Marquette University e-Publications@Marquette

Clinical Lab Sciences Faculty Research and Publications

Health Sciences, College of

2-1-2016

Suboptimal Trichomonas vaginalis Antigen Test Performance in a Low-Prevalence Sexually Transmitted Infection Community

Kimber L. Munson Wheaton Franciscan Laboratory

Maureen Napierala Wheaton Franciscan Laboratory

Erik Munson Marquette University, erik.munson@marquette.edu

Published version. *Journal of Clinical Microbiology*, Vol. 54, No. 2 (February 2016): 500-501. DOI. © 2016, American Society for Microbiology. Used with permission.



Suboptimal *Trichomonas vaginalis* Antigen Test Performance in a Low-Prevalence Sexually Transmitted Infection Community

Kimber L. Munson,^a Maureen Napierala^a Erik Munson^{a,b}

Wheaton Franciscan Laboratory, Milwaukee, Wisconsin, USA^a; College of Health Sciences, Marquette University, Milwaukee, Wisconsin, USA^b

T*ichomonas vaginalis* is the most common nonviral etiology of sexually transmitted infection (STI) worldwide (1). The OSOM Trichomonas rapid test (OSOM; Sekisui Diagnostics, San Diego, CA) is a rapid surrogate to microscopic analysis in symptomatic patients (2), but its performance in low-prevalence STI populations has been assessed on a limited basis in the literature (3). OSOM has widespread usage, as accreditation data from the College of American Pathologists report that over 300 participant laboratories utilize this assay on an annual basis (4). We sought to characterize the analytical and clinical performance of OSOM in a low-prevalence STI population on the basis of a commercial transcription-mediated amplification (TMA) reference.

Results from the performance of OSOM with 1,421 consecutive vaginal saline suspensions were audited from a 4-month interval in a low-prevalence southeastern Wisconsin STI population (5). The concomitant Aptima specimen transport tube from the health care encounter (98.7% endocervical, 1.3% vaginal), previously subjected to Chlamydia trachomatis and Neisseria gonorrhoeae TMA (Aptima Combo 2 assay; Hologic, San Diego, CA), was forwarded for retrospective T. vaginalis TMA (Aptima Trichomonas vaginalis assay; Hologic) evaluation on a TIGRIS direct tube sampling (DTS) system per the manufacturer's specifications (6). A previous assessment of T. vaginalis TMA showed 100% molecular concordance between the data from vaginal saline suspension aliquots and endocervical specimens maintained in Aptima specimen transport tubes (7). In addition, Napierala et al. (8) have shown equivalent T. vaginalis TMA detection rates from endocervical swabs and vaginal swabs in our population. This study was governed by the Wheaton Franciscan Healthcare Institutional Review Board.

The low-prevalence STI population exhibited TMA detection rates of 6.4% and 0.6% for *C. trachomatis* and *N. gonorrhoeae*, respectively, while the *T. vaginalis* TMA detection rate was 4.0%. On the basis of a *T. vaginalis* TMA reference standard, the sensitivity and specificity of OSOM were 35.1% and 99.9%, respectively (Table 1). The kappa value for this data set was 0.502 (95%)

 TABLE 1 Performance of OSOM Trichomonas rapid test and Aptima

 Trichomonas vaginalis assay in a low-prevalence STI community

OSOM Trichomonas rapid test result	No. of specimens with indicated result by Aptima Trichomonas vaginalis assay		Total no. of
	Positive	Negative	specimens
Positive	20	1^a	21
Negative	37	1,363	1,400
Total	57	1,364	1,421

^a Repeat Aptima Trichomonas vaginalis assay testing yielded a negative result.

TABLE 2 Performance of OSOM Trichomonas rapid test and Aptima					
Trichomonas vaginalis assay in an increased-prevalence STI community					

OSOM Trichomonas	No. of speci indicated res Aptima Tric vaginalis ass	No. of specimens with indicated result by Aptima Trichomonas vaginalis assay	
rapid test result	Positive	Negative	specimens
Positive	18	0	18
Negative	3	77	80
Total	21	77	98

confidence interval, 0.346 to 0.658), and agreement was 0.973 (95% confidence interval, 0.963 to 0.981).

