stephenson speculates that Gannett composed lyrics that he did not seek to publish “due, in part, to a fairly high degree of fastidiousness in his judgment as to what was worthy to be printed” (149). Foote notes that in *Hymns of the Spirit* (1937) the lyrics were “attributed to ‘William Channing Gannett and others,’ being an arrangement from one of his poems” (111).
8. No. 28 in the series *Unity Short Tracts* (later called *Unity Mission Tracts*), *Love to God and Love to Man* was also published in combination with another hymnal tract, *Songs of Faith, Hope, and Charity*, in 1888.
9. According to Putnam, the hymns of “the Liberal Faith” “reveal, as a class, a strong faith and tender trust in God as the Father; a fine appreciation and love of all that is grand and beautiful in Nature; a deep conviction that a divine hand is in all things, and is guiding all things on to a glorious issue and end; a profound and earnest reverence for Christ, as the Way, the Truth, and the Life, and a heartfelt recognition of his Cross as the emblem and pledge of victory; a genuine ‘enthusiasm for humanity’ and a sense of the supreme value of a good life, and a large and genial sympathy and fellowship with all true and faithful souls in every sect or communion, — which give to their lyrics a power, a fervor, and a joy” (ix-x).
10. The physical format of *Unity Hymns*, which employed a special “cut-leaf” presentation, makes this practice explicit. With musical scores printed on the upper halves of the pages and lyrics on the lower halves and the pages physically cut between the staves and the words, the volume enabled users to turn the half-pages separately in order to “[bring] any tune over any hymn on any opened page.” This feature allowed “hymns and tunes [to] be arranged in perfect independence of each other” (iii). At the same time, the edition suggested tunes for each set of lyrics, the preface noting that “much delightful study has been given to these matings, but with no thought that the choice made may not be bettered by the preference of others” (*Unity Hymns* [1911] iv).

11. Watson, who characterizes the rhetoric of *Sacred Songs and Solos* as “threatening, sadistic, bullying, regressive, self-centered,” laments that the hymns “reduce the complexities of human experience to an excitable repetition, an assertive sentimentality” (493; 497). For him, their appropriation of African-American slave songs (which he admires) makes them seem “inauthentic and second-hand” (501).
12. In Watson’s estimation, “This Whitmanesque vision of hope and new life helps to explain why Unitarianism was such a strong religion in New England: through its hymns it also had a pervasive effect on other churches in other parts of America” (465).
13. Morgan defines “hymn culture” as “the tradition of writing, editing and compiling hymns and also the practical experience of hymns; singing, sharing and using them as points of reference in every day life. It also refers to the various conventions hymns follow, such as hierarchical address, teleological narrative and particular imagery; [and] encompasses the rationale and specific ideas about social cohesion that such conventions produce, and the various effects those ideas have upon the editorial choices made during the compiling of hymnals” (23).
14. Although standard works on Dickinson’s reading make no mention of Doddridge, Martha Winburn England refers to (but does not enumerate) “allusions to the hymns of Burkitt, Watts, Doddridge, Stennett, John Burton, Newton, Cowper, Robinson and possibly Kelly, Hart, and Simon Browne.” As England notes, “the chief source of information about her knowledge of church song” are the three hymnbooks she used during her attendance at church (126-27): *The Psalms, Hymns, and Spiritual Songs of the Rev. Isaac Watts, D. D., to which are added Select Hymns, from other Authors; and Directions for Musical Expression*, ed. Samuel Worcester (1819); *Church Psalmody . . . Selected from Dr. Watts and Other Authors*, ed. Lowell Mason and David Green (1831); and *Village Hymns . . . a Supplement to Dr. Watts’s Psalms and Hymns*, ed. Asahel Nettleton (1824). All three of these texts contain hymns by Doddridge. Deconinck-Brossard notes, “In the shadow of Isaac Watts’s ‘unrivaled ascendancy’ and ‘overwhelming popularity,’ some of Doddridge’s hymns managed to come into their own” in New England (np). According to Julian, “Doddridge’s hymns are largely used by Unitarians both in G. Britain and America. As might be expected, the Congregationalists come next . . . Taken together, over one-third of his hymns are in C.U. [common use] at the present time” (1:306).
15. On Doddridge’s optimistic tone and “affectionate spirituality,” see Deconinck-Brossard. Contrasting with Doddridge’s use of “moments,” in the King James Bible the singular noun “moment” is typically used in a negative sense with reference to the brevity of life.
16. Drout makes a similar point (*How Tradition Works* 42).
17. This hymn also appeared in E. Walker’s *Psalms and Hymns for Public and Social Worship* (3rd ed., 1860), Isaac Ashe’s *Songs of Zion* (3rd ed., enlarged, 1864), and the *London Hymn Book* (enlarged edition, 1873), where it went under the title “My God, what cords of love are Thine,” a modified version of the hymn’s original first line, “My God, what silken cords are Thine.” Derived from the epigraph from Hosea 11.4, the “bands of love” / “cords of love” meme also appears in #532 in *Village Hymns*, a collection Dickinson used at Mt. Holyoke Seminary and that Manheim identifies as “perhaps the most significant site of [Dickinson’s] borrowing” from “the immensely popular discourse of revivalism” (378).
18. Alfred Habegger speculates that some of the poems Dickinson composed during this period may have been “written with her new preceptor [Higginson] partly in mind” (458). As Morgan notes, “Higginson was a Unitarian minister, and she no doubt would have been familiar with Unitarian views and the controversy they proliferated within the Protestant Evangelical Revival culture of the 1830s and 1860s” (91).
19. “Bandaged” occurs as well in the line “Big my Secret but it’s *bandaged* - ” in Dickinson’s “Rearrange a ‘Wife’s’ Affection!” (Fr267), where it signals not only injury but also forcible constraint, silencing (being gagged), and concealment. With its imagery of bandages, bombs, and horror, “The Soul has Bandaged moments - ” also has affinities with the body of Dickinson’s poems arising from and alluding to the Civil War.
20. On Dickinson’s bee imagery, see Morgan, Chapter 6.

21. Possibly relevant here is Doddridge's hymn "The Seasons," which personifies winter as a "Horror" in the lines "And Winters, soft'ned by thy Care / No more a Face of Horror wear" (qtd. in Deconinck-Brossard np). An American version published in *New England Harmony* (1801) eliminates the reference in the revised lines "While wintry storms direct our eyes, / With fear and wonder to the skies" (Swan 66).
22. The *Emily Dickinson Lexicon* lists "dislocated" as a "webplay" result for "bandage(-d)."
23. Habegger notes that in 1862-63, "The isolation she claimed was by no means wholly fictive: she *was* the only family member who hadn't joined the First Church" (456). A few years later, Dickinson would compose a poem celebrating "The Soul's Superior instants" (Fr630).
24. Another promising area for research lies in the digitized bound volume of Dickinson's sheet music recently published by the Houghton Library. In the Dickinson Family Library, see "Music: a bound volume of miscellaneous sheet music, without title page / with Emily Dickinson's name written on flyleaf" (EDR 469, Houghton Library). As George Boziwick notes, "the contents of her music book provide a revealing perspective on just how assiduously and enthusiastically she collected, listened to, and performed the music of her time" (np).
25. As Sizer notes, revivalist rhetoric, stressing a "likeness of feeling" that "glorified uniformity and homogeneity," "could be employed to create a community which claimed no political or structural ties, while in fact being deeply implicated in social and political identities" (137).

Works Cited

The following abbreviation is used to refer to the writings of Emily Dickinson:

Fr *The Poems of Emily Dickinson*. Ed. R. W. Franklin. 3 vols. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1998. Citation by poem number.

- "Bandage(d)." *Emily Dickinson Lexicon Website*. Brigham Young University, 2014.
- Benson, Louis F. *The English Hymn: Its Development and Use in Worship*. New York: Hodder and Stoughton, 1915.
- Blair, Thomas. "The Crowning Day." *Sowing and Reaping: Hymns, Tunes, and Carols for the Sunday School, Prayer, Praise and Gospel Service*. Ed. John H. Kurzenknabe. Harrisburg, PA: J. H. Kurzenknabe & Sons, 1889.
- Boziwick, George. "Emily Dickinson's Music Book [EDR 469]." *Houghton Library Blog*. Sept. 5, 2013.
- Deconinck-Brossard, Françoise. "The Circulation and Reception of Philip Doddridge's Hymns." *Dissenting Praise: Religious Dissent and the Hymn in England and Wales*. Ed. Isabel Rivers and David L. Wykes. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2011.
- De Jong, Mary. "Textual Editing and the 'Making' of Hymns in Nineteenth-Century America." *Sing Them Over Again to Me: Hymns and Hymnbooks in America*. Ed. Mark A. Noll and Edith L. Blumhofer. Tuscaloosa: U of Alabama P, 2006. 77-97.
- Doddridge, Philip. "The Bands of Love." *The Springfield Collection of Hymns for Sacred Worship*. Comp. William Bourn Oliver Peabody. Springfield, MA: Samuel Bowles; Boston: Leonard C. Bowles, 1835.
- . "Gratitude, the Spring of true Religion." *Hymns Founded on Various Texts in the Holy Scriptures. By the Late Reverend Philip Doddridge, D. D., Published from the Author's Manuscript by Job Orton*. London: J. Eddowes and J. Cotton, 1755.
- . *The Rise and Progress of Religion in the Soul. Illustrated in a Course of Serious and Practical Addresses, Suited to Persons of Every Character and Circumstance with a Devout Meditation and Prayer, Added to Each Chapter*. Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1843.