In an analogous fashion, 98 consecutive tandem vaginal saline suspensions and endocervical swabs from an increased-prevalence STI setting (*C. trachomatis* TMA detection rate, 11.2%; *N. gonorrhoeae* TMA detection rate, 6.1%; setting characterized previously [7, 9]) were retrospectively analyzed via OSOM and *T. vaginalis* TMA, respectively, per the manufacturer's guidelines (2, 6). Improved concordance between OSOM and *T. vaginalis* TMA was observed within this study set, with a 21.4% *T. vaginalis* TMA detection rate (Table 2). An increased kappa value of 0.904 (95% confidence interval, 0.797 to 1.000) was calculated, with agreement of 0.969 (95% confidence interval, 0.907 to 0.992).

Campbell et al. (3) reported 94.7% sensitivity for OSOM compared to microscopy in a population with a 1.9% *T. vaginalis* detection rate. Molecular diagnostics did not factor into the determination of the overall *T. vaginalis* incidence. For a high-prevalence population, Huppert and colleagues (10, 11) reported 83 to 90% sensitivity for OSOM. One can hypothesize that the significant *T. vaginalis* TMA/*T. vaginalis* antigen discordance frequency in our low-prevalence population is related to organism burden (12) or to *T. vaginalis* TMA detection in asymptomatic patients. However, 56.8% of OSOM-negative/*T. vaginalis* TMA-positive data in the low-prevalence population were derived from symptomatic patients (determined by chart review to have pelvic pain, abdominal pain, vaginal discharge, irritation, or itching). This rate of symptom incidence did not differ from that for patients yieldDownloaded from http://jcm.asm.org/ on July 12, 2016 by Marquette University Libraries

CrossMark

LETTER TO THE EDITOR

Accepted manuscript posted online 9 December 2015

Citation Munson KL, Napierala M, Munson E. 2016. Suboptimal *Trichomonas* vaginalis antigen test performance in a low-prevalence sexually transmitted infection community. J Clin Microbiol 54:500–501. doi:10.1128/JCM.02949-15.

Address correspondence to Erik Munson, Erik.Munson@wfhc.org.

Copyright © 2016, American Society for Microbiology. All Rights Reserved.

TABLE 3 Symptomatic status of Aptima Trichomonas vaginalis assaypositive patients from low- and increased-prevalence STI communities stratified by OSOM Trichomonas rapid test result

OSOM Trichomonas rapid test result	No. (%) of patients positive by Aptima Trichomonas vaginalis assay exhibiting symptoms		
	Low-prevalence community	Increased-prevalence community	
Positive Negative	15 (75.0) 21 (56.8) ^a	16 (88.9) 3 (100.0) ^b	

 $^{a}P = 0.17$, versus those with positive OSOM result; significance test of proportions.

 $^{b} P = 0.54$, versus those with positive OSOM result; significance test of proportions.

ing positive OSOM and *T. vaginalis* TMA results (P = 0.17; Table 3). Moreover, symptomatic status did not impact concordant and discordant OSOM/T. vaginalis TMA frequencies in the increasedprevalence population (P = 0.54).

It has been documented that up to 70% of infections with T. vaginalis are asymptomatic (13). Detection of subclinical trichomoniasis is important, as studies have demonstrated persistent indolent infection via laboratory detection of the agent following previously negative results in the face of sexual abstinence (14, 15). In further support of this paradigm, 27% of the 37 patients with OSOM-negative/retrospective T. vaginalis TMA-positive results in our low-prevalence population returned for clinical evaluation of an STI (data not shown). In conclusion, poor reliability of OSOM in a low-prevalence population combined with the inability to detect the organism in a significant proportion of symptomatic patients may warrant consideration of T. vaginalis TMA for accurate laboratory diagnosis of this protozoan.

FUNDING INFORMATION

Funding was not provided by any external source.

REFERENCES

- 1. Cates W, Jr. 1999. Estimates of the incidence and prevalence of sexually transmitted diseases in the United States. The American Social Health Association Panel. Sex Transm Dis 26(Suppl 4): S2-S7.
- 2. Sekisui Diagnostics. 2013. OSOM Trichomonas rapid test package insert. Sekisui Diagnostics, San Diego, CA.
- 3. Campbell L, Woods V, Lloyd T, Elsayed S, Church DL. 2008. Evaluation of the OSOM Trichomonas rapid test versus wet preparation examination for detection of Trichomonas vaginalis vaginitis in specimens from women

with a low prevalence of infection. J Clin Microbiol 46:3467-3469. http: //dx.doi.org/10.1128/JCM.00671-08.

- 4. College of American Pathologists. 2014. Vaginitis screen participant summary, VS-A and VS-B. College of American Pathologists, Northfield, IL.
- 5. Munson E, Bykowski H, Munson KL, Napierala M, Reiss PJ, Schell RF, Hryciuk JE. 2016. Clinical laboratory assessment of Mycoplasma genitalium transcription-mediated amplification using primary female urogenital specimens. J Clin Microbiol 54:432-438. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128 /JCM.02463-15.
- 6. Hologic. 2012. APTIMA Trichomonas vaginalis assay package insert. Hologic, San Diego, CA.
- 7. Munson E, Napierala M, Basile J, Miller C, Burtch J, Hryciuk JE, Schell RF. 2010. Trichomonas vaginalis transcription-mediated amplificationbased analyte-specific reagent and alternative target testing of primary clinical vaginal saline suspensions. Diagn Microbiol Infect Dis 68:66-72. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.diagmicrobio.2010.05.002.
- 8. Napierala M, Munson E, Munson KL, Kramme T, Miller C, Burtch J, Olson R, Hryciuk JE. 2011. Three-year history of transcription-mediated amplification-based Trichomonas vaginalis analyte-specific reagent testing in a subacute care patient population. J Clin Microbiol 49:4190-4194. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/JCM.05632-11.
- Munson E, Napierala M, Olson R, Endes T, Block T, Hryciuk JE, Schell 9. RF. 2008. Impact of Trichomonas vaginalis transcription-mediated amplification-based analyte-specific reagent testing in a metropolitan setting of high sexually transmitted disease prevalence. J Clin Microbiol 46:3368-3374. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/JCM.00564-08.
- 10. Huppert JS, Batteiger BE, Braslins P, Feldman JA, Hobbs MM, Sankey HZ, Sena AC, Wendel KA. 2005. Use of an immunochromatographic assay for rapid detection of Trichomonas vaginalis in vaginal specimens. J Clin Microbiol 43:684-687. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/JCM.43.2.684-687 .2005.
- 11. Huppert JS, Mortensen JE, Reed JL, Kahn JA, Rich KD, Miller WC, Hobbs MM. 2007. Rapid antigen testing compares favorably with transcription-mediated amplification assay for the detection of Trichomonas vaginalis in young women. Clin Infect Dis 45:194-198. http://dx.doi.org /10.1086/518851.
- 12. Kurth A, Whittington WLH, Golden MR, Thomas KK, Holmes KK, Schwebke JR. 2004. Performance of a new, rapid assay for detection of Trichomonas vaginalis. J Clin Microbiol 42:2940-2943. http://dx.doi.org /10.1128/JCM.42.7.2940-2943.2004.
- 13. Sutton M, Sternberg M, Koumans EH, McQuillan G, Berman S, Markowitz L. 2007. The prevalence of Trichomonas vaginalis infection among reproductive-age women in the United States, 2001-2004. Clin Infect Dis 45:1319-1326. http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/522532.
- 14. Peterman TA, Tian LH, Metcalf CA, Malotte CK, Paul SM, Douglas JM, Jr, RESPECT-2 Study Group. 2009. Persistent, undetected Trichomonas vaginalis infections? Clin Infect Dis 48: 259-260. http://dx.doi.org/10 .1086/595706.
- 15. Gatski M, Kissinger P. 2010. Observation of probable persistent, undetected Trichomonas vaginalis infection among HIV-positive women. Clin Infect Dis 51:114–115. http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/653443.