- Drout, Michael D. C. *How Tradition Works: A Meme-Based Cultural Poetics of the Anglo-Saxon Tenth Century*. Tempe, AZ: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 2006.
- _____. "A Meme-Based Approach to Oral Tradition Theory." *Oral Tradition* 21 (2006): 269-94.
- Effinger, John R. "Report of the Western Conference." *Official Report of the Proceedings of the Twelfth Meeting of the National Conference of Unitarian and Other Christian Churches held at Saratoga, NY, September 20-24, 1886*. New York: Russell N. Bellows, 1886. 26-30.
- England, Martha Winburn, and John Sparrow. *Hymns Unbidden: Donne, Herbert, Blake, Emily Dickinson and the Hymnographers*. New York: New York Public Library, 1966.
- Foote, Henry Wilder. *American Unitarian Hymn Writers and Hymns*. Cambridge, MA: Hymn Society of America, 1959.
- Gannett, William Channing. "The Crowning Day." *Unity Hymns and Chorals for the Congregation and the Home*. Ed. William Channing Gannett, James Vila Blake, and Frederick L. Hosmer. Chicago: Charles H. Kerr, 1889.
- _____. *Love to God and Love to Man*. Unity Mission Pamphlet no. 28. Chicago, Unity Mission, 1886. *Unity Hymns and Chorals for the Congregation and the Home*. Ed. William Channing Gannett, James Vila Blake, and Frederick L. Hosmer. Chicago: Charles H. Kerr, 1889. 157-71
- _____. James Vila Blake, and Frederick L. Hosmer, eds. *Unity Hymns and Chorals for the Congregation and the Home*. Chicago: F. L. Hosmer, 1880; Rev. ed. 1889.
- _____. James Vila Blake, and Frederick L. Hosmer, eds. *Unity Hymns and Chorals with Service Elements*. Chicago: Unity Publishing Co., 1911.
- _____. and Frederick L. Hosmer, eds. *The Thought of God in Hymns and Poems*. 2nd Series. Boston: Roberts Brothers, 1894.
- Genette, Gérard. *Palimpsests: Literature in the Second Degree*. Trans. Channa Newman and Claude Doubinsky. Lincoln: U of Nebraska P, 1997.
- Guerra, Jonnie G. "Dickinson's 'The Soul has Bandaged moments.'" *Explicator* (Fall 1989): 30-32.
- Habegger, Alfred. *My Wars Are Laid Away in Books: The Life of Emily Dickinson*. New York: Modern Library, 2002.
- Harper, Frances E. W. *Iola Leroy; or, Shadows Uplifted*. New York: Oxford UP, 1988.
- Hitchcock, A. P. "Hymns and Hymn-Tinkers." *The Atlantic Monthly* 49 (1882): 336-46.
- James, Jacqui, ed. *Between the Lines: Sources for Singing the Living Tradition*. 2nd ed. Boston: Skinner House Books, 1998.
- Julian, John. *A Dictionary of Hymnology*. 2 vols. 2nd rev. ed., 1907. Rpt. New York: Dover Publications, 1957.
- Manheim, Daniel L. "'Have We Not a Hymn?': Dickinson and the Rhetoric of New England Revivalism." *The New England Quarterly* 68 (2005): 377-406.
- Morgan, Victoria N. *Emily Dickinson and Hymn Culture: Tradition and Experience*. Surrey, UK: Ashgate, 2010.
- Pease, William H. "Doctrine and Fellowship: William Channing Gannett and the Unitarian Creedal Issue." *Church History* 25.3 (Sept. 1956), 210-38.
- Putnam, Alfred P. *Singers and Songs of the Liberal Faith; Being Selections of Hymns and Other Sacred Poems of the Liberal Church in America, with Biographical Sketches of the Writers, and Historical and Illustrative Notes*. Boston: Roberts Bros., 1875.
- Rogal, Samuel J., comp. *Sing Glory and Hallelujah! Historical and Biographical Guide to Gospel Hymns Nos. 1 to 6 Complete*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1996.
- Ruebush, William Howe. "Arise and Shine." *Crowning Day, No. 3: A Collection of Choice Gospel Songs for Sunday Schools, Revivals, Young Peoples' Meetings, and all the Services of the Sanctuary*. Ed. J. H. Ruebush, J. H. Hall, A. S. Kieffer, and W. H. Ruebush. Dayton, VA: Ruebush-Kieffer Co., 1898.
- Sizer, Sandra S. *Gospel Hymns and Social Religion: The Rhetoric of Nineteenth-Century Revivalism*. Philadelphia: Temple UP, 1978.

- Stephenson, H. W. *Unitarian Hymn-Writers*. London: The Lindsey Press, 1931.
- Swan, Timothy. *New England Harmony: Containing, a Variety of Psalm Tunes, in Three and Four Parts, Adapted to All Metres: Also, a Number of Set Pieces, of Several Verses Each, Together with a Number of Anthems*. Northampton, MA: Andrew Wright, 1801.
- Unitarian Universalist Association of Congregations. *Singing the Living Tradition*. Boston: Unitarian Universalist Association, 1993.
- Watson, J. R. *The English Hymn: A Critical and Historical Study*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997.
- [Whittle, Daniel Webster.] pseud. El Nathan. "The Crowning Day." *Sacred Songs and Solos, Nos. 1 and 2 Combined*. Comp. Ira D. Sankey. London: Morgan & Scott, 1881.